[Catalysis Today xxx \(xxxx\) xxx–xxx](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cattod.2019.04.008)

Contents lists available at [ScienceDirect](http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/09205861)

Catalysis Today

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/cattod

The fascinating effect of niobium as catalytic promoting agent

M. Olga Guerrero-Pérez

Departamento de Ingeniería Química, Universidad de Málaga, E-29071, Málaga, Spain

ARTICLE INFO

This paper is dedicated to Prof. Maria Ziolek on the occasion of her 70th birthday.

Keywords: Heterogeneous catalysts Niobium catalysts Niobium materials

ABSTRACT

Niobium is a very important element in catalysis, active component of many catalytic systems. But it is not only a major component in many catalytic systems; in addition, it is usually used as a key promoter, because it has a rich complex chemistry and is able to react with many elements forming a wide range of compounds and oxide phases with complex structures. Thus, present contribution makes a brief review on the main industrial catalytic processes in with niobioum have been used as a promoting agent during the last decade. The uses of niobium as main component in the catalytic formulations have not been considered.

1. Scope

Niobium is an important element, used for the preparation of several catalytic materials, and its catalytic properties have been analyzed [1–[3\]](#page-5-0) extensively for both heterogeneous and homogeneous [[4](#page-5-1)] applications. But it is not only used as main component in catalytic formulations, or as support as $Nb₂O₅$, since it is also usually used in a small amount in the formulation of several catalytic systems, as additive. Ten years ago our group published a review paper about the promoting effect of Nb as additive for catalysts formulations [[5](#page-5-2)]; with the objective of investigating the promoting effect of Nb on different catalytic formulations used for selective oxidation reactions. It was shown that there were four main types of selective oxidation reactions in which Nb was used as promoting agent of the catalysts: oxidative dehydrogenation of lower alkanes (ODH) to produce olefins, oxidative coupling of methane and oxidation and ammoxidation of alkanes to produce oxygenates and nitriles. It was shown (5) that the promoting effect is mainly due to the ability of Nb to combine with many other elements forming new compounds. Upon such interaction, typically the redox properties are modulated, and increase the acidity, rendering systems more catalytically active. Nb also enhances the catalytic performance to active phases by promoting the entanglement of other elements in such active phases that must change the oxidation state under reaction conditions. It seems that such entanglement favors the necessary structural changes that the active phase must suffer under reaction conditions. It also prevents the buildup of segregated pure phases, e.g., in the Mo–V–O system, M1 phase, or the rutile $VSD₄$ system. This promoting effect of niobium additive is limited to low loadings, and typically, is lost when well defined niobium-containing phases form.

A brief analysis of literature during the last decade in selective gasphase oxidation heterogeneous catalysis, shows that the interest in the eighties-nineties was focused in the synthesis of oxygenates, nitriles and olefins [[6\]](#page-5-3), and, although these applications have continued to develop until today, the research efforts on environmental catalysis are receiving more interest [[7](#page-5-4)], and also this tendency is detected for those studies that use catalytic materials in which Nb is used as dopant, as will be shown in the present contribution. Thus, the objective of this work is to update the previous one of 2009 (5), in order to evaluate and analyze the use of Nb as an additive in the formulation of catalysts for partial oxidation reactions. Therefore, a review of the bibliography on this issue, Nb as additive of mixed-oxide catalysts for redox reactions, during the last decade in this field is presented.

2. Propane and ethane ODH

The oxidative dehydrogenation (ODH) of propane and ethane $[8-10]$ $[8-10]$ $[8-10]$ is a promising route for olefins production due to the favorable thermodynamic and kinetic advantages that it has compared with conventional thermal cracking, but it has some difficulties in the control of the selectivity due to over-oxidation side reactions that increase the selectivity to CO and $CO₂$. Several catalytic systems have been tested and have demonstrated to be promising for the ODH of both ethane and propane. By 2003, Tanabe (2) already reviewed the promoting effect of doping Mo-V-O catalytic system with Nb, and this multioxide catalytic system is still considered one of the most promising for the commercial implementation of this process $[11-13]$ $[11-13]$. And, by 2009 (5), it was shown that Nb had shown a promoting effect on several catalysts for both ethane and propane ODH reactions, such as VOx supported and NiO catalysts. In all cases, it was shown that when a small amount of Nb cations were able to incorporate in the lattice, modifying the acidity and redox properties, the catalytic properties were enhanced, on the contrary, a high Nb content leaded to saturate

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cattod.2019.04.008>

Received 15 February 2019; Received in revised form 27 March 2019; Accepted 4 April 2019 0920-5861/ © 2019 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

E-mail address: [oguerrero@uma.es.](mailto:oguerrero@uma.es)

the bulk lattice sites and to the formation of non-selective Nb containing mixed oxides, such as $NiNb₂O₆$, VNbO₄ or VNbO₅.

A brief analysis of the literature during the last ten years shows that these catalytic systems (Mo-V-O, NiO and VOx supported) are still being investigated for ODH of propane and ethane, and the effect of Nb, as dopant, is still being studied as promising catalytic systems. NiO catalytic system was reported as active and selective for ethane ODH by Lemonidou and coworkers [[14,](#page-5-7)[15](#page-5-8)], among others [[16\]](#page-5-9), and it was described the enhancing effect of Nb as dopant, since pure NiO presented a quite low ethylene selectivity during ODH reaction, whereas 90% ethylene selectivity with high activity was reported for a $Ni_{0.85}Nb_{0.15}O_x$ mixed oxide catalyst (15). This Nb promoting effect was studied by our group by operando Raman spectroscopy [\[17](#page-5-10)[,18](#page-5-11)] and HRTEM [[19\]](#page-5-12) in order to characterize the active species under real reaction conditions. These results showed that two Ni-Nb-O phases can be form in these catalysts, a Nb-poor phase with a particle size in the 20–50 nm range, and a Nb-rich one, with a smaller particle size. The Nb-rich phase is not catalytically active for alkane activation reactions, in line with other studies by other groups [\[20](#page-5-13)[,21](#page-5-14)]. In this line a study by Lemonidou and coworkers [[22\]](#page-5-15) showed the similarities and differences between NiO and Nb doped-NiO catalysts during alkane ODH and pointed out the formulation $Ni_{0.85}Nb_{0.15}Ox$ as optimum catalyst. The study showed similar active sites for alkane activation, but they could identify a surface concentration correlation of O- species with Nb content, that was attributed to a less activity in the activation of alkane and subsequently a higher selectivity towards the olefin (22). The redox properties of Ni-Nb-O catalysts were evaluated by CO oxidation for various Nb contents [[23\]](#page-5-16), they reported less activity for the samples with higher Nb contents, in line with the previous studies that indicated the Nb-poor phase as the most catalytically selective.

In the case of Nb as dopant of V-containing catalysts, it was reported (5) that Nb enhances the catalytic properties of vanadium catalysts for propane oxidehydrogenation only when it does not form mixed V-Nb-O phases, being this enhancement of the catalytic performance related with the acidic properties of niobium. During the last decade, a few papers have continued investigating this promoting effect of Nb for alkane ODH reactions on Vanadium containing catalysts. For example, Hossain et al [[24\]](#page-5-17) investigated the effect of VOx-Nb formulations supported on La stabilized Al_2O_3 support for the oxidative dehydrogenation of ethane. They founded higher ethylene selectivity and ethane conversion for the Nb-doped catalyst. They attributed this effect since Nb was able to minimize the formation of crystalline V_2O_5 phases for the same vanadium contents, being this oxide undesirable for ODH reaction since it favors total oxidation reaction. The isomorphic substitution of V atoms in $Nb₂O₅$ crystals was studied by Ramalho and coworkers [\[25](#page-5-18)], that reported the oxidative dehydration of glycerol into acrylic acid on $V/Nb₂O₅$ supported catalysts. According to their theoretical calculations, they suggested that the incorporation of V is more favorable in the $Nb₂O₅$ bulk structure than on the surface. They related this change in the lattice with the lower energy during some steps of the reaction mechanism, though a thermodynamic analysis. Although according with their findings the incorporation of V in the catalysts formulation does not introduce any changes in the mechanism, it changes the reaction energetics, favoring the occurrence of some steps, and increasing the reaction rate, according with previous studies (5) that also pointed out the enhancing effect of the presence of some $Nb-V-O$ bonds in the catalysts, without the formation of crystalline V $-Nb-O$ structures.

During the last decade, some groups have focused in the design of synthesis methods for the preparation of nanoscaled catalysts, which means that the procedure allows to control not only the chemical composition of the catalysts (active phases that are on the surface), but also the morphology of the catalytic material, since submicrometric and submicronanoscaled materials present several advantages with respect to conventional ones [[26,](#page-5-19)[27\]](#page-5-20), with this methods, highly active and selective nanocatalysts have been described [[28,](#page-5-21)[29\]](#page-5-22). In this line, the

synthesis of $NbOx/CeO₂$ -rods catalysts by hydrothermal method, and their use for propane ODH was reported [[30\]](#page-5-23). They reported that the presence of Nb species on the surface of the $CeO₂$ was able to decrease the surface reducibility of $CeO₂$ rods, leading to an increment in the propene selectivity at the same conversion range but, decreasing the activity at the same temperature. Similar results were achieved by our group, since it was reported the synthesis of sub-micron diameter fiber VOx/ZrO2 catalysts by electrospinning for propane ODH reaction (26) and reported that the presence of Nb sites decreased the activity [\[31](#page-5-24)]. This in line also with the results reported in the previous paragraph for the NiO catalytic system, for low Nb concentration, both selectivity and activity were increased due to the presence of a Nb-poor phase, identify by Raman spectroscopy (19), and subsequently, for high Nb concentration, a different phase was detected, being detrimental for alkane ODH reactions.

Another important group of materials that are promising catalysts for alkane ODH reactions are those based on mesoporous molecular sieves. These materials are attractive catalytic supports since they have an ordered structure that allows them to disperse oxide active phase species. Ziolek et al [[32\]](#page-5-25) demonstrated that the surface hydroxyls groups of mesoporous MCM-41 type materials are able to disperse vanadium mixed oxide species, being more convenient that conventional oxide supports such as silica. Ziolek group investigated the incorporation of Nb species to these mesoporous materials (MCM-41 and SBA-15) [33–[38\]](#page-5-26). However, for Si/Nb ratio 32 or 64, in most cases Nb was located not only in the walls of mesoporous channels, but also in the extra framework sites, as Nb-oxides phases. It was demonstrated that the efficiency of Nb species incorporation during the synthesis procedure depends on the structure of the final material and it is much higher for MCM-41 (33) than for the SBA-15 (35). The most important differences in the synthesis procedure of these two types of mesoporous molecular sieves are the type of template used (ionic surfactant for MCM-41 and triblock copolymer in case of SBA-15) and the synthesis medium (basic, MCM-41 and acidic, SBA-15). Another important parameter to be considered is the Nb precursor, which also influences the amount of metal included into the mesoporous material [[39\]](#page-5-27). Ziolek group described by the first time the preparation of Nb-Si mesostructured solids avoiding extra framework Nb-oxide species [\[40](#page-5-28)], as was confirmed by XRD and UV–vis, and demonstrated that these materials were promising for ethane ODH reaction. The absence of extra framework Nb species in these materials was an advantage because the presence of Nb outside the walls caused the increase of alkane total oxidation reaction to COx, decreasing the selectivity to the olefin (40). This was evidenced by the catalytic results during ODH reaction described by Ziolek group ([Table 1\)](#page-1-0) for the three types of mesostrutured materials (NbMCM-41 and NbSBA-15, with extraframework Nb species and NbSBA-3 without), that evidence that Nb tetrahedrally coordinated and connected with siliceous-oxygen species in the walls is responsible for the propane ODH reaction towards propylene, whereas niobio-oxide species located in the extra framework sites are responsible for the total oxidation towards CO and CO2. Due to the homogeneity of Nb species in these catalysts, it was possible to establish the correlation of the activity and selectivity with

Table 1

Activity for ODH of propane at 813 K (after 1 h time on steam) (Reproduced from Ref. [\[40](#page-5-28)].

Catalyst	Real atomic ratio Si/ Nb	Propane conversion (%)	References
NbSBA-3-32(Co)	113	9.8	[40]
NbSBA-3-32(Cl)24	24	15.3	[40]
NbSBA-3-64(Cl)52	52	9.8	[40]
NbSBA-3-128(Cl)	107	13.8	[40]
$NbSBA-15-32(ox)$	73	2.8	351
NbSBA-15-128(ox)	207	7.4	351
$NbMCM-41-32(ox)$	26	6.6	331

the number, strength of active sites, as well as the isolation of Nb species.

3. Selective (am) oxidation of light alkanes to nitriles and oxygenates

Ammoxidation (oxidation with O_2 in the presence of NH₃) of light alkanes, such as ethane and propane, is a promising process for the production of nitriles, such as acrylonitrile (from propane) [[41,](#page-5-30)[42\]](#page-5-31) or acetonitrile (from ethane) [[43\]](#page-5-32). The partial oxidation of light alkanes to obtain oxygenates with commercial interest, such as acrylic acid have been also investigated during the last ten years. These reactions share similarities that result in different catalyst requirements. The key difference with respect the alkane used as starting material is that all $C-H$ bonds in ethane are equivalent and primary, whereas propane also has also a secondary carbon $-CH_2$, a methylene group. Thus, the activation of the alkane (ethane or propane) requires different active sites [[44\]](#page-5-33), being Ni-Nb-O catalysts able to catalyze both, whereas other studied catalytic systems, such as multioxide Mo-V-Nb-Te-O or Sb-V- (Nb)-O, are only able to activate the propane, and not active for the ethane based reaction (44). In all cases, the Nb species roles a crucial play in the catalytic behavior, as have been already described in the previous section for NiO based catalysts, in which a low content Nb doped NiO phase was identified as active for these partial oxidation reaction (19). The role of Nb in the activity behavior and characterization of Sb-V-(Nb)-O catalytic materials was already described in the previous review paper (5). With respect the multioxide (Mo-V-Nb-Te-O) based catalysts, there are several studies on the role of Nb content on the structure and activity of them [[45,](#page-5-34)[46\]](#page-5-35) that have been performed during the last decade. In this catalytic system it has been described the structure of the active phases, that has been named as M1 [\[47](#page-5-36),[48\]](#page-5-37). The promoting effect of Nb is only positive at low Nb contents [\[49](#page-5-38)–51]. Millet et al [[52\]](#page-5-39) analyzed the cationic and valence distributions in the M1 phases of catalysts with different Nb compositions using several techniques such as V K-edge and Sb or Te L₁-edge XANES spectroscopy. They concluded that Nb modulates the surface acidity and the amount of $Mo⁵⁺$ species of the M1 phase, and by this way it can be inhibit the over-oxidation of the desired product (oxygenate such as acrylic acid).

Ziolek team worked on describing also Nb-doped mesoporous materials with catalytic applications in these (am)oxidation of light alkanes processes. They described Nb containing MCM-41 and MCM-48 materials as support for VOx species during propane ammoxidation reaction [[53\]](#page-5-40). [Table 2](#page-2-0) reproduces the activity data that they reported (53). In this paper it was shown that for high $V + Sb$ coverage on the corresponding support, MCM-48 type support was able to stabilize $Sb_{0.95}V_{0.95}O_4$ rutile structure, in which V is in a reduced oxidation state [[54](#page-5-41)[,55](#page-5-42)], whereas MCM-41 type supports favored the formation of

Table 2

Activity results reproduced from (53) during propane ammoxidation reaction at 773 K.

Fig. 1. Propane conversion (%) and selectivity to main products (%) obtained during the propane ammoxidation reaction at 773 K. Reaction conditions: total flow 20 cm³ min⁻¹; feed composition (% volume): $C_3H_8/O_2/NH_3/He$ (9.8/25/ 8.6/56.6), 100 mg of Catalysts. Reproduced with permission from (56).

oxidized Vanadium 5+ species, detrimental for the partial oxidation reaction. It was also described that when Nb was introduced during the synthesis of MCM-41 support, the surface acidity of such Nb-doped material was able to influence the catalytic behavior during the ammoxidation reaction. In all cases, Nb sites were able to interact with V and to stabilizing rutile active phase, and increasing the selectivity to nitriles formation.

Ziolek team also described a Niobiosilica material that demonstrated to be a good catalytic support also for the Sb-V-O active species [[56\]](#page-5-43), in this case, they described a synthesis method for a non-ordered porous niobiosilica material, without the use of a template, and the use

M.O. Guerrero-Pérez *Catalysis Today xxx (xxxx) xxx–xxx*

of such material as support for VOx active species during the propane ammoxidation reaction. [Fig. 1](#page-2-1) shows the activity results obtained in such work. It can be observed that in absence of V sites, the catalysts are not selective for nitrogen insertion. For all the Sb–V catalysts, the selectivity to acrylonitrile increases with the use of the Nb-containing support, being higher for the catalysts with lower coverage. In this case the Nb promoting effect if related to the formation of larger particles of rutile VSbO₄ phase, as identified by XRD (56), that have structural defects in the structure, which enhances the catalytic properties. This results are in line with previous studies on ammoxidation over Sb-V-O catalytic system that showed that the SbVO4 rutile structure stabilizes cation vacancies in its structure [\[57](#page-5-44)], and with the ability of Nb species to incorporate into the rutile lattice [\[58](#page-5-45)]. This leads to a higher structural reactivity that significantly enhances the catalytic properties of the rutile SbVOx active phase for propane ammoxidation. Since the promoting effect of niobium additive is limited to low loadings, and typically is lost when well defined niobium-containing phases form, it is necessary to control the amount of Nb to be incorporated, and this is possible using the Nb-doped catalytic supports described by Ziolek group (53,56).

4. Oxidation of CH4

Gas natural transformation into hydrogen and chemical intermediates has been the objective of several studies during the last decades, being one of the most studied the transformation of methane into syngas. At industrial scale it is carried out thought steam reforming, being the partial oxidation of methane a good alternative that is being studied [[59,](#page-5-46)[60\]](#page-5-47). One of the disadvantages of the seam reforming process (CH₄ + H₂O \leftrightarrow CO + 3H₂) is that it is endothermic, whereas partial oxidation (CH₄ + $1/2O_2 \leftrightarrow$ CO + 2H₂) is exothermic and in addition it presents a $H_2/CO = 2$ ratio, which allow the straightforward transformation for obtaining methanol or Fischer-Tropsch processes [[61\]](#page-5-48). Good results for the methane partial oxidation have been obtained with noble metals based catalysts [\[62](#page-5-49)], although Ni-based also present promising results [\[63](#page-5-50)] with the advantage of the low cost in comparison with noble metal based materials. Also in the case of reactions that involve the activation of alkane C-H bonds, Nb compounds are quite promising, since DFT calculations as well as the experimental evidences have demonstrated the ability of Nb-O bonds to initiate the activation of such bond [64–[66\]](#page-5-51). Although that, as have been already presented in the previous section, Nb, at low concentration, is able to improve the catalytic properties of NiO based catalysts for the partial (am)oxidation of ethane and propane, thus, supported $NiO/Nb₂O₅$ and bulk Ni-Nb-O catalytic system have been also investigated for the partial oxidation of methane.

A recent paper by Brandao et al. [\[67](#page-5-52)] describes the promotion effect of Nb species in Ni based catalysts for this process. They prepared two series of catalysts, one in which $Nb₂O₅$ was used as support for NiO species, and a second series of perovskite based materials with compositions LaNi_(1-x)Nb_xO₃ (x = 0, 0.5). It was described (67) that the presence of Nb in the perovskite based catalytic materials increased the activity close to 20% weight of nickel. They attributed this results to a better dispersion of Ni active sites, but in this study Raman spectroscopy was not used in order to confirm the presence of the Ni-Nb-O mixed phases already described (18,19). For a high amount of Nb in the catalytic formulation, as in the case of the Ni°/Nb_2O_5 catalyst studied in the paper (67), no syngas formation was detected. This was attributed to a strong metal support interaction suppressing the accessibility of Ni° to the reactant gases and allowing only total oxidation.

5. PROX

CO Preferential oxidation (PROX) is used for removing small amounts of CO to trace level from the hydrogen-rich stream, which will be then supplied as a fuel to PEM (polymer–electrolyte membrane) fuel cells. The key to the application this reaction is to develop an appropriate catalyst that operates well in a wide temperature window and has good resistance to $CO₂$ and steam [[68\]](#page-5-53). There are some catalytic systems that have demonstrated to be promising for the commercial implementation of this process, being supported noble metals, specially Pt (68) and Au [[69](#page-5-54),[70\]](#page-5-55), and Ce-based catalysts [[71,](#page-5-56)[72\]](#page-5-57), that have demonstrated good results. The combination of both has also been investigated (Pt supported on CeO₂ based materials). Ramos-Fernandez and coworkers [[73\]](#page-5-58) prepared Pt supported on $CeO₂-TiO₂$ supports, and demonstrated that these catalysts presented a better performance in comparison with Pt supported on pure oxides. The effect of Nb sites on the reaction mechanism of this process has been also investigated. The adsoption of CO on the catalytic active sites was studied by Oliveira et al. [[74](#page-5-59)] by in situ IR absorption spectroscopy, that showed how the presence of substituting Nb atoms in the structure of a hematite catalytic material modifies the surface properties. As a result, the presence of Nb changes the catalytic properties by the addition of oxygen vacancies. In addition, mixed oxides containing Nb, such as $CeO₂-Nb₂O₅$ mixtures, have demonstrated also good results as support for Pt particles for preparing PROX catalysts. Sepúlveda-Escribano and coworkers investigated the effect of Nb content in these materials [\[75](#page-5-60)]. It was found that the Pt/Nb_2O_5 catalyst was almost inactive during the PROX reaction, whereas $Pt/0.7CeO₂$ -0.3Nb₂O₅ sample achieved a quite high CO conversion (85%) with a high selectivity, as in the case of other catalytic systems doped with Nb that have been described in the present review paper, a solid solution containing Nb was identified. It was described that Nb^{5+} is able to diffuse into the CeO₂ lattice to replace some $Ce⁴⁺$, and was described also that these changes on the structure of the support affsects the oxide surface and morphology of the Pt nanoparticles, improving their catalytic activity.

6. Environmental applications

Both oxidation and reduction processes found many applications in environmental catalysis (7), some well known examples are the selective catalytic reduction (SCR) for removal of oxides of nitrogen (85), desulfurization [\[76](#page-5-61)], including the selective oxidation of H_2S to elemental sulfur [\[77](#page-5-62),[78\]](#page-5-63), removal of N-containing organic pollutants [[79](#page-5-64)[,80](#page-5-65)] and removal of VOCs by total oxidation $[81-84]$ $[81-84]$. Most of the catalytic systems that have demonstrated to be effective for these redox processes are those based in mixed oxide materials, being also in this case Nb a promoting additive for them.

A very important environmental issue that catalysis science must face is the abatement of harmful compounds such as nitrogen oxides (NOx), from both mobile and stationary sources. During the last decade, more efforts have been focus in the development of catalytic converter technologies for diesel-powered vehicle engines that operate at high air/fuel ratios, since "three-way" catalysts have been successfully used in gasoline vehicles for over 30 years to control the emissions of CO, hydrocarbons and NOx. In this way, several techniques seem to be feasible for NOx abatement, being one of the most promising the ammonia- or urea- Selective Catalytic Reduction (NH3-SCR) [[85\]](#page-5-67). Different catalytic materials have been described as active and selective to this process, with active phases such as Cu- and Fe- based catalysts [[86,](#page-5-68)[87](#page-5-69)], Mn-Ce-O mixed oxides [[88](#page-5-70)[,89](#page-5-71)], and V based [\[90](#page-5-72)]. Ceria, and Ce-Zr-O based catalysts constitute the most promising for this process, due to the redox cycling between Ce^{3+} and Ce^{4+} , that has been also used for three-way catalysts (TWCs) [91–[94\]](#page-5-73).

Several groups have investigated the effect of Nb as dopant for these catalytic systems for the SCR reaction, due to the acid properties of Nb sites. Since for the SCR reaction a mechanism with two active sites, in which both redox and acid functionalities are required [[95\]](#page-5-74) has been proposed, it makes sense the combination of Nb (acid properties) and Ce (redox properties). Ce-Nb-O catalytic materials have been reported as active and selective for the SCR of NOx, urea hydrolysis and soot oxidation in diesel exhaust [[96\]](#page-5-75), demonstrating the importance of

Table 3

Main applications described during the last decade of Nb as doping agent during redox reactions with bulk and supported mixed oxides.

having both types of active sites in order to have appropriate catalysts. In addition, the Nb-Ce-O catalysts showed a good behavior against the most significant deactivation processes (hydrothermal ageing and sulfur poisoning). Gao and coworkers [[97\]](#page-5-76) investigated the effect of Nb as dopant of Ce-based catalysts for the SCR reaction, in order to establish relationships between the structure and activity of them. They synthesized a series of Ce-Nb binary oxides with different compositions, and found several conclusions. First, Nb atoms, are able to incorporate into the cerium oxide lattice resulting in materials with larger surface areas compared with $CeO₂$ single oxide, which is beneficial for the catalytic behavior, since more active sites are provided. Pyridine adsorption experiments (97) demonstrated that the introduction of Nb species to $CeO₂$, leaded to an enhancement of the number of acid sites on the samples. Nb-OH bonds can serve as Brønsted acid sites, whereas Nb=O bonds as Lewis ones. At low temperatures, both Brønsted acid sites and Lewis acid sites may contribute to the reaction, whereas only Lewis acid sites are responsible for the reaction at high temperatures. These effects, increase of acidity, of surface adsorbed oxygen and the changes on the chemical environment of Ce sites, due to the incorporation of Nb, give rise to a higher catalytic performance for the SRC reaction. Wu et al. [\[98](#page-5-77)] studied the effect of Nb on $CeO₂$ -ZrO₂ mixed catalysts. Quite good results were obtained with a Ce-Zr-O sample containing 15% wt of $Nb₂O₅$, in this case, 100% selectivity to $N₂$ was obtained. As in the case of previous works with $CeO₂$, also for Ce-Zr-O, it was shown how the Nb incorporation promoted the formation of $\rm{Ce^{3+}}$ ions, oxygen vacancies and active oxygen species, resulting in a better catalytic performance.

In addition to Ce-Zr-O based catalysts, other materials have been also described as promising for the SCR reaction, as for example the V_2O_5/TiO_2 based catalysts [[90,](#page-5-72)99-[102\]](#page-5-78). Nb has been also described as a good dopant for V supported $TiO₂$ catalysts. During the SCR reaction, it is also important to consider the sulfur resistance of the catalysts, since $NH₄HSO₄$ would be inevitably produced through the reaction of certain amounts of SO_x , H_2O and NH_3 in the exhaust gases that are treated by the SCR process. The as-formed $NH₄HSO₄$ blocks the pore structure, covering the catalytically active sites, rendering a negative effect on the SCR reactions and constituting the main barrier in commercializing low-temperature SCR systems [[103](#page-6-0)]. In this sense, Gao et al [[104](#page-6-1),[105](#page-6-2)] investigated the effect of Sb and Nb on V based catalysts during the SCR reaction, in order to increase the sulfur resistance of the catalysts. They found that for high Nb and Sb amounts, it might result in a deficit in TiO₂ sites for the accommodation of the reaction intermediate NH4HSO4, causing the appearance of crystallite ammonium sulfate salts, and decreasing the activity. As have been described in this work for other catalytic systems and reactions, the promoting effect of Nb is lost at high concentrations. But, for low Nb or Sb contents, the electron density around S atom have a positive effect on the reaction

mechanism, promoting the decomposition of intermediate NH₄HSO₄ and enhancing the sulfur resistance of the catalysts. Nb has also demonstrated to be a good dopant in other catalytic systems usually used for SCR, as in the case of zeolite based [\[106\]](#page-6-3); also in this case the addition of small amount of Nb improved the oxidation ability, created vacancies, and increased the poison resistance of the catalytic materials at high temperatures.

7. Concluding remarks

Group five elements are a group of metal transition elements that have a rich chemistry and properties [\[107](#page-6-4)–110] that makes them very useful in catalysis. Niobium has an invaluable additive due to its ability to introduce in crystalline lattices creating vacancies (that usually enhances the catalytic activity), and due to its acidify, since the increase of surface acidity may render in an enhancement of the active sites for adsorption in some cases, that increases the reaction rate. Due to these main properties, upon its interaction, it typically modulates redox properties of the active phases and increases the number of active sites, and resulting in a catalytic material more efficient for redox reactions.´

[Table 3](#page-4-0) summarizes the most representative applications of Nb as doping agent of catalytic systems for some redox reaction of industrial interest that have been studied during the last decade. This is quite a brief resume to get some trends, but it should be considered that the catalytic properties depend on many factors, such as the preparation procedure and on the precursors that have been used in each case. The main conclusions are similar to those described in the revision made in 2009 (5), that the Nb enhancing effect is lost at high Nb concentrations, due to two main reasons: when it forms crystalline structures, they are not active and some other elements (such as V, Ni or Ce) are not available to form the active-phase when they are bond to Nb forming such structures. In addition, it seems that moderate activity in most cases increases the reaction rates, but when the number of acid sites is high, it usually causes that the reaction products are not able to desorb and the selectivity to over-oxidation products (COx) increases. Thus, Nb is a good additive for both oxidation and reduction processes catalyzed by metal oxides, but it has to be incorporated at low amount in most of the cases.

Acknowledgements

This article is dedicated to Prof. Maria Ziolek, since due to all her research work; humanity has taken a big step in advancing knowledge in the rational design of catalytic materials. Given that these catalysts are useful for energy and environmental applications; her work has contributed to make a better world. In addition, she has been a reference and an example for many other female researchers, like me, and

I really appreciate her for this.

References

- [1] [M. Ziolek, Catal. Today 78 \(2003\) 47](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0005)–64.
- [2] [K. Tanabe, Catal. Today 78 \(2003\) 65](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0010)–77.
- [3] [M. Ziolek, I. Sobczak, Catal. Today 285 \(2017\) 211](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0015)–225. [4] [T.C. Silva, M.S. Pires, A.A. de Castro, L.C.T. Lacerda, M.V.J. Rocha, T.C. Ramalho,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0020) [Theor. Chem. Acc. 137 \(2018\) 146.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0020)
- [5] [M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, M.A. Bañares, Catal. Today 142 \(2009\) 245](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0025)–251.
- [6] [S. Valange, J.C. Vedrine, Catalysts 8 \(2018\) 483.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0030)
- [7] [M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, Catalysts 8 \(11\) \(2018\) 564.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0035)
- [8] [C.A. Carrero, R. Schloegl, I.E. Wachs, R. Schomaecker, ACS Catal. 4 \(2014\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0040) 3357–[3380.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0040)
- [9] A.M. Gaff[ney, O.M. Mason, Catal. Today 285 \(2017\) 159](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0045)–165.
- [10] [M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, A.E. Lewandowska, M.A. Bañares, Recent. Pat. Chem. Eng. 1](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0050) [\(3\) \(2008\) 201](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0050)–208.
- [11] C. Baroi, A.M. Gaff[ney, R. Fushimi, Catal. Today 298 \(2017\) 138](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0055)–144.
- [12] A.M. Gaff[ney, O.M. Mason, Catal. Today 285 \(2017\) 159](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0060)–165.
- [13] [P. Botella, A. Dejoz, M.C. Abello, M.I. Vázquez, L. Arrúa, J.M. López Nieto, Catal.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0065) [Today 142 \(2009\) 272](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0065)–277.
- [14] [E. Heracleous, A.A. Lemonidou, J. Catal. 270 \(2010\) 67.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0070)
- [15] [E. Heracleous, A.A. Lemonidou, J. Catal. 237 \(2006\) 162.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0075)
- [16] [A. Qiao, V.N. Kalevaru, J. Radnik, A. Martin, Catal. Today 264 \(2016\) 144](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0080)–151.
- [17] [M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, E. Rojas, A. Gutierrez-Alejandre, J. Ramírez, F. Sánchez-](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0085)[Minero, C. Fernández-Vargas, M.A. Bañares, PCCP 13 \(2011\) 9260](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0085)–9267. [18] [F. Rubio-Marcos, E. Rojas, R. López-Medina, M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, M.A. Bañares,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0090)
- [J.F. Fernández, ChemCatChem 3 \(2011\) 1637](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0090)–1645. [19] [E. Rojas, J.J. Delgado, M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, M.A. Bañares, Cata. Sci. Technol. 3](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0095)
- [\(2013\) 3173.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0095)
- [20] [H. Zhu, S. Ould-Chikh, D.H. Anjum, M. Sun, G. Biausque, J.M. Basset, V. Craps, J.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0100) [Catal. 285 \(2012\) 292](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0100)–303.
- [21] Z. [Skoufa, E. Heracleous, A.A. Lemonidou, Chem. Eng. Sci. 84 \(2012\) 48](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0105)–56.
- [22] [Z. Skoufa, E. Heracleous, A.A. Lemonidou, J. Catal. 322 \(2015\) 118.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0110)
- [23] [P. Laveille, G. Biausque, H. Zhu, J.-M. Basset, V. Caps, Catal. Today 203](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0115) [\(2013\) 3](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0115)–9.
- [24] [A.H. Elbadawi, M.S. Osman, S.A. Razzak, M.M. Hossain, J. Taiwan Ins. Chem. Eng.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0120) [61 \(2016\) 106](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0120)–116.
- [25] [L.C.T. Lacerda, M.S. Pires, S. Corrêa, L.C.A. Oliveira, T.C. Ramalho, Chem. Phys.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0125) [Lett. 651 \(2016\) 161](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0125)–167.
- [26] J.J. Ternero-Hidalgo, J. Torres-Liñán, M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, J. Rodríguez-Mirasol, T. Cordero, Catal. Today 325 (2019) 131–143, [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cattod.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cattod.2018.10.073) [2018.10.073.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cattod.2018.10.073)
- [27] [M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, Catal. Today 285 \(2017\) 226](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0135)–233.
- [28] [Y. Li, G. Somorjai, Nano Lett. 10 \(7\) \(2010\) 2289](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0140)–2295.
- [29] [V. Calvino-Casilda, A.J. López-Peinado, R.M. Marín-Aranda, M.E. Pérez Mayoral](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0145) [\(Eds.\), Nanocatalysis: Applications and Technologies, CRC Press,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0145) [2019February 28.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0145)
- [30] [R. You, X. Zhang, L. Luo, Y. Pan, H. Pan, J. Yang, L. Wu, X. Zheng, Y. Jin,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0150) [W. Huang, J. Catal. 348 \(2017\) 189](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0150)–199.
- [31] J.J. Ternero-Hidalgo, M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, J. Rodríguez-Mirasol, T. Cordero, Catal. Today 325 (2019) 144–150, [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cattod.2018.10.072.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cattod.2018.10.072)
- [32] [H. Golinska, M. Ziolek, P. Decyk, Catal. Today 142 \(2009\) 175](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0160)–180. [33] [B. Kilos, M. Aouine, I. Nowak, M. Ziolek, J.C. Volta, J. Catal. 224 \(2004\) 314.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0165)
- [34] [B. Kilos, J.C. Volta, I. Nowak, P. Decyk, M. Ziolek, Stud. Surf. Sci. Catal. 154](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0170) [\(2004\) 848.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0170)
- [35] [B. Kilos, I. Nowak, M. Ziolek, A. TUel, J.C. Volta, Stud. Surf. Sci. Catal. 158 \(2005\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0175) [1461.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0175)
- [36] [M. Ziolek, I. Sobczak, A. Lewandowska, I. Nowak, P. Decyk, M. Renn,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0180) [B. Jankowska, Catal. Today 70 \(2001\) 169.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0180)
- [37] [M. Ziolek, I. Nowak, Zeolites 18 \(1997\) 356.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0185)
- [38] [I. Nowak, M. Ziolek, M. Jaroniec, J. Phys. Chem. B 108 \(2004\) 3722.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0190)
-
- [39] [I. Nowak, Colloid Surf. A: Phys. Eng. Asp. 241 \(2004\) 103.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0195) [40] [B. Kilos, A. Tuel, M. Ziolek, J.-C. Volta, Catal. Today 118 \(2006\) 416](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0200)–424. [41] [M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, J.L.G. Fierro, M.A. Vicente, M.A. Bañares, J. Catal. 206](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0205)
- [\(2002\) 339](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0205)–348. [42] M.O. [Guerrero-Pérez, M.A. Bañares, Catal. Today 239 \(2015\) 229](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0210)–236.
- [43] [E. Rojas, M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, M.A. Bañares, Catal. Commun. 10 \(2009\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0215) 1555–[1557.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0215)
- [44] [M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, E. Rojas-García, R. López-Medina, M.A. Bañares, Catal. Lett.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0220) [146 \(2016\) 1838](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0220)–1847.
- [45] [R. López-Medina, H. Golinska, M. Ziolek, M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, M.A. Bañares,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0225) [Catal. Today 158 \(2010\) 139](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0225)–145.
- [46] [R. López-Medina, J.L.G. Fierro, M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, M.A. Bañares, Appl. Catal. A](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0230) [Gen. 406 \(2011\) 34](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0230)–42.
- [47] [V.V. Guliants, R. Bhandari, J.N. Al-Saeedi, V.K. Vasudevan, R.S. Soman,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0235)
- [O. Guerrero-Pérez, M.A. Bañares, Appl. Catal. A Gen. 274 \(2004\) 123](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0235)–132. [48] [M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, J.N. Al-Saeedi, V.V. Guliants, M.A. Bañares, Appl. Catal. A](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0240) [Gen. 260 \(2004\) 93](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0240)–99.
- [49] [P. Korovchenko, N.R. Shiju, A.K. Dozier, U.M. Graham, M.O. Guerrero-Pérez,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0245) [V.V. Guliants, Top. Catal. 50 \(2008\) 43](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0245)–51.
- [50] [V.V. Guliants, R. Bhandari, B. Swaminathan, V.K. Vasudevan, H.H. Brongersma,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0250) A. Knoester, A.M. Gaff[ney, S. Han, J. Phys. Chem. B 109 \(2005\) 24046](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0250)–24055.
- [51] [J.N. Al-Saeedi, V.V. Guliants, O. Guerrero-Pérez, M.A. Bañares, J. Catal. 215](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0255) [\(2003\) 108](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0255)–115.
- [52] [T.T. Nguyen, B. Deniau, M. Baca, J.M.M. Millet, Top. Catal. 59 \(2016\) 1496](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0260)–1505. [53] [H. Golinska, E. Rojas, R. López-Medina, V. Calvino-Casilda, M. Ziolek,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0265)
- [M.A. Bañares, M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, App. Catal. A Gen. 380 \(2010\) 95](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0265)–104.
- [54] [M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, M.A. Bañares, Chem. Commun. 12 \(2002\) 1292](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0270)–1293. [55] [M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, M.A. Bañares, J. Phys. Chem. C 111 \(2007\) 1315](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0275)–1322.
- [56] [H. Golinska-Mazwa, E. Rojas, R. López-Medina, M. Ziolek, M.A. Bañares,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0280) [M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, Top. Catal. 55 \(2012\) 837](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0280)–845.
- [57] [A.R. Landa-Cánovas, F.J. García-García, S. Hansen, Catal. Today 158 \(2010\) 156.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0285) [58] [M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, M.V. Martínez-Huerta, J.L.G. Fierro, M.A. Bañares, Appl.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0290)
- [Catal. A Gen. 298 \(2006\) 1.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0290) [59] [L. De Rogatis, T. Montini, A. Cognigni, L. Olivi, P. Fornasiero, Catal. Today 145](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0295)
- [\(2009\) 176](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0295)–185. [60] G. [Pantaleo, V. La Parola, F. Deganello, R.K. Singha, R. Bal, A.M. Venezia, Appl.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0300)
- [Catal. B Environm. 189 \(2016\) 233](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0300)–241. [61] [J. Requies, M.A. Cabrero, V.L. Barrio, M.B. Güemez, J.F. Cambra, P.L. Arias,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0305)
- [F.J. Pérez-Alonso, M. Ojeda, M.A. Peña, J.L.G. Fierro, Appl. Catal. A Gen. 289](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0305) [\(2005\) 214](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0305)–223.
- [62] [M. Khajenoori, M. Rezaei, B. Nematollahi, J. Ind. Eng. Chem. 19 \(2013\) 981](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0310)–986.
- [63] [N.N. Nichio, M.L. Casella, E.N. Ponzi, O.A. Ferretti, Nat. Gas Convers. V. 119](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0315) [\(1998\) 723](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0315)–728.
- [64] [T.C. Ramalho, L.C.A. Oliveira, K.T.G. Carvalho, E.F. Souza, E.F.F. da Cunha,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0320) [M. Nazzaro, Mol. Phys. 107 \(2009\) 171.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0320)
- [65] [L.C.A. Oliveira, T.C. Ramalho, E.F. Souza, M. Goncalves, D.Q.L. Oliveira,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0325) [M.C. Pereira, J.D. Fabris, Appl. Catal. B 83 \(2008\) 169.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0325)
- [66] [K.J. de Almeida, T.C. Silva, J.L. Neto, M.V.J. Rocha, T.C. Ramalho, M.N. de](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0330) [Miranda, H.A. Durarte, J. Organom. Chem. 802 \(2016\) 49.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0330)
- [67] D.S. Costa, R.S. Gomes, C.B. Rodella, R.B. da Silva Junior, R. Fréty, E.T. Neto, S.T. Brandao, Catal. Today (2019), <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cattod.2018.10.022> [in press.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cattod.2018.10.022)
- [68] [K. Liu, A. Wang, T. Zhang, ACS Cata. 2 \(2012\) 1165](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0340)–1178.
- [69] [M. Kipnis, Appl. Catal. B 25 \(2014\) 152](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0345)–153.
- [70] [P. Laveille, K. Guillois, A. Tuel, C. Petit, J.M. Basset, V. Caps, Chem. Commun. 52](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0350) [\(2016\) 3179](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0350)–3182.
- [71] [T.R. Reina, S. Ivanova, O.H. Laguna, M.A. Centeno, J.A. Odriozola, Appl. Catal. B](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0355) [15 \(2016\) 62](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0355)–72.
- [72] [E. de Oliveira Jardim, S. Rico-Francés, F. Coloma, E.V. Ramos-Fernández,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0360) [J. Silvestre-Albero, A. Sepúlveda-Escribano, Appl. Catal. A Gen. 487 \(2014\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0360) 119–[129.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0360)
- [73] [S. Rico-Francés, E.O. Jardim, T.A. Wezendonk, F. Kapteijn, J. Gascon,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0365) [A. Sepúlveda-Escribano, E.V. Ramos-Fernandez, Appl. Catal. B 180 \(2016\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0365) 169–[178.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0365)
- [74] [L.C.A. Oliveira, F. Zaera, I. Lee, D.Q. Lima, T.C. Ramalho, A.C. Silva,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0370) [E.M.B. Fonseca, Appl. Catal. A Gen. 368 \(2009\) 17](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0370)–21.
- [75] [E.O. Jardim, S. Rico-Francés, F. Coloma, J.A. Anderson, E.V. Ramos-Fernandez,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0375) [J. Silvestre-Albero, A. Sepúlveda-Escribano, Appl. Catal. A Gen. 492 \(2015\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0375) 201–[211.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0375)
- [76] [E.F. de Souza, T.C. Ramalho, C.A. Chagas, R.B. de Alencastro, Catal. Sci. Technol.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0380) [8 \(2014\) 2550.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0380)
- [77] [M.D. Soriano, J. Jiménez-Jiménez, P. Concepción, A. Jiménez-López,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0385) [E. Rodríguez-Castellón, J.M.L. Nieto, Appl. Catal. B 92 \(2009\) 271](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0385)–279.
- [78] [M. León, J. Jiménez-Jiménez, A. Jiménez-López, E. Rodríguez-Castellón,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0390) [D. Soriano, J.M.L. Nieto, Solid. State. Sci. 12 \(2010\) 996](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0390)–1001.
- [79] M.O. [Guerrero-Pérez, J. Janas, T. Machej, J. Haber, A.E. Lewandowska,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0395) [J.L.G. Fierro, M.A. Bañares, Appl. Catal. B 71 \(2007\) 85](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0395)–93.
- [80] [J. Haber, J. Janas, J. Krysciak-Czerwenka, T. Machej, H. Sadowska, S. Hellden,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0400) [Appl. Catal. A Gen. 229 \(2002\) 23](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0400)–34.
- [81] [J.J. Spivey, Ind. Eng. Chem. Res. 26 \(1987\) 2165](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0405)–2180.
- [82] [M. Shahzad Kamal, S.A. Razzak, M.M. Hossain, Atmos. Environ. 140 \(2016\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0410) 117–[134.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0410)
- [83] [J. Jones, J.R. Ross, Catal. Today 35 \(1997\) 97](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0415)–105.
- [84] [R. Delaible, D.P. Debecker, F. Bertinchamps, E.M. Gaigneaux, Top. Catal. 52](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0420) [\(2009\) 501](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0420)–516.
- [85] [A.M. Beale, F. Gao, I. Lezcano-Gonzalez, C.H.F. Peden, J. Szanyi, Chem. Soc. Rev.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0425) [44 \(2015\) 7371](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0425)–7405.
- [86] [W.F. Shangguan, Y. Teraoka, S. Kagawa, Appl. Catal. B 16 \(1998\) 149](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0430)–154.
- [87] D.W. Fickel, E. D'[Addio, J.A. Lauterbach, R.F. Lobo, Appl. Catal. B 102 \(2011\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0435) 441–[448.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0435)
- [88] [G. Qi, R.T. Yang, R. Chang, Appl. Catal. B 51 \(2004\) 93](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0440)–106.
- [89] [F. Kapteijn, L. Singoredjo, A. Andreini, J.A. Moulijn, Appl. Catal. B 3 \(1994\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0445) 173–[189.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0445)
- [90] [J. Xu, G. Chen, F. Guo, J. Xie, Chem. Eng. J. 353 \(2018\) 507](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0450)–518.
- [91] [R. Si, Y.W. Zhang, S.J. Li, B.X. Lin, C.H. Yan, J. Phys. Chem. B 108 \(2004\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0455) 12481–[12488.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0455)
- [92] [B. Murugan, A.V. Ramaswamy, D. Srinivas, C.S. Gopinath, V. Ramaswamy, Chem.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0460) [Mat. 17 \(2005\) 3983](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0460)–3993.
- [93] [M. Boaro, F. Giordano, S. Recchia, V.D. Santo, M. Giona, A. Troarelli, Appl. Catal.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0465) [B 52 \(2004\) 225](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0465)–237.
- [94] [M. Fernandez-Garcia, A. Martinez-Arias, A. Iglesias-Juez, A.B. Hungria,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0470) [J.A. Anderson, J.C. Conesa, J. Soria, Appl. Catal. B 31 \(2001\) 39](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0470)–50.
- [95] [N.Y. Topsoe, Science 265 \(1994\) 1217](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0475)–1219. [96] M. [Casapu, A. Bernhard, D. Peitz, M. Mehring, M. Elsener, O. Kröcher, Appl. Catal.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0480)
- [B 103 \(2011\) 79](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0480)–84.
- [97] [R. Qu, X. Gao, K. Cen, J. Li, Appl. Catal. B 142-143 \(2013\) 290](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0485)–297.
- [98] [Z. Ma, Z. Wu, Z. Si, D. Weng, J. Ma, T. Xu, Appl. Catal. B 179 \(2015\) 380](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0490)–394. [99] [E.T.C. Vogt, A.J. van Dillen, J.W. Geus, F.J.J.G. Janssen, Catal. Today 2 \(1988\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0495) 569–[579.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0495)

M.O. Guerrero-Pérez *Catalysis Today xxx (xxxx) xxx–xxx*

- [100] [L. Lietti, P. Forzatti, J. Catal. 147 \(1994\) 241](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0500)–249.
- [101] [I.E. Wachs, G. Deo, B.M. Weckhuysen, A. Andreini, M.A. Vuurman, M. De Boer,](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0505) [M.D. Amiridis, J. Catal. 161 \(1996\) 211](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0505)–221.
- [102] [J. Xu, G. Chen, F. Guo, J. Xie, Chem. Eng. J. 353 \(2018\) 507](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0510)–518. [103] [X.Y. GUo, C. Bartholomew, W. Hecker, L.L. Baxter, Appl. Catal. B 92 \(2009\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0515)
- 30–[40.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0515)
- [104] [X.S. Du, X. Gao, Y.C. Fu, F. Gao, Z.Y. Luo, K.F. Cen, J. Coll. Int. Sci. 368 \(2012\)](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0520)

406–[412.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0520)

-
- [105] [D. Ye, R. Qu, C. Zheng, K. Cen, X. Gao, Appl. Catal. A Gen. 549 \(2018\) 310](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0525)–319. [106] [Y. Zhao, B. Choi, D. Kim, Chem. Eng. Sci. 164 \(2017\) 258](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0530)–269.
- [107] [M. Ziolek, M.A. Bañares, I.E. Wachs, Catal. Today 142 \(2009\) 99](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0535)–334.
- [108] [G. Busca, F. Cavani, Catal. Today 192 \(2012\) 1.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0540)
- [109] [M.O. Guerrero-Pérez, J. Rodríguez-Mirasol, T. Cordero, Catal. Today 254 \(2015\) 1.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0545)
- [110] [B.M. Reddy, G. Deo, Catal. Today 325 \(2019\) 1.](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0920-5861(19)30075-6/sbref0550)