

STATE HISTORICAL
SOCIETY OF IOWA

IOWA DEPARTMENT OF CULTURAL AFFAIRS

The Annals of Iowa

Volume 70 | Number 3 (Summer 2011)

pps. 260-262

Wandering Souls: Protestant Migrations in America, 1630–1865

Linda K. Pritchard

Eastern Michigan University

ISSN 0003-4827

Copyright © 2011 State Historical Society of Iowa. This article is posted here for personal use, not for redistribution.

Recommended Citation

Pritchard, Linda K. "Wandering Souls: Protestant Migrations in America, 1630–1865." *The Annals of Iowa* 70 (2011), 260-262.

Available at: <https://doi.org/10.17077/0003-4827.1556>

Hosted by [Iowa Research Online](http://iowa-research-online.org)

Moreover, while Belich is clearly aware of the exploitive side of Anglo expansion, those seeking a full consideration of displacement of and resistance by indigenous peoples would need to look elsewhere. Overall, however, *Replenishing the Earth* is a rewarding book that enables readers to re-situate and reconsider stories of settlement and expansion that they might think they already know well.

Wandering Souls: Protestant Migrations in America, 1630–1865, by S. Scott Rohrer. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2010. x, 312 pp. Illustrations, tables, maps, appendixes, notes, bibliography, index. \$39.95 cloth.

Reviewer Linda K. Pritchard is Department Head, Women's and Gender Studies, and a professor of history at Eastern Michigan University. Her publications include "A Comparative Approach to Western Religious History: Texas as a Case Study, 1845–1890" in the *Western Historical Quarterly* (1988).

Scott Rohrer's thesis in *Wandering Souls* — "[Protestant] religion's role in migration and the settlement process was far more important than has been recognized" (247) — counters what he believes is a distortion of America's internal migration story. For a large variety of Protestant groups, religious migrations differed fundamentally from secular ones. Rather than a setting for disparate individuals to meld into Frederick Jackson Turner's "new American," the frontier, Rohrer argues, provided space for religious peoples to reinspire, reestablish, and reinvent their own religious traditions. The migrations of such groups did not threaten their "Christian Community"; instead, they were generally successful attempts to strengthen ties of shared religious values.

Rohrer selects various well-known and obscure migrations from 1630 to the end of the Civil War to demonstrate the power of religion to shape migration in North America. The book begins with an account of the "first frontier" migration in the form of Thomas Hooker's departure from Massachusetts Bay Colony to the Connecticut Valley in 1636. Rohrer organizes his account of subsequent Protestant migrations into two broad categories. The first includes religiously minded people who moved to find spiritual and economic fulfillment. The "sojourners" he documents in this category include Devereux Jarratt and the Anglicans moving from tidewater to upcountry Virginia in 1752; two groups of Scots-Irish Presbyterians in the mid-eighteenth century, one moving from Boston to Maine and another within Virginia; the Moravian migration into North Carolina from eastern Pennsylvania in 1765; and, finally, Methodists from Virginia into the Ohio Country after the Revolution. Rohrer's second category of Protestant

migrations was churches or congregations migrating to escape persecution, establish "utopia," or mitigate internal dissent. Here he details the "dissenter" Seventh Day Baptists who moved from Shrewsbury, New Jersey, to western Virginia in 1789; the Inspirationists coming from Ebenezer, New York, to found colonies in Amana, Iowa, in 1855; and the quintessential "American Exodus" of Mormons from upstate New York through Ohio, Missouri, and Illinois and finally to Utah's Great Salt Lake Basin in the 1830s and '40s.

The author elegantly and expansively tells the story of each migration. Rohrer writes a nuanced account, based on secondary sources, of religious and economic factors leading to migration. Readers will find a richly contextualized account of group migrations, including brief histories of each migrant group's religious traditions. For example, his description of Amana's Society of True Inspiration includes an account of Pietist origins in Germany and Switzerland, followed by a description of the four villages first established in 1842 in Ebenezer, New York, five miles from Buffalo. By 1855, their leader, Christian Metz, was convinced that "Ebenezer's rampant materialism risked all that society achieved by leaving Germany" (94). Through Metz, God revealed that illness in the villages was punishment for lack of religious commitment and that village children spending too much time in Buffalo were signs of secular temptations. Barely 13 years after founding Ebenezer, Metz organized a move away from the immediate distractions of a modernizing society to an isolated spot on the Iowa frontier. Between 1855 and 1865, more than 1,100 Inspirationists founded the communal Amana settlements.

While the focus on the role of religion in migration might be a corrective for some, Rohrer overstates the case for historical neglect of the role of Protestantism in migration. The well-known migrations highlighted in his book have self-evident religious motives. This is especially true for the second category, utopian groups and those suffering persecution. No account of the Mormons, religious dissenters starting with the Puritans, or Pietists would dare neglect the religious dimension, although historians might quibble about the balance of religious and secular motives or even the inclusion of Mormonism as a nineteenth-century Protestant group. Even the "pilgrims" of the author's first category, those who moved on their own initiative for spiritual and economic fulfillment, have well-documented Protestant origins. For example, the Second Great Awakening is a well-known consequence of the Protestant migrations into New York's Burned Over District and the Ohio Valley. And arguments for mid-nineteenth-century "democratization" in political and religious circles often begin with the "dis-

senter" tradition of migration in American Protestantism. It would have been more convincing for his argument to document American internal migrations where historians have missed latent or overt religious motives.

Even so, this volume provides ample evidence for a closer look at the role of religion, dissenter or otherwise, in more recent migrations as well as in Roman Catholic, Jewish, Islamic, and even so-called secular migrations. Rohrer is correct to imply that religion is not uniformly valued as an independent or even dependent variable of behavior in migration or in other historical phenomena. *Wandering Souls* reminds historians to look at religion with the same critical eye as they do at class, ethnicity, and gender.

A Most Magnificent Machine: America Adopts the Railroad, 1825–1862, by Craig Miner. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2010. xvi, 325 pp. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, index. \$34.95 cloth.

Reviewer Scott E. Randolph is assistant professor of history at Armstrong Atlantic State University in Savannah, Georgia. His Ph.D. dissertation (Purdue University, 2009) was "Playing by the Rules: Markets, Manipulation, and the Meaning of Exchange in the American Railway Industry, 1900–1918."

In *A Most Magnificent Machine*, Craig Miner illustrates with vivid detail the shock, wonder, delight, and dismay that attended the early decades of the railroad revolution in antebellum America. That exercise alone is a useful tonic for our jaded, modern eyes. In the twenty-first century, groundbreaking transformation has been normalized and has become routine, almost boring, and certainly expected. Even the internet seems less significant when viewed against the longer history of electronic communication from the telegraph onward. Yet, for those who witnessed them, the railroad and the steam engine seemed to herald an age without limits, freeing humanity from the restrictions and limitations of muscle and sinew. The railroad became the physical and metaphysical incarnation of progress and transformation, and Americans could not stop themselves from talking about it morning, afternoon, and night. Miner takes us into that experience, as Americans struggled to comprehend both the vehicle and the pace of change. The world as they knew it was changing in ways no previous experience had prepared them for.

Miner's story, based on newspaper and booster pamphlets, is that of the literate and politically engaged; it favors the voices of the towns over the countryside, and reflects, as one would expect, a faith in progress. The narrative moves in a loosely chronological fashion, opening