

## 'Back to the Land': Performance Practice and the Classic Period

Malcom S. Cole

Follow this and additional works at: <http://scholarship.claremont.edu/ppr>



Part of the [Musicology Commons](#), [Music Performance Commons](#), and the [Music Practice Commons](#)

---

Cole, Malcom S. (1988) "'Back to the Land': Performance Practice and the Classic Period," *Performance Practice Review*: Vol. 1: No. 1, Article 4. DOI: 10.5642/perfpr.198801.01.4

Available at: <http://scholarship.claremont.edu/ppr/vol1/iss1/4>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at Claremont at Scholarship @ Claremont. It has been accepted for inclusion in Performance Practice Review by an authorized administrator of Scholarship @ Claremont. For more information, please contact [scholarship@cuc.claremont.edu](mailto:scholarship@cuc.claremont.edu).

## 'Back to the Land': Performance Practice and the Classic Period<sup>1</sup>

---

Malcolm S. Cole

Interest in performance practice (performing practice, historical performance) is a 20th-century phenomenon. Digging through the accretions of centuries, performer-scholars in ever-growing numbers are striving to recover "authentic" styles, to go "back to the land," in Adam Carse's delightful phrase.<sup>2</sup> For the Classic period specifically, no longer does the misconception prevail that performance problems declined dramatically (or vanished) as notation and instruments became more like today's. To the contrary, numerous issues invite attention.

First, however, I recommend reflection in three broad areas: the peculiarly elusive nature of the subject; the ground covered by the term "Classic period"; the apparent continuity of performing tradition from

---

1. The following abbreviations are used in this paper: *AM*: Acta musicologica; *JAMS*: Journal of the American Musicological Society; *JM*: Journal of Musicology; *MJb*: Mozart Jahrbuch; *ML*: Music and Letters; *MT*: Journal of Music Theory; *NG*: New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians; *NGDMI*: New Grove Dictionary of Musical Instruments; *NMA*: Neue Mozart Ausgabe; *PAMS*: Papers of the American Musicological Society; *PQ*: Piano Quarterly; *RRMCE*: Recent Researches in the Music of the Classical Era; *RRMNET*: Recent Researches in the Music of the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries

2. Adam Carse, *The Orchestra in the XVIIIth Century* (Cambridge: W. Heffer & Sons, 1940), p. 160. Carse's discussion, with its common-sense limitations, still makes worthwhile reading.



that time to the present. Richard Taruskin and Joseph Kerman have addressed the first area, Taruskin cautioning, "Research alone has never given, and is never likely to give (. . .) enough information to achieve that wholeness of conception and that sureness of style — in a word, that fearlessness — any authentic, which is to say, authoritative, performance must embody."<sup>3</sup> The time frame involves some compromises. Even though scholars generally agree that the elements of Classical style are in place much earlier, authors of the Classic component of multi-volume histories still tend to begin their accounts ca. 1750, the division customarily followed by performance practice writers as well.<sup>4</sup> Likewise, they typically proceed through ca. 1825, focusing upon Beethoven, while leaving the contemporary Schubert to the Romantic volume. In a praiseworthy overview of performing practice after 1750, Robert Winter forcefully challenges the notion of a continuous tradition, concluding, "Neither the assumption of an unbroken performing history nor the corollary of an unbroken performing tradition stands up."<sup>5</sup>

Conspicuously absent at this time and arguably premature, given the complexity of the subject, is a comprehensive, single-volume study of performance practice in the Classic period, comparable, for example, to Robert Donington's *The Interpretation of Early Music*.<sup>6</sup> For the curious, however, abundant study material awaits, despite the countless 18th-century invocations of "taste," "feeling," "judgment," and "long experience." Primary sources include dictionaries, treatises and instructional books, eye-witness accounts, correspondence, court records, literary and iconographical evidence, and the music itself. The three great mid-century treatises — by Leopold Mozart, C.P.E. Bach, and J.J. Quantz — long have been available in exemplary English translations.<sup>7</sup>

3. Richard Taruskin, "The Musicologist and the Performer," *Musicology in the 1980s: Methods, Goals, Opportunities*, ed. D. Kern Holoman and Claude V. Palisca (New York: Da Capo, 1982), pp. 108-9; the article appears also as "On Letting the Music Speak for Itself: Some Reflections on Musicology and Performance," *JM* 1 (July 1982): 338-49; Joseph Kerman, "The Historical Performance Movement," *Contemplating Music: Challenges to Musicology* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1985), pp. 182-217.

4. See, for example, Giorgio Pestelli, *The Age of Mozart and Beethoven*, trans. Eric Cross (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984) and Julian Rushton, *Classical Music: a Concise History from Gluck to Beethoven* ([London]: Thames & Hudson, 1986). Compare Howard Mayer Brown and James W. McKinnon, "Performing Practice," *NG*, 14:370-93, and, a strikingly different entry after 1750, Brown, McKinnon, and Robert Winter, "Performing Practice," *NGDMI*, 3:34-61.

5. Robert Winter, "Performing Practice," (6: *After 1750*), *NGDMI* 3:53-59. For a different view, see Brown, *NG* 14:388-89.

6. Robert Donington, *The Interpretation of Early Music*, New version (London: Faber & Faber, 1975).

7. Leopold Mozart, *A Treatise on the Fundamental Principles of Violin Playing*, trans. Editha Knocker, 2d ed. (London: Oxford University Press, 1951); Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach, *Essay on the True Art of Playing Keyboard Instruments*, trans. William J.



Joining them at last is D.G. Türk's *Klavierschule* (1789) in Raymond H. Haggh's widely acclaimed translation.<sup>8</sup>

Secondary sources run the gamut: bibliographies both general and specialized;<sup>9</sup> dictionaries and encyclopedias, among which towers *NGDMI*; books devoted to a wide range of performance topics, such as, Eva and Paul Badura-Skoda on Mozart's keyboard music, William S. Newman on Beethoven's sonatas, Robin Stowell on the violin, Frederick Neumann on ornamentation and improvisation in Mozart, and A. Peter Brown on Haydn's *Creation*;<sup>10</sup> journals (note the expanded coverage of *Early Music*); conference reports; Festschriften; dissertations; scholarly thematic catalogs, not only for Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven, but also for Pleyel, Boccherini, and others; and modern critical editions. Additional thought-provoking performance practice considerations can be culled from a host of musicological works with multiple thrusts, by Charles Rosen, for example, or by Leonard Ratner and Wye J. Allanbrook, who base important new interpretations of the period on 18th-century principles.<sup>11</sup>

Not to be overlooked are two other valuable, ever-expanding resources: the instruments themselves, whether originals or replicas; recordings, both by individuals and groups devoted to performing repertory of the *Classic period on authentic instruments* and by *historically-informed performers on modern instruments*.

---

Mitchell (New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 1949); Johann Joachim Quantz, *On Playing the Flute*, trans. Edward Reilly (New York: Schirmer Books, 1975 [c1966]).

8. Daniel Gottlob Türk, *School of Clavier Playing, or, Instructions in Playing the Clavier for Teachers and Students*, trans. Raymond H. Haggh (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1982).

9. Mary Vinquist and Neal Zaslaw, *Performance Practice: a Bibliography* (New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 1971); Ann Basart, *The Sound of the Fortepiano: a Discography of Recordings on Early Pianos* (Berkeley: Fallen Leaf Press, 1985).

10. Eva and Paul Badura-Skoda, *Interpreting Mozart on the Keyboard*, trans. Leo Black (1962; reprint, New York: Da Capo, 1985); William S. Newman, *Performance Practices in Beethoven's Piano Sonatas: an Introduction* (New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 1971); Robin Stowell, *Violin Technique and Performance Practice in the Late Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985); Frederick Neumann, *Ornamentation and Improvisation in Mozart* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986); A. Peter Brown, *Performing Haydn's The Creation: Reconstructing the Earliest Renditions* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1986).

11. Charles Rosen, *The Classical Style: Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven* (New York: The Viking Press, 1971); Leonard Ratner, *Classic Music: Expression, Form, and Style* (New York: Schirmer Books, 1980); Wye Jamison Allanbrook, *Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart: Le nozze di Figaro and Don Giovanni* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1983).



A component-by-component overview reveals that for the Classic period — gaps, inconsistencies, and contradictions notwithstanding — our knowledge of performance practice is good at this moment, and it is getting progressively better.

### The Edition

"The first duty of the modern performer," Howard Mayer Brown counsels, "is to search out the most authentic text available" (*NG* 14:389). Because preparation of a performance typically begins here, the Edition logically becomes the first component to consider. A most encouraging situation exists. Proceeding carefully and drawing upon preserved autographs, manuscript copies, and first editions, modern editors are achieving laudable results.

While far from complete, critical editions of Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven, and others are steadily advancing. In the *NMA* (Bärenreiter), for example, the piano concertos appear with *col basso* lines restored to the keyboard and with editorial realizations of skeletal passages. Leopold Nowak's edition of the Requiem supplies Mozart's fragment, Eybler's *Ergänzungen*, and Süssmayr's completion. Daniel Hertz's edition of *Idomeneo* has aided materially in restoring a masterwork to its rightful place in the operatic repertoire. On a smaller scale, the publication of *Single Pieces for Clavier, Organ, Mechanical Clock, and Glass Harmonica* (IX/27/2, ed. Wolfgang Plath) makes available for the first time four-staff scores (as opposed to four-hand arrangements) of the compositions for mechanical clock. To cite an unhappier scenario in Gluck, a critical edition may not necessarily offer the last word, as Bruce Brown's recent recovery of the original libretto of *La rencontre imprévue* graphically illustrates.<sup>12</sup>

Quality editions of composers other than the Viennese giants signal a welcome trend. Samples include H. Allen Crow's two volumes of Dussek's piano music (*RRMNET*; A-R Editions); Stefan Kunze's meticulous edition of Gazzaniga's *Don Giovanni* (Bärenreiter); the collected works of Johann Christian Bach (Ernest Warburton, general editor, Garland); volumes in the *RRMCE* series (vol. 3, symphonies by Carl Friedrich Abel, ed. Sanford Helm; vv. 17, 18, symphonies by Johann Vanhal, ed. Paul Bryan, A-R Editions); and, a massive contribution, *The Symphony 1720-1840*, a comprehensive collection of full scores in sixty volumes (Barry S. Brook, Editor-in-Chief, Garland).

12. Bruce Alan Brown, "Gluck's *Rencontre imprévue* and Its Revisions," *JAMS* 36 (Fall 1983): 498-518.



Within the budget of most performers are excellent practical Urtext editions, for example, the Haydn piano sonatas (ed. Christa Landon, Universal-Edition) and the Beethoven piano sonatas (ed. Bertha Wallner, Henle). Illustrating the Henle commitment to accuracy is Ernst Herttrich's edition of the Mozart piano sonatas (preface dated 1977). It replaced an earlier publication when additional sources became available.<sup>13</sup> Facsimile editions at affordable prices and supplied with authoritative introductions are multiplying, providing performer-scholars entrée to an unedited world of primary materials. Garland leads the way with series such as *The Collected Works for Solo Keyboard by Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach* (Darrell Berg), *Italian Opera 1640-1770* (Howard Mayer Brown), and *German Opera 1770-1800* (Thomas Bauman).

The editor of a reconstruction may speculate to a degree not allowed in a critical edition. For a representative example, see H.C. Robbins Landon's fleshing out of Mozart's unfinished Mass in C minor, K. 427 (417a; Eulenburg, cop. 1956), especially the eight-part realization of the Sanctus and Osanna (cf. Landon's solution with the recently-published *NMA* volume, ed. Monika Holl and Karl-Heinz Köhler, I/1/5).

## Sound

Several considerations fall under the broad heading of Sound, beginning with the instruments themselves. *NGDMI* provides a convenient starting point as it traces instrumental construction and evolution. Although the fortepiano long has received the lion's share of attention, welcome change is afoot. In a model study that performer-scholars on other instruments might well wish to emulate, Robin Stowell details the violin's evolution between 1760 and 1840, a remarkable period of transition from Italian to French domination.<sup>14</sup> Available today also is a wide range of original instruments, often admirably restored, and skillfully built replicas, such as the fortepianos by Philip Belt. No longer restricted to prose descriptions and accounts, modern performers can actually see, hear, and play, experiences that have converted more than one skeptic.

Closely related to the instruments and still somewhat uncertain (even with Haydn) is the particular instrument envisioned by the composer, who, wishing to maximize his sales, often listed multiple options. A

13. For a lively account of how and why he established his music publishing business, see Günter Henle, "Three Spheres," *PQ* 99 (Fall 1977): 4-21.

14. Stowell, *Violin Technique and Performance Practice* (see note 10 above). The piano will, of course, continue to attract. I eagerly await Robert Winter's forthcoming book, *The Romantic Piano: Its Makers and Its Music*.



typical Pleyel title page might read, for example, "A Favourite Sonata for the Piano Forte or Harpsichord With an Accompaniment for a Flute or Violin and Violoncello."<sup>15</sup> Recent clarifications of several heretofore confusing arrays of choice are attributable largely to new, scholarly thematic catalogs, of which the late Rita Benton's Pleyel volume provides a splendid example.<sup>16</sup>

Of the orchestra, Robert Winter observes: "Attempts to create the sound and balance of Classical orchestras simply by reducing the numbers while retaining modern instruments and seating plans is doomed to failure (*NGDMI* 3:57). In fruitful collaborations, performers in several countries have established entire classical orchestras of historical instruments, England's The Academy of Ancient Music, for instance. While Adam Carse's pioneering effort of 1940 remains the only scholarly book devoted solely to the Classic period orchestra, significant updates concerning orchestral size, disposition, and conducting have appeared as parts of larger studies by Daniel Koury and Linda Ferguson.<sup>17</sup>

To acquire the necessary expertise, whatever one's instrument or voice, 18th-century performing techniques must be investigated and tried. Applied in C.P.E. Bach's *Probe-Sonaten*, for example, are the fingerings explained in his *Versuch*. Treatises and methods abound, the bulk of them devoted to keyboard (Clementi, Dussek, Hummel), violin (Geminiani, L'Abbé le fils, Löhlein, Corrette, Hiller, Kreutzer, Rode), or voice (Tosi, Bérard, Marpurg, Hiller, Corri, Martini, Vaccaj, Garcia).<sup>18</sup> For the voice, too often slighted in performance practice studies,

15. Malcolm S. Cole, "A Pleyel Collection at UCLA," *Notes* 29 (December 1972): 219. The composition cited is Sonata 1, in C, from the set of six sonatas dedicated to the Queen of Great Britain.

16. Rita Benton, *Ignace Pleyel: a Thematic Catalogue of his Compositions* (New York: Pendragon Press, 1977).

17. Daniel J. Koury, *Orchestral Performance Practices in the Nineteenth Century: Size, Proportions, and Seating* (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1986); Linda Faye Ferguson, "Col basso' and 'Generalbass' in Mozart's Keyboard Concertos: Notation, Performance Theory, and Practice" (Ph.D. dissertation, Princeton University, 1983).

18. For a report about a treatise for another instrument, see Thomas E. Warner, "Tromlitz's Flute Treatise: a Neglected Source of Eighteenth-Century Performance Practice," *A Musical Offering: Essays in Honor of Martin Bernstein*, ed. Edward H. Clinkscale and Claire Brook (New York: Pendragon Press, 1977), pp. 261-73 [*Auführlicher und gründlicher Unterricht die Flöte zu Spielen* (Leipzig, 1791)].



Suzanne Beicken has prepared a translation, with commentary, of Johann Adam Hiller's seminal treatise of 1780.<sup>19</sup>

Scholars have begun to isolate the components of technique. Jeanne Bamberger suggests four functions of Beethoven's own keyboard fingerings: balance, grouping, touch, and character.<sup>20</sup> Similarly, examining Beethoven's keyboard and string fingerings, William S. Newman offers interpretive clues under four rubrics: articulation, grouping of ideas, realization of ornament signs, and tone color and projection.<sup>21</sup> More problematic areas of keyboard technique include pedalling and, in Haydn and Mozart especially, the interpretation of performance directions. We cannot yet answer the three provocative questions Robert Winter poses concerning the limited dynamic markings of the period: (1) Is the performer "freed from the usual restraints imposed by a score?" (2) Do "conventions no longer familiar still apply?" (3) What are the implications of "the fact that the marking *mf* (or *mp*) so rarely appears in the scores of Haydn and Mozart"?<sup>22</sup>

The late 18th-century keyboard performer chose basically between non-touch-sensitive instruments (organ, harpsichord) and touch-sensitive instruments (clavichord, fortepiano).<sup>23</sup> The modern performer faces yet another choice, that between period instruments and the modern piano. Once the latter is selected, adaptation becomes the keyword. Should the informed player "strive to translate his experiences of historical instruments to modern pianos or should [he] regard his performances of the earlier repertory as essentially transcriptions" (Winter, *NGDMI* 3: 55)? Stephen Bishop's elegant rendition on a modern instrument of Mozart's Piano Concerto in C Major, K. 503 demonstrates that one can be perfectly up-to-date in all other respects.<sup>24</sup> Lively, ongoing debate

19. Suzanne J. Beicken, "Johann Adam Hiller's *Anweisung zum Musikalisch-Zierlichen Gesange*, 1780: a Translation and Commentary" (Ph.D. dissertation, Stanford University, 1980).

20. Jeanne Bamberger, "The Musical Significance of Beethoven's Fingerings in the Piano Sonatas," *Music Forum* 4 (1976): 237-80. Bamberger's discussion of a psychological, as opposed to technical, significance of fingerings inspired an entire dissertation: Deborah Yardley Beers, "'Bebung' in Beethoven?: the Meaning and Execution of the Composer's Indications for Change of Fingers on Tied Notes in the Piano Works" (DMA dissertation, University of Colorado at Boulder, 1985).

21. William S. Newman, "Beethoven's Fingerings as Interpretive Clues," *JM* 1 (April 1982): 171-97.

22. Winter, *NGDMI* 3:57. For one scholar's opinions, see Ratner, *Classic Music*, 187-90.

23. For a particularly lucid discussion, see A. Peter Brown, *Joseph Haydn's Keyboard Music: Sources and Style* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1986), especially Essay V, "The Question of Keyboard Idiom," pp. 134-71.

24. W.A. Mozart, Piano Concertos K. 467 and K. 503, Stephen Bishop, London Symphony Orchestra, cond. Colin Davis (Philips 6500 431).



seems likely concerning technical matters (such as tone production, and acceptable range of colors, dynamics, and accent) and more problematic transcriptional matters (such as the respacing of chords in the bass register, or exceeding the fortepiano range available to the composer, as in Beethoven's Sonata op. 90/I, m. 214, beat one [adding the lower octave E]).

Once limited to fortepiano or chamber ensemble with fortepiano, recordings now embrace other chamber combinations, symphonies, *Lieder*, the mass, and even opera. A measure of the quantitative growth of fortepiano recordings can be gained from Ann Basart, who lists commercially-produced records, through 1984, on 336 labels in her impressive *The Sound of the Fortepiano: a Discography* (1985; see note 9). Astounding as well is the qualitative growth from the Jörg Demus set of Beethoven keyboard works on an unrestored historical instrument (*Beethovens Clavier*, BASF, KHF-20328) to Malcolm Bilson's exemplary renditions of C.P.E. Bach, Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven on responsive, beautifully-sounding replicas (chiefly on the Nonesuch label). With some compositions now available in multiple versions, for the Classic period at least one sees evidence of Robert Winter's hoped-for next step: "The surest sign that the movement is coming of age will be when the next review of its progress can focus on performance issues rather than the instruments upon which they are fought out."<sup>25</sup>

Tuning and temperament continue to offer severe challenges. Whether addressed in depth by Arthur Mendel or summarized by Robert Winter, the inescapable conclusion is that for the Classic period these matters are neither settled nor uniform.<sup>26</sup> Much research is needed!

### Tempo and Rhythm

Perhaps no component better illustrates the relativity of performance practice studies than Tempo and Rhythm. "Time is the soul of music," Leopold Mozart claims (*Violin Playing*, p. 30). Enticingly, he leads us on: "Every melodious piece has at least one phrase from which one can recognize quite surely what sort of speed the piece demands" (p. 33).

---

25. Robert Winter, "The Emperor's New Clothes: Nineteenth-Century Instruments Revisited," *19th Century Music* 7 (April 1984): 262. See his earlier "Performing Nineteenth-Century Music on Nineteenth-Century Instruments," *19th Century Music* 1 (November 1977): 163-75. Basart, *The Sound of the Fortepiano*, pp. 40-41, lists versions of Beethoven's Sonata op. 31, no. 2 by Malcolm Bilson, Malcolm Binns, Jörg Demus, Kenneth Drake, and Anthony Newman.

26. Arthur Mendel, "Pitch in Western Music since 1500: a Reexamination," *AM* 50, Fasc. I/II (1978): 1-93; 328. Winter, *NGDMI* 3:55.



Then, frustratingly, just as we are about to grasp it, the elusive key to tempo fades away: "Long experience and good judgment are required" (p. 33).

For tempo, two questions are paramount. First, how can appropriate tempos be determined? The Classic period had two ways, Leonard Ratner explains: descriptively [i.e., relatively], with terms and qualifying words; mechanically [i.e., absolutely], with watch, pendulum, clockwork, pulse, and finally the metronome (see the Crotch tempo suggestions reprinted in Ratner, p. 184).<sup>27</sup> "The *descriptive* reflected the performance practice of the time more faithfully, since it was based on a set of expressive conventions. Tempo indicated the ruling sentiment."<sup>28</sup> Second, a tempo having been chosen, should that pulse be maintained strictly [i.e., constant], or is some deviation permissible [i.e., fluctuation]? The theorists generally advocate a steady tempo, with slight modifications allowable as an expressive nuance. In effect, two types of rubato exist in the Classic period: an 18th-century meaning — allowing the melody to fall behind the steady pulse of the bass (for a written-out example, see Mozart's Sonata in C minor, K. 457/II, m. 19); a more modern usage (in Koch, for example) — slight variations in note lengths that result in a quickening and holding back.

Rhythmic probes tend to fall into two categories: (1) matters of detail in which one quickly can become either mired (3 against 2, overdotting) or sidetracked by absorbing rarities (polymeters in Mozart: *Don Giovanni*/I, ensemble finale, Oboe Quartet K. 370(368b)/III, m. 95, Piano Concerto K. 456/III, beg. m. 171; an incorrect rhythmic notation in Beethoven's Sonata op. 57/I, beg. m. 81);<sup>29</sup> (2) more global views of rhythm and its contributions to expression. A building block of his "Rhetoric" division, Ratner's Chapter 5 is required reading, with its explorations of meter, *Quantitas intrinseca*, scansion, and rhythmic arrangements. "Rhythm in 18th-century music contributes to *expression*

27. Ratner, *Classic Music*, pp. 183-87. By the close of the Classic period, the simple tempo words adequate for Haydn and Mozart had attracted countless satellites, as in Beethoven's Sonata op. 90/I: *Mit Lebhaftigkeit und durchaus mit Empfindung und Ausdruck*. Concerning absolute tempos, two articles make enjoyable reading: Ralph Kirkpatrick, "Eighteenth-Century Metronomic Indications," *PAMS* (1938): 30-50; Nicholas Temperley, "Tempo and Repeats in the Early Nineteenth Century," *ML* 47 (October 1966): 323-36. For a thought-provoking recent investigation of tempo in Beethoven, see William S. Newman, "Tempo in Beethoven's Instrumental Music: Its Choice and Its Flexibility," *PQ* 116 (Winter 1981-82): 22-29; 117 (Spring 1982): 22-31.

28. Ratner, *Classic Music*, p. 183. For a fuller understanding of the quoted material, Ratner's Part I (Expression) is crucial, especially Section 2 (Topics).

29. Claude H. Herndon, "A Notational Error in the *Appassionata* (Op. 57)," *PQ* 138 (Summer 1987): 54.



with typical dance and march patterns . . . and by choice of meter and tempo. It helps to organize *rhetoric* by locating stressed and unstressed moments and by the play of regular and irregular groupings of beats, measures, and phrases."<sup>30</sup> Ultimately, tempo and rhythm are inseparable. Wye J. Allanbrook, for example, has brilliantly applied Ratner's approach to Mozart's *Le nozze di Figaro* and *Don Giovanni*.<sup>31</sup> Other masterworks await comparable scrutiny.

### Phrasing and Articulation

Writing in *NGDMI*, Geoffrey Chew cites Phrasing and Articulation as "the elements for which the performer bears the most direct responsibility" ("Articulation," 1:77). While generally they have not received the systematic treatment due their significance, truly the assorted markings of dot, stroke, and slur can make or break a performance. Phrasing simply refers to melodic sections that hang together.<sup>32</sup> Addressed to some degree for Mozart (the Badura-Skodas) and Beethoven (Newman), the chief phrasing issue of the Classic period requires much more research: "the extent to which individually slurred bars are to be connected into longer phrases" (Winter, *NGDMI* 3:58).<sup>33</sup>

"*Articulation* signifies the degree of separation between notes and figures in performance; it also refers to degrees of emphasis" (Ratner, *Classic Music*, p. 190). Thus, articulation brings clarity to a performance, imbuing it with personality in the process. During the Classic period, articulation must be approached in two ways: the meanings of the various markings; the evolution, chronicled by Clementi and others, from a detached style of execution to a legato delivery. Concerning the markings, for the period of Haydn and Mozart, Türk (Chapter 6) and others impart the general intent of dot, stroke, and slur clearly enough. However, debate about specific realizations of these markings promises to continue. Did composers intend a distinction between dot and wedge (indeed, are dot and wedge always distinguishable in a composer's

30. Ratner, *Classic Music*, p. 68. See also the concise discussion of poetic feet by William S. Newman, "Four Baroque Keyboard Practices and What Became of Them," *PQ* 130 (Summer 1985): 23-25.

31. Allanbrook, *Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart*. See, for example, the metrical spectrum chart, p. 67.

32. For an introduction to the topic, see Hermann Keller, *Phrasing and Articulation: a Contribution to a Rhetoric of Music*, trans. Leigh Gerdine (New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 1965).

33. See Ratner, *Classic Music*, Chapter 3 (Periodicity), for an important, stimulating, and hopefully prophetic discussion of periodicity, with its enormous implications for performance.



autograph?)?<sup>34</sup> How much value does a staccato dot remove from the note it modifies? How does one execute those ticklish series of dots connected with a slur over a passage (portato; Türk's *Tragen der Töne*)? Should one adjust or retain inconsistencies between parallel passages? Concerning the evolution from detached to legato, a paradoxical situation must be acknowledged: on the one hand, "The variety of articulations found in Haydn and Mozart survived well into the 1820s" (Winter, *NGDMI* 3:58); on the other, "Melodies around the turn of the century began to acquire a more continuous and broader sweep, calling for a legato style of performance. This shift represents a fundamental change in declamation; Haydn and Mozart were linked to the older tradition, Beethoven to the newer style" (Ratner, *Classic Music*, p. 190).

### Ornamentation and Improvisation

Post-1750 Ornamentation remains a fascinating, ever controversial subject. The 18th-century treatises supply plentiful ammunition for a host of more recent coverages, beginning with Heinrich Schenker's important *Ein Beitrag zur Ornamentik*.<sup>35</sup> Organized by family and function, Robert Donington's "Ornaments" entry in *NGDMI* provides a structured introduction to the topic (2:931-72). The Badura-Skodas, Newman, Ratner, and others have made valuable contributions as well, Ratner, for example, calling attention to the broad categories of *Spielmanieren* (performance ornaments) and *Setzmanieren* (written out, compositional ornaments; *Classic Music*, pp. 196-200).

In 1978, Frederick Neumann issued a forceful challenge, its purpose: to release 17th- and 18th-century music from "the stranglehold of the on-beat monopoly."<sup>36</sup> More recently, he has addressed ornamentation and improvisation in Mozart specifically, allotting equal time to vocal music, and recognizing the centrality of context.<sup>37</sup> Convincingly, Neumann demonstrates that Mozart's "Vorschlag, slide, trill, turn, and arpeggio had a wider range of freedom and flexibility than is usually believed to be the

34. Hans Albrecht, *Die Bedeutung der Zeichen Keil, Strich und Punkt bei Mozart: Fünf Lösungen einer Preisfrage* (Cassel: Bärenreiter, 1957). The finale of Mozart's Sonata K. 333(315c), the Fantasy in C minor, K. 475, and the great Rondo in A minor, K. 511, make particularly effective teaching pieces for the study of articulation and phrasing.

35. Heinrich Schenker, *Ein Beitrag zur Ornamentik: als Einführung zu Ph. Em. Bachs Klavierwerken, mitumfassend auch die Ornamentik Haydns, Mozarts, Beethovens etc.*, rev. ed. (Vienna: Universal, 1908). For an English translation, see H. Schenker, "A Contribution to the Study of Ornamentation," trans. Hedi Siegel, *Music Forum* 4 (1976): 1-139.

36. Frederick Neumann, *Ornamentation in Baroque and Post-Baroque Music: with Special Emphasis on J.S. Bach* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1978).

37. Neumann, *Ornamentation and Improvisation* (see note 10 above).



case" (p. ix). "To 'apply' a rule from a treatise to another master's music...is a dangerous procedure, comparable to a surgical transplant of a vital organ that can succeed only on condition of full compatibility and superb surgical skill . . ." (pp. 3-4). Hopefully, Neumann's nicely-turned phrase will inspire contextual studies that will prove immensely fruitful not only for the practices of Mozart and Beethoven, which are reasonably well covered already, but particularly for Haydn's complex ornamentation.<sup>38</sup>

As Neumann's title suggests, ornamentation is closely tied to another practice that runs through the Classic period, Improvisation: "any pitches sung or played that were not written in the score, whether done in impromptu spontaneity or prepared in advance" (Neumann, *Ornamentation and Improvisation*, p. 179). Four questions help focus this often treacherous issue: (1) What passages are already ornamented? (2) What passages do not require ornamentation? (3) What passages might benefit from it? (4) What passages must have it? Several situations bear the potential for improvisation (Table 1), whether the insertions be single pitches, "small" ornaments, or larger additions of two distinct kinds: "one, the florid elaboration of a written melody, the other, the filling in of empty spaces with transitional passages" (Neumann, p. 179).

To reach informed decisions, the performer must consult written-out models in the music of C.P.E. Bach, Haydn, and Mozart; 18th-century treatises, notably Hiller's and Türk's; and modern secondary sources, such as Eva Badura-Skoda and Ratner (general) and the Badura-Skodas, Melkus, and Neumann (for Mozart).<sup>39</sup> Following Türk's lead, 20th-century writers advocate moderation. Beyond this consensus and some other basic agreements about where improvisation is mandatory — vocal appoggiaturas, *Eingänge*, cadenzas, clearly skeletal passages in the piano concertos — lie numerous issues which demand further investigation. Is improvised embellishment as necessary on modern instruments? Besides appoggiaturas and (one-breath) fermata embellishments, should it be added to arias of Mozart's maturity? Is improvisation strictly the

38. For a modest beginning in English, see Paul Badura-Skoda, "On Ornamentation in Haydn," trans. Frank E. Kirby, *PQ* 135 (Fall 1986): 38-48. Excellent instructional movements include Mozart, Sonata in A minor, K. 310(300d)/II, and Sonata in C minor, K. 457/II (especially for turns and small notes); and Haydn, Sonata in Eb Major, H.XVI:49/II.

39. Eva Badura-Skoda, "Improvisation," *NG* 9:43-48, including a handy summary of Hiller's rules for vocal improvisation. The same entry appears in *NGDMI* 2:296-301. Eduard Melkus, "Zur Auszierung der Da-Capo-Arien in Mozarts Werken," *MJb* (1968/70): 159-85, attempts to accomplish in the vocal sphere what the Badura-Skodas did in the instrumental sphere.



province of the soloist?<sup>40</sup> Can Türk's observations of a piece's tempo and character (for instance, "naive" vs. "flirtatious," Chapter 5) meaningfully point the modern performer toward appropriate degrees of improvised embellishment? For these questions, as for so many other performance practice matters, Haydn's music sorely needs attention.

TABLE 1

1. Recitative
2. Da Capo Arias
3. Slow Movements — for a written-out example, see Mozart's Piano Sonata K. 332 (300k)/II, autograph versus first edition
4. Rondo Returns
5. Sonatas with Altered Reprises
6. Skeletal Passages — see Mozart's Piano Concerto in C minor, K. 491/I (for suggested solutions, see the Badura-Skodas, <i>Interpreting Mozart</i> , pp. 194-95, and the <i>NMA V/15/7</i> ).
7. Empty Spaces at Articulation Points within or between Structural Units —
<i>Eingänge</i> : for models, see Mozart's Piano Variations K. 613 and Beethoven's Piano Concerto op. 37/III.
Cadenzas: for models, see Mozart's Piano Sonata K. 333(315c)/III and Piano Concerto K. 488/I; for two dramatically different solutions conceived for the same movement, see Beethoven's Piano Concerto op. 58/I.

The cadenza requires a special word. The modern performer ideally should use Mozart's own when they survive.<sup>41</sup> In their absence, options

40. Neumann, *Ornamentation and Improvisation*, p. 183, firmly believes that it is: "Improvisation is strictly the province of the soloist. It has no place in orchestral or choral performance, and hardly any in chamber music." A detailed report of 18th-century practice suggests otherwise: John Spitzer and Neal Zaslaw, "Improvised Ornamentation in Eighteenth-Century Orchestras," *JAMS* 39 (Fall 1986): 524-77.

41. Eva Badura-Skoda, "Cadenza," *NGDMI* 1:294-96. The same entry appears in *NG* 3:588-92. For a concise overview of Mozart cadenza sources, see Ruth Rendleman, "A Reference Guide to the Cadenzas for the Mozart Piano Concertos," *PQ* 114 (Summer 1981): 35-40. For a recent study of the cadenza in relation to the composer's artistic control, see Michael Sitton, "Mozart's Cadenzas and Improvisations," *PQ* 138 (Summer 1987): 40-44.



include cadenzas by contemporaries and by later composers (masters such as Brahms and Britten; lesser lights such as Carl Reinecke). Because excesses of length, virtuosity, and style intrude so frequently, several 20th-century composers and performers, notably Soulima Stravinsky and especially Marius Flothuis, have returned to 18th-century principles of style, proportions, and technical moderation. Given the number of surviving Mozart cadenzas and the analytical/structural model extracted therefrom by the Badura-Skodas (*Interpreting Mozart*, Chapter 11), an informed performer can reasonably improvise his/her own.

### Continuo

While the Continuo survives in the Classic period, chiefly in sacred music and simple recitative, it "had severed its link with any improvisation worthy of that name and had at best become no more than the transcription of a bass into simple chords for the right hand of the keyboard player."<sup>42</sup> Mozart's piano concertos and, to a lesser degree, Haydn's and Mozart's mature symphonies continue to stimulate discussion. The editors of the *NMA* have restored the tutti string bass line to the keyboard (*col basso*) and supplemented it where possible with *Generalbass* figures or realizations from Mozart's time.<sup>43</sup> Still, is the continuo even needed in performance today? Rosen, for one, considers it unnecessary, even distracting. Others view the discreet participation of a Mozart fortepiano — a participation that respects the solo-tutti polarity — as an acceptable alternative (e.g., Neumann, Ratner). Ferguson, whose work in this area merits wider circulation, painstakingly documents the Classic period view of continuo participation, concluding: "A trained musician was expected to play during the tuttis as accompanist and Director, but an amateur might rest" ("*Col basso*' and '*Generalbass*,'" p. iii).

---

42. Neumann, *Ornamentation and Improvisation*, 253. See also the Badura-Skodas, *Interpreting Mozart*, Chapter 9; Rosen, *The Classical Style*, pp. 191-96; and Ratner, *Classic Music*, pp. 137-38.

43. For a sample of the reactions elicited by the preserved *Generalbass* realization of the Piano Concerto K. 246, see the *NMA* (V/15/2): to accompany a full orchestra; Rosen, *The Classical Style*, pp. 192-93: to replace missing winds; Ferguson, "*Col basso*' and '*Generalbass*,'" 27: half of a very early "example of a concerto whose orchestral tuttis happened to be arranged, on one special occasion, for two keyboards."



## Musical Design

A final component, Musical Design (in its broadest implications), merits more sustained examination than it has received thus far.<sup>44</sup> Potential areas of investigation are listed in Table 2.

TABLE 2

1. Whether or not to observe the repeats indicated by the composer.<sup>45</sup>
2. Reordering the movement cycle: for example, by exchanging the position of the slow movement and the dance movement.
3. Reducing the movement cycle by eliminating one or more movements: e.g., Beethoven, Violin Sonata op. 30, no. 2, delete the Scherzo; Mozart, "Haffner" Serenade K. 250(248b), delete one or more of the eight movements in concert performance.
4. Augmenting the movement cycle: for Beethoven's Quartet op. 130, include both the new finale and the Great Fugue.
5. Substitution of movements: for example, replace the original finale of Mozart's Piano Concerto K. 175 with the Rondo K. 382.
6. Choosing the original or a substantially revised version of a work: for example, Beethoven's Quartet op. 18, no. 1 (for the original, see the performance by the Pro Arte Quartet, Laurel Record, LR-116).
7. Realizing the composer's "ideal" intention or his "final" version: for example, Beethoven's Fifth Symphony/III, five-part version vs. three-part version.<sup>46</sup>
8. Incomplete or Unfinished Works: supplementing the preserved components with other movements, as in Mozart's Mass in C minor, K. 427(417a); supplementing an incomplete orchestration, as in C.R.F. Maunder's amplification of Mozart's Requiem (W.A. Mozart, *Requiem*, cond. Christopher Hogwood, L'Oiseau-Lyre 411 712-1).
9. Doubtful or Spurious Works: the Sinfonia Concertante K. 297b (Anh.C • 14.01) is a particularly controversial example.<sup>47</sup>

44. Newman, *Performance Practices*, Chapter 14, provides a good beginning for Beethoven.

45. For a recent survey of a longstanding question, see Elfrieda Hiebert, "Beethoven's Pathétique Sonata, op. 13: Should the Grave Be Repeated?", *PQ* 133 (Spring 1986): 33-37.

46. Sieghard Brandenburg, "Once Again: On the Question of the Repeat of the Scherzo and Trio in Beethoven's Fifth Symphony," *Beethoven Essays: Studies in Honor of Elliot Forbes*, ed. Lewis Lockwood and Phyllis Benjamin (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1984), 146-98.

47. Daniel N. Leeson and Robert D. Levin, "On the Authenticity of K. Anh.C 14.01(297b), a Symphonia Concertante for Four Winds and Orchestra," *MJb* (1976/77): 70-96. Announced for some time, Levin's *Who Wrote the Mozart Four-Wind Concertante?* (Pendragon Press) has not yet appeared.



10. Opera, a challenging area of investigation:
- a. Cuts
  - b. Insertions
  - c. A particular version, e.g., *Idomeneo* in its Munich form (W.A. Mozart, *Idomeneo*, cond. Nikolaus Harnoncourt, Telefunken 6.35547-00-501); *Fidelio* in its 1804-5 version (Beethoven, *Leonore*, cond. Herbert Blomstedt, Arabesque Recordings 8043-3L).
  - d. Sequence of components, e.g., the now discredited Moberly/Raeburn hypothesis for *Figaro*, Act III.<sup>48</sup>
  - e. Libretto, e.g., *Die Zauberflöte*.<sup>49</sup>

Closely related is the matter of appropriate settings, acoustical and otherwise. For example, should Haydn's symphonic masses be presented in concert performances? Not only are the liturgical connections severed; the unbroken stretches of tonic key can become tiresome!

In sum, impressive work has been accomplished; much remains to be done. While a comprehensive, single-volume overview appears premature, praiseworthy models exist for numerous types of specialized, potentially fruitful investigation. Needed especially, in terms of components, is more exploration of sound (to include 18th-century technique, instruments other than fortepiano and violin, the voice, and adaptation to modern instruments), phrasing and articulation, musical design, even rhythm/tempo. Needed equally are more exhaustive studies of the performance practices of individual composers (notably C.P.E. Bach and Haydn), more attention to the larger genres, particularly opera (to include staging), and sustained coverage of specific compositions.<sup>50</sup>

For this overview, I have isolated the various components. The performer must integrate them. The appropriate execution of an ornament, for example, might influence the choice of tempo.<sup>51</sup> Danger lurks and frustration arises in a subject that involves taste and feeling to such a degree. At the same time, challenge, reward, and a variety of

48. Robert Moberly and Christopher Raeburn, "Mozart's 'Figaro': the Plan of Act III," *ML* 46 (April 1965): 134-36. For information about the rediscovered primary source that refutes their hypothesis, see Alan Tyson, "Le nozze di Figaro: Lessons from the Autograph Score," *MT* 122 (July 1981): 456-61.

49. Michael Freyhan, "Toward the Original Text of Mozart's *Die Zauberflöte*," *JAMS* 39 (Summer 1986): 355-80.

50. For an example of a promising multi-media type of study, see Paul Badura-Skoda, "A Master Lesson on Mozart's Fantasy in C Minor (475)," *PQ* 125 (Spring 1984): 36-39, with accompanying recording.

51. See Neumann, *Ornamentation and Improvisation*, p. 155, concerning Mozart's overture to *Le nozze di Figaro*.



acceptable solutions to almost any given problem await the adventurous. Assisted by a host of sources, the performer-scholar is well equipped to negotiate the Classic period, guided by a final caution from Taruskin: beware, he warns, of "reliance upon authentic editions, authentic instruments, or authentic performance practices learned from authentic treatises in place of careful and independent consideration of the music" ("The Musicologist and the Performer," p. 112). Thus supported and advised, the modern performer is in an enviable position to undertake, through reflection, study, and "extensive experience and practice" (Quantz, p. 297), his/her return "back to the land."