

**GoodWork® Project Report Series, Number 78**

**Manifest Destiny in American Higher Education:**  
Elite Tertiary Institutions and the Branch Campus Phenomenon

Alexis Brooke Redding  
Harvard Graduate School of Education  
June 2012

Howard Gardner, Series Editor

COPYRIGHT 2012. All Rights Reserved.

**Manifest Destiny in American Higher Education:  
Elite Tertiary Institutions and the Branch Campus Phenomenon**

Alexis Brooke Redding  
June 2012

**Abstract**

American colleges and universities are increasingly looking overseas to form collaborative partnerships that can enhance institutional prestige and increase revenue. The rise of this global branch campus model is helping to transform higher education today. There are currently 164 international branch campuses around the world, most of which have opened over the past decade (Fischer, 2010) in response to changing technological advancements and economic challenges.

While successful proximal collaborations among tertiary institutions exist throughout the USA, they are not without their own challenges. These relationships can pose logistical obstacles for institutions that share both geography and ideology. When tertiary institutions collaborate on a global scale, these problems may be compounded by difficulties that arise from trans-national logistics, cultural differences, and conflicting political ideologies. To ensure success, it is important that clear goals are articulated to help institutions classify these relationships and define success.

This paper is a first step towards establishing a set of standards to define quality international education at the tertiary level. Using the literature about nine global partnerships, I coded emergent themes and selected the six categories mentioned most frequently in these sources: (1) Academic Offerings, (2) Faculty Involvement, (3) Mutual Benefits, (4) Relationship with local government, (5) Admissions Standards, and (6) Leadership & Organization. Using these categories, I developed a taxonomy that can be used to define the type of relationship that exists: Branch Campus or Campus Outpost.

The taxonomy is designed to facilitate reflection about mission, goals, and the ultimate purpose of an international collaboration. As such, it can be used to evaluate the components of each type of global partnership and to measure how these elements of the relationship may or may not contribute to its ultimate success. To demonstrate the taxonomy's usefulness in understanding global partnership arrangements, I used this tool to evaluate NYU's Abu Dhabi campus and to illustrate the strengths and challenges of this evolving relationship.

Institutional collaboration is deep-seated in the culture of American higher education. Throughout the 20<sup>th</sup> century, neighboring institutions with similar missions came together to offer expanded academic programs while reducing costs through shared resources and combined purchasing power (Dotolo & Horgan, 2009). These types of consortial relationships have become particularly beneficial to institutions struggling with diminished endowments in today's economic climate (Reyes, 2010). Despite the increasing role of institutional partnerships in higher education, the literature detailing how institutions define successful collaboration is sparse. To that end, I previously explored seven high-profile collaborative partnerships among proximal colleges and universities in the USA in order to define two types of relationships: Comprehensive Consortia and Focused Collaborations (Redding, 2011). Based on these findings, I created taxonomy that can be used both to determine the type of consortial relationship that exists and the depth of engagement between partner institutions (Appendix). While this has proved to be a useful tool for looking at relationships between tertiary institutions, it only applies to traditional consortia for which campus proximity is a defining feature. It cannot be used to examine the fastest growing type of higher education collaboration: global partnerships.

Over the past decade, there has been a dramatic shift in the ways in which institutions of higher education form collaborative partnerships. Decreased costs of international travel and the rise of the Internet to facilitate communication have contributed to the rise of the global branch campus phenomenon. As Hacker and Dreifus (2010) explain, “[j]ust as American businesses and banks have looked overseas for new markets, so our universities are globalizing in a quest for revenue and growth”. The pace

of this change has been dramatic. While there are fewer than 1,500 higher education collaborations in the USA built over the past century (Minearo, 2009), there are already 164 international branch campuses, 80 percent of which have opened in the last decade (Fischer, 2010). Further, American schools oversee at least 65 of these branches in 34 countries (Hacker & Dreifus, 2010). Lewin has described this dramatic increase as “a kind of educational gold rush [where] American universities are competing to set up outposts in countries with limited higher education opportunities” (Lewin, 2008). However, despite their rapid proliferation, this new kind of collaborative relationship is rife with potential problems.

Since collaborative ventures pose a challenge for proximal institutions, it is easy to imagine how distance, clash of cultures, and the introduction of trans-national logistics could derail even the most well-intentioned efforts. For this reason, ongoing evaluation must constitute a key component of administering a successful branch campus. As Mark G. Yudof, president of the University of California system quipped, “[g]etting scientists to share equipment in buildings across the street can be difficult. Working internationally can throw up even more obstacles as administrators figure out the rules of mutual engagement” (Wheeler, 2008).

In recent times, we have witnessed the highly-publicized failures of Michigan State University’s branch campus in Dubai, which cost the university more than 4 million dollars (Mills, 2010a; Wildavsky, 2010a), and the closure of George Mason University’s campus Emirate of Ras el Khaimah due to a dispute with their regional partner over funding (Wildavsky, 2010b). These debacles underscore that understanding and defining

a multi-national campus venture is of tantamount importance to preserving both the reputation of the home institutions and promoting fiscal responsibility.

Despite the impending challenges that these international relationships may face, new collaborations make headlines every month. The lure of these potential partnerships is understandable. As Lewin (2008) explains, “[o]verseas programs can help American universities raise their profile, build international relationships, attract top research talent who, in turn, may attract grants and produce patents, and gain access to a new pool of tuition-paying students, just as the number of college-age Americans is about to decline.” This state of affairs may explain why, in the shadow of announcements of failed international ventures, Carnegie Mellon University announced plans to build a campus in Kigali, Rwanda on September 19, 2011 (Jaschik, 2011). Two months later, *The Chronicle of Higher Education* (2011) reported that Bard College acquired the European College of Liberal Arts in Berlin, which it plans to operate as a satellite of the college. And, last December, the *Duke Chronicle* headlined the university’s decision for the Fuqua School of Business to offer its first comprehensive Master’s degree on their China campus (Kim, 2011). Indeed, it seems that the pace of developing branch campuses has increased recently and stories about these collaborations are everywhere.

As a first step towards defining Yudof’s ‘rules of mutual engagement’ (Wheeler, 2008), I have created a new taxonomy. This taxonomy can be applied specifically to global partnerships in order to define both the type of relationship that exists and the depth of engagement between home and branch campuses. As McCartney explains, “[g]ood intentions, broad consensus, and intricate plans are insufficient without sustained leadership and periodic formal assessments of progress” (McCartney, 2007). This

taxonomy provides an overview of the categories that are present in a successful international campus and can be used to evaluate global partnerships that either currently exist or are in the planning stages. This instrument can be used to determine areas of weakness that may need extra attention. As such, it is not a diagnostic tool *per se*, but a framework for fostering important conversations that can help develop and maintain a strong overseas branch campus. Given the potential pitfalls inherent in any collaborative venture, which may be exacerbated by cultural and political conflicts, a solid foundation for a trans-national partnership cannot be overestimated.

Kinser and Lane conducted a study of forty international partnerships and concluded that an important key to success is the ability to conduct a careful analysis before opening a satellite campus (Fischer, 2010). Given the high-cost of failure and the risk to reputation faced by the American institutions, having a solid basis for understanding what the partners expect from the relationship and what it will entail becomes even more important. Since these new ventures blend the obstacles that face higher education collaborations with the new challenges of trans-continental logistics, cultural challenges, and conflicts with political ideology, they are loaded with pitfalls. As McCarthy (2007) explains, “[a] successful plan transforms how an institution operated, how it sees itself, and how it is perceived by others”. This taxonomy is designed to facilitate that kind of reflection about mission, goals, and ultimate purpose of an international partnership.

## **Methods**

To explore the nature of international higher education collaborations, I selected nine current partnerships and reviewed the available material on each joint venture

American Institution	Location of Home Campus	Location of Satellite Campus
Carnegie Mellon University	Pittsburgh, PA	Doha, Qatar
Carnegie Mellon University	Pittsburgh, PA	Kilgali, Rwanda
Cornell University	Ithaca, NY	Doha, Qatar
Georgetown University	Washington, DC	Doha, Qatar
MIT	Cambridge, MA	Republic of Singapore
New York University	New York, NY	Abu Dhabi, United Arab Emirates
New York University	New York, NY	Republic of Singapore
Northwestern University	Evanston, Illinois	Doha, Qatar
Yale University	New Haven, CT	Republic of Singapore

**Table 1: Partnerships**

(Table 1). Sources included the websites and mission statements of the home institutions and their campuses abroad; published interviews with key administrators and faculty; press releases from the institutions and governments involved; articles in both the academic and popular press; and conversations with admissions officers or faculty members at selected institutions. I then coded emergent themes from the literature and selected the six categories mentioned most frequently in these sources: (1) Academic Offerings, (2) Faculty Involvement, (3) Mutual Benefits, (4) Relationship with local government, (5) Admissions Standards, and (6) Leadership & Organization (Table 2). Selected themes were discussed in relation to at least 3 different institutions and show how individuals currently engaged in global partnerships define success.

Two types of international collaborations emerged: Campus Outposts and Branch Campuses. Based on these findings, I define Campus Outposts as traditional relationships where an institution establishes a subsidiary campus overseas that carries its brand and where the flow of resources is primarily uni-directional. In contrast, I define Branch Campuses as collaborative ventures that are designed to be true partnerships between the home institution and satellite campus and to provide a bi-directional flow of students and resources between them. The details of each category are shown in Table 3, with a range

of individual criteria for each. To meet the criteria for a Campus Outpost, schools must meet all of the criteria from at least two of the categories. In order to be considered a full-fledged Branch Campus, all criteria in each of the six categories must be present (or in advanced stages of development).

Home Institution	Location	(1) Academic Offerings	(2) Faculty Involvement	(3) Mutual Benefit	(4) Relationship w/ local government	(5) Admissions standards	(6) Leadership & Organization	Category (AO/BC)
CMU	Qatar							
CMU	Rwanda							
Cornell	Qatar							
Georgetown	Qatar							
MIT	Singapore							
NYU	UAE							
NYU	Singapore							
Northwestern	Qatar							
Yale	Singapore							

**Table 2: Taxonomy for Evaluating Successful International Partnerships**

After establishing the categories, I created a case study of New York University Abu Dhabi (NYUAD), a high-profile international collaboration with deep engagement from the government of the host country (Table 4). NYUAD was selected because of the availability of information about the program (including published interviews with key administrators); the fact that it is in its second year of operation; and its stated mission to develop “a remarkable multilayered model of how higher education can advance a global vision” (Bloom, 2011). After analyzing NYUAD and determining that it meets all six criteria for a Branch Campus, I further tested the taxonomy by applying it to the other six schools in my initial survey. In order to complete the taxonomy, I returned to the literature and evaluated their alignment with the criteria of each category to determine which kind of partnership exists and the differences among them (Table 5).



	<b>Branch Campus</b> <i>Meets criteria for all 6 categories</i>	<b>Campus Outpost</b> <i>Meets criteria for at least 2 categories</i>
(1) Academic Offerings	<p>Students <b>must</b> have access to comprehensive academic fields across a range of disciplines</p> <p>Students <b>must</b> have reciprocal access to both the home and the host campuses during their degree program</p> <p><b>Must</b> be a degree-granting institution.</p> <p>Campus <b>may</b> serve as a destination for outside students to enroll in short-term study (ex. Summer abroad)</p>	<p>Students <b>must be</b> given access to at least one specialized professional degree program (ex. medicine, journalism) in a field for which the institution is well-known</p> <p><b>May</b> offer joint degrees with their local university partnership</p> <p>Campus <b>may</b> serve as a destination for outside students to enroll in short-term study (ex. Summer abroad)</p>
(2) Faculty Involvement	<p>At least 50% of classes <b>must</b> be taught by faculty imported <u>from</u> the home institution</p> <p>Faculty from the home institution <b>must</b> be involved in the curricular design</p> <p>Faculty <b>may</b> receive short or long-term appointments to teach at the portal campus</p> <p>Faculty <b>may</b> be offered incentives to participate in the program.</p>	<p>The majority of classes <b>must be</b> taught by local faculty</p> <p>The faculty <b>may be</b> trained by the home institution</p>
(3) Mutual Benefit	<p><u>Host Country:</u> Campus <b>must</b> extend degree options for regional students</p> <p><u>Home Institution:</u> The prestige of the home institution <b>may be</b> enhanced by the partnership</p> <p>The home institution <b>must</b> receive financial benefit from the partnership</p>	<p><u>Host Country:</u> The host country <b>does not</b> explicitly receive a benefit from the partnership.</p> <p><u>Home Institution:</u> The prestige of the home institution <b>may be</b> enhanced by the partnership</p> <p>The home institution <b>must</b> receive financial benefit from the partnership</p>
(4) Relationship with local government	<p><b>At least</b> part of the cost must be paid by the host country</p> <p>Students from the host country <b>may be</b> given subsidized tuition or governmental scholarships</p>	<p><b>May</b> have a relationship with the host government regarding visa procedures, but not required</p>
(5) Admissions	<p>Students <b>must be</b> admitted directly to the portal campus, through a parallel admissions process</p> <p>Admissions standards <b>must be</b> equal to <b>or</b> higher than the home campus</p>	<p>Students <b>may be</b> admitted to either the home campus or the host campus</p> <p>Students may be able to attend courses at the host institution for short-term or limited enrollment without being formally admitted to the school</p>
(6) Leadership & Organization	<p><b>Must</b> have a local partner</p> <p><b>Must</b> have a defined campus with educational facilities, dormitories, and faculty housing.</p> <p>Campus mission <b>must be</b> aligned to the values of the home institution</p> <p>The home institution <b>must have</b> full control over curriculum, staff, and admissions decisions</p>	<p><b>May</b> have a local partner</p> <p><b>Must</b> have a permanent building designated for classes</p> <p><b>May</b> have either a dormitory or local housing options (host families, hotels, hostels)</p> <p>The home institution <b>must have</b> full control over curriculum, staff, and admissions decisions</p>

**Table 3: Categories for Evaluating International Partnerships**

### **Case Study: New York University – Abu Dhabi (NYUAD)**

In the global charge to internationalize education, the United Arab Emirates and Qatar have taken an active role in recruiting top international universities to the region; many institutions have been lured with generous financial incentives. Their outreach has been successful and now more than 30% of the international satellite campuses exist in these two countries (McMurtrie, 2008). Qatar’s Education City, opened in 2001, has evolved into an educational metropolis covering more than 14 square kilometers (TEN, 2011). That includes high-profile partners, such as Cornell’s Weill School of Medicine and Northwestern University’s School of Communication & Medill School of Journalism. The government of Abu Dhabi drew upon this model when they entered what Krieger (2007a) describes as a “regional game of one-upmanship in which rich countries on the shores of the Persian Gulf are using their oil wealth to buy prestige through marquee universities”.

Given NYU’s stated long-term goal of becoming a ‘Global Network University’ (Mills, 2010d) the approach from Abu Dhabi in 2005 was ideal for NYU President John Sexton. NYU’s global network of 12 study-centers abroad was missing a campus in the Middle East, making the proposal particularly appealing to their institutional mission (Krieger, 2007c). The plan, announced on October 12, 2007, was to create the ‘World’s Honors College’ by recruiting the highest-caliber students and faculty members from around the world (Souccar, 2010) and to create a “portal” through which students could access the full-resources of the NYU system (NYUAD, 2011). According to the NYUAD website (2011), the university operates through the NYU in Abu Dhabi Corporation, a

New York not-for-profit institution that is registered to conduct business in Abu Dhabi, and all aspects of development and operations are fully-funded by their government.

At the outset of this joint venture, NYU Washington Square was given an unrestricted gift of \$50 million, to incentivize them and establish ‘good faith’ (Lewin, 2008). President Sexton was subsequently promised all of the funding required in order to create a world-class institution abroad (Krieger, 2007c). The goals for the NYU-Abu Dhabi partnership have been lofty from the outset. The government described their substantial investment in the project as a way of creating an “idea capital” in the region and to develop a knowledge-based economy. The establishment of NYU has indeed helped to create a magnet for other prestigious institutions to set up branches on their soil (Lane, 2011), including the Louvre and the Guggenheim Museums (Mills, 2010d).

While creating study abroad sites overseas is common among tertiary institutions in the USA, the freedom given to NYU through unlimited resources and complete academic control has helped it to become the first foreign campus explicitly designed to replicate the experience students receive on the home campus (Daley, 2011). Currently housed in a temporary facility, a massive building project is underway for a permanent campus on Saadiyat Island, expected to open in 2014 (NYUAD, 2011). This facility will house the expansive campus of NYUAD, including residential centers for students and faculty. It includes a 670-acre cultural district with outposts of world-class museums (Wildavsky, 2010c). According to the NYUAD website (2011), the island is being built to accommodate a population of 150,000 and will also include luxury hotels, golf courses, and waterfront villas (Krieger, 2008) in addition to the educational and research facilities.

The curriculum for NYUAD was designed by NYU Washington Square faculty and intended to offer the same high-caliber education, tailored to the Middle East context. As stated on the NYUAD FAQs website (2011), “NYU has unfettered authority over academic programs at NYU Abu Dhabi”. The result is a campus that currently offers 18 majors, five multidisciplinary concentrations and electives in pre-professional tracks, (Mills, 2010d; NYUAD, 2011). The institution’s core curriculum is organized around four themes: Pathways of World Literature; Structures of Thought and Society; Art, Technology, and Invention; and Ideas and Methods of Science that are tailored to the cultural environment of the Persian Gulf location (NYUAD, 2011). Students are encouraged to spend ‘semesters away’ at the NYU Washington Square campus or any of the study centers located throughout the world (NYUAD, 2011). Similarly, students from NYC are encouraged to attend summer sessions or participate in study abroad programs in Abu Dhabi (NYU, 2011), which ensures a bi-directional flow of students and ideas.

NYUAD offers both a Bachelor of Arts (B.A.) and a Bachelor of Science (B.S.) degree and grants a diploma that is identical to the one received by students who attend school on the home campus. Plans are underway for the campus eventually to include graduate degree programs as well. Offering “a regular NYU degree with no asterisk” (Hacker & Dreifus, 2010) was one of the key components of the agreement with the Abu Dhabi government, this arrangement is mirrored by other schools in Qatar’s Education City and highlights the importance foreign governments place on the ability to offer equal degree programs on their soil. In fact, Yale’s refusal to entertain this idea led to a termination of their plans to set up a branch campus in Abu Dhabi in 2008 (Krieger, 2008).

One distinctive feature of NYUAD is that recruiting faculty from the home campus is a priority. In order to ensure an equal educational experience in Abu Dhabi, access to the same world-class faculty is a key to the success of the campuses. After the initial call for volunteers, more than 300 faculty members from Washington Square expressed interest in joining the brigade of educators to spend at least part of the year in Abu Dhabi (Mills, 2010c). Currently, 40 faculty members are living and teaching on campus, with plans for up to 100 to be in residence at any given time (NYUAD, 2011). At present, there is a faculty-to-student ratio of 1:3, which will eventually decline to 1:8 as enrollment grows (Mills, 2010c). Some of these will be visiting professors from NYU Washington Square, who will lead either short seminars or full semester classes in Abu Dhabi, while maintaining their core affiliation to their department in NYC. To this end, NYUAD has developed a “flexible academic model” that can accommodate the scheduling needs of professors traveling to the campus (NYUAD, 2011). Other members of a more permanent faculty have been appointed jointly to the two faculties and will spend 50 percent of their time on each campus (NYUAD, 2011). In addition to the incentive of working on an international campus and contributing to a new and evolving curriculum, interested faculty members receive financial incentives, including salaries commensurate with that of the NYC campus, round-trip business-class airfare for faculty and family members, free private school tuition for minor children, and “significant research support” (Mills, 2010c; NYUAD, 2011).

President Sexton described the desire to attract the top 1% of the students from around the globe to NYUAD (Wildavsky, 2010c). To this end, admissions standards at NYUAD are extremely stringent, making it one of the most selective colleges in the

world. While the Washington Square campus admits 38% of its applicants (College Board, 2011), NYUAD admitted just 2.1% of their applicants to their inaugural class (Mills, 2010b) and 3.3% of the subsequent applicant pool (NYU, 2011). SAT scores were also slightly higher (30-50 points) in Abu Dhabi than Washington Square (Mills, 2010b). Admitted students represent more than 70 countries, from 6 continents, and speak 68 languages. Enrolled students receive up to \$62,500 in tuition by the government of Abu Dhabi, as well as a \$2000 stipend and round-trip tickets home (NYUAD, 2011). The yield rate, a figure that indicates the number of students who accept an offer of admission and is carefully watched in higher education, of 79.4 percent was slightly higher than that of Harvard, which has the highest yield in the United States (Souccar, 2010). The university uses this information in its literature to speak to the desirability of its unique educational model (NYUAD, 2011). Further, NYU press statements explain that retention is extremely high, despite the fact that the program is still developing and is currently housed in temporary facilities. So far, only 2 students have left Abu Dhabi and both subsequently transferred to the Washington Square campus (NYU, 2011).

The establishment of NYUAD has not been without cultural conflict and backlash from NYU professors. These critics cite Abu Dhabi's record on human rights and the recent imprisonment of a Sorbonne University lecturer who was accused of publicly insulting the Crown Prince (HRW, 2011). Additional issues include concerns about free speech (Jackson, 2010; Redden, 2010); charges of anti-Semitism (Krieger, 2008); and laws against homosexual acts (Krieger, 2008). Due to these concerns, Andrew Ross, NYU Professor of Social and Cultural Analysis, worries about the risk that the NYUAD campus "will become a showcase for an authoritarian government" (Mills, 2010d),

**Table 4: Evaluation of NYUAD as a Branch Campus**

<p>(1) Academic Offerings</p>	<p>NYUAD offers 18 majors, 5 multidisciplinary concentrations, electives in pre-professional tracks (NYUAD, 2011)</p> <p>The university will offer a B.A. and a B.S. degree (NYUAD, 2011).</p> <p>This degree will be indistinguishable from diplomas awarded by NYU Washington Square (Krieger, 2007b).</p> <p>Students at NYU Abu Dhabi are encouraged to spend a semester or summer at NYU Washington Square and/or any of the other NYU study abroad centers located around the world (NYUAD, 2011)</p> <p>Students at NYU Washington Square are invited to spend a term in Abu Dhabi (NYUAD, 2011)</p>
<p>(2) Faculty Involvement</p>	<p>Faculty from NYC will teach the majority of classes, ranging from 3-week seminars to full-semester courses (Mills, 2010c).</p> <p>The flexible academic calendar at NYUAD was designed to promote a flow of faculty from NYC (NYUAD, 2011)</p> <p>Any new faculty hired to teach in Abu Dhabi are approved by the NYU provost (NYUAD, 2011) and will spend at least one year teaching in New York beforehand (Mills, 2010c).</p> <p>Some faculty may be offered 50-50 appointments between the two campuses (NYUAD, 2011).</p> <p>New York City faculty designed the curriculum (Mills, 2010d).</p> <p>Hundreds of faculty members have volunteered for short-term appointments (Daley, 2011)</p> <p>Tenure track positions were created in Abu Dhabi to lure faculty from the Washington Square campus</p> <p>Bonuses of up to 2/3 of a year's salary are offered for faculty members who sign up for long-term appointment (Daley, 2011).</p> <p>Departments in NYC receive supplementary funding when their faculty members are overseas (Krieger, 2007c).</p> <p>Faculty receive business-class tickets for themselves and family members (Weinberg, 2011)</p> <p>Free tuition to private schools for faculty children (Daley, 2011)</p>

(3) Mutual Benefit	<p><u>Host Country:</u></p> <p>Sheikh Mohamed bin Zayed Scholars Program gives opportunities to local university students; Shieks Mohamed bin Zayed Scholarship for Outstanding High School Students gives access to younger students (NYUAD, 2011)</p> <p>“The crown prince shares our vision of Abu Dhabi becoming an idea capital for the whole region,” (Lewin 2008)</p> <p><u>Home Institution:</u></p> <p>The NYU network of 12 global campuses was “missing a Middle East outpost” (Krieger, 2007b)</p> <p>The royal family gave NYU in Washington Square \$50 million dollars as a good faith investment at the outset of the project (Lewin, 2008).</p>
(4) Relationship with local government	<p>The government of Abu Dhabi covers all costs associated with the campus (Lewin, 2008).</p> <p>Eligible students are eligible for full-tuition of \$62,000/year, a \$2,000 stipend, and plane tickets (Mills, 2010b)</p>
(5) Admissions	<p>The NYU Common Application allows students to designate interest in NYU Abu Dhabi. They are then considered by a NYUAD-specific admissions committee (NYUAD, 2011).</p> <p>Admissions statistics are 2.1 – 3.3%, compared to NYU Washington Square admissions rate of approximately 38% (Lewis, 2010; Mills, 2010b; College Board, 2011)</p> <p>Average SAT scores for NYUAD students are higher than those at home campus (Mills, 2010b).</p>
(6) Leadership & Organization	<p>NYU has formed a partnership with the Royal Family and government of Abu Dhabi (NYUAD, 2011)</p> <p>The campus includes dormitories, faculty housing, performing-arts and athletic facilities, and student services (Krieger, 2007b).</p> <p>“NYU Abu Dhabi shares fully in the educational and research mission of NYU” (NYUAD, 2011).</p> <p>“NYU has unfettered authority over academic programs at NYU Abu Dhabi” (NYUAD, 2011)</p>

**Table 4: Evaluation of NYUAD as a Branch Campus**



lending credibility to a country that he believes has a questionable record on human rights issues. However, President Sexton has been described as “brushing off” these concerns (Souccar, 2010) and explaining that “[w]e have to accept the fact that, like in New York, we cannot provide immunity to students or faculty members at NYU Abu Dhabi from the normal laws of that society when not engaged in activities on our campus” (Krieger, 2008). The premise of the argument may be logical. However, the fact that drug use and adultery are punishable by flogging and speaking out against the Royal family is an offense that can lead to imprisonment does provide a stark contrast to the American judicial system that this former law professor uses as a comparison.

Issues of anti-Semitism are particularly troubling for a university that claims “not to discriminate on the basis of national origin in its admissions and hiring practices” (NYUAD, 2011). NYU administrators have been forced to acknowledge that local immigration laws regarding Israeli citizens may have an impact on hiring decisions. Since the U.A.E. does not have diplomatic relations with Israel, Israeli students and faculty cannot come into the country or be issued a visa. In fact, non-Israeli students who have a stamp in their passports from a visit to Israel are similarly precluded from entry into the country. While this issue caused The University of Connecticut to pull out of their own pending venture in the region, it has not impeded the NYU collaboration. According to a Connecticut state legislator, “It’s appealing when a wealthy nation offers to create a campus and potentially cover all of its costs, but it’s always important to understand whom you are partnering with” (Krieger, 2008). In open letters to President Sexton, the Washington Square faculty members have made a similar, yet unacknowledged, argument. In fact, Mubarak Al Shamesi, director-general of the Abu

Dhabi Education Council explained that “NYU was aware of our local culture and rules and guidelines, and our policies [...] were clearly not a concern for them” (Krieger, 2008).

Similar problems face LGBT students and faculty who want to go to the Abu Dhabi campus. While NYU in Washington Square is considered to be the most gay-friendly college campus in the United States (Schwartz, 2010), the same cannot be said of NYUAD, located in a country with laws against homosexual acts (Talev, 2011). This policy has implications for student enrollment, faculty recruitment, and campus life. However, it is not a new concern for the NYU Global Network, which already has a campus in Ghana where homosexuality is illegal (Hernandez, 2007). Despite widespread outrage over this issue, including open letters written to President Sexton and a Town Hall meeting in 2007, little has been said about this issue publicly. Sexton’s past response that he would actually encourage any Israeli or gay students to go to Abu Dhabi because he “doesn’t think in those categories” (Krieger, 2008), is an answer that many in the NYU community have found troubling.

### **Conclusion & Future Research**

The international expansion of higher education indicates an important trend in globalization. As more colleges and universities look to foreign soil as a means of building institutional prestige and increasing revenue, it is important that clear goals are set for these multi-national partnerships. According to Lane (2011), “[r]elative to the total number of private higher education institutions worldwide, the number of [international branch campuses] is still miniscule; but their potential to affect the evolution of higher

education in developing nations is substantial” (p. 378). The implications for diplomatic relations are also significant and extend far beyond the educational mission of the partner institutions.

Looking at the range of collaborations that currently exist, it is clear that each academic setting emerged to fit a particular cultural niche and to fill specific needs. The majority of campuses surveyed here do not meet the threshold for being a Branch Campus (Table 5), despite that fact that all of the schools spoke about the importance of all six categories. The most common issues surround diplomas and faculty, two issues tied to institutional prestige, concern over diluting the ‘brand’, and faculty buy-in. This situation suggests that further in-depth analyses must be completed in order to capture some of the more nuanced elements of these partnerships to understand the decisions of the leadership.

My initial survey suggests that further research is needed to create a more comprehensive portrait of partnerships across a range of countries and in different cultural and political climates. By continuing to evaluate other partnerships and examining the failed collaborations in depth, we should be able to develop a standard measure that is applicable across a broad range of international educational ventures. Further analysis may also allow for an in-depth understanding of the relative importance of each category that will create a hierarchy of institutional priorities. Of particular interest would be a comparison of satellite campuses from a single institution (*i.e.* NYU

Home Institution	Location	(1) Academic Offerings	(2) Faculty Involvement	(3) Mutual Benefit	(4) Relationship w/ local government	(5) Admissions standards	(6) Leadership & Organization	Category (AO/BC)
CMU	Qatar		A blend of regional faculty and visiting scholars from CMU			Lower admissions standards than at the home campus		Campus Outpost
CMU	Rwanda		Regional faculty will be trained by CMU			n/a		Campus Outpost
Cornell	Qatar							Branch Campus
Georgetown	Qatar					Lower admissions standards than at the home campus		Campus Outpost
MIT	Singapore	Degree granted by partner institution and will not say MIT	Regional faculty will be trained by MIT			n/a		Campus Outpost
NYU	UAE							Branch Campus
NYU	Singapore		n/a					Branch Campus*
Northwestern	Qatar							Branch Campus
Yale	Singapore	Degree will be awarded by NUS, not Yale	Will be primarily staffed by new faculty hires			n/a		Campus Outpost

**Table 5: Using the Taxonomy to Classify the International Partnerships – Preliminary Results**

*White* = indicates that the group has met the requirements for a Branch Campus from Table 1

*Gray* = indicates that the group has not met the requirements for a Branch Campus; explanation given

*n/a* = information about this category not currently available

(\* = pending determination about faculty)

Abu Dhabi & NYU Singapore, CMU Qatar & CMU Rwanda); multiple institutions in a single location (*i.e.* schools in Qatar’s Education City); and the difference between graduate and undergraduate satellite campuses (*i.e.* NYU Law in Singapore and NYUAD in Abu Dhabi). A longitudinal study showing how each venture evolves over time could also be telling.

Future research could also include the development of a third category where collaborations that meet four to five of the six categories receive a separate designation. Such an expansion may better capture the nature of these ventures, especially for schools that have modified their admissions standards to accommodate the lower SAT results of foreign students who are non-native English speakers. The current category designation may inadvertently mask the fact that admissions standards are tailored to a regional population that simply has not excelled on this measure. Given the fact that SAT results have limited validity in predicting college performance (Geiser & Santelices, 2007), this variable may not be as salient in defining Campus Outposts and Branch campuses.

The bottom line, according to Wildavsky (2010b), is that “[b]ranch campuses are at heart entrepreneurial ventures. Some will succeed, some will fail, and it will take time for universities to figure out which models, if any, are best replicated in which locations”. The 20<sup>th</sup> century version of collaborations among neighboring institutions has fundamentally changed. When partnerships are no longer bound by proximity and logistical concerns change from bus service to international flights, the nature of the relationship must be transformed accordingly. I believe that it is important to address the question of what makes a bi-national partnership successful because the number of schools planning their own global campus continues to rise. After carefully examining

the available source materials, I have created a complementary version of the taxonomy for regional partnerships (Redding, 2011) that can be used to evaluate this new generation of global collaborations. While there is room to refine this taxonomy, it is a start towards taking a critical look at international higher education partnerships and establishing a method for discussing what different parties hope to gain in a cross-national collaborative venture.

## **Acknowledgements**

For their generous support of this research, I would like to thank the following individuals and foundations: John Abele and the Argosy Foundation. I would also like to thank Howard Gardner, Richard Light, Wendy Fischman and Lynn Barendsen for their comments and guidance on earlier drafts.

## References

- Barta, P. (2011, March 31). Yale plans joint campus in Singapore. *The Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved from <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748704530204576234721179898338.html>
- Benhabib, S. (2011, May 18). Why I oppose Yale in Singapore. *The Yale Daily News*. Retrieved from <http://www.yaledailynews.com/news/2011/may/18/benhabib-why-i-oppose-yale-singapore/>
- Bloom, A. (2011, December 8). Advancing a global vision. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/Developing-a-Sense-of-Shared/129937/>
- Branch, M.A. (2010, November 1). Singapore spinoff: Yale's plan to bet its brand on a new college in Asia. *Yale Alumni Magazine*. Retrieved from [http://www.yalealumnimagazine.com/issues/2010\\_11/singapore327.html](http://www.yalealumnimagazine.com/issues/2010_11/singapore327.html)
- Carnegie Mellon Qatar. (2011). *Admission*. Retrieved from <http://www.qatar.cmu.edu/78>
- Carnegie Mellon Qatar. (2011). *Community*. Retrieved from <http://www.qatar.cmu.edu/171>
- Carnegie Mellon Qatar. (2011). *Faculty & Staff*. Retrieved from <http://www.qatar.cmu.edu/169>
- Carnegie Mellon Qatar. (2011). *Home*. Retrieved from <http://www.qatar.cmu.edu/>
- Carnegie Mellon University. (2011). *Carnegie Mellon University in Rwanda*. Retrieved from <http://www.cmu.edu/rwanda/>
- Carnegie Mellon University. (2011). *Perspective students*. Retrieved from <http://www.cmu.edu/rwanda/prospective-students/index.html>
- Carnegie Mellon University. (2011). *Why is CMU establishing an academic program in Rwanda?* Retrieved from <http://www.cmu.edu/rwanda/prospective-students/index.html>
- Christofferson, J. (2011, April 2). Yale develops 1st overseas campus in Singapore. *The Boston Globe*. Retrieved from [http://www.boston.com/news/education/higher/articles/2011/04/02/yale\\_develops\\_1st\\_overseas\\_campus\\_in\\_singapore/](http://www.boston.com/news/education/higher/articles/2011/04/02/yale_develops_1st_overseas_campus_in_singapore/)



- Cohen, M. (2011, September 9). Yale alumni lament Singapore sting. *Asia Times*. Retrieved from [http://www.atimes.com/atimes/Southeast\\_Asia/MI09Ae03.html](http://www.atimes.com/atimes/Southeast_Asia/MI09Ae03.html)
- Cornell University. (2011). *Faculty & Students*. Retrieved from <http://www.cornell.edu/visiting/qatar/faculty.cfm>
- Cornell University. (2011). *Qatar Campus*. Retrieved from <http://www.cornell.edu/visiting/qatar/index.cfm>
- Daley, S. (2011, April 15). NYU in the UAE. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.nytimes.com/2011/04/17/education/edlife/edl-17abudhabit.html?pagewanted=all>
- Dotolo, L.G., & Horgan, T. (2009). A cooperative proposal to Mr. Obama: higher education consortia is [sic] an important solution to the present and future success of academia. *Consortia Magazine*, Retrieved from <http://www.highereducationconsortia.com/Spring2009/Spring2009HEConsortiaTodayTwo.html>
- Fairbanks, A.M. (2011, March 31). Yale finalizes plans to open college in Singapore. *The Huffington Post*. Retrieved from [http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2011/03/31/yale-singapore-university\\_n\\_842845.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2011/03/31/yale-singapore-university_n_842845.html)
- Fischer, K. (2011, March 31). Yale and National U. of Singapore set plans for new liberal-arts college. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/YaleNational-U-of/126943/>
- Fischer, K. (2010). Overseas branch campuses should start small, assess demand, proceed carefully. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/Overseas-Branches-Should-Start/124416/>
- Foderaro, L. W. (2010, September 13). Yale plans to create a college in Singapore. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.nytimes.com/2010/09/14/nyregion/14yale.html>
- Foderaro, L. W. (2010, June 20). NYU scours globe for top students. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.nytimes.com/2010/06/21/education/21nyu.html?pagewanted=print>
- Geiser, S. & Santelices, M. (2007). "Validity of high-school grades in predicting

- student success beyond the freshman year: High-school record vs. standardized tests as indicators of four-year college outcomes.” Center for Studies in Higher Education, UC Berkeley: <http://cshe.berkeley.edu/publications/publications.php?id=265>
- Griswold, A. & Henderson, D. (2011, April 12). Singapore campus takes shape. *Yale Daily News*. Retrieved from <http://www.yaledailynews.com/news/2011/apr/12/singapore-campus-takes-shape/>
- Hacker, A. & Dreifus, C. (2010, September 20). The trouble with going global. *Newsweek*. Retrieved from [www.newsweek.com/2010/09/13/the-trouble-with-global-education.html](http://www.newsweek.com/2010/09/13/the-trouble-with-global-education.html)
- Hernandez, S. (2007, November 13). At UAE campus, gay rights not a given. *Washington Square News*. Retrieved from <http://nyunews.com/2007/11/13/14/>
- Holden, N. (2011, November 18). Building hands on instructors: Hobby shop makes MIT’s manus tangible for visiting Singapore professors. *MIT NEWS*. Retrieved from <http://web.mit.edu/newsoffice/2011/sutd-visit-hobby-shop.html>
- Human Rights Watch. (2011). *UAE: Sorbonne should condemn lecturer’s prosecution*. Retrieved from <http://www.hrw.org/news/2011/10/13/uae-sorbonne-should-condemn-lecturer-s-prosecution>
- Jackson, J.M. (2010, July 8). Abu Dhabi’s liberal arts island. *Inside Higher Ed*. Retrieved from <http://www.insidehighered.com/views/2010/07/08/jackson>
- Jaschik, S. (2011, September 10). Carnegie Mellon in Rwanda. *Inside Higher Ed*. Retrieved from [http://www.insidehighered.com/news/2011/09/19/amid\\_protests\\_carnegie\\_mellon\\_moves\\_to\\_open\\_branch\\_campus\\_in\\_rwanda](http://www.insidehighered.com/news/2011/09/19/amid_protests_carnegie_mellon_moves_to_open_branch_campus_in_rwanda)
- Kaplan, T. & Podaras, E. (2007, October 26). As Yale develops plans, NYU Abu Dhabi campus in works. *The Yale Daily News*. Retrieved from <http://www.yaledailynews.com/news/2007/oct/26/as-yale-develops-plans-nyu-abu-dhabi-campus-in/>
- Kim, K. (2011, December 2). Council approves DKU MMS degree. *The Duke Chronicle*. Retrieved from <http://dukechronicle.com/article/council-approves-dku-mms-degree>

- Krieger, Z. (2008, April 13). The emir on NYU. *New York Magazine*. Retrieved from <http://nymag.com/news/features/46000/>
- Krieger, Z. (2007a, November 7). Northwestern U. to open journalism school in Qatar. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/Northwestern-U-to-Open/39906>
- Krieger, Z. (2007b, October 26). New York U. plans to open a 'comprehensive liberal-arts campus' in Abu Dhabi. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/New-York-U-Plans-to-Open-a/19465/>
- Krieger, Z. (2007c, October 15). New York U. says it will open a 'comprehensive liberal arts campus' in Abu Dhabi. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/Abu-Dhabi-Will-Get-Its-Own-NYU/89/>
- Lane, J. E. (2011). Importing private higher education: International branch campuses. *Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis: Research and Practice*, 13(4), 367-381.
- Lewin, T. (2008, February 10). U.S. universities rush to set up outposts abroad. *New York Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.nytimes.com/2008/02/10/education/10global.html?pagewanted=all>
- Mangan, K.S. (2008, May 16). Cornell graduates the inaugural class and its medical college in Qatar. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/Cornell-Graduates-Its/765>
- Mangan, K.S. (2001, April 20). Cornell's medical school will open degree-granting branch in Qatar. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/Cornell-s-Medical-School-Will/24655>
- McCartney, J.S. (2007, June 29). A roadmap for creating the global campus. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/A-Roadmap-for-Creating-the/10279>
- McMurtrie, B. (2008, November 10). Overseas programs increasingly sharing risk with host countries. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/Overseas-Programs-Increasin/19693/>
- Miller, C.L. (2011, May 1). Yale in Singapore: Lost in translation. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/Yale-in-Singapore-Lost-in/127277/>

- Mills, A. (2010a, July 6). Low enrollment led MSU to cancel most programs in Dubai. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/Low-Enrollment-Led-Michigan/66151/>
- Mills, A. (2010b, June 21). New York U's Abu Dhabi campus to start with academically elite class. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/New-York-Us-Abu-Dhabi-Campus/66005>
- Mills, A. (2010c, April 16). 'Tabula rasa' attracts NYU professors to new Abu Dhabi campus. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/Tabula-Rasa-Attracts-NYU/65019/>
- Mills, A. (2010d, April 11). NYU populates a liberal-arts outpost in the Middle East. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/NYU-Populates-a-Liberal-Arts/65018/>
- Mills, A. (2009, July 10). Students at some American branch campuses in Qatar have lower SATs. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/Students-at-Some-American/47868>
- Mills, A. (2009, March 6). Failure of George Mason U.'s Persian Gulf campus sparks concern about overseas ventures. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/Failure-of-George-Mason-Us/1566>
- Minearo, R. (2009). Academic consortia. *Consortia Magazine*, Retrieved from <http://www.highereducationconsortia.com/Summer2009/Summer2009CooperationUpClose.html>
- Muzzin, S.T. (2011, March 31). NUS and Yale to create Singapore's first liberal arts college. *Yale News*. Retrieved from <http://news.yale.edu/2011/03/31/nus-and-yale-create-singapore-s-first-liberal-arts-college>
- n.a. (2011, November 30). [Web log message]. Bard College acquires liberal arts institution in Berlin. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/blogs/ticker/bard-college-acquires-liberal-arts-institution-in-berlin/38615>
- Northwestern University in Qatar. (2011). *Academics*. Retrieved from <http://www.qatar.northwestern.edu/academics/index.html>
- Northwestern University in Qatar. (2011). *Admissions*. Retrieved from <http://www.qatar.northwestern.edu/admissions/index.html>

- Northwestern University in Qatar. (2011). *General FAQ's*. Retrieved from <http://www.qatar.northwestern.edu/admissions/frequently-asked-questions/general-faqs.html>
- NYU. (2007). *NYU to open campus in Abu Dhabi*. Retrieved from [http://www.nyu.edu/about/news-publications/news/2007/10/12/nyu\\_to\\_open\\_campus\\_in\\_abu.html](http://www.nyu.edu/about/news-publications/news/2007/10/12/nyu_to_open_campus_in_abu.html)
- NYUAD. (2011). *Benefits for Abu Dhabi employees*. Retrieved from <http://nyuad.nyu.edu/human.resources/benefits.html>
- NYUAD. (2011). *Message from the Chancellor*. Retrieved from <http://nyuad.nyu.edu/about/message.html>
- NYUAD. (2011). *NYU Abu Dhabi academic programs*. Retrieved from <http://nyuad.nyu.edu/academics/index.html>
- NYUAD. (2011). *NYU Abu Dhabi news*. Retrieved from <http://nyuad.nyu.edu/news.events/news.html>
- NYUAD. (2011). *NYU Abu Dhabi undergraduate admissions*. Retrieved from <http://nyuad.nyu.edu/admissions/index.html>
- NYUAD. (2011). *NYU Abu Dhabi welcomes class of 2015*. Retrieved from <http://nyuad.nyu.edu/news.events/press-release-2015-class.html>
- NYUAD. (2011). *Sheikh Mohamed bin Zayed scholars program*. Retrieved from <http://nyuad.nyu.edu/smsp/>
- NYUAD. (2011). *Why work at NYU Abu Dhabi?* Retrieved from <http://nyuad.nyu.edu/human.resources/>
- NYU Law. (2011). *About*. Retrieved from <http://www.law.nyu.edu/about/index.htm>
- NYU Law. (2011). *Academics*. Retrieved from [www.law.nyu.edu/academics/index.htm](http://www.law.nyu.edu/academics/index.htm)
- NYU Law. (2011). *Admissions*. Retrieved from <http://www.law.nyu.edu/admissions/index.htm>
- NYU Law. (2011). *Faculty*. Retrieved from <http://www.law.nyu.edu/faculty/index.htm>
- Redden, E. (2010, October 12). *Habitus for academic freedom*. *Inside Higher Ed*. Retrieved from <http://www.insidehighered.com/news/2010/10/12/Singapore>

- Redden, E. (2010, June 21). The world's honors college? *Inside Higher Ed*. Retrieved from <http://www.insidehighered.com/news/2010/06/21/nyu>
- Redden, E. (2008, September 30). 'Emblematic' leader for NYU's Abu Dhabi campus. *Inside Higher Ed*. <http://www.insidehighered.com/news/2008/09/30/abudhabi>
- Redding, A.B. (August 2011). Collaborations among tertiary institutions: State of the art. (Good Work Project Report Series No. 75). Cambridge, MA: Harvard University, Project Zero.
- Resmovits, J. (2010, June 21). NYU Abu Dhabi accepts first class. *The Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved from <http://online.wsj.com/article/SB10001424052748704638504575319182083037018>
- Reyes, B. (2010, September 9). Five College plan to increase cooperation. *The Amherst Student*. Retrieved from <http://amherststudent.amherst.edu/current/news/view.php?year=2010-2011&issue=04&ion=news&article=03>
- Schwartz, J. (2010, April 16). Finding a gay-friendly campus. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/18/education/edlife/18guidance-t.html?pagewanted=all>
- SFS-Qatar. (2011). *About*. Retrieved from <http://qatar.sfs.georgetown.edu/about/>
- SFS-Qatar. (2011). *Academics*. Retrieved from <http://qatar.sfs.georgetown.edu/academics/>
- SFS-Qatar. (2011). *A global university*. Retrieved from <http://qatar.sfs.georgetown.edu/about/global/>
- SFS-Qatar. (2008). *Four professors from Georgetown University's Washington campus to join SFS-Qatar*. Retrieved from <http://qatar.sfs.georgetown.edu/112580.html>
- Shea, C. (2011, May 4). Yale's Singapore branch. *Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved from <http://blogs.wsj.com/ideas-market/2011/05/04/yales-singapore-branch/>
- Souccar, M.K. (2010, June 21). NYU's first Abu Dhabi class rivals the Ivies. *Crain's New York Business*. Retrieved from <http://www.crainsnewyork.com/article/20100620/SUB/306209973>
- SUTD. (2011). *Campus life*. Retrieved from [http://www.sutd.edu.sg/campus\\_life.aspx](http://www.sutd.edu.sg/campus_life.aspx)
- SUTD. (2011). *MIT collaboration*. Retrieved from [http://www.sutd.edu.sg/mit\\_collaboration.aspx](http://www.sutd.edu.sg/mit_collaboration.aspx)

- SUTD. (2011). *Press Releases*. Retrieved from [http://www.sutd.edu.sg/pressrelease.aspx?news\\_type=press%20release](http://www.sutd.edu.sg/pressrelease.aspx?news_type=press%20release)
- Taley, M. (2011, December 8). Rights of gays to figure in U.S. foreign aid. *The Sydney Morning Herald*. Retrieved from <http://www.smh.com.au/world/rights-of-gays-to-figure-in-us-foreign-aid-20111207-1oj4l.html>
- TEN Education. (2011). *Qatar Education City*. Retrieved from [http://education.theemiratesnetwork.com/zones/qatar\\_education\\_city.php](http://education.theemiratesnetwork.com/zones/qatar_education_city.php)
- Weinberger, E. (2011, November 11). Ivy League-Asia move is paid for but will still cost. *The Australian*. Retrieved from <http://www.theaustralian.com.au/higher-education/opinion/harvard-asia-move-is-paid-for-but-will-still-cost/story-e6frgcko-1226195771379>
- Weinberger, E. (2011, October 27). Why is Yale outsourcing a campus to Singapore? *The Atlantic*. Retrieved from <http://www.theatlantic.com/national/archive/2011/10/why-is-yale-outsourcing-a-campus-to-singapore/247463/>
- Wheeler, D.L. (2008, November 10). Conference speakers mull risks and rewards of overseas campuses. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/Conference-Speakers-Mull-Risks/113937/>
- Wildavsky, B. (2010a, August 26). University globalization is here to stay. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/article/University-Globalization-Is/124148/>
- Wildavsky, B. (2010b, July 8). How much do branch campuses really matter? *The Chronicle of Higher Education*. Retrieved from <http://chronicle.com/blogs/worldwise/how-much-do-branch-campus-really-matter/25361>
- Wildavsky, B. *The great brain race: How global universities are reshaping the world*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2010c.
- Yale NUS College. (2011). *Curriculum*. Retrieved from <http://www.ync.nus.edu.sg/Curriculum.html>
- Yale NUS College. (2011). *FAQs*. Retrieved from <http://www.ync.nus.edu.sg/FAQs.html>
- Yale NUS College. (2011). *Learning at Yale-NUS College*. Retrieved from <http://www.ync.nus.edu.sg/Learning-at-Yale-NUS.html>

Yale NUS College. (2011). *Objective*. Retrieved from

<http://www.ync.nus.edu.sg/Objective.html>

Yale NUS College. (2011). *Prospective Faculty*. Retrieved from

<http://www.ync.nus.edu.sg/Prospective-Faculty.html>

Yale NUS College. (2011). *Vision*. Retrieved from

<http://www.ync.nus.edu.sg/Vision.html>

*Note: All URLs cited above were verified on December 9, 2011.*



## Appendix

	<b>Comprehensive Consortia (CC)</b> <i>Must meet criteria from <u>all 6</u> categories</i>	<b>Focused Collaborations (FC)</b> <i>Must meet criteria from <u>at least 2</u> categories</i>
(1) Academic Integration	<b>Must</b> contain <u>2 or more</u> of the following: - expanded curricular options - joint programs/certificates - intercollegiate departments	<b>May</b> contain some elements of academic integration, but not required
(2) Shared Academic Resources	<b>Must</b> contain a joint library system  <b>May</b> contain at least one other shared academic facility (i.e. art museum, research lab)  <b>May</b> also contain shared equipment to facilitate academic research (ex. MRI)	<b>May</b> contain a joint library system, shared academic facility, and/or equipment that facilitates academic research, but not required
(3) Logistical Support Services (Academic)	<b>Must</b> operate a consolidated database of courses offered at the member institutions  <b>Must</b> have a protocol for cross-registration  <b>Must</b> offer full transfer of credits among institutions <b>and</b> grades must appear on the home institution transcript  <b>Must</b> make efforts to synchronize calendars	<b>May</b> operate some logistical support services, but not required
(4) Logistical Support Services (Student Life)	<b>Must</b> offer free shuttle service that provides full access to academic and extra-curricular options (if necessary due to distance)  <b>Must</b> offer dining options on multiple campuses (though this may be limited to certain hours or dining facilities)  <b>May</b> also offer joint services and facilities (i.e. health center, campus mail)  <u>At least one</u> member institution <b>must</b> be involved in overseeing these operations.	Transportation is: (1) not required for use of the consortium, (2) outsourced to another company, or (3) arranged by students, at their expense
(5) Integrated Campus Life	<b>Must</b> offer <u>at least 3</u> of the following: - combined extra-curricular groups - joint student council - shared intramural sports - joint publications (i.e. student paper) - shared calendar showcasing events and performances on multiple campuses	<b>May</b> offer some elements of integrated campus life, but not required.
(6) Organization	<b>Must be</b> run by <b>either</b> a Board of Directors/Trustees <b>or</b> have <u>at least one</u> joint operations committee  <b>May be</b> incorporated as a non-profit organization  <b>May</b> also have a shared operating budget	<b>Is not</b> run by a Board and has no joint operations committee  <b>Is not</b> incorporated as a non-profit organization  <b>May</b> have a shared operating budget

### Features of Comprehensive Consortia versus Focused Collaborations