Boise State University
ScholarWorks

# Management Accounting Systems Support StartUp Business Growth 

Michael Lee
Boise State University
Spencer R. Cobia
KPMG Advisory


By Michael Lee, Ph.D., SF Fin, and Spencer R. Cobia

## When a start-up company entered an entrepreneurial crisis, it turned to FORWARD-LOOKING MANAGEMENT ACCOUNTING TOOLS TO MEET THE CHALLENGES OF ITS CHANGING MARKETPLACE STRATEGY AND INCREASINGLY DEPARTMENTALIZED organizational structure. These strategic tools—Variance analysis, profit PLANNING, AND A PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT SYSTEM—ALLOWED THE COMPANY TO sustain its entrepreneurial spirit and growth. Here is the story of how it AlL CAME TOGETHER.

E
ntrepreneurial businesses emerge from the execution of unique and commercially viable ideas, but the success rate of these businesses is relatively low, according to recent research done by the University of Tennessee. A quarter of such businesses fail in the first year, while more than half cease to exist after five years. ${ }^{1}$ The main reasons for the failures include a lack of planning, no knowledge of financing, no experience with record keeping, and a lack of managerial experience. Recent research in management accounting, however, offers good news and shows that formally adopting management control systems provides entrepreneurial businesses with greater success at surviving and transition-
ing into larger, more influential companies. ${ }^{2}$
Management control systems, which comprise a broad set of organizational controls, include management accounting systems. ${ }^{3}$ The research literature defines a management control system as the formal, information-based routines and procedures managers use to maintain or alter patterns in organizational activities. ${ }^{4}$ Elements of the control system include:

- Strategic plans, operating budgets, statistical reports, performance appraisals, and policies and procedures; ${ }^{5}$
- Personnel controls that select and recruit employees with similar objectives to those of the organization;
- Action or behavioral controls that influence employ-
ees by prescribing actions to be taken; and
- Results or outcome controls that influence employees by measuring the results of their actions. ${ }^{6}$

Other views of management control address informal control processes such as belief systems, group norms, socialization, and culture. ${ }^{7}$

As a subset of management control systems, management accounting systems specifically include a package of cultural controls, planning systems, cybernetic controls, administrative controls, and rewards and compensation. ${ }^{8}$ Such a system should incorporate vision and mission; key success factors; strategy and plans; organizational structure; key performance measures; performance targets; performance evaluation at individual, group, and organizational levels; financial and nonfinancial rewards; and penalties for missed performance targets. ${ }^{9}$

Empirical evidence supports the association between sustainable growth in entrepreneurial businesses and the presence of management control systems. ${ }^{10}$ The evidence shows that these businesses become gradually more complicated in structure and sophisticated in decision making, reaching a situation known as an "entrepreneurial crisis." In order to continue his or her company's growth, the entrepreneur must transition into becoming a manager who can display company stewardship to both investors and employees. ${ }^{11}$ The manager has little choice but to collect more data and pay increasing attention to selecting and presenting information in order to make control and operational decisions for the organization. ${ }^{12}$ Strategically focused management accounting tools can use this information to evaluate business performance, determine profit plans, and measure performance. ${ }^{13}$ Because most entrepreneurial businesses are not likely to have such strategic tools, adding these tools will sustain the entrepreneurial spirit and growth.

Our case study describes an entrepreneurial business, Globe, from the starting phase to its current entrepreneurial crisis. Up until this point, the business had developed an informal management control system that featured elements of strategy and structure that would support the needs of a small business. Accounting literature refers to this control system as organic or cultural
and mechanistic or administrative controls. Globe's accounting system only supported reporting, compliance, and taxation requirements and did not aid in the control and decision-making processes.

In order to successfully meet the changes in strategy, size, and evolution in structure, we designed a "missing piece"-a strategically aligned, forward-looking management accounting system with specific tools to help Globe transition through the entrepreneurial crisis. Our cybernetic controls and planning system follow the advice from prior research about management accounting tools in entrepreneurial businesses and feature a performance evaluation tool, profit plan, and a set of key operational measures. The case-based evidence supports and validates the requirement that management accounting can provide a dynamic set of tools and procedures that can meet the challenges of a growing entrepreneurial business when used in conjunction with other elements of management control.

This case study can help entrepreneurial businesses understand how management accounting tools provide information analysis about the performance of existing products and services. The tools support the strategic planning process by defining and setting key financial and operational targets for the business to achieve. They also monitor strengths and weaknesses in existing sales, delivery, other operational processes, and payment cycles to catch early signs of process failure and encourage improvements that would otherwise increase operational costs, lose future sales, and damage the company's reputation.

## Case Study

Gabriel Zimmerman, president and CEO of Globe, comes from a long line of entrepreneurs. ${ }^{14}$ When he was growing up, he would often drive around with his father and grandfather, looking at businesses. In 2005, he continued the entrepreneurial family tradition and launched Globe, an eBay-style business that sells used office equipment. His business has grown into one of the largest niche companies selling used dental equipment. ${ }^{15}$ Serving the entire country, Globe continues to grow at double digits each year, employs approximately 40 people, and has strategic warehouse locations in the northwestern United States. In 2012, Zimmerman
earned the Small Business Administration's Young Entrepreneur of the Year award-out of 70 candidates from the United States.

Zimmerman began the business based on the premise that "there is a lot of value sitting idle in used equipment in many companies," and he identified the opportunity to unlock the value either by selling the used equipment for the companies on consignment or just buying the used equipment and selling it to others. Although his strategy was to create a unique marketplace for used office equipment, Zimmerman found it more lucrative to focus on used dental equipment.
"This year [2012], we started having some discussions with a couple of gentlemen. They were interested in getting involved in my business to help me grow it. Both sides decided that this was going to be beneficial. In hindsight, I wish I would have spent a little more time up front preparing the company to be able to report to new stakeholders. We spent a lot of time up front just guessing what our true performance actually is. And that was a waste of time really."

In May 2012, Zimmerman engaged the help of investors to grow his business. He had already developed a successful marketplace strategy and organizational structure but realized that there was much to do, especially in accounting, to prepare his business for its next growth phase. While the accounting system could meet reporting and taxation requirements, it was not flexible enough to be used for operating decisions, performance evaluation, and planning. With additional staff, new locations, and new investors, Globe needed to change its accounting system to one that would not only meet the requirements of reporting and taxation but also future decision making, performance evaluation, and planning.

## Early Strategy and Structure

"Initially the product was very scatter shot. I threw the phone book at our salespeople and said, 'All right, here is the idea: There is value sitting in all of this idle equipment.'"

It was the salespeople's job to search for any kind of
business that was willing to part with its equipment so that Globe could sell it on consignment.
"The idea was to get a couple of salespeople competing for the best value in the marketplace. One person would go out and focus on restaurant equipment. Another would focus on expiring rental construction equipment. They developed an approach to each of those verticals, and then I would decide whether it was profitable or not and whether we wanted to go further in on it. We ended up selling retail inventories, chain saws, and ditch pumps, even French fry fryers and ovens. I mean, it was literally everything."

The actual process of specializing in a product did not occur until a few years later. As Zimmerman became familiar with different types of equipment, their markets, and margins, he could distinguish between products that required more effort and those that needed less.

> "We had really started paring things down after the third year, and this was strictly evaluated based on profitability and how receptive that class of product was to our service. We got a deal with an optometrist, and we got a deal with a dentist. They were very smooth transactions. We made good money doing it. And so, each year we would pare things back toward these types of product areas."

By 2008, Globe had used its understanding of the resale market to focus on the profitable areas, which included construction, medical, and dental equipment as well as used business IT systems. In 2010, the company narrowed its focus further by selling a variety of specialized devices within the dental industry. In late 2011, Zimmerman realized that Globe earned its revenue through various streams, and their classification was important in understanding where the revenues and profits were coming from to plan for future business expansion. This classification assisted Globe in defining its core activity as selling used dental equipment on consignment. Globe, however, was also purchasing used dental equipment and selling it to online customers. Furthermore, it was also providing a repair
and shipping service to its customers.
During this period, Zimmerman spent most of his time in sales and employed salespeople to grow his business. Just like any other entrepreneurial business, it began with its founder completing most of the day-today tasks.
"In the early days, I would be doing the shipping and packing half of the time and keeping the business going the other half. But I was also grooming and training salespeople. I needed to keep the sales engine pumping."

His first goal was to have the sales department bring in enough revenue to support its own wages. As sales grew, he hired more staff and groomed them to add shipping and handling capacity. He also hired a person to check consignments and inventory to reduce errors and costs and to improve the quality of his products and services. The sales and the shipping and handling departments are the two most important departments for Globe because they bring in the revenue that pays the rent and operating expenses.

In 2008, Zimmerman's role in sales and shipping diminished as the two departments established themselves. His handling of the day-to-day operations of the business changed to more of a $\mathrm{CEO} /$ manager role, where he would make operating decisions and undertake reporting and planning responsibilities. Zimmerman attained his lofty goal to manage his business rather than be involved with the intimate details of its operations sooner than most entrepreneurs.

## Current Strategy and Structure

The motivation for Globe's first comprehensive business strategy came from customers who expressed some confusion about the type of business Globe represented. Zimmerman realized that this confusion was a result of the changing products and services Globe had offered since its inception. He wanted the company to be more than a consignment service and seller of used dental equipment. Instead, he wanted Globe to be a marketplace with all types of products and services related to dental equipment.

[^0]> can provide general transaction-type services, but, over the course of the evolution of the company, we have learned that dental equipment has special needs. Dental equipment is difficult to package and transport. It has a certain process that you go about to appraise its value. It has services around uninstallation, installation, repair-all of those different things that do not apply to all categories equally. I will build a marketplace and add on all those services side-by-side. And a customer can interact with us and take those services a la carte."

Zimmerman currently spends a lot of his time understanding the drivers of his business. He frequently asks questions relating to existing operations and also searches for new ways to develop his business for the future. Globe's organizational structure includes an operations department that has a manager, two senior and four junior procurement specialists for regional purchasing, shipping and handling staff, a marketing manager, and a sales manager (see Figure 1).

With a new strategic focus on dental equipment and a departmentalized structure, Globe enjoyed great success online and in its originating location. Two issues, however, started to limit sales. First, the early growth in sales was attributed to acquiring all the opportunities in the immediate vicinity, so the sales teams would have to travel to other regional locations and beyond in order to maintain this growth. Second, because consignments and inventory were handled from the original warehouse, it became increasingly difficult from a logistical perspective to keep routing these sales through there. Furthermore, sales growth began consuming and limiting warehouse space, so Zimmerman began to consider expanding into other strategic locations.

## Business Expansion

In 2012, Zimmerman chose a board of directors to help take his entrepreneurial business to the next level. The board of directors provided business advice, led operational improvements, and sought bigger and better business opportunities for Globe. The board's investment in the business created more capital and an incentive to grow Globe. With new stakeholders, the level of decision making became more complex and sophisti-

# Figure 1. Organization Chart 


cated, and this highlighted a number of weaknesses in the accounting system at Globe.
"As you bring in stakeholders, such as investors, the level of decision making changes because you add new people into the conversation. The nature of your accounting requirements changes as your stakeholders require different snapshots of analysis. What might work for a sole proprietor, in terms of level of detail, might not work when you upsize. We spent a lot of time up front just guessing about numbers and guessing about what our true performance actually was because our reporting and taxation requirement did not tell us much detail about our operations or our
products and services, nor was it in real time. We spent the first part of our engagement in block-and-tackle mode, which basically meant that we focused on figuring out how to report Globe's financial information to investors and business managers. It is the very first thing you do with a business that is transitioning to the next level. In hindsight, I wish I would have done this preparation ahead of time."

Table 1 presents Globe's profit and loss statements for the past three years. Two weaknesses appear in these financial statements. First, these statements report historical performance, which is unlikely to represent Globe's future performance given the business's

expansion. Second, business growth and newly appointed investors necessitated a change in management style that required more formal and frequent communi-
cations and reporting. While Zimmerman could typically understand and run his business on a daily basis, Globe's board of directors, who were not involved in
the day-to-day operations, required regular information about the operations and performance of its products and services. Recently, Zimmerman has admitted that, as the size of the business has grown, he is less able to identify precisely how specific products, services, and operating processes are performing, let alone potential business opportunities.

Globe was in an "entrepreneurial crisis." Zimmerman needed to become a manager for a business he created that would be responsible to both investors and employees. ${ }^{16}$ Prior research shows that specific management accounting tools provide the infrastructure that is associated with the likelihood of the business surviving the entrepreneurial crisis. ${ }^{17}$ Because most entrepreneurial businesses are not likely to have such accounting tools, adding them can sustain the entrepreneurial spirit and growth.

Businesses are advised to adopt tools that will evaluate performance using contribution margin analysis,
forecast future profit, and measure operational performance. These tools provide the information and format to plan, control, and make important operating decisions for the entrepreneurial business. The research reports that using these tools results in much faster business growth in the early years, relative to competitors that do not use these tools. ${ }^{18}$ This research also finds that the design of these management accounting systems requires specific knowledge that must be "imported" and cannot be done simply by following a set of instructions.

Globe is not the only company creating its own market. On a much larger scale, there is eBay, which is a platform where buyers and sellers come together to carry out business transactions. But because Globe focuses on the niche market of dental equipment, eBay is actually less of a threat than other competitors. Table 2 provides information on the companies that Zimmerman sees as competitors.

|  | Table 2. Competitor Profile |  |  | Dental Product Shopper | UsedDental Equipment.net |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Globe | eBay | BuyDental Equipment.com |  |  |
| Number of Employees | 40 | 27,700 | 15 | 5 | 32 |
| Total Dental Equipment Sales 2012 | \$5.86m | \$0.50m | \$1.52m | \$0.75m | \$2.85m |
| Consignment Units Sold 2012 (2012 Expected) | $\begin{gathered} 6,152 \\ (5,428) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 112 \\ (127) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1,073 \\ & (982) \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} 635 \\ (724) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 1,428 \\ (1,279) \end{gathered}$ |
| Consignment Market Share 2012 | $\begin{gathered} \text { 65.45\% } \\ \text { (Target 68\%) } \end{gathered}$ | 1.19\% | 11.41\% | 6.76\% | 15.19\% |
| Strategy | Everything dealing with dental equipment | General marketplace open to all | Mid- to high-end dental equipment | Newer options for dentists | Focuses <br> on old <br> dental <br> equipment |
| Customer Brand Perception | All types of medical equipment | Marketplace | Quality equipment | Expensive options | Lower-end equipment |

## Table 3. Strategic Priorities

- Meet investors' expectations
- Maintain profitable growth by region
- Increase contribution margin per revenue source by revenue stream
- Increase customer sales by sales representative
- Increase customer satisfaction and loyalty
- Increase profitable marketing campaigns
- Become a marketplace for used dental equipment
- Increase brand name recognition
- Maximize efficiency per warehouse
- Increase inventory turnover
- Provide employees information about customers
- Increase employee training
- Improve reporting
- Improve decision making

Zimmerman believes that it is important to track Globe's market share performance among its competitors. Table 2 shows that Globe is currently the market leader in used dental equipment. To help maintain this position, Zimmerman outlined a number of strategic priorities for his business (see Table 3).

In line with the research literature, we set about to design a management accounting system with specific tools for this entrepreneurial business. Prior to our design, we asked the business investors and managers about the types of decisions that they would like to make and the types of information required to make those decisions. The investors and managers specifically expressed that they would repeatedly ask questions about how the existing products and services are performing in real time. They would like to monitor strengths and weaknesses in existing sales, deliveries, other operational processes, and payment cycles to catch early signs of process failure. Where process weaknesses and failures are detected, Globe's managers would be able to make improvements to prevent the weaknesses and failures from increasing costs, forfeiting future sales, and damaging its reputation. Finally, Zimmerman and Globe's board of directors would like to see how the business could use its information to
develop various scenarios (for example, planning and sensitivity analyses) around its products and services and the impact on future profitability.

## Variance Analysis

The first task was to convert Globe's income statement (Table 1) into a variable costing or contribution margin statement. Variable costing or contribution margin statements take all existing cost transactions and divide them into variable or fixed costs. This is shown in Tables $4 \mathrm{a}, 4 \mathrm{~b}$, and 4 c . Where possible, the total revenue was broken out by product and service revenue stream and matched with the corresponding variable costs to calculate product and service contribution margins. Zimmerman, the board of directors, and Globe's management team can use these statements to understand Globe's profitable revenue streams and the drivers of their cost to make the necessary decisions to maintain their revenue streams and control their associated costs.
The second task was to evaluate Globe's performance using variance analysis of the contribution margin statement in Table 4a. We prepared a flexible budget and calculated variances for each of the line items (see Table 5). A flexible budget is a volume-adjusted column that allows for variance calculations that separate the effects of selling prices and purchasing costs from sales volumes and purchase quantities for each line item and in total. A favorable variance results from higher-than-planned revenues and lower-than-planned costs. Managers can analyze both favorable and unfavorable variances and ask questions such as, "Did we lower prices due to competitive pressure, or was it because of discounts on old products to entice customers?"

Figure 2 summarizes the relationship among all revenue and cost variances. We explained the sales volume variance calculated in Table 5 in terms of market size, market share, and product mix effects by using the competitor information on consignment units and the values Globe provided in Table 2.
We reconciled all our variance calculations in Table 6. In summary, this set of variances alerts managers to price, volume, cost, product mix, and/or competitor effects to help them make decisions that would support long-term performance.

# Figure 2. Relationships Among Variances 



## Profit Planning

The third task, profit planning, provides an entrepreneurial business with guidance for achieving its strategy and goals by translating them into future financial performance targets. Specifically, the revenue streams and the variable and fixed costs are extended into the future. ${ }^{19}$ Figure 3 shows our profit plan for Globe.

Because forecasting sales and cost line items requires consideration of the markets and market growth that the entrepreneurial business is likely to experience in the coming year, we used Globe's strategic positioning, evolving structure, and competitor information as the context to develop a 2013 profit plan. We used the variable costing or contribution margin statements in Table 4 because these statements divide revenues by product and service stream and costs by variable and fixed classifications.

Profit planning involves identifying drivers and making assumptions about how each line item in the statement is expected to behave based on its classification and assumptions about the future. We stated our forecast assumptions in the profit plan so that Globe can understand what is driving our forecasts, make changes, and conduct sensitivity analyses to see the impact of changes to our assumptions. For example, we forecasted each revenue stream based on future views about the market size for used dental equipment and Globe's expected future market share. Variable costs
were forecasted on the basis of the margins that Globe's revenue stream is expected to achieve, and indirect variable costs, as well as fixed costs, were estimated based on suitable drivers stated in the profit plan.

## Performance Measurement

To ensure that Globe meets its profit plan, we developed a set of performance measures that directly linked Globe's operating activities with the various line items in the profit plan and the business's strategic objectives. Since its inception, Globe had evaluated its financial performance by using accounting ratios from information in its historical financial statements. Not only were these ratios based on historical performance, but they made no reference to Globe's operating activities and how these activities contributed to its past performance.

For the fourth and final task, we employed the balanced scorecard (BSC) to create a set of measures that would meet Globe's strategic priorities and its profit plan (see Figure 3). ${ }^{20}$ The BSC approach suggests that the set of performance measures should meet the following four criteria:
(1) There are measures for the four perspectives of financial performance, customer performance, internal business process performance, and learning and growth performance.
(2) The measures in the four perspectives are related by cause and effect and are dependent on each other.

## Table 4a. Contribution Margin Statements

|  | Plan <br> 2012 <br> Total | Actual 2012 Total | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Growth } \\ 2012 \end{array}$ | Plan <br> 2011 <br> Total | Actual 2011 Total | Growth 2011 | Plan 2010 <br> Total | Actual 2010 Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Revenues |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Shipping | 589,530 | 543,787 | 18.93\% | 442,148 | 457,239 | 13.82\% | 331,611 | 401,729 |
| Handling | 17,559 | 16,196 | 25.00\% | 13,169 | 12,957 | 18.25\% | 9,877 | 10,957 |
| Service | 129,384 | 119,345 | 11.88\% | 97,038 | 106,669 | 8.67\% | 72,779 | 98,154 |
| Inventory | 46,806 | 43,174 | 3.15\% | 35,105 | 41,854 | 2.30\% | 26,328 | 40,912 |
| Consignment | 5,564,033 | 5,132,305 | 21.47\% | 4,173,025 | 4,225,213 | 15.67\% | 3,129,769 | 3,652,752 |
| Total Revenue | 6,347,312 | 5,854,807 | 20.87\% | 4,760,485 | 4,843,932 | 15.21\% | 3,570,364 | 4,204,504 |
| Cost of Goods Sold |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Shipping | 503,276 | 464,225 | 18.93\% | 377,456 | 390,340 | 13.82\% | 283,092 | 342,952 |
| Handling | 11,998 | 11,067 | 25.00\% | 8,998 | 8,853 | 18.25\% | 6,749 | 7,487 |
| Service | 25,771 | 23,772 | 11.88\% | 19,328 | 21,247 | 8.67\% | 14,496 | 19,551 |
| Inventory | 8,969 | 8,273 | 3.15\% | 6,727 | 8,020 | 2.30\% | 5,045 | 7,839 |
| Consignment | 3,727,921 | 3,438,662 | 21.47\% | 2,795,941 | 2,830,907 | 15.67\% | 2,096,956 | 2,447,356 |
| Total COGS | 4,277,935 | 3,945,999 | 21.07\% | 3,208,450 | 3,259,367 | 15.37\% | 2,406,338 | 2,825,185 |
| Contribution Margin |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Shipping | 86,254 | 79,562 | 18.93\% | 64,691 | 66,899 | 13.82\% | 48,518 | 58,777 |
| Handling | 5,561 | 5,129 | 24.98\% | 4,171 | 4,104 | 18.27\% | 3,128 | 3,470 |
| Service | 103,613 | 95,573 | 11.88\% | 77,710 | 85,422 | 8.67\% | 58,282 | 78,603 |
| Inventory | 37,837 | 34,901 | 3.15\% | 28,378 | 33,834 | 2.30\% | 21,283 | 33,073 |
| Consignment | 1,836,112 | 1,693,643 | 21.47\% | 1,377,084 | 1,394,306 | 15.67\% | 1,032,813 | 1,205,396 |
| Total CM | 2,069,377 | 1,908,808 | 20.46\% | 1,552,034 | 1,584,565 | 14.88\% | 1,164,024 | 1,379,319 |

Table 4b. Other Expenses

|  | Plan $2012$ <br> Total | Actual 2012 Total | Growth 2012 | Plan <br> 2011 <br> Total | Actual 2011 Total | $\begin{array}{r} \text { Growth } \\ 2011 \end{array}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Plan } \\ & 2010 \end{aligned}$ Total | Actual 2010 Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Other Expenses |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Travel \& Entertainment | 47,654 | 57,477 | 30.76\% | 31,769 | 43,956 | 22.46\% | 23,827 | 35,896 |
| Professional Fees | 20,599 | 29,682 | 56.22\% | 13,733 | 19,001 | 41.04\% | 10,299 | 13,472 |
| Office Supplies | 13,125 | 16,578 | 36.93\% | 8,750 | 12,107 | 26.96\% | 6,562 | 9,536 |
| Equipment Rental | 16,169 | 8,274 | -44.52\% | 10,779 | 14,915 | -32.50\% | 8,085 | 22,096 |
| Bank Service Charges | 868 | 3,954 | 393.63\% | 579 | 801 | 286.96\% | 434 | 207 |
| Donations |  | 540 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Small Tools and Equipment |  | 168 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Total Other Variable Expenses | 98,415 | 116,673 | 28.52\% | 65,610 | 90,780 | 11.79\% | 49,207 | 81,207 |
| Operating Margin | 1,970,962 | 1,792,135 | 19.97\% | 1,486,424 | 1,493,785 | 15.07\% | 1,114,817 | 1,298,112 |

## Table 4c. Transaction Count 2012

| Plan |  |
| ---: | ---: |
| $\mathbf{2 0 1 2}$ |  |
| Total | Actual <br> $\mathbf{2 0 1 2}$ <br> Total |
|  |  |
| $5,195.00$ | $6,041.25$ |
| $2,505.00$ | $1,976.25$ |
| 112.50 | 112.50 |
| 255.00 | 146.25 |
| $5,427.50$ | $6,151.88$ |

[^1]
# Table 5. Flexible Budget, Quantity, and Price Variances for 2012 

## Sales Volume Variance $=\$ 241,797$ favorable Selling Price Variance $=\mathbf{\$ 1 , 3 0 7 , 4 7 2}$ unfavorable Cost Variance $=\mathbf{\$ 9 0 5 , 1 0 7}$ favorable

${ }^{\text {a Profit Plan Budget }}(\mathrm{BP} \times \mathrm{BQ})$ : expected revenues and expenses items.
${ }^{\text {b }}$ Quantity Variance: difference between actual and expected amounts due to quantity, budgeted prices/costs held constant.
${ }^{\text {cFlexible }}$ Budget ( $\mathrm{BP} \times \mathrm{AQ}$ ): quantity and price effects are isolated with a volume-adjusted column or flexible budget.
${ }^{d}$ Price Variance: difference between actual and expected amounts due to price/costs, quantity (actual) held constant.
${ }^{e}$ Actual ( $A P \times A Q$ ): actual revenues and expense items.
BO: Budgeted Quantity, the number of expected or forecast units/sales or purchase of inventory.
AQ : Actual Quantity, the actual number of units/sales or purchase of inventory.
BP: Budgeted Price, the price expected or forecast to sell or pay for inventory.
AP: Actual Price, the actual selling price or price paid for inventory.
(3) The measures for learning and growth performance provide a lead into internal business process performance, which in turn supports forthcoming customer performance and, ultimately, financial performance.
(4) There is a mix of nonfinancial and financial
measures, with nonfinancial measures often leading to financial measures.

Table 7 shows how we developed a BSC using Globe's strategic priorities in Table 3.
To show the leading and lagging nature of the mea-

# Table 6. Explaining Differences Between Profit Plan and Actual Results 

## Total Contribution Margin - Profit Plan

2,069,377

## Volume Effects

Sales Volume Variance
Explained by:
Market Share Effect ${ }^{\text {a }}$
$(81,192)$
Market Size Effect ${ }^{b}$
197,952
Product Mix Effect ${ }^{\text {c }}$
98,707
Other Effects ${ }^{\text {d }} \quad 26,330$

## Price Effects

Selling Price Variance
Cost Variances
Cost (COGS) Variance
$(1,307,472)$

Total Contribution Margin - Actual 905,107

1,908,809
This table reconciles the differences between the profit plan and actual results in Table 5. The differences are due to price, volume, and cost effects, as shown in Figure 2. The volume effect can be explained in relation to market share, market size, and other effects.
${ }^{\text {a }}$ The market share effect measures the dollar effect of changes in the company's overall market share of products and services among its competitors.
${ }^{\text {b }}$ The market size effect measures the dollar effect of changes in the overall market size.
cThe product mix effect measures the dollar effect of changes in mix of revenue streams.
dThe other effects are calculated from the residual of the sales volume variance, market share effect, market size effect, and product mix effect. Because we did not have any competitive information outside of consignment sales, this effect represents Globe's sales volume effects from revenue streams.
sures and their cause and effect, we created a diagram that depicts the relationships among the measures that we developed (see Figure 4). Financial measures include such items as return on investment (ROI), return on equity (ROE), and sales. Financial performance, which is derived from sales to customers, results from success in the other perspectives (customer, internal business process, and learning and growth). Providing exemplary service and support are key requirements for driving strong sales.

Internal business process involves the inner workings of the business's operations. At Globe, the measures monitor process efficiencies (or the lack of) so that management can continually assess and improve business processes through coordination, integration, and opti-
mization. When business processes are working well, customer satisfaction is created through exemplary service and support, and company value comes from process cost reductions. This ultimately leads to financial performance. Investment into learning and growth-such as research and development-and investment in technology and employee training contribute to improved internal business processes, better customer satisfaction, and, ultimately, a greater level of financial performance.

## What We Demonstrated

In this case study, we examined how Globe, an entrepreneurial business, supported its strategy, expansion in size, and evolution in organizational structure with a

Figure 3. Globe 2013 Profit Plan


# Table 7. Key Operating Measures 

| Categories | Strategic Objectives | Measures | Target |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Financial(F) | F1 - Meet investors' expectations | Sales, Return on Investment (ROI), and Return on Equity (ROE) | Sales increase by $5 \%$, ROE by $5 \%$ per quarter or $20 \%$ per year |
|  | F2 - Maintain profitable growth by region | Gross profit \% by region | Target 5\% growth per region per quarter |
|  |  | Net profit margin \% by region | Increase 2\% per region per quarter |
|  | F3-Increase contribution margin per revenue source by revenue stream | Contribution margin by revenue source by revenue stream | Increase 1\% per quarter |
| Customer (C) | C1 - Increase customer sales by sales representative | Sales by sales representative Lead conversion by employee | Increase 10\% Increase to 3.5\% |
|  | C2 - Increase customer satisfaction and loyalty | Orders by customer Use standard eBay metrics | Increase 2.5\% per quarter Decrease negative feedback $2 \%$ per quarter |
|  | C3-Increase profitable marketing campaigns | Conversion/website traffic ROI per campaign Leads by source/sales | Increase to 3.5\% <br> Target 15\% <br> Increase 0.25\% per quarter |
|  | C4 - Create a marketplace | Listings by territory <br> Number of market share buyers and sellers | Increase 5\% per quarter Increase 3\% per quarter |
| Internal <br> Business <br> Processes (IBP) | IBP1 - Increase brand name recognition | Direct and search-engine traffic compared to prior year's quarter Amount spent on sales conventions | Increase 3\% per quarter Spend \$1,000 per quarter |
|  | IBP2 - Maximize efficiency per warehouse | Shipping delay by warehouse Errors per order | Decrease 2\% per quarter Decrease $1.5 \%$ per quarter |
|  | IBP3-Increase inventory turnover | Days in inventory by revenue type | Increase to 2.5 times in a year |
| Learning and Growth (L\&G) | L\&G1 - Provide employees information about customers | Rate of inventory acquisition Rate of consignment acquisition | Increase 1\% per quarter Increase 0.5\% per quarter |
|  | L\&G2 - Focus on employee training | Goal attainment by sales representative | Increase 5\% per quarter |
|  | L\&G3 - Increase employee training, and improve reporting and decision making | Amount spent on training | Spend an average of $\$ 1,500$ per quarter |

Figure 4. Cause and Effect Among Key Operating Measures
Categories
Financial (F)
Customer (C)
Internal
Business
Processes (IBP)
Learning
and
Growth
(L\&G)



L\&G1 Provide employees information about customers


| C3 Increase |
| :---: |
| profitable |
| marketing |
| campaigns |



IBP3 Increase inventory turnover


L\&G3 Increase employee training, and improve reporting and decision making
forward-looking management accounting system. Initially, the company evaluated its performance from historical financial statements that were used for reporting, compliance, and tax purposes. As the business grew and took on investors, however, it became apparent that the requirement for frequent performance evaluation, periodic profit planning, and real-time operational decision making became a necessity.

Our case study applies the recommendations from prior management accounting systems design research for entrepreneurial businesses. Our management accounting system design is consistent with this prior research and validates the necessary components of a management accounting system to support an entrepreneurial business. Given an established set of strategic priorities and an evolving organizational structure, using a management accounting system with dynamic tools and procedures can meet the challenges of a new growing business. We utilized the context and evidence our entrepreneurial business provided to create a design that met with the approval of Globe's CEO and founder Gabriel Zimmerman and its board of directors.

We suggested that Globe recast its income statement into a variable costing or contribution margin statement so that management can understand its revenues and costs. We provided a variance analysis tool for calculating revenue and cost variances that would explain the price/cost and volume/quantity effects of the differences. Our variances took into account the differences due to market size, market share, and product mix. Using the variable costing or contribution margin statement, we created a profit planning template and provided suggestions about how to incorporate Globe's expectations and assumptions about its future business environment and future performance. Finally, we examined Globe's operations and developed a set of performance measures that would inform management about the likelihood of meeting their profit plan and prompt a proactive course of action to keep the business from veering off course.

Michael T. Lee, Ph.D., SF Fin, is an assistant professor in the department of accountancy at Boise State University in Boise, Idaho. He is also an IMA ${ }^{\circledR}$ Member-at-Large. You can reach him at (208) 426-3410 or michaellee2@boisestate.edu.

Spencer R. Cobia is a consultant at KPMG Advisory in
Mountain View, Calif. You can reach him at spencercobia@gmail.com.

## Endnotes

1 www.statisticbrain.com/startup-failure-by-industry.
2 Antonio Davila, George Foster, and Ning Jia, "Building Sustainable High-Growth Startup Companies: Management Systems as an Accelerator," California Management Review, May 2010, pp. 79-105; Mikko Sandelin, "Operation of Management Control Practices as a Package-A Case Study on Control System Variety in a Growth Firm Context," Management Accounting Research, August 2008, pp. 324-343; and Paul M. Collier,
"Entrepreneurial Control and the Construction of a Relevant Accounting," Management Accounting Research, September 2005, pp. 321-339.
3 Collier, 2005.
4 Robert Simons, Levers of Control: How Managers Use Innovative Control Systems to Drive Strategic Renewal, Harvard Business School Press, Boston, Mass, 1994.
5 Richard L. Daft and Norman B. Macintosh, "The Nature and Use of Formal Control Systems for Management Control and Strategy Implementation," Journal of Management, Spring 1984, pp. 43-66.
6 William G. Ouchi, "A Conceptual Framework for the Design of Organizational Control Mechanisms," Management Science, September 1979, pp. 833-848; and Kenneth A. Merchant, "Modern Management Control Systems: Text and Cases," Prentice Hall, Upper Saddle River, N.J., 1997.
7 Simons, 1995; Ouchi, 1979.
8 Teemu Malmi and David A. Brown, "Management Control Systems as a Package-Opportunities, Challenges, and Research Directions," Management Accounting Research, December 2008, pp. 287-300.
9 Aldonio Ferreira and David Otley, "The Design and Use of Performance Management Systems: An Extended Framework for Analysis," Management Accounting Research, December 2009, pp. 263-282.
10 Davila, Foster, and Jia, 2010; Sandelin, 2008; and Antonio Davila, George Foster, and Mu Li, "Reasons for Management Control Systems Adoption: Insights from Product Development Systems Choice by Early-Stage Entrepreneurial Companies," Accounting, Organizations and Society, April-May 2009, pp. 322-347.
11 Davila, Foster, and Jia, 2010.
12 Danny Miller and Peter H. Friesen, "Successful and Unsuccessful Phases of the Corporate Life Cycle," Organizational Studies, October 1983, pp. 339-356; and Ken Moores and Susana Yuen, "Management Accounting Systems and Organizational Configuration: A Life-Cycle Perspective," Accounting, Organizations and Society, May-July 2001, pp. 351-389.
13 Davila, Foster, and Jia, 2010.
14 Gabriel Zimmerman and his business, Globe, are both pseudonyms to ensure confidentiality.
15 Based on licensed eBay market data.
16 Davila, Foster, and Jia, 2010.
17 Moores and Yuen, 2001; Sandelin, 2008; and Antonio Davila and George Foster, "Management Accounting Systems Adoption Decisions: Evidence and Performance Implications from Early-Stage/Startup Companies," The Accounting Review, October 2005, pp. 1039-1068.

18 Davila, Foster, and Jia, 2010.
19 Out of all the revenue streams, the consignment revenue stream was adjusted in accordance with the Financial Accounting Standards Board (FASB) Accounting Standards Codification (ASC) 605-10-25-1, Revenue Recognition, and Staff Accounting Bulletin (SAB) 104, Reconsidering Revenue Recognition, to improve the representation of revenues and revenue forecasting.
20 Robert S. Kaplan and David P. Norton, "Using the Balanced Scorecard as a Strategic Management System," Harvard Business Review, July 2007, pp. 75-85.


[^0]:    "There are lots of marketplaces out there that

[^1]:    *Each transaction is one unit. Globe takes into account incomplete transactions when making its plans each year. Globe also estimates incomplete transactions year-end.

