Durham E-Theses

Transnational subjectivities: the practice of relatedness among British Pakistanis

Iqbal, Nazalie

How to cite:

Iqbal, Nazalie (2006) *Transnational subjectivities: the practice of relatedness among British Pakistanis*, Durham theses, Durham University. Available at Durham E-Theses Online: http://etheses.dur.ac.uk/2552/

Use policy

The full-text may be used and/or reproduced, and given to third parties in any format or medium, without prior permission or charge, for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes provided that:

- a full bibliographic reference is made to the original source
- a link is made to the metadata record in Durham E-Theses
- the full-text is not changed in any way

The full-text must not be sold in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

Please consult the full Durham E-Theses policy for further details.

Academic Support Office, Durham University, University Office, Old Elvet, Durham DH1 3HP
e-mail: e-theses.admin@dur.ac.uk Tel: +44 0191 334 6107
http://etheses.dur.ac.uk

Transnational Subjectivities: The Practice of Relatedness among British Pakistanis

PhD

University of Durham, Anthropology Department
October 2006

Candidate: Nazalie Iqbal

Supervisors: Dr Peter Collins and Dr Kate Hampshire

The copyright of this thesis rests with the author or the university to which it was submitted. No quotation from it, or information derived from it may be published without the prior written consent of the author or university, and any information derived from it should be acknowledged.

27 JUL 2009

Declaration

The copyright of this thesis rests with the author. No quotation from it should be published in any format, including electronic and the Internet, without the author's prior written consent. All information derived from this thesis must be acknowledged appropriately.

The word length of this thesis is 95,500

Ms N Iqbal

Abstract

This thesis explores the meaning and experience of local and transnational kin connections for Pakistani Muslims living in Teesside, United Kingdom. The thesis contributes to knowledge about 'the practice of kinship' in a transnational context. The attempt to combine an investigation of transnationalism with a study of how kin relations are conducted in the present day is one of the strengths of the work.

The ethnography is based on eighteen months of fieldwork carried out among British Pakistani Muslims. It explores the domestic nature of transnationalism in kin connections that forms the experiential basis of global and local relationships. The research was undertaken with the co-operation of first, second and third-generation British Pakistanis living in the north east of England. Various ethnographic qualitative methods were used to collect data, including semi-structured interviews, life histories, participant observation and focus group discussions.

The social life of many of the first, second and third-generation British Pakistanis I interviewed demonstrates the complex interplay of gender, age, origin, kin connection and life-course events in creating variation in individuals' engagement with the transnational. I argue that during their migratory experiences many first and second-generation Pakistanis display new forms of 'habits of meaning' or 'habitus' to cope with differences exposed in their transnational travels. The thesis is written from the perspective of local actors: people who identify themselves as Pakistani, British Pakistani and have a Pakistani-origin. Although the thesis attempts to foreground their perspectives and narratives, it is also infused with my open interpretation and analyses, which I attempt to distinguish from local 'emic' ones. I am much less interested in this thesis in generalising claims about British Pakistani migrants, than in local practices of British Pakistanis in Teesside.

For British Pakistanis, transnational practices involve not only a particular post-colonial history, but also unique understandings of the meanings of *birādari* (extended family), marriage and family life and the everyday practices in which the recipients of such global processes must live. The migration of Pakistanis into the United Kingdom however, has introduced volatile relationships between kin as new configurations of space, consumption and social reproduction are negotiated. A striking aspect of the lives of those whom I interviewed was the fact that most of them were in the process of acquiring new patterns of commodity consumption and desire.

Narratives from parents and grandparents contain a 're-consciousness' of property relations revealing new ideas and practices about the importance of siblings and children in the new migratory context. Moreover, they form new self-definitions of fellow British Pakistanis and relatives living in Pakistan. It is these complex transnational reconfigurations (transnationalism, subjectivity, the meaning of 'home' and relatedness) that comprise the main subject of the present thesis. However, this thesis spans several areas of anthropological interest: the practice of kinship and relatedness, South Asian migration, transnationalism, diaspora, intergenerational conflicts, nurturing practices, ethnicity and studies of ethnic minorities in Britain.

Acknowledgements

The friendships formed with the families I studied have exceeded the research scope of the fieldwork phase. My family and I are happy to now include many of them into our friendship connections. I have learned from them more about the highs and lows of life and have enjoyed their friendship beyond what I can attempt to represent with these words. I would like to thank the families for their time, patience, support and allowing me to visit them in their homes.

Although doing a PhD is a solitary pursuit, the writing is seldom a solitary project. In the process of writing this thesis I have incurred many intellectuals debts as well as developed wonderful friendships, all of which have helped to shape my project of thinking creatively about British Pakistani relatedness and diasporic practices. From the very early stages of this PhD various people have facilitated bringing it to fruition by reading parts of the early draft versions of the chapters, engaging in lively discussions, helping to complete the necessary research tasks, such as computer support, photocopying as well as providing useful advice. My sincere thanks go to Professor Michael Carrithers, Dr Iain Edgar, Dr Steve Lyon, Professor Catherine Panter-Brick, Professor Helen Ball, Dr Tammy Kohn, Ms Vikki Wood, Dr Anselma Gallinat, Dr Adam Kaur, Dr Tessa Pollard and Dr Andrew Russell. In particular I would like to thank my two wonderful supervisors and friends, who over the last years I worked most closely with and helped give me a strong sense of anthropology and critical inquiry: Dr Peter Collins and Dr Kate Hampshire. My dream of completing the PhD was fuelled by their constructive and critical engagement with my work and their kind words of encouragement. Dr Peter Collins' interest in theory has sparked interests in writing about the 'habitus', 'diaspora' and 'transnationalism'. His meetings were always stimulating to me. I have known Kate since my very first day as an undergraduate student, she has always been a wonderful friend and given me her full support in the practical aspect of my fieldwork. She has always been there for me throughout the last six years and her supervision has been remarkable.

My training in anthropology began long before my official enrolment in anthropology courses. As a British Pakistani, disabled, single, Muslim female, included an insistence on an openness to all people, which gave me a sense of how differences between people were a matter of changing perspectives. My participation and observations of home life, such as living with my grandparents, aunts, mother, father, brother and sister, shaped my own ideas about 'culture', 'identity' and 'community'. No words are able to express the support and encouragement I

received from my family members. Over the last six years they have been a source of inspiration, as well as engaging with my work.

In particular I would like to thank my mother who has been my rock throughout the last six years (undergraduate and postgraduate years). She travelled with me to many of my fieldwork sites, hospitals, including sitting in some of my seminar classes at the Department of Anthropology. My mother prepared many of my meals during the writing stage of my thesis and would each day take the time to talk about my work. She has been remarkable and the following PhD is therefore a testament to her steadfast support to help bring this project to completion.

Notes on Transliteration

Words from Urdu and Punjabi (general and Mirpuri dialect) used in this text are transliterated following the system used by Platts (1960) with slight changes. I am adopting the contemporary use of some symbols in spite of following Platts exactly. I have changed the symbol of Persian Izafat. For instance, *khatm-e-Qur'ān* is used instead of *khatm-ᵕ-Qŏr'ān* as used by Platts. These languages generally share a common vocabulary while I have distinguished in the glossary if any word is used exclusively in either language. All the local words are italicized in small caps. Urdu and Punjabi also borrow words from Arabic and Persian. I have not transcribed the Arabic or Persian words according to their own literary forms; instead, I have noted their oral pronunciation in Urdu and Punjabi. For instance, Arabic form '*madrasah*' is used as '*madarsa*' to convey the popular version of the term in Pakistan. Terms and names of persons or places which have a standard form in English or at least practiced in some standard form in English are used without any diacritics here like Punjabi, Urdu, and Naseem. The word God in the text refers to Allah. The words *kashmiri* and *pathan* are italicized where these are used as names of castes and not as national identities.

This transliteration also notes a distinction between some long and short vowels. Long vowels are distinguished from the short ones with and additional '-' on them i.e. ā, ī, ū. All the short vowels have the same sound as in English. Below are the consonants which have different pronunciation in Urdu and Punjabi:

a	*a, e, i, u* (It is also used as a replacement for *ah* sound of an Arabic/Persian consonant at the end of certain words)
ć	*ch* (As in 'charm')
d	As *th* in 'then', 'there'
ḍ	un-aspirated *d* (As in 'diamond' and is different from sound of *d* in)
e	*e* (As *ay* has in 'day')
-e-	Persian *Izafat* to denote possession like in *khatm-e-Qur'ān*
gh	aspirated consonant *g*
ḥ	Its sound comes a little back from *h* in throat
kh	aspirated consonant *k*

kh	aspirated consonant *k* has soft fricative sound from the upper portion of throat
ṅ	nasalized *n* (As in 'trunk')
ṛ	retroflexed *r*
ŝ	emphatic *s*, an Arabic consonant. It is pronounced in similar fashion to *s* at popular level in Urdu and Punjabi in speaking, though distinguished clearly in writing. In Platts (1960), ŝ is denoted as *s* with two dots below.
sh	(As *sh* in 'furnish')
ṭ	un-aspirated *t* (As in 'tilt and is different from sound of *t* in 'thanks')
u	As *oo* in 'look', 'cook'
ẕ ẓ	z-like sound has more than one expressions in Arabic. The difference in them is ignorable in Urdu and Punjabi in speaking, though distinguished clearly in writing
'	It usually comes before *i* in the text to note an alphabet *ain*. This will change the sound of vowel *i and* '*i* will be pronounced as *ee*
'	It is only present in Arabic words generally to note a glottal pause between two consonants, one of them is a vowel

Contents

Declaration		i
Abstract		ii
Acknowledgements		iv
Notes on transliteration		vi
Chapter One	Introduction	1
Chapter Two	The Process of Settlement: From Pakistan to Britain	9
Chapter Three	Theoretical Approach	31
Chapter Four	Methodology	58
Chapter Five	Childlessness and the Social Process of Kinning	84
Chapter Six	Cosmopolitan Everyday Life: Habitus, Cultural Reproduction and Reflexivity	103
Chapter Seven	Conflicting Discourses of Relatedness: Equality, *Qaum* (caste) and Ambivalence among British Pakistanis	126
Chapter Eight	Migration and Becoming *Walāytī*	149
Chapter Nine	The Flow of People and Things	174
Chapter Ten	Conclusions	195
Glossary		211
Bibliography		214
Appendix 1	Ethnic Composition of the Tees Valley	227
Appendix 2	Information on Core Informants	228

Chapter One

Introduction

During the 1990s, discussions of globalisation and transnationalism figured prominently in debates in all social sciences. Many such debates deal with migration and diasporas in the context of a transnational globalising world and encompass issues as diverse as the political economy of migration, the nature of diasporic identity and its implications for the idea of citizenship and the nation state (cf. Werbner and Modood 1997). There has been concern over the question of whether transnational migration, or transmigration, as it is often called, is a new phenomenon as is sometimes claimed and, if this is not the case, over the question of how transnational migration now differs from international migration in the past.

In general, the transnational practices of migrant families, besides sending home remittances and other economic activities, remain under-researched (Gardner and Grillo 2002: 179). With regard to kinship, some research has examined the ways in which British Pakistanis continue to remain in contact with kin living in Pakistan (Shaw 2000, 2001, Charsley 2003, 2005, Werbner 1990, Ballard 1994, Alavi 1972), but the micro-politics of kinship practices is under-investigated. There is an absence of discussion of transnational kinship practices at the level of household (*ghar*) and extended family (*birādarī*). Kelly (1990), who claims to have coined the pertinent term 'transcontinental families' in 1985, describes the marriage arrangements of a potential migrant in India and his British-based fiancée, but provides only a passing glimpse of transnational kinship practices. Analyses at a kinship level of the performances of and meanings attributed to kinship practices should offer an important route to understanding relations between place, culture, ethnicity and gender among migrants in a transnational world and illuminate contemporary processes of globalisation.

1.1 Aims and Objectives

This thesis focuses on the domestic nature of transnationalism in kin connections that forms the experiential basis of global and local relationships. The social life of many of the first, second and third generation British Pakistanis I interviewed demonstrates the complex interplay of gender, age, origin, kin connection and life-course events in creating variation in individuals' engagement with the transnational. The ethnography demonstrates that cultural understandings of kinship, translated as *birādarī* in Punjabi (Mirpuri dialect) and Urdu, are influenced by – and in turn contribute to the shaping of – the political dynamics of national and transnational identities, the economic movements of labour and capital and the cosmologies of religion. In focusing on these

topics, it became evident that the construction of kinship in such contexts is both prominent and deliberate. The increased intensity and frequency of the movements and migration involved allow kin relations, such as those established through transnational adoption, access to more familiar ever-increasing numbers of people in various parts of the world. For instance, changes in the global economy make it possible to marry across a wide range of national, geographic, and ethnic boundaries.

In this thesis, I endeavour to explore the meaning and experience of local and transnational kin connections for Pakistani Muslims living in Teesside. In particular, I address the following research questions:

1. What are the consequences for the extended *birādarī* as meanings about kinship are changed, rejected or when a process of renovation occurs as migrants encounter alternative ways of life in the new context?
    - How does the reconfiguration of relatedness in the diasporic context influence childless couples?
    - To what extent and how is ambivalence of social practices among British Pakistanis manifested?
    - What are the differences between religious discourses about brother and sisterhood and ideologies of caste (*qaum*) categories?

2. As migrants are exposed to new living practices, what happens to the traditional basis of what is acceptable or desirable?
    - What are the nurturing practices of second and third-generation British Pakistanis?
    - What are parental concerns about bringing up children in Britain?
    - What kinds of inter-generational conflicts occur among British Pakistani Muslims?
    - What are the ambivalences of relations inherent in the kin relations of British Pakistanis?

3. How do British Pakistanis maintain transnational connections?
    - What kinds of transnational practices are demonstrated by first, second and third generation British Pakistanis?
    - What kinds of dilemmas do British Pakistanis experience as a result of multiple ties and dual loyalties?
    - How do British Pakistanis' multiple allegiances around the globe inform our understandings of diaspora?

4. What is the relationship between diaspora and homeland?
    - What are the implications of being *walāytī* (from abroad)?
    - How have wider social and political events influenced British Pakistani Muslims' relationships with their homeland/s?
    - How does the notion of *walāytī* influence understanding of the concept of diaspora and diaspora consciousness?

The main aim is twofold: to see what happens to kinship under conditions of migration and transnationalism, and to examine the usefulness of focusing on kinship practices in attempting to understand transnationalism. In the transnational context, where people, practices and resources are dispersed, the household becomes more and more difficult to define. Indeed, the term household is often unhelpfully narrow as wider networks of kin, neighbours and friends are clearly central to many of the events (such as marital and religious rituals, nurturing practices and inter-generational conflicts) under discussion. The thesis illustrates that the transnational family is a large amorphous structure made up of conjugal and nuclear units, as well as consanguineous segments that spread across national boundaries. A network of interdependent linkages characterises the transnational family. Critical family functions such as economic support, decision-making and nurturing are divided among the central links in the network. Without abandoning the household, the more traditional analytical phenomena of kinship compelled me to investigate what it might tell us about transnationalism. The kinship groups and sets of relationships are the focus of this thesis.

It is important not to reify a distinction between the macro transnationalism of state and economy, and the micro transnationalism of the *birādarī*. It is their interrelationship that is crucial, and to focus on the local and micro, on households and families, enables one to explore the articulation of the global with 'questions of identity, status and culturally specific forms of hierarchy and inequality' and consider how 'transnational activities articulate with different forms of power in different locations' (Gardner and Grillo 2002: 183). One way of exploring the articulation would be to focus on the transnational family (*birādarī*), and my data contains much that is relevant to that focus. Here, however, I observe transnationalism primarily through the lens of kinship.

In this thesis, I place the close, intimate and emotional work of kinship beside the larger projects of transnational and diasporic lives. The lived experience often seems too mundane or too obvious to be worthy of close scrutiny. But the illustrations I use make clear that kinship is far from occupying the realm of the 'given' as opposed to the 'made'. It is, among other things, an area of life in which people invest their emotions. For British Pakistanis, kinship involves creative energy and new imaginings, which of course can take both benevolent and destructive forms. Practices of relatedness among the younger British Pakistanis indicate that kinship involves not just rights, rules and obligations, but that it is also a realm of new possibilities, and this becomes apparent when we look at inter-generational conflicts and marital practices. I argue that creativity

is not only central to kinship conceived in its broadest sense, but that for most people kinship constitutes one of the most important arenas for their creative energy (cf. Faubion 2001).

Although I am principally concerned with kinship practices in the context of transnationalism, it is apparent from my fieldwork data that participation in life-crisis events 'back home' by returned migrants or migrants who are engaged in operating transnationally demands a show of their new social status and, in a way, of their modernity. Materially, practically and symbolically, the family events described in the thesis are important performances that both say and do many things. A striking feature of these events (marriages, funeral ceremonies and nurturing practices) is that they are multifaceted and multi-vocal. For instance, a wedding in Teesside gives women an opportunity to compare and contrast the welfare system of Britain and Pakistan, while funeral ceremonies enable members to hold meetings and enter into conflicts about ideas of belonging.

The kinship practices I describe relate crucially to success and change with migration. But they are also about continuity. Transnational kinship practices make statements about membership in the community of origin, which have symbolic and practical significance. We may see this in the symbolic languages through which statements are made, regarding food and clothing: tangible phenomena with multiple semiotic possibilities. They are not just made, however, but also contested.

Transnationalism, living across and between worlds, poses questions about identity, membership and belonging in all of them. The notion of 'home' figures prominently in the ethnography, and the cases illustrate that there are certain rituals, which are located 'over there', in places that informants think of as home and this is essential for our understanding of how they are performed and what they say. I show that the character of kinship in the Teesside community[1] appears as an important aspect of the strategy for survival within the wider British social system. In this way the transnational connections also provide ways in which a sense of self and identity are sustained.

[1] Although I refer to the notion of 'community' throughout the chapter, I readily acknowledge the problematic nature of this term when it comes to the complex questions of boundaries and differentiation within and across Pakistani 'communities' in Britain. However, for reasons of space, questions of caste (*qaum*), social status, area of origin and different patterns of integration are omitted here but are discussed in the following chapters.

The dialectic of continuity and change is a prominent theme that emerges from the ethnography. It appears that through their everyday practices participants are able to operate an ideal and perhaps usually unattainable concept of the family and family relations: what a proper family does or should do. Underlying these practices is a model of the 'good' family or ideal family relations, which modernity, transnationalism, and change have disrupted and challenged. Embedded in that model are the ways in which rituals allow one to glimpse how certain life events, as well as notions of appropriate gender relations, might be at odds with how people live or want to live. The ideas about continuity, however, do not mean that British Pakistanis in Teesside are static, unchanging and unchallenged. An important thread running throughout the thesis reveals the flexibility of people's ideas about 'traditional' practices, which vary according to who is performing, who is observing and what they want to say. In this way, living in Britain for British Pakistanis involves contestations about continuity and change, as there are ongoing negotiations over power, status, history and identity. Kinship relations are a fertile terrain through which participants creatively work through the meaning of modernity (or tradition) and navigate the individual and collective transformation wrought by migration under conditions of transnationalism.

Whether or not contemporary transnationalism takes a different (and varied) form compared with previous eras, a transnational perspective has undoubtedly opened up questions previously not addressed. The ethnography shows how people talk about ideas of 'home' in relation to important life-cycle events. One example of this concerns the performance of rituals, such as the funeral ceremony. The burial of relatives, which involves the bodies of deceased migrants being transported 'back home', demonstrates to surviving relatives that the deceased have indeed passed away, providing the opportunity to mourn and acknowledge loss.

However, during in-depth interviews and participant observation with informants, I discovered that they often discussed the way that burials should be performed under conditions of migration. Their comments indicate how rituals take on new significance when viewed through the current analytical lens of transnationalism. I present accounts of other sets of rituals, wedding ceremonies and *khatm-e-Qur'ān* (ritual events where the complete Qur'ān is read), which also suggest that rituals are not static events and that ritualisation is not a static process. This is revealed in the way people perform *khatm-e-Qur'ān*, when sometimes facilities are simply not available in one location, or parts of rituals seem most appropriately performed in one place rather than another.

On the whole, however, the British Pakistanis I interviewed have been international migrants for a long time and are well adapted to living transnationally and organising their lives accordingly.

Referring to a wide range of institutions, organisations and communities that operated transnationally, Hannerz (1992:46-7) commented that they 'offer the contexts in which globalisation occurs as the personal experience of a great many people in networks where extremely varied meanings flow'. This is certainly true of the families I met, seen through the lens of kinship. Familial relationships show that transnationalism opens up the domestic site of public activity, creativity and loss, where participants play a central and public role in them.

The thesis is based on eighteen months of fieldwork among British Pakistani Muslims living in the North-East of England. Various ethnographic qualitative methods were used to collect data, including semi-structured interviews, life histories, participant observation and focus group discussions. Community centres and local clinics were visited on a weekly basis to recruit participants for the research. In addition to this, the snowball sampling technique was a useful strategy to contact potential informants.

1.2 Outline of Chapters

Chapter Two: The Process of Settlement: *From Pakistan to Britain*: This chapter forms the background to this thesis. It provides a discussion of the migration history of British Pakistanis, focusing particularly on Britain and Teesside. In particular, I provide details of the way in which kinship plays a role in facilitating these migration histories. The chapter also highlights the socio-economic status and geographical distribution of British Pakistanis living in Teesside. There follows a review of some of the anthropological and sociological research that has been conducted among British Pakistanis.

Chapter Three: Theoretical Approach: There are seven main theoretical themes and concepts central to this thesis, which this chapter aims to address. I focus on the following: ethnicity, transnationalism, diaspora, cosmopolitanism, kinship, habitus and cultural navigators, and gender and family relationships. The discussion will highlight the under-explored contribution of relatedness in the diasporic context among British Pakistanis.

Chapter Four: Methodology: This chapter provides an overview of the methodological approaches employed during the research. The first set of sections describe the qualitative methods and how I contacted potential informants. Secondly, I provide some information about

data analysis and the way the grounded theory was approached. I discuss the important relationship between ethnography and theory as well as the language issues I encountered. In the final sections I describe the importance of being both an 'insider' and 'outsider' in relation to working with British Pakistanis in my own home town in Teesside. The final section provides a note concerning ethics.

Chapter Five: Childlessness and the Social Process of Kinning: The aim of this chapter is to explore the way in which childlessness contributes to an understanding about relatedness in the transnational context for British Pakistanis. In particular I show the way in which there is a process of kinning occurring during the quest for a child.

Chapter Six: *Cosmopolitan everyday life: habitus, cultural reproduction and reflexivity*: The process of cultural reproduction is important for British Pakistanis, and this chapter provides an insight into the concerns parents and grandparents have about the transmission of Pakistani knowledge, values, beliefs and 'tradition'. I also describe what being a Pakistani entails and the important role of language during the early stages of life. However, inter-generational disputes do occur and this chapter provides an overview of how second-generation British Pakistanis negotiate their identities.

Chapter Seven: *Conflicting Discourses of Relatedness: Equality, Qaum (caste) and Ambivalence among British Pakistanis:* Ambivalence and kinship are important themes in this thesis and this chapter deals with the way in which Pakistanis renew and relocate their values and principles about equality and caste. I suggest that Pakistani ideas and practices of social life display a pronounced concern with power, practice and agency, all of which are thoroughly immersed in issues having to do with mixed emotions.

Chapter Eight: *Migration and Becoming Walāytī*: The relationship between 'home' and 'away' is important for many British Pakistanis and this chapter illustrates the consequences of belonging to two places at the same time, and the conditions or circumstances which make this possible. The ethnographic material shows that homeland and diaspora are not clear-cut and precise terms, but are considerably more complex and contingent on wider social and cultural processes.

Chapter Nine: *The Flow of People and Things*: The emphasis of this chapter is on the practice of transnationalism 'from below': how the flow of people, things and ideologies revises previous understandings of the migration process. There are two main aims in the chapter: first, to show the flexible relationship of British Pakistanis with the place of Pakistan. The second will discuss

how the *birādarī* constitutes a significant means of connecting to the common source of origins in Pakistan.

Chapter Ten: *Conclusions*: This chapter sums up the main aims of the thesis, looking in particular at the meaning and experience of local and transnational kin connections for Pakistani Muslims living in Teesside. I also discuss further areas for research.

Chapter Two

The Process of Settlement: From Pakistan to Britain

2.1 Introduction

The aim of this chapter is to provide an overview of the process of settlement of the British Pakistani population. The first part of the chapter will discuss the migration history of first-generation British Pakistanis and the legislation which influenced the movement of migrants from overseas. The second section will discuss the ways in which British Pakistani kinship reciprocities play a major role in facilitating a large-scale process of transnational migration. The third section will provide an overview of the ways in which British Pakistanis established religious prayer mosques in Teesside.[2] The fourth section focuses on the geographical distribution and socio-economic status of British Pakistanis, with particular reference to Pakistanis living in Teesside. In the final part of this chapter I review literature that deals specifically with integration, assimilation and inter-generation relationships, that has been carried out in Britain and which is most relevant to my study. Whilst not exhaustive, the purpose of the review is, firstly, to point the reader in the direction of important comparative works and, secondly, to highlight some of the key analytical points which emerge from the existing literature.

2.2 Migration History

As far as movements between Punjab and the UK are concerned, chain migration has passed through at least three phases (cf. Dahya 1973:253). The first phase was one that enabled young adult males to make their way to Britain to access industrial employment, which they could do virtually without hindrance until the 1960s. The second phase was instigated when this initial wave of male migrants began to call their wives and children over to the UK to join them. The second phase began earlier for Hindus and Sikhs, but rather later for Muslims and was largely complete by the mid-1980s. However, by then more stringent immigration controls had been implemented and it was widely accepted that once this process of family reunion was complete, further immigration from South Asia would drop to a trickle. These expectations were not fulfilled, largely because of the gradual emergence of a third phase of chain migration, which was facilitated by marriage (cf. Ballard 1994:16-20). By the beginning of the twenty-first century, the first two phases had more or less come to an end, and the third had emerged as by far the most

[2] Teesside is used here to include central areas of Middlesbrough, Thornaby and Stockton. However, most of my informants live in central Middlesbrough, with a few of their relatives living in areas of Stockton and Thornaby.

effective vehicle through which to facilitate the maintenance of transnational networks in the longer term.

Although the migration histories of British Pakistanis involved in my study were temporally and experientially diverse, it did appear that men arrived as single male migrants between the 1920s and 1960s as part of the working group (see below). Like Shaw (2000:29), I found that Pakistani men came to the UK as single men during the 1950s and early 1960s as part of working groups from Lahore, Islammabad, Jhelum, Mirpur district of Azad Kashmir. A few of these new arrivals were Arabs or Somalis, but the vast majority were South Asians from East and West Pakistan (East Pakistan did not become the independent state of Bangladesh until 1971), together with a small number of Kenyans. Most migrants came either as single men or left their families back in Pakistan, but by the late 1970s they were increasingly being joined by sons, wives and daughters. Initially, many regarded their stay in Britain as a temporary expedient and declared their commitment to return home once they had achieved their economic and social objectives.[3]

I interviewed men (and their families) who originated in the rural migration region of Azad Kashmir and urban areas widely known as Lahore, Islamabad and Jhelum. Those men arriving from urban areas came for some kind of educational course (such as teaching and engineering), even though many did have problems as Pakistani education qualifications were not recognised in England. Many men returned to Pakistan after two to four years to get married, but a lot of them were sponsored by members of kin (mostly paternal and maternal uncles in this case) and obtained visas for wives to join them.

The shipping industry and seafaring appear to have brought the first Pakistanis to the North-East of England and to Teesside. During the second half of the nineteenth century, a structural and technological transformation of the world's merchant shipping industry was taking place as freighters began to switch from sail to steam. The first Pakistani Muslims to settle in the North-East for whom there is documentary evidence did so in the 1920s (Lawless 1995). A Punjabi informant recalled that his cousin had specialised in treating eyes (called a *hakīm*) in Harrogate.

As other works have shown (Shaw 2000:30-1, Werbner 1990, Ballard 1994), it was a combination of the difficult social and economic conditions in the Mirpur region and the powerful

[3] Ten of the older informants still regarded their stay in Britain as temporary and were planning to return to their countries of origin in the future

attraction of employment opportunities in Britain that produced large-scale migration in the post-war era. For instance, Shaw (2000:30) suggests that migration in 1955 and 1960 was accelerated when the

> Pakistani Government embarked upon constructing a hydroelectric dam at Mangala, in Mirpur district, which would submerge about 250 villages.

There has been less agreement about the relative importance of push and pull factors. During interviews, many of the older generation spoke of the poverty of the Mirpur area and the hardships of life there: the dry, stony soil, poor houses without heating, piped water or mains sanitation and the threadbare clothes worn by villagers. My own grandmother often reminds us of the extreme poverty experienced by her family. She recalls that on one evening there was very little food in the house and they had to eat the grass outside. Many informants spoke about the impact of the remittances sent to families in Mirpur by the first migrants. When the money sent home was changed into local currency and used in the village, many other families were impressed and wanted to send one of their members to work in Britain. If a man wanted to emigrate he often sold land and/or his wife's jewellery, or sometimes relatives in Britain paid his passage.

Many of the migrants who came from Mirpur to Teesside were uneducated farmers who knew no English and were unfamiliar with British customs. A few had been to school before emigrating to Britain. Most of those who migrated to Britain wanted to enhance their social mobility through the accumulation of greater wealth. Those migrants who had some knowledge of English when they arrived in Britain had a definite advantage over uneducated ones. Those who were educated and knew English often helped other migrants who were illiterate, translating and filling out forms for them (cf. Lawless 1995, Werbner 1990, Anwar 1979, 1998).

Some migrants came directly to the North-East while others stayed with relatives and friends in other parts of the country before moving to Teesside when they heard about job opportunities there. Middlesbrough in particular was known as a high wage area at this time and this may have been one of the factors that attracted migrants who had originally settled in other parts of the country to move to Teesside (Lawless 1995: 38). As these new arrivals established themselves in the region, they were joined by other members of kin from the same village. At a time of employment and labour shortages in some industries, a worker would be asked by the management to find other men from his own family or village.

The timing of migration and the migrants' experience was determined partly by the changing legislation regarding immigration (cf. Shaw 2000:31-33). Immigration is part of the tool of the state underpinning the construction of national identities. Immigration throughout British history is a contentious political issue. The restrictive controls were meant to control the flow of people who immigrated into Britain and had direct effects on the type of people who immigrated and their settlements patterns in Britain. The Immigration Acts that affected the migrants I worked with were: the British Nationality Act (1948) when there were no restrictions on entering Britain for Commonwealth members; the Commonwealth Immigrants Act (1962), which made entry conditional on a work voucher and the Common Wealth Immigration Acts of 1968 and 1972 aimed at further restricting immigrants owing to fears about political uncertainty in East Africa (cf. Gilroy 1993, Anwar 1999, Vertovec 2001, Ditz 2004).

Shaw (2000:31) also suggests that it was in the 1970s that the brief period of post-war affluence was followed by a period of rapid economic decline, which had lasting effects on the social fabric of the nation and, in particular, on how immigration was preceived. The increasingly restrictive Commonwealth Immigration Acts of 1968 and 1972 came as a response to this. These policies focused attention on the ongoing connection of migrants with other parts of the world. The grandfather clause of the 1972 Commonwealth Immigration Act ensured that only those individuals whose grandparents were British nationals could enter the Isles as residents. In effect, this excluded non-white British citizens who hailed from South Asia and had been living in Africa for up to three generations. The 1970s industrial decline combined with high inflation fuelled Britain's insular response and created a period of intense social unrest marked by union strikes, 'race riots' and National Front fascist attacks in 'ethnic areas'. The Thatcherite years that followed attempted to halt economic decline with severe government cutbacks (cf. Gunaratnam 2003, Soysal 2000).

Although the voucher system was introduced by the government immigration service between 1962 and 1964, migrants experienced few problems so long as kinsmen had located a job for them in a factory in Britain. With the kinsmen's help and that of the employer, there was usually no difficulty obtaining the required voucher. More and more Mirpuris arrived in the region during the 1960s through chain migration networks to stay with a waiting member of kin or village. This largely accounts for the fact that most of the Mirpur population in Teesside has its origins in only a few villages in the Mirpur region. The survey of the Asian community resident in the inner area of Middlesbrough (1982), for example, revealed that 59 per cent of Pakistani respondents first

came to live in the United Kingdom in the 1960s compared to only 17 per cent between 1946 and 1960 (CCRI 1982:219-249). Informants also emphasised the fear of tougher immigration legislation as being another factor that contributed to the quickening pace of migration during the 1960s. One man explained that people arrived in something of a flood during this period because they were worried that immigration might be banned or regulations made more stringent. Certainly the research confirms that the 1962 immigration legislation had less impact than was widely thought but that legislation later in the decade was considerably more effective (ibid:7). As a result of the 1968 Act, the emphasis shifted away from primary migrants - men who came to work, save and remit funds - towards dependents and the reunion of families (cf. Ditz 2004).

Some have criticised the three-phase model of Asian migration saying it has mistakenly produced a gendered historical migration chronicle: it emphasises male histories in which women are dependents (Massey 1994, Afshar and Maynard 2000, Bauer and Thompson 2004). Banks suggests that 'the role of gender in constructing and transforming ethnic identities is still an ill-researched topic, and much of the earlier literature on ethnicity is effectively gender blind' (1996:102). In relation to Pakistan, Shaw (1988, 2000:54-60) and others (Werbner 1990, Ballard 1997, Pessar and Mahler 2003, Ditz 2004) have provided insights into the role of women in creating social networks by their migration. Men's connections with people in Britain were often defined through women. Of course, women arrived as daughters as well as wives.

2.3 Gender relations, marriage patterns and family networks

Ballard (1996: 122) and Shaw (2001:317-8) note how Pakistani Muslim migrants in general come from regions that are not very dependent on government aid and assistance and where more reliance is placed on kin reciprocities and responsibilities. Nevertheless, Pakistani Muslim families across Britain are diverse with respect to origins, social class and *qaum* (caste) groups (cf. Modood et al. 1997, Werbner 1990, Bradby 2000, Shaw 1988, 2000, Wazir 2002). Pakistani Muslims have high rates of endogamy, where marriage occurs within the extended family known as the *birādarī*. Researchers have shown the way in which kinship reciprocities play a major role in facilitating in almost every large-scale process of transnational migration, as well as in the process of ethnic colony construction (Alavi 1972, Ballard 1994, 2004, Shaw 1988, 2000, 2001, Werbner 1999, Charsley 2005).

Although the word *rishta* can be crudely translated as the English term for 'marriage', it has a much wider meaning, since it also refers to human relationships of all kinds (cf. Anwar 1979, Charsley 2003). Hence in the North Indian context the term for kinsfolk is *rishtedār* – literally

'those with whom relationships are held' (cf. Jeffery and Jeffery 1996). It is also taken for granted by Pakistanis that marriages will normally be arranged, and that this will bring together spouses drawn from two separate but corporately structured extended families. In this context a *rishta* does much more than to establish and legitimate the bride and groom's conjugal union. Marriage marks the transfer of the bride out of her natal family and into that of her in-laws, and in doing so sets up a network of affinal relationships between two corporate extended families (cf. Bradby 2000, Charsley 2005).

Patrilocal residence is the norm: that is, the bride's formal transfer from her natal residence to that of her in-laws is a central component of Pakistani marriage rituals. Even if the distance which the bride travels is less than a few miles and sometimes no more than a few yards, such transfers establish a relationship of affinal kinship, *rishtedārī*, between the two families. It follows that all relationships are in principle translocal in character, in the sense that they establish a web of reciprocities between two spatially separated extended families. It is the capacity of kinship relationships, both agnatic and affinal, and no less those articulated by women than by men, to generate and support resilient networks of translocal reciprocity which has led to their playing such a salient role in ordering processes of long-distance migration and settlement (cf. Shaw 2001: 318).

The growth and character of transnational networks among the Pakistanis I worked with have deeper historical roots than one might appreciate. Now that communication technology has ceased to be a monopoly of the elite and become accessible to all, those operating from below have frequently tapped into the resultant opportunities.

Some works on South Asian migration have concentrated on the role of men in coming and setting up work and employment (cf. Eriksen 1993 and Lawless 1995). However, several researchers have looked more closely at the operation of gender roles in households / family life (Werbner, 1998; Shaw, 1988 2000; Gardner, 2002; Pessar and Mahler, 2003). Ballard (2008), in particular, points to the importance of South Asian women in family life: "... whilst transnational networks are invariably assumed to be patriarchal in character, closer inspection soon reveals that women, together with affinal ties to which their marriages give rise, play a far more active role than is commonly appreciated in developing, maintaining and extending *rishtedārī*, complex patterns of reciprocity whose smooth operation is the key to the strength and resilience – and hence to the success – of these informal transnational networks." (ibid: 6).

The central role of the extended family in the migration process has been commented on by several researchers (Ballard 1994, 1996, 2008; Shaw 2000, 2001; Werbner 1990). Ballard (2008: 6) notes that, while it is usual for the first migrant to be an individual male, the active support (including financial support) of the extended family is crucial to this. Support is not only financial: Shaw (2000:54) described how, among British Pakistanis living in Oxford, some used 'various strategies for bringing boys or young men into the country. In several cases men brought over 'sons' who were in fact brothers' sons or other relatives' sons...' The extended family are also implicated in the effects of individuals' migration. Ballard (2008: 6) describes how the whole family network is expected to share any benefits from the migration (via remittances, for example), but that they also bear the costs: notably household disruption and separation of close kin. He goes on to show that family re-unification in Britain – i.e. gradually moving whole households - has been widely adopted by South Asian migrants to address the problem of separation. He argues that, among the resultant "ethnic colonies", despite considerable efforts to reconstruct key institutions from "back home", people have carved out their own pathways and their own "*Desh Pardesh*" (home from home). (Ibid: 8).

This thesis will examine how transnational networks extend across generations. Settlers' offspring are successfully plugged into the network of transnational reciprocities in their own right. Reciprocities are constantly renewed to avoid fading and it is precisely in this context that the role of marriage becomes vital (cf. Charsley 2005, Bradby 2000). Besides binding a further generation into the network itself, network endogamy provides its members with by far the most effective opportunity to develop and reinforce its spatial dimensions. If this was true 'back home'[4], it is now becoming apparent that the proposition holds true in the transnational context. As many researchers (Ahmad 2006, Ballard 1994, Anwar 1998, Ghuman 1999, Gardner and Shukur 1996) have shown in some detail, the various communities of which Britain's South Asian population is composed have by now long since implemented transnational practices, although the speed with which each group has done so has varied enormously.

The socio-economic position of South Asian communities in Britain is generally regarded as poor, compared with that of both the white population and of Indians and other minority groups. Modood et al. (1997: 180) wrote that 'The first, and outstanding, finding is the extent of poverty among both Pakistani...households...Name any group whose poverty causes national concern-pensioners, disabled people, one-parent families, the unemployed - Pakistanis...were poorer'. It

[4] The phrase 'back home' is used among British Pakistanis themselves, and usually refers to Pakistan.

is the complex set of interactions between socio-economic constraints and gender and kinship norms that underpin both the ways in which migration has happened and the ways that transnational networks operate.

2.4 Religious activities and practices

The reunion of families fundamentally changed the structure of the Pakistani population in Teesside and particularly its religious activities. As elsewhere in Britain, Muslims settling in Teesside quickly found that they were living in a situation where nothing could be taken for granted in terms of access to Islamic facilities. Shaw (2000), for instance, shows that many Pakistani Muslims in Oxford perceived their non-Muslim environment as being actively inimical to things Muslim. Many matters that had been taken for granted at home, such as the provision of facilities for prayer, teaching Islam to children, access to halāl food and proper burial, now had to be consciously sought out. This was certainly the experience of Pakistani Muslims on Teesside.

One of the problems experienced by Pakistani settlers in Teesside was the need to find food that was lawful according to their religion. A number of the older men explained that at the outset there was nowhere to buy halāl meat, some ate chickens which they bought live and killed themselves, others lived mainly on vegetables. Later the situation improved as Muslims started to open small businesses and there are now numerous shops selling halāl meat. One shopkeeper told me that he went to a slaughterhouse every morning so that the meat in the shop was fresh and killed according to Islamic customs. Another problem was the lack of facilities for prayer at their place of work. Some stated that when they were single and worked shifts they had little time for religious observances. They had to be clean before each prayer and this was often difficult given the harsh conditions in the factories. Several examples were given to me of workers not being allowed to pray while they were at work, with managers showing little understanding of their religious obligations and refusing to make any concessions to their Muslim workers.

Facilities for communal prayer were also lacking until a house was purchased in Grange Road, Middlesbrough which was converted into a Mosque in 1962. Before that, prayer meetings took place in the houses where workers were living. A hall was hired for the celebration of *'īdu'-ẓ-ẓuhā* (the Feast of Sacrifice) marking the end of pilgrimage, and *'īdu'l-fitr* (the Feast of Breaking the Fast) marking the end of Ramadan. A Pakistan Association was set up in 1958 and one of its functions was to see that a mosque and burial ground be developed. Attempts were made to buy a number of houses, but often those available were of a row of terraces and planning permission for

a conversion to a mosque was refused. One local businessman stated that he organised a collection among the community to purchase a house, and was given permission to renovate it. A total of £1000 was collected to purchase the house on Grange Road. The house was refurbished and the central walls were removed on all floors to make one large room on each level. The ground floor was used for teaching the children and the upper room was arranged to serve as a permanent prayer room. The second mosque in Teesside was opened in Hartington Road, Stockton in 1971. Until that time Muslims in Stockton had to travel to Middlesbrough to the mosque in Grange Road (cf. Lawless 1995 and personal communication with a local *maulvī*).

By the mid 1970s the Grange Road mosque in Middlesbrough was due to be demolished under a clearance area compulsory purchase order. In 1974 the community therefore purchased a former Methodist Church in Waterloo Road and converted it into a new mosque. However, I was told by many people that the purchase of the Waterloo Road mosque caused serious rifts in the Pakistani Muslim community. According to press reports, a faction composed of mainly of non-Mirpuris, presumably Punjabis, claimed to have broken away from the Grange Road mosque committee and the Islamic Association in 1975 after differences about the way the Association was run. They maintained that it was their group who had bought the Waterloo Road mosque and operated it with their own money. During interviews, various people remembered the dispute and one Punjabi informant was keen to emphasise that it was Punjabi Muslims who had collected money for the new mosque, but that the Mirpuris later took over because they had become the majority group in Middlesbrough. In his opinion, the Mirpuris had few of the skills needed to run the mosque efficiently.

There seems little doubt that from the outset the mosque committee became an important arena for factionalism and political in-fighting within the Pakistani Muslim community in Middlesbrough. Similar factional disputes have emerged in other Pakistani communities elsewhere in Britain where the mosque has also been the most important political arena. Werbner, for example, drawing on her research into communal politics in Manchester, has argued that this intense and often volatile political in-fighting can in part be explained by the fact that

> the marked encapsulation of overseas Pakistanis in Britain, their remoteness from positions of status and honour within the wider British society, make positions within the community prizes of immense significance and worth competing for. A man's status derives from his internal positions, the offices he holds in key local Pakistani associations (1991:188-215).

Among Pakistanis in Manchester, Werbner found that local politics were inseparable from religious politics and that, in Pakistani communities throughout Britain, mosques were exerting a growing influence on communal affairs.

By the later 1980s a great deal had been achieved by way of increased religious institutionalisation. From the early Muslim Burial and Welfare Societies, several mosques had been established in the region and classes in Qur'ānic studies and Arabic were organised after school and at weekends for a growing number of Muslim children, with transport provided where necessary from their homes to the mosque. Unlike some of the major centres of Muslim settlement in Britain, such as Bradford and Manchester, which have attracted large-scale funding from wealthy Islamic states, religious institutions in Teesside have been principally from donations from ordinary Muslims living in the region. There had been a marked reassertion of religious identity and observance, especially among Pakistani Muslims, partly explained paradoxically by the region's economic decline (personal communication with *maulvīs* and various first-generation British Pakistani informants). When there was full employment, Muslim workers had little time for their religious duties, but after many were made redundant, the mosque, serving both as a place of worship and community centre, became an important refuge as they struggled to come to terms with the consequences of unemployment. One of my informants explained that mosque attendance was as much for the purposes of meeting members of their own community, talking in their own language and releasing tensions as it was for worship.

There is widespread concern that children of the community should receive religious instruction to ensure the continuation of Islamic practices and values among future generations of Muslims. In Pakistan it is the grandparents, I was told, who are responsible for many aspects of the religious education of children. But in Britain, grandparents are not always present and it was mentioned that parents often do not possess the necessary religious knowledge to impart to their children. Parents have supported the establishment, within the mosques, of *madarsas* (schools) in providing religious instruction.

For the Muslims of Teesside, as elsewhere in Britain, Islam has become a 'refuge from racism'. The mosque is 'Muslim space': a pure enclave in a hostile environment. It is a place where Muslims are treated with respect and esteem, where the value and dignity of the individual are recognised, in contrast to the external society, in which Muslims often feel discriminated against

and humiliated. Many informants spoke of the religious and racial attacks they experienced at work or in other public spaces.

Several researchers working among Pakistanis elsewhere in Britain have commented that as settlements became more permanent and men were joined by their wives and children, most opted to cherish and safeguard their own values and lifestyles rather than adopt British equivalents (Jeffery 1976, Shaw 2000: 316, Werbner 1990, Charsley 2003). There were, it was argued, good reasons for South Asians to retain their own 'traditional' values, in particular because of the migrants' belief that they would eventually return home to their village of origin.[5] A migrant was therefore encouraged to maintain strict conformity whilst abroad in order to ease his acceptance back into the community of origin when the time came. Strong emotional and physical links were maintained with Pakistan and the villages from which they had migrated. The reception which migrants received from British society, generally characterised by hostility and avoidance, was unlikely to encourage any deviation from adherence to traditional cultural standards and beliefs. Yet some scholars suggest that this eventual return is a myth rather than a genuine commitment (Anwar 1979). For instance, some researchers (Anwar 1979, Ballard 1994) have identified strong forces discouraging return and some have argued that the concept of return has become a convenient fiction to make life bearable in a racist society which rejects coloured migrants. The belief in eventual return is a useful crutch which helps migrants survive in a hostile society knowing that it must be endured 'for only a few more years'.

Ballard (1996) provides a 'rational actor' perspective on the morality of 'Asian communities'. At first, the labour migrants were sojourners who aimed to move back to South Asia when they had earned enough money. At that time, the communities consisted of males only, who put questions of morals and honour at bay. Then the sojourners became settlers, but in order to provide a suitable environment for the raising of children, morality was strengthened.

> All of a sudden conformity mattered...As conventional norms were re-established, deviance invited criticism and ridicule. Those who mimicked English ways too closely began to be accused of being *be-izzat* without honour...Since each settlement had become an arena within which honour could be sustained, life within it was transformed...From this perspective *izzat* emerges not as something fixed and permanent, but as a matter of relative standing which generates constant competition...It follows that as soon as competition for *izzat* takes off, there can be no escape: anyone who fails to play the game will by definition lose face (Ballard 1994: 15).

[5] The myth of return has male connotations to it, owing to the fact that the very first migrants were mainly Pakistani young men.

In Ballard's view, the reified morality is an effect of 'internal community matters'. *Izzat* is a value in Asian culture for which rational actors within this cultural universe compete. In contrast to this view, Parekh is more concerned about the wider British institutional factors. When members of minority cultures feel that their values are threatened by the majority, they will turn inwards and withdraw from dialogue. In his view, this was prevalent in the years of the new right- the Thatcher years of increasing nationalist assimilation, and it reached a climax at the time of the 'Rushdie affair'. Many Muslims felt powerless when the legislation protecting Christianity did not apply against what they saw as extreme blasphemy in *The Satanic Verses*. Again, the right to equal citizenship was felt not to include British Muslims (Parekh 1998:19).

2.5 Population, geographical distribution and socio-economic status

Recent surveys have suggested that Britain's Muslim population increased throughout the 1990s and the total number of Muslims in Britain is probably now about 2 million (Nielsen 1995:43). The largest group of British Muslims, South Asians predominantly of Pakistani and Bangladeshi origin, had grown from 640,000 in 1991 to around 1 million, an increase of 36 per cent (Nielsen 1995:43) There are also smaller but not insignificant numbers of Muslims of other nationalities: Algerians, Bosnians, Jordanians, Kurds, Lebanese, Mauritanians, nationals of the Gulf Emirates, Nigerians, Palestinians, Sudanese, Syrians, Tunisians (cf. Geaves 2000:137-59). In addition, it is estimated that the total number of British converts, many of whom are African-Carribeans, could be as high as 5,000. Muslim communities organized along ethnic lines are concentrated in different parts of Britain. According to the 1991 Census, more than half the Bangladeshis in Britain lived in Greater London (53 per cent), and nearly half of these (43 per cent) were resident in just one borough, Tower Hamlets. Large concentrations of Pakistanis exist in the industrial West Midlands, the 'mill towns' of Lancashire, Greater Manchester (cf. Geaves 2000) and West Yorkshire. In south-east England, Pakistanis are located in north-east and west London, Slough, Buckinghamshire and Oxford. Pakistanis form the majority of the Muslim population of Scotland (cf. Vertovec 1997; Modood et al.1997).

Teesside is claimed by the Middlesbrough Unitary Authority to be one of the few major industrial conurbations without a substantial 'Asian' or 'Afro-Caribbean' population (Lawless 1995). Its ethnic minority groups are relatively small, but although they come from several different countries they are overwhelmingly Pakistani and Muslim. The majority originate from Pakistan, Bangladesh and East Africa, mainly Kenya. There are smaller Muslim communities from Somalia, Yemen and Iran. The actual size of the Muslim population on Teesside has been the subject of some debate. Cleveland County Council Research and Intelligence (CCRI) estimated

that the 'Asian' population of Cleveland was 8,150 in 1981-1982 and that three-quarters of the adults recorded in their survey were Muslims born in Pakistan. Of these, some 60 per cent were Mirpuris and 40 per cent Punjabis (CCRI 1982 and 1991). Others (Tees Valley Joint Strategy Unit Report 2001) have claimed that 90 per cent of Cleveland's immigrant population is from Pakistan. In contrast to the Pakistani majority, other Muslim groups in the region are very small. Statistical reports suggest that the Bangladeshi community numbered some 150-200 people, with 100 Somalis and the 50 Yemenis (CCRI 1982).

The 2001 Tees Valley Joint Strategy Unit reported that some 7,400 of the non-white population in the sub-region were Pakistani (Tinkler: 2004:3). Several of my informants, however, argued strongly that official statistics greatly underestimate the size of the entire Pakistani Muslim community on Teesside. A community leader at one of the local mosques told me that, based on figures for mosque attendance and the number of children enrolled in Qur'ānic classes, the Muslim population on Teesside is more than 20,000.

Teesside's population tends to have a clear conceptual map of ethnic minority residential concentration in the area, with central Middlesbrough talked of (by British Pakistani residents themselves, English residents and health and social care professionals) as the main 'Asian' area. Although South Asian households are in fact found across Teesside (see Appendix 1), Middlesbrough has become a centre for Muslim and South Asian services, with food and clothes shops, mosques and community centres and a large Pakistani population. Teesside's Pakistani population derives largely from one particular area: the Punjab or Mirpur in Azad Kashmir. Most of those with whom I worked are Punjabi and some are from Mirpur. Hence, the term 'Pakistani' in this thesis should be understood to refer largely, but not exclusively, to Punjabis or Mirpuris.

The term 'community', or the Urdu/Punjabi phrases *ham log/apne log/hamāre log* (we people/ one's own people/our people), as used by my informants, has a variety of meanings in different contexts. Sometimes it refers to Pakistanis as a whole, sometimes only to those from a particular region, sometimes to the 'community' in England, or to only that in Middlesbrough. There are pan-Asian voluntary organisations, occasions on which Pakistanis, Bangladeshis, Somalis, White converts, and others may come together as Muslims, and countless other 'multi-ethnic alliances' and interactions among members of Teesside population (cf. Baumann 1996). Intermarriages are, however, far less frequent. In the context of the current discussion, I would argue that it makes sense to use the term 'Pakistani' to delineate a group in Teesside which, despite some diversity of

ethno-linguistic and socio-economic backgrounds, has many commonalities in the practice of kinship in the transnational context.

My informants include many whose families are from both villages and urban areas in Pakistan, but the majority are from Azad Kashmir District, a narrow strip of territory on the border of Pakistan. Regional differences among British Pakistanis are significant in terms of the structure of settlement in Britain. It has been noted how Mirpuris dominate Pakistani settlement in some areas, including Birmingham, Leeds and Bradford (Bolagnani, 2007), while people from the central Punjab areas, such as Faisalbad, reside mainly in Manchester (Werbner 1990) and Glasgow. The way in which British Pakistanis identify their regional differences are important in terms of socio-economic differences and marital patterns (cf. Ballard 1996 and Shaw 2001). It is therefore important to recognize that my study relates to a particular group of Pakistanis in Britain, which cuts across a variety a socio-economic and ethno-linguistic backgrounds, but should not be treated as representative of the British Pakistani population as a whole.

The economic decline of Teesside since the early 1970s and mounting redundancies have had a dramatic impact on all the Muslim communities living in the region. The 2001 Census Ethnic Minorities in the Tees Valley (local survey) suggests that there was a greater proportion of white people aged 16-74 years in full-time employment in the Tees Valley than South Asians in the same region and this was consistent with results regionally and nationally. These figures were also reflected at borough level, although there were differences. In Darlington, for example, a third of ethnic minorities of working age were in full-time employment, whereas in Middlesbrough less than one in five were. The report also confirms that the female ethnic population was significantly less economically active than the white population in the Tees Valley (Tedlock 2001: 17-19).

However, in a region with one of the highest rates of unemployment in the country (Lawless 1995, Teesside Census 2001), finding a job has become increasingly difficult for Pakistani workers both young and old. With so many unemployed and with so few vacancies, a growing number of Muslim Pakistani workers have joined the ranks of the long-term unemployed. Recent statistics on the socio-economic picture on Teesside reveals that the joblessness[6] rate in

[6] It should be noted that the number of jobless are simply the number of people of working age *not* in employment calculated as the unemployed plus the economically inactive. The report also highlights the fact that not all these people actually want work but that the figures indicate levels of economic activity (Middlesbrough Socio-Economic Picture 2001).

December 2001 was 32.27 per cent, higher than the National level of 27 per cent. This statistic however, does not include a breakdown showing how many members of the ethnic minority population are jobless or claim an unemployment benefit (Middlesbrough Socio-Economic Picture 2001).

2.6 Assimilation, integration or pluralisation

Political discourse on immigration and integration since the post-war years in Britain has had a significant influence on how the integration of first and second-generation British Asians has taken place. This discourse was in turn shaped by wider political perceptions of the legitimate basis of nation state and the rights of individuals, as well as the concept of 'culture'. Since the immigrants and their descendants participate in the same global discourses, these concepts are also shaping the way they think and act concerning their own integration.

In her macro study on citizenship and migration in Europe, Soysal looks at how the categorisation of migrants changed with the emergence of the nation state. Migration has always taken place, but the political incorporation of new members – i.e., how they were categorised – changed with the emergence of nationalism (Soysal 1994: 14). Soysal draws on the analyses of nationalism by Benedict Anderson (1983) to show how the concept of national citizenship after the French Revolution increasingly tied the individual to the state through bonds of dependence. The labour of individuals became a national resource and states started to invest in their citizens by means of education and welfare (Soysal 1994: 17). The exclusionary character of the national institutions created boundaries between states, which not only encumbered migration, but also made it consequential in new ways. In order not to challenge the new national citizenship, the migration that still took place had to be dealt with in new ways. Labour migration became seen as temporary, as exemplified by the guest-worker system (ibid: 21).

However, as we have seen, the south Asian 'sojourners' became settlers in Britain, a fate they shared with most other 'guest-workers' in Europe. Within this perspective, the immigration of culturally different 'others' was seen as a threat to the perceived cultural homogeneity of nationstates, as we saw above, and the immigrants had to be categorised as an inherently different category of outsiders.

Bauman (1990) writes that 'assimilation' provided the answer to the new 'intolerance of difference' and the 'drive to uniformity' of modern states (1990: 155-160). Individuals were invited to escape the stigma of the 'inferior-ised' categories. However, the dominant group, who issued the invitation, 'held complete control over the meaning of their conduct' (ibid: 159). As Bauman puts it, 'like the capacity of a bridge, would be measured by the quality of the weakest section' (ibid: 162), any member of a stigmatised community would be associated with the least 'progressive' part. As long as there exist 'weak sections', one is reminded of the assimilation process that has taken place, hence of the artificiality of the membership in the 'natural unity' as the nation perceives itself to be. According to the literature, the attractiveness of a South Asian Briton would not be judged equally with that of a white British person as long as 'Asian' was excluded from 'British-ness'.

In Britain, the general view after World War Two was that if the number of 'coloured' immigrants was kept low, they would assimilate, and problems would be avoided. Britain has neither the assimilationist and republican policies of France nor the American way of integrating newcomers into a common sense of citizenship, so how the integration of the culturally different people should take place was not given much public thought until the mid-1960s (Parekh 1998: 14). At that time, it had become clear from the widespread evidence of resentment and discrimination against non-whites that 'assimilation' would not happen by itself (ibid:13). Parekh distinguishes between three different models of integration, which have intermingled in Britain since then. Until the late 1970s, 'integration', preferred by the liberals, dominated. In the era of the new right and new racism, nationalist 'assimilation' took over. Full assimilation consisted in immigrants 'identifying' with Britain, cultivating 'love' for and 'loyalty' to its way of life, taking 'pride' in its history and abandoning their cultures in favour of the British national culture' (ibid: 16).

In addition to describing a misguided idea of one homogenous English culture, Parekh draws attention to what lies behind the demand for assimilation:

> It stems from intolerance of differences, and for the intolerant every difference is one too many and a source of intense unease. Even the thoroughly assimilated German Jews fared no better than the unassimilated ones at the hands of the Nazis (Parekh 2000: 7).

The idea behind 'integration' – or rather 'partway assimilation', as Parekh names the process – is that minorities should be assimilated into the public realm of a society, and live the way they like in private (ibid: 2).

Between Two Cultures, edited by Watson (1977) became a pivotal piece of work and an influential term for youth, health and social workers. According to Ballard (1994), however, the term 'between two cultures' never had an empirical base:

> It is [...] most unfortunate that an earlier and extremely influential compendium on the minority presence in Britain, James Watson's *Between Two Cultures*... used this phrase in its title. The term therefore appeared to have been given academic and analytical credence, even though none of the contributors to that volume made any further use of it (Ballard 1994: 30).

The heterogeneity of British South Asians has been obvious to social scientists for sometime (cf. Shaw 2001: 318). *Desh pardesh: the South Asian presence in Britain* (Ballard 1994), looks into how eleven ethnic communities draw on their distinct cultural resources from "back home" as well as entrepreneurial activity in the creation of homes away from home. The heterogeneity of such communities is a main theme in Baumann's (1996) monograph from the West London suburb, Southall. He spent many years on a 'community study' in the Punjabi dominated town. Baumann aims to challenge what he terms the dominant discourse concerning ethnic minorities. This discourse binds one 'culture' to each 'community'. It is reinforced in the local society through official multicultural policies, where resources are distributed on the basis of 'ethnic community'. Because public resources are scarce, people have to engage in this discourse in order to compete for them. It favours ethno-politics fronted by 'community leaders', and leaves no space for individual civic rights (ibid: 71). 'Sikh', 'Muslim', 'Hindu' and 'Afro-Caribbean' are the 'ethnic' categories which are equated with social groups, termed 'community' and designated with a reified culture.

In addition to the dominant discourse where 'culture' and 'community' are reified, the Southallians daily engage in 'making culture' by denying the congruence between 'community' and 'culture'. Baumann calls this the 'demotic' discourse. He sees this discourse as going in two directions. On the one hand, he finds some shared elements in Southallian culture. First, it is a poor area and the aim to move up socially means, for everybody, to move out of Southall (ibid: 43). The pivotal point in the making of a Southalli culture is, however, a result of the dual competence of the Southallians to engage in the two discourses. This competence turns 'culture' and 'community' into terms of contestation (ibid: 145). Bauman shows four ways in which this is done. The first is the 'discovery' (ibid: 157) of an Asian youth culture centred around the reinvention of the traditional Punjabi music, Bhangra. The second is a discussion among political

activists as to whether Asians should use the political category 'black' or not. The third is interfaith networks, where various faiths work together. The fourth is religious convergence, in the sense that many Sikhs and Hindus have, for instance, started to celebrate Christmas (ibid: 179). On the other hand, the Southallians share the 'ability to reinterpret heritage in the light of changing circumstances and goals' (ibid: 115).

However, Baumann writes that 'the dominant equation between *culture* and *community* is thrown into doubt and disengaged within the confines of each *community'* (ibid:109, see also p: 98). He shows that they do this by using the same cultural elements that he described as being part of the reified *cultures*. For instance, the Sikhs reinterpret class divisions in the idiom of castes. The Southalli Muslims come from so many different places, that it 'stands to reason that their shared adherence to Islam can hardly suffice to overcome their great cultural differences' (ibid: 124). He ends up equating 'community' with 'culture' and social group again, but accepts that the groups are slightly different - i.e., segmentary versions of the dominant, and that they do in fact share a culture. This culture is 'what anthropologists conceive culture to be in the first place: a process of making and remaking sense of collective changing social facts, rather than some reified possession' (ibid: 189). Baumann criticises the 'immigrant ethnic reductionism' which, he writes, reigned supreme in Britain in the early 1980s: agency is absent and culture is an imprisoning cocoon (ibid:1).

Almost 50 per cent of teenagers in Baumann's study had close friends of a different religion (ibid: 147). As the teenagers see themselves as a minority: 'they depend upon recognizing affinities across *community* boundaries...These affinities and alliances are forged in creative individual acts'. This should not be discounted as a youthful phenomenon only (ibid: 141), he writes, because adults forge similar individual bonds (ibid: 140). Such bonds forged between peers and neighbours are important and make all the difference to those who do not wish to move out and up.

Perhaps as a response to Baumann's title (*Contesting Culture: discourses of identity in multi-ethnic London*), Avtar Brah published her book on theories and politics of migration with the subtitle *Contesting identities* in the same year (1996). She emphasises the notion of intersectionality of identities, which she suggests is the way in which 'race', gender, class, sexuality and ethnicity intersect in individuals (ibid: 10). She argues that Baumann's community

approach is insufficient[7]. One cannot ignore the various positions of the informants and treat them merely as representatives of an ethnic category. In addition, Brah is concerned about what discourses do, as well as how they are shaped by power relations. Discourses shape how we experience the world (ibid: 11) and they must be seen in relation to the dominant order in society (ibid: 19).

In *Twelve Girls: growing up, ethnicity and excitement in a South London microculture*, Wulff inherits an interest a micro-culture from Fredrik Barth. In *Cosmologies in the making*, he describes how a tradition of knowledge is (re)produced and modified (1987). '[T]he events taking place in a tradition [are] incidents of the very processes that shape that tradition' (Barth 1987: 84). The reinterpretation is made by individuals deeply embedded in social relations as well as in practices of communication: '[T]he plausible sources and correlates of ideas, and the nature of coherence in a tradition, will differ under different conditions of existence of that tradition; and this can only be appreciated if the expressions which compose it are correctly depicted with regard to the social and communicative loci in which they occur' (ibid: 85). Cultural reproduction on whatever level must always be studied in micro-cultures because the contexts are of fundamental importance, according to Barth. As Wulff points out, the management of meaning - interpretation, negotiation and reformulation - goes on in small groups among people with inner lives of their own (1988: 27). The participants in these groups are intersectionally positioned, as Brah indicates, in all kinds of cultural flows and discourses. These discourses are of course not idiosyncratic, but shared with various collections of people. Therefore, in addition to studying what goes on in a micro-culture, the cultural flows and discourses also need to be taken into account.

In the beginning, I was looking for particular participants, since I was interested in finding people who merged 'South Asian' and 'British' elements in 'new ways'. Rattansi's work has provided important insights into these processes. He writes about this rapidity of the cultural transformations taking place among British Asians:

> There is obviously no singular description or analysis that can capture this vibrant phenomenon in some clever discursive totalization – witness the failure of suggestions that a specifically British Asian youth identity was finally coalescing around the culture of *bhangra* music as suggested by Gillespie (1995) and Baumann (1996) and comprehensively contested by Sharma and his coauthors (1996). Little wonder that such concepts such as hybridity have encountered severe limitations so soon after their celebration in cultural studies (Rattansi 2000: 129).

[7] Southall is treated as enclosed and arranged in an orderly manner homogenous community.

Rattansi writes about music and creative expressions in the tradition of cultural studies. What I find even more interesting than this is that *all* the British Asians I met, not only a 'creative avant-garde', took part in these cultural re-definitions in a number of ways.

2.7 Inter-generational Differences

From Ballard's perspective, second-generation British Pakistanis' behaviour could undermine the status of parents in the community. Shaw's (2000:163, 165-7) work discusses the way in which the *izzat* of British Pakistani families could be lost if children deviate from the norm, especially in the case of the behaviour of women:

> Traditional ideas about gender, sexuality and marriage do continue to influence the behaviour and attitudes of the majority of young Oxford Pakistanis, despite the experiences of being schooled or employed in Britain (ibid:166)

Indeed, one of the main obstacles for the more 'unconventional' members of the second-generation is the pressure exerted by these 'ethnicity niches' (Bauman 2000:171). The case studies presented in this thesis will highlight the dilemma faced by many first-generation parents. Whilst they retain many of the values with which they were raised, they find it hard to balance their children's upbringing between these values and the ones set by British society. Having children that appear to be too 'westernised' can be seen as a failure on their part. Cooper et al. (1999:87) suggest that although 'an individual family may accept certain behaviour, concern about how such behaviour would be judged within their Asian community and whether it would have a negative impact on their families' reputation will worry parents'. Moreover, gossiping is often seen as a coping strategy. In many British South Asian communities, gossiping is used by many members to divert attention away from the problems that their own children cause (cf. Bauman 2000:170-1).

'Code switching' is a common practice among second-generation British Pakistanis. Code switching is a term borrowed from linguistics. It is not a new phenomenon in anthropological literature. It means to alternate between one language, dialect or sociolect and another: between Punjabi and English for instance. Barth (1969) endorses this view, as he says people often play out different and inconsistent sides of their identity. From Roger Ballard's rational choice perspective, Asian parents maintain the asset *izzat* (honour) through turning a 'blind eye' to their children's code switching (Ballard 1994: 33). In this perspective, actors are not programmed by cultural values to act in a certain way, but instead they assess their situation rationally and opt for the choice with the best return. When the children are happy and do not undermine the authority

of their parents in public, a 'blind eye' might be the best strategy. For example, if the authority of the parents is not questioned or dishonoured then to turn a blind eye might be preferable. Ballard's view is that young British Asians are cultural navigators:

> Just because young British Asians do not follow a single given set of conventions, all cultural navigators must constantly decide how best to behave in any given context, while also finding some means of switching smoothly from one to the next...Cultures, like languages, are *codes*, which actors use to express themselves in a given context; and as the context changes, so do those with the requisite competence simply switch code...But problems may arise when one is *known* to have switched codes, and where behaviour in the second arena takes a form which is regarded as unacceptable from the perspective of the first...Hence if one can keep all the arenas in which one is an actor apart, so that information does not flow inappropriately and unexpectedly from one to the next, no problems will arise. When difficulties [do] occur, they are more likely to be a result of unexpected information leakage than of code-switching in itself (Ballard 1994: 31-2).

In his survey-based book, Anwar writes that British Asian girls are more reluctant to marry in the subcontinent than their male counterparts. This of course leaves a shortage of marriageable males in Britain (Anwar 1998: 111). Also, in a survey among young Asian girls and women carried out by Henning et al. (1999), the expectancy of an arranged marriage was found to be an important reason for young girls to conform to the norms of the community.

2.8 Summary

This chapter has attempted to illustrate how, during the 1950s and 1960s, in the first phase of post-war South Asian migration to Britain, kinship provided the dynamic for migration in the first place, as migration has been seen as of furthering the interests of the *birādarī*. I also explored how kinship reciprocities play a major role in facilitating almost every large-scale process of transnational migration, as well as in the process of ethnic colony construction. Marital practices, which involve the transfer of the bride out of her natal family and into that of her in-laws, play an important role in the lives of British Pakistanis. This practice sets up a network of affinal relationships between two corporate extended families. The *birādarī* is the basic building block in the migratory process and can be understood as the outcome of a complex and ever-changing admixture of individual and collective considerations.

Many observers assumed that Pakistanis would be assimilated into British society and adopt Western customs and values. However, as the latter part of this chapter has demonstrated, this was a simplistic assumption. Although there are constant dilemmas experienced by many first-generation parents, the younger generations do not adopt Western lifestyles and values. The ethnographic investigation which is described in this thesis reveals the constraints facing first,

second and third-generation British Pakistanis. As marriage is the perpetuation of the *birādarī*, I explore the deliberation, decisions and changing strategies of marriage arrangements.

In chapter three I will focus on the theoretical approaches of the thesis. I will concentrate on six core concepts and themes: ethnicity, diaspora, transnationalism, cosmopolitanism, kinship, habitus and gender relationships. The discussion will highlight the under-explored contribution of relatedness in diaspora among British Pakistanis.

Chapter Three

Theoretical Approach

3.1 Introduction

The aim of this chapter is to discuss the main theories and concepts which are relevant for the thesis. There are seven main themes and concepts that I will focus on: ethnicity, transnationalism, diaspora, cosmopolitanism, kinship, habitus and cultural navigators, and gender and migration. The principle reason for focusing on these theoretical perspectives is that they are most relevant to the key questions addressed by the study.

The order in which these theoretical concepts are presented here traces (to some extent) an historical trajectory, taking the reader from some earlier works in anthropology towards the more current theoretical ideas, in order to understand British Pakistani kinship practices. Thus, the chapter begins with a discussion of the ways in which ethnicity has been constructed in academia and public discourses. Many debates around the concept of ethnicity in Britain have centred upon ideas of assimilation and multiculturalism, which have profoundly influenced the lives of British Pakistanis. There then follows a discussion of the concept of transnationalism, which contrasts with some of the earlier ideas bound up with ethnicity that focus on multiculturalism and assimilation.

I then examine some of the recent writing on diasporas and cosmopolitanism, which has challenged the 'New Right' political rhetoric that emerged in Britain in the 1980s and which resulted in the marginalization of immigrants and their families through racialisation of difference. In contrast, the new body of work challenges the essentialism of much thinking about ethnicity and 'race' and celebrates difference through a focus on the construction of new ethnic identities. It argues that the global scale of an increasing proportion of economic relations, and the existence of transnational and transcontinental labour market flows in particular have contributed to the emergence of new hybrid identities (Appadurai 1990).

I go on to develop the concept of kinship and its changing nature within the discipline of anthropology. I argue that one needs to understand how the changing social and cultural conditions of migrants have produced innovative techniques of relation-making. Ballard (1994: 31) described young British South Asian as "competent cultural navigators" – a theme which I go on to explore in relation to the re-negotiation of the construction of kinship and social relations in

a diasporic context. I end this review with a discussion on the relationship between gender and migration, which will inform subsequent discussion of the ways in which British Pakistani women's lives have changed as a result of migration.

It is not my intention to present here a fixed theoretical framework which can be said to have guided my fieldwork and analysis of the empirical findings from the outset. As the methodology section will show, there was a two-way relationship between the empirical and the theoretical aspects of the study: that is, as the process of data collection and analysis progressed, I constantly reviewed the theoretical suppositions in the light of what was coming to the fore. Thus, the conclusions which I have reached on the basis of fieldwork, and which are presented in subsequent chapters, both follow from and feed into the theoretical concerns which are considered here.

To understand the meanings and implications of kinship practices for British Pakistanis in Teesside, we need to consider how these different theoretical notions are manifested for ordinary people. Although my main concern is with the micro level of the household and kinship, it is important not to produce a dichotomy between macro and micro transnational practices. As we shall see, the British state exerts an important influence over British Pakistani migration processes, kinship practices and rituals surrounding weddings and funerals.

3.1 Ethnicity

Broad classifications of ethnicity are typically used for data collection in a variety of studies and locations. For example, in the UK, we typically use categories derived from the 1991 Census classification (Black Caribbean, Black African, Black Other, Indian, Pakistani, Bangladeshi, Chinese, Other Asian, Other), though this is being replaced by a similar list derived from the 2001 Census. Much of the empirical and theoretical work on 'ethnicity/race' is rooted in a concern to expose and understand social inequalities, which has led to a research focus on the external process of identity definition, where identity is imposed on a minority/less powerful group by the majority/ more powerful. The focus has been, in particular, on how and why 'ethnicity/race' is used to signify the 'other' as different and how this allows the construction and maintenance of boundaries of exclusion and hierarchical relationships. Most commentators on such processes of signification have emphasised the role of physical characteristics and the ideological notion of 'race', although it is recognised that this process also involves the reification

of cultural characteristics (cf. Miles 1989, Miles 1996: 253 and Mason 1996: 201). This process allows claims of collective origin and designates ethnic/racial signifiers as natural (Miles 1996), so justifying the associated exclusion.

However, to understand fully the processes that underlie the formation of ethnic groups we must recognise that ethnic groups are formed not only by external labelling, but also as a consequence of individual agency. For example, Jenkins describes the 'internal definition', where individuals and groups define their own identity in addition to (and perhaps in response to) the 'external definition'. So, in addition to work that has focused on racism, 'race' and race relations, more recently there has been a growing emphasis on examining the ways in which ethnicity is also an identity, and an identity that reflects agency as well as structure. This being the case, it is argued that underlying the 'racist categorisation' imposed on ethnic minority groups are: 'real collectivities, common and distinctive forms of thinking and behaviour, of language, custom, religion and so on; not just modes of oppression but modes of being' (Modood 1996: 95). Jenkins' definition recognises how groups form boundaries of inclusion that provide a sense of identity and access to social resources, and where the relations between ethnic groups 'are not *necessarily* hierarchical, exploitative and conflictual' (Jenkins 1996: 71, emphasis added). Jenkins also describes identity as: 'two interacting but independent entailments: a name (the nominal) and an experience (the virtual)' (1994: 218). Defining *who is* a member and *what it is to be* a member of a particular social group involves the consolidation of the internal and external processes just described: the external imposition of a characterisation, for example, will affect the social experience of living with that identity and therefore the self-image of those so defined. The process of self-representation is such that what it means to have a particular identity will also vary according to the external audience: for example, whether such identification is seen positively or not. In this way, racist oppression can actually structure an individual's own identity, as well as affecting the way in which someone with that identity interacts with others.

Defining who we are, therefore, both by name and in experience, is dynamic, relatively ambiguous and will be heavily influenced by the wider society. Thus, while the emphasis may appear to be on internal factors (agency and the construction of identity), the structuring of identity by external social factors remains important. I argue that ethnic identity cannot be considered as fixed, because people develop and adapt and, as a result it is not an autonomous and static features in an individual's life. Cultural traditions are historically located, but they occur within particular contexts and change according to time, place and person. In addition,

ethnicity is only one element of identity, and its significance depends on the context within which the individual finds him/herself. For example, gender and class are also important, and in certain situations may be more important, aspects of identity than ethnicity (cf. Ahmad 1996).

The suggestion is, therefore, that there is a range of identities that come into play in different contexts and that identity should be regarded as neither secure nor coherent (Hall 1992). Thus, rather than being something innate and fixed, identity is something that is formed and transformed in relation to self-representation and reaction. Hall (1992) argues that central to this idea is the process of globalisation, which has had the effect of exposing and contesting the supposedly unified and trans-historical boundaries of national identities. The challenge of globalisation might then lead to a strengthening of local identities (including white or majority identities), and the revival of cultural traditionalism, perhaps in response to the experience of racism and exclusion.

Alternatively, globalisation might lead to the production of new hybrid identities, where identities are adapted or become incorporated with aspects of other (not necessarily ethnic) identities. Hall argues that migration means that people are 'obliged to come to terms with the new cultures they inhabit, without simply assimilating to them and losing their identities completely.' He continues

> They bear upon them the traces of the particular cultures, traditions, languages and histories by which they were shaped .. . [but] are irrevocably the product of several interlocking histories and cultures, belong at one and the same time to several 'homes'... people belonging to such *cultures of hybridity* have had to renounce the dream or ambition of rediscovering any kind of 'lost' cultural purity, or ethnic absolutism. They are irrevocably *translated.* (Hall 1992:310 emphasis in the original)

There is some distance between discussions of an ethnic identity that incorporates elements of hybridity or translation and discussions of 'acculturation'. While acculturation is a term that is often used to describe how minority groups adopt the values and behaviour of the dominant society (Palinkas and Pickwell 1995), it does not contain any sense of how the process of translation affects all cultures, including dominant ones. An example of the processes identified by Hall (1992) can be found in Jacobson's (1997) qualitative study of young British Pakistanis in London. She found (Muslim) religious identity to be more important for the self-definition of these young people than their status as 'Asian' or 'Pakistani', a distinction which stemmed from the perceived attachment of the ethnic label to a particular place of origin and to customs and traditions that were non-religious in origin, rather than to the 'purer', more universal, religious identity. This religious identity also suppressed the conflict between those who felt 'Pakistani' or

'Asian' in ancestry, but more 'at home' in Britain. The identities of these young people thus appeared to have been translated, with their traditional national identity to some extent transformed into one that incorporated their location in Britain. But this also appeared to involve a strengthening of their 'local' Muslim identities, perhaps as a form of resistance against racism and assimilation into the dominant culture.

Shaw (2000:289-90) has also commented that the use of the word ethnicity in both academia and popular discourses has undermined its 'analytical value'. Like Shaw, I suggest that the problem with the term arises when it is related to 'cultural' characteristics, including 'social structures, economic activities, religious beliefs, health beliefs, and so on'. Often people describe identity in terms of difference, making it 'difficult to disentangle which particular characteristics are salient, at any point in time, and which one changes' (ibid:290). The present study will therefore avoid the term ethnicity and instead demonstrate that British Pakistanis are a heterogeneous category (in terms of region, religion, class and caste), and that this influences their way of life in Britain and how they assimilate to Western values and norms. Shaw (2000) is cautious about using the term in her works and also argues that 'what characterizes a group of people and indeed what defines them as a group may alter over time as circumstances change' (ibid:290).

Related to discussions of hybrid identities is Hall's discussion of a 'cultural supermarket' (1992: 303). Here he describes our apparent ability to choose from a range of identities that we are confronted by:

> Within the discourse of global consumerism, differences and cultural distinctions which hitherto defined *identity* become reducible to a sort of international *lingua franca* or global currency into which all specific traditions and distinct identities can be translated. (Hall 1992: 303, emphasis in the original)

Thus, local identities can become translated and would appear to be accessible to all. However, while individual decisions about who we are and our lifestyle choices may appear to be unbounded, they are made within social constraints, what Bourdieu terms 'habitus'[8] (1977). Bourdieu argues that while social practice has some purpose and practical intent for the individual, these goals are located within an individual's own experience of reality, which is related to *who* and *what* they are and is therefore, at least partially, externally defined. His theory of habitus explores the influence on behaviour of symbolic representations which relate to the following:

[8] See the section on habitus, below.

> A whole body of wisdom, sayings, commonplaces, ethical precepts ('that's not for the likes of us') and, at a deeper level, the unconscious principles of the ethos which .. . determines 'reasonable' and 'unreasonable' conduct for every agent. (Bourdieu 1977: 77)

The only means of expanding this sphere of 'reasonable' behaviour is through increasing the number of lifestyle choices available. Access to potential lifestyle choices is through forms of 'capital', which are also delimited by social position. Attempts by social groups to define and appropriate their own lifestyle will thus be restrained and influenced by social structures, partly because of external constraints and partly, perhaps through the need to establish a lifestyle distinct from other 'local' identities (Smaje 1996). Therefore, while aspects of ethnic identity may be internally defined, the scope of those choices will be restricted and affected by external forces. Central to this idea is an identity that is rooted in and draws upon a particular cultural *context*, rather than a culture that is a construction of identity choices or discourses (Bader 2001).

In this way, while local identities may appear universally accessible, there will be (internally and externally imposed) constraints on access to them. One reaction to such external constraints may be for an ethnic group to develop a form of politicized identity. Ethnic identity, like gender and sexuality, has become politicised and for some people has become a primary focus of their politics. There is an ethnic assertiveness, arising out of the feelings of not being respected or lacking access to public space, consisting of counterposing 'positive' images against traditional or dominant stereotypes. It is a politics of projecting identities in order to challenge existing power relations; of seeking not just toleration for ethnic difference but also public acknowledgement, resources and representation. (Modood 1997: 290)

Indeed, Solomos (1998) has cogently argued that an ethnic identity is a political resource that can be used to further a (dominant or subordinate) group's interests. Here, ethnicity as identity could be construed as a new social movement, perhaps occurring in the vacuum produced by the disappearance of a class-based politics (Gilroy 1987). This idea of a 'racialised minority' led commentators in the 1970s and 1980s to use the term 'blackness' as a metaphor for the 'expression of a common experience of exclusion and of a common political identity forged through resistance to that exclusion' (Miles 1994: 7), although the temptation to adopt this term as a further means of essentialising diverse ethnic minority groups into an undifferentiated whole has led to its unpopularity among many commentators today (cf. Modood 1988). The suggestion that racial discrimination is a broadly similar experience and may have similar effects across

different ethnic minority groups, despite the fact that it may come in different guises, suggests one way in which the experience of racism may become part of an 'ethnic minority' identity.

3.2 Transnationalism

During the past decade, the concept of 'transnationalism' has entered the lexicon of migration scholars, embraced by those who are attracted to its attempt to capture the distinctive and characteristic features of the new immigrant communities that have developed in the advanced industrial nations at the core of the capitalist world system (Roberts 1995, Glick Schiller 1997, Vertovec 1999, Faist 2000, Urry 2000). The term has emerged and evolved at a time characterised by high levels of labour migration from economically less developed nations to the most developed and from high levels of political refugees seeing conflicts and instability in former communist and Third World nations (Castles and Miller 1993). The influx of new labour migrants and refugees is reshaping the ethnic mixes, not only of nations with long histories of immigration, the settler states of the United States, Canada and Australia, but also of states that have not been notable as immigrant receiving nations in the earlier phases of industrialisation, such as certain countries in Western Europe and, to a lesser extent, Japan. The high levels of migration, the new locales of settlement, changes in the nature of capitalist economies in a new industrial epoch, changes in the meaning and significance attached to the idea of citizenship, and the potency of a globalised popular culture have contributed to the conviction that what is novel about the present requires equally novel conceptual tools if we are to make sense of the impact of the new immigration on both the receiving and the sending countries.

However, as with other terms used in the study of immigration and ethnicity including the older concepts of assimilation and cultural pluralism that arose during an earlier period of mass immigration, this concept suffers from ambiguity as a result of competing definitions that fail to specify the temporal and spatial parameters of the term. Vertovec (1999: 449–56), who in his capacity as Director of the ESRC's Research Programme on Transnational Communities is an active promoter of the concept, points out several recurring themes that shape the ways the term is employed. He identifies six distinct, albeit potentially overlapping or intertwined, uses of the term: (1) as a social morphology focused on a new border spanning social formation; (2) as diasporic consciousness; (3) as a mode of cultural reproduction variously identified as syncretism, creolisation, bricolage, cultural translation, and hybridity; (4) as an avenue of capital for transnational corporations (TNCs), and in a smaller but significant way in the form of remittances sent by immigrants to family and friends in their homelands; (5) as a site of political engagement,

both in terms of homeland politics and the politics of homeland governments vis-à-vis their émigré communities, and in terms of the expanded role of international non-governmental organisations (NGOs) and (6) as a reconfiguration of the notion of place from an emphasis on the local to the translocal.

Transnationalism is used widely by anthropologists, sociologists, political scientists and geographers, the concept is mainly discussed in three ways: (1) the first articulated by anthropologists Nina Glick Schiller, Linda Basch, and Christina Szanton Blanc (1992, 1995; see also Basch, Glick Schiller and Szanton Blanc 1994 and Glick Schiller 1997); (2) as refined by sociologist Portes (1996a, 1996b, 1998, 1999a, 1999b, see also Portes, Guarnizo and Landolt 1999) and deployed by him and numerous colleagues in research on the second-generation and beyond (Portes 1995, Portes and Zhou 1999); and (3) according to the most rigorously systematic theoretical articulation of the term by political scientist Faist (1998, 2000). Here I will discuss the principle way in which transnationalism is discussed by anthropologists.

The focus of contemporary theories of transnationalism is on borders and the management of flows across them: of people, goods, objects and messages (Glick Schiller 1992). To a lesser extent it is also about the flows of ideas and practices. A key point distinguishing transnationalism from the old literature on migration is that literature on the latter tended to assume a one-way migration to the West. The newly emergent debates on migrant transnationalism acknowledge the importance of a reverse process around return, circulatory international migration and thus also a permanent condition of being a 'transmigrant', which means a migrant who moves back and forth between the West and the rest. In addition, Glick Schiller (1992:1) alleged that transnationalism is 'the process by which immigrants build social fields that link together their country of origin and their country of settlement'. Modern anthropologists, however, reject the analytic appropriateness of the term 'immigrant' because of the way it 'evokes images of permanent rupture', while the reality is that today 'immigrants develop networks, activities, patterns of living, and ideologies that span their home and the host society', and they instead refer to 'transmigrants' (Basch et al. 1994:3-4). The term 'transmigrants', according to these authors, refers to people living their lives across borders who are simultaneously incorporated in two or more societies. A significant theme in the literature concerning migrant transnationals is that of communication. In the global village, daily contact by telephone and email, low cost flights, mobile phones, video conferences and faxes, all make instant communication an experienced reality for transmigrants. Many of the migrants I met were

subject to pressures from people 'back home' in Pakistan and participated in joyful and sad events as though they lived in a neighbouring town.

Transnationalism has been defined as a multifaceted and multi-local process (Smith and Guarnizo 1999). A main concern guiding the following chapters is with discerning how this process influences social organisation at the local level. Although ethnographic works have highlighted how first-generation Pakistani immigrants are skilful handlers of economic capital, in terms of overseas remittances (Ballard 1994, Vertovec 1999 and Werbner 1990), rarely have they paid attention to the way agents actively shape their subjectivity in a transnational context. While the global cultural economy of people, products and ideas might be characterised by disjunctures (Appadurai 1990), regimes of consumption are hierarchised for many informants.

In her recent work on transnationalism in the Asia Pacific region, Ong (1999) employs the term transnationalism to describe 'the conditions of cultural interconnectedness and mobility across space - which have been intensified under late capitalism' (1999:4). She explores these global processes by placing cultural logics and human practices at the centre of her analysis. Ong's suggestions are as follows:

> while mobility and flexibility have long been part of the repertoire of human behaviour, under transnationality the new links between flexibility and the logics of displacement, on the one hand, and capital accumulation, on the other, have given new valence to such strategies of manoeuvring and positioning. Flexibility, migration, and relocations, instead of being coerced or resisted, have become practices to strive for rather than stability (1999:19).

For this reason, Ong adopts the language of transnationalism to analyse movements, their underpinnings and their effects and meanings, rather than that of globalisation, which, she argues, refers to 'the narrow sense of new corporate strategies' (1999:4). Ong's characterisation of transnationalism as a means to capture 'the *trans*versal, the *trans*actional, the *trans*lational, and the *trans*gressive aspects of contemporary behaviour and imagination that are incited, enabled and regulated by the changing logics of states and capitalism' (1999:4), is pertinent when examining the diverse transnational practices of British Pakistanis.

Mobility is a central charactersitic of transnationalism in the above definitions. The problem, however, with these various definitions, lies in their emphasis on the movement of bodies across space, the physical translocation of migrants across boundaries dividing two or more nationstates. These definitions are therefore too restrictive, since transnational social fields can be constructed and maintained without emigration, through, for example, the internet, tourism or in transnational

remittances. In the postmodern era of the twenty-first century, national boundaries are less significant for social analysis than they were previously. While this is well known with regard to the practices of transnational corporations (Ong 1999), the development and maintenance of social ties across borders is much less known and understood. Changing communication and transportation technologies, international migration and political changes have all been driving these transnational processes, but in some places they have increased dramatically, with some countries experiencing social transformation, as in many parts of South Asia, including Pakistan (cf. Ballard 2004). The various cases discussed in this thesis will illustrate that transnational flows of investment and people are made possible by and structured through households, family enterprises and shared habitus. Flows across borders include not only labour and capital, but also gifts, contributions to household expenses, obligations, and importantly, the import of new modes of consumption and desire.

The above discussion has shown that in the contemporary world a multitude of forms of relationships, exchange and mobility function intensively while being spread across the world. New technologies, such as televisions and computers, serve to connect such networks. In some cases transnational processes serve to speed up and intensify historical patterns of activity, while in others they represent new forms of human interaction. While transnational practices, and their consequent figurations of power, are influencing the world of the twenty-first century, it is necessary to provide ethnographic illustrations of their influence on reconfiguring practices of relatedness.

3.3 Diaspora

Anthropological concerns with diasporic processes are obvious to researchers in relation to questions concerning boundaries, space and mobility. In the first issue of the journal *Diaspora*, the editor, Tőlőyan (1991), states that the concept is related to a vast field of meanings, including global processes of de-territorialisation, transnational migration and 'cultural hybridity'.[9] It has also been alleged that the concept of diaspora has been rediscovered in order to be deployed in relation to theoretical work on the growth of new experiences and ideas of belongingness (Brah 1996, Gilroy 1993 Clifford 1994, Cohen 1997). One of the principal scholars who writes about diaspora is Cohen (1997). He has used diaspora the concept as a descriptive tool to explain

[9] In recent debates in the social sciences about the concept of 'ethnicity', some (Hall 1996) have chosen to use the term 'hybridity' to connote mixture, cross-over, ambivalence about peoplehood and constructedness of race and ethnicity that are particularly important to South Asian diasporas (cf. Werbner and Madood 1998). Terms such as these are praised for their openness and mutability, and they also signify forms and modes of expression.

migration and settlement in the global era. In contrast to its old usage, the word diaspora is used in contemporary work to refer either to a 'population category' or to a 'social condition' involving a specific type of 'consciousness' that is compatible with postmodernity and globalisation, embodying the globalising principle of transnationalism.

The concept of diaspora has become increasingly important to our understanding of South Asian migration and settlement processes in the modern era. Tőlőyan, argues that the purpose of the journal is to trace 'the struggles over and contradictions within ideas and practices of collective identity, of homeland and nation.' He explains the concept of diaspora in more detail as follows:

> *Diaspora* is concerned with the ways in which nations, real yet imagined communities, are fabulated, brought into being, made and unmade, in culture and politics, both on the land people call their own and in exile. (1991:3)

In this context, the concept of diaspora has acquired a new and theoretically challenging position. The notion implicitly denies the more 'rooted' forms of representation such as 'regions' and 'nations' and marks a general decline in 'locality' as a reference pointing to homeland and belongingness.

The concept of diaspora cannot be usefully limited to any single type of community or historical situation (Werbner 2002). Some researchers have nevertheless noted that a number of common denominators remain. Kokot et al. (2004) argue that in all periods 'a deep symbolic (and at times organizational) relation to the 'homeland' - be it an independent nation-state or set in [a] quasi mythological [distant] past - is maintained by reference to constructs of common language, history, culture and - central to many cases - to religion' (2004:3).

Cohen (1992) argues that the term diaspora indicates the experience of displacement, denoting a constant multiplicity of forms of origins and nationalities. Shukla (2000) suggests that the concept of diaspora resonates significantly with contemporary anthropological debates concerning continuity and change amongst the diverse South Asian de-territorialised groups. Shukla (2000) suggests that diaspora:

> illuminates...the apparent paradox of the amazing persistence of South Asian traditions and forms of expression around the world and the increased visibility of innovative renderings of national, regional, and religious identities under the sign of 'South Asianness', 'Indianness or even 'Islam'. Things stay the same and they change in South Asian as well as other diasporas. (2000:525)

Shukla's observations are interesting and important in terms of the biographies and images conveyed by the informants I interviewed. Throughout the thesis I will demonstrate the ways in which the flow of goods, ideas and people from England to Pakistan, Pakistan to Saudi Arabia or England to Saudi Arabia, unravel important categories of nationality, 'identity' and 'culture', which are often misleadingly portrayed as coherent and stable.

Appadurai's (1991:198-9) intriguing argument reveals that the globalisation of media technology has influenced the balance between lived experience and imagination, which may have shifted somewhat. Immigrants and their kin and/or neighbours living in Pakistan are more aware than ever before of other possible lives in which fantasy has become a significant feature. People living in Britain are therefore important mediators in terms of the transmission of these fantasies. This thesis will illustrate the way in which people in Pakistan act on such fantasies in different ways: some relatives living in Pakistan fantasise about living in Britain. For some informants, once the move has taken place, for instance from Pakistan to England, life in Pakistan then becomes another possible life.

The continuing relationships, both real and imagined, between 'home' and 'away', 'here' and 'there', 'homeland' and 'diaspora' form the major topic of the following chapters. The classic 'old' diasporas were the Jews, the Greeks and the Armenians (cf. Safran 1991. Schwalgin 2004, Kokot et al. 2004), people who lost or were driven from their ancient homelands and then came to reside in different lands as dispersed minorities, and yet continued both to dream and to plan someday to 'return home'. The Jewish diaspora has continued for more than two thousand years, and Armenians have lived in their diaspora for centuries. Gypsies should also be included in this list, since they have often been called 'wanderers' in their diaspora for many hundreds of years, as well as the black populations who, beginning in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, were brutally wrenched out of Africa and dispersed to different parts of the Americas (Kokot et al. 2004).

Today's 'new' diasporas are considerably different, more numerous and more scattered (Safran 1991). These new diasporas have emerged from the worldwide movements of millions of persons, which in turn have been caused by global inequalities, modern information and production technologies, powerful multinational corporations that frequently shift production across the world, as well as the more 'old-fashioned' reasons of famine and war. At another level, diasporas can also be seen to thrive in a world made up of nationstates: inasmuch as they practise

exclusivity. Nationstates relegate 'others' to long-term minority status at best, brutal elimination at worst. In his recent book, *Global Diasporas*, Cohen (1997) lists such diverse groups as Lebanese traders, English colonists in India and Australia, Palestinian refugees, and Japanese managers and technicians living abroad, as different types of 'new' diasporas.

3.4 Cosmopolitanism

As the term cosmopolitanism has been around for a long time, it has attracted many meanings and uses over the years. The multi-layered character of cosmopolitanism is complex, involving different theoretical interventions. The focus of the cosmopolitan perspective, in this thesis, is on the social or more intimate personal level, where individuals are able to articulate complex affiliations, meaningful attachments and multiple allegiances to issues, people, places and traditions that lie beyond the boundaries of their nationstates. Such a 'pluralisation' of political orientations is coexistent with the nation state's struggle to maintain a singular political identity in the face of globalisation. Multiculturalism has been one notion embodying both a kind of broad vision of society and often a set of specific policies, whereby both specific ethnic and religious identities could be maintained alongside a common national one. Nevertheless, multiculturalism has received wide criticism for resting upon and reproducing rigid notions of 'culture' and group belonging (Modood and Werbner 1997). In contrast to multiculturalism, cosmopolitanism is currently evoked to avoid the drawbacks of essentialism or an all-or-nothing understanding of identity issues within a nation state framework (Clifford 1998).

Cosmpolitanism is a controversial topic among social scientists in general. A recurrent criticism is that cosmopolitanism is only available to the elite: those who have the resources to travel and absorb other languages. This might be to some extent valid historically, where the majority of the population were living within their own nation or ethnic group, and where cosmopolitanism was not an option. However, in the contemporary era, the capacity to communicate with and understand others is potentially available to many. Travel and immigration mean that it is now common to meet people from a wide range of backgrounds in work settings or at street corners, as well as in markets, neighbourhoods, schools and recreational areas.

In a recent article, Werbner (1999) alleges that Hannerz is wrong to lump together 'migrants, settlers, exiles or refugees, the formative makers of diasporas, with tourists' (1999:17). Werbner argues that Hannerz divides professional-occupational transnational 'cultures' from refugee transnational 'cultures', which indicates a Eurocentric and class-bound assumption that

transnational 'cultures' are centred in the North and managed by high status professionals. As a result, Werbner argues, Hannerz's cosmopolitanism-transnational division is 'ambiguous', confusing class-based dimensions with a global theory of subjectivity. She therefore offers two case studies which demonstrate the possibility of working-class migrants becoming cosmopolitans (cf. Werbner 1999:18).

However, Hannerz (1990, 1996: 102-6) makes it clear in his discussions of cosmopolitanism that it 'becomes a matter of varieties and levels'; accompanied by a great variety in the mobility patterns of cosmopolitans. He carefully distinguishes the footlooseness, the 'willingness to engage with the Other', and the idiosyncratic assemblage of cultural sources and personal autonomy associated with this perspective, from the orientations of contemporary travellers (1996:102-6). He argues that the exile, in contrast, has involvement with another culture forced on him or her; his or her competence in his culture may be more a matter of reluctant necessity than embraced opportunity. And the labour migrant is also not likely to be a cosmopolitan; striving to keep the case of involvement with another culture as low as possible, he or she seeks to establish a 'surrogate home...with the help of compatriots, in whose circle one becomes encapsulated' (1996: 102). These distinctions are relative ones, descriptions of orientation rather than lifestyle per se. No one can be entirely open to new cultural stimuli, and anything other than the briefest of sojourns in new locales is likely to require some level of engagement with the 'Other'. After all, the syncretism, hybridity and creolisation which cultural theorists have often associated with contemporary mobility, despite frequently being over-exaggerated or fetishised, is not simply fanciful. Yet the distinctions Hannerz is attempting to draw between different orientations towards mobility and cultural engagement are nonetheless crucial ones that are all too often elided in a tendency to lump together refugees, immigrants, exiles, guestworkers, tourists and intellectuals as undifferentiated fellow travellers in a relentlessly mobile world (cf. Clifford 1992 and Appadurai 1990).

As Fabricant (1998) notes, the movement of these different categories of voyagers involves very different kinds of resources, can invoke harshly different receptions and present a range of opportunities increasingly polarised between privileged wanderers and the masses of poorer migrants. Hannerz himself notes that the cosmopolitan can *choose* to disengage from his or her culture of origin. While he or she may embrace an alien culture, he or she always knows where the exit is (1996:104), an option not available to all travellers. Fabricant suggests that the struggle to make oneself at home in the world is still relevant, in spite of the seemingly exhilarating

boundedlessness of the 'cosmopolitan diasporic space' (Chow cited in Fabricant 1998:27). I concur with Fabricant's critique, but in the following chapters I hope to demonstrate the different degrees of cosmopolitanism that exist amongst the British Pakistanis I worked with. As the first-generation of Pakistani men migrated to Britain for work during the 1960s, they provided routes for relatives and goods, and opportunities for travel. I argue that the movement of these migrants entails reconfigurations of meanings about relatedness and subjectivity. As families are dispersed across the globe, there are continuous negotiations of meanings, values and symbolic forms going on, involving those living in Pakistan and Britain. Parents and grandparents revealed their intense concerns about and experiences of discontinuity and rupture. The negotiation they engage in, with their children, is influenced by the implication of the meanings, values and symbolic forms associated in the participants' minds with particular kin, events and settings. The negotiation can also be between those who have migrated and those in Pakistan, between husbands and wives or between parents and children. When so-called 'loved ones' turn out to be an 'other' this entails dramatic clashes involving ideas about transnational subjectivity.

In the contemporary age of transnational flows, diasporic attachment and multiple affiliations it can be difficult to locate the 'substance' of cosmopolitanism. Clearly the desire for elements of otherness or dealing with others in itself does not indicate a deep sense of cosmopolitanism. Following Hannerz (1990, 1996), I therefore suggest that there are different degrees of cosmopolitanism and that merely mobile people, such as tourists and transnational employees, should not necessarily be labelled cosmopolitans. The 'true' cosmopolitan, Hannerz claims, exhibits an open disposition and interest in a continuous engagement with the other. The other category, Hannerz explains, want some experience of 'home plus' - a bit of exoticism when going abroad. Tomlinson (1999) says that in addition to this, the real cosmopolitan needs to have a sense of commitment to belonging to the world as a whole.

Despite attempting to draw boundaries between 'real' and 'fake' cosmopolitans, I suggest that there exists a wide variety of expressions of cosmopolitan behaviour among non-elites. The very early migrants or some of the older generations discussed in this thesis are primarily transnationals, living to some degree in encapsulated surroundings in the worlds to which they have travelled, but the thesis will show that some of these migrants are able to gain knowledge and familiarity with the 'other'. In the initial phase of immigrant settlement, the social interaction between immigrants and the indigenous population is minimal and mainly confined to the mechanics of finding work and shelter. Most immigrants to Teesside are not fluent English

speakers and this creates major obstacles inhibiting everyday interaction. In family interviews, immigrants emphasised repeatedly the stress associated with this period of isolation from mainstream society. Few have sufficient experience of the 'host' society and the luxury of time needed to evaluate the reception they receive. Most rely on local social in-group institutions and many are also nurtured by extensive transnational networks. Cosmopolitanism, in an active sense, occurs rarely among these immigrants, given the struggle for survival and communication barriers. Some grandparents can typically be characterised as 'labour migrants': going away from Pakistan and migrating to England is ideally 'home plus income' for them. Involvement with the indigenous population is described as a necessary cost, while among the population a surrogate home is created with the help of compatriots, in whose circle one becomes encapsulated (Hannerz 1996:54).

I argue that cosmopolitanism among some immigrants should be viewed as a process where there is a shift from in-group to cosmopolitan interaction. Interacting with 'others', including *gore*, Arabs and Bangladeshis, I was told, depends to a large degree on the attitudes and behaviour of the 'host' society. As mentioned, immigrants spend little time thinking about how to associate with 'others' when they initially arrive, but reflect on this question more and more as time passes. During group and family interviews the feeling was generally expressed that children integrate quickly and build friendship networks that span ethnic and religious boundaries. When asked about her experience of living in England, a Pakistani-born woman mused that she used to feel that the English were 'distant' and 'obsessed with performing their jobs' and other activities. However, as the pace of her life has increased, she realises she has fallen into the same behavioural pattern. She commented on how her extended family in Pakistan have begun to criticise her obsession with work and earning money. The issues of the reception and sociability offered by diverse British Pakistani neighbourhoods provide an interesting area for a study of the reconfiguration and fostering of new forms of relatedness.

3.5 Kinship and Relatedness among British Pakistanis

For many decades the study of 'kinship' has been one of the most distinctive theoretical orientations of social anthropology. It has, however, undergone radical reinventions and is currently in the midst of a revival entailing important reconfigurations within a range of sites - from rural Malaysia (Carsten 2003) to new reproductive technologies (NRTs) in fertility clinics. The novel contexts of kinship theory and the new locations where kinship theory is being deployed have encouraged anthropologists to scrutinise age-old questions, including the

fundamental question 'What is kinship all about?' (Peletz 1995). There is no doubt that 'kinship' remains a contested analytical concept (Strathern 1992), although anthropologists claim it to be a useful epistemic device (Franklin and McKinnon 2001). Franklin and McKinnon assert that using the concept 'kinship' helps us not only to engage with debates concerning what 'kinship' is all about, but also to describe wider changes within anthropology (2001:3).

In the past, anthropologists have seen the distinction between 'social' and 'biological' kinship as fundamental to an analytical understanding of this domain. For the most part, social anthropologists confined their efforts to understanding the 'social' aspects of kinship, setting aside the pre-given and biological as falling outside their expertise. But increasingly this separation, which is central to Western folk understandings of kinship, has itself come under scrutiny (Strathern 1992). This shift is partly the result of technological developments and the public concerns they engender. Certainly, many people are confronted in their daily lives and in media representations by some apparently unfamiliar kinds of kinship – not just broken or reconstituted families, but a new world of possibilities engendered by technological interventions (Franklin 1997).

Carsten (2004) argues that to a certain extent, because mid-twentieth century debates about kinship in anthropology became removed from the most obvious aspects of actual lived experiences of kinship, kinship as a sub-discipline became increasingly marginal to anthropology through the 1970s and 1980s (2004: 8). Anthropological interpretations all too often failed to capture what made kinship such a vivid and important aspect of the experiences of those whose lives were being described. In this era, studies of kinship gave way to studies that focused on power and hegemony or on gender.

In this thesis, I place the close, intimate and emotional work of kinship beside the larger projects of transnational and diasporic lives. The lived experience often seems too mundane or too obvious to be worthy of close scrutiny, but the illustrations I use make clear that kinship is far from being the realm of the 'given' as opposed to the 'made'. I argue that creativity is not only central to kinship conceived in its broadest sense, but that for most people kinship constitutes one of the most important arenas for their creative energy (Faubion 2001).

As will be seen in the later chapters, the new hybrids often associated with global culture (Werbner and Modood 1999, Werbner 2004) were visible among the British Pakistanis I met, in a

decreasing emphasis on 'traditional' forms of kinship and an increasing reliance on non-kin (friends, fellow villagers and work associates) in the diasporic context. The changing social and cultural conditions of migrants have produced innovative techniques of relation making. Given the fluidity of what might count as kinship for British Pakistanis, it becomes imburātive to examine the processes through which potential kinship ties are both assembled and disassembled. This thesis will provide important contributions to understanding the mechanisms by which possible lines of relation are brought into being or erased, by foregrounding various connections. In the social process of kinning (particularly during childlessness), I offer an alternative reading of the tensions between various strategies of creating kinship ties by illustrating how British Pakistanis move between contradictory explanatory frameworks that transform non-biological relations into biological relations, which stress social nurturance and biologise culture as a form of heredity.

Changes in both customary property relations and the introduction of a commercial economy in Britain have introduced new forms of practices of relatedness among some Pakistani immigrants, which, on the one hand, foreground more egalitarian links between friends, affines, fellow villagers and religious associates. This finding reflects on migration and the projects of transformation experienced by British Pakistanis (cf. Gardner and Osella 2004). On the other hand, immigration has also involved backgrounding more traditional, hierarchical relationships. For instance, the ongoing process of commercialisation has created more latitude and instrumentality for individuals to manoevure in dealing with interpersonal relations. Commodity production and market-related activities rely almost exclusively on kinship ties. The number of one's outside connections and friendships has become an obvious sign of social capital for some British Pakistanis. I demonstrate the way in which examining kinship patterns among first and second-generation British Pakistanis has altered the inter-generational flows of resources (inheritance, property) and sociality within newly flexible urban families. The flexibility of relationships among second and third-generation British Pakistanis reveals an increased emphasis on individual choice, which can cause conflicts among the wider *birādarī*. As Yan (2001) explains, it is not simply that kinship must always be created, negotiated, and brought into practice. Yan (2001) and Carsten (2000) demonstrate that the lines between kinship and other forms of relationality are fluid. Similarly, I reveal the way in which friends, villagers, religious associates, ethnic 'others' and strangers can be made into kin, among British Pakistanis, while on the other hand, fathers, mothers and patrilineal relations can be made into strangers.

Kinship systems have been theorised as classificatory systems, which are mobilised to signify kinds of connection and inclusion, as well as specific types of disconnection and exclusion. As relations of power are central to the articulation of such classificatory boundaries and movements, kinship is also deployed to articulate the possibilities for social relations of equality, hierarchy, amity (Fortes 1969, Ballard 2004), ambivalence and violence (Das 1995). Haraway (1997) argues that kinship constitutes 'a technology for producing the material and semiotic effect of natural kinship, of shared kind'. Yet Strathern (1992: 16-17) considers that kinship's naturalising function is two-way, suggesting that for Euro-Americans it is a 'hybrid' between nature and culture, biology and society. From Haraway's (1997) and Strathern's (1992) points, kinship appears to be a cultural technology used not only for designing relationships, but at the same time, for transforming natural relations into cultural forms. Kinship therefore works in both directions, moving back and forth between what counts as given (natural) and created (cultural).

In the Euro-American tradition, culture is configured 'after nature', as something added to transform nature (Strathern 1992). I will discuss the concept of kinning among British Pakistanis, which indicates that during their quest for a child, would-be parents attempt to naturalise (biologise) relationships out of different modes of relatedness. This attempt is explored in the way biological facts are transformed in the context of transnational adoption and making relations. I use the term 'kinning' to describe an active process, and specifically explore how informants use concepts employed in the 'kinning process' (Howell 2003) and use the symbolising of bodies and personalities in attempts to create meaningful resemblances between themselves and their children. The aim of British Pakistanis is to embed the child into their kin group, and one way to achieve this is by talking about the child in a recognisable kin idiom

As ideologies of kinship become embedded in and signify relations of power that draw on lines of hierarchy and exclusion, they also bring about relations of dominance and subordination. While these relations are central to kinship as 'amity' (Fortes 1967) or 'diffuse enduring solidarity' (Schneider 1984), the focus on kinship as a form of connection has led to the neglect of its important constitution out of acts of disconnection or rupture. In chapters 5 and 7 I consider these themes, highlighting the way in which relatedness becomes a signifier of the power relations, inclusions and exclusions that are definitive of religious faith and community. Ambivalence and relatedness are important avenues through which to understand the complex kinship relations in the diasporic context of British Pakistanis. Peletz (2001) suggests that ambivalence produces insights into the nature of kinship as it is shaped by the tensions and contradictions inherent in

different relations of power and resistance, individual agency and diverse rights, demands and obligations.

The attention to ambivalence and emotional valences offers a different perspective on the practices of relatedness among British Pakistanis. In anthropology it was Evans-Pritchard's (1940) work among the Nuer that recognised the double-edged nature of kinship ties. He noted that kinship as a moral system cuts both ways, and this stems partly from the fact that kinship involves moral entailments in the form of expectations and obligations that are often onerous and difficult to meet. Evans-Pritchard also brought to light the fact that fulfilling these expectations and obligations brings little guarantee of the diffuse (or otherwise) reciprocity or solidarity that is frequently inscribed in kinship. I observed that ambivalence is a highly relevant feature among the British Pakistanis I worked with. On the one hand, brother and sisterhood are pertinent themes in the social conduct among informants, especially in relation to Islamic religious discourses. These themes are evident in the descriptions of the particular social practices in which British Pakistanis engage when they unite for local events. On the other hand, there also exist crucial differences in terms of caste and social status, which gives us an insight into practices that indicate certain rivalries and hostilities intrinsically built into close relationships. This reveals the other side of kinship relations: that is, in practice, kinship relations are actually a set of rather flexible interpersonal relations negotiated by individual agents in response to social changes that occur through migration.

Although the older generations of British Pakistanis might be considered as 'guardians of continuity' who attempt to continue their 'traditional' habits in the diasporic context, the narratives presented in this thesis demonstrate how the *doxic* (Bourdieu 1977) premises of the social organisation of meanings are challenged and the very assumptions of relatedness are thrown into self-conscious relief. The meanings are at risk of becoming reinterpreted, reorganised, and in some contexts, even rejected. I argue that the process of multiplicity entails a consciousness of participating in multiple, discrepant universes of discourses. People select particular elements, styles and explicit materials (rituals/beliefs) and invest them with particular meanings in concrete life circumstances. The 'other' cannot any longer be treated as inert; instead a mutual interrogation is possible.

Like Hannerz, others have also commented on the importance of local daily life in the organisation, production and transmission of tradition (Appadurai 1990, 1996). What is

significant in Hannerz's approach regarding the mixture between local and global 'cultural' flows and elements, is his argument regarding how the local is the space 'in which a variety of influences come together, acted and perhaps in a unique combination, under these special conditions' (Hannerz 1996:27). This thesis takes this approach and explores the local in daily life, which Hannerz calls the 'form-of-life-frame'. This frame includes the daily activities of British Pakistanis in their household, workplace and neighbourhood and daily face-to-face relations with other people they are closely connected to people, and daily uses of symbolic form. Hannerz says these are, in brief, elements 'which we largely take for granted as part of local life' (ibid: 28). What interests me is how we see the circulation of meanings between participants in local life, and in this regard Hannerz writes: 'It is by way of people's attentions to one another in situations within the form-of-life frame...that meanings are most continuously and precisely constructed' (1996:73).

However, Hannerz also refers to the state, movement and the market as other frames that interrelate with the form-of-life-frame. In relation to this thesis, it is important to point out that many British Pakistanis are directly and indirectly implicated in the processes of ordinary meetings and mingling. An inflow of new knowledge about different aspects of their social life involves filtration by local experiences, which allow acceptance, refusal, interpretations and transformation of actions and forms: for instance, gender relations and work opportunities, *kameṭī* (rotating credit systems) financial strategies, obligations and ancestral land. The familial context, a place identified by British Pakistanis as crucial for the reproduction and transmission of 'tradition', is very closely linked to external influences of globalisation. The trans-generational continuity of attitudes, representation and desires is being increasingly undermined by the processes of globalisation.

3.6 Habitus and Cultural Navigators

Hannerz's theoretical insights into the everyday life of habitats of meaning, in my opinion, resembles Bourdieu's conception of habitus. Bourdieu defines habitus as 'a system of durable, transposable dispositions, structured structures predisposed to function as structuring structures.' (1977:72).

The habitus is both a set of principles that help generate, and 'structuring practices' that are regulated by some objective structures. In a way, then, the habitus is a sort of mediation in Bourdieu's theory of practice: it helps to mediate between objectivism and subjectivism. The way we understand the world, our beliefs and values, Bourdieu alleges, are always constructed

through the habitus, rather than passively recorded. He assumes that we are disposed towards certain attitudes, values or ways of behaving because of the influence exerted by the socialisation process.

As Hannerz points out, globalisation generally refers to the 'matter of increasing long-distance interconnectedness, at least across national boundaries, preferably between continents as well' (1996:17). The connections across borders include a re-structuration of spaces. A growing process of deterretorialisation, and the disappearance of the fixed links of human beings in towns and villages, and according to national frontiers is evident. The life-spaces, activities and social links of individuals and societies are larger than national frontiers. These forces and processes of globalisation therefore influence the habitus of British Pakistanis. Instead of having stable identities, people have to 'make do' with whatever is at hand (Appadurai 1990:18). This means that, British Pakistanis are distanced from the 'official' cultural texts and their meanings. This is merely because, in a globalised world, what is understood as normal or *doxic* is always subject to rapid challenge and change.

As a result of globalisation processes assisted by, for instance, the mass media, numerous possible lifestyles are identified by and presented in local settings. They represent ideas which allow the construction of fantasies and perspectives that are not the same as traditional Pakistani representations of lifestyles. What is important here is that while many have argued that Bourdieu's conception is deterministic (Jenkins 1990 and Webb 2002), the habitus is always constituted in moments of practice. It is always 'of the moment', brought out when a set of dispositions meets a particular problem, choice or context in everyday life. In other words, it can be understood as a 'feel for the game'. Among the younger generation of Pakistanis I interviewed it was revealed how they were able to improvise from a number of alternative kinds of consciousness, which they had accumulated through their participation in British schools and religious institutions. They use situationally competent action and generate new practices, thus forming a repertoire that is made up of complex backgrounds and multiple traditions.

According to Bourdieu's understanding, habitus operates, at least partly, on an unconscious level (Bourdieu 1977 and Webb et al. 2001). But this does not mean that these practices are arbitrary and unmotivated, and that we act out of disinterestedness. I would therefore suggest that when migrants arrive in Britain, as a result of people's attention to one another in situations within the form-of-life frame, meanings are continuously constructed. Depending on who they associate

with, for instance whether with other Muslim Pakistanis or with people of other *qaum* (caste) categories, patterns of social inclusion and exclusion influence interaction and attention structures. The degree of acquaintance and familiarity with various notions of relatedness, differs according to the traditional repertoire and knowledge of each individual.

While acknowledging that some practices may reinforce boundaries, the findings in this thesis suggest that the situation is not clear cut and becomes even less so. Rather than being individuals with a fixed sense of belonging to this group or that, or feeling comfortable in only one type of cultural situation, it became clear that, in general, the children I was working with could move unselfconsciously from one milieu to another. Cultural competence and improvisation are core features of Bourdieu's notion of habitus: the non-conscious set of dispositions and classificatory schemes that people gain through experience, which provides a kind of repertoire for situationally competent action, improvisation and the generation of new practices. Bourdieu describes habitus as something historically patterned yet open to adjustment in relation to the changing conditions of the social field. This adjustment occurs when the narratives, values and explanations of a habitus no longer make sense in the diasporic context, and when agents use their understanding and feel for the rules of the game as a way of furthering and improving their own standing and capital. It is a concept particularly useful for approaching the subject of agency in diasporic cultural practice and reproduction. Appadurai (1991) agrees, yet he believes we must re-work the concept with reference to 'a general change in the global conditions of life-worlds: put simply, where once improvisation was snatched out of the global undertow of habitus, habitus now has to be painstakingly reinforced in the face of life-worlds that are frequently in flux' (1991:200). Thus, these contexts are permeated by the competences, beliefs and values acquired through religion or interaction with the *gore* (white).

Ballard claims that, in the same way that linguists have proved that bi-or multi-lingualism does not cause psychological confusion in individuals, neither should this be said of multiculturalism. He proposes the term 'skilled cultural navigators' as being a more fitting term, perceives this 'navigation' as a kind of 'code switching' among various contexts (ibid p. 31). This understanding has gained influence recently in academic discourse as well as among second-generation immigrants themselves. In 'Cosmopolitans and Locals in World Culture', Hannerz (1990) describes cosmopolitans as being similar to skilled cultural navigators.
'[C]osmopolitanism is a perspective, [..] a mode of managing meaning,' he writes (ibid p. 238).

> [It] includes a stance toward diversity itself, toward the coexistence of cultures in the individual experience [..], a willingness to engage with the Other. At the same time,

> however, cosmopolitanism can be a matter of competence, and competence of both a generalized and a more specialized kind. There is the aspect of a state of readiness, a personal ability to make one's way into other cultures (ibid p. 239).

I find this description very accurate in relation to the British Asians I met. However, Hannerz also says the 'perspective of the cosmopolitan must entail relationships to a plurality of cultures understood as distinctive entities' (ibid p. 239), and this does not seem to hold true. I will now return to Ballard, and quote his use of the term 'skilled cultural navigators' in full length in order to make my point clear.

> Just because [young British Asians] do not follow a single given set of conventions, all cultural navigators must constantly decide how best to behave in any given context, while also finding some means of switching smoothly from one to the next. [..]. Cultures, like languages, are *codes*, which actors use to express themselves in a given context; and as the context changes, so do those with the requisite competence simply switch code. [..] But problems may arise when one is *known* to have switched codes, and where behaviour in the second arena takes a form which is regarded as unacceptable from the perspective of the first. [..]. Hence if one can keep all the arenas in which one is an actor apart, so that information does not flow inappropriately and unexpectedly from one to the next, no problems will arise. When difficulties do occur, they are more likely to be a result of unexpected information leakage than of code-switching in itself (Ballard 1996: 31-2).

In my view, Ballard provides a key to the dispute about the distinctness of the arenas or cultures. He makes the point that code-switching takes place more often among members of excluded and devalued groups (Ballard 1996:31). Dilemmas of code-switching occur not because 'the value-premises' are different, 'but rather because each side has such a markedly negative perception of the other' (Ballard 1996: 32). I fully endorse the view that people play out different and often inconsistent sides of their identities in different arenas.

However, my aim is to show that there is a strong urge to reconcile the major discrepancies in most people's lives. Many of the respondents in this thesis concealed things from parents so as not to taint the image that was held of them. This in itself underlines an important fact: although all of my informants' parents had different world views from their parents, the values instilled in informants during socialisation kept them loyal to their culture at the same time. It was loyalty that motivated them to hide certain things from their parents. Considering this in the light of Parekh's '*Prima facie*', many young British Asians are defensive and fiercely proud of their heritage. Parekh refers to this as 'a loyalty to a way of life including its values, ideals and system of meaning and significance and moral and spiritual sensibilities' (2000:159).

3.7 Gender and Migration

Existing theories of migration and the socio-historical narratives they produce have failed adequately to take account of the dynamics of gender, despite the fact that gender is increasingly acknowledged to be a crucial factor in theories of migration (Pessar and Mahler 2003, Phizacklea 2004, Bauer and Thompson 2004). The fact that gender has not yet been fully incorporated into the framework of migration theory has meant that most empirical accounts of the migration process continue to ignore it in practice. As has been the case more generally in the disciplines of History (Ditz 2004) and Sociology (Milkman and Townsley 1994) respectively, the gendered particularity of actors, networks, institutions and cultures of migration is seldom discussed.

Although feminist interventions have brought about a significant redress of this imbalance in academic literature on migration by highlighting the experiences of women, the importance of female migration has, for the most part, been treated adjunctively. To study gender, in other words, has meant studying women in isolation, rather than in conjunction with the processes which produce and reflect the social relations of power between men and women (Pessar and Mahler, 2003). The study of gender can include the very construction of ideas about sexual difference, the implications of which are far-reaching: migration is likely to alter and contribute to the meaning of gender in profound ways that we have so far largely ignored. The striking absence of studies that deal with the construction and performance of masculinity in the migration process, is testament to this fact, and represents a shortcoming in the literature that this thesis seeks to address, in the context of the Pakistani migration to the West.

It is crucial, in this context, to understand that gendered identifications and practices are produced and performed *relationally*, in opposition to and in interaction with the multiplicity of others that given subjects encounter. Failure to understand this may lead to a reification of the boundaries of their existence by isolating that existence from the existence of groups most commonly presumed to be furthest ontologically from their experience – above all, women and occidentals. Post-colonial theory has, of course, gone some way towards providing a gender-sensitive framework for unpacking the real and imagined historical relationships between the Western male self and alterity that routinely emerged in and shaped colonial encounters (Sinha, 1999, Stoler, 1995).

Comparisons between the experience of men and that of women, according to Ditz, are equally important in studies of masculinity, in order to prevent the occlusion of women (Ditz 2004: 17). Even for men, however, self-improvement in rural Pakistan is viewed primarily through the prism

of honour and status through the possession of material wealth acquired in the migration process rather than on the basis of education, which is seen as simply a means to an end (Lefebvre 1990).

This thesis will demonstrate that migration has brought challenges to gender relations, and to traditional forms of masculinity, while unmarried women have been able to negotiate their marriage prospects. For some women I met there was a redefinition of motherhood, while earning money away from home out of love for their children. The gendered nature of migration is important in contemporary ethnographies (cf. Gardner 1995, 2002). The invisibility of women's migration, often mistakenly described as primarily social (women do not usually migrate independently) and subject to men's economic migration (men migrate to exploit economic opportunities) has been challenged by some anthropologists (Werbner 1990, Shaw 2000) who illustrate that the migration and non-migration of women married to town-employed men has economic as well as domestic significance. This thesis will illustrate that shifting the focus onto women's work and the household, women's household work from paid employment to the servicing of networks, including maintaining economic and social links with places of origin, is central to the success of migrant households' social mobility strategies. Women clearly play an increasingly important role in the remittance economy. Some British Pakistani first-generation women have to rely on their own resources to run the household, to invest remittances and to make decisions abut their children's education. I suggest that these women have been able to operate successfully in the new social and economic spaces. For some, migration, has allowed them to renegotiate and even challenge existing gender relations.

Conclusion

This chapter has attempted to provide an overview of the theoretical perspective of this thesis. I have explored seven key themes that will be discussed in relation to the empirical material presented below. I contend that, in order to understand kinship practices of British Pakistanis, it is crucial to recognise the continuing importance of their relationship to a wider diasporic Pakistani/South Asian culture. I have thus given priority to these central concepts. I have attempted to highlight that maintaining transnational links with family and friends in Pakistan and other countries of Pakistani settlement is important to British Pakistani kinship practices. Maintenance of a Pakistani and Islamic culture is also highly prioritized and involves many British Pakistanis in both house and community-based activities to ensure the socialization of the children into gaining an identity of a British Pakistani Muslim. The identity of 'British Pakistani

Muslim women' is a contested area, with a number of competing ideas about appropriate work, dress and appearance, which are related to the position and lifestyle of women.

As social transformation is a core theme in this thesis I argue that the process of creating a new life in Britain has involved changes in people's conceptions of what being a British Pakistani Muslim entails, and for most it has involved a sharpening of their awareness of themselves as 'Pakistani men' 'Pakistani women' and 'Muslim'. British Pakistanis feel themselves to play significant parts in maintaining the cultural identity of Pakistanis in Britain and socializing their children as members of this 'community'. Allied to the themes of social transformation, I described how for many British Pakistani women migration has entailed engaging with expectation of their role as women, which clashed with those of their family and class of origin in Pakistan. For these women migration can be interpreted as a move that has required a struggle between different, and sometimes conflicting, identities.

My aim here has been to provide the necessary theoretical background for each of the ethnographically oriented chapters which follow. In order to understand the form and nature of the kinship practices of British Pakistanis, living in Teesside, we must analyse the processes that take place within the household, as well as the wider historical, economic and political factors. The analysis of transnational kinship practices will reveal both how places are imagined and acted upon, and the power relations between them. Migration is a household process for my informants: household rituals and activities, which are often conducted by women, draw attention to the much-neglected issue of gender relations and how these are affected by transnationalism. An associated theme that will be explored is relations between generations. While the household is a useful starting point for analysis, we must be careful not to be blinkered by it. Wider social networks are spread between Britain and Pakistan and these are important. The ethnographies will reveal that one of the most common forms of remittance between Britain and Pakistan today is payment for ritual activities, which take place not just at the level of the household, but over the whole patrilineage and local 'community'.

Chapter Four

Methodology

4.1 Introduction

The traditional anthropological convention of fieldwork sites, writes Amit (2000:3), is based upon cultural, social and spatial distance that determines 'ethnographic authenticity'. Time-space compression, enabled by widening access to transportation and digital communications technologies, has transformed the conventions of fieldwork. One such transformation has been the deconstruction of a place-focused concept of 'culture'. As a result, a theoretical shift has occurred in concepts such as collective identity, place, social relations and 'culture' (Caputo 2000). Some anthropologists allege that locality is not a bounded site of culture, and this has been revealed by work among migrants, who have multiple identities and 'whose social networks and frames of reference are likely to be dispersed and multilocal rather then conveniently fixed in one place' (Amit 2000:13, cf. Smith and Guarnizo 1998).

The increasing mobility of informants, and even of anthropologists themselves, has blurred the boundary between 'home' and 'away'. Over the last fifteen years, more researchers are conducting anthropological fieldwork in their own local areas (cf. Okley 1983, Strathern 1981, Frankenburg 1957, Edwards 2000, Arweck and Collins 2006, Simpson 1998, Shaw 1988, Werbner 1990). The geographical distance of fieldwork has become highly ambiguous and an insight into the social world of people close to home is said to be as unique and exotic as in a place far away (Caputo 2000:29). Like Caputo, I will illustrate that the open-ended quality of ethnographic investigation implicates our understanding of what constitutes 'home' and 'away', showing that these are not 'mutually exclusive terms, and that the lines between the two are not always distinct' (Caputo 2000:29). Amit also argues that an anthropologist cannot disconnect him/herself from fieldwork, 'just as our subjects cannot disconnect themselves from the world and their pursuit to engage with or to be abandoned by us' (Amit 2000:13).

The duration of fieldwork has also been seen as highly important, and long-term experience is thought to be necessary. It is well known among anthropologists that fieldwork is a performative experience, which entails a social relationship between an anthropologist and his/her informants (Amit 2000). This means that an anthropologist must be able to build up a rapport with

informants and to participate in their activities over an extended period. In addition, for an anthropologist to gain any insight into the informants' social world, she or he needs to establish a relationship, which Amit suggests is the primary vehicle of ethnographic enquiry. Throughout the thesis, I present numerous case studies, which demonstrate how the scholarly inquiry of anthropology is unique in the nature of the relationship that anthropologists have with informants, based as it is upon intimacy and friendship.

The tension between my professional role (a student anthropologist) and my personal identity was a crucial aspect of my experience when researching my 'own' group of people in my home town. During the initial phase of my fieldwork I was perplexed when informants became special friends, and friends and neighbours became informants. I felt discomfort in using textual references, such as 'subjects' or 'informants'. On one occasion I remember vividly writing in my journal; How do I remain detached and be professional, yet be Naz, a friend to my informants, who can tell me about their lives?' The idea that one must separate professional work from personal, and home from work, has stemmed from a structural bias in capitalist and industrial societies (Amit 2000:3). Throughout the thesis my analysis will contain autobiographical information highlighting the interfusion of contexts, involvement, roles and perspectives in the research.

Anthropologists rarely discuss the methodological aspects of their research in great detail. However, this chapter is devoted to describing the ethnographic process of the fieldwork. In the first part I discuss the strategies and routes I used to search for potential informants. I also discuss the diverse methodological approaches I used. In the second section I provide an overview of the way the data were analysed and of the approaches that were employed. The third section will discuss the relationship between ethnography and theory. The fourth part focuses on the theme of 'researching your own' and the tension between 'insider' and 'outsider' status. The final section concentrates on the ethical considerations encountered during the research.

4.2 Qualitative Approaches, Ethnographic Methods and Seeking Informants

4.2.1 Qualitative Approaches

The research adopted a qualitative, interpretative approach, focusing upon the behaviour and actions of groups in specific contexts. The method is orientated towards examining the 'differences and particularities in human affairs and prompts the social researcher to discover what people think, what happened and why' (Arksey and Knight 1999:10). The accounts

presented also emphasise the authenticity of human feelings, actions and thoughts. This is in contrast to the positivist gaze, where predications and generalisations are the main focus. The qualitative method emphasises the importance of the social researcher and demands that he/she be more self-reflexive. Thus the researcher exchanges the role of a detached observer for that of participant researcher, who reflects upon the difference between 'insider' and 'outsider' status (1999:10-12 and see section 4.4).

The essence of the qualitative approach is that it is orientated towards seeking answers or understanding regarding how social experience is created and given meaning. The qualitative research for this thesis involved the collection and use of a variety of empirical materials: case study, personal experience, life history, narratives, interviews, observation, participant observation and visual artefacts (family video films and photographs). These empirical materials revealed routine and problematic moments and meanings in individuals' lives. Consequently, I was able to deploy a wide range of interconnected interpretive practices, in order not only to obtain a better understanding of the subject matter at hand, but also to understand the ways in which new information or research data are transformed into a written form. The advantage of using a number of methods is that '[each] practice makes the world visible in a different way' (Denzin and Lincoln 2003:5).

However, at a subtler level, the study is ethnographic in that it attempts 'to place specific encounters, events, and understandings into a fuller, more meaningful context' (Tedlock 2003:165). There are countless methodological facets of ethnography; however, I have focused on the few that I found the most relevant here. This type of ethnography was classified as 'autoethnography' which is a term used 'to describe studies by anthropologists of their own cultures' (Patton 2002: 85). The most effective way in which to present research into one's own culture is in the style of ethnography, which enables an emic approach to the research. Ellis and Bochner have stated that 'increasingly, autoethnography has become the term of choice in describing studies and procedures that connect the personal to the cultural' (1996: 74).

Manning (1995) emphasises that, in order to write postmodernist ethnography, 'One should demonstrate a willingness to write reflective and reflexive work that takes into account the subtle demands of making sense of others' conduct as well as one's own' (1995: 250). This thesis is written from two perspectives: as a first- person narrative and with the observer as the writer.

The latter approach is used primarily when relating theory to the research, which is usually described in the first-person. Throughout the discussion, to represent more accurately the atmosphere of the environment in which the research was conducted, representations of time and space are included, particularly when demonstrating how British Pakistanis practise kinship.

Ethnographic studies attempt to focus on locally crafted meanings and the settings within which social interaction occurs. The combination of how social order is built up in everyday communication with detailed descriptions of place settings mediates the meaning of what is said in the course of social interaction. The texts produced are highly descriptive of everyday life, with conversation extracts from the settings and ethnographic accounts of interaction. To the extent that the analysis is of talk in relation to social interaction and setting, it tends to take the form of discourse analysis, which highlights how talk and conversation are used to make meaning.

4.2.2 Narrative and ethnography

I would suggest that for me the practice of fieldwork entailed an overlap between narrative and ethnography, something which has been demonstrated in Whyte's classic urban ethnography *Street Corner Society* (1943). His work not only reports patterns of social interaction composed of leadership, followership and their associated activities and sentiments in the street life of an American city, but continues this with narrative interpretations of habitats. Narrative analysis in this context refers loosely to the examination of diverse stories and commentaries and conversations engaged in everyday life.

Ethnography broadly refers to the careful and usually long-term observation of a group of people to reveal the patterns of social life that are locally experienced. Ethnography presents details of living not always evident in stories and other accounts, which are distinguished from the disinterested inspection of interactional and narrative occasions. Narrative and ethnography stand side-by-side with what is written about the social organisation of British Pakistani lives in this thesis. During my fieldwork, I was always being told stories by my informants, whether from the older or the younger generation. There were several occasions when informants' stories were so long that my two-hour cassette tapes were not long enough to record everything. They used to provide me with explanations by presenting their life stories. I was fascinated to discover how social action is enacted in narratives. Hardy has stated that 'we dream in narrative, day-dream in

narrative, remember, anticipate, hope, despair, believe, doubt, plan, revise, criticize, construct, gossip, learn, hate and live by narrative' (MacIntyre 2000:211). Throughout the thesis I use narratives in order to convey my ideas to the reader; these narratives need to be considered in relation to their contexts, that is, taking into account how action is situated in its historical context.

4.2.3 Sampling and contacting informants

My research began in May 2003, though my intellectual journey began much earlier. Between May 2003 and January 2005, fifty-two families identified by means of snowball sampling were interviewed in their homes in Middlesbrough, Stockton, Thornaby and South Bank (see Appendix 2). The informants represent a cross-section of different *qaum* (caste), gender, ages, occupations and social classes and include some of the first migrants to settle here. Over the course of eighteen months I interviewed in total one hundred informants: of these, thirty-five represented core informants whom I visited on a weekly basis. The majority of the families were from the *arāīń* (fifteen), *zamīndār* (fourteen), *gujar* (nine) *and naī* (eight) *qaum* categories. Three families were from the *kashmiri qaum*, two from the *jogī* and only one was from a *pathan* family. Forty-eight informants were first-generation British Pakistani men and women who arrived from the Mirpuri district in Azad Kashmir and eighteen of these women married men living in the capital Islaammābad. Thirty-eight informants were second-generation, of whom eighteen were women and twenty were men. Twelve third-generation informants were also interviewed, of whom five were core informants.

	All informants	Core informants
Total	100	35
Gender		
Male	40	15
Female	60	20
Generation		
1st	48	18
2nd	38	12
3rd	12	5
Quam*		
arāīṅ	15	8
Zamīndār	14	7
Gujar	9	7
Naī	8	7
Kashmiri	3	3
Jogī	2	2
Pathan	1	1

* *Qaum* categories are of the number of families identified during the research

I used a variety of recruitment strategies to seek potential informants, including attending local clinics,[10] community centres, and networking with personal contacts. I attended three local community centres and participated in sewing classes for fifteen months where I met forty-seven women and thirty men. In addition, fifteen first-generation men were recruited through personal contacts when I attended a local gym during the six-month summer period of my fieldwork. As my family lives in central Middlesbrough, I already had personal contacts with British Pakistani Muslim families.

I also attended six local GP and antenatal care clinics over the course of fifteen months, during which I met Pakistani couples, where either or both the husband and wife were second-generation or where one spouse had joined the husband or wife in Britain. I felt very privileged to observe interactions between Pakistani women (accompanied by their families) and health professionals. When Pakistani women attended the GP surgeries I would greet them (*salām-alaikum* in Punjabi or 'hi' in English) as they sat down. The midwife or doctor would often introduce me to them or I

[10] My initial proposition was to explore the procreation practices of British Pakistanis and recruit families from NHS clinics, which is why I began recruiting from NHS clinics. However, during my fieldwork experience I revised my research project during the early phase of the research, when the focus turned out to be more on ideas and practices of migration and practices of relatedness. I came to question the very nature of what I was researching - a questioning that I identify as one of the strengths of anthropology.

would tell them why I was there and ask if they would allow me to be present during their appointment. For some Pakistani informants I acted as an interpreter. They would chat with me and question me about where I lived, my family, *birādarī* and why I walked with the aid of crutches. Many of the women came from families that were friends of my own family. In this case I would inform them about the research, tell them I was studying the social life of British Pakistanis and would like to be present during their appointments, but said that if they felt uncomfortable about it I would understand their concern. I also offered to wait outside the consulting room, but there was never an occasion when this happened and many would say, 'You are one of us...we know you are here for your education...so stay in the room'.

4.2.4 Interviews and life histories

A series of semi-structured and in-depth interviews were used with the informants. The essence of the semi-structured interview is that it generates an agenda that permits all parties to participate and allows the interviewee to be proactive in that process. It is composed primarily of open-ended questions which encourage the interviewee to think of past experiences or encounters, often, in my experience, leading to the recollection of other encounters that are more relevant.

During the interviews I had some basic questions that I began with, leading to a conversation which elicited relevant information that I would not necessarily have been looking for at the start. During the course of the interviews, as I only had basic 'starter' questions, I often had to use 'exploratory probes'. These are questions such as 'Is there anything else?' or 'Are there any other reasons?' The use of clarifying probes was also necessary as people sometimes made statements that were unclear and I had to ask them to 'explain more fully' or ask, 'In what way?' (McCrossan 1991:35). A total of 180 interviews were conducted with informants, each of which lasted on average one hour.

Life histories were collected from many informants over the course of several interviews. Talking about informants' past experiences allowed me to have a relatively flexible approach with each individual informant. The method worked well, especially among the first-generation migrants, and was particularly useful when informants focused on a few key events or a few important relationships.

Early criticism of the use of life history in anthropology revolved around questions of representativeness and objectivity; today, the most heated debates centre on the authorial hand of the ethnographer. In the process of editing and rearranging an oral text in order to create a translation that is comprehensible to a reading audience far removed from the British Pakistani context, there is a risk of ignoring indigenous methods of story-telling and constructing a life (Gubrium and Holstein 1999).

However, Geiger (1986) argues that life histories help us to gain access to the political, economic and social conditions of the twentieth century. In addition, 'they permit comparative cross-cultural studies of [peoples'] responses to such conditions in different settings' (Geiger 1986:343). It is with these aims in mind that I present the diverse ethnographic life histories and stories told to me over the course of my fieldwork.

The interviews for me became increasingly like conversations as I met more people. Many would ask me about my life: 'What happened to you? Why are you on crutches? Where does your family come from and what are their names?' With hindsight, I suggest that this kind of dialogue with informants and their families interpenetrated and influenced the anthropological knowledge I gained.

4.2.5 Gossip and British Pakistanis

At local sewing classes, community centres and local gyms attended by older Pakistani men, I used observation and participant-observation methods. I also listened to stories and gossip amongst the group. Gossip and talk with the wider Pakistani 'community' in Middlesbrough is a striking characteristic of informants' talk. Often, people would ask me, 'Have you heard about so and so?' This type of gossip or talk can be used to damage people's *izzat*, or more crudely, the reputation of the *ghar* (household) or *birādarī*. Some of the topics that were high on my informants 'talk' lists were: killings and/or deaths in Middlesbrough/other towns in England, failed marriages and the break-up of families, children running away from home, causes of infertility, or failed careers and businesses. For instance, experiences of infertility reveal claims of and opposition to sorcery that exist in the background to Pakistani affairs. For some people, sorcery flourishes in the shadows, fed by gossip and rumours, which emerge into public

contestations or allegations in times of tension. Strathern and Stewart (2003:7) comment on the central role of rumours and gossip in accusations of sorcery:

> ...Notabl[y], rumours follow the patterns of imputed jealousies, hostilities, and resentments that also keep mostly to the shadows or lurk in the background of social life, ready to reveal themselves in times of crisis. Or they swing into play at times...that cause...fear.

In an article on gossip published forty years ago, anthropologist Max Gluckman notes that gossip takes place among close friends, and is about close friends; gossiping, he says, is a privilege that demonstrates and reiterates belongingness to a certain group (Gluckman 1963:313). Gluckman is interested principally in the function of gossip to establish social bonds and boundaries:

> Gossip and even scandal unite a group within a larger society, or against another group in many ways: first by creating a past history for the members; second by 'competitively aligning' individuals and cliques against each other as they struggle for status. The struggles must be kept within the general values of the group. (1963:313)

Gluckman's view of gossip as a social activity is relevant to understanding some of the material in this thesis. I would add that the majority of the narratives in the thesis contain significant details of gossip or talk among neighbours, close kin and friends. The narratives in this thesis provide an insight into the perceptions of 'brothers' or 'sisters', which in turn give glimpses of their social universes. These relations are seen as power-laden and hierarchical and all social activities are scrutinized and evaluated by intimate and not-so-intimate others.

Furthermore, I would agree with Rapport (2002), that the gossip of a community can provide a picture of the identity of that community:

> in gossip a community can be seen to paint a self-portrait: the gossip of a community is an inherent part of its identity, a confirmation indeed of its existence, in which all members portray and simultaneously are portrayed. What most characterizes the portrait [is] its continuousness, its democratic completeness and, above all, its range. (2002:314)

Gossiping together is a physical activity, which Rapport described as follows:

> a secondary elaboration on a previous physical engagement; at least, a vicarious engagement if the former event was missed. And gossip extends and ramifies past physicalities into the future, events are kept embodied, their consequences multiplied and an appreciation of their intricacies fostered. (2002:314)

During gossiping, exclusions are made when outsiders scrutinise the present and record the past. There were times during the fieldwork when informants would involve me more closely in the gossiping activity, especially when I was interviewing people who became my friends in the latter period of the fieldwork. The fact that people were gossiping about me and wanted me to partake

in gossiping indicated, to some extent, that they included me as a member of the local community.

4.2.6 Recording the information

As I was visiting many informants on a weekly basis it became difficult to record everything during our conversations. However, I developed a useful technique during the first three months. I noticed that informants and friends would often feel shy and anxious about talking when I had a tape recorder present. I therefore decided not to use the recorder and wrote notes when either sitting in my car or having a break during my time at the community centres. Maintaining eye contact with Pakistani women informants is particularly important in building rapport and establishing a relationship. From the outset, I did not want the interview to come across as a 'formal' session and therefore notepads and tape recorders were not used in the latter period of the fieldwork. Although there were some minor pieces of information that were lost during interviews, such as voice tone, I decided that this technique was suitable for my informants. The transcriptions found in this thesis are from the early stages of the fieldwork or from when I had the opportunity to record the interviews.

When orgnanising the interview material, I used a code number for each family (such as 001, 002, 003 et cetera) and typed up interview notes on a weekly basis. I also kept an ethnographic journal (four large A4 pads), which contain reflexive accounts, including personal feelings towards informants and about the anthropological experience.

4.3: Data Analysis

4.3.1 Theoretical Approach

With the exception of a handful of field researchers (e.g. Glaser and Strauss, 1967, Miles and Huberman 1984, Comaroff and Comaroff 1992, Burawoy 1998), many ethnographers either gloss over the practices and procedures of analysis or fail to articulate them in their final reports.
A characteristic of qualitative research is that data are analysed as they are collected as well as after collection has ceased. Analysing interpretive practice focuses on both the *hows* and the *whats* of social reality, and in particular on both 'how people methodically construct their experiences and their worlds and ... the configurations of meaning and institutional life that inform and shape the reality-constituting activity' (Gubrium and Holstein 2003:215).

Ethnomethodology was one particular interpretive approach used to analyse the research findings in the study. From an ethnomethodological perspective, people actually 'do' social life. My particular intention was to document how people construct and sustain entities such as *birādarī*, migration patterns and gender. Gubrium and Holstein (2003:218) explain that an ethnomethodologist focuses on 'the social world ... [and this] is accomplished by way of members' constitutional interactional work, the mechanics of which produces and maintains the accountable circumstances of their lives...'. In contrast to conventional sociological approaches, the ethnomethodological approach is orientated towards understanding how people use rules, norms and shared meanings to account for the constancy of actions. Therefore, ethnomethodologists

> set aside the idea that actions are externally rule-governed or internally motivated in order to observe how members themselves establish and sustain social regularities. The appearance of action as being the consequence of a rule is treated as just that - the *appearance* of action as compliant or noncompliant. (ibid: 219-20, original emphasis)

The second mode of analysis used in the research was discourse analysis which, like ethnomethodology, was first developed during the 1960s. While ethnomethodology engages in the accomplishment of everyday life at the interactional level, Foucault (1972) undertook a related project, which 'considers how historically and culturally located systems of power/knowledge construct subjects and their worlds' (Gubrium and Holstein 2003:224). Foucault (1972) calls these systems 'discourses', highlighting the fact that ideas, ideologies and other symbolic formulations are not merely bodies of thought, but are also working attitudes, modes of address, terms of reference and courses of action immersed in social practices.

As ethnomethodologists viewed social interaction as reflexive, Foucault also considers discourse as both constitutive and meaningfully descriptive of the world and its subjects. The analytic attention in discourse analysis is focused more on the constructive *whats* that discourse constitutes than on the *hows* of discursive technology. Foucault deals with discourse as social practice, in particular focusing on the importance of understanding the practices of subjectivity. He (1988) explains how subjects and objects are constituted through discourse, and also offers a vision of an active subject who shapes discourse and puts it to work:

> If now I am interested...in the way in which the subject constitutes himself in an active fashion, by the practices of the self, these practices are nevertheless not something that the individual invents by himself. They are patterns that he finds in his culture and which

> are proposed, suggested and imposed on him by his culture, his society and his social group. (1988:11)

Qualitative researchers increasingly focus on the two sides of interpretative practices, looking at both the artful processes and the substantive conditions of meaning making and social order. Maynard (1989) argues that ethnographers have previously asked, 'How do participants see things?' while ethnomethodologically informed discourse analysts have asked, 'How do participants do things?' He explains that it is important not to ignore the former. In the interest of how members do things, ethnomethodologists tend to de-emphasise the factors that condition their actions. Maynard explains that 'external social structure is used as a resource for social interaction at the same time as it is constituted within it' (1989:139). Therefore, ethnographic and discourse studies can be mutually informative, and this allowed me to note the ways in which the 'structure of interaction, while being a local production, simultaneously enacts matters whose origins are externally initiated' (1989:139). Maynard suggests that by combining 'how people "see" their workaday worlds', researchers should attempt to see how people 'discover and exhibit features of these worlds so that they can be '"seen"' (1989:144). I therefore explored the meanings given to transnationalism in relation to kinship practices and how informants constructed the social world around them.

4.3.2 Language Issues

During the interviews carried out over the course of eighteen months, the informants spoke to me in Punjabi (including Mirpuri dialect), Urdu or English. The older generation communicated with me in Punjabi, and even though some men knew some English terms, they chose to speak in Punjabi during interviews. One *kashmiri* family who are known to be relatively wealthy were interviewed, and the grandmother and two daughters-in-law spoke to me in Urdu, even though they had all migrated from Pakistan over eighteen years ago. The second-generation spoke to me in both English and Punjabi. In these interviews, it was interesting to note how particular Punjabi words were chosen to convey certain ideas. For instance, there is a particular way to say 'honest' that has religious and symbolic associations, which is *qasme*. Many of the second-generation would discuss things in English and then say *qasme* at the end. All the interview material that was in Punjabi was translated into English. In many instances it was difficult to provide an exact English term, but, as will be seen in the following chapters, I provide explanations when this occurs.

Many of the second and third generation spoke Punjabi/Urdu picked up from family and friends. Their spoken language might not be grammatically correct. In the accounts that follow I retain the words these informants used during interviews. It should also be emphasised that there is huge linguistic variation among British Pakistanis, and therefore I will distinguish the Mirpuri dialect from 'standard' Punjabi or Urdu vocabulary.

4.3.3 Coding and Analysis

Once the transcripts and fieldwork notes had been formed I used a series of descriptive codes, such as diaspora consciousness, social process of kinning, homeland orientations and transnationalism, to highlight the material. Throughout the research process, I developed analytical interpretations of the data to focus further data collection, which I used in turn to inform and refine still further the developing theoretical analyses. This method is commonly referred to as grounded theory, and was developed by Barney G. Glaser and Anselm L. Strauss in their pioneer work *The Discovery of Grounded Theory* (1967).

A grounded theory approach validates studying people in their natural settings and redirects qualitative research away from positivism. Grounded theory focuses on meaning, and its proponents argue that using grounded theory furthers, rather than limits, interpretive understanding. For instance, as the older generation discussed the importance of movement, transnationalism and the process of kinning, I probed further to understand the topic of diaspora. I analysed the interpretations informants provided in relation to the fluidity of relatedness and the social process of kinning in the diasporic context. There was thus a simultaneous collection and analysis of data. There was a two-step data coding process during the analysis phase: using first descriptive labels and then analytical ones. In addition, comparative methods were also employed, which consisted of comparing and contrasting empirical findings, such as findings relating to transnational subjectivity across different generations of British Pakistanis.

Theoretical categories were developed from an analysis of the data collected, and the names of the categories explained the data they contained. Grounded theory provides a useful conceptual rendering and ordering of the data that explain the studied phenomena. The relevance of grounded theory derives from its offering analytic explanations of actual problems and basic processes in the research setting. Grounded theory is durable, as it allows for variation; it is

flexible for researchers when modifying their emerging themes or establishing analyses as conditions change or further data are gathered.

4.4 The relationship between ethnography and theory

Behar (2003: 16) writes that the beauty and mystery of the ethnographer's quest is to find the unexpected stories, the stories that 'challenge our theories'. She then asks, 'isn't that the reason why we still go to the field . . . ?' I certainly agree with her recognition of the link between ethnography and theory, as the discussion below will make clear. Ethnography and theory are mutually informative, in that theory focuses and sharpens ethnography while ethnography grounds theory in the richness of social life. It remains the case, however, that the analytic moment is often a neglected phase in accounts of the research process.

That some level of analysis takes place is clear, but how ethnographers do it across the board remains vague and relatively unarticulated. Ethnographers need to be oriented towards larger theoretical concerns from the outset of their projects by, at the very least, being sensitive to the range of theoretical relevancies of their orienting research questions and of the alternative paths through which those questions might be linked to theoretical development.

The notion of theoretical 'development' is important here as it connotes the dynamic processes by which theories emerge, change, and grow in scholarly work. The definition of theory encompasses one or more of these four basic elements:

(1) a set of logically interrelated propositions;

(2) an openness to subjecting propositions to empirical assessment and falsification;

(3) a focus on making empirical events meaningful via conceptualisation; and

(4) a discourse that facilitates the explanation of empirical events.

Beyond these four fundamental elements, theories also provide links between empirical studies and allow researchers to interpret the larger meaning of their findings for themselves and others (e.g. Hoover 1980).

The demise of the widely-held assumption that theoretical development derives solely from the deductive application of theory, and the fact that all research is embedded in a theoretical substrate of some kind, has led some scholars to dismiss the idea of generating grounded theory. Yet ethnographers have long recognised the importance of openness, in which the researcher allows the conditions of the field or the interests of informants to guide foci and methods of

investigation, and many exemplary ethnographic works are known more for their seminal theoretical contributions than for their particularistic findings.

One can point as well to other classic ethnographic field studies in anthropology and sociology that can be said to have generated significantly new theoretical approaches or sensitivities. Included in such works might be Whyte's *Street Corner Society* for its study of stratification, mobility, and social organisation at the level of the neighborhood or community (1973 [1943]). In this particular case certain concepts and theoretical principles are stimulated by or emerge from ethnographic observations, rather than being imported or derived from extant theory, and this cuts to the core of theoretical discovery.

In this thesis, the empirical material was used to develop theory in two main ways: by theoretical extension and by theoretical refinement. In the process of theoretical extension, one does not discover or develop new theory *per se*, but extends preexisting theoretical or conceptual formulations to other groups or aggregations, to other bounded contexts or places, or to other socio-cultural domains (cf. Lincoln and Guba 1985). Theoretical extension thus focuses on broadening the relevance of a particular concept or theoretical system to a range of empirical contexts other than those in which they were first developed or intended to be used. In this sense, theoretical extension preeminently involves the transferability of theory between at least two contexts (Lincoln and Guba 1985: 124). This process can be illustrated, for example, by my application of Howell's notion of kinning (which she used in her fieldwork among Norwegian adoptive parents) to describe the way in which childless British Pakistani informants accomplished their parenting role. Although the specific contents of the actions observed are different from those of Howell's informants, their social forms are similar.

The second avenue, theoretical refinement, refers to the modification of existing theoretical perspectives through extension or through the close inspection of a particular proposition with new case material. This could be considered as overlapping with analytic induction or negative case analysis inasmuch as the theory is modified on the basis of new evidence. For instance, I describe the way in which British Pakistanis bring up their children in Britain, what is commonly referred to as the act of socialisation. While I refer to major theoretical works that focus on socialisation, I analyse them using the case material collected in this thesis. I used the ethnography and the theory in conjunction with one another: I looked at what I had discovered and then looked at the similarities and differences between my findings and those of researchers.

Four clear points emerge from the above discussion that have guided my practice (cf. Behar 2003, Lincoln and Guba 1985, Hoover 1980). One is that it is important to approach the field familiar with a repertoire of relevant substantive and formal theories, but without having those theories function as the sole determinant of what is attended to and seen. From this vantage point, I view theories more in terms of repertoires than as blueprints (such as using habitus to write about bringing up second-generation British Pakistanis). Secondly, I contend that one should become as immersed in the context as possible, but also have an eye open to the possible generality of what is being observed. Thirdly, in examining one's field observations, one should allow the data to speak as loudly as the theories, so that they mutually inform each other. And fourthly, as the refinement of one or more theories proceeds, it is imperative that the researcher revisit his/her notes, and perhaps even the field, with the objective of capturing data that further substantiate the evolving refinements.

It is important to consider the conditions that facilitate or encourage theoretical development. One set of conditions operates at the level of the researcher. Among these conditions is a systematic approach to fieldwork and data analysis – such as analytic ethnography – that promotes the linkage of field data to relevant theoretical traditions. A second element that facilitates theoretical development at the level of the researcher is a conscious and explicit comparative agenda that seeks to identify the conditions under which extant theoretical concepts or perspectives on generic social processes may be extended or refined. A final condition for ethnographic theoretical development is a deep familiarity with one or more substantive or formal theoretical traditions, including familiarity with the theory's application in the research literature. I suggest that the more conversant the ethnographer is with a range of theoretical perspectives, the more numerous the opportunities for theoretical development.

4.5 'Researching your own': the insider and outsider problem

Many anthropologists before me have argued against the simple dichotomy of insiders and outsiders (Abu-Lughoud 1991, Kumar 1992, Narayan 1989). These scholars exposed one of the crucial assumptions of otherness that continues to pervade scholarship in muted form, yet I faced the same assumptions. Whereas the insider is comfortable, the outsider is often seen to undergo culture shock in functioning in a new language and learning new cultural rules (Jackson 1986). The insider/outsider problem is concerned with two conflicting positions. On the one hand there are some who suggest that there is something about doing research with your own 'native' group

that allows you to understand the 'real' nature of their social life. In contrast to this proposition, some argue that researchers who are also members of the group being studied are so involved that they are unable to be detached and unable to understand the group from another objective position.

The standard insider-outsider model represents an over-simplification, where the insider/outsider question is posed too simplistically as a dichotomy between subjectivity and objectivity. The advantages and disadvantages of being an insider or an outsider are carefully weighed, insiders wielding the spear of cultural knowledge and outsiders carrying the sword of objectivity, each jousting for a better position. Glossed as insider research, my work contributed to doing fieldwork 'at home'. With increasing numbers of people doing fieldwork 'at home', anthropologists have revised debates about whether insiders or outsiders are in preferential positions (Schutz 1962, Strathern 1981, Cohen 1987, Narayan 1989). For instance, it was believed that an anthropology in a milieu in which one felt linguistically and behaviourally at home was hardly credible because of the difficulties of taking too much for granted. It was argued that one simply could not gain a vantage point upon those accustomed 'common background expectancies' (Schutz 1962) by which everyday life was mainly mostly lived and where 'culture' deeply resided.

However as Rapport (2002) states, anthropology at home has

> a rather different grounding: in meritoriousness and significance...Anthropology in Britain has the potential ...of providing some of the best that the discipline can offer because an anthropologist thoroughly at home in linguistic denotation, and familiar with behavioural form, is more able to appreciate the connotative: to pick up those niceties of interaction and ambivalences and ambiguities of exchange, where the most intricate (and interesting) aspects of sociocultural worlds are constructed, negotiated, contested and disseminated. (2002: 7)

As Rapport argues, the fieldworker at home is well placed to identify those vital differences and diversities (between ideals and practices, between appearances and actualities, between sayings and doings, between sayings and doings of individuals or of the same individual at different times) that provide the 'dynamo' of cultural practices and social processes. In addition, 'culture is not a secret', Rapport (2002:7) argues, 'it is something experienced – the formal medium of an experience – and its study is not an esoteric pursuit so much as an exercise in concentration and will'.

Against this discussion lies a series of problems concerning the nature of the 'objective' study of human behaviour and the question of what it is to be an insider and outsider. It is this latter part of the discussion that I am concerned with, of what it means to be an insider and outsider amongst the British Pakistani Muslims I was working with. As a twenty-six year old, second-generation British Pakistani, physically disabled, single woman, I argue that there are levels of 'insiderness' and 'outsiderness', and that where the researcher sits on this continuum proves to be important to the research at hand. The loci along which we stand is aligned with or set apart from those whom we study are multiple and in flux. Factors such as education, gender, class, caste, religious orientation and family background may at different times outweigh the identity we associate with insider and outsider status. I suggest that, instead of worrying about being insiders or outsiders, anthropologists should concentrate on the quality of their relationships with the people whom they represent in their texts.

Although I feel uncomfortable with the label 'insider', I write as someone who is to some extent an insider anthropologist. To illustrate the personal and professional dilemmas raised by the assumption that an insider anthropologist can represent an authentic insider's perspective, I incorporate personal narrative into a wider discussion of anthropological scholarship. Following the work of others (Dyck 2000, Amit 2000, Abu-Lughoud 1988), the writing in this thesis situates me as belonging simultaneously to the world of engaged scholarship and the world of everyday life.

I would like to provide some background information about myself. The reason why I present these threads of biographical material is to demonstrate that a person may have many strands of identification available, strands that may be tugged into the open or stuffed out of sight. A highly mixed background such as mine perhaps marks the insider status problematic in this context. Abu-Lughod's (1988, 1991) pioneering work uses the terms 'halfies' or 'partial anthropologists' in the context of multiple identities in which countries, regions, religions and classes may come together. From this perspective, I would say that there are several important dimensions: *zamīndār* caste identity, power dynamics between ancestors and members within my *birādarī*, the Sunni Muslim sect, as well as my being a British Pakistani, physically disabled woman, all contribute to and mark my identity.

My paternal grandmother and grandfather come from a small village in the Mirpuri district of Azad Kashmir. My grandfather arrived in Britain during the 1960s and lived in Oxford with relatives before settling in Middlesbrough. My grandfather worked in the local shipyards on Teesside and then in a milk factory for 15 years. His wife, my grandmother, obtained her visa five years later and arrived in Middlesbrough. She returned to Pakistan soon after to arrange the marriage of her son (my father) to her sister's daughter (my mother). My father arrived in England in the early 1970s with his mother and sisters and went to a secondary school for a couple of years before returning to Pakistan to marry my mother. After his marriage he came back to Britain to find employment in the steel industry and obtain my mother's visa. Over the course of five years my *birādarī* supposedly arrived in large numbers settling in different parts of Britain, such as Leeds, Birmingham, Bradford and Oxford. As a child, I lived in central Middlesbrough with my grandparents, four of my paternal aunts and one of my father's cousins (whom I regard as my uncle).

At the age of eleven I was playing outside my junior school when I experienced a sudden thrombosis that left me paralysed from the waist down. I stayed in hospital for five months with my family by my side day and night. One weekend I was allowed to come home. When people first saw me in a wheelchair, I was shocked by their reaction: they were crying out loudly. My grandmother was crying out loudly that 'We've died - what has happened to us?' My father was crying and people were comforting him. My mother stood in a corner, looking down and sobbing her heart out. My sister and brother were standing and staring at me looking frightened of me. This memory sticks clearly in my mind.

The following day, on the Sunday, a *khatm-e-Qur'ān* was performed and up to 50 people were invited for the Qur'ān to be read. My grandmother tells me that the 'whole of Middlesbrough came when you became ill to pay their respects'. Various local people brought me presents, including holy water and home-made food. My *nānā* (mother's father) and *khāla* (maternal aunt), living in Birmingham, visited me, bringing with them olive oil that had been prayed over, to be applied to my paralysed legs. The news of my illness had reached my relatives in Pakistan and my *nānī* (maternal grandmother) made numerous phone calls to my mother. When doctors were unable to find the cause and prescribe treatment of the illness, my grandmother begged my

mother to take me to Pakistan. My mother tells me that neighbours and relatives in Pakistan believed that there were numerous treatments available in that particular context, including rituals at certain shrines and remedies from *pīr* (saints). However, my mother and father refused to take me to Pakistan; they had lost hope.

For a full year after my illness various people visited, and I remember my grandmother telling them 'the story' of what happened leading up to the illness. After my illness it was difficult getting back to school, but I started at a mainstream senior school and people would constantly ask 'Does she go to a normal school?' When my family replied, 'Yes', they would comment, 'So her brain is alright then isn't it?' Neither my immediate family nor my *birādarī* or the local Pakistani friends and neighbours ever expected that I would go on to higher education. I endured constant bullying at school for the way I walked and people insisted on calling me the 'legless lass'.

My relationships with informants were complex and shifting: in different settings, my *qaum*, my *birādarī*, my ancestral land in Azad Kashmir, my disability, gender, age, education, single status and childlessness were highlighted in different ways. Even as an insider or partial insider in some contexts I was drawn closer, while in others I was thrust apart. While every anthropologist exhibits 'multiplex subjectivity', a term coined by Rosaldo (1989), the facet of our subjectivity, which we choose or are forced to accept as a defining identity can change, depending on the context and the prevailing vectors of power.

Yet the *quality* of the relationship I had with my informants was central for me personally and to the kinds of data I collected. The relationship with my informants rested on having a shared discourse. I am using discourse here to refer broadly to a way of speaking and/or writing, a way of using language that is related to a specific social group. Discourse covers all aspects of language, both verbal and visual, and this allows us to refer to 'shared discourses'. During my fieldwork, and especially during Rammadan, I would visit family centres and participate in certain rituals during the holy month. This was a significant period during my experience when ideas about 'partial insider' prevailed. Being a Muslim and sharing a discourse with informants could distinguish me from an outsider. From my own reflections, I was able to talk to informants and friends about *Allah*: how I thank *Allah* for what I have despite having the illness and how I

feel so privileged to study for a PhD at university. I used particular Arabic words to convey this idea to them, such as the Arabic saying *al-ham-do-lilla* ('praise be to God'). Or when men and women talked about religion, we shared a language, which I suggest would be difficult for someone who has no religious experience.

Nonetheless, while it is possible for people sharing a religious faith to share a common discourse, there are clearly divisions within religions, including Islam. I acknowledge that sharing language experiences can be far more significant and far more relevant for particular individuals than the common discourse of religion. In terms of the process of 'Islamicisation', however, ideas about *Allah* being 'out there' are generally central among the British Muslim Pakistanis I worked with. An underlying theme emerges here, which is how we can discuss faith as part of a discourse of exclusion. Faith here asserts a difference between 'us' and 'them' and therefore has to do with the construction of boundaries. These are related to identity, understanding who we are, and are therefore part of the symbolic constructions of particular communities (Cohen 1985). Stringer and Arweck put forward a very similar argument and comments on how faith 'is part of a discourse undertaken by the dominated, the threatened, in order to retain their distance, their identity and their distinctiveness'(2002:14). In relation to religion, I therefore suggest that having a Muslim background influenced the way I undertook the research among the British Pakistani Muslims in Teesside. In relation to religion, I would not consider myself as a complete insider here, but the sharing of a discourse was beneficial to the ethnographic research.

There were numerous events throughout the fieldwork when my physical disability allowed me access to areas of people's social lives which would have been difficult for others. When people discussed my illness with me they would first ask, 'What happened to you?' and 'When will you get better?' Most of the older generation would say, 'May *Allah* help you get better'. I decided to go to a local gym, which I discovered the older men went to. When some of the local Pakistani women told me that 'only men went there [to the gym]', I decided to use my disability to gain access. The local Pakistani men there recognised me and said, 'You are ... granddaughter aren't you'. When I used to swim there, many would come up to me and we would have long chats about illnesses, religion, family conflicts and local events. I had great respect for them and called them either *uncle jī* (uncle) or *bābā* (grandfather). Many Pakistani women are threatened by the presence of another young, able-bodied and unmarried Pakistani woman around their husbands. When I talked to these young men, the women were happy for me to be there and many would go

into the kitchen or upstairs, while I continued to talk to their husbands. In hindsight, it is likely that the fact that I have a disability, made me less threatening in some contexts than an able-bodied single woman might have been.

'Empathy' is a term relating to 'understanding', and I would suggest that its use either by me or by participants helped to diffuse the boundary between insider and outsider. This was especially the case among the infertile couples I interviewed -- both women and men. One of my informants, Amina, a childless woman, told me, 'You are like me aren't you...what life have *we* got in this world?' [my emphasis]. For Amina there is something in her childless social status that she believes I can empathise with. During the conversation I remember feeling quite shocked by the way she compared her childless state to my disability, but in hindsight I think she wanted someone to empathise with her life without children.

However, the outsider aspect became increasingly explicit during conversations with my own family members about *qaum* categories. One incident occurred when a local neighbour's daughter eloped with a young man of a different *qaum*. They got married and had their *nikāḥ* ceremony. The event shocked the local Pakistani neighbours and my own family. I was out shopping with my mother and we came to the subject of marriage with people from different *qaum*. To my utter surprise she commented:

> The girl should have never married him, she will always be considered an outcast by her in-laws. She will always be reminded that she is not one of them. When things happen in the family, like little things, such as if her children misbehave, she will get the blame, they will say it's because of her...I think it would have been better for her to get married to a *gorā* (white male), at least then she wouldn't have to suffer...

Although the salience of *qaum* categories is discussed further in the thesis, I personally felt uncomfortable at first with the deeply held prejudices my own family have about *qaum* categories.[11] On reflection, however, I suggest that this was part of discovering and exposing aspects of Pakistani social life that were *doxic* and certainly taken for granted by myself. This particular incident helped me also to reflect on anthropological knowledge and how it is not

[11] From various discussions with other young British Pakistanis informants, these informants also question these 'traditional' views about *quam*.

simply something which is 'objective' or 'out there' for anthropologists to get hold of, but is subjective: it interacts with and invites other subjectivities to play roles in anthropological productions. Knowledge here is situated, negotiated and part of an ongoing process. The process spans professional and personal domains.

In some ways, and in order to combat the insider and outsider idioms, my reactions to the field are woven into this ethnography. I hope to share my own interpretive dilemmas and choices by interweaving a narrative of discovery with a narrative of finding. The contrasting and sometimes jarring switches between the two narratives highlights contrasts between my authorial stance and my fieldwork experience. By owning up to the interlocution between the fieldworker and the fieldwork, I use the writing style itself to explore how I learned about people's lives, and make the authorial 'I' obvious. While some may opt to separate these two registers completely, I choose to link them. When using this method, however, the fieldwork as a process of discovery develops into a written register of authority. My intention is always to be aware of the discovery, and my own reactions, in the attempt to show how the knowledge of a group can be obtained without constantly referring to the differences that creates clear-cut insiders and outsiders.

Fieldwork was not simply a professional 'rite of passage' for me; rather, it was the centre of my intellectual and emotional life. Anthropology for me meant my whole life and not merely doing fieldwork. There were two particular experiences with informants in which the boundary between 'fieldwork' and 'non-fieldwork' became unclear. One woman was going through a highly emotional time in her life, when her mother had died unexpectedly. She came to rely on me a lot and started to phone me on a daily basis and sometimes even twice a day. I found it difficult to deal with this woman towards the end of my fieldwork and found it increasingly difficult to delineate boundaries between 'friends' and 'informants'. As a British Pakistani Muslim, however, I felt that it was a social obligation for me to 'help' her. When I visited her on one occasion her husband thanked me for my help and said she had been

> at the end of her tether before she met you...she talks to me about you...Thanks so much for your help - it means a lot to me and my family.

After her husband had said this, I decided to be honest with her and revealed how busy I would be with my university work during the following months. I told her that I would continue to visit her every month and that if she wanted to talk to me she should ring me during the week. The young

woman continues to refer me as her *sahelī* (friend) and invites me to her young children's birthday parties. This incident illustrates some of the difficulties one can experience when doing 'anthropology at home', difficulties that many other researchers have also come across (Reinharz 1992). However, as Rapport (2002:7) argues, we 'are all and always anthropologists in and of [our] lives, to a variable degree pondering [our] selves, [our] worlds and others'. From this perspective, people are always engaging in methodology, in creating 'meanings out of the fragments and randomness of experiences'.

Participant observation implies simultaneous emotional connection and objective detachment. Experience is intersubjective and embodied. It is not individual and fixed, but social and processual. Intersubjectivity and dialogue entail situations where bodies marked by the social - that is, by difference (gender, ethnicity, race) - may be presented as partial identities. The experience of being a woman, being physically disabled or being a Muslim can never be singular. It will be dependent on a multiplicity of locations and positions that are socially constructed. The positionings are different for each individual, as well as for each culture that ethnographers come into contact with as fieldworkers. Concomitantly, during the middle phase of my fieldwork experience, I used members of my own family (such as my grandmother) as informants and discovered how participant observation became observant participation, when I attempted to step back and observe situations I participated in and took for granted.

4.6 Research Ethics

The above examination has revealed the nature of my research practice, and at the same time has also explored, implicitly, a number of ethical issues generated by that practice. In this section I intend to make explicit some of the starker ethical considerations presented by my research methodology.

Since I am a young British Pakistani woman living in Middlesbrough, many of the local people were known to my family. In some ways my position was clearly defined and I was habituated to being thoughtful about the ways in which people of similar backgrounds read our relationship differently and chose to present some subjects for discussion but not others. Throughout my fieldwork with British Pakistanis, I have worked entirely with the material that my informants chose to discuss during our meetings.

In addition to being attentive to what informants said and did, I added a form of triangulation to my methodology by seeking out a small number of key people who were not informants per se. These people performed the function of discussing my ideas in general with me, and were members of my own family, including my mother, grandmother and grandfather. Throughout the chapters I present illustrations from my own family members, a practice which does have ethical implications. My family members were aware of the fact that I was conducting fieldwork and even though they assumed that once I was indoors I was away from it all, they did acknowledge that I was writing about them as well. My grandmother and mother accompanied me to some informants' homes and I interviewed many of my grandmother's and grandfather's friends. I also used to joke with my grandmother, saying that she was my best informant!

I cannot claim neutrality or even non-intervention. Even the researcher who claims neutrality will do so in vain, as he or she will inevitably influence the people whose lives he or she touches, if merely as a memory. Amit (2000) emphasises the way in which informants' lives are multifaceted, interconnected, contextually situated and deeply meaningful. This implies a high degree of sensitivity to the subject's needs, but at the same time recognises that these needs change according to time, place and group. Ethical standards are not necessarily fixed principles that guide research actions, but may be seen as such.

However, there are further ethical considerations that will be woven closely into the research actions. They involve such issues as participation, consent, confidentiality and privacy, reciprocity and collaboration (Miles and Huberman 1984). The names of all the informants have been changed in the thesis to respect the confidentiality of informants. During the fieldwork the relationship between people and myself was based on reciprocity. I told informants about my background and that I was physically disabled. I explained the personal importance of conducting my fieldwork; they wanted to give me something in return and allowed me to enter into their lives.

There were important ethical issues concerning role management during access to privileged information (gossip). There were some occasions when informants asked me what I had heard from or about other informants. I made a conscious decision not to intervene, which to some

extent influenced the relationships I had with them and hence data collection. I did, however, tell one informant that I was working on my project, and that it would not be appropriate to talk about other people for reasons of confidentiality. She understood my situation well, but I found it difficult to tell older informants about my professional role: in their eyes I was a young British Pakistani woman first and a researcher second. I am aware of the effects of being a British Pakistani researcher on the process of establishing oneself in the (Teesside) Pakistani 'community' and the influence it has on one's choice. I am also aware of the subjectivities each individual brings to the experience.

Concluding remarks

In this chapter I have described how the terms 'fieldwork' and 'field' are in a constant state of flux. With changing times, the scope of anthropology has shifted to include industrialised societies. In this new setting, it is advantageous to focus on changing identifications in relationships with the people and issues that an anthropologist endeavours to represent. Even if one is able to blend into particular social groups without necessarily travelling to exotic places, the very nature of researching what to others is taken for granted creates an uneasy distance. It therefore seems necessary to redefine what constitutes the 'outsider' or 'insider' status of an anthropologist.

Chapter Five

Childlessness and the Social Process of Kinning

5.1 Introduction

The study of childlessness has significant contributions to make to the study of relatedness, precisely because parents struggle with handling biological malfunctions, which are usually taken for granted and relevant to kinship. The narratives collected from Pakistani men and women about their quest for a child raise important questions concerning the practice of relatedness among British Pakistanis. I will show how infertility causes hostile relationships between blood relatives, which create tensions and ambiguities for marriages within the *birādarī*. Some delicate conversations with men provided me with insights into fatherhood, fathering and men's feelings about being pushed by kin to remarry when their wife was unable to bear a child. The ethnographic material presented below will show how the establishment of polygamous arrangements presents an interesting context in which to study the reworking of social networks of significant others, which becomes a conscious business of re-evaluating the status and meaning of relationships.

The three ethnographic cases will show that, owing to the cultural emphasis on the desirability of children and family life amongst Pakistanis, for most adults social life is centred round having and bringing up children. For those couples who fail to give birth, the pressures become great indeed (cf. Shaw 2000:218-9). Family and other Pakistani acquaintances tend to assume there are fertility problems when couples do not start a family within one year of marriage. The idea of a young married woman who remains childless by choice is unthinkable. Infertility is thus a highly stigmatised condition, in which both men and women face ostracism. Narratives indicate that, for many informants, being involuntarily childless triggers a pattern of exclusion from both the *birādarī* and the wider Pakistani community (see also Papreen et al. 2000). The inability to conceive and/or carry a pregnancy to term thus alters identities, and profoundly affects conjugal and wider social relationships (cf. Reissman 2000, Inhorn and Van Balen 2001, Richards 2002 and Culley and Hudson 2005). In the Muslim normative order, the birth of a child, a son in particular, allows for social reproduction: the orderly transfer of privilege through inheritance to the next generation of kin. This strongly pro-natalist social norm is demonstrated both by ethnographic research (Inhorn 2003, Richards 2002) and by the high fertility rates of British Pakistanis compared with other groups in the UK (total fertility of 4.0, compared with the UK average of 1.7 (Berthoud 2001).

Among British Pakistanis, informal kin-based modes of adoption have been used as a way of addressing the problem of childlessness. In such arrangements, brothers or sisters will typically bring up their siblings' children and thereby keep family formation close to the 'agnatic blood'. The in-migration of Pakistanis into the United Kingdom, however, has created a volatile relationship between kin as new configurations of space, consumption and social reproduction are negotiated (cf. Werbner 1990, Osella and Gardner 2004). As Pakistanis have high rates of cousin marriages, the reconfiguration of relatedness and ideas about kin obligations cause complications for childless couples when adopting children from within the *birādarī*.

As a naive PhD student I did not realise how sensitive the topic of infertility was to Pakistani women and men. My initial contact with many of the Pakistani women who had problems conceiving was at a local family centre. When I questioned them about whether they had any children, many became distressed and quickly changed the topic of conversation. However, having apologised, I found myself as a Pakistani researcher in a somewhat delicate position when asking women to describe intimate details of their lives that had a bearing on their involuntary childless situations. At times women talked to me in private, but often kin joined in discussions, including husbands.

Writing on notions of kin among adoptee Norwegian parents, Howell (2003) shows how the social process of 'kinning' - where a previously non-biological relative is brought into a significant and permanent relationship with a group of people expressed in a kin idiom - becomes important for parents in establishing their relatedness with adopted children. The idea of 'kinning' has important implications for the ways British Pakistanis manage their childlessness. However, I would like to take this notion further and suggest that 'kinning' for British Pakistanis is a way of manipulating the so-called biological 'facts of life', which are to be reconfigured in the language of social kinship and relatedness.

British Pakistani perceptions about their own personal belonging in the contemporary social world are constructed through personal trajectories worked out in an idiom of kinship. The idiom of kinship tends to be grounded in a biological connectedness of shared substance. Even though blood (*Khūn*) is one of the symbolic markers of Pakistani kinship, recognised as a substance, its significance is its meaning in contexts of kinship. To share the same *Khūn* means to share certain physical resemblances as well as insubstantial qualities, such as personality, interests and

abilities. This social dimension of kinship creates continuity over time, and a sense of belonging is important to my informants.

However, within Pakistani kinship systems there are certain relationships, some of which are asymmetrical and carry asymmetrical expectations of sociality, such as the relationship between an older and younger brother, which are particularly important. As Faubion insists 'being kin obliges us to care about and care for particular others, and obliges particular others to care for and care about us' (2001:10). The re-examination of kin relations during infertility experiences produces interesting challenges for childless couples. Throughout the cases described below I will show that Pakistani parents do not operate a form of either/or regarding the constitutive and defining role of biology and sociality, but, in different contexts, foreground one at the expense of the other. The task can be difficult for those whom I interviewed, as the previous taken-for-granted or *doxic* (Bourdieu 1977) expectations of certain kin are thrown into self-conscious relief. A recurrent theme in this chapter is how there becomes a noticeable change in childless couples' attitudes during this time, as they shift from seeking to produce children from their own bodies to seeking to obtain children by others and, in many cases, unknown bodies. In these cases, relatedness is no longer a mere state of *being*, rather it is something achieved by the act of doing. Among the group of British Pakistanis I interviewed fathering and mothering is a performatively constituted relationship, which means that it is carried out through the giving of nurture. This chapter will provide several vignettes, of both men and women, in order to demonstrate that among British Pakistanis the ability to become a mother and father through the act of nurturing (*parwarish karnā*) is central to women's and men's lives, identities and relationships.

5.2 Migration and Kinship

Amina's story[12]

Amina was a 54-year-old childless woman, born in Pakistan. She had one sister and two brothers. Her father had recently died and she was living with her mother when I met her. She was married to her mother's brother's (*māmā's*) son, called Aziz, who was living in Pakistan with his second wife, who had borne him two children: one son and one daughter. I met Amina through her cousin, Gulzaar, who was pregnant with her fourth child. Amina was a strong and courageous woman who had turned her attention to Allah for comfort over her having no children and her husband remarrying. She had a tense relationship with the co-wife, whom she had not met face-to-face, but to whom she had talked on two occasions on the telephone. She told me sadly that she

[12] Amina's interview was conducted in Punjabi.

had spent most of her life hoping and praying that she would be given a pregnancy by Allah. She had visited a number of holy places, including shrines in Pakistan, had made four visits to Mecca and to various local healers, but nothing had remedied her infertility. Amina declared to me that her step mother-in-law (*matraī sās*), called Rasham, was the cause of her infertility. Her *māmā* had unfortunately lost his first wife, Sakeena, during labour with her fourth daughter. She had left behind two daughters and two sons, including Aziz. Amina's *māmā* decided to remarry this son to a woman, called Rasham, who was not related to him: 'she came from outside and not within the family'. Rasham and her new husband had three children.

Amina's marriage to Aziz took place in Pakistan in 1977. It was in Pakistan, exactly five months after her wedding that Rasham, her step mother-in-law, started to turn against her. It was then that she stated, 'my monthly bleeding stopped', suspecting that Rasham had used sorcery (*jādū*) against her. She confided in me that at one time she saw Rasham entering the couple's bedroom and, Amina said, she used evil amulets (*burā tāwīẓ*) against her. Rasham allegedly started to cause fights between Amina and Aziz. Aziz decided to migrate to England and try to find work so that Amina could come over and the couple could settle there. Aziz arrived in England, (his mother's brother arranged for him to come over as his son) in 1978 and Amina followed him three years later. After Aziz started to work he would send money back to his father and the rest of the family in Pakistan, or 'back home', as Aziz described it. He also arranged for his youngest brother to come over to Britain. His youngest brother, Abdul, with whom Aziz said he had a 'close' relationship, came over. Amina and Aziz arranged Abdul's wedding to a cousin living in England. Both brothers settled in the same household and successfully set up a taxi business.

Abdul's wife, called Shaheen, gave birth to a son shortly after their wedding. Aziz and Amina were very pleased and accepted him as their 'own' son. Amina said that she and Shaheen got along very well:

> ...in those days we went out everywhere together, we'd cook and clean together, and we treated each other like sisters ...

When Shaheen's oldest son was born, Shaheen and Abdul told Amina and Aziz:

> ...even though you don't have children please accept these children as your own. They will stay with you all your life and take care of you. You can bring them up how you want. You are now responsible for them.

Aziz and Amina were very happy with this offer and Amina told me she mothered her nephew, who called her mother (*ammā*) and Shaheen *māmī* (also translated as mother).[13] Two years later Shaheen gave birth to another son and a daughter.

As the two brothers' business was successfully expanding they arranged to bring the rest of their family to Britain, including two sisters and one brother. Shaheen and Amina continued to maintain a close relationship, as Amina told me:

> I really thought of her children as my own. My husband sat me down one day and said, 'you never know what life will bring you, but I want you to know that if ever something happens to me everything will be left to you and my sons', meaning his nephews...

He went on to say that his brother had given him something 'special: children that we could not have at first'. This demonstrates how 'close' kin gave the couple the experiential role of mothering and fathering. Amina described that although she was upset and accepted the fact that she was unable to experience pregnancy and birth, she 'really believed' that she did have children of her own. Amina's relationship with Shaheen continued to be good and she discussed how they both

> would go out together everywhere and [people] couldn't believe how well we got along we were all so happy. Our *rishtedār* (relatives) were kind of jealous of this, but we never took any notice. We described ourselves as *bahin* (sisters) to others.

The account above suggests that Amina attributes her failure to conceive to her step mother-in-law's malevolent intentions and the use of evil charms, not to any type of medical problem. Four other older Pakistani women, to whom I talked about their inability to have children, mentioned intentions to harm, which are used mainly by relatives: either *sāsa* (mothers-in-law), *niynana* (husband's sisters) or *hamsāyā/gawānḍī*[14] (close neighbours) living in both England and Pakistan. We can also see from the above that Abdul and Shaheen are very clear about the fact that while parents and children can be biologically related, these relations are not only premised on notions of shared bodily substances. Instead, Amina and Aziz's relationships with the children are constituted through forms of social practice, the act of doing. Therefore, Aziz's co-residence pattern with his brother provided him with the opportunity to play a fundamental role of fathering, or rather more formally, *pater*. This is in

[13] There is no difference between *ammā* and *māmī*. *Māmī* is a Punjabi term that can also be translated as mother.

[14] *gawānḍī* is a Punjabi term for neighbour, while *hamsaī* is an Urdu term, but they are often used interchangeably.

contrast to Abdul's role as the *genitor*. Amina's description of her 'family life' and her acquiring the mothering role demonstrates the crucial significance of the emotional ties she had with her brother-in-law and sister-in-law.

However, after thirteen years of the four adults living and nurturing three children together, there arose hostility between Abdul and Aziz. Amina said that Abdul demanded that Aziz split the business between them. Abdul announced that 'his children were getting older and he needed to think about their future'. Aziz and Amina felt devastated. Amina told me she felt they had 'lost everything in life...It was what Aziz and I had lived for. The children were our own and it was like being stabbed in the heart'. Describing the emotional pain of it all, Amina is certain that the reason behind all this was her step mother-in-law, who was living in England at the time. Rasham had a close relationship with Abdul, and she was increasingly uneasy about his relationship with his half-brother, and more crucially, about the relationship between Amina and Shaheen. Amina told me that she would often hint that Amina could not give Aziz his own *Khūn* (blood) children and that she was 'no woman', while she boasted about Shaheen's ability to conceive.

In terms of migration and kinship, I suggest that Amina's case demonstrates the ambiguity of British Pakistani migration. Migration involves 'projects of transformation': as 'migrants struggle to transform themselves and their families, they are torn between competing ideals: to separate their families and gain access to the power and resources of new places, or to remain together...' (Osella and Gardner 2004: xlii). Here, Abdul chose to escape the constrictive and burdensome obligation towards his older brother Aziz.

In addition, Ballard (2004:37) also demonstrates that migration and consumption are an important feature of British Pakistani economic practices. Consumption of new economic types (business in this example), reveals the local discourses of consumption, as, for instances, when Aziz arranged for the family business to be divided and Abdul and Shaheen moved out of the house shortly afterwards. Amina remembers the day they moved, vividly describing how she could not sleep or eat and 'felt all numb'. Although Aziz felt devastated, he never expressed his pain and hurt to his wider kin and became increasingly depressed about the situation. He immersed himself in work. Amina visited Mecca on a number of occasions and prayed to Allah to ease their pain and 'for some miracle to occur'. Unfortunately, this did not happen. Amina said that her in-laws constantly phoned Aziz from Pakistan and demanded that he come alone to visit them. Aziz looked very upset and worried:

> He then decided to tell me about the long conversations he was having with his stepmother and father. He revealed to me that he was being pushed by his *mathrai ma* (stepmother) and *abbā* (father) to remarry and told me he would continue to support me when he did. He said, 'I don't want to divorce you. We have shared something very important and I still love you, I still feel sympathy for you and respect you.'

Amina started to cry at this point during the interview and told me:

> Although I felt so upset and hurt, I felt for Aziz the fact that we had no *aulād* (children/offspring) and that he was being pushed by his relatives which was influencing his decision to remarry... I was not angry with him; I was angry with my *māmā* (uncle) and *sās* (mother-in-law).

Aziz went to Pakistan to get married to a young woman: the *nikāḥ* (Islamic wedding ceremony) was organised by his uncle's sons and stepmother. Aziz continues to live in both England and Pakistan, visiting Amina on a regular basis. Aziz and his second wife, Nusrat, had two children: a boy and a girl. Amina stated that Aziz's second wife was always demanding money and telling her 'to get a divorce from Aziz so that he can arrange for her and the children to come to England'. But Amina refuses: 'I am never going to do that. I am going to die as his wife. I never want to divorce him. He is my husband, why should I?' Amina lives with her elderly mother and has recently performed Umbra (pilgrimage to Saudia Arabia) with her brother's wife and nephew.

Amina assumed that the idiom of relatedness and co-residence with Aziz and his wife would provide the basis for her to become a 'mother'. An implicit theme running throughout Amina's narration is how nurturing these children provides a useful way of contextualising relations through practice. This was most striking when Amina revealed:

> We [her and Shaheen] would share the children at night and often I would take care of the youngest. They all slept with me. I believed that if Allah never gave me a child then it doesn't matter because these are my own. I will have children and celebrate their weddings, I will have grandchildren and there will be children to remember me when I die. But now everything has been taken away from me. I am nothing now.

However, it is simplistic to assume that the distinction between 'true' and 'not true' parents was the reason for the termination of Amina and Aziz's mothering and fathering role. Rather, I suggest that the dissolution seems to be related to a range of economic and social factors. There were other important kin involved in the dismantling of the household arrangement, which shows the relativity of kinship relations and how monogamous marriages can be quickly dissolved or transformed with the arrival of a pregnant new wife. In this case Rasham, according to Amina, played a major part in the fission of this household, as well as in disaggregating the conjugal relationship between Amina and

Aziz. Following Faubion's (2001:11-12) helpful insights I would suggest that kinship in this case can be seen as something necessarily achieved in and through relationships with others.

The rearrangement of marriage relationships was a dominant theme among several of my informants. Having had similar experiences to Aziz's, Shaheed, a 51-year-old Pakistani man, confided to me that he put up a fight against his relatives' assertion that he should take another wife, but this led to conflicts in the home and led his first wife to go and live with her brothers. He told me that this was very upsetting for him and caused a rupture in his relationships with his *phūphī* (paternal aunt), whose daughter was his wife. He told me that:

> It hurts because I really loved my aunt. I thought a lot of her, and my brothers-in-law helped me to come over from Pakistan and supported me a lot.

The fact that infertile Pakistani couples are embedded in a network of close social relations, places a childless woman at an increased risk of others' interventions. The cases of Amina, Aziz and Shaheed reveal a deeper issue, which is related to the re-arrangement of kin relationships when men remarry. For example, Thasveer, a thirty-eight-year-old infertile woman, told me how her relationship with her 'in-laws' and *phūphī's* side of the family became uncertain, as they participated in forcing her husband to remarry when she was unable to conceive. This finding highlights an important theme in this thesis: that is, the way in which social disruption challenges and relativises existing social relationships (cf. Osella and Gardner 2004: xxxi).

Women of the older generation told me how marrying within the *birādarī* (intermarrying within a caste group) and 'your own blood' (endogamous marriages) was designated to make the emotional tie between husband and wife and their immediate kin group become stronger. However, as Amina said to me:

> When things like this [inability to conceive and have children] happen you think your own family wouldn't just turn around and take these terrible measures, such as go out and look for another wife. You married them so that they would be devoted to you, not hurt you. They are your own blood. But when they turn around and partially kill you... you feel empty and think, 'can these people really do this to you...Don't they care for you?'

Similarly to Amina, another infertile informant, Thasveer, declared:

> My own chucked me because of not having children. You know my own *phūphī* (paternal aunt) who I thought loved me, and that day when she took me to her house to be her son's wife I believed that she was like my own mother and that she would never do such a thing.

These quotations highlight how the quest for a child, along with the transformation of marital relations, makes explicit and conscious the fact that biological reproduction is an underlying purpose of 'real' principles of endogamous marriage arrangements. Although a relationship with a paternal aunt prior to the breakdown of a marriage may be described as 'close', to a childless mother their rights, claims and interests become problematic. The implication is clear and part of a broader change in the symbolic significance of marrying within the *birādarī*. A woman's transformation from 'close' kin to 'distant' kin blurs a boundary within the *birādarī*, which was previously deemed to be based on a strong sentimental principle. Whereas in theory marriage between a couple strengthens a set of seemingly indissoluble relationships, when men remarry there is the possibility for agents to reflect and to construct new networks of significant adult kin relations. As notions of continuity, connectedness and extension are fundamental to personal relatedness, the relational context through which people identify themselves becomes controversial when remarriage occurs. Feelings and sentiment which previously flowed more or less freely are subject to multiple and conflicting interpretations.

The implications and emotions involved in the search for a child vary for men and women and between different couples. To conceive and nurture a child is intrinsic to gaining some sense of the identity of fatherhood, demonstrated clearly by the account below of the story of a man I came to know particularly well over the two years. Rasab's narrative illustrates clearly that his connections in Pakistan and relatives there enabled him to gain the identity of father. This was by his relationship with his 'child' (Haroon), conceptualised in terms of 'care' and the act of 'doing', a role that is therefore performed through practice.

5.3 Transnational Adoption, Flexibility and Kinship

Rasab's story[15]

Rasab's narrative will illustrate how kinning devices are employed in transnational adoption and the way in which childless couples employ an idiom of resemblances between themselves and their children. As you will see, overarching these and other kinning devices is a scenario of fate or destiny.

Rasab arrived in England in the 1970s with the help of his *ćaćā* (normally any younger paternal uncle except *tāyā*, which is the father's elder brother). Rasab was only in his early twenties then

[15] Rasab's interview was conducted in Punjabi and English. This was the case among a lot of my informants and in each case they switched between English and Punjabi throughout the interview.

and his parents were living in Pakistan, in what he described as 'circumstances of extreme poverty'. When he arrived in Britain he lived with older men, most of whom were kin. The main intention behind migrating to Britain was economic: 'to raise money and to send it back to my parents for food and clothes for my brothers and sisters'. He worked at a number of places, including shipyards, butchers and bakeries, and is currently working at a restaurant:

> What I was earning I would send it back to *ammā* (mother) and *abbā* (father). I missed all my family and my parents told me to come and visit them after a couple of years.

When Rasab returned to Pakistan he was told that his wedding had been arranged with his *phūphī's* (paternal aunt's) daughter, Jameela. He told me that his wedding was a relatively big occasion when all the extended *birādarī* and friends got together.

Soon after the wedding he came back to England in order to work and 'to get the visa sorted out for Jameela because you had to make sure she would have full financial support'. After one year, Jameela was successfully allowed to migrate to England. Jameela was a well educated young woman, who had read up to eighth grade/level of Urdu and attended school in Pakistan until the age of sixteen. When settling in England she decided to teach young Muslim children the Qur'ān. Together the couple accumulated enough money to buy a separate house close to their uncle. Rasab told me:

> I felt I was able to stand on my own two feet at this stage of my life. Although I would continue to send payments back to my parents, at least, I thought, I had my own house. My next aim was to get my younger brothers over. It was at this point that we both wanted children and when our parents rang from Pakistan they would continually ask Jameela whether there was a baby on the way.

Unfortunately Jameela was unable to conceive. She put a lot of effort into praying and taking herbal remedies. Rasab confided to me that after three years he felt people around them were starting to 'talk' about the delay in having children.

Rasab continued to tell me how he and Jameela visited local *pīrs* (religious saints) for spiritual rituals, and they travelled to Pakistan to visit 'popular shrines'. Rasab said that he and Jameela 'became increasingly tired and we just wanted an *aulād* (offspring in Urdu and Punjabi). Jameela confided in a local friend about her 'problem', who recommended that she visit a doctor. Rasab and Jameela decided to visit their GP, who recommended they have tests to determine the nature of the problem. After undergoing a series of lengthy procedures Rasab and Jameela were told that Jameela had 'blocked fallopian tubes' and that it was impossible for them to have 'a baby like you do normally, but you could have a test tube baby'. Rasab revealed that:

> Jameela wanted to have this test tube thing, but I didn't. I told her that I was fully devoted to her and I would remain with her no matter what not to worry. If it's meant to be it will happen. If we have children it will happen.

However, Rasab told me that unfortunately his maternal uncles were always saying to him:

> 'What kind of man are you, you haven't got any children? What's happening to you? If Jameela isn't good enough just marry someone else'. I felt really angry towards them for this...

Rasab resisted his relatives' insistence that he take another wife because he loved Jameela. He also loved his *phūphī* and did not want to hurt her, since, he said:

> She gave me her daughter to marry and I promised that I would care for, love and remain loyal to her all her life.

The importance of not remarrying is justified by the 'love' and 'loyalty' to his wife and his *phūphī*. It was at this point that they received a call from Pakistan. As in many of the families I met, the maintenance of and investment in transnational ties is crucial for migrants. As noted above, contemporary work on transnationalism focuses on borders and the management of flows across them: of people, goods, objects and in this case, messages. Rasab and Jameela heard how Rasab's father had helped to rescue a family during the Kashmir conflict. The Kashmiri family were in exile at one of Rasab's father's houses in Pakistan. Rasab's father told him that in this family, a mother had died during the war, leaving twins. Rasab's father insisted that he and Jameela travel to Pakistan and take one of these children so that they could 'bring up the child as their own'. They went to Pakistan and brought over Haroon, who is now twenty-four years old:

> He is our son and he knows about the whole situation, but fully accepts us as his true parents.

Although the blood metaphor can be dominant in expressing kin relations, Rasab's narrative demonstrates how relations are created and maintained by oscillating between biological and cultural codes of relation. Rasab's narrative thus shows that childless couples present hybrid discourses comprising rapid shifts between biology and sociality as constituting reference points. His claim that Haroon is his son who 'knows about the whole situation, but fully accepts us as his parents', clearly demonstrates the effort to background biological and national origins and foreground the social essence of the relationship. This is a process of self-conscious kinship (Howell 2003: 468).

Examples such as this illustrate the increased pressure that is put on men to acquire the identity of fatherhood. On many occasions I was told by several informants who had failed to have progeny, how

much they longed to be engaged in the wider social life around them, but without children they were unable to do so and therefore thought of themselves as excluded from this social world. In different gender-specific ways, childlessness may be as painful for men as it is for women (Shaw 2000, 2004, Culley and Hudson 2005: 3-13). Although Rasab is not the *genitor* of Haroon, he has been accepted by the wider Pakistani community as his *pater* through his nurturing role. Rasab has arranged Haroon's marriage to his brother's daughter. He told me:

> Without children a man does not have a sense of self. There is no harmony in his life, he can't hope for the future. He becomes upset and this puts a strain on the relationship between a husband and wife...

Rasab's case raises questions regarding what constitutes 'the family'. Procreation is not part of Rasab and Jameela's household unit, suggesting that the integration of marriage, procreation and parenthood is somewhat blurred in this case. The nurturance of Haroon did not only provide an experiential aspect of parenting for Rasab and Jameela, but it also helped to strengthen the conjugal relationship in promoting the collaborative nature of parenting. Rasab had access to international social networks that allowed him to gain 'a sense of self', which for some women and men was not possible. Here the 'emotional capital' formed the emotional linkage between Rasab, his father and the Kashmiri family in Pakistan, allowing Rasab and Jameela to nurture Haroon. A man called Javaid, in a similar situation to Rasab's, described how his brother from Pakistan 'gave him a child'. Javaid ackowledged that his son was from the 'belly of my sister-in-law and not my wife. But [he] was my son...it was meant to be like this'. In this case, the act of conception does not determine the progeny, rather the act of nurturance. The role of *ādmī* (man) or *kār-ālā* [16] (husband) and *abbā* (father) are bound together in sentimental and practical terms; what therefore becomes significant is which persons are involved. Even though Rasab and others were allowed to nurture someone else's child, they were also quite open and willing to reveal which were the 'others' or whose 'other bodies' had been involved in giving them a child.

The following case of Begum and Thazeem suggests one other way in which social networks may allow particular relationships (in this case mother-daughter) to be reconstituted through nurturing.

5.4 Social Support and Kinning

The case study below will reveal that childlessness does not necessarily result from biological abnormalities, but can also be manifested as a result of divorce or marital difficulties. This can be

[16] A Punjabi term, from the Urdu, *gharvala*, both colloquial terms for husband.

an example of what Kreager and Schröder-Butterfill (2004: 8) refer to as 'de-facto childlessness'. Childlessness can therefore be problematic for elderly British Pakistanis who 'are mostly first-generation immigrants from rural Punjab, whose expectations of support in old age are shaped by values derived from the South Asian joint-family system' (Shaw 2004:198). The process of kinning is once again explicit here, as people's aim is to incorporate the child into their kin group, and one way to achieve this is by talking about the child in a recognisable kin idiom.

Begum and Thazeem's story[17]

Thazeem was a twenty-six-year-old pregnant woman living with her husband Azar. Thazeem had arrived in England from Pakistan six months before I first met her. Azar is a second-generation British Pakistani and went to Pakistan a year ago to meet and marry Thazeem, a marriage arranged by his father and *phūphī* Begum. Thazeem came from a very poor background in Pakistan and she told me that her *ammā* (mother) was living in England as well. When I arranged to visit Thazeem at her house she told me that her *ammā* was going to come with 'their own relatives' soon. Thazeem told me that her *ammā*, called Begum, was not living with her brothers and sisters-in-law. I assumed that her father had died.

Thazeem, however, told me that in Pakistan her 'biological' mother had died during childbirth and that her 'biological' father was alive and living in Pakistan:

> My *Khūn* (blood) mother died when having one of my youngest brothers. We lived in really bad and poor circumstances and when I was about eight years old I was sent by my father to live with *ammā* and her [Begum's] mother. I was told by *ammā* when I was older that she never had a husband because he left her after a few days of marriage. She stayed at her brothers' houses in Pakistan and looked after their houses. I also became one of the servants. But she looked after me, she fed me, she clothed me and I called her *ammā*. We would do everything as mother-daughter.

Begum was a very respectable figure and was described by Thazeem as 'a good person' in the village in Pakistan. She was popular among the elderly women and many felt for her circumstances, her separation and childlessness. Thazeem told me that she remembers vividly how Begum constantly had people around her in Pakistan. Begum was a courageous and very kind-hearted woman. All the women in the village had spoken to her about having a child in the house, so she could get some physical help. This is when neighbours in the village arranged to talk to Thazeem's father so that he could send her to Begum so she could 'raise' her.

[17] We spoke in Punjabi during the interviews.

When Thazeem was recounting her life history I was astonished how the terms 'mother', 'biological mother' and 'father' were constantly being switched from one situation to the next. Mothering for Thazeem entailed co-residence, caring and the giving of food and clothes, from Begum. Once again this highlights the fact that for Thazeem, as for many Pakistani informants, the relation between mothers and children is not thought of in terms of shared substances that is specifically in relation to blood.

When Thazeem turned eighteen she told me that her mother started to think of her marriage prospects, and

> Started to think of my future. She told me that she was getting old and that she did not want to leave me behind alone when she died. My mother had a very difficult life, her younger brother's wife and four children had died during childhood. Her own mother was very old when she died and she looked after her. I told her that I would look after her and not to worry about me, but she started to arrange my wedding.

I asked Thazeem about her sisters and brothers and whether she continued to see them:

> Oh yeah, I visited them all the time, like when it was their weddings. They would also come to stay over with me and my mam. My mam really helped my father: she gave him money when my sisters got married. Once she brought the whole *jahez* (dowry)[18] for my sister's wedding. My father knows that I have received the biggest gift in my life: a mother. What she has done for me I will never be able to do for her.

Begum became quite a prominent figure not only in Thazeem's life, but also in her father's, and provided him with financial support. Thazeem told me that her mother wanted to keep her within her family and decided to marry her to one of her nephews, Azar, in England.

However, Begum's brother decided that she was getting old, and organised her visa so that she could come to England. Thazeem revealed that Begum started to worry about what would happen to her:

> Even though she was getting me married to Azar who was still at college at the time, she was really worried about what would happen to me when she went. I told her not to worry and that I would go and live with one of my *bahin* (sisters). But she told me that was not good and that she wanted to stay with me. Mam started to get really ill and when I phoned her brother, my uncle, he said to me that he was coming to collect her and get her visa organised.

[18] *Jahez* may consist of clothing, toiletries, make-up, shoes, gold jewels, furniture, cars and sometimes even houses. Parents may also present their daughter with money. At one wedding I attended, during my fieldwork, the *jahez* money was £10,000.

After three months Begum's brother brought her over to England and arranged for Thazeem to stay with her *bahin*, but Thazeem told me that it was the first time she had ever been separated from her mother:

> We were so upset. I used to sleep with mother at night and the last night you should have seen us. We cried so much and I told her not to forget me, I knew she wouldn't. But I just hated being separated from her. After she left she would phone me every week and used to say that she would come soon with her nephew and get me married to him.

After Azar had finished his 'A' levels at college Begum and her younger brother made the wedding arrangements and went to Pakistan to get Azar and Thazeem married. For the majority of South Asians growing up in Britain, marriage, kinship and religion continue to be endogamous, communally focused, transcontinental and towards the homeland.[19] In addition, the White Paper on Immigration reports relatively high rates of transnational and intercontinental marriages among South Asians (Home Office 2002). This finding provides an interesting case from which to examine ideas such as hybridity and cosmopolitanism. It appears that although the young generation can be reflexive, conscious and develop new desires by associating with 'others', they also, however, retain the particular marital practices of obeying the guardians of the family, the older generation and its *izzat* (cf. chapter 6)

During one of the interviews with Thazeem, Begum was staying with her. Thazeem told her that I was her *sahelī* (friend) and that I was studying at university. Begum told me that her daughter was expecting their first child and that she needed to be looked after by her so she came on a daily basis:

> I come to visit her (Thazeem), you know, every day because while she is *bimār*[20] (expecting/pregnant) you need to be looked after don't you...I hope everything is all right. I am looking forward very much to my grandchild.

In a similar way to Amina and Rasab, in their mothering and fathering roles, Begum has come to be recognised by Thazeem as her mother through nurturing. Begum recounted that:

> Once my husband started hitting me my brothers took me to their home in Pakistan. I never returned and I would watch all the women around me having children. I started to feel really sorry and began to feel really lonely, even though without my brothers I wouldn't be here in England. That's when Thazeem came along. Allah gave her to me and I looked after her and brought her up as my own daughter. She is all I've got and even though she is not from my stomach I am still her mother.

---

[19] Both Shaw (2001) and Charsley (2003) report on the high rates of intercontinental and intra-caste marriages among young British Pakistani marriages (over fifty per cent).

[20] *Bimār* literally means ill, a euphemism for pregnant.

These quotations provide an insight into the different ways through which women can become mothers. Although there is little information about Thazeem's father's motive in giving her to Begum, it seems that his poverty played a major role. The remarkable aspect of this case is the way in which Thazeem is incorporated into Begum's kin networks and biology is rendered irrelevant.

In English terms, Thazeem and Begum's case may be referred to as an informal form of 'adoption', but without the often complex official procedures involved. Many of the older informants told me that such cases were very common in Pakistan, when mothers died during childbirth and infertile or 'women without children' became 'suitable candidates to bring them up as their own', as one woman told me. In contrast, the precondition for adoption in England is that a couple has the means (social, economic and physical support) to bring up a child, and I was told that the adoption procedure is long and sometimes very stressful. For instance, Rubina, a second-generation 34-year-old married woman waited for seven years to have children. Her husband was a successful businessman and a popular figure among the Pakistani community in Middlesbrough. I met Rubina at a Pakistani women's sewing class and at that time she had four adopted children: three boys and one girl. Rubina and her husband Arshad had decided to adopt a child and wanted a Muslim child. Rubina said:

> It took so long to get everything sorted out. Like I had people come to look at our home, our personal finances and even our relationships with others... Because we were quite well off this was a major advantage for us. We also had a good size home for these children.

The 'Muslim' identification of the child was essential to Rubina, who told welfare organisations that she wanted to have children who had Muslim parents:

> All three of the children are brothers and sisters and we adopted them at different times, but all from the same family. We adopted them when they were less than one year old. As far as we know the biological mother just didn't want them, as she had some awful circumstances at home.

Rubina and Arshad's socio-economic status helped them to adopt children through formal, legal procedures in Britain. The couple, she said, wanted to have a Muslim child. The three other couples I met who had adopted through social services also stated that they wanted a Muslim child. As one devout Muslim man told me, 'According to Islam you should really bring up a child as Muslim and the child should have Muslim parents'. The importance of the Muslim origin of a child may reveal a deeper meaning: that is how adopting a Muslim child is in effect imagining the couple belonging to a wider, civic Muslim 'community'.

5.5 Discussion

A fundamental theme recurrent in this chapter has been the sense of similarity between adoptive parents and children. As the *doxic* (Bourdieu 1977) premise of biological relatedness is challenged when couples search for a child, there are noticeable changes in childless couples' (and their kin's) attitudes towards the quality of relationships. For instance, on one occasion Rubina's mother was babysitting her adopted children when I once went to visit her and she told me, 'Even though these children were not born out of my daughter's stomach they are our own...they were made for us...' This may highlight how adoptive parents may undergo a process of de-biologising the quality of relationships between child-parent and grandchild-grandparents. In the majority of contexts, the social nature of relationships is being 'foregrounded' displacing the biological one, as in Begum and Rasab's narratives, but in Amina's case this was strikingly different. Amina and Aziz were interested in parenting the children of their 'own'; that is, seeking children produced by the known biological bodies of his brother and sister-in-law.

As Pakistanis in Middlesbrough are a Muslim diasporic group, they have come to identify themselves with other Islamic areas – including Kashmir. Werbner suggests that Pakistanis in Britain are transnational communities of co-responsibility, which, I suggest, is a useful notion against which to examine Rasab and Begum's narrative. Werbner (2004) argues that the notion of co-responsibility indicates the *material* flows of goods and money, through gestures of 'giving' or *khidmat karnā*, public service. Members of the diaspora mobilise politically to defend or protest against injustices and human rights abuses suffered by co-diasporic groups elsewhere. They raise money, or, in Rasab's case, *parwāh* (to care) for orphans and poor children (like Begum above). According to this perspective, the diaspora is in one sense not a multiplicity at all, but a single place, which is the world. When people suffer elsewhere, immigrants feel the pain as well. The pain demands action. Therefore what people 'buy into' in the diaspora is an orientation and sense of co-responsibility. The rest is up to the imaginative ability to create and invest in identity, mobilise support, or manage transnational relations across boundaries.

However, there are two other important ways in which migration has entailed 'projects of transformation' (Osella and Gardner 2004: xlii), which might engender particular forms of kinning. Firstly, in relation to migration and ambiguity, I would suggest that there are reconfigurations of transnational subjectivities among British Muslim Pakistanis, causing fluid relationships within the *birādarī*. For instance, ideas and practices about property relations between siblings may have provoked the split between Abdul and Aziz, which as a consequence caused difficulties in informal

kin-based modes of adoption. Abdul and Shaheen moved out of the house and set up a home and business on the outskirts of Teesside. To this day, I am told by Amina, neither she nor Aziz has any access to the children nor do they ever see them.

Secondly, there is the way in which gender relationships are reworked in the diasporic context. As women engage more with higher education and professional careers, the reproductive and marriage patterns of young Pakistani couples have been shifting towards those of young British white people (Hennink et al. 1999, cf. chapter 6). Many men arrive from Pakistan with high levels of education that are not recognised within the British education system. Consequently, men face difficulties in ontaining employment, which sometimes means that their British-born wives might have to work. This can be distressing for some men, as many of them believe that men should be the main breadwinners of the household. They therefore might attempt to establish their identity by producing children, and when this fails men become increasingly anxious to gain a fathering role.

My contention, in this chapter, is that childless Pakistani couples deploy and foreground biological explanatory models at the expense of sociocultural ones, and in other contexts, sociocultural models are foregrounded while those of biology are ignored. I suggest that this provides a profound insight into kinship as an idiom of significant relatedness that emerges as dominant in the various discourses and practices surrounding childlessness and the act of nurturing among British Pakistanis. In the popular Pakistani view, *birādarī* is about descent and blood-relatedness. The idiom of *birādarī* encloses the family within biologically grounded relations. The act of bringing up and adopting a child challenges such notions.

However, as we have seen above, the kin network can be opened to incorporate nonbiologically related persons into existing categories that are predicated on biology. The boundaries of relatedness within the conventional kinship classification may be expanded, as well as restricted, and in such cases, the social or religious characteristics of people will be emphasised over biological ones. Although the parents and children do not share substance, adopted children are transformed through a process which I have referred to as 'kinning'.

Conclusion

In this chapter it has been my intention to use narratives about infertility and responses to infertility as a lens through which to explore the social process of kinning. Infertility experiences for British Pakistanis are complex and varied. Even though infertility has distressing costs in cultural contexts

where children are special and cherished, women who have impaired fertility or the inability to bear a child of their own are sometimes not deprived of children. The cases of Rasab and Begum showed that having transnational ties with kin in Pakistan enabled them to gain experience of fathering and mothering. In addition, the Pakistani notion of *khidmat karnā* (service) provides a strong motive and justification for childless Muslim couples who choose to nurture orphans or children from poor backgrounds. The quest for a Muslim child by British Pakistani parents highlights the way in which relatedness becomes a signifier of the power relations, inclusions and exclusions that are definitive of religious faith and community.

However, for some women, when social networks break down, as in Amina's case, or when social networks are limited, childlessness continues to be extremely painful and problematic for them. Their experiences offer a significant insight into the interaction of personal relationships and reproduction. We saw how Rasab and Jameela nurtured a child through their relationships with extended kin in Pakistan. Although Amina and Aziz had to cope with heartbreaking consequences after their parental role was taken away from them, their relationship with Aziz's brother was of significance to them prior to the disruption. In practice, research participants frequently evaluated and re-evaluated kinship distance in accordance with their ongoing interactions with relatives.

When a man is forced to remarry owing to his wife's infertility, there is a significant transformation in the meaning of close relationships, such as *sās* (mother-in-law). With some men remarrying we see a process of extrication, redefinition and possibly the termination of parts of the networks. I have attempted to locate these changes within the broader anthropological issue of British Pakistanis re-interpretation of the meaning of endogamous marriages within the *birādarī*. Feelings and sentiment which previously flowed more or less freely are subject to multiple and often conflicting interpretations. The religious context of Pakistani women was of great importance in the course of the action they took in order to relieve pressure to bear a child. Women rotated between different knowledge systems in order to gain some understanding of their infertility experiences. The case studies in this chapter speak to very topical issues at the heart of how Pakistani 'subjects' and persons are perceived. It seems of obvious significance that such stories can be framed around how sisters and brothers allowed childless couples to nurture their children.

Chapter Six

Cosmopolitan Everyday Life: Habitus, Cultural Reproduction and Reflexivity

6.1 Introduction

There is no doubt that, as a diasporic group, British Pakistanis are highly concerned about the transmission of tradition, particular values and obligations to their children. Disagreements are very likely to emerge over the minutiae of day-to-day parenting, such as discipline, dress, marriage proposals and socialising activities. Narratives from parents reveal that fundamental to such conflicts is the question of the kind of person their child ought to be and will become. The nurturing process can therefore introduce vulnerability and uncertainty where there are high expectations of confidence and predictability. Simpson has recently shown how children can be treated like items of property and objects of parental duty (Simpson 1998:52). From this perspective parental responsibility is brought into sharp focus. In the midst of such inter-generational conflicts the child is treated as a possession, with parental responsibility being to safeguard and protect, as individual agency is denied to the child.

As stated in section 2.7, at the centre of such disputes is the British Pakistani notion of *izzat*. When sons or daughters are recognised as social deviants, parents can often feel that they have failed the test of passing on how to become a Pakistani onto their children. Specifically, they feel embarrassed and neglected by them. In this sense, the process of nurturing for British Pakistanis triggers a contest over the future of offspring: it raises questions over the way a child maintains his/her parent's *izzat*, and the boundaries of parental responsibility become exposed. The quality of parenting becomes a focal topic for neighbours, the *birādarī* and the local people of Teesside. Being a 'good' role model and setting the 'right' levels of intervention, direction, discipline, freedom, control and indulgence can become integral to the quest for good parenting.

In this chapter I will illustrate how the physical proximity enforced on people in cities introduces them to observing others 'doing the same things differently, or [..] doing something different at the same time' (Bourdieu 1977:233, n16). This happens at 'the very heart of the routine of the everyday order' (1977: 233, n16), which is exactly the locus fundamental for the phenomenological 'taken-for-granted' acquisition of reality. Hence, in cities, people are exposed to a number of different human practices. There are various ways of being a 'good mother', a

'good daughter' or leading a 'good life' in cosmopolitan cities, which are all on display on your own doorstep.

In order to ground these perspectives we turn to the homeland of anthropology: to the world of living, thinking and interacting individuals. As Bourdieu (1977) and Hannerz (1996) suggest, it is in the lives of individuals and their negotiations in everyday situations that the interpretation and enunciation of cultural reproduction takes place.

In the first part of this chapter I will focus on what becoming a Pakistani and learning Pakistani ways of life entail: knowing how to greet, how to respect and obey elders and developing an understanding of the central Pakistani notion of *izzat*. My aim is to show that conceptions of childhood - what it is like to be a Pakistani child - are part of Pakistani habitus, and how in the early stages of life these Pakistani dispositions begin to be assimilated. The ethnographic material will reveal the roles of parents and grandparents in creating a young child's sense of being Pakistani. These adults are significant persons in observing and guiding children's behaviour, judging them according to Pakistani standards and instructing them, for instance, through the use of praise and criticism. The second section will explore how Pakistani children's play provides an insight into how they are disposed to classify the world differently from other ethnic groups. In order to explore the intricate methods of cultural transmission, the final section will illustrate how cultural reproduction never follows a blueprint: some British Pakistanis in Teesside develop differently from how one might expect. This section will also focus on gender negotiations and what informants accounted as the 'right' and 'correct' form of behaviour for British Pakistani girls or women.

6.2 Becoming a Pakistani

On 7th January 2004 at 10.25am I received a phone call from Yahoob telling me about the birth of his newborn son. He told me that Faridah had experienced some problems during labour and needed to have a Caesarean section, but that both mother and baby were doing well. I asked him if it would be all right for me to visit Faridah later on that day and he told me that it would be fine with him. I was very excited for Faridah and her family; I grabbed my camera and drove to the local maternity suite. On arrival I met Faridah's sisters-in-law taking her some home-cooked chapattis (*roṭī*) and chicken soup. I shouted congratulations (*mubārak*) to them from a distance, they both greeted me and we walked together towards Faridah's bed.

Both sisters-in-law kissed and hugged Faridah and asked how she was and then lifted the baby out of the bedside cot, while repeating the Arabic word *bismilla.* I had taken Faridah and her baby some small gifts and now placed them on the bed. The younger sister-in-law Saleena handed me the baby. About twenty minutes after we arrived, an older man dressed in the male Pakistani *kurtā* (long shirt) and *shalwār* (bottoms) arrived with Yahoob's youngest brother. This was one of the local *maulvī* (priest) who had agreed to perform the *aẕān.* Yahoob told me and the other sisters-in-law to wait on one side while *maulvī* performed the rite. Out of respect we (Faridah, her sisters-in-law and myself) covered our heads with our *dupaṭṭā* (chiffon scarves that were initially around our necks; placing them on our heads is a sign of respect and piety) and stood to one side. Yahoob drew the curtains around the bay for privacy. The baby was placed in the cot and the *maulvī* started to recite words of the Qur'ān. He then bent down slightly and started to shout some words into the baby's ear very slowly and then blow on him. While he was doing this, Faridah sat there looking down at the baby. The men in the room were also carefully listening and observing the *maulvī's* performance of the *aẕān.*

Once the *maulvī* had finished the rite the men in the room prayed and everyone said, '*mubārak*' to one another. The rite of *aẕān* is generally carried out during the first twenty-four hours of a child's life. To Yahoob and Faridah this means the infant can now be brought up as a Pakistani Muslim, which means living in very close quarters with other Pakistanis. The baby would share its mother's bed (or sometimes grandmother's) until it was two or three years old.[21] He (all this could apply as easily to a girl) would not have the routine 'going to bed' practices of many English children - often children go to bed when the mother/the rest of the extended family goes to bed and get up when everybody else gets up. He will get used to a number of carers, all from the same family - close cousins, siblings, aunts, grandparents - all of whom would bring him up as a Pakistani. Like James and Prout (1997:7), I suggest that the 'immaturity of childhood is a biological fact of life but the ways in which this immaturity is understood and made meaningful is a fact of culture'.

When another informant called Rani had her baby girl, her mother-in-law stayed with her for 10 days. Rani and her mother-in-law slept downstairs and the baby was cared for mainly by the mother-in-law. When I went to visit Rani four days after she had given birth, she told me that her

[21] However, there are some Pakistani girls as old as 18 who told me in secret that they continued to sleep with their mothers. This was no surprise to me, as I slept with my grandmother from birth until the age of 15.

father-in-law had chosen the name Fazaa. Fazaa was having her hair shaved for the first time (a traditional practice performed by Pakistanis) by a local Pakistani *naī* (Pakistani caste group defined as barbers) and her mother-in-law bathed her later. Rani was observing and helping her mother-in-law as well. The mother-in-law explained to me that, since it was Rani's first child, she would be worried about the care:

> I have had six children and to be honest you learn everything you know about looking after a child...what is good or bad...I remember when I had my oldest daughter Shaida I had my own mother-in-law to help, but after that it comes to you...I can do everything with my eyes closed now...

Rani works as a teaching assistant and told me that after her maternity leave she would be returning to work on a part-time basis and that Fazaa would be cared for by her in-laws. When a Pakistani child is born various intersubjective relationships are created. The birth of the child involves physical separation from the mother and he/she will also be cared for by people who are not the birth mother.

In order to learn how to manage and operate in the world into which we are born, we are taught by those around us. Schieffelin and Ochs (1986) claim that language socialisation can be understood as 'both socialisation through language and socialisation to use language' (1986:2), and this view encourages us to think of nurturing processes and language learning as closely intertwined. Accordingly, children 'acquire tactical knowledge of principles of social order and systems of beliefs (ethnotheories) through exposure to and participation in language-mediated interactions' (ibid:2). Like others (Bruner 1990:70-1, Schieffelin and Ochs 1986), I suggest that the development of knowledge is significantly influenced by communicating with others. The following ethnographic material examines the verbal interactions between British Pakistani caregivers and infants/children. I will illustrate how children learn language in the process of interacting with others in patterned ways. More importantly, I show that among British Pakistanis there are marked differences in terms of the amount of responsibility children are allowed to assume, their degree of subordination and the way characteristics of gender are distributed.

James and Prout (1997:24) suggest that child development needs to be situated in a social context and that it is necessary to understand what is referred to as the social construction of childhood. Pakistani caregivers and other close family members note when the child starts to articulate words. When this skill is developed early, the child is believed to be quick (*tez*) and clever (*shār*).

Faridah's youngest sister-in-law Shaida told me that she was really concerned about Faridah's oldest son when he was young because he was late talking and walking:

> When he was small I noticed how he couldn't control his neck and he started to talk much later than aunty's grandson next-door who is the same age as him. When I used to say to Faridah that we should tell the doctor about this she just used to say some children are slower so he might take some time.

Once the child begins to say a few words, he/she is taught to participate in speech events in certain ways that help to inculcate specific values. Interactional routines are useful for examining the content and routines to be expected in sequences: structures specify who can say what to whom. In learning an interactional routine, Pakistani children learn to develop an understanding of social role appropriate to age and sex.

After one year of age caregivers speak in a high-pitched voice to the infant, often telling him/her what to call his/her caregivers or kin: mother (*ammā*), father (*abbā*) grandmother (*dādī ammā*), grandfather (*dādā* or *bābā*), older sister (*bājī*) and older brother (*bhā'ī jān*). However, there were many cases I came across where this was not the case and children would imitate the words of other adults and called their caregivers by different names. When Fazaa was one year old she would call her paternal grandmother *bī* (older sister) just as her own father and his siblings would call their mother *bī*. Fazaa's grandmother was called *bi* by her own children because her sister-in-law (her father's paternal aunt) referred to her in such a way. Likewise, Fazaa would describe her grandfather as *abbā* and called her father's younger sister by her name. Interestingly, she called her mother *maam* (mother) and father *daddy* (father).[22] I suggest that this reference to close kin is particular to Pakistani nurturing practices. Firstly, as a result of being embedded in complex webs of kinship, Pakistani children might have to discover a sense of belonging to successive sets of individuals as 'the family' changes (cf. James 1993).

Secondly, there is a relationship between the structural position of a son/daughter in a Pakistani family, and the authority and responsibility of kin, which is conceptualised in Bourdieu's (1977) notion of habitus. Habitus is a situational link between person and structure. Structures are reproduced in concrete situations. People act through – hence in tune with – their habitus. Habitus is an incentive to perceive situations in particular ways, thus to act in particular ways. In order for

[22] Fazaa addressed her own mother and father, according to local *gorā* usage.

Fazaa to become an obedient and respectable granddaughter, it was important for her parents to discipline her and instill values of respect and authority.

Routine language learning allows infants or children to perceive and analyse speech in a predictable and recurring manner. I often observed the way in which explicit instructions during activities and speech events were constantly made. When Pakistanis interact with one another, their actions are influenced by their conceptions of their own and others' social status and by the roles associated with such statuses. These conceptions lead to expectations concerning their own and others' conduct. Included in these are expectations concerning language behaviour. Language contains specific constructions of different levels of grammar and discourse that signal information relating to how interactants see their own and others' social positions and roles (Schieffelin and Ochs 1986:6). When children are acquiring Punjabi, they are mastering vital aspects of social order.

The tendency of Pakistani caregivers is to appeal explicitly to social norms in correcting misbehaviour: for instance, 'You don't speak like that to adults: if you do that again I will be angry'. The use of such directives or expressions of anger specifies the circumstances in which punishment can be expected to be delivered unless there is compliance. During the period following the caregiver's first utterance the child is expected to give verbal assurances of compliance, or remain silent, but not to complain or argue ('Don't talk back'). The child may not comply, in which case a final confrontation is likely to ensue, which has its own subroutines.

One of the basic features of communicative style is knowing when to speak and when not to speak (cf. Gee 1999). I experienced some contexts in which children were trained to listen to adults and not to argue or answer back to parents. (This was most often with fathers/male relatives). When I visited Faridah and her relatives, the children would behave differently when Yahoob or their uncles were present. Faridah told me that the children were 'scared' of the men, especially Yahoob, as 'he would shout at them when they were naughty or did bad things'. On one of my visits Yahoob was getting ready for work and Faridah, along with her younger sister-in-law, was cooking his dinner in the kitchen. Aliya was sitting talking to me about what she had done at school that day and Shazad (aged six years) was watching a cartoon programme on TV. Yahoob said to Shazad, '*putra* (son) go and get me some water'. Shazad sat there trying not to listen to Yahoob, so Yahoob repeated his instruction. Shazad again ignored him. Yahoob then got up, shook Shazad's shoulder and raised his voice:

> I have told you twice now and I don't expect to say it again...go and get it for me. You should listen to me you are not a baby anymore, you are old now, go and get it or I will not like it if you don't.

Shazad got up from the floor and hurried to the kitchen. As he put the water on the table for Yahoob, Yahoob said, '*shābāsh putra* now it didn't take you long did it...What do you say when you put it down', Shazad recited in a slow voice '*bismilla*'. Pakistani communicative style places the main burden for successful communication on adults, especially fathers/grandfathers, and the first rule for children must be to notice and pay attention to speech that is addressed to them. The basic rule of politeness is to respond to questions and requests. As we can see, an older person instructs a younger infant in what to say by modelling each utterance repeatedly for the child to copy. In this sense, the transmission of knowledge is socially derived, that is, it is communicated and passed on to others. Faridah's father-in-law Ibraheem arrived from Pakistan for a short stay during my fieldwork. Aliya told me that she liked it when she saw her grandparents and related how her grandfather (*bābā*) used to tell her about their upbringing:

> This *bābā* and our other *bābā* who is in Pakistan and were looked after by their father and grandma when their mother died. He also tells us like when he was poor and tells us to say thank you to Allah when we eat something...So now I remember before I eat to say *bismilla.*

However, it should be recognised that even though Pakistani children cultivate particular ways of acting in different situations, this does not mean that they simply and inevitably accept them. Through previous interactions a child will acquire a common understanding or definitions of how to act in this or that situation, such as the way to greet older Pakistani older men or women. These common definitions allow people to act alike, but the common repetitive behaviour does not mean that there is no interpretation involved in the actions. Children such as Aliya told me why they say *bismilla* when they eat or why it is respectful to say *tusaṅ*(a polite way of saying 'you' to an older Pakistani person[23]) to elders. Even though these examples are rather crude, they show in some way how meanings are constructed during action (cf. Gee 1999).

Being prompted to use particular phrases and greetings are among the earliest verbal activities that Pakistani children experience. Specific situational contexts are routisined in children's communication with others and such routinisation provides a language-learning environment for the child. For instance, on one occasion when I went to visit Rani and Fazaa, Fazaa was being

[23] In contrast, *tū* is used to address someone younger, or someone very close, and even God.

looked after by her grandparents and *phūphī* (paternal aunt). I was told that Rani was at work. As soon as I walked into the house, Fazaa came over to me and her grandmother said in Punjabi:

> **G**: Greet aunty and what do you say?
> Fazaa attempts to say *salām-alaikum* and shakes my hand and kisses me on the cheek, which is generally done by Pakistani women.
> **G**: *shābāsh*! what are you going to do now?
> Fazaa points at the stool nearby and says,
> **F**: You sit here
> **G**: No, what do you say to adults? You don't say *tū*; you say *tusaṅ*, don't you Fazaa?

Fazaa's grandmother provides leading questions that indicate what Fazaa should say next. The practice of caregivers provides explicit instructions in what to say and how to speak in a range of recurrent activities and events is emphasised at a very young age. These illustrations suggest that systems of kin classification become embodied, and are therefore reproduced as the natural order. Gender roles are reproduced in this way. These naturalised orders present themselves as limitations; the world simply is like this and certain actions are possible and others unthinkable - in a literal sense.

For instance, in the early years, particular values are instilled regarding the way girls and boys participate in certain things. When I visited Faridah, her older son, Tayab, would come to me and shake my hand. Faridah tried to explain to him that men only shake hands with other men and men do not greet women in that way:

> **F**: Tayab, men do that, they shake hands when they first meet. You do that with men, not with women. You put your head in front of older women and they will stroke it like this [she shows him by acting it out].

The above example highlights the way in which parents/grandparents interpret or define children's actions, emphasising, in so doing, the 'correct' Pakistani mode of action. In this way are the children further informed about the meaning and value of such social interactions. In both the example given above we are offered some insight into this process: Fazaa's grandmother praises her actions, while Faridah defines and judges the 'proper' ways of greeting Pakistani men and women.

The embodiment of religious practices is also instilled at an early age. When Fazaa's grandmother offered me some fruit and tea, her grandfather said to her in Punjabi 'Show aunty how you say *bismilla* when you eat'; Fazaa put her hands together and said, '*bismilla- ir-Rahman-ir-Rahīm*' (approximately translated as 'In the name of God, most Gracious, most

Compassionate'). Her grandfather said to her '*shābāsh* (well done), now show aunty how you read *namāz* with me'. Fazaa laid down her grandmother's scarf and started to mimic the bodily actions that Muslims follow during the Islamic daily prayers.

6.3 Pakistani children's play '*We are playing māsī-māsī*'[24]

During my fieldwork I had the good fortune to interact, observe and play with some of the children of my informants. Following Ballard (1996), I suggest that a bilingual person will have grown accustomed to various ways of classifying the world, without becoming confused. As mentioned earlier in this thesis, Ballard draws an anology between code-switching in language and between cultures. He writes: 'Cultures, like languages, are *codes*, which actors use to express themselves in a given context; and as the context changes, so those with the requisite competence simply switch code' (Ballard 1996: 31).

After I became good friends with Faridah and her extended family, the children called me *māsī* Naz. Faridah and her sisters-in-law would often invite me to have dinner with them and the children. In this section I would like to present a particular incident that I witnessed and attempt to demonstrate how Pakistani children become interested in language almost as a form of play. The older generation of parents do not play any sort of games, though sometimes rhymes are sung in the Urdu language. Grandparents can sometimes refer to Punjabi riddles and a very common one is about pieces of thread and a snake. A common practice is also to sing *bay badaniyā* (like the English nursery rhyme 'See-saw, marjorie daw') with children when you lie down and swing the children to and fro or up and down.

When I first met Faridah she told me that their children were never given any toys to play with, because, 'they would only fight over them...but they have never really asked for them'. After several visits to the house the children started to open up to me: we talked about their life at school and 'at read' (attendance at a local Pakistani religious teacher's house to learn Urdu and the recitation of the Qur'ān). Five weeks after Faridah had given birth I went to visit her. The new baby was sleeping in the living room while the rest of the children played in the passage area. Faridah told me that they were sent out of the room while the baby slept and we continued to chat in the living room. Faridah told me she had to go upstairs to change her clothes and asked me to keep an eye on the baby. One sister-in-law was cooking in the kitchen and the other was in their

[24] *Māsī* is a Punjabi word meaning mother's sister, but Pakistanis use it to express broader idioms of relatedness in Middlesbrough. In general, people use *māsī* in honorary kinship terms and *māsī* can be used between older women and younger women.

house next-door tidying-up. Faridah left the room and the door was left slightly open, where I could hear and see Faridah and Shaida's daughters and youngest son. They were all speaking in Punjabi:

> **Aliya:** Lets play *māsī-māsī*. Sadia and I are going to come to your house. Arfan, you will be my little boy, so hold my hand.
> **Sarish:** All right, we have to pretend to give you some almonds and tea.
> **Aliya:** We are going to come now (Aliya and Sadia pretend to knock on a door and then give *salām* to Sarish and Nadia and give them kisses on the cheeks).
> **Sarish:** Come and sit down (Aliya and Sadia settle on the first step on the staircase. After sitting down the girls start to emulate the typical features of Pakistani women socialising.
> **Sarish:** How are your children? What is the oldest one doing now? What about your daughter who got married recently, how is she doing?
> **Aliya:** They are fine. She lives separately from us. She lives with her husband and their family.
> **Sarish:** (to Nadia) Now pretend to get some tea for them.
> **Aliya:** Oh, you shouldn't have bothered. I have a bag, let me go and get *bhārī ammā's* from the bedroom. (Aliya runs up to get it)
> **Aliya:** OK, I am going to give you money.
> **Sarish:** OK, but we won't keep it.
> **Aliya:** We will have to go now *māsī* because I need to get my children from school...I want to give you this.
> **Sarish:** Oh no, please, I don't want it.

Both girls started to interact with one another as many Pakistani women do when they exchange gifts. I was fascinated to see how the girls acted out this play and how they attempted to make the game 'real', imitating the way Pakistani women greet one another, the giving of food to guests and the way gifts were exchanged. The girls' play imitates aspects of the everyday social life of adult Pakistanis (cf. Shaw 2000, Werbner 1990 on *lenā-denā* (giving and receiving)).

After a while, Faridah returned and I told her what I had witnessed; we both laughed about it. Faridah told me that when her oldest Aliya and Sarish started school they were both in the same nursery class and played *māsī-māsī*:

> When Aliya and Sarish started nursery, the teacher told us that they would play in the play-house all the time and call each other *māsī* and only speak Punjabi. When I asked them what they were doing they told me we're playing *māsī-māsī*. It was so funny [starts to laugh loudly].

The type of play I observed provides an illustration of the connections within the social world that the girls have grown up in and have learned to be part of, as well as the ways in which play is used to resemble the reality of the Pakistani social world to them. If we look at this in more detail, this kind of play indicates the way in which they are able to communicate in a common

environment. Where two or more people share a similar environment, that allows them to interact and play with one another. The dialogue between Aliya and Sarish allows for mutual understanding when they talk about the giving of gifts or offering of food to guests. We can take this further to show how the interaction took place in a situation where there was a common understanding of the subtleties of the Punjabi language. The exchange of words, which are communicated between the girls, requires particular forms of gestures and sounds that can be interpreted as 'signs'. These signs are specific to the life of Pakistanis and have been inculcated in the girls from a very early age. The usage of such signs consists of the 'utilization of an interpretational scheme' (Schutz 1972) known to all the persons involved.

As I was leaving I asked Aliya what they were doing and she replied, 'we were playing *māsī-māsī*'. I asked what that involved: 'it's when we pretend to be *māsī* and come to each other's house to do, you know ...and talking and that'. I replied that this sounded like a really good game and asked if I could come and play with them next time. They all looked at me in a strange way and started to laugh. The subjective meaning offered by Aliya of the youngsters' game shows that the girls' involvement in a 'communicative common environment', the establishment of mutual understanding, reflects the experience of the 'We' relationship. Schutz emphasises how the 'We' experience is achieved when one can capture the 'stream of consciousness' of others through his/her own presence in the same situation. At the heart of the stories I collected from Aliya and other Pakistani children lies the assumption that members belong together, share a common situation and, with it, a common system of classifications.

6.3 Habitus, plurality and change

The notion of habitus has been a central one in Bourdieu's works. His thoughts on the subject are as follows:

> The conditionings associated with a particular class of conditions of existence produce habitus, systems of durable, transposable dispositions, structured structures, that is, as principles which generate and organise practices and representations that can be objectively adapted to their outcomes without presupposing a conscious aiming at ends or an express mastery of the oburations necessary in order to attain them. Objectively 'regulated' and 'regular' without being in any way the product of obedience to rules, they can be collectively orchestrated without being the product of the organising action of a conductor. (Bourdieu 1990:53)

Bourdieu makes an explicit connection between patterns of thought and social conditions. Particular forms of social condition produce particular forms of habitus. The habitus is in turn not

so much a context as a set of principles, principles which, I suggest, are embodied or expressed in the stance of being a Pakistani. Rather than the focus being on the particular contexts in which the principles can be employed, the emphasis is on the way in which a similar set of principles is employed across contexts and 'applied, by simple transfer, to the most dissimilar areas of practice' (Bourdieu 1990:175). A significant factor in this application is then whether they are appropriate to the particular rules of the game. Bourdieu is concerned to emphasise the practical mastery of the rules of the game and the effortless performance of rules without the recognition that such rules are being followed. The rules emerge from the ebb and flow of practice and are inherent in the relations that operate in a particular setting. Bourdieu argues that there exists 'an economy of practices, a reason imminent in practices, whose 'origin' lies neither in the 'decision' of reason understood as rational circulation nor in the determination of mechanisms external and superior to the agent' (Bourdieu 1990:50).

However, the ability to employ appropriate strategies depends on the tactical acquisition of generative principles that depend on social position. Those from different social conditions will tend to respond in the same way, because of the objective conditions of existence that they share (Bourdieu 1990:58). The early experiences will be crucial in determining Pakistani childrens' future responses, as they tend to react to new experiences by assimilating them to the generative principles they have acquired (Bourdieu 1990: 60). Habitus offers an attractive framework in which to explore British Pakistani nurturing practices. But we must acknowledge that for Bourdieu habitus is prior to practice and regulates it. If habitus, as Bourdieu insists, is acquired at an early stage in an unconscious fashion and is resistant to change, then the issue is the interaction between habitus and practice.

The notions that Bourdieu adopts in respect of patterns of thought, on this argument, are better for explaining transmission and reproduction (continuity) than for explaining change. To summarise crudely: if patterns of thought are established through tactical acquisition at an early stage, if such patterns of thought are durable and transferable, and if they reflect and reproduce existing patterns of social structure, how are they to change? How can patterns of thought emerge which challenge existing modes of thought, at a micro-level? How can individuals, at a micro-level, escape the habitus which they have acquired? In order to answer these questions, it is necessary to examine the issues of change at an individual level. There are also changes that we can track in the domain of the family, which might be thought to challenge the links between conditions of cultural reproduction and the disposition to think and act.

Wulff (1988) and Werbner's (2004) work has provided some important details about the way in which the younger generation of British Pakistanis can socialise their parents into modes of acting and communicating associated with their school and recent religious experiences. In their new country of residence, British Muslim Pakistanis have to reconstruct, practise and represent their religion according to the conditions of a modern, culturally complex society. As the younger second-generation become simultaneously more urban and literate, they seek both a concept and practice of religion that cannot only be performed (as their parents might have done), but must also be debated intellectually within the Muslim community, as well as explained to outsiders. This means that agents must be reflexive in taking into account the so-called rules and *doxic* knowledge systems obtained from parents and grandparents.

While many critics have suggested that Bourdieu's theory of habitus is deterministic, Bourdieu does assert that the ability to respond appropriately to events in the world arises from skills without recourse to rules and representations. The narrative provided by one informant will reveal how the experience of difference leads to reflexivity and the denaturalisation of the social order.

Azam's Story

Azam was a sixty-eight-year-old gentleman whom I met in the waiting room of one of the local clinics I attended. Azam arrived in Britain in the early 1960s and spoke very little English and therefore interviews were conducted in Punjabi. I found him crying and muttering words painfully to himself. Feeling quite shy, I decided to go up to him and asked him in Punjabi if he was all right. He gave me a slight smile and asked me where I lived and what my father's name was. When I told him, he nodded his head and then he asked me whether I was married and had any children. I replied no to both questions. After a moment, he told me that having children, especially sons, is supposed to be an enjoyable time when you think of the future and what it might bring:

> You think you will be *āzād* (have freedom) when you have a son, but you don't know what can happen...Look at me: my son has died.

I said how sorry I was to hear about this and asked him how he had died. Azam told me his story:

> He has destroyed me... My brother and I live in the same house. We've only got each other you see. We have four sisters, but there are only two of us, so all of our lives we have stayed with each other. He has looked after our houses in Pakistan and I have lived here with my sister-in-law and the children. My brother has three *baććīyāṅ* (daughters) and one *baćća* (son). His children call me *baṛā*

abbā ('big/older dad'). With my first wife we had five children, three girls and two boys. She and three of the children had serious illnesses and she and my two daughters and one son died within three years of one another. They all died between 1985 and 1988. At that time I really found it hard, but my brother supported me. My children were nineteen, eighteen and fifteen when they died. I felt I had died from inside when my life was turned upside down in three years... My youngest son was only six months old when his mother died and he was *parwāh* (cared for) by one of my sisters. My oldest daughter was healthy and she is now married in London.

In the first couple of years after my wife died I kept saying to my brother that I wanted to get married again and he kept saying to me, '*bhā'ī* (older brother), why do you want to get married I will be with you all the time'. So I told him that I wanted more children. So I got married to someone outside the family; she was from a different village in Pakistan and from a different *qaum* (caste) to us. My brother got all her visa thing sorted out and she came to England and we had a daughter together who would be fifteen now. But she ran away with my daughter when I was visiting Pakistan. She took a lot of my money and just went to stay with her sister in Bradford.

After my son had stayed with my sister for *das sāl* (ten years), my brother and I brought him back to our own home in England. He was all we had left and we cared for him so much. He was really clever and we [Azam and his brother] told him that he could do anything he wanted to. We paid for him to be educated and he is a doctor now. I wanted him to marry my brother's daughter, my niece, but he has disgraced me. He didn't want to marry her and kept saying to me, 'She's my sister' but I said, 'How can you say that? You have never stayed with her, you were either living away or you lived with your aunty'- my sister who brought him up. After some time he agreed to get married and we did a really big wedding here [in England]. He didn't sort himself out and he never treated my niece as his wife, he never talked to her like a wife and they never had any kind of relationship like a husband and wife do. So I said to him 'either 'you get yourself together or just go and never come back here, and as far as I'm concerned you will be dead. Don't come to my funeral; as far as I am concerned, you died like my other children did'.

Anyway he left after two years of the marriage and he has since got divorced from my *bhatījī* (niece: brother's daughter) and has gone. As far as I'm concerned I have no son, *mar gayā* (he has died), but he has caused my relationship with my brother to become hostile. I have nothing now. I have no *izzat* left, he has caused *sharam* (shame) to me. I can't step outside. Sometimes I feel people looking and talking about me, but what can I do? I'm just so fed up.

Azam's narrative reveals the kinds of inter-generational conflicts that British Pakistanis experience and how there can be conflicts in commitments, values and thus in the 'rightness' of various claims of knowledge about values. An implicit theme essential to this narrative is how his son's marriage to Azam's niece would have gained Azam *izzat* and a valued social identity among the Pakistani community, something which Shaw (2000) also discovered. With regard to the notion of *izzat*, it seems that Azam is expressing ideas about the construction of persons: the

child allows parents to externalise and demonstrate, in embodied forms, who they are in terms of their values, social status and aspirations. Azam feels embarrassed by *laug* (literally meaning people, but in this context outsiders) and 'what they might be thinking of [him] being left alone'. He said that when his son was leaving he cried in front of him and told him to come back to him:

> I begged him to come back to me...I told him that I have nothing without him, but he won't...He would not be a person... What kind of person is he, if he has thrown away all his family?'

Throughout this thesis it will become increasingly apparent that many Pakistanis are aware of selves in respect of the 'other' (the extended *birādarī* and wider 'community' of British Pakistanis: cf. Ballard 1996). There is no doubt that the narratives I collected about children being disowned by kin have a moral status. [25] In his book *Acts of Meaning* (1990), Bruner claims that each social group encompasses a 'folk psychology', which is transmitted to children during the socialisation process. An essential point that Bruner explores in some depth is how narratives are constructed by people when 'anybody is seen to believe or desire or ... [performan an] act that fails to take the state of the world into account, to commit a truly gratuitous act, he is judged to be folk-psychologically insane...' (Bruner 1990: 40). Azam's narrative contains a link between 'the exceptional and the ordinary', providing a sense of 'canonicality', that is, focusing upon what should have happened. He endows this with the legitimacy and authority of being 'right'. According to Azam, his son violated the Pakistani marriage canonicality. Azam's understanding of this type of story is a result of his encounter with the exceptional case and through the 'telling' he is justifying the action of disowning his son.

Throughout life, Pakistanis explore their moral identity through their membership in the family and extended *birādarī*, and their belonging to an Islamic religious group. An individual has to begin with some kind of knowledge of these moral particularities even if these can pose problems for the younger generations. In other cases I came across when 'biological' relatives were disowned as a result of family conflicts, very often when so-called 'arranged marriages' or elopements occurred, I discovered how those who were believed to have 'betrayed' the *izzat* of the family were obliterated from family narratives and memory, a process that Dr. Peter Collins (personal communication) defines as 'selective remembering'. Like those of Shaw (2000: 163-7),

[25] I did not have access to Azam's son's side of the story, as he was living in London away from his father and family.

my findings reveal that as second and third-generation Pakistanis find themselves members of numerous social groups, such as British schools, immediate kin, wider *birādarī* and religious groups, their individual private order of domains of relevance is changed. I would also suggest that this often leads to conflicts mainly originating in the endeavour to live up to the various and frequently inconsistent role expectations inhering in their children's membership of these disparate groups.

What, then, does habitus offer us in the context of British Pakistanis' nurturing practices? Bourdieu (1977) alleges that the way we understand the world, our beliefs and values is always constructed through the habitus, rather than passively recorded. As daily life for British Pakistanis can no longer be considered as the sphere where reproducible tactics and dispositions are reproduced, there are multiple ways of being Pakistanis. What is important here is that while many have argued that Bourdieu's conception is deterministic, the habitus is always constituted in moments of practice. It is always 'of the moment', brought out when a set of dispositions meets a particular problem, choice or context. In other words, it can be understood as a 'feel for the game'. The younger generation of Pakistanis I interviewed revealed how they were able to improvise from a number of alternative kinds of consciousness, which they accumulate through their participation in British schools, religious institutions, sporting clubs and by associating with acquaintances from 'other' backgrounds.

They use situationally competent action and generate new practices, a repertoire that is made up of complex backgrounds and multiple traditions. This does not necessarily mean that multi-membership is a resource that translates into different perspectives. There are factors, and habitus is one of them, that condition the extent of difference between different contexts. The analytical interest lies in the extent to which such dispositions are challenged and altered by different perspectives, or to what extent they remain immune to such influences. The notion of boundary here in the case of nurturing practices seems fruitfully to apply in the case of second-generation British Pakistanis who in these circumstances are crossing the boundaries and who are able to negotiate new ways of knowing within their communities of practice.

To be more specific, I would also suggest that Bourdieu's theory about doxa is also useful for understanding how change is negotiated among the younger British Pakistani generations. Bourdieu refers to *doxa* as the taken-for-granted world view, an 'arbitrary order', which can be denaturalised into what he has termed a field of opinion:

> Of all the mechanisms tending to produce this effect, the most important and the best concealed is undoubtedly the dialectic of the objective chances and the agents' aspirations, out of which arises the sense of limits, commonly called the sense of reality, i.e. the correspondence between the objective classes and the internalized classes, social structures and mental structures, which is the basis of the most ineradicable adherence to the established order. (Bourdieu 1977:164)

Systems of classification become embodied, and are thus reproduced as the natural order. Gender roles, as well as the class differences Willis (1997) writes about, are reproduced in this way. These naturalised orders present themselves as limitations; the world simply is like this; certain actions are possible and others literally unthinkable. For instance, according to Azam his son was embodied to obey traditional values instilled in him about respect and maintaining a parent's *izzat*.

According to Bourdieu, the *doxic* order can only be challenged by 'the constitution of a field of opinion'. A field of opinion is the locus where competing discourses confront each other (Bourdieu 1977: 168). Here, self-evident instructions of how to live as people crumble in confrontation with different world views. It is particularly in cities that people are exposed to difference. When different cultural traditions confront each other in small spaces, the arbitrariness is exposed and experienced in the very heart of the routines of the everyday order, and the possibility is presented of doing the same things differently. Hence, Azam's son like other members of the younger generation I met, got to know different ways of life and different ways of doing things. Many of these younger British Pakistanis have grown up in areas where a variety of different ethnic groups are represented. The schools, colleges and universities they attended are multi-ethnic. They have been exposed to observable and audible differences in all areas of life, and I suggest that a field of opinion has been established in many of them. These influences have led them to develop a cosmopolitan - opinionated as opposed to *doxic* - outlook on how to live their lives.

6.4 Negotiation of Female Gender Identity

In this section I will illustrate how British Pakistani women negotiate news ways of being British 'minority' women. I interviewed various women who had negotiated their own particular ways of being female. The negotiation was between security and freedom. However, the experience of differences and encountering different world views can be illustrated by how various informants discussed the 'right' behaviour of young Pakistani women.

During a meeting with an older informant called Daad at a local mosque, he made many references to how women should dress, talk and socialise in public. His references to gender identities were very much tied to female purity, which he suggested should be embodied during the early stages of life.

Daad was a devout priest (*maulvī*) at the central mosque in Middlesbrough. We had many conversations regarding his concern over the younger generation 'forgetting that they were Muslims'. He told me that being a Muslim involves facing many struggles, some of which are amplified in the migratory context:

> I believe it is wholly up to the parents to educate the child about the teachings of being a Muslim. I see a lot of Pakistani children living in the local area and they think they are *gorā*, like the girls dress in English clothes, don't speak in Punjabi and some girls have their hair cut very short. This is not on the whole bad. But when they don't give *salām* or when they do bad things against Islam, such as drinking alcohol, boys and girls going out together and girls showing their bodies, this is all wrong.

Daad was therefore concerned about the younger generation becoming influenced by the *gorā* way of life and the importance, because of this, of teaching children about Islam. All the Pakistani families I met sent their children to learn the Qur'ān by attending local mosques or at friends' and /or neighbours' homes. Local mosques have weekly sessions when a local Islamic Professor teaches children about Islam. I was told by Daad that, as well as learning to read the Qur'ān and Urdu, the children were taught, in the English language, the stories of the prophet Muhammed and his dedicated acts.

During the interview he made many gender references. He took Pakistani girls' hairstyles and the way they dressed to be signs of becoming Western, and he claimed that they therefore had certain experiences, which prove to be essential to concerns over identity and control. What a girl chooses to look like and her decisions over the deeply symbolic act of cutting hair or wearing Western clothes make a significant statement regarding parental status (cf. Yates 1990:78-9). He commented that when

> Pakistani children's behaviour is bad or when girls have cut their hair and wear English clothes, and then people say it is the parents who are bringing up their kids in *burā* (bad) ways ...

According to Daad there is a 'good' (*aććhā*) way of bringing up Pakistani Muslim children, particularly girls.

However, some women, such as Madia, had negotiated new ways of being female. Madia was a 27-year-old woman studying at Teesside University, but who lived with her parents in Birmingham. Her parents, she told me, lived in Mirpur in Pakistan. She has three siblings: two older brothers and one older sister, all of whom were married. There is a cultural importance attached to a particular way of being female in many Pakistani families (cf. Shaw 1998, Werbner 1990, Eglar 1960, Yates 1990). We have seen how important it was for many to be 'a good girl'. The older generation would mention the inequalities present based on the simple fact that 'they are girls'.

Madia talked about how her life had been different from that of her whole matrilineal family before her. She saw herself as part of a new generation of 'Asian' women who are charting new territories in Britain now. Like the young women in Yates' (1990: 78) study, many informants claimed that it is a double disadvantage to be a woman from an ethnic minority:

> My mam's sisters' husbands always ask my mother 'Why isn't she married? you should tell her to get married'. She is getting too old'. My mam is being pressurised by relatives and the wider community about my marriage. But when I tell her that I want to have a career, settle down and travel for a bit, she finds it difficult to understand why I want to.

Many of the second-generation tried to dissociate themselves from this community construction of reality, which they found limiting in the same way as Madia. To leave Birmingham and pursue a career instead of toeing the line is discouraged by the community, she said. We have heard about this generational and community versus individual conflict earlier (in Azam's case study), but here we see that the opposition is between community, parents and the second-generation.

However, as I have pointed out before, they displayed a very high level of reflexivity concerning embodied culture. When I met Madia she told me about the way in which she experienced differences. An English friend at university had passed away recently:

> The way her family reacted to her death, we found really alien. Don't wanna talk about it. Just kind of getting on with things. Whereas the whole Asian way of responding to that kind of tragedy is to embrace that expression, that emotion. It's about immersing yourself in the total tragedy of the event. I've grown up within this culture. The way that you experience death, marriage, things like that. Another example is how we are taught certain things about loyalty and commitment. Some of my English friends get frustrated by the fact that I go home every weekend to see my family. Because they only go and see their family at Christmas and New Year. If that. Or maybe once or twice

> during the rest of the year. You know, it's not as important for them, whereas for me, it is a lifeline. I *have* to see them every week. It's that loyalty and commitment to my family.

From the quotation above, it is evident Madia did not see her position as a British Pakistani woman as negative or as a burden. Instead, the nuance of sarcasm in Madia's description and her choice of the word 'lifeline' indicates that she thought her friends were missing out on something by having so little contact with their families. The bond and commitment Madia felt towards her family set her apart from her English friends who, in Madia's eyes, did not have such sentiments.

Madia saw the values of life-long commitment as having been inherited from her parents. Madia had become conscious of her embodied values. She could verbalise her values and see that they were different from those of her white friends. Despite viewing them as ingrained or instilled, they were no longer taken for granted by either Madia or Azam's son. When a way of life is no longer *doxic*, but a conscious 'choice', the choice can be revised and altered. Madia touched upon this when she discussed marriage arrangements with me.

Unlike some of her friends who were married to cousins in the *birādarī*, Madia told me she wanted to marry someone outside the family. However, she wanted to marry a Pakistani Muslim. This consciousness also made her able to evaluate her values and make an effort to hold on to the ones she appreciated, and let go of the ones she disliked. To ignore the 'instilled values' was not easy. It was not 'just to switch codes from arena to arena', as Ballard assumed (1996: 31-2). Madia seemed not to have been able to 'switch codes' entirely because the codes were incompatible. It was not easy to have to deceive her parents all the time. Neither was it easy to go against her own 'instilled values'.

Madia and other second-generation British Pakistanis found the values of the Pakistani community 'time warped' and reified, communal, narrow-minded and materialistic, a finding which was also revealed in Yates' study among the young women living in Broadmere (1990: 80-4). Many of these women were concerned about their parents' social position. They were willing to restrict their own freedom if they knew it was important to their parents. As one informant put it, her parents had only one world while she had many, and she was very concerned about that. Madia and many others stayed at home and were 'good girls'. The reason they gave for this was so as not to upset their parents. Madia kept secrets from her parents in order 'not to break her parents' picture of her, as she put it.

Clearly, they did not see these constraints as originating from 'community pressure'; they did it out of respect for and loyalty to their parents' world view, a world view they saw as different from their own. They did not choose to 'keep within the boundaries' because these values were instilled in them, but because breaking them would cost them more in terms of emotional distress than it would to wait until they were out of their parents' sight. Madia's 'good girl' story goes like this:

> Loads of boys and girls used to bunk off school to go to daytime gigs. [..]. I was a good girl in High School. I never used to do things like that. The thing is, I studied at school because I always knew that once I turned 18 and went to university, that's when my real life would begin. And I was prepared to wait for that.

After Madia left for university, she started to switch codes between Birmingham and Middlesbrough, weekends and weekdays. She and others transgressed these kind of limitation with the help of an 'ignorance is bliss' justification: what their parents did not know would not harm them. The purest form of Ballard's (1996) concept of 'code switching' is evident here. Madia chose to wait in order to be out of sight of her parents.

Madia's case study conveys some important details about cultural flows and generational differences. Her parents' openness is an important marker of difference in relation to the rest of the local Pakistani community. One of the few things all my participants had in common was that they saw explicit cosmopolitanness as the most important difference between themselves and the 'other', 'mainstream' Asians. Madia described her family as standing out in this respect. I therefore claim that there are mixed directions of cultural flows - (from grown-ups to children or from children to grown-ups) - for some British Pakistani informants, and this had become an important marker of identity for Madia's family. In some cases Madia followed her parents' values, in others she did not, but made her parents listen to her.

This section has shown how people have halted or altered cultural flows coming from their parents. Research on 'second-generation youth' has moved from the paradigm of 'in-between cultures' (prevalent until the late 1980s, cf. Yates 1990), to that of 'skilled cultural navigators' (Ballard 1996). I have, however, pointed out that there is a limit to 'code-switching', and consequently, there seems to be a persistent aim to 'find a middle ground'. I have tried to demonstrate these individual efforts to negotiate a middle ground among people like Madia. In

order to reconcile various influences, second-generation British Pakistanis have to participate in and contribute to the process of cultural transmission.

Azam's narrative revealed that the 'competition for *izzat*' (Ballard 1996) was a reality for him. There was a limit to the 'code-switching' and blind-eye strategy. Some families can take extreme action by disowning sons or daughters in order to maintain their position in the 'community'. Parents like Azam have therefore an inflexible view of tradition, where no negotiation can be made. However, some young British Pakistani women had simultaneously found a way to negotiate a middle ground together.

Conclusions

This chapter has focused on the processes of cultural reproduction among British Pakistanis living in Teesside. Pakistani parents are concerned that their children should share their beliefs about what people are like, what the world is like and how things should be valued. There must be an inculcation of particular values regarding respecting elders, obedience and authority.

The chapter argues that childhood development needs to be understood in its social context. An examination of the verbal interactions between children and adults demonstrates that through learning and using the Punjabi language children acquire an understanding of the vital aspect of Pakistani social order and systems of beliefs. An analysis of Pakistani forms of child-play helps to reveal the process of acquisition and use of the Punjabi language and its essential role in communicating in a common environment and in establishing a mutual understanding.

Throughout the chapter I have shown how parents, and more particularly grandparents, continue to play an integral part in the process of cultural reproduction. Through active participation in social interactions children come to internalise and gain performance competence in Pakistani sociocultural contexts. When Fazaa was interacting with her grandmother and grandfather (or when Faridah was showing her son Tayab how to greet Pakistani men or women), she was learning to recognise and construct identifiable social contexts and to relate these contexts one to another. Tied to the whole idea about socialised the 'proper' way is the role and maintenance of *izzat* in Pakistanis families.

The work of cultural reproduction in new settings is therefore complicated by the politics of *izzat* and by representing the family to neighbours and the wider *biṛādarī* in the new locale. As the

younger generation of British Pakistanis are exposed to differences in a cosmopolitan society, the habitus of an older Pakistani son or a young Pakistani daughter are challenged. According to Bourdieu (1977), the *doxic* order can only be challenged by the constitution of a field of opinion. Azam's son and Madia became acquainted with different ways of life as with the practical results of doing things differently, which Bourdieu refers to as embodiment. They had been exposed to observable and audible differences in all areas of life, by many members of the second-generation, and I claim that a field of opinion has been established in many of these. The last section illustrated the fact that the people participate in a number of arenas with (slightly) different world views. However, there were particular cultural values, which had been instilled in the younger generation, of which they were conscious but which they were unable to reject, such as obeying the wishes of the family.

Chapter Seven

Conflicting Discourses of Relatedness: Equality, *Qaum* (Caste) and Ambivalence among British Pakistanis

7.1 Introduction

Ambivalence has come to assume greater analytical centrality in kinship studies as ethnographers have begun to take more seriously the need to account more accurately for and contextualise the heterogeneous data bearing on the mixed emotions encountered in the field. Ambivalence is still somewhat under-theorised, although anthropologists are now in a better position to develop a richer and more nuanced sense of how kinship and social relations of the various kinds are practised, experienced, understood and represented in the specific societies and multiple contexts that comprise them. Since the 1980s, the field of kinship studies has been reconfigured and revived, owing in large part to the increased centrality within anthropology and other human sciences of the Marxist perspective – including practice theory as developed by Bourdieu (1977) and Ortner (1984), as well as numerous variants of post-structuralism and postmodernism (for example, Strathern 1988, Weiner 1992). One of the more fruitful features of the reconstituted field of kinship studies is the scholarly energy devoted to understanding social actors along with the specific contexts in which they organise themselves and their resources, as well as create meaning and order in their lives. Inspired by the interpretive anthropology developed by Bourdieu (1977), much recent research has focused on the practices of variably situated, embodied actors and the emotional tenor (feeling-tones) of the daily experiences of intimacy and subordination.

Just as kinship is as much about institutionalised power as it is about class, the focus on class has obscured many power-laden relationships and their significant dimensions of kinship and social relations. From Peletz's (2001:431) important insights into ambivalence and kinship I show that we need to understand the symbols, meanings, emotional economies and social relations implicated in prescriptive amity, 'diffuse, enduring solidarity' and attendant imburatives embedded in normative cultural statements. For reasons that were noted long ago by Evans-Pritchard (1940), we need to understand that all emotional attachments are linked to the realisation of ambivalence: intense attachments are thoroughly suffused with mixed emotions. The principle aim of this chapter is to explore the idea of ambivalence in relation to British Pakistani social practices.

As British Pakistanis renew and relocate their values and principles in a new context, they evolve localised ideas about hierarchy and status based predominantly on notions of *qaum* (caste). In the

first part of the chapter I will provide details of some of the daily practices of the Pakistanis I met to reveal how explicit markers of transnational connections need to be read alongside markers and negotiations of difference in which certain meanings of *qaum* are taken up. This and the following chapter will highlight an essential theme relating to the way Pakistanis in Teesside present/represent different layers of 'belonging'. These layers comprise the extended *birādarī* unit, caste group, village in Pakistan, followed by the locality in Teesside, and layering out to religious (Islamic) and national space (such as Pakistan, Saudi Arabia, Britain). It will be shown how, depending on the situation, people foreground one (or in some cases more than one) layer, whilst concealing the rest in their daily social practices. In the second part of this chapter I devote considerable analytical attention to caste and ambivalence. I suggest that Pakistani ideas and practices of social life display a pronounced concern with power, practice and agency, all of which are thoroughly embedded in issues having to do with mixed emotions, and are therefore highly conducive to discussions of these issues.

7.2 An Islamic Ethos of Equality: Brotherhood and Sisterhood

> **Aaron**: *Auntee* Naz, can you listen to my Urdu *sabaq* (recitation) that my *ustād* (teacher) has given me to learn?
> **N.I**: What do you want to read to me?
> **Aaron**: This reading about *Pakistani baćće* (Pakistani children).
> **N.I**: Go ahead...Oh yeah I can remember this one. I read it when I was small as well.
> **Aaron**: I like it...look, this is the flag of Pakistan, isn't it?

The above interview transcript is from an encounter with Aaron, an 8-year-old boy who quickly became one of my 'nephews'. Aaron is the grandson of one of my core informants, Naseem. Naseem is a 65-year-old Pakistani who lives in central Teesside with her husband, son, daughter-in-law and three grandchildren. Aaron is Naseem's daughter's son. Saleena, his mother, discovered that she was pregnant with her second child when I met her. I first met Naseem at one of the local clinics where I was doing my fieldwork during the summer of 2003. Naseem was standing in the reception area of the clinic while Saleena talked to the receptionist about her mother's appointment with their GP. I walked over to greet them both: I gave *salām* to them and started to talk to Saleena about Aaron and how he was doing at school and at *masjid.* Saleena told me that her mother was feeling unwell and needed to see her doctor. While talking to Saleena I started to make eye contact with Naseem, who began questioning me about my background:

Naseem: Where do you come from? Where is your home?
N.I: In a small village near Mirpur, but here I live on Cambridge Road in Linthorpe.
Naseem: We live close to you near Mirpur you know. We are *sake* (relatives) then.
N.I: OK.
Naseem: What is your family's name?
N.I: My father is called... and my mother is called... But you might know my grandmother, she is called...
Naseem: Oh yes, I know your family. Of course I know them, you are our relatives. [At this point Naseem bounces up from her chair and kisses me on both cheeks and strokes my head] How is your grandmother? I have not seen her for a while. You will have to tell her to come around when you come and visit Saleena. Your grandmother and I were very close in Pakistan. We used to meet when we fetched water from the local river back home. We had some lovely times and I have always remembered her. Tell her to come and see me. I heard about you and how you became ill. I was in Pakistan then and your *nānā* was really worried about you. How are you now?

I tell Naseem about my 'place', both in Pakistan and Teesside; she tells me about how apparently we are *sake*. These words provide an insight into how Pakistanis imagine 'migrancy' both in terms of physical movement and cognitively (cf. Rapport and Dawson 1998:4). Naseem's friendly way of framing relatedness is intended to elicit a sense of pre-migration group identification. She first asks who my family are and where they come from in Pakistan before enquiring where they live in Teesside.

When I arrived home that evening I remember telling my grandmother and the rest of my family that I had met Naseem and her daughter. I had promised Saleena that I would not disclose her pregnancy to my family, as pregnancy for some women is considered to be a secret and embarrassing event often negatively associated with sexuality. We therefore decided that I should only inform my grandmother about meeting Naseem in the waiting area of one of the GP clinics where the fieldwork was being carried out.

On my second visit to Saleena's home, I asked my grandmother and mother if they would like to come with me to see Naseem. On our way to Saleena's house, my grandmother and mother were both talking about Naseem: how *aććhī* (good) she was and that she had a good reputation within the 'Pakistani community'.[26] They told me that she had constructed a close network of friends since migrating to England and that she was a dominant figure among her extended *birādarī*. Saleena told me in advance that when we visited she would call her mother, who lived close to her (her brother also lived only three doors away from her).

[26] The notion of 'community' is relevant here, as people elaborated on it in terms of Pakistani ideas of social life.

When we arrived, Saleena greeted us and went to call her mother who quickly joined us. As we talked there was continuous banging on the doors: neighbours and kin asking for things. Naseem and my grandmother talked about Pakistan. Naseem told my grandmother that she was just thinking about 'those good times at home' in Pakistan because she was going to make *bairā nī roṭī* (chapatti made from corn flour (Mirpuri dialect)). The flour had been given to her by her niece, who had recently returned from a trip to Pakistan[27]:

> **Naseem**:[28] Sister, I remember all the time how we lived and what things were like. I know things were hard because of being poor, but people were different then. Here people are more concerned with money; they are bothered about competing with one another, who looks better...
> **Grandmother**: Yes, sister, that is so right. I remember that on one day when we [brother, sister, father and mother] were young we had no *roṭī* to eat in the evening and we were hungry and we had nothing but grass to eat. Here the children have it all and they don't know how difficult it was for us in those days.
> **Naseem**: Do you remember when we used to fetch the water every day and how we used to see each other all the time? There was you, me, our other siblings, and do you remember Rasham [a deceased relative of mine]? I hope she rests in peace wherever she is. She used to joke with us and say how we would do more talking than working...
> **Grandmother**: [slight laugh] I remember when you used to stay with us. You, me and my sister Sarwal used to sleep on one *khāṭ* [a large bed made out of straw]. On the other *kat* there was Sugra [grandmother's older sister] and our neighbour Jameela. What about that night when you stayed and there was a noise and we were all getting scared? It was dark so we could not see...We started to look around and the noise was getting louder and louder...We were all getting scared; we thought it was a thief, then it suddenly stopped. In the morning, when we could see, we saw your smaller brother Qurbaan. It was him. He had sneaked over to stay with us as well. [They both laugh loudly]
> **Naseem**: [Looks down at her hands and clothes] Oh, you know why my hands have got flour on them? Because when Saleena called me I was going to make *bairā nī roṭī*. My niece Zahida went to Pakistan and I told her to bring some *makā nā āṭā* (corn flour) back for me...You can buy the flour here, but the taste from home is better. You can't get anything like it here can you? I have mixed the flour, all I need to do is make the chapattis. Wait, I will go and fetch it and we will cook it here so we can all have some.

The passage above provides an example of how, in the context of daily interactions, Pakistanis in Teesside recreate their traditions, their common images, idioms and values. Naseem and my grandmother can be considered 'real' or 'same' home people: they were both from the same village and often in such cases, you find people talk about each other as 'sisters' and 'brothers'. Naseem and my grandmother chat about Pakistani corn flour chapattis and how the taste of

---

[27] I will be examining the exchange between Naseem and my grandmother in more detail in the next chapter on the ideas associated with the notion of *walāytī* (living abroad) in Pakistan.
[28] The exchange between my grandmother and Naseem was in the Punjabi language (Mirpuri dialect).

foodstuffs from Pakistan is perceived as 'purer' and tastier. Here we have the first indications of how there is a sense of belonging to a particular geographical location, even though it becomes more complex when one becomes a *walāytī* (outsider). (cf. chapter 8). Naseem and my grandmother 'lived with one another' and stayed together sharing similar experiences, which created a 'we' relationship. The theme of relationships between significant others retains a central prominence as the conversation continues:

> **N.I:** So did you all live close to one another?
> **Naseem:** Yes, really close *putrā*[29]...It was about five minutes away.
> **Grandmother**: We lived with one another.
> **NI:** O.K.
> **Naseem:** It was really your great-grandmother and my grandmother who were close and my siblings and I were really looked after by our grandmother. We thought of her as our mam. She cared for us until we were married. It was our grandmother who arranged our marriages for us. She was a good lady and everyone respected her and that's why people were good to us as well. When they were close we got close to your grandmother and them didn't we?
> **Grandmother:** Yes, they (her mother and Naseem's grandmother) were very close.

What starts to emerge in first-generation Pakistani accounts is how the feeling of belonging is not restricted to a place, objects or in such cases, foodstuffs, but that people refer to something greater than themselves by mentioning presence of significant others. When talking about past relationships, many Pakistani immigrants described how they were brought up or cared for by other Pakistani neighbours and kin. For instance, Shaan and Daad are two brothers who migrated from Pakistan in the late 1950s and settled initially with family on Teesside. During my fieldwork I met them both at a local gym popular with local Pakistani men. The oldest brother, Daad, told me how they were cared for by one of their paternal grandmothers, as their mother 'went to marry another man because our father died when we were very young'. Naseem remembers how she and my grandmother were 'close' to one another. I collected numerous stories such as these, each reflecting the ways in which relationships and shared experiences, rather than shared biology, are central to sociality. These findings tend to support much of what has been referred to as the 'new kinship studies' (cf. Strathern 1992, Carsten 1997, Edwards 2000). While one could assert that kinship is 'given', something one passively receives or is 'thrown into', my acquaintances are hardly passive recipients of the kinship they have with others: theirs are quite active quests for relationships, voluntarily forged.

[29] Literally meaning son, but here refers to child - a term of endearment indicating closeness.

However, this and the following two chapters also provide important details concerning the way British Pakistanis conceptualise ethnicity. In many public and media discourses the term ethnicity is characterised as a predominant feature of many minority groups. What begins to emerge in this ethnography is how diasporas are politically reflexive; they engage in internal arguments about who we 'are'. Diasporas are full of division and dissent, in terms of *qaum*, *birādarī* group, and social status. Yet at the same time they recognise collective responsibilities, not only to the home country, but also in host countries.

Unity among Teesside Pakistanis

During my fieldwork I was indirectly involved (through my grandfather) in a local event that demonstrated how local Pakistanis attempt to enforce the premise of equality between fellow migrants, despite the continued dominance of caste categories that are widely shared by most Pakistani members in Teesside.

> As I was walking from Parveen's house today I noticed several young Pakistani boys standing outside the mosque handing out leaflets informing men about a local election. As I nervously walked forward, as no other woman was in sight, the boys looked at me strangely and handed me a leaflet. The leaflet was printed in Urdu and English and it basically advocated voting for a local Pakistani man, [here called Sajawal] to become a local councillor. It stated how Sajawal was a very well respected person with a highly educated background. My family knew Sajawal and his extended family quite well and my grandfather told me on Monday how all the men at the mosque were discussing the event and told everyone to meet at the local town hall that evening to support Sajawal.

On that evening I remember coming home to find several visitors (two close relatives and three friends) from Birmingham, who had made the trip to Teesside especially to support Sajawal. My mother was cooking dinner for them and she told me that Mazir, one of the men from Birmingham, (he was my maternal aunt's husband), was very good friends with Sajawal and his family in Pakistan. Sajawal's brother, who was living in Pakistan, was a very respectable person. I was told quietly by my mother in the kitchen that he was a man with great wealth and who apparently had a good occupation (working at one of the main banks in Islammābad). We were told by Mazir that he had received a phone call from his best friend (Sajawal's older bother) in Pakistan, telling Mazir to come to Teesside and give Sajawal the support he needed on this important occasion.

I went to greet my uncles Mazir and Farooq in the front room; all the men (including my grandfather, father, neighbour and my grandfather's nephew) were sitting discussing Sajawal and

the event.[30] My grandmother followed me in and we sat in the other half of the room.[31] Mazir was telling the rest that Sajawal and his extended family 'are really good people' and that it would be beneficial for the local Pakistanis to have him as a local councillor. My grandfather started to say that Sajawal was well educated and had arrived in England as a very young child. Even though he had prospered economically, Sajawal and his extended family lived in central Teesside. Sajawal and his family chose not to move to the suburban areas where it is perceived that the wealthier or the more rich Pakistanis currently live. My grandfather was commenting on Sajawal saying that:

> he didn't change - he never thought of himself as big-headed or anything...He talks to everyone, doesn't matter what kind of background they are from...He is a good-natured person...

After a while Mazir and the rest of the men started to make arrangements to visit the local town centre. As all the men went to support Sajawal that evening, I remember thinking how Mazir invested a lot of time and effort in maintaining relationships between other Pakistanis. Mazir and his family made extensive economic and ritual investment in Pakistan, and he continued to draw spouses for his children from a pool of close affines and kin people living there.

The purpose of describing this particular event is to illustrate how Teesside Pakistanis unite, revealing their ideas and values of brotherhood and equality. When many of my informants and other local Pakistanis were dealing with other local political events, I started to notice how people used a range of symbols of Pakistani-ness (such as common background, notions of Islamic values of equality and brotherhood and/or sharing the local area of Teesside, *qaum* as a strategy for corporate action). These different emblems provide an orientating framework for the content and ideology of social relations and the hegemonic idioms of sameness. I was told that they wanted to vote for Sajawal, as he was believed to be particularly well suited to represent the local Pakistani 'community'. One could go further and suggest that, in this example, being Pakistani is an important characteristic from which people are able to draw and define a field of relationships that can be appealed to. Teesside Pakistanis continue to organise themselves internally, stimulated largely by external pressures, in order to defend economic or political interests. This case echoes the idea that Clifford (1994:308) put forward regarding one of the perspectives of diaspora. He

[30] The discussion was conducted in the Punjabi language.
[31] It is not usually regarded as 'normal' for a young, unmarried Pakistani girl to sit with guests of the opposite sex. Although I told my family that I was interested to find out more about the event, my presence was a cause of concern to my father, who was giving me signs to indicate that he was not happy for me to be among the men! After about twenty minutes I unfortunately had to leave the room as my father was becoming increasingly agitated.

claims that through the historical contexts of displacement, diaspora should be considered as a *signifier* of political struggles to define the local as a distinctive community.

7.3 Caste and Ambivalence

What happens when migrants from a vast region divided by nationality, religion and language, but united by a popular custom and 'tradition', settle permanently in Britain? What kind of diaspora does such a heterogeneous group form? These are the questions I will address in this section - in terms of ideologies and practices associated with *qaum*, religion and social and economic status.

In Teesside, one finds numerous settings and situations in which local Pakistanis encounter one another, from casual conversation in halāl meat shops and clothes shops to daily meetings in the neighbourhood and common work in small factories. In these types of situation British Pakistanis interact with people from a variety of backgrounds (For instance, Mazir and Sajawal are from different *qaum* categories). While Pakistani migrants originate from widely separated localities and disparate backgrounds, no distinctions are made between fellow Pakistanis in matters concerning hospitality, worship and feasting. It will become clearer from what follows that friendship among Pakistanis cuts across both caste and kinship boundaries. Naseem and my grandmother come from different castes, but they are 'people of the same village' and continue to live in the same area of Teesside. This phenomenon becomes even more evident in the context of women's daily interaction, which consists principally of women who share the same neighbourhood or meet at local community centres.

When British Pakistanis meet each other for the first time they tend to ask questions about each other's area of origin in Pakistan and explore what caste category they belong to. It is not considered polite to ask directly what caste one comes from, and this is often discovered through other neighbours or acquaintances by finding out who their consanguineous relatives are. My informants would probe to explore what the *qaum* was of their new neighbours or new friends, and during conversations with me they would often ask me what *qaum* so-and-so belonged to.

However, British Pakistanis use *qaum* categories to distinguish one person from another. Caste labels are not simply imported from Pakistan, as the case studies below will show. Rather they serve as what Banks refers to as 'cognitive maps' (1996:30); they are continuously enforced and relevant to Pakistanis in daily actions: familial, political and religious. In Britain, new situations

arise in which the actions of participants have not been previously regularised and standardised. Correspondingly, the *qaum* categories, used as symbols and tools of interpretation, vary and shift in migratory situations. Even though most Pakistanis in Teesside express disapproval of the caste system, all my informants would practise and assert it when negotiating marriage strategies, or more occasionally, in allegiance with fellow migrants.

During the early phases of migration, both Pakistani men and women associated with people from different caste backgrounds. When I raised this topic during conversations, the younger generation stated that all Pakistanis were 'equal' and one young religious man declared; 'that it doesn't matter whether you are *zamīndār* (name given to a landowning caste group) or *naī* (name given to a barber caste group) (see table 7.1[32]) as long as you are Muslim'; this type of belief can potentially lead to inter-generational conflict. For the younger generation growing up in Britain, *qaum* categories can be of little importance, but I would suggest that this would depend on how kin openly discuss this in the domestic context.

However, in relation to diaspora consciousness, I would assert that we are seeing, here, a particular kind of self-questioning stimulated by conditions of diaspora coupled with religious pluralism. Under such conditions the younger generation of British Pakistanis are compelled to realise that the routine habitual practice, rote learning and 'blind faith' underpinning previous contexts are no longer operational. Emblematic of a shift in religious self-consciousness, the primary question has shifted from 'what shall I believe?' to 'how shall I believe it?', which has implications for understanding and using *qaum* categories in their daily practices. As the younger generation have become literate in Arabic, and now that the translations of the Qur'ān and hadith texts are accessible to them, they have come to realise that *qaum* is a 'traditional' social marker derived from previous generations, rather than deriving from Islam. The younger British Pakistanis question the importance of *qaum* categories. I discovered that people like Azam's son (chapter 6) or Hafza and Mo (see below) are conceptually establishing a firm distinction between 'religion' and 'culture', which were largely indistinguishable realms for their parents. Further, they are rejecting their parents' conformity to 'traditions' which are considered as emblematic of religiosity (such as using *qaum* categories in marital relationships). Among these younger British Pakistani men and women, there is a self-consciousness in their exploration of the Islamic religion that was not relevant to the first-generation (cf. Shaw 2000:189-93).

[32] The caste names that will be provided are those used by informants, which are not necessarily official.

Children and Qaum

I would like, now, to elaborate on children's uses of *qaum*, which make explicit certain markers of mixed feelings towards others of different *qaum*. One cold, Friday afternoon, I was on my way home from meeting Afsha (informant in chapter eight) when I saw Maneeza (an informant) outside, getting absolutely soaked in the rain. I pulled my car close and beeped my horn and shouted for her to come over to the car. 'No, I don't want to trouble you', she insisted. I persuaded her to get in the car, which took some time. She told me that she was going to collect the children from school and that they would walk back. 'No, listen to me *bājī*. If you don't listen to me I will be angry with you', I said jokingly and we both smiled at one another. So we both went to pick up Maneeza's three children (two boys and one girl). She also had a younger daughter who was only eight weeks old at that time. Maneeza is a first-generation British Pakistani who migrated ten years ago after marrying her husband Sorwat. Sorwat's mother and father lived alternately with them and Sorwat's younger brother, also in Teesside. They would stay one month with Sorwat and Maneeza and the next with the other son and his family.

We chatted about local events among Pakistanis in Teesside: (for instance, the killing of a young British Pakistani woman, the kidnapping of two young Pakistani girls and an elaborate wedding that we had both attended). I waited in the car while Maneeza collected her children. They looked very surprised to find me waiting in the car for them. The oldest boy, called Ammar, was very interested in cars, so for him it was good to be travelling back home in one. The youngest two were telling their mother about their day at school. Maneeza put them in the back of the car and jumped into the front passenger seat. On our way home Ammar shouted from the back seat to his mother in Punjabi, '*Ammā* (mother) we're not *jogī* [caste group: see table below] are we? Because at school Sagar was saying that we are. I told him we are *zamīndār* and he said you are not'. Maneeza said, 'Son, we are *zamīndār*', and started to laugh as she replied to him. She continued talking to me: 'It's so funny, isn't it, how kids talk about *qaum*?' I nodded my head and waited to see whether Ammar would say more. Instead, Maneeza commented, 'Son, it doesn't matter what *qaum* you are from and don't make fun of others - you are all Muslim brothers, O.K'. I glanced in the rearview mirror to see Ammar's reaction, as he smiled and said mischievously, 'I won't'.

For some families, like Ammar's, *qaum* is openly discussed in front of young children and this indicates the way difference is given meaning during the early years of life. However, this is *not* the case for all the informants I met. Many British Pakistani youngsters only begin to understand

the significance of *qaum* as they grow older. Parents and the older generation reconstruct a localised caste ranking, whose categories and place in the hierarchy have a meaning different from that of the original context. In Pakistan, caste labels are closely associated with the type of hereditary occupation or land ownership one has. Table 7.1 records the caste categories of the Teesside Pakistanis I worked with. The table also contains some brief information about each caste category and the type of land ownership or occupation associated with it. The list is not presented in order of hierarchy.

Table 7.1: Caste categories represented by some informants in Teesside

CASTE CATEGORY	INFORMATION
Arāīṅ	The majority of my informants were from this caste. They are usually associated with vegetable marketers in Pakistan. However, the *arāīṅ are* perceived as wealthier, for instance, by the *gujar* caste. The *arāīṅ* people I met have kin who live in large cities in Pakistan, such as Islammabad, Mirpur, Jhelum who brought *kotiya* in Lahore. Afsha and Daad come from this caste.
Zamīndār	Landowning caste. A lot of my informants referred to themselves as the *zamīndār* caste, even though some were from a *jat* background. *Jat* is usually a sub-category of the *zamīndār* caste, a farming caste dominant in rural Punjab in Azad Kashmir. For instance, Azam, Amina and Aziz are all from the *zamīndār* caste.
Gujar	The *gujar* caste are usually referred to as cattle herders. For instance, Naseem is from this caste. I found it interesting that a lot of the *zamīndār* caste associated with people from the *gujar* background. First-generation Pakistanis had contacts from Pakistan with the *gujar* people in Pakistan and maintained their connections when migrating to Britain. Rasab also is a member of the *gujar* caste.
Naī	The *naī* caste are usually referred to as barbers in Pakistan. During my fieldwork, a lot of my informants came from this caste and a lot of their ancestors used to be barbers in Pakistan. Moreover, some *naī* have hair salons in Teesside, or when a baby is born the first hair is cut by a *naī* in the local area. As well as being barbers, four of the families of the *naī* caste made meals for large communal events in Teesside, such as weddings, funerals and *khatm-e-Qur'ān.* Informants such as Pervaiz and Begum are from the *naī* caste.
Kashmiri	Origin in Kashmir, Pakistan. A large number of wealthier Pakistanis in Teesside come from the *kashmiri* caste. The men and women tend to have some sort of educational background in Urdu or English. Informants would refer to people from the *Kashmiri* caste as 'city people'. For instance, people such as Sadique's family are from this caste. Many of those living in Teesside are business-orientated families.
Jogī	A lot of the *jogīs* in Pakistan are relatively poor. However, in Teesside my informants from the *jogī* caste lived in central Teesside and some owned family businesses. One informant from the *zamīndār* caste told me how she had *jogī* lodgers living in her house in Pakistan and this was ideal for the *jogī*, as some had no permanent settlement and were identified as nomads by other Pakistanis.
Pathan	*Pathans* usually have the common title of Khan. *Pathans* are therefore easily identified by local Pakistanis, as their family surname is generally Khan. Many *pathans*, I was told, are inferior in terms of social class and some told me that they were very 'hard' people.

An individual belongs to a particular *qaum* by inheritance. This is why Pakistanis prefer to practise endogamous marriages between *rishtedār* (consanguineous relatives). Marriages are therefore 'highly significant *symbolic* ranking mechanisms' (Werbner 1990: 87) for Muslims. I was fortunate enough to meet some Pakistani women who were married to Arab men, migrants from Saudia Arabia. These women and their extended kin asserted that marriage should be more about whether one is Muslim or not, rather than about caste affiliation. Many of these women came from very religious families and often I felt there were religious and personal motives for their marriages. For instance, Jabreen and her three sisters are all married to Arab men. Jabreen's father, a highly devout and somewhat strict individual, would assert to the rest of the Pakistanis in Teesside (I got to know this through Maneeza, one of the neighbours living close to the family) that he was performing a 'good Islamic deed' by 'getting poor Arab men to marry his daughters so they could obtain their visas and stay permanently in England'. Jabreen and her sisters all lived very close to their parent's home and although Pakistani marriages often involve virilocal residence, (where a daughter leaves her natal home and lives with her in-laws), Jabreen and her sisters have never had to live with their in-laws, which can be regarded as a burden by some Pakistani daughter-in-laws.[33] In fact, since Jabreen's marriage (six years ago) she had only seen her in-laws once, when the family made a visit to Dubai.

Although Islam is rather lenient towards marriage with a wide range of fellow Muslims, Werbner (1990) argues that preferences for first cousin marriages should *not* be considered as the ultimate explanation for the continued significance of caste among British Pakistanis. Here I will use two case examples to show how *qaum* becomes important in both marriage negotiations and also in disputes between two families of different backgrounds.

Marriage Choices, Conflicts and Relatedness

The ethnography that follows will demonstrate how notions of *birādarī* and *qaum* can be used negatively towards families of another *qaum*, thus highlighting a major theme of the chapter: the implications of the ambivalent nature of Pakistani interpersonal relations and social experience in Teesside. The first case study concerns one of my informants, called Hafza, a 23-year-old British Pakistani who was three months pregnant when we met.[34] Hafza lived with her husband Mo and his family (mother, father, younger three siblings) in a relatively prosperous part of Teesside. After Hafza had received her 20-week scan at the hospital, she started confiding in me. When I

[33] Living with in-laws is a sensitive topic among British Pakistanis see Shaw (2000, 2004) and Charsley (2005)

[34] The interview with Hafza was conducted in English.

started to ask questions about her family, Hafza revealed that over the last year and a half she had experienced a lot of heartache with her '*paykay*' (natal family/home) because of her marriage choice.

> **Hafza:** You might have heard about this because there was a lot of talk about it. People thought it was scandalous, but I had a love marriage and chose to marry Mo. I met Mo at college and we really got on together. My mam and dad were arranging my marriage to a relative in Pakistan and I tried to tell my mam that I didn't want to marry him. I told her that I liked Mo and that we were going to get married, she started to say how he was of another *qaum*, he was *arāīṅ* and because we are *zamīndār* they said it was wrong and his family were different. Then one day my father started to arrange for us to go to Pakistan during the Christmas holidays, I told my mother that I would not be going to go and didn't want the marriage. She said if I was to marry Mo, I would never be allowed to come back to the house, as my father, brother and the rest of the family would be deeply saddened. She told me that my father would really kill me. I just cried and cried and contacted Mo told him what was happening...
> **N.I:** How did his family see it?
> **Hafza:** He told them and they were not happy and he told them we would run off together if they disapproved. Anyway he has an aunty who told them [his parents] that it would be better to support him because otherwise they would lose their son. Then Mo and his family arrived and asked my parents for the *rishtha* (marriage proposal), but my family were just devastated. They said we could have the *nikāḥ* (Islamic wedding ceremony), but they would not support me. That day I chose to leave them and be with Mo. I decided to leave my family for him.
> **N.I:** How has it been with his family?
> **Hafza:** When I first came all his family were really awful to me to be honest. I knew his mother didn't want it and his dad just didn't say anything. His extended family were not too bad, except one member of his family: she would come around and be really nosy about it all. I knew she would come for the gossip. She would always pick up on everything, like one day I was cooking and she was saying to my mother-in-law: make her do all the work in the house and then she will get tired and leave. Things like that hurt. Then I thought, I have made my decision, I'll just have to put up with it now. Mo and I just felt we hadn't done anything wrong, but still found it difficult confronting all these people. I didn't want to go to town at first. I remember when I used to go out people used to give me really dirty looks. Things have got better now, but I still don't visit my family and I really wish they would accept me...
> **N.I:** What about your brothers or sisters?
> **Hafza:** I've seen one of my brothers and his wife and they started to cry at first and asked me how I was. When I asked them how mam was they said, 'You have really killed them. Dad does not go out anymore and mam just cries'. I felt so bad, so guilty, and it hurts me.

Hafza's emotional story reveals how there is a shift of relations of belonging when marriage occurs among members different castes. Earlier in the chapter I showed how there is a reconfiguration of ideas of relatedness in the new migratory context and how people from different caste backgrounds would call each other *bahin* or *bhā'ī* and invest a lot of effort in maintaining these close relations. I would suggest, however, that idioms of kinship are

insufficient in themselves to explain social life amongst Teesside Pakistanis. My contention is that, for Teesside Pakistanis at least, sociality is ambivalent; at a superficial level people's ideologies are centred on notions of brotherhood (suggesting that the ideology is also gendered) and equality (and political). A closer examination of the Pakistani sociality of everyday life reveals how *qaum* distinctions constitute a 'conceptual hierarchy' (Shaw 2000:133) and a practice of inequality.

The reinterpretation of the significance of *qaum* distinctions by some of the younger generation arises from new situations in which people have to construct new forms of action. Hafza and Mo give different weight to caste distinctions; they piece together different patterns of equality and inequality among British Muslim Pakistanis. In Hafza's narrative, what starts to emerge is how she needed to consider her own actions in relation to the ongoing activities of other significant kin. What one's associates are doing becomes the context inside which one's own developing act has to fit. Thus, the expression by the younger generation (such as Hafza and Mo) of their expectations and intentions, their solicitations and instructions, their demands and commands, are matters which the individual has to take into account in fashioning her/his own act.

I discovered that Hafza comes from a different type of background fromo Mo. Hafza comes from a *zamīndār* background; her family are not considered wealthy and her parents had no education in Urdu and Arabic. Her father works at a local restaurant, and in Pakistan they live in a small village near Azad Kashmir. In contrast, Mo is not only from the *arāīn* caste, but his extended *birādarī* are rather prosperous and the family own several local businesses. In Pakistan, Mo has many wealthy relatives, including several uncles who are doctors living in the city of Mirpur. Mo's parents had very high expectations that he would complete his final year at college and do a business/law degree at university. I am aware that Mo chose to take a year out from his studies to support Hafza and his newborn child.

The anxieties felt by many British Pakistanis, including my own family, were reiterated when I attended a wedding of some close friends during the early stage of my fieldwork. These friends were from a different *qaum* category and were identified as one of the richest families in Middlesbrough. A relative from the groom's family came up to my grandmother and greeted her, going on to say, 'You are my real *khāla* because my mam married your cousin for a while, didn't she...?' My grandmother became embarrassed and looked very anxious, then got up quickly and told us all (my mother, younger sister and two aunts) to move away from the woman. When

trying to hurry on my crutches, I enquired what the woman meant by claiming that she was related and why my grandmother had reacted in such a way. My grandmother and mother told me to be quiet and said that they would tell me when we returned home. When we arrived home that night they told me that my grandmother's first cousin, living in Pakistan, had been married to a woman from a different *qaum* for a while. It was believed to be scandalous and later his family forced him to leave her and marry his paternal cousin. My grandmother told me that very few people knew about this and that it should be 'kept a secret'.

Often, in inter-caste marriages, parents would tend to support their son's decision, and Mo's parents consent for him to marry Hafza has, I think, deeper symbolic significances. Inter-generational conflicts present an interesting context in which to study interests, emotions and what Fortes (1969) once labelled 'the axiom of amity'. In the migratory context, when parents and children are involved in these kinds of dispute each engages in a re-evaluation of the meaning of relationships. Besides the affection felt by Mo's parents, here we begin to see that affection felt is just as reciprocal as duty. While strong moral claims on one's autonomy and resources are lodged in ideas of what Pakistanis may accept as 'family' or *birādarī*, affection becomes duty, which provides an insight into the prescriptive performance of emotions. Children who do not adhere to the moral Pakistani prescriptions are seen as bad. Parents deny the existence of any positive emotions in those who are not virtuous (an example being Hafza labelled a 'bad girl' by her parents). This reveals one of the essential themes of this thesis: the hostilities and rivalries built into relationships of close kin amongst the Pakistanis I worked with. Hafza's narrative illustrates that inter-generational disputes create a conscious act of negotiation of relationships. But in Pakistan, obeying parents' decisions to marry within the *birādarī* is where the 'prescriptive altruism' (Fortes 1969:246) is enacted and reinforced.

However, the advantage of paying attention to the concrete social experiences of people - the specific contexts in which they organise themselves, their resources, the ways in which they create meanings and order in their lives - is that it enables us to unpack the emotive tones inherent in Mo's parents' assessment. Material interests and the web of emotions which hold the immediate *ghar* members in place are viewed for the most part as separate and distinct. Mo is the oldest son and his father is involved in a family business. Mo's parents might believe that their son's education would benefit them in the future (whenever I visited the family Mo was always absent, helping his father with the family business). In addition, Mo's paternal aunt is an important figure, and she told her brother and sister-in-law to give their consent and allow Hafza

to become Mo's wife. I was told by Hafza that Mo's aunt warned his parents to 'keep your hands on him [Mo] and forgive him don't lose a son, it's not worth it'.

In contrast, Hafza's parents were devastated by her actions and even after the birth of her child, neither the family nor any of her *birādarī* members visited her. This highlights the way in which particular biological uncles and aunts may virtually disappear from the kin network as a result of negative social and emotional connectedness. In contrast to Mo's family, Hafza's family's emotions did not dictate a 'code of conduct' (Schneider 1984). However, on a later visit I was told that one of Hafza's sisters-in-law did come and that her mother had sent some gifts for the baby and Hafza. When I asked Hafza what she thought about her mother not coming to give the presents herself she explained:

> My mam is scared of my dad and his family because I was supposed to get married to my *ćaćā's* (younger paternal uncle's) son. This has caused a lot of hatred within the family. My dad will be blaming my mother for it all. I can imagine it all happening. He'll be saying to her 'you are the one who spoilt her. I told you not to; and my mam will believe him as well...My dad's got a sister in England who was really awful to my mam anyway. She hates my mam and I bet she is having a really good time now because she can really stir it up...

The above quotation is interesting from a number of perspectives. Firstly it highlights the way in which British migrants are deeply entrenched within networks stretching across both Pakistan and Britain, as a result making the social category *qaum* of continued significance. Marriages with relatives are thought to be necessary if the kinship relationship is not to vanish. For instance, one mother told me that when her only daughter married her brother's son, her brother said to her: 'By giving your daughter to me you have returned to us because I was married outside the *birādarī*'. The quote from Hafza, however, vividly describes how marriage between cousins from Pakistan and England becomes significant in maintaining kin connections. Secondly, the quotation also shows that within new forms of relatedness with neighbours, friends and workmates British Pakistanis in the migratory context make *qaum* distinctions, which are continuously enforced.

However, there were some cases I came across where women and/or men had not married within the *birādarī* but had instead married with members of the same caste. When my grandmother and Naseem were talking they turned to the topic of relationships between kin and the fissures that can develop when children grow up. One of Naseem's daughters, called Aneela, was supposed to

marry her brother's only son who was living in London. Naseem told my grandmother that when her daughter was young

> everyone knew that they were matched and when people used to ask for her *rishtha* I used to say, I am going to give my daughter to my brother. But when she left school and I started to think about her marriage, my brother's son refused to marry her. I was told that he wanted to marry my other niece. We were devastated. I had practically brought up my brother. I spoilt him like anything when we came to England...It was all my sister-in-law's doing. She is the one to blame. She wanted her son to marry my other sister's daughter. She wanted it to happen this way...Anyway, when I found out, I stopped talking to both my brother and my sister...Then, you know, *māsī* Saleem palākā *nā*[35], she met me at a *mātam* (a commemoration of death) and told me that she was going to come to visit me that evening....She came with her son Babar and daughter Khalida and they told me that they wanted the *rishta* for my Aneela for Babar's son...I said that I would need to ask my husband and daughter and then tell them...We were really confused about it because they were not in the *birādarī* and so we asked our (extended family). They said they thought they were good people and that *māsī* Saleem was a good person...So when they came back we said yes, and we started to prepare for the marriage...

I also heard about Aneela's marriage from one of my acquaintances who went to the wedding. She told me that although the families were considered to be from the same *qaum*, they maintained different lifestyles because they belonged to different classes. Naseem in this context was described as being of a higher status, while the boy's family were thought to be poorer and lived in a part of Middlesbrough considered to be deprived. I was informed that Naseem was turned down by her brother so she had 'no choice - what could she do? She had to give her daughter there'. In this case, for Naseem and her family, caste was of primary importance throughout. Naseem had allegedly given a lot of *dāj sonā* (dowry and gold together, referring to the dowry) to her daughter and their family; it was believed that the boy's side had increasingly benefited from this new kin connection.

So far in this chapter I have attempted to illustrate some of the myriad sites in the production of ambivalence surrounding relatedness in the everyday practices of Middlesbrough Pakistanis. The second example will attempt to provide an insight into the anxiety and vulnerable nature of Pakistani social life. A central component featured in Hafza's narrative is 'gossip' and 'talking' among the Pakistani community about her choice. In chapter 6, Azam revealed his *sharam* (shame) over his son's actions. In Hafza's case, relatives were said to be 'nosy' about her situation.

---

[35] Often you hear immigrant Pakistanis say the name of the individual and then the village that they lived in in Pakistan. In this instance, Saleem came from a village called *palāk* (Azad Kashmir).

Friendships and hostility

Parvaiz was the father-in-law of one of my friends, Uzma, a 30-year-old Pakistani immigrant. She was married to Pervaiz's oldest son, Ragib. They had two children and Uzma was pregnant with the third. Pervaiz and his family came from the *gujar* caste. Pervaiz was known as a *ćaudharī* (crudely translated as headman) in Pakistan and had taught at a school before arriving in England. On arrival, Pervaiz was introduced to a popular figure (called Sadique) among the small clique of Pakistani men that Pervaiz began to interact with. Sadique was from the *kashmiri* caste and was regarded as a well-educated man who came from a wealthy family.

When Pervaiz's wife Jameela arrived, she told me that she missed Pakistan, and her family and friends in particular, but that Sadique's wife Jaan was a huge help to her:

> I honestly didn't know how to turn on the cooker or anything and she would come around and show me. She took me to shops with her to get food and clothes. She was just my *sahelī* (female friend); she would take me to the doctor's. We became very close and we used to tell each other about our problems with the extended family. My sisters-in-law were jealous because of the friendship and I called Jaan my *bājī*. She was always present at the births of my children...I thought of her as my sister.

Sadique opened a small business and asked Pervaiz to be involved in its planning and organisation. Pervaiz's son told me that his father did not actually work as a labourer in the factory, but helped to liase with company associates. The two men continued to have 'a very good relationship' and Pervaiz called Sadique '*bhā'ī*' (older brother). Sadique and his family bought a large house on the outskirts of Middlesbrough, while Pervaiz moved to a suburban area. There was a clear divide in wealth between Pervaiz and Sadique's family, and Pervaiz described Sadique's family as 'high people'.

Sadique's business expanded and he formed new alliances with fellow companies. Pervaiz was still working with Sadique at this time and his son told me that when Pervaiz organised his son's marriage, Sadique played a major role. He not only helped organise these elaborate occasions, but continued to support Pervaiz's household financially. Sadique's three sons worked in the factories and they called Pervaiz *bhā'ī*. When Sadique and his family visited Pakistan in August 2001, Pervaiz and his wife travelled with them. Jameela told me that she and her husband did not go to their 'home village' in Pakistan, but stayed in one of Sadique's *koṭhī*. She described the relationship in the following way:

> We were very close, and you know, our family was really jealous that we were really good friends with the family. One of my sisters-in-law hated it. She even used to say that if we had to choose between them and Sadique, we would choose Sadique and his family. My mother-in-law used to hate it and when we used to have *dāvat* [meaning an invitation to a large meal for a family] or call them at Eid, our *rishtedār* would really get annoyed, but they were our friends and good people.

The strong emotional bonds between Sadique and Pervaiz's families were based on the time-consuming and arduous task of acknowledging and taking careful notice of each other's feelings. After 15 years of this, Pervaiz's daughter-in-law and son Ragib informed me, obviously very upset, their father had been 'tricked' by Sadique and his sons:

> Sadique really tricked my father...He got these legal papers arranged for us. When my father wanted to buy a house because we needed a bigger one, he basically told my dad to pay the deposit, but we found that the signatures were his. That meant that the house was in his name. He would own the house and my dad wouldn't. He even got a lot of money from him. When our dad found out from a letter sent to our address he tried to cover it up and say because he sorted it all out he thought it might be easier to say it was his. Dad told me and we all had a fit. Sadique was so selfish and we honestly thought this could not happen. We threw a fit. So we brothers got together and went to Sadique's and shoved the letter in front of his face. We told him that we were not having this and we found out what it was all about. We knew that he was taking advantage of us. He knew that my dad was naïve, uneducated and that we were, you know, poorer than him and that he could just manipulate us. But we found it all out.
> **N.I:** How were your mam and dad?
> **Jameela:** Oh, they were really hurt, you should have seen them. *khāla*, she couldn't eat, sleep, do anything for days, and *māmā* (maternal uncle), he couldn't face people because I think he just felt his *izzat* was gone.
> **Ragib:** You know, the rest of the family was laughing and they said we were waiting for this to happen to you. My dad hated it all, but that wasn't the end of it. A month later, my mam and dad were at home and Sadique came in demanding that my dad give him the money that he had lent my father. My dad said, 'How can I get you the money?' My dad owed him something like £50,000 and to be honest we couldn't get that much...We have had to sell the house we lived in and now we are living here, which is so small.
> **Jameela:** All the families were loving it all, they were laughing. *Māmū* and *khāla* are so depressed with it all and we are trying to help them to come to terms with it.
> **N.I:** What about the other people who worked there?
> **Ragib:** You know, my dad's other friends were great you know all the *gujar* living in the area really backed my dad and they even arranged to meet with Sadique at the mosque. They said, how could he have done it to him, but Sadique is clever, he made out that he had never done anything and said he just wanted his money back from us. There was one day when my dad went to a *mātam* and all the people started to discuss it. My dad said it started to turn into a conflict between the *naī* and *kashmiri* there. The *gujar* were saying they are people, what kind of people are they, who just think of money and don't think about being a Muslim? It helped my dad to know that people were on his side, but still he felt hurt.

The details given by Ragib and Uzma are important on at least two counts. First, Pervaiz and Sadique could be described as having a multiplex relationship. These types of multiplex relations are significant to many British Pakistanis living in England, including those in Bristol, as Jeffrey's (1973) work has explicitly highlighted. But here we see how Pervaiz and his family were bound together in multiple roles. In Pervaiz and Sadique's context they were not only 'close', or as Ragib said, 'really good friends', but they were also involved in other types of relationship (employer-employee).

However, at the heart of this narrative is the constant re-evaluation of status and meaning in relationships. Ragib and his wife's interpretation about caste differences and brotherhood between Pakistanis is constructed in a very different way from that of the case studies examined in section 7.1. It is apparent that Pervaiz and his family's reactions to the offence committed by Sadique are constructed solely within the interpretive framework of difference. In contrast, Sajawal's negative interpretation of *qaum* distinctions switched the framework of difference to that of unity. Switching in this way allowed him to construct an account in which a potentially demeaning experience could be transformed into a reaffirmation of the relationship between *all* Muslim-Pakistanis in Britain and Pakistan. I suggest that by using difference and unity as alternative interpretative frames, Muslim-Pakistanis in Middlesbrough avoid having to confront the contradictions between equality and inequality.

Nevertheless, the cases of both Hafza and Pervaiz reveal how the central features of caste can be concealed behind a disguise of new forms of relatedness in Middlesbrough. When friends from different caste backgrounds call each other *bahin* (sister), *bhā'ī* (brother), and when Pakistanis say that they are all equal, it is essential to elucidate the complexity of caste and how it is put into practice in the context of migration. Furthermore, Ragib has an interest in emphasising the unity of different *qaums* in political confrontations. Different *qaum* categories constitute a contested domain and an uneasy set of ambivalences are apparent in the discourse and practice surrounding social relationships among British Pakistanis. This is largely resolved by Pakistanis through creating cognitive maps which link contexts. Sometimes practices of brotherhood/equality are foregrounded and at other times *qaum* categories are. As Pervaiz and Sadique's case study shows, however, the shadow of caste differences always looms in the background, and when friendship networks are disrupted caste becomes a core issue. I would add further that the personal bond between Pervaiz and Sadique, before the conflict, is distinct from that between Mo and his parents. The bond created by Sadique and Pervaiz, although revealed as initially 'strong' or

'close', did not entirely erase their differences, which became foregrounded when the conflict occurred.

While acknowledging that some practices may reinforce boundaries, the findings in this chapter would suggest that the situation is not clear-cut. Rather than individuals having a fixed sense of belonging to the British Muslim Pakistani group, it becomes clear that, in general, the informants I interviewed are able to move unselfconsciously from one milieu to another. As Sadique has migrated he has experienced a reconfiguration of desires and ideas about material wealth. He has become competent in associating with people from different *qaums* as well as with the wider host society. As noted in chapter 6, cultural competence and improvisation are core features of Bourdieu's notion of habitus: the non-conscious set of dispositions and classificatory schemes that people gain through experience, which provides a kind of repertoire for situationally competent action, improvisation and the generation of new practices (Bourdieu 1977, 1990). I also illustrated the fact that habitus is a concept particularly useful for approaching the subject of agency in diasporic cultural practice and reproduction. Appadurai (1991) suggests this, yet he believes we must rework the concept with reference to 'a general change in the global conditions of life-worlds: put simply, where once improvisation was snatched out of the global undertow of habitus, habitus now has to be painstakingly reinforced in the face of life-worlds that are frequently in flux' (1991:200).

7.4 Conclusions

In this chapter I have provided extended illustrations of the kinds of social relations found amongst the British Pakistanis living on Teesside. Throughout these examples I have sought to bring out two main themes. Firstly, I have argued that Pakistani social life generally occurs in relation to significant others with a set of references consistent with traditional family and kin ideology. British Pakistanis' desire for substantive sociality - to interact with people who share a similar background - is ambivalent. Migrant Pakistanis recreate the ideals maintained by cultural values about brotherhood and equality, but they do so self-consciously and adaptively in order to accommodate their particular needs.

While place of origin and belonging to a place each plays an integral part in the narratives of both my grandmother and Naseem, the dialogue indicated some of the ways in which each of these is foregrounded. In other accounts we saw how the production of shared narratives linked to place of origin is an important aspect of the formation of new types of relations (such as those between Pervaiz and Sadique). When kin status might be extended to those outside the blood kin network,

everyone knows that they are not real kin - blood is a determining factor - but they interact in ways that are recognisably kin-like. Pakistanis talk of being like kinfolk and this is interesting from several perspectives. In these cases, however, shared experiences have in themselves created bonds between people. In chapter 6 we read of informants explaining 'it is good for children to go to Pakistan and find out where they really come from'. But here, what seems equally clear is that it is good for parents to maintain relationships with kin, friends and *gra na banday* (people from the same village) in order to renew *birādarī* and *qaum* categories.

The second theme illustrates how a closer inspection of Pakistani practices reveals complex interactions constituting micro-histories of their own, indicating that *qaum* categories are salient. Hafza's vignette revealed how the practice of marrying a close cousin in Pakistan would have been essential for the family's *izzat* and would have helped to maintain its *qaum* and *birādarī* status. As a whole, the chapter has attempted to shed light on the ambivalent nature of Pakistani interpersonal relations. This theme is intrinsic to the overall aim of the thesis which, it should be remembered, is to explore the vast range of mixed feelings towards kin relations in the migratory context. Mo's case illuminates the way in which inter-generational disputes provide important insights into the reworking of material interests and re-examination of emotions towards kin. The ethnographic examples reveal the complex and often contradictory reworking of Pakistani traditions concerning relatedness in early-twenty-first century diasporic contexts. In chapter 8, I will explore in more detail individuals' connections with Pakistan, paying particular attention to the way people refer to it as 'home'. I will discuss the various ways one can become *walāytī* (foreign/outsider) in Pakistan and how people claim 'insider' or 'outsider' status.

Chapter Eight

Migration and Becoming *Walāytī*

8.1 Introduction

The continuing relationships, both real and imagined, between 'home' and 'away', 'here' and 'there', 'homeland' and 'diaspora' form the major topic of this chapter. The basic term 'homeland'has been revised and given different meanings by different people. Previously, homeland was commonly depicted as a sacred place filled with memories of past glory and bathed in visions of nobility and renaissance. Paradoxically, in the new discourse, homelands sometimes fade out of view entirely, or as noted above, they become nationstates that by definition repress minorities and impose limits upon their cultural and other freedoms. As highlighted in chapter 3, the meaning of 'diaspora' has also been transformed. In the old usage, diasporas were commonly depicted as melancholy places of exile and oppression that restricted social and cultural achievement. In sharp contrast, in the current view diasporas are enthusiastically embraced as arenas for the creative melding of cultures and the formation of new 'hybrid' mixed identities. To be part of diasporas is, apparently, to be 'on the cutting edge' of new cultural and other formations.

The sudden multiplicity of what are being called 'diasporas' might be confusing. Definitions are necessary, as without them practically any migration to any place can be seen to have produced its diaspora. Clifford has argued that in the late twentieth century, all or most communities have diasporic dimensions, but some are more diasporic than others (1994). From this perspective, important questions emerge: are all contemporary ethnic minorities better understood as diasporas that are as much influenced by their links to their homeland as they are to the hosts among whom they reside? Do diasporas influence homeland, and why? Under what circumstances can or might a diaspora become a homeland and what are the dynamics of these changing relationships? What are the consequences of belonging to two places at the same time, and what conditions or circumstances make doing so possible? These are the questions I attempt to answer by placing homeland and diaspora at the centre of the discussion. The ethnographic material below will demonstrate that homeland and diaspora are not clear-cut and precise terms, but are considerably more complex and contingent on other issues. For instance, there are circumstances in which a diaspora begins to take on some of the qualities of a homeland. The diaspora and homeland pair is therefore open to question. If we live in a 'world on the move', then which among the millions of

migrants are those who can properly be said to be living 'in diaspora' and which are just plain 'migrants', 'transnationalists' or 'ethnics'?

While many British Pakistanis return to their 'real homeland' (Pakistan), they have also come to see Britain as their 'symbolic homeland'. I offer ethnographic vignettes with broader analysis to explain why some Pakistanis choose to bury their dead in the local village cemeteries in Pakistan rather than in England. In addition, large numbers of Pakistanis living in England, have also developed a kind of nostalgia for and symbolic identification with Pakistan. This is expressed in such matters as trips – practically pilgrimages – 'back home' to Pakistan and a growing number of films that present the past in glowing colours. In short, Britain has become both a diaspora and a new centre; the relationship between diaspora and homeland may be fluid, historically conditioned and even multi-directional. This reformulation has broad theoretical consequences for 'diaspora studies'. What 'diaspora' is and what constitutes homeland are not necessarily obvious and clear in the complex contemporary world of movement and migration. Indeed, the paradigm itself requires reconsideration. Relationships between diaspora and homeland are anything but static and, in fact, immigration often sets off processes which are unexpected and richly paradoxical.

Discussions among British Pakistanis would suggest that they belong to various local and national contexts: they wish to 'become British Pakistanis', albeit on their own terms, and like others they attend state-sponsored schools, vote in elections and get jobs. They also suffer from racial prejudice and some (Werbner 2004) report how British Pakistanis have staged large demonstrations to protest against discrimination. At the same time, some travel back to Pakistan, for spices, clothes and videos (cf. chapter 9). In this sense they are becoming part of a transnational Pakistani community that includes Pakistani and non-Pakistani, and their identity as 'British Pakistanis' takes on entirely new meanings. What is more, for some, alienation from the dominant majority in British society, as well as involvement with contemporary global processes, have led to the development of a new Pakistani 'diasporic consciousness'. Ironically, having returned to Pakistan, the homeland, a growing number of British Pakistanis are also constructing new identities as participants in a global Pakistani diaspora (such as Afsha below). This is a crucial point, which offers a new perspective of homelands and events which needs to be understood in the interplay between the local British context, the former village of origin and the global dimensions of world culture.

Ballard's book, *Desh Pardesh* (1994), is relevant to understanding the relationship between home and away. In Urdu, *Desh* means 'homeland' or 'nation' and *Pardesh* implies 'away' or 'homeland', but another form of 'home'. Ballard translates his title in the following way:

> *Desh Pardesh* has a double meaning, for it can equally well be translated both as 'home from home' and as 'at home abroad'.

Ballard's focal concern here is, essentially, with homes. The collection contains various illustrations of the maintenance of the religion, language, *birādarī*, caste distinctions and social networks of South Asian immigrants (1994). He specifically points out that each ethnographic paper addresses

> ... current processes of social, religious and cultural adaptations within a specific, and usually highly localized, British South Asian community. (1994:3)

A major facet of Ballard's book is the concern with connections between overseas populations and 'the motherland' and the maintenance of and loss of 'tradition'. During the 1970s, many social scientists concentrated on the 'two ends of the migration process' (cf. Watson 1977). Since then some have criticised such works, for instance, Anwar's (1979), study of 'culture', for the way they compare the subcontinents with counterparts that South Asians have left behind. Others (van de Veer 1995) have, however, commented that it is not that the subcontinent is not important, but that the way the researcher understands the connection is perhaps more significant.

Previously, migration studies concentrated on unilinear and irrevocable models of movement from a place of origin to a new place of residence. Questions concerning integration and assimilation were central to the notion of migration. In the last two decades, however, these models have been replaced by a focus on what is referred to as 'hybridity' and movement across borders. Through this change we have seen the introduction of the terminology of 'transnationalism' and 'transmigration' into academic debates (cf. chapter 3).

The principle aim here is to show that what is diaspora and what constitutes homeland are not necessarily obvious and clear for some British Pakistani informants, in the complex contemporary world of movement and migration. During interviews I started to see how informants' interactions with Pakistan were in fact more complex. Some families could be characterised as temporary migrants or sojourners, since each couple would take turns living 'here' and living 'there', in Pakistan and England in this case. Many informants had connections not only to Pakistan, but other places in the world, and their experiences provide useful insights into ideas of longing and belonging. Accordingly, I will use the Punjabi notion of *walāyt*, which designates a

place outside Pakistan. A person who migrated to England was known as *walāytī*: someone outside/foreigner. Often diasporic populations are labelled as forming distinct diasporic 'communities', which implies that experiences of migration are similar for each person. The movement of people, however, brings with it a vast amount of variety and, like Osella and Osella (2000), I argue that migration is an ambiguous experience, which brings success and prosperity for some and inequality for others (cf. Gardner 1995).

The ethnographic material presented below consists of four case studies, which highlight three interconnected arguments. Firstly, the migration of Pakistani grandparents and parents to England makes them 'double outsiders'. As they leave Pakistan they become known as *walāytī* and are considered as outsiders by kin and neighbours living in Pakistan. As migrants (and 'Asians') living in the United Kingdom, Pakistani parents still feel 'foreign' and are considered as outsiders by the majority or dominant group in Britain. In this instance, we see that many people refer to Pakistan as 'home' or 'back home'. I suggest that people's identification with Pakistan as home is created by British Pakistanis resulting from works of the imagination, whereby certain group identifications are naturalised.

The second argument is that although the majority of the Pakistani families I interviewed are in a constant dialogue with Pakistan, becoming *walāytī* is a social process that entails a re-interpretation of what home/s entail. I suggest that when one analyses narratives about the notion of *walāyt* it is important to explore the temporal and spatial constructions of experiences. The examples below will specifically describe how Pakistani transnational migration does not necessarily entail movement between two unconnected places, in this case Britain and Pakistan, but rather involves a more plural vision of what home is.

The third argument, closely connected to the second, relates to how recent social and political factors have modified perceptions about belonging and living in Britain. The perceptions for some families are tied to the September 11th 2001 terrorist attacks on the USA that placed Islam and Muslims of every hue in the media and made them the objects of political focus. During the course of their lives, older generation Pakistanis and their children have been labeled outsiders in the lands of both emigration and immigration, and the narratives presented below will reveal how they are implicated by each of these two processes. Each narrative in the chapter provides an exploration of the complexities of belonging and identification and the shifting experiences of dislocation. Like Safran (1991:16), I argue that there are particular 'triggering' events, in this case

in the hostland, that have revived the diasporic identities of Pakistani Muslim groups in Middesbrough. The 'triggering' events include acts of religious intolerance, or what can now be referred to as 'Islamophobia' (Werbner 2004).

8.2 Case Studies

Ideas about Belonging and Home: *'Where are you from?'*

I would like to return to the conversation between Naseem and my grandmother about Pakistan (see chapter 7 case study 1), as it will provide an insight into the way in which transnationalism plays out in their lives and also will illustrate how the homeland is being framed. The exchange between Naseem and my grandmother begins with a reference to something different from what people usually connote by the word 'home'. They discuss sharing similar past experiences, and in particular, their poverty. Naseem describes how when she and my grandmother were young they would meet one another whilst fetching water from the local river. My grandmother goes on to explain how they used to stay and sleep together, providing indications of how similar past experiences in Pakistan-as-home give a sense of place where they belong.

I found it somewhat difficult to respond to questions that first-generation Pakistanis asked me when we first met. I found it hard to answer the question 'Where do you come from?' because I did not understand what, in this case, people meant by home; was I supposed to understand it as meaning Pakistan or Middlesbrough? There are many moments in the field when it is difficult to know exactly what is being asked or what is likely to be answered. Such questions are, quintessentially, questions concerned with self and other. But here, the question 'Where are you from?' is usually conceived as a friendly attempt to learn more about and get to know a person. The question 'Where is your home?' is socially accepted and can be heard in everyday conversations between Pakistanis in Middlesbrough.

While we were eating *makā nā roṭī* (corn flour chapattis), the topic of conversation between Naseem and my grandmother was still centred on Pakistan - a place that I believed could be identified as home. They both started to talk about being *walāytī* when visiting Pakistan. Naseem started to tell my grandmother:

> You know my sister Jaan? Well she is living here in England now. My brother's got her visa to come over here, but she hates living here. I say to her, Why do you want to go to Pakistan? We have very few relatives there. She says, 'Because you have become a *walāytī* you don't feel the way I do about Pakistan: it is my homeland, where I want to

> live.'. So my younger brother is going to go and stay with her in Pakistan. She is getting me angry because it took a huge effort to get her over here. She doesn't really understand what my brothers and my son had to go through, like getting the house surveyed for the paperwork and all that. She doesn't understand and won't listen - she is stubborn.

I remember vividly how struck I was at this point in the conversation by the way in which ideas about belonging and longing are negotiated. The homeland is destabilised in this context. The following questions were going through my mind: How long does it take to become *walāytī* in a foreign country? Are there differences between immigrants and what core factors are involved? As I sat there listening to them both, my grandmother started to elaborate on becoming *walāytī*:

> You know, I migrated at the beginning of the 1970s. Actually, I remember it was a Monday the 25th August 1970. When I first came here there were eight men living with us and I had to cook, clean, do everything and I hated it because no other woman in our family was here then...There were no washing machines like there are now. I had to wash the clothes and my children's cloth nappies by hand and often in cold water. I had to make about thirty chapattis with all the big men to feed. I remember when I had my third daughter I had an operation with her birth and when I came home there was no rest like girls have now. As soon as I arrived the house was in a terrible state and I had to get down on my knees to clean the floor. It was really hard for me then...
>
> But you know *bahin* Jameela she was really good with me and helped me a lot... I missed everyone and everything back home, and when people used to say *walāytī* was a really easy life, you know, you do very little work and there was a lot more money here...But I found it so difficult and all I did was stay in the kitchen and I felt *gabrāī* (upset)...When I went back to visit and to get my son married, people there would say 'don't forget us', and I would say this is my birth place and I wouldn't. But now people there [Pakistan] think that we are *walāytī* and have forgotten them. A couple of weeks ago - you know we have *bahin* Sarwal looking after our houses there – well, she phoned me and was complaining that our house was rotting away and people were taking portions of our land and building new houses there and that we should come over to sort it all out... She kept saying, You've become *walāytī* now haven't you?' When I tried to tell her about my situation here [explains it], she didn't really understand...But people don't understand it's not one of those situations where you can just get up and go. I have so much to think about for us here as well...

Alfred Schutz (1944) describes the difficulties a stranger faces when approaching a foreign group in order to become accepted as one of them. The prototype is the Pakistani immigrant where the stranger is here to stay and becomes part of the 'othered' group. After settling, Pakistani immigrants would learn the requirements of everyday life in Britain, which includes additions and deletions to particular rituals and recipes. They selectively preserve and recover traditions, customise and adapt them in novel and sometimes antagonistic situations. The first-generation are often well versed in this role, which involves their hospitality skills, their knowledge, as well as their respected status as 'knowing elders' whom one consults for advice.

As I took life histories from the first-generation of Pakistani migrants, a gendered difference was evident when they were talking about their lives in Britain. Men like Ibraheem (see below) spoke about employment and the people they had to associate with in relation to their immigration. Women, in contrast, emphasised hardship, such as the large amount of housework or having to cope with the little money given to them by their husbands. The older generation tended to discuss the lack of understanding of the value of money or housing by their children. In the above exchange we can see that the older generation's improved financial status has not erased these memories. While these stories revolve around life when these people first arrived, they are also told to children in terms of 'everything we have done for you' or 'with you in mind'. What is pertinent in these accounts is how spatial, temporal and social reproduction is managed by these grandparents/parents.

During my encounters with young girls in the sewing class they told me, in a joking fashion, about these early years of migration of their parents and how 'tough' or 'hard' it was for them. This reveals the enormous pressures towards aspirations, goals and achievement placed by parents on their children. Hardship tales (living in Pakistan in poverty, early migration experiences) are repeated to the younger generations and therefore serve significant purposes. These narratives are essential to the creation of a sense of family, which is enforced during inter-generational disputes or other crisis events; children often feel guilt when disobeying parental wishes. For instance, many children, such as Hafza's husband (introduced in chapter 7), feel a sense of obligation and duty, and feel that they must respect parental desires.

Parents and grandparents of the first-generation of Pakistanis provided details of their connection to Pakistan, such as 'birth place' or where kin live. I would claim that connections to Pakistan and its meanings have changed over time. Ironically, like many people, Naseem and my grandmother are able to emphasise how they are 'outsiders' in Britain, but here we begin to see how they are also seen as 'outsiders' in Pakistan in terms of national belonging. The sense of difference and being *walāytī* is predicated on a changed notion of belonging to a homeland and they are perpetually and simultaneously marked as being outside of the nation. Therefore, *walāytī* is a term used by British Pakistanis and those living in Pakistan to indicate how migrants' movement to Britain has marked them as being outsiders to their 'home' in Pakistan. In addition, in both Pakistan and England, various social and economic conditions are important to the ways in which Naseem and my grandmother trace their connections. For Naseem, her family have various properties in Pakistan and when her brother and sister return, the kin connections in Pakistan may

become stronger. In contrast, my grandmother claims that her social conditions have changed since her initial arrival in Britain and that the main house that they have in Pakistan now seems to be in poor condition.

What interested me in these accounts, from both men and women, is that they seem more concerned with sharing an ongoing history of displacement along with adaptation to and resistance by the host society, than with projecting a specific homeland. A major feature of these accounts is their concern with who lived with whom and who engaged with whom when first arriving in Middlesbrough. These social relationships were generally praised and privileged. As described in chapter 2, on arrival in Middlesbrough, older men declared that working in local shipyards with 'other local Pakistani men' provided a sense of security from the *gorā*. For instance, the grandfather, called Ibraheem, of a second-generation informant told me how he migrated in the late 1950s and how he got work in the local shipyards:

> In Pakistan, after I got married, I had three children there and we heard about how others were migrating to Britain and getting employment for money. We decided that some of our men should try and go. It didn't take as much time as it does now to get the visa and that done because they were crying out for workers here and in other countries. My wife's older brother Gulbaar was already here and then my nephews went along with my older brother. They sent us tapes, letters and messages, and people would return to Pakistan telling us how they found work and were earning money...So after about 2 or 3 months, do you know *bhā'ī* Ashraf who is dead now? They were *kashmiri*. Well, he was already here with his wife and children and extended family. I don't know if you know much about *bhā'ī* Ashraf, but he was a very educated person, very respected here and very high, well he really helped us a lot. He helped our families to settle in Middlesbrough: got us our first English clothes and when my children came he got my girls their first dresses. He was such a good person and I hope that he rests in peace. Anyway when I came over first I was sent like what you call vouchers now and it took about three months to travel from Pakistan to England. My brothers and nephews were already working at the shipyards and this helped because I got a job pretty much straightaway. I lived with Gulbaar, my older brother, his three sons and four *rishtedār* who live in Oxford now. We used to have some good laughs you know then, but it was a time of fear because we were new people here...

Ibraheem is recounting how he came to settle in Britain where he had kin, friends and fellow-villagers. A recurrent pattern inherent in men's narratives is how a brother would join a brother, a son would join his father, an uncle would send for a nephew or a villager would join a member of his wider kinship group. This process of chain migration (cf. Ballard 1994, Shaw 2000:27-30) to some extent helped Pakistanis find work in a climate of racial prejudice, and these were often jobs that did not attract the white labour force. Ibraheem discussed this in detail:

> When you first arrive you are scared, you don't speak the language and it was hard. We worked hard and tried not to get in the way of the *gore*. Most of our day was spent working almost fourteen or fifteen hours. Some whites were really good with us, showing us how to do things, but others were tried to pick fights and that. They called us 'Niggers', and said things like 'Pakis get out of here you don't belong here'...But with other men you knew here they used to tell us about how they had to cope with these abuses as well and that just ignore it... But you know coming here it was risky business and you needed to make connections with other Pakistani men simply to survive you know.

When conversations turned to living in Middlesbrough whilst trying to maintain contacts with Pakistan, first-generation grandparents and parents gave me accounts of how they attempt to maintain both difference and independence from outsiders, but in the midst of changes that are widely believed to threaten both. Many informants envisaged this threat in relation to the socialisation process of younger British Pakistanis. In chapter 6 we saw the increased effort that is invested by parents and grandparents in socialising children with regard to respecting elders, using the correct forms of greetings and learning to speak Punjabi. Although children are encouraged to accept the general pattern, or the 'folkways, mores, laws, habits, customs, etiquette fashions' referred to by Schutz (1944: 409), crisis events can occur as we have seen. Schutz argues that the unexpected event

> interrupts the flow of habit and gives rise to changed conditions of consciousness and practice; or as we may say, it overthrows precipitously the actual system of relevancies. The cultural pattern no longer functions as a system of tested recipes at hand; it reveals that its applicability is restricted to a specific historical situation. (1944:502)

As you will recall, associating with and becoming like the *gorā* was seen as obliterating distinctive Pakistani ways and threatening local integrity. As children are told about Pakistan-as-homeland, ideas about *walāytī* and who is a real Pakistani are likely to be expandable, flexible and inclusive.

Migration and Patterns of Consumption: '*My relatives there [in Pakistan] just thought we were millionaires*'

Afsha,[36] a 20-year-old British Pakistani, and her parents reveal the kinds of stakes involved when being described and treated as *walāytī* by kin, neighbours and other residents in Pakistan. I met Afsha at a local sewing class in which I was receiving training on how to sew Pakistani clothes (traditional *shalwār-qamīẓ*). Afsha had recently returned from Pakistan where she had her *nikāḥ* (Islamic wedding ceremony) performed with a maternal cousin. Afsha invited me to her home, which she shared with her mother, father and older brother. She told me excitedly that she would

[36] My interviews with Afsha were mainly in English, although she did use particular Punjabi words, which are included in the narratives. My interviews with her parents were in Punjabi.

show me the photographs she had taken of her stay in Pakistan. While we both looked at these pictures Afsha provided me with many details of who her relatives and neighbours were, whom she particularly 'liked' and 'disliked', the sites the family visited and of her new husband called Saif. We were sitting in her bedroom on one occasion when I asked how she felt as a young British Pakistani woman going to visit Pakistan for the very first time. I told her about the fact that I had never been to Pakistan, which was useful to elicit Afsha's perspective:

> I'll be honest with you Naz. When you go for the first time people treat you as though you are really different. I first thought it was because I was, you know, 'a girl from England', but when we went out to the *bāzār* (market place) people would even talk to my parents differently. Men would say to my dad, 'You are *walāytī* now you are big'. With my mam local women were always interested in talking about the gold she had on because they regard people from England as really really rich. Even my relatives would not treat me like a real Pakistani girl; they would say things like, 'You can't do this work properly because you're from there,' and when I offered to make the chappatis on the stove they thought I wouldn't be able to do it and when I did they were surprised. I think they expect that a Pakistani girl from England can't do any housework (laughs). Don't get me wrong, I had a really good time and I loved it seeing all my relatives rather than just talking to them on the phone and that, but after you've been staying for about 6 months you notice these things. You feel people don't really regard you as a true Pakistani, do you know what I mean? And wherever you go that will be the case.

Afsha's experiences of Pakistan are particularly interesting in terms of the way in which her family were seen as outsiders. Pakistani parents and to some extent their children have created a myth of return to their 'homeland'. Parents, however, tell stories to children about the place of Pakistan – such as the type of schooling they had, the houses they have there or which relatives live there. (For instance, Bilal and his brothers had a large *koṭhī* in Pakistan in Lahore. They had a spectacular portrait of it in their frontroom, which they explained was to show their children). As I continued to ask Afsha about her extended family in Pakistan and how her parents were treated by them, Afsha commented on her parents' experiences of connections to Pakistan and living in Britain:

> My mam went after ten years and dad went after twenty years, so the people there were crying when they met them. I think for my dad it opened his eyes as to how people there have changed. Like the girls there have their hair cut and the girls that live in the city, they are more modern than us - no lie, honest, Naz. My dad told me how things had changed so much there like the roads, they have become better. But he said there is so much more pollution around. He says it is because of all the development work happening in the villages. But now the things you can buy there, it's just like we have here, and all the stuff you get here - cereals, chocolates and chips - its quite amazing actually. People have sofas, fitted kitchens and microwaves. This is because with people having relatives here [in England] people build a lot of *koṭhīyāṅ*, with big kitchens and bathrooms in smaller villages just like we have here. My mam went [to Pakistan] when

her mam was ill, so for her to see them again was really nice. When we were coming back people were saying 'Please come back don't leave it a long time now'.

But I honestly think that mam and dad won't, because they never really have to. My dad's older brother in Pakistan, he's built so much property and he always boasts like I have built this and that for my sons here, but my dad has a different way of thinking. He says I know my kids will never settle in Pakistan so it is better to get them houses here, which is right. I really like Pakistan, but I can't live there like permanently, cause you know it's just so different to how we've been brought up here. It's not like basic things, but people there have different expectations and ideas.

In the above extract, Afsha explains how she and her parents were quite amazed by the physical changes or what you could actually purchase in Pakistan. Wider physical and structural changes influenced how these *walāytīs* perceived Pakistan and their links to it. In the second part of the transcript she tells me that her parents' connections to Pakistan are more about kin interactions than about a place they can call home. Afsha reveals that there are relatives whom she 'likes' and those whom she 'didn't like', such as her paternal uncle, which might indicate that since her parents' migration relationships with kin have changed. As Afsha's parents' experiences have become increasingly complex with living in new conditions, old situations are becoming unstable and the influence of connections to Pakistan - as - home are decreasing. This kind of change is fundamental to what is imagined as being home, and here we see how Afsha's parents give different weight to property in Pakistan and England. While they note and piece together their associations in different patterns, however, they still maintain connections with Pakistan.

Afsha's parents' experience may highlight an important observation about diaspora experience, including its relationship with ethnicity and identity. In this area, Hall (1996) and Clifford (1994) offer important insights suggesting that diaspora does not refer to dispersed groups whose identity is tied to some 'sacred homeland' to which they must at all costs return. The latter approach homogenises ethnic groups (Anthias 1998). Rather, it seems that in the diasporic context, Afsha's parents' identities are constantly reproducing themselves anew through transformation and difference, creating what we might call a hybrid form of identity.

However, the feelings of strangeness at being in Pakistan described to me by some of the second and third generation British Pakistanis I talked to provides insight into how kin and neighbours see *walāytīs*. These *walāytīs* are seen in a different light by their kin and neighbours in Pakistan. For instance, Afsha describes the way in which she is seen as strange or different from people in Pakistan, which shows that Afsha is perceived as not sharing the historical tradition formed by Pakistani people. *Walāytīs* living in Britain do not possess the particular knowledge held by

people in Pakistan, which bestows 'the authority of a tested system of recipes' (Schutz 1944: 502). While parents told me that they instil in youngsters the so-called traditional Pakistani ways, I would say that this alone is insufficient and that, 'it has [not] become an integral part' (ibid. 1944:502) of their lives, as it has for the people in Pakistan. But what we might be witnessing here is the way in which new identities are being created by the younger generation in the diasporic context, a different version of Pakistani-ness.

Afsha is treated as a stranger and a newcomer during her stay in Pakistan, despite the fact that she lived there for some time and that she had got married there. This is still inadequate for her to be considered as a 'real' Pakistani, since she had not shared previous experiences with the group. The strangeness that others saw in Afsha in Pakistan is different from that felt by first-generation British immigrants such as Ibraheem. There are many ways in which strangers are received in these accounts, the way they are associated with modes of arrival, the relative temporality and the extent to which they are seen to be part of an 'other' group. Afsha is less strange to her kin than Ibaheem was to the *gore* when he first migrated. The key aspect of this feeling of strangeness for first-generation Pakistanis in Britain and *walāytī* in Pakistan, is how asymmetry is understood, particularly where the stranger is the subordinate stranger or when he/she is here to stay.

In a similar vein, Afsha's parents, like Naseem and my grandmother, are also to some degree seen as strange or different by their kin in Pakistan, their shared experiences of the past having been broken. They have undergone personal experiences that question the hitherto unquestioned scheme of reference. The older generation interpret their new social context in a different light even with schemes of reference brought from Pakistan. For Afsha's parents (like Naseem and my grandmother) their awareness of two places where the vision of home becomes plural, gives rise to a 'contrapuntal' vision (Clifford 1994: 329) whereby

> plurality of vision gives rise to an awareness of simultaneous dimensions, an awareness...[of] habits of life, expression or activity in the new environment [which] inevitably occur against the memory of these things in another environment. [Thus] both the new and the old environments are vivid, actual, occurring together conceptually.

Although the quotation above is referring to experiences of exile, I find this characteristic applies to several of those I interviewed. I acknowledge the fact that my informants' experiences are different from those of people in exile. For some of the people I met, displaced dwelling is made relatively easy by collective practices during the initial stages of dwelling in Britain (as Ibraheem found). As people come to have access to more than one line of thought, the process entails skills of combining, maintaining and selecting facets of life ways.

Appadurai (1996) argues that mass media penetrate into people's minds, but, in the above ethnographic profiles, rumours about kin and neighbours who have become inhabitants of England are also spread in Pakistan to significant others. Afsha's parents are in a new social context where they have developed new perceptions of investment opportunities, which has tested their loyalty to kin (Osella and Osella 2000, Gamburd 2000). Through the media and rumours, relatives of migrants to Britain construct an image of Britain as a place where there are greater chances of employment, of raising money and hence of social status. As I continued to ask Afsha what she thought about *walāytī* she elaborated on her experiences: Afsha told me that *walāyt* or *walāytī* is a term used by British Pakistanis and those living in Pakistan to denote the way in which migrants' movement to Britain prevented them from being seen as insiders in Pakistan. Afsha commented that when the family went to Pakistan they were surprised by people's reactions to them in the village:

> Oh, you know, it was awful at first, because people know you have come from England and they just think and look at you in a different way. My relatives there [in Pakistan] just thought we were millionaires because they just wanted money from us. Like my dad's brother - he always asks our dad for money. My dad just gives it to him because he says, 'He is a father to me'. My dad's dad died when my dad was only a couple of years old so my uncle really brought him up. He, like, was the main breadwinner in the family. But sometimes my *tāyā* (senior paternal uncle) takes the piss out of it, he asks for so much you know, that it causes fights between my mam and dad. My mam says, just say no to him, we can't afford it, we've got our own kids to think about you know. But my dad he's just so soft he would never do that... When you first go to Pakistan, well like, if you go as a young unmarried girl all the local boys there know a girl from England has come over and they try their best to get married to you so that they can come over. When you go out people call you a *walāytī* and they don't really treat you as a true Pakistani there. It can be nice sometimes because you can be treated really special, like when we went to the *bāzār* the bus drivers would give us free rides and some of our relatives went out of their way to make our visit really good.

Here, in Afsha's account her ideas of similarity and difference relate directly to notions of *walāytī*. In this case not only did people and kin in Pakistan view *walāytīs* as different and as 'outsiders', but Afsha and her parents, themselves, see these people in Pakistan as different. As you can see in the latter part of the transcript Afsha is blunter when talking about these differences in relation to the opposite sex. The experiences of Pakistani immigrant women are particularly useful for analysing how dwelling in England is very often positively represented. On the one hand, Afsha's mother, like many other Pakistani women in Middlesbrough, maintains connections with kinship networks and neighbours in Pakistan, but her daily interactions in Britain involves her taking on new roles and demands. Afsha's mother worked at a local fabric

factory, owned by a Pakistani family, which helped her to earn an income and set up a *kameṭī* system (a rotating credit scheme) for local Pakistani women.

Migration has brought challenges to gender relations, in particular traditional forms of masculinity, and a redefinition of motherhood. Many Pakistani women are earning money away from home for their children. Like Gardner (2002: 237) and Gamburd (2000), I suggest that through migrating people develop multiple belongings, and in this case women circulate between different arenas. Afsha's mother's narration embeds the changing dynamics of gender relations in the imperatives of kinship. In Afsha's account we gain an insight into how Afsha's mother remains selectively attached and to some extent empowered by her associations in Pakistan. Fundamental values of speech, social patterns, food, body and dress are preserved and adapted in a network of ongoing connections outside England. Nonetheless, she and her husband have refocused their attention on the value of property in Pakistan and would rather invest in houses in Britain for their children, unlike Yahoob or Naseem. Some Pakistanis work hard to make a home in England while keeping some sort of attachment to Pakistan; these first-generation Pakistanis are caught between ambiguous pasts and futures. They can selectively connect and disconnect, forget and remember, in complex and strategic ways. In addition, for some of the younger generation, such as Hafza (see chapter 7), their lived experiences involve painful difficulties in mediating discrepant worlds. For instance, Hafza chose not to go to Pakistan to marry to her cousin, but instead decided to marry a local Pakistani boy of a different caste background.

During one of my meetings with Afsha, she put on a videotape of her *nikāḥ* (Islamic wedding ceremony) in Pakistan. She pointed out her relatives, neighbours and the ancestral land of her deceased grandfather. Afsha talked about how she and her husband travelled around different cities and scenic areas in Pakistan, such as Lahore and Peshawar. The videotape was interesting to me for these and other reasons. She told me how she had maternal uncles in Italy and Dubai. They had both lived there since they were very young, and her husband's younger brother was living and working with one of his maternal uncles in Italy. As Afsha's uncles lived in diverse locations she talked about how all her maternal uncles and aunts would arrange to have 'a get-together so that they can see one another', again reiterating how interaction between kin was a focal concern for some of my informants. There were divisions between those who wished to return and those who did not want to return to Pakistan. For Afsha's mother, her siblings' dispersion around the world might have discouraged her to settle there. Afsha described how her maternal uncles and aunt, as well as her mother, have always met in Pakistan - largely due to her

nanna's grave being there. The next example will show how the deaths of local Pakistani Muslims indicate important changes in the lives of those in the diaspora.

Migration and Religion: '[I]*n Islam a person should be buried quickly shouldn't they*?'
Like Naseem's sister, many older generation Pakistani immigrants say explicitly that they choose to be buried in Pakistan. An interesting case I came across that generated some family hostility was the death of Fatima, the mother of Sameena, one of my informants. Fatima died unexpectedly at the young age of forty-three. Sameena had two daughters and was pregnant with her third baby when her mother died. She lived with her husband and daughters in a small house in central Middlesbrough. Saed, her father, and her two sisters, three brothers and one of her sisters' husbands lived in a large house about four miles away.

The death of her mother was a heartbreaking time for Sameena and during the interviews she would spend a lot of time talking about her mother and the effect of her death on the extended family. Sameena had a very close relationship with her mother. She told me how her mother was present at the birth of her two daughters. The initial interviews with Sameena were very difficult for her and each time she talked about her mother she broke down. On one occasion she told me that she would not cry 'in front of my dad and them [sisters and brothers] because I need to be strong for them'. Sameena was an extremely courageous young woman, who married a paternal second cousin from Pakistan. Later in her pregnancy her in-laws arrived from Pakistan for the birth of their grandchild.

However, when Sameena's mother died it became a topic of talk for the local Pakistanis, as she was a well-liked and respected person. When my own family heard about the unexpected and somewhat shocking death my grandmother and mother were very upset and attended the *mātam*[37]. I decided to go in order to pay my respects to the relatives. Fatima died on Monday and her *janāza* (funeral) was organised for the evening of the following day, as the post-mortem needed to be conducted on the Tuesday morning. Fatima's husband tried to negotiate with the hospital staff to release the body on the same day so that the *janāza* could be held on the same day (Monday evening). Local Muslims claim that a central obligation set down in the Qur'ān is for the burial to take place as quickly as possible, as the soul is said to suffer until the corpse is laid to rest. Although interpretations of the words of the Qur'ān might vary, this practice is upheld by

[37] A *mātam* is a commemoration of death held at the home of the deceased or their relative's home, where the local Pakistanis will come to pay their respects to the family. In this case the *mātam* was held at Sameena's father, Saed's, home.

Muslims worldwide. Saed had even arranged for a local Pakistani religious official to attend the hospital with him so that Fatima could be laid to rest on the same day, rather than having a post-mortem carried out.[38]

Unfortunately the hospital told the family that the post-mortem would have to be carried out for 'official and legal reasons' so that a death certificate could be given and the body released to the mosque. When I attended the *mātam* Sameena and her two sisters were very distressed and crying painfully. Fatima's *birādarī* lived in various towns all over Britain and were beginning to congregate in Middlesbrough for the funeral. When Fatima's brother (Ijaz) arrived from London he broke down on seeing his nieces. All the women in the room were in tears observing this painful union between nieces and uncle. Ijaz was hugging and kissing his sister's daughter, while Sameena was sobbing loudly and crying out, '*māmū*, our mother has gone, she has left us'. Traditionally, there is a custom whereby relatives of the deceased performed sad songs to honour the dead. In this case, Sameena was crying out loudly saying to her mother, 'Please don't leave us - how will we survive without you?' The period before the burial is an intense moment when it is often said that the dead can see and hear everything and are awaiting judgement. Generally, this imagined state of affairs allows people to express their feelings about the deceased and describe how much they meant to them, accompanied by loud crying.

After a while two local women got up to try and comfort Ijaz, Sameena and the younger sisters. Ijaz started to ask about the funeral arrangements. He wept and muttered, 'My sister wanted to be buried in Pakistan near *ammī* and *abbā*'. When returning home that evening I found out from a neighbour that there was some disagreement between Saed and Ijaz over the burial and where it should take place. Saed was supposedly insisting that according to Islam it would be painful to the body for it to be sent to Pakistan and that Fatima should be buried in England. My neighbour explained how Saed also claimed that all of Fatima's children were in Middlesbrough and that they could visit the grave when they wanted to, 'Whereas could they if it [grave] was in Pakistan?'. Ijaz, however, was insisting that all the siblings wanted to be buried in Pakistan, on their deceased father's land (cf. Shaw 2004:212 and Ballard 1990).

[38] I also heard how a local religious imam tried to persuade the staff *not* to perform the post-mortem, as it was prohibited in Islam, and insisted that the burial should take place on the same day as the death.

Stories of Muslim Pakistani deaths are also tales of the transnational dimensions of religious orders in the modern world. Unlike Sameena's mother, many of the deceased relatives of my informants are sent to Pakistan and this often involves disagreements in the family about where the burial *should* occur. When I attended the cemetery to visit the grave of one of my relatives I noticed that many of the younger generation are buried in Middlesbrough. There are two particular cemeteries for Pakistani Muslims – in Thornaby and Thorntree. There are also many older generation men and womens' burials and these were either people who were religious (such as *maulvīs*) or immigrants whose extended family live in England. When one of my own family relatives died last year all her children decided that the burial should be in Middlesbrough. The reason given was that all the children, grandchildren and the husband were in England. But my deceased relative had migrated to England only 'recently' (in 1990), according to local Pakistanis, and when her cousin phoned from Pakistan he was annoyed by this decision and argued that the burial should have been in Pakistan. The relative stated, 'This was her homeland: she belonged here...she had relatives here too. We wanted to say our goodbyes to her.'

Fatima's death gives rise to significant questions about how and why people 'back home' want to participate in the burials of relatives. Even though rituals have been imported into the diaspora, Islamic answers given in circumstances of migration begin to vary from those given in Pakistan surroundings. Life in the diaspora for most people requires a split between daily, secular life and life in the wider milieu. Within the diaspora one is confronted by people from different social backgrounds (rural and urban) whom one would not normally meet living in Pakistan. An interesting aspect of Fatima's case is that the strain is increasingly experienced in families separated by long distances, and this intensifies when somebody dies. In the new social situation, Pakistani Muslims have different types of traditional and religious self-understanding that collide with each other over religious particulars they have taken for granted. In Saed's case, his argument that his wife's burial should take place in England provides an insight into how religious obligations 'become compatible and consistent with all the other facts of ... experience and their meanings' (Schutz 1944:507), while Ijaz's claim that she should be buried in Pakistan is rooted in more 'traditional' terms that suggest his sister should be buried on their 'ancestral land'.

Many British Pakistanis choose to bury the deceased in Britain and although kin and neighbours in Pakistan criticise them for doing so, they still send messages paying their respects. For instance, the children and extended relatives of my late paternal grandmother (she was actually my grandmother's sister) received numerous calls from Pakistan from family and friends to

express their respects. The latter is a very common practice and before people had phones in villages in Pakistan, people would have to pay to use a phone in the city or, more commonly, send a letter. Thus, under changing conditions of mass communication and globalisation, dispersed people are able to maintain and link members 'at home' and 'away' (elaborated in chapter 9). In the past it was common for the deceased to be sent to Pakistan, but this practice is no longer the standard for British Pakistanis. Either deceased relatives in the UK were sent directly to Pakistan for burial or were sent, by air, in their coffins following a funeral in the UK. Some relatives living in England would accompany the coffin. On arrival in Pakistan a second funeral would be held.

Fatima's death further shows how residence patterns, religion and connections in Pakistan all become focal features when assessing where one should be buried. Fatima's death became a topic of talk for local Pakistanis. As I myself talked to various people about Fatima's death, they would often tell me about their choice of funeral arrangements, a topic that is openly discussed by many Pakistanis. I heard diverse interpretations of why people would prefer Pakistan or England. For some of my participants, though, the connection to Pakistan was strong enough to resist erasure through processes of forgetting, assimilating and distancing. The fourth case study will, however, reveal that through associating with another nation, region of the world or historical force (Islam), added weight is given to claims against an oppressive national hegemony.

About three weeks after her mother's death I met Sameena at one of the clinics. She told the midwife that she was under a lot of stress because of her mother's death. Then the midwife introduced me and allowed me to have a quick chat with Sameena. I told Sameena that I did attend the *mātam* on the first day of her mother's death, and she said, 'I can't remember 'cause I was in such a state. It was a huge shock to us'. I paid my respects and explained my presence in the consultation room to her. I expressed my unease at talking about my work during this upsetting time and asked whether she would be interested in talking to me in the future. When I told Sameena, she understood my interests, gave me her contact number, and told me to ring in a couple of weeks.

I contacted Sameena by phone after three weeks and we arranged to meet at her home. On my first visit the majority of the conversation was centred on her mother's death. She told me that her mother was buried in one of the cemeteries in Middlesbrough and that her sisters and brothers

would visit the grave and recite various *sūrats* (verses of the *Qur'ān*). Sameena explained how the disagreement between her father and uncle had deeply saddened her:

> It was really hard for me because I love my *māmā* and my mam and dad. I knew what my *māmā* said made sense because Pakistan is important for them, but my dad is right for us and in Islam a person should be buried quickly shouldn't they?...So it was really difficult, and since my mam's death my *māmā* and dad haven't really talked, which is sad for us kids because he would have been in the place of our mam now...

Like Afsha's parents, Sameena's parents' sense of connection to Pakistan reflects the sense of being part of an ongoing transnational network that includes the homeland, which is not something simply left behind. It might be considered to be a place of attachment and this becomes more prominent when people discuss ideas of socialisation and how children should know about Pakistan. The various ways people talked about Pakistan and England contained a mixture of positive and negative perceptions. Amjad and Parveen's case study will reveal how experiences of discrimination and exclusion in England are constituted negatively.

Politics and Ideas about Home: '*We're fed up with living in Britain and the way Muslims are treated*'

Parveen and Amjad are a young married couple who were expecting their first child after being married for a year. Parveen wore the *burqā'*[39] as all the women did in the family. Amjad wore the traditional bottoms and *kurtā* (long shirt) that many Pakistani men wore. Amjad worked at one of the local call centres. I noticed how he used to dress in Western trousers and shirt when he worked but fold the trousers up really high from the bottom and put them really high, as various young devout religious Muslim men do. Amjad chose to wear a very long beard. The reason why I have presented these details is that both Parveen and Amjad made reference to them when they discussed living in Britain and their experience of indiscriminate physical and verbal assaults.

On my first visit to Parveen's home she told me that wearing the *burqā'* at senior school in 1995 was one of the 'most difficult' things she had to do. She told me that there were very few young girls at that time who wore even the *ḥijāb* (headscarf) and that no other girl in the school wore the long *burqā'*. Like Arfa, Parveen was learning Arabic claiming that the exact 'meaning of the Qur'ān' and relevant holy books 'needed to be understood'. She gave me some Islamic books in English to read. Parveen would often tell me that I should pray and invited me to go with her to one of the local mosques. Her extended family have played a dominant role in the development of

[39] A long black cloak that covered her head and shoulders, worn outside the house and in front of male strangers.

this specific mosque and they continue to invest a lot of time and effort in developing it further. The women in the family teach younger Muslim girls the Qur'ān and Arabic. They also organise talks and conferences by many *imāms* from various places, such as Saudi Arabia, Iraq and Pakistan. On one of the visits Parveen started to reveal that one of her uncles was in Saudi Arabia at the time of the fieldwork:

> To be honest we haven't told anyone else, but we are all thinking of moving to Saudi Arabia. My uncle Nawaaz is there at the moment and he is setting up businesses and getting to know the area. We're fed up with living in Britain and the way Muslims are treated. We don't want to live in a country where they are killing Muslims. You know it's getting worse...The thing is the government say all Muslims are not bombers or whatever, but then they say about how everyone should learn how to speak English, then you've got the immigration controls and having an ID, what's this all about? This is indirect discrimination trying to convert us and don't they want Muslims to live here...They want to change people and there are some Pakistanis here who will just let that happen...But we won't let anything come in the way of our faith so we thought about moving to Saudi...Have you ever been, because it's so nice?

During a later interview with Parveen she told me that the women in the family experienced verbal assaults:

> Like I was walking on your road that day and there was this old man and I was with our Safa [Parveen's niece] and he just started to say all this stuff to me, like 'What's that you've got on? You think you can wear that and walk around? You don't belong here, we don't want you lot here! You are all bloody killers! Get out, go on, you fucking niggers!' I just got really scared,' cause you know you get used to the name calling, but the fact is that the old man, he was really old and frail...At one point I thought he was going to get violent and hit me or grab my niece...It was really awful...I got home and told Amjad and the rest of my family...Now a couple of us go out for walks and that...

Amjad, who was present during one of these visits, described how he had gone to the local bank and had to deal with an unexpected situation:

> Oh I went to the bank yesterday and as soon as I walked in people started looking strangely at me and started to move away from me. When I got to the counter I handed over a lot of change, because with our father's taxis you know you get a lot of loose change so I often take it to the bank...Well, the clerk assistant she had to go and call about 3 people to see if it was OK to do this for me...I said, 'What is the problem? You usually do it for me'. I think because they see a man with a beard they think he's a terrorist.

The experiences of discrimination are believed to be produced by larger political forces. However, what interests me here is the feeling that global Islam can offer a sense of having an attachment to a different temporality and vision, and different from what might be assumed in

Pakistan. Parveen told me how her mother-in-law had to visit Pakistan recently after the death of her uncle, but was disgraced by the 'people there'. Parveen's mother-in-law was 'stunned' by neighbours and relatives in Pakistan and 'how they are just interested in money and want to come over here [England] so they can send it back for their families to build large houses there'. For Parveen and her in-laws there seemed to be very little attention paid to their connections with Pakistan - a place that is their birthplace – instead, the family were in the process of renegotiating their place of belonging in new and global circumstances.

From a similar though not identical perspective, Yahoob elaborated his strategy to expand his family's possessions in Pakistan. Here Yahoob identified Pakistan as his homeland. In the following transcript, Yahoob explains that having a 'home' and 'business set-up' in Pakistan should be considered by all Pakistani Muslims in the light of the current post-9/11 political climate:

> I think our home is Pakistan. We invest more there than we do here. We came here to start the business to expand our houses and buy more land in Pakistan. Our parents and other older kin are settled there and we all go and stay for a year with our families. There are people that don't bother with anything there, but not for us. What would happen if the *gorā* kicked us out and it can happen, can't it, because with everything happening around the world, like in Birmingham where our relatives live they are sending some of their families back because of some passport problems, but I think that the real motive behind it is because they are Muslims and they don't want us here anymore. Since the America thing *gorā* treat us differently now. Like I went to my doctor's surgery the other day and when I walked in people started to whisper. One receptionist even called another and they were looking at me suspiciously. I was upset because going to the doctor's was normal; now you are treated differently. I worry about what is going to come if people are acting like this now. So if they [*gorā*] throw us out, at least if you have houses and businesses at least you have somewhere to go.

Yahoob's case invites careful consideration of the way recent changes in both Britain and Pakistan have caused people to begin thinking again about the original plans to return to Pakistan. When Yahoob questioned me about my home in Pakistan, he advised me to recommend that my familyset up a second home there. Yahoob and his brothers had a large family business in Middlesbrough and on their return to Pakistan they would set up in trade. On one afternoon when I went to visit Faridah, Yahoob was watching the afternoon BBC news and paying careful attention to the rate of exchange, as this was relevant to the economic transactions of the family, and could affect its socio-economic situations. In addition, Yahoob and his family may be described as transnational sojourners: sometimes 'here', sometimes 'there'. The plans that they were making to return raise some striking questions about how belonging is being framed. While

Yahoob's account offers an interpretation of why people might think of returning, I suggest that political factors may have precipitated the revival of the myth of return or the reassessment of perceptions of Pakistan.

What is pertinent in Afsha's narration of her parent's story is that they are engaged in re-negotiating their relationships with one another, and redesigning the content of their own Pakistani identity. This is further highlighted in Naseem and my grandmother's dialogue about the past and the way in which each searches for the meaning of 'being Pakistani' in the diaspora. The ingredients include conflicting images of the homeland, speaking the language, maintaining and giving money to various mosques in Pakistan and placing an emphasis upon family ties and relationships. Dialogue is often harsh and contentious, as partisans on all sides debate the passionate issues that structure their lives both 'here' and 'there'.

8.3 Discussion

My findings in this chapter suggest the need for a radical reformation of the usual ways of thinking about homeland-diaspora relationships. The issues of maintaining ties with the homeland (often depicted as motherland) are not sosimple or one-directional. Parveen and Yahoob explore the changing patterns of daily practice that have lately emerged between British Pakistanis, Pakistan and the West itself.

The case studies presented in this chapter demonstrate that the relationship between *desh* and various places of overseas migration (*pardesh*) is neither one of simple economic dependency, nor a one-way traffic. Goods and people move back and forth between locations, and although migration might be a source of new styles and wealth, it holds no ideological superiority over *desh*.

Clifford (1994) and others (Kokot et al. 2004:1, Tőlőyan 1991, Safran 1991) have also criticised the ahistorical and static perspectives of those anthropologists who worked at 'both ends of the migration chain', adopting a simplistic comparison of 'here' and 'there'. We see how for Amjad and Parveen's families the aftermath of 9/11 has influenced their relationship with Pakistan, Saudi Arabia and other Islamic sites. I would suggest that their case demonstrates that the relationship between homeland and diaspora is therefore anything but static. For them there is a search for a sacred homeland. Those who live the precarious life of immigrants in societies that function around racial and ethnic ideologies look to Pakistan or, in Amjad's case, re-orientate

their vision of home, to provide periodic solace to their often harsh living conditions and secure for them a home base in case they are unable to continue to live in the immigrant milieu.

For many British Pakistanis, family ties have remained at the base of Pakistani transnational connections. The experience of racism towards Pakistanis as part of a broad attack on immigrants of colour has made them feel that, no matter how long they stay, they will never be accepted fully as 'British'. In Britain, in particular, Pakistanis find that although there are strong pressures on immigrants to assimilate, these pressures are filtered through a racial lens. Pakistani immigrants find that the assimilation they are allowed is structured according to a racial ordering that defines them as either a distinctive black ethnicity or as British Pakistanis positioned at the bottom of society. Consequently, many British Pakistanis, including a prominent section of those born in Britain, maintain ties with Pakistan even though they remain settled in Britain.

Together, the narratives in this chapter suggest that it is in the context of their specific histories and current circumstances that ideas about Pakistan as homeland are enforced. The notion of *walāytī* is interesting and relevant here in that it is loaded with connotations of longing and belonging. To be a *walāytī* is to be away from home but it is also a category that has starkly material concerns. In the context of wider political factors, ideas about *walāytī* might have to be re-interpreted, after which people like Yahoob might be described as permanent sojourners. In Yahoob's case the permanent home is lost, while he lives in both places. In terms of diasporic experiences, the core families I interviewed all claimed an identity based on shifting notions of what it means to be an insider or an outsider. The first-generation parents/grandparents are simultaneously *walāytī* and 'Asian'. Many have complex kin ties around the globe, which influences who they have become. The children of these first-generations occasionally visit Pakistan, and some have cousins in Saudi Arabia or Turkey (such as Afsha).

8.4 Concluding remarks

While these ethnographic examples present different aspects of the Punjabi notion of *walāytī* among the British Pakistanis I interviewed, they contain several common themes. Maintaining a sense of connection with Pakistan for some first-generation Pakistanis in Middlesbrough is a distinct social circumstance that sets them apart from 'white people' and allows them to associate with people with whom they share material conditions of subordination. Throughout this chapter I have given many examples in which feelings are described of strangeness and *walāytī*, understood as outsider/stranger. The first two examples revealed how there is a diverse number of

ways in which strangers are received, which relates partly to their mode of arrival, their relative temporality and the degree to which they are seen to be part of another group. The movement of people has intensified feelings of strangeness in both England and Pakistan, such as in the case of Naseem and Parveen.

For those I interviewed, the Pakistani diaspora is currently being conceived in many ways across the world and there are complex and changing connections between Pakistanis and their homelands. The workings of the imagination in a world of movement can be detected in these accounts, as in the change in property relations. The movement of British Pakistanis opens up a dialogue about the ways in which they imagine their connections and sense of belonging. I have brought into focus the ways in which difference is framed by the subtle ways in which being an outsider is perceived: there is a double edge in becoming *walāytī* and in being labelled 'Asian'. In the latter case, difference is assumed to be a product of the nations which migrants leave behind.

The ethnographic material in this chapter has provided an insight into how British Pakistanis sustain links with the lands of birth and with members of their families, both within and beyond the country of migration. People like Afsha's mother have multi-locational attachments. For many the travelling back and forth to Pakistan helps to refine and revise the diasporic experiences, which would suggest that they are perpetually in motion. Living diasporically leads Middlesbrough Pakistanis to engage actively in a series of dialogues with others at a local, national and transnational level.

Diaspora has, however, both positive and negative connotations. During the early years of migration the older generation of men described how being seen as the outsider, the migrant, the visibly different, resulted in racial abuse. For some of the individuals I interviewed, the idea of returning to Pakistan is not because it is felt to be home; rather, it is a result of the reconstructing and refashioning of home owing to the pressure of wider political and structural factors, while women in particular, especially the younger generation, are participating in economic and educational opportunities. In relation to diaspora, at the centre of many criticisms surrounding it is the implied connection with, or longing for the homeland and its perceived role for the migrant. South Asian diaspora research has focused on the dialectics of 'belonging' and 'longing'.

Although there is ongoing debate as to the utility of the concept of diaspora, for an anthropologist researching migrants in Britain, the term is useful because it invokes global relations, yet it allows

one to research a local population. Unlike the 'two ends of migration' that underpinned much research during the 1970s, the concept of diaspora allows us to think of South Asian populations in Britain as inhabiting a space that extends beyond the local community and which is formed by local and global relations.

In terms of the utility of diaspora as a concept in understanding some of the above, the global dimension is important, but the concept of diaspora does not enable us to question conceptualisations of the temporal and spatial components. Diaspora assumes a spatial and temporal constancy and the research focus must be sensitive to the changes occurring in the transplanted setting (in this context in Britain). There is a common presumption that transformations in immigrant lives are a result of the movement alone, moving from being an insider to an outsider. The change is not thought of as ongoing processes of interaction and experience. Hierarchical and asymmetrical relations are neglected in diaspora and in narratives such as those presented by Afsha and Azam (chapter 5), which therefore enable us to understand how the obligations between siblings change with movement and experience.

Chapter Nine

The Flow of People and Things

9.1 Introduction

The focus on migrant networks and activities that extend across national boundaries is an emerging area of research (Basch et al. 1994). The current emphasis on transnationalism, with the attendant flow of people, things and ideologies, revises previous understanding of the migration process, moving it away from push/pull models or the settlement (myth of return) framework. The literature on transnationalism increasingly questions the nature of linkages between geographical places, objects and people, while stressing these as being neither neutral nor solely related to the technological advancement of late capitalism (Appadurai 1996, Clifford 1992, Gupta and Ferguson 1997).

However, there is a tendency to focus on public activities and institutions which downplays the importance of local contexts within smaller interconnected units, such as households (for exceptions, cf. Gardner 1995, 2002. During the course of my research it became evident that transmigrant women and men are aware of the contradictions and opportunities that arise from their transnational networks in different geographical localities. Following on from this, I explore the way informants maintain transnational ties with relatives in Pakistan. This chapter has two main aims. Firstly, the cases that I draw on are intended to provide an overview of the way that transnationality induced by accelerated flows of capital, people, images and knowledge stimulates a new, more flexible and complex relationship between British Pakistanis and the place of Pakistan. Studies of the Pakistani diaspora have shown that family networks extending between points of origin and migration often constitute an important social context of life (Ballard 1996, 2004, Shaw 1988, 2000, Werbner 1990, Charsley 2003, 2005). This is very much the case with the families I worked with. Indeed, the older members of the families travelled so much within the family networks that it was often quite difficult to keep track of them. It is not just people, but also words that travel in family networks, especially by telephone. Many would tell me about the weather conditions in Pakistan and the effect it was having on their crops (for instance, Begum below). Those who live in areas in Teesside where there is a heavy concentration of Pakistani people have found themselves in centres of communication with their villages and cities back in Pakistan. For instance, an older informant called Mantha explained to me that:

> There is always somebody going or coming [from or to Pakistan]. We are always getting messages, letters or gifts from my brother or friends. When I see something in the shops I always get it and put it away until someone goes because I know that someone from here will be going within a month or two. I saw a really nice blanket and duvet during the Christmas sales. I put it away and I've just heard that one of my neighbours who lives close to us in Pakistan is going to get his daughter married next week.

Secondly, the chapter will demonstrate that *birādarī* constitutes an important site that provides not just a sense of relatedness and identification with Pakistan, but also a significant means of connecting to the common source of origins in Pakistan. The significance of the extended family (*birādarī*) and the meaning attached to it vary a great deal according to the position and personal circumstances of individual persons as well as the particular family to which they belong. Second and third-generation migrants who are once or twice removed from Pakistan have maintained the close, personal engagement in the wider Pakistani family network of relations (*birādarī*) that the older generation displays. Usually, they know many of their relatives in Pakistan with whom they have direct, personal contact. Both men and women were quite explicit about the importance of maintaining ties with kin. They related how they had been helped by relatives with the care of children and how they had received various other kinds of support in times of trouble. They described how they maintained close ties with relatives by telephone, through visits, letters, messages and gifts. Some of the third-generation, whose relatives live in the more urban parts of Pakistan, told me that they preserved ties with their cousins through email. Some mentioned the family as a group of people who would 'always be there for you', while others told me the opposite about the fluidity of kin relations in the migratory context (see Afsha's and Aunty Shaad's case study below). Many of the younger people expressed similar feelings concerning the importance of kin relations, perhaps a reflection of family values inculcated in them by parents. For some, the feeling that there were people who actually cared for them was important at a concrete level of mutual assistance. There was also a sense of being part of a closely knit group to whom one's well-being mattered.

However, some, such as Razwana, who was born in England and was studying in Middlesbrough, saw a family as providing a sense of being an integral part of a larger social group, even when one lived in places where one might feel rather alone:

> I feel closer to my family than to friends, because my entire family would be upset if something happened to a relative. The ties are so extensive and the effects are much broader with the family. If something happens like if two people in the family don't get along, it is strain on the family. Like my sister was married to my cousin and when they got married they had a fight and it was a huge strain on everyone else. But then

> other members of the family got everyone together and did *ranavā*[40], you know everyone wanted us to stick together. The family ties are strong.

Perhaps the youngsters expressed most clearly the overwhelming sense of belonging that could be experienced in relation to the family, when they visited Pakistan and discovered the whole village of relatives who took a huge interest in them. Children might find an unconditional source of love and belonging in the family during relatively brief visits to Pakistan. Many, however, expressed awareness of the fact that in the long term, the sense of being part of the family was conditional upon the ability to live up to certain expectations. These revolve primarily around preserving the *izzat* (honour) of the family, leading a 'moral' and 'responsible' life. Showing respect to older people was an important ideal among the people I interviewed, which is also a strong Islamic ethos, inculcated in youngsters during the early years of life. This was particularly apparent from the life stories collected from older members of the family, as they tended to delete certain aspects of their lives which did not live up to the standards of respectability. Some parents, for instance, proudly told me about their sons or daughters having 'good jobs', but did not mention them getting divorced or remarried. One of the most blatant failures to live up to the tenets of respectability was that of refusing to marry within the *birādarī*: for instance, when the younger generation, such as Hafza (in chapter 6), revealed to me the 'loss' she felt when her family rejected her for not obeying their wishes or leading a 'moral' life.

The family constituted an important source of belonging for the persons interviewed. The family provided a sense of being part of a larger group of people who were concerned about one's well-being and ready to provide help whenever needed. The family was rarely activated as a group, but several informants noted the importance of weddings or '*id* celebrations when they reacquainted themselves with those they had not seen for some time (see Afsha's wedding celebration, below). On occasions such as these, some mentioned how they had got to know family members they had only heard about from parents and grandparents. Furthermore, the family had constituted an important, implicit frame of reference in the lives that individuals had sought to live. It was apparent that even though one was born into a family, one had to earn a status of respect and acceptance within that family in order to be able to count it as a true source of a sense of belonging.

[40] *Ranavā* refers to people, usually families, who have split as a result of quarrels being reunited, either to solve the situation or just to get together again.

The first example provides an in-depth account of Afsha's wedding celebrations and the rituals associated with it. The core family might appear as 'betwixt and between' the idea that people belong neither to one place nor the other. However, transnational practices cannot be constructed as if they were free from the constraints and opportunities that contextuality imposes. Transnational practices, while connecting collectivities located in more than one national territory, are embodied in specific social relations established between specific people, situated in unequivocal localities, at historically determined times (cf. Appadurai 1996, on the construction of 'locality'). Despite the high level of fragmentation in the literature on transnationalism, the concepts of 'deterritorialisation' and 'unboundedness' have gone unquestioned. These concepts are not only interesting but also offer a relevant means of analysing the case studies that follow. The elaborate and complex rituals of Afsha's wedding help demonstrate that British Pakistanis make and recreate their own rituals and symbols in Britain. The illustrations reveal that the specific contexts in which transnational actions take place are not just local, but also 'trans-local' (local to local), and Glick Schiller et al. (1992) call these contexts 'translocalities'. In these social fields transnational practices are vested with particular meanings. Trans-local relations are constituted within historically and geographically specific points of origin and migration established by transmigrants. Such relations are dynamic, mutable and dialectical. They form a triadic connection that links transmigrants, the localities to which they migrate, and their locality of origin. The locality of migration provides a specific context of opportunities and constraints into which migrants enter. I will expand on this idea further in discussing the ways in which these concepts have implications for our understanding of the transnationalism and diasporic character of British Pakistanis.

The second case study concerns Begum and Thazeem's trip to Pakistan, which is illustrative of the ways in which transmigrants maintain ties with Pakistan. I deal specifically with the flow of goods, philanthropic giving, and political support between diaspora communities and their homeland. The final case study of *bābā* (grandfather) Ali will describe his familial, religious and work ties across the globe. Ali's case provides an insight into how people do not merely have singular centres, but recognise and foster multiple concerns and more than one sacred centre of high value. These two case studies will illustrate that the fit between specific kinds of migrants and specific local and national contexts abroad shapes not only the likelihood of generating, maintaining or forsaking transnational ties, but also the very nature of the ties that migrants can forge with their place of origin. Ali's case will highlight specifically how transnational practices extend beyond two or more national territories, they are built within the confines of specific

social, economic and political relations, which are bound together by perceived shared interests and meanings. Without such social closure, without basic shared meanings and a sense of predictability of results uniting the actors involved (i.e., social control), it would be unthinkable for any person to establish any kind of relations across national territories whether this were a transnational migrant network or an economic project.

9.2 Case Studies

Transnational Marriages: The arrival of Afsha's husband

> I received a text message from Afsha this morning to tell me that Saif had got his visa and was going to be arriving in England next Sunday. They had received a call from Pakistan from Saif and his parents. When Saif arrived he was going to stay with his *māmā* and *māsī* in Birmingham until the *shādī* (wedding) took place in Middlesbrough. Afsha asked me to go round next week to start organise her wedding...

I visited Afsha the following week. When I turned up on the doorstep I could hear loud noises coming from the font room. Afsha's mother answered the door and told me to go into the back room where Afsha was sewing some clothes. Afsha got up excitedly from the floor and I congratulated her, for Saif's visa, as we hugged. Afsha told me that so much had happened over the last week about the wedding arrangements and that she was sewing some clothes for her *jahez*. I asked her when Saif would be arriving in England. Owing to the delay in the wedding arrangements, Afsha's parents had made a phone call to Pakistan to tell his parents to delay his arrival for another week as things were 'not organised'. As we are talking, Aunty Shaad (Afsha's mother) enters the living room area and tells me that they have been with the wedding chef who is organising the meal for the actual wedding day. They have invited 460 households from all over England. Aunty Shaad's brothers from Dubai were also arriving for the wedding of their niece and nephew.

Afsha leaves the room to go into the kitchen and Aunty Shaad continues with the sewing. She tells me that over the last five days they have had to shop in Bradford, Leicester and Birmingham for the wedding *jahez*, presents for the groom, his immediate family in Pakistan and her husband's extended family members. Afsha and her mother know how much I love shopping for clothes and jewellery and invite me upstairs to see the clothes. I hurry impatiently up the stairs and they both laugh at how excited I look! When we enter the room and begin admiring the lovely outfits and jewels for Afsha, and Aunty Shaad and the presents for various family members in Pakistan, Aunty Shaad tells me that she has had some upsetting news from her

husband (Uncle Gulbaar) this morning - that his brother would be coming to England for the wedding:

> ...I know that he is going to come to mess things up, to cause fights...he didn't want Afsha to get married to my side of the family anyway so he is doing this intentionally...I told Afsha's father to tell him not to come if he was going to cause fights, but he would not dare, he is frightened of him he [Afsha's father] keeps saying, 'He is like a father to me - he is the one who brought me, my younger brother and my sisters up when our father died when we were young'. I have therefore organised a *khatm-e-Qur'ān* to take place on Sunday. Please come and bring your family... I want only my close friends there. I want us to pray to Allah that the wedding goes all right and that Afsha and Saif have a happy life together.

I look over at Afsha who appears very worried about the whole event. She tells me how she does not want her *tāyā* to come over and how he is going to expect her father to give him 'big and costly' gifts, even though he will not get anything for her and Saif, which is usually an obligation from uncles, to buy presents for their nieces at weddings. As we are talking, the phone rings and Aunty Shaad answers it. I hear her say how much she needs the *kameṭī* (credit rotation system, cf. Shaw 2000: 242, Werbner 1990) today to pay for the gold bracelets she has brought for Saif's mother. Aunty Shaad works at a local factory owned by local Bangladeshi Muslims. The money she earns, she told me, is usually invested in the *kameṭī* system as well as gift-exchange practices with wider kin and neighbours at weddings or the births of children. She tells me that eighty pounds would go into the *kameṭī* system each week and depending on what each woman or household needed, a large sum would be given to them. As Aunty Shaad puts the phone down, she tells me how expensive the whole wedding is going to be.

I have tried to show that transnational connections have a considerable economic, socio-cultural and political impact on migrants, their families and collective groups, as well as on the dual localities in which they variably dwell. In Aunty Shaad's case, the economic impact of transnational, migrant communities is extensive, and this is also found in the massive flow of remittances that migrants are expected to send to families in sending countries (cf. Werbner 1990, Smart and Smart 1999, Glick Schiller and Fouron 1999). The money that migrants send not only plays a crucial role in supporting families, but may also progressively rework gender relations, support education and the acquisition of professional skills and even facilitate local village development projects, such as water systems or places of worship. For instance, Aunty Shaad told me that when Afsha's father first arrived in England, he sent money each month for his younger sister's education. I am told she is now a teacher at one of the schools in Lahore in Pakistan. Afsha's mother said that her younger *niynanā* (sister-in-law) is married to a young man from a

local village, but he does not have any kind of formal education and works at the local *bāzār* (market). Werbner (2004: 907) has also noted the way in which second-generation Pakistani Muslim women work in salaried employment, and drive and move around freely. In addition, the women 'are active in their own philanthropic voluntary associations and have their own religious experts'.

The Shādī (wedding) *celebrations*: Two weeks before the actual wedding day I visited Afsha at home. A week before the wedding her paternal uncle had arrived and Afsha told me:

> He [her *tāyā*] wants to be treated like royalty. He told my dad not to spend a lot on the wedding. He wants the money, that's why he's come you know. My dad never said anything to him... He's just scared of him. My mam said to him [the uncle] 'We've only got one daughter and we want to give her a good wedding'. He went quiet then...I hate him being here, I honestly wish he had never come, Naz.

In relation to migration and transnationalism, the flow of people and things reproduces ties with kin and neighbours among the informants I interviewed. For some informants, however, the transnational reversal has resulted in a reassessment of relatedness leading towards new modes of habitats of meanings. Afsha once told me that her *tāyā* had accused her mother and father of becoming 'like *gorā*' (white) because they chose not to invest in land or businesses in Pakistan. The forms of cultural and social 'hybridity' Afsha's parents have developed are to some extent the product of the constant juggling of moral commitments and aesthetic images from 'here' and 'there'.

During many encounters with Afsha our conversations were mainly centred on the family in Pakistan: the family she was marrying into, her mother's brothers and her cousins in England. On the Tuesday, a week before the wedding, Saif arrived at his uncle's house in Birmingham. The wedding celebrations commenced a week before the actual wedding. I attended each of them and made notes on the various people invited, the gifts collected and on relationships between particular people. For instance, during the *mehndī*[41] ritual, Aunty Shaad's neighbours and friends from her workplace assisted her with preparing and serving the food to guests. Her female relatives I noticed sat in the corner of the room. When I went into the kitchen area Aunty Shaad said:

[41] This is a henna ritual celebrated a night before the wedding. Women and young girls gather and henna is put on the hands and feet of the bride. We also applied different patterns of henna to our hands as well. Singing and dancing also took place involving younger and older women during the event.

> Have you seen their [the female relatives] faces? They are sitting there like it's a *mātam* (death/funeral). I told you how much they don't want this wedding to happen and they want people to know that. They also hate the idea that I have so many friends and people who care and help us.

At the *mehndī* ritual all of Afsha's *jahez* was displayed in one of the bedrooms. On one of the beds all her Pakistani outfits (*shalwār* and *qamīẓ*), ready-made embroidered clothes, shoes, bags, perfumes, gold jewellery and make-up were displayed. On one side there were Saif's suit, watch, gold rings, shoes and toiletries. On the other side all the gifts for Saif's parents, and the gifts for his aunties and Aunty Shaad's brother and sisters-in-law were shown. These gifts consisted of gold jewellery, clothes, and English shirts and jumpers for the men. Aunty Shaad's in-laws also received similar items as gifts. As part of her *jahez* Afsha also received a car and a house from her parents.[42]

On the night before the wedding day Aunty Shaad's brothers arrived from Saudi Arabia, bringing with them some expensive gifts, such as diamond bracelets for Afsha and their sister. One brother handed £700 to his niece. As these uncles were Afsha's *māmā* it was considered to be an obligation for them to give some of the *jahez* to her. I noticed people continuously and intensively probing: 'What did her *māmā* give?' Those women who do not have a *māmā* are considered disadvantaged. In some cases, however, a mother's first cousin will act as a *māmā* and meet these obligations. When a *māmā* fails to provide *jahez* for a niece people assume that there is some hostility between the families.

On the morning of the wedding day, Afsha told me to come early before her new husband, his family and friends arrived (*bārāt*). As I was dropped off outside Afsha's house in my new ready-made *shalwār* and *qamīẓ*, I noticed Afsha's father and *tāyā* rushing around and Aunty Shaad instructing her sister to get the food prepared for the *bārāt* (tea, drinks and snacks). I hurried upstairs to Afsha's bedroom where her beautician was applying her make-up and winding her hair into a bun. Afsha invited me in and instructed me to sit on the bed close to her. She told me to get her handbag (which matched her outfit) and to put some accessories, such as tissues and money, in it. I remember vividly how beautiful Afsha looked with her wedding outfit (*lairŋghā*) and her jewellery on. The photographer arrived in the bedroom and her cousins, from various parts of England, arrived to congratulate her.

[42] Owing to limitations of space it is not possible to provide a lengthy discription of the actual wedding day, but a brief outline will be provided.

The *bārāt* arrived at 11.30 am. I waited in the bedroom with Afsha while her cousins ran to the front door to welcome Saif and to carry out the ritual of milk-giving. While in the bedroom Afsha told me how nervous she was feeling about the whole event, as well as about the future:

> You don't know what can happen...It seems great now, but what if things change when we [her and Saif] get married and we don't get on?

The wedding took place at a local hotel, which usually costs about £1000 to hire excluding the meal costs. Saif and Afsha sat on the stage and all the family come up to the stage and handed their presents to them. These consisted of money, gold rings and one of their *māmā* gave them a huge television, DVD and microwave. People around them watched and local friends and neighbours observed very carefully what particular *rishtedār* (relatives) presented. Such occasions certainly provide topics of conversation for the week ahead between local Pakistani neighbours and friends. The presents given by local neighbours and friends invited by Afsha's parents are referred to as *naydrā* (of money and of a gift as well), where a man usually sits to one side and writes down the name of the person/family and what *naydrā* is given. Although the amount of *naydrā* varies across time and space, in England, the average is usually £10-20.

We can see from this example and the following two that practices of transmigration are being sustained largely through family and personal networks. There is, of course, a variety of opinions among Pakistani immigrants of different class, caste and education levels regarding the amount of energy one should invest in the activities of various different organisations. Here the role of the second and third generations is particularly noteworthy. Many persons of Pakistani descent identify themselves in some contexts as British Pakistani and maintain their transnational family-based activities. However, my observations lead me to suggest that a vocal and influential sector of this population participates vigorously in organised activities that link them with the home country and its national identity. For instance, in February 2005, a group of young British Pakistani women in their twenties, many of them second and third-generation, organised a Pakistani Society at one of the schools. These girls would also get together on a monthly basis to discuss various topics, including their experiences of visiting Pakistan, Bhangra dancing and fashion shows.

However, this still leaves unanswered the question of what, if anything, is different about current transnational practices. Critics of the reconstitution of immigration studies argue that cross-generational language retention remains problematic, that different receiving state practices (such

as ethnic pluralism in the United States versus full assimilation in France) still tilt the balance in favour of assimilation over time, and that renewed anti-immigration hysteria creates further pressure for immigrants to assimilate or 'go home', rather than maintaining the double consciousness required of transmigrants. From working with various British Pakistani immigrants and their British-born children, I would suggest that contemporary transnational practices are reproduced beyond first-generation migrants. In relation to the micro-dynamics of migration there is a difference between the reproduction of networks and that of households. The actual process of migration is not carried out exclusively by kinship networks. I would suggest that transnational social structures are sustained by social networks in migration and by their attendant modes of social organisation, such as home town associations, economic remittances or social clubs established by local Pakistani 'communities'.

A pertinent theme arising from Aunty Shaad and Afsha's narration of their hostile relationship with Afsha's *tāyā* is the reassessment of property relations in the diaspora. In chapter seven we saw how some Pakistani transmigrants, whether they remain abroad or return to Pakistan, face a series of obstacles. If there is interconnection, there is also a history of simultaneous disjuncture and hostility between Pakistanis settled abroad and those who remained in Pakistan. In some families there exist competing perspectives on investing in property and land that continue to divide those in the diaspora from those who live in Pakistan. The multiple familial, social, economic and political ties that transmigrants maintain with Pakistan contain many areas of dissonance and conflict as well as interconnection. There is one major area of disjuncture between Pakistanis living in the diaspora and those living in Pakistan: families economically dependent on those in the diaspora often resent their apparently more prosperous relatives and feel that the support they provide is inadequate.

Many of those living in Pakistan have developed an ideology of obligation. For instance, Saif's family in Pakistan expected him to send money back to help the family. I was told on numerous occasions that those who do not send money to family in Pakistan are deemed to have 'changed' and adapted to a novel lifestyle. On the other hand, those in the diaspora find themselves overwhelmed by the financial responsibilities they have to shoulder in both the country of settlement and in Pakistan. Transmigrants rarely find among those they support in Pakistan a person who understands the dilemmas and stress that they face; many in Pakistan believe that Pakistanis in the diaspora are rich. Since Pakistan is a country where one's social standing is very

important, few migrants try to dispel this myth. At the same time they feel overburdened with responsibilities to attend simultaneously to the needs of their family abroad and in Pakistan.

After Afsha's wedding I visited her on several occasions and we talked about married life and the 'duties' of sons arriving in England. Afsha was looking for employment. Saif had acquired a high level education in Pakistan and was training to be a doctor. However, in England it was proving to be difficult to get any kind of practical work and therefore he had to start medical training from the very beginning. This was deeply disheartening for him and he told me on one occasion of the difficulties he was experiencing:

> I hate it not getting anywhere. I don't want to live off other people's money. I want to earn for myself. In England they are suspicious of everything. I went on work experience that day and just had to observe at the hospital. It was awful. I came home and told Afsha that I couldn't carry on with this and let's go and live in Pakistan where at least my qualifications would be recognised.

On one occasion Afsha also described her frustration with the demands placed on her and Saif in both England and Pakistan:

> It's difficult when you are married. I am so used to just going out and buying stuff for myself. But now I have to think about how we are going to pay the bills and get food, and his parents think that because he is a *walāytī* he will be earning and will be able to send his brothers and sisters money to help with their education. They don't seem to understand that it does not work like that. It will probably take a few years for us to stand on our own two feet. My mam and dad have helped us out so much, we can't always be asking for money you know. Saif thinks because he is the oldest son he needs to send money and things back, but he doesn't understand that it's complicated here...

An interesting theme that emerged during my discussions with various informants, such as Afsha and Ali (case three below), is the way in which mobility has influenced a new flexible attitude towards status. But here Saif is not merely a labourer engaged in profit-making in England in order to send remittances home to his family. He is also in the process of acquiring a range of symbolic capitals that will facilitate his acceptance as a son in *walāytī*. I am told that when a son is sending money to his family in Pakistan, parents usually praise their son's 'respect' for his parents. Many informants told me that people's social status increased when they had a *walāytī* son, as remittances would help them not only in terms of their own livelihoods, but also to participate in the constant Pakistani gifting practices (see Werbner 1990). I suggest therefore that in terms of the transnational context, the accumulation of capital should be seen as Pakistani immigrants practising strategies of flexible citizenship, for which they find greater social acceptance in certain countries than in others. As suggested earlier in the chapter, Saif's case also

highlights the way in which the locality of migration provides a specific context of constraint, in terms of employment opportunities, into which he has entered.

Transnationalism and Networks: Begum and Thazeem's trip to Pakistan

I met Begum and Thazeem shopping at the local *Debenhams* store in Middlesbrough in March 2004. I shouted over to Thazeem and they waited for me near the lifts. Thazeem's son, who was one year old at that time, was crying loudly. Begum got him out of the pram and gave him the bottle of juice. After we greeted one another I noticed that Thazeem had several men's jumpers in her hand and I jokingly added how pleased her husband would be to see all these presents for him. They both laughed, but told me that they were for their *rishtedār* and friends in Pakistan. Begum and Thazeem were flying off to Pakistan in a couple of week's time for some *kam* (business), I was told. Begum said:

> My younger brother and I decided to go because we are having some problems with the bank there [in Pakistan] so I want to go and get things sorted out...When Normaan [Thazeem's son] was born we also wanted to do the *aqīqa*[43] in Pakistan. It's supposed to be for the poor: no one is poor here. But in Pakistan there are many poor Muslims and that's where it should be done.

Thazeem invited me to visit them both before their trip. Begum also told me about one of Thazeem's close relatives living in very poor conditions in Pakistan:

> I don't know if Thazeem has told you about one of her *khāla's* living in Pakistan. But they are living in very poor conditions, their house is deteriorating. She used to find it difficult to feed her five children. Her husband was taking the money to purchase drugs and used to get violent with her. She was always battered and bruised. Her children are older now and one of her sons has opened a shop in *Chaksvaree* [an urban region in Pakistan]. *Puttrī* if you and your family want to send some money to the poor she would be someone who would truly deserve it, so do tell your *ammā*.

When I said goodbye to Begum and Thazeem that day, I walked away reflecting on the links between the diaspora and Pakistan, which can be important as a source of funds and personnel. From Begum's comments and from my observations of Afsha's wedding and the arrival of Saif, it appeared that these transmigrants were part of the political process of Pakistan in practice. With the ease of travelling, the familial, religious and charitable networks that stretch between the diaspora and Pakistan have become a lifeline. At the same time, most people in Pakistan saw the diaspora as working in their interests and thus shared a joint interest. For instance, when I went to visit Thazeem, two days before they were going off to Pakistan, she revealed to me:

---

[43] An Islamic religious ritual called *aqīqa* when two goats are slaughtered and the meat is distributed to poor and local neighbours in Pakistan.

> You know we were telling you about my *khāla's* situation in Pakistan...Well, her older son, called Jangeer, we are trying to get him a *rishta* here...*Ammā* [referring to Begum] has been around asking a few people. Some people with daughters who are good, they know that people from poor backgrounds face a difficult life so they would get *tharza* (religious reward) for marrying someone poor...my *khāla* does not know, but we know that is what she would want for her child to come to *vālāyat* (England) so that he will be able to work and send money back for his parents and siblings...

An intriguing issue arising from the case of Begum and Thazeem is the ability to participate in transnational affairs and their willingness or desire to do so. Following Ong's (1999) insight into transnationalism, I suggest that, like many informants in this thesis, Begum and Thazeem's case demonstrates the flexible practices and strategies associated with transnational capitalism. Among transnational Pakistani subjects, those most able to benefit from their participation in global capitalism celebrate flexibility and mobility, which give rise to people like Ali (case study 3), who can be described as someone with 'flexible capital', shuttling across borders for business and maintaining ties with kin.

On the day I visited Thazeem three women from the local area arrived and gave Begum and Thazeem gifts and money for their relatives who live close to Begum in Pakistan. One older woman, called Rashida, told Thazeem to give her sister living in Pakistan a message: '...tell her to send me some spices'. Rashida also sent her sister fifty pounds. There was also a letter given by Rashida's daughter for her mother-in-law. The last woman remained quiet and then called Begum to have a private word in the kitchen. They went on talking for quite a while. The rest of us chatted, but we were all curious as to what Begum and the older women were talking about.

When Begum returned she told us that she had phoned her relatives to inform them about their visit and to tell them that they would be arriving at a particular time.

> When I rang this morning, our lodgers told us that the weather was really cold and that it was even snowing...it was a surprise, but it was having an effect on our fields and crops...

Rashida quickly replied,

> *Bahin* why are you going if the weather is so bad there?

Begum explained:

> When Normaan was born we wanted to do an *aqīqa* here, but no one is poor here so Thazeem and I want to go to Pakistan where we have poor relatives...you

might also have heard that the banks in Pakistan are being relocated and we need to sort our money out in these banks. That's why my younger brother is going with us - he will be doing all that work.

I was quite surprised at this point by the way in which various policy interventions can positively increase people's capacity to participate in both home and host contexts simultaneously. On the other hand, the state's role in shaping transnational subjectivities can be different. Pakistan continues to play a central role not only in the management of migration, but also in the reproduction of Pakistani subjectivity outside the country. This is achieved through the regulation or conditioning of migrant flows and the construction of everyday discourses. Overseas Pakistanis are considered to be part of Pakistan society and their depiction remains wholly in line with dominant official discourses of Pakistani cultural heritage and values. People who embody transnationalism weave their collective identities out of multiple affiliations and positionings and link their cross-cutting belongingness with complex attachments and multiple allegiances to issues, peoples, places and traditions beyond the boundaries of their resident nationstates. These kinds of connections help deepen understanding about transnational subjectivities.

A pertinent theme important to Begum and Thazeem's case study is the way in which transnational flows are not limited to transmigrants' bodily geographic mobility. They also include multiple exchanges of monetary and non-monetary resources, material and symbolic objects, commodities and cultural values. During the early phase of migration, it is apparent that the continuous flow of new arrivals and materials from Pakistan produced transnational social fields. So maybe the continuous flow of ideas and information provided by return visits (such as Begum and Thazeem's). All these mechanisms have played a role in the re-emergence of transnational ties.

Plurality and the vision of home: *Bābā (grandfather)* Ali's return from Denmark

Zeenath[44], one of my core informants, who sewed clothes for local British Pakistanis, told me that her father, called Ali, would be visiting her, from Denmark, 'his workplace', she told me. Zeenath had two sisters and two brothers. One of her sisters was married to her *khāla's* son living in London. The younger sister, called Zenab, also lived in Middlesbrough and was also married within the *birādarī*. One of her brothers was living with his family in America and supposedly had 'a really good job...with a secret agency'. The younger brother was working in Manchester and he had recently visited Pakistan and got married to a young woman in his village.

[44] My conversations with Zeenath and *bābā* Ali were in Punjabi

When I first met Zeenath, my family pushed me to find out if she sewed clothes for *dūsre log* (other people), as they were looking for someone to sew our Pakistani clothes. Zeenath told me that she learnt how to sew in England at a local college and was at that time running an informal business, by sewing clothes for various people (including Arabs, English and Bengalis as well as costumes for local schools). My family were pleased to find this out and visited Zeenath with me to ask her to make our clothes for us. Zeenath was very keen to get to know me at the very early stages of my fieldwork. She wanted to know about my legs, asking me 'What happened to you?' She told me about her cousin in Pakistan who was also experiencing problems with his legs and used crutches to get around.

On our earlier meetings, like the ones I had with the majority of my informants, we talked about our families. Zeenath's mother had died of cancer in Pakistan. She told me:

> Our mam died at the early age of fifty-four...she had cancer. My dad was working in Denmark. She did come to England only the once for a visit when our Shakeel (older brother) lived here, but because my younger brother and sisters were back in Pakistan she had to go back...my mam was such a cheerful person and died so quickly after being diagnosed with it...she died within three months...

Zeenath's father (I called him grandfather (*bābā*) Ali), was working in Denmark at one of the factories. Zeenath told me he had worked there for many years. He would visit his daughters every six months in England and during one of my visits Zeenath introduced me and my family to him. He was a small, loud man who was continually joking around with his grandchildren. He spoke English, Danish, Punjabi and Urdu. He would teach us (Zeenath's children and me) a few words in Danish, such as how to say 'hello', 'how are you?' and 'I am a Muslim'.

Bābā Ali told me that he had first arrived in England in the early 1970s and lived with his older brother and other men in the *birādarī* in Middlesbrough. *Bābā* Ali was a devout man, who recited the Islamic prayers (*namāz*) five times a day and read the Qur'ān on a daily basis. Although he worked in the shipyards for a couple of years, he told me that some of his *rishtedār* emigrated to Denmark. Employment and payment opportunities were supposedly better for manual labourers, such as Ali. Ali was therefore told to come and work in the factory in Denmark by one of his paternal cousins. He said that during his early days in England, the men would jokingly have English girlfriends:

> My cousin chose a really fat one for me, but she was short like me...We never touched the alcohol, and for *halāl* meat we would have to slaughter the animals ourselves...they were good times, but difficult in terms of employment. We were paid very little and the *gorā* made us work our arses off - we would sometimes do 12-hour shifts...

At that time his late wife and children were all in Pakistan and he was trying to get a visa for them to come over to England. Since *bābā* Ali was working in Denmark this was said to be difficult officially. Ali told me that he liked travelling to England, Pakistan and Denmark, as well as visiting his son in America. Ali's older son was married to *bābā* Ali's cousin's daughter from England. The wedding took place in Pakistan and his daughter-in-law applied for a visa for her husband to come and live with her in England. *Bābā* Ali was at that time working in Denmark and living in both England and Pakistan.

When his wife was taken ill, he decided to leave his job in Denmark and join the family. He described it as 'a difficult time' for him and the children. At one moment in the conversation with him, I found him nearly crying, when talking about his late wife. He told me:

> She was my companion in life...We had a good relationship...you hear about men beating their wives and some of them having *bure* (bad) relationships with them, but ours was different. We were so like, always joking around with people...In our village in Pakistan people would say that Allah had made us to be together and that our destinies were written like this...When she died I felt life was unfair...and felt a great big loss.

Zeenath told me in our earlier meetings that her father had remarried and his new wife was a woman from within the *birādarī*. Zeenath told me that her sister and younger brother were not happy with their father remarrying, but:

> What could we do? He kept saying that he needed someone and that no one would replace our *ammī*...I gave in and let him do what he wanted to do.

At the time of my fieldwork *bābā* Ali was in the process of applying for his new wife's (called Seema) visa. But as he was currently working in Denmark this was again proving to be more difficult. He was therefore thinking of finding work in either London or in America, where he could join his son Yusaaf.

Like Strathern's (1991) ideas about Melanesian identity and her claim that 'places move through people', Ong (1999) also suggests that diasporic people develop distinct identifications based on movement across space rather than on intimate associations with specific places. What is striking about Ali's example is how his constant movement promoted new strategies involving a flexible

attitude toward citizenship. Immigrants such as British Pakistanis should indeed be conceptualised as 'social fields' comprising people, money, goods and information that are, in turn, constituted and maintained by migrants over time, across space, and through circuitry that transcends national borders. According to this logic, national borders are 'spaces of possibility' as well as spaces of control, as diasporic groups develop identities based on movement and connection across space (Ong 1999), rather than on a close association with a particualr area.

The case studies illustrated in this thesis (such as those of Naseem, Parveen and Amjad [chapter 8] and Ali) show that transnational flows of images, practices, discourses and perspectives can have a profound effect on people's subjectivities vis-à-vis both local and global settings. Ali's orientation is towards Pakistan, Saudi Arabia, Britain, and Muslim communities in Denmark and elsewhere. Such orientations are embedded in interpersonal networks and conceptual links with people, places and histories outside Pakistan. Drawing upon these acquired transnational perspectives of home, I suggest that the younger generation undertakes the evaluation of everyday experiences of the past and future, with a double consciousness acquired from transnational links and a transnational conception of self. Narratives and the sharing of experiences - particularly regarding being British Pakistanis - have had a powerful impact even on those who have never left Britain.

From the various case studies discussed in this and the previous chapters we have gained some insight into the way people maintain social ties with Pakistan. The ability and willingness of individuals to live up to family ideals has a strong impact on their relationship with their place of origin in Pakistan and their sense of Pakistaniness rooted in Pakistan. For instance, Afsha's parents are referred to as '*gorā*' by kin in Pakistan who believe their priorities have changed in the migratory context. Naseem, in chapters 7 and 8, revealed that her neighbours in Pakistan say she has 'forgotten' about her friends and relatives. She has become a *walāytī* according to these Pakistanis.

Family members who succeeded in obtaining education or employment, especially in the professions, and especially those leading to what the family would consider a 'moral' and upright life, become exemplars of the ideals that the family advocates. Several of these family members had actually returned to Britain and had become not just model *walāytīs* but also models for other family members. As a result of their distinguished careers and their contributions to charities or building projects in Pakistan, Pakistan had become a symbol of family achievement. Yahoob

revealed that he had set up a 'second home' in Pakistan and how he had built 'massive' houses in his village. Local neighbours and friends would tell me about his various enterprises in Pakistan and the energy he invested in his homeland. This meant, however, that those individuals who had not lived up to family ideals so closely had become somewhat alienated from Pakistan. The village had become a homeland that could be visited and cherished, but not made into an actual home in everyday life. This has important implications for the notions of transnationalism and diaspora that emphasise the continued importance of their places of origin for people who have moved.

We should be careful in placing people of Pakistani background into discrete categories, such as diasporic, transnational, ethnic or even migrant. Such labelling risks conceptualising these people primarily as people who are searching for their roots and seeing their identity as fractured and ruptured. The cases examined above have shown that it is appropriate to see such people of Pakistani background as people seeking to fulfill family ideals that spring from and transcend their places of origin. Transnational ties with kin in Pakistan were important for British Pakistanis in terms of sharing a sense of belonging. Informants noted the significance of maintaining the honour (*izzat*) of the family, by respecting and obeying the wishes of elders. *Izzat* had therefore become a distinguishing marker for the families living in Pakistan and Britain. The family also provided a sense of 'community', which involved, apart from periodic reunions at major family events, the extension of help and favours which were important to the livelihood of individuals. The similarity between members of the group became apparent when the 'ethnic' identities and practices of these people derived from a particular place. Place is not in and of itself a given entity that can be used as a natural point of reference in ethnic, diasporic, or transnational identity. Rather, it is constructed as people define and give meaning to a particular physical locale in the course of their lives. In this chapter I have therefore argued that the categorisation of people according to place must be unpacked in order to explore the complex of social, economic and political practices and cultural values that these places represent.

One important theme implicit in this chapter has been the disparate nature of the experiences of Pakistani migrants to Britain. While in diverse situations transmigrants have built social relations with their native land, the type, scale and scope of these relations differ. The differences stem not only from the contextual variations abroad, but also from the selective social and regional composition of transmigrants in both locations. The cases illustrate the generalisation that migration from the same country is formed from a heterogeneous rather than a unitary group of

people, possessing distinct personal and social endowments (human capital and social capital), migrating under disparate circumstances and professing significant, if subtle, regional differences. Heterogeneity, in turn, results in varying rates of access to opportunities in the receiving labour market (see the problems of Afsha's husband, Saif, above) and society, which in part explains why not all migrants are able to afford the maintenance of active transnational ties and why the transnational practices of those who do maintain them are also diverse. In general, different receiving localities offer migrants dissimilar contexts of reception and thus distinct opportunities and constraints.

9.3 Concluding remarks

Although movement has persisted as a theme in theoretical arguments concerning transnationalism, a fundamental area of investigation that has been neglected in literature is the need to focus on the practices deriving from this flow of people and goods. Processes and patterns conditioning the inter-generational succession and reproduction of transnational ties remain largely under-researched and under-theorised. In this chapter I have provided an insight into the transnational practices of British Pakistanis. The case studies have shown that while mobility and flexibility have central importance, under transnationality the new links between flexibility and the logics of displacement, on the one hand, and capital accumulation on the other, have given a new valency to strategies of manoeuvring and positioning. Flexibility, migration and relocation, instead of being resisted, have become practices to strive for rather than to avoid.

During my fieldwork I heard various conversations that were, in effect, about transnationalism, in which people mainly discussed the ways in which they maintained ties with kin in Pakistan. The divisions between those living abroad and those living within the territory of Pakistan are lines of discord that compound the many profound cleavages among people who define themselves as 'Pakistanis'. In order for us to make sense of both the Pakistani transnational discourse as well as the many similar discussions that link transmigrants in immigrant receiving societies to the nationstates from which they emigrated, we must understand the processes that generate disjuncture between immigrants and their homelands. In addition, attention should be paid to the processes by which continuing identifications with the homeland are sustained and reinforced.

The subjectivity of travelling Pakistani subjects does not merely reflect the imperatives of mobile capitalism; it is also influenced by the powerful effects of familial regimes that define what it may mean to be *walāytī* Pakistanis. Among *walāytīs*, Pakistani norms dictate the maintenance of trans-

local networks: men and women become the disciplinable subjects of familial regimes. Globalisation and transnationalism have led to Pakistanis immigrating to sites all over the globe, including Britain, and thus entail the flow of people and things across borders. Some Pakistani men, such as Azam (chapter 4) or Yahoob (chapter 5), might be labelled 'sojourners', with two transnational families - one located in Pakistan and the other in the diaspora. While for people such as Ali, transnationalism has promoted a revival of sojourning practices: he jets all over the world to see various members of his family located in different parts of the globe, while setting up another family 'back home' in Pakistan. For Azam, the 'Pakistani wife' and the 'British wife' represent the two poles of an extended family strung across nations.

In this and the previous chapter we gained an insight into migrants' own desires, strategies and practices of remaining connected around the world. I have chosen to examine the everyday effects of transnationality in terms of the tension between hegemonic Pakistani family norms and the force of social change. The agency of displaced subjects and attempts by specific kin to regulate their activities and subjectivities helps to gain some understanding of transnationalism. The pressures on families and individuals to manage the contradictions between the homeland and the host country reflect the ambivalences that pervade Pakistani subjectivity.

The major role played by transnationalism in cities of the world provokes some challenging questions: while in the UK, do 'strangers' also have meaningful ties and feelings that lie elsewhere? A more interesting question from a pragmatic perspective is whether this deep duality in the structure of feelings is also functional. Can this duality or even multiplicity facilitate cross-cultural understanding? The so-called 'cultural clashes' can be located in social relations, but also in the minds of the immigrants now transformed. Seen in this way, immigrants are not 'foreign', because they adapt their transplanted habitats of meaning to the daily, practical exigencies of living here and now, thus transforming themselves and the milieu with which they are entangled.

While immigrants have made many complimentary remarks about their reception in Britain, they also voice a long list of criticisms and concerns. Above all, they express dismay over the way that credentials and experience obtained in Pakistan are routinely disregarded when they attempt to find work within the British labour market. The disappointment associated with failing to find employment was raised in many interviews. Moreover, the difficulty of finding appropriate work in Britain forces many immigrants to rely on Pakistani acquaintances/friends or transnational networks for economic support.

Certain forms of transnationalism significantly challenge British official discourses concerning 'assimilation' and 'foreigners'. British Pakistani transnational practices, images and cues - observed in places like sewing classes for Pakistani women - challenge implicit membership models and narratives of incorporation persuasive in British public debates and policy. This is mainly because the conventional 'scripts of belonging' in the public sphere are based on ethnic/national exclusivism, whereas the transnational experiences lead to a more cosmopolitan sense of participation and belonging.

Chapter Ten

Conclusions

10.1 Migration and Kinship

The aim of this thesis was to explore the meaning and experience of local and transnational kin connections for Pakistani Muslims living in Teesside. In each of the chapters I have provided detailed accounts of the unique understandings and meanings of *birādarī*, marriage and family life and everyday practices in which Pakistani migrants, their children and grandchildren must engage. Although the focus is mainly on Britain, what seems to distinguish the different ethnographic cases is not so much where migrants move to, but the conditions of life when they arrive. In particular, this thesis has demonstrated the ambiguity of migration (cf. Osella and Gardner 2004). Although migrants transform themselves and their families, they are torn between competing ideals: to separate their families and gain access to the power and resources of new places, or to remain together; to retain links with their villages or to break away from their constrictive obligations; to return or to stay. The narratives presented illustrate that the new ways of being, experiences and ideologies represented by the places which migrants move to seem to evoke highly ambivalent responses.

The thesis has shown that migration is not an individual affair, nor does it involve a once-for-all break with village life, but is rather part of wider family strategies. One of the major aims in this thesis was to illustrate the ambivalence of close relationships within the *birādarī* and the reconfiguration of relatedness in the diaspora. As kin are reconstituted in the new urban environment, regular contacts with rural kin are maintained - through visits, letters and exchanges of gifts, money and services. I would argue that changes in kinship organisation, such as a rise in the number of love marriages, seem to be more related to the emergence of a new habitus than to the effect of rapid modernisation. I suggest that tradition is adapted to the requirements of modern urban life in Britain.

The ethnographic accounts of the practices of relatedness of British Pakistanis reveal the ambivalence of the *birādarī*, in, for example, the reproduction and termination of life alliances, as well as marriage alliances. Many family members that I interviewed lived across national boundaries and were not settled in the same country at the same time. Although families can be scattered across the world, acquiring different forms of habitat, the circulation of stories about

various kin prevail, especially at threshold moments, such as births, deaths and weddings. These stories and moments may also function as discourses and practices of contestation and integration within the socio-cultural landscape. The ethnographic accounts clearly demonstrate the importance of marital practices and especially the concerns and disputes over marital partners. The stories that circulate regarding marriages in families serve as an entry point to examine the family constructions of British Pakistanis. To some extent, Pakistani practices of relatedness contribute to the interlacing of private and public domains.

In effect, the social mores as regards marriage and the particular attitudes and practices that inform British Pakistani marriages belie an existing structure of power relations. In the case of the British Pakistanis I met, the marital practices were in fact complex, with ethnic origins and class not being divorced from each other or from other social, political and economic considerations. To some extent they work in tandem with each other and sometimes they can appear contradictory. The accounts by the second and third-generations of marital disputes over marriage partners reflect complex and even permissive attitudes to crossing social boundaries and to enduring restrictions.

It is worth highlighting the fact that for many of the people I met, marriage remains a highly valued, normatively upheld institution. Islam praises the virtues of marriage. It is, however, a social process infused with multiple meanings in the lives of British Pakistanis. It can be perceived as a contract between two families with legally binding obligations on both parties. Marriage is a means of consolidation of social status for Muslim Pakistanis. It also provides the only approved access for young men and women to be sexual and reproductive partners. Marriage for Pakistanis, in particular the older generation, is considered to be a major turning point in the lives of both men and women, heralding the transition to adulthood (cf. Charsley 2000, Shaw 2001).

Marriage, particularly for British Pakistanis, serves the purpose of procreation and family building (Shaw 2004:212). Thus, the majority of marriages are arranged or at least semi-arranged through family intercession. Love is expected to emerge after marriage through the intense experience surrounding the birth and parenting of children. Some marriages are inherently fragile and unstable until the birth of a child. For the younger second and third generation, however, I started to witness the emergence of new narratives, suggestive of profound change. For the older generation, however, marriage within the *birādarī* functioned primarily as a connective link

between status equals and it was aimed at the maintenance and reproduction of the existing power structure. For them, marriage can be understood, in the first place, as maintaining the dominant Pakistani *birādarī* social networks.

While marriage and childbearing for British Pakistanis go hand in hand (Shaw 2004:212), I was told again and again during interviews how much men and women 'love' to have children. For many women, including the younger and older generations, motherhood is deemed to be a 'natural' part of their lives linked to feminine drives and desires that emerge at a very early age. There are also strong Islamic religious beliefs about an innate 'maternal instinct', which is said to make women naturally desirous of and loving towards children. Therefore women who are childless as a result of infertility are deemed to be incomplete feminine subjects and adult human beings, since they are unable to express the supposedly instinctual desires for children, which in effect complete their gendered personhood (Shaw 2004: 214-5).

One major theme connected with childlessness, which this thesis did not address, would be the way in which people age without children. This theme could be explored by examining not only those infertile owing to biological dysfunctions, but also people who are 'de facto childless', which refers to the absence of children as a result of 'migration, divorce, remarriage, enmity and conflicting priorities that remove children permanently or over long periods from older people's lives' (Kreager and Schröder-Butterfill 2004:4). Kreager and Schröder-Butterfill (2004:8) argue that the 'situation of the childless elderly is complicated by the fact that there is no hard and fast line between their situation and the position of many older people who have no offspring. Having children...does not guarantee access to them or their support: there is a problem of de facto childlessness, where offspring are absent or are unable or unprepared to maintain kin ties'. An understanding of the role of de facto childlessness would provide an insight into the quality and changeability of relationships among British Pakistanis. Shaw (2004:198-222) documents the stereotypical view among health and social care professionals that British Pakistanis 'look after their own'. However, she discovered the anguish that Pakistani elderly experience as a result of the effect of children's absence during times of need.

10.2 Migration, Consumption and Choice

Pakistanis are no different from members of other ethnic groups in that they develop new tastes: lifestyles influencing habits of meaning which can have consequences on notions of relatedness with kin, neighbours, fellow Pakistanis and Arabic Muslims in Teesside. In the global ecumene,

these diasporic groups of British Pakistanis attempt to be similar in some ways and different in others, the openness and variation occurring together. I would suggest that the equation between migration, urbanisation and the emergence of 'modern' socio-economic identities remains open-ended. The thesis has only provided an overview of the way in which new styles of consumption and hierarchies of prestige have given rise to new arenas of masculine competition for status. Gardner's (1995) ethnography of Talukpur, a Bangladeshi village, has provided an understanding of how migration has introduced new sources of inequality, as between those who have/have not been able to migrate and between more or less successful migrants.

As Pakistani grandparents and parents arrived in the early years of migration they shared similar kinds of habitus with kin/neighbours living in Pakistan. Although the older generations of British Pakistanis might be considered as 'guardians of continuity', and although they attempt to continue their 'traditional' habits in the diasporic context, the narratives presented demonstrate how the doxic (Bourdieu 1977) premises of the social organisation of meanings are challenged and the very assumptions of relatedness are thrown into self-conscious relief. The meanings are at risk of becoming reinterpreted, reorganised and in some contexts even rejected. I suggest that this diversity entails a consciousness of participating in multiple, discrepant universes of discourses. People select particular elements and styles and explicit materials (rituals/beliefs) and invest them with particular meanings in concrete life circumstances. The ethnographic accounts elucidated how the enculturation process does not consist of merely the replication and imitation of the older generation. Instead, and particularly in relation to religion and marital practices, there are modes of expression of creativity and innovation.

In terms of Bourdieu's (1977, 1990) understanding of the role of habitus, I would suggest that among the younger generation of Pakistanis there is an increasing confidence in their ability to improvise from a number of alternative kinds of consciousness. This is a skill learned outside the family, in their participation in British school life and in religious institutions (such as Arabic classes). They use situationally competent action and generate new practices, a repertoire that is made up of complex backgrounds and multiple traditions. British Pakistanis improvise and adapt to new lifestyles and sometimes become known as *walāytīs* (from abroad) by kin/neighbours living in Pakistan. Their desires, choices, ambitions and obligations are changed as a result of their movement, a theme which reflects how migration transforms local social relationships (cf. Gardner 1995, Osella and Gardner 2004).

An accompanying theme in relation to migration and transformation is how movement has an effect on more intimate relationships within households and families. Throughout the ethnographic cases I illustrated how gender relations are destabilised through migration. Some British Pakistani women have access to wage-earning opportunities, as they move independently from their families to take up salaried employment. These women work to raise money partly in order to service kin networks, and in doing so help maintain economic and social links with places of origin which are central to the social mobility of households. Although I met women who play an increasing role in the remittance economy, I have not provided a thorough analysis of how this is handled (cf. Werbner 1999, Shaw 2000), as the primary aim was to understand the practice of transnational kinship. The focus was on the shape, interactions and dynamics of transnational families, and households. I illustrated the way in which continuities and differences impact on families; the men and women within them, the roles they perform and the transformations they may undergo. In particular, in chapters 6 and 8 we saw how migration involves women being exposed to new ideologies of what it is to be a woman.

An interesting finding by Thangarajah (2004), who carried out fieldwork among Muslim women migrants from Eastern Sri Lanka to the Gulf, showed how they adopted Islamic orthodox practices. They were active agents in processes of Islamicisation, gaining status through their new, pious behaviour. Among the Muslim British Pakistani women I worked with I also recorded the way in which they would get together and arrange public talks about Islam and women at local community centres. Gardner (1998) also discovered a similar trend in her fieldwork with British Bangladeshi women. She concludes that the more orthodox Islamic households enjoy far greater public status and better material conditions.

For transnational families that continue to engage actively in family life across national boundaries a sense of place and belonging is acute. The sense is more often than not located in the imaginary and in memory, as Appadurai (1996) points out. It is made more acute by the fluidities of transnational communications and the instability that is found in traditional forms of belonging and identity. In chapter 8 I demonstrated this as I explored the Punjabi notion of *walāytī* and how it connects with participants' understanding of home (cf. Rapport and Dawson 1998). I suggest that the concept of home has become highly complex in the lives of the British Pakistanis I interviewed. Previously, home was taken for granted, but the perspective of many British Pakistanis was affected by the experience of alienness and distance after visiting Pakistan. From the narratives documented in this thesis there emerges a strong sense of some detachment

from, and sometimes even irritation with, those living in Pakistan. Some informants discussed how Islamic global events have had a dramatic influence on their images of home. For these research participants, the idea of home draws on several sources of personal meaning. For many first-generation migrants it is their ability both to surrender to and master their living in Britain which makes it their home. What we are seeing in many cases are the ways in which the attachment to the homeland by parents or grandparents is fundamentally reworked.

For some, a home becomes a home in a special way, which is a reminder of the pre-cosmopolitanism past, a privileged site of nostalgia (Hannerz 1996). For such people, home is a comfortable place of familiar faces or where things seemed fairly simple and straightforward (Amit 2000). Home for others, however, is where 'others' are locals and this is true for those referring to either Pakistan or Britain as home. For instance, the younger generation of British Pakistanis, are perceived as being 'different' from the wider indigenous population. As Hannerz (1996) points out, such people are usually respected for their experiences, but not seen as people to be trusted as a matter of course. In this way trust becomes a focal issue when 'the social organisation of meaning does not necessarily apply to the relationship between local and cosmopolitanism'. Some research participants' connections to Pakistan and their plural vision of home illustrate the complexity of cosmopolitanism and transnationalism.

10.3 Transnationalism, Cosmpolitanism and Ethnicity

There exists a wide variety of expressions of cosmopolitan behaviour among those I interviewed. This thesis has shown clearly that transnationalism is a multifaceted and multi-local process. An important thread running throughout the chapters has been the exploration of transnational practices and processes 'from below'. Paradoxically, the expansion of transnational practices from above and from below has resulted in outbursts of entrenched, essentialised nationalism in both 'sending' and 'receiving' countries. In receiving nationstates this has taken the form of movements aimed at recuperating and reifying a mythical, 'pure' national identity and expanding it as a way to eliminate the penetration of alien 'others'. States of origin, on the other hand, are re-essentialising their national identity and extending it to their nationals abroad as a way to maintain their loyalty and preserve the flow of resources 'back home'. By granting them dual citizenship, these states are encouraging transmigrants' instrumental accommodation to 'receiving' societies, while simultaneously inhibiting their cultural assimilation and thereby promoting the preservation of their own national culture.

Intermittent spatial mobility, dense social ties, and intense exchanges fostered by transmigrants across national borders have indeed reached unprecedented levels. This has fed the formulation of metaphors of transnationalism as a 'boundless' and therefore liberating process. However, transnational practices cannot be construed as if they were free from the constraints and opportunities that contextuality imposes. Transnational practices, while connecting collectivities located in more than one national territory, are embodied in specific social relations established between specific people, situated in unequivocal localities, at historically determined times.

The social construction of place is still a process of local meaning-making, and territorial specificity, however complexly articulated these localities become in transnational economic, political and cultural flows (cf. Appadurai 1996:185). However, there is a complex matter further illustrating how the occurrence of transnational actions is not just local, but also 'trans-local', where transnational practices are vested with particular meanings. Trans-local relations are constituted within historically and geographically specific points of origin and migration established by transmigrants. Such relations are dynamic, mutable and dialectical. They form a triadic connection that links transmigrants, the localities to which they migrate and the locality of origin. The diverse effects of this triadic trans-local relation are clearly illustrated in chapter 8, which compares the disparate experiences of first and second-generation Pakistani migrants in England. While transmigrants have built up transnational relations with their native land, the type, scale and scope of these relations differ.

The differences stem not only from the contextual differences abroad, but also from the diverse social and regional composition of transmigrants in both locations. Some of those migrating to England could not afford to make visits to other parts of the world because of their lack of social capital connecting them with the migration networks. This case well illustrates the generalisation that migration from the same country is formed by a heterogeneous rather than unitary group of people, possessing distinct personal and social endowments, migrating under disparate circumstances and professing significant, if subtle, regional differences (cf. Sorensen 1999). Heterogeneity results in disparate rates of access to opportunities in the receiving labour market and society, which in part explains why not all migrants are able to afford the maintenance of transnational ties and why the transitional practices of those who do maintain them are so diverse. In general, different 'receiving' localities offer migrants dissimilar contexts of reception and thus dissimilar contexts of opportunity.

In everyday discourse, the term cosmopolitan is generally applied to places with a marked cultural diversity, as in 'London is a more cosmopolitan city than Manchester'. Amongst academics, such as Hannerz (1990, 1996), Calhoun (1997), Werbner (1999), Friedman (1994) and Vertovec and Rogers (2000), cosmopolitan is used as an adjective to describe individuals who are well travelled and have learned to be comfortable in many habitats and open to all forms of otherness. Some scholars, such as Calhoun (1997) have insisted that this sense of citizenship goes 'beyond' affiliations with particular places or nationstates and that this type of cosmopolitanism is frequently achieved by elites but rarely by others. Cosmopolites are therefore said to feel nothing for particular places or polities, and live lives with no commitment to particular places. From this perspective, cosmopolites have much in common with transnationals, as they both occupy the interstices between places.

The multi-layered character of cosmopolitanism is complex, involving different theoretical interventions. The focus of this thesis has attempted to account for the cosmopolitan perspective as a way of living, based on an 'openness to all forms of otherness', associated with an appreciation of, and interaction with, people from other backgrounds. I also speak of 'cosmopolitanism' not in the sense of an uncaring, disconnected elite but rather as a capacity to interact across cultural boundaries. From this logic, cosmopolitanism can be described in terms of cultural outreach, consisting of everyday practices of hospitality which connect people from different backgrounds.

In each of the different vignettes presented, I have described how the working out of transnationalism and cosmopolitanism is uneven, varying in detail, according to gender and generation. It appears to me that transnationalism and cosmopolitanism might not be complementary, but rather that some transnational lifestyles have actually inhibited cosmopolitan behaviour.

For some of the British Pakistanis I met, cosmopolitanism can occur in several facets of everyday life. These contexts of social life can include the home and neighbourhood, work, consumption and social interaction. What we begin to see here is how the type and degree of cross-cultural interaction varies in each of these domains. Some research participants, such as Yahoob, were born in Pakistan and now live in central Middlesbrough, an area dominated by British Pakistanis. Yahoob's butcher's shop is also located there, and the majority of his friends and customers are of Pakistani-origin. In contrast, Ali, an older, first-generation informant, spends his days in a

mixed-cultural workplace, interacts socially with various people and consumes a multicultural menu of products. However, many research participants are not so easily classified and interact in mono-cultural contexts in certain aspects of their lives (friendship networks) and cosmopolitan ones in other aspects (workplace). Ali, as someone who consumes multicultural products and services and interacts across different socio-cultural settings, might be considered to be actively cosmopolitan.

Many theories of assimilation imply a sense of process, proposing that the minority cultures will be 'integrated' and that this process will be impeded if individuals live out their lives exclusively within the bounds of their cultural communities. At the individual level, this may imply that individuals gradually move from a mono-cultural to a 'multi-cultural' conception, adopting an increasingly cosmopolitan way of life. According to this perspective there is an assumption that once individuals become cosmopolitan they do not return to mono-cultural patterns of interactions and their lives are enriched by experiences of alternate cultures. My research shows that we should be wary of this logic. For instance, a 50-year-old Pakistani woman living in the suburbs of Middlesbrough went on holiday with some Bengali friends. She spoke of her growing confidence in using English, which she has learnt since arriving in England. She told me that she felt comfortable associating with 'all types of people', even though she has remained a devoted British Muslim Pakistani.

There was a general feeling throughout family interviews that children integrate quickly and build friendship networks that span cultural boundaries. When asked about her experience of integration, Aunty Shaad, who was born in Pakistan, mused that she used to feel that English people were distant from kin and obsessed with performing their jobs and other activities. But as the pace of her life has increased, she realises she has fallen into the same behavioural pattern and no longer feels isolated. When members of her family came to visit her from Pakistan they commented on her obsession with time and money.

Active multiculturalism depends fundamentally on the attitudes and behaviour of the host 'society'. As mentioned previously in chapters 3 and 8, British Pakistanis are currently profoundly affected by 9/11 and subsequent terrorist attacks. As a group, they reflect on the reception of the host and majority group around them. Some research participants criticised Britons as uncaring and oblivious to immigrants living within their society. My research participants spoke of subtle discrimination in everyday events, such as people looking at them

curiously when sitting in hospital clinics. Many have been verbally abused and one informant's husband was physically attacked during the course of my fieldwork. These events do cause people to re-examine ideas about belongingness, place and home. One of the most intriguing features in the narratives is that while migrants' material identities and relationships may be changing, so too are their spiritual ones. Movement into the wider world and the radical shift in perception which this involves tend to shake up existing spiritual beliefs. Among my research participants I observed people moving from an Islam based on local shrines, saints and hierarchies and towards a new, global form of Islamic purism and brotherhood. Various authors (Osella and Gardner 2004: 110, Gardner 1993 and Thangarajah 2004) have discovered how tradition is central to the way in which people reformulate their relationship with God.

Many of the families of my research participants were moving to the suburban areas of Middlesbrough for various social and economic reasons. Many favoured a multicultural neighbourhood. A British Pakistani informant born in England spoke of her decision to leave the major concentration of Pakistani people in central Middlesbrough because of 'drug problems' in the area. Another older informant born in Pakistan moved from the same area to ensure her children would grow up in an English-speaking neighbourhood, believing that their long-term opportunities might be compromised if she stayed in the area. I hear criticisms from local residents born in Pakistan that there are 'too many Pakistanis' in this area. A young British Pakistani research participant commented unfavourably on the level of surveillance and corresponding lack of freedom in living in central Middlesbrough:

> You can't do anything here without people talking. If you are talking to a friend who happens to be a boy they ruin the relationship for you...People look for gossip here...It's sad what you hear sometimes...

These comments raise a number of sensitive and important issues about the meaning of ethnicity, community and, to some extent, even racism. These kinds of comments from research participants demonstrate that definitions surrounding racism are far more complex than simply the subordination of one undifferentiated group of 'others' by an equally homogenous dominant population. In particular, they challenge the idea that we can draw a sharp boundary between 'hosts' and 'newcomers' in a society that receives large numbers of immigrants.

As stated in chapter 3, ethnic identity is often described as a consolidation of internal and external processes (Jenkins 1994). The way in which British Pakistani families speak about other members of their own ethnic group informs us that they are not a homogenous group. There are other important markers, such as gender, religion, generation and sexual differences, which suggests that ethnic identity is dynamic, relatively ambiguous and will be heavily influenced by many of these factors. Hall (1992) would call this the production of new hybrid identities, where identities are adapted or become incorporated with aspects of other identities.

Hall (1992) has also commented that with globalisation there might be a strengthening of local identities and the revival of cultural traditionalism, perhaps in response to the experience of racism and exclusion. As I pointed out in chapter 7, when Pakistanis migrate to Britain, there are new ways of uniting, and ethnic identity is one way in which groups can be formed. In addition, as in Jacobson's (1997) study of young British Pakistanis in London, many of the second and third-generation I interviewed revealed that their religious (Muslim) identity is more important for them than their status as 'Asian' or 'Pakistani'. Thus, the identities of these young people appeared to have been translated, with their traditional national identity to some extent transformed into one that incorporates their location in Britain. But this has also appeared to involve a strengthening of their 'local' Muslim identities, perhaps as a form of resistance to racism.

Returning to the conceptualisation of cosmopolitanism introduced at the beginning of this thesis, do individuals move steadily from in-group to cosmopolitan forms of interaction? What about second-generation migrants raised in Britain who have little experience of their parents' home countries? Although further research would be able to provide a more thorough understanding of these processes, there is some evidence that reveals divergent patterns, with some appreciating diverse neighbourhoods, workplaces and a general ethos of multiculturalism and others expressing comfort with diversity.

The examination of British Pakistanis' statements about integration and associating with 'the other' suggests a retreat from cosmopolitanism, or at least a different version of it. Parveen, Amjad and Naseem (chapters 7 and 8) all came to value their cultural background in new ways as they entered adulthood. A crucial phase of the life cycle became registered in a new mode of cultural interaction. This process of cultural reflection and re-evaluation occurred in conjunction with the entry of new immigrants, as stated by the older generation, and a deepening degree of

transnationalism. In fact, some spoke of a growing desire to visit, in some cases even to relocate to Pakistan. Several who had lost their Punjabi language are relearning it, in an effort to conform. They are, in the process, challenging a view of cosmopolitanism as an end state and also as the most desirable state.

Although transnationalism and cosmopolitanism converge in some settings, for instances, in the cases involving Ali, Amjad and Parveen (chapters 8 and 9) and even to some extent Afsha's mother (chapter 8), it is not the case in all of them. There are examples where neither occurs, as in (perhaps mythical) homogenous societies with little or no outward movement, or in exclusive residential subdivisions where minorities are absent. Labour migration or sojourning is a classic case in which individuals move around the world in search of economic opportunity, but do not interact much with the societies they enter. At the opposite end of the spectrum we have the situation in which immigrants from many places settle and interact, but basically become British by embracing their new society and detaching themselves from their old one: this is an example of cosmopolitan without transnationalism. I would like to emphasise the point that the experience of transnationalism and cosmopolitanism is uneven, that they are more fully realised in some places, and among some groups, than others. Furthermore, transnationalism and cosmopolitanism do not necessarily occur together. Becoming a cosmopolitan is, in practice, a complex social phenomenon.

10.4 Methodological limitations and concluding remarks

It is tempting to end here, questioning the logic of globalisation and the interpretation of cosmopolitanism as a unidirectional process. However, significant qualification is in order in the light of the methodology that guided this study. The interviews and focus group discussions included 52 British Pakistani families living in various parts of Teesside, including first, second and third generations. The method of recruitment for this study was purposive and I can therefore not claim that the material presented here is fully representative of all British Pakistanis or indeed of all Teesside Pakistanis. Second, I have reported everything as a series of straightforward texts, with little thought to the potential difficulties involved in collecting and representing these 'data'. Meetings between the researcher and subjects are inevitably performative events, where each side assumes certain roles. No doubt the uneven power relations involved in this project, between the academic researcher and recently arrived minority immigrants, had an impact on what I was and was not told. In addition, the dynamics of group interviews with first and second generations and groups consisting of both first and second-generation were completely different. In the former

case there were times when some of the older generation seemed uncomfortable discussing certain aspects of their lives with a younger student. Among many younger informants, conversations usually flowed freely and no one seemed to mind discussing sensitive aspects of their experiences, such as the experience of racism at schools.

This thesis makes an important contribution to the transnational literature and it is to be hoped that the theoretical insights generated by studying the relationship between kinship and transnationalism inspire further research among other migrant populations. Centrally the thesis presents an insight into the fluidity of kin relations of British Pakistanis, which has helped to reveal important ideas about the way in which the diasporic context might engender particular forms of kinning. Underlying the stories told by the informants are important contradictions and disjunctures associated with transmigration, their relationship and sometimes resistance to the British state, and what they often present as the breakdown of traditional ways. The nature of transnational subjectivities and of the diasporic consciousness of British Pakistanis is useful to illustrate different forms of cosmopolitan behaviour. Even though British Pakistanis are likely to have intense ties with kin and friends in Pakistan, the relationship between homeland and diaspora offers some fresh insights into the notion of *walāytī* and how this in turn influences people's outlook on 'home'.

However, Pakistani practices of relatedness merit further research, which should especially focus on the childless experiences of first, second and third-generation British Pakistanis. A milieu-specific study like this would work from the centre of the issues discussed above and would therefore broaden knowledge about the intersection between migration, transnationalism, gender dynamics and ageing. Nevertheless, the analysis should not remain restricted to religious or cultural matters but should take into account socio-structural factors and social networks including kin living in Pakistan. My work with research participants since my undergraduate degree has stimulated further research interests relating to British Pakistani Muslims. Areas of potential research programmes are the exploration of infertility and New Reproductive Technologies being used among British Pakistani Muslims; the meaning of death in the diaspora; attitudes towards post-mortem examinations among Muslim groups, and attitudes towards and practices relating to the care of the elderly among British Pakistani Muslims.

What does this thesis tell us about British Pakistani Muslims in contemporary Britain? The thesis illustrates that long-distance nationalism is reconfiguring the way many people understand the

relationship between populations and the states that claim to represent them. A 'transborder state' (Basch, Glick-Schiller and Black 1994: 17-19) has appeared which extends its scope, and claims that emigrants and their descendants remain an integral part of their ancestral homeland. The lack of acceptance and loss of identity for the first generation British Pakistani Muslim has compelled them more towards the country of origin.

As people discussed their ideas about the notion of home it became obvious how transnational identity is hard to establish, with resentment and non-acceptance in the place of origin identified as common experiences. Although researchers claim that a new globally orientated identity is threatening the relationship between transnational communities and 'home', the redefinition of the meaning of home is testing immigrants' loyalties. This does not, however, deter British Pakistani migrants from pursuing an identity based on childhood memories, linguistic commonalities and the land of birth. As such it can be argued that the British Pakistani Muslims of Teesside have been caught in what Grillo (2001) has termed the 'betwixt and between' phase of transmigration.

British Pakistani Muslims' narratives about home demonstrate ideas about how international transnational identity is situated between South Asians in the homeland and South Asians in the diaspora. This echoes ideas from contemporary researchers about identities being based on historic claims to the homeland, which are secondary to the practical realities of inter-ethnic divisions that come as a result of class and wealth differences, gender differences, caste politics and division over claims to territory. These lead to competition, conflict and identity confusion between individuals from the same ethnicity and religion. Discussions about group consciousness, ethnic commonalities, myths, values and symbols of the 'homeland' are prominent in gatherings, such as Eid celebrations, Friday prayers, weddings, extended family gatherings. The latter are all examples of how British Pakistani settlers help bind their fellow migrant community to the homeland.

Thus, the process of migration, and its side effects, such as displacement and identity formation, is shown to be highly complex and contingent. I have also attempted to highlight the explanations that help to demonstrate why people engage in such a complex process. Whilst return is unlikely, the 'ideal' of return still persists especially as group consciousness based on common ethnicity, language, heritage and religion keeps alive the political ideology of long-distance nationalism between the British Pakistani diaspora community of Teesside and Pakistan. The origins of

nationalism, whether ethnically or territorially bound, thus merits further investigation. What the British Pakistani migratory experience highlights is that groups and human beings are fluid and constantly engaging in a process of physical movement, which precipitates a transnational identity. British Pakistani communities, such as those living in Teesside, transcend both political and geographical boundaries.

Issues of concern to the third generation of British Pakistani Muslims have shifted from assimilation and social integration to religious identity and discrimination. I illustrated the ways in which first generation British Pakistanis maintained religious and cultural norms concealed within private familial settings. Succeeding generations have struggled with issues of integration and racism in the conditions of assimilation policies of New Labour. Racial equality goes beyond what was claimed in the 1960 and 1970s. As ideas of equality and colour-blindness are spreading across the world, a new ideal of equality has been encouraged to revive heritages and identities. Simultaneously, identification with Islam underpins attitudes of many of the current generation, both as a reaction to racist hostility and a search for deeper understandings of Islam. Young British Muslims are in an uncertain position of having to decide between Islamic and British values. On the one hand, there are radical Islamic politics and on the other hand developments in British multicultural citizenship. This generates anxieties and pressures on British Pakistani Muslims; it pushes some to struggle and question policies and practices, whilst others choose to adapt to Western values.

The thesis has also provided analysis of the ways in which British Pakistani Muslims have prepared themselves for life in a multicultural society, and how important norms and values of being British Pakistani are understood, internalised, actualised and passed on to the next generation through processes of socialisation. The discussion concerning identity and citizenship becomes particularly pertinent in the post-September 11 period. I offered some valuable insights on how issues impacting on British Pakistani Muslims in wider settings are specifically revealed in micro-community settings.

In terms of identity and multiculturalism there must be a focus not just on 'difference', but also on commonality. In order for multiculturalism to develop, minority and majority ethnic groups need to recognise the value that multi-culturalism might have for society. It cannot however be accomplished unless ethnic social inequalities (such as housing, racial discrimination and employment) are addressed and, ultimately, eliminated. However, the thesis has also illustrated

that British Pakistanis are not passive victims of racial prejudices. Rather, they posses cultural capital which can be transformed to their benefit, allowing them successfully to prevent or avoid the effects of racial exclusion.

Glossary of Terms

abbā	father, superior
aććhā	good, well done
aććhī	good (f)
ādmī	person, man
al-ham-do-lilla	praise be to God
ammā/ammī	mother
ammā jān	mother-in-law
aqīqa	The hair on the head of a new-born infant (so called because it is *cut* or *shaved* off on the sixth day)
arāīṅ	name of a caste
āṭā	flour
aulād	offspring
āzād	free
aẓān denā	to give prayer
bābā	respectable term for old man
baćća	child (m)
baćće	children (m. plural), also used for mix of male and female children
baććī	child (f)
baććīyāṅ	children (f. plural)
bahin	sister
bairā nī roṭī (Mirpuri)	chapatti made from corn flour
bājī	elder sister
bārāt	groom's party at a wedding
baṛā	big, great (m)
baṛī	big, great (f.)
baṛī ammī	'big mother' (often when referring to 'grandmother')
bay badaniyā	like the English nursery rhyme 'See-saw, marjorie daw'
bāzār	market place
bhābhī	brother's wife, sister-in-law
bhā'ī	brother
bhátījī	brother's daughter

bhagnī (Punjabi)	sister's daughter
bhāṛjī	sister's daughter
bī	elder sister
birādarī	extended endogamous unit
bimār	expecting/pregnant, literal means ill
bismilla	in the name of God
bismilla- ir-Rahman-ir-Rahīm	In the name of God, most Gracious, most Compassionate
biswār	'mixture of spices and aromatic seeds powdered and ready for use in curry or pickle; curry-powder
burqā'	Cloth covering body and face for the purpose of veil
burā	bad (m)
bure/buray	bad (m; plural)
burī	bad (f)
būwā (Punjabi)	father's sister
ćaćā	father's younger brother
ćādar	shawl
ćapātī	round flat unleavened bread
ćaudharī	headman; honorific form of address
dādā	father's father
dādī/dādī ammā	father's mother
dāj (Punjabi)	dowry
das	ten
dāvat	an invitation to a large meal for a family
desh	homeland
dupaṭṭā	headscarf
dūsre log	other people
gabrāī	feeling upset (f)
ghar	home, house belonging to family
ghar-wālā (Urdu)	literally 'person of the household', family member, or (in Punjabi usage) 'husband'
grāṅ nā bande (Mirpuri)	people from the same village
gorā	white (m)
gorī	white (f)

gore	white (m. plural)
gujar	name of a caste
ḥaj	pilgrimage to Mecca
ḥalāl	lawful, according to religion
ḥakīm	practitioner of Greek medicine
hamsāyā/gawānḍī	neighbour
hamsaī	neighbour (f)
ḥijāb	veil, concealment
hosh-yār (Urdu)	intelligent, intellectual
'īdu'l-fitr	the festival at the end of Ramadan (month of fasting)
'īdu'-ẓ-ẓuhā	the festival commemorating Abraham's offering of Isaac, which is held 10th day after hajj
imām	priest
izzat	honour, respect
jādū	magic
jahez	dowry
janāza	funeral
jinn	a capricious spirit
jogī	name of a caste
kameṭī	rotating credit association
kār-ālā (Punjabi)	husband
khāṭ	bed made of rope wound around a wooden frame
khāla	mother's sister
khāndān	family
khatm-e-Qur'ān	the ritual of the completion of Quran
khidmat karnā	to service/do service
khoprā	coconut (dry)
Khūn	blood
Khushī	happiness
koṭhī	small house, cottage, hut
koṭhīyāṅ	small houses, cottages, huts
kurtā	long shirt
laiṅghā (Punjabi)	wedding outfit (consists of a skirt and top)
lenā-denā	taking-giving

log	people
madarsa	school (especially the religious one)
makā nā āṭā/roṭī (Mirpuri)	corn flour or home-cooked chapatti/bread
māmā (Punjabi)	maternal uncle
māmī	mother's brother's wife
māmū	maternal uncle
māmiyā-sās	husband/wife's mother's sister
marnā/ marjānā	to die
mar gayā	(he/it) died
māsī (Punjabi)	mother's sister
matraī sās	step mother-in-law
mātam	grief, mourning
maulvī	priest
mehndī	henna
mubārak	congratulations
naī	name of caste
namāz	prayers
nānā	mother's father
nanad	husband's sister
nānī	mother's mother
naydrā (Punjabi)	presents given at a wedding
nikāḥ	Islamic marriage contract
niynanā	husband's sisters
paise	money, finance
palākā *nā*	of Palak village
pardesh	away/foreign
parwāh	care
parwarish/parwarish karnā	nurture, to bring up and nourish
phūphī	father's sister
pīr	saint, spiritual guide
putar/putra (Punjabi)	son (Urdu *betā*)
puttrī (Punjabi)	daughter (Urdu *betī*)
qasm	an oath

qasme (Punjabi)	I swear
qaum (Punjabi)	caste
ranavā (Punjabi)	to make up after dispute
rishta/rishtedār/rishtedārī	kin relation
rishta	marriage arrangement
rukhsatī	the bride's send off
roṭī	home-cooked chapatti/bread
sabaq	lesson, lecture
sake/sakay	*relatives*
sāl	year
sālā	wife's brother
salāmī	gift of money at marriage
salām-alaikum	Muslim way of greeting, hi
sahelī	female friend of a woman
sahelīyāṅ	female friends of a woman (f..plural)
sās	mother-in-law
shābāsh	well done, bravo
shādī	wedding, festivity
shār (Punjabi abbreviation of *hosh-yār*)	clever
sharīf	respectable
shalwār-qamīẓ	loose trousers and long shirt/blouse
sharam	shame
shukr karnā	to thank
sonā	gold
sūrat	verses of the *Qur'ān*
tāyā	father's older brother
tāwīẓ	amulet
tez	sharp, keen
tū	you (intimate or disrespectful form of address)
tusaṅ (Punjabi equivalent to Urdu *āp*)	you (respectful form of address)
umbrā (Punjabi)	pilgrimage
'umra	pilgrimage
uncle jī	uncle
ustād	teacher

walāyt	abroad
walāytī	from abroad, often refers to a person from abroad
zamīndār	landowner
zanānī	woman

Bibliography

Abu-Lughoud, A.1991. Writing against culture. Pp: 137-162 in *Recapturing Anthropology: Working in the Present*, edited by R. G. Fox. Santa Fe: School of American Research

Abu-Lughoud, A. 1988. *Veiled Sentiments: Honor and Poetry in a Bedouin Society*. London: University of California Press

Afshar, H. and Maynard, M. 2000. Gender and ethnicity at the millennium: from margin to centre. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 5: 805-19

Ahmad, I. U. W. 1996. The trouble with culture. Pp: 190-218 in *Researching Cultural Differences in Health*, edited by D. Kelleher and S. Hillier. London: Routledge

Alavi, H. 1972. Kinship in West Punjabi villages. *Contributions to Indian Sociology* 14: 1-27

Amit, V. 2000. *Constructing the Field: Ethnographic Fieldwork in the Contemporary World.* London: Routledge

Anthias, F .1998. Evaluating 'diaspora' beyond ethnicity. *Sociology* 32: 557-80

Anwar, M., Roach, P. and Sondhi, R. 1999. *From Legislation to Integration? : Race Relations in Britain*. Basingstoke: Macmillan

Anwar, M. 1998. *Between Cultures: Continuity and Change in the Lives of Young Asians*. Routledge: London

Anwar, M. 1979. *The Myth of Return: Pakistanis in Britain*. London: Heinemann

Appadurai, A. 1996. *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimensions of Globalization*. London: University of Minnesota Press

Appadurai, A. 1991. Global ethnoscapes: Notes and queries for a transnational anthropology. Pp: 191-210 in *Recapturing Anthropology: Working in the Present*, edited by R.G.Fox. Santa Fe: School of American Research

Appadurai, A. 1990. Disjuncture and difference in the global cultural economy. Pp: 295-310 in *Global Culture: Nationalism, Globalisation and Modernity*, edited by M. Featherstone. London: Sage Publications

Arksey, H. and Knight, P. 1999. *Interviewing for Social Scientists*. London: Sage Publications.

Arweck, E. and Collins, P. (Eds.). 2006. *Reading Religion in Text and Context: Reflections of Faith and Practice in Religious Materials*. Ashgate: Aldershot

Bader, V. 2001. Culture and identity: Contesting constructivism. *Ethnicities* 1: 252–85

Ballard, R. 2004. A case of capital-rich under-development: The paradoxical consequences of successful transnational entrepreneurship from Mirpur. Pp: 35-54 in *Migration, Modernity and*

Social Transformation in South Asia, edited by K. Gardner and F. Osella. New Delhi: Sage Publications

Ballard, R. 1994. 'Introduction: the emergence of Desh Pardesh'. In *Desh Pardesh*: *The South Asian Presence in Britain.* London: C. Hurst & Co. Ltd

Ballard, R. 1990. Migration and kinship: the differential effect of marriage rules on the processes of Punjabi migration to Britain. Pp: 219-249 in *South Asian overseas*: *migration and ethnicity*, edited by C. Clarke, C. Peach and S. Vertovec. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Ballard, R. (accessed 2008). *Riste* and *Ristedari*: the significance of marriage in the dynamics of transnational kinship networks. Accessed 15/7/08 at http://www.casas.org.uk/papers/pdfpapers/ristedari.pdf

Banks, M. 1996. *Ethnicity*: *Anthropological Constructions*. London: Routledge

Barth, F. 1987. *Cosmologies in the Making: A Generative Approach to Cultural Variation in Inner New Guinea.* Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

Barth, F. (Ed.). 1969. *Ethnic groups and Boundaries*: *The social Organization of Cultural Difference.* London: Allen and Unwin

Basch, L.Glick-Schiller, N and Blanc-Szanton, C. 1994. *Nations Unbound*: *Transnational Projects, Postcolonial Predicaments and Deterrioralized Nation-States*. New York: Gordon and Breach Publishers

Bauer, E. and Thompson, P. 2004. 'She's always the person with a very global vision': the gender dynamics of migration, narrative interpretation and the case of Jamaican transnational families'. *Gender & History* 2: 28-40

Bauman, Z. 2000: *Liquid Modernity*. Polity Press: Cambridge.

Bauman, Z. 1990: Modernity and ambivalence. *Theory, Culture & Society* 7: 150-169

Baumann, G.1996. *Contesting Culture*: *Discourses of Identity in Multi-ethnic London.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Behar, R. 2003. Ethnography and the book that was lost. *Ethnography* 4: 15-39

Berthoud R. 2001. Teenage births to ethnic minority women. *Population Trends* 104: 12-17

Bolognani, M. 2007. Islam, Ethnography and Politics: Methodological Issues in Researching amongst West Yorkshire Pakistanis in 2005. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 10(4): 279-293.

Bourdieu, P. 1990. *The Logic of Practice.* Standford: Stanford University Press

Bourdieu, P. 1977. *Outline of a Theory of Practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Bradby, H. 2000. Locality, loyalty and identity: experiences of travel and marriage among young

Punjabi women in Glasgow. Pp: 236-249 in *Tourism and Sex: Culture, Commerce and Coercion*, edited by S. Clift and S. Carter. London: Pinter

Brah, A. 1996: *Cartographies of Diaspora: Contesting Identities*. London: Routledge

Bruner, J. 1990. *Acts of Meaning*. London: Harvard University Press

Burawoy, M. 1998. The extended case method. *Sociological Theory* 16: 4–33

Calhoun, C.1997. *Nationalism*. Buckingham: Open University Press and Minnesota Press

Caputo, V. 2000. At 'home' and 'away': Reconfiguring the field for late twentieth-century anthropology. Pp: 19-31 in *Constructing the Field: Ethnographic Fieldwork in the Contemporary World*, edited by V. Amit. London: Routledge

Carsten, J. 2004. *After Kinship*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Carsten, J. 1997. *The Heat of the Hearth: The Process of Kinship in a Malay Fishing Community*. Oxford: Clarendon Press

Carsten, J. 1995. Children in between: Fostering and the process of kinship on Pulau Langkawi, Malaysia'. *Man* 26:425-443

Castles, S. and Miller, M.J. 1993. *The Age of Migration: International Population Movements in the Modern World*. New York: The Guilford Press

Charsley, K. 2005. Unhappy husbands: Masculinity and migration in transnational Pakistani marriages. *Royal Anthropological Institute* 11:85-105

Charsley, K. 2003. Zarurat Rishta: Making and maintaining connections in transnational Pakistani marriages. Paper presented at The Pakistan Workshop, The Rook, How, Lake District, 9-11 May 2003

Clarke, C., Peach, C. and Vertovec, S. (Eds.). 1990. *South Asian Overseas: Migration and Ethnicity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Clifford, J. 1998. Mixed feelings. Pp: 362-370 in *Cosmopolitics: Thinking and Feeling Beyond the Nation*, edited by P. Cheah and B. Robbins. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press

Clifford, J. 1994. Diasporas. *Cultural Anthropology* 9:302-28

Clifford, J. 1992. Travelling cultures. Pp: 96-116 in *Cultural Studies*, edited by L. Grossberg, C. Nelson, and P. A. Treichler. London: Routledge

Cohen, A. 1992: Self-conscious Anthropology. In *Anthropology and Autobiography*, edited by J. Okely and H. Callaway. Routlege: London.

Cohen, A. 1987. *Whlasay: Symbol, Segment and Boundary in a Shetland Island Community*. Manchester: Manchester University Press

Cohen, A. 1985. *The symbolic Construction of Community*. London: Travistock

Cohen, R. 1997. *Global Diasporas: An Introduction.* London: University College London Press

Collins, P. 2006. *Personal Communication*, February 2006.

Comaroff, J. and Comaroff, J. 1992. *Ethnography and the Historical Imagination.* Boulder, CO: Westview Press
Culley, L. and Hudson, N. 2005. Diverse bodies and disrupted reproduction: infertility and minority ethnic communities in the UK. *The International Journal of Diversity in Organisations, Communities and Nations* 5:1-13

Dahya, B. 1973. The nature of Pakistani ethnicity in industrial cities in Britain. Pp: 77-118 in *Urban Ethnicity*, edited by A. Cohen. London: Travistock

Das, V. 1995. National honor and practical kinship: Unwanted women and children. Pp: 145-167 in *Conceiving the New World Order: The Global Politics of Reproduction*, edited by F. Ginsburg and R. Rapp. Berkeley: University of California Press

Denzin, N and Lincoln, S. (Eds.). 2003. *Collecting and Interpreting Qualitative Materials.* London: Sage Publications

Ditz , T. L. 2004. The new men's history and the peculiar absence of gendered power: Some remedies from early American gender history'. *Gender & History* 1: 12-29

Dyck, N. 2000. Home field advantage? Exploring the social construction of children's sports. Pp: 32-55 in *Constructing the Field: Ethnographic Fieldwork in the Contemporary World*, edited by V. Amit. London: Routledge

Edwards, J. 2000. *Born and Bred: Idioms of Kinship and New Reproductive Technologies in England.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Eglar, Z.S. 1960. *A Punjabi Village in Pakistan.* New York: Columbia University Press

Ellis, C. and Bochner, A.P. 1996. *Composing Ethnography: Alternative Forms of Qualitative Writing.* London: AltaMira Press

Eriksen, H.T. 1993. *Ethnicity and Nationalism: Anthropological Perspectives.* London: Pluto Press

Evans-Pritchard, E. V. 1940. *The Nuer: A Description of the Modes of Livelihood and Political Institutions of a Nilotic People.* New York: Oxford University Press

Fabricant, C. 1998. Riding the waves of (post) colonial migrancy: Are we all really in the same boat? *Diaspora* 7: 25-52

Faist, T.1998. Transnational social spaces out of international migration: evolution, significance, and future prospects. *Archives Européenes Sociologie* XXXIX: 213–47

Faist, T. 2000. *The Volume and Dynamics of International Migration and Transnational Social Spaces.* Oxford: Oxford University Press

Faubion, J. (Ed.). 2001. *The Ethics of Kinship: Ethnographic Inquiries*. Oxford: Rowman and Littlefield

Franklin, S. and McKinnon, S. 2001. *Relative Values: Reconfiguring Kinship Studies*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Frankenburg, R.1957. *Village on the Border: A Social Study of Religion, Politics and Football in a North Wales Community*. London: Cohen and West

Friedman, J. 1994. *Cultural Identity and Global Process*. London: Sage Publications

Fortes, M. 1969. *Kinship and the Social Order: The Legacy of Lewis Henry Morgan*. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company

Foucault, M. 1988. *Politics, Philosophy, Culture: Interviews and Other Writings*. London: Routledge

Foucault, M. 1972. *The Archaeology of Knowledge*. London: Tavistock

Gamburd, M.R. 2000. *The Kitchen Spoon's Handle: Transnationalism and Sri Lanka's Migrant Housemaids*. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press

Gardner, K. 2002. *Age, Narrative and Migration: The Life Course and Life Histories Amongst Bengali Elders in London*. Oxford: Berg Publishers

Gardner, K. 1998. Women and Islamic revivalism in a Bangladeshi village. Pp: 203-21 in *Appropriating Gender: Women's Activism and Politicized Religion in South Asia*, edited by P. Jeffery and A. Basu. New York: Routledge

Gardner, K. 1995. *Global Migrants, Local Lives*. Oxford: Clarendon Press

Gardner, K. 1993. Desh-bidesh: Sylhetti Images of Home and Away. *Man* 28: 1-15

Gardner, K. and Grillo, R. 2002. Transnational households and ritual: an overview. *Global Networks* 2:179-190.

Gardner, K and Shukur, A. 1996. I'm Bengali, I'm Asian, and I'm living here. Pp: 142-64 in *Desh Pardesh: the South Asian Presence in Britain*, edited by R. Ballard. London: Hurst Publishers

Geaves, R. 2000. *The Sufis of Britain: An Exploration of Muslim Identity*. Cardiff: Cardiff Academic Press

Gee, J.P. 1999. *An Introduction to Discourse Analysis: Theory and Method*. London: Routledge

Geertz, C. 1975. *The Interpretation of Cultures: Selected Essays*. London: Hutchinson

Geiger, S.1986. Women's life histories: Method and content. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 11:334-351

Ghuman, P. 1999. *Asian Adolescents in the West*. Leicester: BPS Books

Gilroy, P. 1993. *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press

Gilroy, P. 1987. *There Ain't No Black in the Union Jack: the Cultural Politics of Race and Nation*. London: Hutchinson
Glaser B.G. and Strauss L.A. 1967. *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies of Qualitative Research*. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company

Glick Schiller, N. 1997. The situation of transnational studies. *Identities* 4:155–66

Glick Schiller, N, Basch, L. and Blanc-Szanton, C. (Eds.) 1992. Transnationalism: a new analytic framework for understanding migration. Pp: 1-24 in *Toward a Transnational Perspective on Migration: Race, Class, Ethnicity and Nationalism Reconsidered*. New York: New York Academy of Sciences

Glick Schiller, N. and Fouron, G. 1999. Transnational Lives and National Identities. Pp: 130-161 in *Transnationalism From Below*, edited by P.M. Smith and L. E. Guarnizo. London: Transaction Publishers

Gluckman, M. 1963. Papers in honour of Melville J. Herskovits: Gossip and scandal. *Current Anthropology* 4:307-16

Gubrium, J. F. and Holstein, J.A. 2003. *Postmodern Interviewing*. London: Sage Publications

Gubrium, J.F. and Holstein, J. A. 1999. At the border of narrative and ethnography. *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography* 28:561-573

Gunaratnam, Y. 2003. *Researching 'Race' and Ethnicity*. London: Sage Publications

Gupta, A. and Ferguson, J. (Eds.). 1997. *Anthropological Locations: Boundaries and Grounds of a Field Science*. London: University of California Press

Hall, S. 1996. New ethnicities. Pp: 441-450 in *Stuart Hall: Critical Dialogues in Cultural Studies*, edited by D. Morley and K. Chen. London: Routledge

Hall, S. 1992. The question of cultural identity. Pp: 273-325 in *Modernity and its Futures*, edited by S. Hall, D. Held and T. McGrew. Cambridge: Polity Press

Hannerz, U. 1996. *Transnational Connections: Culture, People, Places*. London: Routledge

Hannerz, U. 1992. *Culture Complexities: Studies in the Social Organisation of the Meaning*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Hannerz, U. 1990. Cosmopolitans and locals in world culture. Pp: 237-251 in *Global Culture: Nationalism, Globalisation and Modernity*, edited by M. Featherstone. London: Sage Publications

Hennink, M., Diamond, I. and Cooper, P. 1999. Young Asian women and relationships: traditional or transitional? *Ethnic and Racial Studies*. 22: 145-160

Home Office. 2002. *Secure borders, safe haven: integration with diversity in modern Britain.* London: The Stationery Office

Hoover, K.R. 1980. *The Elements of Social Scientific Thinking.* New York: St Martin's Press

Howell, S. 2003. Kinning: the creation of life trajectories in transnational adoptive families. *Royal Anthropological Institute* 9:465-484
Inhorn, M. C. 2003. Global infertility and the globalisation of new reproductive technologies: illustrations from Egypt. *Social Science and Medicine* 56: 1837-1851

Inhorn, M., C. and Van Balen, F. (Eds.). 2001. *Infertility Around the Globe: New Thinking on Childlessness, Gender, and Reproductive Technologies.* Berkeley: University of California Press

Jackson, A. 1986. (Ed.). *Anthropology at Home.* London: Routledge

Jacobson, J. 1998. *Islam in Transition: Religion and Identity Among British Pakistani Youth.* London: Routledge

James, A. and Prout, A. 1997. *Constructing and Reconstructing Childhood: Contemporary Issues in the Sociological Study of Childhood.* London: Falmer

Jeffrey, P. 1973. *Pakistani families and their networks in Bristol and Pakistan.* Unpublished PhD. thesis, University of Bristol

Jenkins, R. 1996. *Social Identity.* London: Routledge

Jenkins, R. 1994 Rethinking ethnicity: identity, categorization and power. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 17:197–223

Kalra, V. S. 2000. *From Textile Mills to Taxi Ranks.* Ashgate Aldershot

Kelly, E. 1990. Transcontinental families – Gujarat and Lancashire: a comparative study. Pp: 251-268 in *South Asian Overseas: Migration and Ethnicity,* edited by C. Clark, C. Peach and S. Vertovec. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Kokot, W., Tőlőyan, K. and Alfonso, C. (Eds.). 2004. *Diaspora, Identity and Religion: New Directions in Theory and Research.* London: Routledge

Kreager, P. and Schröder-Butterfill, E. 2004. *Ageing Without Children: European and Asian Perspectives.* Oxford: Berghahn Books

Kumar, N.1992. *Friends, Brothers and Informants: Fieldwork Memoirs of Banaras.* California: University of California Press

Lawless, L.1996. *Teesside Muslims: Their Migration Histories, Settlement Patterns and Community Development.* Cleveland: Cleveland County Council

Lincoln, Y.S. and Guba, E.G. 1985. *Naturalistic Inquiry.* Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications

MacIntyre, A. 2000. *After Virtue.* London: Duckworth

Manning, P. (1995) In Van Maanen, J. (Ed.) 1995. *Representation in Ethnography.* Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Mason, D. 1996. Some reflections on the sociology of race and racism. Pp: 36-52 in *The Racism Problematic: Contemporary Sociological Debates on Race and Ethnicity*, edited by R. Barot. Lewiston: The Edwin Mellen Press
Massey, D. 1994. *Space, Place and Gender.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press

Massey, D., Arango, J., Hugo, G., Kouaouci, A., Pellegrino, A. and Taylor, J. E. 1998. *Worlds in Motion.* Oxford: Clarenden Press
Maynard, D.W. 1989. On the ethnography and analysis of discourse in institutional Settings. Pp 127-146 in *Perspectives on Social Problems*, edited by J.A. Holstein and G. Miller. Greenwich, CT: JAI

McCrossan, L. 1991. *A Handbook for Interviewers: A Manual of Social Survey Practice and Procedures on Structured Interviewing.* London: HMSO

Middlesbrough Borough Council. 2001. Middlesbrough Socio-Economic Picture.

Miles, B. M.1994. *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Book.* London: Sage Publications

Miles, B.M. and Huberman, A.M. 1984. *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Sourcebook of New Methods.* Beverly Hills, CA: Sage Publications

Miles, R. 1996. Racism and nationalism in the United Kingdom: A view from the periphery. Pp: 250-262 in *The Racism Problematic: Contemporary Sociological Debates on Race and Ethnicity*, edited by R. Barot. Lewiston: The Edwin Mellen Press

Miles, R. 1989. *Racism* London: Routledge

Milkman, R. and Townsley, E. 1994. Gender and the Economy. Pp 44-64 in *Handbook of Economic Sociology.* Princeton: Princeton University Press

Modood, T. 1996. If races don't exist, then what does? Racial categorisation and ethnic Realities. Pp: 90-105 in *The Racism Problematic: Contemporary Sociological Debates on Race and Ethnicity*, edited by R. Barot. Lewiston: The Edwin Mellen Press

Modood, T. 1988. 'Black', racial equality and Asian identity. *New Community.* 14: 397–404

Modood, T. and Werbner, P. 1997. *The politics of Multiculturalism in the New Europe: Racism, Identity, and Community.* London: Zed Books

Modood, T., Berthoud, R., Lakey, J., Nazroo, J., Smith, S., Virdee, S. and Beishon, S. 1997. *Ethnic Minorities in Britain: Diversity and Disadvantage.* London: Policy Studies Institute

Narayan, K. 1989. *Storytellers, Saints and Scoundrels.* Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Nielsen, J.S. 1995. *Muslims in Western Europe*, 2nd edition. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press

Okely, J. 1983. *The Traveller-Gypsies*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Ong, A. 1999. *Flexible Citizenship*. Durham , N.C.: Duke University Press

Ortner, S. 1984. Theory in anthropology since the sixties. *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 26:126-66

Osella, F. and Gardner, K. (Eds.). 2004. *Migration, Modernity and Social Transformation in South Asia*. New Delhi: Sage Publications

Osella, F. and Osella, C. (Eds.). 2000. *Social Mobility in Kerala: Modernity and Identity in Conflict*. London: Pluto Press

Palinkas, L. A. and Pickwell, S. M. 1995. Acculturation as a risk factor for chronic disease among Cambodian refugees in the US. *Social Science and Medicine* 40: 1643–53

Papreen, N., Sharma, A., Sabin, K., Begum, L., Ahsan, K.A. and Baqui, H. A. 2000. Living with infertility: Experiences among urban slum populations in Bangladesh. *Reproductive Health Matters* 8: 33-44

Parekh, B. 1998. Integrating minorities. Pp:7-27 in *Race Relations in Britain: a Developing Agenda*, edited by T. Blackstone, B. Parekh and P. Sanders. London: Routledge

Parekh, B. 2000. *The Future of Multi-Ethnic Britain: Report of the Commission on the Future of Multi-Ethnic Britain.* London: Bhikhu Parekh. Profile Books

Patton, M.Q (Ed.). 2002. *Qualitative Research and Evaluation Methods*. California: Sage Publications

Peletz, G. M. 2001. Ambivalence in kinship since the 1940's. Pp: 413-444 in *Relative Values: Reconfiguring Kinship Studies*, edited by S. Franklin and S. McKinnon. Durham: Duke University Press

Peletz, G. M. 1995. Kinship in late twentieth-century anthropology. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 24:343-372.

Pessar, P. and Mahler, S. 2003. Transnational migration: bringing gender in. *International Migration Review* 3: 813-44

Phizacklea, A. 2004. Migration theory and migratory realities: a gendered perspective. In *International Migration in the New Millennium*, edited by D. Joly. Aldershot: Ashgate

Platts, J.T. 1960. A Dictionary of *Urdu, Classical Hindi, and English*. Oxford: Oxford University Press

Portes, A. 1999a. Conclusion: toward a new world – the origins and effects of transnational activities. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 22: 463–77

Portes, A. 1999b. Immigration theory for a new century: some problems and opportunities. Pp: 21–33 in *The Handbook of International Migration: The American Experience*, edited by C. Hirschman, P. Kasinitz, and J. DeWind. New York: Russell Sage Foundation

Portes, A. 1998. Divergent destinies: immigration, the second generation, and the rise of transnational communities. Pp. 33–57 in *Paths to Inclusion: The Integration of Migrants in the United States and Germany*, edited by P.H. Schuck and R. Munz. New York: Berghahn Books

Portes, A. 1996a. Global villagers: the rise of transnational communities. *American Prospect* 25: 74–7

Portes, A. 1996b. Transnational communities: their emergence and significance in the contemporary world-system. Pp: 151–68 in *Latin America in the World Economy* , edited by R.P. Korzeniewicz and W.C. Smith. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press
Portes, A. 1995. Children of immigrants: segmented assimilation. Pp: 248-80 in *The Economic Sociology of Immigration*, edited by A. Portes. New York: Russell Sage Foundation

Portes, A, Guarnizo, L.E. and Landolt, P.1999. The study of transnationalism: pitfalls and promise of an emergent research field. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 22: 217–37

Rapport, N. 2002. (Ed.). *British Subjects*: *An Anthropology of Britain.* Oxford: Berg Publishers.

Rapport, N. and Dawson, A (Eds.).1998. *Migrants of Identity: Perceptions of Home in a World of Movement.* Oxford: Berg Publishers

Rattansi, A. 2000. On being and not being brown/black-British: Racism, class, sexuality and ethnicity in post-imperial Britain. *Interventions - Journal of Postcolonial Studies* 2: 125-140

Reinharz, S.1992. *Feminist Methods in Social Research.* Oxford: Oxford University Press

Reissman, C.K. Stigma and everyday practices: Childless women in South India. *Gender & Society* 14: 111-135.

Richards, S. C. 2002. 'Spoiling the Womb': Definitions, Aetiologies and Responses to Infertility in North West Province, Cameroon. *African Journal of Reproductive Health* 6: 84-95

Roberts, B. 1995 Socially expected durations and the economic adjustment of immigrants. Pp: 42–86 in *The Economic Sociology of Immigration*, edited by A. Portes. New York: Russell Sage Foundation

Rosaldo, R. 1989. *Culture and Truth.* Boston: Beacon

Safran, W. 1991. Diasporas in modern societies: Myths of homeland and return. *Diaspora* 1:83-99

Schieffelin, B. and Ochs, E. 1986. *Language Socialization Across Cultures.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Schneider, D. 1984. *A Critique of the Study of Kinship.* Ann Arbour: University of Michigan Press

Schutz, A. 1972. *Phenomenology of the Social World*, Translated by G. Walsh and F. Lehnert. London: Heinemann

Schutz, A. 1962. *Collected Papers* I: *The Problem of Social Reality.* Nijhoff: The Hague.

Schutz, A. 1944. The stranger: an essay in social psychology. *The American Journal of Sociology* 49:499-507

Shaw, A. 2004. British Pakistani elderly without children: an invisible minority. Pp: 198-222 in *Ageing without Children: European and Asian Perspectives*, edited by P. Kreager and E. Schröder-Butterfill. Oxford: Berghahn Books

Shaw, A. 2001. Kinship, cultural preference and immigration: Consanguineous marriage among British Pakistanis. *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 7:315-334

Shaw, A. 2000. *Kinship and Continuity: Pakistani Families in Britain.* Netherlands: Harwood Academic Publishers.

Shaw, A. 1988. *A Pakistani Community in Britain.* Oxford: Blackwell Publishers

Shukla, S. 2000. Locations for South Asian Diasporas. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 30:551-72.

Simpson, B. 1998. *Changing Families.* Oxford: Berg Publishers

Sinha, M. 1999. Giving masculinity a history. *Gender & History* 11: 145-167

Smaje, C. 1996. The ethnic patterning of health: New directions for theory and research. *Sociology of Health and Illness* 18: 139–71

Smart, A and Smart, J. 1999. Transnational networks and negotiated identities in interactions between Hong Kong and China. Pp: 103-129 in *Transnationalism From Below*, edited by P.M Smith and L.E. Guarnizo. London: Transaction Publishers

Smith, M. P. and Guarnizo, E. (Eds.).1998. *Transnationalism From Below.* London: Transaction Publishers.

Solomos, J. 1998. Beyond racism and multiculturalism. *Patterns of Prejudice.* 32: 45–62

Solomos, J. 1993: *Race and Racism in Britain, 2nd edition.* London: Macmillan

Sorensen, N.N. 1999. Narrating identity across Dominican worlds. Pp: 241-269 in *Transnationalism From Below*, edited by P.M Smith and L.E Guarnizo. London: Transaction Publishers

Soysal, Y. N. 1994. *Limits of Citizenship: Migrants and Postnational Membership in Europe.* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press

Soysal, Y. N. 2000: Citizenship and identity: living in diasporas in post-war Europe? *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 23: 14-29

Stoler, A. 1995. *Race and the Education of Desire.* Durham, NC: Duke University Press

Strathern, M. 1999. *Property, Substance and Effect: Anthropological Essays on Persons and Things.* London: Athlone Press

Strathern, M. 1992. *After Nature: English Kinship in the Late Twentieth Century* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Strathern, M. 1991. *Partial Connections.* Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield

Strathern, M. 1988. *Gender of the Gift: Problems with Women and Problems with Society in Melanesia.* Berkeley: University of California Press

Strathern, M. 1981. *Kinship at the Core.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Strathern, A and Stewart, P. 2003. *Witchcraft, Sorcery, Rumours and Gossip.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Stringer, M. and Arweck, E. 2002. *Theorizing Faith: The Insider/Outsider Problem in the Study of Ritual.* Birmingham: Birmingham University Press

Tedlock, B. 2003. Ethnography and ethnographic representation. Pp:165-213 in *Strategies of Qualitative Inquiry,* edited by N.K. Denzin and Y.S. Lincoln. London: Sage Publications

Thangarajah, Y.C. 2004. Veiled constructions: Conflict, migration and modernity in Eastern Sri Lanka. Pp: 141-162 in *Homelands and Diasporas: Holy Lands and Other Places*, edited by A. Levy and A. Weingrod. Stanford: Stanford University Press

Tőlőyan, K.1991. The nation-state and its others: In lieu of preface. *Diaspora* 1:3-7

Tomlinson, J. 1999. *Globalization and Culture.* Cambridge: Polity

Urry, J. 2000. *Sociology beyond Societies: Mobilities for the Twenty-First Century.* London: Routledge

Van de Veer, P. 1995. *Nation and Migration: The Politics of Space in the South Asian Diaspora.* Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press

Vertovec, S. 2001. Transnationalism and identity. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 27:573-582

Vertovec, S. 1999. Conceiving and researching transnationalism. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 22: 447-62

Vertovec, S. and Rogers, A. (Eds.). 1998. *Muslim European Youth: Re-producing Religion, Ethnicity, Culture.* Aldeshot: Ashgate

Voiels, V. 1998. *Hinduism : A New Approach.* London: Hodder and Stoughton

Watson, J. (Ed). 1977. *Between Two Cultures: Migrants and Minorities in Britain.* Oxford: Blackwell Publishers

Wazir, B. 2002. Things can only get bitter. *The Observer* 7 July 2002.

Webb, J., Schirato, T. and Danaher, G. 2001. *Understanding Bourdieu.* London: Sage Publications

Weiner, A. 1992. *Inalienable Possessions*: *The Paradox of Keeping While Giving*. Berkeley: University of California Press

Werbner, P. 2004. Veiled interventions in pure space: Honour, shame and embodied struggles among Muslims in Britain and France. Paper presented at The Pakistan Workshop, The Rook, How, Lake District, 9-11 May 2004

Werbner, P. 2002. The place which is diaspora: citizenship, religion and gender in the making of chaordic transnationalism. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 28:119-133

Werbner, P. 1999. Global pathways, working class cosmopolitans and the creation of transnational ethnic worlds. *Social Anthropology* 7:17-35

Werbner, P. 1991. Factionalism and violence in British Pakistani communal politics. Pp: 188-215 in *Economy and Culture in Pakistan*: *Migrants and Cities in a Muslim Society*, edited by D. Hastings and P. Werbner. London: Macmillan Press

Werbner, P. 1990. *The Migration Process*: *Capital, Gifts and Offerings among British Pakistanis*. Oxford: Berg Publishers

Werbner, P. and Modood, T. (Eds.). 1997. *Debating Cultural Hybridity*. London: Zen Books

Whyte, W.F. 1943. *Street Corner Society*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Willis, P. 1997. *Learning to Labour: How Working Class Kids Get Working Class Jobs*. Ashgate: Aldershot

Wulff, H. 1988. *Twenty girls: Growing Up, Ethnicity and Excitement in a South London Microculture*. Stockholm: Stockholm Studies in Social Anthropology

Yan, Y. 2001. Practicing kinship. Pp: 224-245 in *Relative Values*: *Reconfiguring Kinship Studies*, edited by S. Franklin and S. McKinnon. Durham, NC: Duke University Press

Yates, P. 1990. Interpreting life texts and negotiating life courses: youth, ethnicity and culture. Pp: 76-87 in *Anthropology and the Riddle of the Sphinx: Paradoxes of Change in the Life Course*, edited by P. Spencer. London: Routledge

Appendix One: Ethnic Composition of the Tees Valley

Table 1: Number of People in Ethnic Groups
***Source*: 2001 Census:**
Ethnic Minorities in the Tees Valley

	All People	Number of people in ethnic groups:							
		white	all non-white groups	non-white groups included in 'all non white groups'					
				mixed	indian	pakistani	bangla-deshi	chinese	other
Darlington	97,840	95,730	2,120	610	430	80	290	240	470
Hartlepool	88,610	87,570	1,030	320	190	210	70	100	140
Middlesbrough	134,860	126,400	8,450	1,280	840	4,840	70	270	1,150
Redcar & Cleveland	139,130	137,660	1,470	440	160	290	120	110	350
Stockton-on-Tees	178,410	173,480	4,920	1,000	780	1,990	50	300	800
Tees Valley	638,840	620,840	17,980	3,650	2,400	7,400	590	1,020	2,920
North East	2,515,440	2,455,420	60,020	12,230	10,160	14,080	6,160	6,050	11,340
England & Wales	52,041,920	47,520,870	4,521,050	661,030	1,036,810	714,830	280,830	226,950	1,600,600

Table 1 above shows numbers of people in each ethnic group. There were almost 18,000 people whose ethnic group was non-white in the Tees Valley. Almost half of these were in Middlesbrough and a further quarter in Stockton-on-Tees. In the sub-region over 7,400 (40 percent) of the non-white population were Pakistani and 2,400 (14 percent) Indian.

Appendix Two

Information on Core informants

Amina and Aziz

Amina and Aziz are both 54 years of age and live in the central Middlesbrough area of Teesside. They come from a rural area of Azad Kashmir in Pakistan. They are both from the *gujar* caste and Amina and Aziz are first cousins who were married in Pakistan. Aziz is Amina's *māmā's* son. They have a wide kin network living in Middlesbrough, Sheffield, Nottingham and Leicester in England. Amina's father died 10 years ago and her elderly mother lives with the couple. Aziz's father and step-mother live in Pakistan. Aziz has 2 sisters and 2 younger brothers living in England. He is the oldest brother and has an older sister. Amina has 2 brothers who are both married to her *khāla's* (mother's sister's) daughters.

Begum and Thazeem

Begum was in her early seventies and lived with her two brother's in Teesside. She is from the *zamīndār* caste and comes from a small village of Azad Kashmir in Pakistan. She has 2 brothers and 3 sisters, one of whom died a while ago. She has a close kin network in England. She lived in Pakistan most of her life and migrated to Britain almost 8 years ago. She was married to a relative in Pakistan, but due to fighting between the couple, they separated. Since then her husband re-married and has 7 children from his second wife. Begum therefore lived with her brother and mother in Pakistan. As her mother was getting old, it was becoming increasingly difficult for Begum to look after her. She then asked a close neighbour whether his daughter (Thazeem) was come and live with her and help to take care of her elderly mother.

Thazeem's family was very poor in Pakistan and was also from the *zamīndār* caste. Thazeem moved in with Begum and her mother at the age of 12 and referred to Begum as her mother. Thazeem's own mother had died during childbirth when she was only 2 years old. When Begum's mother died, her brother's arranged for her to come to England. Begum became worried about Thazeem's situation and therefore arranged for her to marry her nephew. Thazeem has a child now and continues to send money to her father and siblings in Pakistan.

Yahoob and Fridah's family

Yahoob and his family live in two joint houses in the outskirts of the Thornaby area in Teesside. His has 3 brothers, their wives and children all living together. Yahoob and his brothers run a *halāl* meat shop in Middlesbrough. Yahoob and his wife have 5 children and his two brothers have 4 each. Yahoob's youngest brother is waiting to get married to a cousin in Pakistan. Yahoob and his second brother are married to 2 sisters who are distant relatives. The third brother is married to his *taya's* daughter.

Yahoob migrated to Britain almost 19 years ago at the age of 21. The family are of the *arāīṅ* caste and originally lived in the rural area of Pakistan. However, since their expansion in businesses they have invested in properties in Mirpur and Islamabad areas of Pakistan.

Naseem and Saleena

Naseem is 67 years of age and lives in the outskirts of Middlesbrough area with her son. She has 4 daughters and 1 son. Her son is married to her sister's daughter who has 3 children between them. Saleena is the third youngest child, married to her *khāla's* son from Pakistan. Saleena has 2 children, a boy and girl and was pregnant during our meetings. The family are from the *jogī* caste and live in the rural area of Azad Kashmir. Two of Naseem's sisters are married to her husband's relatives. One of them lives in Leeds and the other is in Middlesbrough. Her third youngest is not married and lives with her in Teesside.

Naseem has 3 brothers and a sister living in Pakistan. She did return to Pakistan almost 8 years ago with her daughter-in-law. Saleena's in-laws are living in Pakistan with their older son. She visited Pakistan 2 years ago when her in-laws requested to see their grandchildren.

Afsha and Aunty Shaad

Afsha is a second-generation 26 year old British Pakistani living with her parents and younger brother in the Stockton area of Teesside. Afsha and her family come from the *arāīṅ* caste. Afsha was engaged to her *māmā's* son and the wedding took place during my fieldwork. Aunty Shaad is the mother of Afsha; she has relatives living in Pakistan in her natal home town of Mirpur. Aunty Shaad married Afsha's father, who is a very distant cousin of hers. Afsha's father has an older brother living in Pakistan (Islamabad) and has 3 younger brothers in England. Afsha's paternal grandfather died almost 40 years ago and her uncle (*tāyā*) took the role of a father.

Aunty Shaad has 4 sisters and 4 brothers. Two of her sisters and 2 brothers live in Pakistan. Her elderly father is looked after by her youngest son and her mother died recently. Afsha has 2 younger paternal uncles living in Middlesbrough and one in London. One uncle is a very well respected lawyer in the London area and her 2 youngest are self-employed. Aunty Shaad has had many conflicts with her in-laws and only started to speak to her youngest brother and his wife in the last year.

Aunty Shaad has a wide network of friends and has an important role in the community. She takes part in the *kameṭī* system, a credit rotating system, of £100 each week. The family own 6 houses in England, which are all rented out. Afsha's father owns 2 food outlets in Newcastle.

Parveen and Amjad

Parveen and Amjad are a young couple who come from one of the most devout religious families I met. They are both in their mid twenties and were expecting their first child when I met them. They come from the *zamīndār* caste and live in the outskirts of Middlesbrough. Parveen is Amjad's first cousin; he is her *māmā's* son. The family originally came from the Azad Kashmir area of Pakistan. They have 7 large families who all live in 3 large houses close to one another. All the members prayed 5 times a day. One of Amjad's brothers has recently moved to Saudi Arabia. The family own 3 take-away. All the women in the household wear the *burqā'* when outside the home. Some of the men wear the traditional *thambi* (bottoms and tunic shirt). They all have long beards and are learning the Arabic language. Three of the younger second generation women lecture at a local mosque about Islam and women's role. Some of their younger children have been removed from mainstream school and are educated at home in English, Maths and Arabic.

Some of their distant relatives in Middlesbrough have married Arab men, who have gained permanent visas to live in Britain. Parveen's *khāla's* daughter told me that her father wanted to give help/service (*idmat karnā*) to these men and their family. They told me that they would receive religious merit in return.

Zeenath and *Bābā* Ali

Zeenath and *bābā* Ali come from the *naī* caste. *Bābā* Ali is Zeenath's father. Zeenath lives with her husband 3 children in central Middlesbrough. Zeenath's mother died 10 years ago and her father married a woman from Pakistan 2 years after his wife's death. *Bābā* Ali works in Denmark and visits Pakistan regularly on an annual basis. He also stays in England with Zeenath and nephews in Leeds during his visits. He is a kind and loud person, who prayers 5 times a day.

Zeenath's husband works as a taxi driver and she sews the traditional *shalwār-qamīẓ* for the local women. She also cooks for a local bakery. The family plan to purchase a larger house in Middlesbrough. Zeenath's husband is her *māmā's* son. Zeenath has 2 brothers, who both live in Leeds. Her brother's are married to distant relatives and *bābā* Ali has had many rifts with his daughter-in-laws.