

BOOK REVIEWS

JOHN O. DORST, *The Written Suburb: An American Site, An Ethnographic Dilemma* (Contemporary Ethnography Series; ser. eds. Paul Stoller and Dan Rose), Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press 1989. xii, 220 pp., References, Index, Illustrations. No price given.

The Written Suburb, the first volume in Stoller and Rose's 'Contemporary Ethnography Series', already has as dated a feel to it as the very word 'contemporary' has (as in 'contemporary music'). In part an ethnography of Chadds Ford, a small village-cum-township in Pennsylvania and in part a mapping out of the terrain of 'post-ethnographic' investigation, it is unsatisfactory in the first instance and somewhat tiresome in the second.

Chadds Ford is the most important (to its inhabitants and to Dorst) of a number of small townships clustered along the Brandywine Creek and is, for Dorst if not for its inhabitants, a 'Site': 'a complex ideological production—an ordering of texts' (p. 10). In traditional ethnographic terms its importance derives from two historical associations: as the site of a major battle during the Revolutionary War (and consequent 'colonial' associations) and as the home of the Wyeth family of painters (and the subsequent development of the 'Brandywine School'). It is the contemporary and near-contemporary artefacts and activities associated with these two sets of historical associations (craft fairs, tourism, museums, restaurant menus, restored houses) that make up the 'texts' that Dorst wishes to analyse. So far so straightforward, but the problem—the 'dilemma' of Dorst's subtitle—is that this Site experiences the conditions of postmodernity. That is, it is self-conscious in the reproduction of its own image and as such is its own ethnographer. The inhabitants of Chadds Ford produce texts about themselves consciously (such as a potted history of the settlement on the back of a restaurant menu card) and unconsciously (through, for example, mirrored glass surfaces on buildings that allow the spectator to tell him- or herself a story about their relation to the environment) and have no further need of a conventional ethnographer to interpret them: 'postmodernity seems to render the professional ethnographer superfluous' (p. 2). The 'dilemma', then, is about finding a new place for the ethnographer in the postmodern world.

Dorst is blatant about his disregard for many of anthropology's more central concerns: 'It should be apparent that I have not been particularly concerned with the lives of the people who inhabit Chadds Ford, nor with the social relations and categories of specific subjects. I confess my goal here to be unashamedly anti-humanistic.... In so far as I present informants, they should be taken as parables, as foci of textuality, as things spoken rather than speaking' (pp. 208–9). Dorst is not, apparently, an anthropologist and comes to the discipline just as it was undergoing its most embarrassing period of genuflections towards the high priests of postmodernist literary theory. As a consequence he seems unaware that all societies produce and consume self-conscious representations of themselves, and

that since Durkheim and Mauss anthropologists have considered the ways in which the material and ideological environments have been used as a blackboard for the writing and rewriting of these texts. In the five years since *The Written Suburb* was published the discipline has begun to refound itself, leaving much of Dorst's vision of a 'post-ethnographic' future by the wayside. There is also an inherent paradox in Dorst's project itself. Consisting of an arbitrary series of 'fragments' of ethnography, a 'collage' as Dorst terms it, interwoven with a portentous narrative on postmodernism, the book's aim is to come to grips with 'the culture of advanced consumer capitalism' (p. 2), but as all modernist scholarly enterprises are now apparently bankrupt there is the paradox that the book is itself merely a text of postmodernity and can only be a 'one kind of response to the conditions of advanced consumer culture' (p. 206), rather than any form of analysis. Certainly, the fact that many societies have indigenous conceptions of 'consumption' (including, presumably, the inhabitants of and visitors to Chadds Ford) is a point of no apparent interest to Dorst, who constantly privileges his own readings of the texts produced and consumed in Chadds Ford.

There is no doubt that some parts of the book are well worth reading. The chapter on a 'reading' of two of Chadds Ford's museums (chapter 5) would undoubtedly be of interest to those involved in the new museology, while as an almost painfully self-conscious account of the postmodernist enterprise the book will no doubt be of use to future historians of academic trends and fashions.

MARCUS BANKS

JAN BRØGGER, *Pre-Bureaucratic Europeans: A Study of a Portuguese Fishing Community*, Oslo: Norwegian University Press and Institute for Comparative Research in Human Culture 1990. 151 pp., References, Index. £20.00.

In the opening sentence of this interesting book the author tells us that even though Nazaré, the fishing community studied, is situated on the Atlantic coast of Portugal, its culture and language are mediterranean. Later, he devotes much of the book to pointing out how unmediterranean (the author's word) the community is. This is one of many inconsistencies peppered throughout Jan Brøgger's new book.

The introduction dwells on the author's central theoretical concerns. These include: an interpretative ambition (following Geertz's 'thick description'); the process from *Gemeinschaft* to *Gesellschaft* (after Tönnies); social history and its small-scale insights into large-scale changes; the transformation from medieval to modern society; and the concept of pollution as to do with categories (as examined by Mary Douglas). These concerns are pursued throughout the book, which concentrates on the pre-bureaucratic organization of social relations amongst the

fishing community. This quality of pre-bureaucraticness, defined as occurring in a face-to-face community where bureaucracy plays an insignificant role, apparently explains why local beliefs and superstitions have remained unchanged.

One of the unmediterranean aspects of this community is the dominance of women, a subject that the author meets head-on in the early chapters. Matri-focality, and the economic dominance of women through their monopoly of the fish market, have left the men 'gentle, sometimes resigned, and somewhat introverted' (p. 42). The author draws many such psychological conclusions from his observations. For example, when considering machismo, he adds 'the absence of this type of masculinity in Nazaré is probably due to the fulfilment of masculinity at sea' (p. 42). This type of remark, easily refuted by comparable examples, typifies many of the author's observations, which are hastily concocted hypothetical reasonings.

In contrast to such descriptions of male behaviour, we learn that 'the Nazarenos subscribe to common mediterranean ideas of male dominance' (p. 34) and that 'the most successful fishermen sometimes manage to establish themselves as masters of their households' (p. 37). Domestic superiority has been equated with economic power, and the women apparently have the upper hand; unfortunately, we do not learn enough about the nuts and bolts of this economic relationship. Even though we are told that tourism is the second most important industry in the community, that women exploit it, and that it has 'facilitated the development of the two distinct strata in Nazaré, the bourgeoisie and the fishermen' (p. 16), we learn precious little else about it. This is a major weakness, as it is implied that the power relationship between the sexes is a result of economic dominance and that, in turn, it is responsible for the organization of the society and therefore its intellectual character: 'in order to change the people of the "praia" into modern rationalists, nothing less than a basic change in the social organisation of relationships would be necessary' (p. 126).

The bulk of the book is concerned with descriptions and analysis of family structure, behaviour and communal living, supernatural beliefs, the structure of relationships, and the social organization of fishing. In three out of the seven chapters, there is an emphasis on superstitious beliefs, and there are explicit illustrations of various witchcraft and sorcery activities and their impact on everyday life within the community. Brøgger is also preoccupied with the psychological aspects of the community, in both individual and group manifestations, a factor that lends substance to his descriptions. This combination of qualities in a book concerned with a fishing community in Europe gives it a uniqueness, and makes it a welcome addition to the corpus of material on this region.

Most of the topics investigated are supported with examples, and there are plenty of local accounts in the form of dialogue and narrative. These all help to give the book an authentic quality, and together with the detailed genealogical information and careful examination of the fisherman's lifestyle, form its ethnographic strong points. At times there is an unnecessary quantity of

information, in particular with the pedantically technical details of fishing equipment (pp. 91–9), which may irritate non-specialist readers.

Overall, however, the book suffers from Brøgger's overenthusiasm to be comparative both spatially and temporally, his tendency to draw unsubstantiated psychological conclusions, his willingness to promote the community as a 'unique family system' (p. 37), and his propensity to draw historical conclusions, as in 'the modern bourgeois was born in pain and hardened through ruthless discipline. Maybe it is this strength which made the great transformation of agrarian society into modern industrial civilization possible' (p. 146). This type of conjectural statement partly devalues this otherwise intriguing and provocative study.

DON MACLEOD

JAMES G. CARRIER and ACHSAH H. CARRIER, *Wage, Trade, and Exchange in Melanesia: A Manus Society in the Modern State* (Studies in Melanesian Anthropology 7; gen. eds. Gilbert H. Herdt, Fitzjohn Porter Poole and Donald F. Tuzin), Berkeley etc.: University of California Press 1989. xvii, 257 pp., References, Index, Tables, Maps, Figures. \$35.00.

Ponam Island, a small community off the north coast of Manus Island, Papua New Guinea, is the subject of this innovative study. The authors extend the criticism within anthropology of ethnographies that attempt to analyse village communities without reference to the nations of which they are a part, and that equate the tradition and the exotic with the untouched. In describing the articulation between a peripheral village society and the national economy and institutions of a nation state, the Carriers have written a book that will interest all those concerned with social change and the anthropology of development.

The frame that shapes this description is the relationship of village and town, the traditional and the modern. The lessons drawn bear on the necessity of seeing villages like Ponam in terms of their links with the towns, with wage employment, commodities and the state. In order to deal with this articulation adequately, Ponam economics is divided into three parts. The first is domestic economic activity, production and circulation undertaken by people living on Ponam Island. These sprang from the island's and region's endowments of land and sea, sun, wind and rain, and consisted mostly of fishing, the dominant conventional village-based productive activity, and market trade, by which islanders secured the necessities they did not produce for themselves. These were central elements of both Ponam economic life prior to colonization and of the way Ponam Islanders perceived themselves and their past.

Complementing domestic activities were foreign or overseas activities. The authors are not referring here to the sort of indirect involvement that comes with

being part of an integrated economic system, but to direct personal involvement with distant people and places. Foreign economic activities include migrant labour, cash-crop production, and other forms of petty commodity production. Even though this migration was both relatively recent and alien to what Ponam Islanders were accustomed to doing, its consequences had come to shape not only central elements of social life on the island, but also Ponam Islanders' self-conceptions. At the same time that they maintained their traditional identity as island people who fish and trade, they established another, more contemporary identity, as people who must migrate to seek wealth.

The chief importance of the book, therefore, is in its discussion of the third area—the articulation of the domestic and overseas realms of Ponam life. The most explicit discussion is found in chapter 6, entitled 'Internal Exchange', as it conducts an analysis of these two areas and looks at the way ceremonial exchange mediated between residents and migrants. This mediation tied migrants to home and motivated them to save money and remit it to Ponam, a remittance that produced a number of important results. It subsidized life on Ponam, keeping it pleasant and attractive to migrants, and thus strengthened their commitment to home and their willingness to send money. As part of this subsidy, remittances enabled residents to cope with their deteriorating position relative to their Manus trade and market partners, and so helped maintain that area of local economic activity. It also increased the economic significance of ceremonial exchange, making it remunerative to residents in fact as well as in ideology. This appears to have led to an increase both in the frequency of exchange and in the proportion of resident adults participating in it. The result is a strengthening of the importance of the kin groups that play a central role in this exchange and the kin relations that shape people's access to and place in exchange. In its turn, this strengthening helped these groups remain important in the other area of life in which they featured, the ownership of property, particularly property related to traditional fishing, the main element of domestic economic production.

Somewhat less explicitly the authors describe other important aspects of this articulation. Of concern here is the relationship between Ponam social structure and the island's relations with the outside world. Briefly, prior to colonization, when the outside world was the rest of Manus, relations among Ponam Islanders were unequal, with the dominant position going to those people having the strongest control over the production and circulation of wealth within the region. However, as the outside world expanded, and as the economic importance of Manus for Ponam decreased, islanders lost their ability to control significant sources of wealth, particularly wealth from outside the island—they became dependent on the emerging national economy. Consequently, no group of villagers was able to control wealth to the exclusion of others, and relations among villagers became more equal.

In sum, the book logically and interestingly argues that although Ponam Islanders thought of themselves in terms of a separation between their island and the outside world, between island ways and town ways, these two realms were

joined. The customary daily round on the island was not independent of the existence of the outside world and the part Ponam Islanders played in it. On the contrary, the survival of Ponam tradition required that Ponam Islanders participate in modernity. The Ponam mix of migration, remittance and exchange was a glue that helped hold the society together, rather than a solvent causing it to fall apart.

DAVID A. MCCLELLAND

CAROL LADERMAN, *Taming the Wind of Desire: Psychology, Medicine, and Aesthetics in Malay Shamanistic Performance* (Comparative Studies of Health Systems and Medical Care 29; gen. ed. John M. Janzen), Berkeley etc.: University of California Press 1991. xvi, 366 pp., Glossary, Bibliography, Index, Photographs. \$39.95/\$16.00.

Previous studies of Malay shamanism have been restricted in scope due to their failure to transcribe and analyse texts from the Main Peteri or curing performance. As part of her study, which is based on two years' fieldwork in Trengganu State, Laderman uses the texts of three complete seances to demonstrate the great variety of forms that Main Peteri can take. The book is divided into two parts. The first discusses the concepts and practices of Malay healing and prepares the reader for understanding the cultural context of the Malay shaman's seance. The second comprises translations of three complete performances of shamanic seances, extensively annotated.

Malay shamanism and changing Western attitudes towards the phenomenon are discussed, followed by an outline of the Malay humoral system, which is the corner-stone of Malay medical and cosmological theory. Although the majority of illnesses are regarded as normal and are dealt with by employing a rational, scientific approach based on this humoral system, there are also unusual illnesses caused by incursions from the unseen world. These are the illnesses with which the *bomoh* (shaman) is concerned. A spirit attack, which will only be effective if the victim is already weakened in some way, most frequently consists of the spirits blowing on their victim's back and upsetting his humoral balance. If the *bomoh's* normal methods of counterbalancing the attack fail, then a Main Peteri may be deemed necessary. The attacking spirits are brought to the seance by the *bomoh's* helping spirits (*penggawa*) and are coaxed and threatened into restoring the patient to health.

Illness may also be due to the patient's personality. The Malays believe that an individual's personality, drives and talents are determined by an inner wind (*angin*) that is present at birth, and Laderman's discussion of *angin* represents one of the first attempts to understand Malay ideas about the self and personality. If the person is allowed to express his *angin*, i.e. his traits, talents and ideas, he will

lead an untroubled, productive life, but if these desires are thwarted, the *angin* is blocked, resulting in illness termed *sakit berangin* (wind sickness). Different kinds of *sakit berangin* are identified, each one having an archetype in a folk story. The task of the *bomoh* in the Main Peteri is to identify the thwarted personality and, by inducing the patient into trance, to get him to act out the repressed portions of his personality, and face up to it by moving into an altered state.

The study goes on to consider the performance aspects of the shaman's seance, discussing its dramatic form, music, movement and props. The seance form of ritual drama is divided into scenes, much like a play. In its language, music, movement, themes and world-view, it is related to the Mak Yong dance theatre and to the *wayang kulit* (shadow play). For example, the dialogue between the *bomoh* (who is acting as a mouthpiece for the spirits) and the *minduk* (his partner who does not go into trance, and who often accompanies him on the Malay fiddle) relies heavily on metaphors from the Mak Yong and shadow play, as well as folk beliefs about spirits. This is clearly demonstrated in the transcribed dialogues that comprise the second half of Laderman's book. The transcriptions further demonstrate ideas about the human body (often conceptualized as a house under siege) as a microcosm of the universe.

Overall, the book provides a fascinating description and analysis of a Malay belief system, particularly valuable in view of the increasing rarity of the Main Peteri due to opposition from the Muslim hierarchy. If it has one failing it is that it does not include the original Malay, but only the English translation of the seance transcriptions. In view of the importance of the spoken word and the power that words can carry, this is unfortunate.

SIAN E. JAY

ANTHONY GOOD, *The Female Bridegroom: A Comparative Study of Life-Crisis Rituals in South India and Sri Lanka* (Oxford Studies in Social and Cultural Anthropology), Oxford: Clarendon Press 1991. xiv, 256 pp., References, Glossary, Index, Plates, Figures, Tables, Maps. £35.00.

Although Van Gennep's representation of typical ritual structures has lasted better than many anthropological models of the period, one of its less happy legacies has been a certain tendency to demarcate too sharply from one another the different rituals of a particular cultural tradition. Although one can hardly throw this accusation at Van Gennep himself, ethnographic accounts of ritual often follow relentlessly the chapter headings of *Les Rites de passage*, without any clear recognition of the way in which different rites may implicate one another. For example, the coming together of different parental substances in the child through pregnancy and birth may have to be properly redistributed, or at any rate accounted

for, when the child, as an adult, eventually dies; similarly, relationships set up through marriage may have to be recognized at birth or death ceremonies; and marriage rites may refer back to, or even partly constitute, rites of puberty or initiation.

Thus such rites are often best examined as whole sequences, which is precisely the way the present book treats them as they occur in south India and Sri Lanka. Although its first two-thirds are exhaustively descriptive and concentrated mostly on Good's own fieldwork in Tirunelveli District, Tamil Nadu, there is also a comparative chapter on the work of others in the general area, as well as further chapters dealing with rival interpretations and with the overall analysis of the entire ritual sequence. Much background data on caste composition and kinship are also provided, most of the latter having already appeared in print as articles (as has the critique of the concept of a '*jajmani* system' in chapter 4). Among sundry ancillary features one might mention are Good's attempt to apply to descent Needham's three levels of analysis in the study of affinal alliance systems, and his confirmation of earlier observations that the Dumontian dichotomy between pure and impure is too global in that it does not really incorporate the alternative dichotomy between auspicious and inauspicious but must be supplemented by it. Perhaps this was especially apparent in an area where, Good says, nobody bothered much about untouchability, something indeed on which the people prided themselves.

But it is the ritual sequence, largely concentrated on women, that is Good's main concern. The book's title refers to the use in this region of a girl's mock wedding to another girl to mark her menarche. This invites comparison not only with the real wedding she must go through later, but also with other examples in India where a form of marriage acts as a ritual instrument on occasions that are not marriages, or only dubiously so, from a Western point of view. Good discusses the famous Nayar case in some detail and touches on the use made of similar devices by tribal groups further north. Dumont has traced sporadic instances as far away as Nepal, and in *Homo Hierarchicus* he gives other examples in which such 'marriages' enable a woman to enjoy married status while undertaking sexual activities unusual in type or degree. As Good mentions, they may also occasionally give a dying or dead woman married status after a spinster's life of seclusion. What he is mostly concerned with, however, are instances in which they form part of the regular ritual cycle that transforms a girl into a woman and a woman into a wife. The concept certainly deserves wider comparative treatment, for the purposes to which it is put are as varied as whatever and whoever it is one marries, and as whatever and whoever is being married, though the idea of an ersatz wedding links them all.

In order to interpret his material, Good rejects the psychological and ethnosociological approaches (the latter because it means 'abdicating the analyst's role') in favour of a basically structural approach. To it is added a consideration of symbols in terms drawn ultimately from Turner's distinction between dominant and instrumental symbols, though bringing in a further dichotomy between import

and purport—by which is meant, roughly, symbolic values in the abstract versus symbolic values wedded to context. Good does not really exploit the performative jargon with which he starts, and he seems more concerned to push the idea of ‘instrumental symbols’ as something analogous to the chemical reagents he must have learned all about in his previous incarnation as a chemistry student, which in turn are said to be analogous to the capacity of these symbols ‘to effect particular kinds of transformation’. Ultimately, analogies always have more illustrative than explanatory value, though this one is more apt than many encountered in anthropology. So long as we are not being asked to witness the emergence of an ethnochemistry here, I suppose there is nothing much to worry about.

Finally, ‘controlled regional comparison’ is put forward as something ‘increasingly necessary to the advancement of anthropological study’. The idea is hardly new in itself, of course, having been advocated years ago by such figures as Evans-Pritchard and Fred Eggan, and the Dutch have long practised it in Indonesia. Good’s approach bears some resemblance to the latter, as later revised by P. E. de Josselin de Jong, in that the different case-studies are seen as transformations of one another, all being focused on a common structural theme. What is different is that for Good the theme is defined polythetically rather than substantively, which allows cultural variations to be taken fully into account, the structural core notwithstanding. Thus does Good, who has proved himself positivist enough elsewhere to claim that anthropology is a science, at least in the Popperian sense, make use of a model associated above all in anthropology with the philosopher Wittgenstein—the ethnosociological philosopher *par excellence*, one might say, in that for him the only real truths were cultural statements.

ROBERT PARKIN

ALF HILTEBEITEL, *The Cult of Draupadi II: On Hindu Ritual and the Goddess*, Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press 1991. xxi, 482 pp., Appendix, Bibliography, Indexes, Map, Figures, Plates, Tables. £59.95/£21.95/\$86.25/\$31.75.

The first volume of this projected trilogy was reviewed enthusiastically in these pages (Vol. XXI, no. 3, pp. 327–9). The present volume does for the ritual aspects of the cult what its predecessor did for the mythic aspects, and the standard is well maintained. This is high-class scholarship on a theme that merits it.

The range is impressive. Geographically the focus remains on Tamilnad, the ‘core area’ of the cult, but by exploiting the literature the author moves easily across the 1200 miles from Kerala to Bengal, with occasional sorties further afield, for example to the Indian community in Singapore. In the temporal dimension he ranges from contemporary fieldwork by himself and others right back to the Vedas,

and socially he is as much at ease with metropolitan centres as with villages. The notion of ritual covers, of course, not only what people do but also where they do it, and the effigies, altars, posts and other impedimenta that they use. Here the 38 black-and-white plates are a useful supplement to the text.

Draupadī festivals, like some others, may begin in the temple with the planting of ‘Gardens of Adonis’: seedlings are encouraged to sprout prematurely and are then discarded. Hildebeitel seizes the opportunity for interesting comparisons with ancient Greece, as analysed by Detienne. Next, wristlets are tied and flags are hoisted. The flagpole provides an extraordinarily rich topic, being linked both with the Vedic sacrificial stake and with the mythical Pōttū Rāja, a figure salient in folk narratives relating to the *Mahabharata* but absent from the Sanskrit epic itself. Here Hildebeitel draws on the pioneering work of Biardeau, but he also argues that the Goddess’s temple is an intermediary form between two *outdoor* ritual sites, the ancient Vedic sacrificial terrain and the ‘battlefield’ that is laid out for some of the most dramatic events of the festival. The battlefield often contains large effigies of Duryodhana (leader of the demonic party in the epic) lying on his back. One such effigy, modelled from five tons of earth and painted from crown to heel, was nearly forty feet long, while another was ninety feet. Often, rites representing the death and revival of epic characters take place. Similar rites, widely distributed in South Asia, have been linked by Obeyesekere with the Frazerian theme of dying and rising gods, and he suggests that they diffused from West Asia; but Hildebeitel relates them, more cautiously, to the Vedic Aśvamedha ritual. Sometimes the notion of battlefield is replaced by that of fortress, and a structure is built with walls four feet or four inches high. However, the culminating event is usually the celebrated fire walk, in which participants cross a shallow pit filled with smouldering embers. A variety of interpretations have been offered, and Hildebeitel’s is catholic, emphasizing the pervasive theme of sacrifice.

From the point of view of general anthropology, the very richness of the material and the catholicity of approach may limit the book’s impact. The interpretation of ritual and its relation to myth are mainstream anthropological concerns, and here we have a substantial case-study that might offer general lessons. However (perhaps because the author was originally a Sanskritist rather than an anthropologist), the theoretical and methodological implications are left to the reader. One implication seems to me to concern the scale on which one should be looking for interpretations of ritual. I suspect that many of us have left for the field thinking that to understand a ritual all one needs is an understanding of local life, a good description of the event, a forthcoming local exegete (like Victor Turner’s?), and some general theoretical background. This is certainly a start, and may be all that time allows, but the resulting analysis is likely to be highly vulnerable to such comparative and historical approaches as Hildebeitel’s. Probably this is as true of ‘tribal’ areas as of literate civilizations.

Elements of the author’s theoretical position can be put together from his scattered criticisms of others—and of himself (p. 456f.) for some earlier Freudian

formulations. Thus the German Orissa Project wrongly attributed to tribal origins much that was essentially Hindu (see pp. 99, 125); Heesterman, as Trautmann has also observed, arbitrarily interpreted as 'pre-classical' the agonistic aspects of Vedic sacrifice (p. 139 n.); Obeyesekere did not need to call on diffusion to explain revival rites (p. 367); and Parpola carried speculation too far with his hypothetical pre-Vedic Dāsa religion, supposedly linking the Hindu goddess to West Asian city goddesses (pp. 385ff.). In other words, we need a more inclusive sense of Hinduism before we postulate outside influences. I would agree, arguing that a good deal of what appears 'alien' can be conceptualized by means of a Dumézilian fourth function.

We can now look forward eagerly to the concluding volume of this major work.

N. J. ALLEN

OWEN M. LYNCH (ed.), *Divine Passions: The Social Construction of Emotion in India*, Berkeley etc.: University of California Press 1990. x, 312 pp., References, Glossary, Index. No price given.

This book can be taken on two levels. First, it is a welcome contribution to the ethnography of South Asia, providing data from a number of interesting contexts on the way emotions are 'constructed' in the subcontinent. Secondly, there is an argument, stated explicitly by Lynch in his introduction, and taken up and endorsed to varying degrees by the other contributors, for what he calls the 'social constructionist' position in the study of emotion. This is defined primarily by its opposition to physicalism, a position Lynch traces back to Descartes, Hume and William James. Physicalism presupposes that emotions are the effects of physiological causes and frequently makes use of a hydraulic metaphor: emotions 'well up', are 'blocked', or have to be 'controlled'. This is perhaps the commonest folk model in the West.

Lynch takes his own social constructionist position to be a variety of Lévi-Strauss's cognitivism. He summarizes it in six main points. 'Emotions,' he writes, 'are essentially appraisals, that is, they are judgments of situations based on cultural beliefs and values' (p. 8; point 1). As such, they are 'constitutive for the individual' (point 2), 'implicate in some way agent responsibility' (point 4), 'involve moral judgments' (point 5), and 'have consequences for the way individuals relate and for how social systems are variously constructed and operate' (point 6). Much of this is very helpful, and is undoubtedly a salutary warning against the assumption that emotions can be compared unproblematically across cultures. More controversial is his third point: 'as cultural appraisals, emotions are learned or acquired in society rather than given naturally. They are, therefore, culturally relative, although theorists differ on the degree to which this

is so' (p. 9). The key admission lies in the subordinate clause: cultural relativity is a matter of degree. The emotions experienced by people in other cultures, for all that they are 'constructed' differently, are not entirely different, as the ethnography presented in this book clearly demonstrates.

Most of what Lynch says is sensible; but in failing to see that there are different types of emotion, and that while some may be entirely culturally constructed, others are so to varying degrees, he falls, without seeming fully aware of it, into an indefensible relativism. 'There are probably no universal, objective situations,' claims Lynch, 'that, without agent appraisal, automatically trigger in humans innate emotional responses such as humor or fear' (ibid.). Surely small children all over the world are frightened by loud noises.

India has its own traditional 'high culture' theory of emotions or *rasa*, as Lynch notes, and this is relevant for the chapters of the book that deal with Vaishnavism, the religious system that gives salvific value to prescribed types of love felt for Krishna. The full implications of this are not worked out, however. Since the book is a collection of conference papers, the coverage is not systematic. Of the nine ethnographic chapters, five deal with Vaishnavism (including Marglin's piece on rituals in the temple of Jagannath, Puri). From these one gets considerable insight into internal Vaishnava debates about which emotions are most salvific, and whether sexual ones are permitted. Three focus on the family, and one on the mutual appraisals (especially in relation to feelings of honour and shame) of immigrant and north American convert Sikhs in Canada. Unfortunately, none of the papers deals with those significant South Asian religious traditions, to which Vaishnavism is a reaction, that emphasize the suppression of emotion, though hints of this are found in Trawick's subtle analysis of love within the Tamil family, where there is much stress on the need to hide and control love.

Vatuk's paper comparing old age in India and the USA is perceptive and moving. She tacks on some remarks about social constructionism at the end, but does not convince; if anything her data highlight similarities in the emotional experience of old age, for all the well-known different expectations about living arrangements. Kolenda's long and detailed paper on the use of humour, based on data collected in the 1950s among low-caste Chuhras, is also excellent. Peter Bennett's paper, like Marglin's, focusing on the role of emotion in Vaishnavite ritual, is very good. Lynch's own ethnographic paper on Krishnaite Brahmans in Mathura is also fascinating, since they overturn many of the normal stereotypes of the Brahman.

In short, there is much excellent ethnography in this volume, and Lynch has certainly performed a service by stating so explicitly the presuppositions of social constructionism. However, the material is by no means uniformly marshalled to support the conclusions Lynch draws from it, nor can the volume be said to constitute a study of the 'the social construction of emotion in India' as such. Rather it provides fascinating glimpses of how some emotions are viewed and used in some contexts and some places in India.

DAVID N. GELLNER

PAUL HOCKINGS (ed.), *Blue Mountains: The Ethnography and Biogeography of a South Indian Region*, Delhi: Oxford University Press 1989. xiii, 376 pp., Bibliography, Index, Plates, Maps, Tables, Figures. £22.50.

This book, consisting of fifteen papers, is intended to provide an interdisciplinary introduction to the Nilgiri Hills or Blue Mountains of Tamil Nadu, south-west India. Only seven papers are purely ethnographic, the remainder dealing successively with the environment, primatology, prehistory, language, an urban study of the town of Gudalur, colonial history and cultural ecology; there is also an introduction by David Mandelbaum. I concentrate here on the ethnographic papers, many of which follow the Dumontain view that groups like the Toda, Kota, Badaga and Kurumba, formerly classified as 'tribals', have rather to be treated within the conceptual framework of Hindu society. This perspective is developed above all by Mandelbaum, but also by Walker, Hockings, and to a certain extent Hockings and Kapp, although the Kurumba groups pose special problems. In fact, the interactions of these various groups might rather prompt a re-evaluation of some leading theories about Hinduism and caste, though this is not attempted by any of the authors.

David Mandelbaum's paper, a reprint of his famous essay of 1956, showing in detail the relations of the Kota with their neighbours, concludes simply that their social system is in most respects close to caste. Anthony Walker's paper on the Toda describes their traditional features and the modern developments they have undergone. Paul Hockings' paper on the Badaga includes data on their history, economy and ecology as well as ethnography, and he also deals with their myth of the ancestress Hette. Although he notes the connection of this theme with the Puranic literature, I would not call the myth 'a parochialized version' of it; the directions of influence are not so obvious.

A joint essay by Hockings and Dieter Kapp shows that within the Kurumba category, which defines the 'outsiders' in this remote area, are found at least seven separate ethnic groups, each with its own habitat, language and culture, though all live variously from shifting cultivation, hunting, gathering and the exchange of forest products. Aspects of the religion and ideology of the Alu Kurumba are described briefly, based mainly on data collected by Kapp, who has published extensively on them. The authors argue that they have quite elaborate rituals and mythology that cannot be regarded as isolated from the surrounding culture. However, Nurit Bird-David's treatment of another group of Kurumba, the Naiken or Jenu Kurumba, differs in stressing the low degree of importance they give to ritual and religion generally, though her further argument, that what for a Badaga or a Toda is a ritual service might for a Kurumba be just another economic transaction, is not entirely convincing. The essay by Noble and William Jebadhas on the Irula, who live on the eastern slopes of the Nilgiri, is concerned with their traditional economy and modern changes.

All in all, the book is to be recommended to anyone interested in the anthropology of this region and of South Asia generally.

LUKAS WERTH

DANIEL M. NEUMAN, *The Life of Music in North India: The Organisation of an Artistic Tradition*, Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press 1990 [1980]. 296 pp. Glossary, References, Index, Plates, Tables. £12.75/\$18.25.

With his 1974 dissertation and its first published version in 1980, the American anthropologist Daniel Neuman gave Western students fresh impetus for investigating the organization of Hindustani (North Indian classical) music. Neuman spent two years (1969–71) as a practical student of music in Delhi, and during and after this time he used his close association with Hindustani music circles to collect a large amount of information on the artistic as well as the familial and social character of his musician subjects, including also centres other than Delhi. His book showed the contribution that ‘ethnomusicology’ might make to our appreciation of how Indian music is propagated and practised, and his amalgam of music–technical and socio-cultural study has been a most effective model for a number of successful works published more recently. Ten years later, the book has been reissued in paperback with a new preface and a few supplementary bibliographical references. To the latter many more might (and should) have been added. Merely as an illustration of the kind of response the first edition received I would mention Regula Qureshi’s highly positive review essay in *Asian Music* (Vol. XV, 1984).

The main body of Neuman’s text remains essentially unchanged. Though ideally he would have taken account of subsequent research, which has improved our understanding of the history of Indian music, he argues that the major conclusions that he reached earlier remain largely intact. These concern the social grouping of hereditary and professional musicians, the changes brought about by modern patronage systems, and the impact of the urbanization of classical music traditions over the last hundred years. Rereading this book, one has a sense of returning to a primary source, such is the currency of several of Neuman’s themes. Some of these have now become such familiar stuff that, if treated as new ground, they would appear to verge on the banal; we must remind ourselves that Neuman really was one of the first Western scholars to publish good accounts of what he calls the ‘enculturation’ of Hindustani musicians—their training, their becoming artists, their remaining at the forefront, their *riaz* (practice) procedures, and so on. The chapters on musicianship are thus to be viewed as essential and stimulating reading for Western newcomers, students perhaps not only of Hindustani music and musicology but even other fields of Indian culture that bear scrutiny from a sociological perspective. One might also say that it is due to Neuman that something new is now needed. Other chapters have weathered excellently, and it is refreshing to see how well observed and well expressed is so much of Neuman’s material on the ‘organization of specialist knowledge’ and the ‘adaptive strategies’ of musicians in the modern world. It has been scarcely possible for serious writers on Hindustani music to ignore his work, and often enough the sociological arguments subsequently presented by Western scholars have been prefigured by those in ‘Neuman 1980’, even when these have had to be modified.

If there is an underlying problem in the method, it comes in any attempt to generalize, to proceed from observation of one social and professional part of the mesh to statements about the whole Hindustani musical culture. But here we must be fair to Neuman, as he is himself careful to draw attention to this problem in the preface. He comments that his focus is that of the Delhi Muslim scene, and that he has made claims that 'probably overemphasize the Delhi reality'. He remains convinced, however, that other areas are 'derivative from the Delhi tradition'. Differently focused regional studies have already begun to test and modify his conclusions, and will continue to do so.

There is a related snare inherent in the use of terminology. Such concepts as 'community', 'caste', 'professional group' and 'lineage' are, as Neuman himself knows, and others have tirelessly emphasized, fluid; questions have to be open enough for informants to be able to represent their own concepts uninhibitedly, and nothing ties the answer down more than the supplying of a supposedly specific, but in reality 'polysemic' term like *gharana*. Neuman is in fact quite judicious in his conclusions about the range of meanings to be accorded to such terms, and a careful reading shows that he is aware of the limits to their usefulness, but one sometimes suspects that his arguments about such categories as *kalawant* (artist), *biradari* ('brotherhood', but often, he believes, an important concept of endogamous and professional community) and *khandan* (lineage), and the interrelation of these, might have had a different shape if his questions had been formed differently.

Despite these problems, however, Neuman's book remains an important source, a valuable introduction for students, and a delightful read for any enthusiast of North Indian music.

JONATHAN KATZ

RUTH FINNEGAN, *The Hidden Musicians: Music-Making in an English Town*, Cambridge etc.: Cambridge University Press 1989. xvii, 341 pp., References, Index, Figures, Illustrations. £35.00.

The Hidden Musicians is an ethnography of music-making in Milton Keynes. It describes 'an invisible system structuring and maintaining local music up and down the country'—a hidden world that none the less involves staggering human and material resources, and binds together (from the point of view of the musicians and their audiences) the social fabric of the town. This system is discussed by Finnegan in terms of more or less discrete 'musical worlds', namely classical music, brass bands, music theatre, jazz, country and western, folk, rock and pop. These worlds provide 'pathways' through the city, means by which people can organize urban time and space and consequently develop a sense of 'personal

meaning and control' (p. 304) in an environment that is for most a monument to faceless modernism.

The book starts with the premise that music-making is first and foremost social activity and not a corpus of disembodied texts encapsulated in musicians' memories or written scores. This focus on process rather than product is hardly news to ethnomusicologists, but what distinguishes *The Hidden Musicians* is an ethnographic approach that is both detailed and sensitive to the nuances of local musical life. Perhaps the most immediate theoretical point (both a conclusion and a premise) is that local-level music-making should be the object of ethnographic study at all, that careful and systematic observation about the role of music in urban English social life is generally lacking, while its significance is widely discussed.

Seeing musical worlds as systems of practices, Finnegan delineates the common patterns of rehearsal, organization of venues and audiences, and performance, and argues on this basis that music-making in Milton Keynes is characterized by a 'plurality of equally authentic musics', a fact that constitutes 'one major conclusion of this book' (p. 181). This formulation alerts the reader to the slippery notion of 'authenticity', a word with a long history in musicological writing and cultural theory. To see musics principally as processes that organize time and space in more or less similar ways is to attribute less significance to their cultural and ideological loads: for example, rock, with its aesthetic of anti-authoritarian 'authenticity'; country and western, with its 'Wild West' mock shoot-outs; brass bands, with their collectivist and highly competitive ethos; and church choirs, with their quiet dedication to the rituals of the ecclesiastical year. All of these musics have histories (of which their practitioners are usually highly conscious) and technologies that bring people together in specific ways and in response to specific values, and in which the notion of 'authenticity' itself is constituted in quite different terms. Clearly, there are significant 'authenticities' to be distinguished, a fact that renders Finnegan's notion of 'equal authenticity' highly problematic.

The equality of authenticity shared by these worlds is underscored by Finnegan's assertion that class is on the whole not a relevant factor in local-level music in Milton Keynes. This is argued on the basis of the fact that rock musicians are not predominantly working class (p. 312), that local classical music involves people from a wide range of backgrounds (p. 313), and that musicians as a whole deny a class component in the constitution of their bands and audiences (p. 314). Country and western bands and audiences, however, appear to be a notable exception. They are predominantly train drivers, lorry drivers, bus drivers, gas, electricity and water workers, builders, factory line-workers, or unemployed. Significantly, they interact less with other musical worlds. It might be argued that the formation of musical tastes, values and practices in this particular context has a clear class referent. Class might indeed, as Finnegan argues, be too vague and general a concept to explain involvements of particular people in other musical genres. Without crudely mapping genres on to class (a position explicitly rejected,

for example, by the Marxian theorist Adorno), one can still argue that musical activity is shaped by the play of power in the wider society, and can be understood in relation to it, if not simply read off it. One is left with the impression that parents push musically gifted children through Associated Board examinations for reasons more to do with the accumulation of cultural capital than the construction of pathways through the city, and that country and western, with its kitsch glamour and shoot-outs, more than any other pathway, will be 'particularly emotive for individuals regarded in some way as "marginal"' (p. 328).

In the tradition of the best ethnographic writing, this is a book that is so rich in accessible detail that readers can construct and follow their own critical pathways through the text. The book's scope, technique and style have already set an agenda for popular music studies; it is 'ethnomusicology at home' at its best and will provide a significant model for anthropologists interested in the ways in which music shapes the experience of urban living.

MARTIN STOKES

MARGARET J. KARTOMI, *On Concepts and Classifications of Musical Instruments* (Chicago Studies in Ethnomusicology; eds. Philip Bohlman and Bruce Nettle), Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press 1990. xix, 302 pp., Bibliography, Glossary, Index, Figures. £39.95/£17.50/\$57.50/\$25.25.

Is this the book we have been waiting for? Margaret Kartomi has collected together many different classification systems, both from literate and oral traditions, to explain 'how various of the world's cultures classify their musical instruments and instrumental ensembles, together with the concepts of instrument upon which the schemes are based' (p. xv).

The book is divided into three main sections: 'On the Nature of Classifications of Musical Instruments', 'Classification in Societies Oriented toward Literary Transmission' and 'Classification in Societies Oriented toward Oral Transmission'. In the first section Kartomi explains and outlines various aspects of classifications. In the first chapter, 'Any Classification Is Superior to Chaos', she deals with the needs for classification and the ways in which the response to these needs shapes the perception of the classified. In the second section Kartomi describes systems from China, India, Sri Lanka, Tibet, ancient Greece, Europe and the Arab world. In studying literary transmission, she is able to examine classification over a long period of time and to show, especially for the Chinese and Greek cases, continuity and change. In the case of the Javanese system, she considers both the oral and the more recent development of literary schemes. Kartomi sums up a surprising number of schemes with admirable lucidity and succinctness. Chapter 11, 'The Expanding Concept of Instruments in the West during the Nineteenth and

Twentieth Centuries', contains brief abstracts of each of the systems that have been devised in the course of the last hundred years, that is, eighteen different examples. In this chapter alone she provides the first clear and impartial guide to the subject ever compiled.

In the third section, the oral traditions described are those of Mandailing, Minankabau, T'boli, some West African systems, the 'Are'are and Finnish Karelia. These examples are drawn primarily from her own fieldwork. Not surprisingly this is a far shorter section, 69 as opposed to 176 pages, but it only serves to demonstrate the very different concepts that can underlie classifications and how these relate directly to the ways in which the instruments themselves are perceived.

Throughout, one is constantly being made aware of the limitations of the systems used by the literate 'West': indeed, not only their limitations but the ways in which they have stultified research by encouraging investigators to present their fieldwork in their own terms, rather than to discover the indigenous schemes that can teach us so much about concepts of musical instruments, music and even social organization. Kartomi also explains how these literate systems of Western academe were compiled mainly by museum curators out of a desire to classify material, often badly documented, in their collections. For this reason, these systems all suffer by being exclusively ethnocentric. This has been to the detriment of any fieldwork collecting that has relied on them exclusively. Many of those collecting musical instruments have used only Western systems as their guides, and the resulting fieldwork has often been insensitive to, or ignorant of any considerations of indigenous schemes of classification.

On Concepts and Classification of Musical Instruments is both a thought-provoking exercise on classification and a useful source-book on the subject. It has a good bibliography, which deals with literate classifications from many different traditions. One element of this that I find inconsistent, however, is Kartomi's inclusion of primary sources in some cases and translations in others. This is particularly noticeable in the case of Latin treatises. It might have been more useful if she had included both the original text and the translation. Also the attribution of masculinity to the late Claudie Marcel-Dubois, eminent French musicologist and collaborator with Rivière on the Musée des Arts et Traditions Populaires I find a whimsical mistake. But Kartomi's thoroughness in finding published classification systems, even those in the newsletter of the ICOM Committee of Music Museum Curators is remarkable.

Each section of the book is well provided with diagrams and charts illustrating the different systems. This, together with the clear text, goes a long way to helping the reader to a closer understanding and appreciation of the many different ways in which instruments can be classified. Yes, with a few minor provisos, this is the book we have been waiting for.

HÉLÈNE LA RUE

HELEN MYERS (ed.), *Ethnomusicology: An Introduction* (New Grove Handbook in Musicology), London: Macmillan Press 1992. xxiv, 487 pp., Illustrations, Musical Examples, Photographs, Reference Aids, Bibliographies, Index. £35.00.

British Journal of Ethnomusicology, Vol. I (1992) (published by the International Council for Traditional Music, UK Chapter, London), 162 pp.

These long-awaited volumes have at last been published and together mark a significant step in the first half-century of the discipline of ethnomusicology. The ever-growing numbers of musical ethnographies are now complemented by a standard reference book for the student of ethnomusicology and an outlet for British academics to publish scholarly work in their specific areas. Together they will provide valuable research materials not only for ethnomusicologists but also for anthropologists, musicologists, sociologists, linguists and others.

Ethnomusicology: An Introduction, one of the New Grove handbooks in musicology, brings together contributions from seventeen authors, ranging from some of the founding figures of the field in the early 1950s to younger researchers who are setting the trend for the years to come. The four parts to the volume—'Introduction', 'Theory and Method', 'Ethical Concerns and New Directions' and 'Reference Aids'—provide an essential source for the student of ethnomusicology and clearly explain the basic theoretical and practical problems that are likely to be encountered during research and fieldwork. All the basic and essential points concerning the discipline are covered, many of which will be of particular interest to anthropologists and others working in related areas. The topics covered include ethnomusicology, fieldwork, field technology, ethnography of music, transcription, notation, analysis, historical ethnomusicology, iconography, organology, the biology of music-making, dance, ethics, gender, commercialism, preservation and new trends. Clear explanations of issues that have concerned the field since its beginnings, together with more recent ones, are succinctly deliberated with a full chronological bibliography at the end of each discussion.

While anthropologists generally have shunned the study of music systems, perhaps because they consider it to be the work of musicians, this book provides an initial frame in which the fieldworker may approach the study of music. Even when the analysis of musical style is considered (Blum, pp. 165–218), it shows that the researcher does not have to be a musicologist to attempt to understand music. In particular, the analysis of the structure of music is shown by many means other than staff notation.

Of particular relevance to students of ethnomusicology are the five reference aids that examine and list research resources, instrument collections, instrument classification, pitch measurement and national mains frequencies and voltages together with television standards. Each of these sections provides reference material in one complete volume that would otherwise be spread among several publications in the discipline.

Ethnomusicology: An Introduction is sure to become a standard textbook and reference aid for all ethnomusicologists for the foreseeable future. It summarizes the theoretical aspects of the discipline in a way previously unmatched in a single volume.

The new annual *British Journal of Ethnomusicology* replaces a former *Bulletin* and, according to its editorial preface, 'is intended primarily to provide a professional forum for UK-based ethnomusicologists'. The first volume includes reviews of books and recordings, and eight scholarly articles ranging from analyses of distinct genres and musical instruments to a discussion of music education and ethnomusicology. The inclusion of indigenous notation systems, instead of the large amount of staff notation that is used for examples and transcriptions, would have been a welcome sight and might do much to draw a larger readership, especially from anthropologists and specialists of specific cultural areas. Still, the music examples are generally accompanied by good textual descriptions. The publication of a British journal of this type will be welcomed by the growing numbers of musicologists, anthropologists and sociologists interested in the musics of the world and in the way that the study of music can contribute to other fields.

HENRY JOHNSON

JAMES McLAUGHLIN, *My Friend the Indian* (with an introduction by Robert M. Utley), Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press 1989. xvii, 434 pp., Index, Illustrations. £10.35.

James McLaughlin was the agent of the Sioux agency at Devils Lake in Dakota Territory from 1876 until 1881. It was he who ordered the Indian Police to arrest Sitting Bull in December 1890, to bring an end to his ghost dance crusade. This incident resulted in several deaths, including that of Sitting Bull. For a quarter of a century from 1895, McLaughlin served as US Indian inspector, during which time he became familiar with every tribe and reservation and, according to Robert M. Utley's introduction, made friends with hundreds of Indians. He was a stern moralist, paternalistic, confident of the superiority of White civilization, and convinced that the policy of allotting land in severalty (giving each Indian head of family an individually owned farm) was the right path for Indian advancement. He was very much a man of his times, which comes through in his writings and the opinions he expresses.

Sensibilities easily offended by such opinions may not find this a congenial book to read. Nevertheless, it is graphically written, with accounts of incidents in Indian life based on firsthand knowledge or information derived from the Indians concerned. He relates the Battle of the Little Big Horn as remembered by the Sioux who survived it. He gives a lengthy description of the events leading to Sitting Bull's death and of course a justification of his own involvement, which

came under criticism after the event. He recounts his own role in negotiating several treaties, many of which have been reviewed in the courts in recent years. One chapter describes Captain Jack and the Modoc war of 1873. Perhaps the most gripping part of the book is the story of the flight of the Nez Perces through Idaho and Montana in 1877 in search of the Canadian border and under the leadership of Chief Joseph, who told his version of the incident to McLaughlin in June and July 1900.

The original was published in 1910. This version includes the chapters left out of the original, two of which have to do with Sitting Bull.

R. H. BARNES

PAUL E. MINNIS and CHARLES L. REDMAN (eds.), *Perspectives on Southwestern Prehistory* (Investigations in American Archaeology; ser. ed. Paul E. Minnis), Boulder etc.: Westview Press 1990. vii, 368 pp., References Cited, Index, Maps, Tables, Figures. £26.95.

The aim of this volume is to overcome the excessive specialization and parochialism that has resulted from an increased intensity of research into southwestern archaeology, the history of which is now over 100 years old. The twenty-three papers of this collection are divided into five sections relating to specific topics: 'Hunters and Gatherers', 'Transitions to Sedentism', 'Elites and Regional Systems', 'Protohistoric Period: Transitions to History' and 'History of Southwestern Archaeology'. The individual articles are diverse and, of course, their evaluation requires specialized knowledge. The authors cover such matters as residential mobility, inter-regional exchanges, disease episodes and their consequences, increased dependence on maize cultivation, and population growth. The final chapter describes the clash between Jesse Walter Fewkes and Harold Sellers Colton in the 1920s in which Fewkes defended nineteenth-century approaches against the later, more chronologically oriented, archaeology.

Among the views expressed are that the interpretation of hunters and gatherers derived from the *Man the Hunter* symposium and distilled in Sahlins' essay on the 'Original Affluent Society', an image 'spawned by the idealism of the 1960s', diverted attention from some critical sources of stress brought to light by more recent work. Debates about élites and social complexity have come full circle, but complexity is difficult to define, in that complex social systems exhibit many behaviours that are irreducible to a single structure and are highly unpredictable. Furthermore, the available data do not easily fit the archaeologists' formal and abstract models. The level of social complexity of the protohistoric Western Pueblo people has not been demonstrated. It is not known whether nearby villages were politically integrated, nor whether there were alliances between village

groups. Beyond a knowledge that goods were exchanged, there is no understanding of how the exchange systems worked. Furthermore, the similarity of ethnographic and prehistoric social institutions cannot be taken for granted or dismissed.

R. H. BARNES