

Abstract

A superficial line of demarcation exists in the public's understanding of individuals commodified for men's sexual pleasure. Some participants in these practices are labelled as "trafficked" victims while a second group are considered prostituted individuals, pornographic actresses, strippers, web cam performers or adult escorts. The former are most often viewed as being forcibly exploited, while the latter may be perceived as volunteers exercising free agency in their actions. In this study, those distinctions are diminished in favor of research indicating how profound harm is rendered to women who are subjected to these practices. I endorse the perspective that assistance should always be offered to those wishing to abandon these deviant practices. The lives and narratives of North American women who have survived commercial sexual exploitation (CSE) and then completed Christocentric rehabilitation programs will be considered here to discover the obstacles impeding them as they reintegrate into community life after program completion. This is a qualitative research project grounded in holistic evangelism and discipleship studies. Administrators from eleven agencies employing Christian approaches to rehabilitation were interviewed regarding their practices and observations. Seventeen women who have been CSE in various regions of the U.S. and have subsequently completed rehabilitational care programs within these agencies were each interviewed twice (one questionnaire, one face-to-face interview) to determine the chief impediments they have faced in their efforts to flourish in communities they choose to reside in. Their remarks were transcribed, assessed, and criteria was evaluated in eighteen areas to determine flourishing propensities in their rehabilitated lives (high, moderately high, medium, low, poor). The principal obstacles to flourishing are identified, as well as the assets that enabled high- to medium flourishers to overcome obstacles. The propriety and strength of the networks they established after rehabilitation proved critical to their flourishing in addition to personal faith, new routines, vocational

engagement, and willingness to receive ongoing treatment for mental health concerns. Select respondents were not wholly successful at overcoming historic deficits that seemed to interfere with current predicaments, and psycho-spiritual conditioning from past experiences appeared to factor critically in the establishment of new habits and thinking patterns. The role of the residual effects of sin acquired by this community is considered in the analysis of their obstacles, using the concept of *han* as conceptualized by theologian Andrew Sung Park. Transformational Development principles endorsed by development practitioner and theologian Bryant Myers are likewise applied to determine the adverse effects defective community relations have upon marginalized peoples, and how redemptive social- and spiritual relationships can enhance their abilities to flourish.

**Imago Dei Interrupted:
Christocentric Measures to Reintegrate American Women into New Communities
After Having Survived Commercial Sexual Exploitation**

A Dissertation

Presented to the Faculty of the E. Stanley Jones

School of World Mission and Evangelism

Asbury Theological Seminary

Wilmore, Kentucky

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree

Doctor of Philosophy in Intercultural Studies

Dissertation Committee:

Mentor: Dr. W. Jay Moon,

Reader: Dr. Stephen W. Offutt

Examiner: Dr. A. Sue Russell

By

Timothy P. Robbins

March 2022

Copyright by Timothy P. Robbins

March 2022

Copyright 2022
Timothy Peter Robbins
All rights reserved

Table of Contents

<u>Chapter 1: Introducing the Story</u>	1
<u>1-1 Mona’s Story</u>	1
<u>1-2 Statement of the Problem</u>	2
<u>1-3 Current Cultural Environment</u>	2
<u>1-4 Motivation for the Study</u>	3
<u>1-5 North American Context of the Study</u>	5
<u>1-6 Research Questions</u>	9
<u>1-7 Significance of the Study</u>	10
<u>1-8 Theoretical Framework</u>	11
<u>1-8 a. Three Primary Sources</u>	11
<u>1-8 b. Intersection of the Sources</u>	16
<u>Chapter 2: Organizing the Story</u>	24
<u>2-1 Overview</u>	24
<u>2-2 Delimitations</u>	25
<u>2-3 Limitations</u>	27
<u>2-4 Definitions</u>	29
<u>2-5 Institutional Approval</u>	34
<u>2-6 Biases</u>	36
<u>2-7 Data Collection and Interview Transcriptions</u>	41
<u>2-7 a. Grounded Theory</u>	41
<u>2-7 b. Interpreting the Data</u>	44
<u>2-7 c. Coding the Data</u>	46
<u>2-7 d. Analyzing the Language: Discourse Analysis</u>	49
<u>2-7 e. Flourishing Indices</u>	54
<u>2-7 e-i. Developmental Flourishing Index</u>	55
<u>2-7 e-ii Spiritual Flourishing Index</u>	56
<u>2-7 e-iii. Scoring the Indices</u>	60
<u>Chapter 3: What Story? A Review of the Literature</u>	65
<u>3-1 Faith-based Approaches to Rescue, Rehabilitations and Reintegration</u>	66
<u>3-1a Ethics and Agency</u>	66
<u>3-1b Endemic Violence</u>	67
<u>3-1c Disparate Views</u>	70
<u>3-2 Survivors’ Perspectives</u>	71
<u>3-2 a. Narratives from Former CSE Women and Their Caregivers</u>	71

3-2 b. Survivors' States of Mind	74
3-2 c. Navigating Stigmatization	77
3-3 Barriers to Overcome as Identified by Women Who are CSE	78
3-3 a. Psychological, Trauma and Mental Health	79
3-3 b. Physical Health.....	80
3-3 c. Financial Adjustments	82
3-3 d. Social adjustments	84
3-3 e. Legal Complexities	85
3-3 f. Religio-Spiritual Factors	87
3-4 Reintegration Perspectives.....	88
3-4 a. A Paucity of Literature	88
3-4 b. Parallels to Other Populations	90
3-5 Evangelism and Discipleship as Desirable Responses for CSE women	91
3-5 a. Definitions and Context	91
3-5 b. Discipleship and Evangelism are Contextual	93
3-5 c. Relevant History	95
3-5 d. Effects of Flourishing Considered	96
3-5 e. Appropriate Outreach for CSE Women in Their New Communities.....	98
3-6 The Nature of Christian Community.....	100
3-6 a. Community is Needed for Confessing Women after Emancipation	101
3-6 b. One-Anothering	104
3-6 c. Affirmative Community Needed for all CSE Women	105
3-7 Summary.....	111
Chapter 4: Facilitating the Story's Outcome: Administrative Interviews	113
4-1 The Programs.....	113
4-1 a. Criteria for Program Administrators	113
4-1 b. Differences Among Organizations	115
4-1 c. Program Enrollment vs. Program Completion	116
4-2 The Interviews	117
4-3 Summary of Insights and Remarks	119
4-3 a. Obstacles to Flourishing.....	119
4-3 a-i. Engaging in Unhealthy Relationships.....	120
4-3a-ii. Poor ingrained Spending Habits	123
4-3a-iii. Workplace Inexperience	124
4-3a-iv. Evading Healthy Supports.....	125

4-3 a-v. Interfering History.....	126
4-3a-vi. Social Media Use and Approval Seeking.....	128
4-3 a-vii. Failure to Embrace Spiritual Transformation and Forgiveness.....	128
4-3 b. Assets Optimizing Flourishing.....	130
4-3 b-i. Vocational Stability.....	131
4-3 b-ii. Emotional Well-Being and Sobriety.....	134
4-3 b-iii. The Presence of Affirmative Community.....	134
4-3 b- iv. The Spiritual Component.....	139
<u>Chapter 5: Data from the Respondents: Obstacles Identified.....</u>	145
5-1 Analytical Foundation.....	145
5-1 a. Demographics.....	145
5-1 b. Referral Biases.....	146
5-1 c. Christian Faith Focus.....	148
5-2 Interviewing Methodology.....	149
5-3 Coding the Data.....	154
5-4 Flourishing Indices.....	155
5-5 Voices of the Respondents: Obstacles Identified.....	157
5-5 a. Loneliness.....	159
5-5 b. Consumerism.....	161
5-5 c. Restlessness/Boredom.....	163
5-5 d. Sex Addiction.....	165
5-5 e. Ghetto Side.....	168
5-5 f. Interfering History.....	171
5-5 g. Self-Sabotage.....	174
5-5 h. Life Skills.....	177
5-5 i. Substance Abuse.....	180
5-5 j. Mental Health.....	183
5-5 k. Employment Concerns.....	187
5-5 l. Family Issues.....	194
5-5 l-i. Parents and Other Adults.....	195
5-5 l-ii. Complications Involving Children.....	196
5-5 m. Inadequate Network.....	200
<u>Chapter 6: Voices of the Respondents: Assets Promoting Flourishing.....</u>	205
6-1 Categories of Assets Accommodating Reintegration.....	205
6-2 Analysis of Assets.....	206

<u>6-1 a. My Sobriety</u>	206
<u>6-1 b. Ongoing Counseling</u>	207
<u>6-1 c. Boundaries Honored</u>	209
<u>6-1 d. Giving Back</u>	212
<u>6-1 e. Active Dreams and Aspirations</u>	215
<u>6-1 f. Vocational Progress</u>	218
<u>6-1 f-i. Paid Internships</u>	218
<u>6-1 f-ii. Fulfilling Jobs</u>	219
<u>6-1 f-iii. Domestic Flexibility</u>	221
<u>6-1 g. Spiritual Engagement</u>	221
<u>6-1 h. Agencies Assisted</u>	224
<u>6-1 h-i. Pregnancy/Infant Resources</u>	224
<u>6-1 h-ii. Housing Assistance</u>	225
<u>6-1 h-iii. Employment Assistance</u>	226
<u>6-1 h-iv. Counseling Assistance</u>	226
<u>6-1 h-v. Food and Medical</u>	227
<u>6-1 i. Community Supports</u>	228
<u>6-1 i-i. Program People</u>	229
<u>6-1 i-ii Church People</u>	230
<u>6-1 i-iii. Family Support</u>	232
<u>6-1 i-iv. Healthy Friends</u>	233
<u>6-1 j. Transformed Identity</u>	236
<u>Chapter 7: Ending the Story Well</u>	243
<u>7-1 Overview: Recognizing Poor Networks and a Tarnished Imago Dei</u>	243
<u>7-1 a. Obstacles and Assets Summarized</u>	243
<u>7-1 b. CSE Women and Spirituality</u>	244
<u>7-2 Theoretical Framework Revisited</u>	247
<u>7-3 Contributions to Missiology</u>	251
<u>7-3 a. Community Support is Integral to Flourishing</u>	251
<u>7-3 a-i. Exploitative Networks Beckon</u>	251
<u>7-3 a-ii. Low Flourishers: The Company they Keep</u>	254
<u>7-3 b. The Significance of Spiritual Engagement in Maintaining a Life of Flourishing</u>	257
<u>7-3 c. The Significance of Metrics in Addressing Flourishing Levels</u>	261
<u>7-3 c-i. Developmental and Spiritual Flourishing Indices</u>	261
<u>7-3 c-ii. Correlation Between Developmental Index and Spiritual Index</u>	264

7-3 d. Addressing Han Issues to Enable Healing and Flourishing.....	266
7-4 Practical Applications.....	272
7-4 a. The Mandate of Horizontal Faith (Redemptive Communities).....	272
7-4 b. Addressing Han Issues Within Christian Communities	276
7-5 For Further Consideration	282
7-5 a. The components constituting spiritual transformation for CSE women	282
7-5 b. How manifestations of <i>han</i> in CSE women compare to those of other marginalized populations	282
7-5 c. Principles Christocentric rehabilitational programs employ that could be adaptable to secular organizations to improve flourishing	282
7-5 d. Steps Christocentric rehabilitational facilities can take to improve and better monitor aftercare for graduates of their Programs.....	282
7-5 e. Efforts churches are making to provide intentional community focused upon women who abandon CSE networks	283
7-5 f. Exploring the relationship between the identities of respondents, how they are perceived in their new communities, and the new roles they	284

Charts

Chart 2-0: Respondent Demographics.....	26
Chart 2-1: Spiritual Flourishing Index Scores	62
Chart 2-2: Developmental Flourishing Index Scores.....	63
Chart 4-1: Program Policies and Estimated Statistics	116
Chart 5-1: Coding	155
Chart 5-2: Composite Scores of Flourishing Indices.	156

Appendices

Appendix 2-1: Explanation Letter and Consent to Participate- Administrators	285
Appendix 2-2: Explanation Letter and Consent to Participate- Respondents	287
Appendix 2-3: Guiding Questions for Interviews with Administrators and Caregivers	290
Appendix 2-4: Written/Dictated Questionnaire for Respondents and Approved Questions for Face-to-Face Interviews.....	291
Appendix 2-5: Developmental Index for Flourishing	293
Appendix 2-6: Spiritual Index for Flourishing.....	303
Appendix 3-1: Biblical Basis for Rescuing.....	311
Appendix 3-2: Disparate Views Regarding Rescue and Emancipation	314
Appendix 3-3: Religious and Spiritual Barriers to Flourishing for Traumatized Populations..	320

<u>Appendix 3-4: CSE Women Rehabilitated in Christocentric Aftercare Compared to Other Groups</u>	324
<u>Appendix 4-1: Summaries of the Administrators’ Responses: Obstacles and Assets to Flourishing Noted Among CSE Clients</u>	335
<u>Appendix 5-1: Organization of Codes</u>	348
<u>Appendix 5-2: Exemplary Codes- Obstacles to Flourishing as Articulated by Respondents</u> ..	354
<u>Appendix 5-3: Infrequently Mentioned Obstacles to Flourishing</u>	357
<u>Appendix 5-4: Brief Snapshots of the Respondents</u>	360
<u>Appendix 6-1: Exemplary Codes- Assets for Flourishing</u>	370
 Bibliography.....	 374

Dedication

I have been privileged to know many strong and exemplary women over the years—ministering with some, studying with others, serving as a therapist with still others and being gratefully employed by several. I have worked in professions dominated by women, as a middle-school teacher, therapist and children’s pastor. But of all the influential women I have known, three of them were particularly helpful during the time I researched and wrote this dissertation and I would like to dedicate this to them.

First of all, to Brenda who didn’t merely enable me to finish this project, but who encouraged and facilitated me for over thirty years to accomplish what I felt Christ had called me to do. Those endeavors never resulted in much fortune or fame, but she didn’t complain as we maintained a lifestyle of biblical simplicity. For that I am emphatically grateful, and I hope our simplicity won’t need to be quite so pronounced as this phase of our lives concludes.

The second of these is Deanna, to whom I came as a stranger but she offered her considerable knowledge and abilities to me in Christian charity. She helped secure many of my interviews, making phone calls and running interference when she had nothing personal to gain from her efforts. Her only motivation seemed to be that my research would be completed and that it would enable other women like those graduating from the Programs mentioned here to become emancipated from commercial sexual exploitation. I am betting on her good judgment, believing that this research will lead to just such an outcome either directly or indirectly.

Lastly, I dedicate this to Beverly, without whom it would have been impossible to complete this project. Although I had known her for several months before we embarked on our interviewing journey, I made one of the most audacious requests possible early in our acquaintanceship, trusting that the Lord had brought our paths together for such a time as this. My request was that she would monitor and interview up to two dozen CSE women with me, travelling to several states to do this for little or no compensation. I felt I was one of the country’s most fortunate men when she agreed, and true to my word, I was not able to compensate her! Not only did she absorb some of the costs of travel herself, but she performed exemplary work, bringing insights and expertise from her years of practice as a psychologist. Her presence greatly enriched the research process as well as the women with whom we spoke, and me personally. When she revealed before we were halfway through that she was planning to be married before the scheduled interviews concluded I was elated for her and for Ken, but extremely concerned for my project! True to *her* word, though, she didn’t miss a beat, honeymooning during an off-weekend and then returning for the remaining interviews as if her volunteer commitment was a top priority. I cannot thank her enough, in addition to Deanna and Brenda, so I will simply continue to trust that our Father in heaven passes on ample rewards to them all.

Acknowledgements

It is not always easy to make major changes late in life. That is nevertheless what I felt compelled to do and it is fortuitous that many encouragers went along for the ride. I have made poor decisions in life and some good ones as well. Among the very best of them, though, was to pursue a terminal degree at Asbury Seminary. Both the school itself and the insights I carried away surpassed my expectations. For the administration who guided me, for the wonderful faculty and the students who connected with me I am exceedingly grateful.

Double honor is due Dr. W. Jay Moon. He was with me on the journey from the first week of my studies to the last paragraph written for this project. I suspect he will still be there for me after I move on to teach and publish full-time. He has been a mentor and much more, investing hours when he could have been chilling in a cabin at the Red River Gorge. He taught me, directed me and advocated for me.

Dr. Steve Offutt has been a great inspiration and an additional role model for me. He coached me in obtaining a working knowledge of Development Studies and he has set a high mark both for scholarship and for character which I would do well to emulate. My deans, Dr. Greg Okesson and Dr. Kima Pachuau, could have hardly done finer work in the administration of their responsibilities and in encouraging and guiding me. Patti Walker in the ARP office has been similarly amazing. Dr. Sue Russell is one of the best scholars I will ever know; She provided me with early encouragement in the pursuit of my project, though she hasn't gotten to read a word of it yet as of this writing. Dr. Steve Ybarrola gave me insights into Cultural Anthropology that I had not previously considered; But I will remember him even more for his humor and congeniality. Dr. George Hunter III is a true pioneer in the field of evangelism studies and a great communicator who took time for me whenever I needed it; He is also a fine Mentalist. Finally, Dr. Art McPhee grounded me in my studies and illuminated profound insights to me during my time here. He was the first faculty member I met at Asbury, and he may have had serious doubts about me during my initial year of studies! Today, though, I am blessed to call both him and his wonderful wife Evie friends, allies and examples of what it means to be faithful followers of Christ.

My family have been along for the journey as well. It was heartbreaking to leave my oldest behind when I journeyed into deepest, darkest Kentucky, but I am so happy to have her now living only two hours away. My son has been invaluable in his assistance with charts and all things PowerPoint, and I am elated with the academic progress he is currently making. I didn't meet my goal of completing studies before my middle daughter graduated from high school, but at least I am able to do so before she finishes college— alas, only by a month. We are thrilled for her academic excellence, and for her upcoming marriage to a fine young man later this year. My youngest daughter has been a champion, a creative force and a great joy on our sojourn, and part of me still wishes she hadn't grown so much during the Asbury years that we had to discontinue our nightly story hour and all those games with the stuffed animals.

Carl Lammers and Knox Fellowship will always be appreciated for their role in shaping me to be a better teacher of evangelism. Amanda Allen has been invaluable in her bibliographical and technical assistance and in co-leading our ICS cohort. Many other students have been helpful over the years, but I remember with particular fondness the writing and study sessions with Yakubu Jakada, Samuel Odubena, Sam Lee, Shivraj

Mahendra, Susangeline Patrick, my co-teacher and fellow traveler Irene Kabete and the enduring academic friendship of Isaac Watson. Finally, I was privileged to labor at “The Best Christian Workplace in Lexington” during my research years, and I could not have completed the work without their graciousness, enthusiasm and flexibility. Laura Carr has been a leader among leaders not only at the Lexington Rescue Mission, but also in the greater Lexington area. Julius Johnson merits special recognition for his leadership skills, his humility, forbearance, and his personal encouragement to me as I finished my seminary work. We are privileged to have a great re-entry team at the LRM where mutual edification is the rule, not the exception.

For the respondents and the administrators of rehabilitational facilities who gave their time to help me learn from their struggles and victories and who enabled me to understand their unique phenomena—kudos! As Paul said in Philippians 1:3 “I thank my God every time I remember you.”

Timothy P. Robbins

23 February 2022

Chapter 1: Introducing the Story

1-1 Mona's Story

On the day I interviewed Mona in August of 2019 she was no longer involved with any church or faith-based group. She was working as a civil servant several miles from the rehabilitative facility where our interview was held. She had endured a harrowing childhood in the household of a crack-addicted mother. For several years she had been placed in the care of her grandmother, who had taken her to church. “Like all older black people do?”, she confided. “They go to church on Sunday... But that’s a social gathering place, you know.” Although she reported having embraced the church enthusiastically, her experiences became much darker as she approached her teenage years. Several men in the church began to comment on the voluptuous figure she was developing—and their improprieties didn’t end with the remarks. She described to me how when she was twelve or thirteen, a much older man

...kind of selected me only. And it was another thing where I kinda just go... It was another one of those situations where I would try to scoot over, I would try to walk away. Try to do whatever. And then after a while I try to just take it so I can go back to everybody else, you know?

At the time of our interview, she had been free from commercial sexual exploitation for about four years, and she no longer abused narcotics. She had made a decision to cohabit with a boyfriend which she considered to be a compromise, yet she couldn’t fathom how she might afford a suitable apartment in a large metroplex on her salary alone. She lamented that although a good deal of hardship and degradation had transpired in her past life, it was also difficult adjusting to the meager wages and relative monotony she now encountered as a payroll specialist. “...because I’ve always been a very money driven person,” she explained.

Growing up poor, I always said “When I’m an adult and I can control my own money I’ll never be broke again.” So

that's something that's always stayed with me and driven me upon these different paths. And so I feel like my anxiety and my overall peace would be a lot better if I could just have more self-control when it comes to money. You know I never want to be homeless again, so I always make sure my bills are paid, but... after I pay my bills, with whatever little money I have left, it's like, "Fill me up with something."

1-2 Statement of the Problem

I am studying North American women who have survived commercial sexual exploitation and then completed Christocentric rehabilitation programs to discover the obstacles that impede them as they reintegrate into community life. I am doing this to contribute to our understanding of a unique phenomenon occurring within a specific demographic. My desire is to help other institutions and researchers to comprehend the barriers faced by women who have emerged from commercial sexual exploitation and then completed Christocentric rehabilitation programs before branching into independent living. It would be an added benefit if organizations would consider the results of this research to make adjustments in their own programs.

1-3 Current Cultural Environment

At the time of this writing, the realities of sexual harassment and abuse have finally begun to creep into the headlines in the North American press. Hollywood moguls, actors, comedians, talk show hosts, physicians, and politicians are being routed from their positions of prominence due to public revelations about their treatment of women.¹ Yet in the "industry" in which Mona spent many of her teenage and young adult

¹ After the prominent Hollywood producer Harvey Weinstein was confronted with numerous allegations of improprieties including rape, it was like a dam had broken, as women and a few men became emboldened to report criminal sexual behavior that had been perpetrated upon them by powerful men. In the case of Judge Brett Kavanaugh and Senator Al Franken and others, the accusations crossed party lines. While Kavanaugh's accuser focused upon a single uncorroborated incident concerning an allegedly drunken teenage incident which couldn't be proven, others resulted in real consequences. Democrat Senator Al Franken was forced out of the Senate by his own party in 2017, Republican Judge Roy Moore simply failed to beat his opponent in the Alabama Senatorial election in that same year. Glamour, "Post-Weinstein, These Are the Powerful Men Facing Sexual Harassment Allegations," *Glamour*, May 18, 2019, <https://www.glamour.com/gallery/post-weinstein-these-are-the-powerful-men-facing-sexual-harassment->

years there will be no prosecutions, no disciplinary action, no supportive #MeToo movements advocating on her behalf.² The same behaviors being resisted in other segments of society are not only tolerated among trafficked women in the U.S., but are approached with collective yawns.

1-4 Motivation for the Study

I am sometimes asked if there is a personal factor motivating me to undertake research of this nature. A brief and uncomplicated answer would be “no”. No known member of my family was ever commercially sexually exploited, nor did I experience any unusual trauma in my childhood. Perhaps my inquirers are most perplexed about why a male would be pursuing this research. *Is it simply a chivalrous impulse?*

This writer is a student of evangelism and discipleship. As a layman and a professional serving numerous churches over a period of several decades, I have encountered numerous theories about how God’s spirit is transmitted and about how people are recruited for ministerial purposes. One of the schools of thought I encountered is that *everything is personal*. An entire class in my first seminary track was predicated upon the idea that all the major events in one’s life prepares one for ministry. If you were raised Mormon, you were called to reach Mormons. If you or your parents

allegations; “Larry Nassar Case: The 156 Women Who Confronted a Predator,” *BBC News*, January 25, 2018, Online edition, sec. US & Canada, <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-42725339>; Laurel Wamsley, “Doctor, Girlfriend Charged With Drugging, Raping Women; Hundreds of Victims Possible,” *NPR*, September 19, 2018, Online edition, sec. National, <https://www.npr.org/2018/09/19/649529045/doctor-girlfriend-accused-of-drugging-and-raping-2-women-and-maybe-many-more>; “Kavanaugh Trump Republican Sexual Abuse,” *New York Times*, September 18, 2018, Online edition, sec. Opinion Editorial, <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/09/18/opinion/editorials/kavanaugh-trump-republican-sexual-abuse.html?auth=linked-google>.

² Tarana Burke was credited with starting this movement after hearing too many stories of sexual harassment and abuse that had not only gone unpunished, but completely ignored by both the press and by the industries associated with the accused sexual harassers. According to this article, actress Alyssa Milano promoted the hashtag #metoo, which hundreds of thousands of women utilized to express the sentiment that this phenomenon had also affected them. “MeToo Movement Tarana Burke,” *New York Times*, October 20, 2017, Online edition, sec. U.S., <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/10/20/us/me-too-movement-tarana-burke.html?module=inline>.

had been alcoholics, then it was clear whom you had been “called” to reach. However, I never adopted that perspective, to the disappointment of at least one instructor and several of my colleagues who insisted they were “spirit-led.” But my friends from substance-abuse backgrounds must have been relieved to discover they didn’t *have* to accept that particular perspective, since close proximity to other addicts often caused them to relapse.

As a mental health therapist, I heard scores of additional stories from American women that had previously gone unheralded. Many of these young women described to me how they had been conditioned for abuse since early childhood. They spoke of responding to these abuses later in life by engaging in unrestrained promiscuity, feeling they were fulfilling their duties as women. Sometimes they had gone on to support themselves via prostitution. Later in their lives they discovered they were not able to circumvent the degradation and the labels affixed to them through no faults of their own.³ Based upon our conversations, I believe that many of these women didn’t feel they had the moral authority or resolve to confidently pursue lives of exemplary conduct. Often, their experiences caused them to perceive they had morally compromised themselves, regardless of whether this was accurate. Individuals who see themselves as abject failures before they have even reached voting age face an uphill battle ontologically at the moment they should be pondering their moral- and vocational futures. Not only had their bodies been used in humiliating ways but their souls had likewise become disfigured. In the most severe cases, the Image of God had all but been extinguished from their lives.⁴

³ Dan B. Allender, *The Wounded Heart: Hope for Adult Victims of Childhood Sexual Abuse*, vol. Revised edition (Colorado Springs, CO: NavPress Publishing Group, 2008); Judith Herman, *Trauma and Recovery: The Aftermath of Violence—from Domestic Abuse to Political Terror* (New York, NY: Basic Books, 2015); June Price Tangney and Ronda L. Dearing, *Shame and Guilt* (New York: Guilford Press, 2002).

⁴ Carrie Doehring, *Internal Desecration: Traumatization and Representations of God* (Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 1993); Lisa Rudolfsson and Inga Tidefors, “I Have Cried to Him a

If there is any genuine personal connection to this project, it's based on my historic desire to see both justice and mercy extended to this community. I recall observing a stunning girl in my high school arriving to school daily with bruised arms and a hollowed out facial expression and I possessed no insights into what afflicted her. It's because a man in my church with whom I broke bread assaulted his teenage daughter inexplicably one day, and I watched her ascend into a life of promiscuity over the next two years. And because as an adult I met women who joked about being little more than objects of pleasure for an array of men, who treated them accordingly. In my worldview, women such as these need the love of Christ, and a fighting chance at life. They require the justice and restoration He provides. In my thinking it is fortuitous that some of these had turned to redemption in Christ before their ordeals began, and others did so along the way. Notwithstanding, I will never know how many became casualties midway through their journeys— rejected by a world that didn't seem to favor them or disenchanted by a God who didn't appear to hear their cries when they were being violated.

1-5 North America Context of the Study

This writer has both an academic and practical background in evangelism/discipleship studies. I have noted how in recent years North Americans have struggled with the ability to cultivate committed disciples of the Christian faith.⁵ The concept of discipleship-- how people become disciples of Christ-- may seem less foreign to those who emerge from communally-based cultures while societies founded upon individual liberties, such as those in the U.S.A., have struggled with this.⁶ American

Thousand Times, but It Makes No Difference: Sexual Abuse, Faith, and Images of God.," *Mental Health, Religion & Culture* 17, no. 9 (November 2014): 910–22, <https://doi.org/10.1080/13674676.2014.950953>.

⁵ A lively discussion on the reluctance of American churches to address these issues can be found on pp 165-176. Alan Wolfe, *The Transformation of American Religion: How We Actually Live Our Faith* (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2003).

⁶ In *The Missional Church*, Craig Van Gelder traces the social movements here that contributed to the USA's attitudes concerning autonomy and radical individualism. Darrell L. Guder and Lois Barrett,

culture enables individuals to relegate all their activities to the private sphere, and this includes church life.⁷ These attitudes often hamper church attendance and full participation. William Abraham, a practical theologian in the field of evangelism, notes that contemporary churches often neglect the discipleship of the congregation in favor of pragmatic concerns. When this happens, the pastors end up overseeing churches full of half-evangelized people.⁸ Rather than evolving into congregations of committed believers, he notes, they are taught by example to become merely a communities of assenters, which is helpful to no one, as he concedes.⁹

Those who adhere to New Testament authority believe that pursuing Christ is the key to flourishing.¹⁰ A strong case can be made that evangelism enjoys a status of primacy.¹¹ Jesus posed a persuasive rhetorical question that instructs us to this end: *What does it profit if a man gains the world, yet forfeits his soul?* (Mark 8:36). The transformation of humanity holds a uniquely prominent position in the church's mission (John 3:3-7; Acts 3:19-26). Lewis Rambo, a leading authority on human conversions, notes that this is precipitated by many factors which are primarily social, personal, cultural and religious.¹² When women are emancipated, this is a thing to be celebrated. But beyond what they have been emancipated *from*, people who are integrally involved in the women's lives must address the question of what they are emancipated *to*. People who make a major change constituting a "conversion" experience a sense of mission and

eds., *Missional Church: A Vision for the Sending of the Church in North America*, The Gospel and Our Culture Series (Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1998).

⁷ Guder and Barrett, 78.

⁸ William J. Abraham, *The Logic of Evangelism* (Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans, 1989), 111.

⁹ Abraham, 13.

¹⁰ Jesus' admonitions in the Gospel of John, that he has come to provide abundant life (10:10), and that those who believe in him will experience "rivers of living water" flowing from within them are primary in articulating this concept.

¹¹ James Scherer and Bevans, Stephen B., *New Directions in Mission and Evangelization 1: Basic Statements, 1974-1991* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Bks, 1992), 280.

¹² Lewis R. Rambo, *Understanding Religious Conversion* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1993), 12-13.

purpose when this happens, and an alleviation of guilt feelings, sensitivity to their own shortcomings and societal injustices, or deepening of their belief system.¹³ More than just being personal, there are political, social and theological consequences embedded in the conversion process. This provides individuals with psychological means enabling them to gain renewed independence.¹⁴ This is usually accompanied by new companions and habits. Those who believe in biblical authority wish to further establish that they have been delivered *to* a lifestyle that is redemptive in every way, beginning with principles of human flourishing under Christ's Lordship.

We cannot examine all the individual factors that led to every woman's initiation into "The Life" as it's called, but we will listen to their voices expressing what has transpired since they have left, completed season of healing and rehabilitation, and begun living independently. Numerous organizations exist for the purpose of keeping women and girls from further exploitation, and many of these are organizations that incorporate the teachings of Christ into the formulation of their post-trafficking development plans. For these organizations, whether the initiates remain free from exploitative networks, and how what they to accomplish meaningful lives is a concern linked intrinsically to discipleship.

Today we may consider how exposure to discipleship practices have influenced women who have lived for years under the domination of men who have controlled their bodies, their movements and access to their purses. They have successfully completed programs of rehabilitation or healing which have been individually tailored to fit their circumstances.¹⁵ A woman may have been kidnapped and held as a personal sex slave by a gang of men for several weeks, or she may have been a street prostitute for twenty

¹³ Rambo, 170.

¹⁴ Rambo, 157.

¹⁵ For some organizations, this may be a 9-month program, or up to three years for others

years, working independently for much of that time. She may have initiated an evangelical-style commitment to Christ at an early age and tried to carry on with spiritual matters during her ordeal; Or she may have thought that the “religion thing” appeared preferable to her present reality after having been abused by men for most of her life. CSE women possess shared experiences of having been forced to perform unimaginably degrading activities over the passage of time. These women also expressed interest, in varying degrees, in following the Lordship of Christ Jesus into their new situations.

The complications of experiential trauma, abuse and compromised moral codes will be considered here in conjunction with what we have already observed regarding the state of discipleship in the West. American cultural norms resist discipline and what is considered authoritarian structures.¹⁶ Cultural American soteriologies defer to emphases of grace over personal responsibility resulting in ambivalence about submitting to Christ’s Lordship.¹⁷ As Dallas Willard observed

...actual discipleship or apprenticeship to Jesus is, in our day, no longer thought of as in any way essential to faith in him. It is regarded as a costly option, a spiritual luxury, or possibly even as an evasion. Why bother with discipleship, it is widely thought, or, for that matter, with a conversational relationship with God? Let us get on with what we have to do.¹⁸

¹⁶ Researcher Alan Wolfe notes, “Like other aspects of religious practice in America, the inward-looking quality once associated with strong versions of faith has been transformed by the individualism and hedonism of American culture.” Wolfe, *The Transformation of American Religion*, 66. Craig Van Gelder lays out specific characteristics of the autonomous church here that have crippled her ability to retain and disciple believers effectively. Guder and Barrett, *Missional Church*, 62.

¹⁷ Dietrich Bonhoeffer only spent about two years in the U.S., between 1930 and 1940. But having observed the state of Christianity for that period of time as well as ministering in England and ultimately in his native Germany during the World War II era, he was in a unique position to assess a moral decay that appeared to be occurring throughout the West. He coined the term “Cheap Grace” to identify the phenomenon, and his assessment became widely circulated following his premature death at the hands of the Nazi party. “Cheap grace is the preaching of forgiveness without requiring repentance, baptism without church discipline, Communion without confession, absolution without personal confession. Cheap grace is grace without discipleship, grace without the cross, grace without Jesus Christ, living and incarnate.” Dietrich Bonhoeffer, *The Cost of Discipleship*, Revised and Unabridged (New York, NY: Macmillan, 1963), 45.

¹⁸ Dallas Willard, *The Divine Conspiracy: Rediscovering Our Hidden Life in God* (San Francisco, CA: HarperCollins Publisher, 1998), XVII.

If the dominant American culture resists radical discipleship, what expectations can we place on women who have spent a year in intensive discipleship and rehabilitation, yet have seen so much of life's dark side?

As this study begins, the respondents have been living independently for several months or years in communities they have chosen after completing Christocentric rehabilitation programs. My purpose is to qualitatively assess the progress they are making in their faith journeys, providing a window into the world of women who have faced great obstacles in trying to achieve autonomy. This writer wishes to determine how they will proceed along the trajectory of spiritual growth, after the crises have passed and they are no longer living in their cloistered and highly structured rehabilitative environments.

1-6 Research Questions

What are the obstacles that keep female American survivors of Commercial Sexual Exploitation from flourishing after they have graduated from Christocentric rehabilitative programs and reintegrated into communities?

Sub-questions:

1. What are the characteristics of flourishing for women who are establishing new lives after having survived years of exploitation, and how can we quantify these?
2. What assets do Christ-following women who have been commercially sexually exploited rely upon to help them successfully reintegrate?
3. What lifestyle habits practiced in community life promote or impede the process of holistic flourishing for commercially sexually exploited North American women who complete Christian rehabilitation programs?

The characteristics of flourishing (sub-question 1) are addressed by the data compiled in two flourishing indices that appear in chapter 5. The assets that Christ-

following women rely upon to assist them in their reintegration journeys are addressed in chapter 6. The lifestyle habits that influence flourishing in community are addressed by the Program administrators in chapter 4, by the respondents in chapters 5 and 6 and are then clarified in chapter 7.

1-7 Significance of the Study

Narratives of women being trafficked and exploited have been explored in other research projects.¹⁹ Similarly, exploited women have been observed in early stages of recovery wherein their hopes for the future have been noted and recorded.²⁰ Very little has been done to track what happens to these same women in the post-liminal, re-integration phases of their lives.²¹ University of Buffalo sex trafficking researchers Bincy

¹⁹ Alexa Albert, *Brothel: Mustang Ranch and Its Women* (New York, NY: Ballantine Books, 2011); Rochelle L. Dalla, Yan Xia, and Heather Kennedy, “‘You Just Give Them What They Want and Pray They Don’t Kill You’: Street-Level Sex Workers’ Reports of Victimization, Personal Resources, and Coping Strategies,” *Violence Against Women* 9, no. 11 (November 2003): 1367–94, <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077801203255679>; Jennifer C. Dunn, “Legal Prostitution as Sex Work: Discourses of the Moonlite Bunny Ranch” (Ph.D., Athens, OH, Ohio University, 2009), ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global (304965707); James Anderson Hall, “Listening to the Voiceless: Women in Street Prostitution and the Feminist Democratic Project” (Ph.D., Arizona, USA, Arizona State University, 1992), APA PsycInfo (1994-71889-001); Lisa A. Kramer, “Prostitution: Why Women Enter, What They Experience Emotionally, and How They Use Substances to Cope” (Ph.D., Arizona, Arizona State University, 2006), ProQuest Dissertation Publishing; Donna Sabella Monheit, “Lives in the Life: Exploring the Lived Experience of Prostitution Through Narrative” (Ph.D., United States -- Pennsylvania, University of Pennsylvania, 2010); Carson, Morris, “A Qualitative Study of the Lived Relational Experiences of Sex Trafficked Women” (Dissertation, Reno, NV, University of Nevada, 2020); Jolanda Sallmann, “Living With Stigma: Women’s Experiences of Prostitution and Substance Use,” *Affilia: Journal of Women & Social Work* 25, no. 2 (May 2010): 146–59, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0886109910364362>; Sanchez, Lisa, “Sex, Violence, Citizenship, and Community: An Ethnographic and Legal Geography of Commercial Sex in One American City” (PhD, United States--California, University of California, Irvine, 1998), ProQuest Dissertations Publishing.

²⁰ Raven R Bowen, “Squaring Up: Experiences of Transition from Off-Street Sex Work to Square Work and Duality-Concurrent Involvement in Both--in Vancouver, BC,” *Canadian Review of Sociology* 52, no. 4 (November 2015): 429–49, <https://doi.org/10.1111/cars.12085>; Katherine A. Cascio, “Leaving ‘The Life’: Exploring Services for Women Exiting Prostitution” (University of Kentucky, 2018), (2017-36666-199); Kristine E. Hickie, “Getting Out: A Qualitative Exploration of the Exiting Experience Among Former Sex Workers and Adult Sex Trafficking Victims” (Arizona, USA, Arizona State University, 2015), APA Psychinfo; Meagan A. Jones, “Leaving ‘The Life’: The Recovery Journey of Sex Trafficking Survivors” (US, Regent University, 2015), ProQuest Information & Learning; Sharon S. Oselin, *Leaving Prostitution: Getting Out and Staying Out of Sex Work* (New York, NY: New York University Press, 2014).

²¹ Bincy Wilson and Lisa D. Butler, “Running a Gauntlet: A Review of Victimization and Violence in the Pre-Entry, Post-Entry, and Peri-/Post-Exit Periods of Commercial Sexual Exploitation,” *Psychological Trauma: Theory, Research, Practice, and Policy* 6, no. 5 (September 2014): 494–504, <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0032977>; Richelle Ashley McGhee Long, “The State of Aftercare: A Critical Look

Wilson and Lisa D. Butler stated “...Research needs to continue to analyze how the overall exiting process unfolds for prostitutes, and other types of sex workers, beyond the initial exit.”²²

1-8 Theoretical Framework²³

1-8 a. Three Primary Sources

First, I have utilized Bryant Myers’ Transformational Model²⁴ of development to analyze the progress women who have been commercially sexually exploited make when they integrate into communities after a time of rehabilitation and healing. Myers is the Senior Professor of Transformational Development at Fuller Seminary, and for years held senior management roles with World Vision including Vice President for Development and Food Resources. His expertise is in poverty studies and development issues, including the integration between evangelism and development. I will be utilizing his best-known work, *Walking with the Poor* (revised 2011 version) in my analysis of the conversations with the seventeen respondents. Myers expertise in poverty issues and his

at the Response to Victims of Human Sex Trafficking in the United States” (Ph.D., Tennessee, The University of Memphis, 2014), ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global.

²² Sharon S. Oselin, “Weighing the Consequences of a Deviant Career: Factors Leading to an Exit from Prostitution,” *Sociological Perspectives* 53, no. 4 (2010): 547, <https://doi.org/10.1525/sop.2010.53.4.527>.

²³ The original framework proposed for this study underwent a transformation after I had completed interviews and analyzed the data of CSE respondents and administrators who have served that population. Using a Grounded Theory approach, I did not wish to project my bias into the principal insights that might be revealed from the lived experiences of experts. I began the project retaining the belief that 12-step Recovery Principles, as posited by The Alcoholics Anonymous movement, would provide a good context for evaluating another population beset by various addictions and compulsions. This proved to be inadequate in light of the accumulated data, and it was discarded. I retained the framework suggested by Bryant Myers, and discovered that the concept of *han* as articulated by Andrew Sung Park, which I had already planned to use in the study, accelerated in prominence because it clarified many of the concerns I observed in the eyewitness accounts. In addition to that, when the role of defective relationships emerged as a fundamental obstacle on the reintegration journeys of the rehabilitated CSE population, I re-evaluated my base of literary sources for a framework specifically addressing the phenomenon. This established most adequately in the article, “The Importance of Supportive Relationships Among Women Leaving Prostitution” by Swedish sociologists Mansson and Hedin and supported by other sociologists and theologians, and I subsequently included in my overall framework as a vital insight and analytical lens by which to evaluate obstacles and assets of this particular demographic.

²⁴ Most of my insights are drawn from Bryant L. Myers, *Walking with the Poor: Principles and Practices of Transformational Development*, Revised and Expanded Edition (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2011).

abilities in ministering to them according to Christocentric principles provided a strong foundation for my research. Although “The Poor” of whom Myers writes are one expression of a marginalized group and “CSE Women” are another, I will illuminate parallels between the exploitation that occurs in both. The women from The CSE demographic exhibit characteristics similar to those of the impoverished. Jayakumar Christian has observed that one of the most fundamental characteristics of poor people is that they lack access to power.²⁵ Their low statuses in life, sometimes generational, keep them from making authoritative demands or positioning themselves strategically to bring about changes that would improve their situations. One of the more noteworthy insights for the purposes of this study is that the CSE women, like the impoverished in Myers’ model, are characterized by marred identities and degraded vocations. Myers notes how the poor are often regarded as “damaged goods.”²⁶ Collective grief permeates entire communities and often remains for generations.²⁷

Another component of the Transformational Model relevant to this study is that Myers regards poverty as being fundamentally spiritual.²⁸ Believers in Christ recognize that evil was brought into the world by humankind’s choice to rebel against God’s design. (Romans 5:12-21; I Corinthians 15: 21-22). People who are willing to serve their own selfish ends by abusing others do so as a response to pervasive evil. When they hoard resources, exploiting others to make themselves wealthy, they yield to dark spiritual forces. While God’s design is for people to flourish (John 10:10; Psalm 95:12-

²⁵ Jayakumar Christian, *God of the Empty-Handed: Poverty, Power and the Kingdom of God* (Monrovia, CA: MARC, 1999), 118; Bryant L. Myers, *Walking with the Poor: Principles and Practices of Transformational Development*, Revised and Expanded Edition (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2011), 69–72.

²⁶ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 76.

²⁷ Andrew Park likens group han to Jung’s “collective unconsciousness” here and references passive collective unconscious han to African-Americans who endured slavery, and to the Koreans who were entangled in warfare during the 20th century. Andrew Sung Park, *The Wounded Heart of God: The Asian Concept of Han and the Christian Doctrine of Sin* (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1993), 38–40.

²⁸ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 88.

15) individuals and corporations may choose the opposite for their own purposes.

Without a strong theology of sin, comprehensive explanations of poverty are hard to come by. Therefore, in the worldview of the Christ-follower, the Gospel message must be integral to any comprehensive solutions to poverty.²⁹

This framework will help in assessing the unique needs these women possess, regardless of whether the CSE victims have experienced *material* poverty. Both demographics must be able to establish and maintain proper relationships with people, with entities and with God to supplant their unique circumstances. Bryant Myers references John Friedmann and his idea of “alternative development” to explain how the poverty of the poor hinges upon a lack of access to social power.³⁰ Numerous social spheres must be navigated for the poor to become self-sufficient and transition into lives of flourishing. The occurring process of change must be one that is self-generated rather than something imposed upon them.³¹ The good that is done must accomplish truth, righteousness and justice in their communities.³² Violent force has been used to pacify them; Therefore, it becomes all the more important that a bias towards peace should be expressed in the transformative process.³³ Above all, whatever efforts are exerted to move them towards the establishment of abundant lives (or *shalom*) should be sustainable—not only physically, but also psychologically, socially, and spiritually.³⁴

Secondly, I have borrowed a concept best expressed by theologian Andrew Sung Park and developed in his book, *The Wounded Heart of God*. Park has adopted the

²⁹ Okesson speaks here of “Complicated wickedness” leading to poverty and other deplorable conditions. On p. 22, he provides a succinct illustration of the complicated variables resulting in the impoverishment of a single village in Tanzania, illustrating that the factors are not easily reconcilable. Gregg Okesson, *A Public Missiology: How Local Churches Witness to a Complex World* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2020), 20–22.

³⁰ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 118–19.

³¹ Myers, 111–12.

³² Myers, 123.

³³ Myers, 125–26.

³⁴ Myers, 129–34.

concept of *han* from the Korean Minjung theology developed in the 1970's at a time when the polarization between the rich and poor was escalating. Although "Minjung" defies a concise definition, the term refers to the impoverished and powerless classes who believed their low wages and marginal existences resulted from the poor wages and marginalization at the hands of the political-industrial complex. National rule had been seized by a military dictatorship, resulting in protests among college students, which were violently suppressed. About three million Christians existed in Korea at the time but the students viewed most of these as largely ineffective due to their cooperation with the wealthy power structures. Some of them decided to engage in what was being called "Industrial Evangelism", living among the slum dwellers in order to propagate the Gospel among them. By recognizing Jesus' essential love for the impoverished as revealed in the New Testament, they took on what they saw as the most fundamental biblical task. The students believed they were doing the work that the prevailing churches in Korea either refused or neglected to do.

Theological language rose out of this movement which they believed to be helpful in ministering to the marginalized population to whom they had been called to assist holistically. The concept of *han* used in this study was adopted from the Minjungs for a discussion of the emotional and spiritual barriers placed upon the CSE women resulting from complicated wickedness. *Han* can roughly be understood to mean "The critical wound of the heart generated by unjust psychosomatic repression, as well as by social, political, economic and cultural oppression."³⁵

I didn't encounter the Minjung concept of *han* through studies of theologies of liberation, but rather through exegesis of the Gospel accounts of the so-called "Lord's"

³⁵ Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 10.

Prayer. It is noteworthy that Christ is quoted as directly linking the forgiveness of mankind's sins to the petition for asking forgiveness for the transgressions they have perpetrated upon others. Yet this is an underemphasized feature in Western theological circles. In the Matthew 6 narrative, the Greek word *opheilma* (debts or trespasses) is paired with the cognate *opheiletes* which designates a "debtor". The Luke 11 exposition uses the Greek word *hamartia*, the more common word for "sin" to describe the substance of what mankind is supposed to ask forgiveness for. But in the latter, Luke reverts to the Greek word *opheiletes* as Matthew did to describe "debtors".

The understanding of sin conceptualized almost entirely as humanity's trespasses against God continues to prevail in Western theology. As Howard Zehr declares, "Christianity has worked to release the offender from guilt while leaving the victim still hurting."³⁶ Minjung theology uses the concept of *han* to describe the effects of evil that have been absorbed by individuals who have been exposed to violence, great sorrow or oppression. Andrew Sung Park frames this as a concern for "sinners" versus concern for the "sinned against."³⁷ "...The traditional doctrine of sin has been one-sided, seeing the world from the perspective of the sinner alone, failing to take account of the victims of sin and injustice."³⁸ These include deeply imbedded patterns of pain, anger and other kinds of woundedness that many have experienced but few can define.³⁹ Western theology has focused upon the sinfulness of individuals and the need to forsake entrenched patterns of sin to reconcile with God. Yet, the Scriptures also comprehensively address the effects of evil, even if we haven't utilized a specific word to

³⁶ From Lisa Barnes Lampman and Michelle D Shattuck, eds., *God and the Victim: Theological Reflections on Evil, Victimization, Justice, and Forgiveness* (Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans; Neighbors Who Care, 1999), 136.

³⁷ Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 119.

³⁸ Park, 10.

³⁹ English has no corresponding term, so the Korean term will be utilized for the purposes of this study. However, my suggestion is that in English we sometimes use the phrase "Baggage" to convey a similar meaning.

describe this phenomenon.⁴⁰ If new language is popularly employed in combatting the problem of evil in the lives of individuals, it may be useful in addressing the manner in which evil has affected humanity, whether people view themselves primarily as agents or as recipients of evil.

Lastly, I employ a framework suggested by Swedish sociologists Ulla-Carin Hedin and Sven Axel Månsson in a 2003 article entitled “The Importance of Supportive Relationships Among Women Leaving Prostitution.” The authors initiated qualitative research with women who had described themselves as having been prostituted and then had eventually attempted to abandon their previous lifestyles. They discovered from the participants that the exodus from the old patterns of life did not necessarily lead to good health and development. Those who flourished required extensive efforts establishing relationships and social networks. The researchers discovered three main components required for their successful integration: Working through traumatic experiences, repairing and mastering previously close relationships and building new heterogeneous social networks. While the difficulties associated with overcoming traumatic experiences can best be addressed in discussions regarding the *han* of the subjects, the latter concerns require a robust theological understanding of the purpose and necessity of community. Supportive relationships indeed are important for any exploited person trying to acquire stability and developing flourishing patterns in a particular place. For those pursuing discipleship in a specifically Christian context, though, it is also vital that the new relationships being established are redemptive ones.

1-8 b. Intersection of the Sources

⁴⁰ From Lampman and Shattuck, *God and the Victim*, 114.

The population of CSE women share some comparative characteristics with an impoverished population.⁴¹ There are most often superior safeguards in place to keep middle- and upper-class women from some of life's harsher realities. Physical poverty renders individuals vulnerable to exploitation since they must worry about basic daily bread issues unfamiliar to the upper classes. Studies are referenced in Chapter 3 demonstrating the link between CSE engagement and violence.⁴² Due to their powerlessness, girls from lower economic backgrounds are often subject to violence and sexual exploitation at home. Many of these consequently leave home at early ages to escape ongoing harm and degradation. Inability to survive on the streets without money exposes them to coercion. Unskilled and underage, they may turn to survival sex as the only apparent way to become sheltered. Once they have broken the taboo, a complex series of events begins to unfold, making it extremely for many of them to "just" get out.

Poverty is, in part, a deficit. "Poor people do not have enough to eat, a decent place to sleep, or clean water. Their land is poor, there is no water for irrigation, roads are inadequate, and there are no schools for their children."⁴³ It results in diminished personal and relational well-being;⁴⁴ Impoverished people are not able to establish nor to maintain healthy relationships that would advantage them in trying to rise above their circumstances. People who are viewed as economically insignificant become captive to

⁴¹ Not all women who have been commercially sexually exploited come from impoverished backgrounds, although it is much more common for them to emerge from lower-class backgrounds. Di Tommaso's essay demonstrates how poverty influences entry into CSE on a global scale. Tyler and Jonson's article explores how the poverty of homeless youth compels them to trade sex for money when they run out of viable options. See Maria L. Di Tommaso et al., "As Bad as It Gets: Well-Being Deprivation of Sexually Exploited Trafficked Women," *European Journal of Political Economy* 25, no. 2 (June 2009): 143–62, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ejpoleco.2008.11.002>; Kimberly A. Tyler and Katherine A. Johnson, "Trading Sex: Voluntary or Coerced? The Experiences of Homeless Youth," *The Journal of Sex Research* 43, no. 3 (2006): 208–16, <https://doi.org/10.1080/00224490609552319>.

⁴² See Chapter 3, Section 1b, "Endemic Violence."

⁴³ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 113.

⁴⁴ Myers, 120.

the god-complexes of those who hold power.⁴⁵ Deception by principalities and powers which hold no interest in their ascendancy contribute to the ongoing cycle of entrapment.⁴⁶ In Myers' framework, the nature of poverty is fundamentally relational, and is a consequence of the presence of sin in the world.⁴⁷ It is "...the result of relationships that do not work, that are not just, that are not for life, that are not harmonious or enjoyable."⁴⁸ Poverty results from a network of poorly developed or broken relationships. The poor don't have equal access to social power, and they experience marginalization by the community. Since they have often accepted the disdain that has been projected onto them, they may even experience self-loathing, believing that they don't have the ingenuity or the talent to properly make their way through life. This, in turn, keeps them from establishing meaningful relationships with a God whom they believe has passed them over. Faced with such brokenness, they find it difficult to fulfill the meaningful roles required of them in appropriately functioning communities. The expectation of brokenness often becomes a self-fulfilling prophecy. Thus, when positive opportunities are presented, their low expectations or lack of skills in navigating good fortune cause them to self-sabotage.⁴⁹ Myers acknowledges that the Poor must recognize their own complicity in their poverty. He clearly expresses their need to take ownership in their own development⁵⁰ In a section on seeking truth, justice and righteousness, he encourages practitioners to help impoverished people to assume the

⁴⁵ Myers, 124.

⁴⁶ Myers, 126.

⁴⁷ Myers, 68, 86–87.

⁴⁸ Myers, 86.

⁴⁹ Ruby Payne notes, for example, how the impoverished will grossly mismanage money that comes their way from a settlement or inheritance, returning them to poverty again within a few months. See Ruby K. Payne, *A Framework for Understanding Poverty*, 4th rev. ed. (Aha! Process, 2005).

⁵⁰ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 332.

initiative in discovering the truth concerning any contributions they may be making to their own poverty.⁵¹

A variable affixed to the impoverished condition exists, however, which Myers may be overlooking: While poverty can be viewed as a deficit, it is one that also creates a surplus among people who are affected. It creates a surplus of baggage, or *han*. Myers references the writings of Jayakumar Christian⁵² indicating how poverty mars the identities of the poor.⁵³ In two sections of *Walking with the Poor* he acknowledges the prospect that *han* contributes to the debilitation of the poor, linking it first to discrimination that may be apportioned by those who play the roles of gods in their lives.⁵⁴ Later on, he refers to the effects of *han* as possibly being complicit in marring the identities of the poor.⁵⁵ He also acknowledges the possibility of the effects of *han* contributing to issues of community poverty, implying that these could be communally acquired among the impoverished.⁵⁶ When marginalized peoples are sinned-against, they become ensnared in a vortex over which they do not have complete control. When a bone is broken it can be set again to heal, but rarely does this occur in a precisely identical configuration. The residual effects of the break perpetually remain. When a woman has been sinned-against for many years, she has incurred the impact of ten thousand violations. Physically impoverished people accumulate baggage through scores of indignities cleaving to their impoverished conditions. Women who are CSE

⁵¹ Myers, 186.

⁵² Christian, *God of the Empty-Handed*, 139–41.

⁵³ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 123.

⁵⁴ Here he states “When fallen human beings play god in the lives of others, the results are patterns of domination and oppression that mar the image and potential productivity of the poor while alienating the non-poor from their true identity and vocation as well. This malfunctioning of social systems as a result of sin led theologian Andrew Sung Park to argue that we need a theology of sin that does not just talk about sin and sinners, but also about the impact of sin on those who are being sinned against.” Myers, 67.

⁵⁵ Myers, 140.

⁵⁶ Myers notes that “*han* is not just a personal or individual phenomena; it often finds communal expression.” He follows this by quoting passages Andrew Sung Park. Myers, 140.

experience unique and enduring indignities that continue to fester. Violence, scorn, physical abuse and commodification occur for them numerous times a day for years on end. Whether their specific circumstances suggest trafficking or prostitution, the result is that they are violated often from their youth for significant intervals which may extend into years. Depravity on that level inevitably possesses adverse effects. Myers appears to be interested in further exploring how communities affected by the effects of residual sin can be assisted by churches adopting better theological constructs. He notes how, “This malfunctioning of social systems as a result of sin led theologian Andrew Sung Park to argue that we need a theology of sin that does not just talk about sin and sinners, but also about the impact of sin on those who are being sinned against.”⁵⁷ His remarks here pertain to a general audience—namely “The Poor”. To address a more particular demographic, though, such as CSE women who have been rehabilitated and are settling into communities, resources beyond improved theological understanding of the injuries of the sinned-against are needed. *Han* has affected this constituency in physically and visceral ways. Better theology is needed to equip churches to meet the needs of the marginalized. Beyond that, though, specific strategies, physical resources and protocols will also be required to optimize their abilities to flourish.

In Hedin and Mansson’s “Supportive Relationships” article the sociologists note how one key external factor they discovered in their research was that “Exploitation and violence from ‘boyfriends’ prevented many of their subjects from successfully breaking away from CSE and acclimating into new lifestyles.”⁵⁸ This a *han* issue. Women experiencing transitional difficulties shouldn’t expect being beaten or forced to sexually

⁵⁷ Myers, 67.

⁵⁸ Ulla-Carin Hedin and Sven Axel Månsson, “The Importance of Supportive Relationships Among Women Leaving Prostitution,” *Journal of Trauma Practice* 2, no. 3/4 (July 2003): 234.

service men by Significant Others as entries in their portfolios of complicating factors. But it was normative among women interviewed for that particular study.

CSE women belong to a unique demographic. They share the historic poverty of the Minjungs in Korea⁵⁹ and of the Dalits in India⁶⁰ and the impoverished masses in Latin America.⁶¹ They are not part of a particular ethnic or a regional demographic but are rather a people characterized by similar experiences. Their shared lifestyles, values and experiences have caused them to acquire more than the ordinary share of baggage that most impoverished groups accrue. This baggage precipitates a diminished acquisition of personal and emotional well-being. The deficit of common decency the non-poor can realistically expect has been replaced with a surplus of complicated wickedness.⁶² They possess embedded burdens that contribute to their daily existences even after initial healing has occurred. The *han* resulting from thousands of indignities provides unique interference that will not dissipate after the completion of a one-year Program.

Andrew Sung Park wishes to reveal the primary source of woundedness in people who have been neglected, marginalized, and dehumanized. His observations and analysis on the residual effects of sin upon sin's recipients is groundbreaking and firmly rooted in biblical texts particularly when viewed through non-western lenses. What he may be underestimating in his desire to help churches to realign their thinking and practices is that all of humanity is complicit as both agents and as instigators of sin. There can be no tidy divide between sinners and the sinned-against, although it is fair to concede that many populations have been more oppressed than others. Consequently, while better

⁵⁹ Chang-nack Kim, "Korean Minjung Theology: An Overview," *Chicago Theological Seminary Register* 85, no. 2 (Spring 1995): 8.

⁶⁰ Christian, *God of the Empty-Handed*, 50–52.

⁶¹ Orlando E. Costas, *The Church and Its Mission: A Shattering Critique from the Third World* (Wheaton, IL: Tyndale House Publishers, 1974), 224–25.

⁶² This is a phrase with roots in the teaching of John Wesley, appearing in his discourses on social sin. John Wesley, *The Doctrine of Original Sin: According to Scripture, Reason, and Experience* (Salem, OH: Schmuel Publishing Co, 1999).

solutions need to be employed in helping CSE women to overcome the principal obstacles inhibiting their posterity, we must also continue to encourage them to develop character and to address circumstances they may change, as the administrators in the rehabilitational facilities interviewed for this study appear to be consistently doing. The attendant respondents have carried baggage weightier than most citizens can imagine. Psychotherapists, pastoral counselors, mentors and program administrators should learn to recognize the effects of sin and to respond accordingly. Graciousness, patience, and wisdom are required of people helpers. Solid effort and tenacity is needed from the sinned-against. None of these characteristics is mutually exclusive. The CSE population in this fashion is similar to addicts in the recovery movement. While healing occurs under the supervision of informed caregivers, participants must never neglect to “Work the Program.”⁶³

To Summarize: CSE women bear similarities to “The Poor” of whom Bryant Myers writes. Defective social relationships is the chief component responsible for keeping the impoverished in their poverty. Hedin and Mansson write specifically about a group to whom they refer as “Prostitutes” although they didn’t consider agency or prior life circumstances in their assessments. For their study, they interviewed women whom they described as having been “prostituting” on the streets of Sweden. More than anything else they found that this group needed strategic social relationships to assist them in leaving this “street work” and remaining free from exploitative networks. Their remarks were made without the deliberate inclusion of any religio-spiritual resources, although other sociologists have noted that spiritual resources often have been most

⁶³ This phrase is commonly used by those in the 12-Step or Recovery Movement to indicate actively pursuing the recognized steps to achieving recovery on an ongoing basis. Anonymous, *Alcoholics Anonymous: The Story of How Many Thousands of Men and Women Have Recovered from Alcoholism*, 4th edition (New York City: Alcoholics Anonymous World Services, 2001), 58–60.

critical in keeping many of these women free from returning to The Life. Speaking as a theologian, Andrew Sung Park notes that numerous individuals (not just women from CSE networks) experience inner turmoil, self-loathing, bitterness and self-sabotaging tendencies due to the residual effects of having been sinned against. This can occur individually or corporately. My observation is that CSE women are a marginalized population who experience strong effects of *han*. They have difficulty leaving CSE networks and remaining emancipated from them, as they have been conditioned to respond to the impulses of *han*. Some may turn to spiritual resources for healing and solace, but they struggle in their new lives. Having strong community relations-- especially social connections with committed Christians who will look out for their best interests-- will optimize their abilities to remain free. Participation in just communities incorporating motivated supporters will mediate the effects of *han* and increase the likelihood that they will successfully reintegrate into the communities of their choosing.

Just as the work Recoverers do must be focused and intentional, the researcher's task must be systematic and structured to be meaningful. I was fortunate to obtain interviews with numerous firsthand witnesses who were able to provide detailed narratives regarding their personal struggles to move beyond CSE, beyond the Programs that prepared them for encounters with stable lifestyles and independent living in the communities of their choosing. Because little research has been conducted on the reintegration journeys of this population, an appropriately high regard for the views of eyewitnesses was established in order not only to hear their voices, but subsequently to document our conversations and to make sense out of the narratives they supplied. The next chapter reveals the limits of the research done for this project, the methods employed and how data was obtained and analyzed.

Chapter 2: Organizing the Story

2-1 Overview

This study concerns CSE women who have cycled through several distinct phases of their lives. Little has been done to track what happens to these same women in the post-liminal, re-integration phases of their lives. Transitional living is much different from returning to community, getting a job, having to pay bills and dealing with relatives, acquaintances and agencies. Progress achieved by dedicated staffers in the rehabilitation phases have limited value if they do not result in the impending flourishing of program graduates. To identify the obstacles that impeded this group of formerly CSE women reintegrating after Christocentric rehabilitation programs I had to find expert eyewitness as well as those who had lived and worked among them. After I had done this, I was compelled to transcribe all the interviews, analyze their statements, look for patterns and then organize the units of thought into categories reflecting the perspectives of the eyewitness. This chapter demonstrates how those tasks were accomplished, enabling me to develop a theory consistent with other literature I had studied.

The project was divided into two phases. In the first phase, I met with executives and caregivers who have guided women into the re-integration stages of their journeys. A series of lengthy interviews with them to determine revealed the best questions to ask the CSE women and helped to anticipate what the CSE interviews might reveal. They were asked for their observations regarding their clients' transitions into community. They in turn referred me to other prospective respondents who have navigated this transition.

In the second phase, I corresponded with the women who have completed Christocentric programs of rehabilitation and have since established themselves in their communities. I began with a personal biographical questionnaire enabling me to see a

fuller picture of each individual's life before proceeding directly into questions about how they are faring today. After that, every woman who completed a questionnaire also attended a face-to-face interview. The relationship of the survivor-participant to the studied phenomena and to the interviewer and to the process will also shape the type, extent, and relative depth of the subsequent story.

The interviews were recorded and transcribed verbatim. A profile for each woman was compiled by creating documents that merged the transcriptions of the face-to-face interview with her self-interview. Each interview was then analyzed for content related to the obstacles and assets she experienced in her re-integration journey.

2-2 Delimitations

This is a study with women (age 18 and older) who self-identify as either having been prostituted or trafficked commercially. It is phenomenologically based in the identified experiences of CSE women who have been emancipated from what they refer to as "The Life". Each subject has completed a biblically based restorative program and then begun to live independently in the communities they have chosen. The subjects have been exposed to Christocentric faith-principles as part of a rehabilitative program. Participation did not require adherence to the label "Christian" or any other religious self-descriptor. Basic demographic information about the respondents is gathered in Chart 2-0 on the following page.

Chart 2-O	
17 CSE Respondents, Interviewed in Summer/Autumn 2019	
Ages of Respondents	Youngest: 21 Oldest: 53
Ethnicities	Anglos: 12 African-Americans: 4 Other Non-Black: 1
Number of States Subjects were Residing in	5
Subjects Born in U.S.A.	17/17
Years out of C.S.E.	1.5 -12 Years
Enrolled in College	5/17
Employed	15/17
Living in Stable Housing	16/17
Receiving Social Security/Disability Benefits	1/17

Source: Questionnaires and Face-to-Face Interviews

The seventeen respondents have been emancipated from *The Life* for at least eighteen months to complete rehabilitative programs according to the sponsoring organization's satisfaction. My intention has been to discover the trajectory of the holistic spiritual journeys made by CSE women after completing faith-based nurture and rehabilitation. I have qualitatively assessed how the respondents are progressing in the eras following program completion. I have examined the holistic progress they are making both in their journeys towards faith in Christ and in assimilating into communities as they had hoped to do.

In gathering data, I made no distinctions between women raised with or without exposure to the Gospel. Each subject provided me with a narrative summary of their upbringings told in as many or as few words as they chose. I presented questions regarding their backgrounds which they were asked to address in their written or orally narrated self-interviews. If details of their narratives were not clear to me, I made clarifications at the beginnings of the face-to-face interviews. If they seemed hesitant to

provide further details, I did not press them. My priority was that they were comfortable relating their experiences rather than verification of narrative details. The project's focus was upon their post-program experiences, not upon their CSE experiences.

Two groups of individuals were interviewed for this study: 1) Caregivers who minister to women who have been commercially sexually abused. Paid staff or volunteers with extensive experience working with this demographic were considered. The organizations they represent must possess Christocentric worldviews. 2) Women who have been CSE and then completed a faith-based, Christian rehabilitation and reintegrated into the communities of their choices. Ethnicity wasn't considered for participation, but respondents were required to be fluent in English. Some were members of both groups—which is to say, they had previously been CSE, and then accepted positions with organizations that minister to that population. The primary purpose of interviewing the former group was to discover their observations regarding obstacles to re-integration, what questions should be asked of the CSE women during interviews later in the year, and what approaches should be used to enable the women to provide accurate data without causing them to feel devalued or exploited. Further, I hoped the administrators would allow me to observe some of the environments in which they worked and introduce me to candidates who might wish to participate in the study. My principal focus was upon the second group, the CSE women, whose remarks were coded and analyzed for theoretical development.

2-3 Limitations

1) Since the respondents had completed at least one program of rehabilitation, which typically occupies about a year of residency, women who had dropped out of the Programs were not interviewed. 2) Respondents were presumed to possess generally positive views of the Christian faith. Some expressed how they had chosen the programs

because they wanted to incorporate Christian spirituality into their recoveries. Many said this was not a consideration in selecting a program. All were exposed to Christian teaching, counseling and church attendance during their programs. 3) Participants were referred by the agencies from which they had graduated. The agencies may have been more enthusiastic about allowing me to speak with women who had generally reintegrated well than those who were reporting greater struggles, and those from the latter group may have also been more reluctant to participate. One organization referred me to all the women who had completed all phases of the program since it had been a small number, and each of those women participated. I asked the organizations to include women who were not considered particularly “successful,” and I attempted to track these women with added deliberation. Some of the strugglers who had relapsed ended up participating. Administrators expressed their suspicions that two who dropped out before completing the first questionnaire were women still experiencing significant instability with boyfriends and would probably have considered themselves on the “relapse” trajectory. It also stands to reason that women who hadn’t remained in touch with the administrators or who couldn’t otherwise be located were also more likely to have been among those experiencing greater difficulties adjusting to their new situations.

4) The IRB at Asbury Seminary also placed restrictions on my contact with the women and the topics which I would be permitted to discuss. These are outlined later in this chapter. Time constraints restricted me to a single face-to-face interview with each respondent. The logistics and expenses of travelling out of the region while coordinating two schedules necessitated my assistant and I to only travel to cities where we would be able to interview more than one subject per trip. The interviews had to be concluded by the end of 2019 to give me time to transcribe the interviews and write and defend the

dissertation within academic parameters. For this study, the observations were recorded between July and November of 2019.

2-4 Definitions

Human Trafficking: In 2000, the U.N. began drafting international standards to clarify illegality in a wide variety of circumstances. Their Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime, commonly known as the Palermo Protocol, was ratified on December 25, 2003. Article 3 spells out uniform standards to be recognized internationally:

“(a) Trafficking in persons” shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs. (b) The consent of a victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) have been used.⁶⁴

The international version of the law was strengthened in the U.S. with the passage of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) of 2000. This defines sex trafficking as a situation in which a “commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such act has not attained 18 years of age.”

Victim/Survivor: I make no distinctions between coerced, forced, or “voluntary” forms of prostitution or trafficking for the purposes of this study except when those distinctions are significant in the narratives of the survivors. Survivor interviews and published data

⁶⁴ UN General Assembly, “United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime: Resolution/Adopted by the General Assembly,” Pub. L. No. A/RES/55/25 (2001), <https://www.refworld.org/docid/3b00f55b0.html>.

have persuaded me that all persons who has been prostituted or serially sexually abused have suffered some degree of trauma. Those working in facilities providing Christocentric aftercare concerned with the restoration of the exploited individuals rather than with addressing legal distinctions such as “voluntary,” “coerced,” or “forced.” Having said that, it is prudent to recognize that those who were clearly taken by force and compelled to engage in activities they resisted may experience deeper trauma than those who professed to choose prostitution for economic reasons. I will refer to all these women as participants or interview subjects recognizing that trauma has occurred regardless of who bears responsibility. “Former prostitute” is only appropriate for women who, as adults, have clearly identified their own agencies in choosing that path for their lives for economic benefit. It is incumbent to recognize, though, that this line is often mercurial due to grooming and conditioning that has often occurred, including incest and pedophilia. The term victim may be appropriate particularly for women who are currently enmeshed in webs of sex trafficking, but survivor is a preferable term used here occasionally for those who have become emancipated from being used commercially for sex.

Commercial Sexual Exploitation (CSE): This researcher read and listened to narratives of girls and women who stated they had been trafficked. These narratives included coercion, force, violence and kidnapping. Other women reported engagement in what they described as stripping, nude modelling, escorting, prostitution, pornographic film production and sex work. These actions were often accommodated by patterns of coercion and violence indistinct from what the trafficked individuals described. A neutral term was chosen to identify their experiences without having to evaluate the degree of agency involved. Researchers Wilson and Butler made a parallel choice, noting how

the increasing common use of the term “commercial sexual exploitation” to denote both, is supported by the emerging understanding of the circumstances that are common to both forms of exploitation. In particular, the ubiquity of victimization and violence that girls and women typically endure prior to and during their time in prostitution (regardless of whether the prostitution is domestic or international). Given the pervasiveness of maltreatment and coercion, it becomes less justifiable to claim that “choice” and/or “willingness” are meaningful criteria by which to make a distinction between being trafficked and prostituted.⁶⁵

Christocentric Aftercare: This indicates that the agencies involved believe the Christian faith is viewed as integral to the treatment and recovery of these survivors. Caregivers in these programs hold biases towards faith-based solutions to reintegration, and those biases extend to belief in the Lordship of Jesus Christ and in the divine inspiration of the Christian Scriptures.

The Life: This the common term women who have been prostituted use to denote their lifestyle or experiences. It refers to the subculture of prostitution. Women and girls will say they’ve been “in The Life” if they’ve been involved in prostitution for a significant period of time.⁶⁶ Some of my interview subjects also called it “The Game Life”.

The Program (and likewise Programs capitalized) is a phrase that will be used uniquely in this study to refer to the many Christocentric rehabilitational programs in the U.S. that enable CSE women to experience freedom from their former lifestyles of exploitation and addiction. I spoke to representatives from eleven such organizations for this research. Four of them were willing to let me speak to their graduates on the record, so in the narrower sense the term as used here refers primarily to one of those four programs. The

⁶⁵ Wilson and Butler, “Running a Gauntlet,” 495.

⁶⁶ Linda Smith, “Trafficking Terms,” Shared Hope International, accessed February 1, 2021, <https://sharedhope.org/the-problem/trafficking-terms/>.

Institutional Review Board from my seminary asked me not to reveal the names of the organizations, although none of the administrators themselves requested anonymity.

Obstacles are regarded in this study not as physical barriers but as situations or phenomena that obstruct. Obstacles in the lives of CSE women are those obstructions that impede their abilities to flourish holistically.

Flourishing refers to the ability to grow, to develop or to mature. It describes a person's ability to thrive or to prosper in a community setting. It is used here in the holistic sense, encompassing capacities to thrive physically, spiritually, psychologically, socially, economically, politically and intellectually. Special emphasis has been placed here upon spiritual flourishing, but progress in an individual's life this cannot be observed in a vacuum. Activities in one realm of her life demonstrably affects the other realms.

Evangelism: Wesleyan theologian William Abraham's definition will be employed here:

"We can best improve our thinking on evangelism by conceiving it as that set of intentional activities which is governed by the goal of initiating people into the Kingdom of God for the first time."⁶⁷ When a person has been evangelized, she has taken an essential step in journeying toward Christ. Her step *begins* a journey, rather than ending one.

Discipleship: In the Great Commission of Matthew 28:19, Jesus commanded his disciples (*mathetes*) to execute one task above all others using a rare verb, *mathetheusate*: To make disciples.⁶⁸ The term will be used harmoniously with its meaning in Matthew's gospel here as living out the teachings of Jesus by way of "...a commitment to God's reign, to justice and love, and to obedience to the entire will of God"⁶⁹ as missiologist

⁶⁷ Abraham, *The Logic of Evangelism*, 95.

⁶⁸ David Jacobus Bosch, *Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission*, American Society of Missiology Series 16 (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2011), 73.

⁶⁹ Bosch, 81.

David Bosch has described it. It involves practicing everything Jesus instructed his disciples to do. Discipleship is understood to be the continuation of the evangelism process. One without the other is futile. Not only are they interconnected, but in the early stages of a believer's life they may be indistinguishable. There is not necessarily a clear boundary to determine at what point a seeker is being "evangelized" and at what point she is being "discipled."⁷⁰ Discipleship is an ongoing component that completes what was accomplished in the "Evangelism" stage of a believer. These are both steps in the "Good news-ing"⁷¹ journey consistent with New Testament teaching. The evangelism/discipleship process considered here is one that engenders stability, personal piety, and corporate establishment in the Body of Christ.

Han is the critical wound of the heart generated by unjust psychosomatic repression and by social, political, economic and cultural oppression.⁷² It has been described as a manifestation of collapsed feelings of pain⁷³ related to unresolved resentment for injustices suffered.⁷⁴ It is an internal response to residual sin that others have committed against wounded parties. It can be appropriated individually but also has may be collectively manifested in marginalized peoples. It may be revealed acquiescently, manifested by despair or resignation or actively by rage and vengefulness.⁷⁵ Where sin is committed, *han* arises as its corollary.⁷⁶

⁷⁰ James F. Engel and Hugo Wilbert Norton, *What's Gone Wrong with the Harvest?: A Communication Strategy for the Church and World Evangelization* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1975); Paul and Sue Hazelden, "The Modified Engel Scale: The Complete Article," Personal Website, The Modified Engel Scale: The Complete Article, May 28, 2008, http://www.hazelden.org.uk/pt02/art_pt068_modified_engel_full.htm; Bob Whitesel, *Waypoint: Navigating Your Spiritual Journey*, Waypoint (Indianapolis, IN: Wesleyan Pub. House, 2010).

⁷¹ An approximate rendering of euangelion

⁷² Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 10.

⁷³ Park, 17.

⁷⁴ Park, 19.

⁷⁵ Park, 32.

⁷⁶ Andrew Sung Park and Susan L. Nelson, eds., *The Other Side of Sin: Woundedness from the Perspective of the Sinned-Against* (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2001), 48.

Redemptive/Redemptive Communities: Missiologist Christopher Wright notes that the English word “redeem” suggests a financial transaction in which one “buys back” something that has been previously forfeited, or in which one party pays a price to obtain freedom for a third party.⁷⁷ Theologian Brenda Colijn links redemption to the Greek terms *agorazo* and *exagorazo* (to purchase) and a family of words related to *lyo* (to loose or release).⁷⁸ She cites as an example Paul’s admonition to the Corinthian Church in I Corinthians 7:23 (“You were bought with a price; Do not become slaves of human master.”).⁷⁹ Christ is seen throughout the New Testament as the redeemer of mankind, paying the price with his own blood for salvaging humanity. Redemption therefore means something that has been salvaged, and now possesses value regardless of how it had previously been perceived. The term *Redemptive Communities* is used here to describe communities recognizing that their worth is based upon how they are perceived by God. Specifically, these are communities who realize they have been redeemed by Christ, and due to that recognition they endeavor to salvage those whom other segments of society have undervalued.

2-5 Institutional Approval

In preparation for this research, I met and corresponded with the Institutional Review Board of Asbury Seminary numerous times between 2017-2019. I did not initiate the interviewing of research subjects until obtaining IRB approval for phase I of the research to interview administrators working with women who had been CSE on December 19, 2018, enabling me to interview the administrators in January and February of 2019. On July 2, 2019, they approved my phase II proposal to speak to the primary

⁷⁷ Christopher J. H. Wright, *The Mission of God: Unlocking the Bible’s Grand Narrative* (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2006), 266.

⁷⁸ Brenda Colijn, *Images of Salvation in the New Testament* (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2010), 147.

⁷⁹ Colijn, 147–48.

subjects who had been CSE. I agreed to and practiced the following during and after the human subject correspondence phase of the project:

- I completed Human Subjects Training to the satisfaction of the IRB on 10-20-2017.
- All administrators to whom I spoke signed consents before participating in interviews. Administrative questions were approved (See Consent Form in [Appendix 2-1](#)). No compensation was offered or procured for those interviews, which were conducted face-to-face in Kentucky and via telephone for respondents outside of Kentucky.
- All primary subjects were recruited following strict ethical guidelines. The research was explained to prospective subjects in layman's terms, and each interview subject signed a consent form before participating (See [Appendix 2-2](#) for Consent Form). Their sponsoring organizations were able to verify they had completed a program of rehabilitation to the organization's satisfaction. No coercion was used in the recruiting or interviewing process. All subjects were referred to me by organizational caregivers. I did not advertise the need for subjects. The participating organizations all sent letters to the IRB indicating their cooperation in the project.
- All face-to-face interviews were conducted in the presence of a licensed psychologist, Beverly Whitaker, Ph.D., who also completed the Human Subjects Training module to the satisfaction of the IRB. She accompanied me to all interviews and was also present for the interview conducted via Skype.
- The IRB approved the stipend I proposed to pay the subjects for their participation. I provided \$100 in gift cards (Grocery, gas or general merchandise) for one written or recorded self-interview and a face-to-face interview. No pressure was applied to complete both interviews, and no penalty incurred if they dropped out. Regardless, every subject who eventually sent me a self-interview also followed through with a face-to-face interview

- All tentative questions were approved by the IRB. This consisted of questions for the administrators and the two questionnaires used for the primary subjects, found in Appendices 2-3 and 2-4.
- I used pseudonyms for all the subjects. After interviews were transcribed, I converted all the authentic names of the subjects to their pseudonyms.
- I did everything in my power to keep confidences and practice discretion regarding the identities of my subjects. I conducted all interviews securely. I kept all my data in devices that are locked and password-protected and did not leave my data anywhere in which it could be disseminated. I also utilized secure methods of corresponding with the subjects and the administrators.
- I researched laws in the states where I would be conducting interviews. I discovered no barriers prohibiting me from interviewing cooperative subjects in their states of residence. I proposed a timetable to the IRB for destroying the raw data after the project was completed.

2-6 Biases

Faith Bias: This project was accomplished in conjunction with my studies at a conservative Wesleyan Seminary. The researcher is a student of evangelism and discipleship. The research perspectives stated here are consistent with an orthodox understanding of the Christian Scriptures and the historic creeds. My faith has also been influenced by Wesleyan thought. Though the meaning of “evangelical” seems to be evolving during the duration of this project at least in the Western hemisphere, I can affirm what is commonly referred to as historian David Bebbington’s characteristics of evangelicalism:

Biblicism — Through the Scriptures of the Old and New Testaments, the God who is objectively there has revealed

universal and eternal truth to humankind in such a way that all can grasp it.

Christocentrism — God’s eternal Word became human in the historical man Jesus of Nazareth, who definitively reveals God to humanity.

Crucicentrism — The good news of God’s revelation in Christ is seen supremely in the cross, where atonement was made for people of every race, tribe and tongue.

Conversionism — The truth of the eternal gospel must be appropriated in personal faith, which comes through repentance — that is, a discernible reorientation of the sinner’s mind and heart towards God.

Activism — Gospel truth must be demonstrated in evangelism and social service.⁸⁰

Additionally, this writer affirms the tenets of the Lausanne Commission for World Evangelism: which emphasizes that the biblical practice of evangelism centers upon the proclamation of Christ’s teachings in conjunction with faith-based social action.⁸¹ The holistic practice of evangelism among orthodox Christian practitioners can also be summarized in the works of Ron Sider and others.⁸² Arguments that it may somehow be unethical to encourage others to adopt specific faith principles (“evangelism”) run contrary to 2,000 years of church history and practice. Evangelism is appropriate for *all* people and is commonly practiced within the context of social action.⁸³ People in the process of experiencing particularly difficult passages in their lives are often more aware

⁸⁰ David Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1730s to the 1980s* (New York, NY: Routledge, 1993), 636.

⁸¹ Julia E. M. Cameron, *The Lausanne Legacy: Landmarks in Global Mission* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 2016).

⁸² Ronald J. Sider, *Good News and Good Works: A Theology of the Whole Gospel* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1999).

⁸³ This is affirmed in the 1982 Grand Rapids Consultation on the Relationship of Evangelism and Social Responsibility sponsored by the Lausanne Commission on World Evangelization (Scherer and Bevans, Stephen B., *New Directions in Mission and Evangelization 1*, 1992, 276–80.) The World Council of Churches is more cautious, but affirms that “We have heard different emphases on how the gospel is to be shared. Some emphasizing the sharing of the gospel through resisting oppression and exploitation of the poor, and identifying with the marginalized. Others, while not denying the necessity for such an attitude on the part of the churches, have, nevertheless, emphasized the necessity for an explicit invitation to faith in Jesus Christ.” (1987 Stuttgart Consultation James Scherer and Bevans, Stephen B., *New Directions in Mission and Evangelization 1: Basic Statements, 1974-1991* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Bks, 1992), 65–66.

of comprehensive needs, and therefore may be particularly open to spiritual changes.⁸⁴

This openness may be credited to the intersection of circumstances and timing rather than manipulation. It is clear, though, that manipulation and mixed motives can occur in the process of recruiting people in the service of any great cause or idea, and it is discriminatory to single out Christianity as some kind of particularly nefarious predator. The Wesleyan school of thought to which this writer ascribes consistently emphasizes free moral agency in its approach to the propagation of the Gospel.⁸⁵ Individuals are free to embrace or reject Christian faith. If manipulation was used to coerce someone into a faith commitment, it is not likely that that commitment will reflect a prominent, enduring legacy.

This researcher is appreciative of all who labor for the cessation of human trafficking and to those who provide healing for victims of CSE and other forms of abuse and exploitation. I particularly value those who also incorporate biblical principles into their labors of healing and rehabilitation.

Evangelism as Propagation of the Faith: Jesus' mandate was the admonition to "Follow me"—not simply to adopt a new thinking pattern. As William Abraham states, "All authentic evangelism requires initiation into the body of Christ in a specific Christian community and engagement with its life, worship, formation and mission."⁸⁶ In other words, it is not an evangelism that is accomplished, but an evangelism that develops into the abundant life of a disciple. At the inauguration of the salvation event, the process of discipleship (journeying towards maturity) begins, then continues throughout a disciple's

⁸⁴ "Unless we are very careful such delicate matters as friendship and love will be turned into one more utilitarian means or tool to increase the statistics of church membership," evangelism scholar William Abraham cautions in Abraham, *The Logic of Evangelism*, 77.

⁸⁵ Galatians 5:13-17 is a key text underscoring the premise that humans are free to make their own choices. They may choose to follow the teachings of Christ, or to turn away.

⁸⁶ Abraham, *The Logic of Evangelism*, 95.

life. Although North American methods of evangelism have gravitated towards a truncated view of initiation into Christ's kingdom capped by a "decision," this is not a biblical understanding that would have elicited endorsement from Jesus or his disciples.⁸⁷

As Scot McKnight has observed,

Most of us don't pay attention to the rhetoric at work in this traditional approach to gospeling. What I mean is that articulating the "gospel" like this is to shape themes of salvation in a rhetorical order aimed at precipitating a response. The rhetorical shape of the gospel above the jump is aimed at getting an audience into a state of liminality, a state where one feels he or she is between God's love and God's justice/wrath and holiness.⁸⁸

In the *King Jesus Gospel*, he adds, "The gospel doesn't work for spectators; you have to participate for it to work its powers."⁸⁹

In Mark 8:36, Jesus rhetorically asked his disciples, "What do you benefit if you gain the whole world but lose your own soul?" (NLT). While agents of social and charitable endeavors regularly use holistic methods when working with marginalized populations, those who follow Christ are particularly concerned with the spiritual realm. Having meaningful vocations, safe housing and money in the bank are generally good things, but they can ultimately become dissatisfying without the presence of *shalom*, which Bryant Myers defines as just, peaceful, harmonious, and enjoyable relationships with each other, ourselves, our environment, and God.⁹⁰ Counseling to mediate the effects of trauma and substance abuse are needs that are commonly identified by CSE survivors.⁹¹ When trauma and substance abuse are addressed and healing occurs, though,

⁸⁷ Which may be viewed as a waypoint along a path leading to a final destination with Christ in the afterlife.

⁸⁸ Scot McKnight, "Gospel and Rhetoric," Patheos, November 7, 2011, <https://www.patheos.com/blogs/jesuscreed/2011/11/07/gospel-and-rhetoric/>.

⁸⁹ Scot McKnight, *The King Jesus Gospel: The Original Good News Revisited* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2011), 28.

⁹⁰ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 113.

⁹¹ Barry S Cooper et al., "Weapon Focus in Sexual Assault Memories of Prostitutes," *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry* 25, no. 2 (April 2002): 181–91; Melissa Farley et al.,

something is needed to replace the negative forces that have been reduced or eradicated.

Holistic practitioners recognize the accommodating need for spiritual development.

Christocentric healers believe that Christ-centered changes are preferable.

Anti-Sex-Work Bias: Regarding prostitution and other “sex work” by adults who

allegedly exercise agency in these pursuits, I share the same antipathy addressed by *all*

the administrators interviewed for this study. Arguments that commercial sex practices

can somehow be empowering to participants and therefore necessitate legal protection

and regulation are unpersuasive to me.⁹² It can be demonstrated that in regions where

prostitution is legalized and regulated, the illegal varieties always flourish as well.⁹³

Regulation and healthcare benefits are never sufficient to compensate for the degradation

and holistic risks endured by the participants.⁹⁴ Participants in these scenarios

continually live in peril. The practices are never sufficiently sanitary, and women who

have been groomed from childhood to sell their bodies are not rationally culpable to

volunteer in these enterprises due to the adverse mental conditioning.⁹⁵ Their bodies and

“Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries,” *Journal of Trauma Practice* 2, no. 3–4 (January 2004): 33–74, https://doi.org/10.1300/J189v02n03_03; Allison Ward and Dominique Roe-Sepowitz, “Assessing the Effectiveness of Trauma-Oriented Approach to Treating Prostituted Women in a Prison and a Community Exiting Program,” *Journal of Aggression, Maltreatment & Trauma* 18, no. 3 (April 2009): 293–312, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10926770902809837>.

⁹² See, for example, the arguments of Teela Sanders, “Inevitably Violent? Dynamics of Space, Governance, and Stigma in Understanding Violence Against Sex Workers,” in *Special Issue: Problematizing Prostitution: Critical Research and Scholarship*, ed. Austin Sarat, Studies in Law, Politics & Society 71 (Bingley, UK: Emerald Group Publishing Limited, 2016), 93; Ronald Weitzer, “The Social Construction of Sex Trafficking: Ideology and Institutionalization of a Moral Crusade,” *Politics & Society* 35, no. 3 (September 2007): 447–75, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0032329207304319>; Ronald Weitzer, “The Mythology of Prostitution: Advocacy Research and Public Policy,” *Sexuality Research & Social Policy: A Journal of the NSRC* 7, no. 1 (March 2010): 15–29, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13178-010-0002-5>.

⁹³ Siddharth Kara, *Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery* (New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2009), 103–4.

⁹⁴ Mandi L. Burnette et al., “Prevalence and Health Correlates of Prostitution Among Patients Entering Treatment for Substance Use Disorders,” *Archives of General Psychiatry* 65, no. 3 (March 2008): 337–44, <https://doi.org/10.1001/archpsyc.65.3.337>; Farley et al., “Prostitution, Nine Countries”; Janice G. Raymond and Donna M. Hughes, “Sex Trafficking of Women in the United States: International and Domestic Trends,” Report (U.S. Department of Justice: Office of Justice Programs, March 2001), <https://dx.doi.org/10.3886/ICPSR03438>; Janice G Raymond, “Sex Work Dignifies Prostitution but Not Women,” *Viewpoint*, no. 5 (February 2011): 21–25.

⁹⁵ Susan Michele Foti, “Child Sexual Abuse as a Precursor to Prostitution” (Ph.D., Evanston, Illinois, Northwestern University, 1994),

psyches routinely experience abuses for which they were not sufficiently prepared, and from which they cannot adequately recover.⁹⁶ People who “choose” to mutilate their bodies as a means of releasing tension are rarely championed similarly. “Voluntary” prostitution should be regarded in the same manner as self-mutilators—they are harming themselves whether they recognize this or not, and the psycho-social baggage compelling them to embrace either practice should be identified and addressed. Legalizing and normalizing deviant practices may appease the consciences of a few—particularly the abusers—but it doesn’t alter the nature of the abuse. CSE will be viewed in this study as an evil that contaminates all participants.

2-7 Data Collection and Interview Transcriptions

2-7 a. Grounded Theory

I chose a Grounded Theory (GT) approach for analyzing my data because I genuinely did not have a strong preconception before embarking on the research regarding what I would discover about primary barriers to re-integration for CSE women. Barney Glaser, the “father” of Grounded Theory, remarks, “All that GT is, is the generation of emergent conceptualizations into integrated patterns, which are denoted by categories and their properties. This is accomplished by the many rigorous steps of GT woven together by the constant comparison process, which is designed to generate concepts from all data.”⁹⁷ I had a general idea of categories and major themes that would

<http://search.proquest.com/docview/304148688/abstract/94751587A2E04B2DPQ/1>; Ronald L. Simons and Les B. Whitbeck, “Sexual Abuse as a Precursor to Prostitution and Victimization Among Adolescent and Adult Homeless Women,” *Journal of Family Issues* 12, no. 3 (September 1991): 361–379.

<https://doi.org/10.1177/019251391012003007>; Wilson and Butler, “Running a Gauntlet,” 498.

⁹⁶ Courtney Cronley et al., “Entering Prostitution in Adolescence: History of Youth Homelessness Predicts Earlier Entry,” *Journal of Aggression, Maltreatment & Trauma* 25, no. 9 (October 2016): 893–908, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10926771.2016.1223246>; Doehring, *Internal Desecration*; Melissa Farley and Howard Barkan, “Prostitution, Violence, and Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder,” *Women & Health* 27, no. 3 (1998): 37–49, https://doi.org/10.1300/J013v27n03_03; Farley et al., “Prostitution, Nine Countries.”

⁹⁷ Barney G. Glaser, “Conceptualization: On Theory and Theorizing Using Grounded Theory,” *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 1, no. 2 (Spring 2002): 23, <https://doi.org/10.1177/160940690200100203>.

surface, since I had done some reading on secular rehabilitative approaches and experiences I had also interviewed some women from “The Life” while they were still enrolled in their program at a Christian rehabilitative program and was surprised at the time that they had focused on some areas that I had not anticipated and ignored others that I had expected them to zero in on. In that experience, I discovered that I had not gotten to know that “population” as well as I thought I had via the literature. Ancillary to that insight is the recognition that there can be no authentic “that population” but only a group of individuals who share some particular characteristics and traits, each possessing their own unique histories and narratives. My previous exposures had not precisely replicated the research I was endeavoring, and I considered that a GT approach would most likely provide me with the tools to process the phenomenon I would be observing with minimal bias.

The literature review undertaken in preparation for this project possessed the potential of biasing the theory emerging from my data collection prior to collection. Kathy Charmaz, a prominent contemporary GT theorist, noted that GT favors deferring the literary review until one has made his analysis.⁹⁸ By the time I recognized that principle, though, I had already read a large corpus of literature from both Christian and non-Christian sources. I tried to minimize existing biases by discontinuing any new reading on the subject until my interviews had all been completed and coded. Although absolute objectivity is elusive, I used the skills learned in my six years as a mental health therapist and the hundreds of hours I had logged as a crisis counselor as foils. Ultimately, “A GT approach theorizes the interpretive work that research participants do, but also

⁹⁸ Kathy Charmaz, *Constructing Grounded Theory*, 2nd Edition, Introducing Qualitative Methods (London: Sage, 2014), 306.

acknowledges that the resulting theory is an interpretation. The theory depends on the researcher's view; It does not and cannot stand outside of it.”⁹⁹

As I transcribed interviews, I wrote a series of memos to assist with interpretation of the data. The writing of memos is part of the analysis which helps to move the analysis forward and aids in the conceptualization of a theory.¹⁰⁰ The memos may vary in content in the degree of conceptualization, and in length depending on the phase of the research, the researcher's intent, and the materials being coded, as GT theorist Simon Hull noted.¹⁰¹ These also created a storehouse of analytic ideas that could be sorted, ordered and retrieved. Ideally, they serve to reveal concepts in need of further development and refinement.¹⁰² The memos become increasingly important as transcription ended and initial codes are developed. As Glaser noted, “Writing grounded theory requires a ‘write up’ of the theoretical sorting of memos.”¹⁰³

Simon Hull adds that the researcher should examine the data for evidence to support or refute his propositions and “... if our intuitions are supported by data then they can become clear statements of relationships or hypotheses to be checked later on.”¹⁰⁴ The researcher should ask, *What about the area of study seems most striking?*¹⁰⁵ Entering the participant's world of implicit meaning is a privilege in which you may experience previous shared moments.¹⁰⁶

⁹⁹ Charmaz, 98.

¹⁰⁰ Hull, Simon, “Doing Grounded Theory: Notes for the Aspiring Qualitative Analyst,” *University of Cape Town; Division of Geomatics*, December 13, 2013, 16, <https://doi.org/DOI:10.6084/m9.figshare.1050453.v1>.

¹⁰¹ Hull, Simon, 16.

¹⁰² Hull, Simon, 16.

¹⁰³ Barney G. Glaser, *Theoretical Sensitivity: Advances in the Methodology of Grounded Theory* (Mill Valley, CA: The Sociology Press, 1978), 116.

¹⁰⁴ Hull, Simon, “Doing Grounded Theory: Notes for the Aspiring Qualitative Analyst,” 20.

¹⁰⁵ Hull, Simon, 21.

¹⁰⁶ Charmaz, *Constructing*, 98.

GT pioneers Strauss and Corbin have written that if one follows this method, the... “Theory evolves during actual research and it does this through continuous interplay between analysis and data collection.”¹⁰⁷ Grounded theorists must stay active in the interview and alert for interesting leads.¹⁰⁸ During the interview and transcription process I employed constant comparative analysis to determine the most salient phenomena upon which to focus in the middle and final stages of the study. The presence of a female research assistant was also valuable not only in helping me to record the data, but also to interpret it and to help balance any gendered bias I might be reading into the data.

2-7 b. Interpreting the Data

“The most basic challenge in grounded theory building is to reconcile the need of letting categories emerge from the material of research ... with the impossibility of abandoning previous theoretical knowledge” writes GT theorist Udo Kelle.¹⁰⁹ To try to excavate an accurate depiction of the salient phenomena I adopted a constructivist approach of interpretation. An *objectivist* approach would have been appropriate if I were obtaining information about chronology, events and problems that the participant seeks to resolve.¹¹⁰ Using a constructivist approach, though, I concerned myself with “...eliciting the participants definition of terms, situations, and events and try(ing) to tap his/her assumptions, implicit meanings and tacit rules.”¹¹¹ I was not seeking information that might have been obtained by a simple biography or a survey. I wanted the humor of the respondents to emerge, as well as their agony and conflicted thoughts. I wished to

¹⁰⁷ Juliet Corbin and Anselm Strauss, *Basics of Qualitative Research: Techniques and Procedures for Developing Grounded Theory*, 3rd edition (Los Angeles, CA: SAGE Publications, 2007), 273.

¹⁰⁸ Charmaz, *Constructing*, 96.

¹⁰⁹ Udo Kelle, “‘Emergence’ vs. ‘Forcing’ of Empirical Data? A Crucial Problem of ‘Grounded Theory’ Reconsidered,” *Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 6, no. 2 (May 2005): 192.

¹¹⁰ Charmaz, *Constructing*, 95.

¹¹¹ Charmaz, 95.

observe how their eyes, their body language and demeanor informed the data in addition to their verbal disclosures. The manner in which they perceived the nuances of their experiences was important as well as how they regarded components of their narratives even during the course of the interviews. I allowed them to take their time, and to ramble if they chose to. As Charmaz reflects, the things they *don't* say—silences, tone, etc.—may be as important as what they say.¹¹² I didn't insist that every respondent answer every question. If the question made her squirm, that was instructive in its own right. I allowed them to weep if they wanted to, as long as Dr. Whitaker was not alarmed by the behaviors. I permitted them to be awkward at times and allowed for long silences to communicate messages their words could not.

A grounded theory interview can be viewed as an unfolding story which emerges as the interviewer and participant explore the topic together and imprint a human face upon it.¹¹³ I searched for a story line that was accurate and authentic in the lives of my respondents. Strauss and Corbin suggest the general approach to finding a good story line is "...to tell the story analytically."¹¹⁴ After the emerging data was constantly compared with subsequent interviews, I began to develop a hypothesis. If my intuitions were supported by data, they became clear statements of relationships or hypotheses that could be verified at a later juncture. The final theory was limited to those categories and subcategories, properties and dimensions, and statements of relationships for which verification in the data could be found.¹¹⁵

¹¹² Charmaz, 91.

¹¹³ Jaber F. Gubrium and James A. Holstein, *Handbook of Interview Research: Context & Method* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2002).

¹¹⁴ Corbin and Strauss, *Basics of Qualitative Research*, 120.

¹¹⁵ Hull, Simon, "Doing Grounded Theory: Notes for the Aspiring Qualitative Analyst," 20.

2-7 c. Coding the Data

Barney Glaser, the Father of Grounded Theory, urged fellow researchers to always “Study your emerging data.”¹¹⁶ As I analyzed data from prior sessions, I continually condensed findings to focus upon the most pressing concerns that had regularly resurfaced in the previous interviews. Coding is the process of breaking down, examining, comparing, conceptualizing, and categorizing the data.¹¹⁷ Charmaz states it is “...the pivotal line between collecting data and developing an emergent theory to explain the data.”¹¹⁸ As I compared data from each of the respondents, their remarks regarding their re-integration experiences began to reach something close to a saturation point, in which a limited number of categories began evolving to describe their experiences. Respondents often used different language to discuss phenomena that were common to their collective experiences. Further analysis and constant comparison between their remarks enabled me to narrow down the different experiences the respondents expressed into logical and concise categories.

GT theorist Susan Leigh remarks, “A code sets up a relationship with your data, and with your respondents.”¹¹⁹ It need not be complicated, Charmaz suggests, adding that GT researchers should “Remain open to what the material suggests and stay close to it.”¹²⁰ “Codes capture patterns and themes and cluster them under a ‘title’ that evokes a constellation of impressions and analyses for the researcher,”¹²¹ GT Theorist Lora Bex Lempert added.

¹¹⁶ Quoted in Charmaz, *Constructing*, 114.

¹¹⁷ Hull, Simon, “Doing Grounded Theory: Notes for the Aspiring Qualitative Analyst,” 10.

¹¹⁸ Charmaz, *Constructing*, 113.

¹¹⁹ Antony Bryant and Kathy Charmaz, eds., *The SAGE Handbook of Grounded Theory*, Paperback Edition (Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications Ltd, 2007), 80.

¹²⁰ Charmaz, *Constructing*, 120.

¹²¹ Bryant and Charmaz, *The SAGE Handbook of Grounded Theory*, 253.

The logic of GT coding differs from that of quantitative logic which applies preconceived categories or codes to the data.¹²² Journal articles and independent research positioned me to expect that some of the barriers respondents described might have to do with vocational matters, substance abuse, with people with whom the respondents kept company post-program, with their self-identities, and whether they were continuing in habits that had been taught to them. But they also brought up issues and situations I hadn't anticipated-- perspectives of which I had not been able to hear from previously. Mona, Summer and Ginger, for example, discussed their distrust of assigned mentors, indicating they suspected them of being insincere and voyeuristic. Shannon and Tia spoke of the temptations of promiscuous feelings, which previous research had indicated would not occur significantly among those who had been CSE. Complications also arose regarding marriages that had not been dissolved, and custody issues involving children who had been fathered by pimps.¹²³ Placing all their verbatim remarks side-by-side was fundamental to determining emerging patterns regarding the primary stumbling blocks the respondents discovered in their re-integration journeys as well as circumstances predicting the likelihood of their proclivities for flourishing.

When all the interviews had been transcribed, I began scouring them for patterns. This is consistent with Charmaz' admonition to "Remain open to all possible theoretical directions indicated by your reading of the data."¹²⁴ and to use more focused coding and pinpoint and develop the most salient codes as the data is analyzed. Strauss and Corbin speak about "Open Coding" in their 2007 work, but after eliminating components irrelevant to the subject of re-integration from my interviews I felt it was more accurate to label my initial finding as "Broad Codes." The relevant remarks fell into four broad

¹²² Charmaz, *Constructing*, 114.

¹²³ These will be explored further in Chapters 5 and 6.

¹²⁴ Charmaz, *Constructing*, 114.

categories, which was critical in determining how the most salient remarks interfaced with the re-integration journeys of the respondents. One group of remarks related to how their historical struggles reflected upon their current struggles. Although this information was important, it was only indirectly related to current obstacles to reintegration. It significantly influenced how their lives had developed chronologically from pre-exploitation through the end of their Program eras. The second two categories were the principal ones from which I obtained the most fundamental information about their current obstacles. The first of these consisted of discussions about the obstacles themselves as they perceived them to be. The other category was expressed in converse terms: That is, what was reported about their assets in community, or the components they identified as assisting them in flourishing. I placed these “Not-Obstacles” in a category called *Assets*. My fourth broad category was a leaner one having to do with identified responses that proved ambiguous. Respondents may have opined that these situations were not obstacles, but further reflection revealed narratives that were more complicated. The respondents may have here expressed ambivalence about how particular components had affected their lives, or they may have presented perspectives that appeared to be self-contradictory.

Strauss and Corbin suggest the purpose of open coding is to break apart the data in so that various dimensions and properties can be identified.¹²⁵ I established my four broad codes for that purpose, which prepared me for creating the theoretical codes inherent in the data. After that I developed specific categories that could be considered Substantive Codes. Simon Hull, drawing on the work of Glaser and Holton, and Kelle notes that “Substantive coding begins with open coding as codes related to the empirical

¹²⁵ Corbin and Strauss, *Basics of Qualitative Research*.

substance of the research domain are developed ad hoc.”¹²⁶ At that point I began achieving theoretical saturation, as no new properties or unique categories were being suggested from ongoing coding. Hull suggests that when this occurs

The researcher then moves to theoretical coding. Theoretical codes establish conceptual / hypothetical relationships between substantive codes and hence help to form theoretical models based on the theoretical concepts that the researcher brings into the data collection and analysis. They give the researcher integrative scope, broad pictures of the data, and a new perspective for analysis.¹²⁷

The hundreds of individual codes I identified and associated with various Substantive Codes would be called “Axial Codes” by Strauss and Corbin.¹²⁸ Glaser would focus upon Theoretical and Substantive Codes in analyzing the data.¹²⁹ Distinctions here are somewhat superficial, and less important than finding a rational scheme for interpreting the remarks from the seventeen respondents to discover possible recurring patterns. It is more critical to develop adequate responses to the following questions: *Do initial codes reveal patterns? Which of the codes best account for the data? What does comparison between codes indicate? Do your focused codes reveal gaps in the data?*¹³⁰

2-7 d. Analyzing the Language: Discourse Analysis

I utilized principles of Discourse Analysis in analyzing the language of the subjects. In discourse analysis, the details of speech, gaze, gesture and action are not only relevant in the situation at hand but are also relevant to the theory that develops from the interview.¹³¹ Unlike Content Analysis, the variables I as a researcher was looking for

¹²⁶ Hull, Simon, “Doing Grounded Theory: Notes for the Aspiring Qualitative Analyst,” 10.

¹²⁷ Hull, Simon, 10.

¹²⁸ Corbin and Strauss, *Basics of Qualitative Research*.

¹²⁹ Glaser, *Theoretical Sensitivity*.

¹³⁰ Charmaz, *Constructing*, 140–41.

¹³¹ James Paul Gee, *An Introduction to Discourse Analysis: Theory and Method* (New York, NY: Routledge, 1999), 88.

were not simply the verbal responses to a series of propositions. Within a language, grammatical structure allows for choices. If we think only about the meanings of isolated sentences, those choices can always seem arbitrary.¹³² We possess the capability to organize sentences numerous ways while retaining the meaning. It was critical therefore to keep in context remarks offered during interviews.

My ambition was to come optimally close to understanding the respondents' beliefs and attitudes concerning their re-integration journeys. Sometimes respondents stated their views as clearly as possible. Other times, they were still working out their beliefs in the discussions. Some of their thoughts were implied, not stated. Other times, various respondents used questioning tones to indicate that they were leaning towards a particular belief.

Discourse Analysis (hence DA) emphasizes the contextual meaning of language, rather than simply examining the words employed. Its focus is upon larger units of discourse rather than isolated words and sentences. It regards linguistic approaches to language beyond sentence grammar and considers issues of action and inaction. A DA approach takes non-verbal aspects of interaction into account in interpreting the meanings of what is discussed in conversation.¹³³

After hearing a respondent describe her narrative compellingly, I would allow her to remain in contemplative silences for long periods until she chose to resume the conversation. Dr. Whitaker and I were able to perceive eye contact or the diversion of their eyes when they spoke of struggling with promiscuous thoughts. We observed moments when respondents checked themselves awkwardly after they had spoken of

¹³² Barbara Johnstone, *Discourse Analysis*, 2nd Edition, Introducing Linguistics (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2008), 113.

¹³³ Ruth Wodak and Michael Meyer, eds., *Methods of Critical Discourse Studies*, Third edition (London ; Thousand Oaks, California: SAGE Publications Ltd, 2015), 2.

feeling exploited by interviewers wishing to hear details of their lives. Others wept as they recounted their stories, and while Dr. Whitaker was present in part to ensure they didn't become overly distraught or traumatized, we felt privileged when respondents trusted us to generously offer vulnerable remarks. Depths of meaning resided in the tentative suspicions, the silences and the weeping that couldn't be captured in mere transcriptions.

Barbara Johnstone, a leading authority on DA, suggests that an analyst must understand the social community from which the respondent is speaking and to evaluate their patterns of speech accordingly.¹³⁴ In our interactions with the respondents, Dr. Whitaker and I noted that the women generally were comfortable utilizing lingo with which most outsiders would be unfamiliar. Expressions such as “Bottom Girl”, “tricking” or being “A Trick”, “choosing up”, and “turning out” were ones I was familiar with from the literature I had immersed myself in. They also used language from the drug culture which was generally known to me, but not always. They answered patiently if we had questions, but occasionally because I didn't wish to disturb the narrative flow I neglected to ask if something was unclear.

Summer, for example, described how dumbfounded she is today that she was able to turn her life around so thoroughly. She used a synecdochal expression, stating that

I've done a whole 360 in my life. If you would've told me when I was in the streets that this is where I would be at, at this time in my life I would've told you, “No, you're wrong. Let me get a rock.” I wouldn't have believed it... Oh yes, I used to be a real big drug addict.¹³⁵

¹³⁴For example, New Yorkers who recognize one another will utilize shared jargon, expressions and mannerisms that might not make sense to those outside the group. Likewise, high school cliques may possess unique expressions and means of interacting. Johnstone, *Discourse Analysis*, 113.

¹³⁵ Summer. Interview with Timothy P. Robbins. Personal Interview. 9-27-2019

In transcribing, I played the recording back several times to make sure I was hearing her correctly. When Dr. Whitaker and I discussed it later, we recognized that Summer had previously been addicted to crack cocaine, so purchasing a rock for her indicated an escape from reality. It was important to understand this comment to characterize it as a remark addressing her satisfaction with her current life, notwithstanding its unfamiliar responsibilities and the meager wages she was earning at the time of the interview.

Although she had been exposed to particular luxuries in the past life, she had also been daily humiliated, sometimes beaten, and she could not believe her good fortune today. For social groups with whom I was more familiar, though, “Getting a rock” would indicate a diamond, or more specifically, an engagement ring. But contextually speaking, my default sociological meaning would have been nonsensical if applied to Summer’s narrative.

DA principles were also significant in indicating to me the way the subjects perceived power structures and social dynamics. Many respondents appeared to be very relaxed, and content to call Dr. Whitaker and me by our first names if they used our names at all. Some of them were obviously conscious of status issues, particularly the women who had gone to work for the Programs from which they graduated. Those women predominantly used “Sir” and other generally deferential language towards me and Dr. Whitaker. I also noted that the respondents who demonstrated high levels of developmental flourishing also referred to the administrators in their former programs as “Mr. Jared” and “Ms. Alicia.”

In a situation when Holly recounted her trauma responses, her deference to the interviewer sometimes synthesized uncomfortably with her desire to speak authentic truth in a revealing way. She had climbed the ladder to a prominent position in her

organization, and she speaks here of how the effects of trauma continue after more than a decade of freedom from exploitation:

I still have... I hope this isn't offensive to you, Mr. Robbins, but there are times when I'm in a restaurant... And I say to myself *that guy has totally molested his daughter*. Or I'm in church and... And I think *that worship pastor is totally abusing that girl*. And I don't know if that will ever get out of my head? I think it's some secondary trauma, too? Especially fathers and daughters, just because of all the stories I've heard.¹³⁶

The concern on Holly's face as she spoke and her observation indicating her self-consciousness about this admission in front of the male interviewer belies how deeply some of her paranoid thoughts continue to trouble her. In the context of her remarks, I surmised that she may easily have looked at me and had entertained that very thought ("Mr. Robbins looks like a molester") and became confounded in articulating her sentiments, wishing to accurately convey her daily struggles but perhaps feeling ashamed that this thought had occurred to her. Otherwise, her apology and remark that "*I hope this doesn't offend you...*" makes no sense. She had not stated anything aloud that could have been construed as offensive to me. She appeared to be conflicted with the presence of irrational thoughts while continuing to show deference to her guest, whom she rationally knew to be an ally. Though we had spoken several times before, once for over ninety minutes, she had only seen me face-to-face for the first time that morning, and my face may have triggered an unpleasant association.

The forms of the language the principal respondents utilized clearly were critical to hearing the content of the narratives they communicated. Similarly, their body language and the stories they chose to describe the phenomenon of transitioning into

¹³⁶ Holly, Personal Interview, September 6, 2019.

communities needed to be judiciously interpreted to recognize the greater narratives unfolding in their lives.

2-7 e. Flourishing Indices

After coding the remarks of the seventeen formerly CSE respondents interviewed for this project, two indices were developed to measure the degree to which these individuals flourished, measuring both spiritual flourishing and developmental flourishing. I developed these for the purposes of compiling and presenting comparable data. A list of eight criteria were established on the Spiritual Flourishing Index, and ten additional criteria were used for comparable assessment on the Developmental Flourishing Index. The respondents were assessed on a scale of 0-5 on each of the indices. Their responses were then added up to reflect their levels of flourishing on a scale of 0 to 100. An average of the two indices was determined to express overall flourishing levels reflected as percentages of 100%.

For each of the two flourishing indices, I examined the relevant comments which had been arranged according to four broad categories. I considered the overall story the participants had described for me in each of the two interviews and observed the contexts in which these issues had been discussed. The categories in the Flourishing Indices sometimes adhered closely to the language utilized in my questionnaire and interview questions, but often did not. For example, I had a question about Community (*#4: Tell me a little about your community supports—for example, where are the supportive people in your life from? What places do you go to for support, and how often do you find yourself going to these supportive places?*) and one about Identity (*#6: What was your identity like in the past, and how has that changed today?*) in my face-to-face questions. Sometimes the respondents could not recall the most representative examples at the time I asked those questions. While discussing other issues during the face-to-face interviews,

though, they divulged information related to their identities, or regarding people with whom they had been keeping company. The rearranged comments presented me with opportunities to find quotes or descriptions of situations relevant to the concerns in the flourishing indices.

Most of the participating women were not interviewed in their homes or at job sites but rather in professional offices or Program headquarters. The respondents' remarks were evaluated using Discourse Analysis principles. While I can verify that these views were expressed to me in context, it cannot be definitively established that their remarks accurately represent their post-Program lives in community. If a respondent did not appear to have offered insights on a particular principle represented in the index, that principle was not weighted into the final assessment determining her level of flourishing.

2-7 e-i. Developmental Flourishing Index

For an index assessing my CSE respondents' abilities to developmentally flourish in community, I have utilized principles from Bryant Myers' *Transformational Model of development*. Myers' best-known work, *Walking with the Poor*, provides understanding of the worldviews and realities of the impoverished in order to resource practitioners who will partner with them in transcending poverty.¹³⁷ Myers does not outline a comprehensive list of specific steps needed for engagement for transformational development to occur. He does, however, discuss numerous principles that lead to desirable goals among the recipients of the developmental process. The principles here are generated from chapters five and six of *Walking with the Poor*, culminating in a framework for transformation (Figure 6-6 on page 202). I have compiled a list of goals

¹³⁷ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*.

from these discussions. Issues that did not come up for discussion among my respondents and principles that would be too difficult to assess based upon my interactions with the women were not used in the assessment. I have assigned numerical values to these principles based upon the women's remarks and each evaluation is based upon direct quotes. The ten categories used for the developmental Flourishing Index are as follows:

1. No harm
2. Recovering true identity and vocation
3. Affirming the role of God
4. Affirming the agency of human beings
5. Maintaining just and peaceful relationships
6. Seeking truth, justice and righteousness
7. Recognition of pervasive evil
8. Addressing causes of having been CSE
9. Affirming the role of the church
10. Addressing sustainability

The inclusion of the categories “Affirming the role of God” and “Affirming the role of the church” may appear counterintuitive in the Developmental Index as these appear to be “spiritual” categories, and there is an entire index devoted to spiritual matters. The reason for this is because the index is meant to reflect the primary emphases revealed in *Walking with the Poor*. I affirm by their inclusion how Bryant Myers recognizes human flourishing to be a holistic phenomenon. Therefore, the categories embody social, psychological, spiritual and physical manifestations of flourishing. It would be remiss to eliminate religio-spiritual principles cited by Myers simply because they are covered elsewhere. A complete explanation of what these ten categories entail and how they were selected is found in Appendix 2-5.

2-7 e-ii. Spiritual Flourishing Index

What has been commonly called the “Lord’s Prayer” is found in Matthew 6:9–13 and Luke 11:2–4. This was used as a basis for finding measurable values by which to assess the holistic spiritual journeys of the respondents. Jesus did not offer the prayer as a method or a technique that his disciples were expected to enact or as a mantra for them to recite.¹³⁸ Rather it is a reliable guide for spiritual formation and a condensed treatise for promoting holiness.¹³⁹ Also called the “Disciples’ Prayer,” it can be viewed as a summary by which to identify variables measuring intentional Christian behavior, or a process known as *Christian Discipleship*.¹⁴⁰

In Matthew 28:18-20, Jesus admonished his disciples to be dispersed into the world to carry out his *euangelion*, or “Good news.”¹⁴¹ The term “discipleship” has proven useful to ministerial practitioners to describe the process of living out and developing one’s faith. Whether expositors prefer to focus upon corporate or individual responses to Christ’s commission, it is imperative that Christian character must be developed for Christianity to expand. One might inquire regarding *which* disciples are obligated to follow the framework of the Lord’s prayer, but the answer is self-evident. It has been provided, and recorded for posterity, for the benefit of all disciples.

As with all summaries, The Lord’s Prayer it is not comprehensive, but contains most of the key variables needed for the life of a disciple. If Christ has asked his disciples to pray in this way, this indicates a significant variable for daily guidance. Further, the global church has incorporated this passage of Scripture into their liturgy and worship more than any other biblical passage. Because the church recognizes the

¹³⁸ Haase, *Living the Lord’s Prayer*, 11.

¹³⁹ Haase, 14.

¹⁴⁰ Westerners have found this phrase useful, though, to describe the process of becoming one of Christ’s disciples. “*Mathetuo*” is a Greek verb having to do with students or apprentices who follow after a leader.

¹⁴¹ Partial parallels to this commission or also found in Mark 16: 15-16

enormous significance of the Prayer, it stands to reason that this would be an excellent starting point for assessing fidelity to Christian spirituality. The “Lord’s Prayer” provides a rudimentary framework to assess the commitment to discipleship for *any* group of people. Recorded with plural pronouns (*Our* Father...) the prayer appears to be especially meaningful in the discipleship process when used by a group who are bound together by a common purpose and identity.

New Testament scholar N.T. Wright sees the Prayer as a framework by which we might be able to observe and practice the character of Christ. It “...serves as a lens through which to see Jesus himself, and to discover something of what he was about.”¹⁴² William Willimon and Stanley Hauerwas write “...if you are asked, ‘Who is a Christian’ the best answer you can give is, ‘A Christian is none other than someone who has learned to pray the Lord’s Prayer.’”¹⁴³

I arrived at the notion of using the Lord’s Prayer as a framework for analyzing the progress of women who had been commercially sexually exploited not by a study of the Prayer, or by way of a search for an ideal frame of reference. Rather, it evolved from analysis of the responses I heard from CSE survivors in a previous study who had shared with me the things they felt they most needed to heal. To nobody’s surprise, they discussed a prerequisite of being able to physically sustain themselves. But also mentioned with similar frequency was the need for feeling safe. They expressed earnest longing that their captors and pimps would be unable to find them nor to threaten their families in any way. That was followed by discussions concerning the need to stay away from the cultures of drugs and alcohol that had enticed them in the past, and how they

¹⁴² Wright, N.T., *The Lord and His Prayer* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2014), 2.

¹⁴³ William H. Willimon, Stanley Hauerwas, and Scott C. Saye, *Lord, Teach Us: The Lord’s Prayer and the Christian Life* (Abingdon Press, 1996), 18.

had to be careful to avoid flirting with men and cultivating dishonest relationships, since they had expertly learned how to manipulate men in the past. This led to conversations about being free from fear and from historic bondages. Subsequently, they discussed ridding themselves of anger and hatred towards people who had horrifically abused them, as well as emptying their souls of the woundedness they had accrued through no faults of their own. As I continued to listen and to read other accounts of women who endured similar abuses, certain phrases started coming to mind: *Give us today our daily bread. Deliver us from the evil hour. Keep me from temptation. Your will be done on earth. Forgive me for the things I've done to others as well as for the things that have been done to me through no fault of my own. Yours is the power.* It occurred to me that I was hearing a familiar petitionary pattern that seemed to address the concerns they were expressing.

When a survivor authentically calls out to *Our Father* in earnest, at least two factors must be operative. To say “our,” she must be a participant in a group, indicating a web of relationships.¹⁴⁴ Yet, most of the associations which kept her in captivity must be severed for flourishing to occur. More so than with other demographics, these survivors must establish new networks to survive day-to-day life when integrating into new communities.

The scale I utilized to assess spiritual development among respondents was adopted from categories mentioned in the Lord’s Prayer that can be measured and evaluated in conjunction with respondents’ remarks. In categories where respondents were silent or unclear, respondents were not evaluated. The “silent” response was

¹⁴⁴ Nicholas Ayo, *The Lord’s Prayer: A Survey Theological and Literary* (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1992), 21–22.

removed from the weighted score of that respondent. Thus, it was possible for respondents to be evaluated upon only six or seven categories rather than upon the entire eight. The following are the categories of the Spiritual Flourishing Index:

1. Fellowship with believers
2. Redeemed identity
3. Engagement in outreach
4. Redemptive vocation
5. Embracing God's provision
6. Resisting immorality
7. Separation from evil
8. Acquiring spiritual momentum

A complete discussion on the content of the categories and how they were selected for use in the index can be found in [Appendix 2-6](#).

2-7 e-iii. Scoring the Indices

For every variable in the index, I isolated one or more quotes from each woman addressing that particular variable. After I had completed examining the rearranged comments, I returned to the entire two-interview document and scanned it to see if I could find more relevant information or if I might be misrepresenting the woman's view on a particular variable. If it was not apparent she had addressed the specific variable anywhere in the two interviews I eliminated that variable from her results and did not consider it in the assessment.¹⁴⁵

Behind every number assigned to each woman in each category are specific quotes or narratives addressing that variable. There is a degree of subjectivity to this, but this was likely mitigated over an eight- or ten- variable index. I preferred assigning evaluations of 5, 3 and 1 if they were either obviously flourishing in that area (5), or flourishing to an appreciable degree (3), or obviously failing to flourish (1). I found,

¹⁴⁵ Although there were ten categories in the first index (Developmental) and eight in the second (Spiritual), some of the women were evaluated based upon nine categories instead of ten, or upon how they had fared in seven categories instead of eight.

however, that some of their responses put them in a category that made it difficult to say whether they were doing quite well (5) or merely doing adequately (3), and in those cases I awarded a value of 4. Likewise, some of the women provided data to indicate that they were not doing very well in a particular category but were not entirely floundering either. In those situations, I awarded a value of (2). Under rare circumstances, I awarded a 0 in a situation where it was clear that a respondent was demonstrating virtually no flourishing propensity at all in a particular category. For a woman living in her car with her boyfriend actively pursuing drug addiction with no plan or apparent hope of pursuing employment, for example, it was not appropriate to give her merely a (1) under the value “No harm is being done to her.” She was living constantly in harm’s way, every day violating the principles and habits she had acquired during her year in the Program. A value of (0) was more accurate. Likewise, to say that she was doing “poorly” in outreach, or that she was doing “poorly” at establishing a redemptive vocation was less accurate than observing that there was no evidence of flourishing at all in these areas. She remarked that she was doing nothing at all to pursue a vocation but rather trying to find a way to make some quick cash every day in order to maintain an opiate high. She had no desire to enroll in another rehabilitation program, she remarked, because she didn’t want to give up the intoxicated sensations, and rehab would not change that for her. She was not doing anything to reach out to other addicts or to try to advance the agenda of any other individual. She confessed to actively resisting help. Therefore, she was awarded (0) in these categories, rather than a (1) which would merely indicate failure. Charts 2-1 (a and b) and 2-2 (a and b) reveal how each respondent was evaluated in each category.

Chart 2-1: Spiritual Flourishing Index

2-1a	Alanna	Ginger	Holly	Jamie	Kelsey	LaDonna	Louise	Melody	Mona
FELLOWSHIP WITH BELIEVERS	3	1	3	4	2	5	4	5	2
REDEEMED IDENTITY	5	1	5	5	2	5	5	5	2
ENGAGEMENT IN OUTREACH	4	0	5	n/a	1	5	3	n/a	3
REDEMPITIVE VOCATION	5	0	5	4	3	5	5	5	4
EMBRACING GOD'S PROVISION	5	1	5	5	4	5	5	4	2
RESISTING IMMORALITY	5	0	5	3	2	4	4	4	3
SEPARATION FROM EVIL	4	0	4	3	3	5	5	3	3
ACQUIRING SPIRITUAL MOMENTUM	5	1	4	4	1	5	4	5	5

2-1b	Patti	Sadie	Scarlett	Shannon	Summer	Theresa	Tia	Yvette
FELLOWSHIP WITH BELIEVERS	5	5	5	4	1	5	4	2
REDEEMED IDENTITY	5	4	5	4	2	4	5	2
ENGAGEMENT IN OUTREACH	5	5	3	2	1	5	4	0
REDEMPITIVE VOCATION	3	4	5	4	4	5	5	2
EMBRACING GOD'S PROVISION	3	4	5	3	4	5	3	2
RESISTING IMMORALITY	4	4	4	4	3	5	2	2
SEPARATION FROM EVIL	4	5	4	3	4	5	3	2
ACQUIRING SPIRITUAL MOMENTUM	5	5	5	4	3	5	4	3

Chart 2-2: Developmental Flourishing Index

2-2a	Alanna	Ginger	Holly	Jamie	Kelsey	Louise	LaDonna	Melody	Mona
NO HARM	5	0	5	3	3	3	4	3	3
IDENTITY & VOCATION	5	1	5	5	2	5	5	5	2
ROLE OF GOD	4	3	4	5	3	4	5	4	4
AGENCY OF HUMANS	4	2	4	5	4	5	5	4	5
APPROPRIATE RELATIONSHIPS	5	2	5	n/a	2	4	5	4	4
SEEKING RIGHTEOUSNESS	4	1	4	3	2	n/a	5	4	n/a
RECOGNIZING EVIL	5	3	5	3	4	n/a	3	4	2
ADDRESSING CAUSES	5	3	5	5	3	4	5	4	3
ROLE OF CHURCH	3	2	3	1	2	3	5	5	3
SUSTAINABILITY	5	1	5	5	3	4	5	5	2

2-2b	Patti	Sadie	Scarlett	Shannon	Summer	Theresa	Tia	Yvette
NO HARM	4	3	5	3	3	3	2	2
IDENTITY & VOCATION	3	5	5	5	2	5	5	2
ROLE OF GOD	4	4	5	4	2	5	5	3
AGENCY OF HUMANS	3	5	4	5	4	4	5	5
APPROPRIATE RELATIONSHIPS	2	5	5	3	2	5	4	2
SEEKING RIGHTEOUSNESS	n/a	5	3	3	1	5	n/a	n/a
RECOGNIZING EVIL	3	5	4	5	3	5	4	4
ADDRESSING CAUSES	2	5	5	5	4	5	3	4
ROLE OF CHURCH	5	3	5	3	1	4	5	4
SUSTAINABILITY	2	3	5	4	3	4	5	2

In this chapter I have provided an overview of how the research was conducted.

The forms of the language the principal respondents utilized was viewed as critical in hearing the content of the narratives they communicated. Their body language and the

stories they chose to describe the phenomenon of transitioning into communities needed to be judiciously interpreted to recognize the greater narratives unfolding in their lives. The manner and protocol in which the interviews were conducted was established. The transcribing, interpreting, coding and assessing of the remarks of the principal respondents have been revealed.

In the next chapter, I discuss the bodies of literature utilized to provide context and further broaden the reader's perspectives regarding what is already known about the phenomenon of women exiting CSE networks, enrolling and completing Christocentric programs, and moving into new situations in the communities of their choosing. This will provide a contextual lens by which to analyze the respondents' understanding of the obstacles they have encountered. Because the respondents frequently spoke of historical circumstances interfering in their current situations which conditioned them for negative outcomes, I will begin by first discussing the background factors that have made them a unique population who experience difficulties embracing lifestyles free from exploitation. After that, I survey literature documenting some of the obstacles noted by psychologists, sociologists, legal scholars and theologians. We will hear from women who have been CSE and from those who have provided care to those who have abandoned or tried to leave exploitative networks. Because my interest is in providing ministerial resources to this population including exposure to the Gospel, I summarize evangelism and discipleship principles relevant to the CSE demographic. Because my interviews and many interlocutors have demonstrated the critical need for strong socio-spiritual support for women when they leave their previous lifestyles, I end with a section on the nature of Christian community and why this is a critical component in the reintegration of those who wish to remain free from CSE networks after they have completed Christocentric rehabilitation.

Chapter 3: What Story? A Review of the Literature

The corpus of literature enabling me to discover obstacles to flourishing for CSE women meeting research criteria could be perceived as massive or miniscule depending on one's perspective. It is massive because surplus ink has been spilled in recording and analyzing concerns involving what has been referred to as human sex trafficking, prostitution, sex work, adult entertainment and other designations. Available literature specifically focused upon the precise demographic group noted here is miniscule at best, though. The interviews I conducted and the indices created were the principal reservoirs of information used to explain the phenomenon of reintegration into communities for the CSE group. In addition to those, however, I disseminated a wide variety of resources referencing this phenomenon even if the sources only reflected small pieces of the puzzle. The articles and books used in this purpose came from the fields of sociology, psychology, theology and missiology and sometimes from the criminal justice field.

My review of the most significant literature supplementing the interviews was not completed until after analysis and coding of the interviews had concluded. Grounded theorists suggest that researchers try to set aside previous knowledge as best as they can when seeking an explanation for the phenomena they are exploring¹⁴⁶, and I followed this methodology to the best of my ability. After having discovered primary obstacles impeding and assets promoting flourishing, I recognized that *han*-related concerns required me to consider many of the antecedents to the respondents' years of exploitation. In addition to that, data from the interviews enabled me to recognize how a poverty-like grip was prominent among this population, also influenced by baggage that had been accumulated due to social, spiritual, physical and psychological conditioning. I was

¹⁴⁶ Kathy Charmaz, *Constructing Grounded Theory*, 2nd Edition., Introducing Qualitative Methods (London: Sage, 2014), 306.

therefore compelled to include literature drawing parallels between my respondents and other populations. Finally, when I examined the data revealing the vital need for social relationships among my respondents, as Mansson and Hedin had indicated, I undertook further research from sociologists and theologians regarding the substance and significance of establishing and maintaining community. Most of this literature came from the theologians, however, who have from the first century written about the requirement of *one-anothering* in the context of developing an enduring strain of horizontal faith which came to be known as *ekklesia*, or the church. The literature review concludes, therefore, with theological perspectives on the essential need for establishing redemptive community among those who are interested in pursuing Christian faith.

3-1 Faith-based Approaches to Rescue, Rehabilitation and Reintegration

3-1 a. Ethics and Agency

Although it is not necessary to present extensive documentation of approaches to rescuing and rehabilitating exploited women, some context and acknowledgement of Christian perspectives on engaging this population and alternative viewpoints are helpful in presenting a full picture of the work performed by Christocentric rehabilitative programs. To this end, a brief biblical basis undergirding the rationale for rescuing is included in Appendix 3-1.

Women who have been CSE have in the past been stigmatized by relatives and others in their communities who are familiar with their background or perceived as individuals to be scorned due to extreme choices they have made to procure above-average incomes that require few skills.¹⁴⁷ Contemporary research, however, reveals that what may present as compliance or even enthusiasm for commercial sex activities is

¹⁴⁷ Sallmann, "Living with Stigma"; Ariel Wolf, "Stigma in the Sex Trades," *Sexual & Relationship Therapy* 34, no. 3 (August 2019): 290–308, <https://doi.org/10.1080/14681994.2019.1573979>.

often not what it appears to be.¹⁴⁸ It is clear that girls are groomed for these activities before they are able to provide informed consent.¹⁴⁹ This phenomenon is frequently reported as occurring in response to manipulation of young women who believe their pimps maintain genuine romantic interests in them and in their well-being.¹⁵⁰ Other individuals are kidnapped outright in scenarios that precisely adhere to the phenomenon commonly referred to as “Human Sex Trafficking.”¹⁵¹

3-1 b. Endemic Violence

The commerce of humans results in violence towards those individuals.¹⁵² This is normative when one coalition devalues another to the degree that they would market their

¹⁴⁸ Elaine Chase and June Statham, “Commercial and Sexual Exploitation of Children and Young People in the UK—A Review,” *Child Abuse Review* 14, no. 1 (January 2005): 4–25.

¹⁴⁹ Chris Bagley and Loretta Young, “Juvenile Prostitution and Child Sexual Abuse: A Controlled Study,” *Canadian Journal of Community Mental Health* 6, no. 1 (April 1, 1987): 5–26, <https://doi.org/doi:10.7870/cjcmh-1987-0001>; Mimi H. Silbert and Ayala M. Pines, “Victimization of Street Prostitutes,” *Victimology* 7, no. 1–4 (1982): 122–33; Celia Williamson and Michael Prior, “Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking: A Network of Underground Players in the Midwest,” *Journal of Child & Adolescent Trauma* 2, no. 1 (March 2009): 46–61, <https://doi.org/10.1080/19361520802702191>.

¹⁵⁰ Mark Clayton, “Girls Entering Sex Trade May Say It’s a ‘Choice’...,” *Christian Science Monitor* 88, no. 203 (September 13, 1996): 10; M. Alexis Kennedy et al., “Routes of Recruitment: Pimps’ Techniques and Other Circumstances That Lead to Street Prostitution,” *Journal of Aggression, Maltreatment & Trauma* 15, no. 2 (November 2007): 1–19, https://doi.org/10.1300/J146v15n02_01; Rachel Lloyd, *Girls Like Us: Fighting for a World Where Girls Are Not for Sale, a Memoir* (New York, NY: Harper Perennial, 2012).

¹⁵¹ Alexis A. Aronowitz, *Human Trafficking, Human Misery: The Global Trade in Human Beings* (Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers, 2009); Kevin Bales and Zoe Trodd, eds., *To Plead Our Own Cause: Personal Stories by Today’s Slaves* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2008); Karen Beeks and Delila Amir, eds., *Trafficking and the Global Sex Industry*, Program in Migration and Refugee Studies (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2006); Maria Ivanna De Angelis, “Human Trafficking: Women’s Stories of Agencies” (Ph.D. Thesis, Kingston upon Hull, University of Hull, 2012), <https://ethos.bl.uk/OrderDetails.do?uin=uk.bl.ethos.613460>; Gary Haugen and Victor Boutros, *The Locust Effect: Why the End of Poverty Requires the End of Violence* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014); Kennedy et al., “Routes of Recruitment”; Nicholas D. Kristof and Sheryl WuDunn, *Half the Sky: Turning Oppression into Opportunity for Women Worldwide*, First (New York NY: Vintage Books, 2009); Andrea Parrot and Nina Cummings, *Sexual Enslavement of Girls and Women Worldwide* (Westport, CT: Praeger, 2008); Jesse Sage and Liora Kasten, *Enslaved: True Stories of Modern Day Slavery* (New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006); Sheldon X. Zhang, *Smuggling and Trafficking in Human Beings: All Roads Lead to America* (Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers, 2007).

¹⁵² Melissa Farley, “Prostitution and the Invisibility of Harm,” *Women & Therapy* 26, no. 3/4 (September 2003): 2003, https://doi.org/10.1300/J015v26n03_06; Wendy Freed, “From Duty to Despair: Brothel Prostitution in Cambodia,” *Journal of Trauma Practice* 2, no. 3/4 (July 2003): 133–46, https://doi.org/10.1300/J189v02n03_07; Sharvari Karandikar and Moises Prospero, “From Client to Pimp: Male Violence against Female Sex Workers,” *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 25, no. 2 (January 1, 2010): 257–73, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260509334393>; Kristof and WuDunn, *Half the Sky*; Anita Raj et al., “Violence Against Women Associated with Arrests for Sex Trade but Not Drug Charges,” *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry* 29, no. 3 (May 2006): 204–11.

bodies to dangerous and unpredictable ends. Gender Studies and legal researcher Susan Hunter summarizes many of these findings in her essay, “Prostitution is Cruelty and Abuse to Women and Children.”¹⁵³ “Prostitution is unwanted sex. It is sex that she says, ‘yes’ to, but it is the kind of ‘yes’ that is uttered under circumstances devoid of choice,” she writes, providing corroborating documentation.¹⁵⁴ Street-level prostitution seems to be the most dangerous by many accounts.¹⁵⁵ When women are trafficked on the streets “A mismatch between a worker’s appraisal and the customer’s true intent may result in threats, harm, assault, or murder. Because a worker can never, with all certainty, know a customer’s intentions, a level of vulnerability is always present,”¹⁵⁶ the author observes. But other forms of CSE are reported to be just as dangerous by the participants.¹⁵⁷ The rates for murder of CSE women compared to other populations is astronomical. One study found homicides to be eighteen times the rate of women who are not CSE, or 229 per 100,000,¹⁵⁸ which is a conservative estimate considering other findings that were 3-4 times higher.¹⁵⁹

¹⁵³ Susan Hunter, “Prostitution Is Cruelty and Abuse to Women and Children,” *Michigan Journal of Gender & Law* 1, no. 1 (January 1, 1993): 91–104.

¹⁵⁴ Hunter, 95.

¹⁵⁵ Dalla, Xia, and Kennedy, “Just Give Them What They Want”; Nabila El-Bassel et al., “Sex Trading and Psychological Distress Among Women Recruited the Streets of Harlem,” *American Journal of Public Health* 87, no. 1 (January 1997), <https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.87.1.66>; Farley, “Invisibility of Harm”; Farley and Barkan, “Prostitution, Violence”; Ine Vanwesenbeeck et al., “Professional HIV Risk Taking, Levels of Victimization, and Well-Being in Female Prostitutes in The Netherlands,” *Archives of Sexual Behavior* 24, no. 5 (October 1995): 503–15, <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01541831>; Celia Williamson and Gail Folaron, “Understanding the Experiences of Street Level Prostitutes,” *Qualitative Social Work: Research and Practice* 2, no. 3 (September 2003): 271–87, <https://doi.org/10.1177/14733250030023004>.

¹⁵⁶ Williamson and Folaron, “Understanding the Experiences,” 280.

¹⁵⁷ Dalla, Xia, and Kennedy, “Just Give Them What They Want”; Corita Grudzen et al., “Pathways to Health Risk Exposure in Adult Film Performers,” *Journal of Urban Health* 86, no. 1 (January 2009): 67–78; Jody Raphael and Deborah L. Shapiro, “Violence in Indoor and Outdoor Prostitution Venues,” *Violence Against Women* 10, no. 2 (February 2004): 126–39, <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077801203260529>.

¹⁵⁸ John J. Potterat et al., “Mortality in a Long-Term Open Cohort of Prostitute Women,” *American Journal of Epidemiology* 159, no. 8 (April 2004): 778–85, <https://doi.org/10.1093/aje/kwh110>.

¹⁵⁹ Farley et al., “Prostitution, Nine Countries”; C. Gabrielle Salfati, Alison R. James, and Lynn Ferguson, “Prostitute Homicides: A Descriptive Study,” *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 23, no. 4 (April 2008): 505–43, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260507312946>; Wilson and Butler, “Running a Gauntlet.”

Numerous CSE interview subjects have called their work “paid rape”¹⁶⁰ which is thought to be hyperbole by activists who advocate for greater legitimacy and protection for what they consider to be the “sex work” industries.¹⁶¹ But even minimizing reported instances of rape in which the respondents disclose being forced to do things they hadn’t agreed to, or men who use them for agreed-upon sex and then refuse to pay, the reports of CSE women being raped in incidents unrelated to their customer’s demands is prolific.¹⁶² In the most extensive study of its kind, 854 individuals (mostly women, but also including males and transgendered individuals) were interviewed in nine countries. As an aggregate, the incidence of rape was reported by 57% of these respondents, the majority of whom (59%) stating it had occurred five or more times.¹⁶³ When focusing solely on American incidences in San Francisco, Farley and Barkan found this statistic to be much higher.¹⁶⁴ Researcher Jennifer Su adds that if prostitutes who were exclusively female had been sequestered for this study, the incidence of violence would have been higher still “...since male and transgender prostitutes appear to experience less violence than female prostitutes.”¹⁶⁵ Girls who had been CSE interviewed for a Silbert and Pines

¹⁶⁰ Rachel Moran, *Paid For: My Journey Through Prostitution*, First edition (New York, N.Y.: W. W. Norton & Company, 2015), 112; Janice G. Raymond, “Prostitution as Violence Against Women: NGO Stonewalling in Beijing and Elsewhere,” *Women’s Studies International Forum* 21, no. 1 (February 1998): 1–9, [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0277-5395\(96\)00102-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0277-5395(96)00102-1); Melissa Farley and Vanessa Kelly, “Prostitution,” *Women & Criminal Justice* 11, no. 4 (August 2000): 29–64.

¹⁶¹ Ronald Weitzer, “Sociology of Sex Work,” *Annual Review of Sociology* 35, no. 1 (2009): 214, <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-soc-070308-120025>.

¹⁶² Farley and Barkan, “Prostitution, Violence”; Farley et al., “Prostitution, Nine Countries”; Hunter, “Prostitution Is Cruelty”; Mimi H. Silbert and Ayala M. Pines, “Occupational Hazards of Street Prostitutes,” *Criminal Justice and Behavior* 8, no. 4 (December 1981): 395–99, <https://doi.org/10.1177/009385488100800401>; Roberto J. Valera, Robin G. Sawyer, and Glenn R. Schiraldi, “Perceived Health Needs of Inner-City Street Prostitutes: A Preliminary Study,” *American Journal of Health Behavior* 25, no. 1 (Jan/Feb2001): 50–59, <https://doi.org/10.5993/ajhb.25.1.6>; Jeremy M. Wilson and Erin Dalton, “Human Trafficking in the Heartland: Variation in Law Enforcement Awareness and Response,” *Journal of Contemporary Criminal Justice* 24, no. 3 (August 2008): 296–313, <https://doi.org/10.1177/1043986208318227>.

¹⁶³ Farley et al., “Prostitution, Nine Countries,” 33–74.

¹⁶⁴ Farley and Barkan, “Prostitution, Violence,” 37–49.

¹⁶⁵ Jennifer Y. Su, “Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health of Women Exiting the Sex Industry” (Ph.D., Virginia, USA, Regent University, 2012), 35, ProQuest Dissertations Publishing.

study reported they are raped at the rate of about ten times a year.¹⁶⁶ Research by Susan Hunter revealed that about 78% of trafficked women had also reported being raped, averaging 4-9 times per year.¹⁶⁷

3-1 c. Disparate Views

Researchers resistant to Christocentric interventions have indicated they believe narratives regarding the harm done to women who have been CSE to be alarmist and overwrought.¹⁶⁸ They express strong disapproval of the work of Christocentric organizations in emancipating and rehabilitating women who have been CSE. Their claim is that those who advocate for helping women escape from CSE or prostitution networks do so out of false belief in a “oppression paradigm.”¹⁶⁹ Indeed, many of them would likely challenge the use of the term “exploited” used here as well as the premise of this research. A summary of their views is found in Appendix 3-2.

My own views as a seminary educator desiring to work for a world where impoverished and oppressed people may embrace abundant lives can be summarized in Matthew 7:12. Here Jesus notes that his followers should treat others as they would wish to be treated. It is self-evident that observant Christians would never want their mothers, daughters, sisters or wives to be sexually exploited and wouldn't therefore wish this upon any individuals or groups. This perspective is explored further in the previously cited Biblical Basis for Rescuing in Appendix 3-1. Data demonstrating that physical-, psychological, social and spiritual damages incurred by those engaged in these practices

¹⁶⁶ Mimi H. Silbert, “Prostitution and Sexual Assault: Summary of Results,” *International Journal of Biosocial Research* 3, no. 2 (1982): 471.

¹⁶⁷ Hunter, “Prostitution Is Cruelty.”

¹⁶⁸ Kamala Kempadoo, Jyoti Sanghera, and Bandana Pattanaik, eds., *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered: New Perspectives on Migration, Sex Work, and Human Rights* (Boulder, CO: Paradigm Publishers, 2012); Weitzer, “The Mythology of Prostitution.”

¹⁶⁹ Weitzer, “Social Construction”; Ronald Weitzer, “Sex Trafficking and the Sex Industry: The Need for Evidence-Based Theory and Legislation,” *Journal of Criminal Law & Criminology* 101, no. 4 (Fall 2011): 1337–69; Weitzer, “The Mythology of Prostitution.”

are pervasive are cited elsewhere in this chapter. Practices proven injurious to recipients are considered as evil in a Christian worldview.

3-2 Survivors Perspectives

3-2 a. Narratives from Formerly CSE Women and Their Caregivers

A study of this nature is incomplete without 1) the voices of women have experienced this phenomenon firsthand, and 2) those who have assisted them as they transition from former communities where they were positioned into new communities. The personal interviews conducted for this study with CSE women who had completed Christocentric rehabilitation were foundational to understanding the challenges confronting them. The narrated memoirs of other women who have experienced similar phenomena also indicate that there was little “choice” or agency involved in the elaborate webs of vice and manipulation resulting in the exploitation of these particular agents.¹⁷⁰

Fallen: Out of the Sex Industry and Into the Arms of the Savior by Annie Lobert and *Purchased: Leaving the Sex Trade* by Deanna Lynn share themes of spiritual transformation in Christ as primary catalysts in helping the subjects reintegrate.¹⁷¹ Both of these autobiographies touch upon failures the authors experienced in maintaining new sexual values they had established for themselves even after leaving CSE networks as well as the influence which controlling men had upon them during their initial post-exploitation years. Both authors also discussed the need to receive emotional healing

¹⁷⁰ These experiences are also reflected in my research. In a private interview, one of the authors disclosed to me, “Since my mom showed me porn movies when I was six and assured me it was natural to watch because that is how I was made, I pretty much knew in first grade that would be my fate.” One of my interview subjects known as Kelsey revealed that her mom was involved in “The Life” and had her accompany her on “dates” where she would personally teach Kelsey the tricks of the trade in depraved tag-team scenarios. Another respondent I called Patti reported that an uncle began regularly transporting her to the loading docks in her city to have her service men there beginning when she was only six years old. See, for example: Bales and Trodd, *To Plead Our Own Cause*; Sage and Kasten, *Enslaved*; Kristof and WuDunn, *Half the Sky*.

¹⁷¹ Annie Lobert, *Fallen: Out of the Sex Industry and Into the Arms of the Savior* (Worthy Publishing, 2015), 202; Deanna Lynn, *Purchased: Leaving the Sex Trade* (Alpaca Love Productions, 2019).

from their traumatic experiences in addition to their struggles to downsize from lives that had included abundant materialistic excess. A unique contribution Lobert made was her emphasis on forgiving those who had harmed her including a pimp who had beaten her mercilessly on numerous occasions.¹⁷² She noted how regardless of the reality that great harm had been inflicted upon her, *she* had also caused harm to numerous others on her journey. She noted that instead of pointing fingers, every individual should consider looking within themselves to identify and ask forgiveness for debts they have incurred upon others.¹⁷³

In *Girls Like Us: Fighting for a World in Which Girls are Not for Sale*, author Rachel Lloyd draws upon her own experience to reinforce the narrative of how a controlling man can coax a woman who has previously been under his control back into a compromising relationship, even years after she has been free from exploitative networks.¹⁷⁴ Like Lobert, the author was impacted by what she had experienced in her early years to the degree that she began an organization in a large American metropolis to assist others in rehabilitation and reintegration.¹⁷⁵

Several administrators have published autobiographical works about their experiences caring for CSE women, such as Mary Frances Bowley's *The White Umbrella* in which the author shares narratives of women and girls she has worked with, resulting in the founding of Wellspring Living in the Atlanta area.¹⁷⁶ Bowley discusses the need for reliable community to ensure stability for clients who have never experienced this in

¹⁷² Lobert, *Fallen*, 176–77.

¹⁷³ Lobert, 178.

¹⁷⁴ Lloyd, *Girls Like Us*. This will be further explored in Chapter 4, which focuses upon administrators of Programs

¹⁷⁵ Lobert's organization *Hookers for Jesus* and its rehabilitational facility *Destiny House* were incorporated in Las Vegas in 2005. Lloyd founded Girls Education and Mentoring Service (GEMS) in New York in 1998 when she was 23 years old. Unlike Lobert's organization, it focuses on underaged girls, and is not specifically faith-based.

¹⁷⁶ Mary Frances Bowley, *The White Umbrella: Walking with Survivors of Sex Trafficking* (Moody Publishers, 2012).

the past. Her organization teamed up with the Atlanta Mission in providing numerous services to meet the needs of their local sexually exploited population. "...Collaborating in the best interest of sex trafficking survivors sends a new message to a girl: Her new community is different, and this new community recognizes her value," she writes. "It shows her that while people of her past may have used her, this new community exists to serve her."¹⁷⁷ As Wellspring expanded its ministry to include adult women who had been likewise exploited, they have maintained their ethic of attempting to keep former clients connected to affirming community agents who will continue to walk them through the reintegration process after they have graduated from their Programs.

Similarly, Vanderbilt professor and Episcopal priest Becca Stevens discusses events leading to her founding of the rehabilitational facility Magdalen and the anti-exploitation organization Thistle Farms in Nashville in her memoir *Snake Oil: The Art of Healing and Truth-Telling*.¹⁷⁸ She recounts how her rehabilitational facility was structured to facilitate the healing power of love, with the goal of creating an environment where her clients can be creative, practical, and joyful. Her desire is for the women she serves not only to feel safe in community but that they would also be empowered to follow their instincts towards healing.¹⁷⁹ The essential oils produced by survivors and made commercially available at her Nashville facility become metaphors for the healing she wishes to facilitate through her ministry.

¹⁷⁷ Bowley, 154.

¹⁷⁸ Becca Stevens, *Snake Oil: The Art of Healing and Truth-Telling* (New York, NY: Hachette Book Group, 2013). Previously mentioned were autobiographical works by Annie Lobert and Rachel Lloyd, both of whom were emancipated from years of CSE and went on to found organizations focused upon helping girls and women with similar life experiences to abandon and remain free from exploitative networks.

¹⁷⁹ Stevens.

None of the narratives regarding the founding of rehabilitational ministries provides extensive details about the organizations they founded.¹⁸⁰ The individual websites for these organizations were the best sources for finding policy information. But the conversations conducted and recorded with the administrators of those organizations proved to be essential in describing the authentic ground-level activities of the Programs referenced here.

The authors of *Transitional Housing Facilities for Women Leaving the Sex Industry: Informed by Evidence or Ideology?* believe that survivors' narratives are exaggerated, and as such they provide valuable skeptical feedback.¹⁸¹ They reported that the organizations for whom they conducted website content analysis seemed to reveal "...conflation of transactional sex with sex trafficking, dominance by Christian organizations, race-neutral approach, and depiction of their clients as uneducated and socially isolated."¹⁸² Researchers on this project found the majority of Programs for CSE survivors to be too simplistic, ideologically driven and poorly informed on issues such as cultural differences and insufficiently neutral on the morality of sex work.

3-2 b. Survivors' States of Mind

Firsthand accounts by women reintegrating into communities have reported experiencing degradation since they were children or adolescents. The woundedness they inherited may be related to childhood sexual abuse and other traumas.¹⁸³ Melissa Farley,

¹⁸⁰ Bowley, *The White Umbrella*; Lobert, *Fallen*; Lloyd, *Girls Like Us*; Lobert, *Fallen*; Stevens, *Snake Oil*.

¹⁸¹ Susan Dewey, Jennifer Hankel, and Kyria Brown, "Transitional Housing Facilities for Women Leaving the Sex Industry: Informed by Evidence or Ideology?," *Sexuality & Culture* 21, no. 1 (March 2017): 74–95, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12119-016-9379-5>.

¹⁸² Dewey, Hankel, and Brown, 75.

¹⁸³ Evelyn Abramovich, "Childhood Sexual Abuse as a Risk Factor for Subsequent Involvement in Sex Work: A Review of Empirical Findings," *Journal of Psychology & Human Sexuality* 17, no. 1–2 (2005): 131–46, https://doi.org/10.1300/J056v17n01_08; Richard J. Estes and Neil Alan Weiner, "The Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children in the U.S., Canada and Mexico" (Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania, September 19, 2001), <https://doi.org/10.3886/ICPSR03366.v1>; Foti, "Child Sexual Abuse as Precursor"; Marilyn Ganje-Fling et al., "Effects of Childhood Sexual Abuse on Client

after having conducted several hundred interviews with CSE women, warns that the harm done to women often appears to be invisible.¹⁸⁴ Counseling is mandated during their rehabilitation but needs to continue after reintegration to address the complex trauma and other psychological damage incurred from years in The Life.¹⁸⁵

Women who have successfully abandoned CSE networks have reported feeling as if they were on the losing end of Jesus' proclamation in Matthew 13:12: "Whoever has will be given more, and they will have an abundance. Whoever does not have, even what they have will be taken from them." In *Breaking the Matthew Effect: On Women Leaving Prostitution* researchers Mansson and Hedin¹⁸⁶ base their research upon personal interviews with over 200 women. They discovered that about a third of the women with whom they spoke after exiting The Life found themselves unemployed, questioning their decisions, and wondering why their prospects in life appear to be dismal.¹⁸⁷ The subjects noted that it seemed there were only meager rewards apportioned to them for all the effort it has taken to establish a "Square Life."¹⁸⁸ While younger people who get early starts on their careers seem to be miles ahead, they observed how men who had perpetrated crimes and degradation against them continue to have prosperous lives.

Spiritual Well-Being," *Counseling and Values* 44, no. 2 (January 2000): 84–92; Donna Kane, Sharon E Cheston, and Joanne M Greer, "Perceptions of God by Survivors of Childhood Sexual Abuse: An Exploratory Study in an Underresearched Area," *Journal of Psychology & Theology* 21, no. 3 (1993): 228–37; Susan M. Nadon, Catherine Koverola, and Eduard H. Schludermann, "Antecedents to Prostitution: Childhood Victimization," *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 13, no. 2 (April 1998): 206–21, <https://doi.org/10.1177/088626098013002003>; Mimi H. Silbert and Ayala M. Pines, "Sexual Child Abuse as an Antecedent to Prostitution," *Child Abuse & Neglect* 5, no. 4 (1981): 407–11, [https://doi.org/10.1016/0145-2134\(81\)90050-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/0145-2134(81)90050-8).

¹⁸⁴ Farley, "Invisibility of Harm."

¹⁸⁵ Hedin and Månsson, "Importance of Supportive Relationships," 231–33.

¹⁸⁶ Sven-Axel Månsson and Ulla-Carin Hedin, "Breaking the Matthew Effect - On Women Leaving Prostitution," *International Journal of Social Welfare* 8, no. 1 (January 1999): 67.

¹⁸⁷ Månsson and Hedin, 70.

¹⁸⁸ A life that is on the level. A person engaged in this life earns their money legitimately, free from substance abuse and CSE networks and has become established in a particular community. It may be a relatively boring life which may or may not integrate spiritual formation. The point of a Square Life is that it is relatively free from negative drama, starting with a separation from illegal or manipulative activities. This term was best articulated to me by the administrator from the West Program, who also spent many years being CSE.

In a dissertation for the School of Psychology and Counseling at the evangelical Regent University, psychology researcher Jennifer Su writes from a Christocentric perspective of how incidences of complex trauma brought on by violence and serial sexual abuse also complicates the outlook and spiritual responses of women even after they have exited from CSE networks.¹⁸⁹ Because the abuses have been prolific and habitualized, women cannot simply “get over it” and move on with their lives.¹⁹⁰ Many of them have been adhering to the code of “You just give them what they want and pray they don’t kill you.”¹⁹¹ They still possess diverse concerns requiring further reflection if they wish to avoid relapse.

In “You Can’t Hustle all your Life” researchers R. L. Dalla, et al. discovered only a minority of the 43 participating women had met their goals of staying clean from substance abuse and not returning to The Life by the end of their study.¹⁹² A majority of these respondents vacillated back and forth between exploitation and attempts to escape exploitative lifestyles, without finding much success at maintaining the *Square Life*. When their peer groups continued to be dominated by people who were also involved in addictions, unstable families and relational discord, a majority of the subjects were not able to achieve and maintain high levels of emotional and economic flourishing. Sobriety and ongoing emancipation from exploitation requires tenacity and a supportive

¹⁸⁹ Su, “Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health.”

¹⁹⁰ Melanie Abas et al., “Risk Factors for Mental Disorders in Women Survivors of Human Trafficking: A Historical Cohort Study,” *BMC Psychiatry* 13, no. 1 (September 2013): 1–12, <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-244X-13-204>; Di Tommaso et al., “As Bad as It Gets”; El-Bassel et al., “Sex Trading and Psychological Distress”; Robert Grant, “Spirituality and Trauma: An Essay,” *Traumatology* 5, no. 1 (March 1999), <https://doi.org/10.1177/153476569900500103>; Michelle R. Kaufman and Mary Crawford, “Sex Trafficking in Nepal: A Review of Intervention and Prevention Programs,” *Violence Against Women* 17, no. 5 (May 2011): 651–65, <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077801211407431>; Oselin, “Weighing the Consequences”; Cathy Zimmerman et al., “The Health of Trafficked Women: A Survey of Women Entering Posttrafficking Services in Europe,” *The American Journal of Public Health* 98, no. 1 (January 2008): 55–59, <https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2006.108357>.

¹⁹¹ Dalla, Xia, and Kennedy, “Just Give Them What They Want.”

¹⁹² R. L. Dalla, “‘You Can’t Hustle All Your Life’: An Exploratory Investigation of the Exit Process Among Street-Level Prostituted Women,” *Psychology of Women Quarterly* 30, no. 3 (September 2006): 276–90, <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-6402.2006.00296.x>.

community.¹⁹³ People who have been subjected to violent- and sexualized traumas require healing and reliable emotional support in order to properly acclimate in community.¹⁹⁴

3-2 c. Navigating Stigmatization

Women who have been commodified and commercially exploited possess surplus stigma, regardless of whether they were complicit in any of the sexual activities into which they were co-opted.¹⁹⁵ They experience prolific spiritual confusion affecting relationships and levels of trust with new people who may be allowed into their lives. Shame often permeates their cognitive responses. The stigma surrounding an already-stigmatized population makes things worse when they are trying to heal and move into new communities.¹⁹⁶ They are often fearful of others finding out about their past, or insecure

¹⁹³ Cascio, “Leaving ‘The Life’”; Hedin and Månsson, “Importance of Supportive Relationships”; Hickie, “Getting Out”; Long, “State of Aftercare”; Nancy Romero-Daza, Margaret Weeks, and Merrill Singer, “‘Nobody Gives a Damn If I Live or Die’: Violence, Drugs, and Street-Level Prostitution in Inner-City Hartford, Connecticut,” *Medical Anthropology* 22, no. 3 (September 2003): 233–60, <https://doi.org/10.1080/01459740306770>; Valandra, “Reclaiming Their Lives and Breaking Free: An Afrocentric Approach to Recovery From Prostitution,” *Affilia: Journal of Women & Social Work* 22, no. 2 (2007): 195–208, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0886109907299052>.

¹⁹⁴ Allender, *The Wounded Heart*; Abas et al., “Risk Factors for Mental Disorders in Women Survivors of Human Trafficking”; Linda DeRiviere, “A Human Capital Methodology for Estimating the Lifelong Personal Costs of Young Women Leaving the Sex Trade,” *Feminist Economics* 12, no. 3 (July 1, 2006): 367–402, <https://doi.org/10.1080/13545700600670434>; El-Bassel et al., “Sex Trading and Psychological Distress”; Oselin, “Weighing the Consequences”; Zimmerman et al., “Health of Trafficked Women.”

¹⁹⁵ Jason Brown et al., “Challenges Faced by Women Working in the Inner City Sex Trade,” *Canadian Journal of Urban Research* 15, no. 1 (Summer 2006): 36–53; Lois A. Jackson, Carolyn G. Bennett, and Barbara A. Sowinski, “Stress in the Sex Trade and Beyond: Women Working in the Sex Trade Talk About the Emotional Stressors in Their Working and Home Lives,” *Critical Public Health* 17, no. 3 (September 2007): 257–71, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09581590701549535>; Kaufman and Crawford, “Sex Trafficking in Nepal”; Thanh-Tu Nguyen, Christian R Bellehumeur, and Judith Malette, “Women Survivors of Sex Trafficking: A Trauma and Recovery Model Integrating Spirituality,” *Counseling et Spiritualité* 33, no. 1 (2014): 111–33, <https://doi.org/10.2143/CS.33.1.3044833>; Sallmann, “Living with Stigma”; Miyuki Tomura, “A Prostitute’s Lived Experiences of Stigma,” *Journal of Phenomenological Psychology* 40, no. 1 (May 2009): 51–84, <https://doi.org/10.1163/156916209X427981>.

¹⁹⁶ Joan M. Blakey and Alana Gunn, “The ‘Ickiness Factor’: Stigma as a Barrier to Exiting Prostitution,” *Journal of Offender Rehabilitation* 57, no. 8 (December 2018): 538–61, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10509674.2018.1549177>; Cecilia Benoit et al., “Prostitution Stigma and Its Effect on the Working Conditions, Personal Lives, and Health of Sex Workers,” *Journal of Sex Research* 55, no. 4/5 (June 2018): 457–71, <https://doi.org/10.1080/00224499.2017.1393652>; Hilary L. Surratt et al., “Sex Work and Drug Use in a Subculture of Violence,” *Crime & Delinquency* 50, no. 1 (January 2004): 43–59, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011128703258875>; Wolf, “Stigma in the Sex Trades.”

about what the neighbors know and how their secrets will impact others.¹⁹⁷ They entertain questions regarding why God permitted or caused the events of their lives, and whether the Deity stigmatizes them.¹⁹⁸ “The preponderance of evidence gathered from research studies reviewed above strongly suggests that prostituted persons, particularly women and girls, tend to demonstrate poorer psychological adjustment than people who have never traded sex for money or material goods,” writes Jennifer Su.¹⁹⁹

If the subjects are to be successfully reintegrated into their communities, they must navigate through the emotional and psychological damages incurred. Their overall abilities to overcome reintegration obstacles and to thrive in the communities where they have chosen to live will be indelibly affected by how they have processed the exploitation they are abandoning. They experience shorter life spans due not only to excessive homicides, but also attributed to suicides, high occurrences of AIDS and venereal diseases, and drug overdoses.²⁰⁰ Traumatic responses may be buried beneath optimistic exteriors, as CSE women become experts in role-playing. Due to the excessively high incidences of mental health disorders, though, they also require extensive mental health care before embarking on further major life adjustments.²⁰¹

3-3 Barriers to Overcome as Identified by CSE Women

Having laid the literary foundation for barriers that CSE women are likely to encounter on their reintegration journeys, the spotlight now shifts to discussions of the barriers themselves as identified by numerous literary sources. Deficits do not occur in

¹⁹⁷ Jackson, Bennett, and Sowinski, “Stress in Sex Trade,” 266.

¹⁹⁸ Doehring, *Internal Desecration*; Herman, *Trauma and Recovery: Aftermath*; Rudolphsson and Tidefors, “I Have Cried to Him a Thousand Times.”

¹⁹⁹ Su, “Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health,” 84.

²⁰⁰ Stuart Brody et al., “Psychiatric and Characterological Factors Relevant to Excess Mortality in a Long-Term Cohort of Prostitute Women,” *Journal of Sex & Marital Therapy* 31, no. 2 (April 2005): 97, <https://doi.org/10.1080/00926230590477943>.

²⁰¹ Brody et al., “Psychiatric and Characterological Factors”; Farley, “Invisibility of Harm”; Farley and Barkan, “Prostitution, Violence”; Su, “Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health”; Valera, Sawyer, and Schiraldi, “Perceived Health Needs.”

vacuums. They are the results of various components working aggregately in the complex environments of individuals engaged in complex lifestyles. As holistic beings, factors affecting one arena of their lives significantly reverberates in other arenas.

3-3 a. Psychological Trauma and Mental Health

In in the prominent 1998 article, “*Prostitution, Violence, and Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder*” Melissa Farley and Howard Barkan brought the psychological travails of CSE women to the attention of sociologists, feminists, psychological researchers and those in the helping professions. In 2004, Farley edited a widely read volume of evidence-based essays focused upon the latest research on the psychological effects of CSE women and men across the globe.²⁰² Mental illnesses, especially PTSD, were revealed to be normative among these populations. From a collective assessment of CSE individuals in nine countries, she found that 68% of victims met the criteria for diagnoses of PTSD.²⁰³ Although recitation of percentages inevitably varies due to the specificity of those contexts, her principal findings regarding the inevitability of harm have been affirmed by numerous other studies in the medical, psychological and sociological fields.²⁰⁴ Other emotional and mental illness- related concerns are rampant in this population.²⁰⁵

²⁰² Melissa Farley, *Prostitution, Trafficking, and Traumatic Stress*, First Edition (Binghamton, NY: Routledge, 2004).

²⁰³ Farley et al., “Prostitution, Nine Countries.”

²⁰⁴ Lara B. Gerassi and Andrea J. Nichols, *Sex Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation: Prevention, Advocacy, and Trauma-Informed Practice* (New York: Springer Publishing Company, 2018); Amanda Roxburgh, Louisa Degenhardt, and Jan Copeland, “Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Among Female Street-Based Sex Workers in the Greater Sydney Area, Australia,” *BMC Psychiatry* 6 (January 2006): 1–12, <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-244X-6-24>; Su, “Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health”; Valera, Sawyer, and Schiraldi, “Perceived Health Needs.”

Abas et al., “Risk Factors for Mental Disorders in Women Survivors of Human Trafficking”; Brody et al., “Psychiatric and Characterological Factors”; El-Bassel et al., “Sex Trading and Psychological Distress”; Jackson, Bennett, and Sowinski, “Stress in Sex Trade”; Surratt et al., “Sex Work and Drug Use”; Ine Vanwesenbeeck, *Prostitutes’ Well-Being and Risk* (Amsterdam: VU University Press, 1994).

²⁰⁵ Abas et al., “Risk Factors for Mental Disorders in Women Survivors of Human Trafficking,” 1–12.

In the *Wounded Heart of God*, theologian Andrew Sung Park's explains how the residual effects of sin upon marginalized people have contributed to their marginalization. Although he doesn't focus specifically on a female CSE population, his theological discussions on the effects of wrongdoing against marginalized peoples is revealing.²⁰⁶ The accumulated transgressions of others have historically adhered to wounded parties. This woundedness may present like collapsed feelings of pain, he writes, "...like a black hole forcing people to submerge their pain."²⁰⁷ The passive form manifests itself in a kind of resignation. Individuals in this condition descend into a kind of self-denigration. They often take revenge against themselves..."²⁰⁸ as in self-sabotaging.

Western theology has focused upon the justification of sinners, while neglecting the *responsibilities* that sinners bear towards their victims, Park surmises. Protestants have been trained in the church to focus on repentance to God; Far fewer discussions are initiated on the social dimension, and repentance towards others, he adds.²⁰⁹ CSE women wishing to utilize Christian teaching in their rehabilitation and reintegration may become frustrated in their degradation and woundedness if they are directed to focus upon their own sinfulness rather than observing churches call for contrition and restitution from the parties responsible for their oppression.²¹⁰

3-3 b. Physical Health

²⁰⁶ On a chapter concerning the structure of *han*, Park mentions Jews in particular, but especially Holocaust victims as having experienced the residual effects of collective despair. He also discusses the Chinese after the Tiananmen Square massacre, victims of child molestation, and Koreans after the occasions of numerous atrocities. He points to the blues music arising out of the African-American experience and the melancholic nature of Jewish music as lamentations arising from the passive side of the internal agonies of wounded populations. Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 34–41.

²⁰⁷ Andrew Sung Park, *The Wounded Heart of God: The Asian Concept of Han and the Christian Doctrine of Sin* (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1993), 17.

²⁰⁸ Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 34.

²⁰⁹ Park, 89.

²¹⁰ Park, 89.

Possession of poor physical health is a barrier to flourishing for anyone in any of life's circumstances. It bears particular mention here because the components of a sexually exploited existence causes not only poor psychological health to escalate, but poor physical health as well. A neglected and misunderstood variable in the reintegration of CSE women is the reality that violence and other poor habits don't merely affix themselves to women who are trafficked, but they also create circumstances profoundly complicating proclivities to transitioning into community.

Women co-opted into CSE networks experience high levels of exposure to AIDS and sexually transmitted diseases. They are surrounded by agents who possess little concern for them beyond protecting what they consider to be their commodities. Further, they are ensconced for prolonged seasons in lifestyles in which they are either too lethargic or incapable of properly caring for their own medical well-beings.²¹¹ Numerous beatings are routine within this population.²¹² The effects of this treatment can permanently imprint both the physical and psychological arenas.

²¹¹ D. L. Cohan et al., "Health Indicators Among Low Income Women Who Report a History of Sex Work: The Population Based Northern California Young Women's Survey," *Sexually Transmitted Infections* 81, no. 5 (2005): 428–33; Farley, "Invisibility of Harm"; Kristof and WuDunn, *Half the Sky*; Steven P. Kurtz et al., "Barriers to Health and Social Services for Street-Based Sex Workers," *Journal of Health Care for the Poor and Underserved* 16, no. 2 (May 2005): 345–61, <https://doi.org/10.1353/hpu.2005.0038>; Zimmerman et al., "Health of Trafficked Women."

²¹² Sarah Crocke, "Stripping Agency from Top to Bottom: The Need for a Sentencing Guideline Safety Valve for Bottoms Prosecuted Under the Federal Sex Trafficking Statutes," *Northwestern University Law Review* 111, no. 3 (June 2017): 753–91; Dalla, Xia, and Kennedy, "Just Give Them What They Want"; Farley, "Invisibility of Harm"; Farley et al., "Prostitution, Nine Countries"; Kendra Nixon et al., "The Everyday Occurrence: Violence in the Lives of Girls Exploited Through Prostitution," *Violence Against Women* 8, no. 9 (September 2002): 1016–43, <https://doi.org/10.1177/107780120200800902>; Jody Raphael, *Listening to Olivia: Violence, Poverty, and Prostitution*, Northeastern Series on Gender, Crime, and Law (Boston, MA: Northeastern University Press, 2015), <http://ezproxy.asburyseminary.edu/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=e000xna&AN=1083324&site=eds-live>; Raphael and Shapiro, "Violence Indoor Outdoor"; Silbert and Pines, "Occupational Hazards"; DominiqueE. Roe-Sepowitz, Kristine Hickie, and Andrea Cimino, "The Impact of Abuse History and Trauma Symptoms on Successful Completion of a Prostitution-Exiting Program," *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment* 22, no. 1 (January 2012): 65–77, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10911359.2011.598830>; Linda A. Smith, Samantha Healy Vardaman, and Melissa A Snow, "The National Report on Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking: America's Prostituted Children" (Arlington, VA: Shared Hope International, 2009), https://sharedhope.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/09/SHI_National_Report_on_DMST_2009.pdf; Surratt et al., "Sex Work and Drug

Substance abuse is a normative phenomenon co-occurring with CSE. A substantial portion of the commercial sex aspect originates in the circumstances of addicted girls and women seeking to earn incomes sufficient to support their habits.²¹³ In other instances, women report that narcotics and alcohol are needed to divert them from the degradations of their daily routines. They were either compelled, encouraged or desirous to alter their states of consciousness as direct consequences of being CSE.²¹⁴

3-3 c. Financial Adjustments

Teela Sanders notes how in studies she was privy to "...It was not necessarily negative attitudes toward the job or clients that motivated workers to leave but other concerns such as long-term financial stability, the unregulated nature of the industry, and worries about HIV/AIDS."²¹⁵ A woman interviewed for a qualitative study on the habits of women being CSE in Hartford, Connecticut lamented,

People like myself who have AIDS or the virus, we may be unable to get a job...they're testing. Even a McDonald job is asking to test you even to clean the floors, you

Use"; Valera, Sawyer, and Schiraldi, "Perceived Health Needs"; Wilson and Dalton, "Human Trafficking in the Heartland."

²¹³ Ross J. Clarke et al., "Age at Entry into Prostitution: Relationship to Drug Use, Race, Suicide, Education Level, Childhood Abuse, and Family Experiences," *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment* 22, no. 3 (March 2012): 270–89, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10911359.2012.655583>; Susan Dewey et al., "Control Creep and the Multiple Exclusions Faced by Women in Low-Autonomy Sex Industry Sectors," *Vibrant Virtual Brazilian Anthropology (Online)* 17 (November 2020): e17457, <https://doi.org/10.1590/1809-43412020v17d457>; Jessica M Edwards, Carolyn T Halpern, and Wendee M Wechsberg, "Correlates of Exchanging Sex for Drugs or Money Among Women Who Use Crack Cocaine," *Aid Education and Prevention* 18, no. 5 (2006): 420–29, <https://doi.org/10.1521/aeap.2006.18.5.420>; Romero-Daza, Weeks, and Singer, "'Nobody Gives a Damn If I Live or Die.'"

²¹⁴ Linda Cusick and Matthew Hickman, "'Trapping' in Drug Use and Sex Work Careers," *Drugs: Education Prevention and Policy* 12 (October 2005): 369–79, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09687630500226779>; DeRiviere, "Human Capital Methodology"; El-Bassel et al., "Sex Trading and Psychological Distress"; Kramer, "Prostitution: Why Women Enter"; Kurtz et al., "Barriers to Health"; Long, "State of Aftercare"; Janice G Raymond et al., "Comparative Study of Women Trafficked in the Migration Process," Report (U.S. Department of Justice: Office of Justice Programs), accessed June 4, 2020, <http://action.web.ca/home/catw/attach/CATW%20Comparative%20Study%202002.pdf>; Surratt et al., "Sex Work and Drug Use"; Krishna Vaddiparti et al., "The Effects of Childhood Trauma on Sex Trading in Substance Using Women," *Archives of Sexual Behavior* 35, no. 4 (August 2006): 451–59, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10508-006-9044-4>; Amy Young, Carol Boyd, and Amy Hubbell, "Prostitution, Drug Use, and Coping with Psychological Distress," *Journal of Drug Issues* 30, no. 4 (Fall 2000): 789–800, <https://doi.org/10.1177/002204260003000407>.

²¹⁵ Teela Sanders, "Becoming an Ex-Sex Worker: Making Transitions Out of a Deviant Career," *Feminist Criminology* 2, no. 1 (January 2007): 76, <https://doi.org/10.1177/1557085106294845>.

understand what I'm saying? So what jobs can we get? Who's going to really give us a job? It ain't like I don't want to work-- give me a job, I will work. But I have this problem where if I get a cut or anything, you cannot touch me. You understand?²¹⁶

It is unsurprising that women who have lived on the margins of society for prolonged timeframes experience financial difficulties when they attempt to transition into lifestyles antithetical to the ones they recently abandoned. Whether or not they had been permitted to keep most of their earnings when they were CSE, their finances are ordinarily handled by others. The rules change for them when they establish new lifestyles. Programs such as the ones that will be referenced in Chapter 4 are important not simply to supply them with new environments and resources, but also to socially- and emotionally prepare them to re-enter the work, ideally with newly acquired social- and professional skills.²¹⁷

Sociologist Sharon Oselin's research on CSE women included her inquiries into what she labelled "Prostitute Service Organizations" (PSO's). She reported that an overwhelming majority of the women in the organizations she analyzed had not finished high school at the time of their interviews:

80 percent had not earned a high school diploma, 12.5 percent had, and one woman had an Associate's degree in nursing prior to entering prostitution. A lack of educational attainment puts them at a serious disadvantage as they attempt to transition out of sex work and into legal professions. Recognizing this fact, the PSOs strongly encouraged clients to return to school and earn their degrees, as it elevates their chances of employment and increases their self-esteem and self-efficacy.²¹⁸

²¹⁶ Romero-Daza, Weeks, and Singer, "Nobody Gives a Damn If I Live or Die," 243.

²¹⁷ Judith Lewis Herman, "Hidden in Plain Sight: Clinical Observations on Prostitution," *Journal of Trauma Practice* 2, no. 3/4 (July 2003): 1-13; Hickie, "Getting Out"; Becca C. Johnson, "Aftercare for Survivors of Human Trafficking," *Social Work & Christianity* 39, no. 4 (Winter 2012): 370-89; Long, "State of Aftercare"; Zimmerman et al., "Health of Trafficked Women."

²¹⁸ Oselin, *Leaving Prostitution*, 153.

Further complicating this situation, many employers will not hire felons, and the social stigma associated with their recently departed lifestyles may further limit work opportunity or result in discrimination.²¹⁹ Many have difficulty adopting proper workplace habits, as this may have not been modelled for them in the past. Job-hopping is normative for this population.²²⁰

3-3 d. Social adjustments

Swedish researchers Ulla-Carin Hedin and Sven Axel Månsson conducted qualitative interviews with 23 women who had left the sex trade between 1985 and 1995. The women's family histories did not equip them with adequate models for close relationships. Sexual exploitation, emotional rejection, and parents' relationship problems all had negative effects on their self-confidence and upon their abilities to form appropriate attachments.²²¹ Yet it has been demonstrated that strong social supports are essential for successful transition.²²²

Many CSE women reported that bearing children filled their lives with new meaning. According to Hedin and Mansson

Someone needed them and required their care and attention. At the same time, the women were quite fragile in the marginal situation following the breakaway. Several described great difficulty during their child's infancy when they needed considerable support and help from their networks in order to cope with the stress.²²³

When women were being sexually exploited, they established strong subcultural ties with other women who were involved in parallel situations. This created powerful "Us against them" cultures enabling them to better endure the degradation. Both positive and

²¹⁹ Hickle, "Getting Out," 24.

²²⁰ Williamson and Folaron, "Understanding the Experiences."

²²¹ Hedin and Månsson, "Importance of Supportive Relationships," 228.

²²² Dalla, "You Can't Hustle All Your Life"; Valandra, "Reclaiming Their Lives."

²²³ Hedin and Månsson, "Importance of Supportive Relationships," 230.

negative developments evolved from this camaraderie. The subjects were acquainted with many other women who genuinely understood what they were enduring. On the other hand, the vast majority of their intimate acquaintances were women with similar limitations and lifestyle habits, which made exiting more difficult.²²⁴ During the breakaways, they often alluded to engagement between two worlds-- the one they want to leave and the one they want to join. Both worlds filled them with ambivalence and insecurity. Sometimes, the women endeavored to repair earlier, positive relationships, in which the foundations of trust, understanding, and communication already existed.²²⁵

The sentiments expressed among the CSE women interviewed for this current study were similar to those in the Swedish study. Some of the subjects discussed the hardships their children imposed, and others conveyed grief associated with having partners or social services confiscating their children. The narrative threads regarding how the responsibility of taking care of their children had also *enhanced* their lives was also consistent across the two studies.

3-3 e. Legal Complexities

Women from the USA who have been domestically CSE face two commonly recurring legal situations. The first involves their children in the custody of others. Sometimes this is due to drug addiction and subsequently failing to embrace the responsibilities of taking care of the children or having had custody rescinded.²²⁶ A further complicating factor is that they often bear children with men who have abused them and pimped them out. This may result in further complications in that those

²²⁴ Hedin and Månsson, 230.

²²⁵ Hedin and Månsson, 231.

²²⁶ Margaret A. Baldwin, "Living in Longing: Prostitution, Trauma Recovery, and Public Assistance," *Journal of Trauma Practice* 2, no. 3/4 (July 2003): 267–314; Hedin and Månsson, "Importance of Supportive Relationships"; Sallmann, "Living with Stigma"; Sanders, "Becoming an Ex-Sex Worker."

particular men wield power over the women and are often dangerous.²²⁷ Additionally, the women may still retain strong romantic or ambivalent feelings towards these men. Sharing custody could be devastating for the mother and children and having to communicate constantly with the former pimp or john who impregnated her could place her safety at risk, resulting in retraumatization or coercion back into exploitation.²²⁸ In an article discussing how trauma and public assistance access have affected CSE women, Law Professor Margaret Baldwin notes,

If the father is the survivor's pimp, the survivor may fear retaliation from him if he discloses his name, loss of her child to Child Protective agencies if she discloses the nature of his relationship to her, or loss of the benefits if she declines to cooperate at all. If she suspects that the father is a john, she may have no idea who he is or where to find him. And she may fear losing her child if she discloses why she has so little information to offer.²²⁹

The second prominent legal complication characterizing this population is that they frequently possess arrest records.²³⁰ This may be linked to substance abuse disorder or to survival. Partially due to rampant homelessness in the population, they may have acquired shoplifting and theft charges. Some of them have been arrested for prostitution or soliciting charges as well, although this is becoming less normative as law enforcement recognizes the Trafficking in Victims Protection Act.²³¹ Regardless, another ubiquitous theme expressed by CSE women is that they accepted penalties for the

²²⁷ Another of my subjects, Alanna, had two children with her pimp. She testified against him, and he had been locked up during the time she has been free from CSE. She told me that she was able to keep his name off the birth certificate. But she wondered aloud about the future: "He's really possessive... I don't know. We'll see. It's been seven years, so it's one of those things... He might just forget about it. So he's going to go on his way? Or he's going to pick it back up again and get weird about it. But I've just got to... Trust the Lord that he's brought me this far, and he's going to continue to protect me.

²²⁸ Baldwin, "Living in Longing"; Lloyd, *Girls Like Us*.

²²⁹ Baldwin, "Living in Longing," 311.

²³⁰ Crocke, "Stripping Agency"; Kurtz et al., "Barriers to Health"; Williamson and Prior, "Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking."

²³¹ Crocke, "Stripping Agency"; Maureen A. Norton-Hawk, "The Counterproductivity of Incarcerating Female Street Prostitutes," *Deviant Behavior* 22, no. 5 (September 2001): 403–17, <https://doi.org/10.1080/01639620152472804>.

behaviors of their pimps.²³² While expungement of criminal records is possible, it is never guaranteed. Those who are victimized by their pimps may discover they are doubly exploited in having to retain in their reintegrated lives charges that cannot be legally refuted.

3-3 f. Religio-spiritual Factors

In this study, particular emphasis has been placed upon the spiritual journeys of CSE women. Humans are holistic beings. A dysfunction in one sphere of a person's life will affect her entire reality. Spiritual growth is integrated with growth in other spheres of her life. Notwithstanding, the spirit is not the body, and the body is not the psyche. Spiritual growth is a significant personal component regardless of whether a respondent describes herself in conspicuously religious or spiritual terms. Some victims of sexual assault have reported that their past traumas have been catalysts for growth.²³³ Some of the administrators interviewed for this study believed that the women who had a religious upbringing did better in faith-based programs of rehabilitation. The administrator from a Christocentric Rehab facility in the southern U.S. reported:

The ones who do have the childhood faith and are coming from a Christian background tend to do a little bit better. There is an exception that I see though sometimes. And I haven't measured this. But sometimes when I see somebody's raised in a Christian home and then has gone into this Life for some reason or another—usually drugs—there's a deeper depression that I see.²³⁴

Other administrators stated that having Christian backgrounds hindered many of the clients enrolled in their programs. The reasons expressed for this most often fall into one of two categories: 1) Many of them were believed to have been wounded by churches—either because they had been sexually abused in church environments or because they

²³² Sallmann, "Living with Stigma."

²³³ Rudolfsson and Tidefors, "I Have Cried to Him a Thousand Times," 910.

²³⁴ Deep South Program, Personal Interview, February 15, 2019.

felt they had been judged harshly by churches or by church-going people. 2) Numerous survivors of sexual abuse have expressed incredulity regarding the concept that a loving God who would allow their lives to have been exceedingly difficult and cruel.²³⁵ No studies could be located specifically exploring barriers relating to religion or spirituality of women reintegrating into communities after being CSE. Similar studies conducted on other traumatized populations are relevant in considering barriers facing CSE women, however. This information is summarized in Appendix 3-3.

3-4 Reintegration Perspectives

3-4 a. A Paucity of Literature

Organizations assisting people who have been CSE or trafficked are dynamic, and no attempt to list or document their existences can ever be exhaustive. Currently, the UN publishes a list of dozens of such organizations, most of which do not promote a faith-based or religious emphasis.²³⁶ These run the gamut from informational to legal assistance to rescuing organizations to aftercare. Many of them also address and focus upon issues of labor trafficking, abuse towards children, trafficking for organ harvesting and other emphases not relevant to this study. One study examined the relationship between religious coping and psychological adjustment among African-American female survivors of violence from their intimate partners in addition to other traumas.²³⁷

Religion was found to be critical in positively affecting health and life satisfaction among

²³⁵ Dan B. Allender, *Healing the Wounded Heart: The Heartache of Sexual Abuse and the Hope of Transformation* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 2016); Doehring, *Internal Desecration*; Rudolfsson and Tidefors, "I Have Cried to Him a Thousand Times."

²³⁶ OHCHR, "Resources List of United Nations Agencies, Programmes, NGOs and Foundations Working on Contemporary Forms of Slavery," United Nations, Office of the High Commissioner, 2021, <https://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Slavery/UNVTFCFS/Pages/SlaveryList.aspx>.

²³⁷ Rebekah Bradley, Ann C. Schwartz, and Nadine J. Kaslow, "Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Symptoms Among Low-Income, African American Women with a History of Intimate Partner Violence and Suicidal Behaviors: Self-Esteem, Social Support, and Religious Coping," *Journal of Traumatic Stress* 18, no. 6 (December 2005): 685–96, <https://doi.org/10.1002/jts.20077>.

this population, and spiritual well-being among mothers in low-income black families resulted in fewer psychological symptoms.²³⁸

A 2010 study entitled *Spirituality and Well-Being: The Relationship Between Religious Coping and Recovery from Sexual Assault* focused upon faith in female survivors of adult sexual assault.²³⁹ The researchers concluded that positive religious coping is related to higher levels of psychological well-being and lower levels of depression, whereas negative religious coping is related to higher levels of depression.²⁴⁰ Although similarly to the aforementioned study it found a higher degree of religiosity among African-Americans than in the general population, they found that ethnicity had no impact on positive religious coping among those who had been sexually assaulted. An aggregate of all the survivors utilizing religious faith practices discovered coping to be easier in these circumstances regardless of ethnicity.²⁴¹

Researchers examining trauma responses with women who have from CSE backgrounds have noted a paucity of research concerning the best practices to effectively address the lifetime of trauma experienced by victims of CSE²⁴² as well as scant empirical data documenting services provided to survivors of human sex trafficking²⁴³ and literature focusing on how women use faith-based practices to address interpersonal violence.²⁴⁴ Sociologist Rochelle Dalla was one of the few researchers to consider the role of religion in the lives of women who were leaving CSE networks. Her article “You Can’t Hustle All Your Life” revealed that the subjects she interviewed who spoke about

²³⁸ Bradley, Schwartz, and Kaslow, 686.

²³⁹ Courtney E. Ahrens et al., “Spirituality and Well-Being: The Relationship Between Religious Coping and Recovery from Sexual Assault,” *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 25, no. 7 (July 2010): 1242–63, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260509340533>.

²⁴⁰ Ahrens et al., 1242.

²⁴¹ Ahrens et al., 1254.

²⁴² Wilson and Butler, “Running a Gauntlet,” 501.

²⁴³ Long, “State of Aftercare,” 86.

²⁴⁴ Su, “Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health,” 251.

religion or faith had a much better success leaving prostitution than those who had not.²⁴⁵

“One of the most interesting, yet surprising, findings of this study involved the central role of religion (and integration within religious communities) among those whose exits were successful,” she remarks. “No other study involving prostituted women could be located that addressed, or even alluded to, this issue. The door is certainly open for continued exploration of the role of religion in the exit process.”²⁴⁶ For this current study, no literature could be specifically identified dealing with women who had been enrolled in Christocentric rehabilitations and then resettled into communities of their choosing.

3-4 b. Parallels to Other Populations

While no direct comparisons can be obtained from current literature regarding the reintegration journeys of the exact population which this study focuses upon, useful comparisons can be drawn between them and other populations. Similarities exist between CSE women who have completed Christocentric rehabilitation and other traumatized populations, as well as with indigent populations, and with substance-abuse recovering populations. Dan Allender, for example, notes how the sexually traumatized clients he served are inclined to curse their own bodies²⁴⁷ in a manner that mirrored what the interview subjects and CSE women quoted in other studies have described. This can be manifested either by neglecting or abusing them or by vowing to keep them from experiencing future pleasure. Bryant Myers discusses how the impoverished share some culpability in their own poverty, as well as observing how their poverty is the result of defective relationships.²⁴⁸ Jayakumar Christian similarly observes how poor people lack

²⁴⁵ Dalla, ““You Can’t Hustle All Your Life.””

²⁴⁶ Dalla, 289.

²⁴⁷ Allender, *Healing the Wounded Heart*, 77–86.

²⁴⁸ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 332, 123, respectively.

access to power, which is another characteristic of the recurring presence of defective relationships.²⁴⁹ These were also characteristics consistent with the subjects interviewed for this study.

The Recovery/12-Step demographic and CSE women both include people whose lives have been chaotic due to addictions, compulsions, shame and embarrassment due to exposure of their lifestyles and stigmatization when exposure occurs. Bill Wilson, one of the co-founders of Alcoholics Anonymous notes that without incorporating a regimen including a supportive community and a spiritual focus, alcoholics—like the CSE population--rarely registered any success in recovery.²⁵⁰ The parallels between CSE women and these other populations is summarized in Appendix 3-4.

3-5 Discipleship and Evangelism as Desirable Responses for CSE women

3-5 a. Definitions and Context

Missiologist David Bosch stated that evangelism “...consists in the proclamation of salvation in Christ to nonbelievers, in announcing forgiveness of sins, in calling people to repentance and faith in Christ, in inviting them to become living members of Christ’s earthly community and to begin a life in the power of the Holy Spirit.”²⁵¹ Wesleyan theologian William Abraham added that it consists of a set of intentional activities which is governed by the goal of initiating people into the Kingdom of God for the first time.²⁵² So, proclamation of gospel truths to people who haven’t heard it before is vital, as Bosch declares. Intentionality is foundational to the process, as Abraham suggests. Then, the audience’s responses should be meaningful enough that they will make conspicuous changes reflecting the inner transformation.

²⁴⁹ Christian, *God of the Empty-Handed*, 336.

²⁵⁰ Dalla, ““You Can’t Hustle All Your Life,”” 288–89.

²⁵¹ David Bosch, “Evangelism: Theological Currents and Cross-Currents Today,” *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 11, no. 3 (July 3, 1987): 100.

²⁵² Abraham, *The Logic of Evangelism*, 95.

The most significant theological component to grasp regarding this study is the principle that Christian faith is *acquired*. It is not an ethnic value inherited by participation in a community. Conservative Christian faith presumes every person stands outside the threshold of faith until they take deliberate action in response to hearing and believing the expression of its truths. Families decidedly practice and express their faith in the anticipation that the children and other relatives will participate, but they don't consider this to be an automatic process. As Bosch states, adherence to the faith involves repentance, community participation and divine cooperation with what Christians believe to be God's spirit.²⁵³ The goal of the acquisition of Gospel principles is *transformation*, which contrasts with maintaining the status quo. A prominent feature of the Gospel's message can be observed in Jesus' encounter with Nicodemus in John 3:1-18. Jesus uses the phrases "born... of the spirit" and "born again" soteriologically in this passage. Later in the narrative (John 7:37-39) he speaks in terms of "rivers of living water" flowing from the depths of a person who believes. This theme continues throughout the New Testament, as when the Apostle Paul speaks of believers in Christ as "new creation(s) who have allowed old habits to be replaced by new, redemptive ones" (II Corinthians 5:17). Transformation, not simply socio-cultural adaptation, is the goal of faith for New Testament adherents.

Discipleship is the ongoing component that continues what was started in the "evangelism" stage of a believer. These are both steps in the "good news-ing" journey consistent with New Testament teaching.²⁵⁴ The normative evangelism/discipleship process is one that engenders stability, personal piety, and corporate establishment in the

²⁵³ Bosch, *Transforming Mission*, 100.

²⁵⁴ An approximate rendering of *euangelion*

Body of Christ.²⁵⁵ In *The Logic of Evangelism*, William Abraham offers this clarification: “All authentic evangelism requires initiation into the body of Christ in a specific Christian community and engagement with its life, worship, formation and mission”²⁵⁶ In other words, it is not an evangelism that is accomplished, but an evangelism that develops into the abundant life of a disciple. This is relevant for CSE women who have chosen to adhere to Christian principles prior to reintegrating into communities because it requires them to recognize the communal aspects of the Christian faith. They cannot co-opt a legitimate and authentic Christianity without engaging in Christian community. While they are free to choose any faith they desire or no faith at all, what they cannot choose is a Christian faith that violates the precepts of Christianity. The horizontal aspect of Christian faith (community) is equally as necessary as the vertical one (devotion to Christ). If the vertical dimension does not result in horizontal growth, it is a false expression of the faith.

3-5 b. Discipleship and Evangelism are Contextual

When a person has been evangelized, she has taken an essential step in journeying toward Christ. Her step *begins* a journey, distinct from ending one. Jesus’ consistent mandate was to “Follow me”—not simply to adopt new cognitive thought patterns. Immediately upon experiencing redemption, the process of discipleship or journeying towards maturity begins, then continues throughout a disciple’s life.²⁵⁷ Although North American methods of evangelism have at times gravitated towards a truncated view of initiation into Christ’s kingdom capped by a “decision,” this is not a biblical

²⁵⁵ Robert Webber, *Ancient-Future Faith: Rethinking Evangelicalism for a Postmodern World* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1999), 132–33.

²⁵⁶ Abraham, *The Logic of Evangelism*, 104.

²⁵⁷ Here, ‘redemption’ may be viewed as a waypoint along a path leading to a final destination with Christ in the afterlife.

understanding that would have elicited endorsement from Jesus or his disciples. As theologian Scot McKnight has observed,

Most of us don't pay attention to the rhetoric at work in this traditional approach to gospeling. What I mean is that articulating the "gospel" like this is to shape themes of salvation in a rhetorical order aimed at precipitating a response. The rhetorical shape of the gospel above the jump is aimed at getting an audience into a state of liminality, a state where one feels he or she is between God's love and God's justice/wrath and holiness.²⁵⁸

In *The King Jesus Gospel*, he adds "The gospel doesn't work for spectators; you have to participate for it to work its powers."²⁵⁹

As indicated in the previous section, there is a sense in which literature regarding women who have been CSE can be used to demonstrate that they are both the same as-, and different from other people. While they possess parallel membership in particular ethnic- and socio-economic groups, which also inevitably affect their worldviews, they are imprinted with the traumatic experiences of the past, rendering them unique from other demographic groups.²⁶⁰ This is important in evangelism/discipleship discussions because all theologies have contextual bases. No "general" theology exists that is rational and apparent to all humanity. Bosch noted that "Interpreting a text is not only a literary exercise; It is also a social, economic and political exercise. Our entire context comes into play when we interpret a biblical text. One therefore must concede that *all* theology... is, by its very nature, contextual."²⁶¹ People in every demographic require, and deserve, practical explanations and strategies resonating within their peculiar

²⁵⁸ McKnight, "Gospel and Rhetoric."

²⁵⁹ McKnight, *The King Jesus Gospel*, 28.

²⁶⁰ These ethnic-and socio-economic groups are usually, but not always, from impoverished classes. John R. Belcher and Steven Herr, "Development of Grounded Theory: Moving Towards a Theory of the Pathways into Street Prostitution Among Low-Income Women," *Journal of Addictions Nursing* 16, no. 3 (Fall 2005): 117–24, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10884600500196651>.

²⁶¹ Bosch, *Transforming Mission*, 423.

contexts. While appropriate respect is extended to those with differing views, the presupposition that redemption is found exclusively in Christ is a conservative Christian proposition functioning in these evangelism discussions.

A Wesleyan view of discipleship is assumed for the purposes of this study. In a nutshell, evangelism and discipleship will not be regarded here as separate entities but as two descriptive categories working harmoniously in a Christ-follower's journey essential for her ultimate redemption. Salvation is an act initiated by God, based on faith alone. The process of becoming a follower of Christ may appear to begin with reception of Gospel proclamation for the initiate, but it is perceived by Wesleyan believers to be precipitated by prevenient grace and played out in the life of the church.²⁶² It is revealed by the evidence of a changed life, consistent with the insight that "Faith without accompanying action is dead" (James 2:17).

3-5 c. Relevant History

My purpose here precludes a presentation of an entire overview of understanding evangelism/discipleship history and practices. The Great Commission, which church tradition considers to be the official inauguration of evangelistic activity has already been affirmed as essential to the faith by Catholics, ecumenicals, and evangelicals.²⁶³ Christ's directive to "good news" the world's peoples can be interpreted as converting them to the faith, as meeting their social needs, as dialoguing with them, or as witnessing to what

²⁶² George G. Hunter, *To Spread the Power: Church Growth in the Wesleyan Spirit* (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1987); James C. Logan, ed., *Theology and Evangelism in the Wesleyan Heritage* (Nashville, Tenn: Kingswood Books, 1994); James Weldon Smith, "Some Notes on Wesley's Doctrine of Prevenient Grace," *Religion in Life* 34, no. 1 (Winter -1965 1964): 68–80.

²⁶³ For notes on evangelistic activity and the Great Commission, see Martin I. Klauber and Scott M. Manetsch, eds., *The Great Commission: Evangelicals and the History of World Missions* (Nashville, TN: B & H Academic, 2008). For Catholic, ecumenical, and evangelical confirmation of the great commission, see of Scherer and Bevans, Stephen B., *New Directions in Mission and Evangelization 1*, 1992, 133, 42, 296, respectively.

they have seen and observed concerning his divinity and teaching.²⁶⁴ It cannot result in new believers apathetically returning to former habit patterns. For this project, it suffices to observe that the organizations consulted here all began in the twenty-first century and were influenced by the conservative evangelism practices that were molded in the mid-twentieth century.

3-5 d. Effects of Flourishing Considered

In *Understanding Church Growth*, the twentieth century's preeminent church growth scholar Donald McGavran identifies a phenomenon critical to the CSE survivors.²⁶⁵ McGavran calls this "Redemption and Lift."²⁶⁶ The concept consists of both positive and negative elements. McGavran regarded impoverished people in various global communities who embraced the gospel message. When they became serious about their faithful commitments to Christ their lives holistically improved. They stopped drinking, gambling, spending their money unwisely and calling in sick to work habitually. They became better employees, were able to save more money, to obtain promotions and to begin small businesses. In a word, they flourished, passing their prosperity on to their children which resulted in improved lives and health of their families.²⁶⁷ That was the positive "lift" aspect; Redemption resulted in demonstrably improved lives. The negative factor emerged when their Gospel-oriented "lift" enabled them to leave their impoverished neighborhoods. It was an immediate positive development for the families, but detrimental to the old neighborhoods, as the established

²⁶⁴ Wright, *Mission of God*, 51. Throughout the book starting on pp 34-35, he emphasizes that this is not simply a mandate, but an assumption. Christ is not directing the disciples here to "go" any place particularly but encouraging them to make disciples of people wherever they go. Wright views the Commission as a small part of the entire counsel of scripture in which YHWH instructs adherents to follow him, to make disciples, and to live exemplary lives of service to others.

²⁶⁵ Donald A. McGavran, *Understanding Church Growth*, ed. C. Peter Wagner, Third Edition (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1990).

²⁶⁶ McGavran, 209–20.

²⁶⁷ McGavran, 211.

communities lost the witness of their role-modelling and general ethical advances. After a few years, the newly redeemed people had built friendship bases in the new communities and churches primarily with Christians. The redeemed people were no longer rooted in the lives of the impoverished who needed redemption. They abandoned their prior roles of influencing their neighbors.²⁶⁸ This is significant for CSE women, in that it demonstrates how the new habits they learned in the Programs and from their mentors retained genuine potential to lead improved lives. Some of the interview subjects discussed frustration with newfound poverty in entry-level positions. The principles they acquire in the new lifestyle, however, possess inherent potential to accomplish vastly improved lives, if adherents persevere. Every administrator this researcher spoke with agreed that if their former clients desired to flourish, they must resist prior influences. Optimal situations can consequentially occur when they are able to envision ways to continue influencing others while maintaining safe margins in their own lives.

Donald McGavran, Charles Engel²⁶⁹, and Frank Gray²⁷⁰ are among the researchers who have examined flourishing among individuals who claim that Christianity has affirmatively affected their lives. (It is beyond this study to determine whether people have truly been spiritually transformed or to determine the components involved in the experience of spiritual transformation, although this is an underexplored area for researchers to consider in future studies. When formerly CSE respondents explained to me that they had been transformed by Christianity or by interactions with Christ, I noted their remarks and included them in this study. Delimitations impeded me

²⁶⁸ McGavran, 212–13.

²⁶⁹ James F. Engel and Hugo Wilbert Norton, *What's Gone Wrong with the Harvest?: A Communication Strategy for the Church and World Evangelization* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1975).

²⁷⁰ Frank Gray, "Home of the Gray Matrix," Personal, *The Gray Matrix: Getting the Message Across*, last modified April 2015, accessed September 13, 2020, <https://thegraymatrix.org/>.

from exploring the phenomena to which they referred. While Lewis Rambo has extensively studied the phenomenon of conversion, his studies focused upon all religions and quasi-religious experiences rather than solely upon Christianity.²⁷¹ What I have been able to contribute to this study, in the absence of further interviews regarding the transformational experience of the respondents, is a set of indices offering comparable data from the reintegrating formerly CSE respondents regarding specific components of their Post-Program flourishing experiences in their communities. The data on these indices reveals a portrait of what flourishing should look like in the lives of people who are marginalized. I specifically had CSE women in mind who had experienced rehabilitational programs and then moved into communities when I compiled them. They may be adapted for other specific demographics, however. One of the indices evaluates developmental flourishing on a holistic basis, incorporating physical, psychological, spiritual and social elements. The other index examines purely spiritual components reflecting the data provided by the respondents. A researcher more interested in the psychological-, social-, or physical flourishing of the group they are studying might wish to develop their own index to reflect that emphasis. Similarly, a criminal justice researcher might wish to develop questions reflecting how their respondents are adjusting to reintegration from that perspective. The Developmental Flourishing Index, however, could be useful to researchers from all disciplines. The development of these indices is discussed in chapter 2 and implemented in chapters 5 and 6.

3-5 e. Appropriate Outreach for CSE Women in Their New Communities

Evangelism focused upon marginalized people-- those with addictions or those identifying with highly specific peer groups—has been called “radical” by some

²⁷¹ Lewis R. Rambo, *Understanding Religious Conversion* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1993).

practitioners.²⁷² Australian evangelist-scholars Michael Frost and Alan Hirsch write, “Too much existing Bible teaching happens to passive groups of Christians, many of whom are not involved in any kind of risky missional activity.”²⁷³ In *The Shaping of Things to Come* they discuss “Incarnational evangelism” for people who are ignored, neglected, unnoticed or perceived as difficult to reach.²⁷⁴ The incarnational approach requires ministers to become active in the communities where their audiences go, following the adage that individuals cannot be truly understood unless one walks a mile in her moccasins. To accomplish this, one needs “...a real and abiding incarnational presence among a group of people... If you want to reach the local gangsta, you are going to have to live where they live and hang out where they hang out.”²⁷⁵ Whereas western churches focus upon unchurched people discovering their churches, incarnational ministers will go where others go and become interested in their interests.²⁷⁶ Hirsch also notes that this is not a new method of ministering the Gospel to neglected demographics, but a return to ancient practices.²⁷⁷

Evangelism consultant and scholar George Hunter concurs that reaching people from atypical destinations by engaging in their cultural activities is a time-honored tradition. He observes that if Christians become increasingly aware of the needs of secular or unchurched people, they will identify with them relationally, recognizing prominent emotional needs and ministering to them as allies.²⁷⁸ Enhanced understanding of the disease of addiction and the use of Recovery Principles (12-Step) will enable

²⁷² Hunter, *To Spread the Power*.

²⁷³ Michael Frost and Alan Hirsch, *The Shaping of Things to Come: Innovation and Mission for the 21st Century Church*, Revised and Updated Edition (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 2013), 27.

²⁷⁴ Frost and Hirsch, 35–59.

²⁷⁵ Frost and Hirsch, 39.

²⁷⁶ Frost and Hirsch, 35–36.

²⁷⁷ Alan Hirsch, *The Forgotten Ways: Reactivating the Missional Church* (Grand Rapids, MI: Brazos Press, 2006).

²⁷⁸ George G. Hunter, *How to Reach Secular People* (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1992), 61.

churches to reach a demographic that is not currently being emphasized in American church cultures, he writes.²⁷⁹ CSE women, who also have historically grappled with addictions, are another example of a unique subculture that would be better served with enhanced deliberation and education within church communities. In *Radical Outreach*, Hunter suggests that more churches adopt models such as that of First Baptist Church in Leesburg, Florida, which states that they are seeking out “All the people we can find that no other church seems to want.”²⁸⁰ Though this may be hyperbole, it expresses intentionality absent in many congregations.

Women who have been CSE and then moved into communities after rehabilitation may experience difficulties acclimating to traditional church cultures. Because discipleship is contextual, the reintegrating women may believe obstacles facing them have little relevance to a given church community. Yet, several subjects interviewed for this research expressed no difficulties fitting into existing church cultures.²⁸¹

3-6 The Nature of Christian Community

The trajectory of this literature provides clear indicators that women involved in CSE networks in North America are often initiated through coercion, grooming and manipulation. Those who wish to exit on their own volitions are sometimes afforded that

²⁷⁹ George G. Hunter, *Radical Outreach: The Recovery of Apostolic Ministry and Evangelism* (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2003), 141–45.

²⁸⁰ Hunter, 150.

²⁸¹ Patti and LaDonna, for example, discussed church ministries they were enthusiastically leading. Scarlett was dating a man from her church, and Shannon had married a faithful parishioner. Kelsey, on the other hand, possessed numerous complaints about her church experiences, even though she admitted that church people had done charitable things for her and her son. Ginger had not attempted to get involved in a church but observed how she thought the Christian volunteers who tried to assist with her rehabilitation were voyeurs. Based upon these diverse remarks, it appears that their success in acclimating to church cultures may be a matter of perception. Individuals not considered to be marginalized might offer identical litanies and reservations. What is critical for this population is that when they choose to involve themselves in congregational life, they should select Christian communities where they feel accepted and supported.

opportunity, although determination and support are required. Rehabilitation is available, both for the psycho-spiritual conditioning and the accommodating lifestyle deficits that have transpired in their lives as well as for substance abuse habits which may be tethered to their experiences. If they wish to select Christian-based programs they may do so, and this will place additional emphases upon learning and upholding New Testament values.

The final element to be considered in this review of relevant literature presents a classic ontological concern: *Now what?* After emancipation from undesirable lifestyles, the subjects discover the necessity of removing obstacles keeping them from obtaining positive outcomes. The practical and theological response to accomplishing this can be found in community identification and membership. Those embracing the holistic benefits of communal life greatly increase their flourishing capacities.

3-6 a. Community is Needed for Confessing Women After Emancipation

Evangelism professor W. Jay Moon has discovered in interviews and interactions with more than five hundred individuals that the millennial generation which has been prominently characterized by its willingness to declare themselves “nones”, are open to a system of faith that offers them “Belonging with purpose.”²⁸² They are indifferent to religious affiliation per se, but those attitudes are malleable if the promise of authentic community presents itself. Although the CSE women interviewed for this project did not all belong to the same age group, more emerged from the millennial generation than from any other. As citizens in a secular, post-modern subculture we may infer that they would also be receptive to lifestyles offering affirmative community. For some, a sisterhood of like-minded women possessing shared lifestyles and stigmas were the principal points of

²⁸² W. Jay Moon and W. Bud Simon, *Effective Intercultural Evangelism: Good News in a Diverse World* (Downers Grove, IL: IVP, 2021), 36.

connectivity with other women providing a semblance of stability for them when they were in *The Life*.²⁸³

Gregg Okesson, public theologian and Provost at Asbury Theological Seminary, concurs with Moon that the U.S. Millennial generation is essentially rejecting the institutional church, but not because they are disinterested in spiritual matters. In *A Public Missiology*, he observes that contemporary young Americans don't believe the church will prepare them for a complex world.²⁸⁴ They are looking for multi-faceted, "thick" faith to address elaborate personal and societal concerns. Their elders are versed in proposing individualistic, technical and problem-solving solutions to address complex social issues.²⁸⁵ There are many public realms in which contemporary citizens interact and believers should not be shy about inhabiting those spaces. Westerners are accustomed to solving problems with technology. Often these are acceptable solutions--but they are incomplete.²⁸⁶ Spirituality must be factored into the resolutions of the Millennials' complex concerns while addressing the suspicion with which they regard dogmatic solutions and directives seemingly divorced from their realities. Religious solutions are required among the panoply of significant responses, but they must be of a *particular* kind of religion that addresses their contemporary realities.²⁸⁷ The public realms in which they participate impenetrate each other but they can also be impenetrated by the Lordship of Christ. These "Publics" may be embodied within a community of believers gathered together in a place.²⁸⁸ In such a communal setting various concerns may be addressed, and the entire community can work together in engagement and

²⁸³ Williamson and Folaron, "Understanding the Experiences."

²⁸⁴ Okesson, *Public Missiology*, 34.

²⁸⁵ Okesson, 35.

²⁸⁶ Okesson, 36.

²⁸⁷ Okesson, 52.

²⁸⁸ Okesson, 64.

resolution. CSE women particularly have become enmeshed in webs of “complicated wickedness” as Okesson describes it,²⁸⁹ borrowing a phrase from John Wesley.

Individualistic thinking often drew them into exploitation, and a team or community of supportive people are required to extract them from oppressive networks. A community enabled them to complete programs of rehabilitation, and a community is also required to guide them into states of flourishing.

Trinity College religion professor Frank Kirkpatrick examined various models of community practiced throughout history which he presents in his writings. He notes that only in communities of love wherein individuals live primarily for others because of God’s power can the ideal of biblical community ultimately be realized.²⁹⁰ Other communities in which relationships are based upon contractual obligations are able to function to the degree that those obligations are met. But the Christian model of Koinonia is the truest form of community in that it is based upon agape and has no need for self-satisfaction to function appropriately.²⁹¹ The church serves as a community among communities in which justice and nurture can be accomplished without deferring to oppressive structures.²⁹² Wheaton College theologian Robert Webber also recognizes how Christian community needs to function as a diffuse community within the various global structures to maintain viability. The church is the primary presence of God’s activity in the world, Webber observes. As congregations discern what it means to *be* the church, they offer a communal alternative to secular society. This new community, the embodied experience of God’s kingdom, will draw people into itself and nurture them in

²⁸⁹ Okesson, 20–21.

²⁹⁰ Frank G. Kirkpatrick, *Community: A Trinity of Models* (Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2008), 138.

²⁹¹ Kirkpatrick, 227.

²⁹² Kirkpatrick, 214–18.

the faith. In this sense the church and its life in the world will become the new apologetic.²⁹³

3-6 b. One-anothering

The practice of the Christian community as a collective body of faith in the Acts of the Apostles is self-evident. The prominent New Testament principle of “One-anothering” is completely disingenuous for those subsequently choosing lifestyles of isolation or radical autonomy. Particular demographic groups responsive to notions of an individualistic gospel exist today—namely, western individualists who have little exposure to collectivist societies. A Christianity promoting the rhetoric of a “Personal Savior” and sentiments like, “My faith is so personal, I won’t discuss it publicly” would not have been recognized by first-century believers, who become part of local body of Christ followers shortly before or after they believed. The idea of maintaining strong familial ties is absurd if adherents don’t practice and promote continual family engagement. Communing with other believers is the default status for those who want to follow Christ’s mandate. As theologian Charles Moore remarks,

Superficiality and rootlessness are diseases of our time. Shallow friendships and fragile relationships mark not only our society but also the church. By contrast, we read that the early Christians did not just occasionally fellowship (verb); they were a fellowship (noun). They didn’t go to church; they were the church. Few of us today experience life together as the early Christians did—a common, daily, material life of unity and sharing.²⁹⁴

The concept of *allelon* or one-anothering mentioned in chapter 1 provides a self-contained accountability and safety structure for church members. It should therefore be an appealing feature for CSE women beginning new lives. The admonitions to care for

²⁹³ Webber, *Ancient-Future Faith*, 72.

²⁹⁴ Charles E Moore, “It Takes Work,” in *Called to Community: The Life Jesus Wants for His People*, ed. Charles E Moore (Walden, NY: Plough Publishing House, 2016), 82.

“one another” in various settings and circumstances is hard-wired into Apostolic teaching. It is not included as an optional variant for Gospel adherents.²⁹⁵ This observation will be further explored in Chapter 7.

3-6 c. Affirmative Community is Needed for all CSE Women

Women who are CSE have reported on the complete loss of control that occurs in their lives²⁹⁶ sometimes even resulting in loss of free agency. Women are exploited by actors who coerce, condition, threaten and torture them into submission for their own commercial gain, with complete disregard for the perspective of the exploited class. In Bryant Myers’ framework from *Walking with the Poor*, the nature of poverty is viewed as fundamentally relational.²⁹⁷ It is “...the result of relationships that do not work, that are not just, that are not for life, that are not harmonious or enjoyable.”²⁹⁸ Poverty results from a network of poorly developed or broken relationships. Faced with such brokenness, they find it difficult to fulfill the meaningful roles required of them in appropriately functioning communities. The expectations of brokenness often become self-fulfilling prophecies. Thus, when positive opportunities are presented, their low expectations or lack of skills in navigating good fortune cause them to squander them in self-sabotage.

Not all women who are CSE emerge from impoverished backgrounds.²⁹⁹ However, physical poverty makes affected individuals more vulnerable to exploitation, as resulting from having to worry about daily bread issues in a manner that is foreign to the

²⁹⁵ Gordon D. Fee, *God’s Empowering Presence: The Holy Spirit in the Letters of Paul* (Colorado Springs, CO: Hendrickson Publishers, 1994); Guder and Barrett, *Missional Church*; Gerhard Lohfink, *Jesus and Community: The Social Dimension of Christian Faith* (Philadelphia, PA: Fortress Press, 1984); Charles E. Moore, ed., *Called to Community: The Life Jesus Wants for His People* (Walden, NY: Plough Publishing House, 2016).

²⁹⁶ Wilson and Butler, “Running a Gauntlet,” 495.

²⁹⁷ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 86–87.

²⁹⁸ Myers, 86.

²⁹⁹ My respondents Alanna, Cassie, Holly, Louise and Shannon all identified their family backgrounds as being either middle-class or upper middle-class.

upper classes.³⁰⁰ If we view women who have been commercially exploited-- whether physically impoverished or not-- as possessing characteristics similar to Myers' understanding of poverty, his framework becomes useful in assessing the unique needs these women possess, even when their needs vary from those experiencing material poverty. Both demographics must be able to establish and maintain proper relationships with people, with entities and with God to supplant their unique circumstances³⁰¹ Before justice can be accomplished in their communities, caregivers and other interested parties must ascertain that no harm is done to them.³⁰² The occurring process of change must be one that is self-generated rather than something that is imposed upon them.³⁰³ The good that is done must be adequate to sustain truth, righteousness and justice in their communities.³⁰⁴ Violent force has been used to pacify them; Therefore, it becomes all the more important that a bias towards peace should be expressed in the transformative process.³⁰⁵

Although this study is interdisciplinary, the motivating organizational perspective has been clearly stated: For Christians holding a high view of biblical authority, it is considered a positive outcome if individuals become interested in matters of faith and better still if they cultivate habits consistent with that faith. In completing this survey of the diverse body of literature informing the field research conducted for this research, all interview respondents have been exposed to a Christocentric worldview for a minimum of nine months, and some for much longer. It is appropriate to consider how this corpus applies to individuals who either have not been exposed to New Testament teaching, or

³⁰⁰ Haugen and Boutros, *The Locust Effect*, 41–46.

³⁰¹ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 75.

³⁰² Myers, 225.

³⁰³ Myers, 63.

³⁰⁴ Myers, 186–88.

³⁰⁵ Myers, 190.

who are indifferent to it as indeed some of my subjects were, or who reject Christian faith for any number of reasons. These women may not be affected by a Christian perspective of community, nor is this a reasonable expectation. Compelling them to participate in a church or Christian fellowship does not interface with the free expression of religion, and those abandoning CSE networks may not welcome mentors who are specifically Christocentric in their approaches. Theologian Frederick Foerster frames the dilemma this way:

Many say: “Can we not be brothers and sisters without the Crucified?” Of course. Such slight claims can be made of depth and purity of fraternal love that the cross is not necessary to make possible such community. But if you are in earnest about becoming a real brother or sister you will also earn the self-knowledge in this conflict which will open for you the indispensability of the cross for the perfection of the bond of brotherhood.³⁰⁶

In endorsement of this sentiment, it remains apparent that every CSE woman needs some kind of affirmative community—one that is free of the influences that co-opted them into trafficking networks. Healthy community is mandatory for actors who wish to flourish when reintegrating in their chosen communities after rehabilitation. Affirmative community for them might be Jewish, Buddhist, Hindu, Islamic, secular, agnostic or indifferent to faith. What it *cannot* be is exploitative. It must be a community concerned with the best interests of its members.

Asbury Seminary’s Professor of Christian Ethics, Christine Pohl stated, “Human beings were made for living in community, and it is in community that we flourish and become most fully human.”³⁰⁷ This is not an imperative solely restricted to human beings who gravitate towards a Christian worldview. Humanity needs one-anothering,

³⁰⁶ Dietrich Bonhoeffer and Friedrich Foerster, “The Center,” in *Called to Community: The Life Jesus Wants for His People*, ed. Charles E. Moore (Walden, NY: Plough Publishing House, 2016), 135.

³⁰⁷ Christine D. Pohl, *Living into Community: Cultivating Practices That Sustain Us* (Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans Publishing, 2012), 3.

and individuals who have been CSE need it more than most. The need for interconnectedness in human relationships can be articulated on a general level.³⁰⁸ For those who have experienced trauma or addictive behaviors it is critical that they participate in community not simply to negotiate wise counsel, but also for the observation and exposure to positive behavior and for support through various temptations and struggles. Psychiatric researcher Alan Vaux writes that “Successful coping with... (the effects of major life changes) requires a reorganization of one's life. A major aim of this reorganization is the development of reinforcing social roles and activities appropriate to current life circumstances.”³⁰⁹ Various non-religious journal articles also observed the critical need for strong social support networks for CSE women if they are to remain free from exploitative networks.³¹⁰

Sociologist Sharon Oselin observed that maintaining contact with the service organization assisting in her interview subjects' emancipation was a significant factor in their successes in remaining emancipated.³¹¹ Kristine Hickle in her dissertation “Getting Out: A Qualitative Exploration of the Exiting Experience Among Former Sex Workers and Adult Sex Trafficking Victims,” discussed a woman she had interviewed named Sasha who decided to remain in her former neighborhood where she had always used drugs and sold sex after she had left The Life. She was able to continue along a path of successful exiting by drawing upon internal resources such as spirituality and fear of consequences and by relying upon a new growing social network of friends from church,

³⁰⁸ For example, see the work of: Helen R F Ebaugh, *Becoming an Ex: The Process of Role Exit* (Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1988); Barton J. Hirsch, “Natural Support Systems and Coping with Major Life Changes,” *American Journal of Community Psychology* 8, no. 2 (April 1980): 159–72, <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00912658>; Alan Vaux, *Social Support: Theory, Research, and Intervention* (New York, NY: Praeger Publishers, 1988).

³⁰⁹ Vaux, *Social Support*, 170.

³¹⁰ Dalla, ““You Can’t Hustle All Your Life””; Oselin, “Weighing the Consequences”; Oselin, *Leaving Prostitution*; Valandra, “Reclaiming Their Lives.”

³¹¹ Oselin, *Leaving Prostitution*, 146.

including people who offered her rides to church events and provided her with new clothing.³¹²

The previously referenced Hedin and Mannson article on social relationships is particularly revealing in its characterization of the vitality of redemptive friendships for women who endeavor to abandon exploitative networks and settle into the communities of their choosing. They first of all describe the loss of many of those relationships when the women become involved in CSE. Upon entering the sex trade, they note, the women they interviewed gradually lost contact with former friends and schoolmates. In prostitution, they developed strong ties to the prostitution subculture. In most cases, quitting prostitution brought about a break with all contacts in that social environment.³¹³ After they had decided they wished to abandon this lifestyle, desperation and uncertainty led them to throw themselves headlong into new relationships with men. In some cases, the women ran straight into the arms of pimps who perceived and exploited their vulnerability. Failing to escape at that juncture, they were forced to continue in the sex trade for several years under accelerated conditions, mentally and physically exhausting themselves. This torment occurred before they finally succeeded in breaking away.³¹⁴ Some of the respondents, though, spoke of men they had met in connection with the breakaway who were different from earlier relationships. These men provided practical and instrumental support, for example, offering refuge from drug dealers or pimps, or connections to housing and new jobs. Through these men, the women sometimes

³¹² Hickle, "Getting Out," 106.

³¹³ Hedin and Månsson, "Importance of Supportive Relationships," 229.

³¹⁴ Ulla-Carin Hedin and Sven Axel Månsson, "The Importance of Supportive Relationships Among Women Leaving Prostitution," *Journal of Trauma Practice* 2, no. 3/4 (July 2003): 226.

accessed new social networks.³¹⁵ The researchers considered these to be transitional relationships, which occupied a particular function in contributing to the breakaways.³¹⁶

The initial relationships primarily established by the women leaving CSE networks consisted of social workers or health professionals. The foundational security of this network was eventually replaced by expressions of impatience and insufficiency. The women struggled to broaden their circles, make new friends, and repair old networks. This was a rapid process for some women, often connected to initiating academic pursuits or new jobs. For others, however, this took a considerable amount of time—especially for women who found themselves unemployed following the breakaway or unable to identify with new social roles from which they were able to form new relationships. These women were caught in permanent marginal situations. Within the populations they interviewed, these experiences often led to relapse.³¹⁷ Heterogeneous social networks, including new social identities and repaired social networks, are vital in a permanent break from CSE. The women not only required attachments to psychologically important people, but entirely new networks of social relationships.

Mansson and Hedin concluded their research with the affirmation that supportive social relationships are critical for the break from CSE. They noted that this finding is consistent with previous research, for example, into breaking away from drug addiction. The internal and interpersonal problems that contributed to participation in exploitative networks still occurred after the breakaways. During prostitution, these problems were increased by violence and other traumatic events. After the breakaways the women were in urgent need of supportive relationships in both informal social networks and in formal professional relationships with therapists. The researchers asserted that their subjects

³¹⁵ Hedin and Månsson, “Importance of Supportive Relationships,” 226.

³¹⁶ Hedin and Månsson, 227.

³¹⁷ Hedin and Månsson, 229.

required changes in their coping strategies and escape from destructive relationships to establish new lives in new communities.³¹⁸

3-7 Summary

Every woman's story is unique. However, though each story has a beginning, a middle and an ending, researchers have historically compiled the aggregate data focused upon the middle of the story. That is, the women being trafficked or prostituted has been observed and written about extensively. The beginning of the story is less well known, and the ending has hardly been known at all. Deliberate efforts were made here to document the beginnings of the lives of many of the women involved in CSE networks, and critical elements of the middle of the story have been documented because this affects the end of their lives so profoundly. Due to *han* factors acquired either individually or corporately due to being born into groups they would not have chosen for themselves, such as impoverished homes or environments where their parents were participants in CSE networks or living with pedophilic household members, their family statuses placed them at risk for exploitation. We must carefully regard the violence, coercion and conditioning that occurs early in these lives to appreciably grasp why they cannot simply shake off the indignities and move forward even many factors working in their favors have seemingly been extended to them. Next, obstacles were identified by various sociologists and those providing physical-and mental health services to understand what they have discovered concerning the needs of women who have been CSE. It was noted that this demographic is similar to others who have also experienced difficulties making adjustments in society such as the poor, the traumatized and the addicted. *Han* – related factors-- which may also be recognized as sexual grooming,

³¹⁸ Hedin and Månsson, 233; Månsson and Hedin, "Matthew Effect," 57.

acquired mental health factors and addictions—complicate the abilities of those victimized by CSE to successfully abandon exploitative networks. Then, the nature of evangelism and discipleship was presented not only as healthy but ideal developments for persons wishing to pursue Christian faith.³¹⁹ Participation in Christian faith has been cited as ameliorating the effects either of *han* or of poor social, spiritual and psychological conditioning. Finally, because the eyewitnesses and administrators insisted on the need for strong communal supports to accomplish successful flourishing, this chapter ends with literature referencing Christian perspectives on community. Redemptive community has been consistently cited as a foil optimizing the likelihood that CSE victims will not return to previous exploitative networks.

Had I begun to analyze the literature only at the point of reintegration into communities, this would not have permitted sufficient understanding of why innumerable subjects had made perplexing choices during the post-exploitation phases of their lives. A comprehensive overview of current literature prepares us to understand the primary obstacles faced by reintegrating post-rehabilitational CSE women. The next sections will personalize this literature by surveying the perspectives of women with whom I spoke who have been vocationally committed to working with the CSE population and nurturing them towards ongoing flourishing. The conversations with these administrators prepared me for the narratives I would hear several months later with the primary subjects themselves.

³¹⁹ This perspective is particularly vital because my research centers upon women who have sought out a type of discipleship program. If I had been primarily interested in physical- and psychological flourishing, the research could have been done as a dissertation for a degree in sociology. It would have been much less valuable for seminary and church use.

Chapter 4: Facilitating the Story's Outcome: Administrative Interviews

This chapter focuses upon how the struggling former CSE population was viewed by people who spent years trying to coach, disciple and prepare them for reintegration into the communities of their choosing. My conversations with people who had worked closely assisting those abandoning their old networks foreshadowed what I would later learn from the rehabilitated respondents themselves. I discovered a good deal of consensus among them regarding primary obstacles to flourishing in the lives of their Program participants. Many stories of successful reintegration experiences circulated among them. Regarding both those Program participants who did well and those who languished, though, it was clear that baggage from their past entanglements, or *han* issues, continued to beckon to them during the months they spent in the Programs and after they had graduated.

4-1 The Programs

Small organizations devoted to rehabilitating women abandoning CSE networks proliferate throughout the U.S.A. Hard data regarding their spiritual and philosophical foundations is difficult to obtain, but many of these organizations—perhaps the majority—operate on faith-based principles. That is to say, they incorporate religious principles or spirituality into their rehabilitative programs. Although a majority of women enrolling in their Programs never reportedly completed them, many of them did. The participants who dropped out were not always viewed as “failures”, because some of them stayed long enough to begin establishing new habits in their communities.

4-1 a. Criteria for Program Administrators

For this project, I spoke to thirteen administrators from ten organizations.³²⁰ All of these worked with adult women who had been CSE. Eleven of the thirteen individuals worked for organizations that met my established criteria for Christocentric rehabilitation.³²¹ One of the organizations had a general anti-human trafficking emphasis,³²² working with men and the transgendered as well as with women and in areas of labor trafficking as well as sex trafficking.³²³ Four of the administrators had been CSE themselves, and they provided particularly unique perspectives

I selected primarily regional pseudonyms to identify the organizations as this made it easier for me to quickly recall the under discussion.³²⁴ The following are the assigned organizational names, which will be used throughout the project: Northeast, Southeast, South 1, South 2, Mid-South, Anti-Trafficking Group (ATG), Drop-In Center (DC), Deep South, West, and Northwest.³²⁵

³²⁰ In addition to this, I had a lengthy conversation with a woman from an 11th organization. The phone call was exploratory, and helpful, but in talking to the administrator I discovered that the organization didn't meet criteria. It was Christocentric, but it was entirely "outpatient," signifying that they didn't have a program where women lived on-site for any period of time. Further, their work also included girls under 18 years of age. The deviation from my established criteria was far enough removed that I didn't write up any notes for this project.

³²¹ One of these organizations also worked with girls (under 18 years of age). However, I interviewed only the administrator in that organization who was solely responsible for adult women, and all her remarks referred to the organization's involvement with the adult population.

³²² Some of their clients may have been trafficked into the USA from other countries. For this reason, I labelled that organization the "Anti-Trafficking Group" (ATG). (Anti-Trafficking Group Program, Personal Interview, February 8, 2019.) However, the administrator interviewed from that organization restricted her remarks to observations about adult women she had worked with who had been sex-trafficked within the USA. That organization also didn't specifically run a "Program" according to the criteria outlined in the Definitions section, but they provided services for women who had graduated from such "Programs." They later ended up referring me to a woman who met all the criteria for interview subjects and she participated in the interviews.

³²³ A further distinction between this organization and all the others in this study is that it operates under the jurisdiction of a single liturgical church body. All the other cooperating organizations considered themselves to be independent or interdenominational.

³²⁴ As noted in Chapter 2, none of the cooperating organizations was averse to being named, and some of them would have preferred disclosure of their names as this may have generated interest in the work they were accomplishing. The IRB at Asbury Seminary, however, asked that their identities remain anonymous to optimize security.

³²⁵ One of the administrators interviewed was not in charge of a "Program" that satisfied the research criteria, but I interviewed her with the recognition that she worked with many women who were trying to leave CSE networks. For that reason I labelled her organization as "Drop-In Center." She did not end up referring me to any subjects who had completed a Program but her insights were helpful regardless. Because her clients had not completed Programs and were typically still engaged in CSE, the demographic

4-1 b. Differences Among Organizations

As noted in Chapter 2, many anti-trafficking organizations perform significant work on several fronts.³²⁶ The primary purpose for speaking to administrators before interviewing the research subjects was four-fold: 1) To discuss the challenges and approaches to dialoguing with this population in preparation for facilitating interviews with the primary subjects. 2) To discover information about the philosophies and programmatic elements of these organizations. 3) To gain insights into what they believed to be the primary obstacles to CSE women trying to reintegrate into new communities and, conversely, what the greatest helping factors or “non-obstacles” were assisting in their reintegration journeys based upon their observations and experiences. 4) To seek the assistance of these organizations in identifying and facilitating interviews with their former clients who met research criteria.

Although I spoke with administrators from ten organizations, the following chart only reflects data from eight of them. This is due to the recognition that only eight of the organizations met strict criteria for having run “Programs” specifically designed solely for the rehabilitation of women leaving CSE networks. Remarks from administrators in the other two organizations were very helpful and are interspersed throughout this chapter; however, their organizational structures and emphases were significantly different from the other eight. I use their remarks mostly for information about obstacles faced by women who were trying to abandon CSE networks. One of these organizations

she referenced was somewhat different from the ones which other administrators addressed. I used her remarks sparingly, and the designation “DC” serves as an indicator that her experiences were those of a Drop-In Center observer, rather than that of someone who observed clients completing a Christocentric Rehabilitation.

³²⁶ Other organizations may exist for the purposes of education, rescuing, convening support groups or offering legal assistance. Many fine non-faith organizations exist which endeavor to meet the needs of CSE women. However, those administrators were not interviewed for this particular project. With the two exceptions noted above, those interviewed here worked within with the narrowly defined population upon which this study focuses.

was able to refer me to a client who completely satisfied criteria for primary respondents, while the other was unable to refer me to any woman meeting criteria.³²⁷ The similarities and differences in emphases of the programs are highlighted here in [Chart 4-1](#):

Chart 4-1: Program Policies and Estimated Statistics (from Administrative Interviews)

	Northeast	Southeast	South 1	South 2	Mid-South	Deep South	West	Northwest
Timeframe for Program Completion	2+ Years	Approx. 12 Months	Approx. 12 Months	12 Months	9 Months w/ Optional 3 Month Extension	12-24 Months	Approx. 12 Months	18-24 Months
Dating Permitted in Program	No	Discouraged	Discouraged	No	No	No, but has been loosely enforced	No	No
Job Required for Graduation	Yes	Yes- Must be a Living-Wage Job	"If They're Able" Job Equivalent	Yes, at least a Part-Time or Temporary Job	Yes	Yes	Encouraged	Job or Equivalent
12-Step Counseling for Substance Abusers	Yes	No	Yes	Sobriety, not necessarily 12-Step	Celebrate Recovery Preferred	Sobriety Required	Not Emphasized	N/A
Church Attendance Policy	Yes	Encouraged	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Recommended	Recommended (Not Compulsory)
Graduates who remain Connected (estimates)	10%	Less Than Half; Not Systematized	More Than 50%	50% Plus or Minus	45%-50%	50%	75%-80%	50%-60% (96% were tracked)
Women Remaining Free from C.S.E. (estimates)	Less Than Half	Unknown	Could Not Speculate	50%-60%	70%	85%	About 50% Plus or Minus (some readmitted at later date)	75%

4-1 c. Program Enrollment vs. Program Completion

Interviews with the primary respondents was delimited to those who had completed Christocentric rehabilitational programs. The Programs assessed for this study varied in length, but the requirement of program completion established a standard indicating the participant had done everything programmatically available to her during that season to prepare for a new life in community. Some of the organizations offered complete Programs that were surprisingly long. The Northwest administrator noted,

So the first phase is six months. The second phase is an additional four to eight months. Then the third phase is

³²⁷ The two outlying organizations not running Programs (DC and ATG) satisfied the latter two purposes. They possessed insights into obstacles for flourishing in community, and they had the potential to refer me to interview subjects who met criteria. The ATG group indeed referred me to a subject who completely satisfied criteria, and who eventually completed both interviews for the study. The DC group was not able to refer me to any such subject, as their primary clientele consisted of women who were active in CSE, and the administrator didn't know of any clients with whom she was still connected that had completed a Program.

eight to ten months. So... out of all three phases we have had four people graduate. Out of those four people, there has been three that have maintained their sobriety and been “successful.” Louise (*pseudonym for another administrator*) and I being two of them. And we’ve had what, 56 women through the program? (*Confers with Louise*). So more than that. Almost sixty. And *several* of them have graduated Phase II. And are doing *very* well.³²⁸

Due to exceptional demand and their desire to serve as many CSE women as possible, the Mid-South Program has shortened their mandatory residency requirements. The administrator reported, “It’s pretty much cut off at nine months. Now there’s an option to stay longer. An extra three months that are available to them, if they feel like they need some extra transitional care.”³²⁹

4-2 The Interviews

The administrative interviews took place from January 29, 2019, through March 18, 2019. They were not designed to provide the researcher with a weighted list of obstacles and deficits in the lives of CSE women, but rather to identify patterns and principles these professionals had observed in the lives of their clients. I used the administrative interviews to prepare me for the primary subjects whom Dr. Whitaker and I would eventually interview in July through September of 2019. Their observations were to inform the questions I would ask the CSE women and to enable me to approach that demographic group with sensitivity and enhanced understanding. In addition to that, I desired to generate sufficient enthusiasm and insight about the project that they would be willing to refer prospective subjects to me.

Dr. Whitaker and I were able to visit the campuses of three of the primary organizations meeting research criteria. On two of those occasions, we also met the directors of the organizations and conversed with them informally. At two of the

³²⁸ Northwest Program, Personal Interview, January 29, 2019.

³²⁹ Mid-South Program, Personal Interview, February 15, 2019.

facilities, programmatic activities took place in two campus buildings. One of these had recently built several townhomes on their property where several graduates had moved in with their families. The third facility I visited was an extremely large house in a residential neighborhood. The administrator with whom I spoke at that location stated how they also utilized several other buildings throughout the metropolitan area, including a separate residential facility used to house girls. That organization was further involved in opening a group of tiny homes on privately opened land for individual Program graduates to move into if they so desired. In each instance, the facilities were immaculate and accommodating.

I was able to participate in what I consider a “partial visit” of another organization’s headquarters. It took place in offices that were rented for the administrative purposes of the organization, but it was not in the same location where the CSE women lived and engaged in programmatic activities. I also conducted an administrative interview at the Drop-in Center located in an older building in an urban center.³³⁰ The location was within easy walking distance of the domain of many of their clients. Volunteers made food, and others dropped off care packages for the clients while I was there. When the doorbell rang, the personnel used caution in permitting entrance into the facility. Most of the clients frequenting the DC were still active in CSE. The director explained to me that boyfriends, pimps and clients had regularly tried to breach the building in search of particular women or seeking information about women they claimed to know, although these were never accommodated.

The Institutional Review Board Asbury Seminary stipulated that 1) Approved releases of consent must be signed and returned in advance of the interview; 2) That the

³³⁰ Drop-In Center Program, Personal Interview, February 22, 2019.

names of the administrators and their organizations remain confidential; and 3) That permission to record would be obtained before the conversations were recorded. The IRB also approved a list of questions to be used in the interview process, and the administrators were emailed the questions in advance of the interviews. The agreed-upon protocol was adhered to for all interviews. Each of the subjects agreed to be recorded, and their remarks were transcribed verbatim for use in this chapter. No noteworthy problems or concerns arose during the interviews. In the ensuing weeks, five of the organizations agreed to provide contact information to prospective subjects to be interviewed for the primary interviews. These referrals resulted in eighteen qualified contacts who expressed interest in participating. Seventeen of these completed a questionnaire (self-interview) and a face-to-face interview during the months of July through November 2019.

4-3 Summary of Insights and Remarks

The administrative interviews weren't systematically assessed until after the principal transcription and analysis was done with the CSE subjects.³³¹ Brief summaries and quotes of the administrators' remarks regarding Obstacles and Assets to flourishing are found in Appendix 4-1. The following is a compilation of the most relevant insights the administrators provided along with comments deviating from remarks in which consensus was achieved.

4-3 a. Obstacles to Flourishing

³³¹ The remarks were arranged into the following categories: Organizational/programmatic elements; The greatest obstacles to flourishing observed post-program; Chief assets promoting holistic flourishing observed; Comments made by administrators regarding community; Comments regarding spiritual transformation; Grey areas; Other remarks relevant but unrelated to these six categories. The remarks regarding Community and Spiritual Transformation were further scrutinized after I had finished analyzing the CSE respondents' remarks, as they appear in chapters 5 and 6, due to their prominence in the remarks of the principal subjects

4-3 a-i. Engaging in Unhealthy Relationships was mentioned by the administrators more than any other factor obstructing flourishing. Regarding a direct question about primary obstacles to flourishing, a Southeast administrator quipped,

I think this is going to be really surprising but... *men*. (*We laugh*). I was just trying to be funny. Definitely the chief obstacle is some kind of unhealthy previous relationship. But it's not always a romantic relationship. It's sometimes with their families. Those are the big ones... it's normally a previous relationship. But sometimes it's "Well we're both going to rehab together and we want to stay together while we're doing it." And... it never works.³³²

The theme of establishing community with people whom the subjects predicted would be injurious to their clients was ubiquitous. In their experiences, they had seen a few women fall into lesbian relationships, but coupling up with an unreliable male was by far the most common phenomenon shared. The Administrator I spoke to from the Deep South remarked,

Something that I see a lot-- *it's almost like I can set my watch*. It's when they're successful on the outside, and then here comes "love". And *that* can knock them off their path very quickly (*Laughs*). You know, that commitment and accountability and understanding of healthy relationships is very important. We're just beginning to address that at the (Deep South Program) and we're really just beginning to see how you can have everything in place, but if you have a certain taste in a certain type of person, and that person is not healthy person-- then you're in trouble.³³³

The administrators commonly evoked the "Bad Boy" terminology employed by the CSE clients themselves. One of the administrators from the Mid-South spoke of her ongoing efforts to convince her clients that although on the surface these men sometimes seemed to appear for redemptive purposes, it never ended well for the women who were just beginning to establish themselves into communities:

³³² Southeast Program, Personal Interview, January 29, 2019.

³³³ Deep South Program, Personal Interview.

They think, well I see some potential “Bad Boy” -- I can help to change him! I’ve had so many bad things happen to me I can share them with him (*laughing*)! But we’re like, “No, you can’t change him.” All the things literally that we had talked about not doing, and she had agreed with, then all of a sudden, she’s doing them all. She’s got this guy and she’s trying to get him into meetings, and she’s trying to get him a sponsor and I was like, “You’ve got to stop. Your job is not to rescue and save him.”

The administrator from the Southeast, who had been CSE herself and had completed her employer’s Program years before, was able to draw upon her own experiences and the frame of mind that had accompanied her in rehabilitation as well as upon her years of working directly with the clients in numerous capacities. She emphasized their tendencies to become obsessively reliant upon a man for decision-making and guidance. Her remarks appeared to be hyperbolic, but this underscored the frequency and predictability of the phenomenon she had observed in the Program and caring for the women after they had left:

...A lot of times, they can’t imagine them being by themselves for a year, or eighteen months, without being in a relationship or not having a man. And ten times out of ten, that gets in the way of their recovery. And, I don’t have any numbers, but I would say 99% of the women who have left our program, you can look back and see where it started.

The predictability and apparent naivete of their clients regarding men was so embedded in their experiences that the administrators often laughed and joked when discussing this. Everybody around them seemed able to predict the outcomes of the folly that awaited the reintegrating CSE clients except for the clients themselves. This presented as co-dependent behavior often acquired from having their freedoms restricted by a domineering pimp.³³⁴ Rachel Lloyd, the founder of GEMS (Girls Educational and Mentoring Services) discusses the enduring psychological draw pimps have upon some

³³⁴ Herman, *Trauma and Recovery: Aftermath*.

of the women they have exploited, beginning with her own narrative. Years after being free from his abusive control, she still feels drawn to the man and calls him up to report on her well-being. "...Despite all my progress, there is part of me that is still glued to him,"³³⁵ she writes. Though thousands of miles divided them, she nevertheless fell to the floor and covered her head when he began to make angry and violent threats over the phone. Even so, several years later she looked up his phone number when she was passing within a few hours of his home and considered contacting him.³³⁶ She recounts with empathy the stories of several other girls enrolled in her program who ran off with their pimps after they have been emancipated and rehabilitated because she fully understands the phenomenon.³³⁷ Mansson and Hedin underscore the need for "hardiness and resilience" for women breaking away from The Life due to their ingrained tendencies to automatically co-opt the whims of others for their lives.³³⁸ The conditioning may have occurred over a period of years, and it may reasonably take several years to reprogram one's thinking. One of the administrators from the Northwest, who had also graduated from the Program where she was now employed remarked on how

We will have women who come in and saying, "Oh, he doesn't use, he doesn't use." And then come to find out that he drinks but then they'll say, "Yeah, but he doesn't use anything else." And I say, "Yeah—so you can leave this Program to live with this guy every day, and you're going to be cool with that. You're never going to drink while you're with him." And then she'll just say, "Oh I'm, just going to be with him, I'm just going to drink a little bit, and I'm just going to smoke a little pot." (*Laughs nervously*). I mean, if you're around it— what *we* say is, you're eventually going to do it.

Another sub-theme that emerged is that some of the reintegrating CSE clients had often quickly found men with whom they moved in for the principal purpose of being

³³⁵ Lloyd, *Girls Like Us*, 186.

³³⁶ Lloyd, 186.

³³⁷ Lloyd, 190–94.

³³⁸ Månsson and Hedin, "Matthew Effect," 75.

able to pay their bills more easily. One of the Mid-South administrators identified a pattern in which she had observed clients "...Shacking up with the guy in (*Southern City*) just due to financial concerns. They're both chipping away at the bills..." she continued. "It gives them an opportunity to catch their breath a little bit, makes them feel like we're both going to be okay. But then, who they shack up with just creates other (problems)." While one or two of the administrators might concede that romance six months' out of the program could conceivably be positive, they were unanimous in believing it was unacceptable for a former client to cohabit with a man for financial purposes. The premise that their client might meet a "Bad Boy" whom they would affirmatively influence or rehabilitate was also universally dismissed by the administrators.

4-3 a-ii. Poor Ingrained Spending Habits

Continuing with the theme of financial need, the administrators spoke about how the navigation of paltry starting incomes placed their clients at the precipice of having to make dangerous or devastating choices. Poor incomes placed them in poor neighborhoods, which exposed them to danger, to an abundance of accessible drugs, and the temptation to sometimes earn "easy money" as a mechanism to move up the economic ladder more rapidly. Another recurring financial issue was the presence of fines and fees requiring repayment, but especially the payment of child support for children who were now being raised by others.³³⁹ The administrator at the South 1 Program observed:

One the biggest complications I feel we can run into is child support. That can be a huge issue. We tried to do as much as we can with that while they're in the Program; but some of them owe back pay from child support that will take them years to pay off. And some of them don't want to open a bank account, because child support will take out what's there. (*Laughs*)... That's a problem to *me*. They may not

³³⁹ Jackson, Bennett, and Sowinski, "Stress in Sex Trade"; Oselin, "Weighing the Consequences"; Valandra, "Reclaiming Their Lives."

see it as a problem, but I see it as a problem. If you don't have a place to store your paycheck and then you just walk around with this cash, it's much easier to spend it than it is to responsibly save it and delegate where it goes.³⁴⁰

If the CSE women reintegrating into communities were able to defer child support while they were in the Programs, or if they were living rent-free and able to make payments during the Programs, that was all subject to change once they had left the facilities, began working full-time, and moved into their own domiciles. In addition to being compelled to negotiate new expenses they are threatened with jail time if they get too far behind on legal payments. All those responsibilities were levied without the advantage of being able to experience most of the positive benefits of parenting their children.

4-3 a-iii. Workplace Inexperience

Holding down regular jobs, much less managing careers, may be something that doesn't occur without a good deal of struggle for some of the CSE women reintegrating into communities. They have been subjected to extremely degrading work environments, and other agents have ordinarily assumed responsibility for paying their bills. Managing their money and spending their money in a disciplined fashion can be common struggles for them. Administrators reported that many have been accustomed to staying up late and sleeping into the early afternoon. The realities of assuming responsible employment may be foreign to them at first.³⁴¹ Neglecting these skills may be critical errors. One of the administrators from the Northeast put it this way:

...For some of these women, forty-hour work weeks are quite hard. And at the end of the day they get a paycheck and they say, "Wait, wait a minute, what's this FICA thing?" (Laughs). Which has been the hardest just as far as integration, living on their own? But also... You know what? ... they didn't know that they needed to, it's easy for us to say if you're in the new environment, if that makes

³⁴⁰ South 1 Program, Personal Interview, February 6, 2019.

³⁴¹ Dalla, "You Can't Hustle All Your Life"; Su, "Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health."

sense. It's very hard to... Learn the community while you're working at the same time.³⁴²

Although the administrators used different approaches to encourage their clients to become acclimated to the work force, they all recognized how difficult the transition to a *Square Life* would be. The administrator I spoke to from the West, who had also herself been exploited for many years, articulated an approach that may not have sounded sufficiently sympathetic on the surface, but rang with the authenticity of an insider:

First of all: you know what it is to work hard. Because you are working for a trafficker. He slaved you out, right? Why would you not work just as hard for your employer? Except, now you get a paycheck-- you get to keep the money. Yeah, when the girls expect to be given things...? They're not ready—you're not ready. Girl—*work!* Let's not be lazy here.³⁴³

In many of the Programs represented here, the women enrolled only had about a year at most to prepare for entirely new lifestyles. It was critical that they rapidly absorb insights offered to them to keep from stumbling.

4-3 a-iv. Evading Healthy Supports

One set of relational problems was explained by the Southeast administrator:

...the women have never *had* anyone to show them what a healthy relationships looks like. So, when somebody is overly, like (*in an exaggerated authoritarian voice*): “What are you doing-- where have you been?” we would think “Oh, that's like creepy!” but to them it's like, “Oh! He loves me! He cares about me!” So even just taking the time to learn, *What is a healthy relationship? What are the things to look for?*

While some of the administrators were particularly concerned about actively seeking out people who might be malignant, this category appears different in that the emphasis is upon flight rather than pursuit. The end result may have been that they fell in with people

³⁴² Northeast Program, Personal Interview, March 7, 2019.

³⁴³ West Program, Personal Interview, March 18, 2019.

who were unhealthy for them, or it may have been isolation—i.e., no significant community at all. The Program representatives discussed how some of their former clients were overly confident and headstrong when reintegrating, not bothering to remain in touch with their established support systems and failing to build new ones. Several of them also recognized that these women not only neglected community, but they also resisted or actively evaded affirmative support networks after graduating. This was always an indicator for them that something was defective. “When they stop checking in, this is a bad sign” remarked the Southeast coordinator.

4-3 a-v. Interfering History

The administrators provided several examples of women who had been enrolled in Programs, but complications involving their old lives and identities continued to envelop them, thwarting their flourishing efforts. Sometimes this was due to legal charges that endured when they entered rehabilitational facilities. Other times it was because their clients were legally tethered to custodial situations, such as to pimps who were the legal parent on their children’s birth certificates to whom they were legally married; Or they chose to correspond with relatives who had serially abused them in the past but were currently acting friendly towards them. In other situations, the habit patterns protecting them when they lived in survival mode had proven too entrenched for them to navigate their new situations. The administrator from the West made a humorous aside about this during our session:

West: It’s basically this: You’re stuck in the past. You’re stuck in a time machine. Get out of there! Quit going back to the future! We don’t need to fix anything in the past--okay? We’re not in the DeLorean there with... (*she pauses*)
 Tim: *Michael J Fox?* (*We laugh.*)

Like some of the other prevalent obstacles ensnaring their clientele, this phenomenon may seem darkly humorous in its predictability to those who have observed it repeatedly.

This underscored a common frustration recurring among the administrators. They expressed that if their reintegrating clients could only see their behaviors through the lenses of experience, they could avoid further sorrows.

The administrator in the Northeast also mentioned another aspect of the “interfering history” obstacle that might easily be missed by an interviewer:

The past is always following them. So it’s almost like a fear... The one person I’m thinking of right now is so afraid of someone finding out about her past that she’s kind of holding herself hostage, if that makes sense... Because she so worried about it, she’s putting on a false front and being too... too perfect, if that makes sense. That she thinks she has to do well and everything—so she’s the other end of the spectrum. She’s become such a perfectionist, a lot of them do that, and that becomes an obstacle for them because we know that’s hard to maintain.

The administrators are heavily invested in these women, with whom they may spend an entire year or more of their lives. Their primary goal is to see them flourish. Yet, their training and experiences help them recognize that perfectionism is characteristic of addictive behaviors and as such may also be predictors of relapse.³⁴⁴ Far from possessing legalistic approaches, the administrators at the eight primary organizations utilized the language of *grace* and *love* in their approaches. I recorded no examples of unrealistic expectations such as pressures for perfectionism among them. During interviews with the CSE respondents (Discussed in chapter 5 and 6), none of them complained that they were being held to unattainable, idealistic standards. The administrators presumed that clients would fail at intervals on the journey, and strong, adequately trained support

³⁴⁴ Peggy J. Cantrell, “The Relationship Between Relapse Prevention Treatment Outcome and Self-Efficacy” (Conference Paper, Annual Convention of the American Psychological Association, Toronto, Canada, August 22, 1993), <http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=ED370065&site=ehost-live>; W Bryce Hagedorn and Holly J Hartwig Moorhead, “The God-Shaped Hole: Addictive Disorders and the Search for Perfection,” *Counseling and Values* 55, no. 1 (October 2010): 63–78; Stephanie A. Nugent, “Perfectionism: Its Manifestations and Classroom-Based Interventions,” *Journal of Secondary Gifted Education* 11, no. 4 (Summer 2000): 215–21, <https://doi.org/10.4219/jsge-2000-630>.

networks were subsequently encouraged to support them when those inevitable failures occurred.

4-3 a-vi. Social Media Use and Approval Seeking

Several administrators reported on having issued warnings to their clients avoiding social media while they were in the Programs. Others have mandated that their clients weren't permitted access to cell phones while they are enrolled in the Program or minimally that the phones get checked into the offices. Once the CSE women leave the Programs, though, no agent is restricting their social media usage. While media is a communication tool that can be used for many purposes, the administrators and mentors advise Program graduates to be cautious in this area, as expressed by the South 2 administrator here:

...Another thing we seen is, women who have gotten points for getting on Facebook or social media, and the *main* reason they (CSE participants) say is because "I just want people to see how *good* I'm doing. So that's why I'm posting a picture, that's why I said I have a job." And I say like "Why do you still feel like you need to get their approval?" And that goes back to, like, to search for significance again. Why do you need *their* approval to know that you're doing good? Like, they don't need to know that. And so, it never fails—we always find out, because there's always somebody who comes back and says "So and so is on Facebook and they posted a picture, and..." And I think that's just this generation, too. That's how you promote yourself is through social media.³⁴⁵

The administrators warned their former clients about the temptations of falling into patterns of self-promotion. Old friends move quickly from congratulations to manipulative flattery. In addition to that, the platforms they use often identify where they are currently located, leading to additional dangers.

4-3 a-vii. Failure to Embrace Spiritual Transformation and Forgiveness

³⁴⁵ South 2 Program, Personal Interview, February 11, 2019.

Whether or not one can technically consider it an “obstacle” if a CSE woman fails to embrace spirituality or not is arguable but the administrators interviewed for this study all worked for Christocentric Programs, and some of them framed spiritual failure in terms of obstruction. The respondent from the Northeast lamented, “Those that do not embrace Christianity tend to... I don’t know... They’re just... They fall a lot quicker. I just feel like they’re wandering a lot more, if that makes sense.” Since the representatives of the programs all stated that allegiance to Christianity is not coerced, it may be a philosophical stretch to connect the two in this manner. Rather than considering whether this “deficit” is technically correct or not, it appears that the administrators were simply expressing their heartfelt values; They have observed that those with a solid faith foundation are more inclined to flourish.

In contrast to this, the administrator from the West discussed not only the spiritual commitments she had seen her participants successfully utilize, but also specific Christian values, particularly forgiveness. The foil to that is that unforgiveness, from her perspective, seriously impedes her clients’ abilities to acclimate in community:

If they cannot process the... The unforgiveness they have towards their perpetrators that have hurt them... And *current* people who have hurt them... that they are observing who have hurt them... They are not going to make it. They fail. And we *all do*—when we don’t forgive, we all fail. So, what that does is, it gets them angry... Now they’re getting high again. And then there slipping back into, “*I’ve got to get money for this*” and “*I’ve got to get money for that*”, and all of a sudden, back into the lifestyle.

It is particularly noteworthy how the administrator presented this as both a universal and a specific problem. And yet, she noted, this is also the *common condition* of humanity. Just as the Christian scriptures teach that all have sinned and fallen short of God’s glory (Romans 3:23), the struggles of CSE women reintegrating have parallels to the common struggles of humanity, if they allow bitterness to fulminate without resolution.

On the one hand, the CSE women are expressly marked in this manner, because they have been egregiously violated and may transmit vast deposits of anger and sorrow. Andrew Sung Park would say that they have accumulated a surplus of *han* and have possibly descended into a state of resentful bitterness and feelings of abandonment.³⁴⁶ If this is an active form of bitterness, they may be weighed down with thoughts of revenge.³⁴⁷ But if it is passive, they often descend into self-denigration, feeling as if they deserved what happened to them, too absorbed in despair to easily invest their feelings into forgiveness.³⁴⁸ The undeserved wrong, after all, was perpetrated upon them, and forgiveness is something they are owed rather than something they're obligated to offer. They may engage in actively taking revenge upon themselves, dismayed that they were too stupid or unworthy to avoid the circumstances that engulfed them. Self-sabotage may be a recognizable phenomenon, but recognition is not resolution. Psycho-spiritual healing must be employed for flourishing to be optimized.

4-3 b. Assets Optimizing Flourishing

The administrators expressed the sentiment that CSE women who had completed their programs were successful if they did not return to a life of sexual exploitation. They also should be compelled to demonstrate they are "...willing to live clean and sober to a degree", as one of the administrators from the Northwest revealed. It is imperative that "...She is willing to live a transparent life... Who can ask for help when she needs it. I think that is *huge*," she added. The administrator from the West noted that she didn't necessarily consider women to have failed if they returned to The Life for a time, if they came back to the Program later and tried again. As with substance abusers, relapse may

³⁴⁶ Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 19.

³⁴⁷ Park, 32.

³⁴⁸ Park, 34.

be a component of the cycle which eventually leads to complete recovery.³⁴⁹ The administrator also noted a number of other factors indicative that the residents in her Program were travelling the road to stability:

Learning to love themselves and really learning to believe that they are worth it. And refusing to be treated badly anymore—refuse to be treated like an object anymore or to be abused by people? Changing their friends. Changing their work environment and changing even their family. Deciding to (abandon family who have) been severely abusive and have good conflict resolution skills, and good boundary skills.

All these sentiments were echoed in varying degrees by other administrators throughout our discussions.

4-3 b-i. Vocational Stability

The insight that CSE women reintegrating into communities require financial stability beginning with a sustainable job—one with the potential for raises and/or promotions—was commonly expressed by the administrators. They provided a number of qualifying remarks addressing some of the nuances involved in this process, such as the administrator from the South 2 Program who remarked “We still try to encourage them to *continue* to progress in that. Because if they’re going to work in a warehouse, we have the viewpoint that they should do their work well... ‘steady income’ is important.” For this administrator, maintaining a positive attitude and doing a quality job even in a meager position were tied into identification with those who were following Christian principles.

The Program founder from the West and another administrator referred to a phenomenon that developed among some of the women reintegrating in that they adopt a

³⁴⁹ Cantrell, “Relapse Prevention Treatment”; Carl G. Leukefeld and Frank M. Tims, “Relapse and Recovery in Drug Abuse: Research and Practice,” *International Journal of the Addictions* 24, no. 3 (March 1989): 189–201, <https://doi.org/10.3109/10826088909047283>.

kind of entitlement mentality. They are understandably angry and extremely frustrated about having been co-opted into their previous lifestyles with little or no input permitted into the management of their own affairs. After they have completed the Programs, they feel as though the world owes them some sort of restitution. They were given things, including room and board, while they were being rehabilitated, and they may become content living in perpetuity upon the good graces of others. But, as the respondent from the West noted, that situation would not result in healthy reintegration.

The administrators discussed how some of their clients had to take entry-level positions due to their lack of experience—but this continually motivated them to work towards career paths that would sustain them in the long run. One of the Mid-South administrators disclosed how

...A lot of my ladies just have not had a lot of job experience. So for them success is just, you know getting a job, even if it's a Kroger's or McDonald's. They have to adjust to the mindset that they're making minimum wage; that's kind of hard for them. They have to start building that resume. But I have others who... Like, right now I have one who's going to CNA school. So when she graduates, she will be working. In an industry, in a field where she... feels called to.

Entry-level jobs were regarded as a kind of necessary evil. The wages accrued usually weren't enough to result in financial flourishing/stability. As the administrator from the West observed

So, I think that offering jobs... Is definitely a plus. But jobs that would be the kind that would offer some opportunity as well. To go up in the company. I think that will help survivors want to actually try what they call the "Square Life."

Many of the clients had not experienced meaningful work environments, and they needed to begin somewhere. Several of the administrators affirmed that good wages could be obtained in the hospitality industry, particularly in waitressing, but they discouraged their former clients from choosing that path. One of the Mid-South administrators noted,

They may say “I’m a really, really good waitress—I’m really great at it. But because of the alcohol, I can’t work in Applebee’s.” Or “Because of what I know goes on with employees after hours, I really can’t work jobs that close at 1 o’clock in the morning. I really need to not be around that kind of stuff at 1 o’clock in the morning because I end up partying after work is over.”

Flourishing, then, also requires the reintegrating actor not only to earn a living wage, but also to gain enough insight to recognize the industries which would be most beneficial to her welfare and avoid the ones likely to facilitate relapse.

The Organizations in the South 1 and Mid-South have both enrolled women over forty years of age into their Programs in addition to the more numerous younger women. They found employment opportunities for all their clients but recognized the reality that some had been too physically or mentally traumatized to ever pursue vocations with advancement potential. In those situations, they were willing to concede that some clients might have to collect disability and find ways to experience meaningful activities—namely, what the South I administrator perceived as the difference between clients who had been kidnapped or verifiably forced into CSE, and those who asserted agency in their former exploitative lifestyles:

I would say that women who have really been “trafficked” have more plans for themselves: They want to get an education, they want to work. They want to be safe, they want to have their own sense of safety. They want all of the normal things that other people have to establish some sort of normalcy in their lives. So they would like to change their name, be in a totally different place than they’ve ever been before which feels as safe as possible to them and have a functioning life when nobody ever asks them about their past. ...They can just pretend like none of that ever happened (*Laughs*).³⁵⁰

³⁵⁰ As indicated in Chapter 1, it is beyond the scope of this study to attempt to distinguish between “prostitutes” and the “trafficked.” It is an interesting distinction, though, and a worthy topic for further research.

4-3 b-ii. Emotional Well-Being and Sobriety

One theme that reverberated regarding the assets utilized by CSE women to flourish in community was that they had to demonstrate they had been emotionally healed, or at least that they were travelling along healing trajectories. If the subjects had acquired PTSD from their experiences or if they had possessed mental illnesses, continuing in post-programmatic counseling was indicative that they were acclimating properly. The administrator from South 2 discussed how her former clients needed to adopt submissive attitudes towards caregivers and those in their support networks. The director from the West emphasized the need for reintegrating former clients to forgive themselves, while the Southeast administrator focused upon the ability of her former clients to be emotionally healthy to the degree that they have learned to “give back” to the community rather than maintaining inwardly focused perspectives. Before graduating from the Programs, the women staying in the rehabilitational facilities were required to demonstrate they had achieved sobriety as well as having broken free from exploitative networks. The administrators in the Northwest and West facilities noted that this was a priority in their Programs. For the South1 Program, these two factors carried somewhat equal weight. The program director from that organization indicated that even if the women were not *flourishing* per se, she was sanguine if they were at least able to *maintain*. “And what I mean by maintaining is, that they can still stay in their sobriety... They will still be productive members of society, meaning they are going to work, they are paying their bills, and they are no longer committing any types of illegal acts,” she remarked good-naturedly.

4-3 b-iii. The Presence of Affirmative Community

One of the two administrators interviewed from the Northwest program remarked that for her, an indicator of flourishing would be a woman who has found community.

Other organizations also affirmed this view with a variety of qualifications. A respondent from the Northwest had also graduated from the Program where she was currently working, so later she added a personal perspective:

For me, it was seeing mature Christians. Like, learning what it was like being a Christian. It was having people break it down for me. You know, seeing married couples and what their relationship was like. Being able to ask those questions. You know, what does typical parenting look like, and being able to tailor that to being a single mom.

The administrator from the Southeast had also recovered through the Program where she was currently working. She stated "... I just had a lot of good support around me. And so, thankfully, I was able to stay consistent and to stay sober and stay the course." Later, she added

Um, it's so important that the girls find someone they can connect with and that they trust, who will check in on them... I think, that for the women who choose to pursue Christianity—the ones who are more likely to establish community, to give back to the community, to not be in a relationship *because* of the Christian beliefs. In recovery, being by yourself is never a good thing.

The administrator of the D-C was adamant about the value of maintaining a supportive community particularly if it is a spiritual one:

(CSE women need) solid support of community that accepts them. A spiritual community. And they're involved with that-- whether that means just attending services. Typically they have a small group. Yeah. An active, spiritual life... you encourage them to reunite with healthy people and reconstruct healthy relationships. And to stay away from those relationships that led them into addiction or encourage and help with their addictions.³⁵¹

Many of them made a distinction between Christian community and other kinds of community. The consensual view was that spiritual or religious community was generally

³⁵¹ Drop-In Center Program, Personal Interview.

the best but that it wasn't the only variety of *healthy* or *positive* community. The South1 administrator noted that "...whether that means that they only go to church or they're only going to AA and NA meetings, or maybe they just have a group of people that they associate with that they keep connected with that really help promote their emotional and mental health... basically, good groups of friends that are healthy for them."

The founder of the Twelve-Step movement, Bill Wilson, experienced great disappointment with the abilities of organized churches in the 20th century to develop programs that dealt with real-world problems. He recognized how faith in God had been the greatest asset facilitating his own ability to maintain sobriety. Recognizing this truth as based upon the faith-based teachings of Samuel Shoemaker, Wilson considered some of the theological propositions he'd encountered in churches to be relevant only to "religious" people, while the severities of his addiction didn't appear to be addressed in churches with which he was familiar.³⁵² Shoemaker had taught him that men may be redeemed in a life-changing fellowship.³⁵³ He began his own fellowship to address the deficit he perceived, in which God's power would assist people in overcoming their obsessive-compulsive impulses and a community would be available to alcoholics during the week to assist them and hold one another accountable.³⁵⁴ Many of the AA/Recovery principles are applicable to recovering CSE women, particularly if they also experienced addictions. Many of the administrators I spoke with, however, might depart from Wilson on the role of the church. The 21st century world is much different from the 20th century model referenced by Shoemaker and Wilson and not all the CSE women were subject to addictions. Beyond that, though, most of the administrators had found church

³⁵² Bill Pittman and Dick B., eds., *Courage to Change: The Christian Roots of the Twelve-Step Movement* (Center City, MN: Hazelden, 1994), 14; Ernest Kurtz, *Not-God: A History of Alcoholics Anonymous*, 1st edition (Center City, Minn: Hazelden Publishing, 1991), 177.

³⁵³ Pittman and B., *Courage to Change*, 191.

³⁵⁴ Kurtz, *Not God*, 209.

involvement to be very helpful, and women who didn't join a church were encouraged to at least surround themselves with redemptive individuals. Several of the administrators addressed co-dependency, noting that for many years their former clients had been compelled to allow men to make all decisions for them and manage their lives and they were now predisposed to falling into similarly familiar patterns. An administrator from the Northeast program related how they dealt with women graduating from their

Program:

We asked them to surround themselves with key people, with people you can trust from a spiritual aspect and from a social aspect. Or it could be vocational or academic. Depending on what's going on in their lives. Who are the key people you need to surround yourselves with? Who can you reach out to? You talk to them and ask them if they can identify who this type of person would be. And stay connected to those people.

Accountability was one factor the administrators cited regarding the critical need of community in the lives of CSE women. One of the Northwest administrators placed a positive spin on her recommendation that her reintegrating former clients need "...somebody in the community who is like a mentor to you. You know, somebody who is wise; They have the liberty to call you out." The administrator from the rehabilitational facility in the West took a much blunter approach in similarly assessing the need for experienced mentors:

A lot of people don't want to hold these girls accountable. People are afraid to address them. But me--? I'm gutter. Like, for example, I'll say, "*Did you turn a trick last night?*" And a lot of girls are like, "*Well, I'm offended!*" And I'm like, "*Well be offended then—but I'm you. I used to be just like you. Don't try to pull the wool over my eyes, okay?*"

Both of these administrators recognized that in an effective mentoring relationship, some confrontation may be needed. As with any healthy community, conflict is inevitable, but this needn't be viewed in negative terms. Only with confrontation can there be

resolution, which results in enhanced flourishing and socio-spiritual health when properly executed.³⁵⁵ When the Program participants complete their rehabilitations, an established network of support remains. Only the Northeast Program stated that they were not intentional about remaining in contact with their graduates, and one of the administrators of that Program remarked that she thought they should probably be re-evaluating that perspective.³⁵⁶ A common theme among them was that not only should the graduates remain in touch with the networks they had already established in the programs, but also that this was a critical indicator of socio-spiritual health. The administrator of the South 2 program elucidated:

...The ones that we see that are really growing are the ones who are in constant communication with us. You know, they'll call us every once in a while. They'll send us text messages. We're usually leery of the ones who don't communicate after they've graduated. Because, if you're here and this has made such a big impact in your life, you would kinda want to tell people that you're doing better.

One of the administrators from the Mid-South programs concurred: "The ones that stay in contact with me here, with my staff or even with my volunteers-- they seem to do a lot better. They have better success than for the ones who just cut themselves off." As a foil to this, the Administrator from the Deep South emphasized how the graduates should resist the impulse to neglect establishing deep community *outside* of the Program:

You know, the development of positive relationships is really key— relationships with people *outside* of our program. We have a number of community mentors-- women who come in from our community, volunteers, who will mentor them one on one. It is really a spiritual mother to them. And when those relationships are very strong, that mentor is not only guiding them when she's visiting with

³⁵⁵ Moore, *Called to Community*, 181–86.

³⁵⁶ Although this Program was set up ideologically similarly to the other ones that provided interviews, they were outliers in two areas: 1) They admitted they had made little effort to remain in contact with participants after they had exited the Program, and 2) Both administrators I spoke with estimated that successful reintegration into communities after leaving their program was probably quite low.

them, but she's also taking the women out into the community and introducing them to other people. Which helps her think a little bit further down the line than just our program, then. When those relationships are very strong, that's very powerful.

One final observation the administrators initiated focused not only upon the dangers associated with defective community, but also with having too *little* community. The South 1 administrator offered that

...(Isolation is) the issue sometimes. When they move off on their own, they go from living in a community of women, and a houseful of women, and they go into living in an apartment by themselves... And if they are not surrounding themselves with a good support system, um, and they just kind of hide out, hang out and they just isolate themselves in their apartment—they get lonely. While some of them say that they're okay with being lonely— they're *not*. We're not made for being lonely-- were not made that way. We *need* relationships in order for us to feel valid.

While rugged individualism is deeply rooted in America's social consciousness, the results of this can be counterproductive according to those who had cared for the CSE graduates. Codependency results in one set of unhealthy behaviors, but isolation is not the antidote, as it results in a different variety of defective socio-spiritual health. Interdependency within the boundaries of a strong supportive network appears to result in the most positive community reintegration experience, according to those who have invested their careers in outreach to this population.

4-3 b-iv. The Spiritual Component

The administrators spoke to this researcher on the record, and I perceived that I was commonly identified as a “fellow traveler” doing research for a conservative seminary. I had no mechanism for being objective about Christian faith—nor did I feel constrained by that need. A kind of camaraderie therefore rapidly developed between the interviewer and many of the administrators. This was most evident when they spoke

about the spiritual lives of their clients including transformative behaviors they had recognized in some participants, and their personal disappointments in the relatively meager spiritual formation of others. For example, the administrator in the Southeast declared,

...This is my personal opinion. But that's (Christianity) what keeps a reason behind what you're doing. If you don't believe in Christianity, if you don't believe anything outside of this world, it gets dark pretty quick. I'm thinking of past participants.

The administrator I spoke to in the West concurred. Hers had been one of the first organizations in the U.S. to begin a program of rehabilitation specifically focused upon women who had been CSE. She had not been at all subtle either in the branding of her organization, or in explicitly expressing its purpose. Christ had transformed her and enabled her to leave abusive structures perpetuated by evil agents, she declared. If you are not willing to consider a Christ-centered solution, you probably shouldn't apply for services with her organization, as she noted that the application process is arduous, and the waiting list is long:

I gotta go back to the question you asked me (about factors promoting flourishing) because I want to make sure I answer that correctly for you.... I think our main one would be: The Christ factor. That they've introduced Christ into their heart, that they've accepted that God has created them, and that he has a plan for them, period.

One of the administrators I spoke to in the Northeast expressed the inverse of the same sentiment, noting that those who *don't* make a profession of faith or submit to spiritual transformation are the women who struggle the most in community: "Those that do not embrace Christianity tend to... I don't know... They're just... They fall a lot quicker. I just feel like they're wandering a lot more, if that makes sense." None of these claimed that Christianity was a panacea for the struggles the women faced, but they were

convinced that it constituted the primary difference between flourishing and floundering, based upon their observations. They seemed enthusiastic in my presence with the recognition that most women they had worked with had become spiritually transformed or had at least embraced Christian faith principles.

Some of the organizations required their clients to attend churches, while for others it was optional as Chart 4-1 indicates. No incidences of coercion to “convert” or to co-opt a Christian identity were reflected either in interviews with the administrators or with the CSE respondents who had attended their Programs, as the administrator in the Deep South explained:

All of the graduates that I’ve had in my two years here have claimed to have a faith experience. And that’s without us pressuring them. Like I said, there’s no box that they have to check (indicating their faith experiences). There is no coercion. So is hard to say it’s more like, *is there a depth of experience? Is that faith experience actually having an impact on choices?* I don’t *doubt* their faith experience but I just think sometimes the roots aren’t there.³⁵⁷ And that sometimes makes it a little harder to succeed. On the opposite side of that I’ve seen the strong faith— and in those cases, I see a much more positive outcome.

The administrators in the Mid-South program noted that “...it’s like around 65% (who) have made professions of faith and baptism. And some people come in and they’ve already made confessions of faith, and so of course they don’t get baptized and so forth.” In the following exchange, they reveal how their clients overwhelmingly embrace Christian identity, even if it is not always a transformative experience for them:

Administrator 1: I would say the majority of our program... I’m trying to think when was the last time that we had anybody who *didn’t* embrace faith.
Administrator 2: I haven’t had anybody who *didn’t*.

³⁵⁷ I did not ask for clarification here, but I interpreted this to mean that many of these women were young in their Christian faith. They had made recent professions or renewals of their faith and did not therefore possess spiritual maturity. Two sentences later she contrasts these women with those of “strong faith” who present better results.

Administrator 1: Obviously, there are varying degrees to which people embrace it.

While the administrators were careful not to exaggerate the impact that a commitment to Christianity had upon their clientele, they clearly were convinced that the aggregate effects of a Christian lifestyle experienced by dozens of clients over a period of several years was compelling. Some of the administrators, like the one from the South 2 Program, explained that they didn't consider clients assenting to what some would call "salvation" or a "Relationship with Christ" was a silver bullet that would place respondents on a fast track to stability. Rather, the cumulative effects of religious faith would affirmatively influence their capacities to flourish.³⁵⁸ "With Christians," she remarked, "I see a submissiveness, where they *want* to take wise counseling, they want to sit under the authority of other people, they are looking for people to lead them and guide them." One of the administrators from the Northeast noted, "Those who choose Christ have a guidepost, a framework for living. Those who don't are still making it up as they go and floundering more often." Christian faith is based on principles of selflessness in which believers are taught to love God above all other things as demonstrated by loving one's neighbor to the same degree one loves herself (Matthew 22:36-40). That perspective is grounded in a reality that can be observed, rather than in mystical thinking that can merely be perceived. Because the practice of the faith involves the establishment of an ethical foundation, those who do this consistently realize lifestyle benefits in addition to spiritual and emotional stability.³⁵⁹

³⁵⁸ This is discussed in Rodney Stark, *America's Blessings: How Religion Benefits Everyone, Including Atheists* (West Conshohocken, PA: Templeton Press, 2012). Among Stark's findings are that people who embrace religious faith engage in less criminal behavior, lower divorce rates, produce more and better-behaved children, enjoy more and better sex with their spouses with higher fidelity rates, experience better mental health, are more generous with money and time, and obtain higher levels of education.

³⁵⁹ This was explored in the discussion on Redemption and Lift, proposed by missiologist Donald McGavran, in Chapter 3, section 5d.

The only significant digression from this theme emerged from the South 1 group, where it was reported “I don’t know if I find the whole Christianity and spirituality part of it to be a huge factor for the majority of them. I think that it is for *some* of them...” She went on to explain that a prominent feature of their founder’s testimony was that she had been abused as a child in a church environment. They are therefore cautious about religiously coercing residents. “It’s not that they’re not interested in being spiritually involved, it’s more that they don’t want it to be a mandate that it’s transactional,” she clarified. “They don’t want to have to *do* something to receive something.”

The South 1 group described their mission in terms that closely adheres to mainline Christianity. Their founder is firmly embedded in a liturgical tradition, and the staff don’t actively promote adherence to a particular faith tradition in their programming. “(The Program)... has its own spiritual component,” the administrator explained to me, in terms that echoed those of a twelve-step program:

You know, it is built around that. Generally people say, “Our Higher Power”, but most of our people do refer to their Higher Power as God. And so a lot of our women when they first come into the program, they are not jumping into trying to get back into religion, if they had in the past. Or they are interested, and they just don’t know what they want to believe right then and there--but I think they find their way.

The administrator of the South 1 program indicated that several women for whom they had provided care had complained of having been raised in spiritually abusive environments. “Even the ones who come from-- people who come from very ritualistic backgrounds of abuse were, they’d been in sadistic kinds of organizations that have a front of religious practices, but they’re just these horrible, horrible frightening cult of people who are doing things that are unimaginable,” she remarked. “Even those individuals, I find, still want a spiritual relationship with God-- or their Higher Power, whoever they believe that individual to be.”

The ATG was the only other organization interviewed for this study who were also aligned with a liturgical Christian movement. They were outliers in the study due to their non-programmatic elements and their broader mission of ministering to *all* trafficked individuals. Even so, the administrator I spoke to acknowledged the benefits of spiritual formation which she had observed among her clientele:

Faith in God... Helped them get through some of the hardest times. And I don't know that I would've *thought* that would've been the case beforehand... So I find it really interesting that quite a few people over the years have *said* that helped them get through. That their *faith* helped them get through it.

The depth and breadth of spiritual participation varied significantly among the CSE clients described to me by the administrators. The degrees to which they engaged in life-changing faith activities could not be accurately assessed based solely upon the narratives described here, and the earnestness and maturity with which they approached Christian faith cannot be conclusively established based solely upon these remarks. Notwithstanding, the Program administrators all acknowledged they had observed the role of faith occupying a vital component in either *some* or *most* of the CSE clients they had worked with.

Several months after talking to the administrators I conducted a series of interviews with formerly CSE residents who had left their previous networks and completed Programs of care and rehabilitation like the ones represented by the administrators here. Some of the obstacles they described aligned remarkably closely to what the administrators had predicted-- although other remarks may have surprised even the administrators. In the next chapter we will examine the obstacles identified by those who had formerly been commercially sexually exploited and listen to the nuances and surprises they brought in helping us understand the dynamics of their reintegrated lives.

Chapter 5: Data from Respondents: Obstacles Identified

5-1 Analytical Foundation

The foundational research for this study is found in this chapter and the following chapter. While the transcribing of the interviews was conducted, the results were continually being compared to the other interviews consistent with Grounded Theory principles. In this manner, salient remarks of the respondents were labelled, organized, analyzed and the results were compared with what other researchers had discovered. This resulted in the construction of an overarching theory regarding the primary and secondary obstacles impeding CSE women reintegrating into new communities after completing Christocentric rehabilitations.

5-1 a. Demographics

The seventeen respondents who completed this study collectively spent their lives in different regions of the U.S.: In the West and Northwest, the Midwest, and various sections of the South. Only one of them had spent extensive time in the Northeast. The respondents had all been born and raised in the USA although this was not a requirement for participation. The precise regions where they grew up, or where they relocated as adults are irrelevant to the study. Due to the nature of trafficking, most of them relocated several times prior to the Program involvement and often did not see themselves as residents of one region who had picked up cultural characteristics from that one region. I interviewed three of them in the Pacific Northwest and one in the Northeast. The remainder of the interviews took place in three Southern states.

Based upon our conversations, only one to two of the women chose to re-integrate into a geographical region where they had formerly been exploited. They had consistently been counseled against doing this, as so doing would optimize chances that they would return to exploitative networks. Consistent with counsel, their rehabilitations

occurred in regions where they had never lived before and sixteen of the seventeen women were currently settled into communities within eighty miles of where they had completed their Programs.

The respondents had been free from CSE for between two and ten years, although it was unclear among two to three respondents whether they had accepted money for sex in the past two years. Two of them had married since leaving their programs, two reported they were engaged, and three of them each were co-habiting with a man. They had graduated from their Programs between one and nine years prior. No religious “test” or qualification was administered to applicants in the four Programs represented by the respondents. Likewise, no religious test was sought or desired for participation in this research.

All of them graduated from Christocentric rehabilitation programs specifically designed for women who were CSE. Briefly stated, this indicates that as adults, each of the respondents invested a minimum of one year into environments biased preferentially in favor of the efficacy of the Christian faith over other worldviews. Unlike non-religious programs, their treatments exposed them to staff members and programmatic elements favoring New Testament faith. They had attended Bible studies and were introduced to people who were actively praying for their successes. They may have been required or expected to attend weekly church meetings. It is therefore reasonable to assume this sample of women is more spiritually- or religiously focused than would be a sampling of former residents from secular or non-religious rehabilitation Programs.

5-1b. Referral Biases

A bias was created in my aspiration to speak with women who had completed the rehabilitative Programs. Women who had dropped out of Programs for this project were not used, unless they had later returned and finished it to the satisfaction of their

administrators. The majority of the women who enroll in these Programs don't complete them according to the administrators I spoke with.³⁶⁰ Therefore one indicator of "success/achievement" has already been attained before the interviews convened.

Further, it is possible that the program administrators interviewed in the previous chapter contributed to a biased sampling by directing me to people with whom they still had contact. The CSE subjects who were doing poorly may have been less likely to participate in the project. I tried to mitigate that outcome by offering the respondents a total stipend sufficient to encourage reluctant women to participate. I also did my best to track down qualified participants whom I had been told were struggling in their re-integration journeys. In each of the four regions where we interviewed, Program representatives connected us to at least one prospective subject of whom they thought was not doing "well," though those concerns were not specifically expressed before the interviews began.³⁶¹

360. From a ministry in the southern U.S., the male administrator stated "The average length of stay for us is 7 ½ months. That's actually up from the last two years; used to be 4 ½ months" Since the Program is nine months long, this indicates that the majority don't finish. His Program had a far higher graduation rate than most of those I spoke with. From an East Coast program, K stated "A lot of them choose to leave after 90 days. Usually they know what the program is. Most of them they make that conscious choice and they know they're getting into." From the Deep South, Dee reported that lives are affirmatively impacted even if the majority don't complete the program: "65% of the women I guess we could say are successful. That includes women who go to our immediate shelter. We have an immediate shelter and then we have girls who go through our long-term program, from which people graduate. So factored into that, 65% of the people include those who graduate and those who only come and stay for a week and get right back out. They're just not ready for the program. It is not the people who graduate from the program. Those who graduate the program, the success rate is much higher."

³⁶¹ In one region, the "struggling" respondent was indigent and suffering from poor physical- and cognitive health, but she was living in a safe place. In the second region, the "struggling" woman dropped out before she completed the first questionnaire, and I was unable to re-establish contact. In the third region, the woman had physically relocated to a location too isolated from the other interview sites for us to travel to, but we successfully completed the process via Skype. In the region where almost half our interviews were conducted, I texted and called a prospective subject's mentor several times and waited through a period of drug rehab before the sessions were completed. Another woman who lived within driving distance from that same region dropped out for several months, which turned out to be due to paramour problems, homelessness and a return to substance abuse. Because I was still transcribing interviews and hadn't done much analysis of the data yet, I reconnected with her later in the process and she ended up finishing her questionnaire and interview about two months after the other interviews were completed. So, the voices of all these women, excluding the one who dropped out early on, were finally included in the project and they provided some of the most cogent and valuable insights.

5-1 c. Christian Faith Focus

Each of the seventeen respondents indicated their beliefs in Christian spirituality. Several of them remarked that their lives were not in alignment with Christian principles, but none of them expressed rejection of the faith when I interviewed them or indicated preferences for some other faith or wisdom tradition. They possessed broad viewpoints regarding whether they favored Christianity when they enrolled in their Programs, or whether they had been seeking faith-based approaches to their rehabilitation. Several expressed they had not acquired any spiritual preferences whatsoever pre-program. Some had intentionally sought out Christocentric care, but others had not. Some respondents possessed historic Christian faith that had been active, dormant, or abandoned before their admission into the Programs. Mona spoke of how her grandmother took her to church growing up...

Like all older black people do? They go to church on Sunday... But that's a social gathering place, you know. So, I went to church with her every other weekend from three years old... I was actually baptized when I was five- I made the decision. I walked right up there during altar call, and she didn't even know I was going to do that. I've always felt... A higher power. I always loved to go to church... I guess it was my social place, too.³⁶²

Patti reflected on the historic complexities involved in trying to pursue Christian spirituality as a teenager but being subjected to continual abuses that she alleged to have occurred since early childhood due to the complicity of family members:

(In)...my senior year of high school I was president of the Christian Club on my school campus, which the club overall was very small, I didn't have a lot of time to pour into as I would like... Youth group was a way to escape everything that was going on at home, with trafficking and school. I did have mentors along the way, but I was too scared to ask for help-- many had hurt me emotionally along the way. I still never gave up on the Lord, but it wasn't easy.³⁶³

362. Mona, Personal Interview, September 6, 2019.

363. Patti, Personal Interview, August 26, 2019.

Select respondents preferred the spiritual components offered by their Programs when they enrolled, and others stated they had genuinely not processed that information when choosing a rehabilitative program. Sadie noted, “I had no idea that this was going to be a faith-based program and it really wasn’t that important to me at the time.” In an exchange that had both the psychologist and the interviewer chuckling, Ladonna reported, “And I was just like, “I thought I was getting *help!* I didn’t want Jesus; I don’t want anything to *do* with Jesus!” None of the respondents reported having been coerced to make faith decisions, either before, during or after the Programs. None of them suggested they found the inclusion of Christian principles to be manipulative or inappropriate.

5-2 Interviewing Methodology

The interviews were recorded and transcribed verbatim. A profile for each woman was compiled by creating documents that merged the transcriptions of the face-to-face interview with her self-interview. Then each interview was analyzed for content related to the obstacles and assets she experienced in her re-integration journey.

The self-interviews (Questionnaires) were completed by respondents in the modes they selected. This resulted in a mixture of those who dictated their responses into recording devices and those who wrote out their answers and emailed them back to me. Ginger was in drug rehab when the project started and she lived out of her car in the weeks prior to her face-to-face interview, so she wrote out her questionnaire answers by hand. Patti submitted by far the longest written document at 7,422 words and along with it she also enclosed some of her poetry and the transcript of a speech she had given at an advocacy event. Misspellings, typos and awkward constructions in the women’s

remarks reflect the actual documents submitted to me along with acknowledgments that I recognize the grammatical discrepancies (sic).³⁶⁴

For the sake of the responses, I made little distinction between the questionnaires and the face-to-face interviews, placing greater weight on the content of the responses than on the medium. Occasionally it was important to indicate that I was using a written response, and in those situations, I acknowledged that I was using an answer from the questionnaire. I used far more data from the interviews than from the questionnaires, preferring the latter as I was able in those circumstances to clarify obscure responses and to ask follow-up questions when appropriate. Also, the face-to-face interviews afforded a superior opportunity to survey each participant's mood, affect, eye contact, body language, tone and demeanor. In discourse analysis, the details of speech, gaze, gesture and action are not only relevant in the situation at hand but are also relevant to the theory that develops from the interview.³⁶⁵

Respondents were given opportunities to study the questions prior to the interviews. This was not only to reduce anxiety about what might be discussed, but also to enable them to prepare ahead of time should they choose to. I emailed the questionnaire to all participants who had email addresses but discovered at the interviews that they often had not read the questions.

³⁶⁴ If an accent sounded prominent, that was reflected in my transcripts. Some responses were muffled, and others sounded so affected to me that I often had to listen several times to understand what was being said. If I became conspicuously aware of a respondent dropping her "g's for example, I transcribed it that way to better reflect what I was hearing. This method allows for more of the respondents' speech inflections, tones and their personalities to emerge. If a respondent from a southern state used the expression "Fixing to (do something)" and it sounded like "Fittin' to..." I preferred the latter. To my ears, LaDonna had the oddest pronunciation of the word "boundaries" I had heard, and it initially puzzled both me and the psychologist. However, the respondent discussed boundary issues in such a thorough manner that it soon became obvious to both of us what she was talking about based on the context. Some words have situated meanings which I had to clarify to properly interpret them.³⁶⁴ I asked for clarifications regarding things I was not understanding. Sometimes, however, I may not have understood a phrase and I didn't wish to interrupt the flow of the conversation, so the speaker was permitted to continue uninterrupted. In the transcribing, if the word or phrase still could not be understood after several playbacks, I simply acknowledged that it sounded garbled or unclear.

³⁶⁵ Gee, *An Introduction to Discourse Analysis*, 88.

I also provided the questions in written form at the beginnings of the interviews so they could follow along. The questions were generally asked in order, but this was not a methodological necessity. The participants were reminded to focus on their post-program journeys. If they wished to discuss childhood incidents or things that occurred in *The Life* as clarification to a particular response, this information was welcomed as providing a more complete picture of their struggles. It was not necessary to discuss past exploitation, however, and those seasons of their lives were not focal to the interviews. We offered introductions and usually bantered for a few moments before the interviews began, and if we happened to land upon topics scheduled be covered in the interviews, we may have begun the formal interview at that juncture, returning to the remaining questions later.

Dr. Whitaker and I did our best to create relaxed atmospheres in which the participants would feel comfortable and empowered to answer questions and engage in discussions with authenticity and frankness. In the three U.S. states we travelled to beyond our home base, we met with administrators of whom I had already become acquainted. Those administrators were able to serve as hosts at their headquarters in all but two of the out-of-state interviews (seven out of nine total) which broke the ice to some degree. We consistently met in safe locations approved by the respondents. We always chose well-lighted areas to interview where the doors were shut to optimize privacy. We offered coffee when circumstance permitted and we allowed the respondents to take breaks whenever they desired, or to discontinue the interviews if they wished to, although that phenomenon never occurred. We began interviews by asking if anything was unclear to the respondents or if they wished to know more about the project, my studies, or the process. I also distributed the stipends, which were gift cards, before the interviews began to reduce their anxiety about compensation. Further, I didn't

wish to appear as if the processes were commodified—i.e., that they would be “paid” only after they had performed.

It was not possible to avoid the reality that I was an academic, coming into their worlds and conducting interviews with them as individuals who had experienced a phenomenon unlike anything I had been involved with. Some of the respondents may have related to Dr. Whitaker more easily than to me due to her gender. Her educational status was higher than mine, however, and since the respondents had been informed that she was a psychologist they would likely have presumed she had many years of experience, particularly since she was older than any of them. Two of the respondents had earned Masters’ Degrees since leaving their Programs, however, and others had either earned baccalaureates or were currently taking college classes, so our statuses may have been less pronounced for them. There is no getting around the recognition that we were both different from them, however. We already discussed how some used formalities with us while others did not (Chapter 2, section 2-7c). They may have related to Dr. Whitaker and me similarly to the way they related to Program founders and administrators. We tried to compensate for our different social statuses by dressing casually, using non-clinical language, and asking them to tell us about things about their lives that we did not fully understand. Most of them smiled easily and seemed very comfortable and gracious, although there was no way to definitively verify their comfort levels.³⁶⁶

³⁶⁶ Tia looked frightened when she arrived for the interview; Although we were in a private room in a public library, my perception was that she was afraid of being recognized. Melody also seemed fearful or extraordinarily shy even though we interviewed her at her Program headquarters. Yvette appeared to be irritated and suspicious, as if our meeting was an inconvenience. As with Tia, we met Yvette in a private room at a public library of her choosing, but she claimed in marginally defiant tones that it didn’t matter if we chose the private room we had reserved because she was not ashamed of anything she had to say. About halfway through the interview, though, Yvette became much calmer, and gave us complete answers when we asked for more details. It appeared to Dr. Whitaker and me that the respectful manner in which we conducted the interview eventually penetrated her negativity. Ginger and Kelsey were sarcastic at

Questions were open-ended, and every effort was made to enable open-ended follow-up questions. “Can you explain that a little further?” or “Tell me more about that?” or “How so?” “In what way...” were typical follow-ups. If a participant simply replied she could not explain any further or she appeared to be flustered or uncomfortable we moved on. The goal was that they would be relaxed and not feel pressured by anything we discussed. Sometimes a respondent failed at finding an appropriate way of expressing herself in the moment, so we moved to another question, and later she might think of clearer phrases to express her thoughts. There was no pressure to weigh in extensively on every topic if they did not desire to do that. I frequently asked, “Anything else?” before switching to another topic. At interview’s end, we always asked if we might have missed something, or if participants had additional thoughts we had not broached that might make our understanding of their journeys, their feelings, their obstacles and their assets more complete.³⁶⁷

The participants were encouraged to choose the labels and descriptors they wished to apply to their experiences, and their descriptors were respected and utilized. I avoided using terms such as “survivor,” “victim,” “prostitute,” and “trafficking” unless they first proposed the terms. Likewise, I did not ask them if they were “Christians” or

times, but any aggression in their speech did not appear to be directed towards us. The other twelve interviews seemed to be relaxed and mutually satisfactory.

³⁶⁷ Opportunities were not available in the moment to follow up on misunderstandings regarding the questionnaires, but the obscure remarks were highlighted, and the participants were asked about those entries towards the beginning of the face-to-face interviews. When the interviewing convened, I was successful at asking every question of each respondent. This is not to say that a precise answer was provided for each question. Sometimes the respondent gave a monosyllabic answer and did not provide much follow-up discussion. Other times she demurred, asking me to return to the question later. No ethical or academic requirement constraining me to present every question in each interview. One respondent gave such long, rambling and sometimes incoherent responses that 135 minutes into the interview it did not appear that all the material would be covered. She was the sole respondent who was asked to summarize or condense her final few responses, as they had not seemed to coincide with the questions during the previous hour or more. Her digressions were valuable regardless, as we were able to discover what she *was* interested in, and it became apparent that her poor social skills and incoherent speech were among her greatest obstacles regarding reintegration into her community.

members of any other demographic, but rather listened for terms they used to describe themselves and adopted those. Questions about faith or spirituality were proposed in neutral terms, and the respondents were encouraged to explore these topics in whatever manner they chose. The question regarding identity (#6: *What was your identity like in the past, and how has that changed today?*) was particularly helpful in allowing them to affix social and religious terms to themselves if they chose to. Additionally, if they had already settled upon clear choices regarding preferred terms referencing their identities in the questionnaires, I was often able to make better assumptions beforehand about many of the things they valued and the symbolic terms they might use in self-description.

The insights revealed by my group of respondents should not be construed as insights that are universal or “representative” of women in similar demographics. No other group is identical to this one, so the insights gleaned here are understood to be true for this group.³⁶⁸ It should also be noted that their insights represent a moment in time. In this study, these were the observations made to me between July and November of 2019. It is possible and even probable that some of their views, opinions and experiences will have changed by the time the study is completed.³⁶⁹ Even so, the individual insights revealed by this group may have applications relevant to understanding the reintegration journeys of other women who have been commercially sexually exploited.

5-3 Coding the Data from CSE Subjects

The verbatim transcripts were analyzed and broken down into Broad Codes, Focused Codes, and hundreds of individuals units. A synopsis of the process used to organize and sequester units of speech is found in Appendix 5-1. Exemplary focused

³⁶⁸ Corbin and Strauss, *Basics of Qualitative Research*, 320.

³⁶⁹ One respondent, Yvette, even vacillated between a situation she considered to have been stable-- though this was likely a gloss, as her interview revealed-- to a relapse, homelessness, job loss and then back to self-described sobriety and stability within the seven-month period I had been in contact with her.

codes regarding obstacles identified by the respondents appear in [Appendix 5-2](#). These are presented as a means of gaining a quick overview of statements the respondents made regarding the phenomena they discussed in the interviews. [Chart 5-1](#) (below) provides a thumbnail sketch of how the interviews broke down into broad codes and focused codes.

Chart 5-1 Summary of Respondents' Remarks		Coding			
Broad Code: Historic Antecedents	Broad Code: Obstacles	1. Life Skills		Broad Code: Assets	
	2. Self-Sabotage	3. Defective Socio-Spiritual Network		1. Community Supports	2. Ongoing Counseling
	4. Ghetto Side	5. Restlessness/Boredom		3. My Sobriety	4. Spiritual Commitment
	6. Mental Health	7. Sex Addiction		5. Transformed Identity	6. Vocational Progress
	8. Consumerism	9. Substance Abuse		7. Agencies Assisted	8. Active Dreams
	10. Family Issues	11. Loneliness		9. Boundaries Honored	10. Giving Back
	12. Interfering History	13. Employment Concerns			

5-4 Flourishing Indices

One index was developed to measure levels of holistic flourishing and another was developed to specifically reflect levels of spiritual flourishing, as described in Chapter 2, Section 2-7e. For each of the two indices, the overall flourishing statuses of the respondents was determined this way:

High Flourishing: 90-100%

Medium High Flourishing: 80-89%

Intermediate Flourishing: 70-79%

Low Flourishing: 50-69%

Poor Flourishing: 0-49%

The composite scores for every individual on both indices can be compared by examining [Chart 5-2a](#) and [Chart 5-2b](#) below.

5 – 2a
 D = DEVELOPMENTAL FLOURISHING
 S = SPIRITUAL FLOURISHING
 FLOURISHING LEVELS ASSESSED ACCORDING TO RESPONDENTS' CONTEXTUAL REMARKS
 FINAL VALUES BASED UPON A SCALE OF 0% - 100%.

Composite Flourishing Indices

	<u>Alanna</u>	<u>Ginger</u>	<u>Holly</u>	<u>Jamie</u>	<u>Kelsey</u>	<u>LaDonna</u>	<u>Louise</u>	<u>Melody</u>	<u>Mona</u>
DEVELOPMENTAL FLOURISHING	90	36	90	77.8	56	96	80	86	60
SPIRITUAL FLOURISHING	90	10	90	80	45	97.5	87.5	88.6	57.5
COMPOSITE SCORE	90%	23%	90%	78.9%	48%	96.75%	83.75%	87.3%	58.75%

5 – 2b
 D = DEVELOPMENTAL FLOURISHING
 S = SPIRITUAL FLOURISHING
 FLOURISHING LEVELS ASSESSED ACCORDING TO RESPONDENTS' CONTEXTUAL REMARKS
 FINAL VALUES BASED UPON A SCALE OF 0% - 100%.

Composite Flourishing Indices

	<u>Patti</u>	<u>Sadie</u>	<u>Scarlett</u>	<u>Shannon</u>	<u>Summer</u>	<u>Theresa</u>	<u>Tia</u>	<u>Yvette</u>
DEVELOPMENTAL FLOURISHING	62.2	86	92	80	50	92	84.4	55.6
SPIRITUAL FLOURISHING	85	90	92.5	72.5	57.5	97.5	75	37.5
COMPOSITE SCORE	73.6%	88%	92.25%	76.25%	53.75%	94.75%	79.7%	46.55%

5-5 Voices of the Respondents: Obstacles Identified

The key question being explored in this study is, *what are the obstacles that keep female American survivors of Commercial Sexual Exploitation from flourishing after they have graduated from Christocentric rehabilitative programs and reintegrated into communities?* The categories, or “Obstacles Interfering” with re-integration and “Assets Accommodating” reintegration both spoke directly to the question, as two sides of a coin. Some of the respondents were best able to identify their main re-integration obstacles by also stating the things that had gone well for them as they have made the transition from life in The Program (a liminal phase, by its nature) and life in community which is meant to be a permanent situation. The category “Historic Factors/Antecedents” is useful in understanding the main categories, but it speaks to the question indirectly. The category “Complex Variables” is valuable in that it records variables in the re-integration journeys which some respondents might view as being beneficial and others would view as detrimental. It may be that narratives in this category are eventually proven to be helpful or harmful, but for the present it is beneficial to consider complex situations that arise in the lives of the CSE respondents to shed light on emerging situations in the future.

Of the coded variables, thirteen themes emerged frequently in the Obstacles category and ten in the Assets category³⁷⁰ as well as numerous other variables, some of which were only mentioned by one or two respondents.³⁷¹ I have allowed the voices of the participants to express themselves in identifying the following primary obstacles. I have included remarks from every respondent, since each of them has encountered various obstacles regardless of how well they may be flourishing today; Each one is an

³⁷⁰. These Assets will be the focus of Chapter 6.

³⁷¹. These less-mentioned responses appear in Appendix 5-6.

expert eyewitnesses regarding her own experience. Their insights will be discussed here in the approximate order of how frequently these were mentioned. The first four categories here were suggested by at least 3-4 respondents apiece; The last four were discussed at some point in nearly all the interviews.

- a. Loneliness
- b. Consumerism
- c. Boredom/Restlessness
- d. Sex Addiction
- e. Ghetto Side
- f. Interfering History
- g. Self-Sabotage
- h. Life skills
- i. Substance Abuse
- j. Mental Health
- k. Employment Concerns
- l. Family Issues
- m. Inadequate Network

These categories represent both behavioral and ontological concerns. Remarks made regarding “Loneliness” and “Ghetto Side” clarify the respondents’ outlooks that these categories are states of being rather than behaviors. The category “Sex addiction” is more complicated, as it involves both behaviors and *being*. Primarily, though, respondents present this ontologically. In essence, “I *am* a sex addict” or “I *am* promiscuous.” The “Mental Health” category is similarly presented, primarily as a state of being (“I *have* a depressive disorder; I *have* PTSD”) that also involves specific behaviors, some of which they may learn to control, particularly after working with a therapist or administrator. The remainder of these categories are behavioral. Respondents reported that they self-sabotage, and abuse substances, or behave in ways that cause them to be terminated from their employment or possess poor networks that could have been more robust had they made the efforts to reinforce them.

Categories such as “Interfering History” or “Family Issues” involve elements that are often out of respondents’ control, since the behaviors of other agents present the identified obstacles, at least initially. If their parents humiliate them, their children misbehave, or former exploiters reappear in their lives due to legitimate child custody issues the respondents cannot always manage the behaviors or the outcomes. It is noteworthy that except for “Life Skills” and the final three categories (“Employment Concerns”, “Family Issues” and “Inadequate Network”) what the women describe here are all *han* issues. Due to a surplus of sin-behaviors that have been projected upon them they are lonely, they possess poor life skills, they abuse substances, they self-sabotage and so forth. Although sin may not be prominent in every category, *han* issues undergird each one. It is not sinful, for example, if a respondent doesn’t know how to balance a checkbook, or if she does not have good friends, or if she is mentally ill. The circumstances of her *han*-ridden life, however, may influence even these areas. Had she not been groomed to perform sexual services for men from childhood, she may know how to balance a checkbook by the time she had reached her late twenties. She may not have been mentally ill had she not been traumatized due to the behaviors of others. She may not have acquired a “Ghetto Side.” She may still have experienced Employment Concerns and Family Issues, but not with the same degree of severity. She may still have pursued sexual relationships with a variety of men, but it is not likely she would have felt that she was driven to seek out toxic men to the same degree if she had not been CSE. What follows in the remainder of this chapter are specific quotes reflecting each of the thirteen categories identified by the respondents as being major impediments to flourishing in addition to my own commentary and observations drawn from other interlocutors.

5-5 a. Loneliness

This was a concern even among women who otherwise had established strong socio-spiritual support networks. Two respondents had married post-program and two others reported they were engaged to men, and two additional respondents were co-habiting with paramours. Loneliness was reportedly prevalent among several of the other women as well as with one of the engaged respondents. The women who were unattached spoke of possessing high standards of purity, and they sometimes eschewed the dating scene altogether due to a fear of returning to old habits and thinking patterns (Alanna, Holly, LaDonna and Louise). As a group, they were discontented with being unmarried, and expressed a longing for the right kind of man to share their lives with. Alanna lamented that she hadn't "really" dated anyone since establishing her new life; "I've always had this dream of getting married and doing life with somebody else. That has not been the case. And... It's been *very* lonely these past few years!" she remarked.

Loneliness was also described as occurring in platonic, non-romantic friendships and relationships. A common complaint was that other agents could not really relate to the difficulties they were experiencing in their reintegration journeys. Yet if respondents sought out too many others who had similar histories, they might open themselves up to unhealthy tendencies. Some of them did not wish to tell their new friends or neighbors about the substance of their past. Others reported they had ingrained habits of managing people or remaining emotionally distant from them for survival reasons, and they found these habits difficult to change, particularly when they did not know to whom they could safely articulate their struggles. Tia, in a discussion about being more transparent with her mentor, noted

In a way I wish that they (the mentors) would know that there are a lot of lonely times here. I get very lonely! That's when all the thoughts come. I ache. And sometimes you're just thinking too much. Like, you know that it's not

even true, but you still believe it somewhat. They don't know nothing about that.³⁷²

Holly remarked on how she feels like she does not fit in to any group, considering that the loneliness is the hardest component she has had to deal with in her newly established life. She noted that she's a very social person, and my observations confirm that she was an outgoing individual who cares a great deal about her clientele. She only has one or two friends, she lamented, and the relationships with others are "...just very surface... I had to get rid of all the friends from the first 30 years of my life. Because all we had in common was drugs and you know, partying." Today, though, her unique experiences of having been commodified and now being a standard-bearer for integrity makes her a difficult match for close friendships. She feels like "...nobody really *gets* me or understands me, kind of like maybe I don't fit in anywhere." It is a situation that may be easy to comprehend, but difficult to resolve.

5-5 b. Consumerism

The respondents described this obstacle as either a compulsion to buy things they do not need or could not afford, or as *materialism*. In the life of CSE, participants are often exposed to profligate spending, and they rarely reported on saving money. If money is available, they impulsively buy nice clothes or luxuries whether due to an absence of spiritual resources, desires to bring some happiness or excitement into oppressive environments, or just due to lack of discipline. Upon entrance, CSE is not viewed as a negative for some respondents but is instead perceived as a survival strategy to help alleviate financial burdens. Women perceived obstacles in the formal economy that presented barriers to financially sustaining themselves and a family.³⁷³ Researchers

³⁷² Tia, Personal Interview, July 6, 2019.

³⁷³ Williamson and Folaron, "Understanding the Experiences," 7.

Williamson and Folaron interviewed a woman named Chris who provided this revealing narrative of her initiation in CSE:

I was hanging out at bars and getting quick and easy money and spending it quick and easy. I was staying at hotels, like when you got credit cards, taking cabs every damn where. There would be times when I would go get me a whole bunch of money and I would go shopping. There would be times when I would make three, four hundred dollars and go shopping, get my hair done. I liked taking my little sister shopping.³⁷⁴

According to these researchers, women who began trading sex professed to new feelings of financial security. Even those involved with pimps thought their contributions merited a significant difference between success and failure in the lives of the pimps and themselves. With financial means to support themselves, the respondents believed in their abilities to control and influence activities in their lives in a way they had previously not been able to. They subsequently reported feeling accomplished and empowered within their circles.³⁷⁵ If their worldviews and experiences had been similar to the subjects interviewed by Williamson and Folaron in two Midwestern cities, it is easier to understand how palpable the struggle might be for reintegrating women to live frugally for a few years until they become well established in new careers. The respondents Dr. Whitaker and I interviewed who groused at this obstacle had also participated in “high end” sex trafficking, and thus had become habitually accustomed to numerous luxuries over CSE journeys which had lasted several years. Shannon, for example stated, “That’s why I went into that industry, because I can make so much money!”³⁷⁶ Mona admitted,

I’ve always been a very money-driven person. Growing up poor, I always said, “When I’m an adult when I can control my own money I will never be broke again.” So that’s something that’s always stayed with me and driven me upon these different paths. And so, I feel like my anxiety and my

³⁷⁴ Williamson and Folaron, 8.

³⁷⁵ Williamson and Folaron, 8.

³⁷⁶ Shannon, Personal Interview, September 27, 2019.

overall peace would be a lot better if I could just have more self-control when it comes to money.³⁷⁷

Consumeristic attitudes generated several problems for respondents. First of all, the new salaries they typically earn in the early post-Program years could not support their spending habits, causing financial problems, including evictions. Secondly, this caused spiritual problems for the women who were trying to learn self-discipline and contentment in their rehabilitated lifestyles. Thirdly, consumeristic desires contributed to searches for a “Sugar Daddy”; That is to say, several women spoke either of finding a man or of *contemplation and temptations* of searching out a man either because he appeared to be wealthy, or because they could share expenses with him, enabling them to afford more luxuries.

This concern is one that is underreported in the literature. Perhaps Christian teachings absorbed by respondents influence how they reported this. Conservative Christianity’s historic condemnation against greed and self-centered behavior may have influenced these women to see consumerism as a sin, whereas those raised in post-modern western societies unconcerned with biblical dogma may be less attuned to this. When reintegrating women are motivated by wealth and luxuries, this adds an additional layer of struggle to their capacities to flourish if they fixated on higher salaries and luxurious material goods.

5-5 c. Restlessness/Boredom

Numerous respondents considered time management to be a distinct obstacle. They had been accustomed to others controlling their schedules in The Life. In the Programs that followed, their lives were well-structured. Upon re-integration into communities, they were sometimes confounded by the notion of using their time

³⁷⁷ Mona, Personal Interview, September 6, 2019.

redemptively. They were accustomed to abundant substance abuse, parties, interaction with strangers and generally frenetic behaviors. They found boredom setting in post-Program which became a catalyst for engaging in unhealthy activities. As Tia noted,

I still struggle a little bit with alcohol drinking. Sometimes I still feel that I need it to sleep. Or when I get bored... My triggers (seem to be) boredom and... stress. And there's one more. Yeah, mainly stress or just when... (*Sighs heavily and pauses for several moments*) ... I don't even know the word for it.

So, although this intersects with Tia's substance abuse obstacle, she views the underlying issue as being something else she cannot find words to express. She strained for an unusually long period of time trying to grasp it, and the agitation and visible frustration revealed how much this troubled her. She spoke of a great conversion experience in her life, of supportive community and a busy schedule. But there remained an underlying "something" she felt was complicating her life. She mentions boredom, but some kind of additional restlessness also apparently pursues her.³⁷⁸

Ginger probably spoke more comprehensively about boredom than did the other respondents. Several times in the interview she bemoaned the perception that no mentor in her life had appeared to possess the time or the skills to walk her through her seasons of boredom and drug-craving:

I needed... Somebody to help put things in place that will keep me busy. Because I'm not going to be the kind person is sitting at home bored and say "I'm to go to the park..." I'm not going to do that. I'm going to sit there and think for four hours ... about how bored I am and how upset I am. That I don't have anyone here to hang out with. I need someone to come and lead me in that area.³⁷⁹

³⁷⁸ It should be noted here that Tia was also the youngest respondent interviewed for the project, and she had been free from CSE networks for just under two years, which was also the shortest chronological distance from the commercial exploitation among the participants. She may have been navigating waters that some of the other respondents had already traversed.

³⁷⁹ Ginger, Personal Interview, September 27, 2019.

This obstacle references Ginger's network as well, but it is a network she has avoided and dismissed. She speaks of mentors whom she perceived as incompetent, or who didn't have an excess of hours to devote to her. Yet, this interviewer spoke with Ginger's devoted mentor several times on the phone who advocated for her mentee, and Ginger admits having a great relationship with the mentor. In the end, she admits to an unwillingness to give up narcotics, even in the first days out of drug rehab. Her restlessness, which Bryant Myers might characterize as absence of *shalom*, appears to be in a category of its own.³⁸⁰

5-5 d. Sex addiction

I use an *in vivo* term here to reflect exactly what some of the respondents related to me. Some of them labelled themselves promiscuous; This seems to be more of an anomaly in the literature, as sex dysfunction has been described more in terms of as feeling cheap or unappealing by other sources. The high degree of "Christianness" in my sample could account for this. Sex outside of marriage is discouraged in conservative Christian circles. Since all the respondents professed some kind of faith, they may have been inclined to talk more about promiscuity as a *temptation* and less inclined to speak to Dr. Whitaker and me about unpleasant sex. Most respondents were not married, and some professed celibacy; The ones who were *not* celibate may have not wished to admit to engaging in sexual relations or to discuss this. Two of the respondents used divergent terms as Tia employs here: "There is one area that I struggle with a lot," Tia remarked. "That's just, a *lust addiction*." She continued:

I struggle with that more than anything. But... I feel like the (Program) has helped me with... With finding grounding tools to help me stay away from drugs and alcohol. (Even though with alcohol, I don't understand

³⁸⁰ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 97.

why I can't let that go). I mean with the lust addiction I don't feel like I got as much help as I needed.

For many of my respondents, reintegration was hampered by impulses to seek out male companionship not tied to commerce. They admitted that they had to fight the desire to sleep around a good deal. Some reported they had become accustomed to commodifying men, and it was difficult not to flirt with men whom they found to be attractive. Also, they had been conditioned to gaining men's approval through sex, whether there had been an understanding of being financially compensated for this or not. Kelsey explained how she had returned to using her body for commercial sex transactions:

...Seeing men for money and drugs lasted until four or five months ago. It was on and off here and there. I was in therapy with my therapist from the (Program) for a little bit. But he did like a deal where I had to be sex free for a long period of time. It never really lasted that long-- the longest it ever lasted was five months. But it always ended up becoming *that*. And I tried doing books about sex addiction, but they never end up working. It didn't work until I found my man.

Shannon stated that one of her biggest obstacles to reintegrating into community was, "Just being promiscuous. Having that promiscuity."³⁸¹ I followed up by asking her about any struggles she might have encountered in adhering to her church's standards of purity outside of marriage, since she had professed to embracing a Christian worldview. She responded,

Well, just for that love—feeling that *love*. And attention. I would feel like I was only good for one thing. So... Breaking away from that, that thinking, that mentality. And realizing my worth as a daughter of Christ, and a daughter of the king. And that I'm paid in full... By the cross. And coming to realize my value is not in giving myself to men.

381 Shannon, Personal Interview, September 27, 2019.

Shannon had been married for several months to a man she had met in church. As stated here, she adhered to a conservative expression of Christian faith which she described as being the principal influence in her life. Even so, when she discussed having experienced promiscuous impulses, she did so with animation in her eyes and a smile that she failed to repress. She struck a similar tone in a later narrative involving her escape from a controlling pimp. In that narrative, she spoke with barely contained amusement about using a man she called a Sugar Daddy whom she considered to be “hot.” He supplied a place for her to stay while she saved money and tried to avoid crossing paths with her former abuser, although their relationship had not been platonic. She has now been away from CSE networks for several years, and the impression she made on the interviewer was one of trying to reconcile pleasant memories of men whose company she had enjoyed with what she recognized as inappropriate attachments according to her new faith and value system.

Sexual disfunction may cut both ways: The extant literature focuses upon formerly CSE women hating sex or experiencing flashbacks from *The Life* which intrudes upon their matrimonial lives. Such feelings, including an erosion of the capacity for trust, may undercut abilities to establish new relationships or to experience intimacy.³⁸² Chronic sexual trauma may additionally translate into sexual dysfunctions in the post-exit period, such as finding sexual activity to be “dull and disgusting” or a cue to posttraumatic reactivity.³⁸³ Intimate feelings may also become dissociated from sexual acts, and survivors may be appalled to find themselves viewing their partners like customers.³⁸⁴ The respondents I spoke with, however, were more inclined to struggle with desiring to have sex but believing this activity would be inappropriate for them.

³⁸² Brown et al., “Challenges Faced by Women”; Dalla, ““You Can’t Hustle All Your Life.””

³⁸³ Hedin and Månsson, “Importance of Supportive Relationships,” 233.

³⁸⁴ Farley, “Invisibility of Harm.”

5-5 e. Ghetto Side (Grounded in Historic Issues)

This phrase was coined by one of my subjects. It bears similarities to not having Life Skills³⁸⁵ which would indicate a deficit. The respondents who lamented “Having too much street” or embracing a “Ghetto Side” viewed this as an inbred status. It is an ontological dilemma rather than presenting as a deficiency. They have been branded with identities, like the tattoos their oppressors had inscribed into their necks, and they are finding it difficult to establish new lifestyles divorced from their former personas.

Summer expressed it this way:

I had to figure the world out myself. Because it’s different from being in the street world, and then being in the real world. It’s really *different*. You learn how to talk. You probably can’t tell, but maybe you *can* tell: I have a lot of street in me.³⁸⁶

Jamie similarly reflected,

...If we were talking about using needles, or we sit around and we are talking about drugs it makes me think like, “God, she has good veins.” I might think “... if I had them veins when I was using...” ... So now being in recovery I have to learn that I’m not going to allow that seed to get planted and I’m not going to let it grow. So, it’s like cutting it off and getting it out of my head learning how to stop that thought process.³⁸⁷

Later in the interview she lamented about her ongoing interests and impulses:

This is something that I still have to work through: Knowing who is... A guy who is right for me. I still have an interest in unhealthy guys. If there was two people standing here, the one with the gold, and the pants hanging down-- the one with a pocket full of money is more interesting to me... And he can call me a Bitch and a Ho... But he for some reason he’s still more interesting to me than the Christian who was opening the door for me, take me out to a movie and not get in my pants the first month.

³⁸⁵ This will be covered imminently in section h.

³⁸⁶ Summer, Personal Interview, September 27, 2019.

³⁸⁷ Kelsey, Personal Interview, July 11, 2019.

During our discussion she processed her initial thoughts and realized that though she had said her chief obstacle is “me,” this was not optimally specific. Later in the interview she added

Okay, now that I’ve talked it out, I see a roadblock would be utilizing the skills that you learned in The Program and applying them. I just be forgetting about all the other stuff that you retain at The Program so I think the roadblock could really just be not utilizing the skills and tools.³⁸⁸

Her frank observation underscores the insight that she is not being impeded in this instance by something that is not available to her. To the contrary, her remark is that the Program ably equipped her to resolve the deficits to which she refers. Her failure or reluctance to execute what she has been equipped to do indicates a condition that could be attributed to *han*. She cannot seem to fathom why she is driven to respond self-destructively. She only knows that this is the reality, and it appears to be linked to years of conditioning that she has not at this juncture been successful at overcoming.

Others decried their social ineptness, which kept them from reaching out to people who would have assisted. Some of them admitted that they felt displaced by the relative ennui that accompanied a sober lifestyle. They wanted to “party” and craved the familiar attentions of unhealthy male relationships, whom they called “Bad Boys.” Tia reported, “I still struggle with not having a man in my life. I still sometimes look for the bad guys since that’s all I know who to go after.”

In a dissertation for the School of Psychology and Counseling at the evangelical Regent University, researcher Jennifer Su notes from a Christian worldview how incidences of complex trauma brought on by violence and serial sexual abuse also

³⁸⁸ Jamie’s reference to having “...talked it out” is also a good example of the successful use of the open-ended interviewing process. As she spoke about her obstacles, some clarity came to her as she expresses here, and she was free to add comments like this later in the interview process, even if we had moved on to other topics.

complicates the outlook and spiritual responses of women even after they have exited from CSE networks.³⁸⁹ Because the abuses have been prolific and habitualized, women cannot simply “get over it” and move on with their lives.³⁹⁰

Sociologist Ine Vanwesenbeeck based her research on interviews with women whom she labelled “street prostitutes” in her native Netherlands. She states that the women whom she interviewed in their environments have learned to manipulate men.³⁹¹ They acquire habits that become hard-wired, and the habits are not likely to be eliminated after a year of treatment, even if it is extensive residential treatment. The nature of their former enterprise is that they are risk-takers.³⁹² This propensity for risk and a fast-paced lifestyles seems to form part of the basis of the Ghetto/Street proclivities. When the exiting CSE participant encounters the *Square Life*, she finds it to be comparatively dull. For example, if an individual particularly loves heavy metal music, she may find it impossible to transform her musical tastes into a love for classical music. Appreciation for another medium can be learned but will not necessarily transpire rapidly without some concentration and effort. There must similarly exist a strong will to leave the Street/Ghetto mentality before this is accomplished.

Vanwesenbeeck concurs with Hedin and Mansson that the *Matthew Effect* phenomenon³⁹³ was an operative principle for the Dutch women whom she had interviewed. She believes they have acquired “learned helplessness” both in their CSE

³⁸⁹ Su, “Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health.”

³⁹⁰ Abas et al., “Risk Factors for Mental Disorders in Women Survivors of Human Trafficking”; Di Tommaso et al., “As Bad as It Gets”; El-Bassel et al., “Sex Trading and Psychological Distress”; Grant, “Spirituality and Trauma”; Kaufman and Crawford, “Sex Trafficking in Nepal”; Oselin, “Weighing the Consequences”; Zimmerman et al., “Health of Trafficked Women.”

³⁹¹ Vanwesenbeeck, *Prostitutes’ Well-Being and Risk*, 1994, 139.

³⁹² Vanwesenbeeck, 116.

³⁹³ As described in Chapter 3, section 2b, this asserts that those who have a surplus of assets receive more, while those who have little are endowed with even less.

experiences as well as when they attempted to transition into *Square Lives*.³⁹⁴ The obstacle, as Vanwesenbeeck and the respondents see it, is grounded in the notion that they have ingrained habits extending back many years. They feel as though they have been psychologically affected to the degree it is nearly impossible to abandon previous habits. Whereas the acquisition of poor life skills is a deficit, those who identified *this* attribute viewed it as the embodiment of a living organism that could only be contained with great effort. If Vanwesenbeeck is properly interpreting what she observed in the lives of the CSE survivors, this demonstrates the effects of *han*.

5-5 f. Interfering History

This category is represented here by a term I created to describe unique situations the subjects related to me. Due to past participation in CSE, unique circumstance transpired sometimes randomly, often apart from their wishes. An earlier interference was previously referenced in the Family Issues section: Namely, the concern of handling a former pimp/abuser who is the father of the respondent's children. But former pimps and johns and their surrogates also interfered variously in other ways. Sometimes the respondents reconnected with these people accidentally or deliberately on social media sites in ways that initially appeared to be friendly, but which the subjects recognized as being inappropriate. Jamie, for example, discussed the dangers she had discovered on social media, stating that her "biggest fear" is Facebook. She has had ongoing disagreements with her mentor on this as she describes it here: "If you're on Facebook, people can find you. Just out of the blue some people will say, 'Hey, how are you doing? I haven't heard from you...' and I'm about to entertain it..."

³⁹⁴ Ine Vanwesenbeeck, *Prostitutes' Well-Being and Risk* (Amsterdam: VU University Press, 1994), 154. It is once again noteworthy to recognize that Vanwesenbeeck's respondents were not offered the opportunities that my interview subjects were. They were neither afforded residential rehabilitational Programs nor were that necessarily exposed to Christocentric worldviews nor provided with intentional caregivers and mentors.

Jamie also spoke eloquently of the ambivalence of receiving communication from her former trafficker. She had experienced what she considered authentic love for him in the past, and he is the father of her children.

...Then before too long, you know I look forward to the phone call. I look forward to the emails. I look forward to hearing his voice. And before you-know-what, I'm-a start taking my paycheck and putting it towards a lawyer... And I know that he's not getting out. But I know me. And that's something that becomes an ambition to me-you know, to this day I still love him. And for me that's hard. That's my biggest struggle I would have to say.

Other times, these actors from the past appeared to stalk or intimidate them. Holly spoke of a permanent restraining order she had placed upon her former abuser, who was at that time facing imminent release from prison. Theresa related how she had tried to begin a consulting-type of enterprise, but was disconcerted upon the realization that one of her regular clients was travelling long distances to see her because he was a regular viewer of pornographic films which she had previously appeared in. She also spoke of harassment and the embarrassment that ensued when a former surrogate repeatedly hacked the website of an organization she was affiliated with to include humiliating information about her.

Beyond the audaciously personal and emotional, another equally detrimental facet of Interfering History surfaced. The majority of the respondents interviewed for this study had incurred criminal offenses before being rehabilitated. Rather than possessing charges of solicitation, most of these involved drugs or theft. Summer, for example stated she had "...taken 25 felonies for my trafficker. And I went and did 17 months in

county jail.” The charges incurred usually result from activities that accommodate a lifestyle of being trafficked and manipulated.³⁹⁵

Some of the respondents reported on educational deficits they had to navigate due to disruption in their education related to CSE. Felonies from their seasons of exploitation initially interfered with housing and freedom of movement for some, particularly if they were still on probation. The felonies also complicated employment in predictable ways. Holly stated that her felonies made it difficult for her to finance her college education, and she needed to rely upon her mother instead for assistance. Sadie reported on additional complications from her criminal record, starting with the loss of a career position which she loved and felt fulfilled in:

So, I was an activities director at a nursing home. And then they promoted me to HR business office manager. Then six months later they fired me (when they discovered my felonies.)

She then spoke about her plans to move to a state in a different region and marry a man there whom she had met. The probation officer forbade her, and she ended up doing neither. She stated that she paid her legal restitution over a two-year period and then was denied an out-of-state transfer when she applied for it. The reason provided for the denial, she stated, was because she had been fired from her job, and was therefore non-compliant.

Outsiders may find it unfathomable that those who have been delivered from CSE networks would ever find any reasons to return, perhaps apart from the severest instances of poverty. However, the mental conditioning survivors have undergone and the difficulties they encounter in a world they do not feel they fit into can affect them adversely. It is logical, and sometimes even comforting, for people to return to networks

³⁹⁵ Expungement of their records is very difficult under these circumstances. See Dalla, “‘You Can’t Hustle All Your Life’”; Long, “State of Aftercare”; Norton-Hawk, “Counterproductivity”; Oselin, *Leaving Prostitution*; Sanders, “Becoming an Ex-Sex Worker.”

with which they are most familiar. Speaking both out of firsthand experience and as a caregiver to CSE girls, Rachel Lloyd explains it this way: “Combine normal human behavior with short-term adolescent thinking, add in the complexities of Stockholm syndrome or trauma bonds, with the persistence of a skilled manipulator, and it’s not surprising that girls struggle so much with returning to the life.”³⁹⁶ Although the respondents had made prior decisions to leave their histories behind, they sometimes feel as if their history comes looking for them. If circumstances align with bad luck or a vulnerable season in the life of a CSE survivor, even if she was rehabilitated, she may decide to heed the call and return to the relative comfort of the familiar.

5-5 g. Self-Sabotage (Poor decisions)

Some of the respondents, such as Jamie employed this precise language of deliberately sabotaging herself: “There’s just things that you can do where you don’t have to feel sorry for yourself and I end up feeling sorry for myself and then I self-sabotage.”³⁹⁷ Others echoed this theme using different terminology. Respondents usually described this as knowing that they were making poor choices, but stubbornly pursuing those poor decisions anyway. Rather than blaming peripheral forces, they recognized that they were confronted with temptations that simply appeared to be so appealing that they chose momentary pleasure over long-term gain. Yvette stated succinctly, “I don’t feel like anybody is keeping me from reintegrating.... Nobody is holding me back, but *myself*. I was my *biggest enemy*. (*Emphasis mine*). Tia expressed a similar thought:

There are some people who try to keep me from doing the things I know I should be doing. But (pauses)... I think a lot of it is *me* as well. I feel like a lot of times I don’t feel like I’m capable of doing what I want to do. I know what I want to do, this little bump in the road, and it makes me think, *is this what I want to do? Should I even keep going?*” I think *I’m* like my biggest enemy. (*Emphasis respondent’s*)

³⁹⁶ Lloyd, *Girls Like Us*, 189.

³⁹⁷ Jamie, Personal Interview, September 6, 2011.

Louise is flourishing reasonably well today. She works full-time for the organization where her rehabilitation was completed, and she scored 83.75% out of 100% composite flourishing score on measurable criteria. Yet she had a rocky start when she was initially exiting from the Program. She spoke at length about how she began to make poor decisions almost immediately upon graduation.

So, because of my holding on to that control, and holding onto so much it eventually led me to a relapse. I want to make decisions by myself, and I want to experience things... it was quite a serious relapse of things. Drugs, sex, unhealthy relationships, break the law... Just so many things. And I... This was a vacation, and I came back to The Program from my vacation and I got caught.

Kelsey was candid about her tendency to isolate herself from positive people. On one hand, she praised the people from her Program and from her old church as being available for her any time she needed them to provide resources. On the other hand, she spoke without evidence about how judgmental she thought they were, based upon feelings of discomfort she had around them when she became pregnant outside of wedlock, when she quit her job, or when she relapsed into substance abuse and self-commodification. For example:

And then losing the Christian family that I had... And then losing the (Employment) family was probably the hardest thing. I... I don't know why I always have to go out with a bang... You know, I get very impulsive. I cut everybody off! (*Laughs ruefully*).³⁹⁸

Mansson and Hedin observe that almost all the respondents they interviewed for their qualitative study, *Breaking the Matthew Effect*, had described the period after their break with CSE networks as being extremely difficult for them.³⁹⁹ Among the negative emotions they experienced such as feelings of shame and regret, they found the most

³⁹⁸ Kelsey, Personal Interview, July 11, 2019.

³⁹⁹ Mansson and Hedin, "Matthew Effect," 71.

prominent one to be "...a strong self-contempt bordering on self-hatred."⁴⁰⁰ Across disciplines and across studies, researchers have found a common contempt among women leaving the Life consisting of revulsion for activities they have engaged in which sometimes develops into an inability to disassociate themselves from what transpired during their darkest years. Wilson and Butler mirror the testimonies we have heard from respondents here in noting how "Survivors of CSE may be overwhelmed with terror, feelings of contamination and differentness, and self-loathing even after leaving the trade. Such feelings, including an erosion of the capacity for trust, may undercut abilities to establish new relationships or experience intimacy."⁴⁰¹ What they describe here is the motivations possessed by the women to self-sabotage. It is a phenomenon inexplicable to some. If a woman holds little respect for herself, though, the impulse to punish herself for contaminating her own life and inhibiting future happiness may obliquely possess a rational basis.

Andrew Park recognizes the occurrences of these tendencies in his examination of the *han* of marginalized and oppressed peoples. He explains that *han* embodies both a passive and an active form.⁴⁰² The passive form presents as a kind of resignation, he writes, causing individuals to descend into self-denigration. At some point they often "...take revenge against themselves."⁴⁰³ The active form of *han* manifests as bitterness, and the passive form presents as helplessness.⁴⁰⁴ My interview subjects demonstrated some of these characteristics, as revealed here in their remarks, and appearing more prominently in the attitudes and demeanors of those who scored poorly on the two

400 Månsson and Hedin, 71.

401 Wilson and Butler, "Running a Gauntlet," 501.

402 In this respect, it is similar to sin. A sin such as hatred, for example, may endure in a passive form, embedded in the psyche and perhaps even outwardly, manifested by smiling or joking about the object of one's hate. The active form, though, may result in verbal denigration and may escalate into physical assault, destruction and even murder.

403 Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 34.

404 Park, 32–34.

flourishing indices. They lamented having returned to drugs or alcohol or co-dependence and sexual relations with men they considered to be inappropriate. Other factors appeared to be tempering most of their lives at this juncture from careening into more extreme behaviors such as characterized by Allender.⁴⁰⁵ All of the respondents had received care from psychotherapists at least during their residential Program stays, and all had been exposed to Christian teaching and had attended religious services. Reported levels of spirituality was prominent among the medium- to high flourishing respondents, and these were all working or preparing academically for careers. The generally upbeat responses generated among them seems to indicate that resolution or healing of *han* issues may be progressing within the group.

5-5 h. Life Skills

Respondents described this asset in a variety of terms. Usually what was expressed could be classified into these sub-categories: a) Money Management; b) No experience managing a household; c) Making ethical choices; d) Lacking meaningful activity beyond partying. Shannon reported, “The hardest thing I’ve had you with since leaving The Program ... Was having so much freedom?” She went on to explain that her traffickers controlled all her movements prior to The Program; Then for a year in The Program, all her time was structured as well. The general complaint was that in their CSE experience, they had not navigated the normal responsibilities that healthy adults engage in. Another agent may have been paying all their bills, buying their clothes, taking care of the rent. Even if they engaged in what appeared to others as being the “High Life,” they had no claims to ownership of their possessions or even the normal responsibilities of apartment renters. This continued to be true in the first phases of their

⁴⁰⁵ My sampling of formerly CSE women was revealed to be a much more religious and spiritually-minded group than would be reflected in a sampling of women from similar backgrounds who had not completed Christocentric Programs preparing them for reintegration.

rehabilitative programs. Most Programs weaned them into independence in their final months of communal living. They taught them how to interview, assisted with internships, trained them in money management and so forth. Some of the women felt that this was too little, too late. When actually faced with the task of living on a budget, paying for utilities and punching a time clock, they floundered.

Louise remarked, “The next most difficult thing (after “*building community*”) would probably be just living independently... paying your bills... So to speak “adulting” can be *really hard*.”⁴⁰⁶ Still others felt overwhelmed by independence, as do some teenagers when they leave for college and attempt to adapt to dorm life. The plethora of choices and temptations they confronted proved to be overwhelming. Ginger said,

When you go to rehab for any type of program, they gave me this one paper and they always say, “What was the thing that you can do *instead of* drugs. Put this on the paper.” I mean, I love to read. So read, walk, exercise... Whatever. So, one of my answers would be to go to the library. But how do you go to the library? Like, I haven’t been to the library since I was a child?”⁴⁰⁷

Melody, who was in a different program in a different state from Ginger and Shannon, explained that in the Program, “They’re teaching us everything, preparing us for when that time comes. But it’s really not going to happen until you’ve experienced it.”⁴⁰⁸

Summer stated her biggest obstacle was

...just adjusting to being in life by myself. I’ve never been by myself in my whole entire life. I’ve always had a man to rely on. This is the first time I haven’t had a boyfriend. So, adjusting to that life of taking care-well, I always took care of myself. But just going to sleep at night by myself without being scared of the dark; Yeah, I am.⁴⁰⁹

406. Louise, Personal Interview, August 26, 2019.

407. Ginger, Personal Interview, September 27, 2019.

408. Melody, Personal Interview, September 23, 2019.

409. Summer, Personal Interview, September 27, 2019.

Mona discussed neither being able to afford the cost or the time off from work to continue seeing her therapist. Her obstacle was complicated by justice and vocational issues, as she was working full-time for a county government and at the minimum, she perceived she could not afford wellness: “I can’t pay forty dollars every other week and miss work.”

In a qualitative study, sociological researcher Kristine Hickle notes how many obstacles in the paths of women leaving CSE networks whom she interviewed resulted from lack of experience or competence (e.g. adult responsibilities, limited employment skills) and abusive relationships that inevitably produced low self-esteem. As women began their exiting journeys, many experienced feelings of empowerment, becoming aware of their newfound competence, skill, and ability, Hickle writes.⁴¹⁰ One of her respondents, Monique, had first begun selling sex at age fifteen and continued in the commercial sex industry for 27 years. She spoke to the researcher at length about the difficulty adjusting to life outside of a CSE lifestyle:⁴¹¹

“You know what else is hard? Not living in motel rooms...there’s no kind of regular skills for us at all, period. House cleaning, none of that...I didn’t even know how to put gas in a car; I had to learn.” Monique went on to talk about watching television to learn life skills (many for the first time) at 42 years old.⁴¹²

Although Hickle’s study didn’t focus upon women who had completed faith-based rehabilitations, the responses of her subjects regarding their needs when transitioning into a new lifestyle bore great similarities. Whether they had entered a Program or not, one intensive year may be insufficient for a woman to develop critical skills she may never have had to consider during her adult development. Even if she is

410. Hickle, “Getting Out,” 90.

411. Hickle, 77.

412. Hickle, 77.

taught how to do these things in a class or by a mentor, it is no substitute for actually doing them over an extended period.

5-5 i. Substance Abuse

Patti spoke ebulliently about her faith, listing all the areas she was involved with in her church. Even so, when addressing substance abuse she remarked,

I see another roadblock, especially in recovery has been like sobriety. Oh, I don't really talk with like many people outside of my sobriety. The Programs that I attended really didn't know that about me, because they didn't really see it on me... Most of my drug use and alcohol occurred when I was trafficked.

The respondents had participated in various stages of drug- and alcohol rehabilitations. Most of them declared they had been sober for two years or more. Shannon was the sole respondent who stated that addictions had never been a prominent concern for her, as she had been part of a stable of women who were not permitted to drink or use drugs due to her pimps' preferences.⁴¹³

Ginger was actively addicted to opiates, openly confessing that her entire life centered upon obtaining the next fix. In the first face-to-face question when she was asked about the ideal life she would like, she startled both me and the attending psychologist with her response:

Well, I think there's two sides to that. If I would wake up tomorrow and have everything my way, I would be able to use drugs, and support my family. I'd be able to have all

413 Concerning the ban her pimp had placed on intoxicating substances, Shannon related this anecdote to me with good humor: "So I was living a lifestyle where I was doing cocaine, and drinking and pot... But when I went with them, because they're so sophisticated, they didn't want me to screw up their operation. They wanted me to be clearheaded. So I had to endure all that sober... That was very, very difficult. At the same time, I was proud of myself that I *did* it. I couldn't believe I *did* it! I would sneak, like... Wine throughout the week. Every now and then, because there'd be happy hour. And then, because he has such manipulating control over me, I feel convicted and guilty... And then my work would be off, and I would be making money. And so the madam would be like 'What do you need to confess? Tell me what you need to confess so we can move on and continue making the money?'" And so then I would be like (*in an exaggerated, despondent kind of voice*) 'I had a drink!' And she would be like, 'Well, don't do it again, and let's get to work.' So it was crazy, the power they had over me. Just that strong sense of family, like you don't want to lie to them."

the things and be able to do what I need to do while having the drugs in my life.

She reported she had never worked a steady job for more than a few weeks in her life, and that even though she had been to several drug rehabs they had never cured her of the craving to return to a permanent state of opiate inebriation. Later in the interview she provided more details about how that currently plays out, stating that she had met a man and resisted his continual advances, but since he was a drug dealer with a continual supply she finally relented and they now live together out of his car. “And since that day,” she concluded, “I just had to sit back and let him drive, basically. Literally and figuratively.”

The other respondents reported maintaining various stages of their sobriety, from maintaining nine years sober without serious temptations to those who had relapsed several times. Melody spoke in fatalistic terms about relapsing back into heroin addiction early in her re-integration process, “But... I had to experience those times. I had to fall, I had to experience those times.” She stated they had been worthwhile experiences because they enabled her to mature. Mona discussed how temptations inherent in working in a major city affects her on a daily basis, even after three years of sobriety:

You know where I work, there’s a lot of drug use and drug sales and a lot of homelessness and prostitution all around me... Sometimes I’ll ask my boyfriend to pick me up, so I don’t have to walk down to the train station and things like that. But even if he is unavailable, I just have to train myself like *just keep going to the train station, you only have a couple more blocks to go.*

From her perspective, three years of sobriety is insufficient. She must deliberately watch where she goes and with whom she talks to keep from relapsing.

Sadie spoke earnestly but with good humor about how she relapsed within the first few hours of her re-integration journey, although this hadn’t been her plan:

So, I left out of there... I call my sister, she's like "*I have my kids. I have nobody to watch my kids if I come get you.*" So, it was a friend who I thought was "a friend" that I was getting high with, and I was talking to him while I was there. He was saying like "*I'm proud of you*" and so forth... So, he's like, "*Okay, I'll come get you and I'll put you in a hotel room.*" So, when he came and got me, he's like, "*I am going to be honest with you, I want to get high.*" And I said like "Man the devil is busy! I haven't even been out for 24 hours and you're offering me drugs. Dude!"⁴¹⁴

Tia spoke of how she has overcome her drug addiction but is currently confronted with using alcohol in a manner she considers to be excessive. Yvette relapsed during the time I began communicating with her about scheduling interviews; My face-to-face interview with her was completed two months after the other subjects after she had achieved sobriety and was ready to talk. She had been clean for a mere seven weeks when I at last secured the interview.

Those who work with addicts recognize that relapse is a nearly inevitable part of the recovery process.⁴¹⁵ Based upon the literature and personal narratives, it is unrealistic to assume that those who have experienced prolonged substance abuse will give it up unproblematically and not return. The Program administrators I spoke with had no expectation of perfection from their clients, and in the area of substance abuse this was no exception. A superior feature of the Programs, though, was that participants had access to numerous resources as is expected from any social service organization. Relapse can be treated, and reintegrating citizens may return to their newly established lives without completely losing all the gains they may have made. Positive emotions are positively related to relapse and may result in fewer relapses and in relapses of shorter durations.⁴¹⁶ It can also be demonstrated that positive expectations concerning relapse will lead to

414 Sadie, Personal Interview, August 15, 2019.

415 Leukefeld and Tims, "Relapse and Recovery"; Katie Witkiewitz and G. Alan Marlatt, eds., *Therapist's Guide to Evidence-Based Prevention* (Boston, MA: Academic Press, 2007).

416 Witkiewitz and Marlatt, *Therapist's Guide*, 6.

more positive results.⁴¹⁷ If the respondents believe in their abilities to control their impulses, and don't adopt fatalistic attitudes about their likelihoods of returning to substance abuse, these are less likely to become self-fulfilling prophecies. The communities in which they choose to participate can help them to maintain hope. If they begin to deviate, community supports are available to assist. Respondents who decide to "go it alone" are greatly disadvantaged in that they shelter themselves from resources likely to affirm and encourage them, as well as removing positive role models likely to inspire them from their lines of vision.

5-5 j. Mental Health

Sociologists Mimi Silbert & Ayala Pines interviewed 200 women formerly and currently engaged in trading sex in the San Francisco Bay area for their study, "Victimization of Street Prostitutes."⁴¹⁸ They concluded that as a group, "psychological paralysis had occurred."⁴¹⁹ 70% of the respondents had experienced serious mental health problems, while reporting on 7.3 different home problems apiece.⁴²⁰ 73%, for example, reported having been raped, 27% of them reporting gang rape *unrelated* to the CSE they had been involved with.⁴²¹ 45% reported being beaten by their johns "... for fun—They get off on it." 66 % reported they were beaten by their pimps or other pimps.⁴²² 63% of them reported they had never discussed this before their interviews with the researchers.⁴²³ Most believed that the things which had transpired were inevitable, and they were characterized as collectively expressed the sentiment that there was "No aspect of our lives we can control".⁴²⁴ They had not experienced the kind of rehabilitation

417 Witkiewitz and Marlatt, 7.

418 Silbert and Pines, "Victimization."

419 Silbert and Pines, 131.

420 Silbert and Pines, 124.

421 Silbert and Pines, 128.

422 Silbert and Pines, 128.

423 Silbert and Pines, 130.

424 Silbert and Pines, 130.

reflected in this study but these statistics provides a snapshot into a few of the traumas these Northern California subjects had endured in the 1980's. Under those circumstances, ongoing mental illnesses are normative. It seems unlikely they would be able to move on unproblematically to establish stable lives in new cultures and strange environments, even if their rehabilitations had occurred under ideal conditions with the best-informed caregivers available. Those subjected to trauma and daily humiliations will require ongoing care for pervasive concerns.

Most of the women Dr. Whitaker and I interviewed discussed serious mental health concerns that had developed during CSE. Whether their conditions had been diagnosed as PTSD or not, ongoing responses to trauma affected the lives of the respondents dramatically. Some discussed fears associated with particular smells, noises or places. Others described fear of the dark, security fears, and nightmares even ten years after their exploitation ended. Yvette reported,

They diagnosed me as PTSD... Multiple personality disorder... Antisocial personality disorder... Bipolar... There's like six of them and I can't remember them all. (But)... because I haven't been going back to therapy, I no longer have the medication.⁴²⁵

Mona noted,

I was good at the tools and everything else like that, but pretty soon the racing thoughts and the depression. ... we're getting really, really exhausting and sometimes all I could do was cry. And pretty soon I can't get out of bed, I'm not going back to work. Now, I'm going to leave without pay because I don't have enough sick time, because I just want to lay down. Or I just want to leave early because I can't stand it.

At another juncture in the interview, she discussed some of the struggles regarding inability to afford the cost or the time off from work to continue seeing her therapist. Her

⁴²⁵ Yvette, Personal Interview, November 19, 2019.

obstacle was complicated by justice-related and vocational issues. She was working full-time for a county government and perceived she could not afford complete wellness:

...Or perhaps (...*The Program could develop a system where*) you could still go to one central place to get my counseling support. I'm not going to counseling. I can't... I can't pay forty dollars every other week and miss work.

Louise was shy and reticent, but she attested to how her courage and self-confidence have been building in recent years. Even so, she still feels the effects of trauma as she describes it here:

People that come to my door unexpectedly when I'm not expecting company. Just kind of knocks on the door (*she knocks*) ... Those kinds of things kind of set me off... I'm kind of the person you see peeping through the blinds to see who drove past my house.

Holly has been engaged for five to six years to a man of whom she speaks in ideal terms. When I first interviewed her in winter of 2019, she spoke excitedly of her upcoming wedding. But when we connected again in August, the wedding had failed to transpire. She explains:

...The first time I talked to you, I was engaged, and I was planning my wedding. Trauma does some funny things to people... And so, because of my—I've been through a lot of therapy. But because of my preconceived notion about men in general and all the things I'd seen in *The Life?* I mean we had sent out invitations, we paid for the venue, I had my dress and one night I just said... "I don't want to marry you. I can't do this" and I just called the wedding off. The next day I called my mom, and everything was canceled!⁴²⁶

Theresa, like Holly, has been away from CSE for almost a decade, and also bore similarities in that she has taken on leadership positions and made exemplary progress. She continues to grapple with psychological scars on an ongoing basis, revealing that every small noise seems to trigger her emotions. The sound of the bathroom fan and her

426 Holly, Personal Interview, September 6, 2019.

husband filling his cooler full of ice were triggers for her anxiety. She said that when she heard the sound of the ice in the morning, she learned to intentionally tell herself, “This is the sound of my husband getting ready for work.”⁴²⁷

It is impossible to know which of the respondents would have struggled with mental illness had they not been exploited. They collectively mentioned anxiety, depression, bi-polar condition and Multiple Personality Disorder as interfering with daily functions. Kelsey and Mona stated they were heavily medicated. Most of the participants engaged in ongoing counseling, although some eschewed it for various reasons while acknowledging that it was still needed.

Theresa also discussed how numerous men had used masturbating as a weapon or punishment to demean and humiliate her over a period of years. She reported on experiencing a traumatic response when she is unable to see her husband’s hands even if the couple are under the covers together. She reported that she has woken him in the middle of the night after developing an irrational fear that he might be masturbating under the covers to spite her.⁴²⁸

A further obstacle presented in the literature of sociology and psychology and echoed by some of the respondents is that the mental health professionals treating them haven’t often acquired adequate knowledge of the CSE lifestyles to competently counsel them.⁴²⁹ Mansson and Hedin reveal how, among their respondents, the women’s cries for help were often not acknowledged. Several staff members dismissed the women’s anxiety and requests for help with naive comments, which reportedly led respondents to

⁴²⁷ Theresa, Personal Interview, July 19, 2019.

⁴²⁸ She expressed great discomfort at approaching this topic, as she had been away from that lifestyle for nine years. However, her self-awareness and desire for optimal holistic healing was reflected in her willingness to help the interviewers confront the depth of psychic scarring that remained after all those years; She was able to find the strength to discuss an uncomfortable truth for the benefit of others trying to understand and address the phenomenon.

⁴²⁹ Hedin and Månsson, “Importance of Supportive Relationships,” 231.

prolonged periods of doubt and uncertainty.⁴³⁰ Some women also reported to the researchers "... 'john-like behavior' from male professionals when they sought help. Male physicians or psychologists, for example, invited them to dinner or nightclubs when they asked for medical treatment or psychotherapy. These unethical and unprofessional behaviors made the women feel even more powerless and unworthy of help."⁴³¹ Several of the respondents I interviewed also related similar experiences.

5-5 k. Employment Concerns

Numerous studies confirm that for women who possess some agency in their entrance into The Life, the lure of relatively high wages was a prominent factor.⁴³² In their qualitative study of women labelled "street-level prostitutes" in the Midwest, researchers Williamson and Folaron noted, "Upon entrance, prostitution is not viewed as a negative, but is instead perceived as a survival strategy to help alleviate financial burdens. Women perceived obstacles in the formal economy that presented barriers to financially sustaining themselves and a family."⁴³³ Within this group, notions of financial security developed after they began engaging in street prostitution. Even those involved with pimps believe their contributions make a significant difference between success and failure in the lives of the pimps and themselves.⁴³⁴ It would therefore be remiss to ignore their critical needs for ongoing steady income and financial security for women abandoning this lifestyle. Research examining the characteristics of women exiting CSE have established that the majority suffer from psychological, behavioral, and somatic sequelae, such as increased addictions, a range of health and mental health conditions,

430 Hedin and Månsson, 231.

431 Hedin and Månsson, 231.

⁴³² Silbert and Pines, "Victimization"; Jennifer James, "The Prostitute as Victim," in *The Victimization of Women*, ed. J. R. Chapman and M. Gates (Beverly Hills, CA: Sage, 1978), 175–201; Tyler and Johnson, "Trading Sex"; Williamson and Folaron, "Understanding the Experiences."

433 Williamson and Folaron, "Understanding the Experiences," 7.

434 Williamson and Folaron, 8.

poor self-care, and difficulties in acquiring high-paying employment and adjusting to work culture in mainstream society.⁴³⁵ This underscores the need for them to secure both meaningful income and vocations after their CSE years have concluded.

Sociologist Sharon Oselin conducted a survey among agencies she called PSO's (Prostitute Service Organizations) who assisted in helping women transition from CSE to new vocations. She discovered that only 12.5 percent of the women she worked with had obtained their high school diplomas.⁴³⁶ A lack of educational attainment, she writes, causes serious disadvantages as they try to transition out of sex work and into legitimate professions. Recognizing this fact, the PSOs strongly encouraged clients to return to school and earn their degrees, as it elevates their chances of employment and increases their self-esteem and self-efficacy.⁴³⁷ The organizations I connected with for this study also made this a top priority. Only one of the seventeen respondents I spoke with had not obtained her GED before leaving her Program.

The employment concerns of the respondents fell into four categories: 1) Previous criminal convictions impeded employment; 2) Respondents struggles to explain gaps in their employment history; 3) Adapting to the workplace environment; 4) Sustaining ongoing stability and health enabling respondents to continue working. Among the respondent interviewed for *this* study, none reported inability to land a job. Patti described how she could not keep one once she'd secured it. Yvette was able to obtain numerous jobs but had difficulty overcoming historically poor work habits.⁴³⁸ *Inadequate wages* is a subjective term, but several of the respondents *stated* their wages were inadequate, and thus problematic. Criminal convictions were normative in the lives

435 Wilson and Butler, "Running a Gauntlet," 499.

436 Oselin, *Leaving Prostitution*, 153.

437 Oselin, 153.

438 She reported experiencing problems finishing her shifts. She would report to work and perform her duties, she said, but consistently made excuses and left her shifts early.

of the respondents, which limited career options for some and kept others from obtaining some of the jobs they applied for. To illustrate this, we return to Sadie's narrative from the last section, after she lost her job, her fiancé, and her freedom to relocate:

Now I'm having a hard time finding a job because it look like I just got a felony in 2017. So, I'm like trying to reach out to do things. But it's like I have to look at like what God is telling me and I just have to be still.

I feel like people should be given more of a chance. Especially... jobs. Like, they're not even hearing me out when I say, you know, I have a paper that proves that this case is ten years old... People are saying that there are these, like--Second Chance jobs. Second Chance businesses and so forth? I'm saying that they're not.

What Sadie is alluding to is that many employers state they will hire felons; Her experience was that she applied to several of these companies and although her charges seem rather minor, many employers would still rather not deal with particular backgrounds. It is not known whether they had identified her as someone who had traded sex or not. People with shoplifting records are sometimes shut out of positions that might be open to those who incurred drug offenses, for example. Yvette confirmed this information, relating in a humorous fashion how her felonies have affected employment:

Well, having two felonies was a big barrier. At first. Until I got in the mind frame that those felonies are *not* going to stop me from getting a freaking good job, period. The first job that really opened up the door? -- Was (a large employer in a mid-sized city). So, once I seen that I could get a good job... As long as none of them (*the charges*) is theft, burglary, stealing something—they're going to give you a chance. You can chop up five people, they don't care. (*We laugh*).

Aside from the self-evident obstacles imposed by holding criminal records, the CSE life also created gaps in the employment record that are difficult or embarrassing for

the respondents to explain to prospective employers.⁴³⁹ If they get hired, they have higher learning curves than do most employees. They may have never been exposed similar environments before, and although The Programs have usually coached them in interviewing and resume-building skills it is likely they will have difficulties understanding the workplace cultures and subsequent expectations of their employers.

Patti had reportedly suffered from a Traumatic Brain Injury from a car accident towards the end of her Program. Perhaps lacking the ability to fully comprehend the complexity of her dilemma, she discussed at length her lack of preparedness for the workforce. Her impression was that the internships offered her would lead to permanent employment, but this never happened. What she related to Dr. Whitaker and I was that she was often told “We don’t feel like you’re further enough in your recovery or healing process. (or) “You might be a discouragement to other people in The Program.” She said that attended classes at a Community College and it did not appear that she had finished the program. Then she said she worked in a jewelry store, a pizza parlor, and as a nanny, but none of these led to sustainable, ongoing employment. She spun these experiences positively, but the reality appears to be that she blazed through numerous jobs because she was not found to be competent to serve in any of the positions permanently.⁴⁴⁰ Later in the interview she revealed,

I was a nanny for about two months and after I was done... my body was just getting so fatigued that I was sleeping like eighteen hours a day. Because my brain couldn’t repair itself. We found that my body produces a lot of stuff, but it wasn’t using the things that it was producing?

⁴³⁹ Brown et al., “Challenges Faced by Women”; Sallmann, “Living with Stigma.”

⁴⁴⁰ In our interview lasting nearly three hours, Patti rambled on for long intervals, often without addressing the questions she was asked. She was pleasant and well-groomed, but her abilities to reason and comprehend information appeared to be compromised.

Had Patti been hired full-time at one of her internships she may have discovered that it was not ultimately sustainable for her. Her health concerns required numerous appointments with specialists which may have interfered with her ability to report for work with reasonable levels of consistency. She stated that her TBI "...definitely limits me, especially like having to travel back and forth to (*large city*) now (about a two-hour car ride) for, like medical appointments, which is like a hundred bucks, the bus travel, and food and transportation and everything." She reported that she has seen "... like over forty different doctors now" and brought up her former employment as a nanny again, revealing that her medical appointments made it untenable to keep the position.

According to her narrative

My source of income is a short-term disability? Which is only \$197 a month. And the food stamps are only \$192 a month. That's pretty much what I lived off for the last year. So... With my housing voucher, my original rent was five dollars because it's 30% of my income. Minus the medications and everything else that I have to pay for my own. So, the rent actually went up this past month. It went from five to \$11 a month. And then all my other bills and the things that come with living on your own...

Today she remains unable to work, which critically restricts her ability to flourish, and she stated that she may not be approved for long-term disability payments.

Chapter 1 began with a portion of Mona's story, including her frustrations with struggling to maintain a decent standard of living and her inability to afford some of the luxuries to which she had become accustomed. She had begun to flourish in office jobs before being CSE, but materialism called to her, coupled with a deteriorating view of her self-agency. Men had taken what they wanted from her without her permission for many years, producing a low sense of self-worth in her. On the surface, she is making great progress on her job working for the county government of a large city. But obtaining that position had been arduous, and now that she was firmly established as a valuable

employee it seemed unfulfilling to her and unlikely to lead to an engaging vocation.

Although she ultimately prevailed, some of her frustrations with her vocational development path mirrored Patti's:⁴⁴¹

You know they (The Program) set us up with these great internships. All this hope and "...do your best. You'll be permanent in three months. Don't even worry about it." And you get to the job, you get to the two months and your manager says like, "We've never had a budget for you to go permanent." And it's like, *wait a minute, what?* So, on top of you being on your own, I have had to fight with keeping my job, or getting another job.

Mona confirmed that she eventually was offered a position and accepted it. However, it was a far more elaborate and competitive process than it might have been, and the process soured her to civil service employment. As she described it, her status was touch-and-go the entire time she was interning. From that juncture, she turned the conversation to that of another friend of hers who was a little older than her and had also been trafficked. The friend now waitresses in a bar and has a side job as a nanny to make ends meet, but even so she has to live with her boyfriend's parents for financial reasons.

She wondered aloud,

... Why do we go through all this training and all this being away from our families for two years just to go back to an awful situation? Now I know that our own personal choices and our own strength have to do with it... (but) I'm (too old) to just go with an internship and, like I'm not going to live with somebody's parents. I can't work in a bar. I cannot.

Mona presented her narrative passionately, and her disappointment was tangible. The details she provided about obtaining her job, followed immediately by bemoaning a friend who had made other choices underscored the depth of feeling she possessed. She saw herself as trying to play by the rules after years of having men exploit her, and the

⁴⁴¹ It should be noted that Patti and Mona live on opposite sides of the country and attended different Programs.

rules didn't seem to be adding up. Her friend was working even more hours at two jobs, perhaps with a superior income from tips, and still felt it necessary to have her costs covered by living in somebody else's house. Mona's lament contained the theme of a betrayal. She was told that opportunities would come her way, which turned out to be somewhat true since she was articulate and resourceful. But the payoff didn't seem appropriate to her. She discovered she was still a far cry from having the kind of life she felt like the Program had enabled her to envision. She was sharing living expenses with a man, perhaps feeling like that was an economic necessity. But in living in an expensive city and having impulses she described as "materialistic" she had failed to adjust her expectations to the realities of starting out on the bottom vocational rung of a bureaucracy. Men were no longer exploiting her, but she does not yet have access to nice possessions. She seems to be pondering whether she and some of her friends have merely traded a great sorrow for a lesser one. Later on, she discussed how the inability to find acceptable work that would provide for her financial needs in exchange for her domesticity and sexual companionship. She mused about what might happen if a woman had completed her rehabilitative program and still had no landed appropriate employment:

What are you going to do: You are going to find a man! Even if you've never done the prostitution part before, but you know how to... submit, so you have a roof over your head. I know (*a friend she had mentioned*) -- That's been one of her biggest struggles. "*But what if I get a boyfriend who's got a good job and makes good money, then I won't have to worry anymore?*" And I'm having to remind her, "*Yes you will, you remember what that's like.*"

While secular sociologists like Sharon Oselin prioritize job preparedness over other concerns such as spiritual transformation and redemptive community, I discovered no source denying or minimizing the importance of education, meaningful employment

and new vocational pathways in assisting CSE women to remain free from exploitation.⁴⁴² “All of the PSO graduates prioritized employment and educational attainment as key components of their new lifestyles. To that end, those who had high commitment to their new role and identity often continued to advance their educational attainment in order to secure jobs and increase their salaries, all of which deepened their ties to conventional society,” Oselin writes.⁴⁴³ Christocentric programs may emphasize some components they think to be even *more* critical than employment than education and employment in enabling reintegrating CSE to flourish in their communities. The emphasis one places upon this component, though, may merely be one of degree. It is not a competition. While individuals need oxygen and will quickly perish if they are not able to breathe, they also need food, water and sleep. The denial of any of these will have catastrophic effects on their perpetuity, even if those effects cannot be observed as quickly as when oxygen is withheld.

5-5 1. Family Issues

Respondents discussed obstacles with me presented by a variety of family situations. Most of these concerned difficulties involving either their parents or their children.⁴⁴⁴ Some were grounded in historic difficulties and might also reflect parallel problems in the category labelled *Interfering History*. Past childhood abuse is rampant among CSE initiates, as discussed in Chapter 3 Section 2b. Wilson and Butler reveal that in addition to this historic phenomenon, the households in which respondents were raised

⁴⁴² Oselin writes, “One study... reveals that most were unemployed, but instead crafted new identities tied to religion or motherhood (e.g., “Child of God,” good mother). In contrast, I find securing stable employment is integral for prostitutes to be able to maintain a life, role, and identity removed from sex work.” Oselin, *Leaving Prostitution*, 153.

⁴⁴³ Oselin, 153–54.

⁴⁴⁴ Only one of the respondents, Jamie, revealed she had been married during her years in CSE. Since her husband had been her pimp, this did present an obstacle for her regarding her children’s welfare. Other respondents had experienced difficulties with former paramour-pimps. Only two of the respondents were married at the time they were interviewed, and they both discussed challenges in their marriages that were related to their backgrounds, but they didn’t present these challenges as critical obstacles.

may have been characterized by violence, neglect, parental substance abuse, a pervasive lack of resources, and continual crises.⁴⁴⁵ Substance abuse has been prevalent in many family backgrounds and in the communities where they have been raised increasing the likelihood of substances being used as a means of coping for victims.⁴⁴⁶ General family dysfunction and various forms of child maltreatment may result in the involvement of child protective services while the risk of CSE increases for children who are removed from their families.⁴⁴⁷ Incorporating some of the parents—now often grandparents—into the rehabilitated lives of their reintegrating daughters may be unwise, problematic and sometimes untenable.

5-5 1. i. Parents and Other Adults

Many of the respondents had fostered warm, mutually satisfying relationships with their mothers post-Program. For others, their mothers had been the agents who had coerced them into CSE from childhood or had abused them in other ways. Theresa testified of a parent who had groomed her for early sexualization and degradation. Her mother died when she was young and her father was always absentee, so the parental issue germane post-Program. Kelsey, on the other hand, had been taught by her mother to service men, and they had engaged in this enterprise together. She is ambivalent about their relationship today:

My mother (is one of my biggest obstacles). I don't want to let go of her, because if she dies from an overdose or something, I would hate myself... I can't *not* be in contact with her because of that selfish reason. I'm not around her-

445 Wilson and Butler, "Running a Gauntlet," 496. These findings are corroborated elsewhere. See for example: Bernadette Barton and Constance L. Hardesty, "Spirituality and Stripping: Exotic Dancers Narrate the Body Ekstasis," *Symbolic Interaction* 33, no. 2 (Spring 2010): 280–96, <https://doi.org/10.1525/si.2010.33.2.280>; Dalla, "'You Can't Hustle All Your Life'"; Su, "Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health."

446 Wilson and Butler, "Running a Gauntlet," 496. For more examples of this, see: Belcher and Herr, "Development of Grounded Theory"; John J. Potterat et al., "Pathways to Prostitution: The Chronology of Sexual and Drug Abuse Milestones," *Journal of Sex Research* 35, no. 4 (November 1, 1998): 333–40, <https://doi.org/10.1080/00224499809551951>.

447 Wilson and Butler, "Running a Gauntlet," 496.

I'm not in the same state as her. So why not talk to her?
 So, we still talk, and it's difficult because I know she's high
 and I know she's very, you know, selfish when it comes
 to... money... And stuff and I just can't be around her.
 Same with my sister.

In Kelsey's interview, she clearly implied that her mother would try to manipulate her, grift money from her and perhaps worse. Historically, her mother had coerced and coached her into trafficking as a teenager and was therefore not simply a pest; She is in reality a child abuser and a spiritual danger to Kelsey. The obstacle presented was one far greater than mere psychological anguish.

Others described neglectful and abusive behaviors from their parents that clearly had left them scarred years later. In those situations, family relationships may currently be nonexistent or difficult if the respondent is attempting to incorporate the parent into her life at all. Yvette describes a complicated relationship with her mother, who had also contributed to her childhood abuse. Today "...She is supportive to the best of her ability - because she's fighting and overcoming her demons also... You know, but as I've gotten older, I can see that she went through some things too," she muses. Her conclusion was that she has forgiven and learned to better cope with her mother today. At the same time, her mother constantly asks her for money and favors, and since Yvette is still struggling mentally and financially she cannot allow her to gain the upper hand.

5-5 1. ii. Complications Involving Children

Those who had children fell into three categories. In the first group were women who had children whom they had abandoned, often under constraint, or whom they had disappointed. Ginger noted how she had become an embarrassment to her children, and her ex-husband was not allowing any contact between them, to which she acquiesced:

My daughter was out of my life... Her dad has always,
 since our divorce he's always had custody of her, and I

can't control that. Thank God. Because I was not making good decisions...

Summer reported that her children are all adults now. As with Mona, some of the details she provided gave a clearer picture as to why her flourishing levels were so low.⁴⁴⁸

Rather than simply reporting on her poor childhood, though, she discussed how much pain she had inflicted on her own family:

(Years ago) I left my kids with their dad... And I just left. And I just messed up my relationship with all my kids. Especially my youngest son-- he won't speak to me; He don't want nothing to do with me. Because you know I left him when he was like three years old, four years old. He would carry my picture around, asking if *Daddy was mom coming home?* I have to live with that every day. All I can do is make it better from this point forward.⁴⁴⁹

An additional family concern involved respondents who were raising children whose fathers had been their pimps. Custody had been established for all the respondents in my sample. However, several of the women still brokered visitation concerns and struggled with issues of justice. Jamie tried to explain some of the complexities to me:

I'm still married to him-- he is the kids' father. It's very... (Long *pause*...). Because why should I have to pay for the divorce? You know this is my exploiter, why can't I just have the state pay for it? That is something that I'm working on and there's somebody was helping me on that. I have a lawyer and he's helping me get my divorce for free. That's why I had my tattoo covered (*She had shown us earlier how her neck had just been tattooed over with artwork that covered what had been there-her abuser's name.*) I just went to the first steps which was 3 ½ hours, and now I have to go back again for the color (*on the tattoo. She affirms that she had his name inscribed on her neck.*)

Tim: He... Insisted that you had his name tattooed there?

Jamie: I... Struggle with that. Because we had more of a relationship where... *I still feel like that we were in love.*

⁴⁴⁸ Summer's flourishing scores were a composite 53.75%, placing her in the Poor Flourishing category.

⁴⁴⁹ Regarding her childhood experiences, she briefly related at another point in the interview how she had grown up in poverty and had been serially raped by her stepfather.

So, everything wasn't done in the manner of like you *have* to do this. So, there was an element of it being like (*Imitates her former voice*) "Oh look at this-- look at when I *did* love you." And so then, he was like, "*Oh then I'll go get my name on you.*" And he has my name on him. But that would make me think that "*I told you he loved me.*" But then he's got it on like seven other girls, too (*she chuckles ruefully*).

Alanna was concerned but did not appear to be fearful about the imminent prison release of her child's biological father from prison. The man had also been her abusive and controlling pimp. She noted that she possesses a no-contact order, but the man had continued to send her letters from prison and then packages for her daughter. She secured the involvement of authorities, but they did not give him any more prison time. He is not permitted to enter her county, and she says he lives some distance away. He may just forget about it, she noted, or he may push the envelope. She stated that she was resigned to "Trust the Lord that he's brought me this far, and he's going to continue to protect me. I have to do my part... And then he'll do the rest of His..."⁴⁵⁰

The third category of child-related problems the researcher encountered involved the raising of the children. For some, this created financial obstacles as well as difficulties regarding daycare. Most of the women with young children were trying to establish new careers. Shannon stated that her ability to move into a career and earn an adequate salary was thwarted by the high cost of daycare for her young daughter. Others had to learn to navigate discipline problems while also managing their own obstacles and earning enough money to provide for the family. La Donna reported on the complexities of raising a teenage daughter. She discovered to her dismay that the tenth grader had begun smoking marijuana and looking at pornography. LaDonna, in her fresh faith, had presumed that her warnings and current example would have shielded the young lady

450 Alanna, Personal Interview, August 26, 2019.

from those things. She had to make a mental adjustment to once again discover the free moral agency individuals possess.⁴⁵¹

Some of the subjects were attending college full-time and working full-time, without partners at home. Three of the respondents reported having mixed-race children with their former exploiters, which they identified as causing difficulties in their current communities. Their children may have already learned about their mothers' turbulent histories, and other respondents were considering how much information they should tell their children, and what the timetable should be.

Lastly, some expressed concerns regarding the safety of their children. Melody had recently moved into housing that had been constructed on Program property at the time I interviewed her. Before the townhomes were available, though, she had to live in government-subsidized housing as she was a single mother, working part-time, and attending classes full-time. She considered the subsidized housing to be a danger both for her and for her children.

I would say if you don't have money or are able to live in a decent neighborhood or anything like that (it created a great obstacle to flourishing). What comes with that is drugs and... Just... It's not a safe, healthy environment. So, it's just hard when you're put in that situation and are trying to do what's right, you try to get ahead in life. It's like impossible when you go back to that.

Andrew Park believes that *han* is transmitted four ways, one of which is biological.⁴⁵² As he explains it,

...If a child inherited the genes of a cardiac disease from a parent, the child may also suffer from cardiac disease. Children of alcoholic parents have a high probability of developing alcoholism. The child inherits the seat of *han*, not the parent's *han* itself. This can be called "the transmission of the structure of *han*."⁴⁵³

451 LaDonna, Personal Interview, August 22, 2019.

452 Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 80–81.

453 Park, 80.

If he is correct, this presents additional complications the respondents did not identify per se but could prove to be significant in removing obstacles to flourishing. First, if *han* is transmitted to CSE respondents via their parents and those concerns are still unresolved with the parents, this may pose an ongoing threat to the children of emancipated women. The toxic behaviors of their grandparents may be more likely to cause complications in the lives of the grandchildren. It subsequently underscores the critical needs of the reintegrating CSE subject to break the cycle of sorrows in her own life and to seize every possible opportunity to transition into a fully realized state of flourishing in her own life. The longer she clings to unwanted baggage in her own life, the more difficult it will be to pass abundant life on to her own children.

5-5 m. Inadequate Network (Socio-Spiritual)

Remarks in this category were particularly prominent by the women who were languishing in community. Though the women did not always diagnose the obstacle succinctly, they spoke of concerns more easily identifiable to them such as: a) Toxic friendships (primarily characterized by ongoing weakness for inappropriate males); b) Unhealthy friends were close friends including addicts and manipulators; c) I rejected a support network that was extended to me; d) I have poor community-building skills which made it difficult for me to maintain a support network.

The respondents did not complain that supporters were unavailable to provide counsel and assistance. A more common theme was that *they deliberately* rejected or avoided available supporters. This was framed as something they possessed agency over; “I avoided healthy supporters” rather than as a criticism of the existing caregiving networks. Louise revealed that “I would definitely say community has been the hardest

thing for me. Since leaving the program... it's hard to understand how different things work." In another part of the interview, she added:

Building my community—to this day... still has been such an internal struggle for me. That's why I believe in it so much for our residents today... And being someone that is already kind of shy, and now a single parent. Where do you go to find people, other than church? But I go to a big church so I can kind of hide away there. It actually is one of the biggest struggles that I've had.

Melody stated that when "...you have people coming up to you, whether it just be men wanting to get with you, or drugs or whatever. You just have to be strong enough to... Say no or to not fall into that sometimes." Later she added a similar sentiment:

When life happens, like when circumstances get bad, sometimes it will trigger you to either want to get high or use, or just go back into that form of thinking? And like... Relationships? Like not knowing... If you've never been like with a godly man, stuff like that. You've only been with these types of man, it's familiar to you.

Others decried their own social ineptness, which had kept them from reaching out to those who would have assisted. Some admitted they were exasperated by the relative ennui that accompanied a sober lifestyle. They wanted to "party" and craved the familiar attentions of unhealthy male relationships, whom they called "Bad Boys". Tia reported, "I still struggle with not having a man in my life. I still sometimes look for the bad guys since that's all I know who to go after." At another interval she also confessed,

I would (love to) have... Healthy, safe friends. Okay, I'm going to take that back. I do have good friends right now but they're just not... As good as they *should* be. Does that make sense?

(Tim asks for elaboration).

Tia: I think that I need to find friends that, when I say, "Let's go drink!" they say "No."

Several times during the interview with Jamie, she discussed some of the difficulties she has endured due to her weak social network. She noted, "...The hardest

thing since leaving would be the separation with (The Program). I'm like, putting my big girl panties on, I would say."

As previously cited, Kelsey spoke of sabotaging her relationships with others in what appeared to be a deliberate effort to avoid accountability. Her perception was that relationships had become so toxic at a job where she had happily worked for over two years that she had to eliminate all the associated friendships. She observed how today she only people she spends time with are her fiancée, with whom she is cohabiting, and one other friend. Yet, she recognized her own contributions to the ensuing toxicity.

At different intervals in the interview, Ginger discussed her disappointment with select volunteers who had assisted in her Program. At times, her complaints bordered on contempt. Inevitably, though, she admitted she does not really want help and that she has deliberately distanced herself from people who might offer affirmation. Speaking of a mentor who had been working with her she remarked,

Charma (*Pseudonym*) has literally said "I don't know you as a drug addict, I know you when you're clean. And I don't know what you're capable of.... If you want to call and talk to me every now and then, fine, but like other than that we're working, kind of on and off right now." And it's like I don't think she's upset with me in any way-- I just think she really doesn't have the skills. She doesn't know that life...

Summer, at the time of her interview, was living in the town in which she had grown up--something administrators discourage. She was situated perhaps a thousand miles from where she had completed her rehabilitation. It appeared from her description of her life that she was not involved with a church and didn't have a significant network surrounding her. When asked who she was spending the most time with, she responded,

I just stick to my own self. Because I have trust issues, for me to trust anybody.... I have to *do* for myself because in the end, nobody's really going to be there for you. When all is said and done, whoever you think is your friend down

the street, they're really *not*... So, I just learn to take care of myself, because nobody else is going to do it for you.

Tim: You don't have any other girlfriends or anything like that?

Summer: No, I don't trust women. No, uh-uh. Even in the streets I never got along with other women, I always had guy friends (*She chuckles*).

Mona stated she was not spending much time with anybody other than her mother, two friends and her boyfriend with whom she cohabits. When asked if she has a mentor now or if one had been assigned to her when she left the Program, she replied in the negative:

No, they don't have that... There are a couple volunteers who I could be, you know, going to coffee, going to church with. But I think even still, for their benefit I don't want to be that transparent. I don't want to be dumping my life on them, because these are not survivors of human trafficking.

Bryant Myers considers that since poverty is the result of unjust relationships, healing for these citizens should transpire within the context of Christian community:

Any Christian vision of a better human future must include a vibrant, growing, living Christian community that is eagerly and joyfully serving God and its community. It is impossible to imagine a transforming community without a transforming church in its midst. Such a church is in love with God and with all its neighbors, celebrating everything that is for life and being a prophetic voice, telling the truth about everything that is against or that undermines life.⁴⁵⁴

The Christocentric rehabilitative Programs share Myers' commitment to seeing marginalized peoples transformed and to become healthy within a community of believers. They are happy when any participant permanently leaves trafficking networks, but they are overjoyed when that individual also becomes part of a Christian community. A good outcome would be for these women to never again return to exploitative communities; The best outcome would be that they do this within networks of people

⁴⁵⁴ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 177.

who will lovingly keep them accountable. Tia expounded on her desire accomplish this, noting that she longs for friends who will tell her “no,” at least at this stage in her life when she is vulnerable and prone to making bad choices. Louise’ struggle in this this area is equally palpable; Even though she has been vocationally successful and has adopted a new identity as a believer, she states how difficult the task of building community has been for her. As Charles Moore has stated, “It takes work.”⁴⁵⁵ Some deliberation in the initial months and years in the new community may feel laborious, until a new normal is established. With adequate commitment to learning the ways of a new culture replete with new mores, friends and habits, the community will become second nature. The neglect to establish healthy and redemptive community supports proved to be a predictor of failure among respondents as many of the administrators had previously indicated. This theme will be further explored in Chapter 7.

The respondents proposed several other unique barriers they had personally struggled with that did not fit into the prominently mentioned categories in this chapter. Because they were mentioned infrequently, I have covered them only briefly. Those remarks are found in [Appendix 5-3](#). A brief biographical sketch of each respondent is available in [Appendix 5-4](#).

Another key to identifying obstacles to flourishing for the respondents is to examine the Not-Obstacles, or the factors respondents identified as assets enabling them to flourish. In Chapter 6, the same criteria used throughout this chapter are applied to reveal the principal assets they identified as strengths enabling them to flourish. Their narratives will be considered as primary data once again, this time describing the things that have enriched their reintegration journeys.

455 Moore, “It Takes Work,” 85.

Chapter 6: Voice of the Respondents: Assets Promoting Flourishing

6-1 Categories of Assets Accommodating Reintegration

This chapter addresses subquestion 2 from my research questions in chapter 1, section 1-6: “*What assets do Christ-following women who have been commercially sexually exploited rely upon to help them successfully reintegrate?*” Ten variables were mentioned by the respondents as favorable factors, assisting them in the process of settling into communities after having been CSE and then completing Christocentric programs of rehabilitative care. Recognizing what went well for this demographic is equally as important as hearing what transpired poorly. By identifying the Not-Obstacles, we may better understand the constraining obstacles facing them and gain a more nuanced appreciation of their experiences. Though no one respondent claims to speak for the group, this list identifies assets unique to the subjects identified here. The following are the ten variables most helpful in assisting their reintegration journeys consistently cited according to respondents’ questionnaires and interviews. A summary of brief exemplary quotes regarding each of these assets can be found in [Appendix 6-1](#). As in chapter 5, these will be analyzed roughly in the order of how prominently they were discussed by respondents, from the least frequently mentioned to the most frequently mentioned topics emerging in discussions. The following are the assets discussed in this chapter:

- a. My Sobriety
- b. Ongoing Counseling
- c. Boundaries Honored
- d. Giving Back
- e. Active Dreams
- f. Vocational Progress
- g. Spiritual Engagement
- h. Agencies Assisted
- i. Community Supports
- j. Transformed Identity

Most of the examples included here come from those whose flourishing scores placed them in the medium- to high flourishing categories; however, a few quotes were also captured from the lower flourishers, based upon the recognition that almost all respondents could express some positive occurrences in their reintegration journeys that might assist in overall positive outcomes if they are able to more fully exploit those assets. Four of the five low- and poor flourishers were involved in circumstances that might be turned around for more positive outcomes with some effort, and their circumstances may indeed have begun improving after the interviews concluded. Kelsey, for example, had a satisfactory income and secure housing, and stated that she was experiencing happiness with a man who seemed to be decent and kind. She reported that she had not been involved in any CSE activities for five months. Mona expressed overall disillusionment with her *Square Life*; However, she did not appear to have ever returned to exploitative networks after graduating from the Program, and she held a respectable professional job and appropriate housing. For these reasons, some of their remarks were included in this section.

6-2 Analysis of Assets

6-1 a. My Sobriety

All the respondents who registered high or above-average levels of flourishing had maintained sobriety in community. Several of them discussed having relapsed at some juncture after reintegration, but at the time interviews were conducted they had been maintaining sobriety. Alanna reported she is a social drinker but that her drinking is appropriate. Tia discussed her struggles with abusing alcohol. The other women did not divulge using any alcohol or illegal drugs at all. Only Ginger reported active drug use, and her flourishing levels were extremely low.

Patti's sobriety was a point of pride for her. On her questionnaire, she wrote, "My accomplishments since leaving is almost sober and clean for 3 years. I haven't had much panic attacks or PTSD, maybe only once a month in public settings." (*sic*). Theresa reported, "I had a good quality of sobriety and had started a new life doing everything the world said to be successful. I was even on a church plant team and contributing to society." Although Kelsey had described sexually exploitative relationships as recently as five months prior, she stated that she had been astute in maintaining her sobriety:

I really don't struggle with drugs, I am two years sober, but I also don't live in the state where I was doing drugs. So... I really don't think drugs were my problem. I think the problem was feeling loved.

Sadie wrote, "I would like to say I'm now almost 3 years sober and clean from the LIFE but when I say that I'm still like a infant that is still just now learning how to walk. I made a decision that was very hard when I graduated from (The Program) after 18 months." (*sic*) While many of the respondents reported ongoing suffering from mental health concerns and from unhealthy compulsions the group of respondents I spoke with seemed collectively more resilient when it came to substance abuse than was described in the many studies involving women who had not participated in Christocentric rehabilitation.⁴⁵⁶ But for those like Patti, Sadie, LaDonna, Kelsey and Theresa, the desire to overindulge in addictive substances was fading in the rear-view mirror, if it remained an active temptation at all.

6-1 b. Ongoing Counseling

More women continued in counseling among respondents post-Program than those who did not. The most frequently mentioned therapeutic mode was mental health

⁴⁵⁶ As previously mentioned, one of them was enrolled in a suboxone maintenance program, one was currently addicted to opiates, one had not been permitted to use addictive substances in her former CSE network, one or more were struggling with alcohol use, and several reported that they had returned to "partying" at least briefly after completing their Programs.

counseling. Many of the Programs they had attended offered access to ongoing counseling even if the subjects could not afford the cost. They spoke of needing to obtain ongoing help regarding anxiety and trauma.⁴⁵⁷ Scarlett attributes part of her favorable flourishing abilities to...

... a really good substance abuse counselor. I came in there pointing a finger-this is that, it's them... she let me do this over a couple of weeks and then she was like, "What's your part in it?" I didn't think I *had* a part in it. I didn't think I had a part. But then when I sat there and thought about it... I know that I was in some circumstances out of my control, but I did make choices, based on the circumstances, that were not wise.

Kelsey received psychiatry provided by a large area church. It is unknown whether the excessive amounts of psychotropic medications she is prescribed are appropriate. But the insight that she has been able to remain under a psychologist's care is a positive one:

I'm extremely medicated. (*Laughs ruefully*). My anxiety... It just flares up every now and then. I can take one of my anxiety pills and be okay for couple of days. I try not to take it religiously because... Because of my past addictions.

Louise also reported great success and satisfaction with a therapist, noting how the sessions she attends brings great structure to her life. Both Alanna and Shannon reported their counseling sessions were with "Christian"⁴⁵⁸ counselors. The latter stated that this was funded for her through Medicaid, "So... The resources are amazing out there. Those all help me to get where I am." Alanna stated that

I go to therapy once a week. And it's going good. It's a Christian counselor. I started going, probably about a year and a half ago and... It's been really, really helpful. To just

⁴⁵⁷ The women who demonstrated low flourishing levels spoke of how they "should" still be attending counseling but were not.

⁴⁵⁸ This could signify anything from pastoral counseling to psychotherapy with an agency who is dedicated to biblical principles, and anything in-between. With both of these respondents, it appears that psychotherapy was being utilized, and their respective Programs had located individuals or agencies that are committed to incorporating Christian spirituality in the session.

kind of help with just life and parenting, and the work I do here. To kind of help me kind of process things... We're doing "lifespan integration" right now. It's good.

Mansson and Hedin report that the majority of the Swedish respondents they interviewed for their study utilized counseling resources during their breakaway periods, and about forty percent used psychotherapy on a long-term basis.⁴⁵⁹ This does not necessarily represent the need of the respondents, but only the frequency of its occurrence, regardless of the demand. It is possible that *all* respondents needed counseling upon leaving their CSE networks. The sociologists reported one of the chief concerns addressed in therapy was that subjects had trouble clearly expressing their needs after prolonged seasons in which their needs were subsumed by those of their pimps, johns and other authoritative voices.⁴⁶⁰ When dialoguing with counselors, who recognize her humanity "...she develops a sense of new meaning to her life and the hope that change is worthwhile. The dialogue seems to affect her self-image and allows her to view herself differently."⁴⁶¹

Although reports of insensitive or inappropriate counselors were not unheard-of, Hedin and Mansson's findings were consistent with what was reported to Dr. Whitaker and me. Women who engaged in ongoing therapy appeared to be uniformly pleased with the results. They noted that therapy was often needed for several years after they were done with the formal rehabilitative element of their programs. When they were able to take advantage of this, respondents reported feeling better equipped to navigate their reintegration journeys.

6-1 c. Boundaries Honored

⁴⁵⁹ Hedin and Månsson, "Importance of Supportive Relationships," 230–31.

⁴⁶⁰ Hedin and Månsson, 230.

⁴⁶¹ Hedin and Månsson, 231.

The respondents had spent long intervals feeling as if they had been compelled to comply with whatever circumstances emerged in their lives. They had been constrained to say “yes” to degradations that were perpetrated upon them. They were often obliged to use mind-altering substances, to do stripteases, to appear in films documenting their exploitation and to be moved from city to city. They may have lived in isolation from other populations, exposed to few social ties other than those within their own networks. Boundaries that are taken for granted by other populations had been habitually violated in their lives—often over prolonged periods extending into years. After rehabilitation and reintegration, they may continue to struggle with the uncertainty of where proper lines of behavior need to be drawn. In their new communities, it may be necessary to change not only former coping strategies, but to work on relationships and networks at the psychological, spiritual and interpersonal levels.⁴⁶² The respondents must learn not only how to improve existing relationships, but also which relationships may need to be radically modified or eliminated altogether. As Hedin and Manson have observed, several components need to be addressed: “Working through traumatic experiences experienced in childhood, adolescence or in prostitution, changing destructive relationships in her primary social network, for example, with parents and siblings. Other components of this work include improving self-esteem, developing new interests, constructing a new identity, and improving her ability to set limits.”⁴⁶³

The need to erect and honor boundaries was one of the prominent emphases featured in the rehabilitative phases of the four Programs represented here. Graduates were encouraged to remain at safe distances from situations that would cause hardships in reintegration. Likewise, they were taught how to establish boundaries with new people in

⁴⁶² Hedin and Månsson, 231.

⁴⁶³ Hedin and Månsson, 231.

their lives. Some of them considered these lessons to prominently factor into their successes at flourishing. Kelsey became enthusiastic in describing the progress she feels she has made in this area:

Boundaries! I'm good at those! Like, my mom was in prison, and everybody called me asking me to help with money to get her out and I said *no, no*. I'm not going to rescue her. This was her choice-she's fifty-some years old and she needs to figure it out. It has nothing to do with me.

LaDonna also used her relationship with her mother to illustrate this theme. She had explained earlier that her mother had historically been a poor role model to her and had consistently looked the other way when she observed her adolescent daughter falling under the influences of toxic people. In the early stages of her reintegration journey, LaDonna made poor choices and compromises resulting in relapse and pregnancy. She discussed what she had learned about establishing boundaries with family members who have contributed to her exploitation in the past. They co-opted money from her and looked the other way when men commodified her because this was financially advantageous to them. When she tried to share her excitement with her mother regarding her current successes, for example, she discovered that her mother still acts inappropriately, and LaDonna has to steel herself to avoid manipulation. As she said in two separate points in the interview:

Like my mom called the other day and I told her I got a raise and she said like "How much did you get?" And I said, like (*squeaking humorously*) "You don't need to know that!" And I'll say like, "Mom I got a promotion," and she'll say, "*Like, how much did they give you?*" Not like she's happy for me. So, I've had to set those boundaries.

Theresa's narrative focused upon historic friendships, but her conclusions are similar to those of LaDonna. She perceives that some of her friends were too inquisitive, or perhaps interested in her in a way that made her uncomfortable. She stated that

enforcing strict boundaries sometimes meant that she had to terminate friendships with people whom she'd been close to. "So that was difficult for *me* because I really put myself out there, and it was really reciprocated because we were in the same life season even though these were, like, really fun girls," she lamented. But along the way, she learned that "...in building relationships... there's a time and a place, and you don't have to let everybody in, and they don't have to know your story. And that's not lying, that's wisdom and discernment."

6-1 d. Giving Back⁴⁶⁴

One feature of the lives of women who flourished in community was the ability to transcend the continual need to be "cared for," "rehabilitated," or "ministered to." Many of them moved into positions of caregivers, whether professionally or casually. This phenomenon harmonizes with the 12th Step of Recovery programs like AA, which states that alcoholics should "...reach out to other alcoholics."⁴⁶⁵ In the section on Community Supports, Patti spoke of numerous areas in which she is currently serving her church congregation. Sadie's engagement appeared to be similar, including "Bible study at the church on Wednesdays... (A charity) Walk--I do mission trips with the church... So, I serve a lot."

Theresa provided numerous examples of how she gives back to her community, some of which have already been noted. Her availability to other women in need is demonstrated here:

⁴⁶⁴ Louise, Holly and Andrea are all professionally employed in helping other CSE women to recover in the Programs they had graduated from themselves. Along those lines, they provided numerous illustrations of women they had assisted in rehabilitation and reintegration. Most of those illustrations had been provided in prior interviews, though, when I had spoken to them as program administrators, and those narratives therefore don't appear in this section.

⁴⁶⁵ A direct parallel cannot be drawn between alcoholics and CSE survivors. CSE is clearly not an addiction and is frequently accomplished without the free agency and consent of the exploited individual. Recovery principles are important for other reasons, however, as previously noted in Appendix 3-4. Anonymous, *Alcoholics Anonymous*, 60.

So, I do throw a lot of parties. I think I'm supposed to be a kingdom party planner. (*We all laugh*). So, just like everywhere I go I meet people and... Stay connected. And they may not be, like best friends. But we stay connected forever.

LaDonna reported on her work with teenage girls and her public speaking supporting the rehabilitation of CSE women. She said she serves in "every service at my church." She overcame her fears of public speaking, and now speaks at homeless shelters and galas. At another interval in our interview, she noted how her main passion for serving has focused upon ministering to teenage girls by teaching them biblical principles and training them to avoid CSE networks and other forms of exploitation. She reported hosting 20-25 girls at her first retreat, providing meals, t-shirts and Bibles for them at no cost. "That makes me, like, want to keep going," she enthused. "Parents are calling me all the time, like, *thank you for talking to our kids, thank you for doing what you do.*"

In *Walking with the Poor*, Bryant Myers speaks from his executive experience with World Vision about the phasing out of international development programs after they have accomplished their specified purposes. Funding for the program will always end at some point he notes, and after that "...community-based organizations emerge to design and run program elements like the building and staffing of schools, building a water supply, and the like."⁴⁶⁶ The final phase of a program transitions into a strategic partnership. When World Vision asked a community in Tanzania what components they would like to see incorporated in this partnership, they found that a number of suggestions from the community had merit. They discussed the need for new ideas and technologies that were difficult to discover on their own because of their region's geographic isolation. They asked the organization to participate in celebrating their

⁴⁶⁶ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 268.

successes with them and to help them to grieve and to enable their failures to be instructive.⁴⁶⁷ Finally, “The community members offered their community as a place where new World Vision programs might come to visit and learn from their experience. They could teach others what they had learned.”⁴⁶⁸ This process of propagation or sharing, Myers notes, is a “...sign of interdependence and giving back.”⁴⁶⁹ Likewise, when healing begins to take effect, whether with a group of alcoholics or with an impoverished community in need of developmental assistance, the healthiest response is to give back and enable others to benefit from their experiences. It is particularly appropriate that respondents like Patti, Sadie, Theresa and LaDonna spoke of engaging in service to their communities within the context of local churches. Churches at their best are organizations endeavoring to advance God’s mission, and community is the primary bearer of mission.⁴⁷⁰ The notion that a Christian community is completely separate from the world, or from the whole of human community is a false and untenable one, theologian David Bosch observes.⁴⁷¹ They are always present and active in worldly arenas, as permanent overlap must necessarily endure between the church and a contemporary, earth-bound world. This doesn’t mean congregational members need to serve in roles analogous to those of lay pastors or ministry professionals. What is most vital for their advancement is that they take the initiative by serving their communities.⁴⁷² If they have become individuals transformed by Christian faith, this should be demonstrated by word, deed and sign, bearing witness to the truths they have learned regarding God and humankind.⁴⁷³

⁴⁶⁷ Myers, 269.

⁴⁶⁸ Myers, 269.

⁴⁶⁹ Myers, 269.

⁴⁷⁰ Wright, *Mission of God*, 66–67; Bosch, *Transforming Mission*, 472.

⁴⁷¹ Bosch, *Transforming Mission*, 388.

⁴⁷² Bosch, 473.

⁴⁷³ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 77.

6-1 e. Active Dreams and Aspirations

Many of the respondents reported on affirmative future plans and what they were doing to achieve those ambitions. One of the questions in the face-to-face interviews addressed this indirectly (#16: *What do you think the future holds for you?*), but they discussed their dreams at other intervals in the process as well. Melody was still processing this concept on the day we spoke with her, and responded in a vague but spiritually ambitious manner, stating "...I'm going to school so I can eventually have a better paying job. I'm still undecided about what I want to *be*, because I'm waiting for God to reveal that to me."

Scarlett is working towards a dream to embark upon a medical career. However, she also revealed that her current full-time job could become lucrative, and she needs no more education to retain it. I asked her if she envisioned doing so well with the current employer that she might consider abandoning her ambition to continue in her current position. She replied,

I want to finish school just because I want to. Even if I don't use it. I have to get it... Because I feel like I need to complete it. Because I set my mind to it and I feel like I have to. You know? I don't know how long it will be before my felonies come off my record or before they pardoned it.⁴⁷⁴ But I told (my employer) when that time comes and I'm able to go to this program, I'm going to put in my notice.

Patti also spoke of her ongoing aspirations to publish her autobiography and to start a non-profit to assist marginalized women in her county. Jamie had a similar ambition in desiring to be a victim's advocate. She speculated that, "I think you need more than a Bachelors? Like right now I just volunteer for someplace, talk to girls... but I want to be my own victim advocate... to change laws for women." Sadie, likewise,

⁴⁷⁴ Two of the respondents who lived in this state told me that there had been a lot of publicity about their governor offering pardons to all individuals who had accrued charges related to having been trafficked.

described a personal vision she had to assist women experiencing domestic violence, rape and CSE: “Like a 24-hour shelter or something like that,” she reported. “Somewhere where people can get help immediately... We need to get it to them, because they’ll get discouraged and change their mind really quickly.”

Mona reported on how she is considering an IT networking career: “I like analytics and problem-solving. So, in a perfect life I would wake up and go to my job that I pretty much would enjoy doing and with my skill set,” she remarked. Theresa stated. “I’m a very ambitious person, and I have new dreams every couple of days. So as of right now if I just put down things and prayed for today, I would be able to move forward and get my book published.” Melody reported that she simply wants “...to be the best version of myself. And to just do God’s will. Whatever he has for me.” Louise also retained aspirations beyond what she is currently achieving at the Christian organization for whom she works, stating that “I’m gonna continue to get more confident in who I am and what I have to offer. And you know, what God has for me.”

It should be noted here that aspirations *do not* equal achievements. A person’s intentions or ambitious dreams are not always accomplished. However, a correlation could be established in this group of respondents between those who spoke affirmatively about the futures and those who currently are flourishing spiritually. Yvette expressed a vague ambition to one day own a food truck rather than working for somebody else, but she had not yet taken any steps to bring that to pass, even though she was well into middle age. Of those whose flourishing scores ranked in the “poor” category, though, she was the only one to express any concrete ideas at all about her future.⁴⁷⁵

⁴⁷⁵ In the “low” flourishing category, Mona expressed an ambition to work in the IT industry, although she was not pursuing the needed educational requirements at the time of her interview. With a 58.75% composite flourishing score, though, she was close to moving into the “medium” flourishing range, and her professionalism and optimistic remarks towards the end of the interview seemed to indicate that her life is moving in an affirmative direction.

Based on their interviews with CSE survivors, Mansson and Hedin state that people who have experienced surplus frustration and disappointment do not dare to dream or to make concrete plans because of the risk of additional failures. However “...the ability to hold on to one’s dreams can turn out to be crucial for change and growth.”⁴⁷⁶ The researchers propose that dreaming and imagining brighter futures are critical in helping them to escape their circumstances. Fantasies have been reported by participants as devices to psychologically disassociate themselves from routine degradation and abuse.⁴⁷⁷ Moreover, dreams and ambitions are considered to be important after the breakaway from CSE networks.⁴⁷⁸ A natural comparison could be made between the survivors of exploitation and those who have been captured or locked up in environments such as prisons or concentration camps. The ability to imagine another life and to consider how this life can become a reality can be a crucial survival strategy.⁴⁷⁹

Ambitions are not realities, but hope can be recognized as an essential motivating force in people, enabling them to press towards higher plateaus. Hedin and Mannson credit the psychology researcher Shelley Taylor’s research on “Positive Illusions” in possibly providing a window into the souls of CSE women trying to envision better futures for themselves.⁴⁸⁰ Taylor’s argument is that these kind of dreams or positive illusions are not simply to be perceived as denial or repression but rather as interpretations of reality “in the best possible light.”⁴⁸¹ Taylor explains this as a form of creative self-deception, or a somewhat exaggerated belief in one’s own possibility to

⁴⁷⁶ Månsson and Hedin, “Matthew Effect,” 74.

⁴⁷⁷ Månsson and Hedin, 74.

⁴⁷⁸ Månsson and Hedin, 74.

⁴⁷⁹ Månsson and Hedin, 74.

⁴⁸⁰ Shelley Taylor, *Positive Illusions: Creative Self-Deception and the Healthy Mind* (New York: Basic Books, 1989).

⁴⁸¹ Taylor, 126.

achieve positive rather than negative results.⁴⁸² It would be remiss to underestimate the power of the imagination and hope for better futures as rudimentary steps in the establishment of foundations for stable reintegrated lives.

6-1 f. Vocational Progress

Among the respondents, those who ranked low on the flourishing indices also had difficulty with employment. The high-flourishing respondents either enjoyed meaningful careers or employment that paid the bills and personally satisfied them, or they were going to college to launch their careers, or both. Some had been established in their careers for as long as seven years. But most reported they had begun with internships. Although the respondents represented four different Programs in four states, each Program offered some kind of opportunity resulting in vocational internships at Program's end which helped respondents to develop skills and workplace decorum.

6-1 f-i. Paid Internships

Mona expressed how the experience was not entirely positive for her, because the internship she was offered at a local county government's office in a large city apparently was not properly budgeted for. But "...they kept extending my internship... and then at the last minute a position opened up the new department, and I interviewed for that and I got on permanent, she noted. "So, all in all it came full circle and it worked out. But during that period-after the three-month apprenticeship that they give you? It was kind of fluid." Jamie stated that to continue in the internship, she had to take classes due to her criminal background, which she found to be "very intimidating." As with Mona, the positive aspects of this experience outweighed the negative. What she describes is not

⁴⁸² Månsson and Hedin, "Matthew Effect," 74-75.

only a paid internship, but also a second-mile opportunity that she successfully embraced while she was struggling to discern her vocational calling and desires.

6-1 f-ii. Fulfilling Jobs

Acquiring either a well-paying job, a fulfilling job, or some combination of these can at least partially compensate for a good deal of anguish. The Programs attended by respondents provided them with internships and enabled them to prepare for real-world marketplace experiences. A few of them led to ongoing employment, either directly or indirectly. No one left their Programs without having acquired some kind of work experience.⁴⁸³

Alanna framed her emerging career path in terms of divine intervention:

So, it was kind of a God thing. I have no... Like educational background for this position. It was just all street knowledge pretty much. So, I came through the Program? I graduated all three phases. Then about eight months later... Rosaline came to me and said, "Would you ever want to do case management?" And I said like, "YEAH!" ... It's been a lot, but it's probably the thing that I'm proudest of. Since leaving The Life. Yeah. (*Pseudonym used*)

She characterized this as her "Dream job" and laughingly added, "And I get to do it every day!" This accomplishment was the thing that she was most proud of, outside of her family, she noted. It was apparent she does not consider this to be merely a "starter" job, or a compromise.

Scarlett, on the other hand, has both a well-paying "Job for now" to support her family as well as a vocational goal to be a radiologist, for which she is currently taking classes. While the current job reportedly pays well, treats her respectfully and could be viewed by some as a career, she is pursuing something for which she has a passion.

⁴⁸³ My pool of respondents did not include anyone who was unable to work due to a disability. Patti was intellectually disabled to an unknown degree due to her TBI and possibly possessed some learning disabilities, but even she completed several internships.

Generally speaking, the women who had acquired steady work or were negotiating careers expressed great appreciation for where they had landed. The women who had enrolled in college were also all employed and they expressed gratitude both for the “job for now” and for the educational opportunities before them. Some didn’t express great vocational ambitions but were working in factories for what appeared to be living wages. LaDonna somehow slipped through the cracks and failed to obtain her GED before completing the Program. Nevertheless, she expressed enthusiasm for her employment with a large corporation. The job has enabled her to own a house and a car, she added. Summer was engaged in on-line classes to complete college, but said she had no problem finding work as a manager at a large chain, despite a long prison record which accelerated after her Program completion. She expressed confidence that if she lost her current job, she could pick up another one just as easily.

Several of the respondents had moved into careers which had helped stabilize their lives. Holly expresses great satisfaction with her job, providing a war story of how she had begun her current position working 96 hours a week for \$28,000 a year.⁴⁸⁴ But now “I make decent money; I *think* I make decent money, I don’t know. And it’s taken me ten years to make what I would call decent money,” she adds.

The job offer Louise received from the organization hosting her rehabilitation came as a surprise to her, as she had relapsed immediately at the Program’s completion, and believed that would disqualify her. But she continued to stay in touch with the personnel there and brought her life into alignment with what they had taught her. Her persistence resulted in a full-time job offer which has led to promotions and the development of new skills as she describes here:

⁴⁸⁴ She also received sleeping quarters and meals in addition to the salary.

It's helped keeping me motivated: just because my position has changed here (her administrative position) because I'm doing a lot more donor development and fundraising. And I'm kind of having more responsibility than I normally would? That's just been really encouraging for me-- knowing that I'm doing something important, and then entrusted to do that, and to have that in my hands.

6-1 f -iii. Domestic Flexibility

Kelsey reported that she was committed to staying at home with her toddler, but she had found employment that facilitated her need. She was engaged to a man on a career track with a large retailer. Shannon also has a child at home, and one on the way. She felt as if her husband's salary was *not* adequate, but she also confessed struggling with materialistic impulses. Though she was momentarily dissatisfied, she was working toward obtaining her realtor's license which would place her on a career path as soon as she felt she was able to spend fewer hours in her child-rearing responsibilities.

6-1g. Spiritual Engagement

Jamie was quoted earlier discussing her transformed identity. A person's claim of having been transformed is greatly diminished without corresponding actions demonstrating practical aspects of faith. Jamie spoke a good deal about evil influences that had enveloped her when she was involved in CSE networks. Her optimism today draws a sharp contrast between her past and present realities. She stated introspectively that she considers the world to be unfair but God has not been malicious; The evil results from free will. "But he takes our mistakes and the bad and will make good. I've taken the steps to become the best me and I won't give up!"

As she noted in her questionnaire,

...every day I wake up I thank my God for waking me up and ask him to protect me with his hands. To give me the strength to apply all the skills and tools that my program has taught me. That everyday is not going to be good but

I'm sober and I know longer am a victim but yet a
overcomer and a survivor! (*sic*)

It appears from what she has written that the evil projected upon her had been a major stumbling block initially inhibiting her spiritual journey, which is a commonly expressed narrative. Psychologist Carrie Doehring, who teaches at the Iliff School of Theology, assessed adults who had been traumatized as children for her book, *Internal Desecration*.⁴⁸⁵ She discovered that the views of God of most of the previously traumatized she interviewed were not much different from the general population if their traumas had been assessed as mild or moderate. If the respondents were considered to be “highly traumatized,” however, their perceptions of God as being either “absent” or “wrathful” began to rise.⁴⁸⁶ When the traumas they had experienced were considered “severe,” though, their images of God become increasingly negative.⁴⁸⁷ When severe traumatization occurs, many can no longer conceptualize a benevolent God. Critical loss of faith ensues, and the goodness of God becomes difficult to fathom.⁴⁸⁸ Complicated wickedness clouds the Imago Dei that might have otherwise been revealed to them, severely crippling spiritual reconciliation.⁴⁸⁹ While the degree of trauma experienced by Jamie cannot be determined from her interview, her early anger towards God seems reasonable based upon what she has revealed of her life. It makes her journey towards transforming faith appear to be momentous.

Louise was introverted and frequently seemed at a loss for words. Her reservedness didn't translate into ambivalence about her faith, though, as she spoke introspectively about her newly transformed lifestyle: “I love the way that God speaks to

⁴⁸⁵ Doehring, *Internal Desecration*.

⁴⁸⁶ Doehring, 88.

⁴⁸⁷ Doehring, 88–89.

⁴⁸⁸ Doehring, 89.

⁴⁸⁹ Okesson, *Public Missiology*, 20–21.

me ... through visuals and... oftentimes through nature and stuff like that,” she noted. Though she admits to a tendency to overanalyze things, she drew attention to the reality that she sometimes experiences “...dry seasons... other times I don’t. Sometimes I feel like a bonfire.” Sadie was straightforward about the impact faith had made in her life. She simply reported. “Today I put God first in my life. He has done for me many of things that I could not have done myself which is leave that life to start a new one with him being the head of it.”

Scarlett was also resolute about how her faith in God has impacted her.

Regarding the greatest assets in her life she wanted the interviewer to know “...That I am on the right path; I’m just *happy*. I’m grateful that he’s so real in my life.” Theresa also spoke of practical and relational aspects of her faith, beginning with her sexuality and ethical standards, noting that her greatest accomplishment may be “...having had a pure dating relationship with a man who had his own values and walk with God and in no way ever tried to compromise mine.”

LaDonna grinned throughout most of her interview. Without prompting, she gave numerous examples of the significance of her faith to her successful re-integration journey. Among these exchanges was this one:

I remember this one guy asked me out. And my oldest daughter, she was like... I mean he was *really* cute. (*Laughs*). He ate healthy, like me, he worked out like me. There was only one thing: He didn’t love God. So, I broke up-- I said we can’t go out anymore. And my daughter said to me, she said *Mom you must really love God*. Because she thought he was really attractive so she thought he was a guy that my mom could date.... Don’t get me wrong, I wanted to date him too. Then for your daughter to say *you must really love God*, and she was so serious...

Because the respondents had come from environments where they were habitually exposed to sexual impurity, to infidelity in relationships, sometimes to rape and other

sexual violence it appears that sexual conduct inhabited their thoughts and conversations. Knowing that defective sexuality had devastated their lives, they recognized how casual attitudes and activities regarding sex were not consistent with the spirituality they had embraced. Their responses and illustrations therefore reflected new ways of thinking regarding sexual concerns. This can be observed in Scarlett's narrative comparing her developing relationship with God to a dating relationship. LaDonna stated that her daughter could discern she was truly committed to a new way of living when mother was able to dismiss a man who was "hot" but not spiritual. Theresa and Scarlett described how meaningful it was for them to engage in dating relationships that were not based upon sex. To them, a truly spiritual life could perhaps be best demonstrated by the adoption of new sexual mores. These were clear indicators of the recognition that not only had their belief systems changed, but their lifestyles had as well.

6-1 h. Agencies Assisted

Many organizations assisted in the re-integration of the respondents, from those that are faith-based to those made possible by state, local and federal government. None of the respondents cited this assistance as being the *most* significant factor in their abilities to flourish, but all of them seemed to have received aid from two or more sources at least in the initial stages of their journeys. It was established that help is available particularly to those who have surrogates able to direct them to the proper resources. Hedin and Mansson noted the staff at the charitable agency with whom their subjects cooperated were particularly significant resources for the women. "Even contacts with the social workers were initiated on the street by giving out a business card, these were a reminder to the women that someone was willing to help them," they note. "The women at first withdrew but some returned later during a crisis. In many instances

this outreach person became a key support person during the breakaway, along with family members.”⁴⁹⁰

6-1 h-i. Pregnancy/Infant Resources

For those who became pregnant after their re-integration began, various organizations stepped forward to fill the needs. Kelsey was impressed with a program she had been using since she was seven weeks’ pregnant.

... It’s free actually (*laughs*), they pay *you* actually. When you come to meetings and get free gift cards and free diapers and wipes... It is through the health department actually. And, they come to your house, they teach you lessons and play with your kid, teach you how to make toys, teach you to take care of a baby. Like, they help you a *lot*.

6-1 h-ii. Housing Assistance

Some respondents were able to obtain HUD homes. Others received assistance from their Programs, or from their city governments, for the first year’s rent, which the respondents characterized as a generous response. Scarlett said she took advantage of a Salvation Army program, which helped to “...pay for your first month’s rent, your down payment and you get your utilities cut on. If you need a mattress, they’ll buy your mattresses or washer, dryer, or fridge and stove. So, they help you get started.”

Louise had found assistance with housing from a woman’s shelter before it was discontinued. She was approved to receive either HUD housing or Section Eight. Mona noted how her Program provided her with a housing grant. “It’s \$200 for six months and then \$100 for six months. Just to get us used to paying rent... And hopefully as we get more experiences at the job and we get more practice paying our bills and things like that.”

⁴⁹⁰ Hedin and Månsson, “Importance of Supportive Relationships,” 231.

Sadie found that Catholic Charities was most helpful to her. “They help me with my security deposit, and they help me pay rent for the first two months so that way I was able to kind of able to save up and have a backup just in case something happens,” she noted. “If I needed them, I can call them and they would give me gift cards to get food.” Alanna found both housing and medical resources easy to navigate, offering that “They set me up with Section Eight, and I found the house. Then I had all the other resources, DSHS ...Medical care and everything.”

6-1 h-iii. Employment Assistance

Although the Programs were competent at finding initial work internships as noted Section 6a, other employment resources were also available to the respondents. Theresa notes how the state Vocational Rehabilitation office was very responsive to her. Mona’s narrative regarding her internship in the county government was recounted earlier. Jamie had an experience somewhat similar to Mona’s, but she was more positive in her assessment:

They offered like a paid internship program just to get your feet wet. For some people, if you’ve never had experience or if you’ve had bad experience or whatever. So that was helpful.

6-1 h-iv. Counseling Assistance

In Section 2 of this chapter, the respondents addressed their gratitude for being able to remain in counseling. Some of this was funded through the Programs. Others made services available to them at low-cost or no-cost. Shannon notes how it was beneficial for her to receive

...Christian-based counseling? Where they will offer counseling in your budget? So, I found some of that, and it help me... To get counseling. Also, they do counseling with Medicaid. If you have Medicaid, you can get counseling... Through (Redacted) Community Health. So... The resources are amazing out there. Those all help me to get where I am.

6-1 h-v. Food and Medical

Medical needs were reportedly met with the help of Medicaid, the ACA and private doctors who volunteered time and resources. Scarlett recounted how she was cured of Hepatitis C through a series of expensive treatments, but the cost was covered for her. Likewise, her drug abuse had rotted most of her teeth, but I observed at the interview how they looked straight and natural which she attributed to charitable healthcare. Shannon added that

I think the Medicaid was done when I was in the program. So, I just renew it. The food stamps-- they have to evaluate you. They are all tied in. So, I guess if I'm keeping my food stamps current then everything else is current. So, it's not hard, as long as you stay on top of it.

Theresa had expressed great satisfaction with vocational services offered to her but lamented that “Food stamps is the hardest thing that we’ve ever had to apply for.” She elaborated: “And we really needed to apply for food stamps, but they wanted my landlord, my brand-new landlord to sign. And I didn’t want him to be scared that we wouldn’t be able to pay rent.” Respondents were required to count the cost in some instances and decide if the service being offered was worth the perceived aggravation.

To summarize, the charitable and governmental organizations assisting the respondents in reintegration concerns received high praise from respondents overall. Some reported on good bonding experiences with staffers at the agencies, and only rarely was a complaint registered. Sociological researcher Jannit Rabinovitch encourages service providers to ascertain that services are provided in culturally relevant environments to minimize harm among the clientele.⁴⁹¹ While the Programs were quick

⁴⁹¹ Jannit Rabinovitch, “PEERS: The Prostitutes’ Empowerment, Education and Resource Society,” in *Prostitution, Trafficking, and Traumatic Stress*, ed. Melissa Farley, 1st Edition (Binghamton, NY: Routledge, 2004), 248–49. Rabinovitch speaks from a Canadian perspective, where she has witnessed harm done by social service organizations who were not culturally aware of many of the First Nations’ practices and experiences, and yet they were tasked with providing resources for them.

to respond to mental health counselors who were culturally insensitive, they exercise far less control over other service providers.⁴⁹² Social service providers must offer ongoing training to employees to equip them for problems which may be unique to a CSE population.

6-1 i. Community Supports

Hedin and Mansson note how in their sampling, women who were actively involved in CSE networks developed strong ties to the to that particular subculture. After they had become emancipated, though most of them severed ties with all contacts in those social environments. Even so, some subjects maintained contact with women friends from the former social group. “These relationships provided a kind of security, in that someone else understood how things were. These contacts tended to diminish with time and to finally come to an end,” they write.⁴⁹³ The women required authentic community, but also a sense that the people with whom they are doing life were willing to understand them and meet them at the intersections of their needs.

The interviews Dr. Whitaker and I conducted were open-ended, and respondents were permitted to pursue tangents or discuss their thoughts in any manner they were comfortable with. Two of the questions proposed in face-to-face interviews regarding community supports resulted in revelations of affirmative enthusiastic reception for the medium-to-high flourishers who had become well-established in their new communities.⁴⁹⁴ Other insights emerged at various intervals. The support networks

⁴⁹² Administrators explained to me that their counselors were often contracted to provide therapy for several women on an ongoing basis. It was therefore in their interests to learn about the culture and circumstances of this demographic. Not only would it make them more effective with them., but it could lead to a steady clientele base, possibly extending several years into the future.

⁴⁹³ Hedin and Månsson, “Importance of Supportive Relationships,” 229.

⁴⁹⁴ From the questionnaire: #4: *Tell me a little about your community supports—for example, where are the supportive people in your life from? What places do you go to for support, and how often do you find yourself going to these supportive places?* And: #9: *Who are you spending the most time with? What criteria do you use to distinguish good influences from negative ones?*

referenced by participants fell into four general categories as described in the remainder of this section.

6-1 i-i. Program People

These subjects stated that after completing their rehabilitative programs they stayed in touch with the support network they had established while in the Program. They continued communicating with mentors whom they had not known in the program or they were assigned new mentors. Other staffers with whom they had worked continued to be available to them. Both paid and volunteer staff members were available for counsel and social activities. They helped the graduates find housing, automobiles and childcare. They remained in touch with them by phone and social media.

Though she had completed her Program more than four years prior, Louise was interacting nearly every day with people who were therapeutically helpful to her at work, stating that she meets with a mentor regularly. Tia also stated that she meets with an “amazing mentor” and continues to maintain contact with people from The Program even though she is now living on a college campus further off from the immediate vicinity of where she spent her year of rehabilitation. Sadie noted how a Program administrator she had bonded with has her over her house frequently for fun activities and family events. Only one of the respondents made negative comments about the degree of caring and competency she thought the Program mentors possessed, so the complaint can be considered an anomaly.

In the consent forms and face-to-face conversations I made it clear that they were assisting with an academic research project, and that every effort would be made to keep their remarks confidential. We would not share the remarks with Program administrators per se, and the Program people did not sit in on the interviews even though seven of the seventeen face-to-face interviews were conducted in Program facilities. Even so, several

respondents ebulliated about the support they had received as the following narratives reveal. Scarlett noted how The Program people continually looked out for her well-being:

I feel like they knew... They know everything they needed to know about me. They made efforts to find out. Even when I wasn't willing... You know, sometimes you meet with somebody and you really connect with somebody, and you meet somebody and you really *don't?* (*I established a good rapport with them very quickly*) ... Because I trusted them. And they really cared. It was genuine.⁴⁹⁵

Jamie related that she had endured many hardships, but her ongoing contact with women she met through the Program are still her greatest champions.

6-1 i-ii. Church People

One dimension of spiritual sustainability has to do with the contribution of faith-based organizations in the community. As Bryant Myers notes, “The church is not so much the Christians gathered, although it is this too, as it is the place where Christians learn and are challenged to live the whole gospel in the fullness of the life of the larger community.”⁴⁹⁶ High- and medium flourishing respondents with whom I conversed became active in local churches. They had discovered some of these churches while enrolled in the Programs, or some of them found new congregations particularly if they had moved away from the immediate area. The degrees of involvement varied, but they described membership in small groups, participated in serving capacities and stepped out into new areas. Melody, who presents as being shy and introverted, explained that her support system consisted of “church people,” whom she likened to “the family I never had.” But initially she was suspicious of them, and resistant to their overtures, “Because

⁴⁹⁵ Scarlett, Personal Interview, September 23, 2019.

⁴⁹⁶ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 198.

when you come here, you're not used to like people *loving* on you," she noted. "You're just like, 'What do you want from me?'"

Melody's early antipathy for people "loving on" her seems amusing on the surface. Having people desiring to embrace them, express affection or ask them about their heartfelt concerns may be intimidating, and the backgrounds of the reintegrating women has not prepared them to accept such behaviors without suspecting ulterior motives. Yet it underscores the observation made in a sociological study that "Survivors of CSE may be overwhelmed with terror, feelings of contamination and differentness, and self-loathing even after leaving the trade. Such feelings, including an erosion of the capacity for trust, may undercut abilities to establish new relationships or experience intimacy."⁴⁹⁷ Scarlett also voiced the theme of early suspicion towards the new people in her supportive community but eventually realized that the support of a church was essential for her "They loved me when I didn't love myself and I didn't want to hear them or be around them..." she remarked.

Tia reported that her church has "... been helping me out too and moving me into my own apartment at the dorms...they're hooking me up with furniture, too." LaDonna revealed that when she got pregnant by a man to whom she wasn't married early in her reintegration journey, she considered securing an abortion. She assumed that the people from her church would be disappointed with her to the degree that they would withdraw from her. She found the opposite to be true: "...Ever since she's been born, I've never had to buy her anything. Somebody at my church will say, "Hey LaDonna, I've got some shoes for you. Got some clothes for you..."

⁴⁹⁷ Wilson and Butler, "Running a Gauntlet," 501.

During our face-to-face encounter, Patti rambled pervasively and had difficulty answering questions coherently, possibly due to her TBI. But she was adamant about the supportive nature of the Christian community in her life, noting “My support comes from the church that I attended...That’s mainly my support system.” She then described at length all the ministries she is currently involved with, adding, “So (a woman from church) been a huge blessing in my life and she has supported me sometimes financially and sometimes just as a friend.”

Theresa discovered that for her, the support of a larger church is helpful if participants become proactive. She noted in the interview that although many have complained to her about attending a larger church, “... I say, like you get plugged in! Well, I started serving!” Like Patti, she listed numerous teams she had served in, adding that “...In order to settle into a community, I need community.” She also took initiative beyond simply participating in existing structures, inviting church members to read through a spiritual book with her, or to plan a holiday gathering with her.

Scarlett described a budding relationship with a healthy man whom she had met at church. Their dating consisted of family times with both Scarlett and her children. She monitored his character and behavior with her family to assess his suitability for an ongoing relationship consistent with her recent conversion to Christianity. Both Shannon and Theresa had married men whom they had met through church involvement or in an academic Christian institution. Holly also spoke admiringly of the Christian ethics she had observed in her fiancé, even though her fears had impeded her from following through with wedding vows.

6-1 i-iii. Family Supports

It was not possible for many of the women to reestablish healthy relationships with their parents. Many of them, however, reported that their mothers were their biggest

supporters (Holly, Alanna and Louise). Some had supportive uncles or siblings. Tia reported that although her father had been distant and combative with her when she was being raised, he has started to reestablish support. He and his new wife had just recently come to visit her from great distance away when I spoke to her.

Alanna expressed the reciprocal support they experienced from having children to nurture in the home: “I would say probably the most important accomplishment that I am most proud of since leaving the program are my kids,” she remarked. “Just the fact that I’m present and supporting them and providing a life for them-- that brings me joy, every day.” Several others noted that they felt their children were supportive, or that the responsibilities of having children kept them grounded. Often, these sentiments were tempered with confessions that the responsibilities of raising children was formidable after the harrowing experiences of their previous lifestyles.

6-1 i-iv. Healthy Friends

Those who reported supportive friendships noted that regardless of whether their friends had similar backgrounds, they recognized the need for them to be sober if they were going to be supportive. Many of the respondents whom I interviewed stated that their best friend was somebody else who had graduated from The Program (Melody and Scarlett, Holly and Louise, Mona and Jamie). Theresa not only continued to foster relationships with numerous women from the program, but she introduced me to several of them and also maintains a Facebook group made up of formerly exploited women. “I kind of collect friends...” she quipped. Collectively the respondents described how they had learned to employ discerning skills to ascertain that new friends were healthy ones. It was clear from their narratives that allowing new friends into their lives occurred on a trial-and-error basis. They proceeded with caution, allowing outsiders into their circles if they appeared to be non-threatening over the period of several months.

LaDonna described a large support system primarily consisting of newer people whom she had met since leaving the program. Having good friends has helped her reach a spiritual pinnacle, she noted, adding: “I think in Proverbs it says, *bad company corrupts good character*. So, imagine if you have good company, it really affects you...” Alanna reported that individual Christian friends, rather than a formal church network, had been most helpful to her. “It’s funny,” she mused, “... they all have like open arms to open up to a survivor. Like they all want to do that.”⁴⁹⁸

Sadie recounted the numerous Christian friends and supporters she had accumulated as being “...very positive. They call me on myself from doing anything inappropriate... they don’t sugarcoat it.” Similarly, LaDonna reported on a vibrant, caring community she has fostered among several groups of friends, including her pastor who is “...like my best friend.” She was especially moved by loaning out his personal car to her after she got into an accident. “And you hear about living for God, but when you really need somebody that’s when you really *know* and he loaned me his car.” she remarked. The inflections in LaDonna’s voice and the earnestness in her narrative persuasively conveyed the depths of her astonishment and gratitude. It was apparent that in her world, one might maintain all kinds of friends for various purposes. But a friend who would loan you his car for an extended period is truly a unique variety of friend.

Theresa was among the women who spoke effusively throughout their questionnaires and interviews concerning the depth and effectiveness of support they experienced from their Program communities. She also expressed the need to establish community with spiritual people *outside* of the community she had within her Program, citing scholarly research among the factors she has considered: “Like, I don’t how much

⁴⁹⁸ Even though she doesn’t necessarily feel supported in raising bi-racial children, she added.

you know about statistics, but the odds are, like, against us when it comes to us actually surviving. Because most people who leave the sex industry either OD, commit suicide or die or get murdered.” Perhaps most helpful to her was to create a “community outside the Program.” She eventually joined a fellowship where for the first time, “I was just a woman studying the Bible among other women... I wasn’t this ‘industry survivor’ there. I was like, a woman studying the word of God.”

The end of reintegrating into community is not, after all, perpetuating a lifestyle that is distinct or at odds with others in the community. This is not to say that individuality will not be welcomed, but the respondents profess here that engagement in the collective-- not the expression of their individualism—is responsible for their flourishing. Ongoing heterogeneity is not the emphasis respondents consider to be responsible for their successful reintegration. Formerly CSE women constitute a particular demographic characterized by common features, but the goal is that they become absorbed in “the congregation” —in other words, so embedded in the community that they no longer are identified by their backgrounds. An indication of healing is that they are not viewed as *projects*, but rather as mainstream members of the collective. Agents of redemptive community will encourage healthy habits among their members as components of overall programs of discipleship.⁴⁹⁹ This includes encouragement for ongoing counseling, substance abuse support groups if needed, and numerous diverse resources. One cannot minimize the importance of authentic relationships in helping reintegrating citizens to obtain household resources, help with childcare and child-

⁴⁹⁹ Numerous Alcoholics Anonymous programs populate both metropolitan and rural areas as well as a smaller number of Narcotics Anonymous groups. These are attended both by people of faith and by non-religious people as long as they are willing to acknowledge some kind of Higher Power. Some churches prefer to send their recovering populations to Celebrate Recovery, which is not as laser-focused upon substance abuse as is AA, but is an intentionally Christian program utilizing similar, generalized principles.

rearing, with transportation, household repairs and with other basic needs, as the respondents have indicated here.⁵⁰⁰ It is nearly impossible to assess the affirmative value of knowing the right people when it comes to obtaining employment or a domicile in a safe neighborhood.

6-1j. Transformed Identity

Lewis Rambo is a professor of psychology and religion, and one of the best-known authorities on the science of religious conversion. He affirms that part of the conversion process commonly involves a crisis in the life of the convert.⁵⁰¹ “The crisis may be religious, political, psychological, or cultural in origin,” he writes.⁵⁰² Usually some kind of conflict precedes a decision to commit to spiritual impulses, and this may be emotional or practical in nature. A “psycho-spiritual surrender” occurs during this season that may help the convert feel connected to God.⁵⁰³ The application of faith is then applied, resulting in what is called saving grace.⁵⁰⁴ This gives way to surrender, energy, and a sense of relief.⁵⁰⁵

Rambo cites a study by Chana Ullman in which forty converts to various groups were extensively interviewed and compared with non-converts in a control group. He discovered that the converts had much higher incidences of childhood trauma, problematic relationships and emotional difficulties than did the control group.⁵⁰⁶ This

⁵⁰⁰ Psychologist Margaret Baldwin has worked to obtain better social services offered to women who have been CSE. She writes that one woman she interviewed remarked, “The most terrifying moments in my life were actually not having a gun held to my head. It was the third night of feeding my kids macaroni and ketchup, realizing we are out of macaroni and we’re out of food stamps. And we’re not getting any more for about a month.” In the absence of an adequate social safety net, then, it is all the more important to be surrounded by people who are aware of the individual’s situation, and who may be able to provide resources, or help her to find them. Baldwin, “Living in Longing,” 305.

⁵⁰¹ In his model this appears as stage two out of seven stages. Rambo, *Understanding Religious Conversion*, 16–17.

⁵⁰² Rambo, 44.

⁵⁰³ Rambo, 168–69.

⁵⁰⁴ Rambo, 130–31.

⁵⁰⁵ Rambo, 135.

⁵⁰⁶ Rambo, 52–53.

demonstrated the proclivity of crises to trigger soul-searching or re-imagining of life's presuppositions. During those times of introspection, prospective converts are more malleable than they might otherwise be. They are willing to consider the deficits in their lifestyles and they become sensitive to the prospect of making major changes that will ideally assist them in navigating the murky waters of their futures. One of the changes they may be willing to consider is initiating a mature commitment to Christian faith.⁵⁰⁷

Ten out of the seventeen participating women discussed personal spiritual transformations that had occurred in their lives during the months just prior to or in the early months of their re-integration journeys. These conversations occurred when I asked them about their identities and at other intervals throughout the interviews.

Theresa penned an abbreviated story of her transformation in the body of her questionnaire:

I came to (The Program) in 2011 and was baptized (almost like a vow renewal in marriage) ... after watching the Passion of the Christ. I realized now what it meant to follow Jesus and I had people who vowed to help point me back to him in good times and bad... My transformation, my salvation, has a huge impact on others when I demonstrate the character and kindness of Christ in all my ways.

Melody noted how this had happened since leaving the Program. She spoke to Dr.

Whitaker and me about being a new convert to the Christian faith:

I know Jesus, I have a personal relationship with him. And my life just fully depends on him. I mean *that's* what my

⁵⁰⁷ This is not to imply that people who navigate major crises are subjected to manipulation, which would imply that converts have been essentially tricked into co-opting new lifestyles. CSE women have been manipulated into numerous circumstances which have led to degradation and commodification. To be coerced into another deception would not be healthy or ethical trajectories for them. Rambo dispassionately examines the reality of what transpired in the lives of converts and observes that many, not all, of the converts he has studied passed through some variety of crisis that initiated them into becoming spiritual seekers. The crisis he speaks of need not be monumental. "Much of the literature in the human sciences has emphasized social disintegration, political oppression, or a dramatic event as the instigator of the crisis. But crisis can also be brought on by something less dramatic, such as the response of a person to powerful preaching that convicts him or her of sin, starting a process of self-exploration and a search for salvation," he writes. The same kinds of crises prompting the respondents to leave trafficking networks might also present as crises motivating them to pursue inherent desires for spiritual stimulation. Rambo, 46.

identity is, in Jesus. I mean, who I am in him. I'm alive, I'm not dead. Not just the walking dead. I'm alive. I mean, even though life is hard, I'm *happy*. Like I actually have a sense of joy or just a hope, I have hope... for my future. And for what God has for me. I have hope now.

LaDonna discussed her faith enthusiastically and would not likely have been dissuaded from talking about it had I wished her to. She had spoken earlier about feeling as if she had failed God due to making compromises in her lifestyle which she clearly regretted. Her description included having experienced God's grace, but later the experience had waned. Here she discloses what appears to be the true turning point in her life, whether it is viewed as a transformation, a renewal, a consecration, or some other phenomenon:

...I got myself up, and I got myself together. And that was at the point where I was like, *I'm living for Jesus, no matter what*. I'm going to repent every day; I'm going to live for God. And ever since then I've been living for God...My identity is in Christ.

Louise presented as being indecisive, apologizing for some of her responses. When it came to her identity, however, she was resolute. In her self-interview, she discussed how she identified as a Christian today, and how she had "surrendered my life to Jesus." But this is all a new experience for her, she continued. In the face-to-face interview, she returned to this theme:

...So today, although I'm not where I want to be, I do know who I am and what I stand for, and I know that I'm loved by God that I *am* worthy... although I still have some struggles--who doesn't? I'm struggling to be the person I know I have the potential to be. But I'm so *happy* with who I am today. Because I'm still indecisive but I don't have to answer everything with "I don't know". I can... Be myself... I am worthy. I am loved. I am capable. And... Et cetera! (*She laughs tentatively*).

Scarlett also made a dramatic comparison between her old identity and the new one, noting that the gratitude and appreciativeness she experiences today directly contrasts with the extreme selfishness of her past identity: "I had a 'poor me' kind of attitude that

led to even more *poor me!* And ‘*not fair!*’ She reported that she had been “saved” when she was twelve years old but “I don’t think I was serious.” In the following monologue she again refers to the depths of despair she had experienced prior to her spiritual transformation:

... I felt dead, emotionally. Spiritually... I tried to be (dead) physically.⁵⁰⁸ I just was dead. Like I said earlier I didn’t think I could come back from that, or out of that. I never even thought I would have my wits about me again. I was... Gone.
 And I went through a lot in between there and adulthood. And even after that... But I don’t know if I had a real spiritual breakthrough until I was *broken*. And he (Christ) met me there... So, I felt like I had to be all the way gone... For him to meet me.

Jamie was another respondent who had experienced a recent transformative experience upon which she elaborated in her written questionnaire. She stated that she had just recently made a commitment to “Jesus as my savior;” that she had always been convinced of God’s existence, yet she was angry with him due to the torments experienced in her life. Now she understands that God wants the best for her, she revealed.

Holly also offered her own transformation story, in which she juxtaposes the confidence she feels today with humiliation she experienced during her CSE era. She stated that “...my identity now is in Christ. A new creation... So strong, brave, courageous.” Yet she marvels that when people hear her story, they regularly declare how they never might have imagined her possessing such a history. In an amusing exchange vacillating between laughter and tears, she contorted her voice into a mock, high-pitched nerdy timbre directed at the stereotype of CSE survivors and at some of the patronizing

⁵⁰⁸ This explicitly refers to suicide attempts which she confirmed in both her questionnaire and another part of the interview.

remarks which apparently had been expressed to her. “Because it’s like... ‘Hey I’m Holly and I’m a survivor’!”

Like I want people to know, that I wouldn’t be who I was today... There’s a reason that I hold my head up high. I have a loud voice, and I’m confident and I act like I know what I’m doing all the time. But definitely my identity now is... There would be no way that there would be any of those things now without God, and the saving grace; Yeah. (*She weeps*).

In a sense, Holly’s transformation and her former life were chronologically far enough in the past that she seems to tire of the “victimhood” label some have placed upon her. This is observable in the manner she gently mocks the typical testimonies she hears, which may sound hackneyed to her at this juncture. Yet the depth of feeling she conveys about her deliverance from that lifestyle and what she perceives as transformation by Christ cannot be mistaken. Her gratitude for the transformed lifestyle is palpable, evidenced by the unexpected weeping that consumes her at the conclusion of the narrative.

Although none of the respondents described the mechanics of their spiritual conversion experiences, their responses to the *identity* question were particularly instructive in determining these had not just been rational experiences for the women we heard from in this section, but also *emotional* ones. They expressed love and gratitude for Christ, using emotional phrases and tones. Most were visibly moved, particularly when they pondered the perceived improvements to their self-images. Brenda Colijn, a woman who is both a theologian and literary scholar notes how “Just as human beings were originally created in the image of God, those who have been re-created will find their divine image restored. The new self (*kainos Anthropos* or *neos Anthropos*) is a new

identity that expresses itself in a new way of life that reflects God's character."⁵⁰⁹

Respondents' perceptions of themselves had clearly been transformed and the gulfs they had conceptualized between themselves and God had been bridged. The images of God some had constructed as children had been interrupted in the sense that, had they considered him to be prominent in their lives when they were younger, they collectively described silence or even judgement⁵¹⁰ while they were engaged in CSE networks. In recent years, though—some during their Programs, but even later for others—the *Imago Dei* or Image of God had been restored in these lives. The perception of God as a loving, caring deity was either initiated or revitalized for them. Colijn weighs in on the theological process of how she believes this transpires:

The Holy Spirit works a change in the disposition of the structure of the self. Believers experience a change in their orientation (toward God rather than toward sin) and the beginning of personal transformation. They possess new freedom and new possibilities—what Paul calls a new self. They have both a new identity and a new community. Their inner renewal expresses itself in their social relationships as they begin to love others as they have been loved.⁵¹¹

Consistent with what the respondents claiming spiritual transformation here have demonstrated, those who reported on transformational Christian experiences also spoke of joining churches, and of having surrounded themselves with communities of like-minded individuals. Although their spiritual experiences were personal, they were lived out collectively, in the company of fellow travelers. Colijn writes, “The new creation is also the beginning of the transformation of all the believer's social relationships...It finds fulfillment in the consummation, when all creation will be transformed to reflect the image of its creator.”⁵¹² If they are to follow New Testament principles, it is not possible

⁵⁰⁹ Colijn, *Images of Salvation*, 115.

⁵¹⁰ This was expressed succinctly in Jamie's remarks

⁵¹¹ Colijn, *Images of Salvation*, 111.

⁵¹² Colijn, 117.

for the transformed individuals to express their passion in vertical terms alone-- which is to say, in isolated worship directed towards heaven. Introspective faith and worship are necessary, but they were never mandated as singular expressions of fervor for Christ's disciples. The horizontal element—relating to others together in community as they relate to God- is the only model of spiritual transformation offered in Jesus' teaching. "Christ defines not only who they are as individuals but also the primary social group to which they belong—the church," Colijn notes. "The new self is not an isolated individual but a self-in-relationship."⁵¹³ A clear connection therefore exists binding spiritually transformed individuals with others who are moving in the same direction.

In this chapter, the respondents discussed factors recognized as beneficial in promoting holistic flourishing. Some additional exemplary remarks to this end are provided in Appendix 6-1. Few remarks from the five lowest flourishers were included in this chapter because these respondents cited fewer assets in their reintegration journeys. Among the twelve respondents who scored "medium" or higher on the two flourishing indices, two assets were mentioned with greater regularity and passion than any others. The first of these was that strong networks of supporters actively assisted them after graduating from their Programs. The second was that they spoke of acquiring spiritual sustenance and stability resulting from transformative spiritual- or religious experiences they attributed to allegiance to Christ. In the final chapter, these observations will be incorporated with the observation that the failure to establish redemptive networks appears to be the most prominent obstacle impeding respondents as they reintegrate into new communities. In addition to this, *han*-related concerns will be identified as influencing most of the obstacles mentioned by respondents.

⁵¹³ Colijn, 116.

Chapter 7- Ending the Story Well

7-1 Overview: Recognizing Poor Networks and a Tarnished Imago Dei

7-1 a. Obstacles and Assets Summarized

Based on the Developmental and Spiritual Indices explained in chapter 5, the five respondents demonstrating high flourishing levels after leaving their Programs all remarked upon how they had maintained networks of supportive people who had partnered with them in their reintegration journeys.⁵¹⁴ In contrast to that, the five respondents registering either “low” or “poor” on the indices reported on how they had neglected the establishment of redemptive community. This is not assigning blame to the respondents who adapted poorly but it is rather a recognition that if healthy connections are not fostered and maintained, it is likely that both spiritual- and developmental maladaptation will occur. The greatest obstacle to flourishing revealed by the respondents in their interviews was a failure to establish redemptive networks after having graduated from their Christocentric Programs.

Conversely, the establishment of robust spiritual support systems in concert with the profession of spiritually transformed lives were the most common assets enhancing flourishing levels as cited by the respondents. Upon analysis of the respondents’ remarks, those who were flourishing when interviewed all provided numerous examples of supportive communities in which they participated. The low flourishers among the respondents described not only weaknesses in their supportive systems, but they also consistently spoke of how they had *resisted* or *avoided* engagement with people whom they acknowledged to be supportive. They recognized that supporters from the Programs continued to avail themselves, and that local churches

⁵¹⁴ In addition to this, the same could be said for each of three respondents who demonstrated moderately high flourishing levels.

had been positive influences in their lives. They also acknowledged that ongoing counseling adds value to their well-being but they often abandoned these supportive networks when establishing new routines.

The twelve highest flourishers described engagement in spiritual transformation as being fundamental to their overall flourishing abilities, linking their experiences to Christocentric spirituality. In addition to that, they embraced the establishment of redemptive communities and the maintenance of supportive relationships, noting how these affirmative support systems enabled them to maintain stability in their new environments. The data indicates that if they wish to journey towards holistic flourishing in their reestablished lives this will be enhanced by participation in redemptive networks of their choosing. Melody, for example, said she enjoyed a “personal relationship with Jesus” while Holly professed that “My identity now is in Christ.” Others used diffuse expressions characterizing themselves as having become Christians or children of God.⁵¹⁵

7-1 b. CSE Women and Spirituality

The title “Imago Dei Interrupted” had been employed for this research for over two years before interviewing of respondents began. Although I could not *precisely* predict the chief obstacles to flourishing, my prior research indicated how maintaining an affirmative image of God is difficult for severely traumatized women.⁵¹⁶ A CSE woman who attaches protracted agency to her deviant actions learns to anesthetize part of her spiritual self to accomplish this.⁵¹⁷ It is as though she suspends the Imago Dei within her

⁵¹⁵ La Donna remarked that she is “...living for God.” Scarlett said that her relationship to Christ is “Kind of like y’all are dating, in a way.” Theresa stated that at her conversion, “I realized... what it meant to follow Jesus” and described her baptism at that time as “...almost like a vow renewal in marriage.”

⁵¹⁶ Doehring, *Internal Desecration*, 88–89.

⁵¹⁷ Psychologist Melissa Farley discusses the disassociation CSE women have described which enables them to get through any given evening of sexual exploitation. One of her interview subjects here discusses how she attributes the degrading behaviors imposed on her as activity perpetrated on her alter

as a coping mechanism. If, on the other hand, she rejects agency in the exploitation that engulfed her – she was conditioned to service men as a minor, or she was kidnapped, or dominated by a violent manipulator-- it may appear more like the *Imago Dei* was confiscated from her.⁵¹⁸ The exploiters are often successful not only at violating the bodies of the exploited, but they inflict severe spiritual damage as well.

CSE women are often interested in spiritual matters, like citizens in other social groups.⁵¹⁹ If they self-identify as prostitutes, their primary concerns may be how they have offended God in their vocations and with other lifestyle choices. If they perceive they have been forced or compelled into human trafficking networks, their concerns about sinful behavior patterns may present as anger and bitterness regarding what others have perpetrated against them. When this occurs, unresolved resentment against injustice may be levied, and feelings of abandonment consequently occur.⁵²⁰ The residual effects of sin have adhered to them.

A one-sided doctrine of sin views the world from the perspective of the sinner.⁵²¹ Andrew Park notes how sin and repentance have “limited utility” in addressing the evil of human suffering.⁵²² Sin and *han* are “indivisible” in their cause/effect relationships.⁵²³ In either scenario, it appears as if the divine spark, the *Imago Dei*, has been interrupted. The individual agent may not have been aware of God’s activity in her life to begin with, or

ego. Another subject explains how she disassociates in the same way she did when she was raped at age fifteen. Farley, “Invisibility of Harm,” 263–66.

⁵¹⁸ Sociologist Alex Bierman cites numerous studies relating negative religious impulses to childhood maltreatment, and notes what he considers to be weaknesses in their arguments. However, he notes, there is a direct link to children rejecting religious- or spiritual impulses if their abuser was their father. Alex Bierman, “The Effects of Childhood Maltreatment on Adult Religiosity and Spirituality: Rejecting God the Father Because of Abusive Fathers?,” *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 44, no. 3 (September 2005): 357, <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-5906.2005.00290.x>.

⁵¹⁹ Barton and Hardesty, “Spirituality and Stripping;” Dalla, ““You Can’t Hustle All Your Life;”” Su, “Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health.”

⁵²⁰ Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 19.

⁵²¹ Park, 10.

⁵²² Park, 69.

⁵²³ Park, 70.

she may have placed these concerns on hold to cope with the phenomenon of being commodified.

At the point when interviews for this project began, many of the respondents had moved beyond liminality and had begun to experience abundant life. Some like Tia, Melody and Jamie appeared to be cautiously and fearfully wading into the brilliance of living waters indicated by Jesus in John 7:38. (“Rivers of living water will emerge from those who believe on me.”) Even so, their shell-shocked narratives enumerating past experiences appeared too close to the present for comfort.⁵²⁴

Among the lowest flourishers, Ginger was angry with many of the Christian women who had volunteered as mentors and she spoke of God only in oblique terms.⁵²⁵ Mona revealed nothing specific about her standing with God other than that she loves and “feels” the presence of God and expresses hope that one day she might pursue integration into a church community. Kelsey was angry with the local churches she referenced, although she could not seem to rationally reconcile this except to complain vaguely about being the subject of gossip. She admitted that the spiritual passion acquired in the Program didn’t endure for long after reintegration:

(During my time in the Program) I was totally in love with Jesus more than you can ever imagine. I was on fire for God every single day. Everywhere I went I would center everything around him. And then when I got out, everything changed, and it started to go... The more I would talk to men and the more we think about impure things, or the more I would do any of those things... You know, trying to make money. It all slipped away slowly.

⁵²⁴ Some of their narratives are found in the “Interfering History” section in Chapter 6. Among them: Sadie and Summer discussed how their felonies incurred due to the CSE lifestyle have continued to thwart them; and Jamie spoke at length about how old acquaintances try to coax her back to the lifestyle when she encounters them on Facebook, and how she feels her judgment beginning to vacillate when a former pimp called her on the phone recently. Both Tia and Yvette state “I am my biggest enemy.” Kelsey, speaking about her post-Program relationships, pondered why “I always have to go out with a bang.”

⁵²⁵ Ginger talked about her inability to surrender, without specifically referencing any authority to whom she referred. The other overtly spiritual statement she made was that she draws up “Gratitude Lists.” Once again, though, she didn’t reveal the content of her lists or specifically state an entity to whom she was grateful.

Summer didn't talk about God at all, as if the strong faith others had professed during the Program had made no impression on her whatsoever.⁵²⁶ It appeared that baggage had adhered to these women rendering them either incapable or unwilling to release it. All of them had experienced traumatic events as described in their questionnaires, and most had provided harrowing accounts of extreme measures taken and sacrifices made to enroll in the Programs. The five highest flourishers had mitigated the bitterness, shame, anger and sorrow affixed to the abandoned CSE lifestyles, enabling them to express *joie de vivre* and optimistic plans for their futures. They embodied concrete examples of the innate possibilities existing for women leaving CSE to become productive and well-adjusted citizens in their communities.

7-2 Theoretical Framework Revisited

I have allowed the dominant respondent narrative to unfold consistent with Grounded Theory. My concern was not so much focused upon whether I had guessed correctly about the obstacles impeding respondents but rather upon what they might explain and describe to me about their principal struggles. But what I have found from the writings of Bryant Myers, Andrew Sung Park and the Mansson/Hedin research team have proven invaluable in assessing the stories of the CSE respondents. Briefly stated, although the poverty of respondents was different from the material poverty described by Myers, it appears that defective community relationships is critical in keeping CSE women who have completed Christocentric rehabilitation from flourishing once they move into communities. The defective relationships established among low flourishing respondents did not result because spiritually healthy people were not available for them

⁵²⁶ The closest thing to a spiritual remark she made occurred in a short discussion regarding her time in the Program. She revealed, "They were teaching me the love that God has for me... I had to learn to love myself." She did not present herself as a current follower of any spiritual principles.

to network with. Rather, spiritually healthy members of the community were available, but these resources were not utilized to full advantage.

It has been established that CSE respondents had collectively participated in defective community in the past.⁵²⁷ The networks providing oversight were functioning against the interests of the respondents, as in Myers' model.⁵²⁸ When abandoning those networks, however, the subjects become citizens of new communities. Even if their participation in the Programs is limited to about a year or so, we have observed that most of the respondents found new communities in the towns surrounding the ones in which they had done their rehabilitation. They had established supporters while in the programs, and these were fortified if they had also joined area churches, which most had done. Yvette moved sixty miles from where she had done her rehabilitation so she could be closer to her family network. Summer likewise relocated several hundred miles away, to the region in which she had grown up, purportedly because she could stay with relatives inexpensively.⁵²⁹ Both of these respondents, however, accrued low scores on the flourishing indices, and both recognized that moving away was contrary to counsel. They chose to abandon safe environments for unsafe ones.⁵³⁰ Each of the respondents who

⁵²⁷ If one accepts my initial premise that CSE is always evil, it follows that the networks supporting the participants will always be toxic. This is self-evident, as reflected in the "Exploitation" component of CSE.

⁵²⁸ "The poor are poor largely because they live in networks of relationships that do not work for their well-being. Their relationships with others are often oppressive and disempowering as a result of the non-poor 'playing god' in the lives of the poor." Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 15.

⁵²⁹ Concerning friendships in her new environment, Summer remarked on how she had no women in her network and didn't appear to be involved in a church or women's group. "I don't trust women... Even in the streets I never got along with other women, I always had guy friends (*chuckles*). They're easier to get along with." It appears that her entire network consists of men whom she has recently met, and the male relative with whom she was staying.

⁵³⁰ Yvette, for example, was transparent about how she rebuffed counsel, and how her poor discretion in this matter led to her relapse. "...I had relapsed not long after I came back to Rockville. Even though they kept telling me *don't go back to Rockville, don't go back to Rockville. Stay here, stay here*, but I'm like, 'Now I'm going home. My mama needs me.' In fact, sometimes you get your family back... And then sometimes when you do get your family back: Are you even ready for it? And I wasn't ready for that... I relapsed in Rockville. Also, I didn't get recertified (to teach or mentor other program graduates) because I came back to Rockville. You know- I started messing up again." (*Name of location is pseudonymous*).

registered medium-to-high scores on the flourishing indices, however, remained in communities where they had recently established a rapport.

Hedin and Mansson's article, *The Importance of Supportive Relationships Among Women Leaving Prostitution* accurately presaged the degree to which personal relationships would prove to be vital for the respondents I spoke with. Although the practice of Christian faith is not factored into their insights, the establishment of networks populated with reliable and responsible individuals is a primary need for any women leaving CSE. My discipline of missiology requires me to apply theological perspectives, and for this study I also employed literature from sociology, psychology and cultural anthropology. Because part of this project was devoted to seeing how Christian faith might influence flourishing, I chose a sample of respondents who had been exposed to Christian principles, enabling me to employ a perspective that a sociologist might be disinterested in. That is, I wished to see if the emphasis on received faith principles—in this case, Christ-centered principles based upon New Testament teachings—would continue to influence the lives of formerly CSE women as they became established into their new living situations. Dr. Whitaker and I did not ask respondents if a “conversion to Christianity” or any other variant of that question had impacted their reintegration, but their responses clarified that the medium-, high- and very high flourishers recognized the degree to which those principles had impacted them, intellectually as well as experientially. This is a unique insight, and no other study to my knowledge has been conducted seeking similar information from a similar group of respondents.

What Hedin and Mansson were not able to determine due to the sampling of clients they interviewed is that consistent practice of the Christian faith optimized opportunities for flourishing within this community. Rochelle Dalla has partially observed this phenomenon, as has faith-based psychology researcher Jennifer Su in her

dissertation.⁵³¹ Similarly, it is difficult for those operating outside of theological constructs to perceive how Andrew Park's conception of *han* makes it difficult for women to optimally reintegrate. As with virtually all theological concepts, *han* cannot be absolutely measured or quantified.⁵³² People of good faith are free to debate what constitutes sin, or a state of *shalom*, or the quality of righteousness. Therefore, to say that the sociologists Mansson and Hedin *missed* or *overlooked* the effects of *han* upon a female CSE population may be predicated upon differences in terminology and the use of labels specific to their disciplines. As they observed the sociological forces inhibiting CSE participants from prospering after abandoning exploitative networks, they were not applying theological concepts to their observations. Terms such as *han* and sin were not part of the vocabulary of sociologists seeking to understand the causes of CSE, and these researchers didn't necessarily share the same burden for resolving those particular concerns as would a seminary-based researcher.

In *Walking with the Poor*, Bryant Myers recognized from a Christian worldview that spiritual forces were complicit in ensnaring poor people in their poverty. He links

⁵³¹ Of the 18 women Dalla interviewed trying to leave what she referred to as "prostitution", all five who were successful at the time of the interview attributed their success to the role of God in their lives as practiced within the context of Christianity. She writes, "All five women described, at length and spontaneously, belief in a higher power and the importance of organized religion in their successful exits... Additionally, they described developing new support systems and connections to conventional society as they increasingly immersed themselves in various church groups. All described being impacted by a higher power." Her focus, however, was upon women leaving CSE networks without regard to rehabilitational programs they participated in. Dalla, "'You Can't Hustle All Your Life,'" 18, 32–33. Su writes, "Both quantitative and qualitative survey responses provided evidence that the overwhelming majority of women in the current study perceived religious and spiritual factors as beneficial to their exit process. Advantages conferred by these religious and spiritual factors include use of positive religious coping to deal with trauma sequelae but, just as importantly, included the development of social support networks within the religious community and the effects of other religious and spiritual factors. The latter two advantages appear to offer reasonably good explanations for why women with greater religious commitment also reported longer duration of exit from the sex industry— because they were more likely to participate in social activities within the faith community and also more likely to benefit from religious involvement in ways that women with lower religious commitment would have had little or no access to." Su, "Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health," 307–8. Like Rochelle Dalla, though, her research centered upon exiters from CSE networks without regard to aftercare.

⁵³² Sin, grace, *shalom*, faith, hope, redemption, and *agape* are among the other concepts that are freely discussed in theological circles but cannot be quantified.

han particularly to the marring of the identities in the poor—a concept which I have identified as the interruption of being able to embrace the *Imago Dei* in the lives of each diffuse individual.⁵³³ Based on the work of Andrew Sung Park, he identifies this woundedness in systemic disempowerment, violence, and deception and observes how it is manifested in corporate expressions as well as in individuals.⁵³⁴ Myers' implication seems to be that the woundedness of impoverished peoples, generally speaking, is corporately acquired. To that consideration, I submit that women in CSE networks and those who have recently been emancipated constitute a unique demographic of citizens who have collectively acquired *han* as the result of their common experiences. For this community, flourishing necessitates that they overcome the residual effects of their acquired hardships and indignities and learn how to think and respond differently than they did when they were being exploited.

7-3 Contributions to Missiology

7-3a. Community Support is Integral to Flourishing

7-3 a-i. Exploitative Networks Beckon

According to sociologists Wilson and Butler, it is not without irony that the needs for intimacy and affection play a part in drawing girls and women into CSE, and yet it is this capacity for connectedness that become a central focus of the damage.⁵³⁵ Men have coerced younger women into lifestyles they would never have chosen for themselves by using false overtures of personal interest, affection and flattery.⁵³⁶ Dominant males also use psychological manipulation whenever possible to keep the emancipated women from

⁵³³ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 140.

⁵³⁴ Myers, 140.

⁵³⁵ Wilson and Butler, "Running a Gauntlet," 500.

⁵³⁶ Bales and Trodd, *To Plead Our Own Cause*; Lloyd, *Girls Like Us*; Sage and Kasten, *Enslaved*.

establishing stability and to try to lure them back.⁵³⁷ A community is waiting to receive those who are awkwardly trying to exit CSE networks. Exploitative networks find this vulnerable population on social media if the women are willing to be found.⁵³⁸ The failure of this population becomes the gain of the exploiters. Wilson and Butler observe how “...Strong supports are essential for successful transition... consequently, failures in outside relationships (either in the reinstatement of relationships established prior to entry or in the development of new relationships) may result in the resumption of relationships developed while in the trade with pimps, drug dealers, and women still in the business and, thus, may be a conduit to re-entry into the sex trade.”⁵³⁹ Whether or not they are aware, the former networks pose continual dangers to those formerly exploited, until they become well-established in safe, new environments. Wilson and Butler concluded their extensive research by noting

The typical experiences of the victims of CSE represent a gauntlet of victimization and violence endured prior to their entry, while in the trade, and around the time of and following their exit. The complex accretion and chronicity of these traumatic experiences... contributes to the challenges of treating this population. The impact for girls and women of being trafficked for sex/prostituted seems universal across cultures and age groups, but its severity may vary with degree and extent of exposure.⁵⁴⁰

The abilities of former pimps and other exploitative associates today is heightened by universal access to numerous social media outlets. They had often been successful in the

⁵³⁷ As discussed by Lloyd, *Girls Like Us*, 186–94. I saw this phenomenon reflected in my respondent Jamie’s experiences recounted in the section on Barriers in Chapter 3.

⁵³⁸ Respondent Jamie had this to say about people from the former life beckoning to them on social media: “The biggest fear is Facebook. I work with my mentor on this, and we go back and forth. I say ‘It’s not that bad, I just want to see like what they been doing... And I like to show them what I’ve been doing and look where I’m at...’ Like one of my steps was admitting that I have a problem with letting my past go... Yeah. But there’s still the issue that if you’re on Facebook, people can find you. Just out of the blue some people will say ‘Hey Sugarmama (*fabricated name*)-you know that was my street name--they’ll say, how are you doing? I haven’t heard from you, or I heard that you died.’ It’s like okay... and I’m about to entertain it...”

⁵³⁹ Wilson and Butler, “Running a Gauntlet,” 500.

⁵⁴⁰ Wilson and Butler, 501.

past at establishing alternate family structures to vulnerable women.⁵⁴¹ While they may not know where to locate former victims, sometimes the recovering women reveal this themselves. Rochelle Dalla noted that it is important for women who wish to remain free from exploitative networks to sever ties with "...old playmates; maintaining sobriety and freedom from the sex industry."⁵⁴² This was based upon her observation that the only five respondents she interviewed who remained free from exploitation after two years had all done this. The established safety structures for countering this is to be surrounded by redemptive community who can counsel and provide accountability.

The administrators I spoke with discussed their efforts to keep their Program graduates connected to churches and mentors after residents left the Programs. More than that, though, the graduates themselves testified to the resources that remained available to them after they reintegrated into communities. I spoke to more graduates from the Mid-South program than from any other, and their graduates reported that redemptive community was readily available, at least if they stayed in the regions from which they had graduated. As Sadie remarked to me

They set up transportation, they help you find a car if you didn't have a car. It was kind of, to me, a *thorough* transition. I feel like I didn't really run into any problems or anything like "Man, this is difficult!" Until like a year or two later...

The two women from the same Program who scored higher than this respondent both related involvement not only in prolific church- and community activities, but they also kept tabs on dozens of other women who had gone through the program.⁵⁴³

⁵⁴¹ Maddy Coy, "'Moved Around Like Bags of Rubbish Nobody Wants': How Multiple Placement Moves Can Make Youth Women Vulnerable to Sexual Exploitation," *Child Abuse Review* 18, no. 4 (August 2009): 254–66, <https://doi.org/10.1002/car.1064>; Herman, "Hidden in Plain Sight."

⁵⁴² Dalla, "'You Can't Hustle All Your Life,'" 19.

⁵⁴³ Neither of them did this vocationally. They both had steady employment in the community, but were avocationally involved in ministering to other girls and women

Scarlett, one of the high flourishers from a different Program, also spoke earnestly of the role her church occupied in her reintegrated life. Holly, another high flourisher, noted “I have a pretty fabulous support system,” which included her mother as well as Christian colleagues at the non-profit agency where she was employed. She also maintained affirmative community with another non-profit that she volunteers with regularly. These respondents discussed how their networks were continually attending to their well-being.

7-3 a-ii. Low Flourishers and The Company They Keep

Summer was one of the lower flourishers interviewed for this research, scoring a 50% on the Developmental Scale and a 57.5% on the Spiritual Index. Although she exuded confidence and good humor throughout the interview, her remarks underscored how she was keeping supportive community at arm’s length. Shortly after graduating from her Program in the Deep South, she moved to the northeast without access to a known redemptive network. She reveled in saying insulting things to her customers at work, and without any evident self-reflection she boasted about how popular she had been in The Life, and how much money she had earned for her pimp. She spoke of being too suspicious of any woman to allow herself to become close to one of them, stating that she only socializes with men. She didn’t mention church or any other social- or therapeutic group she cooperates with today. “I just stick to my own self,” she remarked to me. “Because I have trust issues... So I just like to keep my circle small... I have to do for myself because in the end, nobody’s really going to be there for you.”

Mona was another low flourishing respondent, scoring a composite 58.75% on the two indices. She was well-dressed and groomed for the interview, demonstrating genuine reflectiveness in her answers. She had secured a respectable position in a city agency and appeared to have broken the cycle of commercially exchanging sex. However, she no

longer participated in counseling but provided introspective comments about why she was not involved in any social- or spiritual communities. “There are a couple volunteers who I could be, you know, going to coffee with, going to church with,” she remarked. “But I think even still, for their benefit I don’t want to be that transparent. I don’t want to be dumping my life on them, because these are *not* survivors of human trafficking.” Although she admitted that her Program had benefitted her greatly, noting she had met some remarkable mentors there and had herself been a unifying force for the women while living communally in the facility, she remained distant from these supporters after leaving. While her reasons for distrusting church communities was well established in her personal history, she had not experienced any toxicity in post-CSE church life.⁵⁴⁴ She admitted feeling bad about avoiding church people and other supporters, but she avoided them anyway, contrary to her rational perceptions that those things would enrich her life today.

Ginger was the lowest-scoring respondent in the study, securing a composite of 23/100 on the two flourishing indices. She communicates with a mentor and states that she still talks to a therapist on a weekly basis, though it is sometimes a phone session. When asked about community resources, she rattled off several, reporting estimates of how many people attend each group. But she complained bitterly about wealthy board members in one of the organizations, and about the large and impersonal nature of one of the churches from which she had received services. Although her mentor was resolute in

⁵⁴⁴ Chapter 1 began with her narrative, involving a man who had regularly sexually abused her at church. Her entire story is too involved to recount here, but it includes numerous abusers over the years. Part of this, according to her recollection, hinged upon her friendship with the children of a pastor in a congregation where she attended. When it was discovered that the children had told Mona how the pastor was their father via a relationship the congregation apparently wasn’t aware of, Mona believes his was a catalyst resulting in hostility and verbal abuse directed towards her from the pastoral couple. Further, Mona recounts that this pastor’s wife pronounced what the woman considered to be a prophetic declaration over her, predicting that Mona would become a prostitute and a drug addict in the future. It was apparent during the interview that these things continued to trouble Mona on the day Dr. Whitaker and I interviewed her.

continually tracking her down, Ginger expressed great anger towards many Program mentors whom she characterized as lacking in insight and compassion. “Some of them (mentors) are very clearly there for you, the best way they can be. But... Some of them can’t be,” she remarked. “So I think that has been a roadblock for me. (Trying not to hold) resentments towards people who have said, ‘We will help you.’” Both her mentor and another Program graduate were able to put me in touch with her for an interview. Although redemptive community was available to her, Ginger did not exploit those opportunities socially or spiritually. She stated that she was committed to her opiate addiction, and her actions demonstrated her desire to keep healthy people at bay.

A redemptive network offers more than simple moral-, spiritual- and emotional support. A network can become like an intimate family. Theologian Craig Dykstra observes how healthy individuals are usually irrevocably bound to families.⁵⁴⁵ This can work for affirmative purposes, or for the implementation of evil. While respondent Holly ebulliated over the support she has received from her mother since deciding to leave the life, described her mother as being toxic and manipulative. Kelsey had a mother who had proven herself to be beyond unreliable, as she had actively recruited her daughter into CSE networks and tag-teamed with Kelsey in commercial sexual acts. Theresa reported that her mother raised her on pornography and according to her perceptions appears to have groomed Theresa for CSE. Patti described an uncle who had sold her out to men as a young child, and the rest of her family seemed similarly malevolent according to her narrative. Tia was tentatively optimistic about a steadily improving relationship with her father and his wife but was approaching the situation cautiously because she recalled that he had been an abusive and malignant figure when she was

⁵⁴⁵ Craig R. Dykstra, *Growing in the Life of Faith: Education and Christian Practices*, 2nd Edition (Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2005), 99.

young. In functional families a bond of kinship is meant to be established for proper nurturing and the protection of all family members. Whether the specific family is a natural one or a spiritually constructed one they are fundamentally constituted upon a series of promises.⁵⁴⁶ They are covenanted together based on mutual commitments made for the well-being of one another in their communities.⁵⁴⁷

One cannot choose blood relatives, but respondents can choose to bring people into their lives or not based upon their reliability. Additionally, many CSE individuals emerge from unhealthy families. The poor spiritual health of their natural families sometimes contributed to their exploitation.⁵⁴⁸ The family structures assumed by many citizens does not automatically manifest itself for them. The recoverers are engaged in one of the most critical stages of their lives and may have to endure this with fewer friends from their former lives unless they have communities based upon Program people and/or church people.

7-3 b. The Significance of Spiritual Engagement in Maintaining a Life of Flourishing

We have discussed the incorporation of high flourishing CSE post-Program women into redemptive or spiritual communities. While it is fortuitous for them to join worshipping communities, membership does not signify they are fully committed to the

⁵⁴⁶ Dykstra, 100.

⁵⁴⁷ Dykstra notes that this covenant of promise-making does not necessarily constitute promise-keeping. Numerous circumstances and conditions exist that may render the promises to be unfulfilled. War, poverty, violence, health issues and all forms of social upheaval may interfere with the fulfillment of promises. But this does not dilute the power of promise-making or the need for its implementation. Healthy families may in time become unhealthy, resulting in divorce, estrangement, or church splits. This reflects a broken world in which sin and *han* are present. It is not a rationale for failing to make or to fulfill promises. Dykstra, 100–101.

⁵⁴⁸ Sibnath Deb, Aparna Mukherjee, and Ben Mathews, “Aggression in Sexually Abused Trafficked Girls and Efficacy of Intervention,” *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 26, no. 4 (March 2011): 745–68, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260510365875>; Raymond and Hughes, “Sex Trafficking of Women in the United States”; Williamson and Prior, “Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking.”

church, nor does this compel communal participants to become Christ-followers.⁵⁴⁹

Participation in redemptive communities has been shown to optimize their opportunities for flourishing. The support rendered by caring, others-oriented congregations address many of the unique needs inherent in this population.

Whether their faith had been transformative, though, is a distinct issue. High flourishing respondents interviewed for this project described having experienced transformative Christian renewal, which can also be described as the importance of participating in vertical Christianity.⁵⁵⁰ Those with whom I spoke did not prescribe how others should respond to Christ or react to spiritual impulses to deepen their faith, but rather they discussed phenomena that had occurred to them. The interview protocol did not require the reintegrating CSE respondents to describe transformational processes unfolding in their lives, yet many volunteered informative details when asked about affirmative components in their personal experiences.⁵⁵¹ The high flourishing

⁵⁴⁹ CSE women are accustomed to playing various roles, which has led to a fracturing of their true identities as explained in Herman, *Trauma and Recovery: Aftermath*; Colin Ross, Melissa Farley, and Harvey Schwartz, "Dissociation Among Women in Prostitution," *Journal of Trauma Practice* 2, no. 3/4 (January 14, 2004): 199–212. Some described their commercial sex roles as occurring to another person, replete with an alternative name and degraded or fabricated identities. Christine A. Courtois, "Complex Trauma, Complex Reactions: Assessment and Treatment," *Psychological Trauma: Theory, Research, Practice, and Policy* 5, no. 1 (August 2008): 86–100, <https://doi.org/10.1037/1942-9681.S.1.86>; Judith Lewis Herman, *Trauma and Recovery*, Rev. ed. (BasicBooks, 1997); Colin A. Ross et al., "Dissociation and Abuse Among Multiple-Personality Patients, Prostitutes, and Exotic Dancers," *Hospital & Community Psychiatry* 41, no. 3 (March 1, 1990): 328–30.

⁵⁵⁰ Stanley J. Grenz, *Created for Community: Connecting Christian Belief with Christian Living* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1997), 212.

⁵⁵¹ Four of the respondents had assisted me in contacting other subjects and coordinating contacts. I had spoken to each of these several times before conducting interviews regarding their own CSE reintegration experiences. These all registered as either high or moderately high on the flourishing indices. This is a predictable outcome since all were professionals, and all had been motivated enough by our prior conversations to bring others into the project and to help coordinate interviews. It may be due to the familiarity with the project and with the interviewer that these didn't volunteer many of the details of their conversions or transformational experiences. It had been established in previous months that they were committed Christians and were working for Christian organizations. They seemed to take their conversion stories and identification as Christ-followers somewhat for granted with me, remembering how these things had been discussed in previous months. Most of the more emphatic and detailed quotes, therefore, were generated from the women who had *not* performed administrative roles. These were women I was interviewing for the first time, and they didn't presume that I knew anything about their faith, the trajectory of their vocations, or their experiences in community other than what had been provided in the questionnaires, which was often not very detailed.

respondents⁵⁵² serving in caregiving capacities were very matter-of-fact about their faith as illustrated below:

My (academic) degree was based on conforming to the image of Christ for the sake of others. My transformation, my salvation, has a huge impact on others when I demonstrate the character and kindness of Christ in all my ways. -Theresa

I would say my identity now is in Christ. A new creation... So strong, brave, courageous... -Holly

I'm a believer in Jesus Christ. I identify as a Christian. My current spiritual life includes daily prayer... I try to read the word every day. Often times I listen to the Word in like a Bible app. -Alanna

These respondents had all abandoned CSE networks more than six years before I interviewed them. They reported consistency in many of their habits, and each demonstrated the self-confidence accompanying experienced people who have achieved competence in a particular task or subject. Louise was another respondent who had become a professional caregiver, and she scored in the moderately high range on the two flourishing scales.⁵⁵³ She expressed lower self-confidence than did the other caregivers, which could be attributed to her more recent conversion to the Christian faith, to her personality, or to some other factor. She reported:

I identify myself as a Christian. I am a new believer. Up until six and a half years ago I had no idea who God or Jesus was. So it is all very new to me... I know who I am today, and although I still have some struggles-who *doesn't*? - I'm struggling to be the person I know I have the potential to be. But I'm so *happy* with who I am today.

The content of her interview was filled with frustrations and failures as well as with great optimism. She presented herself as somebody who had not experienced an exemplary

⁵⁵² Indicating a composite score of 90 or higher on the two flourishing indices

⁵⁵³ This indicates her score registered between 80 and 89, or in her case an 83.75% composite score.

journey since graduating from the Program but had nevertheless recovered from her shortcomings and learned valuable lessons from her mistakes.

The theme of brokenness coupled with transformation was introduced by the other two highest flourishers, both of whom were working in jobs that didn't require college although one of them was working towards a degree. LaDonna grinned broadly during most of our interview as she related a narrative in which she owned up to her failures and boasted on the goodness of the God whom she professes to have encountered. She divulged how through her own poor judgement she ended up pregnant after completing the Program, and then began planning for an abortion. Her church family intervened, though, and she is grateful today for the daughter whom she is now raising, in addition to her older daughter. She deepened her commitment to Christ, and the grace that was extended to her at that time seemed to be a catalyst for her to pursue deeper spiritual growth. In her words,

I'm living for Jesus, no matter what. I'm going to repent every day; I'm going to live for God. I know no one's perfect, but only God...Like, I don't know how I did it before. I mean, of course, I was broken before. But I literally depend on God every day.

Similarly, Scarlett ascribed her transformative spiritual experience to having first reached a point of despair, characterized by several reported suicide attempts. She stated that she had felt "... like the machine that you put money into, and it's a claw and then picks you up and then it drops you." Without hypothesizing on what other Program residents might have needed to remain free from CSE networks and drug addiction, LaDonna felt as if *her* despondency positioned her for receptivity to spiritual transformation. She explained,

But I don't know if I had a real spiritual breakthrough until I was *broken*. And he (Christ) met me there. And it was

okay. So I felt like I had to be all the way gone... For him to meet me.

Later in the interview she added:

I'm grateful that he's so real in my life. Times when I get busy or just doing life... You know, the time is intimate, you're knowing him and he knows you. I mean, he already knows you, but like him revealing himself...

Not only did their interviews demonstrate how viscerally these respondents appeared to experience personal spiritual transformation, but they also indicated characteristics of *han* deeply embedded in their experiences prior to having embraced transformed Christian lives. Without describing the mechanics or the processes of how their transformations had occurred, they nonetheless narrated episodes of enduring chronic abuse, degradation, entertaining thoughts of harming themselves and others, and navigating feelings of shame.⁵⁵⁴ All of these spoke of how in recent years they had overcome these obstacles and were currently experiencing immense life satisfaction. These are indicators that the *han*-like symptoms they had described are no longer prevalent. Perhaps equally noteworthy is that Scarlett and LaDonna in addition to Holly and Theresa had all credited redemptive communities for guiding them at critical junctures, offering resources, and supporting them during seasons of instability in ways that were conspicuous to the respondents.⁵⁵⁵

7-3 c. The Significance of Metrics in Addressing Flourishing Levels

7-3 c-i. Developmental and Spiritual Flourishing Indices

⁵⁵⁴ Sociologists Hedin and Mansson state that the shame issue is one of the four key obstacles that women breaking away from prostitution have to overcome in order to successfully abandon CSE networks. Månsson and Hedin, "Matthew Effect," 67.

⁵⁵⁵ In Holly's circumstances, she attributes positive interactions with relatives in addition to her church as having been foundational to her reintegration. Scarlett reported on a strong redemptive atmosphere at her place of employment in addition to the support she receives at church. All of them mentioned ongoing redemptive relationships with people they knew in their Programs as influencing the positive outcomes of their lives, including Alanna who viewed this as the primary redemptive network sustaining her recovery.

Establishing how well somebody is making their way through life can be precarious. If one were to use a quantitative survey, they might supply boxes to check such as “My Mental Health is Excellent-Good-Fair-Poor-Abysmal”. Or, an interview question might read, “How spiritual am I?: Fervent- Deeply Committed- Somewhat Committed-Waning Commitment – Doing Poorly- Abysmal- Non applicable”. One could also devise some short questions to propose, such as “The following things have changed about my values since leaving The Life”, or “The ways that I help others regularly are...” or “My belief system is demonstrated in the following ways...” These all seem superficial, as they require respondents to try to think within the interviewer’s preconceived categories. The open-ended questioning method utilized for this study was time-consuming but it yielded the thoughtful and complex kinds of answers I sought. If conversations were developed organically with the respondents, they would be more likely to provide answers truer to their thinking patterns. This required me to return later and engage in further coding, but it yielded useful information. In the questionnaires, respondents were permitted to answer in any manner they desired, whether in writing or in verbal dictation. In the face-to-face interviews I proposed questions, allowed them to ramble if they wished to, or to revisit questions later in the process if they preferred. I clarified components of language and presented follow-up questions if I hadn’t fully understood their responses. I took precautions to avoid suggesting answers to them, however, or to offer suggestions based on the way others had responded.

When the interviews had been completed and transcribed, I was left with a large body of data to sift through.⁵⁵⁶ The need remained to employ objective analysis by which to evaluate the hundreds of statements the respondents had offered in describing their

⁵⁵⁶ The coding process is described in 2-7 d and e.

reintegrated lives. My intention has been to assess holistic levels of flourishing using their sentiments and descriptions of the trajectories of their lives. I have demonstrated that flourishing does not occur in a vacuum and each respondent needed to be holistically assessed with consideration given to several diverse flourishing factors. Because I am *particularly* interested in *spiritual* flourishing⁵⁵⁷ I felt it was necessary to create an index specifically focused upon that component of their lives. I created the two indices to address those two concerns.⁵⁵⁸ The manner in which I chose my categories and analyzed responses is covered in Appendices 5-4 and 5-5.

Without indices, the standards for the quality of flourishing occurring in the lives of these respondents would have been subjective. The use of metrics enabled me to gain a bevy of information quickly and succinctly regarding the phenomena occurring in the life of each respondent and allowed me to easily compare and contrast statements articulated by high versus low flourishers. I was consequently able to compare experiential differences between respondents enabling me to make apples-to-apples correlations. This does not mean that every respondent was unflaggingly accurate in the descriptions of their experiences, but that variable is no different than in any survey or interview process involving human interaction. I was able to measure what they *declared* had been true in their particular circumstances.

“Count what is countable, measure what is measurable, and what is not measurable, make measurable” is a saying attributed to Galileo Galilei in 1579.⁵⁵⁹ Yet

⁵⁵⁷ See statement in 3-3e (Religio-spiritual factors)

⁵⁵⁸ Due to stated delimitations, I didn't feel the need to create, for example, a separate Social Flourishing or Psychological/Mental Health index. Nor were the approved questions necessarily adequate to specifically address those areas. Spiritual flourishing is a component of my discipline as a missiologist. Creating and utilizing other indices specific to other disciplines, however, would be great contributions for future researchers in the social sciences, psychiatry, criminal justice and perhaps those from other disciplines to initiate.

⁵⁵⁹ John M. Henshaw, *Does Measurement Measure Up?: How Numbers Reveal and Conceal the Truth* (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2006), 15.

not everything is quantifiable.⁵⁶⁰ I did not therefore endeavor to place a number on the degree of happiness or of life satisfaction reported by respondents. Instead, the focus was upon the habits and sentiments of the respondents as they reported them to Dr. Whitaker and me. Eighteen variables were assessed on two indices before I attempted to place numeric values upon their responses. The numbers selected to represent their experiences were backed up by one or more quotes for each variable per respondent.⁵⁶¹

There were ten measurable variables in the Developmental Flourishing Index, which were based upon Myers' *Walking with the Poor*. Louise did not make any statements that could be construed to specifically address the variables "Seeking Righteousness" or "Recognizing the Role of Evil" so she was assessed on eight variables rather than on the complete ten. I considered the category "Seeking Righteousness" to be an important one, so I included it in the Index, but five of the seventeen respondents didn't issue any remarks indicating how this applied to them. Not wishing to speculate on issues they had not addressed, each of these five received a "Not applicable" value in this category, and it was not weighted in their assessments.⁵⁶²

7-3 c-ii. Correlation Between Developmental Index and Spiritual Index

⁵⁶⁰ A University of Tulsa department chair and Professor of Mechanical Engineering notes with amusement that we cannot know how the Apostle Paul was able to determine that between faith hope and love, "...the greatest of these is love." (I Corinthians 13:13). Likewise, happiness cannot be measured, so we must learn to approach with a degree of skepticism indices that measure these things. Henshaw, 203-4.

⁵⁶¹ When their remarks had not clearly addressed a particular variable, I assigned no value to the response and did not factor that variable into their overall assessments. For example, on the Spiritual Flourishing index, neither Jamie nor Melody had made any statements related to the category "Engagement in Outreach." They had mentioned church attendance, but not whether they had become involved in any ministries of the church, and they hadn't mentioned doing charitable acts for the benefit of others. I did not score them in this area and based their Spiritual Flourishing scores on seven variables apiece instead of on eight. Ginger, on the other hand, made it clear she was not engaging in outreach to anybody and was spending each day trying to obtain opiates for her personal use. She scored a zero, and this was factored into her overall score involving eight variables.

⁵⁶² This does, however, underscore the reality that some of the questions I proposed did not specifically address some of the values on the indices I eventually used. In the future, if an interviewer has decided on the content of the index he wishes to use, he may want to adjust his questions so that a response to this variable will likely be addressed. I was at a disadvantage in that I didn't create the indices until the interviewing had concluded.

After scoring was completed on both indices for each of the seventeen respondents, a clear and unanticipated pattern emerged. For sixteen of the seventeen respondents there was nearly a one-to-one correlation between how they were flourishing developmentally versus how they fared spiritually. In fourteen out of seventeen instances, only 11 points or fewer separated their Developmental scores from their Spiritual scores.⁵⁶³ The Developmental index weighs practical factors such as vocational development, the propriety of their relationships, whether they are currently seeking righteousness, addressing the causes of their past involvement in CSE networks, and whether they are pursuing sustainable future plans. In all but one of these instances, then, if a respondent was maintaining spiritual health, she was also maintaining overall holistic health and vice-versa.

Patti was an anomaly. With her Spiritual Flourishing registering 22.8% higher than her Developmental Index, she was the only respondent whose indices varied to the degree that they placed her in a different flourishing category altogether. Her Spiritual score of 85 was high enough to position her as a moderately high respondent in that Index, but her Developmental score (62.2) ranked her as a low flourisher in the corresponding index. This changed her median score (a combination of the two scores) to 73.6%, placing her overall among the moderate flourishers. The reason for the disparity, though was that the Traumatic Brain Injury she had incurred seemed to impede her social skills and kept her from being able to maintain employment, which caused her financial problems. She was, on the other hand, unambiguously invested in her Christian

⁵⁶³ In Ginger's situation, her Developmental score was 24 points higher than her Spiritual Development score, but both of these were still considered in the "poor flourishing" category. She was living out of her car, using opiates daily, and demonstrating almost no interest at all in spiritual matters. Similarly, Yvette had a Developmental score that was 18.1% higher than her Spiritual score, but both were still within the boundaries of "poor flourishing." In seven of these respondents, less than three points separated their Developmental scores from their Spiritual scores. This demonstrates a one-to-one correlation between their spiritual lives and their holistically balanced lives.

faith, and did not seem to be discernibly needy in any area related to spiritual- or religious life. Had she not sustained a physical injury which also appeared to seriously impair her mental processing capacities, it is conceivable that her Developmental score would also have somewhat mirrored that of her spiritual development.

Although I didn't have the benefit of realizing this earlier in the project, it would be helpful to locate or create indices before interviewing commences. In that manner, a researcher could ascertain that the interview questions were adequate to address all the information he sought, and he might be able to avoid some of the "Not applicable" values that appeared on my indices. In qualitative interviewing, however, it is important to avoid leading the respondent into delivering overly simplified or biased responses. If a respondent is directly asked if she "serves" or "gives back" to her community, for example, she might feel obligated to reach for examples placing her in a better light with the interviewer. It was necessary for this project to keep questions open-ended, so it may have worked to my advantage to develop the indices *after* interviewing had concluded. Both the interviewers and respondents might be susceptible to making unconsciously biased remarks leading to predetermined conclusions.

7-3 d. Addressing Han Issues to Enable Healing and Flourishing

The flourishing abilities of CSE women reintegrating into communities after Christocentric rehabilitation appears to be impeded by *han* issues, or by the residual effects of the sins of others perpetrated upon them. Christianity proclaims that Christ can forgive sins and heal individuals from various infirmities. Consistent with those beliefs is the proposition that he can heal people from the effects of *han*.⁵⁶⁴ Although the

⁵⁶⁴ This is covered in the *Definitions* section in chapter 2. Briefly stated, *han* conditions that may be addressed by the sinned-against include bitterness and resignation to their fates (pp. 19-20); self-sabotaging (p.34); rage (p. 32) and despair (pp. 8 and 16). Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993.

respondents did not provide narratives employing this terminology, they spoke of new circumstances indicating how certain negative factors had been ameliorated.

Alanna and Holly both exuded surplus self-confidence, having worked for several years as administrative caregivers after graduating from their respective Programs. Even so, Alanna admitted to me that when things grew tight around the Christmas holidays, thoughts of how to quickly earn some “easy money” had occurred to her on numerous occasions. Holly also confessed. “I’m not going to lie, I played around with ways that I could make fast money but always talked myself out of it-- or my mentor talked me out of it once.” The ease with which these respondents felt like they could succumb to codependent patterns and the fragility they demonstrated years after they had left CSE networks could be described in several ways. Some might attribute it to the *Ghetto Sides* they had developed over several years. They had been conditioned by their experiences to think and to react in ways that had made sense to them during their years of sexual exploitation, and the months they had spent in psychotherapy and spiritual formation did not reliably alter their thought patterns. Another way of perceiving the phenomena is to consider that accumulated *han* had continued to influence them even after they had established new identities in new communities.

In the seventh chapter of Romans, the apostle Paul related a similar struggle that appears to parallel some of the respondents’ experiences. “I do not understand what I do. For what I want to do I do not do, but what I hate I do,” he confessed (Romans 7:15). Later in the narrative he adds, “For I know that good itself does not dwell in me, that is, in my sinful nature. For I have the desire to do what is good, but I cannot carry it out...”

So I find this law at work: Although I want to do good, evil is right there with me. For in my inner being I delight in God’s law; but I see another law at work in me, waging war against the law of my mind and making me a prisoner

of the law of sin at work within me. What a wretched man I am! (Roman 7:18 and 21- 24b)

Paul does not complain here that he is powerless to respond to sin and that he must therefore succumb. Instead, he observes that “another law” wages war with his thoughts. He describes having received a new, redeemed nature, but he refuses to idealize the new nature as something completely reliable or impenetrable. He recognizes that while he has been redeemed, he still possesses an ongoing need to address the old nature. Since his body and mind continue to be earthbound, he will continue to experience their earthly limitations. Andrew Sung Park noted, “Where sin is committed, *han* arises as its corollary.”⁵⁶⁵ *Han*, then is related to sin, but it is passive rather than active. Just as the most earnest Christian still struggles with the desire to commit sin after having confessed to being transformed by Christ, so *han* continues to affect CSE women and other marginalized populations after they have been transformed. If it seems puzzling that women who have been degraded, commodified and exploited would still consider returning to abusing addictive substances, to relying upon unreliable men or perhaps to rejoin the similar networks they to the ones they had abandoned, a study of Paul’s epistle to the Romans is illuminating. If those who believe they have been transformed by Christ continue to struggle with managing their tempers, with selfishly spending excessive time and money on pleasure rather than on needy individuals, with embellishing the truth to benefit themselves, or with entertaining hateful thoughts on a regular basis, then the mystery may seem much less mysterious. Sin plagues humanity on an ongoing basis, and *han* may continue to vex its oppressed constituency even after they have received healing and adopted satisfactory lifestyles in new communities.

⁵⁶⁵ Park, 48.

Han was *identified* in acrimonious relationships, returns to CSE networks, relapse into substance abuse, job instability and low spiritual interest. Three of the respondents discussed how they had elected to prostitute themselves briefly after graduating from their Programs. Several mentioned their attraction to what they called “Bad Boys,” freely acknowledging that these attractions were unhealthy. Two respondents described drifting from job to job. One of them returned to opiate addiction. Three of them spoke negatively about Program mentors and church people, even though that same group of people had admittedly spent many hours trying to assist them. With only one exception, all these complaints were issued by respondents scoring below 60% on the two flourishing indices.⁵⁶⁶ Two of the women registering on the “moderate flourishing” index⁵⁶⁷ reported they were still having thoughts they described as “promiscuous;” One of them had been recently married, and both stated they regarded their promiscuous thoughts as inappropriate. Another respondent on the “medium” flourishing scale reported ongoing attraction to “Bad Boys” and confessed that she was still in the process of navigating a situation she viewed as unhealthy.

Han was expressed as accumulated trauma, compulsions, addictions, restlessness, a Ghetto Side, dissatisfaction with the *Square Life*, rampant materialism, and poor self-image. Two of the top five flourishers, each of whom had been away from CSE

⁵⁶⁶ One of the medium-flourishing respondents reported that she had been pulled into turning tricks for a brief interval but stopped doing it and then experienced a transformational encounter with Christ. The two other women who reported exchanging money for sex post-program stated they weren’t doing that at the time of the interview. A fourth subject didn’t discuss whether she was still involved in that lifestyle any longer; Since this wasn’t one of the approved questions, I didn’t ask her. But her narrative about being homeless and being willing to do almost anything to obtain another opiate high indicate the possibility she was also doing this at least irregularly. She had, however, never identified with human trafficking or prostituting, and instead self-identified as an addict. She indicated that the fixation some people had on addicts who prostituted themselves was misguided, as this was often a casual activity for them—one of many things they were willing to do for their addictions, including theft.

⁵⁶⁷ Indicating they had scored between 60 and 79 on the two indices. It may be noteworthy, however, that all of these had scored in the 70’s, and none of the 17 respondents had accrued a composite score in the 60’s.

networkers, discussed how trauma occurring during their years of exploitation still continually affected them. This included the persistence of paranoid thoughts, pronounced startle reflexes, and sexual trauma.⁵⁶⁸ Another high flourishing individual had been free from the old life for over six years, but was haunted by loneliness even though she maintained a positive network of support. A further complication was that she had not been able to wean herself from a suboxone maintenance plan after more than five years. Among those who scored moderately high or moderate on the indices, narratives of fear and loneliness were commonly expressed. More than half of these also expressed prominent failures occurring post- Program,⁵⁶⁹ although all of them were experiencing stable lives at the time of their interviews.⁵⁷⁰

I will close this section with a theory I have constructed based upon my observations of the respondents in this study. It explains the phenomena of the “Ghetto Side” rhetoric some of them conveyed to me, in addition to the impulses of some to pursue “Bad Boys” and to divest themselves from healthy networks and individuals while simultaneously recognizing that this was not in their interests. As we consider implications of these and other findings requiring further research, my hope is that researchers analyzing deviant or traumatized population will find it useful in assessing their observations.

⁵⁶⁸ One of these described a sanguine marriage, but she continued to experience fears regarding her husband’s sexual practices even though she insisted he was innocent of any misconduct. She also stated that she had been in so many accidents that she was fearful whenever travelling in a car. The other high flourishing respondent had been engaged to a man for over five years whom she professed to adore, but she could not follow through with marriage plans, and had broken if off and then reunited with him during the months I was in touch with her; She attributed all of this to her own embedded fears.

⁵⁶⁹ These were narratives they identified as being failures or relapses, all of them relating either to sexual activities of which they believed they should not have been involved, or substance abuse relapses.

⁵⁷⁰ Two others also mentioned serious car accidents without specifying severity or injuries to themselves. Without further research it is impossible to determine if this is typical of people who have accumulated surplus *han*. The correlation may be related to lifestyles of women who had lived recklessly in the past, or it could be attributed to drivers who had been in inexperienced behind the wheel too due to limited autonomy.

Baggage Theory: People who carry surplus emotional baggage may possess significant diagnosed traumas, or their concerns may be undiagnosed. These individuals may have been characterized as possessing numerous psychological or spiritual maladies.⁵⁷¹ They will not necessarily seek treatment, and treatment may be unavailable. Even under ideal circumstances, those describing trauma narratives may therefore experience difficulties flourishing when they are moved into non-traumatic environments. They may be inclined to resist or reject available healthy lifestyle conditioning. Even after becoming educated or rehabilitated, they can find themselves drawn to risky and unhealthy people, environments and activities. They may describe themselves as not worthy of better circumstances, or as individuals not “fitting in” to healthier environments, or they may fault the new environments as being too complicated or boring. Although they intrinsically desire the benefits of stable lifestyles, their mental conditioning compels them to seek inordinately familiar circumstances in search of normalcy, since they have not yet adequately established new standards of normal conduct. This reversion-impulse arises from the accumulation of residual sin to which they have been exposed. It demonstrates how embedded damage may occur via the manifestation of complicated wickedness. If they have abandoned malevolent environments, those environments are still imprinted upon their memories. These individuals may have been psychologically conditioned for deviant lifestyles in which traumatic or dehumanizing occurrences have been normalized. They carry psycho-spiritual baggage which will require unpacking for them to optimally flourish.

⁵⁷¹ Among these are Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder; Major Depressive Disorder; Numerous personality disorders; and Stockholm Syndrome. Minjung theologians would recognize this as *han* while western theologians may attribute these responses to the effects of original sin, or as the manifestation of corporate sins upon the sinned-against.

7-4 Practical Applications

7-4 a. The Mandate of Horizontal Faith (Redemptive Community)

The practice of Christianity embodies both a vertical and a horizontal aspect. The vertical corresponds to how believers relate to God. Those who seek after the Divine gaze vertically at the heavens in their attempts to know God or to appropriately acknowledge him. Activities such as worship, prayer, meditation and communion are all components of Vertical Faith. Although New Testament believers profess that God has been revealed in Christ Jesus, this recognition involves a struggle to imperfectly grasp a mystery persisting in Divinity. The Horizontal Faith aspect corresponds to how believers relate to other participants in a massive global community known as *the church*, which is to optimally function as a community among communities.⁵⁷² This expression of faith further corresponds to how believers generally relate to the world's citizens, whether they are considered to be spiritually equivalent.⁵⁷³ This construct is based upon what is known as the "Great Commandment." (Matthew 22:34-40). Christ was asked what the greatest commandment was, and he replied with a conjoined principle encouraging followers to extend wholehearted love towards God, demonstrating this by loving one's neighbors in equal proportion to the way one loves himself.

⁵⁷² Kirkpatrick, *Community: A Trinity of Models*, 227.

⁵⁷³ This cannot be authentically known in any event, as it belongs to the realm of God's omniscience. God alone is the final arbiter of which people are "his" and which are not. Some Christians ascribe to a "Bounded Set" mentality, as explained by missiologist Paul Hiebert, in which a distinct boundary defines who or what can be located within the parameters. While this is a rational and respected position within some branches of Christianity it still doesn't position onlookers to know with any certainty who resides within the boundary and who does not. Hiebert writes: "While the centred set does not place the primary focus on the boundary, there is a clear division between things moving in and those moving out. There is an excluded middle. An object either belongs to the set or it does not. However, the set focuses upon the centre and the boundary emerges when the centre and the relationships or movements of the objects have been defined. When the centre and relationships to the centre are stressed, the boundary automatically falls into place." If one takes a centred-set approach, she may focus upon momentum rather than upon a static boundary. While this does nothing to assist us in knowing whether they have become citizens of God's kingdom or not, it provides what I consider to be a more hopeful trajectory. Paul G Hiebert, "The Category 'Christian' in the Mission Task," *International Review of Mission* 72, no. 287 (July 1983): 423, [https://doi.org/10.1002/\(ISSN\)1758-6631](https://doi.org/10.1002/(ISSN)1758-6631).

Stanley Grenz explains how the horizontal expression of Christianity refers to churches of fellowshiping people. “(The Church) transcends spatial and temporal boundaries. We share a fundamental vertical commitment --loyalty Christ-- which shapes our very lives.”⁵⁷⁴ This forms a bond that transcends every other bond, he notes, and Christian community occurs at the point where the horizontal meets the vertical. The Holy Spirit constitutes the church, he writes, while Christ institutes it.⁵⁷⁵ It is sufficient for the trajectory of this study to establish that Vertical Faith indicates people connecting with God, and Horizontal Faith indicates people connecting with people for spiritual- or religious engagement.

If Vertical Christianity is faith focusing heavenward, characterized by worship and personal communication with God, and Horizontal Christianity emphasizes communion with God’s people, we may observe how emphasis on the Horizontal variety of faith involves *social* connections. Both of these are spiritual, integrating personal interactions with Deity and humanity, but God has designed the horizontal to be the vehicle carrying forth His mission.⁵⁷⁶ He has not designed people to live in isolation, but to maintain communion with one another and with creation.⁵⁷⁷

Citizens wishing to flourish according to Christian principles need to do so within community because Scripture provides no other alternatives. Believers are corporately considered to be people of a new covenant. They are privileged to participate in the

⁵⁷⁴ Grenz, *Created for Community*, 212.

⁵⁷⁵ Grenz, 213.

⁵⁷⁶ Lohfink, *Jesus and the Community*, 146.

⁵⁷⁷ Theologian Stanley Grenz makes the argument that community is God’s purpose for humanity in creation, drawing from various positions held throughout history. In a subsequent chapter, he makes the point that hell represents a failure to enter the community God has offered. Part of the penalty characterizing that failure is one of isolation. Because an individual failed to advantage herself of the fellowship with God and humanity that was freely offered, she becomes estranged and lonely, eternally separated from God and his people. Stanley J. Grenz, *Theology for the Community of God* (Nashville, TN: Broadman & Holman, 1994), 112–19, 643.

promises God has instituted.⁵⁷⁸ Or, as Dietrich Bonhoeffer stated, “Christian brotherhood is not an ideal which we must realize; it is rather a reality created by God in Christ in which we may participate.”⁵⁷⁹ Although isolated examples exist in the New Testament of individuals interacting with Christ or being “good news-ed” without the immediate participation of the community, these demonstrate the flexibility of the Christian faith to meet people at their points of need.⁵⁸⁰ Believers are never encouraged to continue in isolation, even if their journeys were initiated alone.

One key for CSE women to fully grasp when reintegrating is that they should consider the establishment of redemptive community (Horizontal Faith) as a mandatory component of their re-aligned lives. This must be more than a strong preference if they wish to remain free from addictions and previous exploitative networks. Paul Hiebert noted how “Religion as a system of explanation deals with the ultimate questions of the origin, purpose and destiny of the individual, a society and the universe. In the West the focus is on the individual; in the Old Testament it was on Israel as a society.”⁵⁸¹ Though the setting of the New Testament is a first-century collectivist culture in Palestine, American communities have been primarily Atomistic from the nation’s foundation. That is, the emphasis has focused upon the rights and desires of individuals rather than

⁵⁷⁸ Dykstra, *Growing in the Life of Faith*, 106.

⁵⁷⁹ From Dietrich Bonhoeffer, “A Visible Reality,” in *Called to Community: The Life Jesus Wants for His People*, ed. Charles E Moore (Walden, NY: Plough Publishing House, 2016), 96.

⁵⁸⁰ Nicodemus the Pharisee came to Jesus by night in John 3:1-3, the recording of which resulted in what is probably the most prominent New Testament passage in which Jesus speaks about salvation. As a Pharisee, he wished to discover God’s mandate for his life, but he also didn’t wish to risk the disfavor of his community at that early juncture in his spiritual pilgrimage. Even so, he was identified as a committed member of the early church by the conclusion of the Gospel, helping to prepare Christ’s body for burial (John 19:39). After Jesus’ resurrection, an Ethiopian Eunuch crossed paths with the disciple Phillip, heard the gospel and responded to it (Acts 8:26-40) on a desert road between Jerusalem and Gaza. Once again, though, he was not encouraged to remain in isolation. Phillip ministered to him, and the enlightenment of the Ethiopian was apparently the result. The Eunuch didn’t require the participation of a church body to respond to the Gospel. The ideal for him would have been that he join with a local body of believers in the region in which he resided, or to start one no such congregation existed.

⁵⁸¹ Paul G Hiebert, “The Flaw of the Excluded Middle,” *Missiology* 10, no. 1 (January 1982): 45.

upon the collective.⁵⁸² According to theologian Frank Kirkpatrick, Americans “...resonate far more sympathetically to an ideology of individualism than to one of socialism or corporatism.” Herbert Hoover was the first to popularly reference the belief in the “rugged individual,” expressing the sentiment that it will benefit all of society if Americans look out for their own interests.⁵⁸³ The subsequent individualization of American Christianity has critically affected the church. To take a concept that cannot exist outside of a corporate reality and redefine it for atomic use is to trivialize it. Emphasizing one’s individual interests in a church context is a non sequitur. Corporality is the engine driving the machine. If CSE respondents wish to follow Christocentric and biblical faith, they cannot view such faith as a menu from which they may choose their favorite emphases. Christian faith transpires in community, not in isolation. A church community must learn to do things together and to rely upon one another. It is not designed, as are some of the world’s great religions, to draw humanity inward, but rather to express its tenets outwardly and conspicuously. Church engagement is not simply a program of personal growth.

Horizontal Faith is beneficial even to those who are not transformed by the Gospel. Participation in an affirmative community is always an asset, as the web of relationships developed there may assist with reintegration in diverse ways. While numerous social groups, clubs and organizations cater to the needs of their constituents, a healthy church seeks to help those who are not currently participating.⁵⁸⁴ Bryant Myers notes how within churches, mosques, and temples reside valuable traditions without

⁵⁸² Kirkpatrick, *Community: A Trinity of Models*, 22–24.

⁵⁸³ Kirkpatrick, 37.

⁵⁸⁴ Evangelization is, among other things recruitment among those who are not yet involved in Christ’s activity, as Scott Jones explains here. As such, “...it must side with the poor, the marginalized, and the powerless in their struggle for liberation from the demonic powers of this world.” Scott J. Jones, *The Evangelistic Love of God and Neighbor: A Theology of Witness and Discipleship* (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2003), 28–29.

which human society cannot function. Repentance and forgiveness will be required in any community desiring sustainable change. “This is the work of the religious community,” he observes. “In spite of the uneven history of religions in terms of their contributions (or lack thereof) to human welfare, religious men and women concerned for the spiritual welfare of the community must play a role in the development of the community if it is to be transformational and sustainable.”⁵⁸⁵ He continues: “For Christians, this means surrendering a privileged place in the community and working alongside people who believe differently. This should not concern us. If our story is the true human story and if our God is the true God, then we need to become servants of all others and in faith believe that God is able to take care of God's self.”⁵⁸⁶

7-4 b. Addressing Han Issues Within Christian Communities

The intention here is to consider broadly how churches and individual Christians in North American can better assist CSE women who may be reintegrating into their own communities and participating in their churches. An ambitious but necessary goal is to begin assessing the doctrine of sin in more biblical and compassionate ways. Western theology has focused upon the justification of sinners, while neglecting the *responsibilities* sinners bear towards their victims. Christ-followers should consider whether the dominant moral framework regarding sinners and the sinned-against has been inadequate.⁵⁸⁷ Theologies should be windows into the mind of God. Most of the

⁵⁸⁵ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 198.

⁵⁸⁶ Myers, 198.

⁵⁸⁷ Marie Fortune responds affirmatively, noting that “An analysis of the dynamics of power and vulnerability is necessary to understand the experience of sin.” Part of her focus is on the overemphasis of sexual sin, which appears to be overstated and only marginally relevant to this conversation since none of the recovering CSE respondents interviewed for this project expressed resistance to conservative sexual ethics. The greater point she makes involves the disparity between graciousness extended to perpetrators while those who have been wounded are often stigmatized and left to resolve the evil done to them without adequate support. Marie M. Fortune, “The Conundrum of Sin, Sex, Violence, and Theodicy,” in *The Other Side of Sin: Woundedness from the Perspective of the Sinned-Against*, ed. Andrew Sung Park and Susan L. Nelson (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2001, 2001), 126, 124 respectively.

theologies used in the North American church were configured by educated males embedded in their institutions and religious traditions. This is not to imply any nefarious machinations, since one presumes leading thinkers will be educated and committed to their institutions. Those who theologize will inevitably possess blind spots, though, as do each of us. As theologian Theodore Jennings writes, this new theologizing

...must begin with an awareness of the way in which construction of doctrine has been in the hands of cultural elites who have often produced doctrinal formations that serve the interests of a religious institution in alliance with the dominant social forces of the world. In respect to a doctrine of sin we must be aware of the way in which the formulation of this doctrine has all too often been placed in the service of social control and the preservation of basic social arrangements instead of serving to indicate that reality that is now in the process of being fundamentally transformed.⁵⁸⁸

A genuinely redemptive approach, therefore, should be initiated particularly with the participation of marginalized groups—those who are recognized as having been sinned-against. Equipped with a new awareness of the need to address both the *han* of the wounded parties and the responsibilities of those who have engaged in heinous activities, in addition to considering the restitution owed to recipients of evil, those who minister must find improved methods of responding to the sinned-against and to convey these principles to their congregations. This new, robust hamartiology should be grounded in biblical scholarship with particular attention given to the principles of reconciliation and restitution for those who have historically been ignored.

Western theology has emphasized the justification of sinners, while focusing far less upon the *responsibilities* sinners retain regarding their victims. Protestants have been trained in the church to illuminate repentance towards God, while Catholics emphasize

⁵⁸⁸ Theodore W. Jennings Jr., “Reconstructing the Doctrine of Sin,” in *The Other Side of Sin: Woundedness from the Perspective of the Sinned-Against*, ed. Andrew Sung Park and Susan L. Nelson (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2001), 121.

penance that can be meaningful to some, but which characteristically maintains focus upon the penitent-- not upon the recipient of sin. Dialogue about the social dimensions of sin and repentance towards others has been scant, as Andrew Park notes.⁵⁸⁹ CSE women desiring to utilize Christian teaching in their rehabilitation and reintegration may become embittered if they are directed to zero in on their own sinfulness rather than hearing churches call for contrition and restitution from the parties responsible for their oppression.⁵⁹⁰ A fresh emphasis upon treating the residual effects of sin must be addressed in a renewed hamartiological emphasis—one that does not rush to absolve the wrongdoer, but that rather promotes restitution as integral to that process. Theodore Jennings observes that the Pharisees in Jesus' era marginalized those outside the community to whom they referred as "sinners." The attitude that sin is *only* against YHWH, without regard to how it affects humans, is like the verticalization that Americans apply to their faith today.⁵⁹¹ The first century Pharisees overemphasized the vertical, enabling them to offer penance in the form of sacrifices involving no interaction with the violated individuals. The violation of the neighbor is then atoned for by virtue of one's relationship to the religious establishment eager to dispense this forgiveness without requiring the inconvenience of dealing directly with those one has wronged, Jennings observes.⁵⁹² Emphasizing an offender-centered view of sin ends up serving the interests of those maintaining the power structures.⁵⁹³ This may shed some light upon American reluctance to commit to church families, or why North American spirituality is often expressed in adherents being "spiritual but not religious." If one verticalizes the faith, then she may interact with God in isolation without having to submit to

⁵⁸⁹ Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 89.

⁵⁹⁰ Park, 11.

⁵⁹¹ Jennings Jr., "Reconstructing the Doctrine of Sin," 112.

⁵⁹² Jennings Jr., 112.

⁵⁹³ Jennings Jr., 116.

accountability. It is an appealing concept for those who believe God's will should be a priority in their lives, yet still wish to practice complete autonomy.

A focus upon justice for the sinned-against should be one emphasis of a reimagined hamartiology. The other new area of emphasis should be the role of corporate sin in the lives of marginalized peoples. Discussions of corporate responsibility for communal sin patterns may be frustrating for American Christians who have primarily come to maturity hearing messages of individual responsibility from their pulpits. In discussions of corporate sins, the reactions may be dismissive, with church members believing they are not responsible for corporate misbehaviors, leading to a quick exoneration from personal responsibility. Logically, though, most Americans are members of numerous corporate bodies. Christ-followers attend churches affiliated with denominations. They work for employers, some of which are large and influential. Their children go to schools, in which parents are also employed. Most are citizens of local, state and federal governments, thus possessing great capacities to influence those structures.

Ron Sider notes how biblical repentance involves the forsaking of *all* sins, including social and corporate ones: "The tragedy of so much modern evangelism is that it has operated with a biblically inadequate view of sin, seeing only the personal side. Consequently, it also operated with a biblically inadequate understanding of repentance and conversion focused only on turning from personal sins and restoring the vertical relationship with God."⁵⁹⁴ When people singularly focus on the personal rather than upon the corporate, they become ideologically self-centered which affects how they deal with wrongdoing. While they are willing to admit wrongdoing to God—and only to God,

⁵⁹⁴ Ronald J. Sider, *One-Sided Christianity? Uniting the Church to Heal a Lost and Broken World* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1993), 105.

at least in the evangelical tradition of which Sider speaks—they may still retain a hands-off approach regarding the assessment of corporate responsibility.

Bryant Myers believes the nature of poverty to be fundamentally relational and its cause to be fundamentally spiritual. A relational problem is a corporate one. It involves the activities of numerous people gathered in community. When sin happens, therefore, it also occurs communally. He notes, “If the most fundamental cause of poverty is the impact of sin, then dealing with sin must be part of any Christian process of change.”⁵⁹⁵ “While we must deal with the individual nature of this sin, we must also address its consequences as expressed in relationships that are based on a web of lies and that promote disempowerment of the poor and domination by the non-poor.”⁵⁹⁶ The concept of repentance is captured in some passages by the Greek word *metanoia*, which can be translated as “to change one’s mind.” This is a key concept in Protestant and Roman Catholic theology signifying reconciliation with God. Often, though, these churches only emphasize a psychological “turning,” which sometimes undermines contrition and penance on the part of the penitent.⁵⁹⁷ *Metanoia* must involve the sinners’ participation in the transformation of an unjust world order.⁵⁹⁸ The emphasis on “forgive me my trespasses” has been the focal point of humankind’s relationship to God in the western church. Restitution, where an offender offers remuneration, has been largely absent from church tradition in recent years.⁵⁹⁹ But Jesus also emphasized that this should occur “...as we forgive our debtors” (Matthew 6:12), encompassing the concept of reciprocity. A mere psychological turning is not sufficient to address the evils some have committed, especially if these resulted in *han* for others.

⁵⁹⁵ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 15.

⁵⁹⁶ Myers, 186–87.

⁵⁹⁷ Park and Nelson, *The Other Side of Sin*, 89.

⁵⁹⁸ Park and Nelson, 90.

⁵⁹⁹ Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 91.

Finally, a reconceived *hamartiology* should not neglect the truth that although the sinned-against have been victimized, they are also sinners themselves in need of repentance. This emphasis may occupy a slightly lower priority than in past iterations, but its truth must endure. When approaching the *han*-laden CSE women concerning unjust economic and political structures that injured them it is important to acknowledge that they are *victims*. This helps believers to empathize with their oppression. Those who theologize must also remember that victims are sinners as well, in need of a common redemption. Concerns of sinned-against individuals and their oppressors should receive more immediate priority than improving social structures, recognizing that sin is more complex than societal evil.⁶⁰⁰ Andrew Sung Park does not seem to address the full reality of this as he focuses upon the neglected segments of the population. Both Sider and Myers, though, recognize the evils of corporate sin and the dilemmas of those who have been marginalized, while retaining traditional beliefs that humanity is shared by all, and therefore the capacity to err is also shared. We can criticize oppressors in a manner that denies *their* humanity, limiting the grace of God.⁶⁰¹ We can also marginalize the humanity of the sinned-against by ignoring the reality that their personal sins need to be addressed, even if they were exacerbated by unrepentant oppressors. Neither of these emphases in isolation reflects the holistic truth of the Gospel or fully respects the spark of divinity God has placed in all his creation. All have sinned and fallen short of the glory of God, and likewise all share common opportunities to offer repentance, restitution and to submit to his transforming power.

⁶⁰⁰ Sider, *One-Sided Christianity?* 153.

⁶⁰¹ Sider, 153.

7-5 For Further Consideration

This study has suggested other under-researched phenomena, the data from which may help to clarify unknown factors and to expand some of the insights presented here. The following hold particular significance for better understanding the obstacles and assets of those identified in this study, or those from related demographic groups:

7-5 a. The components constituting spiritual transformation for CSE women.

Although many respondents mentioned occurrences of religio-spiritual phenomena, the mechanics of these were not revealed. Research in this area may explore their experiences in spiritual transformation and ascertain whether respondents were speaking of common experiences, or if significant disparities occur within their experiences. This could be compared with studies of other demographic groups to determine the nature of the reported transformations and whether these were solitary experiences or whether they always involved enduring components.

7-5 b. How manifestations of *han* in CSE women compare to those of other marginalized populations. Just as sin is a multi-faceted phenomenon, so is *han*. Andrew Park describes it as having conscious and unconscious attributes, as possessing a corporate element, and a biological component.⁶⁰² How it is acquired might involve a qualitative nature/nurture examination. It stands to reason, then, that the individual manifestation of different marginalized groups might report the presence of common traits specific to the group's concerns, perhaps significantly deviating from one another.

7-5 c. Principles Christocentric rehabilitational programs employ that could be adaptable to secular organizations to improve flourishing. The existence of numerous rehabilitational organizations facilitating CSE women is not difficult to comprehend since

⁶⁰² Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 36–42, 36–38, 80, respectively.

biblical admonitions to care for marginalized people are clearly stated. It is uncertain how many of these sheltering organizations are operational contrasted with non-religious organizations trying to accomplish similar ends, but the Christocentric groups are well represented. The two groups share many goals, and some of the Christian groups have gained great expertise in keeping their clients from returning to old networks. It would be helpful to compare the two groups to see if there are principles the Christocentric groups are using that would also keep the women enrolled in non-religious programs from returning to exploitative lifestyles.

7-5 d. Steps Christocentric rehabilitational facilities can take to improve and better monitor aftercare for graduates of their Programs. One correlation made clear by administrators interviewed for this project was that the women who maintained ties with former Programs retained higher flourishing scores than former clients who slipped under the radar. Interviews with the CSE respondents themselves revealed that those who failed to remain connected demonstrated lower overall flourishing patterns (both Developmentally and Spiritually) than those who maintained ties. The organizations, however, varied significantly in how successful they were at post-Program connectivity. It is therefore critical that the organizations offering rehabilitational Programs strengthen their Aftercare efforts. Discovering the best means of doing this is vital to the reintegration of clients and for optimal success of the Programs.

7-5 e. Efforts churches are making to provide intentional community focused upon women who abandon CSE networks. Discussions of churches reaching out specifically to this population has been completely anecdotal in my research but referenced in the interviews. Literature that spoke of radical outreach to similar populations contained no specifics related to the demographic upon which this study

focused.⁶⁰³ Although this researcher failed to find any literature addressing church-based initiatives of this type, my conversations with the respondents indicated that some churches seemed to be initiating acceptable efforts at making CSE women feel included and accepted. If North American churches presently doing this can be identified and analyzed, they may be able to offer some models for others to follow, optimizing the prospects of holistic flourishing for this population.

7-5 f. Exploring the relationship between the identities of respondents, how they are perceived in their new communities, and the new roles they adopt. Galatians 3:28 states “There is neither Jew nor Greek, there is neither slave nor free, there is no male and female, for you are all one in Christ Jesus.” Although this is a theological reality, it does not automatically influence what is practiced within communities. None of the respondents complained of feeling marginalized *after* they had settled into communities, although at least two of them expressed fears and perceptions of being judged by community members early in the reintegration process. Another remarked on how “I was just a woman studying the Bible among other women... I wasn’t this ‘industry survivor’ there.” Those closest to the respondents were aware of their identification in past networks, but these narratives may not have been known outside their immediate circles, depending upon their individual communities. The data collected for this project did not address the receptivity of others towards the respondents and this could therefore constitute the basis for further research.

⁶⁰³ Frost and Hirsch, *Shaping of Things to Come*; Hunter, *Radical Outreach*.

Appendices

Appendix 2-1: Explanation Letter and Consent to Participate (Administrator)

Project: Imago Dei Interrupted: Christocentric Measures to Reintegrate American Women Who Have Survived Commercial Sexual Exploitation into New Communities

You are invited to participate in a research study being initiated by **Ph.D. candidate Timothy P. Robbins** from the Asbury Theological Seminary. Candidates who participate will be those professionals who has worked with women who have been commercially sexually abused. You may participate if you have been an administrator, counselor or any kind of caregiver to women who have survived these circumstances. In addition to that, participation requires that you have observed two or more of these women attempting to become reintegrated into communities. If you are selected it is because you possess extensive first-hand knowledge of this subject matter. Your insights will help form the foundation of this study. If you are familiar with the subject matter and you are willing to and able to fulfill the requirements listed below, your participation is desired.

If you agree to participate, you will be asked to sit for **one interview** of about two hours' duration. This will occur during business hours in the Winter of 2019 (tentatively January or February) and the researcher will travel to your place of business for that purpose. If you live near Lexington, Kentucky, you may choose to come to my office at 629 Broadway during business hours. If you live more than 500 miles from Lexington, we will conduct the interview via a secure phone call or video conference call or if you prefer the latter option for any other reason, you may choose to do a video interview instead of a face-to-face meeting. There is no cost to you to participate, and no compensation for your participation will be offered.

You will be e-mailed the list of open-ended questions to be used in the interview at least seven days before the interview. You will be invited to choose a pseudonym for the project, which will be used in the final published study. The pseudonym will be kept on a flash drive, separate from my other files. It will not be accessible to other parties. If you express no preference for a pseudonym, one will be assigned to you. The interviews will be recorded on my notebook computer unless you object. If you are uncomfortable with the making a voice recording by the interviewer, I will instead take comprehensive notes of the session. The recordings will be kept secure in a password protected notebook that only I have access to. Within a year after the study is published, the interview tapes will be commercially destroyed.

Secondly, you will be asked to be available for follow-up questions, or to clarify questions from the interview either by phone or by secure email. This will take no more than an additional thirty to sixty minutes and will be done at your convenience. I will only contact you for follow-up insights for up to fifty days following the interview.

Finally, you will also be invited to ask women who have previously been in your care if they would like to participate in interviews later in the year (Spring or Summer 2019). I will not contact these women directly, but I will allow them to contact me after you have provided them with my contact information. As with the rest of the study, you may choose not to participate in this phase for any reason and at any time up to the week before the study is published.

Your participation in this study is strictly voluntary. You are always welcome to refuse to answer any or all questions. If you wish to withdraw your participation at any time for any reason your request will be granted. You may also choose to withdraw your responses from use in the study at any time up to a week before it is published.

Your family may be aware that you are being interviewed for the study if you inform them. If anyone else is given information about your role as a caregiver or about remarks you have made your name will not be known to them.

If anything makes you feel uncomfortable in any way while you are in the study, please inform my faculty advisor, Dr. W. Jay Moon, who can be reached at jay.moon@asburyseminary.edu. If you have any questions about this study please contact me, **Timothy P. Robbins**. You can also call me with questions at (814) 771-4626 or email at tim.robbins@asburyseminary.edu

Signing this paper means that you have read this or had it read to you, and that you want to participate in the study. If you do not want to participate, please do not sign the paper. Participation is your choice, and no offense or legal action will be taken if you don't sign this paper or if you change your mind later. You agree here that you have been told about this study, why it is being undertaken, and what your prospective role will be.

I hereby grant and assign to the Researcher all future rights to develop, produce, distribute, or promote the study in any manner that he considers appropriate. I understand and acknowledge that the Researcher will possess sole authorship to the published work.

Agreed and confirmed:

Signature

and Today's Date Name, Printed

Agency/Organization

Appendix 2-2: Explanation Letter and Consent to Participate (Respondent)

Dear Potential Participant:

I am a Doctor of Philosophy candidate at Asbury Theological Seminary and I am doing research on adult women who have been trafficked and later completed a Christian healing program and then have gotten on with their lives. The reason you are being contacted is because an organization where you did a program believes that you might have had all these experiences, and that you might want to participate.

If this is you, I would love for you to be involved. The main thing I want to know is how you're doing in your new life—although I will have a number of specific questions about different areas of your life (such as your supports, relationships, faith-life, education, job and so forth). My hope is that this information about how you are adjusting after having completed your program will help other organizations in the future to make their programs better. That could go a long way in helping other women to have the best possible experiences adjusting to their new lives.

I will do everything possible to make sure this information doesn't get into anybody else's hands. So I will use a made-up name for you in any published studies where I use things we've talked about. I believe this research might one day help Christian agencies who want to minister to other women who have been trafficked or paid for sex work.

There will be two parts to this study, both of which will happen this summer. In Part One, I will ask you to fill out a life-history questionnaire. You may write out your responses on a Word document like in a journal, or speak them into a recording device I will provide for you. The second part will be a personal interview about how you're adjusting to life. The questionnaire should take up to two hours to fill out, and the interviews should take a little less than two hours. The interview will take place in your area in a place where you feel safe.

Your family will know that you are in the study if you tell them about it, as well as your sponsoring organization. A false name will be used instead of your actual name, and the name of your organization will not be revealed in the study, either.

An audio recording of the interview will be made, and no one will be allowed to hear these except my assistant. Tapes of the interviews will be destroyed within two years of the study's publication. I will keep all conversations private to the best of my ability. I will keep all interviews locked and password-protected. However, the absolute privacy of materials used for this study cannot be guaranteed.

You will be given the questions ahead of time, and you can look them over before you start. Also, if you wish to participate but decide to pass on answering any question at any time that's also okay. Your participation in the study will be entirely voluntary, and you can drop out at any time without penalty.

The value of the gift cards will be as follows:

Phase One: Individual questionnaire: \$50.00

Phase Two: Personal Interview: \$50.00

If anything makes you feel uncomfortable in any way while you are in the study, you may inform my faculty advisor, Dr. W. Jay Moon, who can be reached at jay.moon@asburyseminary.edu. If you have any questions about this study please contact me, **Timothy P. Robbins**. You can call me with questions at (859) 457-3995 or email at tim.robbins@asburyseminary.edu

If you are willing to help with this study, please sign and date the enclosed consent form to state that you are a volunteer. Signing this paper means that you have read this or had it read to you, and that you want to participate in the study. If you do not want to take part, please do not sign the paper. Participation is your choice, and no offense or legal action will be taken if you don't sign this paper or if you change your mind later. You are agreeing here that you have been told about this study, why it is being done, and what your role will potentially be.

Feel free to call or write me at any time if you need more information. My number is (859) 457-3995 and my e-mail address is: tim.robbins@asburyseminary.edu. Thank you so much for your time!

Timothy P. Robbins

Rev. Timothy P. Robbins
 Principal Investigator
 Asbury Seminary, Wilmore, Kentucky
 (859) 457-3995 (call or text)
 Tim.robbins@asburyseminary.edu

I hereby grant and assign to the Researcher permission to use information from interviews in future presentations and publications. By signing below, I indicate that I am agreeing to participate in the study described above. I understand that I may drop out of the study any time, for any reason, without any penalty.

I volunteer to participate in **Phase One** (Initial questionnaire)

Your signature: _____

Date: _____

I volunteer to participate in **Phase Two** (Personal Interview).

Your signature: _____

Date: _____

Is it OK for the researcher to contact you for clarification on questions that are unclear to me?

_____ Yes

_____ No

If yes, the way I'd like you to use in contacting me is by

_____ A phone call

_____ E-Mail

_____ Other (Specify)

Appendix 2-3

Guiding Questions for Phase I Interviews with Administrators and Caregivers

1. What motivated you to become involved in this ministry? How long have you been observing women attempting to reintegrate into communities?
2. How would you describe a successful reintegration experience for a woman who has been CSE and then embraced Christian spirituality as an integral part of her becoming established into the community?
3. What criteria do you use to assess if a woman is successful, or flourishing, in community?
4. What is your overall perception of the success rate of the women you have known who leave CSE, go through a rehab like that offered at the Refuge, and then settle into communities?
5. Among this population, have you noticed any patterns or trends that have consistently been present in women who make a *successful* reintegration journeys into communities?
6. What are the patterns or trends you have observed that consistently *interfere* with the survivor's ability to successfully reintegrate into community?
7. According to your observations, what factors constitute the differences between the lives of Christian women reintegrating who remain consistent in their pursuit of Christ and his teachings, and those who don't?
8. (For those who were also in "The Life" before ministering to other women exiting and reintegrating): What were the main factors that led to *your* successful reintegration? Who were the people most critical in enabling you to become established as a Christ-follower in your community? What systems, programs or other factors were most helpful to you in accomplishing this?
9. What have you observed to be the chief obstacles that have kept the women you have worked with from establishing healthy lifestyles? What obstacles have kept them from following Christ?
10. What would be the best themes to discuss with CSE survivors concerning the roadblocks which hinder them from successful reintegration?
11. What open-ended questions would you ask the survivors about their reintegration experiences that would lead to the most honest disclosure about the barriers to establishing the kind of lives in community to which they are trying to attain? Is there anything else I may be missing here? That is to say, anything that's significant in the reintegration journeys of survivors that I need to know which hasn't been addressed here?

Please feel free to contact me with any other insights about these things that come to you in the coming weeks that would give me a fuller picture of the difficulties these survivors face in their spiritual journeys and in their reintegration experiences.)

Appendix 2-4

I. Written/Dictated Questionnaire for Survivors (No Interviewer present)

Modified after interviews with Administrators and Caregivers

You may write out your answers or narrate them into a voice recorder according to your preference.

1. Please tell me your age, a few sentences to describe your spiritual life and how long have held your current spiritual beliefs. You may include any information at all to help me understand your spiritual identity.
2. Please narrate a brief history of your life from childhood to the time you were trafficked or brought into “The Life”. In your own words:
 - a. Talk about the region you grew up in. Was it urban, suburban, rural—something else? What was the financial situation at home? What kind of home life did you have? How safe did you feel in your home during your childhood through high school?
 - b. Talk about the roles of parents and other authoritative adults while growing up. Did you have biological parents, stepparents, or other people raising you? Were there live-in’s, other relatives or authoritative parental figures involved in raising you? If you were ever removed from the home, placed in foster care or something similar, describe those experiences. How did you adapt?
 - c. Tell me about your exposure to Christianity, religion or spirituality while growing up. For example, were you taken to church, and what (if any) consistent Christian principles were being practiced in your household? Describe the quality of the household faith—in your own words, did it seem sincere, loving, indifferent, hypocritical, oppressive, or something else, etc.? (This is subjective, but I’m interested in your perceptions).
 - d. How were you personally involved in Christianity or in the church when you were growing up? In what way were you involved, if at all? (For example, did you attend Sunday school, church services, youth groups, attend mission trips or retreats? Did you personally practice spiritual habits such as prayer and Bible study?) Describe how long you practiced these things, and how meaningful they were to you, if at all.
3. Please briefly describe your general impressions regarding the primary male role models in your life growing up (*Father, stepfather, mom’s boyfriend, brother, grandfather, or other prominent men in your early life*). How did these men influence or affect your life—either positively or negatively? Please state any impressions you had about them that seem important to you.
4. Please provide a narrative in your own words of how you were trafficked or initiated into “The Life”. Describe *in your own words* the circumstances that resulted in your being used that way. What were the reasons why you were brought into that life as far as you understand them, and how long did it go on for?
5. What would you like me or anybody who has NOT experienced these things to know about being in The Life?
6. What things led up to your decision to enroll in a healing or rehabilitative program? How important was it to you (*if it was important at all*) that the program you enrolled in incorporated elements of the Christian faith or of spirituality?

7. The purpose of this study is *not* to focus upon what happened to you in the past, but on how you are adjusting today. With that understanding, what do you think are the current areas of your life that are **the most important to discuss** regarding your adjustment period? In other words, what would a researcher really need to grasp in order to most fully understand and evaluate how your life is developing today?
8. Tell me about the accomplishments you are most proud of since leaving the program, or about the things that bring you the most joy.
9. Tell me a little bit about the most difficult areas of adjustment in your life at this time.
10. What do you think have been the primary things interfering with *other women* you have known who have tried to get out of the Life?
11. What do you think a researcher is most likely to overlook in trying to understand the journeys of women like you who are trying to establish new lives in their communities?

Approved Questions for Face-to-Face Interviews June 2019.

II. Questions for Face-to-Face Interviews (With Interviewer and Psychologist present)

Modified after interviews with Administrators and Caregivers

1. If you were to wake up tomorrow and everything was exactly as it should be, what would that look like?"
2. What is the hardest thing that you have had to deal with since leaving the program?
3. Share some of the roadblocks or some struggles you've encountered in your recovery.
4. Tell me a little about your community supports—for example, where are the supportive people in your life from? What places do you go to for support, and how often do you find yourself going to these supportive places?
5. What is something you felt like you needed in order to settle into community living-- or something that you lacked?
6. What was your identity like in the past, and how has that changed today?
7. Tell me what *services* have been most helpful to you, and about other services that were more difficult to figure out and to deal with. What have you been unable to access that would have been helpful to you?
8. Where are you *at* with your triggers and your anxieties? If you attend counseling, describe how that is *going* for you.
9. Who are you spending the most time with? What criteria do you use to distinguish good influences from negative ones?
10. Tell me about the things that currently influence your career or your ability to earn a living.
11. What are the most positive things in your life today, and how do they influence your progress?
12. Tell me about the role of education in your life, and how that affects what you want to accomplish in life.
13. In what ways, if any, do you feel like your community is *keeping you* from reintegrating?

14. What do you wish the people who run the recovery program that you graduated from knew about you?
15. What would you have hoped that I might have asked that I didn't ask?
16. What do you think the future holds for you?

Appendix 2-5: Developmental Index for Flourishing

The following are the variables of the index based upon principles from *Walking with the Poor*.⁶⁰⁴

1. No Harm

One of the first principles caregivers in many professions absorb is to not make a situation worse due to their participation. Similarly, the principle of “No harm being done” to the impoverished is part of the foundation of Myers’ framework for transformation.⁶⁰⁵ Whether women who have been CSE and then have completed Christocentric Programs of rehabilitation are emerging from physical poverty is less important than ascertaining that abusive or exploitative structures are not overtaking them when they transition. Those experiencing physical poverty may be exploited by unjust wage structures, unscrupulous landlords or mortgage companies, violence and theft. Similarly, women who reintegrate after completing their programs are confronted with

⁶⁰⁴ I found two other principles from *Walking with the Poor* to not be quantifiable, and therefore did not attempt to measure these in the index. 1) A bias towards peace should be expressed: The principle of establishing *shalom* is a significant distinction used by Myers throughout *Walking with the Poor*. As with the entire framework, it was introduced as an affirmation to practitioners that they must include this in their developmental planning. As a variable that could be observed in the remarks about the lived experiences of CSE women, however, it falls short. The approved questions used in this project did not lead to conversations which shed significant light on the topic. However, the *shalom* principle emerged in their remarks regarding networks and relationships; As a stand-alone variable, it does not appear that any new ground could be established or warranted here. 2) Seeking beauty, art and celebration: This category was not included in Myers’ first edition of *Walking with the Poor* but was added in the revised 2011 edition. The set of questions I asked respondents and our subsequent discussions neglected to engage this variable in a meaningful and quantifiable way. While a few of the respondents addressed this in open-ended questions about their identities, their futures, and the “Information I might have missed” question, the majority did not.

⁶⁰⁵ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 202.

temptations and exploitative situations which may result in returning to former harmful networks or which may introduce new threats to their abilities to flourish.

The respondents revealed the situations they have been confronted with in their reintegration journeys and their thoughts about unhealthy circumstances that emerged. Similar to an impoverished population, the most harmful scenarios could involve violence and crime. Substance abuse and sexual exploitation are also ongoing threats. Respondents who stated they had returned to exploitative networks or addiction were given low scores in this area.⁶⁰⁶ Those who divulged they had begun descending into abuse but overcame their circumstances were given mid-range grades, and those who had maintained their sobriety and remained free from abusive, exploitative or coercive situations were considered high flourishers in this category.

2. Recovering true identity and vocation

Vocation refers to more than merely the job or career they are currently engaged in. One's vocation is aligned with a higher calling in life which they have responded to. While some are engaged in their "ideal" careers, others are working a "job for now" while attending college classes and trying to discern where they will best fit into the marketplace. Some may not be able to work due to disabilities, but these should demonstrate that they are involved in meaningful activity or finding purpose in volunteering or giving back to the community in tangible ways.

One of the most noteworthy insights for the purposes of this study is that the poor are characterized by *marred identities and a degraded vocation*. Bryant Myers notes how the poor are often regarded as "damaged goods."⁶⁰⁷ In the East, their misfortune may be attributed to karma or caste. In Western cultures the prevalent expectation is that if

⁶⁰⁶ Indicated by a score of either 1 or 2, depending upon particular information, such as whether this is an ongoing concern.

⁶⁰⁷ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 127.

individuals are industrious and adhere to societal rules they won't be subjected to living in poverty. Likewise, CSE women have been characterized as those who either can't or won't earn their wages legitimately.⁶⁰⁸ An unspoken expectation prevails that if they were more industrious people who followed the rules they wouldn't be living in poverty. Shame is more than an emotion that can be simply brushed aside; It affects entire communities and often remains for generations.

Respondents were generally able to look at their old identities and compare them to the persons they have become today. CSE women who have successfully been redeemed are able to state this decisively. If they were unable to distinguish between the old identity and the new or failed to recognize renewed perspectives on identity and vocation, they were given low scores. According to Myers they should become adept at rereading their own histories and viewing themselves as rehabilitated characters in a new drama.⁶⁰⁹

3. Affirming the role of God

Myers writes

Transformation takes place because God wants change and is enabling change. At the end of the day, any transformation, justice, and peace will be because God has made it so. We are not the authors of change. It is the action of God, the triune God—of God the Father who is ceaselessly at work in all creation and in the hearts and minds of all human beings whether they acknowledge him or not, graciously guiding history toward its true end; of God the Son who has become part of this created history in the incarnation; and of God the *Holy Spirit who is given as a foretaste of the end to empower and teach the church and to convict the world of sin and righteousness and judgment.*⁶¹⁰

⁶⁰⁸ Wilson and Butler, "Running a Gauntlet," 500.

⁶⁰⁹ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 180.

⁶¹⁰ Myers, 184.

Respondents earned high scores if their interviews and questionnaires revealed confidence in God's leadership and the desire to see his purposes fulfilled. Question 2 (c and d) from the questionnaire involved their exposure and subsequent responses to Christianity growing up, but I had no dedicated question regarding their faith in either interview. I derived their responses not so much from their religious lives, but from how their faith was exposed or obscured in the other affairs of their lives. If God's desires were important to them, this was revealed when speaking about vocation, self-image, habits and support networks.

4. Affirming the agency of human beings

Humans must be committed to development, Myers notes. God gives us all gifts and resources, however limited they might be. Therefore, recipients of developmental initiatives have very real choices to make:

Following God, we are actors in history. People must make the choice to seek transformation directed at what God intends and then invest themselves in making it happen. Thus, a Christian understanding of the process of change centers on the decisions and actions of human beings.⁶¹¹

When analyzing the discourse of the respondents I looked for statements indicating how the CSE women responded to independent agents interfering with their lives. The healthiest respondents recognized that people with destructive and self-centered motives had used them, also recognizing they were powerless to change old narratives. Secondly, their own roles in their narratives were considered along with how they currently navigate personal choices in light of the culpability they assign to those who no longer have power over them. While others may have coerced them negatively in the past, it is

⁶¹¹ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*.

equally important to demonstrate how their use of free agency today enables them to make redemptive decisions leading to flourishing.

Jamie is a good example of a respondent who felt the need to continually analyze how she is feeling about her new life, and the inherent danger of making poor choices at any juncture that might place her recovery in jeopardy. She admits to an ongoing attraction to “Bad Boys” stating her inclinations to choose one over a courteous, ethical man every time. She was beaten and pimped out by a man who had several other women in his “stable”; Yet she admits continuing to possess romantic feelings for him which she struggles to control whenever he contacts her:

...before too long, you know I look forward to the phone call. I look forward to the emails. I look forward to hearing his voice. And before you know what, I’m gonna start taking my paycheck and putting it towards a lawyer... And I know that he’s not getting out (of prison). But I know me. And that’s something that becomes an ambition to me-you know, to this day I still love him. And for me that’s hard. That’s my biggest struggle, I would have to say.

5. Maintaining just and peaceful relationships.

Myers speaks of “...a relational framework that links everyone to God, to themselves, to their community, to those who are ‘other,’ and to the environment.”⁶¹² Most people communicate regularly with at least a few other people, so a simple “maintenance of relationships” variable is insufficient. The web of relationships the respondents establish and maintain should overflow with supportive people. Like the impoverished population, CSE women have become accustomed to relationships with exploiters and those who would introduce both physical and emotional turmoil into their narratives. When they have completed a program of rehabilitation, they may still find

⁶¹² Myers, 180.

themselves conditioned to seek out individuals who don't have their best interests in mind.

Respondents spoke throughout their interviews about the significant people in their lives. One of the questions (#9: "*Who are you spending the most time with? What criteria do you use to distinguish good influences from negative ones?*") addressed this concern specifically, and many of their responses were based upon this question. The ones who talked about relationships they had established or maintained that kept them safe from exploitation earned high marks here. Others spoke frankly about men who continued to pull them into exploitative situations and about girlfriends who tried to coax them back into a life of "partying." Those who confessed to having yielded to exploitative people but who had subsequently weaned those people out of their lives by interview time scored in the mid-range. Consistent with Myers' writings, the respondents were assessed on the quality of relationships with those in the community, and the quality of relationships with self.⁶¹³

6. Seeking truth, justice and righteousness

"If the most fundamental cause of poverty is the impact of sin, then dealing with sin must be part of any Christian process of change" Myers notes.⁶¹⁴ For CSE women, their "poverty" centers upon the reality that they have been exploited and are trying to recover from these effects. Andrew Sung Park notes how recent church tradition focused on individuals seeking forgiveness for their sins. A fundamental element lacking in communities is grappling with the effects of sin upon the sinned against. The healing of the effects of being sinned-against have become the "property" of counseling and

⁶¹³Myers, 181.

⁶¹⁴ Myers, 186.

psychotherapy. There must be an open-ended process for engaging our offenses rather than simply moving from guilt to justification.⁶¹⁵

Among the truths acknowledged by respondents should be the recognition of their own contributions to their poverty.⁶¹⁶ Respondents must discover the truth about themselves, and their realities for themselves.⁶¹⁷ Miroslav Volf has observed that justice must involve the will to embrace truth and reality. He adds, "...there can be no genuine and lasting embrace without justice."⁶¹⁸ CSE women must seek justice not only for themselves but also for others with whom they come in to contact. Those who have been hurt often respond by hurting others; If evidence of this emerges in the respondents' remarks, they have been evaluated accordingly.

Finally, a healthy transition to community will demonstrate concern for ongoing righteousness. The post-CSE population should be committed to personal lives reflecting righteousness as well as demonstrating ongoing concern for righteousness within their communities. A developmentally *defective* reintegration will reveal the respondent's overwhelming concern with her own needs, unconcerned with the needs of similar citizens and of those in the community in general. Adequate development demonstrates that righteousness and justice remain ongoing concerns not only for themselves, but also for their neighbors.

7. Recognition of pervasive evil

The Christian faith presupposes belief in absolute evil, in a sweeping narrative that spans the earlier chapters of Genesis to the end of Revelation. The respondents have

⁶¹⁵ Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 91–92.

⁶¹⁶ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 186.

⁶¹⁷ Myers, 187.

⁶¹⁸ Miroslav Volf, *Exclusion and Embrace: A Theological Exploration of Identity, Otherness, and Reconciliation*, Revised and Updated (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2019), 216.

experienced many varieties of evil over the years. Some become desensitized to this, however, as a traumatic response. Non-Christian citizens use other names to describe pervasive evil. Myers writes how

...The prince of this world works actively against life and *shalom*. The liar works through the sin in human beings, encouraging bad choices by promoting a web of lies. The Evil One also works a campaign of deception and domination through the political, economic, social, and religious structures of the world by subverting them in the pursuit of their intended missions.⁶¹⁹

Developmental transformation requires participants to recognize evil forces in their lives. This is an active recognition: One that not only appropriately realizes that evil will continue to knock on their doors, and also that they must proactively oppose those impulses. Respondents earned high scores here not only if they could perceive that evil forces were trying to dominate them but also if they had demonstrated measures they had undertaken to avoid being pulled from its sway.

8. Addressing causes of having been CSE (spiritual, physical, mental, social)

This is appreciably modified from Myers' framework in which practitioners are encouraged to help impoverished individuals address *personal* and *community* issues contributing to their poverty. But his assessment that social- and human transformation cannot be entirely defined by local factors is retained here. "Every community is part of a family of social systems that are regional, national, and finally global," he writes.⁶²⁰

The same four realms should be confronted and addressed by CSE respondents. Many of them demonstrated excellence in explaining the social conditions that led to their exploitation and recognized when similar conditions seemed to be occurring in ways that might again coerce them into exploitative networks. They were negatively assessed

⁶¹⁹ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 186.

⁶²⁰ Myers, 188.

if their social networks began to welcome exploitative people, or if they neglected spiritual habits and supports that had proven beneficial in their rehabilitation, or if they neglected counseling and other positive emotional habits that had enhanced their flourishing levels. I examined what respondents had said about being lured into exploitation in the past and how they were succeeding or struggling with proactively addressing those areas today.

9. Affirming the role of the church

The developmental framework suggested by Myers' framework here is holistic and transformational. Although a supplemental "spiritual" index is also utilized to access the respondents, that doesn't imply that this index is a "secular" one. Spirituality is central to flourishing, and the women I interviewed had all attended and completed Christocentric programs, signifying their willingness to include spiritual principles into their rehabilitative programs. Healthy networks are among the most important variables for flourishing in community, and the church is the primary network for communal expression, participation and development.⁶²¹ "At the end of the day, the work of holistic mission belongs to the church, not to the development agency or development professional per se."⁶²²

Some of the respondents provided narratives concerning abuses or maltreatment in churches during childhood. Assessment of others' needs should not be unsympathetic or callous regarding historic realities. Myers also acknowledges the flaws and limitations of churches, anticipating the objections that will inevitably follow when he suggests the

⁶²¹ Other Christian organizations such as missional organizations may be even more significant in the lives of flourishing CSE survivors, as well as informal structures such as a non-sectarian women's Bible study or prayer group. While some might wish to make a distinction between "The Church" and para-church organizations, it could be argued that these are all expressions of the universal church. The important distinction is that they all exist as expressions of Christian support and solidarity.

⁶²² Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 192.

church's centrality in community development.⁶²³ Even so, the respondents consistently expressed how they had been exposed to some of the most selfless and caring individuals of their lives in the Programs. They were cared for, free of charge, by the collective expressions of compassionate Christian individuals. If, after rehabilitation, they failed to affirm the church's role in their narratives and expressed their aversion to participate in networks of supportive believers they were graded accordingly. Enthusiastic engagement in church life resulted in higher scores here.

10. Addressing sustainability (Spiritual, physical, mental, social)

A holistic index for flourishing would not be complete without addressing this component. While the respondents typically invested a year of their lives to their formal rehabilitations, they can reasonably expect to invest several decades to living in non-exploitative communities. The Programs either initiated or taught them numerous skills to help navigate their reintegration journeys. Some of the Programs provided outright advantages which many other marginalized demographics in society aren't afforded, such as automobiles, internships and subsidized housing. The intentions of Program administrators, though, was not to manage and direct their post-program lives. The women's remarks here were evaluated for evidence that they were consciously making long-term plans rather than simply being driven by hunches and happenstance.

Along those lines, Myers notes that firstly it can be established that even the poorest community already has some level of sustainability. If the communities in his case studies were not sustainable before development agencies arrived, he goes on to say, the communities would not exist.⁶²⁴ Secondly, it must be recognized that the transformation process does not belong to the developmental practitioners, nor even to

⁶²³ Myers, 77–78.

⁶²⁴ Myers, 193.

the respondents for they will never have complete control.⁶²⁵ Human and divine elements may interact and interfere. As has been stated throughout the examination of this framework, the CSE respondents must continually plan for better futures that address their physical, spiritual, mental and social vitality.

Appendix 2-6: Spiritual Index for Flourishing

The evaluative categories are listed below followed by brief descriptions of their bases for inclusion here using principles based upon clauses found in the Lord's Prayer and reinforced by other Christian spiritual literature.⁶²⁶

1. Fellowship with Believers: Participation in communal association with others

The respondent's narrative demonstrated that she was pursuing spiritual relationships with other like-minded people. This need not have occurred within an organized entity that called itself a "church." It also encompasses small groups, individual friendships, mentoring relationships and active participation in the lives of other people pursuing spiritual goals.

⁶²⁵ Myers, 193.

⁶²⁶ Two other categories were suggested from the Lord's Prayer that I did not find to be quantifiable. A **ninth category** was based upon recognition of God's sovereignty: His kingdom, power and glory. Evaluating respondents on "Inviting God's participation in life (Kingdom come, will be done)" was considered. After examination of the data this variable did not appear to be quantifiable. The interviewer was not able to observe the respondents' lives over an extended period as would have been accomplished in an ethnography. We have records of the respondents' words, which include descriptions of their behavior. Notwithstanding, these don't appear to be adequate to measure the quality of their worship or how "welcoming" they might be to Christ's influences in their lives, aside from the remarks considered in the other eight categories.

A **tenth variable** was suggested relating to the beginning of the Prayer. "May your name be held in awe" is commonly recognized as "Hallowed be your name." The concept of deferring to God's reign by recognizing his sovereignty is a requirement for one who is going to be a follower after God. Jesus stated that the law and the prophets can all be summarized in the First Commandment of the Pentateuch, "Love the Lord God with all your heart, soul, mind and strength." Even so, asking the respondents if they *loved* God, or what their levels of passion consisted of would have yielded unreliable data. Expressions of piety would be wholly insufficient in weighing their devotion. Their attitudes concerning God's sovereignty are more accurately captured in other variables noted here than if they had been queried on their reverence towards God, or how devoted they were. The germane responses to this variable were reflected in their descriptions of lifestyle adjustments they had made to accommodate authentic faith.

This theme is consistently found in other forms throughout Scripture.

Prominently in the New Testament, theologians have often utilized the Hebrews 10:25 admonition to resist the forsaking of assembling together with other believers as a basis for establishing fellowship. But observing the example of New Testament believers, particularly in the Acts of the Apostles provides a broad perspective.⁶²⁷

Old Covenant believers are also admonished to not “Go it alone” but to rely upon others who are wiser and have successfully navigated similar situation before. An exemplary admonition can be found in Proverbs 15:22: “*Plans fail for lack of counsel, but with many advisers they succeed.*” Respondents have necessarily survived during ongoing stages of total dependency in the past. American individualistic impulses encourage them to trust their own feelings and strike out on their own. Healthy interdependency is required for them to flourish in community

The Lord’s Prayer begins with the admonition to petition “*Our* Father,” which is an expression of collective participation in the spiritual life. The plural pronoun indicates solidarity with other believers. This is maintained consistently throughout the prayer, an in the petitions to “Forgive us *our* trespasses” and “Keep *us* from the evil hour...”

2. Redeemed identity

Referring to God as “Father” indicates the respondent is acknowledging submission to a familial connection with him. Either she has experienced spiritual transformation, or she is currently acknowledging God’s authority in her affairs. Romans 12:2 indicates believers must be “Renewed by the transformation of your mind”.

⁶²⁷ This can be succinctly summarized in Acts 2:42, whereas in the first years of the Church it was noted that “They devoted themselves to the apostles’ teaching and to fellowship, to the breaking of bread and to prayer.”

At Solomon's colonnade, Peter admonished Israelites who wished to follow God's reign in their lives to "Repent therefore and be converted" (Acts 3:19). Repentance and conversion became the default responses to God's grace after Christ's resurrection. Rituals and sacrifices were de-emphasized in favor of submission to God and identification with other believers, whether Jew or Gentile. These emphases on grace, repentance, conversion and incorporation into a family with other believers became the standard practice of the New Testament church.

Other antecedents from the teachings of Christ can be found in John's Gospel 3:6-7 (wherein Jesus remarks to Nicodemus "Flesh gives birth to flesh, but the Spirit gives birth to spirit. You should not be surprised at my saying, 'You must be born again'") and in John 7:38 in which Jesus remarks, "Whoever believes in me, as Scripture has said, rivers of living water will flow from within them."

3. Engaged in outreach

This is based upon the clause "Your will be done, on earth as in heaven." A disciple is characterized by service to others. Whether or not respondents are *performing* the will of God cannot be definitively established. The value that *can* be measured, at least according to what is expressed in the interviews, is whether they are engaging in outreach to others.

The Apostle Paul wrote in Romans 12: 6-8: "Having then gifts differing according to the grace that is given to us, *let us use them*: if prophecy, *let us prophesy* in proportion to our faith; or ministry, *let us use it in our* ministering; he who teaches, in teaching; he

who exhorts, in exhortation; he who gives, with liberality; he who leads, with diligence; he who shows mercy, with cheerfulness.”

Another antecedent for this “Outreach” variable can be found in the final step of the Recovery Model of Alcoholics’ Anonymous. This twelfth step declares that those who have had a “spiritual awakening” ought to “carry this message to alcoholics.”⁶²⁸ It functions as a kind of an outreach mandate in the program. It is self-evident that not all CSE women are alcoholics. However, as recoverers it is important for those interested in the life of a Christian disciple to reach out to other recoverers. These might be other exploited women, or they could be located in completely different demographics. While this may not be *mandatory* in the healing process, doing so reveals *developing maturity*, and may prove to be the most satisfying aspect of a renewed existence in Christ. Giving back indicates that a person has healed sufficiently to focus upon others, demonstrating a high probability of flourishing potential within community.

4. Redemptive vocation

This is tied into both the petition for provision of physical necessities (Give us today our daily bread”) as well as a response to “Your will be done.” Evaluating specifically how well a person is accomplishing God’s will is difficult. Instead, I evaluated in their interviews the kinds of statements they made about their jobs, their vocations, and activities they were engaged in that benefitted other people.

The conversation with respondents revealed the kind of work in which they were engaged as well as the educational initiatives they employed, the volunteer work they had initiated, and the degree of satisfaction with their efforts they revealed. Vocation is broader than simply employment but narrower than the substance of their ambitions.

⁶²⁸ Anonymous, *Alcoholics Anonymous*, 60.

Their dreams and desires were factored into what they were currently accomplishing, but their current vocations cannot be based upon what they *wish* to do. If they were academically preparing for helping professions, or simply serving their churches in numerous ways, this indicates they were taking steps towards vocational development as believers.

A redemptive vocation doesn't have to be related to ministerial- or helping professions. If former CSE participants labor, it should be a non-exploitative activity that engenders dignity or satisfaction. If they do not work due to having become disabled, they should be engaged in meaningful activity. If they are going to school, this should correspond with something they are motivated to do in life, and they must learn to care for the needs of their children, if relevant, while they're taking classes.

Concerning the early church, Paul remarked, "Our people must learn to devote themselves to doing what is good, in order to provide for urgent needs and not live unproductive lives." (Titus 3:14). He spoke to the Roman church about how every member had different gifts to be utilized in God's service (Romans 12:6-8).

5. Embraces God's provision

Jesus admonished believers to request that God "Give us today our daily bread". In their narratives, respondents expressed how they have discovered the abilities to earn adequate salaries and to live on the wages they earned. They were also quick to volunteer their views regarding their degrees of contentment with the provision they had received. This variable incorporates the principle of resisting materialistic impulses.

It is no challenge to recognize that God has provided “Daily Bread” for each of the respondents.⁶²⁹ Integrated in their remarks about God’s provision, though, respondents offered transparent insights into their thoughts about the adequacy of what had been provided for them. This principle therefore incorporates their attitudes concerning materialistic values along with actual information about how much they were being financially remunerated. In I Timothy 6:6-9, Paul admonished his protégé that

...godliness with contentment is great gain. For we brought nothing into the world, and we can take nothing out of it. But if we have food and clothing, we will be content with that. Those who want to get rich fall into temptation and a trap and into many foolish and harmful desires that plunge people into ruin and destruction.

6. Resists immorality

This is based upon “Forgive us our debts/trespases” and “Don’t lead us into temptation”. For this variable, what respondents expressed regarding inappropriate, selfish or sinful behaviors and unhealthy attachments and temptations is examined. The goal was not to identify aberrant behavior patterns, but to use as evaluative tools their descriptions of actions they regretted or were ashamed of. The low flourishers here were transparent about doing things they said were “sinful,” and about resisting behaviors they knew to be consistent with relapse. This is not to say that they consistently told me the “worst” things they had done, since there was no parallel interview question reflecting those answers specifically. The things they disclosed during the self-interviews and face-to-face sessions revealed numerous illustrations of their daily activities as they related to ethical and toxic behavior.

⁶²⁹ None of the respondents complained of hunger or food insecurity. One of them reported that she was living out of her car and thus had no permanent residence. However, she associated her homeless status with opiate addiction, and she didn’t characterize herself as one who was trying to pursue the life of a Christian disciple.

Had I asked them if they were forgiving others and trying not trespass against others, I may have yielded contrived answers. It was more productive to simply allow them to express their own narratives by asking about their identities, their roadblocks, who they are currently spending the most time with and what criteria they use to distinguish good influences from negative ones. In the self-interview questionnaires, I asked them to describe some early childhood experiences to whatever degree they felt comfortable, and about how they ended up in commercially exploitative relationships. These topics gave me most of the criteria I used to assess their remarks regarding the resistance of immorality.

7. Separation from evil

Whereas resisting immorality is a defensive variable, separating oneself from evil is a proactive one. Both are mentioned in the Lord's Prayer, but this particular response to evil has to do with the CSE women deliberately establishing habits and relationships that would ideally keep them from relapse. Translations of this phrase in the Lukan and Matthean texts range from "Deliver us from evil" to "Deliver us from the evil one" to "Deliver us from the evil hour" as the Greek *tou ponerou* could be credibly rendered in each of those ways.

The Apostle Paul addresses engagement in a life of separation from previous entanglements in I Thessalonians 4:3-7:

It is God's will that you should be sanctified: that you should avoid sexual immorality; that each of you should learn to control your own body in a way that is holy and honorable, not in passionate lust like the pagans, who do not know God; and that in this matter no one should wrong or take advantage of a brother or sister. The Lord will punish all those who commit such sins, as we told you and warned you before. For God did not call us to be impure, but to live a holy life.

This principle relates to the catchphrase people in Twelve-step programs often recite: “Find new people, places and things.”⁶³⁰ CSE women who enter Christocentric rehabilitation programs are instructed to settle into cities where they have no history or reputation of having been exploited; This aids them with the “new places” mandate. The intention is to help them practice separation from toxic relationships and networks similar or identical to the ones that resulted in exploitation in the past. Getting involved with churches or support groups and engaging in church activities, staying in touch with mentors and Program volunteers and learning coping skills are relevant principles they have been exposed to in their Programs. Separation from evil helps to assess if they are practicing these received principles.

8. Acquiring spiritual momentum

A final quantifiable variable concerns the direction and velocity of the spiritual trajectory of the CSE respondent. This encompasses part of the prelude to the Lord’s prayer (“Your will be done”) as well as considering the final words in the doxology (“Yours is the kingdom, the power and the glory forever”). As stated earlier, we may not assess whether a respondent is *doing* God’s will. Similarly, it’s not epistemologically viable to declare whether they are truly prioritizing God’s kingdom as it eclipses into eternity. However, we can measure the direction that their lives are going in *at the time of their interviews* according to their self-descriptions.

Missiologist Paul Hiebert recognized in his work that disciples were appraised by whether or not they were keeping company within a particular “bounded” set. Evangelists he had worked with were rigid about whether or not disciples were “in” or

⁶³⁰ The origin of this phrase seems to be obscure, not originating in the original “Big Book.”

“out” of the box. He suggested that they instead adopt an understanding based not upon boundaries but based rather upon their momentum towards a spiritual center.⁶³¹

Recognizing that some of the respondents were struggling with major compromises and traumatic responses resulting from years of CSE, this variable seeks to nonetheless establish the trajectories of their faith-journeys on the day of their interviews. Regardless of disappointments or failures, their flourishing abilities were affirmatively affected if they expressed ongoing determination and motivation to keep moving towards redeemed lives of passionate faith.

Appendix 3-1: Biblical Basis for Rescuing

Divine inspiration of the canon of Christian Scriptures⁶³² is a previously identified research bias, foundational to the ethical system of all Christ followers. It is logically consistent therefore to briefly cite the biblical basis for this view before considering other compelling literature. The Apostle Paul established a principle that believers should be persuaded in their own minds concerning issues they considered to be significant in the emerging movement of Christ followers in Romans 14:5.⁶³³ Space constraints inhibits an

⁶³¹ Hiebert, “Category ‘Christian,’” 423.

⁶³² For Protestants, this indicates the 39 Old Testament books and the 27 New Testament offerings. Catholics and Eastern Orthodox adherents would concur, while also citing other Apocryphal writings they consider authoritative.

⁶³³ That particular issue concerned whether it was ethical for believers to eat meat that had been consecrated to pagan deities. Paul also draws a parallel here to the ethics of celebrating holidays which believers had quickly become impassioned about. Neither of these is analogous to slavery, prostitution or CSE. I cite it here to establish that this most prominent theologian and leader of the early church admonished the church established in a hotbed of secular/pagan thought (Rome) to act upon their consciences rather than co-opting the customs of others in violation of their own consciences. This researcher has studiously/respectfully considered the opinions of other scholars. Yet, I have often found their arguments to be unpersuasive, as they were initiated from ethical foundations much different from my own.

exegetical analysis although biblical expositors have visited these themes, not always as mechanisms for recommending church advocacy.⁶³⁴

The most fundamental biblical proclamation regarding the treatment of humanity is found in Mark 12:31, wherein Jesus admonishes his disciples to “Love your neighbor as much as you love yourself.” The teaching has an antecedent in the Torah (Leviticus 19:18) and is repeated not only in other Gospels, but also in other epistles (Romans 13:9; James 2:8). In Matthew 7:12, Jesus reiterated: “So in everything, do to others what you would have them do to you, for this sums up the Law and the Prophets”. Properly exegeting these passages need not require a full analysis of texts concerning the treatment of slaves, or a comprehensive study of all the uses of “harlot” throughout the scriptures, or examinations of narratives in which biblical actors paid for sex. The repetition of what has been called the “Golden Rule” of the New Testament leaves little room for interpretive fog. Should we not wish to be exploited ourselves, we shall not wish a similar fate on other people. Questions of merit, agency, election and choice are secondary at least regarding the impulses of those who follow Christ.

Beyond that, directives regarding the treatment of disenfranchised and powerless people are prolific throughout the Torah, the Prophets, the Wisdom Literature, the Gospels and the Epistles. Proverbs 31:8-9 admonishes adherents to “Speak up for those who cannot speak for themselves, for the rights of all who are destitute. Speak up and

⁶³⁴ Chester L Brown, *Mary Wept Over the Feet of Jesus: Prostitution and Religious Obedience in the Bible: A “Graphic Novel” Containing Adaptions of Certain Biblical Stories* (Montreal: Drawn and Quarterly Press, 2016); Marion L S Carson, *Human Trafficking, The Bible and The Church: An Interdisciplinary Study* (Eugene, OR: Cascade Books, 2016); Duane A. Garrett, “Votive Prostitution Again: A Comparison of Proverbs 7:13-14 and 21:28-29,” *Journal of Biblical Literature* 109, no. 4 (Winter 1990): 681–82; James N Hoke, ““Behold, the Lord’s Whore’? Slavery, Prostitution, and Luke 1:38,” *Biblical Interpretation* 26, no. 1 (2018): 43–67; Shelley L Long, “Responding to Human Trafficking in the Bible and the Present,” *Conversations with the Biblical World* 36 (2016): 225–31; Rose Wu, “Women on the Boundary: Prostitution, Contemporary and in the Bible,” *Feminist Theology* 28 (September 2001): 69–81.

judge fairly; defend the rights of the poor and needy.”⁶³⁵ Psalm 82:4 elaborates further: “Rescue⁶³⁶ the weak and the needy; deliver⁶³⁷ them from the hand of the wicked.”⁶³⁸

James the half-brother of Jesus explained to the Jewish Christians of his day that “Religion that God our Father accepts as pure and faultless is this: To look after orphans and widows in their distress and to keep oneself from being polluted by the world.” (James 1:27). Widows and orphans in the first century had neither direct means of support, nor had they automatic legal defenders in society who would advocate for them.⁶³⁹ Jewish and Christian scriptures consistently mention these two groups as ones that were marginalized and therefore required particularly urgent care (Deuteronomy 10:18 and 27:17; Psalm 65:5-6; Isaiah 1:17; Zechariah 7:10). Besides these references, the theme of caring for the needs of those who are generally oppressed, often with no other descriptors affixed other than “the poor” or “the needy”, “the stranger” or “the sojourner”, appear with regularity in the sacred texts (Deuteronomy 24:17; Isaiah 61:1; Ezekiel 34:16; Jeremiah 22:3; Psalm 35:10; Psalm 146:9; Proverbs 14:31; Isaiah 58:6-7 & 10; Psalm 72:12-14; Matthew 19:21; Matthew 25: 31-46; Luke 4:18-19; I John 3:17-18; Hebrews 13:16; Philippians 2:4).

Proverbs 24: 11 notes how those who wish to follow the ways of righteousness ought to “Rescue those being led away to death; Hold back those staggering toward slaughter.” Whether or not this is literally applicable to CSE women belongs to the interpreter. A much clearer case for rescue could probably be made from the passage in

⁶³⁵ In Chapter 5 I provide a detailed response to reasons that the CSE population is analogous to “The poor” whether this designation accurately depicts their economic statuses.

⁶³⁶ A form of the Hebrew *palat* used here has been translated *rescue, save or deliver*.

⁶³⁷ From *natsal*, to snatch away.

⁶³⁸ Regardless, this is not a directive for YHWH’s people to follow, but a reflection of what the Psalmist is requesting of YHWH.

⁶³⁹ Craig S. Keener, *The IVP Bible Background Commentary: New Testament*, Second Edition (Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2014), 674.

Luke 4:18:16-20 in which Jesus stood up to read from an ancient text in a Galilee synagogue. In that instance, he quotes the previously referenced passage from Isaiah 61, noting that the Spirit of the Lord has anointed him "...to proclaim good news to the poor. He has sent me to proclaim freedom for the prisoners and recovery of sight for the blind, to set the oppressed free, to proclaim the year of the Lord's favor." That passage was being fulfilled on that day, he noted. For those who believe the substance of the principal message of the Gospel is to follow Christ by living the way he lived, this signals a clear message of ethical conduct and activism. If he has come to rescue and to emancipate oppressed people, then his followers have been admonished to do likewise.

Appendix 3-2: Disparate Views Regarding Rescue and Emancipation

Sociologist Ron Weitzer claims that "...In no area of the social sciences has ideology contaminated knowledge more pervasively than in writings on the sex industry."⁶⁴⁰ In numerous articles, he criticizes researchers who place too much weight upon selective narratives of individuals describing the violence, degradation, poor sanitation and coercion they have been subjected to."⁶⁴¹ A contingent of women who would consider themselves to be anti-abolitionist feminists have released numerous books and articles which try to frame the prostitution/human trafficking debate with new lenses. In *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*, researchers Kamala Kempadoo and Jo Doezma have compiled an anthology of their writings and those of other like-minded authors as a foil to what they consider to be the dominant narrative

⁶⁴⁰ Ronald Weitzer, "Flawed Theory and Method in Studies of Prostitution," *Violence Against Women* 11, no. 7 (2005): 934-49, <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077801205276986>.

⁶⁴¹ *ibid*

which views CSE women as victims.⁶⁴² They go to great lengths to establish the “redefinition” component, co-opting the phrases “sex work” and “sex workers” in their efforts to legitimize and sometimes even to dignify the circumstances of women who may or may not be exploited, in their estimation. Doezma, for example, contributes an article entitled “Forced to Choose: Beyond the Voluntary vs. Forced Prostitution Dichotomy” that seems appears tone deaf not just for modern feminists, but for anybody with ethical sensibilities. While her desire to destigmatize women subsisting in difficult circumstances may be sincere, the notion that we should get “beyond” the debate of whether a woman is a free agent or a victim of slavery doesn’t appear to be one that will persuade empathetic citizens. Likewise in *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered: New Perspectives on Migration, Sex Work and Human Rights*, Kempadoo and co-editors Jyoti Sanghera and Bandana Pattanaik likewise have gathered essays that seem to be predicated upon the belief that by focusing on how trafficking and migration are conflated this will somehow lead to higher levels of flourishing for CSE women.⁶⁴³

Sociologist Laura Agustin endeavors to focus on cultural ambiguities in her research. In one of her best-known essays, she observes “... the concept of “force” also must be examined to understand what victimization may mean in (the context of women going overseas for legitimate work and then discovering prostitution is expected of them) ... Some people start out doing domestic work but feel compelled to sell sex because of the differential in pay; others feel psychologically obligated but actually could physically

⁶⁴² Kamala Kempadoo and Jo Doezema, eds., *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*, 1st ed. (Albany, NY: Routledge, 1998).

⁶⁴³ It is understandable that Kempadoo, Sanghera et. al. would like to engage in further dialogue regarding women choosing to earn their living through sexual self-commodification. On the other hand, the extensive narratives of tens of thousands of international children and women who have been compelled, coerced or forced into lifestyles of degradation, cruelty and slavery are marginalized here, which seems to add another layer of cruelty and exploitation to those pulled into the vortex of what they consider to be legitimate “sex work”.

escape; some connive with and manipulate those obligating them...”⁶⁴⁴ She is suggesting that other cultures are so disparate that outsiders should not be excessively quick to “judge” what constitutes force and coercion. She states that those in the west are too quick to impose their values on others regarding CSE women, asserting that the desires of NGO’s to rescue women in these circumstances constitutes “The soft side of imperialism.”⁶⁴⁵ When she writes that she wants to highlight “other voices” in the sex trafficking debate what she appears to be searching for are narratives of women who have declared “It’s not so bad” in light of otherwise poor economic options they are facing.⁶⁴⁶ But the oppressive narratives identified here are consistent with the data cited by advocates of those who “rescue.” Her subjects reveal to her exposure to high levels of violence, degradation and poor health. Agustin criticizes New York Times reporter Nicholas Kristof for having written about the global oppression of women and expresses contempt for an American culture that would award him a Pulitzer for his work in 2012.⁶⁴⁷ Compassionate enterprises that engage in rescuing and rehabilitating and their clients who no longer wish to participate in CSE networks are likewise subject to expressions of contempt.⁶⁴⁸

Teela Sanders is another prominent sociologist who is convinced that the trafficking of women is not inevitably violent.⁶⁴⁹ Her focus upon the position that CSE is not nearly the dangerous and degrading enterprise as abolitionists make it out to be is

⁶⁴⁴ Laura Agustín, “Migrants in the Mistress’s House: Other Voices in the ‘Trafficking’ Debate,” *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State & Society* 12, no. 1 (April 2005): 104.

⁶⁴⁵ Laura Maria Agustín, “The Soft Side of Imperialism,” CounterPunch, January 25, 2012, <https://www.counterpunch.org/2012/01/25/the-soft-side-of-imperialism/>.

⁶⁴⁶ Agustín, “Migrants in the Mistress’s House.”

⁶⁴⁷ Agustín’s remarks here also fail to mention that Kristof’s Asian-American wife, who is an Ivy League scholar, coauthored the book with her husband. The work referred to here is the book Kristof and WuDunn, *Half the Sky*.

⁶⁴⁸ Laura María Agustín, *Sex at the Margins: Migration, Labour Markets and the Rescue Industry* (London: Zed Books, 2008).

⁶⁴⁹ Sanders, “Inevitably Violent?,” 93.

perplexing in light of her findings that police routinely rape the women involved in these enterprises and that between fifty and one hundred percent of the women used for these purposes encounter violence.⁶⁵⁰ It stands to reason that if a citizen were to apply for employment and the prospective employer warned that there was a seventy-five percent chance he would be severely raped or beaten on the job during his term of employment, this would significantly affect the applicant's outlook regarding the desirability of employment there. Instead, Sanders presents exaggerated narratives, asserting that things aren't nearly as bad as they seem in these "industries." While her concern for utilizing empirical evidence is persuasive, she expresses callous disregard for the traumatized parties.

Ramona Vijeyarasa, an emerging sociologist, likewise urges her audience to "Move the debate beyond consent."⁶⁵¹ She writes that while her motive is to transcend the issue of legality to focus more narrowly upon distressed women, other researchers have chosen to quibble about whether consent was given for sexual purposes or not. The primary issue with migrant women being trafficked for sex, she insists, should be that their expectations are not being met, and it would therefore be more productive to emphasize adjustments in that arena.⁶⁵² Ole Martin Moen, a Norwegian sociologist, is convinced that scholars who amplify the need for emancipation and rehabilitation of CSE women are primarily concerned due to conflation of all paid sex with "casual sex," which they oppose on moral grounds. CSE is neither a high risk nor a low-risk enterprise, he writes.⁶⁵³ This observation, however, is out of sync with the corpus of literature

⁶⁵⁰ Sanders, 96–98, 103.

⁶⁵¹ Ramona Vijeyarasa, "Exploitation or Expectations: Moving Beyond Consent," *Women's Policy Journal of Harvard* 7 (2010 2009): 11–22, <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3229575>.

⁶⁵² Vijeyarasa, 20.

⁶⁵³ Ole Martin Moen, "Is Prostitution Harmful?," *Journal of Medical Ethics* 40, no. 2 (February 2014): 79, <https://doi.org/10.1136/medethics-2011-100367>.

referenced in chapter three. The dominant view shared by these writers is that CSE is not nearly as nefarious as opponents make it out to be, and that societies should embrace and regulate it rather than confronting it or assisting women in emancipation. Although they criticize those who “rescue” (particularly Christian organizations) as having “ideological blinders,” they themselves are advocates for its legitimacy and proliferation.⁶⁵⁴ He admits that “... workers, particularly those on the streets, are vulnerable to assault, robbery, rape, and murder” but still believes that most presentations are alarmist and therefore counterproductive.⁶⁵⁵ Ron Weitzer, along with co-researchers Sanford and Martinez have pointed out biases in reporting in the New York Times and Washington Post presenting sensationalistic narratives. They believe that the increasing number of stories the press chooses to cover along with the kinds of stories they focus upon presents a skewed image of the reality.⁶⁵⁶

Critics have expressed valid concerns that the tone and tenure of the debate has not always been presented objectively, yet neither are Weitzer and his cohorts paragons of objectivity.⁶⁵⁷ Laura Connelly, a lecturer at the School of Health and Society at the University of Salford asserts that “The victim label thus becomes a tool through which to control subaltern womyn, that is, those that are socio-economically, politically and geographically marginal from, and oppressed by, the hegemonic neocolonial power structure.”⁶⁵⁸ Weitzer is himself an advocate for the legitimization of various commercial

⁶⁵⁴ Weitzer, “Sex Trafficking and the Sex Industry,” 1340.

⁶⁵⁵ Ronald Weitzer, “Flawed Theory and Method in Studies of Prostitution,” *Violence Against Women* 11, no. 7 (2005): 945–46, <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077801205276986>.

⁶⁵⁶ Rachealle Sanford, Daniel E. Martínez, and Ronald Weitzer, “Framing Human Trafficking: A Content Analysis of Recent U.S. Newspaper Articles,” *Journal of Human Trafficking* 2, no. 2 (April 2, 2016): 142, <https://doi.org/10.1080/23322705.2015.1107341>.

⁶⁵⁷ Weitzer, “Sex Trafficking and the Sex Industry,” 1339.

⁶⁵⁸ Laura J Connelly, “‘The Rescue Industry’: The Blurred Line Between Help and Hindrance,” *Graduate Journal of Social Science* 11, no. 2 (January 1, 2015): 156.

sex activities.⁶⁵⁹ He is observably dismissive of those who promote what he labels an “Oppression Paradigm,” which he perceives as focusing unduly upon narratives of individuals who were injured and traumatized by CSE.⁶⁶⁰

While it is self-evident that researchers shouldn’t draw hasty conclusions based upon selective narratives of individual accounts, qualitative studies are designed specifically to bring detailed individual accounts to the fore. Human suffering is not a numbers game. Those who minister to individuals expressing urgent and traumatic needs may be less concerned with knowing the correct number of distressed individuals and with the degree of culpability they contributed to their own distress than with meeting the authentic needs presented to them from within a particular community. Part of Weitzer’s concern is that that some of researchers are involved in anti-trafficking movements or victim advocacy.⁶⁶¹ However, this argument is untenable, as many academics are practitioners in their fields. For example, researchers in poverty studies also perform relief work. There is nothing sinister about engaging in practical work involving the issues researchers are impassioned about. In fact, the recognition that academics would attempt to address societal concerns rather than simply analyzing problems may also be regarded as virtuous.

⁶⁵⁹ Ronald Weitzer, *Legalizing Prostitution: From Illicit Vice to Lawful Business* (New York, NY: New York University Press, 2012).

⁶⁶⁰ Weitzer, “Sex Trafficking and the Sex Industry,” 1339–41.

⁶⁶¹ Weitzer, 1339.

Appendix 3-3: Religious and Spiritual Barriers to Flourishing for Traumatized

Populations

Psychologists Lisa Rudolfsson and Inga Tidefors from the University of Gothenburg interviewed eight victims of sexual abuse who have identified themselves as Christians and have received pastoral care within their Christian churches.⁶⁶² The participants had not reportedly been abused commercially, but all of them expressed how they had been profoundly bewildered by the degrees in which their abuses had affected their images of God. All the subjects described the effects the abuses had on their faith as being essential to their traumas, and considered this to be integral to thoroughly process how to live with their experiences.⁶⁶³ They found that traumatized individuals are inclined to direct their anger towards God, and if they are unable to maintain their faith, they may be further burdened by feelings of guilt and shame.⁶⁶⁴ Rudolfsson and Tidefors also discovered that these individuals who have been sexually abused reported more anger towards God than people who have not been abused and were inclined to feel that God was more distant from them.⁶⁶⁵

Sociologist Alex Bierman studied the effects childhood maltreatment had upon the spiritual-religious lives of individuals after they became adults. His research was specifically focused upon all varieties of physical abuse and not exclusive to sexual abuse. His previous research had revealed that victims of abuse tend to possess enhanced negative views of God, are less likely to believe in God, and are less likely to be involved in organized religion or eschew the practice of religion.⁶⁶⁶ This study looks at

⁶⁶² Rudolfsson and Tidefors, "I Have Cried to Him a Thousand Times."

⁶⁶³ Rudolfsson and Tidefors, 910.

⁶⁶⁴ Rudolfsson and Tidefors, 910.

⁶⁶⁵ Rudolfsson and Tidefors, 911.

⁶⁶⁶ Bierman, "The Effects of Childhood Mistreatment," 349.

perceptions and doesn't specifically try to measure religious behavior. Bierman observes,

Once controls for risk factors for abuse were included in regression models, only maltreatment perpetrated by fathers had a significant negative effect on religiosity. The most obvious explanation for this pattern of results involves the identification of God as a paternal figure. Individuals who are brought up with harsh, capricious fathers may well form a negative view of paternal figures.⁶⁶⁷

Although he couldn't empirically demonstrate that people mistreated by a father figures struggle with the concept of a deity or with generally committing to a personal faith, it isn't difficult to recognize the connection that might exist in the fragile psyches of people who had been mistreated and traumatized.

In *Internal Desecration*, Carrie Doehring examined the perceptions of God by women who had been abused. The respondents answered detailed questionnaires having to do with the abuses they had suffered, and how severe and prolific their past abuses had been. Then they were asked a series of additional queries to determine whether the respondents perceived God to possess a loving nature, or if he seemed absent, or wrathful. The major findings of her study were that the women's perceptions of God as either loving, absent or wrathful did not differ from other demographics except in the instances when traumatization was severe.⁶⁶⁸ Respondents were categorized as those who had been traumatized, highly traumatized and severely traumatized. The only group to score lower on a "loving God" representations and higher on the "absent" and "wrathful God" representations were the highly traumatized populations.⁶⁶⁹ Even the highly

⁶⁶⁷ Bierman, 357.

⁶⁶⁸ Doehring, *Internal Desecration*, 131.

⁶⁶⁹ Doehring, 88.

traumatized didn't seem to perceive the representation of God much differently than the other respondents. When the traumatic experiences from the past had been severe, though, their images of God become more emphatically negative.⁶⁷⁰ This is relevant in that many CSE women may not perceive their trauma to have been particularly acute. Others, however, experienced beatings, rapes and indignities so frequently over the years that their trauma responses may indeed be severe. This causes a greater barrier for particular individuals to respond to spiritual impulses.

Arabella (*pseudonym*), one of the administrators I interviewed for this study, indicated that many of the women who engage in their Christocentric rehab are extremely spiritually responsive, and they make commitments to the Christian faith while they are enrolled in Programs. This is despite the recognition that

...You know, we have a lot of women who've been sexually assaulted from youth. We just did a little survey here. And I would say 70%, maybe 75% of our women have had some type of experience when they were younger—whether it was molestation or sexual assault. Especially if they were in the drug and alcohol world. Unfortunately, that's kind of a common trend is that there was some sexual assault, because of people that they were around.

The founder of the organization that employed administrator Kaleigh (*pseudonym*) offered a somewhat divergent view. She reported on how an incidence of childhood sexual abuse helped to shape their Program's policy:

(Our Founder's) story goes, you know, her childhood sexual abuse occurred within the church. And when she started doing this work, trying to develop this program, the women she sought out for advisement about what kind of program they needed, they were telling her, 'I can't go into a program that requires an exchange of religious practice for my participation.' So, like I don't want to be required to participate in Bible study in order to be a part of your

⁶⁷⁰ Doehring, 88–89.

program. And she said, ‘Of course, I would never push that on anybody else.’ And so, we really try to stick with that.

No studies could be located on the effects of religion or spirituality specifically on the reintegration journeys of women who have been CSE and then enrolled in Christian rehabilitation programs. Jennifer Su’s dissertation for her Psy.D. studies at the Christocentric Regent University probably comes the closest. In *Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health of Women Exiting the Sex Industry*, Su observes how

...given the abundance of research documenting the largely positive impact of religion and spirituality on mental and physical health outcomes in a wide range of populations, and given the numerous studies establishing the frequency of physical and sexual violence among women in street prostitution... it is perhaps surprising that thus far only a handful of studies within the prostitution literature base have mentioned the role of religion in helping women cope with the significant traumas incurred due to involvement in the sex industry. Beyond religion's impact on trauma recovery, some evidence has even suggested that religion may play a central role in helping women exit the sex industry successfully—where "success" is implicitly or explicitly defined as sustained exit over a discrete period of time.⁶⁷¹

She discovered that firstly, positive religious coping was significantly correlated with posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD) in the negative direction, significantly correlated with posttraumatic growth in the positive direction, and not correlated with depression. Negative religious coping was positively and significantly correlated with symptoms of depression but not correlated with PTSD or posttraumatic growth. Second, although religious coping style was not significantly associated with duration of exit, religious commitment was strongly and positively associated with duration of exit, suggesting an important role for general religiosity in preventing relapse and sustaining long-term

⁶⁷¹ Su, “Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health,” 251.

exiting success. Third, it was found that prostitute women had endured significantly more traumatic events and suffered from greater PTSD severity than exotic dancers. Religious factors were reported among the top three motivators for exiting the sex industry, with nearly nine out of 10 women stating that belief in God or a Higher Power was "extremely helpful" in their exit processes.

Appendix 3-4: CSE Women Rehabilitated in Christocentric Aftercare Compared to Other Groups

1. CSE Women Like Other Traumatized Populations

It can be demonstrated that the experiences of CSE women are similar in many respects to other traumatized populations. Both possess sorrows that have been appropriated to them. This is not to say the principal actors had no roles or made no serious contributions to their misfortunes. People make poor choices in the best of circumstances. Bryant Myers believes that impoverished people possess some culpability in their unfortunate circumstances.⁶⁷² Likewise, women bearing the burden of uninvited sorrows will make mistakes of their own volition, common to humanity. But trauma based upon actions initiated by others, which most often involves unwelcome suffering, is anchored in past exposure to traumatic events even if inquirers would like to reserve their sympathies for trauma that they feel is "clean" or lacking ambiguities.⁶⁷³ Liberation theologies and feminist theologies have demonstrated willingness to explore the suffering of marginalized peoples and address grievances. Regarding the former, Gustavo Gutierrez rejects Western theologies that focus upon individual actions, concentrating

⁶⁷² Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 117 and 186.

⁶⁷³ Allender, *The Wounded Heart*; Baldwin, "Living in Longing," 278; Farley, *Prostitution, Trafficking*, 3. Judith Herman speaks here about the difficulty she had convincing a conference organizer to hold workshops on women who had been CSE until she demonstrated by a show of hands that about 75% of the clinicians gathered there were treating clients in that very circumstance.

instead on historical determinism, oppression that has been absorbed by the oppressed, and a breach of communion between God and neighbor.⁶⁷⁴ Representing a feminist theological perspective, Valerie Saiving proposes that women's sin is different from that of men, and that the sin of the oppressor must be distinguished from the sin of the oppressed.⁶⁷⁵

Theologies crafted by the Minjung movement in Korea are useful here because they have identified language that is not explicit in other systems but can be universally recognized and embraced. Andrew Sung Park notes how western theology emphasizes the guilt of the wrongdoer and offers a solution to him. Through the process of *metanoia* (repentance), people can express their sorrows and regrets to God and experience repentance.⁶⁷⁶ There is little emphasis in the church upon the social dimension of *metanoia* which embodies the expression of repentance towards people. Both Catholic and Protestant theologies consider justification from the perspective of the wrongdoer. The favored doctrine of *Justification by Faith* reflects excessive reliance on the intellect in the process of repentance.⁶⁷⁷ The work of reconciliation is done in the mind, and not necessarily in the body. This leaves the psycho-spiritual needs of those who have been wounded—the traumatized, the victims like CSE women--unattended to. If these have been traumatized, their trauma continues unabated. This places undue focus upon an individual's relationship with God, diminishing one's relationship with her neighbor. The victims continue to wear sin that has been transmitted. Then healing becomes the "property" of the counseling community, whether accomplished on the therapist's couch

⁶⁷⁴ As discussed in Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 12–13.

⁶⁷⁵ Carol P. Christ and Judith Plaskow, eds., *Womanspirit Rising: A Feminist Reader in Religion*, 1st ed, Harper Forum Books (New York, NY: Harper & Row, 1979), 37. Comprehensively exploring these extensive schools of theology would be beyond the scope of this study, so the analysis here will focus upon the substance of the offenses that have contributed to trauma in this population.

⁶⁷⁶ Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993, 89.

⁶⁷⁷ Park, 95.

or in the pastor's office.⁶⁷⁸ The church, in its theological rush to move sinners from guilt to justification often leaves the most vulnerable and wounded with their infirmities intact.

Dan Allender is a psychology professor who writes from a Christian perspective on healing for those who have been sexually abused. In both *God and the Victim* and *Healing the Wounded Heart*, he encourages clinicians and those who have been sexually wounded to acknowledge the role of evil in the abuses they have experienced.⁶⁷⁹ Those who have been CSE and wish to reconcile their experiences with a loving God should learn to overcome their tendencies to curse their own bodies and to learn to discontinue punishing themselves for their involvement with the evil.⁶⁸⁰ Believers in Christ, on the other hand, should cooperate in formulating better responses to those who have been violated. Offering cleverly reasoned theodicies may satisfy apologetical purposes but are inadequate to meet the needs of victims trying to reintegrate into communities.⁶⁸¹ In its zeal to express a gospel of grace, the church must also learn to step in and appropriately respond to those who have been wronged if they wish to minister to marginalized peoples.⁶⁸² They must improve at recognizing and teaching holistic biblical mandates that addresses the grievances of victims without rapidly advancing into poorly timed discussions about the histories, backgrounds and foibles of the wounded parties.⁶⁸³ The perpetration of violent crimes and traumatic experiences may indeed present opportunities to minister to those who had not previously been active in the Christian

⁶⁷⁸ Park, 91–92.

⁶⁷⁹ Allender, *The Wounded Heart*; Allender, *Healing the Wounded Heart*.

⁶⁸⁰ Allender, *Healing the Wounded Heart*; Christine A. Courtois, "Complex Trauma, Complex Reactions: Assessment and Treatment," *Psychotherapy: Theory, Research, Practice, Training* 41, no. 4 (Win 2004): 412–25; Park, *The Wounded Heart of God*, 1993.

⁶⁸¹ Fortune, "The Conundrum of Sin, Sex, Violence, and Theodicy."

⁶⁸² Harold Dean Trulear, "Go and Do Likewise: The Church's Role in Caring for Crime Victims," in *God and the Victim: Theological Reflections on Evil, Victimization, Justice, and Forgiveness* (Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans, 1999), 70–88.

⁶⁸³ Elizabeth Achtemeier, "Victimization and Healing: The Biblical View," in *God and the Victim: Theological Reflections on Evil, Victimization, Justice, and Forgiveness* (Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans; Neighbors Who Care, 1999), 89–106.

faith.⁶⁸⁴ But Christ-followers who minister to the marginalized and traumatized must be equipped to address the “big questions,” and to be available to them even when they can’t provide specific answers.

2. CSE Women are like the Indigent

I have utilized Bryant Myers’ Transformational Model of development throughout this study.⁶⁸⁵ My rationale for applying these insights to a different demographic than they were originally intended is summarized here:

1) Not all women who are commercially sexually exploited emerge from impoverished backgrounds, although this is true for many.⁶⁸⁶ Yet the women from the CSE demographic exhibit characteristics similar to those of the impoverished in several ways. Physical poverty makes affected individuals increasingly vulnerable to exploitation, as resulting from having to worry about “daily bread” issues in a manner that is foreign to the upper classes. Jayakumar Christian has observed that one of the most fundamental characteristics of poor people is that they lack access to power.⁶⁸⁷ Their low statuses in life, sometimes generational, keep them from making authoritative demands or positioning themselves strategically to bring about changes that would improve their situations.

Due to their powerlessness, women from lower economic backgrounds are often subjected to violence and sexual exploitation at home. Consequently, they leave their homes at early ages to escape ongoing harm and degradation.⁶⁸⁸ They cannot survive on

⁶⁸⁴ Lampman and Shattuck, *God and the Victim*, 9–16.

⁶⁸⁵ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*.

⁶⁸⁶ Belcher and Herr, “Development of Grounded Theory”; Tyler and Johnson, “Trading Sex.”

⁶⁸⁷ Christian, *God of the Empty-Handed*, 336.

⁶⁸⁸ Coy, “Moved Around like Bags”; Estes and Weiner, “Commercial Sexual Exploitation”; Jessica A. Heerde, Kirsty E. Scholes-Balog, and Sheryl A. Hemphill, “Associations Between Youth Homelessness, Sexual Offenses, Sexual Victimization, and Sexual Risk Behaviors: A Systematic Literature Review,”

the streets without money, though, which often makes them vulnerable to coercion.⁶⁸⁹

Underage and unskilled, they may turn to prostitution as the only apparent way to keep themselves housed and clothed.⁶⁹⁰ Once they have broken the taboo, a complex series of events begins to unfold, making it extremely difficult for many of them to *simply* get out.

2) Secondly, we may acknowledge that the Christocentric Rehabilitation programs for CSE women are engaging in *developmental* work among this demographic. The respondents in this study have received developmental and rehabilitative care for between nine months and two-plus years, depending on the program. Some organizations consider the post-program outreach to former clients to be ongoing work. Development also continues among numerous social service agencies with whom the women continue to engage.

Women who are CSE have reported on the complete loss of control that occurs in their lives sometimes even resulting in loss of free agency.⁶⁹¹ Women are exploited by actors who coerce, condition, threaten and torture them into submission for their own commercial gain, with complete disregard for the perspective of the exploited class.⁶⁹² Similarly, in Myers' framework the nature of poverty is viewed as fundamentally relational.⁶⁹³ It is "...the result of relationships that do not work, that are not just, that are not for life, that are not harmonious or enjoyable."⁶⁹⁴ Poverty results from a network of poorly developed or broken relationships. People who are willing to serve their own

Archives of Sexual Behavior 44, no. 1 (January 2015): 181–212, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10508-014-0375-2>.

⁶⁸⁹ Cronley et al., "Entering Prostitution in Adolescence"; Wilson and Butler, "Running a Gauntlet."

⁶⁹⁰ Estes and Weiner, "Commercial Sexual Exploitation."

⁶⁹¹ Dalla, Xia, and Kennedy, "Just Give Them What They Want"; Wilson and Butler, "Running a Gauntlet."

⁶⁹² Farley, "Invisibility of Harm"; Haugen and Boutros, *The Locust Effect*; Kristof and WuDunn, *Half the Sky*; Su, "Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health."

⁶⁹³ Myers, *Walking with the Poor*, 86–87.

⁶⁹⁴ Myers, 86a.

selfish ends by abusing others do so as a response to pervasive evil. When they hoard resources, exploiting others to make themselves wealthy, they yield to dark spiritual forces. While God’s design is for people to flourish, individuals and corporations may choose the opposite for their own purposes. Without a strong theology of sin, comprehensive explanations of poverty are difficult to articulate. Therefore, in the worldview of the Christ-follower, the Gospel message must be integral to any comprehensive solutions to poverty.

Myers’ framework is helpful in assessing the unique needs which these women possess, regardless of whether the CSE victims have experienced *material* poverty. Violent force has been used to pacify the poor as well as CSE women; Therefore, it becomes increasingly important that a bias towards peace should be expressed in the transformative process.⁶⁹⁵ Above all, whatever efforts are exerted to move them towards the establishment of abundant lives (shalom) should be sustainable—not only physically but also psychologically, socially, and spiritually.⁶⁹⁶

3. Christian CSE Women Like Recoverers

The narrow sub-culture of women who have been CSE can be considered members of a radical demographic in need of a contextualized approach to ministry. Certainly, North American women who have participated in “the Life” possess shared characteristics that makes them unique from other sub-cultures. As Craig Storti has observed, cultures consist of “...the shared assumptions, values and beliefs of a group of people which result in characteristic behaviors.”⁶⁹⁷ A portion of what makes the subculture of Recoverers unique and challenging to work with is that substance abuse is rampant among their population, resulting in their need to be treated for addictions during

⁶⁹⁵ Myers, 125–26.

⁶⁹⁶ Myers, 129–34.

⁶⁹⁷ Craig Storti, *Figuring Foreigners Out: A Practical Guide* (Yarmouth, ME: Intercultural Press, 1999), 5.

the liminal or “recovery” phases of their journeys.⁶⁹⁸ This is one factor that suggests the usefulness of *Twelve-Step or Recovery Principles* as an additional framework for assessing the spiritual paths taken by the CSE survivors.⁶⁹⁹

The Twelve Steps of Alcoholics Anonymous are simply attributed to “Anonymous” but they are known to be based on the work of Bill W (Bill Wilson) with the organizational help of Dr. Bob (Robert Smith) and an evangelical fellowship known as the Oxford Group.⁷⁰⁰ The latter began hammering out the Steps before AA was founded. Reverend Samuel Shoemaker of the Oxford Groups is widely recognized as being the chief architect of the principles.⁷⁰¹ The AA fellowship is obliquely based upon a Christian concept of God.⁷⁰² Founder Bill Wilson experienced great disappointment with the abilities of organized churches in the 20th century to develop programs that dealt with real-world problems. He considered some of the theological propositions he’d encountered in churches to be relevant only to “religious” people.⁷⁰³ Yet, he also noted that without a spiritual focus, alcoholics rarely registered any success in recovery.⁷⁰⁴ He therefore retained the spiritual focus of the program while allowing the concept of God to be addressed in deliberately vague, non-sectarian terminology.

George Hunter III writes that Recovery ministries serve as a prototype for many other kinds of ministries.⁷⁰⁵ They have been successfully used to treat people afflicted by

⁶⁹⁸ Wilson and Butler, “Running a Gauntlet,” 497.

⁶⁹⁹ Cal Chambers, *Two Tracks One Goal: How Alcoholics Anonymous Relates to Christianity* (Langley, B.C.: Bridging the Gap Enterprise, 1988); Charles Taylor Knippel, “Samuel M. Shoemaker’s Theological Influence On William G. Wilson’s Twelve Step Spiritual Program of Recovery (Alcoholics Anonymous)” (PhD, Saint Louis, MO, Saint Louis University, 1987); Kurtz, *Not God*; Pittman and B., *Courage to Change*.

⁷⁰⁰ Anonymous, *Alcoholics Anonymous*; Kurtz, *Not God*, 9.

⁷⁰¹ Pittman and B., *Courage to Change*, 14. See also Knippel, “Shoemaker’s Theological Influence.”

⁷⁰² Knippel, “Shoemaker’s Theological Influence,” 14.

⁷⁰³ Kurtz, *Not God*, 177.

⁷⁰⁴ Kurtz, 117.

⁷⁰⁵ Hunter, *Radical Outreach*, 143.

various problems, compulsions and addictions. Alcohol and narcotic addictions contain a medical component, since the continuous use of these substances creates chemical dependency. The NIH reports that between 40- 60% of drug/alcohol addiction can be attributed to biological factors.⁷⁰⁶ On the other hand, eating and sexual activity are natural functions, and at least in the former instance one can't sustain life without it. What some may label "addictions" can more accurately be described as "compulsions." If slightly re-worked, the Twelve Steps are broad enough to provide an applicable pattern for any seeker attempting to recover from any kind of obsession or sin-issue. Narcotics Anonymous have found the principles to be applicable to those recovering from drug usage since 1953.⁷⁰⁷ Gamblers, Overeaters, Narcotics, and Sex Addicts all use these established principles to overcome salacious and compulsive practices.⁷⁰⁸ The Twelve Step principles were designed to help a "radical" demographic (alcoholics) to find sobriety, stability and to begin to flourish.

Maintenance of a lifestyle incorporating sexual abuse, trauma, varying degrees of coercion, substance abuse issues and an amorphous vocational element *cannot* be characterized either as an addiction nor a compulsion. English-speaking women who have experienced this lifestyle have labelled the phenomenon "The Life" for this very reason. Variables of this lifestyle are too complex to be relegated to the status of a compulsion or a habit. Women are not *compelled* to prostitute themselves and don't pursue careers in prostitution. They have no inbred propensities for thrill-seeking, and

⁷⁰⁶ NIDA, "Drug Misuse and Addiction," Governmental Website, National Institute on Drug Abuse, July 13, 2020, <https://nida.nih.gov/publications/drugs-brains-behavior-science-addiction/drug-misuse-addiction> Accessed 24 Feb. 2022.

⁷⁰⁷ NA World Services, INC, "Narcotics Anonymous World Services," Narcotics Anonymous, 2022, <https://www.na.org/?ID=aboutus>.

⁷⁰⁸ GA, "Gambler's Anonymous," Gambler's Anonymous, accessed April 25, 2018, <https://www.gamblersanonymous.org/ga/node/1>; NA World Services, INC, "Narcotics Anonymous World Services"; OA, "Overeaters Anonymous," Overeaters Anonymous, 2022, <https://oa.org/>; SAA, "Sex Addicts Anonymous," Sex Addicts Anonymous, 2022, <https://saa-recovery.org/>.

these experiences are not sought to provide adrenaline surges. Another agent almost always chooses their paths for them--either forcing, tricking or trapping them into cycles of depravity which delivers few rewards and fewer pleasures to them. Elements of shame, obligation, financial need and authentic narcotic addiction keeps them captive to lifestyles that may require years to recover from.⁷⁰⁹

4. Christian CSE Women Like All Humanity

The New Testament carries a clear message that all of humanity has failed morally and require a common redemption (Romans 3:23). In that, there is a sense of a level playing field. Though some are more gifted than others, and some have superior opportunities and circumstances available, none of them can obtain righteousness on their own according to New Testament teaching. A person raised in a faith-filled Christian households may start the process of becoming a disciple at a very early age. But all individuals who choose a faith-life are compelled to learn the practices of the faith intellectually and physically. George Hunsberger notes how in North American culture, the church is expected to be vendors of religious services and goods.⁷¹⁰ This is not consistent with the message of the Gospel, though. Christ was explicit in noting that those who wish to be his disciples must deny their own desires and follow him (Matthew 16:24).

The pattern for pray which he instructed his disciples to observe in Matthew 6:5-15 (Commonly called the “Lord’s Prayer”) assisted his disciples in remembering all the major categories of how they were encouraged to order their lives.⁷¹¹ Part of that is the

⁷⁰⁹ Edwards, Halpern, and Wechsberg, “Correlates of Exchanging Sex”; El-Bassel et al., “Sex Trading and Psychological Distress”; Young, Boyd, and Hubbell, “Prostitution, Drug Use, and Coping.”

⁷¹⁰ Guder and Barrett, *Missional Church*, 84.

⁷¹¹ Nijay K. Gupta, *The Lord’s Prayer*, Smyth & Helwys Bible Commentary (Macon, GA: Smyth & Helwys, 2017); Albert Haase, *Living the Lord’s Prayer: The Way of the Disciple* (Downers Grove, IL: IVP

prayerful mandate to request God’s will in their lives, rather than choosing and pursuing selfish ends, which is a concept also underscored numerous times in Matthew’s Gospel.⁷¹² The process of becoming a disciple is intentional; It doesn’t occur automatically. So, although one raised in a household of faith may have an early advantage, she may take faith principles for granted, or possess blind spots due to familiarity. Those whose faith is fresh or newly regenerated may be able to exploit the advantages which they also possess—chiefly, the abilities to view and perceive the teachings of Christ without the surplus of cultural baggage accompanying people of settled faith.

Besides practicing the principles in the Lord’s Prayer, disciples are required to learn new practices to make transitions from undisciplined lifestyles. adaptations are needed to accomplish spiritual flourishing.⁷¹³ In *The Master Plan of Evangelism*, evangelism practitioner Robert Coleman underscores the insight that Christ was not haphazard about how he developed his small band of disciples, but rather he practiced hands-on training with them over an extended period of time.⁷¹⁴ It follows those believers today must not attempt to bypass this critical process in bringing people into the maturity of the faith. The technology is different today, and the forms of church attendance may be different, but the principle of personal discipleship is a fixed one that won’t be accomplished simply by church attendance or exposure to literature. In *Building a Discipleship Culture*, Mike Breen further establishes this theme by providing

Books, 2009); Nicholas Thomas Wright, “Thy Kingdom Come: Living the Lord’s Prayer,” *Christian Century* 114, no. 9 (March 12, 1997): 268–70.

⁷¹² Gupta, *Lord’s Prayer*, 81–82.

⁷¹³ Dorothy C. Bass, ed., *Practicing Our Faith: A Way of Life for a Searching People* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Pub, 1997); Richard J. Foster, *Celebration of Discipline: The Path to Spiritual Growth*, 1st Edition (San Francisco, CA: Harper & Row, 1978); Peter Morden, *The Message of Discipleship: Authentic Followers Of Jesus In Today’s World* (Downers Grove, IL: IVP, 2018); Dallas Willard, *The Spirit of the Disciplines: Understanding How God Changes Lives* (San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1988).

⁷¹⁴ Robert E. Coleman, *The Master Plan of Evangelism* (Grand Rapids, MI: Revell, 2006).

methodology that can be used in the discipleship process.⁷¹⁵ He describes how he has personally mentored other adults and offers a framework for disciplers to follow in his footsteps.

In *Symbol and Ceremony*, Matt Zahniser examines the ways that world citizens disciple their initiates all around the world.⁷¹⁶ Numerous local- and regional rituals are utilized in contextualized demonstrations of faith to bring authenticity and immediacy into the life of initiates. This is an important practice to recognize in light of the reality that CSE women function from within their own unique subcultures. They may emerge from different ethnic- and racial backgrounds, from urban or rural settings and from various family structures. But what unites them is a kind of camaraderie or a sisterhood among women with whom they have shared their experiences. Sometimes this has made the degradations they have endured more bearable. Other times it has made it difficult for them to leave “The Life.” For better or for worse, the unique vocabulary and the shared understandings that exist among them signify a unique phenomenon that non-CSE individuals don’t readily understand. Therefore, an informed and contextualized approach must be adopted for discipling them. It should combine a trauma-informed ethic as well as wisdom passed on from those who have come to know them best. Like all humanity, they have commonalities that are universally recognized, while also possessing characteristics that outsiders may never fully be able to grasp.

⁷¹⁵ Mike Breen, *Building a Discipling Culture*, 2nd Edition (Pawleys Island, SC: 3DM International, 2014).

⁷¹⁶ A. H. Mathias Zahniser, *Symbol and Ceremony: Making Disciples Across Cultures* (Monrovia, CA: MARC, 1997).

Appendix 4-1: Summaries of the Administrators' Responses

Obstacles and Assets to Flourishing Noted among CSE Clients

Northwest

Obstacles

- Homelessness, employment, criminal history may follow indefinitely
- Co-dependency--
- Poor relationships or inability to foster relationships
- Those are the two—co-dependency and relationships.
- Bad relationships particularly intimate ones

Assets

- Mentor with whom can be tough and authentic
- Developing Independence and anonymity
- Exercising self-confidence
- Affirmative community.
- Employment and a pathway to vocational work
- Engaging in daily devotional activities

Quotes

Obstacles:

- Because, if you are subject to lose your home, and you have, you know, kids and mouths to feed... you know YOU, as a mother would do *anything* to, to... feed your kids and so if you didn't have the support and the people all around you, you could find yourself in a real, you know, touchy situation.

Assets:

- (If) She is willing to live a transparent life... Who can ask for help when she needs it, I think that is *huge*.
- I think you need to have somebody in the community who is like a mentor to you. You know, somebody who is wise. They have the liberty to call you out.

Other:

- When you have Christ in your life, things just work out. He has a plan and a purpose for you. And when you are submitting to his purpose, it's up to him to work it out, right? In a way. Um... But when you're *outside* of his will, that's on *you*. That's when the chaos comes, and the disappointments come, and... everything kind of goes awry.
- For me, it was seeing mature Christians. Like, learning what it was like being a Christian. It was having people break it down for me. You know, seeing married couples and what their relationship was like. Being able to ask those questions. You know, what does typical parenting look like, and being able to tailor that to being a single mom.

South I

Obstacles

- Interfering History
- Saving Money
- Back child support
- Inappropriate relationships

Assets

- Having a good job and sustainable income—
- Maintaining positive relationships. When they feel loved, they flourish.
- Plans must be drafted for those who really can't work well.

Quotes

Obstacles:

- One the biggest complications I feel we can run into is child support. That can be a huge issue. We tried to do as much as we can with that while there in the program; but some of them owe backpay from child support that will take them years to pay off. And some of them don't want to open a bank account, because a child support will take out what's there. (Laughs). That's a problem to *me*. They may not see it as a problem but I see it as a problem-if you don't have a place to store your paycheck and then you just walk around with this cash it's much easier to spend it than it is to responsibly save it and delegate where it goes.
- We'll have women who come in and saying, "Oh he doesn't use, he doesn't use." And then come to find out that he drinks but then they'll say, "Yeah, but he doesn't use anything else." And I say, "Yeah—so you can leave this program, you're going to live with this guy every day, and you're going to be cool with that. You're never going to drink while you're with him." And then she'll just say "Oh, I'm just going to be with him, I'm just going to drink a little bit, and I'm just going to smoke a little pot."

Assets:

- And the women who, um, they kinda pursue something for themselves-- whether that be schooling, whether that be a certain job...if they want to go back to community college get a different degree, things like that. I think women who pursue things like that have a pretty strong foundation.

Other:

- (The Program)... has its own spiritual component. You know, it is built around that. Generally people say, "Our higher power", but most of our people do refer to their higher power as God. And so a lot of our women when they first come into the program, they are not jumping into trying to get back into religion, if they've had in the past. Or they are interested, and they just don't know what they want to believe right then and there-but I think they find their way.
- Even the ones who come from-people who come from very ritualistic backgrounds of abuse were, they been in sadistic kinds of organizations that have front of religious

practices, but there just these horrible, horrible frightening cult of people who are doing things that are unimaginable. Even those individuals, I find, still want a spiritual relationship with God,--or their higher power whoever believe that individual to be.

- And for some of them working is not an option. I mean we have one graduate right now who... She was able to work when she was in the program, but not well. And it's slowly declined because her health condition is such that she really needs just beyond disability and not work. She can't physically keep a job. Because she's just too... Her operational skills are just too slow. And that's okay.

South II

Obstacles

- Male relationships
- Mental health/distress, including financial distress
- Self-will
- Isolation.
- Grief
- Social media
- Poor boundaries
- Approval-seeking behavior
- Chaotic relationships interfering including family members

Assets

- Adequate income
- Submissiveness to good counsel
- Excellence at the job
- Positive body image and understanding of the body's purpose
- Becoming part of good community

Quotes

Obstacles:

- And I say, like, "Why do you still feel like you need to get their approval?" And that goes back to like to search for significance again. Why do you need *their* approval to know that you're doing good? Like, they don't need to know that. And so, it never fails—we always find out, because there's always somebody who comes back and says "So and so is on Facebook and they posted a picture, and..." And I think that's just this generation, too. That's how you promote yourself is through social media.

Assets:

- Then the ones that we see that are really growing are the ones are in constant communication with us. You know they'll call us every once in a while. They'll send this text messages. We're usually leery of the ones who don't communicate after they've graduated. Because, if you're here and this is made such a big impact in your life, you would kinda want to tell people that you're doing better.

- And we want them to get involved in the community they're going to the Bible studies, getting to know women getting involved in the small group. And then the last part of that is that they have to be part of a support group. We try to push Celebrate Recovery. But some of them go back to AA. You know we try to push them into CR because we asked them to find us Christian communities where they have that contact with people outside of our house that they can call in.

Other:

- Also with Christians, I see a submissiveness, where they *want* to take wise counseling, they want to sit under the authority of other people, they are looking for people to lead them and guide them.
- We just did a little survey here And I would say 70%, maybe 75% of our women have had some type of experience when they were younger—whether it was molestation or sexual assault. Especially if they were in the drug and alcohol world.

Northeast

Obstacles

- Reconnecting with prior relationships
- Economic instability
- Loneliness and boredom
- Moving back into former communities
- Poor romantic relationships they jump into too quickly

Assets

- Staying connected to a supportive community
- Remaining disconnected from prior relationships and behaviors
- Being self-sufficient
- Being relationally connected, especially to a church
- A woman pursuing her goals, practicing new habits
- Being a part of a worshipping and support community
- Earning a paycheck legitimately
- Adopting new behaviors and disconnecting from old ones
- Balancing their lives and managing their time
- The presence of any kinds of support groups

Quotes

Obstacles:

- The past is always following them. So is almost like a fear... The one person I'm thinking of right now is so afraid of someone finding out about her past that she's kind of a hold of yourself hostage, if that makes sense. So, she's really opening herself up but she's not, she's really guarded.

- I've seen a few where they haven't embraced it...(Christian values) And they haven't been very successful. I've seen a few that have chose not to believe in anything, and I've seen them fall. (*sic*)
- And for some these women, forty-hour work weeks are quite hard. And at the end of the day they get a paycheck and they say "Wait, wait a minute, what's this FICA thing?"
- Those that do not embrace Christianity tend to... I don't know... They're just... They fall a lot quicker. I just feel like they're wandering a lot more, if that makes sense.
- We've had to have been local, from (their urban area). It's been too easy (to return to the former region)--the temptation has been too much. It's been like hiding in plain sight, if that makes sense. They're always looking over their shoulder: having to stay away from certain areas. I think it's better to be removed in an area... I mean it's hard to start over in a new area. But at the same time I think it's healthier for them.

Assets:

- But the ones that are really connected to a church where-sometimes they can't because of jobs-but at least connected to a woman's group or Bible study. Something where they been connected to a church: they have been very successful.

Other:

- We asked them to surround themselves with key people, with people you can trust from a spiritual aspect and from a social aspect. Or it could be vocational or academic. Depending on what's going on the lives.
- Those who choose Christ have a guidepost, a framework for living. Those who don't are still making it up as they go and floundering more often.

Southeast

Obstacles

- Resisting community/Refusing to stay in touch
- Unhealthy relationships with men
- Unsupportive relatives
- Misunderstanding the nature of their faith
- Sexual bondage
- Shame from the past

Assets

- Maintaining employment
- Giving back to community/volunteerism
- Providing for dependent children *can* be a motivator
- Family when they are supportive

Quotes

Obstacles:

- (The biggest stumbling obstacle is) Unhealthy relationships with men! And I say men because that's what we've noticed most. It could be women... (hesitant). But the girls are always, like, oh gosh, here comes the danger again. But the women are so used to being in a relationship which is physical. They're co-dependent, very unhealthy... But a lot of times, they can't imagine them being by themselves for a year, or eighteen months, without being in a relationship or not having a man. And ten times out of ten, that gets in the way of their recovery. And, I don't have any numbers, but I would say 99% of the women who have left our program, you can look back and see where it started.
- And you don't feel like you belong anywhere—that's what we hear a lot.

Assets:

- I think, that for the women who choose to pursue Christianity—the ones who are more likely to establish community, to give back to the community, to not be in a relationship *because* of the Christian beliefs (are successful).
- I wouldn't say children (are an obstacle). If anything, the women that have kids—if anything, that's more of a motivator to keep them from (not) successfully reintegrating.
- Community is just so important. Um, it's just so important that the girls find someone they can connect with and that they trust, who will check in on them...

Other:

- So if somebody is very touchy or wants to hug all the time... or seems too nice too quick. The women may draw back from that. We always ask people to just ask permission, for hugs, or don't ever initiate the first point of contact. Because they're learning what healthy touch is, and they're learning "Is it okay for me to hug this person? And is it okay for this person to hug me?" And when I say well-intentioned, well-meaning people in the church it's just too much, too soon.
- You probably already understand this—but just how *hard* it is for the ladies. A lot of times, they feel most... comfortable in the Life 'cause that's what they've known. So... as *fantastic* as all these opportunities are that we're offering to them... they oftentimes feel like they don't belong anywhere, anymore. And just how hard that is for them.
- I think that... a lot of people think that the Life is really terrible and awful and horrible... and for *some* of the women, for a LOT of the women we serve... that terrible horrible life is a lot better than the one they left.

Deep South

Obstacles

- Love interests especially "Bad Boys"
- Mental health concerns including depression and guilt
- They may anticipate several years of meager earnings before stability
- Poor housing and transportation options
- Chronic health conditions
- Unhealthy friendships
- Returning to old community causes obstacle
- Residual effects of guilt
- Addiction, especially opiates

Assets

- Willingness to communicate with supportive people
- The need to provide for their children
- Reintegration in a *different* community than where they were CSE.
- Sobriety

Quotes

Obstacles:

- Well, we're always talking about entry-level work. And even though we try really hard to get them education so that is *not* entry-level. But what I normally see is entry-level positions. That really don't provide a sustainable income. And so, the temptation is there to try to make money illicitly. So that's a big barrier.
- ...Physical health and a lot of chronic diseases (are obstacles). There's a lot of chronic pain they experience—just from zero self-care for so many years. I think that that hinders. Also because of poverty issues just because of lack of training, their eating habits are not good. And cooking—things like that. Those things hinder and then, emotional health: there is underlying trauma, and underlying mental illness to varying degrees. There are sometimes literacy issues. Then relationship wise, I would say: the world of trafficking is very competitive and combative. So developing healthy friendships is a challenge.
- Let me think really hard before I say this. I think one of the things is probably... Some people come with such strong underlying mental health issues that it makes it difficult to ever live independently.

Assets:

- You know, the development of positive relationships is really key—relationships with people outside of our program. We have a number of community mentors—women who come in from our community, volunteers, who will mentor them one on one. It is really a spiritual mother to them. And when those relationships are very strong, that mentor is not only guiding them when she's visiting with them, but she's also taking the women out into the community and introducing them to other people. Which helps her think a little bit further down the line than just our program, then.

Other:

- I think it takes a long time for somebody to feel like they're part of the community. I've seen that. Most, from childhood, have a sort of existed in the shadows. Most of our women reported abused as children and were moved from city to city.
- As far as spiritual health... Honestly (*sighs*) for the most part, I just sit back and watch—their spiritual health, I almost just have to stay out of the way and they find the Lord. (*Laughs*). It's the easiest evangelism I've ever done in my life.

West

Obstacles

- Failing to recognize their worth

- Failing to forgive their exploiters
- Possessing a jaded view of the world
- Historical problems enveloping them
- Embracing a community of toxic people
- Addictions to substances
- Fraternizing with inappropriate people
- Attitudes of entitlement
- Materialism

Assets

- The Christ factor- Spiritual transformation
- Change of peer group
- Great support system, great relationships
- Stable employment
- Stable community including abandoning inappropriate friends, staying away from abusers
- Possessing accountability to responsible people
- Continuing in the habits she has learned in the program

Quotes

Obstacles:

- Out of all these questions, make sure you note this: I would say, the trauma piece, the complex trauma—that is our number one enemy. It's their brain trauma injury from their abuse.
- So, I think the number one thing is that the girls do that interfere: they fail to know their worth. But... The other, number two thing—I would say it might even be number one—is forgiveness. They... If they cannot process the... The unforgiveness they have towards their perpetrators that have hurt them... And *current* people who have hurt them.
- So they get stuck in that pattern and they just feel like they're worthless because they haven't forgiven themselves, and God commands us to give others, he forgives us... That means *us!* We've got to forgive ourselves!
- They are looking at everything through trauma eyes. They are not fully healed and they have a jaded view of everyone in society. Therefore that causes *entitlement*. And here's the other thing: we have a millennial population here. They are very troubled; they want it and *now!* So that's the other thing: this Millennial Smart Phone generation... They feel very entitled.
- I mean I think we have to be offered this fair amount of choices and opportunities. However—are we ready for it? If we're not emotionally ready to handle a job that is a high volume of stress in a high volume of expectation at work, you're going to blow it anyway.

Assets:

- I gotta go back to the question you asked me because I want to make sure I answer that correctly for you.... I think our main one (helping factor) would be: the Christ factor.

That they've introduced Christ into their heart that they've accepted that God has created them, and that he has a plan for them, period.

- I think the other piece is, then... stay away from using, and working a regular job. And... Staying away from their abusers, and they can have normal relationships now. That is golden.
- So, I think that offering jobs... Is definitely a plus. But jobs that would be the kind that would offer some opportunity as well. To go up in the company. I think that will help survivors want to actually try what they call the "Square life".
- When you have that faith piece--the Christian piece--the girls might go back. But they'll always remember what it felt like when they receive Christ, and how their life changed. They will go back to that safe moment (with Christ) because that's a stabilization piece with a trauma victim.
- I would say the typical girl, if she can grasp what her life is supposed to look like in God's eyes what plan God actually has for her--she can be successful. That is the disconnect, okay. The thing is, that the successful part is a lot of stops and starts so she'll make a mistake, and she'll falter little bit. But then she'll get right back on the horse and start riding the horse again.

Other:

- Do not create welfare systems for these girls! Okay— don't let them stay stuck in this thing! (I should say boys too.) Don't let them stay stuck in the system! Help them become entrepreneurs! (*Striking hands*). Business owners... If not leaders of companies! Tell them that that's what you want to do--you want to see them succeed!
- Of all the girls we've had time I cannot recall one that has not accepted Christ! I'm not kidding you—and honestly, we don't evangelize to them. We just love on them--hard-core. And then when they go to church. I rescue them off the street--and then they'll say, "Can we pray?" And I'll be like *yes of course!* And some of them will say "I want to accept Jesus right now!" And I'm like, *okay! Let's do it!* (Excitedly raising her voice): Let's do it right now!
- *How bad do you want it? How bad you want success in your life?* If you're not ready to go after that thing, then you're not ready to really reintegrate into society. If you're not sick and tired of being sick and tired-- This is one of things that I tell the girls here. Okay?

Mid-South

Obstacles

- Returning to old haunts
- Trauma and mental health-related concerns
- Overconfidence when things are going well; Unhealthy relationships when they're not
- Discouragement related to poor relational choices
- Inability to be friends with other women
- Financial woes
- Paranoid thinking
- Love of "Bad Boys"

- Poor medical care and neglecting medications

Assets

- Ongoing contact with mentors and other positive supports
- Exposure to God's power
- Cultivation of appropriate habits and thinking patterns
- Career acquisition
- Establishing personal structure
- Maintaining sobriety
- Obtaining safe housing
- Continuing with counseling.

Quotes

Obstacles:

- But is probably the number one thing that's talked about in my house with all of them: "I don't know how to be friends with women. Can you help me with that?"
- They want to be accepted, they want to be wanted, they want to be chosen but they've never had that... (They have always embraced)...codependency, and they think, *Well I see some potential bad boy I can help to change him! I've had so many bad things happen to me I can share them with him (Laughing)!* But we're like, no, you can't change him. All things literally that we had talked about not doing, and she had agreed with, then all of a sudden, she's doing them all. She's got this guy and she's trying to get him into meetings, and she's trying to get him a sponsor and I was like, "You've got to stop. Your job is not to rescue and save him."
- Yes, they love bad boys! I've heard them say things about how they love a criminal intent! The number of tattoos he has (*they are laughing*). I mean literally you're saying-- Look at all the red flags! But again they can identify with that.
- It's just like with the meds. They'll say, "Oh I just couldn't afford the co-pay anymore." But yet, they got their hair done. But yet, they got their cigarettes. (*Both together*): They got the Red Bulls.

Assets:

- The ones that stay in contact with me here, with my staff or even with my volunteers-, they seem to do a lot better. They have better success than for the ones I just cut themselves off. Yeah.
- And if they will stay connected in receiving counseling in addition to staying connected and healthy community, and recovery and so forth-- that is really helpful to them.
- They usually experience the power of the Lord at some point during the program but also just the people. It's just been new to them, and I've loved having positive, happy, healthy people in their lives. And they realize *this is where I'm finding it...*

Other:

- Tim, we've got to be careful from a coercion standpoint. You've got to be careful that they feel empowered to make those kind a decision for themselves that we're not spoon feeding them, or that they're not going to receive certain services. I mean, we do a purity ring ceremony, and I think we were even starting to wonder at one point: *Is it the idea of the celebration, and being celebrated and all this kind of stuff, as to why taking that purity ring was important to them?* Because we do a party, and people come together, and it's a ceremony... But then we would find that people honoring that, that was getting pretty questionable! (*Laughing*). I mean, once they got out of the (Program) the purity rings seem to go out the window!
- I mean I had a new lady, and she came in saying she was an atheist. And her dad was a pastor. She completely come to the point where, "I just don't want anything to do with God" (was what she was saying). But, she knew who we were and she still wanted to come ... And, I always accept people right where they are. They don't have to be a believer or Christian or anything of the sort, just as long as they're open and if they say they're going to come and do the work I'm open to any kind of questions they may have. And really, I just want the Holy Spirit to work. And when she left the program, she really did have a powerful experience; and has a relationship with the Lord now.
- You can tell those who have family support do way better than those who have no family at all, or who came from a very broken and abusive dysfunctional family. A lot of them are from poverty also. That's another marker. And unfortunately, a lot of my women... Their trafficking started with the family member.

Drop-in Center (D-C: Not a "Program")

Obstacles

- Reports of Religious sexual abuse
- Treated poorly by the church
- Shallow spiritual formation and faith practices
- Legal background including felonies
- Historic abuses interfere
- Poor quality of available jobs
- Poor housing and availability of sheltered living

Assets

- Strong spiritual community and mentors
- Solid support of a community that accepts them

Quotes

Obstacles:

- So they're going to go to a temp agency, and then what happens at the temp agency? To throw them into a van and take them to (*neighboring town*) with a bunch of people who are probably getting high right? (*Laughs*). Or they're going to go work at a restaurant, which is not the best place for an addict to work.

- (One obstacle would be)... just how they're treated. By the church, I'd say, if they decide to go to church. People who know them know what they do.
- If they are unable to help you find a job and get housing, then right back to where they started from they may say, "Okay I want to move into a safe house." But are there enough transitional houses for women? There are not. There's more for men than there are for women. I know women who have left the (local Program) and then don't have anywhere to go. What do you do?

Assets:

- If they have the (Solid support of community that accepts them. A spiritual community. And they're involved with that-- whether that means just attending services; typically they have a small group. Yeah. An active, spiritual life.
- You encourage them to reunite with healthy people and reconstruct healthy relationships. And to stay away from those relationships that led them into addiction or encourage and help with their addictions.

Other:

- Most of the women who come here are believers. Um... Unfortunately many of them have been hurt by the church, or by a family member, or by a pastor or an elder. They been abused by that. And so their perception of God is fearful— although there still believers. I believe they have to be healed.
- We don't really have that opportunity here (to observe success) because nobody is flourishing.
- I have a lady who has had a job for about a month now. She's living in a safe path. That's a success. Now, is she flourishing? No, she still got a long way to go to flourish or even feel secure

Anti-Trafficking Group (ATG: Not a "Program")

Obstacles

- Substance abuse
- Shame leading to difficulties in approaching God
- Toxic relationships with other people, especially paramours
- Criminal records of clients

Assets

- Employability, an acceptable career or the equivalent (disability payments)
- Strong faith
- Positive relationships and good community
- Disengagement from unhealthy relationships
- Continuing openness to receiving social services if needed

Quotes

Obstacles:

- My observation is that a lot of folks in our programs, particularly in this population, have had a lot of adverse childhood experiences—at an early age and also have not had role models? For how to have healthy relationships? I think those are really big challenges for these women. You know?
- What I've heard women have said the most, is that the women feel a lot of shame. About what happened? And I don't so much hear any women say, all the ways that is problematic for them. But I would imagine that the shame impacts their abilities to be able to approach God—and also their abilities to approach other people. ...about the fact that it wasn't their choice. There's just a lot of shame ...

Assets:

- ...Any kinds of personal relationships. I think it could be any kind of friendships, intimate partner relationships, even relationships of family members.
- But just another example of a success for us though would be that she would feel like she could come back to us. If she did find herself in a situation where she needed more help—in that kind of thing happens they come back to us after six months or a year or three years and say, "I'm in this bad situation right now whatever it might be. Do you think you might help me again?" And we would say, probably yes.

Other:

- I've certainly had cases where former participants were engaged in online web camming, for example—they were earning income that way. In pursuits where the risk of exploitation was a lot higher like that. So, we would like to see them in other types of work. But that's not always the case.
- I would say that something else interesting that I have observed when folks come into our program is that quite a few folks have said that their faith in God help them get through what they got through. I've heard many folks say that... That while they're being exploited, they had faith in God. And for many folks that was really important for them. Helped them get through some of the hardest times. And I don't know that I would've thought that would've been the case beforehand... So I find it really interesting that quite a few people over the years have said that helped them get through. That their faith helped them get through it.
- I'm thinking of one woman in particular who just wanted to volunteer at her kids' school. And because she had a conviction on her record-- she was trafficked for sex but they charged her with a federal crime— there's no way to expunge that federal crime off her record. You can expunge them at the state level, so we help them to do that. What this woman, despite the fact that she was victimized and always ways cannot volunteer at her kids' school.
- I had a client a few years ago who... I knew she had a substance abuse issue... She told me it was not a current issue. But she was pregnant. And we really wanted to serve her and help her get through this pregnancy and deliver this baby free of drugs.... I think she managed to get through the first half of her pregnancy clean-- but without our knowledge she began using during the third trimester. After, the baby was born drug-addicted and was removed from her care. We were not able to continue serving her postdelivery, because she would not go to treatment. It became clear to us, no matter what she was saying, that she was currently using. And the baby went into the care of the Cabinet.

Appendix 5-1: Organization of Codes

Regarding the four broad categories by which the interviews and questionnaires were categorized: The first category was composed of Historical Factors, which weren't considered to be nearly as material as the other categories. This study focuses on post-program reintegration rather than on what occurred during the CSE years and the seasons they spent in The Programs. Remarks regarding personal history, however, were relevant to the degree that some of the respondents mentioned historic events from their experiences that interfered with the present.

A. Broad Codes

The interviews embodied a significant amount of raw data that had to be sorted and managed. The remarks of the CSE respondents were first divided into four broad codes.⁷¹⁷ Conversations or remarks unrelated to each woman's journey into- or out of CSE were not admitted as data.

1. Historic Antecedents. Remarks about historical events that occurred before the reintegration period.

These include early childhood up until the completion of each respondent's program. All events after completion of the program were considered reintegration. Remarks from this era may not have had direct bearing upon what their lives may have been like since she graduated, but they indirectly affected their lives. The women were asked in the self-interviews to describe as much or as little about their past as they were willing, as this gave the researcher a fuller picture of who each woman is and what she has endured. Some of the respondents returned to recollections of past events and they were permitted to do this during sessions if they so chose.

⁷¹⁷ Charmaz, *Constructing*, 113.

A person's past influences one's present and future indelibly. A child who loses her sight in mid-childhood will be permanently affected by this incident. Some women described the effects of trauma, shame and stigmatization as being so prominent they felt permanently impaired. It is noteworthy that these interviews collected data about what women said about themselves. Judgments concerning the validity or propriety of their remarks was held in tension. The "historical" remarks were used sparingly in the analysis phase. If the respondents mentioned childhood rapes or neglect as hindering factors or affixed historic factors to their materialistic instincts or inability to manage money their remarks had relevance.

2. Obstacles. Post-programmatic obstacles impeding reintegration identified.

This is the main category for the purpose of the study. Any remarks the participants made regarding obstacles or impediments in their reintegration journeys was noted. There were two specific questions in the questionnaire (#9: *Tell me a little bit about the most difficult areas of adjustment in your life at this time*; #10 *What do you think have been the primary things interfering with other women you have known who have tried to get out of the Life?*) and two in the face-to-face interviews (#2. *What is the hardest thing that you have had to deal with since leaving the program?* #3: *Share some of the roadblocks or some struggles you've encountered in your recovery*) addressing this area specifically. However, elements of their answers were also revealed in other stages of the interviews, and often the respondents recalled additional obstacles and difficulties when they were discussing other specific issues. Several of their best responses came later in the face-to-face interviews when they began to verbally process other incidents in their reintegration journeys.

3. Assets: Post-programmatic assets accommodating reintegration identified.

These variables are ones which respondents identified in their journeys or as having positive impacts on their post-program journeys. There was one specific question in the questionnaire (#8: *Tell me about the accomplishments you are most proud of since leaving the program, or about the things that you bring you the most joy.*) and one in the face-to-face interviews (#11: *What are the most positive things in your life today, and how do they influence your progress?*) that specifically addressed this. However, this set of variables proved to be the second most valuable category of responses revealing their obstacles. Sometimes respondents would talk about these two things in the same breath (For example, “I had a lot of toxic friends trying to lure me back to the old days... but I could always call my mentor when temptations began to arise”). Other times, understanding their obstacles became much clearer to all parties when they were talking about their “Not-obstacles”.

4. Complex variables

Broad codes considered in this category utilize the self-evident understanding of what constitutes a “grey” area. The participants identified numerous unique complicating factors that were difficult to characterize. These variables were important to them, but it wasn’t always possible to assess whether the identified values constituted flourishing or languishing factors. Respondents may have initially stated these to be a blessings or burdens to them, but more nuanced views would develop after further discussion. An example of this would be statements some of the respondents made about their roles as parents. Some respondents noted that their children were the greatest blessings in their lives, while also remarking that having sole custody meant that they needed more income, larger houses, better neighborhoods, and sometimes childcare difficulties and personal emotional traumas would ensue. For example, Alanna reported

My kids... influence my progress... You know when things at home are good, I'm good. And when things are not good, I'm not good. My daughter has anxiety and depression. So, there's been times where she's, I found that she's been doing self-harm and things like that, and I've like tanked. And it's been really hard for me to even come to work. And so, I would say that when she's doing good things are good at home and I know she's safe, even if I know she's going through a depressive stage, if I know she's safe and I'm still doing good.

The same respondent also reported she continues to undergo suboxone maintenance after more than five years of sobriety from pure opioids. It is beyond the scope of this study to declare whether this is a positive development or a negative one in the life of the respondent, particularly after limited interviews with her. On one hand, the treatment keeps her stabilized and she is a high achiever at her Christian workplace. On the other hand, this reveals an addiction she has not been able to abandon. It's a grey area. As another example Jamie noted this about her learned manipulative abilities:

My thing is that like I said before when you hear "no" I actually hear "yes". And I think that comes from being in the Life. So, I find that I still use tactics that used to help me survive in the life that I use in this new life. And it's actually helped-- there's actually criteria that you can meet. So instead of, before when I was just manipulating, I'm no longer manipulative-I'm just very creative.

B. Focused codes

Respondents brought up recurring themes to describe their principal obstacles to re-integrating into community after having been CSE and then completing Christocentric Programs of healing. As stated, they were asked some direct questions related to obstacles; In providing biographical information formally and informally they also revealed insights that might have been obscured. Another way I was able to ascertain obstacles was to recognize the Not-obstacles, which I have labelled "assets" in their reintegration journeys. The richest insights concerning their struggles could be found

both in the “obstacles” and in the “assets” categories. If some phenomenon occurred that helped them to reintegrate satisfactorily, the phenomenon for that respondent was not an obstacle. So, after relevant remarks had been assigned to broad categories their remarks were further broken down to capture the themes they had proposed. These focused codes enabled me to develop a theory about the principal obstacles encountered. The bulk of the observations were derived from the Obstacles Encountered, and Assets Accommodating with regard to reintegration. Each respondent weighed in on what was helpful and what was problematic along the way to becoming healthy, well-adjusted members of their communities.

Whether an identified variable was always an obstacle for all respondents varied by their individual experiences. For example, one might state that an internship she had been enrolled in was one of the best phenomena enabling her to transition to a steady job. Another might speak negatively about the internship. One respondent ebulliated about how supportive her church family was, while another complained about the amount of toxic people that had emerged at church. Having children at home to care for was portrayed as both blessing and a burden by different respondents. Some variables were very clear. however. Several of the respondents discussed their attraction to “Bad boys” but none of them portrayed this as positive. One expressed her ongoing desire to continue her path of drug addiction, but none of them portrayed the lure to return to abusing substances as positive.

In assigning labels to these codes, I used both *in-vivo codes* and *consensus codes*. My aim was to allow the women’s voices to speak even in the phrases utilized referring to specific phenomena. Therefore, the use of *in-vivo codes* was preferable.⁷¹⁸ When

⁷¹⁸ *In-vivo codes* are symbolic markers designating the participants own speech patterns and the meanings they affix to their own words. Charmaz, 131.

Summer stated that she is still burdened with possessing a “Ghetto Side” she was articulating a concept many of the other respondents had referred to, though they all didn’t use the same phrase. Likewise, we have already discussed respondents’ common usage of the words “The Life”, “Sugar Daddy” and what came to be referred to as “The Program”. Participants consistently used the phrase “Bad Boys” in identical ways, to mean men who were not stable, were not spiritually and emotionally healthy for them to interact with socially, but to whom they were attracted regardless. Another in-vivo phrase commonly heard was “I am triggered by...” It is a powerful phrase because most hearers recognize that a trigger itself in repose is not threatening but when it is squeezed it can potentially cause great damage, sometimes striking unintended targets.

With the large conglomerate of data, however, it was not possible to make every Focused Code in-vivo. Some categories were vast and included *concepts* that most readers would understand but no unique phrase emerged that tied it specifically to this demographic. I considered these to be Consensus Codes because I surveyed all available data describing the phenomenon and chose a phrase that would be easily grasped. “Loneliness” was a category to which I ascribed a Consensus Code. Some respondents described loneliness primarily related to not dating for years at a time. Others spoke of having no close friends who really understood the inner turmoil they had experienced. The emotion underlying both of these phenomena could be described as loneliness, so I combined them under a single heading.

“Mental Health” was another category to which I ascribed a consensual phrase. Some of the respondents spoke of bi-polar responses, depression, and a multiple-personality disorder. Trauma was the most common mental health complaint. Rather than creating too many sub-categories which might cloud the overarching phenomena, I simply grouped these related complaints under a common umbrella of mental health-

related obstacles. The recorded responses of the women should be sufficient to address any ambiguities.

Appendix 5-2: Exemplary Codes- Obstacles to Flourishing as Articulated by

Respondents

1. Life skills

- So to speak “adulthood” can be *really hard*. -Louise
- But how do you go to the library? Like, I haven’t been to the library since I was a child? -Ginger
- it’s different from being in the street world, and then being in the real world. It’s really *different*. -Summer

2. Self-Sabotage

- I think *I’m* like my biggest enemy -Tia
- I don’t feel like anybody is keeping me from reintegrating... Nobody is holding me back, but myself. I was my biggest enemy. -Yvette
- I don’t know why I always have to go out with a bang. But when people hurt me I just... throw a fit, you know-so that was probably the hardest thing. You know, I get very impulsive. I cut everybody off. -Kelsey

3. Inadequate Network

- I still struggle with not having a man in my life. I still sometimes look for the bad guys since that’s all I know who to go after -Tia
- (The mentor) literally said “I don’t know you as a drug addict, I know you when you’re clean. And I don’t know what you’re capable of... I just think she really doesn’t have the skills. She doesn’t know that life... -Ginger
- I just stick to my own self. Because I have trust issues... So I just like to keep my circle small... I have to do for myself because in the end, nobody’s really going to be there for you. -Summer
- There are a couple volunteers who I could be, you know, going to coffee with her, going to church with. But I think even still, for their benefit I don’t want to be that transparent. I don’t want to be dumping my life on them, because these are not survivors of human trafficking. -Mona

4. Ghetto Side

- ...If were talking about using needles, or we sit around and we are talking about drugs it makes me think like, “God, she has good veins.” I might think, “... if I had them veins when I was using...” -Jamie
- I have a lot of street in me. -Summer

- If there was two people standing here, the one with the gold, and the pants hanging down. The one with a pocket full of money is more interesting to me ... And he can call me a Bitch and a Ho... But he for some reason he's still more interesting to me than the Christian who was opening the door for me, take me out to a movie and not get in my pants the first month. -Jamie

5. Boredom/Restlessness

- Because I'm not going to be the kind of person who's sitting at home bored and say "I'm gonna go to the park..." I'm not going to do that. I'm going to sit there and think for four hours ... about how bored I am and how upset I am. -Ginger
- (My triggers seem to be) boredom and... stress. And there's one more. Yeah, mainly stress or just when... (*Sighs heavily and pauses for several moments*) ... I don't even know the word for it. -Tia

6. Mental Health

- Trauma does some funny things to people -Holly
- So, like even the littlest noise is very startling to me. And I feel so bad that my husband lives with that! -Theresa
- There are times when I'm in a restaurant... And I say to myself *that guy has totally molested his daughter.* -Holly

7. Sex Addiction

- ...(The therapist) did like a deal where I had to be sex-free for a long period of time. It never really lasted that long-- But it always ended up becoming THAT. And I tried doing books about sex addiction, but they never end up working. -Kelsey
- I mean with the lust addiction I don't feel like I got as much help as I needed. -Tia
- (One of my biggest obstacles was) ...just being promiscuous. Having that promiscuity. ... (Now I'm) realizing my worth as a daughter of Christ, and a daughter of the king. And that I'm paid in full... by the cross. And coming to realize my value is not in giving myself to men. -Shannon

8. Materialism

- I broke away from the materialism and although I saw a Bentley on my way over here... -Shannon
- You know I never want to be homeless again, so I always make sure my bills are paid, but it's like after I pay my bills, with whatever little money I have left, it's like, "Fill me up with something." -Mona

9. Substance Abuse

- I don't know how to describe it to you, but I want to have my cake and eat it too... And so what I did this time was, I worked and worked and thought and thought and tried to figure it out and couldn't do it. So I met this guy who was dealing. So I knew that he

would consistently have (the drugs). And he just kept asking me out-- he *really* wanted to take me out. -Ginger

- So when he came and got me, he's like, "*I am going to be honest with you, I want to get high.*" And I said like "Man the devil is busy! I haven't even been out for 24 hours and you're offering me drugs. Dude!" So that's how that started. -Sadie
- If I would wake up tomorrow and have everything my way, I would be able to use drugs, and support my family. -Ginger

10. Family Issues

- And so then, he was like, "Oh then I'll go get my name on you." And he has my name on him. But that would make me think that "*I told you he loved me.*" But then he's got it on like seven of the girls too. -Jamie
- I know she's very, you know, selfish when it comes to... money... and stuff, and I just can't be around her. Same with my sister. -Kelsey
- I mean I love my daughter so much, she's my joy. But the money-it's way too expensive. -Shannon
- We have a no-contact order. And he sent me a bunch of letters and stuff? So, I called a detective who was on my case. Then he started sending packages to my daughter? So I called him and he filed more charges against him. -Alanna
- She's smokin' pot with some friends at school in ninth grade. And one of her friends introduce her to porn. So, it really hurts me. In my little mind. It was like when I came to Christ. I thought that God was just going to cover them, but... it's not a perfect world. -LaDonna

11. Loneliness

- I haven't really dated anybody since I've been out of The Life, and I've always had this dream of getting married and doing life with somebody else... And so it's been... It's been *very* lonely these past few years! -Alanna
- Being lonely-- that's when all the thoughts come. I ache. And sometimes you're just thinking too much -Tia
- So, I would say that's probably the hardest thing. Feeling like nobody really *gets* me or understands me, kind of like maybe I don't fit in anywhere. -Holly

12. Interfering History

- But there's still the issue that if you're on Facebook, people can find you. Just out of the blue some people will say *Hey Sugarmama (Pseudonym)* -you know that was my street name-- they'll say, *how are you doing?* I haven't heard from you or I heard that you died. -Jamie
- So, I was an activities director at a nursing home. And then they promoted me to HR business office manager. Then six months later they fired me (when they discovered my felonies.) -Sadie
- I had taken 25 felonies for my trafficker. And I went and did 17 months in county jail. -Summer

- ...Then before too long, you know I look forward to the phone call. I look forward to the emails. I look forward to hearing his voice. And before you-know-what, I'm-a start taking my paycheck and putting it towards a lawyer... -Jamie

13. Employment Concerns

- I was told I was staff by my last job placed, the last interview with them was to try to keep my job. There was that "You're only a support system. Like, you're not actual staff. We don't need another support person". Because the school reimbursed them to pay them like seventy percent of what I was getting paid. -Patti
- All this *hope* and *do your best*. *You'll be permanent in three months. Don't even worry about it*. And you get to the job, you get to the two months and your manager says like, "We've never had a budget for you to go permanent." -Mona
- Well, having two felonies was a big barrier. At first. Until I got in the mind frame that those felonies are *not* going to stop me from getting a freaking good job, period. -Yvette

Appendix 5-3: Infrequently Mentioned Obstacles to Flourishing

Other obstacles that did not fit easily into the thirteen categories listed were mentioned by some respondents as being prominent in their lives. I didn't ask the participants to itemize the obstacles they encountered in the numerical order of their importance. Instead, they were asked to address all the obstacles they were aware of interfering with their reintegration. I mention outliers here to provide voices to all my respondents' chief concerns. The following were mentioned by one or two of the seventeen women as significant obstacles. Some of these might indeed be collapsed into the aforementioned categories, but their concerns were phrased in unique ways. Rather than speculating too broadly about whether their remarks "fit" elsewhere, these brief summaries conclude a full representation of respondents' remarks and may be useful for further research.

Physical Health: Patti discussed at length how her Traumatic Brain Injury, which she incurred at the beginning of her reintegration journey, interfered with her ability to flourish, though she appeared to be sanguine about her level of spiritual flourishing.

Shannon provided a narrative about how her bulimia had interfered with other areas of her life. In addition to these, Scarlett discussed her Hep C and her need for denture work, but she didn't list these as obstacles—she merely remarked that her insurance had paid for these things, which was an asset.

Churches/Program Failed Me: Kelsey spoke of disappointments with her local church and Ginger discussed her feelings that The Program itself, particular the skill of mentors and other caregivers, failed her. In an interesting twist, though, both of these also confided later in their interviews that those failures were ultimately due to their own deficits, so their complaints were similarly addressed in the “Self-Sabotage” category.

Poor education: Both LaDonna and Yvette discussed how they felt their low levels of education kept them from making better progress. These disclosures were also incorporated in the “Interfering History” segment. Not having finished high school was a historic barrier that has limited LaDonna's vocational choices for the time being. Yvette had received her GED over thirty years' prior. She has never considered college and continues to struggle with basic life skills such as budgeting and saving. She would like to own and operate a food truck in the near future but recognizes she will have to take some basic business classes and acquire better knowledge of entrepreneurial concerns before she will be in a position to pursue that dream.

Poor Housing: Melody discussed this as one of her top concerns. Other respondents mentioned it in passing as part of a larger financial issue, but not as a unique concern. Ginger did *not* report this as a top concern although she lives in her car. She recognizes that homelessness is but one symptom of her opiate addiction; If she possessed the desire

and ability to overcome her addiction, numerous other obstacles would consequently be eliminated.

Small Town Mentality (Bi-Racial Kids): Louise and Alanna both reported on a shared problem here. While they didn't include remarks that their "In town" friends ridiculed them or mentioned that the fathers of their children had been exploiters, both of them reported that they felt discriminated and marginalized in their new communities by neighbors who seemed to be offended by the presence of their children.⁷¹⁹

Absence of Greater Survivor Network: Alanna was resolute in observing that a network she felt she *needed* had not been *available*. She received this revelation after attending a Survivors' network and recognizing its' worth; However, she had been post-CSE for about six years before she identified the network, and it may not have been functioning at the time she felt she most needed it.

Inner Conflicts (Agitated, Not Good at Surrender, Living in Two Worlds): Ginger stated that these internal conflicts were her greatest obstacle. Although her concerns seemed to be covered by the variables "Ghetto side," "Self-sabotage," "Substance Abuse" and "Inadequate Network" Ginger's phrasing was unique, so her *in vivo* terms are included here as the aim was to capture what the respondents *expressed* as their chief obstacles. Therefore, greater nuance is included in the event that her concerns have not been expressed in language she would have affirmed.

Poor Self-esteem and Paranoid Thoughts: The respondents spoke a good deal about their identities and their mistakes. Only two of them made a connection to self-esteem

⁷¹⁹ Perhaps not insignificantly Alanna and Louise are friends who live in the same region. They were interviewed separately, but the clarity of their complaints may be somewhat enhanced by past communal discussions where this had been the topic. Their perceptions alternatively could be grounded in a parallel truth that their town actually *is* either more racist or less welcoming of single women with mixed-race children than are other U.S. towns.

though, and they noted that their insecurities sometimes seemed to keep them from flourishing particularly because they believed people were gossiping or discriminating against them, even though they had no evidence of this. So, they related this obstacle to their own feelings of self-worth rather than assuming that their negative thoughts were meritorious.

No stable past to return to: The final unique concern was one raised by Mona. It overlaps with the “Life Skills” and “Interfering History” categories but differs from both of these in a specific and poignant manner. Mona stated to the interviewer

I think like my boyfriend now, he forgets where I came from. Or he doesn't believe the full scale of what I went through because of how I talk and how I look... This is kind of a side note, but my boyfriend, when we are planning to go visit my family out in California. He said to me, “Are we going to stay in the bedroom where you grew up in? That your mom kept for you?” And I'm like, “I didn't have no room. We didn't have a house....” But he, like other people just assumed that I had this nice life.

Concerns about criminal background weren't reported by the respondents as affecting education, housing, personal relations or anything other than prospective employment. For Scarlett, her criminal record potentially turned out to be beneficial, since an ex-felon hired her enthusiastically when she levelled with him about her felonies. Several respondents reported criminal records as obstacles, but that data was merged into a sub-category of employment.

Appendix 5-4: Brief Snapshots of the Respondents

1. **Alanna** was raised in an upper middle-class home and she became engaged to a man who was very wealthy. When the relationship was terminated, her life went into a tailspin involving copious substance abuse which propelled her squarely into the control of a violent and manipulative pimp. An agent eventually intervened to arrange for her emancipation. She was not seeking faith or spirituality, but these elements were present

at her rehabilitative program. She made a commitment to Christ which remains central to her life today. She received a college education and transitioned into a job where she cares for other women who have been CSE. She experiences some loneliness today and isn't as connected to a strong church as she had previously been. She is haunted by the reality that an evil individual was so easily able to dominate and subsume her life.

2. **Ginger** says she was never molested as a child. The role-modeling in her home was poor, but it provides her no excuse for the life she pursued. Since completing the Program, people were available and active in trying to help her to stabilize. It was a mentor who connected her to the interviewer and this study. Yet they simply were not skilled or dedicated enough to shepherd her through her cravings, she said. She lives in her car with a man she doesn't love. Her primary obstacle appears to be that she loves the feeling of being high and won't surrender that for anything. She will refuse rehab. She admits that she will deceive, steal, bend rules and laws and manipulate people for the privilege of being able to stay high. She views herself not as someone who has worked in prostitution, maybe not as an addict so much as a person who has chosen an alternative reality found in narcotics that transcends every other concern or option in life.
3. **Holly** previously drew her identity from her sexuality. Today her identity can be found in being a Child of God. She wept when she discussed how God's grace had been extended to her. She is still undergoing therapy after being out of the Program for many years, and she described traumatic responses she had to strangers on the street, for example. She has been engaged for five years to what she described as a caring and patient man, but she has refused to marry him as the impending date approached due to traumatic fear and ongoing insecurity. Her life has become consumed with helping other women recover from similar experiences. She feels self-confident and has developed the reputation as a dedicated and no-nonsense caregiver. She is content with how much she

has achieved vocationally and with the subsequent upward mobility. Yet she feels that God is calling her to an even higher purpose.

4. **Jamie** is from an upper middle-class family, but she reported that abuse and drug use were pervasive. She was seduced by a drug dealer when she was twelve, and her mother forced an abortion upon her. She was ambitious in the Life, she reports, having worked her way up to Bottom Girl and Madame, recruiting other young women into CSE. She stated that she is an addict, not only striving to remain drug-free, but also to be free from co-dependent relations and extensive sexual entanglements with men. She reports that she also pursued “Bad Boys” when she was in the Program, and that her ongoing sexual compulsions continue to be problematic. But she has a strong support network involving her church, a mentor, Program people and others. She has recently had a transformative experience in which she received Christ as Savior, she reported, and she has been sober three years. She is impressed by how the Program provided great job preparation, not content to allowing participants to simply move into entry-level jobs. She hopes to be a victim advocate one day but needs more education to achieve that. Her life is complicated by having to care for her four children, whose father is her former pimp, and by the ongoing influence of this man in her life.
5. **Kelsey** was molested as a child, raped as a teenager, and had a combative relationship with her mother. She lived with several foster families, regularly absconded, and found her way back to her mother, who initiated her into prostitution. She says she became very spiritual in the Program but doesn’t want faith to be central to her life at this time. She bemoans that the Program people weren’t more deliberate in inserting themselves in her life but also reports on deliberately pushing all supports out of her life. She revealed that the Program people and her church network provided everything she needs to live well. A poor network continues to impede her flourishing. She spoke of churches in

transactional terms. She reflected on her dissatisfaction with co-workers, mentors, churches and other supports. She admitted that her “sex addiction” and tendencies to self-sabotage are great inhibitors. She prostituted herself briefly for at least several months after leaving the program and had a baby from one of her partners. She is currently cohabiting with a man who appears to be caring and industrious and they are engaged to be married. She performs a job from home enabling her to care for her infant son and speaks of wanting a career in the future as a caregiver to animals but has no concrete plans to achieve that. She keeps herself “heavily medicated” with psychotropic prescriptions in order to cope.

6. **LaDonna** grew up in a lower-income household without any particular code of ethics. When she started engaging in risky behaviors, the authority figures in her household never questioned her, she reported. She had two children out of wedlock and believed that self-commodifying was the best option to keep her children from poverty. A concerned couple embedded themselves in her life and urged her to enroll in the Program. She had no knowledge or interest in faith matters up to that point but once she began rehabilitation, she had a life-changing encounter with Christ, she said. Serving his kingdom became the center of her life. She is surrounded by a strong network of church people and other supporters today and reaches out to them weekly. She hasn’t yet finished high school but has been working in a well-paid job for several years that meets her financial needs. She owns her home. She coaches teenagers in life skills at her church and regularly hosts them in her home. She serves in other capacities as well, giving motivational talks and assisting non-profits. She emphasizes the need for a physically healthy lifestyle in addition to one that is spiritually enriching.
7. **Louise** was raised in a middle-class household and always felt like she was worthless and unloved. She lacked a distinct identity, so she filled her life up with drugs and

promiscuity. Then she fell under the control of a trafficker. As an agnostic, she was initially disdainful at the thought of being cared for by what she called “Bible Thumpers” when she enrolled in the Program. She reports relapsing in “every way” at the Program’s conclusion, becoming pregnant and returning for more care. There she “surrendered my life to Jesus” and reports she had at last found a new identity. She works for the Program today and has learned numerous skills. She expresses experiencing fulfillment there. Yet she continues to struggle with building community, due to her introversion she reported. She still utilizes a mentor and a therapist. She doesn’t believe she quite fits into her church, and it seems like her interracial children have been a social barrier in her community. Though she experiences warm fellowship with her Program friends, she admits that there is a degree of discomfort regarding *how much* they know about her. She believes some other career is looming on the horizon for her, which may require more education.

8. **Melody** enthusiastically stated she has been transformed in Christ. However, she noted that there are many temptations facing a young woman trying to make ends meet. When she lived in a HUD home, she fell back into drug use and solicitation. Her complaint is that HUD homes in bad neighborhoods are inadequate places for people in recovery to live. She now lives in housing built on the Program’s property. She is taking full-time college classes in order to provide a better life for her child, so she won’t be tempted to make more poor choices. She does not complain about the three part-time jobs she must juggle in order to pay her bills. She states that she was suspicious at first of the motives of “church People” who were excessively friendly and giving. But since she’s gotten involved with the church, she realizes that their love and support has been authentic.
9. **Mona** grew up in an impoverished urban environment with no stability. She was molested as a child and coerced into sex by older men. Church attendance was

compulsory, but she encountered hypocrisy both among the clergy and the congregation, she said, including men sexually coercing her. She became very materialistic, and although she was able to land office jobs she was dissatisfied with the income. This led her into nude modeling jobs and her life deteriorated from there. Since she left the Program, she has kept many of her supports at bay, but connects with a supportive friend and continues to talk to a mentor. She reports having a bi-polar condition diagnosis and recognizes how this colors her perspective. She cohabits with a man and expresses guilty feeling about the situation. She continues to wrestle with materialistic impulses. Expressing gratitude for subsidized rent, a respectable if routine position and for her sobriety, she still feels that something more dynamic in life must be impending than what her current experiences reflect. She was grievously wounded by past church encounters but embraces a hope that there is a church family on the horizon with whom she might be able to engage constructively.

10. **Patti** speaks of having been trafficked as a small child by a relative. Her entire upbringing, as she describes it, was malignant. Even so, she made a serious commitment to follow Christ as a teenager but continued to be trafficked and to abuse opiates in response. Patti spent several years in the Program that hosted our interview, and in another as well. At the end of her rehabilitation, she was in an automobile accident which cause a Traumatic Brain Injury. So, although she was brought to a safe place and rehabilitated from narcotics, she had problems obtaining employment. Her renewed faith has sustained her through this season of life, she reports. She complained that the work internships provided for her were inadequate. However, it appears that her cognitive abilities have suffered to the degree that any employment will be difficult for her. She is enthusiastic about her faith, and she volunteers in a number of capacities with her church. But she subsists on a stipend of about \$340 a month, not having been yet approved for a

full disability. Finding a safe government-subsidized domicile and travelling to her various physical- and mental health appointments have complicated her life. She appears to be spiritually strong but developmentally weak.

11. **Sadie** was raised in a financially needy household. Although her mother was an addict, some of the male role models she was exposed to were positive, and she gained church exposure through one of these. She placed herself in a vulnerable position and was beaten and non-consensually pimped out by a man she thought was her boyfriend. Faith was not an important factor in finding a rehab, she said, but she had a spiritual reawakening while she was there. She stated that the Program set her up for success, providing everything she needed to flourish. She relapsed once after graduating, but then learned to establish better boundaries with people and to resist unhealthy relationships. The biggest barrier she faced was her criminal background, which got her fired from a career-oriented job she loved and kept her from landing other good jobs as well as restricting her movements. She stated that she had a great network, numerous social services programs and she continues to maintain strong bonds today with church people, Program people, a therapist and other positive influencers. She is a factory employee today and contemplates a future where she can serve others vocationally.
12. **Scarlett** reports that she was raised in a spiritually depressed community where she perceived that women either had to survive based on their appearances, or by selling drugs. She reports being tricked into a CSE network, disclosing how powerful pimps in her region manipulated her and would have brought violence had she not complied. Through participation in the Program, she recognized her own deficits, including how she had ignored God's desires for her life. She pledged a commitment to Christ at age twelve, but fully embodied her Christian commitment while in the Program. Since then, her physical health and her fortunes have flourished. She attributes her progress to a

strong church, ongoing relationships with the Program people, and continuing counseling. She surrounds herself with a Christian community involving church people, Program supports and others. She is going to college to pursue a career track but has a redemptive job in the interim that could result in a career if she wished to remain there. She practices moral purity today, she said, and insists that her current boyfriend spends time with her entire family rather than solely with her.

13. Shannon was raised in an upper middle-class household and continues to struggle with materialistic impulses today. She worked as a high-class escort and remarked that the reason she began doing that was due to the financial rewards. She suffered from bulimia, but substance abuse was not a factor in her rehabilitation. She was accustomed to enjoying new clothes, nice automobiles other luxuries before her life was co-opted by a controlling pimp who stopped permitting her to access her money. Shannon married a man shortly after she met him at church. She speaks of “trying out” different churches, revealing a transactional bias. Her husband has a modest income at this juncture, and she is transparent about her economic dissatisfaction. She has difficulty making friends, and she is pregnant with her second child. The stay-at-home component is a barrier to advancing her career. She is studying to get her realtor’s license to improve their income. She stated that she still must resist impulses to flirt with other men, and she reported marital strife in her first year of marriage. She says she has been truly transformed by Christ. Even so, she is experiencing underlying tension and restlessness in her new role as a housewife.

14. Summer was raised in a rough neighborhood by an alcoholic father who raped and beat her, and he eventually killed her mother, she reports. She endured a complicated relationship with her pimp, who fathered children with her when she was a teenager. She possesses a surplus of self-confidence and jokes about how she was described as the

“Million Dollar Ho”. She served substantial jail time, and from there went to a Program in a different part of the country. She continued to assert great independence after graduation, moving back to her hometown located far from her support network. She reportedly continues to distrust people which has impeded her supportive community. She takes college classes on-line and has no problem finding a job, but she still mismanages her money. She reports both pride and disdain regarding her achievements as a fast-food restaurant supervisor. She knows she can always find employment in spite of her felonies, but she wishes she had a more respectable career. She speaks jovially about the rudeness she has apportioned to her customers when she is experiencing stress. She remarked that she still has a “lot of street” in her which sometimes lands her in trouble. Though her demeanor reflects surplus tenacity, she embraces no significant socio-spiritual community for counsel or stability.

15. Theresa was raised in a toxic household where she recognized from the first grade that CSE “...would be my fate”. She was regularly shown pornographic films and images, and her mother engaged in open sexual encounters in view of onlookers. Employment in nude modelling and stripping led to prostitution and many years of participating in pornographic films. When she enrolled in the program, she underwent a transformational spiritual experience that shapes and guides her life today. She initiates outreaches to other women and is extremely well connected with her church, academic and Program communities, gathering women together for fellowship and events. She is employed at three part-time jobs, including one at her alma mater and one in which she speaks publicly about her experiences. She is a published author, has earned a master’s degree and is considering a doctorate. She married a man who is also affiliated with her alma mater and considers the purity of their dating relationship and the ensuing stability of their marriage to be primary accomplishments. Her former public life has proven to be

one of her greatest obstacles, as she has been stalked and publicly humiliated by individuals familiar with her past. She described numerous anxieties and traumatic responses for which she continues in therapy.

16. Tia described her upbringing in unremarkable terms. Her parents mandated church attendance and she feels as though they pushed religion on her, but she was uninterested. She described how an early fascination with wealth and the misguided trust she placed in a boyfriend led her to CSE. She stated that in the Program she experienced a “complete transformation” and began “a personal relationship with Jesus Christ”. She reports having had no problems landing employment and finding other resources after graduating from the Program. She is engaged in college full-time and is employed at a university job that takes care of most of her financial needs. She stated that people from her church and the Program have continued to shepherd her along in her journey. She volunteers with her church on a weekly basis. However, she expressed difficulty managing a “lust addiction” and reported that people who know her story have tried to manipulate her. She describes loneliness as being her greatest obstacle to flourishing and admits that loneliness has led to alcohol abuse at times. She no longer uses narcotics as in the past, but she experiences a visceral desire for male companionship and laments that she is still attracted to “Bad Boys” although she recognizes they would be detrimental to her socio-spiritual health

17. Yvette still appears to be haunted by her agonizing childhood. She focused a good deal of the interview upon being molested as a child, observing violence and depravity at home, having poor foster care, early exposure to drugs and being coerced into the Life. She is stubborn and self-reliant, she notes, and this has resulted in self-sabotage. She continued to be CSE into her late forties and returned to old habits several times post-Program. She has not established reliable community around her. Against counsel she

re-established community in the city that had proven unhealthy for her, and she continues to struggle with personal relationships. She experiences ongoing difficulties with finishing her shifts when she is working. She considered herself to be clean and sober at the time of the interview, but that had only been occurring for about seven weeks. She recognizes that violence against children is better identified and more succinctly dealt with today than in her day, and she laments the fact that no intervention was ever undertaken on her behalf.

Appendix 6-1: Exemplary Codes- Assets

1. Community Supports

- I do have a good mentor... She is absolutely amazing. She stays in contact with me. - Tia
- The program director there, Crystal—I see Crystal all the time... We do kickboxing in her house a lot, and we go out to eat. Like I really hang out with her family. -Sadie
- I feel like they knew... They know everything they needed to know about me. They made efforts to find out. Even when I wasn't willing... And they really cared. It was genuine. -Scarlett
- I absolutely utilize their resources 100%. They teach you to build community while you're here. I did that. And just like my church family. They are like my new family. The family I never had... they love these women. -Melody.
- But I was like "How am I going to take care of another kid?" But like ever since she's been born, I've never had to buy her anything. Somebody at my church will say, "Hey LaDonna, I've got some shoes for you. Got some clothes for you..." -LaDonna
- My support comes from the church that I attended... That's mainly my support system. And then I have another college ministry that I'm a part of. It's ...a young adults ministry. -Patti
- I was pretty intentional about getting things. So, I go to kind of like a bigger church. And a lot of people complain, like, how to have community in a big church? And I say, like you get plugged in! Well, I started serving! -Theresa
- ...They've all been very welcoming. It's funny, they all have like open arms to open up to a survivor. Like they all want to do that. -Alanna
- I have like five people that I pray with all the time. Like I have one, the mother of a guy that I used to date, and we talk almost every day and we pray almost every day. - LaDonna
- The people in my life are very positive. They call me on myself from doing anything inappropriate; they give me the real deal; they don't sugarcoat it. -Sadie
- At first, it was kind of awkward. Because when you come here, you're not used to like people *loving* on you. You're just like, "What do you want from me?" I wouldn't talk to anybody. -Melody

- It was really important for me to be able to create a community outside The Program... And it was the first place where I was just a woman studying the Bible among other women. -Theresa

2. Ongoing Counseling

- Christian-based counseling? Where they will offer counseling in your budget? ...The resources are amazing out there. Those all help me to get where I am. -Shannon
- I came in there pointing a finger-this is that, it's them... she let me do this over a couple of weeks and then she was like, "What's your part in it?" I didn't think I *had* a part in it. -Scarlett

3. My Sobriety

- I really don't struggle with drugs, I am two years sober, but I also don't live in the state where I was doing drugs. So... I really don't think drugs were my problem. -Kelsey
- My accomplishments since leaving is almost sober and clean for 3 years. -Patti (*sic*)
- I would like to say I'm now almost 3 years sober and clean from the LIFE but when I say that I'm still like a infant that is still just now learning how to walk. (*sic*) -Sadie

4. Spiritual Commitment

- It's kind of like y'all are dating in a way. You know, the time is intimate, you're knowing him, and he knows you. I mean, he already knows you, but like him revealing himself to you... -Scarlett
- Today I put God first in my life. He has done for me many of things that I could not have done myself which is leave that life to start a new one with him being the head of it. - Sadie
- I will say that I've had many encounters, and I love the way that God speaks to me because it fits my personality very well. He speaks to me some through visuals and so oftentimes through nature and stuff like that. I love that and it all makes sense to me. - Louise
- I think my biggest accomplishment is having had a pure dating relationship with a man who had his own values and walk with God and in no way ever tried to compromise mine. -Theresa
- I remember this one guy asked me out. And my oldest daughter, she was like... I mean he was *really* cute. (*Laughs*). He ate healthy, like me, he worked out like me. There was only one thing: He didn't love God. So, I broke up-- I said we can't go out anymore. And my daughter said to me, she said *Mom you must really love God*. -LaDonna

5. Transformed Identity

- I know Jesus, I have a personal relationship with him. And my life just fully depends on him. I mean that's what my identity is, in Jesus. -Melody
- I came to (The Program) in 2011 and was baptized (almost like a vow renewal in marriage) ... after watching the Passion of the Christ. I realized now what it meant to follow Jesus and I had people who vowed to help point me back to him in good times and bad. -Theresa
- And I got myself up, and I got myself together. And that was at the point where I was like, I'm living for Jesus, no matter what. I'm going to repent every day; I'm going to live for God. I know no one's perfect, but only God. And ever since then I've been living for God. -LaDonna

- For you to understand my spiritual identity, I believe that I have been saved by Jesus. I do believe in God. I identify myself as a Christian. I am a new believer. Up until 6 ½ years ago I had no idea who God or Jesus was. I thought it was all a joke. -Louise
- I am on the right path. And I know that I'm with him. I'm just *happy*. I'm grateful that he's so real in my life. Times when I get busy or just doing life, that's one thing that I feel like in the (Program). I probably take that for granted. -Scarlett.
- I just recently received Jesus as my savior. (Now)... I have a God who loves me and wants the best for me. ...This world is unfair but that God never has done nothing to hurt me but there is free will and evil in this world. That he takes our mistakes and the bad and will make good. -Jamie
- I would say my identity now is in Christ. A new creation... So strong, brave, courageous... I speak from time to time and I'll have people come up to me and say, "Wow, I never would have known that that has gone on." -Holly

6. Vocational Progress

- ...I was going to those classes for employment having to do with having had a criminal background... Because having had a past, I was feeling very intimidated. But that class was very encouraging for me. -Jamie
- So, it was kind of a God thing. I have no... Like educational background for this position. It was just all street knowledge pretty much. So, I came through the program? ...Then about eight months later... (Program Founder) came to me and said would you ever want to do case management? And I said like "YEAH!" -Alanna
- Also, my role here at (Program). It has always been my dream job. And (*laughs*) I get to do it every day! It's one of my biggest life accomplishments. -Alanna
- I really love the two positions that I have... This flexible 20-hour job here, and then I have like 10 hours a week here, then I have to rely on like speaking to supplement. The hard part about it is that I love all of my jobs. So sometimes people tell me like, "I have got this job that's perfect for you." But I can't just keep collecting jobs! -Theresa
- ... My position has changed here because I'm doing a lot more donor development and fundraising. And I'm kind of having more responsibility than I normally would? That's just been really encouraging for me-knowing that I'm doing something important, and then entrusted to do that. -Louise

7. Agencies Assisted

- If you need a mattress, they'll buy your mattresses or washer dryer, or fridge and stove. So, they help you get started. -Scarlett
- Their sole focus was to provide housing. So, they got women set up with Section Eight or with HUD housing. -Louise
- They help me with my security deposit, and they help me pay rent for the first two months so that way I was able to kind of save up and have a backup just in case something happens. If I needed them, I can call them, and they would give me gift cards to get food. -Sadie
- ...Then they set me up with Section Eight, and I found the house. Then I had all the other resources DSHS and everything. Medical care and everything. We have great medical insurance through the state. -Alanna
- She told me one of our largest donors just felt that you would be a candidate, and they want to give you their car, so I have a 2012 (Model redacted) with only 70,000 miles on it--one owner. She was like, come pick your car up. -Jamie

- And now I've been sober long enough and was in a pretty good spot in my life when I met them. And so they were like "I'm sorry, do you really need our services?" -Theresa
- And I got a car-it's a really nice one too. (Program founder) tried to give me a car first and it had a stick and I said *no I don't know how to drive that*. So, he sent the car back and gave me a really nice luxury car. -LaDonna
- So... The resources are amazing out there. Those all help me to get where I am. - Shannon

8. Active Dreams

- I even told my present job that when the time comes, I don't know how long it will be before my felonies come off my record or before they pardoned it. But I told him when that time comes ... I'm going to put in my notice. -Scarlett
- I am working on a business to help women in the community of (Redacted) County to find support in area that are needed here. Helping women to heal and as the Lord has help me heal through the things I have been through. -Patti
- I'm thinking about going into maybe an I.T. networking career. I like analytics and problem-solving. -Mona
- And I'm going to school so I can eventually have a better paying job. I'm still undecided about what I want to *be*, because I'm waiting for God to reveal that to me. -Melody
- I've been having *that* (a dream to assist marginalized women) on my heart, too. Like a 24-hour shelter or something like that. Somewhere where people can get help immediately. -Sadie
- I am... (*slowly*)... Going to change lives. I am determined... I feel like the system is so corrupt. And they exploit in so many ways just like exploiters do. -Jamie

9. Boundaries Honored

- Like my mom called the other day and I told her I got a raise and she said like "How much did you get?". And I said like (*squeaking humorously*) "You don't need to know that!" -LaDonna
- It's just knowing those red flags there just, like so embedded my brain right now. "That's a red flag. That's a red flag" ...I get just a very strong conviction. Like, *I can't be doing this. This is unhealthy or unsafe*. -Louise
- Like, my mom was in prison, and everybody called me asking me to help with money to get her out and I said no, no, no. I'm not going to rescue her. This was her choice-she's fifty- some years old and she needs to figure it out. -Kelsey

10. Giving Back

- Like I help out with the Bible study at the church on Wednesdays. Different things. I do mission trips with the church... So, I serve a lot. -Sadie
- So, I do throw a lot of parties. I think I'm supposed to be a kingdom party planner. - Theresa
- Almost 20 to 25 girls showed up and each one of them got a Bible, T-shirt, a full meal... That makes me like want to keep going. Parents are calling me all the time like *thank you for talking to our kids, thank you for doing what you do*. -LaDonna

Bibliography

- Abas, Melanie, Nicolae V. Ostrovski, Martin Prince, Viorel I. Gorceag, Carolina Trigub, and Siân Oram. "Risk Factors for Mental Disorders in Women Survivors of Human Trafficking: A Historical Cohort Study." *BMC Psychiatry* 13, no. 1 (September 2013): 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-244X-13-204>.
- Abraham, William J. *The Logic of Evangelism*. Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans, 1989.
- Abramovich, Evelyn. "Childhood Sexual Abuse as a Risk Factor for Subsequent Involvement in Sex Work: A Review of Empirical Findings." *Journal of Psychology & Human Sexuality* 17, no. 1–2 (2005): 131–46. https://doi.org/10.1300/J056v17n01_08.
- Achtemeier, Elizabeth. "Victimization and Healing: The Biblical View." In *God and the Victim: Theological Reflections on Evil, Victimization, Justice, and Forgiveness*, 89–106. Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans; Neighbors Who Care, 1999.
- Agustín, Laura. "Migrants in the Mistress's House: Other Voices in the 'Trafficking' Debate." *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State & Society* 12, no. 1 (April 2005): 96–117.
- Agustín, Laura María. *Sex at the Margins: Migration, Labour Markets and the Rescue Industry*. London: Zed Books, 2008.
- Agustin, Laura Maria. "The Soft Side of Imperialism." CounterPunch, January 25, 2012. <https://www.counterpunch.org/2012/01/25/the-soft-side-of-imperialism/>.
- Ahrens, Courtney E., Samantha Abeling, Sarah Ahmad, and Jessica Hinman. "Spirituality and Well-Being: The Relationship Between Religious Coping and Recovery from Sexual Assault." *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 25, no. 7 (July 2010): 1242–63. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260509340533>.
- Albert, Alexa. *Brothel: Mustang Ranch and Its Women*. New York, NY: Ballantine Books, 2011.
- Allender, Dan B. *Healing the Wounded Heart: The Heartache of Sexual Abuse and the Hope of Transformation*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 2016.
- . *The Wounded Heart: Hope for Adult Victims of Childhood Sexual Abuse*. Vol. Revised edition. Colorado Springs, CO: NavPress Publishing Group, 2008.
- Anonymous. *Alcoholics Anonymous: The Story of How Many Thousands of Men and Women Have Recovered from Alcoholism*. 4th edition. New York City: Alcoholics Anonymous World Services, 2001.
- Anti-Trafficking Group Program. Personal Interview, February 8, 2019.
- Aronowitz, Alexis A. *Human Trafficking, Human Misery: The Global Trade in Human Beings*. Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers, 2009.
- Ayo, Nicholas. *The Lord's Prayer: A Survey Theological and Literary*. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1992.
- Bagley, Chris, and Loretta Young. "Juvenile Prostitution and Child Sexual Abuse: A Controlled Study." *Canadian Journal of Community Mental Health* 6, no. 1 (April 1, 1987): 5–26. <https://doi.org/doi:10.7870/cjcmh-1987-0001>.
- Baldwin, Margaret A. "Living in Longing: Prostitution, Trauma Recovery, and Public Assistance." *Journal of Trauma Practice* 2, no. 3/4 (July 2003): 267–314.

- Bales, Kevin, and Zoe Trodd, eds. *To Plead Our Own Cause: Personal Stories by Today's Slaves*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2008.
- Barton, Bernadette, and Constance L. Hardesty. "Spirituality and Stripping: Exotic Dancers Narrate the Body Ekstasis." *Symbolic Interaction* 33, no. 2 (Spring 2010): 280–96. <https://doi.org/10.1525/si.2010.33.2.280>.
- Bass, Dorothy C., ed. *Practicing Our Faith: A Way of Life for a Searching People*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Pub, 1997.
- Bebbington, David. *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1730s to the 1980s*. New York, NY: Routledge, 1993.
- Beeks, Karen, and Delila Amir, eds. *Trafficking and the Global Sex Industry*. Program in Migration and Refugee Studies. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2006.
- Belcher, John R., and Steven Herr. "Development of Grounded Theory: Moving Towards a Theory of the Pathways into Street Prostitution Among Low-Income Women." *Journal of Addictions Nursing* 16, no. 3 (Fall 2005): 117–24. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10884600500196651>.
- Benoit, Cecilia, S. Mikael Jansson, Michaela Smith, and Jackson Flagg. "Prostitution Stigma and Its Effect on the Working Conditions, Personal Lives, and Health of Sex Workers." *Journal of Sex Research* 55, no. 4/5 (June 2018): 457–71. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00224499.2017.1393652>.
- Bierman, Alex. "The Effects of Childhood Maltreatment on Adult Religiosity and Spirituality: Rejecting God the Father Because of Abusive Fathers?" *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 44, no. 3 (September 2005): 349–59. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-5906.2005.00290.x>.
- Blakey, Joan M., and Alana Gunn. "The 'Ickiness Factor': Stigma as a Barrier to Exiting Prostitution." *Journal of Offender Rehabilitation* 57, no. 8 (December 2018): 538–61. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10509674.2018.1549177>.
- Bonhoeffer, Dietrich. "A Visible Reality." In *Called to Community: The Life Jesus Wants for His People*, edited by Charles E Moore. Walden, NY: Plough Publishing House, 2016.
- . *The Cost of Discipleship*. Revised and Unabridged. New York, NY: Macmillan, 1963.
- Bonhoeffer, Dietrich, and Friedrich Foerster. "The Center." In *Called to Community: The Life Jesus Wants for His People*, edited by Charles E. Moore. Walden, NY: Plough Publishing House, 2016.
- Bosch, David. "Evangelism: Theological Currents and Cross-Currents Today." *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 11, no. 3 (July 3, 1987): 98–103.
- Bosch, David Jacobus. *Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission*. American Society of Missiology Series 16. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2011.
- Bowen, Raven R. "Squaring Up: Experiences of Transition from Off-Street Sex Work to Square Work and Duality-Concurrent Involvement in Both—in Vancouver, BC." *Canadian Review of Sociology* 52, no. 4 (November 2015): 429–49. <https://doi.org/10.1111/cars.12085>.
- Bowley, Mary Frances. *The White Umbrella: Walking with Survivors of Sex Trafficking*. Moody Publishers, 2012.
- Bradley, Rebekah, Ann C. Schwartz, and Nadine J. Kaslow. "Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Symptoms Among Low-Income, African American Women with a History of Intimate Partner Violence and Suicidal Behaviors: Self-Esteem, Social Support, and Religious Coping." *Journal of Traumatic Stress* 18, no. 6 (December 2005): 685–96. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jts.20077>.

- Breen, Mike. *Building a Discipling Culture*. 2nd Edition. Pawleys Island, SC: 3DM International, 2014.
- Brody, Stuart, John J Potterat, Stephen Q Muth, and Donald E Woodhouse. "Psychiatric and Characterological Factors Relevant to Excess Mortality in a Long-Term Cohort of Prostitute Women." *Journal of Sex & Marital Therapy* 31, no. 2 (April 2005): 97–112. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00926230590477943>.
- Brown, Chester L. *Mary Wept Over the Feet of Jesus: Prostitution and Religious Obedience in the Bible: A "Graphic Novel" Containing Adaptions of Certain Biblical Stories*. Montreal: Drawn and Quarterly Press, 2016.
- Brown, Jason, Nancy Higgitt, Christine Miller, Susan Wingert, Mary Williams, and Larry Morrisette. "Challenges Faced by Women Working in the Inner City Sex Trade." *Canadian Journal of Urban Research* 15, no. 1 (Summer 2006): 36–53.
- Bryant, Antony, and Kathy Charmaz, eds. *The SAGE Handbook of Grounded Theory*. Paperback Edition. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications Ltd, 2007.
- Burnette, Mandi L., Emma Lucas, Mark Ilgen, Susan M. Frayne, Julia Mayo, and Julie C. Weitlauf. "Prevalence and Health Correlates of Prostitution Among Patients Entering Treatment for Substance Use Disorders." *Archives of General Psychiatry* 65, no. 3 (March 2008): 337–44. <https://doi.org/10.1001/archpsyc.65.3.337>.
- Cameron, Julia E. M. *The Lausanne Legacy: Landmarks in Global Mission*. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 2016.
- Cantrell, Peggy J. "The Relationship Between Relapse Prevention Treatment Outcome and Self-Efficacy." Conference Paper presented at the Annual Convention of the American Psychological Association, Toronto, Canada, August 22, 1993. <http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=eric&AN=ED370065&site=ehost-live>.
- Carson, Marion L S. *Human Trafficking, The Bible and The Church: An Interdisciplinary Study*. Eugene, OR: Cascade Books, 2016.
- Carson, Morris. "A Qualitative Study of the Lived Relational Experiences of Sex Trafficked Women." Dissertation, University of Nevada, 2020.
- Cascio, Katherine A. "Leaving 'The Life': Exploring Services for Women Exiting Prostitution." University of Kentucky, 2018. (2017-36666-199).
- Chambers, Cal. *Two Tracks One Goal: How Alcoholics Anonymous Relates to Christianity*. Langley, B.C.: Bridging the Gap Enterprise, 1988.
- Charmaz, Kathy. *Constructing Grounded Theory*. 2nd Edition. Introducing Qualitative Methods. London: Sage, 2014.
- Chase, Elaine, and June Statham. "Commercial and Sexual Exploitation of Children and Young People in the UK—A Review." *Child Abuse Review* 14, no. 1 (January 2005): 4–25.
- Christ, Carol P., and Judith Plaskow, eds. *Womanspirit Rising: A Feminist Reader in Religion*. 1st ed. Harper Forum Books. New York, NY: Harper & Row, 1979.
- Christian, Jayakumar. *God of the Empty-Handed: Poverty, Power and the Kingdom of God*. Monrovia, CA: MARC, 1999.
- Clarke, Ross J., Elizabeth A. Clarke, Dominique Roe-Sepowitz, and Richard Fey. "Age at Entry into Prostitution: Relationship to Drug Use, Race, Suicide, Education Level, Childhood Abuse, and Family Experiences." *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment* 22, no. 3 (March 2012): 270–89. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10911359.2012.655583>.

- Clayton, Mark. "Girls Entering Sex Trade May Say It's a 'Choice'..." *Christian Science Monitor* 88, no. 203 (September 13, 1996): 10.
- Cohan, D. L., A. Kim, J. Ruiz, S. Morrow, J. Reardon, M. Lynch, J. D. Klausner, et al. "Health Indicators Among Low Income Women Who Report a History of Sex Work: The Population Based Northern California Young Women's Survey." *Sexually Transmitted Infections* 81, no. 5 (2005): 428–33.
- Coleman, Robert E. *The Master Plan of Evangelism*. Grand Rapids, MI: Revell, 2006.
- Colijn, Brenda. *Images of Salvation in the New Testament*. Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2010.
- Connelly, Laura J. "'The Rescue Industry': The Blurred Line Between Help and Hindrance." *Graduate Journal of Social Science* 11, no. 2 (January 1, 2015): 154–60.
- Cooper, Barry S, M. Alexis Kennedy, Hugues F Herve, and John C Yuille. "Weapon Focus in Sexual Assault Memories of Prostitutes." *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry* 25, no. 2 (April 2002): 181–91.
- Corbin, Juliet, and Anselm Strauss. *Basics of Qualitative Research: Techniques and Procedures for Developing Grounded Theory*. 3rd edition. Los Angeles, CA: SAGE Publications, 2007.
- Costas, Orlando E. *The Church and Its Mission: A Shattering Critique from the Third World*. Wheaton, IL: Tyndale House Publishers, 1974.
- Courtois, Christine A. "Complex Trauma, Complex Reactions: Assessment and Treatment." *Psychotherapy: Theory, Research, Practice, Training* 41, no. 4 (Win 2004): 412–25.
- . "Complex Trauma, Complex Reactions: Assessment and Treatment." *Psychological Trauma: Theory, Research, Practice, and Policy* 5, no. 1 (August 2008): 86–100. <https://doi.org/10.1037/1942-9681.5.1.86>.
- Coy, Maddy. "'Moved Around Like Bags of Rubbish Nobody Wants': How Multiple Placement Moves Can Make Youth Women Vulnerable to Sexual Exploitation." *Child Abuse Review* 18, no. 4 (August 2009): 254–66. <https://doi.org/10.1002/car.1064>.
- Crocke, Sarah. "Stripping Agency from Top to Bottom: The Need for a Sentencing Guideline Safety Valve for Bottoms Prosecuted Under the Federal Sex Trafficking Statutes." *Northwestern University Law Review* 111, no. 3 (June 2017): 753–91.
- Cronley, Courtney, Andrea N. Cimino, Kris Hohn, Jaya Davis, and Elissa Madden. "Entering Prostitution in Adolescence: History of Youth Homelessness Predicts Earlier Entry." *Journal of Aggression, Maltreatment & Trauma* 25, no. 9 (October 2016): 893–908. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10926771.2016.1223246>.
- Cusick, Linda, and Matthew Hickman. "'Trapping' in Drug Use and Sex Work Careers." *Drugs: Education Prevention and Policy* 12 (October 2005): 369–79. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09687630500226779>.
- Dalla, R. L. "'You Can't Hustle All Your Life': An Exploratory Investigation of the Exit Process Among Street-Level Prostituted Women." *Psychology of Women Quarterly* 30, no. 3 (September 2006): 276–90. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-6402.2006.00296.x>.
- Dalla, Rochelle L., Yan Xia, and Heather Kennedy. "'You Just Give Them What They Want and Pray They Don't Kill You': Street-Level Sex Workers' Reports of Victimization, Personal Resources, and Coping Strategies." *Violence Against Women* 9, no. 11 (November 2003): 1367–94. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077801203255679>.
- De Angelis, Maria Ivanna. "Human Trafficking: Women's Stories of Agencies." Ph.D. Thesis, University of Hull, 2012. <https://ethos.bl.uk/OrderDetails.do?uin=uk.bl.ethos.613460>.

- Deb, Sibnath, Aparna Mukherjee, and Ben Mathews. "Aggression in Sexually Abused Trafficked Girls and Efficacy of Intervention." *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 26, no. 4 (March 2011): 745–68. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260510365875>.
- Deep South Program. Personal Interview, February 15, 2019.
- DeRiviere, Linda. "A Human Capital Methodology for Estimating the Lifelong Personal Costs of Young Women Leaving the Sex Trade." *Feminist Economics* 12, no. 3 (July 1, 2006): 367–402. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13545700600670434>.
- Dewey, Susan, Isabel Crowhurst, Tiantian Zheng, and Thaddeus Blanchette. "Control Creep and the Multiple Exclusions Faced by Women in Low-Autonomy Sex Industry Sectors." *Vibrant Virtual Brazilian Anthropology (Online)* 17 (November 2020): e17457. <https://doi.org/10.1590/1809-43412020v17d457>.
- Dewey, Susan, Jennifer Hankel, and Kyria Brown. "Transitional Housing Facilities for Women Leaving the Sex Industry: Informed by Evidence or Ideology?" *Sexuality & Culture* 21, no. 1 (March 2017): 74–95. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12119-016-9379-5>.
- Di Tommaso, Maria L., Isilda Shima, Steinar Strøm, and Francesca Bettio. "As Bad as It Gets: Well-Being Deprivation of Sexually Exploited Trafficked Women." *European Journal of Political Economy* 25, no. 2 (June 2009): 143–62. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ejpoleco.2008.11.002>.
- Doehring, Carrie. *Internal Desecration: Traumatization and Representations of God*. Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 1993.
- Drop-In Center Program. Personal Interview, February 22, 2019.
- Dunn, Jennifer C. "Legal Prostitution as Sex Work: Discourses of the Moonlite Bunny Ranch." Ph.D., Ohio University, 2009. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global (304965707).
- Dykstra, Craig R. *Growing in the Life of Faith: Education and Christian Practices*. 2nd Edition. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 2005.
- Ebaugh, Helen R F. *Becoming an Ex: The Process of Role Exit*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 1988.
- Edwards, Jessica M, Carolyn T Halpern, and Wendee M Wechsberg. "Correlates of Exchanging Sex for Drugs or Money Among Women Who Use Crack Cocaine." *Aid Education and Prevention* 18, no. 5 (2006): 420–29. <https://doi.org/10.1521/aeap.2006.18.5.420>.
- El-Bassel, Nabila, Robert F. Schilling, Louisa Gilbert, Kathleen L. Irwin, Sairus Faruque, Jennifer Von Bargen, Brian R. Edlin, and Yolanda Serrano. "Sex Trading and Psychological Distress Among Women Recruited the Streets of Harlem." *American Journal of Public Health* 87, no. 1 (January 1997). <https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.87.1.66>.
- Engel, James F., and Hugo Wilbert Norton. *What's Gone Wrong with the Harvest?: A Communication Strategy for the Church and World Evangelization*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1975.
- Estes, Richard J., and Neil Alan Weiner. "The Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children in the U.S., Canada and Mexico." Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania, September 19, 2001. <https://doi.org/10.3886/ICPSR03366.v1>.
- Farley, Melissa. "Prostitution and the Invisibility of Harm." *Women & Therapy* 26, no. 3/4 (September 2003): 2003. https://doi.org/10.1300/J015v26n03_06.
- . *Prostitution, Trafficking, and Traumatic Stress*. First Edition. Binghamton, NY: Routledge, 2004.

- Farley, Melissa, and Howard Barkan. "Prostitution, Violence, and Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder." *Women & Health* 27, no. 3 (1998): 37–49. https://doi.org/10.1300/J013v27n03_03.
- Farley, Melissa, Ann Cotton, Jacqueline Lynne, Sybille Zumbeck, Frida Spiwak, Maria E. Reyes, Dinorah Alvarez, and Ufuk Sezgin. "Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries." *Journal of Trauma Practice* 2, no. 3–4 (January 2004): 33–74. https://doi.org/10.1300/J189v02n03_03.
- Farley, Melissa, and Vanessa Kelly. "Prostitution." *Women & Criminal Justice* 11, no. 4 (August 2000): 29–64.
- Fee, Gordon D. *God's Empowering Presence: The Holy Spirit in the Letters of Paul*. Colorado Springs, CO: Hendrickson Publishers, 1994.
- Fortune, Marie M. "The Conundrum of Sin, Sex, Violence, and Theodicy." In *The Other Side of Sin: Woundedness from the Perspective of the Sinned-Against*, edited by Andrew Sung Park and Susan L. Nelson. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2001, 2001.
- Foster, Richard J. *Celebration of Discipline: The Path to Spiritual Growth*. 1st Edition. San Francisco, CA: Harper & Row, 1978.
- Foti, Susan Michele. "Child Sexual Abuse as a Precursor to Prostitution." Ph.D., Northwestern University, 1994. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/304148688/abstract/94751587A2E04B2DPQ/1>.
- Freed, Wendy. "From Duty to Despair: Brothel Prostitution in Cambodia." *Journal of Trauma Practice* 2, no. 3/4 (July 2003): 133–46. https://doi.org/10.1300/J189v02n03_07.
- Frost, Michael, and Alan Hirsch. *The Shaping of Things to Come: Innovation and Mission for the 21st Century Church*. Revised and Updated Edition. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 2013.
- GA. "Gambler's Anonymous." Gambler's Anonymous. Accessed April 25, 2018. <https://www.gamblersanonymous.org/ga/node/1>.
- Ganje-Fling, Marilyn, Patricia McCarthy Veach, Haijiang Kuang, and Bonnie Houg. "Effects of Childhood Sexual Abuse on Client Spiritual Well-Being." *Counseling and Values* 44, no. 2 (January 2000): 84–92.
- Garrett, Duane A. "Votive Prostitution Again: A Comparison of Proverbs 7:13-14 and 21:28-29." *Journal of Biblical Literature* 109, no. 4 (Winter 1990): 681–82.
- Gee, James Paul. *An Introduction to Discourse Analysis: Theory and Method*. New York, NY: Routledge, 1999.
- Gerassi, Lara B., and Andrea J. Nichols. *Sex Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation: Prevention, Advocacy, and Trauma-Informed Practice*. New York: Springer Publishing Company, 2018.
- Ginger. Personal Interview, September 27, 2019.
- Glamour. "Post-Weinstein, These Are the Powerful Men Facing Sexual Harassment Allegations." *Glamour*, May 18, 2019. <https://www.glamour.com/gallery/post-weinstein-these-are-the-powerful-men-facing-sexual-harassment-allegations>.
- Glaser, Barney G. "Conceptualization: On Theory and Theorizing Using Grounded Theory." *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 1, no. 2 (Spring 2002): 23–38. <https://doi.org/10.1177/160940690200100203>.
- . *Theoretical Sensitivity: Advances in the Methodology of Grounded Theory*. Mill Valley, CA: The Sociology Press, 1978.
- Grant, Robert. "Spirituality and Trauma: An Essay." *Traumatology* 5, no. 1 (March 1999). <https://doi.org/10.1177/153476569900500103>.

- Grenz, Stanley J. *Created for Community: Connecting Christian Belief with Christian Living*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1997.
- . *Theology for the Community of God*. Nashville, TN: Broadman & Holman, 1994.
- Grudzen, Corita, Gery Ryan, William Margold, Jacqueline Torres, and Lillian Gelberg. "Pathways to Health Risk Exposure in Adult Film Performers." *Journal of Urban Health* 86, no. 1 (January 2009): 67–78.
- Gubrium, Jaber F., and James A. Holstein. *Handbook of Interview Research: Context & Method*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2002.
- Guder, Darrell L., and Lois Barrett, eds. *Missional Church: A Vision for the Sending of the Church in North America*. The Gospel and Our Culture Series. Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1998.
- Gupta, Nijay K. *The Lord's Prayer*. Smyth & Helwys Bible Commentary. Macon, GA: Smyth & Helwys, 2017.
- Haase, Albert. *Living the Lord's Prayer: The Way of the Disciple*. Downers Grove, IL: IVP Books, 2009.
- Hagedorn, W Bryce, and Holly J Hartwig Moorhead. "The God-Shaped Hole: Addictive Disorders and the Search for Perfection." *Counseling and Values* 55, no. 1 (October 2010): 63–78.
- Hall, James Anderson. "Listening to the Voiceless: Women in Street Prostitution and the Feminist Democratic Project." Ph.D., Arizona State University, 1992. APA PsycInfo (1994-71889-001).
- Haugen, Gary, and Victor Boutros. *The Locust Effect: Why the End of Poverty Requires the End of Violence*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- Hazelden, Paul and Sue. "The Modified Engel Scale: The Complete Article." Personal Website. The Modified Engel Scale: The Complete Article, May 28, 2008. http://www.hazelden.org.uk/pt02/art_pt068_modified_engel_full.htm.
- Hedin, Ulla-Carin, and Sven Axel Månsson. "The Importance of Supportive Relationships Among Women Leaving Prostitution." *Journal of Trauma Practice* 2, no. 3/4 (July 2003): 223–37.
- . "The Importance of Supportive Relationships Among Women Leaving Prostitution." *Journal of Trauma Practice* 2, no. 3/4 (July 2003): 223–37.
- Heerde, Jessica A., Kirsty E. Scholes-Balog, and Sheryl A. Hemphill. "Associations Between Youth Homelessness, Sexual Offenses, Sexual Victimization, and Sexual Risk Behaviors: A Systematic Literature Review." *Archives of Sexual Behavior* 44, no. 1 (January 2015): 181–212. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10508-014-0375-2>.
- Henshaw, John M. *Does Measurement Measure Up?: How Numbers Reveal and Conceal the Truth*. Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2006.
- Herman, Judith. *Trauma and Recovery: The Aftermath of Violence—from Domestic Abuse to Political Terror*. New York, NY: Basic Books, 2015.
- Herman, Judith Lewis. "Hidden in Plain Sight: Clinical Observations on Prostitution." *Journal of Trauma Practice* 2, no. 3/4 (July 2003): 1–13.
- . *Trauma and Recovery*. Rev. ed. BasicBooks, 1997.
- Hickle, Kristine E. "Getting Out: A Qualitative Exploration of the Exiting Experience Among Former Sex Workers and Adult Sex Trafficking Victims." Arizona State University, 2015. APA Psychinfo.

- Hiebert, Paul G. "The Category 'Christian' in the Mission Task." *International Review of Mission* 72, no. 287 (July 1983): 421–27. [https://doi.org/10.1002/\(ISSN\)1758-6631](https://doi.org/10.1002/(ISSN)1758-6631).
- . "The Flaw of the Excluded Middle." *Missiology* 10, no. 1 (January 1982): 35–47.
- Hirsch, Alan. *The Forgotten Ways: Reactivating the Missional Church*. Grand Rapids, MI: Brazos Press, 2006.
- Hirsch, Barton J. "Natural Support Systems and Coping with Major Life Changes." *American Journal of Community Psychology* 8, no. 2 (April 1980): 159–72. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00912658>.
- Hoke, James N. "'Behold, the Lord's Whore'? Slavery, Prostitution, and Luke 1:38." *Biblical Interpretation* 26, no. 1 (2018): 43–67.
- Holly. Personal Interview, September 6, 2019.
- Hull, Simon. "Doing Grounded Theory: Notes for the Aspiring Qualitative Analyst." *University of Cape Town; Division of Geomatics*, December 13, 2013. <https://doi.org/DOI:10.6084/m9.figshare.1050453.v1>.
- Hunter, George G. *How to Reach Secular People*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1992.
- . *Radical Outreach: The Recovery of Apostolic Ministry and Evangelism*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2003.
- . *To Spread the Power: Church Growth in the Wesleyan Spirit*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1987.
- Hunter, Susan. "Prostitution Is Cruelty and Abuse to Women and Children." *Michigan Journal of Gender & Law* 1, no. 1 (January 1, 1993): 91–104.
- Jackson, Lois A., Carolyn G. Bennett, and Barbara A. Sowinski. "Stress in the Sex Trade and Beyond: Women Working in the Sex Trade Talk About the Emotional Stressors in Their Working and Home Lives." *Critical Public Health* 17, no. 3 (September 2007): 257–71. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09581590701549535>.
- James, Jennifer. "The Prostitute as Victim." In *The Victimization of Women*, edited by J. R. Chapman and M. Gates, 175–201. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage, 1978.
- Jennings Jr., Theodore W. "Reconstructing the Doctrine of Sin." In *The Other Side of Sin: Woundedness from the Perspective of the Sinned-Against*, edited by Andrew Sung Park and Susan L. Nelson. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2001.
- Johnson, Becca C. "Aftercare for Survivors of Human Trafficking." *Social Work & Christianity* 39, no. 4 (Winter 2012): 370–89.
- Johnstone, Barbara. *Discourse Analysis*. 2nd Edition. Introducing Linguistics. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2008.
- Jones, Meagan A. "Leaving 'The Life': The Recovery Journey of Sex Trafficking Survivors." Regent University, 2015. ProQuest Information & Learning.
- Jones, Scott J. *The Evangelistic Love of God and Neighbor: A Theology of Witness and Discipleship*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2003.
- Kane, Donna, Sharon E. Cheston, and Joanne M. Greer. "Perceptions of God by Survivors of Childhood Sexual Abuse: An Exploratory Study in an Underresearched Area." *Journal of Psychology & Theology* 21, no. 3 (1993): 228–37.
- Kara, Siddharth. *Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery*. New York, NY: Columbia University Press, 2009.

- Karandikar, Sharvari, and Moises Prospero. "From Client to Pimp: Male Violence against Female Sex Workers." *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 25, no. 2 (January 1, 2010): 257–73. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260509334393>.
- Kaufman, Michelle R., and Mary Crawford. "Sex Trafficking in Nepal: A Review of Intervention and Prevention Programs." *Violence Against Women* 17, no. 5 (May 2011): 651–65. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077801211407431>.
- New York Times. "Kavanaugh Trump Republican Sexual Abuse." September 18, 2018, Online edition, sec. Opinion Editorial. <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/09/18/opinion/editorials/kavanaugh-trump-republican-sexual-abuse-.html?auth=linked-google>.
- Keener, Craig S. *The IVP Bible Background Commentary: New Testament*. Second Edition. Downers Grove, IL: IVP Academic, 2014.
- Kelle, Udo. "'Emergence' vs. 'Forcing' of Empirical Data? A Crucial Problem of 'Grounded Theory' Reconsidered." *Forum: Qualitative Social Research* 6, no. 2 (May 2005): 1–17.
- Kelsey. Personal Interview, July 11, 2019.
- Kempadoo, Kamala, and Jo Doezema, eds. *Global Sex Workers: Rights, Resistance, and Redefinition*. 1st ed. Albany, NY: Routledge, 1998.
- Kempadoo, Kamala, Jyoti Sanghera, and Bandana Pattanaik, eds. *Trafficking and Prostitution Reconsidered: New Perspectives on Migration, Sex Work, and Human Rights*. Boulder, CO: Paradigm Publishers, 2012.
- Kennedy, M. Alexis, Carolin Klein, Jessica T. K. Bristowe, Barry S. Cooper, and John C. Yuille. "Routes of Recruitment: Pimps' Techniques and Other Circumstances That Lead to Street Prostitution." *Journal of Aggression, Maltreatment & Trauma* 15, no. 2 (November 2007): 1–19. https://doi.org/10.1300/J146v15n02_01.
- Kim, Chang-nack. "Korean Minjung Theology: An Overview." *Chicago Theological Seminary Register* 85, no. 2 (Spring 1995): 1–13.
- Kirkpatrick, Frank G. *Community: A Trinity of Models*. Eugene, OR: Wipf & Stock, 2008.
- Klauber, Martin I., and Scott M. Manetsch, eds. *The Great Commission: Evangelicals and the History of World Missions*. Nashville, TN: B & H Academic, 2008.
- Knippel, Charles Taylor. "Samuel M. Shoemaker's Theological Influence on William G. Wilson's Twelve Step Spiritual Program of Recovery (Alcoholics Anonymous)." PhD, Saint Louis University, 1987.
- Kramer, Lisa A. "Prostitution: Why Women Enter, What They Experience Emotionally, and How They Use Substances to Cope." Ph.D., Arizona State University, 2006. ProQuest Dissertation Publishing.
- Kristof, Nicholas D., and Sheryl WuDunn. *Half the Sky: Turning Oppression into Opportunity for Women Worldwide*. First. New York NY: Vintage Books, 2009.
- Kurtz, Ernest. *Not-God: A History of Alcoholics Anonymous*. 1st edition. Center City, Minn: Hazelden Publishing, 1991.
- Kurtz, Steven P., Hilary L. Surratt, Marion C. Kiley, and James A. Inciardi. "Barriers to Health and Social Services for Street-Based Sex Workers." *Journal of Health Care for the Poor and Underserved* 16, no. 2 (May 2005): 345–61. <https://doi.org/10.1353/hpu.2005.0038>.

- Lampman, Lisa Barnes, and Michelle D Shattuck, eds. *God and the Victim: Theological Reflections on Evil, Victimization, Justice, and Forgiveness*. Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans; Neighbors Who Care, 1999.
- BBC News. "Larry Nassar Case: The 156 Women Who Confronted a Predator." January 25, 2018, Online edition, sec. US & Canada. <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-42725339>.
- Leukefeld, Carl G., and Frank M. Tims. "Relapse and Recovery in Drug Abuse: Research and Practice." *International Journal of the Addictions* 24, no. 3 (March 1989): 189–201. <https://doi.org/10.3109/10826088909047283>.
- Lloyd, Rachel. *Girls Like Us: Fighting for a World Where Girls Are Not for Sale, a Memoir*. New York, NY: Harper Perennial, 2012.
- Lobert, Annie. *Fallen: Out of the Sex Industry and Into the Arms of the Savior*. Worthy Publishing, 2015.
- Logan, James C., ed. *Theology and Evangelism in the Wesleyan Heritage*. Nashville, Tenn: Kingswood Books, 1994.
- Lohfink, Gerhard. *Jesus and Community: The Social Dimension of Christian Faith*. Philadelphia, PA: Fortress Press, 1984.
- Long, Richelle Ashley McGhee. "The State of Aftercare: A Critical Look at the Response to Victims of Human Sex Trafficking in the United States." Ph.D., The University of Memphis, 2014. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global.
- Long, Shelley L. "Responding to Human Trafficking in the Bible and the Present." *Conversations with the Biblical World* 36 (2016): 225–31.
- Lynn, Deanna. *Purchased: Leaving the Sex Trade*. Alpaca Love Productions, 2019.
- Månsson, Sven-Axel, and Ulla-Carin Hedin. "Breaking the Matthew Effect - On Women Leaving Prostitution." *International Journal of Social Welfare* 8, no. 1 (January 1999): 57.
- McGavran, Donald A. *Understanding Church Growth*. Edited by C. Peter Wagner. Third Edition. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 1990.
- McKnight, Scot. "Gospel and Rhetoric." Patheos, November 7, 2011. <https://www.patheos.com/blogs/jesuscreed/2011/11/07/gospel-and-rhetoric/>.
- . *The King Jesus Gospel: The Original Good News Revisited*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2011.
- New York Times. "MeToo Movement Tarana Burke." October 20, 2017, Online edition, sec. U.S. <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/10/20/us/me-too-movement-tarana-burke.html?module=inline>.
- Mid-South Program. Personal Interview, February 15, 2019.
- Moen, Ole Martin. "Is Prostitution Harmful?" *Journal of Medical Ethics* 40, no. 2 (February 2014): 73–81. <https://doi.org/10.1136/medethics-2011-100367>.
- Mona. Personal Interview, September 6, 2019.
- Moon, W. Jay, and W. Bud Simon. *Effective Intercultural Evangelism: Good News in a Diverse World*. Downers Grove, IL: IVP, 2021.
- Moore, Charles E., ed. *Called to Community: The Life Jesus Wants for His People*. Walden, NY: Plough Publishing House, 2016.

- Moore, Charles E. "It Takes Work." In *Called to Community: The Life Jesus Wants for His People*, edited by Charles E Moore. Walden, NY: Plough Publishing House, 2016.
- Moran, Rachel. *Paid For: My Journey Through Prostitution*. First edition. New York, N.Y.: W. W. Norton & Company, 2015.
- Morden, Peter. *The Message of Discipleship: Authentic Followers of Jesus in Today's World*. Downers Grove, IL: IVP, 2018.
- Myers, Bryant L. *Walking with the Poor: Principles and Practices of Transformational Development*. Revised and Expanded Edition. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2011.
- . *Walking with the Poor: Principles and Practices of Transformational Development*. Revised and Expanded Edition. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 2011.
- NA World Services, INC. "Narcotics Anonymous World Services." Narcotics Anonymous, 2022. <https://www.na.org/?ID=aboutus>.
- Nadon, Susan M., Catherine Koverola, and Eduard H. Schludermann. "Antecedents to Prostitution: Childhood Victimization." *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 13, no. 2 (April 1998): 206–21. <https://doi.org/10.1177/088626098013002003>.
- Nguyen, Thanh-Tu, Christian R Bellehumeur, and Judith Malette. "Women Survivors of Sex Trafficking: A Trauma and Recovery Model Integrating Spirituality." *Counseling et Spiritualité* 33, no. 1 (2014): 111–33. <https://doi.org/10.2143/CS.33.1.3044833>.
- NIDA. "Drug Misuse and Addiction." Governmental Website. National Institute on Drug Abuse, July 13, 2020. <https://nida.nih.gov/publications/drugs-brains-behavior-science-addiction/drug-misuse-addiction> Accessed 24 Feb. 2022.
- Nixon, Kendra, Leslie Tutty, Pamela Downe, Kelly Gorkoff, and Jane Ursel. "The Everyday Occurrence: Violence in the Lives of Girls Exploited Through Prostitution." *Violence Against Women* 8, no. 9 (September 2002): 1016–43. <https://doi.org/10.1177/107780120200800902>.
- Northeast Program. Personal Interview, March 7, 2019.
- Northwest Program. Personal Interview, January 29, 2019.
- Norton-Hawk, Maureen A. "The Counterproductivity of Incarcerating Female Street Prostitutes." *Deviant Behavior* 22, no. 5 (September 2001): 403–17. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01639620152472804>.
- Nugent, Stephanie A. "Perfectionism: Its Manifestations and Classroom-Based Interventions." *Journal of Secondary Gifted Education* 11, no. 4 (Summer 2000): 215–21. <https://doi.org/10.4219/jsge-2000-630>.
- OA. "Overeaters Anonymous." Overeaters Anonymous, 2022. <https://oa.org/>.
- OHCHR. "Resources List of United Nations Agencies, Programmes, NGOs and Foundations Working on Contemporary Forms of Slavery." United Nations. Office of the High Commissioner, 2021. <https://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Slavery/UNVTFCFS/Pages/SlaveryList.aspx>.
- Okesson, Gregg. *A Public Missiology: How Local Churches Witness to a Complex World*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2020.
- Oselin, Sharon S. *Leaving Prostitution: Getting Out and Staying Out of Sex Work*. New York, NY: New York University Press, 2014.

- . “Weighing the Consequences of a Deviant Career: Factors Leading to an Exit from Prostitution.” *Sociological Perspectives* 53, no. 4 (2010): 527–49. <https://doi.org/10.1525/sop.2010.53.4.527>.
- Park, Andrew Sung. *The Wounded Heart of God: The Asian Concept of Han and the Christian Doctrine of Sin*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1993.
- . *The Wounded Heart of God: The Asian Concept of Han and the Christian Doctrine of Sin*. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1993.
- Park, Andrew Sung, and Susan L. Nelson, eds. *The Other Side of Sin: Woundedness from the Perspective of the Sinned-Against*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2001.
- Parrot, Andrea, and Nina Cummings. *Sexual Enslavement of Girls and Women Worldwide*. Westport, CT: Praeger, 2008.
- Payne, Ruby K. *A Framework for Understanding Poverty*. 4th rev. ed. Aha! Process, 2005.
- Pittman, Bill, and Dick B., eds. *Courage to Change: The Christian Roots of the Twelve-Step Movement*. Center City, MN: Hazelden, 1994.
- Pohl, Christine D. *Living into Community: Cultivating Practices That Sustain Us*. Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans Publishing, 2012.
- Potterat, John J., Devon D. Brewer, Stephen Q. Muth, Richard B. Rothenberg, Donald E. Woodhouse, John B. Muth, Heather K. Stites, and Stuart Brody. “Mortality in a Long-Term Open Cohort of Prostitute Women.” *American Journal of Epidemiology* 159, no. 8 (April 2004): 778–85. <https://doi.org/10.1093/aje/kwh110>.
- Potterat, John J., Richard B. Rothenberg, Stephen Q. Muth, William W. Darrow, and Lyanne Phillips-Plummer. “Pathways to Prostitution: The Chronology of Sexual and Drug Abuse Milestones.” *Journal of Sex Research* 35, no. 4 (November 1, 1998): 333–40. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00224499809551951>.
- Rabinovitch, Jannit. “PEERS: The Prostitutes’ Empowerment, Education and Resource Society.” In *Prostitution, Trafficking, and Traumatic Stress*, edited by Melissa Farley, 1st Edition. Binghamton, NY: Routledge, 2004.
- Raj, Anita, Jennifer G Clarke, Jay G Silverman, Jennifer Rose, Cynthia Rosengard, Megan Hebert, and Michael Stein. “Violence Against Women Associated with Arrests for Sex Trade but Not Drug Charges.” *International Journal of Law and Psychiatry* 29, no. 3 (May 2006): 204–11.
- Rambo, Lewis R. *Understanding Religious Conversion*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1993.
- Raphael, Jody. *Listening to Olivia: Violence, Poverty, and Prostitution*. Northeastern Series on Gender, Crime, and Law. Boston, MA: Northeastern University Press, 2015.
<http://ezproxy.asburyseminary.edu/login?url=http://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=e000xna&AN=1083324&site=eds-live>.
- Raphael, Jody, and Deborah L. Shapiro. “Violence in Indoor and Outdoor Prostitution Venues.” *Violence Against Women* 10, no. 2 (February 2004): 126–39. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077801203260529>.
- Raymond, Janice G. “Prostitution as Violence Against Women: NGO Stonewalling in Beijing and Elsewhere.” *Women’s Studies International Forum* 21, no. 1 (February 1998): 1–9. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0277-5395\(96\)00102-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0277-5395(96)00102-1).
- Raymond, Janice G. “Sex Work Dignifies Prostitution but Not Women.” *Viewpoint*, no. 5 (February 2011): 21–25.
- Raymond, Janice G, Jean D’Cunha, Siti Ruhaini Dzuhayatin, H Patricia Hynes, Zoraida Ramirez Rodriguez, and Aida Santos. “Comparative Study of Women Trafficked in the Migration Process.” Report. U.S. Department of

- Justice: Office of Justice Programs. Accessed June 4, 2020.
<http://action.web.ca/home/catw/attach/CATW%20Comparative%20Study%202002.pdf>.
- Raymond, Janice G., and Donna M. Hughes. "Sex Trafficking of Women in the United States: International and Domestic Trends." Report. U.S. Department of Justice: Office of Justice Programs, March 2001.
<https://dx.doi.org/10.3886/ICPSR03438>.
- Roe-Sepowitz, Dominique E., Kristine Hickie, and Andrea Cimino. "The Impact of Abuse History and Trauma Symptoms on Successful Completion of a Prostitution-Exiting Program." *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment* 22, no. 1 (January 2012): 65–77. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10911359.2011.598830>.
- Romero-Daza, Nancy, Margaret Weeks, and Merrill Singer. "'Nobody Gives a Damn If I Live or Die': Violence, Drugs, and Street-Level Prostitution in Inner-City Hartford, Connecticut." *Medical Anthropology* 22, no. 3 (September 2003): 233–60. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01459740306770>.
- Ross, Colin A., Geri Anderson, Sharon Heber, and G. Ron Norton. "Dissociation and Abuse Among Multiple-Personality Patients, Prostitutes, and Exotic Dancers." *Hospital & Community Psychiatry* 41, no. 3 (March 1, 1990): 328–30.
- Ross, Colin, Melissa Farley, and Harvey Schwartz. "Dissociation Among Women in Prostitution." *Journal of Trauma Practice* 2, no. 3/4 (January 14, 2004): 199–212.
- Roxburgh, Amanda, Louisa Degenhardt, and Jan Copeland. "Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Among Female Street-Based Sex Workers in the Greater Sydney Area, Australia." *BMC Psychiatry* 6 (January 2006): 1–12.
<https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-244X-6-24>.
- Rudolfsson, Lisa, and Inga Tidefors. "I Have Cried to Him a Thousand Times, but It Makes No Difference: Sexual Abuse, Faith, and Images of God." *Mental Health, Religion & Culture* 17, no. 9 (November 2014): 910–22.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/13674676.2014.950953>.
- SAA. "Sex Addicts Anonymous." Sex Addicts Anonymous, 2022. <https://saa-recovery.org/>.
- Sabella Monheit, Donna. "Lives in the Life: Exploring the Lived Experience of Prostitution Through Narrative." Ph.D., University of Pennsylvania, 2010.
- Sage, Jesse, and Liora Kasten. *Enslaved: True Stories of Modern-Day Slavery*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006.
- Salfati, C. Gabrielle, Alison R. James, and Lynn Ferguson. "Prostitute Homicides: A Descriptive Study." *Journal of Interpersonal Violence* 23, no. 4 (April 2008): 505–43. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260507312946>.
- Sallmann, Jolanda. "Living With Stigma: Women's Experiences of Prostitution and Substance Use." *Affilia: Journal of Women & Social Work* 25, no. 2 (May 2010): 146–59. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0886109910364362>.
- Sanchez, Lisa. "Sex, Violence, Citizenship, and Community: An Ethnographic and Legal Geography of Commercial Sex in One American City." Ph.D., University of California, Irvine, 1998. ProQuest Dissertations Publishing.
- Sanders, Teela. "Becoming an Ex-Sex Worker: Making Transitions Out of a Deviant Career." *Feminist Criminology* 2, no. 1 (January 2007): 74–95. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1557085106294845>.
- . "Inevitably Violent? Dynamics of Space, Governance, and Stigma in Understanding Violence Against Sex Workers." In *Special Issue: Problematizing Prostitution: Critical Research and Scholarship*, edited by Austin Sarat, 93. Studies in Law, Politics & Society 71. Bingley, UK: Emerald Group Publishing Limited, 2016.

- Sanford, Rachealle, Daniel E. Martínez, and Ronald Weitzer. "Framing Human Trafficking: A Content Analysis of Recent U.S. Newspaper Articles." *Journal of Human Trafficking* 2, no. 2 (April 2, 2016): 139–55. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23322705.2015.1107341>.
- Scherer, James, and Bevans, Stephen B. *New Directions in Mission and Evangelization 1: Basic Statements, 1974-1991*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Bks, 1992.
- . *New Directions in Mission and Evangelization 1: Basic Statements, 1974-1991*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Bks, 1992.
- Shannon. Personal Interview, September 27, 2019.
- Sider, Ronald J. *Good News and Good Works: A Theology of the Whole Gospel*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1999.
- . *One-Sided Christianity?: Uniting the Church to Heal a Lost and Broken World*. Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 1993.
- Silbert, Mimi H. "Prostitution and Sexual Assault: Summary of Results." *International Journal of Biosocial Research* 3, no. 2 (1982): 69–71.
- Silbert, Mimi H., and Ayala M. Pines. "Occupational Hazards of Street Prostitutes." *Criminal Justice and Behavior* 8, no. 4 (December 1981): 395–99. <https://doi.org/10.1177/009385488100800401>.
- . "Sexual Child Abuse as an Antecedent to Prostitution." *Child Abuse & Neglect* 5, no. 4 (1981): 407–11. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0145-2134\(81\)90050-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/0145-2134(81)90050-8).
- . "Victimization of Street Prostitutes." *Victimology* 7, no. 1–4 (1982): 122–33.
- Simons, Ronald L., and Les B. Whitbeck. "Sexual Abuse as a Precursor to Prostitution and Victimization Among Adolescent and Adult Homeless Women." *Journal of Family Issues* 12, no. 3 (September 1991): 361–79. <https://doi.org/10.1177/019251391012003007>.
- Smith, James Weldon. "Some Notes on Wesley's Doctrine of Prevenient Grace." *Religion in Life* 34, no. 1 (Winter - 1965 1964): 68–80.
- Smith, Linda. "Trafficking Terms." Shared Hope International. Accessed February 1, 2021. <https://sharedhope.org/the-problem/trafficking-terms/>.
- Smith, Linda A., Samantha Healy Vardaman, and Melissa A Snow. "The National Report on Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking: America's Prostituted Children." Arlington, VA: Shared Hope International, 2009. https://sharedhope.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/09/SHI_National_Report_on_DMST_2009.pdf.
- South 1 Program. Personal Interview, February 6, 2019.
- South 2 Program. Personal Interview, February 11, 2019.
- Southeast Program. Personal Interview, January 29, 2019.
- Stark, Rodney. *America's Blessings: How Religion Benefits Everyone, Including Atheists*. West Conshohocken, PA: Templeton Press, 2012.
- Stevens, Becca. *Snake Oil: The Art of Healing and Truth-Telling*. New York, NY: Hachette Book Group, 2013.
- Storti, Craig. *Figuring Foreigners Out: A Practical Guide*. Yarmouth, ME: Intercultural Press, 1999.

- Su, Jennifer Y. "Spirituality, Religion, and Mental Health of Women Exiting the Sex Industry." Ph.D., Regent University, 2012. ProQuest Dissertations Publishing.
- Summer. Personal Interview, September 27, 2019.
- Summer. Interview with Timothy P. Robbins. Personal Interview. 9-27-2019, n.d.
- Surratt, Hilary L., James A. Inciardi, Steven P. Kurtz, and Marion C. Kiley. "Sex Work and Drug Use in a Subculture of Violence." *Crime & Delinquency* 50, no. 1 (January 2004): 43–59. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011128703258875>.
- Tangney, June Price, and Ronda L. Dearing. *Shame and Guilt*. New York: Guilford Press, 2002.
- Taylor, Shelley. *Positive Illusions: Creative Self-Deception and the Healthy Mind*. New York: Basic Books, 1989.
- Tia. Personal Interview, July 6, 2019.
- Tomura, Miyuki. "A Prostitute's Lived Experiences of Stigma." *Journal of Phenomenological Psychology* 40, no. 1 (May 2009): 51–84. <https://doi.org/10.1163/156916209X427981>.
- Trulear, Harold Dean. "Go and Do Likewise: The Church's Role in Caring for Crime Victims." In *God and the Victim: Theological Reflections on Evil, Victimization, Justice, and Forgiveness*, 70–88. Grand Rapids, MI: W.B. Eerdmans, 1999.
- Tyler, Kimberly A., and Katherine A. Johnson. "Trading Sex: Voluntary or Coerced? The Experiences of Homeless Youth." *The Journal of Sex Research* 43, no. 3 (2006): 208–16. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00224490609552319>.
- UN General Assembly. United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime: Resolution/Adopted by the General Assembly, Pub. L. No. A/RES/55/25 (2001). <https://www.refworld.org/docid/3b00f55b0.html>.
- Vaddiparti, Krishna, Jane Bogetto, Catina Callahan, Arbi B. Abdallah, Edward L. Spitznagel, and Linda Cottler. "The Effects of Childhood Trauma on Sex Trading in Substance Using Women." *Archives of Sexual Behavior* 35, no. 4 (August 2006): 451–59. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10508-006-9044-4>.
- Valandra. "Reclaiming Their Lives and Breaking Free: An Afrocentric Approach to Recovery from Prostitution." *Affilia: Journal of Women & Social Work* 22, no. 2 (2007): 195–208. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0886109907299052>.
- Valera, Roberto J., Robin G. Sawyer, and Glenn R. Schiraldi. "Perceived Health Needs of Inner-City Street Prostitutes: A Preliminary Study." *American Journal of Health Behavior* 25, no. 1 (Jan/Feb2001): 50–59. <https://doi.org/10.5993/ajhb.25.1.6>.
- Vanwesenbeeck, Ine. *Prostitutes' Well-Being and Risk*. Amsterdam: VU University Press, 1994.
- . *Prostitutes' Well-Being and Risk*. Amsterdam: VU University Press, 1994.
- Vanwesenbeeck, Ine, Ron de Graaf, Gertjan van Zessen, Cees J. Straver, and Jan H. Visser. "Professional HIV Risk Taking, Levels of Victimization, and Well-Being in Female Prostitutes in The Netherlands." *Archives of Sexual Behavior* 24, no. 5 (October 1995): 503–15. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01541831>.
- Vaux, Alan. *Social Support: Theory, Research, and Intervention*. New York, NY: Praeger Publishers, 1988.
- Vijayarasa, Ramona. "Exploitation or Expectations: Moving Beyond Consent." *Women's Policy Journal of Harvard* 7 (2010 2009): 11–22. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3229575>.

- Volf, Miroslav. *Exclusion and Embrace: A Theological Exploration of Identity, Otherness, and Reconciliation*. Revised and updated. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 2019.
- Wamsley, Laurel. "Doctor, Girlfriend Charged with Drugging, Raping Women; Hundreds of Victims Possible." *NPR*, September 19, 2018, Online edition, sec. National. <https://www.npr.org/2018/09/19/649529045/doctor-girlfriend-accused-of-drugging-and-raping-2-women-and-maybe-many-more>.
- Ward, Allison, and Dominique Roe-Sepowitz. "Assessing the Effectiveness of Trauma-Oriented Approach to Treating Prostituted Women in a Prison and a Community Exiting Program." *Journal of Aggression, Maltreatment & Trauma* 18, no. 3 (April 2009): 293–312. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10926770902809837>.
- Webber, Robert. *Ancient-Future Faith: Rethinking Evangelicalism for a Postmodern World*. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1999.
- Weitzer, Ronald. "Flawed Theory and Method in Studies of Prostitution." *Violence Against Women* 11, no. 7 (2005): 934–49. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077801205276986>.
- . "Flawed Theory and Method in Studies of Prostitution." *Violence Against Women* 11, no. 7 (2005): 934–49. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077801205276986>.
- . *Legalizing Prostitution: From Illicit Vice to Lawful Business*. New York, NY: New York University Press, 2012.
- . "Sex Trafficking and the Sex Industry: The Need for Evidence-Based Theory and Legislation." *Journal of Criminal Law & Criminology* 101, no. 4 (Fall 2011): 1337–69.
- . "Sociology of Sex Work." *Annual Review of Sociology* 35, no. 1 (2009): 213–34. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-soc-070308-120025>.
- . "The Mythology of Prostitution: Advocacy Research and Public Policy." *Sexuality Research & Social Policy: A Journal of the NSRC* 7, no. 1 (March 2010): 15–29. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13178-010-0002-5>.
- . "The Social Construction of Sex Trafficking: Ideology and Institutionalization of a Moral Crusade." *Politics & Society* 35, no. 3 (September 2007): 447–75. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0032329207304319>.
- Wesley, John. *The Doctrine of Original Sin: According to Scripture, Reason, and Experience*. Salem, OH: Schmul Publishing Co, 1999.
- West Program. Personal Interview, March 18, 2019.
- Whitesel, Bob. *Waypoint: Navigating Your Spiritual Journey*. Waypoint. Indianapolis, IN: Wesleyan Pub. House, 2010.
- Willard, Dallas. *The Divine Conspiracy: Rediscovering Our Hidden Life in God*. San Francisco, CA: HarperCollins Publisher, 1998.
- . *The Spirit of the Disciplines: Understanding How God Changes Lives*. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1988.
- Williamson, Celia, and Gail Folaron. "Understanding the Experiences of Street Level Prostitutes." *Qualitative Social Work: Research and Practice* 2, no. 3 (September 2003): 271–87. <https://doi.org/10.1177/14733250030023004>.
- Williamson, Celia, and Michael Prior. "Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking: A Network of Underground Players in the Midwest." *Journal of Child & Adolescent Trauma* 2, no. 1 (March 2009): 46–61. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19361520802702191>.

- Willimon, William H., Stanley Hauerwas, and Scott C. Saye. *Lord, Teach Us: The Lord's Prayer and the Christian Life*. Abingdon Press, 1996.
- Wilson, Bincy, and Lisa D. Butler. "Running a Gauntlet: A Review of Victimization and Violence in the Pre-Entry, Post-Entry, and Peri-/Post-Exit Periods of Commercial Sexual Exploitation." *Psychological Trauma: Theory, Research, Practice, and Policy* 6, no. 5 (September 2014): 494–504. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0032977>.
- Wilson, Jeremy M., and Erin Dalton. "Human Trafficking in the Heartland: Variation in Law Enforcement Awareness and Response." *Journal of Contemporary Criminal Justice* 24, no. 3 (August 2008): 296–313. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1043986208318227>.
- Witkiewitz, Katie, and G. Alan Marlatt, eds. *Therapist's Guide to Evidence-Based Prevention*. Boston, MA: Academic Press, 2007.
- Wodak, Ruth, and Michael Meyer, eds. *Methods of Critical Discourse Studies*. Third edition. London ; Thousand Oaks, California: SAGE Publications Ltd, 2015.
- Wolf, Ariel. "Stigma in the Sex Trades." *Sexual & Relationship Therapy* 34, no. 3 (August 2019): 290–308. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14681994.2019.1573979>.
- Wolfe, Alan. *The Transformation of American Religion: How We Actually Live Our Faith*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press, 2003.
- Wright, Christopher J. H. *The Mission of God: Unlocking the Bible's Grand Narrative*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 2006.
- Wright, Nicholas Thomas. "Thy Kingdom Come: Living the Lord's Prayer." *Christian Century* 114, no. 9 (March 12, 1997): 268–70.
- Wright, N.T. *The Lord and His Prayer*. Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2014.
- Wu, Rose. "Women on the Boundary: Prostitution, Contemporary and in the Bible." *Feminist Theology* 28 (September 2001): 69–81.
- Young, Amy, Carol Boyd, and Amy Hubbell. "Prostitution, Drug Use, and Coping with Psychological Distress." *Journal of Drug Issues* 30, no. 4 (Fall 2000): 789–800. <https://doi.org/10.1177/002204260003000407>.
- Zahniser, A. H. Mathias. *Symbol and Ceremony: Making Disciples Across Cultures*. Monrovia, CA: MARC, 1997.
- Zhang, Sheldon X. *Smuggling and Trafficking in Human Beings: All Roads Lead to America*. Westport, CT: Praeger Publishers, 2007.
- Zimmerman, Cathy, Mazeda Hossain, Katherine Yun, Vasil Gajdadziev, Natalia Guzun, Maria Tchomarova, Rosa Angela Ciarrocchi, et al. "The Health of Trafficked Women: A Survey of Women Entering Posttrafficking Services in Europe." *The American Journal of Public Health* 98, no. 1 (January 2008): 55–59. <https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2006.108357>.