

THE CONVERSATION

Academic rigour, journalistic flair



Andy Rain/EPA/AAP

Attempts to access Kate Middleton's medical records are no surprise. Such breaches are all too common

Published: March 21, 2024 4.48pm AEDT



Bruce Baer Arnold

Associate Professor, School of Law, University of Canberra

The alleged data breach involving Catherine, Princess of Wales tells us something about health privacy. If hospital staff can apparently access a future queen's medical records without authorisation, it can happen to you.

Indeed it may have already happened to you, given many breaches of health data go under the radar.


Here's why breaches of health data keep on happening.




The Today Show  

@TheTodayShow · [Follow](#)

[#BREAKING](#): There are reports that three members of staff at the London hospital where Princess Kate was treated are being investigated for allegedly trying to access Royal medical records. [#9Today](#)

Watch on X

6:07 AM · Mar 21, 2024 

 7  Reply  Share

[Read 22 replies](#)

Read more: Yes, Kate Middleton's photo was doctored. But so are a lot of images we see today

What did we learn this week?

Details of the alleged data breaches, by up to three staff at The London Clinic, emerged in the UK media this week. These breaches are alleged to have occurred after the princess had abdominal surgery at the private hospital earlier this year.

The UK Information Commissioner's Office is investigating. Its report should provide some clarity about what medical data was improperly accessed, in what form and by whom. But it is unlikely to identify whether this data was given to a third party, such as a media organisation.

Read more: After the Medicare breach, we should be cautious about moving our health records online

Health data isn't always as secure as we'd hope

Medical records are inherently sensitive, providing insights about individuals and often about biological relatives.

In an ideal world, only the “right people” would have access to these records. These are people who “need to know” that information and are aware of the responsibility of accessing it.

Best practice digital health systems typically try to restrict overall access to databases through hack-resistant firewalls. They also try to limit access to specific types of data through grades of access.

This means a hospital accountant, nurse or cleaner does not get to see everything. Such systems also incorporate blocks or alarms where there is potential abuse, such as unauthorised copying.

But in practice each health records ecosystem – in GP and specialist suites, pathology labs, research labs, hospitals – is less robust, often with fewer safeguards and weaker supervision.

Read more: Vaccination status – when your medical information is private and when it's not

This has happened before

Large health-care providers and insurers, including major hospitals or chains of hospitals, have a worrying history of digital breaches.

Those breaches include hackers accessing the records of millions of people. The Medibank data breach involved more than ten million people. The Anthem data breach in the United States involved more than 78 million people.

Hospitals and clinics have also had breaches specific to a particular individual. Many of those breaches involved unauthorised sighting (and often copying) of hardcopy or digital files, for example by nurses, clinicians and administrative staff.

For instance, this has happened to public figures such as singer Britney Spears, actor George Clooney and former United Kingdom prime minister Gordon Brown.

 Britney Spears

Britney Spears' medical records were also the subject of a data breach. Nina Prommer/EPA/AAP

Indeed, the Princess of Wales has had her medical privacy breached before, in 2012, while in hospital pregnant with her first child. This was no high-tech hacking of health data.

Hoax callers from an Australian radio station tricked hospital staff into divulging details over the phone of the then Duchess of Cambridge's health care.

Read more: Did 2Day FM break the law? And does it matter?

Tip of the iceberg

Some unauthorised access to medical information goes undetected or is indeed undetectable unless there is an employment dispute or media involvement. Some is identified by colleagues.

Records about your health *might* have been improperly sighted by someone in the health system. But you are rarely in a position to evaluate the data management of a clinic, hospital, health department or pathology lab.

So we have to trust people do the right thing.

Read more: What is HIPAA? 5 questions answered about the medical privacy law that protects Trump's test results and yours

How could we improve things?

Health professions have long emphasised the need to protect these records. For instance, medical ethics bodies condemn medical students who share intimate or otherwise inappropriate images of patients.

Different countries have various approaches to protecting who has access to medical records and under what circumstances.

In Australia, for instance, we have a mix of complex and inconsistent laws that vary across jurisdictions, some covering privacy in general, others specific to health data. There isn't one comprehensive law and set of standards vigorously administered by one well-resourced watchdog.

In Australia, it's mandatory to report data breaches, including breaches of health data. This reporting system is currently being updated. But this won't necessarily prevent data breaches.

Read more: Government's privacy review has some strong recommendations – now we really need action

Instead, we need to incentivise Australian organisations to improve how they handle sensitive health data.

The best policy nudges involve increasing penalties for breaches. This is so organisations act as responsible custodians rather than negligent owners of health data.

We also need to step-up enforcement of data breaches and make it easier for victims to sue for breaches of privacy – princesses and tradies alike.

Read more: Where's Kate? Speculation about the 'missing' princess is proof the Palace's media playbook needs a re-write
