

BOOK REVIEWS

JAMES CLIFFORD, *The Predicament of Culture: Twentieth-century Ethnography, Literature and Art*, Cambridge MA and London: Harvard University Press 1988. xii, 381pp., Illustrations, References, Sources, Index. £23.95.

Between the almost unanimous American praise for Clifford and the surprisingly unified British desire to attack him, an Irishman like myself has to pick his way cautiously. I have to tread with care in order not to be hit by a sudden burst in the continuing cross-fire. If the adulation of Clifford's compatriots is comprehensible, the harder question is why the Anglo-Saxons are so keen to bash him on the head. For it is suitably ironical that 'British anthropology' has only re-emerged as some sort of meaningful rubric by defining itself negatively in opposition to 'the bratpack' - as several anthropologists have branded the contributors to the collection *Writing Culture*, which Clifford co-edited with George Marcus.

Like many well-known anthropologists, a good part of Clifford's power lies in his rhetorical force. It is not so much what he says (for that really is not so very new) but the way he plays with language to say it. Reading Clifford is always a pleasure. Often it is very instructive. All the chapters bar one were previously published elsewhere but often in obscure journals or magazines. 'On Ethnographic Authority' was the crucial text which fired the 'ethnography as text' debate. 'On Orientalism' is an early piece, a fine-grained assessment of the holes, blindspots and confusions in Edward Said's polemic. His papers on Marcel Griaule as fieldworker and on the Parisian encounter of ethnography and surrealism are already approaching classical status within the history of anthropology. (Michel Leiris, however, in a recent interview in *Current Anthropology*, states that there was very little intellectual exchange between surrealists and ethnographers in the interwar years.) The greatest disappointment is the last, long chapter on a trial he attended in which the 'identity' of a native American 'tribe' was the central issue under debate. Clifford hops and skims here, and refuses to state in detail why he believed the defendants were the Indians they said they were.

For Clifford, like many influential anthropologists or commentators on the subject, is no fieldworker in the hallowed mode. Like Susan Sontag he is a better reporter than practitioner. And those who get dirty doing fieldwork do not like listening to some undusty character telling them where they ought to be headed next. It is even more galling when this anthropologist of our own cultures speaks the language better than most of we academic natives and bothers to write on topics we have always discussed but never got down to. Of course his work is self-interested, but do his critics think they can be innocent of that charge themselves? Of course we

always knew that our writings were governed by certain literary conventions, but why did we never tease out the consequences of this? Of course being anticolonialist is no longer a very radical pose, but isn't it worth reminding ourselves of colonialism's insidious, pervasive nature? Of course he overstated his case in order to gain attention, but are the hands of his critics clean?

Social anthropology has already digested its literary turn with no more than a few hiccups. The subject has not disappeared, nor has it been revolutionized. But it is the richer for it, and it is Clifford, the most astute of 'the bratpack', we have to thank for that.

JEREMY MacCLANCY

ROBERT GOLDWATER, *Primitivism in Modern Art*, Cambridge MA and London: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press 1986 [1938]. xxv, 314pp., Appendix, Bibliography, Index, Illustrations. \$11.95.

The publication of this enlarged edition of Goldwater's classic study will be welcomed not only by historians of twentieth-century Western art, but also by those anthropologists who are interested in the study of art. Originally published in 1938, as *Primitivism in Modern Painting*, a revised edition appeared in 1967. The present edition is a reprint of the 1967 edition with the addition of two of Goldwater's important later papers: 'Judgments of Primitive Art, 1905-1965' and 'Art History and Anthropology: Some Comparisons of Methodology'. A bibliography of Goldwater's publications is also provided.

Whilst justly famous for being the first comprehensive account of the impact of 'primitive art' on modern Western art, Goldwater's study attempts and achieves more than this. Indeed, a careful reading reveals how limited the impact has really been. Modern Western artists found in non-Western arts what they were looking for, not necessarily what was there. And quickly, these artists' use of 'primitive' forms and techniques were what inspired other artists, not the original 'primitive' works themselves.

Primitivism in Modern Art is also an intellectual history demonstrating both how the 'primitivist' tendency in modern Western art is a product of its age and how it relates to its nineteenth-century precursors 'archaism' and 'romanticism'. Though Goldwater does not bring but the point himself, it is perhaps not an exaggeration to see the interests of early twentieth-century artists in the primitive and the 'elemental' as the art-world equivalent of the *Année Sociologique's* interest in 'elementary forms'.

Anthropologists will also be interested in Goldwater's illustration of how far ahead of anthropologists artists were in taking seriously the arts of non-Western peoples. Early anthropological

studies of non-Western arts focused on decoration as the artists of the time (notably Gauguin) focused on the decorative aspects of the non-Western arts they were beginning to appreciate. The study of African and Oceanic sculptural forms was seemingly dependent upon the achievements of Picasso and his contemporaries in making anthropologists, in common with the Western public in general, see the sculpture as art. Anthropologists interested in the study of art will also be interested in Goldwater's illustration of how the methodological development of the anthropology of art mirrors that of the history of art.

There is, then, more to this book than might be thought at first glance. It is to be hoped that Goldwater's intelligent, subtle and sober reflections on his subject-matter will be absorbed by those who, in the wake of the New York Museum of Modern Art's blockbuster show *'Primitivism' in 20th-Century Art*, would have us satisfy our intellectual curiosity about the arts of non-Western societies with references to 'affinities' between 'tribal' and 'modern'; as well as by those whose academic pursuits never seem to get beyond the pedestrian questions of which artist saw what 'primitive' piece where, when and with whom - and what he or she painted the next day.

JEREMY COOTE

BENNETTA JULES-ROSETTE, *The Messages of Tourist Art: An African Semiotic System in Comparative Perspective* [Topics in Contemporary Semiotics], New York and London: Plenum Press 1984. xviii, 238pp., References, Index, Figures, Tables, Illustrations. \$39.00.

The anthropological study of tourist art is a steadily growing field. Jules-Rosette's new book is an informed and, therefore, very welcome contribution to the literature. The author has wide experience of art and craft production in Africa and draws here on fieldwork amongst ivory carvers in Liberia and the Ivory Coast; with carpenters, potters and the Kanyama Artists' Circle in Lusaka; and with Kamba carvers in Kenya. She does not make it quite clear, but it seems that most of the information she presents was collected through interviews and questionnaires rather than through participant observation. The best parts of the book are the more ethnographic chapters in which she gives detailed accounts of the production and marketing processes and, once in a while, allows the artists to speak for themselves. For example, Diouf Kambaba sums up well the complexities of the situation of artists like himself who rely on Westerners to buy many of their works: 'Do we produce only for the European? No, we produce for our people, the Africans. But if we produce for the Africans, we have to produce something that they will understand... We can't be too advanced. We can't

be too far back. We want to be...eh...a bit in step with our milieu' (p. 226). Much half-researched material has been published on African tourist art traditions - as if they were not themselves quite serious enough so did not require or deserve serious study. Drawing on her first-hand knowledge, especially concerning Kamba carvers, Jules-Rosette, however, provides us with solid information as well as exploding many common myths.

The more theoretical sections of the book do not seem to me to substantially advance the understanding present, at least implicitly, in the more ethnographic presentation of the central chapters. Surely there cannot be much mileage left in the anthropological approach to art which takes the model of art as communication as central. Jules-Rosette's attempt to get away from linguistic models but still to talk about African tourist art in semiotic terms as about communication do not help her to get very far. The diagrams offered as illustrations of various processes hinder rather than help to deepen understanding.

Much of the book is taken up, quite rightly, with explicating the differences and similarities between the various enterprises the author discusses. This helps to give the lie to any idea that African tourist art can be lumped together as a single phenomenon. There is much variety, for example, in the organization of production and marketing, in the sources of new designs and in the valuation of creativity. Jules-Rosette suggests explanations in terms of gender differences, levels of technology and economic development etc. (The influence of the colonial authority and its educative values might also be relevant; a comparison of tourist art traditions in former British and French colonies, for example, might be rewarding.) At times, however, Jules-Rosette falls into talking in general terms of African tourist art as if it were one tradition. This is unfortunate, as is the sub-title of the book itself. There is surely not one African semiotic system to be studied semiotically, but a variety of semiotic systems.

The Messages of Tourist Art will be valued for its contribution to our knowledge of the production and marketing of tourist art in Africa. The author promises more information than she is able to give here on the consumer response to these art traditions. I look forward to seeing the results of this research, to seeing if she continues to adopt a semiotic approach - and to seeing too if she can persuade her future publishers to reproduce her valuable illustrations in a rather more satisfactory fashion than that adopted here.

JEREMY COOTE

N. ROSS CRUMRINE and M. HALPIN (eds.), *The Power of Symbols: Masks and Masquerade in the Americas*, Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press 1983. 244pp., Bibliography, Plates. \$40.00.

This is a highly important work which covers most of the central themes and paradoxes which mask and masquerade have inevitably involved. The volume attempts to establish specific ethnographic enquiry as the basis for a general theory of masquerade in place of the popular psychologism and broad empirical generalization which has long hindered an adequate understanding and appreciation of its specific ceremonial and ritual contexts. It is divided into an introduction composed of two papers by Crumrine and Turner, and four sections. The papers in the first three parts treat specific ethnographic examples and are divided geographically between North, Middle and South America. The final section is meant to provide a synthesis from comparative ethnography, but the contributions by Makarius, Webber *et al.*, and Halpin are idiosyncratic and do not appear to make adequate use of the rich data found elsewhere in this volume.

In the introduction, Crumrine defines masquerade as 'the ritual transformation of the human actor into a being of another order' (p. 1). Such a broad definition is meant to allow the inclusion of a wide range of activities including carnival, ritual drama and a number of different techniques which express symbolic transformation such as costuming and face painting. Although Crumrine and Halpin have restricted contributions to those that deal with the manifestation of transformation through the use of artefacts, Crumrine is cautious not to rule out that in some societies it may be another part of the body rather than the head that is the symbolic focus which expresses change. (Note, for example, the use of back ornaments among the Aztec and the use of side-shields among the Mexican Huichol.)

In a statement that is the best comparative synthesis of the ethnographic cases reported here, Crumrine notes that an essential characteristic of masks is their use in generating, concentrating, transferring and exchanging powers between themselves, their audience and the persons wearing them. Sturtevant's essay on the Seneca describes how the mask itself is the focus of power. Walens explains how, among the Kwakiutl, the mask invokes supernatural power to transform its wearer into an extension of the spirit world, and Fogelson and Bell interpret the use of Booger masks among the Cherokee as a means of transferring the physical powers of the young dancers who wear them to the old men of the community who report feelings of renewed strength and virility at such ceremonies.

The theme of masks and the transmission of power is most clearly treated in those examples from North America and in Christopher Crocker's discussion of the Bororo. In these examples, historical change is ignored or minimalized. However, in those societies clearly articulated to national and international politico-economic systems, masks seem to express power relations between different sectors of the population rather than create them. Under these different circumstances other distinct themes occupy the attention

of the ethnographers that have described them. The difference of orientation between contributors who have focused on more traditional societies, and those such as Gillmore, Brody, Bricker and Pollak-Eltz who have described communities often profoundly compromised by the vicissitudes of colonial and independent history, may be explicable through Crocker's use of Gluckman's distinction between ceremony and ritual.

Crocker takes up basic problems of ontology and epistemology, and contrasts private knowledge with public secrets in discussing the status of the indigenous beliefs in the transformation of Bororo dancers into spirits. Gluckman distinguished between ritual as a means of redressing social equilibrium and ceremony as an affirmation of a normative activity. For Crocker, this distinction may correspond to differences in attitude towards masquerade: 'although both ritual and ceremony aim at the momentary representation of the not-self, ritual intends the portrayal to transform morally the actor, the audience or both. Ceremonial masks accomplish no such thing; when they are removed, social life continues ostensibly as before' (p. 162). In the ritual use of masks the participants and the audience may express public belief in their transformative powers, while the ceremonial use of masks allows greater ambiguity or outright recognition of their use as disguises. (The theme of public conviction of the voraciousness of masks is also the subject of Crumrine's essay on the Mayo Parisero, and Walens' contribution on the Kwakiutl also concentrates on ontology and demonstrates well the importance of interpreting masquerade in relation to indigenous notions of the person and the complex semantic fields of which they form part.)

A strong theme in the essays which describe the ceremonial use of masks is the encodation of the past and its expression through masked dance dramas. Richling on the Inuit, Brody on the Tarascans, Bricker on Tzotzil carnival and above all, Gillmore's description of Nahuatl and Zapotec dance dramas, interpret such dramas as re-affirming important events in the history of the community and the present condition of their participants. The use of masks in these dramas symbolizes the power relations between different groups or between the sections within a community. The appearance of heathen spirits at Epiphany among the Inuit as described by Richling, is interpreted as expressing the relation between that part of the season devoted to traditional subsistence patterns and the period of enforced dependence on Moravian Christian missions which was instigated to ensure their proper observance of the Christmas ceremonies. The failure of the heathen spirits to reveal non-Christian beliefs among the children is rewarded by gifts of sweets which the spirits leave them before withdrawing. These events, performed at the close of the Christmas period when the Inuit are about to resume their traditional subsistence patterns, express the relation between their traditional beliefs and Christianity and affirm the power of the latter over them.

Gillmore and Brody both demonstrate that while the structure of performances can be remarkably consistent over a long period of time, their semantic significance can vary and provide a source for a plurality of different interpretations by the audience and

performers. Gillmore describes how Los Tastoanes, a masked dance drama performed by villages in the states of Jalisco and Zacatecas, incorporates themes which permit it to be interpreted variously as representing the struggle between Christians and Moors, the conquest of Mexico or events in the 1910 Agrarian Revolt. Brody reveals a similar propensity in the Tarascan winter ceremonies where masked dancers express the oppositions between male and female behaviour and that of Tarascan females and urban females. Rural and urban values are contrasted, and thus imply a comparison of indigenous and mestizo customs, to affirm a model of behaviour appropriate for Tarascan women. History is telescoped in performances of this kind which compress events of the same qualitative significance into parallel structures that offer a rich repertoire for possible interpretations. In Venezuela, masks are principally used in popular folk-plays, but Pollak-Eltz shows the adoption of old forms to incorporate new subjects and suggest something of the process of the sedimentation and stratification of layers of meaning in such genres.

Bricker's discussion of carnival in San Pedro Chinalho is a more singular interpretation which equates the celebration with the dramatization of certain historical events and conditions taken from the Tzeltal uprising of 1712. (This example does not demonstrate the latent propensities in carnival for encoding events outside of the one described, nor the possible range of significations that its participants might attribute to it, and leaves Tzotzil carnival looking a little anachronistic.)

In his essay about the evolution of the iconography of the Andean devil masks Delgado argues that contemporary devil masks have evolved from pre-Hispanic llama masks by the gradual substitution of horns in place of elongated ears. In discussing the iconography of such masks as they are used in carnival, and in order to uphold his thesis of historical continuity between the pre-Hispanic and contemporary periods, he insists on the traditional nature of masks surmounted by three-headed dragons which he believes developed from earth snails. His adherence to a unilinear view of evolution is not substantiated by carnival in Oruro, where such masks have been a recent adaptation of simpler forms of devil masks, and which are rejected by some mask makers such as Jorge Vargas who has attempted to revive traditional Andean symbols. Delgado's approach does not take full account of the process of bricolage which is very much evidenced in the masks that he discusses. As in Bricker's essay on Tzotzil carnival masks, Delgado does not describe the indigenous meanings applied to such artefacts and their conjunctions in performance.

A further theme raised in the collection is the phenomenon of inversion between forms as masquerade as practised between neighbouring peoples and, within a community, between different periods of the ritual calendar. Although raised by Crumrine and Turner, this aspect is only developed in Zuidema's contrast between the representation of external forces and in-groups and their relation to community structure.

The final theme that I shall mention here is that of historical change and acculturation and, in particular, the role of rituals

and ceremonies in mitigating or expressing outside influences on indigenous systems of classification. Among the Kwakiutl, the re-establishment of the spirit world through masked rituals denies external influences and exigencies, while the Naskapi use of trance affirms indigenous beliefs in activities which are not covered by Christianity, creating a relationship of complementarity between the two semantic fields. In the Venezuelan communities discussed by Pollak-Eltz, the indigenous content of ceremonies appears to have been relinquished leaving the performance of masked dancers as a popular entertainment. However, the most common response among the peoples discussed in the present volume is to incorporate and encode new exigencies semantically in a form whose structural continuity can be demonstrated to have deep antecedents.

We are still far away from establishing what Crocker calls the 'comparative phenomenology of symbolic experience', but from the essays in the present volume the development of such a field might imply the de-construction of 'mask' and 'masquerade' as useful categories in anthropological discourse. Whatever, the present volume is an important contribution which will profoundly influence our view of the complexity, significance and variety of masquerade in the Americas, and will be indispensable in formulating new and related problematics.

ANTHONY SHELTON

JUDITH LYNNE HANNA, *To Dance is Human: A Theory of Nonverbal Communication*, Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press 1987 [1979]. xxii, 243pp., Appendixes, References, Index, Figures, Tables, Plates. £11.95.

The first edition of *To Dance is Human* was published in 1979. It is a measure of the success and integrity of the book that the second edition, apart from minor corrections and tightening of one or two phrases, is unchanged from the first edition. There is, however, a new preface. The interest and development in dance studies over the past ten years supports and sustains such a book and its continuation as a valuable text for both anthropological and dance studies. The entire book relies on the premise that dance is both cognitive and affective non-verbal communication. The various relationships between dance, the individual mind and society, explored through psychobiological bases and evolutionary perspectives, help the reader to understand why dance is used in many different contexts and for many different reasons. Socio-cultural patterns, religion, political thought and action are examined in greater detail to identify the involvement of dance and its potential in these areas as a human phenomenon.

Few people have confronted successfully the complex and

unfathomable question of 'what is dance?'. Most definitions are concerned with the physical aspects, the style, the rhythm, particular movements; how the dance is performed within the technical aspects of the movement. In the chapter entitled 'Dance?', Hanna attempts to identify the essence of dance in terms of its components, its purpose and function within a society, its values and styles within a cross-cultural background and conceptualization. To understand dance in this way is essential for students of dance, whether performers, teachers, historians or social anthropologists. However, it has to be recognized that the book is an anthropological study of the subject, and could only have been written by an anthropologist. Consequently, it is helpful to have an anthropological background and approach to appreciate to the full a book written in this way. Students who are primarily concerned with dance as a performing art can use the book to gain an insight into dance which they rarely consider, and in this context I have found the book very useful.

Hanna sees dance as a total means of communication dealing with 'sensory stimulation, cognitive structures, evolution and hereditary skills'. It communicates socio-cultural patterns and relates to the supernatural within the context of religion. Dance may be used to enhance political thought and action under the headings of role, power and social control. Within warrior dances, for example, we are told of confrontation, status marking, sexual display, rationalization, prestige, displacement and political behaviour: aspects hitherto unheard of by many dancers! One very interesting debate initiated by the book is about whether urban conditions have an impact on dance. I have not seen this question discussed in these terms elsewhere. Finally, the book deals with the future study of dance and the possible applications of dance research.

To Dance is Human, although complex, is innovative, thoughtful and offers many new perspectives on the study of dance. Certainly it widens the interest in dance. To use the book fully, one needs to understand the research methods, the thinking behind the structure and writing, the categories for analysis and the bias of the book towards theoretical aspects of function and cross-cultural reference. For the dancer/anthropologist, familiar with both disciplines, the book is invaluable and provides an excellent framework for thinking, understanding and deliberating on dance as non-verbal communication and human behaviour.

SALLY MURPHY

MELISSA BANTA and CURTIS M. HINSLEY, *From Site to Sight: Anthropology, Photography, and the Power of Imagery*, Cambridge MA: Peabody Museum Press 1986. 127pp., Bibliography, Index, Plates.

This volume was published to accompany an exhibition of the same name of material from the extensive photographic archives at the Peabody Museum of Anthropology and Archaeology at Harvard. Its aims, and that of the exhibition, were to look at the way in which anthropology has used photography in the pursuit of scientific data and to examine the nature of that evidence, its uses and abuses in historical perspective. Although the volume states that it is an overview and makes no claim to be definitive, the scope and range are still vastly ambitious. This is ultimately where its weakness lies, for in 127 profusely illustrated pages it can do no more than scratch the surface.

After a general introduction to both anthropology and the technical aspects of photography, the relationship between photography and each of the anthropological sub-disciplines, social and cultural, biological, museum, archaeology etc., is examined, first in a short general résumé and then as a series of short case-studies. These presumably follow the various sections of the exhibition. In the course of these chapters most of the major issues discussed by visual anthropologists are set out in general terms; the relationship between anthropologist and the 'other', the manipulation of visual evidence, the power of interpretation and the control of information: 'armed with the camera, anthropologists can probe, scan, magnify, reduce, isolate, debase or idealize their subjects' (p. 23).

Much of this is clearly and strongly put, but it necessarily hangs on broad generalizations and poses as many questions as it answers. For example, writing of professional travel photographers of the mid-nineteenth century, it is stated that 'these images influenced Western perceptions of other people and played a role in fostering the discipline of anthropology' - to a degree perhaps, but surely perceptions of 'others' already held were applied to photographic representation, given that new media adopt existing schemata until they develop their own, as for example, the clear relationship in representation between Orientalist painting and the early photography of the Middle East. Or secondly, the great photographer of the U.S. Geological Survey Expeditions to the Southwest, J. Hillers, is described as coming 'closer to our perception of documentary realism today'. True, but what is that perception? What was that of contemporaries in the nineteenth century? And how do they differ? Surely these kinds of questions are central to understanding historical photographic material and indeed the power of imagery of the title. On the other hand, some of the case-studies of more recent material in the field of social and cultural anthropology are most interesting as working anthropologists, for example Cora du Bois in Alors and Thomas Barfield in Afghanistan, comment on their use of the camera in the field and underline some of the more general points, such as those on intrusion and control

made earlier in the book.

Nevertheless, one must remember that the authors do not claim the volume to be definitive, and it is unfair to judge it as such. While specialists might find it frustrating, it undoubtedly provides a useful introduction to the problems of creating and using still photography as a historical record and the diverse applications of photography in pursuit of anthropological data. Given the growing interest in visual evidence in anthropology, scant attention has been paid to the wide range of still photography available in archives. Banta and Hinsley have tackled many of the 'political' issues which surround the use of some historical anthropological material with a calm sensitivity. One hopes that the exhibition and this accompanying volume will lay the foundations for further objective and constructive discussion of the problems.

Finally, although the book is superbly produced with excellent black-and-white, sepia and colour photographs, a British price of £27.50 is quite horrid.

ELIZABETH EDWARDS

ALLAN F. BURNS, *An Epoch of Miracles: Oral Literature of the Yucatec Maya*, Austin: Texas University Press 1983. xiv, 266pp., Bibliography, Maps. No price given.

For those that know Yucatan, the stories recounted here are an allegory of that flat land covered by jungle which is broken up only by the small house compounds and the soaring front façades of pastel-covered churches. For those who know the Maya who live on this paradoxical peninsula, the stories recall the mystery, pathos and tragedy of their life and history. And for those with just a simple appetite for narrative analysis, the care and detail Burns has lavished on preserving the style and manner of delivery raises fundamental methodological questions on the recording of oral literature. In all cases, to read Allan Burns's *An Epoch of Miracles* is an exercise in nostalgia; the book's textual beauty should not fail to move the dowdiest of readers. To write such a work is a test of the ethnographer's concord and sympathy with the people he or she studies, and testifies to his or her closeness to the narrators.

In the Introduction we are told of the extraordinary importance that the Maya give to sound. Aural perception plays the same important and preponderant role as visual apprehension does among North Americans. The tonality of the pronunciation, the pace of speech and periods of silence are indicated in the text by the use of conventions, so that the original voice is preserved in the reader's encounter with the written word.

Burns emphasizes the essential dialogue-like character of Maya narrative, which usually demands the role of respondent to be played alongside that of narrator. The respondent raises questions, and supplies answers at certain places in the recitation, but may also narrate a sequence or episode within the story. Narratives thus unfold through dialogue as a conversation between narrator and respondent. This corresponds with the indigenous idea of story-telling, *tzi'abal*, which falls into different categories. Burns writes: 'in Yucatan Mayan, it is not possible to say "tell me a story". Instead, the only way to bring a story into verbal expression is to ask someone to "converse" a story with you' (p. 20).

From the point of view of method, this is the well important claim of the narrators to which Burns faithfully adheres. It is interesting to compare this perspective with other studies of Meso-American narrative traditions which have been influenced by classical structuralism. Burns's work falls into quite a different tradition, the one pioneered by Bakhtin and Volosinov, which sees meaning as a product of the strategy adopted by the subject in his encounter with others. Structures may well govern the construction of the discourse, but the meaning is a product of the context and does not exist independent of the utterance. It is created anew each time and according to the conception of a perceived order of difference.

For the Yucatan Maya, the problem of production is central. Burns does not present us with different versions of similar stories, but he explains the inevitability of different versions by the nature of a conversation which demands statement and response. The difference between these creates a new story each time, but one that remains thematically recognizable. Moreover, the meaning attributed to a story is contingent on the context of the narration. The Maya themselves define different genres of narrative, each of which is exemplified in seven of the nine chapters of Burns's book. The meaning of a narrative is thus also a product of the relation between a story and a context. The story may even be said to create the event which defines the context. The word is magical and brings a state of being into existence - just as, according to the *Popol Vuh*, the world was brought into existence by a divine conversation. There is a continuity between thought and the perception of the world, between the earliest Latinized Maya text, represented by the *Popol Vuh*, and the stories created for Burns. His work offers a glimpse at the creativity of its renewal, repetition, and sometimes re-orientation.

ANTHONY SHELTON

FRANCES KARTTUNEN, *An Analytical Dictionary of Nahuatl* [Texas Linguistic Series], Austin: Texas University Press 1983. xxxiv, 349pp., No price given.

This is the first English-Nahuatl dictionary to appear on the market and will be an important resource for scholars of the historical civilizations of central Mexico. Previously, Nahuatl dictionaries existed only in Spanish and French: Molinas' *Vocabulario en lengua Mexicana y castellana*, first published in 1571, and Remi Simeon's *Dictionnaire de la langue Nahuatl ou Mexicaine* (1885), which was based partly on the former and on the grammar of Andrés de Olmos.

'Nahuatl' signifies 'harmonious language that gives pleasure to the hearer', and it is particularly appropriate, in the light of this allusion, that this new dictionary focuses attention for the first time on vowel length and glottal stops. Unfortunately, the attention it focuses on the phonetic aspects of the language detract from its usefulness as a source of information on semantics and morphology, and its superiority over other dictionaries in the former area is achieved only at the expense of clarity on these latter matters.

The dictionary contains approximately nine hundred entries which are drawn from three disparate sources. Horacio Carochi's grammar (1645) and a seventeenth-century manuscript 'The Huehuetlatolli' or 'Sayings of the Elders' represent the oldest sources from which entries are drawn. But Karttunen has also drawn her entries from dictionaries which describe contemporary dialects spoken in the two different regions of Zacapoaxtla, Puebla, and Tetelcingo, Morelos. Thus the entries as a whole have been derived from three geographically distinct areas, two of which are separated from the classical language by a duration of approximately three hundred years. While these additional sources are necessary in providing accurate information on the phonetics of the language, their inclusion without reference to word derivation introduces further limitations on the accuracy of the dictionary for semantic information.

Finally, a further problem must be mentioned. Karttunen uses the letter H to denote a glottal stop in place of the more usual diacritic. The employment of the letter interferes with the alphabetical ordering of the words and makes some of them difficult to find as well as complicating comparison with the entries in other dictionaries.

The points raised here are those that strike a reader whose interest lies primarily in the semantics and do not detract from the inestimable value of the work for those for whom phonetics is an overriding concern.

ANTHONY SHELTON

MANIS KUMAR RAHA and SATYA NARAYAN MAHATO, *The Kinnaurese of the Himalayas* [Anthropological Survey of India Monograph 63], Calcutta: The Anthropological Survey of India 1985. 345pp., Appendixes, Bibliography, Plates, Tables, Figures. Rs. 293 / £29.00 / \$88.00.

Strung out along the Sutlej River in Himachal Pradesh, Kinnaur is a heterogeneous region, Buddhist where it adjoins Tibet, increasingly Hindu as one moves downstream. The authors apparently spent some ten or twelve months there in the summers of 1970, 1971 and 1972, concentrating on three villages in different zones; but we learn nothing of their (collaborative?) fieldwork methods. They clearly did not settle down to the language (or languages - we hardly know).

The work is almost too easy to criticize. It needs a serious proof-reader and a ruthless editor. The repetitious text is padded out with extracts from the old gazetteers and with unnecessary diagrams; statistical matter of dubious significance is presented in tables and then laboriously rehearsed in prose; percentages where $N = ca.100$ are given to the second decimal place; a blurry photograph of a temple is duplicated by an even blurrier sketch; the bibliography (containing more than one entry such as Allain, D. for Daniélou, Alain) is infiltrated by irrelevant and uncited titles; and so on. The book was ten years in press, which will limit its value to administrators, just as the remoteness from current approaches to theory or analysis will limit its appeal to anthropologists. Nevertheless, area specialists will find in it some worthwhile new information on Kinnaur, for instance, on the hierarchy of territorial deities.

N.J. ALLEN

DIPALI G. DANDA and SANCHITA GHATAK, *The Sema and their Habitat* [Anthropological Survey of India Memoir 64], Calcutta: Anthropological Survey of India 1985. vii, 68pp., Appendixes, Tables, Maps, Diagrams, Plates, Selected Bibliography, Index. Rs. 113.00 / £11.00 / \$33.00.

This is a very brief and unpretentious account of an endogamous village of some 700 Tibeto-Burman speakers in Assam. Based on a two-month visit in 1979, it concentrates on the economy, in particular on the slash-and-burn agriculture, whose ten-year cycle has recently been halved owing to the increasing population. The most interesting material concerns the system of double descent, with its five patrilineal and sixteen or (the authors are inconsistent) seventeen matrilineal, both sorts of grouping being exogamous. The north-east of the subcontinent is generally patrilineal in emphasis, while the Garo and Khasi of nearby Meghalaya state are classic

examples of matriliney, so there are presumably important comparative and historical questions waiting to be asked. The data presented here are too thin to take one far, but let us hope for more.

N.J. ALLEN

BAGESHWAR SINGH and AJIT K. DANDA, *The Kodaku of Surguja*, Calcutta: Anthropological Survey of India 1986. ix, 128pp., Plates, Tables, Appendixes, Glossary, References, Bibliographies, Index. No price given.

This monograph on a Scheduled Tribe of Madhya Pradesh is a quite typical product of the ASI - problem-oriented, but inconclusive and theoretically both unambitious and old-fashioned. The focus is equally on economic and social organization, though there is also a short chapter on religion. The only really interesting fact is that, faced with the government's ban on swidden agriculture and its desire to introduce settled agriculture in its place, the Kodaku have reverted instead to the gathering of forest products for their livelihood. But generally the data are unexceptional for such a tribe and their interpretation superficial, though as this is the first ethnographic monograph devoted to the Kodaku, it is to be welcomed as a basic source of information about them.

ROBERT PARKIN

HENRY SUMNER MAINE, *Società primitiva e diritto antico* (transl. and with an Introduction by Anselmo Cassani) [Collana Parerga], Faenza: Faenza Editrice 1986. 206pp., Index. No price given.

Though a lawyer by profession, Sir Henry Sumner Maine is better known today as one of the proto-anthropologists of the mid-Victorian age. He is especially remembered for his contrast of status and contract as bases of social organization and for his 'patrilineal' stand (along with Fustel de Coulanges) against the 'age of matriliney' theories of Bachofen, McLennan and Morgan. Now a selection of his writings have been translated into Italian by Anselmo Cassani, who also provides an introduction (one which draws heavily on previous commentaries on Maine) to set them in their contemporary social and economic context. There has been substantial editing, for apart from one article, no work of Maine's has been translated

in its entirety. The bulk of the book is taken up with *Ancient Law* (1861), but other work is also represented, including *Village Communities in the East and West* (1871).

ROBERT PARKIN

Representations, no. 17, Winter 1987 [Special Issue on 'The Cultural Display of the Body']. 166pp., Plates.

Though now [1987] in its fifth year of publication *Representations* is little known outside the USA where it is published by the University of California Press. It is an interdisciplinary journal whose aim is 'to transform and enrich the understanding of cultures'. With its primary focuses on the symbolic dimensions of social action and the social dimensions of artistic practice, it should be of interest to many social anthropologists.

This Special Issue includes one article by an anthropologist on 'Endocannibalism and the Feast of the Dead in Borneo', while the other articles draw on anthropology, explicitly and/or implicitly, to varying degrees. More importantly the journal provides a forum for communication between scholars - whether anthropologists, art or social historians, students of literature etc. - interested in the social aspects of culture. It deserves to be better known.

JEREMY COOTE

PUBLICATIONS RECEIVED

- ALTORKI, Soraya, and Camillia FAWZI EL-SOLHI (eds.), *Arab Women in the Field: Studying Your Own Society* [Modern Arab Studies; ser. ed. Tareq Y. Ismael], New York: Syracuse University Press 1988. xii, 178pp., References, Index. \$27.95 / \$14.95.
- BARRATT, Glynn, *Southern and Eastern Polynesia (Volume 2 of Russia and the South Pacific, 1696-1840)* [Pacific Maritime Studies Series], Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press 1988. xx, 221pp., Notes, Bibliography, Indexes, Illustrations, Maps. \$23.15.
- BATE, Barbara, and Anita TAYLOR (eds.), *Women Communicating: Studies of Women's Talks* [Communication and Information Science; ser. ed. Brenda Bervin], Norwood, New Jersey: Ablex Publishing Corporation 1988. ix, 314pp., Indexes. \$21.00.
- BOURDIEU, Pierre, *Homo Academicus*, Oxford: Polity Press 1988. xxvi, 225pp., Appendixes, Notes, Indexes. \$25.00.
- BRIGGS, Charles L., *Competence in Performance: The Creativity of Tradition in Mexican Verbal Art* [Conduct and Communication Series; gen. eds. Dell Hymes, Gillian Sankoff and Henry Glassie], Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press 1988. xix, 376pp., Notes, Bibliography, Index, Figures, Plates. No price given.
- Cambridge Anthropology*, Volume 13, no. 1 (1988).
- Critique of Anthropology*, Volume VIII, no. 3 (Winter 1988).
- DÉSVAUX, Emmanuel, *Sous le signe de l'ours: mythes et temporalité chez les Ojibwa septentrionaux*, Paris: Editions de la maison des sciences de l'homme 1988. 291pp., Bestiary, Bibliography, Index, Plates. No price given.
- FARDON, Richard, *Raiders and Refugees: Trends in Chamba Political Development, 1750-1950* [Smithsonian Series in Ethnographic Enquiry; ser. eds. William L. Merrill and Ivan Karp], Washington and London: Smithsonian Institution Press 1988. xiii, 317pp., Appendixes, Notes, References, Index, Figures, Maps, Illustrations. \$27.50.
- GREG, Susan Alling, *Foragers and Farmers: Population Interaction and Agricultural Expansion in Prehistoric Europe* [Prehistoric Archeology and Ecology; ser. eds. Karl W. Butzer and Leslie G. Freeman], Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press 1988. xx, 238pp., Appendix, Bibliography, Figures, Tables. \$19.95 / \$7.95.
- GRIFFITH, Jeremy, *Free: The End of the Human Condition*, Sydney: Centre for Humanity's Adulthood 1988. 217pp., Index, Plates. No price given.
- GROTTANELLI, Vinigi L., *The Python Killer: Stories of Nzema Life*, Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press 1988. xii, 190pp., Appendix, Notes, References, Plates. \$19.95.
- HOCKINGS, Paul, *Counsel from the Ancients: A Study of Badaga Proverbs, Prayers, Omens and Curses* [Trends in Linguistics, Documentation 4; ed. Werner Winter], Berlin etc.: Mouton de Gruyter 1988. xiii, 601pp., Appendixes, Bibliography, Glossary and Concordance, Index, Figures, Tables. DML98.
- JOHNSON, Douglas, and David ANDERSON (eds.), *The Ecology of Survival: Case Studies from Northeast African History*, London: Lester Crook Academic Publishing 1988. xi, 303pp., Bibliography, Index, Maps, Figures. \$19.95.
- JOHNSON, Shiela K., *The Japanese through American Eyes*, Stanford: Stanford University Press 1988. x, 171pp., Notes, Index, Illustrations. \$22.50.
- KALTER, Johannes, *The Arts and Crafts of Turkestan*, London: Thames and Hudson 1984. 165pp., Bibliography, Maps, Illustrations. No price given.
- KLIGMAN, Gail, *The Wedding of the Dead: Ritual, Poetics and Popular Culture in Transylvania* [Studies on the History of Society and Culture; ser. eds. Victoria E. Bonnell and Lynn Hunt], Berkeley etc.: University of California Press 1988. xiii, 284pp., Appendixes, Notes, References, Index, Glossary, Map, Illustrations. No price given.
- LEISS, William, *The Limits to Satisfaction: An Essay on the Problem of Needs and Commodities*, Kingston and Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press 1988 [1976]. xx, 134pp., Notes, Bibliography. \$13.55.
- LEVINE, Nancy E., *The Dynamics of Polyandry: Kinship, Domesticity and Population on the Tibetan Border*, Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press 1988. xvii, 279pp., Appendixes, Glossary, Bibliography, Index, Figures, Tables, Photographs. \$37.95 / \$14.50.
- PRASAD, Onkar, *Folk Music and Folk Dances of Bamaras* [Anthropological Survey of India, Memoir no. 71], Calcutta: Government of India 1987. xi, 143pp., Bibliography, Glossary, Appendix, Notation. No price given.
- RUNCIMAN, W.G., *A Treatise on Social Theory, Volume I: The Methodology of Social Theory*, Cambridge etc.: Cambridge University Press 1983. xii, 341pp., Index. \$12.50 / \$19.95.
- SARKAR, Jayanta, *Society, Culture and Ecological Adaptation among Three Tribes of Arunachal Pradesh* [Anthropological Survey of India, Memoir no. 68], Calcutta: Government of India 1987. 205pp., Glossary, Plates, Tables, Figures. No price given.
- VERNANT, Jean-Pierre, and Pierre VIDAL-NAQUET, *Myth and Tragedy in Ancient Greece* (transl. Janet Lloyd), New York: Zone Books 1988. 412pp., Notes, Index. \$25.95.
- WEISMANTEL, M.J., *Food, Gender and Poverty in the Ecuadorian Andes*, Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press 1988. xii, 195pp., Appendix, Bibliography, Figures, Illustrations. No price given.