## Aging-induced double ferroelectric hysteresis loops in BiFeO<sub>3</sub> multiferroic ceramic

G. L. Yuan

Department of Applied Physics, The Hong Kong Polytechnic University, Hung Hom, Kowloon, Hong Kong and Helmholtz-Institut fur Strahlen-und Kernphysik, University of Bonn, Nussallee 14-16, D-53115 Bonn, Germany

Y. Yang

Precision Driving Laboratory, Nanjing University of Aeronautics and Astronautics, Nanjing 210016, China

Siu Wing Or<sup>a)</sup>

Department of Applied Physics, The Hong Kong Polytechnic University, Hung Hom, Kowloon, Hong Kong

(Received 25 May 2007; accepted 28 August 2007; published online 18 September 2007)

Double ferroelectric hysteresis (*P*-*E*) loops are observed in aged BiFeO<sub>3</sub> multiferroic ceramic at room temperature and are explained according to an aging effect driven by charged defects with high activation energy. The aged BiFeO<sub>3</sub> shows *R*3*c* defect symmetry and allows a nonzero charged defect-induced polarization (*P*<sub>D</sub>) below the ferroelectric Curie temperature. This *P*<sub>D</sub> is strong enough to recover the switched 180° ferroelectric domains upon the removal of *E*, but it is rather weak to effectively switch back the 71°/109° ferroelectric domains. As a result, the traits of the double *P*-*E* loops weaken with increasing the maximum *E* from 121 to 167 kV/cm. © 2007 American Institute of Physics. [DOI: 10.1063/1.2786013]

Single-phase BiFeO<sub>3</sub> is a multiferroic ceramic famous for the presence of both ferroelectric order below a high Curie temperature ( $T_{C-FE}$ ) of ~830 °C and *G*-type canted antiferromagnetic order below a high Néel temperature ( $T_{N-AFM}$ ) of ~370 °C.<sup>1-4</sup> Like other multiferroic ceramics (e.g., TbMnO<sub>3</sub>, DyMnO<sub>3</sub>, Tb<sub>1-x</sub>Dy<sub>x</sub>MnO<sub>3</sub>, WMnO<sub>4</sub>, TbMn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>, and YMn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>),<sup>5-7</sup> the spiral spin order of BiFeO<sub>3</sub> may induce an additional (small) polarization, being sensitive to applied magnetic fields.

While there are many reports on the structural, dielectric, and ferroelectromagnetic properties of BiFeO<sub>3</sub> multiferroic ceramic in recent years,<sup>1–4</sup> few reports are made on the aging effect, particularly on the aging-induced double ferroelectric hysteresis effect. In ABO<sub>3</sub>-type ferroelectric ceramics, the observed double ferroelectric hysteresis (P-E) loops mainly result from antiferroelectric components, electric fieldinduced paraelectric-ferroelectric (PE-FE) phase transition near  $T_{C,\text{FE}}$ , and/or an aging effect far below  $T_{C,\text{FE}}$ . However, there is no direct indication (e.g., superhigh stress, supersmall crystal grain, excess doping, etc.) of the appearance of antiferroelectric components in BiFeO<sub>3</sub>.<sup>8</sup> Besides, the double P-E loops reported so far in BaTiO<sub>3</sub>- and (BiNa)TiO<sub>3</sub>-based ceramics are at temperatures near  $T_{C-FE}$ , <sup>9,10</sup> yet those found in aged doped BaTiO<sub>3</sub>/(BaSr)TiO<sub>3</sub> crystals or ceramics are far below  $T_{C-\text{FE}}$ .<sup>11–14</sup> These give essential evidences that aging may induce double P-E loops in BiFeO<sub>3</sub> at room temperature. In this letter, we explain the double P-E loops observed in the aged BiFeO<sub>3</sub> at room temperature according to a special aging effect adopted by Ren and co-workers.<sup>11–14</sup>

A rapid liquid-phase sintering technique was used to prepare single-phase BiFeO<sub>3</sub> ceramic.<sup>2,15</sup> High-purity Bi<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> and Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> powders of  $<1 \mu$ m size were mixed thoroughly and pressed uniaxially into disk samples with a diameter of 5 mm and a thickness of 1.2 mm. The samples were sintered at 855 °C for 20 min at high heating and cooling rates of 100 and 10 °C/s, respectively.

The crystal structure of the freshly sintered sample (denoted as "fresh sample") was examined by an x-ray diffractometer (Brucker D8 Advance System) with a  $2\theta$  step size of 0.02° and at a scan rate of one step/4 s. Simulation of crystal structure based on the measured x-ray diffraction (XRD) data was performed using a Rietveld crystal structure refinement software (FULLPROF 2000). The fresh sample was thinned down to 0.4 mm thick, and silver paste was applied on its two major surfaces as electrodes. The ferroelectric hysteresis (P-E) loops of the fresh sample were measured with a standard Sawyer-Tower circuit at 100 Hz. The electric field dependence of leakage current density (J-E) of the sample was evaluated using a multimeter (Keithley 2000) and a highvoltage amplifier (Trek P0621P). The relative dielectric constant ( $\varepsilon$ ) and loss tangent (tan  $\delta$ ) were determined from 100 Hz to 1 MHz by an impedance analyzer (Agilent 4294A) and from 0.01 Hz to 1 MHz by a broadband dielectric spectrometer (Novocontrol Concept80). The fresh sample was exposed to an environmental chamber for aging at 150 °C for 5 days, and the resulting sample is denoted as "aged sample." The above measurements were repeated for the aged sample.

Figure 1 shows the comparison between the measured and simulated XRD patterns of the fresh BiFeO<sub>3</sub> sample. The refined crystal parameters (i.e., a=b=c=0.3942 nm and  $\alpha$  $=\beta=\gamma=89.43^{\circ}$ ) coincide well with the previous reports about the existence of a rhombohedral structure with the *R3c* space group in single-phase bulk BiFeO<sub>3</sub> at room temperature.<sup>2,15</sup>

Figure 2 plots the measured ferroelectric hysteresis (P-E) loops of the fresh and aged BiFeO<sub>3</sub> samples at room temperature. The fresh sample shows single *P*-*E* loops at two different maximum electric fields  $(E_m)$  of 121 and 151 kV/cm [Fig. 2(a)]. These single *P*-*E* loops become

91, 122907-1

Downloaded 31 Mar 2011 to 158.132.161.52. Redistribution subject to AIP license or copyright; see http://apl.aip.org/about/rights\_and\_permissions

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a)</sup>Electronic mail: apswor@polyu.edu.hk

<sup>© 2007</sup> American Institute of Physics



FIG. 1. Comparison between the measured and simulated XRD patterns of the fresh  $BiFeO_3$  sample.

double *P*-*E* loops after the fresh sample is aged at  $150 \degree C$ for 5 days [Fig. 2(b)]. The arrow lines in Fig. 2(b) project the possible tracks of the single P-E loops based on the measured double P-E loops. The change from the single P-Eloops in the fresh sample to the double P-E loops in the aged sample should exclude the antiferroelectric components and the electric field-induced PE-FE phase transition near  $T_{C-FE}$ from the main cause since both samples should experience the same effect from them. Referring to Fig. 2(b), the difference in polarization between a measured double P-E loop and a projected single *P*-*E* loop is denoted as  $\Delta P$ . This  $\Delta P$ remains quite constant in the first-order approximation compared to the rapid increase in  $P_S$  with increasing  $E_m$ from 121 to 167 kV/cm. Accordingly, weakening of the traits of the double *P*-*E* loops (i.e.,  $\Delta P/P_S$ ) increases with increasing  $E_m$ .

Figure 3 shows the measured electric field dependence of leakage current density (*J*-*E*) and frequency dependence of relative dielectric constant ( $\varepsilon$ -*f*) and loss tangent (tan  $\delta$ -*f*) of the fresh and aged samples at room temperature. From Fig. 3(a), both samples have similarly low *J* of <35 mA/m<sup>2</sup>



FIG. 2. (Color online) Measured ferroelectric hysteresis (*P*-*E*) loops of the fresh and aged BiFeO<sub>3</sub> samples at room temperature. (a) Fresh sample with single *P*-*E* loops at the maximum electric fields ( $E_m$ ) of 121 and 151 kV/cm, and (b) aged sample with double *P*-*E* loops at  $E_m$  of 121, 131, 143, and 167 kV/cm.



FIG. 3. (Color online) (a) Measured electric field dependence of leakage current density (J-E) and (b) measured frequency dependence of relative dielectric constant  $(\varepsilon - f)$  and loss tangent  $(\tan \delta - f)$  of the fresh and aged BiFeO<sub>3</sub> samples at room temperature.

even though they are subject to an elevated E in excess of 140 kV/cm. This reasonably low J not only provides an important proof of the presence of charged defects with high activation energy (corresponding to those trapped in deep potential wells) in both samples but also is a precondition for observing true single and double P-E loops in our samples in Fig. 2 (to be discussed later).<sup>15</sup> In Fig. 3(b), the slight decrease in  $\varepsilon$  from 106 to 98 and the generally low tan  $\delta$  of <0.03 in the fresh sample imply a more significant contribution of electrons/domains than charged defects to the characteristics of  $\varepsilon$  and tan  $\delta$  in the higher f range of 100 Hz-1 MHz. The aged sample, which has relatively stable and smaller values of  $\varepsilon$  and tan  $\delta$ , demonstrates convergence trends toward 1 MHz with the fresh sample. This suggests a weaker contribution from charged defects in the aged sample for f > 100 Hz. An extrinsic factor for the general reduction in  $\varepsilon$  and tan  $\delta$  with decreasing f and in J with increasing E in the aged sample compared to the fresh sample is the reduced water vapor content after the 150 °C aging. An intrinsic factor comes from the different distributions of charged defects, i.e., a random distribution in the fresh sample and a special distribution with the R3c defect symmetry in the aged sample (to be discussed later).

The double *P*-*E* loops observed in Fig. 2 can be explained according to a special aging effect related to the defect symmetry defined as the conditional probability of finding  $O^{2-}$  vacancies at site *i* (*i*=1-6) of an *ABO*<sub>3</sub> single cell.<sup>11-14</sup> In this case, the amount of the induced charged defects with high activation energy should not be too low in order to produce a sufficiently large charged defect-induced polarization (*P*<sub>D</sub>).<sup>11-14</sup> This is why the double *P*-*E* loops are observable in our aged sample. Figure 4 depicts how the double *P*-*E* loops are produced in a single-crystal grain of the aged BiFeO<sub>3</sub> sample.<sup>11,14</sup> Some associated remarks are included as follows.

(1) When the BiFeO<sub>3</sub> fresh sample is just sintered and its temperature (*T*) is still above  $T_{C-FE}$ , its single-crystal grain exhibits an m3m crystal symmetry and an m3m

Downloaded 31 Mar 2011 to 158.132.161.52. Redistribution subject to AIP license or copyright; see http://apl.aip.org/about/rights\_and\_permissions



FIG. 4. Crystal symmetry and defect symmetry of a single-crystal grain in (a) a fresh BiFeO<sub>3</sub> sample at  $T > T_{C-FE}$ , (b) the fresh sample at  $T < T_{C-FE}$ , and (c) the aged sample at room temperature. (d), (e), and (f) show the electric field (*E*)-induced switching of the 180°, 71°, and 109° ferroelectric domains, respectively, in the aged sample at room temperature.

defect symmetry, giving rise to zero  $P_S$  and  $P_D$  [Fig. 4(a)].

- (2) At  $T < T_{C\text{-FE}}$ , the PE-FE phase transition leads to a rhombohedral R3c crystal symmetry, producing a nonzero  $P_S$  (i.e.,  $P_S > 0$ ) [Fig. 4(b)]. However, there does not appear to be any change in the m3m defect symmetry due to the slower defect diffusion in comparison with the PE-FE phase transition. In general, a pyrostrain is induced from the difference between the R3c crystal symmetry and the m3m defect symmetry.
- (3) When the fresh sample is being aged at 150 °C for 5 days, diffusion of the available charged defects, especially for the  $O^{2-}$  vacancies with the smallest effective mass and ion radius, occurs with the help of both the difference in symmetry and the induced pyrostrain as mentioned in (2). At an equilibrium state, the positively charged centers of Bi<sup>3+</sup> vacancies and Fe<sup>2+</sup> ions separate from the negatively charged center of  $O^{2-}$  vacancies, leading to a *R*3*c* defect symmetry and a nonzero *P*<sub>D</sub> [Fig. 4(c)]. Since this *R*3*c* defect symmetry is the same as the rhombohedral *R*3*c* crystal symmetry, the resulting *P*<sub>D</sub> is along the direction of *P*<sub>S</sub> in the single-crystal grain.<sup>11-14</sup>
- (4) By applying an electric field (E) with the maximum amplitude (E<sub>m</sub>) of 121-167 kV/cm and of a frequency ≥100 Hz parallel and opposite to the direction of P<sub>S</sub> and P<sub>D</sub> as in Fig. 4(c), it can induce an effective switching of the available 180° ferroelectric domains with small coercivity (E<sub>C-80</sub>) so that a 180° reversal of P<sub>S</sub> with respect to P<sub>D</sub> occurs [Fig. 4(d)]. As the diffusion of the charged defects is minimal, both the R3c defect symmetry and P<sub>D</sub> are preserved. Upon the removal of E, the status of Fig. 4(c) is recovered by a restoring E of P<sub>D</sub>, being larger than 2E<sub>C-180</sub> (i.e., twice the coercivity of the 180° ferroelectric domains). This 180° ferroelectric domain switching contributes to a constant ΔP and hence to the double P-E loops, as seen in Fig. 2(b).

(5) Under such an applied E, and if the diffusion of the

charged defects is still minimal, the 71°/109° ferroelectric domain switching can induce an electrostrain because of the difference in azimuth angle between the R3c crystal symmetry and the R3c defect symmetry [Figs. 4(e) and 4(f)].<sup>11,14</sup> Similarly, the status of Fig. 4(c) can be recovered after removing E, provided that the restoring E of  $P_D$  is larger than  $2E_{C-71/109}$  (i.e., twice the coercivity of the 71°/109° ferroelectric domains). The switching of the 71°/109° ferroelectric domains results in the double P-E loops and a large recoverable electrostrain.<sup>12</sup> In our aged sample, however, the restoring E of  $P_D$  may be smaller than  $2E_{C-71/109}$  in the firstorder approximation. This implies that a reverse switching of the  $71^{\circ}/109^{\circ}$  ferroelectric domains from Figs. 4(e) or 4(f) and 4(c) may be difficult, and the switching of the 71°/109° ferroelectric domains mainly benefits  $P_s$ rather than  $\Delta P$  for  $E_m$  varying from 121 to 167 kV/cm, as evidenced in Fig. 2(b).

It is noted that the corresponding pinned defects of  $ABO_3$ -type ferroelectric ceramics can be unpinned by a high-temperature annealing, a large dc field, or a low-frequency ac field. Thus, the use of a higher-frequency ac field and a relatively low  $E_m$  is favorable to nondestructively measure the double P-E loops.

In conclusion, double *P*-*E* loops have been observed in the aged single-phase BiFeO<sub>3</sub> multiferroic ceramic at room temperature. Charged defects with high activation energy form *R*3*c* defect symmetry, besides producing a nonzero *P*<sub>D</sub>, in the aged sample below *T*<sub>C-FE</sub>. The restoring *E* of *P*<sub>D</sub>, which is larger than  $2E_{C-180}$ , is strong enough to restore the initially switched 180° ferroelectric domains upon the removal of the applied *E*. However, it is rather weak to effectively recover the switched 71°/109° ferroelectric domains. Therefore, weakening of the traits of the double *P*-*E* loops increases with increasing *E*<sub>m</sub> from 121 to 167 kV/cm.

This work was supported by the Innovation and Technology Fund of the HKSAR Government (GHP/003/06), Alexander von Humboldt Foundation, and National Natural Science Foundation of China (50572038). Technical advice from Dr. Shantao Zhang is also acknowledged.

- <sup>1</sup>M. Fiebig, J. Phys. D **38**, R123 (2005).
- <sup>2</sup>G. L. Yuan, S. W. Or, J. M. Liu, and Z. G. Liu, Appl. Phys. Lett. **89**, 052905 (2006).
- <sup>3</sup>B. Ruette, S. Zvyagin, A. P. Pyatakov, A. Bush, J. F. Li, V. I. Belotelov, A.
- K. Zvezdin, and D. Viehland, Phys. Rev. B 69, 064114 (2004).
- <sup>4</sup>T. Zhao, A. Scholl, F. Zavaliche, K. Lee, M. Barry, A. Doran, M. P. Cruz,
- Y. H. Chu, C. Ederer, N. A. Spaldin, R. R. Das, D. M. Kim, S. H. Baek, C.
- B. Eom, and R. Ramesh, Nat. Mater. 5, 823 (2006).
- $^5$ K. Taniguchi, N. Abe, T. Takenobu, Y. Iwasa, and T. Arima, Phys. Rev. Lett. **97**, 097203 (2006).
- <sup>6</sup>M. Mostovoy, Phys. Rev. Lett. **96**, 067601 (2006).
- <sup>7</sup>S. W. Cheong and M. Mostovoy, Nat. Mater. **6**, 13 (2007).
- <sup>8</sup>D. H. Kim, H. N. Lee, M. Varela, and H. M. Christen, Appl. Phys. Lett. **89**, 162904 (2006).
- <sup>9</sup>N. Srivastava and G. J. Weng, J. Appl. Phys. **99**, 054103 (2006).
- <sup>10</sup>T. Oh, Jpn. J. Appl. Phys., Part 1 **45**, 5138 (2006).
- <sup>11</sup>L. X. Zhang, W. Chen, and X. B. Ren, Appl. Phys. Lett. 85, 5658 (2004).
- <sup>12</sup>D. Sun, X. B. Ren, and K. Otsuka, Appl. Phys. Lett. 87, 142903 (2005).
- <sup>13</sup>W. F. Liu, W. Chen, L. Yang, L. X. Zhang, Y. Wang, C. Zhou, S. T. Li, and
- X. B. Ren, Appl. Phys. Lett. 89, 172908 (2006).
- <sup>14</sup>L. X. Zhang and X. B. Ren, Phys. Rev. B **73**, 094121 (2006).
  <sup>15</sup>G. L. Yuan and S. W. Or, Appl. Phys. Lett. **88**, 062905 (2006).

Downloaded 31 Mar 2011 to 158.132.161.52. Redistribution subject to AIP license or copyright; see http://apl.aip.org/about/rights\_and\_permissions