

Arsenic in the Bangladesh soils related to physiographic region, paddy management, and micro- and macro- element status

Chowdhury , M. T. A., Deacon, C. M., Jones , G. D., Huq, S. M. I., Williams, P. N., Hoque , A. F. M. M., ... Meharg, A. A. (2017). Arsenic in the Bangladesh soils related to physiographic region, paddy management, and micro- and macro- element status. DOI: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.11.191

Published in:

Science of The Total Environment

Document Version:

Peer reviewed version

Queen's University Belfast - Research Portal:

[Link to publication record in Queen's University Belfast Research Portal](https://pure.qub.ac.uk/portal/en/publications/arsenic-in-the-bangladesh-soils-related-to-physiographic-region-paddy-management-and-micro-and-macro-element-status(5914f2e3-bab1-4752-bd55-4deb3299a0a7).html)

Publisher rights

© 2017 Elsevier Ltd. This manuscript version is made available under the CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 license http://creativecommons.org/licenses/bync-nd/4.0/ which permits distribution and reproduction for non-commercial purposes, provided the author and source are cited.

General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Queen's University Belfast Research Portal is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

The Research Portal is Queen's institutional repository that provides access to Queen's research output. Every effort has been made to ensure that content in the Research Portal does not infringe any person's rights, or applicable UK laws. If you discover content in the Research Portal that you believe breaches copyright or violates any law, please contact openaccess@qub.ac.uk.

2 **management, and mirco- and macro- elemental status**

- 3
- 4 M. Tanvir A. Chowdhury^{1, 2}, Claire M. Deacon¹, Gerrad D. Jones³, S.M. Imamul Huq², Paul N.
- 5 Williams⁴, A.F.M. Manzurul Hoque⁵, Lenny H.E. Winkel⁶, Adam H. Price¹, Gareth J. Norton^{1*},
- 6 and Andrew A. Meharg^{4*}
- 7
- 8
- 9 ¹ Institute of Biological and Environmental Sciences, University of Aberdeen, Cruickshank
- 10 Building, St. Machar Drive, Aberdeen, AB24 3UU, U.K.
- ² Department of Soil, Water and Environment, University of Dhaka, Dhaka-1000, Bangladesh
- 12 ³ Eawag: Swiss Federal Institute of Aquatic Science and Technology, Ueberlandstrasse 133,
- 13 P.O. Box 611, CH-8600 Duebendorf, Switzerland
- ⁴ Institute for Global Food Security, Queen's University Belfast, David Keir Building, Malone
- 15 Road, Belfast BT9 5BN, Northern Ireland, U.K.
- 16 ⁵ Soil Resource Development Institute (SRDI), Khamar Bari Road, Dhaka 1215, Bangladesh
- 17 ⁶ Swiss Federal Institute of Technology (ETH), Institute of Biogeochemistry and Pollutant
- 18 Dynamics, ETH Zurich, CH-8092 Zurich, Switzerland
- 19
- 20 Corresponding authors

***** 21 **Andrew A. Meharg**

- 22 Tel: +44 (0)28 9097 5413; fax: +44 (0) 28 90976513; e-mail: aa.meharg@qub.ac.uk
- 23
- 24 ***** Gareth J. Norton
- 25 Tel: 44 (0)1224272409; fax: +44 (0)1224272396; e-mail: g.norton@abdn.ac.uk
- 26

27 **Abstract**

28

29 While the impact of arsenic in irrigated agriculture has become a major environmental 30 concern in Bangladesh, to date there is still a limited understanding of arsenic in 31 Bangladeshi paddy soils at a landscape scale. A soil survey was conducted across ten 32 different physiographic regions of Bangladesh, which encompassed six types of 33 geomorphology (Bil, Brahmaputra floodplain, Ganges floodplain, Meghna floodplain, 34 Karatoya-Bangali floodplain and Pleistocene terrace). A total of 1209 paddy soils and 235 35 matched non-paddy soils were collected. The source of irrigation water (groundwater and 36 surface water) was also recorded. The concentrations of arsenic and sixteen other elements 37 were determined in the soil samples. The concentration of arsenic was higher in paddy soils 38 compared to non-paddy soils, with soils irrigated with groundwater being higher in arsenic 39 than those irrigated with surface water. There was a clear difference between the Holocene 40 floodplains and the Pleistocene terrace, with Holocene floodplains being higher in arsenic 41 and other elements. The results suggest that arsenic is most likely associated with less well 42 weathered/leached soils, suggesting it is either due to the geological newness of Holocene 43 sediments or differences between the sources of sediments, which gives rise to the arsenic 44 problems in Bangladeshi soils.

- 45
- 46 **Introduction**

47

48 Rice is elevated in inorganic arsenic compared to all other dietary staples (Meharg et al., 49 2009). Flooding of soils, as in paddy cultivation, leads to the mobilization of natural and 50 anthropogenic inorganic arsenic stores in iron oxyhydroxide phases, caused by both the

51 reduction of arsenic and iron under negative soil redox potentials (Meharg and Zhao, 2012). 52 Paddy soils are managed through tilling, fertilization, and surface water and groundwater 53 irrigation, with the latter often elevated in inorganic arsenic throughout large areas of 54 Bangladesh (Huq et al., 2003; Meharg and Rahman, 2003; Roberts et al., 2007; Lu et al., 55 2009). Furthermore, arsenic can undergo a number of processes within paddy soils that 56 leads to its subsequent loss such as partitioning to monsoonal floodwaters (Dittmar et al., 57 2007; Saha and Ali, 2007; Dittmar et al., 2010; Roberts et al., 2010), leaching to sub-surfaces 58 (McLaren et al., 2006; Khan et al., 2009; Heikens et al., 2007), and biovolatilization to arsines 59 (Mestrot et al., 2011). Thus, the arsenic loading of any particular paddy soil will be due to 60 geological origin and the subsequent weathering of constituent minerals, and the 61 agronomic management of that sediment (Lu et al., 2009).

62

63 Bangladesh has three major geomorphological units (Brammer, 1996; Huq and Shoaib, 64 2013). These are hill, terrace, and floodplain areas. The hills occupy twelve percent of the 65 country's land area. The uplifted terrace areas are of Pleistocene age and occupy eight 66 percent of the country. The floodplains are of Holocene age and occupy eighty percent of 67 the country. The Holocene floodplains include the piedmont plains, river floodplains, tidal 68 floodplains, and estuarine floodplains. These geomorphological units are related to the 69 parent geological formations, however, they are also characterized by land topography and 70 age of the soil formation through sediment deposition over time (Brammer, 1996).

71

72 To understand and characterise the physiography of the geomorphological areas,

73 Bangladesh is divided into twenty main physiographic regions (FAO/UNDP, 1988). This

74 physiographic classification was based on the parent material in which individual soil types

75 were formed and the landscape on which the soils were developed (FAO/UNDP, 1988). 76 Therefore, the physiographic regions have differences in geology, relief, drainage, age of 77 land formation and pattern of sedimentary deposition. These differences ultimately 78 influence the nature and properties of the soils in the different physiographic regions.

79

80 The biogeochemical cycling of arsenic in soils is strongly affected by other elements. Iron is 81 central due to the strong association between insoluble arsenate and iron(III) oxyhydroxides 82 under aerobic conditions and with the mobilization of iron (II) and arsenite under reducing 83 (that is, paddy) conditions (BGS/DPHE, 2001; Smedley and Kinniburgh, 2002; McArthur et 84 al., 2004; Polizzotto et al., 2005). Manganese oxides also have a similar redox chemistry to 85 iron and are strongly implicated in arsenic immobilization/mobilization during oxic/anoxic 86 cycling of paddy sediments (Smedley and Kinniburgh, 2002; Hasan et al., 2007). Arsenate is 87 a phosphate analogue and, thus, key to competition for binding sites within the soil solid 88 phase, as well as having similar biogeochemical cycling under oxic conditions (Adriano, 89 2001; Meharg and Hartley-Whitaker, 2002; Smith et al., 2002; Lambkin and Alloway, 2003; 90 Stachowicz et al., 2008). Calcium and magnesium immobilize arsenate under oxic 91 conditions, and could also have a role in the biogeochemical cycling of arsenic at a 92 landscape level (Smith et al., 2002; Stachowicz et al., 2008; Fakhreddine et al., 2015). 93

94 Here, we wanted to understand the relationship between soil arsenic and paddy 95 management practice with respect to arsenic loadings in Bangladeshi soils. Cultivation zones 96 of paddy soils (n = 1209) across ten physiographic regions of Bangladesh, from latitude 97 22°06' to 24°53', and longitude 88°20' to 90°59' were sampled and analysed for arsenic and 98 a suite of sixteen other elements (aluminium, calcium, cadmium, cobalt, chromium, copper,

99 iron, lead, magnesium, manganese, molybdenum, nickel, phosphorus, potassium, sodium 100 and zinc). For a subset of soils ($n = 235$), paired paddy and adjacent non-paddy soils were 101 also collected and characterised. The data were used to address four specific objectives: to 102 assess the impact that geomorphological differences have on soil arsenic at a landscape 103 level; to understand the relationship between the concentration of arsenic in the paddy 104 soils with the concertation of arsenic within the underlying groundwater; to determine if 105 the source of irrigation water impacts on soil arsenic concentrations; and by examining the 106 concentrations of arsenic and other elements in paddy and non-paddy soils, we aimed to 107 understand the impacts that paddy management has on soil elemental concentrations.

108 **Materials and Methods**

109 **Collection of Soil Samples**

110 A total of 1444 soil samples (topsoil, 0-15 cm from the surface) from paddy fields (n = 1209) 111 and neighboring non-paddy areas ($n = 235$) were collected from 10 different physiographic 112 regions within 57 sub-districts (upazilas) from 17 districts of Bangladesh (Table S1). Non-113 paddy soils were defined as the soils where paddy cultivation and groundwater irrigation 114 had not been practiced within known memory of the farmers. The physiographic regions 115 from where the soil samples were collected included Arial Bil (n = 42 paddy and 10 non-116 paddy soils), Brahmaputra Floodplain (n = 207 paddy and 64 non-paddy soils), Ganges River 117 Floodplain (n = 261 paddy and 58 non-paddy soils), Ganges Tidal Floodplain (n = 47 paddy 118 and 11 non-paddy soils), Gopalganj-Khulna Bils (n = 63 paddy and 8 non-paddy soils), 119 Karatoya-Bangali floodplain (n = 15 paddy soils only), Meghna Estuarine Floodplain (n = 204 120 paddy and 28 non-paddy soils), and Meghna River Floodplain (n = 184 paddy and 26 non-121 paddy soils) from Holocene floodplains, and Barind Tract (n = 68 paddy and 15 non-paddy 122 soils) and Madhupur Tract (n = 118 paddy and 15 non-paddy soils) from Pleistocene 123 terraces. The source of irrigation water for the paddy soils was recorded (groundwater, $n =$ 124 904; surface water, $n = 281$; both, $n = 24$). Only the soils that had a non-mixed irrigation 125 source were used for analyzing the impact of irrigation type on soil arsenic.

126

127 Sample Processing and Preparation for Analysis

128 The soil samples were air-dried and, prior to analysis, the samples were oven dried (80°C \pm 129 5°C for 48 h), and finely ground using a ball-mill. The soil digestion procedure followed was 130 described by Adomako et al. (2009). Briefly, 0.1 g of soil was placed in a glass digest tube 131 and 2.5 ml of concentrated nitric acid was added to the tube and left overnight for pre-

132 digestion. Then, 2.5 ml of hydrogen peroxide was added to the sample just before digesting 133 and the sample was heated on the block digester for 1 h at 80°C, for 1 h at 100°C, for 1 h at 134 120°C and, finally, at 140°C for 3 h until the solution was clear. Once cooled, the digested 135 soil samples were transferred into 15 ml polypropylene tubes and each glass tube was 136 thoroughly rinsed 3 times with ultrapure deionized water (Milli-Q 18.2 M Ω). The volumes 137 were made up to 15 ml mark using the same water. To obtain the appropriate dilution for 138 analysis by inductively coupled plasma-mass spectrometer (ICP-MS) and microwave plasma-139 atomic emission spectrometer (MP-AES), the samples were further diluted to 1 in 10. 140 Calibration standards were prepared from 1000 mg/l multi-element stock solutions (SPEX 141 CertiPrep Reference Material).

142

143 *Chemical Analysis*

144 The pH of the soil samples were measured at a soil:water (deionized water) ratio of 1:2.5 145 (Huq and Alam, 2005). The ICP-MS (Agilent Technologies 7500c, Japan) was used to 146 determine the total concentrations of arsenic, cadmium, cobalt, copper, chromium, lead, 147 manganese, molybdenum, nickel, phosphorus, and zinc in the soil digests and the MP-AES 148 (Agilent Technologies 4100 Series, USA) was used to determine the total concentrations of 149 aluminum, calcium, iron, magnesium, potassium, and sodium in the soil digests. In each 150 batch of digestion, ten percent of the total number of samples were selected randomly for 151 duplicate analysis (n =172). Every batch of samples consisted of 33 randomly selected soil 152 samples, 4 duplicates, 1 blank, and 1 soil CRM (certified reference material) (NCS ZC 73007, 153 China National Analysis Center for Iron and Steel), which were randomized prior to 154 analytical analysis.

155

156 *Soil Mapping*

- 157 The data used to perform the mapping of arsenic in paddy soils across Bangladesh included
- 158 the 1209 paddy soils analyzed in this study as well as 395 soil arsenic concentrations from
- 159 previous studies (Williams et al., 2011; Lu et al., 2009; Islam et al., 2012). ArcGIS v.10.2 (Esri)
- 160 was used to create and analyze groundwater and soil arsenic map. The groundwater arsenic
- 161 data were obtained from BGS/DPHE (2001).

162

163 *Statistical Analysis*

- 164 All statistical analyses were performed using the statistical software Minitab v.16 (State
- 165 College PA) and SigmaPlot v.13 (Systat Software Inc., CA). The data were checked for
- 166 normality and were transformed prior to statistical analysis where appropriate.

168 **Results and Discussion**

169 In order to verify the accuracy of the analytical methods as well as the quality of the data, 170 percent recoveries of the elements in CRM and relationships between the element 171 concentrations in the samples and in the duplicates (ten percent of the total number of 172 samples) were calculated and the average recoveries (in percentages) of the elements in the 173 CRMs and the results of the duplicate analysis are presented in Table S2 and Fig. S1, 174 respectively.

175

176 To develop a soil arsenic map of the sampled soils, all paddy soil sampling locations within a 177 10 km^2 grid were averaged (Fig. 1). Individual locations and sampling densities are shown in 178 Fig. S2. There is a clear north/south divide in paddy arsenic concentrations with much higher 179 concentrations, in general, in the south. The paddy soil arsenic levels reported here (1-88 180 mg/kg, average = 8 mg/kg) are within the ranges reported for previous Bangladesh paddy 181 soil surveys (Huq et al., 2003; Meharg and Rahman, 2003; Lu et al., 2009; Williams et al., 182 2011; Huq and Shoaib, 2013). The pattern of paddy soil concentrations relate well to 183 groundwater measurements (BGS-DPHE, 2001), again with groundwater elevated in the 184 south, excluding the coastal zone. The exception is the cluster of sampling points in the 185 extreme south-east that have a low soil arsenic concentration and the highest groundwater 186 arsenic concentration. This is probably due to the source of irrigation water used in this 187 south-east region, where the main irrigation method is from surface water rather than 188 groundwater (Fig. S3). When comparing the arsenic concentrations in the paddies that have 189 been irrigated with groundwater and surface water across Bangladesh, there was a 190 significant difference (ANOVA F = 26.23, p < 0.001) in the soil arsenic concentration (Fig. 2). 191 Soils irrigated with groundwater had on average an arsenic concentration of 8.5 mg/kg

192 which was significantly higher than the soils irrigated with surface water, which had an 193 average arsenic concentration of 5.7 mg/kg. For the individual physiographic regions, seven 194 of the regions had enough groundwater and surface water irrigated soils (>10) to do 195 comparisons between irrigation method and soil arsenic. There was no significant difference 196 in soil arsenic between the groundwater irrigation and surface water irrigation for four of 197 the seven physiographic regions. For the three other physiographic regions, significant 198 differences in arsenic concentrations were observed between the soils irrigated with 199 groundwater (GWI) and surface water (SWI), with higher arsenic concentrations in the 200 groundwater irrigated soils than in the surface water irrigated soils (for Ganges Tidal 201 Floodplain, $^{ANOVA}F = 5.97$, p < 0.05, n = 28 (GWI) and 20 (SWI), mean = 14.6 mg/kg (GWI) and 202 8.6 mg/kg (SWI); for Meghna Estuarine Floodplain, $^{ANOVA}F = 14.84$, p < 0.001, n = 69 (GWI) 203 and 111 (SWI), mean = 8 mg/kg (GWI) and 3.9 mg/kg (SWI); for Meghna River Floodplain, 204 ANSVAF = 62.06, p < 0.001, n = 130 (GWI) and 54 (SWI), mean = 9.4 mg/kg (GWI) and 4.7 205 mg/kg (SWI)). As the samples were collected from different geomorphic regions, these 206 results could be confounded by the underlying geomorphology. However, difference in soil 207 arsenic due to different irrigation techniques appears to be a trend across the country.

208

209 Soil arsenic concentrations across ten different physiographic regions of Bangladesh were 210 compared to see how the concentrations varied between the different regions. Highly 211 significant variations $\binom{ANOVA}{F}$ = 75.28, p < 0.001 and $\binom{ANOVA}{F}$ = 6.33, p < 0.001, respectively for 212 paddy and non-paddy soils) were observed in soil arsenic concentrations among the ten 213 physiographic regions (Fig. 3 for paddy soils, fig. S4 for non-paddy soils). The Madhupur 214 Tract and the Barind Tract were found to have the lowest arsenic concentrations (0.6-10.3, 215 mean = 3.4 mg/kg , and 0.8-23.4, mean = 2.8 mg/kg , respectively) in the paddy soils, whereas

216 the Ganges River Floodplain (1.6-68, mean = 11 mg/kg) and the Ganges Tidal Floodplain (3-217 42.5, mean = 13.1 mg/kg) had the highest soil arsenic concentrations. Martin et al. (2014, 218 2015) reported higher concentrations and mobilization of arsenic in the Ganges floodplain 219 soils, due to enhanced influence of the pedoenvironmental properties in the region, 220 compared to that in the Meghna floodplain soils suggesting a complex interaction between 221 soil properties, climate and agricultural management practices in the paddy soil 222 environment in Bangladesh. In the present study the Ganges floodplain soils were classified 223 as Ganges River Floodplain and Ganges Tidal Floodplain, and the Meghna floodplain soils 224 were classified as Meghna River Floodplain and Meghna Estuarine Floodplain, while no 225 significant difference in arsenic concentrations was observed between Ganges River 226 Floodplain and Meghna River Floodplain soils (Fig. 3). Similar observations were also 227 reported for groundwater arsenic concentrations across the different geomorphological 228 units of the country (BGS/DPHE, 2001; Ravenscroft, 2001).

229

230 At a gross level, high and low groundwater arsenic concentration regions are known to be 231 based on physiographic units, with low concentrations of arsenic in groundwaters in the 232 higher altitude Pleistocene terraces, and at high concentrations in Holocene floodplains 233 (BGS/DPHE, 2001; Smedley and Kinniburgh, 2002; Ahmed et al., 2004; Ravenscroft et al., 234 2005). The explanation for this is that Pleistocene sediments are more highly weathered and 235 leached of arsenic (Ravenscroft, 2001; Ravenscroft et al., 2005). A recent study on the 236 source of arsenic in the Holocene/ Pleistocene sediments from the Terai plain of Nepal (that 237 stratigraphically resemble Bangladeshi sediments) proposed a number of complex processes 238 which can explain the differences in arsenic concentration between Holocene and 239 Pleistocene sediments (Guillot et al., 2015). However, the river systems of Bangladesh

240 actively rework the landscape, giving lenses of soil remobilized and re-deposited,

241 interlayering Holocene and Pleistocene soils (BGS/DPHE, 2001; Polizzotto et al., 2005;

242 Meharg et al., 2006; Guillot et al., 2015). It is also known that differential loss of arsenic

243 occurs from groundwater irrigated paddy soils during the subsequent monsoonal floods

244 through partitioning of soil arsenic into overlaying floodwaters (Dittmar et al., 2007; Saha

245 and Ali, 2007; Dittmar et al., 2010; Roberts et al., 2010).

246

247 To determine the contribution of both natural soil arsenic concentrations and how paddy 248 management practices have contributed towards the current soil arsenic concentration, 249 paired non-paddy and paddy soils from major physiographic units of Bangladesh were 250 analysed (Fig. 4). There was a significant relationship for soil arsenic between the paddy and 251 non-paddy soils (^{linear regression} R^2 = 0.26, p < 0.001, n = 235) (Table S3). The slope of the overall 252 regression (that is, for all soils) is 1.6:1 for paddy:non-paddy, that is, a general increase in 253 arsenic of 60% in paddy cultivated soils. The soils form the floodplains and bils (low-lying 254 floodplain) followed the same pattern as the overall regression regardless if they are from 255 the Brahmaputra, Ganges or Meghna floodplains. Pleistocene terrace soils stand apart and 256 do not follow the overall regression, being both on average lower in arsenic, and having less 257 arsenic accumulation in paddy soils compared to Holocene floodplain soils. A paired t-test of 258 the matching paddy and non-paddy soils for arsenic concentrations within the Pleistocene 259 terrace soils indicated that these soils were significantly different ($p < 0.05$), with the non-260 paddy soils having elevated arsenic concentrations in comparison to the paddy soils, on an 261 average the non-paddy soils had 19 percent higher arsenic. This indicates that paddy 262 management is not increasing arsenic concentrations in these terrace soils. Pleistocene 263 terrace groundwaters are low in arsenic (Nickson et al., 2000; BGS/DPHE, 2001; Ahmed et

264 al., 2004; Ravenscroft et al., 2005), and thus, irrigation of Pleistocene terrace soils with 265 groundwaters should not lead to elevation in arsenic. As Holocene floodplain groundwaters 266 used in paddy irrigation are elevated in arsenic (Ali et al., 2003; Huq et al., 2003; Meharg 267 and Rahman, 2003; Saha and Ali, 2007; Lu et al., 2009; Huq and Shoaib, 2013), irrigation of 268 paddies with arsenic elevated groundwaters has the potential to lead to build-up in soil 269 arsenic. Arsenic in the non-paddy floodplain soils ranged from 1.8-24.3 mg/kg (mean \pm sd = 270 5.6 ± 2.9 , coefficient of variation = 0.52, n = 205), showing that arsenic is naturally variable 271 in Bangladeshi floodplain soils, with this range being 2-11 mg/kg (mean \pm sd = 3.9 \pm 1.8, 272 coefficient of variation = 0.46, n = 30) for the Pleistocene terrace soils. This emphasises the 273 inherent variability in natural soil arsenic, but that variability is less on Pleistocene terrace 274 soils. It is the Holocene soils/sediments that are exposed to the active reworking that 275 typifies a dynamic estuarine depositional environment (Sullivan and Aller, 1996; BGS/DPHE, 276 2001; Polizzotto et al., 2005; Meharg et al., 2006; Lu et al., 2009; Guillot et al., 2015), and 277 this may explain the variability. The inherent differences in the sediments of the floodplain 278 basins deposited from different sources over time, differences in arsenic accumulation/ 279 release equilibria related to the indigenous soil chemistry, residence time, depth and 280 duration of monsoon flood water, rate of particle dispersion, rate of leaching to subsurface, 281 and biovolatilization to the atmosphere can also contribute to explain the variability of 282 arsenic in the floodplain soils of Bangladesh (McLaren et al., 2006; Huq et al. 2008; Khan et 283 al., 2009; Roberts et al., 2010; Mestrot et al., 2011; Brammer, 2012; Martin et al., 2015). In 284 addition, the diversity and complexity of soils in the floodplains of Bangladesh are 285 influenced by variations in flooding depth within the inundation land types (Brammer 1997; 286 Huq et al., 2008), and hence, the accumulation and release of arsenic in soils vary within the

287 toposequence of a landscape due to variations in relief and soil properties, particularly iron, 288 clay and organic matter contents (Huq et al., 2008; Brammer 2012b; Ahmed et al. 2011). 289

290 Given that different geomorphic regions within the Holocene floodplain and Pleistocene 291 terrace regions follow the same general trends, with the main differences being between 292 floodplain and terrace, further analysis concentrated on floodplain versus terrace 293 comparisons. For the Pleistocene soils, comparing paddy and non-paddy relationships were 294 seen for all elements tested (Fig. 5 and Fig. S ?). However, it was only for arsenic that paddy 295 soils moved away from a 1:1 relationship, and groundwater is specifically only elevated in 296 arsenic to any significant extent (BGS/DPHE, 2001) with respect to levels already found in 297 soil, this is further evidence that it is groundwater irrigation *per se*, rather than other 298 aspects of field management, such as fertilizer and manuring practices, that perturb paddy 299 soil arsenic levels compared to non-paddy soils. The depletion in macro-nutrients in 300 Pleistocene sediments, particularly the alkaline earths calcium and magnesium, is most 301 apparent. Arsenic is also positively correlated ($r = 0.3$, $p < 0.001$) with soil pH (Fig. $\frac{S3?}{}$), with 302 low pH caused by low calcium and magnesium concentrations, cross confirming the 303 interplay of soils factors correlated with arsenic. Iron and phosphorus, two elements 304 intimately associated with arsenic's biogeochemical cycles (Fitz and Wenzel, 2002; Smith et 305 al., 2002; Heikens et al., 2007) are also highly depleted in Pleistocene soils. Non-essential 306 aluminium, cadmium, and lead also follow the same trend. It has been demonstrated that 307 pedogenic processes are responsible for the depletion of nutrients within soils over time 308 (Peltzer et al., 2010). Additionally, nutrients can be depleted in soils over shorter periods of 309 time (Chen et al., 2011). Soils that have been under continuous paddy cropping have been 310 shown to be depleted in key macronutrients in a very short period of time, for example,

311 calcium, magnesium, and sodium have been demonstrated to be rapidly lost in paddy soils 312 within 50 years of rice cultivation (Chen et al., 2011).

313

314 The wider characterization of Bangladeshi paddy soils, where elemental concentration is 315 plotted against corresponding arsenic concentration (Fig. 6), shows the same trend as the 316 paired paddy – non-paddy samples with Pleistocene depleted in all elements tested as 317 compared to Holocene, with those being high in arsenic also, in general, being high in the 318 corresponding elements (Table S4 and Fig. S?). This indicates again that Pleistocene soils are 319 less sustainable than Holocene with respect to their elemental nutritional qualities. It is off 320 concern that rice grains low in arsenic may be lower in nutrients as well. This subject area is 321 not well investigated except where it was shown that in a Bangladeshi context that on 322 arsenic enriched groundwater irrigated paddies that enhanced grain arsenic had, in general, 323 suppression of micro-nutrient levels in rice grain (Williams et al., 2009; Norton et al., 2010). 324 Unfortunately, there appears to be two global processes that regulate arsenic in grain, low 325 nutrient soils have low arsenic, and high arsenic inhibits grain nutrient levels. This warrants 326 further study in Bangladesh, namely by wide survey of grain versus soil associations for the 327 primary mineral nutrients of human health importance.

328

329 What is also apparent from the plots of elemental concentration against arsenic is that 330 Holocene soils have a much wider range of arsenic concentrations at higher concentrations 331 of the other elements compared to Pleistocene soils, that is, there is much greater inherent 332 variability in arsenic compared to other elements, specifically when other elemental 333 concentrations are high (Fig. 6). This is indicative again that agricultural management 334 practices specifically alter soil arsenic concentrations in Bangladesh. Groundwater for

335 irrigation is the primary source of arsenic to floodplain paddies that are cropped during the 336 dry season and is well known to elevate arsenic in paddy soils (Ali et al., 2003; Huq et al., 337 2003; Meharg et al., 2003; Dittmar et al., 2007; Saha and Ali, 2007; Huq, 2008; Lu et al., 338 2009; Ahmed et al., 2011; Huq and Shoaib, 2013). Paddy soils also have differential 339 interaction with monsoonal floods following dry season application of arsenic, with arsenic 340 capable of partitioning from soils into floodwaters (Dittmar et al., 2007; Saha and Ali, 2007; 341 Dittmar et al., 2010; Roberts et al., 2010). As this interaction between floodwater and soil 342 arsenic will be dependent on soil properties and on the dynamics of floodwater patterns for 343 any specific paddy soil, heterogeneity in arsenic removal is expected. As the paddy soils 344 have a higher arsenic concentration compared to the matched non-paddy soils, it would 345 indicate that this process of loss of arsenic form the soils by monsoonal floods is not 346 sufficient to reduce that arsenic concentration in the paddy soils back to the non-paddy soil 347 background concentration.

348

349 When Principle Components Analysis (PCA) is used to look at the interrelationships between 350 arsenic and other elements, the soils cluster into Pleistocene and Holocene using the first 351 and second components (Fig. 7, Table $S5$). There is some overlap in the middle but this is 352 expected perhaps as the large scales at which physiographic regions are drawn will miss the 353 fine detail on the ground. This is further confounded by the lensing of old soils over new and 354 with the sediment depositional environment also being highly active (Polizzotto et al., 2005; 355 Meharg et al., 2006; Lu et al., 2009; Guillot et al., 2015). The direction of the loadings for the 356 components shows that arsenic trends with most elements, and it is only cadmium and 357 molybdenum that generally differ. The PCA analysis gives further strength to the hypothesis 358 that arsenic is simply associated with less well weathered/ leached sediments, again

383 Adriano, D.C., 2001. *Trace Elements in the Terrestrial Environment*. Springer, New York.

- 384 Ahmed, K.M., Bhattacharya, P., Hasana, M.A., Akhter, S.H., Alam, S.M.M., Bhuyian, M.A.H.,
- 385 Imam, M.B., Khan, A.A., Sracek, O. 2004. Arsenic enrichment in groundwater of the alluvial
- 386 aquifers in Bangladesh: an overview. Appl. Geochem. 19, 181–200.
- 387 Ahmed, Z.U., Panaullah, G.M., DeGloria, S.D., Duxbury, J.M. 2011. Factors affecting paddy 388 soil arsenic concentration in Bangladesh: Prediction and uncertainty of geostatistical risk 389 mapping. Sci. Tot. Environ. 412–413, 324–335.
- 390 Ali, M.A., Badruzzaman, A.B.M., Jalil, M.A., Hossain, M.D., Ahmed, M.F., Masud, A.A.,
- 391 Kamruzzaman, M., Rahman, M.A. 2003. Arsenic in plant-soil environment in Bangladesh, in:
- 392 Ahmed, M.F., Ali, M.A., Adeel, Z. (Eds.), Fate of Arsenic in the Environment. ITN Centre:
- 393 Bangladesh University of Engineering and Technology, Dhaka, pp. 85–112.
- 394 Berg, M., Stengel, C., Trang, P.T.K., Viet, P.H., Sampson, M.L., Leng, M., Samreth, S.,
- 395 Fredericks, D. 2007. Magnitude of arsenic pollution in the Mekong and Red River Deltas —
- 396 Cambodia and Vietnam. Sci. Tot. Environ. 372, 413-425.
- 397 BGS/DPHE (British Geological Survey/ Bangladesh Department for Public Health
- 398 Engineering), 2001. Arsenic contamination of groundwater in Bangladesh, Final Report.
- 399 Kinniburgh, D.G. and Smedley, P.L. (Eds.), British Geological Survey Report WC/00/19. BGS,
- 400 Keyworth, Vol. 2.
- 401 Brammer, H., 1996. The Geography of the Soils of Bangladesh. The University Press Ltd., 402 Dhaka.
- 403 Brammer, H., 2012. *The Physical Geography of Bangladesh*. The University Press Ltd., Dhaka.
- 404 Chen, L.-M., Zhang, G.-L., Effland, W.R. 2011. Soil characteristic response times and
- 405 pedogenic thresholds during the 1000-Year evolution of a paddy soil chronosequence. Soil
- 406 Sci. Soc. Am. J. 75, 1807-1820.
- 407 Dittmar, J., Voegelin, A., Roberts, L., Hug, S.J., Saha, G.C., Ali, M.A., Badruzzaman, A.B.M.,
- 408 Kretzschmar, R. 2007. Spatial distribution and temporal variability of arsenic in irrigated rice
- 409 fields in Bangladesh. 2. Paddy soil. Environ. Sci. Technol. 41, 5967-5972.
- 410 Dittmar, J., Voegelin, A., Roberts, L.C., Hug, S.J., Saha, G.C., Ali, M.A., Badruzzaman, A.B.M.,
- 411 Kretzschmar, R. 2010. Arsenic accumulation in a paddy field in Bangladesh: Seasonal
- 412 dynamics and trends over a three-year monitoring period. Environ. Sci. Technol. 44 (8),
- 413 2925–2931.
- 414 FAO/UNDP (Food and Agriculture Organization/ United Nations Development Programme),
- 415 1988. Land resources appraisal of Bangladesh for agricultural development, Report 2:
- 416 Agroecological Regions of Bangladesh. Report prepared for the Government of the People's
- 417 Republic of Bangladesh by the Food and Agriculture Organization of United Nations, United
- 418 Nations Development Programme, BGD/81/035, Technical report 2.
- 419 Fakhreddine, S., Dittmar, J., Phipps, D., Dadakis, J., Fendorf, S., 2015. Geochemical triggers
- 420 of arsenic mobilization during managed aquifer recharge. Environ. Sci. Technol. 49 (13),
- 421 7802–7809.
- 422 Fitz, W.J., Wenzel, W.W. 2002. Arsenic transformations in the soil-rhizosphere plant system: 423 fundamentals and potential application to phytoremediation. J. Biotechnol. 99, 259–278.
- 424 Guillot, S., Garçon, M., Weinman, B., Gajurel, A., Tisserand, D., France-Lanord, C., van Geen,
- 425 A., Chakraborty, S., Huyghe, P., Upreti, B.N., Charlet, L. 2015. Origin of arsenic in Late
- 426 Pleistocene to Holocene sediments in the Nawalparasi district (Terai, Nepal). Environ. Earth 427 Sci. 74, 2571–2593.
- 428 Hasan, M.A., Ahmed, K.M., Sracek, O., Bhattacharya, P., von Brömssen, M., Broms, S.,
- 429 Fogelström, J., Mazumder, M.L., Jacks, G. 2007. Arsenic in shallow groundwater of
- 430 Bangladesh: investigations from three different physiographic settings. Hydrogeol. J. 15, 431 1507–1522.
- 432 Heikens, A., Panaullah, G.M., Meharg, A.A. 2007. Arsenic behaviour from groundwater and 433 soil to crops: Impacts on agriculture and food safety. Rev. Environ. Contam. Toxicol. 189,
- 434 43–87.
- 435 Huq, S.M.I., 2008. Fate of arsenic in irrigation water and its potential impacts on food chain, 436 in: Ahuja, S. (Ed.), Arsenic Contamination of Groundwater: Mechanism, Analysis, and
- 437 Remediation. Wiley, Hoboken, pp. 23–49.
- 438 Huq, S. M. I.; Alam, M. D. A Hand Book on Analyses of Soil, Plant, and Water; Bangladesh 439 Australia Center for Environmental Research: University of Dhaka, Dhaka, Bangladesh, 2005.
- 440 Huq, S.M.I., Shoaib, J.U.M. 2013. *The Soils of Bangladesh*, world soils book series. Springer, 441 Dordrecht.
- 442 Huq, S.M.I., Rahman, A., Sultana, N., Naidu, R. 2003. Extent and severity of arsenic
- 443 contamination in soils of Bangladesh, in: Ahmed, M.F., Ali, M.A., Adeel, Z. (Eds.), Fate of
- 444 Arsenic in the Environment. ITN Centre: Bangladesh University of Engineering and
- 445 Technology, Dhaka, pp. 69–84.
- 446 Islam, M.R., Brammer, H., Rahman, G.K.M.M., Raab, A. 2012. Arsenic in rice grown in low-447 arsenic environments in Bangladesh. Water Qual. Expo. Health 4(4), 197–208.
- 448 Khan, M.A., Islam, M.R., Panaullah, G.M., Duxbury, J.M., Jahiruddin, M., Loeppert, R.H. 2009. 449 Fate of irrigation-water arsenic in rice soils of Bangladesh. Plant and Soil 322 (1), 263–277.
- 450 Lambkin, D. C.; Alloway, B. J. 2003. Arsenate-induced phosphate release from soils and its 451 effect on plant phosphorus. Water Air Soil Pollut. 144, 41-56.
- 452 Lu, Y.; Adomako, E. E.; Solaiman, A. R. M.; Islam, M. R.; Deacon, C.; Williams, P.N.; Rahman,
- 453 G. K. M. M.; Meharg A. A. 2009. Baseline soil variation is a major factor in arsenic
- 454 accumulation in Bengal Delta paddy rice. *Environ. Sci. Technol. 43*, 1724–1729.
- 455 Martin, M., Bonifacio, E., Jakeer Hossain, K.M., Imamul Huq, S.M., Barberis, E., 2014. Arsenic
- 456 fixation and mobilization in the soils of the Ganges and Meghna floodplains. Impact of
- 457 pedoenvironmental properties. Geoderma 228–229, 132–141.
- 458 Martin, M., Stanchi, S., Hossain, K.M.J., Imamul Huq, S.M., Barberis, E., 2015. Potential
- 459 phosphorus and arsenic mobilization from Bangladesh soils by particle dispersion. Sci. Tot. 460 Environ. 53629, 973-980.
- 461
- 462 McArthur, J. M.; Banerjee, D. M.; Hudson-Edwards, K. A.; Mishra, R.; Purohit, R.;
- 463 Ravenscroft, P.; Cronin, A.; Howarth, R. J.; Chatterjee, A.; Talukder, T.; Lowry, L.; Houghton,
- 464 S.; Chadha, D. K. 2004. Natural organic matter in sedimentary basins and its relation to
- 465 arsenic in anoxic ground water: the example of West Bengal and its worldwide implications.
- 466 *Appl. Geochem. 19*, 1255−1293.
- 467 McLaren, R. G.; et al. Fate of arsenic in the soil environment. In *Managing Arsenic in the*
- 468 *Environment: From Soil to Human Health*; Naidu, R., Smith, E., Qwens, G., Bhattacharya, P., 469 Nadebaum, P. Eds.; CSIRO Publishing: Collingwood 2006; pp 157−182.
- 470 Meharg, A.A., Hartley-Whitaker, J. 2002. Arsenic uptake and metabolism in arsenic resistant 471 and non-resistant plant species. New Phytol. 154, 29-43.
- 472 Meharg, A.A., Rahman, M. 2003. Arsenic contamination of Bangladesh paddy field soils: 473 Implications for rice contribution to arsenic consumption. Environ. Sci. Technol. 37 (2),
- 474 229−234.
- 475 Meharg, A.A., Scrimgeour, C., Hossain, S.A., Fuller, K., Cruickshank, K., Williams, P.N.,
- 476 Kinniburgh, D.G. 2006. Co-deposition of organic carbon and arsenic in Bengal Delta aquifers. 477 Environ. Sci. Technol. 40, 4928-4935.
- 478 Meharg, A.A., Zhao, F.J. 2012. Arsenic & Rice. Springer, Netherlands.
- 479 Meharg, A.A., Williams, P.N., Adomako, E., Lawgali, Y.Y., Deacon, C., Villada, A., Cambell,
- 480 R.C.J., Sun, G., Zhu, Y.-G., Feldmann, J., Raab, A., Zhao, F.-J., Islam, R., Hossain, S., Yanai, J.
- 481 2009. Geographical variation in total and inorganic arsenic content of polished (white) rice. 482 Environ. Sci. Technol. 43, 1612-1617.
- 483 Mestrot, A., Feldmann, J., Krupp, E.M., Hossain, M., Roman-Ross, G., Meharg, A.A. 2011. 484 Field fluxes and speciation of arsines emanating from soils. Environ. Sci. Technol. 45, 485 1798−1804.
- 486 Mukherjee, A., Bhattacharya, P., Savage, K., Foster, A., Bunschuh, J. 2008. Distribution of 487 geogenic arsenic in hydrologic systems: controls and challenges. J. Contam. Hydrol. 99, 1-7.
- 488 Nickson, R.T., McArthur, J.M., Ravenscroft, P., Burgess, W.G., Ahmed, K.M. 2000.
- 489 Mechanism of arsenic release to groundwater, Bangladesh and West Bengal. Appl.
- 490 Geochem. 15, 403-413.
- 491 Nickson, R.T., McArthur, J.M., Shrestha, B., Kyaw-Myint, T.O., Lowry, D. 2005. Arsenic and 492 other drinking water quality issues, Muzaffargarh District, Pakistan. Appl. Geochem. 20, 493 55−68.
- 494 Norton, G.J., Dasgupta, T., Islam, M.R., Islam, S., Zhao, F.-J., Stroud, J.L., McGrath, S.P.,
- 495 Feldmann, J., Price, A.H., Meharg, A.A. 2010. Arsenic influence on cultivar variation in grain
- 496 trace-element nutrient content in Bengal Delta grown rice. Environ. Sci. Technol. 44, 497 8284−8288.
- 498 Peltzer, D.A., Wardle, D.A., Allison, V.J., Baisden, W.T., Bardgett, R.D., Chadwick, O.A.,
- 499 Condron, L.M., Parfitt, R.L., Porder, S., Richardson, S.J., Turner, B.L., Vitousek, P.M., Walker,
- 500 J., Walker, L.R. 2010. Understanding ecosystem retrogression. Ecol. Monogr. 80(4),
- 501 509−529.
- 502 Polizzotto, M.L., Harvey, C.F., Sutton, S.R., Fendorf, S. 2005. Processes conductive to the 503 release and transport of arsenic into aquifers of Bangladesh. PNAS 102, 18819-18823.
- 504 Polya, D.A., Gault, A.G., Diebe, N., Feldman, P., Rosenboom, J.W., Gilligan, E., Fredericks, D.,
- 505 Milton, A.H., Sampson, M., Roland, H.A.L., Lythgoe, P.R., Jones, J.C., Middleton, C., Cooke, D.
- 506 A. 2005. Arsenic hazard in shallow Cambodian groundwaters. Mineral. Mag. 69, 807–823.
- 507 Ravenscroft, P. 2001. Distribution of groundwater arsenic in Bangladesh related to geology, 508 in: Jacks, G., Bhattacharya, P., Khan, A.A. (Eds.), Groundwater Arsenic Contamination in the 509 Bengal Delta Plains of Bangladesh. Proceedings of the KTH-Dhaka University Seminar, 510 University of Dhaka, Bangladesh. KTH Special Publication, TRITA-AMI Report 3084, pp. 41–56.
- 511 Ravenscroft, P., Burgess, W.G., Ahmed, K.M., Burren, M., Perrin, J. 2005. Arsenic in
- 512 groundwater of the Bengal Basin, Bangladesh: Distribution, field relations, and
- 513 hydrogeological setting. Hydrogeol. J. 13 (5-6), 727-751.
- 514 Roberts, L.C., Hug, S.J., Dittmar, J., Voegelin, A., Kretzschmar, R., Saha, G.C., Ali, M.A.,
- 515 Badruzzaman, A.B.M. 2007. Spatial distribution and temporal variability of arsenic in
- 516 irrigated rice fields in Bangladesh. 1. Irrigation water. Environ. Sci. Technol. 41, 5960-5966.
- 517 Roberts, L.C., Hug, S.J., Dittmar, J., Voegelin, A., Kretzschmar, R., Wehrli, B., Cirpka, O.A.,
- 518 Saha, G.C., Ali, M.A., Badruzzaman, A.B.M. 2010. Arsenic release from paddy soils during 519 monsoon flooding. Nat. Geosci. 3 (1), 53-59.
- 520 Rowland, H.A.L., Gault, A.G., Lythgoe, P., Polya, D.A. 2008. Geochemistry of aquifer 521 sediments and arsenic-rich groundwaters from Kandal Province, Cambodia. Appl. Geochem. 522 23, 3029–3046.
- 523 Saha, G.C., Ali, M.A. 2007. Dynamics of arsenic in agricultural soils irrigated with arsenic 524 contaminated groundwater in Bangladesh. Sci. Tot. Environ. 379 (2-3), 180-189.
- 525 Smedley, P.L., Kinniburgh, D.G. 2002. A review of the source, behaviour and distribution of 526 arsenic in natural waters. Appl. Geochem. 17, 517-568.
- 527 Smith, E., Naidu, R., Alston, A.M. 2002. Chemistry of inorganic arsenic in soils: II. Effect of 528 phosphorus, sodium, and calcium on arsenic sorption. J. Environ. Qual. 31 (2), 557–563.
- 529 Stachowicz, M., Hiemstra, T., van Riemsdijk, W.H. 2008. Multi-competitive interaction of
- 530 As(III) and As(V) oxyanions with Ca²⁺, Mg²⁺, PO₄³⁻, and CO₃²⁻ ions on goethite. J. Colloid
- 531 Interface Sci. 320 (2), 400-414.

532 Sullivan, K.A., Aller, R.C. 1996. Diagenetic cycling of arsenic inAmazonshelf sediments. 533 Geochim. Cosmochim. Acta 60, 1465-1477.

534 Williams, P.N., Islam, S., Islam, R., Jahiruddin, M., Adomako, E., Soliaman, A.R.M., Rahman,

535 G.K.M.M., Lu, Y., Deacon, C., Zhu, Y.-G., Meharg, A.A. 2009. Arsenic limits trace mineral

536 nutrition (Selenium, Zinc, and Nickel) in Bangladesh rice grain. Environ. Sci. Technol. 43, 537 8430–8436.

- 538 Williams, P.N., Zhang, H., Davison, W., Meharg, A.A., Hossain, M., Norton, G.J., Brammer, H.,
- 539 Islam, M.R. 2011. Organic Matter-Solid Phase Interactions Are Critical for Predicting
- 540 Arsenic Release and Plant Uptake in Bangladesh Paddy Soils. Environ. Sci. Technol. 45, 541 6080–6087.
- 542 Winkel, L., Berg, M., Amini, M., Hug, S.J., Johnson, C.A. 2008. Predicting groundwater arsenic
- 543 contamination in Southeast Asia from surface parameters. Nat. Geosci. 1, 536–542.

545 **Fig. 1. Sampling locations grouped per 10 km² and sample location marker scaled to size for average arsenic content of that location for surface soils. The underlying contour map** 547 is for groundwater arsenic with data inputted from the BGS/DPHE (2001) arsenic survey.

-
-
- 552
- 553 Fig. 2. Box and whisker plot showing concentrations of arsenic in paddy soils irrigated with
- 554 groundwater and surface water. The boxplots indicate the lower and upper quartile (box),
- **the median (solid line), the mean (dashed line), the 10th and 90th percentiles (whiskers)**
- 556 **and the 5th and 95th percentiles (circles).**
- 557
- 558

- 581
582 Fig. 4. Relationships between arsenic in paddy and non-paddy soils from different
- 583 physiographic regions of Bangladesh. The regression line in each graph is the regression
- 584 **line for all the data. The fit and line equations are given in table S2.**

- 587 Fig. 5. Paddy versus non-paddy elemental relationships with soils classified as Holocene
- 588 and Pleistocene. The line on each of the graphs is the regression line for each of the
- 589 **elements.** The fit and line equations are given in table S2.

- 590
591 Fig. 6. Relationships for arsenic versus elements for paddy soils grouped into Holocene
- 592 and Pleistocene. The line on each of the graphs is the regression line for the corresponding
- 593 elements. The fit and line equations are given in table S3.

595
596

- Fig. 7. PCA of paddy soils classified into Holocene floodplain and Pleistocene terrace along
- 597 with loading plot. The first and second component contributed 54.7 and 10.3 percent,
- 598 respectively, to the variations.