

Georgia State University  
**ScholarWorks @ Georgia State University**

---

Communication Theses

Department of Communication

---

Summer 7-6-2012

# Representations of Haiti in Western News Media: Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake in Haiti

Hillary L. Brown  
*Georgia State University*

Follow this and additional works at: [https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/communication\\_theses](https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/communication_theses)

---

## Recommended Citation

Brown, Hillary L., "Representations of Haiti in Western News Media: Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake in Haiti." Thesis, Georgia State University, 2012.  
[https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/communication\\_theses/88](https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/communication_theses/88)

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Department of Communication at ScholarWorks @ Georgia State University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Communication Theses by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks @ Georgia State University. For more information, please contact [scholarworks@gsu.edu](mailto:scholarworks@gsu.edu).

REPRESENTATIONS OF HAITI IN WESTERN NEWS MEDIA:  
COVERAGE OF THE JANUARY 2010 EARTHQUAKE IN HAITI

by

HILLARY BROWN

Under the direction of Dr. Patricia Davis

ABSTRACT

On January 12, 2010, the Caribbean nation of Haiti suffered from one of the most devastating earthquake in recent history. The purpose of this study is to explore representations of Haiti in Western news media coverage of the disaster. The researcher utilized Jiwani's (2006) theoretical framework of common sense stock knowledge to explore the relationship between the Western news media and Haiti, with an emphasis on media framing. Additionally, the method of journalistic discourse analysis was employed as a means of analyzing the 90 article sample. The researcher found that there were several frames that dominated coverage of the disaster which resulted in the marginalization of Haiti and Haitians.

INDEX WORDS: Haiti, News media, Representation, Identity, West, Earthquake, Social construction of Other, Space and place, Race, Third world, Haiti, Framing, Disaster

REPRESENTATIONS OF HAITI IN WESTERN NEWS MEDIA:  
COVERAGE OF THE JANUARY 2010 EARTHQUAKE IN HAITI

by

HILLARY BROWN

A Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of

Master of Arts

in the College of Arts and Sciences

Georgia State University

2012

Copyright by  
Hillary Brown  
2012

REPRESENTATIONS OF HAITI IN WESTERN NEWS MEDIA:  
COVERAGE OF THE JANUARY 2010 EARTHQUAKE IN HAITI

by

HILLARY BROWN

Committee Chair: Patricia Davis

Committee: Natalie Tindall

Hongmei Li

Electronic Version Approved:

Office of Graduate Studies

College of Arts of Sciences

Georgia State University

August 2012

## DEDICATION

Thank you to my family and friends for all of your love and support throughout this entire degree process. I would not have made it this far without all the encouragement that you have provided me with over the past several years. I extend my most sincere thanks to my parents for providing me with the dedication and advice needed to help me complete this program.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Being a part of the Department of Communication's Masters program has been a challenging and fulfilling experience over the past two years. I would like to extend my sincere thanks to Dr. Patricia Davis, Dr. Natalie Tindall, and Dr. Hongmei Li for their dedication, support, and critiques throughout this entire project.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....	v
LIST OF TABLES .....	ix
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION .....	1
<b>History of Haiti</b> .....	2
<i>Demographics</i> .....	5
<i>Political</i> .....	6
<i>Economy</i> .....	8
<b>Justification of Source Selection</b> .....	8
<i>Historical Implications</i> .....	8
<i>The New York Times</i> .....	9
<i>The Globe and Mail</i> .....	9
<i>The Agence-France Presse</i> .....	10
<b>Overview of the Thesis</b> .....	10
CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF LITERATURE .....	11
<b>Introduction</b> .....	11
<b>Framing</b> .....	11
<i>Framing and Homogenization</i> .....	12
<i>Communicative Practices and Framing</i> .....	13
<i>Framing and the Construction of Place</i> .....	14



<i>Media Framing of Disasters</i> .....	15
<i>Common Frames of Disaster in Haiti</i> .....	16
<b>Media and Representation of Haiti</b> .....	17
<b>Western Construction of the Other</b> .....	26
<b>Invisibility of Western Imperialism</b> .....	30
<b>Theoretical Framework</b> .....	32
<b>CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY</b> .....	37
<b>Introduction</b> .....	37
<b>Method</b> .....	38
<b>Sample Size</b> .....	39
<b>Procedure</b> .....	39
<b>Time Period</b> .....	40
<b>CHAPTER 4: ANALYSIS</b> .....	41
<b>Introduction</b> .....	41
<i>Benevolence of the West</i> .....	41
<i>Poverty</i> .....	45
<i>Violence</i> .....	47
<i>Poor Infrastructure</i> .....	49
<i>Poor Government</i> .....	50
<i>History</i> .....	51

<i>Culture</i> .....	52
Wrap-up of Analysis .....	54
CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSION .....	54
<b>Limitations</b> .....	58
<b>Implications for Future Research</b> .....	58
REFERENCES .....	59
APPENDIX.....	65

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1 Words and Phrases Used by *The New York Times* in Reference to Benevolence of the West in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....44

Table 2 Words and Phrases Used by the *Agence France Presse* in Reference to Benevolence of the West in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....44

Table 3- Words and Phrases Used by the *Agence France Presse* in Reference to Accusations of US Occupation of Haiti in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....44

Table 4- Words and Phrases Used by *The Globe and Mail* in Reference to Benevolence of the West in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....45

Table 5- Words and Phrases Used by *The New York Times* in Reference to Poverty in Haiti in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....46

Table 6- Words and Phrases Used in the *Agence France Presse* in Reference to Poverty in Haiti in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....46

Table 7- Words and Phrases Used in *The Globe and Mail* in Reference to Poverty in Haiti in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....46

Table 8- Words and Phrases Used by *The New York Times* in Reference to Violence in Haiti in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....48

Table 9- Words and Phrases Used by the *Agence France Presse* in Reference to Violence in Haiti in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....49

Table 10- Words and Phrases Used by *The Globe and Mail* in Reference to Violence in Haiti in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....49

Table 11- Words and Phrases Used by <i>The New York Times</i> in Reference to Poor Infrastructure in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....	50
Table 12- Words and Phrases Used by the <i>Agence France Presse</i> in Reference to Poor Infrastructure in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....	50
Table 13- Words and Phrases Used by <i>The Globe and Mail</i> in Reference to Poor Infrastructure in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....	50
Table 14- Words and Phrases Used by <i>The New York Times</i> in Reference to Claims of Poor Government in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....	51
Table 15- Words and Phrases Used by <i>The Globe and Mail</i> in Reference to Claims of Poor Government in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....	51
Table 16- Words and Phrases Used by <i>The New York Times</i> in Reference to Haiti’s History in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....	52
Table 17- Words and Phrases Used by <i>The Globe and Mail</i> in Reference to Haiti’s History in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....	52
Table 18- Words and Phrases Used by <i>The New York Times</i> in Reference to Haitian Culture in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....	54
Table 19- Words and Phrases Used by <i>The Globe and Mail</i> in Reference to Haitian Culture in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.....	54

## CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION

Haiti, a nation known for its history of colonialism, slavery, and revolutionary independence, is no stranger to natural disasters. Its most recent disaster, a destructive earthquake, struck the Caribbean nation on January 12, 2010, and this particular catastrophe is commonly referred to as the most devastating disaster in the Western hemisphere of the modern era (Mason 2010; Balaji 2011). The earthquake was measured at 7.0 Mw on the Richter scale and claimed the lives of an estimated 316,000 people. Another 300,000 were injured and 1,000,000 were made homeless. In total the massive earthquake directly affected nearly 3,000,000 people in a nation that has experienced decades of turmoil before, during, and after colonialism.<sup>1</sup>

The purpose of this research is to understand the way in which Western news media publications represented Haiti and Haitians in their coverage of the January 2010 earthquake. Specifically, the researcher analyzed the way in which major news publications in the United States, Canada, and France have depicted the Caribbean nation. These particular nations serve as examples for the current study because they each have significant histories with Haiti. France colonized the nation and enslaved many of its black inhabitants, while the United States and Canada historically and currently maintain some type of military presence in Haiti.

This research is significant because it reports on an understudied relationship between Haiti and the biases of the Western news media. The theoretical framework of Jiwani's (2006) "common sense stock knowledge", which is a shorthand reference to Stuart Hall's (1990) notion that various humanistic factors that frame and structure media representations and interpretations. To answer the research questions, the researcher used journalistic discourse

---

<sup>1</sup> All statistics regarding earthquake deaths, injuries and damages are according to the Haitian government.

analysis to discover the various tropes present in the ninety articles sampled. The sample analyzed is composed of ninety articles from *The New York Times*, *The Globe and Mail*, and *The Agence France Presse*, the respective major Western<sup>2</sup> news media publications. The current research poses four questions:

- (1) How have the specific media outlets selected covered Haiti and Haitians after the disaster?
- (2) What frames are present in the selected sample regarding Haiti?
- (3) Is there a difference in coverage among the publications?
- (4) Why do such differences occur if they are present?

## **History of Haiti**

The most profitable colony of Europe in the late 18<sup>th</sup> century was St. Domingue, modern-day Haiti. At the time the Caribbean nation was responsible for the production of half of the sugar and coffee consumed by Europeans. The plantations that produced these cash crops were milled via the free labor of African slaves. Almost all of these slaves were shipped to the island nation from the west coast of the continent. The demographics of St. Domingue were quite unusual for the time, with a large number of free people of color, Mulattoes, living there. These people were descendants of European masters, mainly the French, who mated with their African slaves.

---

<sup>2</sup> The dominant society is one that I will refer to as the “West” (Lawless 1992; Potter 2009). Although Haiti is geographically positioned in the Western Hemisphere, the dominant society does not associate the nation with what is commonly imagined as the culturally, ideologically, and politically classic West (Mason 2010; Sheller 2004). The West is considered to be dominant because of the widespread political, economic and social influences that it has throughout the world. This dominance is the result of a high degree of power that is characteristic of the governing West. In this chapter the researcher will create a connection between Haiti’s history and the dominant discourses associated with the popular description of the nation. In addition to the exploration of Haiti’s history, this chapter also covers present-day Haiti with a focus on demographics, politics and economy.

Despite the economic prosperity of the nation, St. Domingue had political tyranny and unrest. All members of the society whether they be White, Mulatto, or the oppressed Black slave, felt as if their rights were being violated in some form (Greggus, 1997). The stresses of the people of St. Domingue hit a peak at the end of the French Revolution, where in 1789, French revolutionaries failed in their efforts to decide if the rights granted to Whites would extend to Blacks (Girard, 2005). The French would eventually suffer from their own victory in the French Revolution because it created a revolutionary spirit among the oppressed people of their Caribbean colony. Slaves found the flag of the French Revolution to be synonymous with the emancipation of the Whites (Greggus 1997, p. 12). A revolt on behalf of the slaves was officially launched in northern Haiti with a general insurrection (Girard, 2005). Although the initial revolt was unsuccessful, Black Haitians made other efforts to forcefully earn their independence from the French.

Haitian slaves received emancipation in 1793 but were fearful of re-enslavement after a French general landed in the nation in 1802 (Reinhardt, 2005). Fighting ensued soon after the general's arrival and turned into a war of race by the end of that year. Regardless of one's social status, military role or political opinion, skin color was sufficient enough to warrant execution; this resulted in the deaths of many White Europeans in the nation. Arendt (1951) argued the Europeans' racism gave them a rationalization for their brutal treatment of Africans; it also gave Haitians the green light to do the same in the 1804 genocide of several thousand white Europeans residing in Haiti. Haiti's independence from France was declared by its founding fathers on January 1, 1804. On that same day, under the rule of Dessalines, the name of the nation changed from St. Domingue to its current title (Reinhardt, 2005). The first draft of the declaration was considered to be weak and not aggressive enough. However, the governing body soon

constructed a declaration that was suitable in 1805 (Ardent, 1951). Haiti was a state that was born in the blood of white Europeans and because of that its independence was not recognized by the United States or France until the late 1800s (Reinhardt, 2005). At the time of Haiti's historic revolution, it was unheard of for a state of African slaves to successfully organize and revolt against a European power like France. Historically, some have claimed that this successful revolution was the direct result of a pact that Haiti's founding fathers made with the devil (Reinhardt, 2005). This ideal came from the fact that one of Haiti's earlier leaders, Boukman, employed vodou to rouse slaves to revolt against their masters (Reinhardt, 2005). Although vodou is simply a religion, like Christianity and Judaism are religions, it carries negative connotations. The prevalence of vodou coupled with the revolution have led some religious leaders to claim that Haiti's present suffering is simply a curse and a product of the alleged pact that the nation made with the devil. This curse is the underlying theme of the past and present representations of Haiti in news media.

United States Marines were stationed in Haiti from 1915-1934 as a result of the Roosevelt Corollary to the Monroe Doctrine (Farmer, 1994).<sup>3</sup> The Caribbean nation possessed huge debts to the French. Some of those debts were refinanced by new loans from the National City Bank of New York (Farmer, 1994). The refinanced debts were paid off by American government officials who took control of customs and the national budget. Toward the end of the U.S. occupation of Haiti, the U.S. established a boundary between Haiti and its neighbor, the Dominican Republic (Farmer, 2006). After the U.S. departed in 1934, Dominican dictator, Rafael Trujillo, ordered his army to kill Haitians living on the Dominican side of the border in an event historically referred to as the Parsley Massacre (Wucker, 2007). Both the US and Canada

---

<sup>3</sup> The Monroe Doctrine proposed that treaties in 1915 and 1917 gave the U.S. effective control over key governments, with one of those governments being that of Haiti.



engaged in an intervention in Haiti in 1993. Here both nations enforced a blockade around the nation as a peacekeeping effort to ease tension after the coup of September 1991 (Farmer, 2006). Later that year, Canada assisted in the UN Mission in Haiti (Farmer, 2006).

## **Present-Day Haiti**

### *Demographics*

The Haitian government conducts no form of a formal census of the citizens of its nation, but the United Nations (UN) took the responsibility of doing so. According to the UN's data, Haiti averages approximately 650 people per square mile with the majority of the population concentrated most heavily in valleys, coastal plains and urban areas. In 2008, a formal census conducted by the UN estimated that the Haitian population was about 9.8 million with about half of that population being under the age of twenty. The latter half of this statistic is a reflection of the poverty and poor quality of living that is present in Haiti today. The UN goes on to claim that nearly 85% of the population is of African descent and are direct descendants of those African slaves who fought for their independence in the early 1800s. The majority of Haitians religiously identify with Catholicism while a small number profess to be Protestant (Balaji, 2011; Mason, 2010). There are also many Haitians who have combined aspects of Catholicism with some practices of vodou or vodun. It is the practice of vodou, which several Western sources referred to as voodoo, that has contributed to some of the negative connotations associated with the Caribbean nation. In a study of news media coverage of Aristide's removal in 2004, Potter (2009) found that the word "blood" was readily used to describe Haiti. Lawless (1992) wrote that "the image of blood is, of course, easily connected in the minds of na'ive readers with the notion of voodoo sacrifices," (p. 2).

Although statistics show that the majority of the Haitian population is comprised of blacks, it is the mulattoes that often serve as the governing minority (Streit, 2004). Mulattoes are of French and African ancestry and are typically of a fairer complexion than their black Haitian counterparts. The election of François Duvalier in 1957 resulted in the rise of the black middle class and the successful challenge to the mulatto elite (Nicholls, 1971). Each group has historically accused the other of prejudice and discrimination. A large separation between the largely mulatto elite groups and the predominantly black masses is still prevalent today (Nicholls, 1971).

### *Political*

Throughout Haiti's 208 year history, the nation has suffered through 32 coupes (Keleman, 2004). The country's long reign of oppression from the hands of both François Duvalier and his son, Jean-Claude Duvalier, has had negative effects on Haiti (Keleman, 2004). Another notable regime was that of Jean-Bertrand Aristide. A former Catholic priest and politician, Aristide served as Haiti's first democratically elected president (Keleman, 2004). During his first stint as president, Aristide attempted to carry out substantial reforms which resulted in opposition from Haiti's military and business elite (Young, 2009). Aristide only served as president briefly until a September 1991 coup (Potter, 2009). He returned in 2001 for a second presidency where he demanded the French to \$21 billion in restitution to Haiti. It is believed that this demand is one of the reasons for his removal in 2004 (Rhodes-Pitts, 2004). Historically, these regimes were considered to be quite corrupt and are a reflection of international perception of the country. In a 2006 report the Corruption Perception Index claims that Haiti ranks first among all countries surveyed for levels of domestic corruption. This ranking is based on the strong correlation present in Haiti between corruption and poverty.

Young (2011) argued that Haiti is in a state of neo-colonialism, a concept that he borrowed from Walter Rodney, a scholar who focused primarily on mapping out the contradictions inherent in the emergence of the contemporary African state and its leadership. Rodney viewed states primarily comprised of individuals of African descent like Haiti as “the end product of a systemic exploitation through external dependencies and internal instruments of power,” (Young, 2011, p. 61). Nkrumah (1974) concluded that:

Faced with the militant peoples of the ex-colonial territories in Asia, Africa, the Caribbean and Latin America, imperialism simply switches tactics. Without a qualm it dispenses with its flags, and even with certain of its more hated expatriate officials. This means, so it claims, that it is 'giving' independence to its former subjects, to be followed by 'aid' for their development. Under cover of such phrases, however, it devises innumerable ways to accomplish objectives formerly achieved by naked colonialism. It is this sum total of these modern attempts to perpetuate colonialism while at the same time talking about 'freedom', which has come to be known as neo-colonialism (p. 239).

The invisibility of Western imperialism is an effort to appear like a benevolent entity. Here the West notices a problem, one that is typically blamed on the suffering nation but may be a direct result of some form of Western imperialism, and enters the nation under the identity of some sort of hero.

Haiti's most recent political election was the presidential election held in 2010. In Haiti, these elections are a two round process and in 2010 the first round was highly contested by locals who believed that it was a fraud. Violence did ensue between supporters of two different candidates when they believed that one candidate, Michel Martelly, should have proceeded to the second round instead of Jude Celestin, the successor of René Prèvalis. According to the Educational Broadcasting Corporation the uproar was a success and Martelly was declared president after the preliminary results were distributed in April 2011.

## ***Economy***

The *World Factbook* contended that since the 1980s there have been social and economic indicators present that depict Haiti as falling behind other developing countries. In 2010 the UN reported that Haiti ranked 142 of 182 countries in its Human Development Index, with 57.3% of the population currently deprived in at least three of the HDI's poverty measures. Mangoes and coffee are two of Haiti's most important exports as reported by the *World Factbook*, but there are people in power outside of Haiti that hope to rejuvenate the Haitian tourism industry as a means to enhance the nation's economy.

## **Justification of Source Selection**

### ***Historical Implications***

The publications chosen for analysis are *The New York Times*, *The Globe and Mail*, and *The Agence France-Presse*. These particular publications were selected because they are major producers of news in three powerful nations that have strong historical ties to Haiti. The French possess the strongest historical relationship with Haiti. France colonized and controlled the Caribbean nation from the mid-seventeenth century until the Haitian Revolution of 1804. Although Haitians were physically freed from French control, the nation was still financially controlled by the European nation after receiving the burden of owing the French millions of dollars. According to the Canadian publication, *Foreign Affairs and International Trade Canada*, Canada has participated in various international interventions in Haiti between 1994 and 2004, and continues to provide substantial aid to Haiti. Canada has had several political appearances in Haiti over the last few decades including the international interventions of 1993 and 2004 where Canada aided in the removal of what it perceived to be corrupted regimes. The United States was also an active participant in these interventions. According to the BBC, the United States,

particularly the southern region of the nation, took great interest in Haiti after the end of the revolution in 1804 with the fear that the rebellious spirit of the Haitian slaves would influence those in America. Since the commencement of the Haitian Revolution, the United States has had a significant military presence in the Caribbean country.

### ***The New York Times***

*The New York Times* was founded and has been continuously published in New York City since 1851. The United States publication has won more Pulitzer Prizes than any other with a total of 106 awards (Perez-Pena 2009). The newspaper is hailed as the largest local metropolitan newspaper in the US as well as the third largest newspaper in the country (Perez-Pena 2009). With readership declining in regard to hard copies of newspapers, news publications have had to resort to the creation of and dependence upon online sites. *The New York Times* has been very successful with its site and is deemed the most popular online newspaper site with 30 million visitors per week (Adams 2011). There are several critics who have accused the newspaper of having a liberal bias.

### ***The Globe and Mail***

*The Globe and Mail* is nationally distributed Canadian newspaper and is based in Toronto. The Canadian newspaper has a weekly readership of approximately 1 million readers (National Audience Databank Survey). The publication is hailed as the nation's largest-circulation national newspaper and its second largest daily newspaper. Over the years the newspaper has been considered to serve as the voice of Upper Canada elite. These individuals are primarily categorized as inhabitants of the Bay Street financial community of Toronto. They are the city's intellectuals of its universities and government institutions. *The Globe and Mail* is generally known as a publication with a conservative viewpoint. However, this point of view

fluctuates between a more liberal or more conservative view when it comes to issues that include but are not limited to gay marriage and the legalization of marijuana.

### ***The Agence-France Presse***

*The Agence France-Presse* (AFP) is the oldest news agency in the world (Fondation AFP). It is also one of the three largest news agencies along with the *Associated Press* and *Reuters*, and is the largest French news agency. (Fondation AFP). The historic news agency transmits the news in six different languages, French, Arabic, Spanish, German, English and Portuguese. The networks of international correspondents for the Agence France-Presse were developed during France's post-war years. The news agency is a government-chartered corporation but is independent of France's government control because it is officially a commercial business.

### **Overview of the Thesis**

Chapter 2 serves as an exploration of literature relevant to the current study. Here the researcher discussed several facets of framing as it relates to homogenization, communicative practices, the construction of place, and coverage of disasters. The chapter explored concepts that relate to the production, consumption and regulation of news media. Additionally, the current study's theoretical framework is introduced in the following chapter.

Chapter 4 provides the reader with information concerning the sample used for analysis in the current study. Here the researcher provides justification for the specific publications selected, the size of the sample, as well as the time period chosen for analysis. Additionally the researcher provides background information on each publication utilized in this study.

Chapter 5 serves as a presentation of the analysis of the 90 articles critically analyzed for the purpose of answering the four research questions posed in the current study. Chapter 6

provides comprehensive results of the findings in Chapter 5, as well a conclusion, limitations of the study, and implications for further research.

## CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF LITERATURE

### **Introduction**

The purpose of this chapter is to explore the concept of news media framing. Here the theoretical concept of framing is expounded upon and provides linkages between patterns of predictable priming and agenda setting as they relate to the dominant discourses. This chapter also provides information concerning Western news media framing of disasters in developing nations. This exploration will provide a more in-depth analysis of shared norms that contribute to the dominant ways of knowing in the West. In addition to framing, this chapter reviewed literature on the production, consumption and regulation associated with news media. In addition to these concepts, this chapter will also explore the subject areas of news media and representation, the construction of the Other, and the invisibility of Western imperialism. A review of the theoretical framework, Yasmin Jiwani's (2006) use of "common sense stock knowledge" is also executed in the following chapter.

### **Framing**

Framing is a process that is defined by its ability to gather a few elements of perceived reality and assemble them into a narrative that highlights specific connections in an effort to promote the desired interpretation on behalf of the target audience (Entman, 2007). According to Entman (2003) framing involves "selecting and highlighting some facets or issues and making connections among them so as to promote a particular interpretation, evaluation and or solution," (p. 417). The narrative function of framing allows the person engaging in the action to tell a

story. Framing identifies the ability of a text to define a situation or issue and set the terms of the debate (Tankard, 2001; Liu, 2009). Because frames have this ability, there is a strong possibility that the range of interpretable meanings will be limited.

The frame is so vital because it is the principal perspective, a consistent message beneath information contained in media reports (Entman, 1991; Meyers, Klak, Koehl 1996, p. 25).

Frames are often dependent upon references to other information within the cultural framework of the reader. They also “convey values and ideological convictions of a group,” (Potter, 2009, p. 213). These values and convictions are often those of the dominant or Western social order. This is one of the primary reasons why the current study utilizes news media reports to analyze representations of Haiti and Haitians in coverage of the 2010 earthquake. Newspapers have a much more broad audience than scholarly literature and therefore have the potential to have a greater impact on audience perception.

### ***Framing and Homogenization***

The use of frames in news media tends to make accounts of the news more understandable and simple. This simplification of the news may lead to a homogenized perspective. According to Sack (1997) “homogenization can threaten geographical awareness because it limits the number of perspectives put forth (p. 19). If a singular viewpoint happens to not appear, we must decide whether it is “due to the measured and reasoned acceptance of a position or to the domination of one culture’s partial view over all others,” (Sack 1997, p. 19). In most cases, the dominant culture, particularly of the Western culture, practices power of the shaping or framing of the general public’s view of some developing nation. These images of the developing nations that are created by the West are typically one that results in the marginalization or commodification of the developing nation. Entman (1991) claimed that



frames make it difficult for a range of viewpoints to emerge. In addition to that the audience or public has difficulty comprehending those frames.

### ***Communicative Practices and Framing***

de Vresse (2005) argued that “the potential of the framing concept lies in the focus on communicative processes. Communication is not static, but rather a dynamic process that involves frame-building (how frames emerge) and frame-setting (the interplay between media frames and audience predispositions),” (p. 51). Entman (1993) noted that frames have a variety of locations, including the communicator, the text, the receiver, and the culture. Several scholars agree that these particular components are fundamental to a process of framing which consists of distinct stages: frame-building, frame-setting and individual and societal level consequences of framing (d’Angelo, 2002; Scheufele, 2000; de Vreese, 2002).

Those factors influencing the structural qualities of news frames are referred to as frame-building (de Vresse, 2005). Both internal and external factors determine how journalists and news organizations frame issues (Shoemaker & Reese, 1996). This process occurs through the continual interaction between journalists, elites and social movements (Cooper 2002; Snow and Benford, 1992). The interaction between media frames and one’s own prior knowledge and predispositions is frame-setting. de Vresse (2005) contended that:

Frames in the news may affect learning, interpretation, and evaluation of issues and events. This part of the framing process has been investigated most elaborately, often with the goal to explore the extent to which and under what circumstances audiences reflect and mirror frames made available to them in, for example, the news (p.54).

The consequences of framing are visible on both the individual and societal levels. On an individual level, one’s attitudes about a particular issue may be altered or fostered due to

exposure to certain frames. In regard to the societal level, frames have the potential to shape processes like decision-making, collective action and political socialization (de Vresse, 2005).

When a frame is fully developed, it also primes the audience and sets an agenda for them. Entman (2007) argued that priming is considered to be the shaping and altering of audience members' preferences and interpretations. Agenda setting can effectively define issues worthy of the attention of political figures and government. McCombs and Ghanem (2001) proposed a second level of agenda setting where three types of claims happen to encompass the core purpose of strategic framing: "to highlight the causes of problems, to encourage moral judgments (and associated affective responses), and to promote favored policies," (Entman 2007, p. 164). Potter (2009) argued that frames can be used to "convey values and ideological convictions of a group, and often depend on references to other information within the cultural framework of the reader," (p.212). The detection and definition of frames is the fundamental goal involved in the interpretation of place and images and their impacts on public perception (Entman 1991, 6; Klak 1994, 322).

### ***Framing and the Construction of Place***

It is essential to understand the frame when studying representation in place studies (Potter, 2009). According to Klak (1994) media reinforces ideological convictions or views, and tends to report solely for entertainment value. Klak (1994) contended that "we could deem the difference between media images of foreign places and those from geographical research as simply two alternative versions of reality were it not for the news media's seductive authority" (p. 319). From day to day news media may make decisions that have a direct effect on the construction of place. Potter (2009) claimed that it is nearly impossible for journalists to be purely objective when reporting the news. Lee and Solomon (1990) argued that journalists "must

first decide what is worth covering, how to gather information, whom to interview, how to shape a narrative from the information compiled, what points should be emphasized, and where to place the story (p. 16).

### ***Media Framing of Disasters***

One of the most common methods that news media utilizes when covering disaster in developing nations is that of marginalization. According to Taylor (2009), the representation of poor areas or nations as sites of moral and physical danger is a common and powerful way of legitimizing their marginalization. Areas of poverty are readily viewed as hazardous places, characterized by violence, disorder and underdevelopment (Austin-Broos, 2005; Bourgeois, 1996; Caldeira, 2000; Jacobowicz, 1994; Perlman, 1976). The fear associated with these places of poverty far exceeds the actual threat that they pose to the dominant society (Taylor, 2009). It is this fear and the rationalization of marginalization that has helped in the creation of some common frames concerning Western news media coverage of disaster in poverty stricken areas.

In times of disaster communication, framing theory suggests that responses to a tragedy are not exclusively determined by the type of disaster or magnitude (Liu, 2009). de Vries (2004) contended that these reactions are instead heavily influenced by the general public's interpretation of the disaster, which are the result of practices of media framing and public relations. Some of the more common frames of media coverage of disaster foster a "prevalence of panic and looting, disaster shock, mass shelter utilization, mass evacuation, emerging heroes, victim helplessness, responsibility and conflict," (Anand, 2005; Luther & Zhou, 2005; Quanrantelli, 1996; Liu, 2009, p. 269). These particular frames fail to provide an adequate accommodation for the complexity of disasters and misrepresent their impact (Liu, 2009). They are typically used by journalists because of the ease of quickly telling disaster-related stories.

Many emergency managers would agree that media is not an ideal teacher of disaster education, but it is readily used to educate the general public on disasters because of its high level of impact and reach (Liu, 2009). Media does not approach disaster education and coverage in the same manner as emergency managers and are primarily more interested in determining the cause of disasters and assigning blame and responsibility for them (Coombs, 2007; Seeger et al. 2003; Sheppard, 2007; Tierney et al., 2001).

Another common frame of news media coverage of disasters is that of the creation of the Other. One result of marginalization is a greater separation of the dominant society from the Other. Here the developing world is placed at a disadvantage in the global political power order (Huang & Leung, 2005). The national image or national stereotype is described as an abstracted and comprehensive summary of a state or its people (Frederick, 1993). When covering disasters in developing nations “media is often criticized for sacrificing the proper political and cultural context of the country concerned, either because the story is visually or emotionally dramatic, or because the journalist lacks the background knowledge required for accurate reporting (Dorogi, 2001; Huang & Leung, 2005, p. 304). A journalist’s improper background knowledge of an area, particularly those in developing nations, has been detrimental to a nation’s image at times. More information on media coverage of the Other is discussed in Chapter 3.

### ***Common Frames of Disaster in Haiti***

Common news media frames associated with Haiti in times of disaster include the notion that the Caribbean nation is “a failed state that is unable to properly govern itself, and is done in by itself and acts of nature,” (Potter, 2009, p. 208). Potter (2009) claimed that press in the US, France and Canada have shown little to no regard for the role that outsiders, primarily the West, have played in helping to create this so-called “failed state”. In a critical geopolitical analysis of

US newspaper coverage of Haiti in 2004, Potter (2009) concluded that newspapers in the United States have the tendency to portray Haiti as holistically isolated from the remainder of the world. Robert Lawless, an anthropologist, conducted a comprehensive study of Haitian press coverage in 1992. His findings concluded that “Haiti was victim to some of the worst US press coverage of any individual country at the hands of foreign observers,” (Lawless, 1992; Potter, 2009, p. 211). Farmer (1992) argued that in 1980s press coverage of AIDS in Haiti centered on the belief that being Haitian made an individual more vulnerable to the disease.

There are several problems associated with media frames and disaster coverage. Durfree (2006) contended that the media’s emphasis on events rather than cultural, sociological, historical ethical, and educational roots or risk can prove to be rather problematic. There is also a tendency for media to construct disaster frames from information used in previous disasters, the problem with this characteristic is that this construction may not accurately depict the reality of the current disaster covered (Durham, 2001). According to Entman (1991) this can prove to be an issue because “audiences tend to go along with the information they are provided with despite the opportunity to question it. Newsmakers fail to challenge the dominant frame, authoritative position dominates the news pages, opposing information is often obscured rather than highlighted in the dominant frames,” (p. 24). Therefore, it is important that scholars critically analyze newspapers because they have a broad audience and have the tendency to write about topics with a high frequency, thus generating a significant impact on a target audience (Potter 2009).

### **Media and Representation of Haiti**

Shah (2009) argued that “news reports about race are imbued with meaning that helps establish and maintain boundaries between the established and the outsiders, as well as the racial

criteria by which people are to be accepted or shunned, deemed worthy or worthless,” (p.5). Collectively the frame matters and is vital to the cultivation of an audience’s viewpoint of various groups, both ‘inside’ and ‘outside’. Entman (1993) took the position that frames possess the ability to focus on pieces of information to create greater meaning or sense of memory to audiences. He went on to say that “texts can make bits of information more salient by placement or repetition, or by associating them with culturally familiar symbols. However, even a single illustrated appearance of a notion in an obscure part of the text can be highly salient if it comports with the existing schemata in a receiver’s belief systems,” (Mason, 2010, p. 53). Mason (2010) argued that the frame, development gaze, and Stuart Hall’s white eye are all established in today’s Western news media. The developmental gaze (Longreen, 2001) positions the West as a sensitive and empathetic superpower that is willing to cater to the needs of those of developing nations. Additionally, this concept “demonstrates how normalized and naturalized images of Others produces White subjectivity,” (Longreen, 2001, p. 3). Hall (1990) stated that the white eye never enters the frame but instead is responsible for the creation of the racialization of the impoverished citizens of the developing nations while denying any responsibility for its current state.

Scholars in the field of media studies are especially interested in idea of representation. This particular concept has provided media scholars with the vehicle to move beyond the understanding of media models as simple portrayals or reflections of reality (Fürsich, 2010). Alison Blunt (1999) defined representation as “the way in which meanings are conveyed and depicted,” (p. 234). In regard to the geographical study of representation, Potter (2009) argued that the concept “concerns itself with place, in terms of how place meanings are conveyed or contested,” (p. 209). This viewpoint is useful in the analysis of media representation of Haiti.

Representations of place are portrayed in a variety of forms of media and have served as an area of interest for geographers since at least the 1960s and 1970s (Potter, 2009). From modern representation studies in geography emerged critical geopolitics. According to the Merriem-Webster dictionary, geopolitics is a study of the influences of such factors as geography, economics, demography on the politics and primarily the foreign policy of the state. Critical geopolitics has sought to question the discourses of conventional geopolitics to “uncover the politics involved in writing the geography of global space,” (Sharp, 1999, p. 184). The practice of critical geopolitics has previously concerned itself with power, space, knowledge, the spatial other and the deconstruction of texts with newspapers serving as essential pieces to this discussion (Potter, 2009). Sharp (1999) contended that “critical geopolitics takes the predominant story that appears quite natural or commonsense and seeks to deconstruct that story,” (p.188). This is critical and significant because the majority of what the U.S. public knows about other parts of the world comes not from scholarly literature, but from the scope of media instead.

Scholars have typically accepted the notion that “representations are embedded in the 24-hour saturated media stream and established norms and common sense about people, groups and institutions in contemporary society. Beyond just mirroring reality, representation in the media such as film, television, photography, and print journalism create reality and normalize specific world-views or ideologies,” (Fürsich, 2010, p. 115). Over the last few decades there have been much debate concerning the amount of impact that media actually has on its audiences.

Avraham (2000) argued that media representation affects three groups: the general public, the policymakers, and the inhabitants of the place being represented. The general public’s attitude toward matters like migration, investments, the establishment of business and tourism

are impacted by the representations of a particular place (Potter, 2009). Therefore, inaccurate or skewed portrayals of a place can prove to be quite detrimental. For example, the Haitian tourism industry was almost completely ravaged in the 1980s by coverage of AIDS that inaccurately portrayed the Caribbean nation as a breeding ground for the disease (Potter, 2009). Further research was conducted to correct these misconceptions, however, this information failed to receive the publicity given to the initial reports, and the tourism industry never totally recuperated from the stigma (Bentivegna, 1991; Farmer, 1992).

Policymakers formulated decisions concerning the allocation of resources, rulemaking and legislation based upon place image (Entman, 1991; Walker, 1997; Avraham, 2000). Early academic writing on media held the fear that extremist political factions were endangering Western democracies through a successful employment of news media propaganda. This viewpoint was especially prevalent before the start of the Second World War which was arguably the time period where the use of propaganda was at its peak. Others such as Walter Lippman found media to be a hazardous propaganda tool that needed to be controlled by a technocracy for democratic use (Fürsich, 2010). Additionally, Neo-Marxist cultural theorists, particularly those of the Frankfurt School, viewed media as a dangerous part of the cultural industry because of its ability to reinforce a repressive status quo (Fürsich, 2010). The researcher agreed with the Frankfurt School and the argument that media have a significant societal and cultural impact on its audiences via the fortification of oppressive ideals.

When media portray Haiti as a failed state, with little hope of improvement, foreign governments have little incentive to offer aid (Potter 2009). Ted Galen Carpenter, a foreign political analyst, expounded upon this issue and stated, “This is a case where the United States has tried repeatedly to stabilize Haiti and to get that country to have a workable democratic



government and a functioning economy-and it has repeatedly failed. There is no reason to be more optimistic this time,” (Michaels, Nichols, and Keen 2004). It is positions such as this one that further reinforce the dominant notion that Haiti is a nation that is unable to effectively govern itself. In regard to the affects that representation of a place can have on the inhabitants of that location, Avraham (2000) argued that these people are forced to face their own self-image and are charged with attempting to cope with the prejudices of others. Haitian American author, Edwidge Danticat expressed the great shame that she felt when she has to reveal her Haitian identity (Pierre-Pierre 1999). Danticat stated, ““It was very hard... ‘Haitian’ was like a curse. People were calling you ‘Frenchy, go back to the banana boat,’ and a lot of kids would lie about where they came from. They would say anything but Haitian,” (Pierre-Pierre 1999, p. 201).

Before a particular ideal can be reinforced, it must first be enforced. Many scholars (Balaji, 2011, Mason, 2011, Shah, 2009, and Hall, 1990) have agreed that the representations viewed in today’s news media are reflective of those of the colonial past. One method of the deployment of these historical positions is prevalent in the narrative function of news media. For example, in Mason’s (2011) study of Canada’s benevolence in Haiti post the 2010 earthquake the researcher found that the Canadian Broadcasting Corporation (CBC) utilized the historical inventory of storytelling practices to present Canada as a giving nation. This same practice painted a picture of Haiti as a desolate, poor, and violent nation that lacked the ability to help itself. These storytelling practices are the result of the national mythologies of these nations. A national myth is defined as an anecdote or inspiring narrative about a nation’s past. The purpose of such myth is to serve as a nation’s symbol while affirming its values. According to Renan (1882), a national myth may be a fictionalized narrative or legend which has been elevated to serious, symbolic, mythological and esteemed level so as to be true of the nation. However, it is

typically the more powerful or Western nation that is afforded the opportunity to not only express its own national myth but the myths of developing nations as well. In regard to the construction of these internal and external myths, Abizadeh (2004) argued that they may “over-dramatize true incidents, omit historical details, or add details for which there is no evidence; or may simply be a fictional story that no one takes to be literally true,” (p. 17).

The narratives associated with national mythologies of developing nations are the result of historical connections between race and rationality. Goldberg (1993) made the observation that racial variance was essential to the organization of human science since the 16th century. According to Shah (2009), “the creation and perpetuation of racial hierarchy was vital for the development of slavery, mercantilism, and colonialism. Europeans’ notions of their superiority over non-Whites were rooted in their self-conception as logical-rational beings as opposed to the emotional-superstitious beings of Africa, Asia, the Middle East and the Americas,” (p. 3). Hannaford (1996) made the argument that “at the core of Western modernity was the application of rationality,” (Shah, 2009, p. 3). In his description of the meaning of rationality, Hannaford (1996) described the concept as a means of proper reasoning in the light of accumulated evidence, without which society would undoubtedly plunge into a realm of chaos and dismay. This position has deep colonial roots and aided in the construction of racial hierarchy where Enlightenment thinkers believed that non-Europeans were completely incapable of remotely mirroring European levels of empathy, reasoning, and civility (Shah, 2009).

Both historical and present-day news media coverage has continued to be a vehicle for these thoughts. Omi and Winant’s (1994) theory of racial formation provides an exploration into this news media phenomena. They define this theory as “the socio-historical process by which racial categories are created, inhabited, transformed and destroyed, (Omi and Winant, 1994, p.

56). Shah (2009) argued that definitions such as this one lead to prominence on race as existing not as a matter of essential qualities but is instead a trajectory that is dependent upon social relationships, political relationships, and specific contexts. Therefore, racial categories are a social construction and not naturally given.

The process of the social construction is conducted via the creation of racial projects. These particular projects link cultural representations that “identify and give meaning to race and social structures,” (Shah, 2009, p. 5). They are used to shape and activate specific racial meanings for people, issues and events. One characteristic of a racial project is that it is public. The news media is a primary outlet for the deployment of racial categories and serves as an important racial project due to its level of publicity. Shah and Thornton (2004) argued that news media “reports on activities of racial projects and are responsible for providing opinions and editorials which present their own positions on racial issues, often in ways that limit and shape discussions,” (p. 5). According to Thompson (1994) news media primarily work on racial projects by appealing to unambiguous modes of operation and strategies of representation which harvest certain thematic prominences. Modes of operations are those ways in which media function to promote or challenge ingrained ideas about social and hierarchical organization. The intentional placement and organization of textual and visual material is referred to as strategies of representation (Shah, 2009). These two concepts are especially prevalent in news media coverage of natural disasters in developing nations. It is here that the media and its “ideals and imagery about race in news provide explanations, descriptions and frames for racial understanding about how the world works as it does,” (Shah, 2009, p. 5). These ideals and images primarily depict marginalized groups as helpless and in desperate need of the benevolence of the West in times of turmoil.

Depictions of these groups as such beings are commonly referred to as the racialization of pity. Before discussing this concept it is important to differentiate between the meanings of empathy and pity. Empathy implies a sentiment that is based on equality, while pity makes the assumption that the one pitying has some type of power over the pitied. Balaji (2011) argued that “race is central to how pity is enacted, appearing visible and hypervisible simultaneously in mediated discourse,” (p. 51). The social construction of race creates a dynamic where those of black and brown complexions are inferior to the white or Western with no ability to care for itself. It is in these mediated discourses of pity where power relations exist between blacks and whites. For example, in coverage of the 2010 earthquake in Haiti, Balaji (2011) found that the American news media made a spectacle of the nation by showcasing it as a pitiful state via the use of images and words like ‘chaos’, ‘dysfunction’, ‘violence’, and ‘hopelessness’. Overall Haiti was a lawless nation that had no chance of functioning without Western assistance. This assistance came in the form of not only food, water and medical care but in the deployment of Western (primarily American, French, and Canadian) military personnel as well. Although some military was arguably necessary, several members of the United Nations questioned why so many soldiers were present in Haiti from these nations. Balaji (2011) argued that the dynamic between pity and race is “further amplified in American and other Western news media where race is an already intensely charged discursive formation,” (p. 51). Therefore, depictions of Blacks and other marginalized groups as hopeless, helpless, violent, ignorant, and unequal leads them to be shunned in mediated civic discourse. Meyers et al (1996) argued that the conflicts and disasters that the marginalized experience are rarely contextualized and humanized for those white and Western audiences of dominant outlets of news media. Haiti has consequently been

symbolically linked with the dysfunctionality of a homogenous Africa which to the West is synonymous with the negative and lacks voice and agency.

According to Mason (2010) Western news media often utilize a recent inventory of storytelling or narrative practices to make sense of security deployments as a part of its aid package. In a CBC article published on February 6, 2010, Canada used the panic surrounding the violent struggle to acquire its aid to Haitians to justify the increase of security measures it deployed in the Caribbean nation (Mason, 2010). In that same article was a quote from Constable Jean Luc Bonin who compared the violence in Haiti with the “Olympics of policing”. The CBC represented the policing of crime in Haiti in conjunction with the Vancouver Winter Olympic Games of 2010 with the hopes that Canadians would take pride in its nation’s security efforts abroad in the wake of the natural disaster.

Constructing the deployment of Canadian and other Western military forces to Haiti as something that should generate national pride is a facet of framing. According to Shah (2009) “journalists select certain issues, events, actors and sources for emphasis into finished items by contextualizing them into recognizable frames of meaning,” (p.4). The use of the term “recognizable” is intentional in that it supports the notion that news media engage in narratives that are common to the public in order to appeal to a particular target audience. That audience is typically comprised of those of the dominant class, meaning White, educated, heterosexual and able-bodied males. These recognizable frames “selectively legitimize some accounts while obscuring others and privileging some political agendas while negating others,” (Button, 2002, p.146). The accounts that are made legitimate are usually those associated with Whites and Westerners meaning that the frame is dependent upon race. This is supported by scholars who all

agree that race has a profound influence on the way in which stories are framed (Coleman, 2003, Entman, 1992, and Inyengar, 1991).

### **Western Construction of the Other**

When observing the media's representations of developing nations and their citizens in times of both natural and unnatural tragedies one can take a Fanonian approach in concluding that these events are typically racialized in an effort to create the "I-Other" binary. These mediated representations have been prevalent in news media long before the Haitian earthquake of 2010. Responses of pity on behalf of the West acknowledge its power and privilege over the helpless Other. Fanon's (1967) primary concern about this particular dynamic is that as a result of the West's pity, the Other is forced to acknowledge his/her inferiority and as a result transforms into what the Westerner expects him to be. Balaji (2011) claimed that "poverty and famine have long been associated with a dark non-white world, a place where tragedy and hopelessness reign and where one's success is determined by the compassion of (white) Others," (p. 52). This construction of the dark world has usually been through a mediated frame, as Fanon (1967) argued, and not direct contact between whites and their Others," (p.52). Historically, developing nations have been assembled as some sort of object. Mason (2010) contended that these nations will always be seen as an outcast or place of difference that is marked by the discursive color line.

Balaji (2011) noted that the diversity of the various cultures linked with the African diaspora have been homogenized by the West as a means to align with pre-existing biases and ideologies. Additionally, "the Kenyan, Nigerian, Haitian, Jamaican, Afro-Brazilian, and African American become consumable Others through tropes such as conflict, struggle, poverty, violence, and dysfunctionality," (Balaji, 2011, p. 54). Since the terrorist attacks of September 11,

2001, a new typology of developing nations has been created (Heron, 2007). The heightened sense of danger that the West associated with the Middle East resulted in the categorization of the citizens of developing nations as the “worthy victim” (Mason, 2011). Pieterse (1992) argued that Arab Muslims are now viewed as competition and a threat to Western society, while other groups of inhabitants of developing nations are simply outcasts and not considered much of a threat at all. This is the West’s typical views of developing nations as lesser civilizations that lack the intellect, determination, and unity that is necessary to ever become an ‘equal’ to the dominant society. Ferguson (2002) supported this argument by stating that “[developing nations] can only mimic the West but can never become a member,” (p. 21). The root of these discourses is the relationship between status and power. Because the West is the central group that harbors these qualities they are able to set the Other in the periphery.

In a study of Israeli geographic periphery in the national press conducted by Avraham and First (2006), the researchers found that “the press makes use of diverse strategies, all leading to the construction of peripheral locations as ‘unimportant’, ‘marginal’ or ‘negligible’, and all characterized by events, customs, culture, norms and behavior patterns different from those characteristic of the ‘center’”, (p. 71). In relating this to Haiti and similar nations one can conclude that the center is the West and the periphery is developing nations. Therefore, there is a relationship between power and place where place is a political construction of power. Only those in power are typically able to stake claim in a place. In regard to the West’s power there is a risk to that domination that is associated with developing nations. From the perspective of a cultural anthropologist, Mary Douglas (1992) claimed that the debates about these risks are actually political struggles over social justice and that such discussions are often used as a tool to maintain the cultural boundaries between “us” and “them”. This dynamic is also described as the

established vs. the outsider where “the outsider is often posited as posing a risk to the established communities, irrational, dangerous, and an overall threat to the community order,” (Shah, 2009, p. 4). Blacks and other racial minorities are therefore considered to be inferior and excluded from the cultural, political and social lives of the dominant West.

Media is instrumental in the association that exists between power and place. Jakubowicz et al. (1994) argued that the national news posits certain issues and players in the forefront as a means to provide a reflection of power and control structures that exist today. The more powerful groups are typically afforded the coverage that contributes to their authorization as a dominant assemblage. Additionally, the minimal coverage of the more marginalized groups maintains their position as lesser or weaker groups (Jakubowicz et al., 1994). Overall due to the hierarchy associated with social, political and cultural clusters, there are differing levels of access which are dependent upon power. Media have the ability to simultaneously transform the masses into a single mass as well as aid in the creation of a sense of disunity. According to Cohen and Young (1981), it is the media that are responsible for providing groups and social classes with the formation of their image, appraisal of the Other, and the holistic meaning of their lives. Avraham and First (2006) argued that:

Media provides us with ‘social knowledge’. It paints for us the social and cultural landscape in which we live in a way that serves as a base for the formation of personal identity and the distinction between us and them. The media therefore play a significant role in the ‘creation’ of places, and not- as previously thought- merely in the objective representation of reality (p.73).

Therefore media is an instrumental character in the creation of our social relationships in general.

Said (1993) contended through depictions of a lessened human value of the Other in mediated discourse, exists a reaffirmation of racism and white privilege. Newspapers have



typically associated “events of social unrest with the underdevelopment or ‘primitiveness’ of the area and its inhabitants, insinuating that these act of violence are the result of ‘unnatural’ characteristics of the location and not an interpersonal conflict,” (Avraham & First, 2006, p. 79). These views are stereotypes that result from an overall lack of familiarity with the marginalized groups of developing nations. Avraham and First (2006) claimed that the Other is constructed in a variety of ways including: the incorporation of generalizations in news stories, an emphasis on differences between ‘us’ and ‘them’, describing inhabitants of developing areas in a pompous manner, and the overall depiction of the periphery as violent and threatening and simply different from ‘us’,” (p. 83). “In viewing tragedies such as the Haiti earthquake, the dynamics of imperialism are more easily noticed because mediated depictions highlight the plight of victims as the opposite of the heroism of the colonizers”, (Balaji, 2011).

Van Dijk (1996) claimed that media defines what we are and what we are not via its coverage of the ‘weaker’ developing nation as being different from the powerful West. This distinction helped to define how the West is considered to be better than the Other. In exploring coverage of the Haitian earthquake, Balaji (2011) concluded that the Fanonian construction of otherness is well suited for analysis. Additionally, Balaji contended that the spotty coverage on behalf of Western news media, absence of the Haitian voice, and the filling of the vacuum with misrepresentations of Haiti and its citizens is synchronized with Fanon’s (1967) construction of the Other. In a survey of news reports conducted by CNN post-earthquake, Balaji (2011) found that the major news media outlets had falsely reported on violence in Haiti arguing that increased security measures were necessary for relief workers to be effective. The discourses of dysfunction and pandemonium were likely an exaggeration put forth by the media in an effort to

fit viewer perception per Balaji. The news media's reports reaffirmed the hegemony associated with Blacks and other marginalized groups.

Husband (1975) and Troyna (1982) demonstrated that in its depictions of the West and developing nations, British news media took the viewpoint of a White Anglo-centrism and saw Blacks as a threat (Avraham & First, 2009). Absent from this particular point of view was the mentioning of "ongoing discrimination and unequal allocation of resources which contributes to the increased marginality of [Blacks and other] groups," (Avraham & First, 2009, p. 74). These facts are conveniently omitted in a mediated effort to ensure that 'we' remain apprehensive of 'them'. These omissions can prove to be harmful to an audience's perception of inhabitants of developing nations since the media is often times the only window to the Other for those in power.

### **Invisibility of Western Imperialism**

Several Western news media outlets represented the Others of developing nations as suffering and desolate beings that can only be uplifted through the hands of the benevolent West. This argument is supported by Heron (2007) who contended that in regard to developmental discourse, developing nations are typically represented in news media as "places of suffering, starvations, and bloodshed" , (p. 2). As stated before, Western news media are well known as an artist who paints a picture of suffering developing nations yet readily omits the acts of Western imperialism that played a historical hand in these nations' present-day condition. In Hall's (1990) assessment of the developmental gaze he argued that this concept presents the West as sensitive to the needs of the Other. Hall (1990) claimed that in regard to this developmental gaze, the white eye "specifically frames the racialization of impoverished [inhabitants of developing nations], simultaneously disavows a politic of accountability, while never actually entering the

frame,” (Mason, 2010, p. 99). This means that as the West evaluates and represents the Other in mediated discourse it makes sure to posit itself on the outside and not acknowledge its role in the deterioration of developing nations.

Projects of visibility and invisibility allow Western nations to depict themselves as places of benevolence. In her exploration of the CBC’s coverage of the earthquake, Mason (2010) found that Canada was represented as a generous nation at “the expense of thorough analysis of Canada’s political and economic role in Haiti both currently and historically,” (p. 99). Engler and Fenton (2005) found that although Canada and other Western nations claim to be helpful to Haiti, historical accounts suggest otherwise. For example, U.S. and Canadian governments facilitated the removal of President Aristide, the commander in chief of Haiti. Although the CBC reported that Aristide resigned and fled the nation as militant rebels approached, Engler and Fenton (2005) determined that this was false and that he was actually escorted to a jet and sent to the Central Republic of Africa. All the while the U.S., France and Canada worked together to create an interim government. Aristide’s officials claimed that he was kidnapped, while the CBC supports the claim that he was pushed out by riots and rallies on behalf of Haitian citizens who were opposed to his dictator-like control over the nation (Mason, 2010).

The West also used natural disasters as an excuse to engage in reform efforts in developing nations. David Brooks, a New York Times columnist, characterized Haiti as a “progress-resistant” nation. Brooks set aside the question of imperialism to ask, “Why is Haiti so poor?”(Ulysse, 2010). In answering his own question, the columnist recognized that the nation’s history of oppression, slavery and colonialism could be to blame but that other Caribbean nations had experienced similar pasts but appear to have brighter futures. “Brooks ignores the fact that Haitians endured a history of bondage, killing for one’s independence, and becoming a

geopolitical pariah, while its neighbors were granted their freedom centuries later at a peaceful ceremony,” (Ulysse, 2010). In a short 2010 commentary titled “Disaster Capitalism Alert: Stop Them Before They Shock Again”, Naomi Klein argued that the exploitation of natural disasters was a common practice. According to Klein (2010), the Heritage Foundation, a humanitarian organization released the following statement in regard to Haiti:

In addition to providing immediate humanitarian assistance, the U.S. response to the tragic earthquake in Haiti offers opportunities to re-shape Haiti’s long-dysfunctional government and economy as well as to improve the public image of the United States in the region. (cited in Klein 2010)

Statements such as these may lead one to conclude that both governmental transitions and natural disasters have transformed into opportunities for the West to act upon interests of economic priorities.

### **Theoretical Framework**

The researcher selected a theoretical framework that would further aid in the analysis of journalistic articles to answer the two research questions posed. Jiwani’s (2006) use of “common sense stock knowledge” was applied in analyzing the discourses present in the sample. Jiwani constructed this concept as a shorthand term in reference to Stuart Hall’s (1990) argument. In his argument, Hall (1990) claimed that “routinized practices, normative values and institutionalization practices of behaviors frame and structure media representations and interpretations,” (p.31).

Hall (1984) observed that “we mainly tell stories like we’ve told them before, or we borrow from the whole inventory of telling stories and of narratives,” (Jiwani, 2006, p. 5). Another way to describe Hall’s observation is that the news media’s narrative structure leads to an activation of previous representations which in turn ground and inform the meaning of current representations (Jiwani, 2006). According to Van Zoonen (1994), “what falls outside an already

existing consensus is hard to make sense of, except as ‘otherness’ or ‘deviance’” (p. 38). Jiwani, (2006, p. 37) argued that news media transmits hegemonic ideology in four different ways.

First the news media shape public opinion by defining issues, setting agendas, framing the parameters of debate, and providing us with the very categories of language by which to make sense of the issues. Second, as representative public texts, the news media influence policy makers by presumably presenting the people’s view. Third, the media impact socialization – in fact, they are a powerful instrument of socialization by “prescribing and describing (Bannerji 1986) the world and social rules governing that world. It is through the media that we learn how we fit in the social order and, moreover how to increase our chances of fitting in and the freedoms and penalties that we may accrue. Fourth, the media sell audiences as potential consumers to advertisers (Hackett et al., 2000; Winter, 1997). As profit making industries, the media attempt to provide a fare that audiences are likely to consume, a fare that rests on audience familiarity and resonance.

The news media work in conjunction with other forms of dominant media to uphold a symbolic image of a nation and its dominant discourses. The historically based stories that are often portrayed by Western journalists when reporting on developing nations are typically intended to make sense to those citizens who share the dominant perspective of the media source and are therefore considered to be the ideal (Jiwani, 2006). In majority of Western societies, this ideal citizen is primarily described as a white, heterosexual, economically stable, and able-bodied male. Those individuals who fail to “fit” the image of the ideal citizen are consistently underrepresented or misrepresented as abnormal, undeserving Others, who do not deserve to inhabit the nation at all whether or not it is their native land (Jiwani, 2006).

News media operates from a position of power since it is primarily run by those who actively engage or adhere to the dominant discourses of the West. Jiwani (2006) argued that “news is a complex of culture and commodity. It has to be intelligible to make sense, and it has to have an inherent structure of appeal in order to capture a market,” (p. 38). It is here that the researcher draws upon Jiwani’s (2006) theory of “common sense stock knowledge” which offers an explanation of the methods used in media coverage of local, national and international occurrences. Connell (1980) suggested: “The explanations proffered by news and current affairs programs are made to seem the ‘best sense’ of a given situation. They are, in the unfolding of television’s accounts, [and in the press] categorized as ‘common sense’, ‘moderate public opinion,’ ‘rational understanding’ or ‘the consensus,’” (Jiwani, 2006). Based on this description, common sense stock knowledge is a social construction that is ideological, gendered and racialized.

This constructed social reality is created in mass media, with an emphasis on news media, via the deployment of filters, frames and stereotypes (Gitlin, 1979, 1980; Jiwani, 2006). In addition to this position, Bennet (2003) identified four biases in the production of news stories. These biases are personalization, dramatization, fragmentation, and authority-disorder bias. The four biases of production in news stories have resulted in the racialization of particular groups of people by demarcating them as different from the majority (Jiwani, 2006). The process of racialization results in ascribed qualities that emphasize the differences of these minority groups. Hall (1990) argued that the “media’s racist manner is not because it is operated by active racists, instead it has been powerfully constrained by a particular set of ideological discourses that result in a structure and set of practices,” (p. 27).

Omi and Winant (1993) took the position that the news media's representation of Others are grounded in a legacy of imperialism and colonialism. In observing the news media of today, it is apparent that there is a "correlation between contemporary representations of racialized people in mass media and those representations generated during the colonial period," (Jiwani, 2006, p. 31). Hall (1990, p. 14) noted, "the 'white-eye' is always outside the frame-but seeing and positioning everything within it," (Jiwani, 2006, p. 32). This view is relevant in describing today's news media because it is a capitalist establishment that is owned and operated by Western corporations. These corporations have the power to exercise their own influences or standards on whatever stories are distributed to an audience. This "normative White/Western standard determines the categorization of minorities and ultimately influences how they are perceived and treated," (Jiwani, 2006, p. 32). The skewing of one's perception of others can prove to be quite detrimental to minorities and inhabitants of developing nations because these representations tarnish their image and can lead to economic constraints and even violence.

In addition to these misrepresentations, Others are also susceptible to underrepresentation, which can prove to be just as disadvantageous. It is a significant issue because it actively "communicates the relative absence of a particular group in the symbolic order represented by the dominant media," (Jiwani, 2006, p. 41). When the media fail to represent a group completely, means that according to that outlet that group does not exist.

Jiwani (2006) stated:

For racialized minority groups, the lack of representation indicates that they do not matter, that they are invisible in the nation, and that, as invisible Others, they remain on the margins. Being under-represented, however, translates into minimal, marginal, and stereotypical representations. This reaffirms the minoritized status of racialized communities. It basically negates their history and contribution to the development of the nation-state and erases their ongoing participation in the social order.

It is because of that historically based underrepresentation that Others are ultimately cast to the outskirts of Western society.

The stereotypical representations of racialized minorities or Others tend to fall into the themes of crime and deviance, ethnic exotica, athletic prowess and societal achievement, which readily creates the “us v. them” dynamic (Jiwani, 2006). What is considered to be unknown is a social construction of the known. The Other is therefore a “strategic necessity for the West’s self-definition to occur. “The nation as a peaceful haven becomes contrasted to their countries which are characterized by war, corruption and instability” (Jiwani, 2006, p. 42).

In today’s society media is less likely to engage in overt racism but there are still many covert forms of racism on display in news media. Media institutions tend to use “modes of inferential racism by which to communicate race and racism,” (Jiwani, 2006, p. 44). Hall (1990a) defined inferential racism as an idea that directly refers to “those apparently naturalized representations of events and situations relating to race, whether ‘factual’ or ‘fictional’, which have racist premises and propositions inscribed in them as a set of unquestioned assumptions,” (pp. 12-13).

In addition to the more traditional ideas of racism there are also more contemporary discourses that utilize other categories of race. Jiwani (2006) argued that within hegemonic establishments there is a growing tendency to covertly express racism via the use of terms like “immigrants” and “foreigners” to refer to individuals fashioned as Others in terms of their language, religion, and ethnic origin and practices. Gilroy (1991) and Hall (1989) referred to this as cultural racism. Hall (1989b) stated: “differences in culture, in ways of life, in systems of belief in ethnic identity and tradition now matter more than anything which can be traced to specifically genetic or biological forms of racism,” (p. 11). Hall (1990a) continued the argument



stating that “the power coordinates keep the traditional forms of racism intact, since the aim of the discourse is to reassert the superiority of the dominant group and the inferiority of Others,” (Jiwani, 2006, p. 91). Cultural racism provides a vehicle for an increased separation between the West and cultures of developing nations. The unknown creates a level of anxiety and confusion that leads to racism. This is also relevant for those cultures foreign to the West but also inhabit its borders.

The historical implications concerning media representation of developing nations supports the current research’s goal of analysis of the United States, Canada, and France’s coverage of Haiti and Haitians post the earthquake of January 2010. The methodological framework of choice aids in the understanding of the way in which nations with specific historical implications with Haiti have chosen to represent the nation in the wake of a major disaster.

## CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY

### **Introduction**

The purpose of the following chapter is to discuss the methodology used to analyze the sample selected for the current study. Here the researcher provided justification for the use of journalistic discourse analysis. This particular methodology is used as a form of qualitative discourse analysis. According to Hsieh and Shannon (2005) qualitative content analysis is defined as “a research method for the subjective interpretation of the content of text data through the systematic classification process of coding and identifying themes or patterns,” (p. 1278). The researcher found this form of analysis to be useful for the current study because it attempts to identify core concepts and meanings (Patton 2002). The researcher integrated these

aspects of qualitative content analysis with journalistic discourse analysis as a means of providing richness in analysis which is often missing in discourse analysis alone. This chapter also provides an explanation of the procedures used as well as the steps used for coding each article and means for data management.

## **Method**

The researcher provides a broad examination of the frames presented in the various discourses that contribute to the situating of Haiti as outside of the parameters of the dominant society. These frames were examined via the use of the qualitative method of journalistic discourse analysis. Alsina (1993) stated that journalistic discourse is “socially embedded in a production system as a result of a process of three phases: production, circulation, and consumption,” (p. 9). For the purpose of this study, the researcher centered attention on the production phase of the concept. The use of journalistic discourse analysis allows the researcher to construct a code book for the purpose of determining the major themes and frames present in the selected articles as well as linking those discourses to the historical content between Haiti, the United States, Canada and France.

Perelman (1989) conceptually defined journalistic discourse as a “construction of reality based on historical determinants and the formal aspects used by media in such a process,” (p. 31). Perelman (1989) argued that a journalists’ reality is not based upon the occurrences of the day, but instead it is the occurrences related to the past that are responsible for the construction of the dominant modes of knowing. From this argument scholars have concluded that language not only serves as a means of communication, but also serves as a means of persuasion (Perelman, 1989, Litz, 2005). This means that a journalist’s discourse has the power to influence his or her audience’s behavior via their use of historical implications in covering news.

The second definition was coined by van Dijk (2005) and Tuchman (1972) which stated that journalistic discourse analysis serves as a “framework through which the social world is routinely constructed, where relationships are reproduced and the sender expresses his or her subjectivity,” (Masjuán 2010, p.213). The objectivity that Western news media hails itself on is not as prevalent as it claims to be. Instead, journalists typically report the news subjectively by interjecting their own views in their coverage of news. In combining the two views, most scholars have accepted the definition that states: “the construction of the discourse is a specialized, mediated, socially legitimized and institutionalized process in which a certain reality is constructed through a symbolic system that produces meaning accordingly with the interests of the sender and through a specific treatment of the discourse,” (Masjuán 2010, p.213). It is the hybrid of the two popular definitions of journalistic discourse that the researcher will use to apply to the current study.

### **Sample Size**

Thirty articles per publication were analyzed totaling a number of ninety news articles. The researcher chose to sample ninety articles based on the one-month time period of analysis and the number of articles that were written by each publication pertaining to the earthquake in Haiti during that time. The articles were analyzed to determine the way in which publications from the three Western nations covered Haiti in the wake of the natural disaster, and determine the similarities and differences among the three publications.

### **Procedure**

To acquire the articles that pertained to Haiti the researcher used Lexis Nexis, an electronic database. More specifically, the researcher conducted an advanced search with the terms “Haiti” and “earthquake” to ensure that the results generated would primarily pertain to

coverage of the disaster. After narrowing the pool of results to a manageable sample size, the researcher electronically converted each article into a PDF document, keeping each newspaper's articles separate from the others in three different files.

The researcher borrowed from the coding procedures of several scholars (Krippendorff, 1980; Myers, Klak, and Koehl, 1996; Riffe, Lacy, and Fico 1998; Potter 2009) in an effort to discover what themes were present in each publication regarding coverage of the January 2010 earthquake in Haiti. These scholars employed a systematic methodology to divulge the recurrence of key words and phrases that can be grouped together to expose the dominant frames recognized to describe Haiti. The researcher read each article repeatedly and electronically highlighted and recorded words and phrases that were used to describe the nation and its inhabitants. After identifying these words and phrases, the researcher then grouped them as a means to identify all frames present in the sample.

### **Time Period**

In an effort to thoroughly examine the selected articles, the researcher narrowed the period of evaluation from January 12, 2010 to February 28, 2010. This particular period was chosen because it consists of coverage of the disaster immediately after it occurred. The immediacy of the coverage is essential in an effort to foster a clear identification of the social construction of the Haitian identity on behalf of Western news media. This allows the researcher to study three specific themes: representations of Haiti and Haitians, the West's response and presence in Haiti, and the differences and similarities in news coverage amongst the three publications.

During this time period there were approximately 792 articles that were published with some reference to Haiti and/or the earthquake in the body of the article. The researcher narrowed

the potential sample from 792 to 478 articles by only selecting those articles that had a direct reference to the nation and the actual earthquake. From the sample of 478, the researcher randomly selected ninety articles, thirty from each publication. Ninety articles were selected as a means of securing a more manageable number of articles for analysis.

## CHAPTER 4: ANALYSIS

### **Introduction**

Potter (2009) argued that frames offer an elementary understanding of the daily events that unfold in the world in an effort to ease the consumer's digestion of news information. According to Entman (1991), the frame is coupled with an overarching message or ideological principle. The current research revealed several dominant frames that are common in *The New York Times*, *Agence France Presse*, and *The Globe and Mail*. The researcher determined these frames by grouping words and phrases that were common to each publication in their coverage of the 2010 earthquake in Haiti. The frames that were prevalent in all three news media sources are benevolence of the West, poverty, violence, and poor infrastructure. In addition to these shared key frames are those that were significant but only exhibited in either one or two of the three selected publications. These additional frames will be discussed in the latter portion of this chapter and include poor government, history, and culture.

### ***Benevolence of the West***

While analyzing the ninety articles selected for the current study, the researcher found that one of the main themes in each publication is that of the humanitarian efforts or benevolence of the West and other developed nations. It is common for developed nations, particularly those in the West, to exhibit responses of pity on developing nations in times of disaster (Taylor,

2009). Words like help, aid, relief, rescue, and protection were readily used in the majority of the articles analyzed, with 81 of the 90 articles mentioning Western benevolence in some form. Uses of words like those listed are partly responsible for the reinforcement of the marginalization of citizens of developing nations (Potter, 2009). They provide the audience with the notion that these nations are unable to care for themselves and must be rescued by the efforts of the more developed and dominant West. Therefore, Haitians are framed as helpless individuals. Fanon (1967) contended that frames such as this one ultimately force the Other to acknowledge his/her inferiority to the dominant Western culture.

Although all of the publications placed a heavy emphasis on the efforts of the West, each one framed this “benevolence” differently. In regard to *The New York Times*, the publication charged other news media outlets with taking an abundance of credit for aid provided to Haiti on behalf of the United States. The newspaper noted that “Brian Williams of MSNBC announced that he and his crew were the only ones there with food, water and power, but that they were using those resources to provide reportage that would galvanize viewers to get involved,” (NYT, 2010, January 16). According to *The New York Times* “CNN repeatedly made a point of showing a scene in which Dr. Sanjay Gupta, CNN’s chief medical correspondent, ran through the street to minister to an infant, the camera lingering on him as he cradled her in his arms and examined her head for lacerations,” (NYT, 2010, January 16). Additionally, the newspaper also highlighted some of the efforts of the United States government to aid Haiti in the wake of the natural disaster. Overall the United States government’s efforts to help Haiti were framed as a means of unifying the superpower and Haiti.

The *Agence France Presse* took a rather different approach to framing Western benevolence. Rather than mention the efforts on behalf of the French and other developed

nations, the AFP readily questioned the motive behind the United States' strong military presence in Haiti (see table 1.3.). In the thirty AFP articles analyzed the researcher found thirty-two total words and phrases that referred to some type of US military or government presence in Haiti. In the January 30, 2010 article headlined "Ecuador president blasts aid 'imperialism' in Haiti trip," President Rafael Correa publicly questioned the presence of the US military forces. Correa stated: "There is a lot of imperialism among the donors. They donate first, but most of it goes back to them," (AFP, 2010, p. 2). Correa's statement implies that donors like the United States are less interested in the process of resuscitating Haiti and more so focused on its own personal gain. Several other leaders shared Correa's view concerning what appeared to be a US military occupation of Haiti. The AFP interviewed Fidel Castro who in an opinion article argued that neither the UN nor Washington have provided the public with a proper explanation of the US military role in Haiti. Venezuelan President Hugo Chavez, Bolivia's Evo Morales and Nicaraguan leader Daniel Ortega have all described the presence of some 20,000 US soldiers in Haiti as an "occupation" (AFP, 2010). In providing the reader with the viewpoints of these leaders, the AFP framed the US as a domineering superpower preying on a poor nation at its time of greatest need. The prevalence of military forces of the US and other nations further supports the argument that one of the more common frames of Western news media coverage of disaster in developing nations is that of marginalization.

In its frames of benevolence in coverage of the catastrophic earthquake, *The Globe and Mail* readily praised Canada and its citizens for large amount of aid that it extended to Haiti. Although each publication provided some detail on the humanitarian efforts of its nation of origin, *The Globe and Mail* only highlighted Canadian efforts and was sure to continuously note that Canada was the first nation to arrive in Haiti after the disaster struck. The newspaper did

provide some insight into the efforts of other nations but readily reminded the reader that Canada served as some type of leader in the efforts to help Haiti.

Table 1- Words and Phrases Used by *The New York Times* in Reference to Benevolence of the West in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Word or Phrase	Number of References
Help; aid; aid efforts; donations; fund raising effort; gift	32
Relief; relief workers; disaster relief; search and rescue; rescuers	32
Reconstruction; long-term reconstruction; rebuild; recovery; recover	30
Protect; protection	12
Disaster Response	5

Table 2- Words and Phrases Used by the *Agence France Presse* in Reference to Benevolence of the West in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Words and Phrases	Number of References
Relief; relief workers; disaster relief; search and rescue; rescuers	29
Reconstruction; long-term reconstruction; rebuild; recovery; recover	26
Help; aid; aid efforts; donations; fund raising effort; gift	35
Mission; peacekeeping missions; humanitarian	11
Protect; protection; protecting	7

Table 3- Words and Phrases Used by the *Agence France Presse* in Reference to Accusations of US Occupation of Haiti in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Words and Phrases	Number of References
Troops; soldiers; military officials	21
US forces	6
Militarization	3
Police	2



Table 4- Words and Phrases Used by *The Globe and Mail* in Reference to Benevolence of the West in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010

Search Words and Phrases	Number of References
Rebuilding; recover; recovery; reconstruction	29
Aid; assistance; help; support; donors	23
Relief efforts; relief; rescue; relief team	18
Humanitarian; peacekeeping; peace-building team; mission	4

### ***Poverty***

Another common frame found in the 2010 coverage of the earthquake in Haiti is the reference to the impoverished condition in comparison to other nations in the Americas or Western Hemisphere. The media often portrayed the poverty of Haitians and Haiti as a problem that the nation created single-handedly with little to no reference to the role that Western countries had in the nation's current state. When there were references to the historical presence of the West as a means to provide explanation for Haiti's current state, the researcher noticed that neither publication pointed the finger at its host nation. This is an example of the invisibility of Western imperialism.

Haiti was readily framed as a poverty stricken state which could prove to create or compound the poor image that the nation has in the minds of the dominant, Western audience. Picard (2010) recognized that the audience is left with the impression that Haiti is a uniformly poor nation by watching and reading coverage of the disaster (The Globe and Mail, 2010, January 21). Among the ninety articles analyzed the researcher coded for words and phrases like poor and poorest nation in the Western Hemisphere/Americas on forty different occasions. Because poverty stricken areas are typically viewed as areas of danger and hazard, representing Haiti as such further marginalizes the nation (Austin-Broos 2005; Bourgeois 1996; Caldeira 2000; Jacobowicz 1994; Perlman 1976; Taylor 2009).

Each publication provided more information concerning the level of poverty in Haiti instead of focusing on the physical and emotional impact of the disaster itself. The presence of such discourses supports the argument that news media often publish information that appeals to and upholds the ideals of the dominant culture. News media serves as a window to foreign lands for many Westerners, and because most of these people have been introduced to Haiti as a miserable and poor nation they expect for that frame to remain the same. These images of marginalization have resonated in the dominant culture for decades and provide a foundation for the present day representations of Haiti. Highlighting the impoverished state of the nation further justifies the West's domination over Haiti and other developing nations

Table 5- Words and Phrases Used by *The New York Times* in Reference to Poverty in Haiti in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Word or Phrase	Number of References
Poverty; impoverished	26
Poor; poorest nation in Western Hemisphere	19
Suffering; desperate; misery; pain	13

Table 6- Words and Phrases Used in the *Agence France Presse* in Reference to Poverty in Haiti in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010

Search Words and Phrases	Number of References
Poor; Poorest nation in Americas/Western Hemisphere; wretchedly poor nation	10
Impoverished; poverty; stricken; struggling	10
Aid-dependent	1

Table 7- Words and Phrases Used in *The Globe and Mail* in Reference to Poverty in Haiti in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010

Search Words and Phrases	Number of References
Poor; poorest nation/country in Western Hemisphere	21
Misery; suffering; homelessness	11
Impoverished; poverty; stricken	6
Slums	4

## ***Violence***

The prevalence of panic and looting served as common frames in Western news media coverage of disasters in developing nations like Haiti (Anand 2005; Luther & Zhou 2005; Quanrantelli 1996; Liu 2009). According to Liu (2009) these particular frames fail to provide an adequate accommodation for the complexity of disasters and misrepresent their impact. This commonality mirrored coverage of the earthquake in *The New York Times*, *Agence France Presse*, and *The Globe and Mail*. Words like looting, ransacking, and pillaging were referenced fifty-seven times in the three publications, while the word violence was referenced thirty-five times. The researcher rationalized looting and ransacking as acts of violence each publication readily used these words in the same sentence as words and phrases like violence, unrest, scuffles and chaos. Here the news media makes survival tactics like looting synonymous to acts of violence. The comparison between the two does not accurately represent Haitians because in several of the articles, the journalist failed to describe the lack of food and resources present and the reasons for looting. There were few stories discussing the efforts of parents to search the area in hope of acquiring enough food to feed and provide shelter for a starving family. For example, in one AFP report the journalist discussed the shooting and killing of looters caught ransacking in a Haitian supermarket. The report went on to say that many of those individuals were present and looting because they had gone over a week without any consistent source of food or water (AFP, 2010, January 18). The researcher noted only four references where the news media discussed the battle for food and resources in relation to looting and ransacking. One can argue that these instincts of survival are universal and would probably be prevalent in a more developed nation under the same conditions.

Instead many of the articles portrayed Haitians as barbaric scavengers. There were portraits painted of less civilized areas. For example, in an AFP article the journalist reported: “In the stinking capital Port-au-Prince, where corpses lay abandoned under the rubble and palace gardens were turned into putrid slums, groups of survivors roamed the streets to scrounge supplies,” (AFP, 2010, January 19). A combined analysis of all three publications revealed use of words like chaos, melees, riots and dysfunction to describe the situation in Haiti-a total of twenty-six references in all. Like frames of violence, these frames of panic and unrest are also common in Western news media coverage of disaster in developing nations. One can argue that here the position of Haitians as the Other in relation to the Western culture is further reinforced.

Another realm of violence portrayed in the sample analyzed is that of gang violence. References to this particular category of violence were most prevalent in *The Globe and Mail*. In this publication there were a total of fifteen references to gangs and gang violence via the use of words and phrases like gangs, drug-transit point, and drug-producing nation. Of these references eight implied that Haiti was a leader in the drug trade. *The Globe and Mail* said that Haiti is a major transit point for cocaine bound for the United States (The Globe and Mail, 2010, January 20). Several reports have proven that these claims are exaggerated.

Table 8- Words and Phrases Used by *The New York Times* in Reference to Violence in Haiti in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Word or Phrase	Number of References
Security	11
Brutal	7
Battle for food; battle for resources	4
Looting and scuffles; looting	17
Unrest; melees; chaos; dysfunction; anger	15
Violence	13
Weapons (guns, machetes, knives, etc.)	14

Table 9- Words and Phrases Used by the *Agence France Presse* in Reference to Violence in Haiti in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Words and Phrases	Number of References
Looters; looting; pillaging; ransacking	22
Violence	6
Security	5
Weapons (guns, machetes, knives, etc.)	4
Riots; dysfunctional; lawlessness	4

Table 10- Words and Phrases Used by *The Globe and Mail* in Reference to Violence in Haiti in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Words and Phrases	Number of References
Violence; crime	16
Looting; looters; pillaging; ransacking	12
Drugs; drug-transit point; drug-producing country	8
Chaos; unrest	7
Guns; gunfire; machete	6
Gangs	5

### ***Poor Infrastructure***

The severe impact of the earthquake was partially blamed on the poor infrastructure of the nation. In an article published in *The Globe and Mail*, Simpson (2010) stated that “homes and other buildings constructed with rickety foundations obviously could not withstand the quake; nor, indeed, could some of the ones built more sturdily.” The position taken by Simpson and other journalists whose work was analyzed is that a more suitable infrastructure may have saved the lives of thousands of Haitians. This may be so, but the journalists fail to note that the infrastructure is weak because the nation is poor, and that the nation is poor primarily because of the financial constraints placed upon it by Western nations. Collectively the three publications had sixty-one references that pertained to Haiti’s poor and fragile infrastructure. These references give the notion that Haiti is somewhat at fault for the vast amount of devastation that occurred in the wake of this natural disaster.

Table 11- Words and Phrases Used by *The New York Times* in Reference to Poor Infrastructure in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Word or Phrase	Number of References
Decaying bodies; corpses; mass grave	18
Poor infrastructure	14
Refugees; squatters; homeless; displaced families; people displaced	12
Tent cities; tents; tarps; sheets; family-sized tents	15
Collapsed; flattened city; rubble	10
Camps; organized camps; ad hoc camps; encampment	8
Relocation	6

Table 12- Words and Phrases Used by the *Agence France Presse* in Reference to Poor Infrastructure in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Words and Phrases	Number of References
Collapsed; damaged; crumpled	15
Flimsy building/construction; shantytowns	3
Morgues	3
Rubble	1

Table 13- Words and Phrases Used by *The Globe and Mail* in Reference to Poor Infrastructure in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Words and Phrases	Number of References
Poor condition; badly built; abysmal infrastructure; fragile infrastructure; lack of safety standards; inadequate infrastructure	8
Collapsed; unstable	5
Rickety foundation; poor foundation	5

### ***Poor Government***

Both *The New York Times* and *The Globe and Mail* referred to Haiti's government in coverage of the earthquake, a total of thirty-three references in all. Of these total references, twenty-nine of them used terms like turmoil, corruption and ruins to describe the government of the earthquake ravaged nation. Coverage of the Caribbean nation's government on behalf of these two publications parallels the political interest that the United States and Canada had in

Haiti over the last few decades. These two Western nations historically and currently hold the position that Haitians cannot depend on their corrupt government and need the West to step in and rescue them. This is another example of common frame of the pitiful developing nation that needs a Western hero to save the day. According to *The Globe and Mail*, “Haiti’s rickety and mistrusted political structures needed the most effort and that Canada has to be part of the search for a new political compact,” (Koring 2010).

Table 14- Words and Phrases Used by *The New York Times* in Reference to Claims of Poor Government in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Word or Phrase	Number of References
Gov’t in ruins	7
Corruption; abandonment	7
Political tumult	6
Authoritarian dictatorship	3

Table 15- Words and Phrases Used by *The Globe and Mail* in Reference to Claims of Poor Government in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Words and Phrases	Number of References
Corruption	7
Political turmoil	2
Barely functional	1

### ***History***

The newspapers often mentioned this historical feat in light of Haiti’s current political struggles. In regard to the nation’s history, the overall frame that emerged is Haiti’s accomplishment as the world’s first black republic that has ultimately failed to achieve its full potential. An example of this can be found in an article published in *The Globe and Mail*, which acknowledged that “Haitians revolted and got themselves free, but have been cursed ever since.” The predominant message in these articles is one of failure. Of course, most of the newspaper

articles that referred to Haiti’s history failed to acknowledge the difficulties the first black republic endured. They ignored how other countries contributed to Haiti’s political strife.

In the colonial times of the early nineteenth century, an independent black republic was an atrocity in the eyes slaveholders and the Western world alike. Representations of failure for the first independent black republic fell in step with notions of slavery and justified discriminatory racial policies (Potter 2009). Alfred Hunt wrote, “To those looking for failure in the emancipation of the former French colony, Haiti represented an affront to the laws of nature and the republic was therefore doomed to fail” (1988, 2). This so called destiny of failure was associated with Haiti’s culture in both *The New York Times* and *The Globe and Mail* are discussed in the following section of this chapter.

Table 16- Words and Phrases Used by *The New York Times* in Reference to Haiti’s History in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Word or Phrase	Number of References
Africans; African slaves; slaves	14
Colonial; French; United States	9
Revolt; great revolt; independence; war	8
Plantation; sugar plantations; cane fields	7
Coup d’etat	6
Debt; reparations; payments	4

Table 17- Words and Phrases Used by *The Globe and Mail* in Reference to Haiti’s History in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Words and Phrases	Number of References
Slave; Africa; Africans; slavery	11
France; French	6
Coup	5
Revolt	4

### ***Culture***

Here the researcher determined that *The New York times* provided a view that Haiti is a nation that suffers because it is simply destined to do so. In several articles, journalists



concluded that this destiny had been determined because of Haitian's practice of vodou as a religion. This view is similar to that of the one charged against the citizens of New Orleans who after suffering from the devastation of Hurricane Katrina in 2005, were deemed fit to be punished by the natural disaster because of their historical ties to the practice.

In a February 20, 2010 article, S.G. Freedman quoted Reverend Pat Robertson's view on Haiti, voodoo, and the nation's suffering. Rev. Robertson said "Haiti has suffered because its rebellious slaves swore a pact with the devil to overthrow the French two centuries ago. Ever since they have been cursed by one thing or another," (p.2). Freedman went on to conclude that "the slave revolt that brought Haiti independence indeed relied on voodoo." Here the journalist gives Haitians no credit for the feat they achieved in taking their independence from France without the presence of outside forces. This position is similar to that of the West which typically feels as if a slave led nation had no way of earning its independence on its own without the involvement of some non-human help.

The researcher found that it was *The New York Times* that most readily placed the blame on Haiti when it came to the suffering it endured during its history as well as the recent earthquake in January 2010. David Brooks posed the question "Why is Haiti so poor?" in his January 15, 2010 article covering the devastation of the natural disaster. In answering his own question, Brooks decided to blame the culture of the nation for the chaos that it experienced historically and in the present-day. The journalist borrowed from Lawrence E. Harrison, who argued in his book, "The Central Liberal Truth," that Haiti is suffering from a "complex web of progress-resistant cultural influences." Here Brooks and Lawrence agree that Haiti has brought this suffering upon itself and does not hold the nations that possess negative historical relations with Haiti accountable for the contribution they made to the nation's current state.

Table 18- Words and Phrases Used by *The New York Times* in Reference to Haitian Culture in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Word or Phrase	Number of References
Vodou	11
Progress-resistant	7
Poor parenting	4

Table 19- Words and Phrases Used by *The Globe and Mail* in Reference to Haitian Culture in Coverage of the January 2010 Earthquake, January 2010-February 2010.

Search Words and Phrases	Number of References
Vodou (voodoo)	8
Progress-resistant culture	5

### Wrap-up of Analysis

The researcher determined that there were several frames present in the sample analyzed. These frames were the benevolence of the West, poverty, violence, poor infrastructure, poor government, history and culture. Of the seven frames only four had a major presence in each publication sampled. All frames contributed to the marginalization of Haitians and the empowerment of the West. The researcher argues that these frames of marginalization are partially the result of racial discrimination. It is race and culture that served as the driving force for the justification of African slaves, where these black people were viewed as uncivilized and underdeveloped Others. These ideals have strong historical implications with documentation of travels of early European colonizers serving as the “window” to the world for citizens of the West.

## CHAPTER 5: CONCLUSION

The purpose of this research was to identify and analyze the major frames present in coverage of the January 2010 earthquake in Haiti in *The New York Times*, *The Agence France*

*Presse, and The Globe and Mail*. The major frames revealed in the study were the benevolence of the West, poverty, violence, poor infrastructure, culture, history, and poor government. In each of these dominant frames the researcher was able to utilize Jiwani's (2006) theoretical framework of "common sense stock knowledge". Borrowing from Connell (1980), Jiwani (2006) argued that news media distributes news to make the "best sense" of a given situation; this information is typically in the form of common knowledge of a target audience. This common sense stock knowledge is ideological, gendered, racialized and socially constructed. This theory is reflexive in the dominant frames associated with Western news media coverage of disasters in developing nations.

One of the more common frames used in disaster coverage in developing nations is marginalization. These nations are marginalized via the representation of poor states as sites of moral and physical danger (Taylor 2009). In the case of disaster coverage of the 2010 earthquake in Haiti, the nation was readily viewed as a site of moral and physical danger via the poor government, violence, and poor infrastructure frames. On several occasions Haiti was portrayed as a nation riddled with a government that was unable to effectively lead and stabilize the quake-ravaged nation in the pages of *The New York Times* and *The Globe and Mail*. Both newspapers repeatedly noted that Haitians were in need of being rescued from their own government by a force in the West. As with all of the dominant frames identified in the analysis of the ninety articles sampled, the researcher found that there were historical implications associated with the way in which Haitian government was framed. The United States and Canada both have histories of political involvement in Haiti which explains the position that each publication took in framing Haiti's government. Findings in the current research support those of Potter (2009) where the researcher concluded that news media outlets in the United States, Canada, and France

often depict Haiti as a failed state while showing little to no regard for the role that Westerners have played in the Caribbean nation's current state.

The frames associated with violence in coverage of the catastrophic earthquake contributed to the identification of Haiti as a failed and marginalized nation. Nations framed as being immersed in acts of violence are commonly viewed as hazardous areas in the eyes of the audience. Although Haiti is a nation that has a history of violence, the researcher concludes that the frames associated with violence in Haiti have been exaggerated in the three publications sampled. The majority of the violence references pertained to looting, but the articles failed to mention the dismal situation that faced those Haitians with no food and shelter. In each publication the poverty and poor infrastructure frames represented Haitians as impoverished, miserable and desperate people who were condemned to poorly built homes that were atop extremely fragile infrastructure. There are many slums and poorly built buildings in the nation but each publication fails to connect the poverty and disparity associated with Haiti to historical involvement on behalf of the West. In regard to the relationship between Haiti and the drug trade, information from the National Drug Intelligence Center which, has estimated the combined involvement of both nations on Hispaniola, failed to corroborate these claims.

According to Potter (2009), although Haiti does play a role in the drug trade the representation of the nation as a leader in the drug trade was unwarranted. According to the 2003 Interagency Assessment of Cocaine Movement, only 22 percent of cocaine bound for the U.S. traveled through the Caribbean; the vast majority of it, 77 percent, traveled through Central America and Mexico (USDOJ 2005). As a whole, Hispaniola was involved with only an estimated 7 percent of all cocaine headed to the U.S. (Potter 2009).

Frames with lesser significance in the sample analyzed were that of history and culture. These two frames were more recognizable in *The New York Times* and *The Globe and Mail* than they were in the *Agence France Presse*. Although France has the most deeply rooted history with Haiti, it failed to mention the nation's history a significant number of times. The researcher found this to be rather interesting and concluded the absence of Haitian history to be an example of the invisibility of Western imperialism. If the *Agence France Presse* were to provide a comprehensive history of Haiti, it would also have to discuss the fact that it was the loser in the Haitian Revolution. In addition to that, the publication would also need to take some responsibility for Haiti's current state of poverty because of the debt that Haiti owed to France and other nations. Although the other two publications did recognize Haiti's history, it framed the nation as one that quickly fell from glory because of its own doings, taking little to no responsibility for their own involvement. When the history of the nation was indirectly referenced, it was primarily in the form of describing Haiti as a failed or cursed nation. With its failure directly associated with the alleged pact with the devil that the nation's fore fathers made with the devil in order to defeat the French in the Haitian Revolution.

In answering the final two questions asked in the current study, the researcher found that there were slight differences in coverage of the disaster among the three publications sampled. The researcher determined that these differences in coverage were primarily based on the histories that each nation shares with Haiti, the current relationship that Haiti has with each nation, and the image that each nation is attempting to uphold whether that be a nation of benevolence or one desiring to be unified with the earthquake ravaged nation. The overarching similarity that was found regarding each publication's coverage of the disaster was the fact the invisibility of Western imperialism was highly evident. Neither publication readily admitted

responsibility for its host nation's involvement in the contribution to Haiti's current state of poverty and disarray.

### **Limitations**

The researcher identified two limitations to this study's approach to analyzing the representations of Haiti and Haitians in coverage of the January 2010 earthquake. First, the time frame selected for the sample was limiting. The limited time frame did provide a good amount of depth in analyzing the initial coverage of the disaster. However, because it has been over two years since the earthquake ravaged Haiti, an analysis of more current coverage could enhance the study. The second limitation identified pertains to the fact that the researcher only analyzed print media and did not look at pictures, video and audio.

### **Implications for Future Research**

Based on the limitations identified, the researcher has some suggestions for future research. It is suggested that others interested in this particular subject matter engage in an analysis of not only print media, but audio, video and still pictures as well. Second, it would be beneficial to engage in analysis of more recent coverage of Haiti as a means to widen the scope of analysis. Finally, the researcher suggests that those interested in the subject utilize other methods to provide for more holistic findings.

## REFERENCES

- Anderson, B.(1991). *Imagined Communities*. New York, NY:Verso.
- Archer, B. (23 January 2010). One cruise this week docks for sunny fun in the Dominican Republic. Another stops in Haiti. It's the same island. So why does one seem worse? *The Globe and Mail*. p. A13.
- Austin-Broos, D. (2005) The politics of moral order: A brief anatomy of racing, *Social Analysis*. 49(2): 182–90.
- Avraham, E. 2000. Cities and Their News Media Images. *Cities* 17 (5): 363-370
- Avraham & First (2006). Media, power and space: Ways of constructing the periphery as the 'other'. *Social & Cultural Geography*. 7(1). 71-86.
- Balaji, M. (2011). Racializing pity: The Haiti earthquake and the plight of 'others'. *Critical Studies in Media Communication*. 28(1). 50-67.
- Bennet, L. *News the Politics of Illusion*. 5<sup>th</sup> ed. White Plains, NY: Longman.8
- Berger, P. & Kellner, H. (1964). Marriage and the construction of reality. *Diogenes*. 1-24.
- Bond, R.; Mccrone, D. & A. Brown (2003). National identity and economic development: Reiteration, recapture, reinterpretation and repudiation. *Nations and Nationalism*. 371–391.
- Brown, A.D. (2006), A narrative approach to collective identities. *Journal of Management Studies*. 43, 731–753.
- Brown, D. (1995). *Inventing New England: Regional tourism in the nineteenth century*. Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press.
- Chen, J. & Gursoy, D. (2001). An investigation of tourists' destination loyalty and preferences. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*.
- Cohen, E. (2002). Authenticity, equity and sustainability in tourism. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*. 10(4). 267.
- Coombs, W.T. (2007), *Ongoing Crisis Communication: Planning, Managing, and Responding*, 2nd ed., Sage, Thousand Oaks, CA.
- Cooper, H. and Landler, M. (18 January 2010). Experts wonder about U.S. role in Haiti after the cameras leave. *The New York Times*. pp. 10.
- Cresswell, T. (1996). *In place out of place: Geography, ideology and transgression*.

Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.

- Curtin, P.A. and Gaither, T.K. (2005). Privileging identity, difference and power: The circuit of culture as a basis for public relations theory. *Journal of Public Relations Research*. 17(2). 91-115.
- Gaither, T. K., & Curtin, P. A. (2007). International public relations: Toward an integrated theoretical base. In T. Hansen-Horn & B.D. Neff (Eds.), *Public relations theory*. New York: Allyn and Bacon.
- Delaney, D. (2002). The space that race makes. *Professional Geographer*. 54(1). 6-15
- Dodman, D. (2007). A place or a people? Social and cultural geographies of the anglophone Caribbean. *Social and Cultural Geographies*, 143–150.
- Dorogi, T. L. (2001). *Tainted perceptions: Liberal-democracy and American popular images of China*. Lanham, MD: University Press of America.
- du Gay, P., Hall, S., Janes, L., Mackay, H., & Negus, K. (1997). *Doing cultural studies: The story of the Sony Walkman*. London: Sage.
- de Vresse, C.H. (2005). News framing: Theory and typology. *Information Design Journal*. 13(1). 51-62.
- de Vries, M.S. (2004). Framing crises: response patterns to explosions in fireworks factories, *Administration and Society*, 36(5), 594-614.
- Durfee, J.L. (2006). Social change and status quo: framing effects on risk perception, *Science Communication*, 27(4), 459-95.
- Durham, F.D. (2001), "Breaching powerful boundaries: a post-modern critique of framing", in Reese, S.D., Gandy, O.H. and Grant, A.E. (Eds), *Framing Public life: Perspectives on Media and Our Understanding of the Social World*, Erlbaum, Mahwah, NJ, 123-36.
- Dumont, J.-P. (1984). A matter of touristic "Indifference". *American Ethnologist* 11(1). 139–151.
- Elden, S. (2010). Land, terrain, territory. *Progress in Human Geography*. 34(6). 799-817.
- Entman, R. (1991). Framing US Coverage of International News: Contrasts in Narratives of the KAL and Iran Air Incidents. *Journal of Communication*. 41 (4): 6-27.
- Entman, R.M. (2003), Cascading activism: contesting the White House's frame after 9/11. *Political Communication*, 20, 415-32.
- Farmer, P. (1994). *The Uses of Haiti*. Common Courage Press.



- Ferguson, J. (2002). Of mimicry and membership: Africans and the “new world society”. *Cultural Anthropology*, 17(4), 551-569.
- Frederick, H. H. (1993). *Global communication & international relations*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.
- Gitlin, T. (1979). News as ideology and contested area: Toward a theory of hegemony, crisis and opposition. *Socialist Review*. 9(6). 11-54.
- Gregory, S. (2003) ‘Men in Paradise: Sex Tourism and the Political Economy of Masculinity’ in D. S. Moore, J. Kosek and A. Pandian (eds.) *Race, Nature, and the Politics of Difference*. Duke University Press: Durham, 323–355.
- Griffin, F. 1995. “Who set you to flowin’?”: The African- American migration narrative. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Hall, S. (1990). The whites of their eyes, racist ideologies in the media. In Alvarado, M. and Thompson, J.O. (Eds.), *The media reader* (pp. 923). London: British Film Institute.
- Hsieh, H.-F., & Shannon, S.E. (2005). Three approaches to qualitative content analysis. *Qualitative Health Research*, 15(9), 1277-1288.
- Hopkins, J. (1998), *Commodifying the countryside: Marketing myths of reality*. In: C. Butler, C.M.
- Jiwani (2006). *Discourses of denial: Mediations of race, gender, and violence*. Toronto, Canada: UBC Press.
- Johnstone, B. (1990). *Stories, community, and place: Narratives for middle America*. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.
- Kahn, M. (2000). Tahiti intertwined: Ancestral land, tourist postcard, and nuclear test site. *American Anthropologist*. 102(1). 7–24.
- Kane, A. (2000), *Narratives of nationalism: Constructing Irish national identity during the Land War, 1879–82*. *National Identities* 2. 245–264.
- Kemmis, D. (1990). *Community and the politics of place*. Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press.
- Kirshenblatt-Gimblett, B. (1998). *Destination culture: Tourism, museums and heritage*. University of California Press, Berkeley, CA.
- Klak, T. 1994. Havana and Kingston: Mass Media Images and Empirical Observations of Two Caribbean Cities in Crisis. *Urban Geography* 15 (4): 318-344.

- Lawless, R. 1992. Haiti's Bad Press. Rochester, Vt.: Schenkman Books.
- Lawson, V. (2010). Reshaping economic geography? Producing spaces of inclusive development. *Economic Geography*. 86(4). 351-360.
- Lee, M. A., and N. Solomon. 1990. Unreliable Sources: A Guide to Detecting Bias in the News Media. Secaucus, N.J.: Carol Publishing Group.
- Liu, B.F. (2009). An analysis of US government and media disaster frames. *Journal of Communication Management*. 13(3). 268-283.
- Mackay, H. (1997). Introduction. In H. Mackay (Ed.), Consumption and everyday life (pp. 1–12). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Mason, C.L.(2011). Foreign aid as gift: The Canadian Broadcasting Corporation's response to the Haitian earthquake. *Critical Studies in Media Communication*. 28(2). 94-112.
- Myers, G., T. Klak, and T. Koehl. 1996. The Inscription of Difference: News Coverage of the Conflicts in Rwanda and Bosnia. *Political Geography* 15 (I): 21-46.
- Michaels, J., B. Nichols, and J. Keen. 2004. Haiti Faces Long Odds of Escaping "Sad Story." USA Today, 2 March, §A, 1.
- Minninger, S.(2010). Haiti-Tourism development in a post-disaster area. *Contours*. 20(1). 17-20.
- Mitchell, D. (2000). *A place for everyone: Cultural geographies of race*. In Cultural Geography: A Critical Introduction. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd.
- Nicholls, D. (1971). "Embryo-politics in Haiti." *Government and Opposition* 6 (Winter).
- Nicholls, D. (1974). A work of combat: Mulatto historians and the Haitian past, 1847-1867. *Journal of Interamerican Studies and World Affairs*. 16(1). 15-38.
- Pearlman and Melnik (2008). Hurricane Katrina's effect on the perception of New Orleans leisure tourists. *Journal of Travel and Marketing*. 25(1). 58-67.
- Perreux, L. and Freeze, C. (18 January 2010). Violence, chaos choke global aid effort. *The Globe and Mail*. p. A1
- Picard, A. (21 January 2010). To rescue Haiti we must look at past mistakes. *The Globe and Mail*. p. L2.
- Picard, M. and Wood, R. E. (eds.) (1997) *Tourism, Ethnicity, and the State in Asian and Pacific Societies*. University of Hawai'i Press: Honolulu.

- Pierre-Pierre, G. 1999. Edwidge Danticat: Chronicling the Haitian-American Experience. In *A Haiti Anthology: LibPte*, edited by C. Arthur and M. Dash, 203-204. Princeton, NJ.: Marcus Wiener Publishers.
- Relph, E. (1976). *Place and placelessness*. London, UK: Pion Limited.
- Rhodes-Pitts, S. (4 January 2004). A call for \$21 billion from France aims to lift Haiti's bicentennial blues. *The Globe*. p 5.
- Ryden, K.C. (1993). *Mapping the invisible landscape: Folklore, writing and the sense of place*. Iowa City, Iowa: University of Iowa Press.
- Sack, R. (1997). *Homo Geographicus: A Framework for Action, Awareness, and Moral Concern*. Baltimore, Md.: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Seeger, M.W., Sellnow, T.L. and Ulmer, R.R. (2003), *Communication and Organizational Crisis*, Praeger, Westport, CN.
- Sharp, J. (1999). Critical Geopolitics. In *Introducing Human Geographies*, edited by P. Cloke, P. Crang and M. Goodwin, 181-188. London: Arnold Publishers.
- Sheller, M. (2004). Natural hedonism: The invention of Caribbean islands as tropical playgrounds' in S. Courtman (ed.) *Beyond the Blood, the Beach, and the Banana: New Perspectives in Caribbean Studies*. Ian Randle Publishers: Kingston and Miami, 170-185.
- Sheppard, N. (2007), "California wildfires: media blame another natural disaster on Bush", *News Busters*, available at <http://newsbusters.org/blogs/noel-sheppard/> (accessed 29 November 2007).
- Smith, A.D. (1991), *National Identity*. Reno, NV: University of Nevada Press.
- Soja, E.W. (1989). *Postmodern geographies: The reassertion of space in critical social theory*. London: Verso.
- Straubaar, J. (1991). Beyond media imperialism: asymmetrical interdependence and cultural proximity. *Critical Studies in Mass Communication*. 8. 1-11.
- Stegner, W.E. (1992). *Where the bluebird sings to the lemonade springs: Living and writing in the West*. New York, NY: Random House.
- Streit, C.K. (2004). Haiti Intervention in Operation. *Foreign Affairs*. 615-632.
- Stokowski, P.A. (1996). *Riches and regrets: Betting in two Colorado mountain towns*. Niwat, CO: University Press of Colorado.

- Stokowski, P.A. (2002). Languages of place and discourses of power: Constructing new senses of place. *Journal of Leisure Research*. 34(6). 368-382.
- Tankard, J.W. (2001), "The empirical approach to the study of media framing", in Reese, S.D., Gandy, O.S. and Grant, A.E. (Eds), *Framing Public Life: Perspectives on Media and Our Understanding of the Social World*, Erlbaum, Mahwah, NJ, 95-106.
- Taylor, E.B. (2009). Poverty as danger: Fear of crime in Santo Domingo. *International Journal of Cultural Studies*. 12(2), 131-148.
- Taylor, P. 2000. Critical Geopolitics. In *The Dictionary of Human Geography*, edited by R. J. Johnston, D. Gregory, G. Pratt, and M. Watts, 125-126. 4th ed. Malden, Mass.: Blackwell Publishing.
- Tierney, K.J., Lindell, M.K. and Perry, R.W. (2001), *Facing the Unexpected: Disaster Preparedness and Response in the United States*, Joseph Henry, Washington, DC.
- Ulysse, G.A. (2010). Why representations of Haiti matter now more than ever. *NACLA Report on the Americas*. 43(4). 37-41.
- Urry, J. (2000). *Sociology beyond societies: Mobilities for the twenty-first century*. Routledge, London.
- Van Dijk, T.A. (1989). Mediating racism: The role of the media in the reproduction of racism. In R. Wodak (Ed.), *Language, power and Ideology* (pp. 199-226). Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Vandergeest, P. & DuPuis, E. M. (1996). *Creating the countryside: The politics of rural and environmental discourse*. Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.
- Walker, D. 1997. *Public Relations in Local Government: Strategic Approaches to Better Communication*. London: Pitman Publishing.
- Wucker, M. (2007). Why the cocks fight: Dominicans, Haitians and the struggle for Hispaniola". *Windows on Haiti*.
- Yakabuski, K. (16 January 2010). Is the United States doomed to forsake Haiti once more? *The Globe and Mail*. pp. A21.
- Young, K.B. (2011). Walter Rodney and the politics of the Haitian ruling class: Rethinking the state in Haiti. *Journal of Third World Studies*. 28(1). 61-81.
- Zerubavel, E. (1996). Social memories: Steps to a sociology of the past. *Qualitative Sociology*: 19(3). 283-199.

APPENDIX

Sample of Articles

<b>Name</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Author</b>	<b>Section/Page</b>	<b>Date</b>
<i>The New York Times</i>	Re “The Underlying Tragedy” (Letter to the editor)	Adams, J.		15 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Stepping Up to Help Out in the Face of Disaster	Agrell, S.	A15	15 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	The Earthquake in Haiti/A nation in Ruins	Agrell, S.	A15	14 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	One Cruise This Week Docks for Sunny Fun in the Dominican Republic. Another Stops in Haiti. It's the Same Island. So Why Does One Seem Worse?	Archer, B.	A13	23 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Haiti in Ink and Tears	Bell, M.S.	p. 3	17 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	The Underlying Tragedy	Brooks, D.	p. 27	15 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	For the Trapped Rescue is but the First Hurdle	Cave, D.	p. 21	16 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	We Need a Marshall Plan for Haiti	Collier, P. and Warnholz	A17	14 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Lend Me Your Ears	Collins, G.	p. 21	16 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Experts Wonder About U.S. role in Haiti After the Cameras Leave	Cooper, H. and Landler, M.	p. 10	18 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	To Heal Haiti, Look to History, Not Nature	Danner, M	p. 31	22 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	New Meaning to the ‘Haitian’ in ‘Haitian-	Fahim, K	p. 17	16 January 2010

	American'			
<i>The New York Times</i>	Voodoo, a Comfort in Haiti, Remains Misunderstood	Freedman, S.G	p. 14	20 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Managing disaster with small steps	Fountain, H.	p. 1	19 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Our Haitian Connection	Gagnon, L.	A12	18 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Canadians Quick to Show Their Generosity	Galloway, G.	A14	15 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Men with Guns in Haiti	Hammond, S.	A14	22 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Canada to Hold Haiti Summit Amid Historic Relief Effort	Ibbitson, J.	A1	18 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Drizzle Serves as a Reminder: A Hard Rain's Gonna Fall	Ibbitson, J.	A13	21 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Port-au-Prince Residents Begin Grim Task of Rebuilding City	Ibbitson, J. and Waldie, P.	A13	21 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Country Without a Net	Kidder, T.	p. 37	14 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Will 'pity time' Result in Lasting Change?	Koring, P.	A15	14 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Hopes Fade in Quake-ravaged Haiti, and Anger Rises	Lacey, M.	p. 1	15 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Patience Wears Thin as Haiti's Desperation Grows	Lacey, M.	p.1	16 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Nightmare in Haiti: Untreated Illness and Injury	Lacey, M.	p. 1	21 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Makeshift Clinic Has its Own Emergency	Leeder, J	A20	9 February 2010

<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	How to Fix a Broken City	Mackinnon, M.	F1	16 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Eight Ways to Rebuild Haiti: Concrete Solutions	McAslan, J.	p.9	17 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	For 45,000 Americans in Haiti, the Quake was a 'Nightmare That's Not Ending'	McKinley, J.C. and Skipp, C.	p.8	18 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Haiti's Cultural Capital/ A Hub of Canadian Involvement	Paperny, A. M	A15	19 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	A Fallen City, a Fleeing Populace, a New Crisis	Paperny, A. M.	A11	8 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Earthquake 'catastrophe' hits Haiti	Paperny, A.M. and Ibbitson, J.	A1	13 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Violence, Chaos Choke Global Aid Effort	Perreux, L. and Freeze, C.	A1	18 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	To Rescue Haiti We Must Look at Past Mistakes	Picard, A.	L2	21 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	U.S. Will Protect Illegal Haitian Residents From Deportation for 18 Months	Preston, J.	p. 9	16 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	A Dose of Economic Freedom Will Help Heal Haiti	Reynolds, N.	B2	20 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Haiti Struggles to Find Tents to Put Over Heads of its Displaced Masses	Rivera, R. and Cave, D.	p. 4	22 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Problems at Crucial Airport	Robbins, L.	p. 13	15 January 2010

	Entangle Relief Efforts			
<i>The New York Times</i>	Haiti Lies in Ruins; Grim Search for Untold Dead	Romero, S.	p. 1	14 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Haiti's Government is in Ruins, Too, but Still Struggles to Exhume Itself	Romero, S.	p. 10	16 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Fierce Quake Devastates Haiti; Worst is Feared	Romero, S. and Lacey, M.	p. 1	13 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Looting Flares Where Order Breaks Down	Romero, S. and Lacey, M.	p.1	17 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	We Wail with You, Haiti	Semple, K.	p.6	28 February 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	When it Comes to Haiti, Things Only Get Worse	Simpson, J.	A23	16 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Countless Lost Limbs Alter Life in Haiti's Ruins	Sontag, D.	p.1	23 February 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	A Scolding Evangelist Puts 'hate' Back in Haiti	Southey, T.	F2	16 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Haiti Broadcasting Coverage: Comparison and Self-configuration	Stanley, A.	p. 10	16 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Does Watching Haiti Pain Change Us?	Timson, J.	L1	22 January 2010
<i>The New York Times</i>	Aftershocks	Trouillot, E.	p. 39	21 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Quake Measuring 7.0 rocks Haiti	Unknown		12 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Bodies Line Port-au-Prince Streets as Dusk	Unknown		13 January 2010



	Falls			
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Brazil Concerned for Peacekeepers in Haiti	Unknown		13 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Exiled Aristide Mourns Haiti Quake Victims	Unknown		13 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Fears of Major Catastrophe as 7.0 Quake Rocks Haiti	Unknown		13 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	France Sends Aid Planes to Haiti	Unknown		13 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Clintons Lead Fundraising Charge in Haiti	Unknown		14 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Looters and Shooters Loose in Quake-hit Haiti: Witness	Unknown		14 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	'Not a Suture Left' in Overwhelmed Haiti Hospital	Unknown		14 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Earthquake in Haiti/ A Nation in Ruins	Unknown	A14	15 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Top US Lawmaker: Quake Aid May Give Haiti a Fresh New Start	Unknown		15 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	UN Says 300,000 Homeless After Unprecedented Haiti Quake.	Unknown		15 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Canadians Doing Proud	Unknown	A22	16 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Haiti Violence 'Below Pre-Quake Levels': US General	Unknown		18 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	No policing role for US troops in	Unknown		18 January 2010

	Haiti: Gates			
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Lawlessness, Health Crisis Loom Over Quake-hit Haiti Capital	Unknown		19 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Tap the Diaspora	Unknown	A16	19 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Aid Needs Security	Unknown	A16	20 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Haiti Ambassador to US Call for More Stable Relief	Unknown		20 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Latest Haiti Quake Reduces Hope for Survivors: Experts	Unknown		20 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	US Troops on Watch Amid Haiti Looting	Unknown		20 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Haiti's City of God Slum Wonders About its Hellish Fate	Unknown		21 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Fidel Castro Demands UN Say on US 'occupation' of Haiti	Unknown		24 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Manpower, Vehicles Needed for Haiti Aid Effort: UN	Unknown		24 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	US Faults Al-Jazeera English Coverage of Haiti	Unknown		26 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	OAS Leader Defends US Against Charges of Haiti 'Occupation'	Unknown		27 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	UN Warns of Gangsters,	Unknown		27 January 2010

	Traffickers Exploiting Haiti Chaos			
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	As Disease Threat Rises, Vaccination Program Rolls Out	Unknown	A4	29 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Big Business Urged to Help Haiti Despite Risks	Unknown		30 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Ecuador President Blasts Aid 'Imperialism' on Haiti Trip	Unknown		30 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	African Summit Remembers Haiti's Victims	Unknown		31 January 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	G7 Nations Vow to Cancel Haiti Debt	Unknown		6 February 2010
<i>The Agence France Presse</i>	Damaged Haiti Supermarket Collapses with People Inside	Unknown		10 February 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Cholera Concerns grow as Makeshift Shelters Spread	Waldie, P.	A15	26 January 2010
<i>The Globe and Mail</i>	Exiled Aristide Bidding to Come Home	York, G.	A17	16 January 2010