## APPENDIX A

# CONFLICT, CONFLICT VICTIMIZATION, AND LEGAL REDRESS, 1945-1996

JENNIFER L. BALINT

Ι

### INTRODUCTION

This report details a preliminary empirical, descriptive and legal study of armed conflict 1946 to 19961 compiled by the author under the auspices of the International Human Rights Law Institute. There have been a number of empirical studies on the incidence of conflict. This perspective of this study is on the relationship between conflict, conflict victimization, and legal redress. The study will demonstrate the gaps that exist between the incidence of armed conflict and the usually consequent commission of grave human rights violations, the current international, regional, and national legal frameworks, the regulation of such conflicts, and their victimization. The focus of this study is on the perpetration of grave human rights violations and their legal redress. The study is not a statistical study. Rather, it is primarily qualitative, with the necessary inclusion of conflict deaths adding a quantitative element. This study does not aim to be exhaustive. It aims to provide an illustrative and definitional guide to the relationship between the incidence of conflict, its legal characterization, its conflict categorization, the victimization incurred in the conflict, and any known legal redress.

H

## **METHODOLOGY**

## A. Process of Compilation

The first step was to gather data on conflicts that occurred from 1945 to 1996. This was done using a number of different sources. Secondary sources

Copyright © 1997 by Law and Contemporary Problems

Law Program/Research School of Social Sciences, The Australian National University.

This report was compiled while the author was a Research Fellow at the International Human Rights Law Institute, DePaul University. The author acknowledges the direction of M. Cherif Bassiouni on this project and the preliminary collaboration of Elizabeth Kidd.

<sup>1.</sup> Note that the study does not include victimization during World War II and subsequent legal redress.

<sup>2.</sup> The principle sources used for the gathering of data are as follows: HERBERT K. TILLEMA, INTERNATIONAL ARMED CONFLICT SINCE 1945: A BIBLIOGRAPHIC HANDBOOK OF WARS AND

have been the main source of information, namely newspaper and journal articles, conference reports, and books. Other conflict studies have been consulted. Some primary sources have been consulted, notably reports and transcripts of trials and truth commissions where available. Gaps in the study are due to the unavailability of certain information.

## **B.** Conflict Categories

The next step was to categorize the conflicts. This was accomplished by determining the following aspects of all conflicts:

- (1) the classification of the conflict (legal and social scientific);
- (2) the parties involved: main perpetrators, main victims, third parties;
- (3) the victimization (deaths);
- (4) duration of the conflict;
- (5) intervention if any;
- (6) nature of the cessation of the conflict; and
- (7) legal redress, if any, and of what type.

## C. Definitions

There are certain levels of categorization in the study for which an explanation is necessary.

MILITARY INTERVENTIONS (1991); SI INTERNATIONAL DIMENSIONS OF INT

MILITARY INTERVENTIONS (1991); SIPRI YEARBOOKS; PIOOM REPORTS; UPPSALA REPORTS; THE INTERNATIONAL DIMENSIONS OF INTERNAL CONFLICT (Michael E. Brown ed. 1996); R. J. RUMMEL, DEATH BY GOVERNMENT (1994); EVAN LUARD, CONFLICT AND PEACE IN THE MODERN INTERNATIONAL SYSTEM. A STUDY OF THE PRINCIPLES OF INTERNATIONAL ORDER (1988. 2d ed.); EVAN LUARD, THE INTERNATIONAL REGULATION OF CIVIL WARS (1972); SEMINAR ON THE RIGHT TO RESTITUTION, COMPENSATION AND REHABILITATION FOR VICTIMS OF GROSS VIOLATIONS OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS (Theo van Boven et al, eds. 1992); COMMISSION NATIONALE CONSULTATIVE DES DROITS DE L'HOMME & THE INTERNATIONAL COMMISSION OF Jurists, Justice not Impunity (1992); Leo Kuper, Genocide. Its Political Use in the TWENTIETH CENTURY (1981); LEO KUPER, THE PITY OF IT ALL. POLARISATION OF RACIAL AND ETHNIC RELATIONS (1977), IMPUNITY AND HUMAN RIGHTS IN INTERNATIONAL LAW AND PRACTICE (N. Roht-Arriaza ed., 1995), William Eckhardt & Edward Azar, Major World Conflicts and Interventions 1945-1975, 5 INTERNATIONAL INTERACTIONS 1, 75 (1978); Peter Wallensteen & Karin Axell, Conflict Resolution and the End of the Cold War, 31 JOURNAL OF PEACE RESEARCH 3, 333 (1994); Istvan Kende, Wars of Ten Years (1967-1976), 3 JOURNAL OF PEACE RESEARCH 15, 227 (1978); J. DAVID SINGER & MELVIN SMALL, THE WAGES OF WAR 1816-1965. A STATISTICAL HANDBOOK (1972); MICHAEL KIDRON & DAN SMITH, THE WAR ATLAS: ARMED CONFLICT-ARMED PEACE (1983); Barbara Harff & Ted R. Gurr, Victims of the State: Genocides, Politicides, and Group Repression from 1945 to 1995, in Contemporary Genocides: Causes, Cases, Consequences (Albert J. Jongman ed., 1996); TED R. GURR & BARBARA HARFF, ETHNIC CONFLICT IN WORLD POLITICS (1994); CASE STUDIES ON HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS. A WORLD SURVEY (Willem. A. Veenhoven ed. 1976); TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE. HOW EMERGING DEMOCRACIES RECKON WITH FORMER REGIMES (Neil J. Kritz ed. 1995); HELEN FEIN, GENOCIDE WATCH (1992); TOWARD THE UNDERSTANDING AND PREVENTION OF GENOCIDE. PROCEEDINGS OF THE INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON THE HOLOCAUST AND GENOCIDE (Israel W. Charny ed., 1984); Priscilla B. Hayner, Fifteen Truth Commissions, 1974 to 1994: A Comparative Study, 16 HUM. RTS. Q. 597 (1994); PIOOM WORLD CONFLICT MAP 1995 & 1996; Human Rights Watch Reports; Amnesty Reports.

#### 1. Conflict.

For the purposes of this study, conflict is defined as public institutionalized armed conflict. It includes armed conflict of an international character (the four Geneva Conventions 1949 and Protocol I of 1977), armed conflict of a non-international character (common article 3 of the four Geneva Conventions 1949 and Protocol II of 1977), and purely internal conflict, including tyrannical regime victimization (to which the Genocide Convention, the Torture Convention, and Crimes against Humanity apply). The definition corresponds in part with that of the Department of Peace and Conflict Research (Uppsala University, Sweden): an "armed conflict" is defined as a contested incompatibility that concerns government and/or territory where the use of armed force between two parties, of which at least one is the government of a state, results in at least twenty-five battle-relate d deaths.<sup>3</sup> The study also corresponds to PIOOM's definition of "High Intensity Conflict" by including conflicts within which at least 1,000 deaths have occurred. In addition, the study includes incidents which in and of themselves may not have resulted in 1,000 or more deaths but which are part of a systematic pattern of human rights violations. Clearly, deaths through internal regime victimization do not occur within the traditional concept of "battle" or "armed conflict"; the victims are usually not armed or only minimally, have no collective cohesive nature other than that ascribed by the state as perpetrator or as ascribed by sub-groups that may form to contest the victimization, and cannot be described as an "adversary" except in the terms of the ideological framework of the state. However, such internal conflict is public (by virtue of its being state conducted), institutionalized, and armed, and therefore corresponds to the stated framework definition.

## 2. Conflict Typology

## a. Primary Classification

The database divides conflicts into three basic types, which concur with international legal characterization of conflict. These are termed the primary conflict classifications: (1) international armed conflict between states; (2) non-international armed conflict; and (3) purely internal conflict (including tyrannical regime victimization).

The rationale for this typology is as follows. The conflict types both correspond with the international legal characterization of conflict, thereby providing a formal legal framework for the study, in addition to incorporating a type of conflict - systematic regime victimization - which is not included within current international legal characterization of conflict. The conflicts are

<sup>3.</sup> See Peter Wallensteen & Karen Axell, Conflict Resolution and the End of the Cold War, 1989-93, 31 J. PEACE RESEARCH 3, 333-349 (1994).

<sup>4.</sup> Interdisciplinary Research Program on Root Causes of Human Rights Violations, Leiden University, the Netherlands.

categorized in this way in order to demonstrate which conflicts within the database are included within the current normative international legal framework and which are not. Thus the classification serves to demonstrate the uneven international and national legal regulation of conflicts. It also provides an umbrella framework for classification of conflicts within the study.

## b. Secondary Classification

Each conflict in the database is further classified according to how the conflict may best be described outside of the primary classification of international, non-international, and internal, as well as by the central issue(s) of the conflict. The majority of conflicts will incorporate more than one of the categories listed. For example, a conflict may be classified as a civil war (secondary classification), as well as by natural resources (central conflict issue). There are eighteen conflict issue classifications and conflict categories, which fall within three main categories: external war/armed conflict, civil war, and state terror/state repression. The eighteen classifications are the following: (1) armed conflict (general); (2) civil war; (3) colonization; (4) decolonization/decolonization continuation (correlate conflict) **:** (5) ethnic conflict; (6) genocide; (7) historically artificial state division or artificial state **(8)** natural resources; (9) national liberation/selfdetermination; (10) religious conflict; (11) rebel; (12) regime; (13) secession; (14) state formation; (15) state terror/state repression; (16) territorial/border; (17) traditional conflict; and (18) war.

## 3. Legal Redress

The legal redress codes used in the study are general codes and, as can be seen, encompass a wide range of legal remedies. There is necessary further work to be done on classification of the depth and intensity of legal redress. An indication of this can be gleaned when a combination of legal remedies is shown to have been employed; however not necessarily when only one remedy has been used. For example, there are clear differences between limited prosecutions and extensive prosecutions. There are also clear differences between overly wide ranging prosecutions and selective prosecutions combined with other legal remedies. There are differences in levels of enforcement.

Another important difference is that between legal remedies used as a purely political tool, often in the course of a particular conflict, and legal remedies following what may be termed "Rule of Law guidelines." For this reason, legal remedies used as a tool of further repression—for example, the military tribunals established by the French against Muslim Algerians in Algeria (Setif), 1945; the prosecution by the British of the Kenyan Mau Mau movement, 1952-56; and the National Commission of Inquiry consisting mainly of members of the Indonesian military established after the November 1991 "Dili Massacre"—have not been included in this report. It is also important to note the contradictions. For example, there can be both a legal remedy - for example, the 1974 Ugandan government Commission of Inquiry into

"Disappearances" of People in Uganda Since the 25th of January, 1971 - yet no legal redress. The following legal redress codes will be used here.

- (a) International Prosecution/Rulings: Includes *ad hoc* international tribunals, rulings of the International Court of Justice, and rulings of regional legal bodies and commissions.
- (b) National Civil Prosecution: Prosecutions by the national civil legal administration.
- (c) National Military Prosecution: Prosecutions by the national military administration.
- (d) Governmental Truth Commissions and Inquiries: Truth commissions or inquiries which are established and conducted by governmental bodies or their delegates.
- (e) Internationally Sponsored Truth Commissions and Inquiries: Truth commissions and inquiries that are internationally conducted by non-state bodies, either non-governmental organizations or the United Nations.
- (f) Non-Governmental Truth Commissions or Inquiries: Truth commissions or inquiries that are nationally conducted by non-governmental bodies.
- (g) Lustration Legislation: National legislation aimed at screening for or removing from public office those individuals alleged to have been involved in the former victimization.
- (h) Compensation Legislation: Includes national, regional, and international legislation, recommendations and awards, aimed at providing compensation for victims of the conflict.
- (i) Amnesty Legislation/Specific Granting of Amnesty: Legislation passed during and after the conflict to bestow amnesty.

### III

#### PRELIMINARY FINDINGS

The study has found an estimated 285 conflicts globally from 1945-1996, of which, as of December 1996, forty-eight were ongoing. These conflicts are grouped, legally, as follows: 65 international, 38 non-international, and 182 internal. The estimated 65 international conflicts produced approximately 11 million deaths between 1945 and 1996. This is compared with the estimated 220 conflicts of a non-international, internal, and tyrannical regime victimization character, which produced approximately 87 million deaths. Taken together, conflicts occurring between 1945 and 1996 have resulted in an estimated 98 million casualties; 87 million of which were in the course of conflicts of a non-international, internal, and tyrannical regime victimization character, and 11 million of which were in the course of conflicts of an international character. The evidence thus is that since World War II, conflicts of a non-international and internal character have produced a far greater level of victimization than conflicts of an international character.

TABLE 1 EXTERNAL WARS <sup>1</sup> AND VICTIMIZATION, 1945-1996

| Date                    | Conflict  | Victimization <sup>2</sup>         | LegalRedress |
|-------------------------|---|------------------------------------|--------------|
| 1950-1962               | Afghanistan - Pakistan                                      | not known                          | No           |
| 1979-1989               | Afghanistan - USSR  | 1.5-2 million                      | No           |
| 1960                    | Cambodia - S. Vietnam<br>(Second Indochina War)             | not known                          | No           |
| 1978-1987               | China - N. Vietnam  | 21,000, 9,000 C                    | No           |
| 1948                    | Costa Rica - Nicaragua                                      | not known                          | No           |
| 1955                    | Costa Rica  | not known                          | No           |
| April 17, 1961          | Cuba - USA  | not known                          | No           |
| 1967-1970               | Egypt - Israel  | 3,000+                             | No           |
| 1982                    | Falklands - Argentina -<br>Great Britain                    | 755-955                            | No           |
| 1945                    | France - Syria  | not known                          | No           |
| 1945-1954               | France - Viet Minh<br>First Indochina War                   | 45,000-1 million <i>C</i> ; 92,797 | No           |
| 1983                    | Grenada - USA   | < 100                              | No           |
| 1963                    | Haiti-Dominican Republic                                    | not known                          | No           |
| 1954                    | Honduras - Guatemala  | not known                          | No           |
| 1962                    | India - China   | 3,000                              | No           |
| 1961-1962               | India - Portugal (Goa)                                      | < 100                              | No           |
| 1962-1966               | Indonesia - Malaysia  | < 100                              | No           |
| 1979-1988               | Iraq - Iran<br>Persian Gulf War                             | 500,000                            | No           |
| 1961                    | Iraq - Kuwait   | not known                          | No           |
| Aug. 1990-<br>Feb. 1991 | Iraq - Kuwait - USA<br>Gulf War                             | not known                          | Yes: h       |
| 1948-1949               | Israel - Egypt - Iraq -<br>Lebanon - Syria -<br>Transjordan | 10,000                             | No           |
| 1956                    | Israel - Egypt  | 1,000+                             | No           |
| June 1967               | Israel - Egypt - Jordan -<br>Syria - Iraq                   | 20,800                             | No           |
| July 1967-<br>1970      | Israel - Egypt - PLO -<br>Jordan- Syria                     | 3,000                              | No           |

| 1973                                       | Israel - Egypt - Syria -<br>Jordan      | 10,000                         | No     |
|--|---|--------------------------------|--------|
| 1978,1982-<br>1985                         | Israel - Lebanon                        | not known                      | No     |
| 1958-1961-<br>1962                         | Laos - Vietnam                          | 18,000-20,000                  | No     |
| 1975-1990                                  | Laos - Vietnam                          | 10,000 ; 30,000 <i>C</i>       | No     |
| July-Sept 1977                             | Libya - Egypt                           | 100+                           | No     |
| 1980-1984                                  | Libya - Tunisia                         | not known                      | No     |
| 1962-1966                                  | Malaysia - Indonesia                    | 100                            | No     |
| 1974-75; 1985                              | Mali - Burkina Faso                     | 400                            | Yes: a |
| 1954                                       | Nicaragua - Guatemalan<br>exiles - USA  | not known                      | No     |
| 1979/1981-<br>1990                         | Nicaragua - USA                         | 30,000 ; 3,000 C               | Yes: a |
| 1950-53                                    | North Korea - South<br>Korea            | 2 million;<br>500,000 <i>C</i> | No     |
| 1947-1949                                  | Pakistan - India (Kashmir)              | 2,000                          | No     |
| 1964-1965                                  | Pakistan - India (Kashmir)              | 6,800                          | Yes: a |
| 1989-cont.                                 | Pakistan - India (Kashmir)              | 12,000-20,000                  | No     |
| 1989                                       | Panama - USA                            | 542-1,000                      | No     |
| July 1977-<br>March<br>1978,1992-<br>cont. | Somalia - Ethiopia<br>(Ogaden)          | 38,000                         | No     |
| 1958-1976                                  | S. Vietnam - N. Vietnam                 | 2 million C                    | No     |
| 1961                                       | Syria - United Arab<br>Republic         | not known                      | No     |
| 1971-1979                                  | Tanzania - Uganda                       | not known                      | No     |
| 1979-cont.                                 | Western Sahara - Morocco<br>-Mauritania | 10,000                         | Yes: a |
| 1953-1959                                  | Kingdom of Yemen<br>(Aden)              | not known                      | No     |
| 1971-1972                                  | North - South Yemen                     | not known                      | No     |

- 1. "External war" includes invasion.
- 2. "Victimization" denotes number of deaths. The deaths in Table 1 are military deaths unless marked by a "c" to denote civilian deaths.
- 3. The legal redress codes are defined, *supra*, in part II.C.3.
- 4. The Nicaraguan-USA conflict could also be classified as a civil war.

TABLE 2
TERRITORIAL/BORDER CONFLICTS AND VICTIMIZATION, 1945-1996

| Date             | Conflict                          | Victimization <sup>1</sup> | Legal<br>Redress² |
|------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------------------|-------------------|
| 1994-1996-cont.  | Republic of Cameroon -<br>Nigeria | not known                  | Yes: a            |
| 1977-1994        | Chad – Libya                      | not known                  | Yes: a            |
| 1949-1969        | China - Taiwan                    | 5,000                      | No                |
| Oct. 1962        | Cuba – USA - USSR                 | not known                  | No                |
| 1964             | Cuba – Venezuela                  | not known                  | No                |
| 1960             | Dominican Republic –<br>Venezuela | not known                  | No                |
| 1951, 1981, 1984 | Ecuador - Peru                    | not known                  | No                |
| 1995             | Ecuador - Peru                    | 1,000                      | No                |
| 1964-1967        | Ethiopia - Somalia –<br>Kenya     | not known                  | No                |
| 1957             | Honduras - Nicaragua              | not known                  | Yes: a            |
| 1972-1975        | Iran – Iraq                       | not known                  | Yes: h            |
| 1980s            | Libya - USA                       | not known                  | No                |
| 1952             | Portugal - China (Macao)          | not known                  | Yes: h            |
| 1995             | Venezuela - Colombia              | < 100                      | No                |

- 1. "Victimization" denotes number of deaths. The deaths in Table 2 are military deaths unless marked by a "c" to denote civilian deaths.
- 2. The legal redress codes are defined, *supra*, in part II.C.3.

 $TABLE\ 3$  Civil War And Victimization, 1945-1996

| Date                     | Conflict <sup>1</sup>                               | Type <sup>2</sup> | Victimization <sup>3</sup> | Legal<br>Redress <sup>4</sup> |
|--------------------------|---|-------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------------|
| 1989-1995-cont.          | Afghanistan   | E, R              | 25,000+                    | No                            |
| May 8, 1945              | Algeria (Setif)                                     | DC                | 1,500-50,000               | No                            |
| Oct. 1954-1962           | Algeria   | DC                | 12,000-60,000              | Yes: b                        |
| 1992-cont.               | Algeria   | R                 | 60,000                     | No                            |
| Feb 1961-1962            | Angola  | NL                | 40,000                     | No                            |
| 1961/2-1974              | Angola  | DC 3,000+         |                            | No                            |
| 1975-1990-1992-<br>cont. | Angola  | Е                 | 1.5 million                | Yes: e                        |
| 1975, 1982-cont.         | Bangladesh  | NR                | 3,000-3,500                | No                            |
| 1960-1965                | Belgian Congo                                       | E, DC, S          | 1,000-10,000               | No                            |
| July 1946                | Bolivia   | P                 | not known                  | No                            |
| 1952                     | Bolivia   | P                 | not known                  | No                            |
| May 1992-1994            | Bosnia<br>Herzegovina:<br>break-up of<br>Yugoslavia | E, N, P, R        | 60,000-200,000             | Yes: a, b, h                  |
| 1948-cont.               | Burma/Myanmar                                       | S, E, R, P        | 14,000-17,500              | No                            |
| 1967-1975                | Cambodia  | P                 | 250,000                    | No                            |
| 1979-1989-               | Cambodia  | P                 | 14,000-20,000              | No                            |
| 1995-cont.               |   |                   |                            |                               |
| 1955/6-mid-'60s          | Cameroon  | NL                | 100s                       | No                            |
| 1969-1970                | Chad  | E, R, DC          | 1,500-2,000                | No                            |
| 1977-1987                | Chad  | P                 | 24,000                     | No                            |
| 1989-1990-cont.          | Chad  | P, E              | 40,000                     | Yes: d                        |
| 1946-1949                | China   | P                 | 10,000-40,000              | No                            |
| 1994-1996                | CIS (Chechnya)                                      | S, P              | 10,000-40,000              | No                            |
| 1992-1996                | CIS (Moldova/<br>Trans-Dniester)                    | S                 | 1,000                      | No                            |
| 1992-cont.               | CIS (Abkhazia<br>& South<br>Ossetia)-Georgia        | S                 | 17,500                     | No                            |
| 1992-cont.               | CIS (North<br>Ossetia)                              | E                 | < 100                      | No: d                         |
| 1991-1994                | CIS (Nagorno-<br>Karabakh) -<br>Azerbaijan          | P                 | 10,000                     | No                            |

| 1991/92-cont.     | CIS (Tajikistan)  | P              | 20,000-50,000  | No           |
|-------------------|-------------------|----------------|----------------|--------------|
| 1994-1995         | CIS               | P              | 100-1,000      | No           |
|                   | (Uzbekistan)      |                |                |              |
| 1947-1953         | Colombia          | P              | 200,000 +      | No           |
| 1965, 1978-1986-  | Colombia          | P              | 30,000 +       | No           |
| 1993-cont.        |                   |                |                |              |
| 1956-1959         | Cuba              | P              | not known      | No           |
| 1963-1973         | Cyprus            | E, P           | not known      | No           |
| July 1974         | Cyprus            | E, P not known |                | No           |
| 1991-1995         | Djibouti          | P              | < 100          | No           |
| 1965-1966         | Dominican         | P              | < 100          | No           |
|                   | Republic          |                |                |              |
| 1951-1952, 1953-  | Egypt             | P              | not known      | No           |
| 1954, 1956        |                   |                |                |              |
| 1991-1995-cont.   | Egypt             | P              | 1,000-2,000    | No           |
| 1976/1979-1992    | El Salvador       | P              | 40,000-47,000; | Yes: a, e, I |
|                   |                   |                | 23, 250 M      |              |
| 1961-1991         | Ethiopia          | S              | 300,000        | Yes: b, g    |
|                   | (Eritrea, Tigre)  |                |                |              |
| 1994, 1996        | Ghana             | E, NR          | 1,000+         | No           |
| Dec. 1944- Jan.   | Greece            | P              | 50,000         | No           |
| 1945; Jan. 1946-  |                   |                |                |              |
| Oct. 1949         |                   |                |                |              |
| 1965-1996-cont.   | Guatemala         | P              | 60,000+        | Yes: b, d    |
| 1962-1974         | Guinea-Bissau     | NL             | 2,000 M        | No           |
| 1947              | Hungary           | P              | not known      | No           |
| 1948              | India             | S              | 1,000s         | No           |
|                   | (Hyderabad)       |                |                |              |
| 1968-1982-cont.   | India (Naxalites) | P              | 1,000-3,000    | No           |
| 1955-1961-1975    | India (Nagaland,  | P              | not known      | No           |
|                   | Manipur)          |                |                |              |
| 1966-1968,1979-   | India (Assam)     | P, S           | 5,000          | No           |
| cont.             |                   |                |                |              |
| 1981/1984 - cont. | India (Punjab)    | E, R, S        | 20,000         | No           |
| 1993- cont.       | India (Tripura,   | P              | 30,000         | Yes: d       |
|                   | Jharkhand)        |                | _              |              |
| 1950, 1958-1959   | Indonesia         | DC             | not known      | No           |
| 1946              | Iran              | С              | not known      | No           |
| July 1958-        | Iraq              | P              | 2,000          | No           |
| March 1959        |                   |                |                |              |

| 1960-1975                 | Iraq (Kurds)              | S, P    | 10,000-100,000;<br>5,000 <i>M</i>   | No        |
|---------------------------|---------------------------|---------|-------------------------------------|-----------|
| 1989-1993-cont.           | Iraq (Kurds,<br>Shi'ites) | E, R, N | 100,000                             | No        |
| 1991-1993, 1995-<br>cont. | Iraq (Kurds)              | E, R, N | 1,000s                              | No        |
| 1948-cont.                | Israel                    | NL, P   | 12,500                              | No        |
| 1945-1949                 | Java<br>(Netherlands)     | NL      | 10s of 1000s                        | No        |
| 1970-1971                 | Jordan                    | P       | 1,000-2,000                         | No        |
| 1958-1959                 | Jordan                    | P       | not known                           | No        |
| 1952-1956                 | Kenya                     | NL      | 8,000+                              | No        |
| 1948                      | South Korea               | P       | not known                           | No        |
| 1946-1987                 | South Korea               | I, P    | 1,000                               | Yes: b, h |
| 1958                      | Lebanon                   | P       | not known                           | No        |
| 1975-1990                 | Lebanon                   | E, R, P | 150,000+                            | No        |
| 1989-1996                 | Liberia                   | E, R, P | 150,000                             | No        |
| 1947-1948                 | Malagasy/<br>Madagascar   | NL      | 10,000-80,000                       | No        |
| 1948-1960                 | Union of Malaya           | NL      | 10,000                              | No        |
| 1946-1987                 | Malaysia                  | P       | 4,000                               | No        |
| 1994                      | Mexico<br>(Chiapas)       | P       | 200+                                | Yes: i    |
| 1952-1956                 | Morocco                   | NL      | not known                           | No        |
| 1964-1975                 | Mozambique                | NL      | 4,000+                              | No        |
| 1978-1992                 | Mozambique<br>(RENAMO)    | P       | 10,000-12,000 <i>M</i> ;<br>110,000 | No        |
| 1966-1972-1988            | Namibia                   | NL      | 12,500                              | No        |
| 1950-1951                 | Nepal                     | P       | not known                           | No        |
| 1984-1988-cont.           | New Caledonia             | NL      | not known                           | No        |
| 1981-1987                 | Nicaragua                 | N, P    | 30,000                              | Yes: h, i |
| 1989-1995                 | Niger                     | S, P    | 1,000                               | No        |
| May-Oct. 1966             | Nigeria                   | P       | 9,000-30,000                        | No        |
| 1967-1970                 | Nigeria (Biafra)          | P, E, S | 600,000-1 million                   | No        |
| 1995                      | Nigeria                   | P, E    | 100-1,000                           | No        |
| 1922, 1969-cont.          | Northern Ireland          | S, P    | 3,200                               | No        |
| 1957-1959/60              | Oman                      | P       | not known                           | No        |
| 1968, 1970-1977           | Oman                      | P       | 1,000-3,000                         | No        |
| Mar. 1971-<br>Dec. 1971   | Pakistan<br>(Bangladesh)  | P       | 1-3 million                         | Yes: b, i |

| 1973-1977       | Pakistan               | S, P     | 3,000 M; 6,000      | No          |
|-----------------|------------------------|----------|---------------------|-------------|
| 1986-1994-cont. | Pakistan               | P        | 14,000              | No          |
| 1947-1948       | Paraguay               | P        | not known           | No          |
| 1902-1962-1972  | Paraguay               | NL, NR   | 900+                | No          |
| 1989            | Paraguay               | P        | 1,000               | No          |
| 1965-1966       | Peru                   | P        | not known           | No          |
| 1980/81-cont.   | Peru                   | P 28,000 |                     | Yes: i      |
| 1945-1950-1955  | Philippines            | P        | not known           | No          |
| 1968/1972-1986- | Philippines            | P,S      | 50,000+             | Yes: d, h   |
| 1996            | 1 milppines            | 1,5      | 00,000              | 1 05. 4, 11 |
| 1989-cont.      | Papua New              | S, P,    | 2,000               | No          |
|                 | Guinea                 | NR, E    | ·                   |             |
|                 | (Bougainville)         |          |                     |             |
| 1966, 1976-1980 | Rhodesia               | DC, E, R | 13,000              | No          |
| 1957-1959       | Rwanda                 | E, P     | 1,000s              | No          |
| Mar. 1962       | Rwanda                 | DC, E    | 1,000-2,000         | No          |
| Dec. 1963-1964  | Rwanda                 | DC, E    | 10,000-14,000       | No          |
| 1973            | Rwanda                 | DC, E    | not known           | No          |
| 1990-1993       | Rwanda                 | P, E     | 5, 500              | Yes: e      |
| 1994            | Rwanda                 | P, E     | 500,000-800,000     | Yes: a, b   |
| 1989, 1991-1993 | Senegal                | NR       | 500                 | No          |
| 1991-cont.      | Sierra Leone           | P        | 30,000              | No          |
| 1950-1956       | Singapore              | P, E     | < 100               | No          |
| 1981-1988-1991- | Somalia                | E, P     | 400,000             | No          |
| cont.           |                        |          |                     |             |
| 1968, 1991-1992 | Spain                  | P        | 1,000               | No          |
| 1958            | Sri Lanka              | Е        | not known           | No          |
| 1977-1983-1987- | Sri Lanka              | E, P, S  | 50,000-60,000       | Yes: d      |
| cont.           |                        |          |                     |             |
| 1955-1972       | Sudan                  | E, DC, P | 500,000-1 million   | No          |
| 1982/83-cont.   | Sudan                  | E, P     | 500,000-1.5 million | No          |
| 1965-1987-1992  | Thailand               | P        | 2,000+              | Yes: d, i   |
| 1991            | Togo                   | P        | < 100               | No          |
| 1990            | Trinidad and<br>Tobago | P        | 1,000               | No          |
| 1952-1954       | Tunisia                | NL       | not known           | No          |
| 1956            |                        | DC D     |                     | NT.         |
|                 | Tunisia                | DC, P    | not known           | No          |

| 1962-1966       | Uganda         | DC, S | 100s             | No        |
|-----------------|----------------|-------|------------------|-----------|
| 1989-1996-cont. | Uganda         | P     | 12,000 M         | No        |
| 1992            | Venezuela      | P     | 1,000            | No        |
| 1961-1967       | Yemen Arab     | P     | 100,000; 2,000 M | No        |
|                 | Republic       |       |                  |           |
| May-July 1994   | Republic of    | P     | 1,500-7,000      | No        |
|                 | Yemen          |       |                  |           |
| 1977-1983       | Zaire          | E, P  | 3,000-4,000      | No        |
| 1993-cont.      | Zaire          | P     | 20,000-60,000    | No        |
| 1983-1985       | Zimbabwe       | P     | 1,500            | Yes: d, i |
|                 | (Matabeleland) |       |                  |           |

- 1. Burma/Myanmar 1948-cont., Ethiopia 1974-87, Rwanda 1994, and Somalia 1981-88 could also have been classified as "state repression" conflicts.
- 2. The codes to denote type are as follows: "E" or "R" denotes that the civil war included ethnic or religious or traditional dimensions, respectively. "NL" denotes that the conflict was primarily for national liberation or it occurred within the context of colonization. "DC" denotes that the context of the conflict was decolonization. "NR" denotes that natural resources or territory were a key issue. "P" denotes that the civil war was primarily of a political or ideological nature (over the direction of the regime). "S" denotes that secession or autonomy was a key issue.
- 3. "Victimization" denotes number of deaths. The deaths listed in Table 3 are civilian deaths unless marked by an "m" to denote military deaths.
- 4. The legal redress codes are defined, *supra*, in part II.C.3.

 $TABLE \ 4^{\scriptscriptstyle 1}$  STATE TERROR/ STATE REPRESSION AND VICTIMIZATION, 1945-1996

| Date                | Conflict                    | Victimization <sup>2</sup>                              | Victims <sup>3</sup> | LegalRedres<br>s <sup>4</sup> |
|---------------------|-----------------------------|---|----------------------|-------------------------------|
| 1945-1985-1989      | Albania                     | 2,000   | I                    | Yes: b, d, g,<br>h            |
| 1976-1983           | Argentina                   | 9,000-30,000  | I, P                 | Yes: b, d, i                  |
| 1972-1990           | Benin                       | Not known   | I, P                 | Yes: b, I                     |
| 1990-cont.          | Bhutan                      | Not known   | ER                   | No                            |
| 1964-1982           | Bolivia                     | 164 "disappeared"<br>+ few hundred                      | P                    | Yes: b, d                     |
| 1968-cont.          | Brazil                      | Over 80 Indian<br>tribes destroyed                      | IN                   | Yes: b                        |
| 1964-1985           | Brazil                      | 300   | I, P                 | Yes: f, h, I                  |
| 1945-1989           | Bulgaria                    | Not known   | ER, I, P             | Yes: b, d, g,<br>h            |
| 1965                | Burundi                     | 2,500-5,000   | E, P                 | No                            |
| 1972-1973           | Burundi                     | 100,000-200,000   | E, P                 | No                            |
| 1989-cont.          | Burundi                     | 200,000-300,000   | E, P                 | Yes: e                        |
| 1975-1979           | Cambodia                    | 1.8 million   | ER, I, RG            | Yes: c                        |
| 1965-1979           | Central African<br>Republic | 500   | I                    | No                            |
| 1973-1976-1990      | Chile                       | 17,500-30,000   | I, P                 | Yes: d                        |
| 1949-1987-<br>cont. | China                       | 35,236,000  | I, P                 | No                            |
| Feb. 1950-cont.     | China (Tibet)               | 65,000+   | ER, I                | No                            |
| 1945-1948           | Czechoslovakia              | 197,000   | E, N                 | No                            |
| 1948-1956-1968      | Czechoslovakia              | 1,000s  | I, P                 | No                            |
| 1968-1989           | Czechoslovakia              | Not known   | I, P                 | Yes: g                        |
| 1946-1953-1989      | East Germany                | 200 (estimated<br>killings at Berlin<br>wall 1961-1989) | I, P                 | Yes: b, d                     |
| 1969-1979           | Equatorial<br>Guinea        | 1,000-50,000  | ER, I, P             | Yes: c                        |
| 1967-1974           | Greece                      | Not known   | I, P                 | Yes: b, g                     |
| 1958-1984           | Guinea                      | Not known   | I                    | No                            |
| 1991-1994           | Haiti                       | 3,000   | I, P                 | No: I                         |
| 1981-1984-1993      | Honduras                    | 179 "disappeared"                                       | I, P                 | Yes: d                        |

| 1956-89        | Hungary         | Not known          | I, P      | Yes: d, g, h    |
|----------------|-----------------|--------------------|-----------|-----------------|
| Oct. 1965-1966 | Indonesia       | 500,000-1 million  | I, P      | No              |
| Dec. 1975-     | Indonesia       | 100,000-200,000    | ER, N     | No              |
| cont.          | (East Timor)    |                    |           |                 |
| 1989-1991      | Indonesia       | 1,000+             | I         | No              |
|                | (Northern       |                    |           |                 |
|                | Sumatra)        |                    |           |                 |
| 1969-1996      | Indonesia       | 500,000            | I, P      | No              |
|                | (Sumatra)       |                    |           |                 |
| Nov. 1960-1984 | Indonesia (West | 10,000-30,000      | I         | No              |
|                | Irian)          |                    |           |                 |
| 1979-cont.     | Iran (Kurds,    | 10,000-20,000      | ER, P, RG | No              |
|                | Baha'i,         |                    |           |                 |
|                | Mujahedeen)     |                    |           |                 |
| 1980-1988      | Iraq (Kurds,    | 280,000-550,000    | ER, RG    | No              |
| 1001 1000      | Shi'ites)       | 0.000              | T D       | N.T.            |
| 1991-1996      | Iraq            | 2,000              | I, P      | No              |
| 1982-1988      | Kenya           | Not known          | I, P      | No              |
| 1991-1992-     | Kenya           | 1,500              | ER, N     | No              |
| cont.          | 37 3 77         | 4.00               |           |                 |
| 1948-cont.     | North Korea     | 1.29 million       | I, P      | No              |
| 1945-1989-1991 | Lithuania       | Not known          | I, P      | Yes: d, g, h    |
| 1964-1994      | Malawi          | Not known          | I, P      | Yes: b          |
| 1968-1990,     | Mali            | 1,000-2,000        | ER, N     | Yes: b, h       |
| 1994, 1995     |                 |                    |           |                 |
| 1970-1990      | Mexico          | 500+ "disappeared" | I, P      | Yes: f          |
| 1962-1990      | Nepal           | < 100              | Ι         | Yes: d          |
| 1945-1947      | Poland          | 1.5 million        | I, ER     | No              |
| 1947-1989      | Poland          | Not known          | I, P      | Yes: b, d, g    |
| 1932-1975      | Portugal        | Not known          | I, P      | Yes: h          |
| 1947-1989      | Romania         | 484,000            | I, P      | Yes: b, c, d    |
| 1994-cont.     | Rwanda          | 10,000             | ER, P     | No              |
| 1948/1961-1991 | South Africa    | 14,500+            | ER, I, P  | Yes: b, d, f, h |
| 1986           | Suriname        | Not known          | I, P      | Yes: a, h       |
| 1976-1981/82   | Syria           | 25,000-40,000      | P, RG     | No              |
| 1971-1979      | Uganda          | 100,000-500,000    | ER, I, P, | No: d           |
|                |                 |                    | RG        |                 |
| 1979-1986      | Uganda          | 50,000-100,000     | ER, N, P  | Yes: b, d       |
| 1974-1985      | Uruguay         | 164                | I, P      | Yes: d, f, I    |
|                |                 | "disappearances"   |           |                 |

| 1946-1954, | USSR       | 22,000,000  | ER, I, P, | Yes: d, f, h |
|------------|------------|-------------|-----------|--------------|
| 1954-1991  |            |             | RG        |              |
| 1945-1947  | Yugoslavia | 82,000      | E, N      | No           |
| 1944-1987  | Yugoslavia | 1 million + | I, P      | No           |

- 1. Situations of "tyrannical regime victimization" and genocide are included in this table. What could have been included, but as yet have not, are the many situations of harm against indigenous peoples, which although are not usually highlighted in the "conflict" literature, represent a situation often of systematic harm for which there has been little access to legal redress.
- 2. "Victimization" denotes number of deaths. The deaths listed in Table 4 are civilian deaths unless marked by an "m" to denote military deaths.
- 3. "Victims" denotes primary victim groups, coded as follows: ER = ethnic/racial; C = communal; IN = indigenous; P = political; N = national; RG = religious; and I = indiscriminate.
- 4. The legal redress codes are defined, *supra*, in part II.C.3.

#### TABLE 5

NUMBER¹ AND TYPE² OF LEGAL REDRESS ACTIONS IN EXTERNAL WAR/TERRITORIAL AND BORDER CONFLICTS, CIVIL WAR, AND STATE TERROR/STATE REPRESSION (INCLUDING TYRANNICAL REGIME VICTIMIZATION), 1945-1996

|                                   | IP | NCP | NMP | GTC/I | ITC | NGTC/I | L | С | A |
|-----------------------------------|----|-----|-----|-------|-----|--------|---|---|---|
| External war                      | 7  |     |     | 1     |     |        |   | 1 |   |
| Civil War                         | 3  | 9   | 1   | 12    | 1   |        | 1 | 1 | 9 |
| State Terror/<br>State Repression |    | 13  | 3   | 18    | 1   | 6      | 7 | 8 | 9 |

- 1. The number of internal conflicts (civil war and state terror/state repression) from 1945 to 1996 is 182. The number of conflicts for which there was some form of legal redress is 49.
- 2. The codes for the types of legal redress actions are as follows: IP = International and Regional Prosecution/Rulings; NCP = National Civil Prosecution; NMP = National Military Prosecution; GTC/I = Government Truth Commission/Inquiry; ITC = International Truth Commission; NGTC/I = Non-governmental Truth Commission/Inquiry; L = Lustration Legislation or Practice; C = Compensation Legislation; and A = Specific Amnesty Legislation or Granting of Immunity.