The Asbury Journal 79/1: 52-91 © 2024 Asbury Theological Seminary

DOI: 10.7252/Journal.01.2024S.04

Robert A. Danielson
H.C. Morrison and the Holiness Union of the South

#### Abstract:

Holiness history in the southern United States tends to view the movement as a collection of local or regional churches or institutions without a unified organization. This view often overlooks the work of H.C. Morrison and an organization he founded called the Holiness Union of the South. It began in 1904 and lasted through 1915 and sought to unite the Holiness work in a fashion similar to the National Holiness Association in the northern United States. The Union focused on the areas of mission. education, and publishing- areas which smaller organizations were illequipped to operate. While the Union was initially successful, a number of forces led to its collapse: the growth of Pentecostalism with its rapid spread across the South, the growth and expansion of Holiness denominations, such as the Church of the Nazarene and the Christian and Missionary Alliance, and the outbreak of World War I. Morrison ultimately returned to his base in Kentucky, where he maintained his focus on mission, education, and publishing, albeit on a smaller scale than he envisioned under the Holiness Union of the South.

**Keywords:** H.C. Morrison, Holiness Union of the South, Pentecostalism, mission, religious education, publishing

**Robert A. Danielson, Ph.D**, is the Director of Strategic Collections and Scholarly Communications Librarian at the B.L. Fisher Library of Asbury Theological Seminary, where he also serves as an affiliate faculty member in the School of Mission and Ministry in Wilmore, Kentucky.

### Introduction

The early 20th century was a period of great transition and consolidation within the Holiness Movement. While movements such as the National Holiness Association were active in the North and Midwest. Holiness denominations such as the Christian and Missionary Alliance, the Free Methodists, and the Church of the Nazarene were also growing in the North, Mid-West and the Western parts of the United States. The Holiness Movement in the South has largely been seen as an abundance of regional associations, small independent groups, and holiness-leaning members of traditional denominations, especially the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. As J. Lawrence Brasher summarized,

> At the turn of the century, holiness people in the South chose one of three paths. Many remained as "loyalists" within the diffident, sometimes hostile, Methodist Episcopal Church, South. Others joined one of the several new independent holiness sects. A few defected to the Methodist Episcopal Church, which was more favorable to holiness then its southern sibling and actively sought members from among the "comeouters." Holiness, which earlier had been a hope of unity between the two Methodisms, was now viewed by the Southern church as an unwelcome "party," and, accordingly, by the northern church as a source of potential strength in the South.1

In the midst of this period, H.C. Morrison, an ardent holiness advocate and evangelist in the Methodist Episcopal Church South, set out to create a holiness organization modelled after the National Holiness Association, but focused on holiness organizations and churches in the South. It would be known as the Holiness Union of the South, or just the Holiness Union, and would last from its founding in 1904 to its final convention in 1915. Morrison used his base in Louisville, Kentucky to build an extensive network across the South and the Southwest, but would ultimately fail to achieve the goals he envisioned. Yet, the movement was significant for the history of both the Holiness Movement and the growth and spread of Pentecostalism in the South.

# H.C. Morrison and the Reasons for the Holiness Union

H.C. Morrison had specific reasons to develop such an organization. The Methodist Episcopal Church, South had set out to undermine those working to expand holiness doctrine by requiring southern Methodist preachers to seek approval from local presiding elders and pastors before speaking outside of their usual domains. As Turley pointed out,

> Henry Clay Morrison, Pentecostal Herald editor and regular speaker at the Indian Springs camp meeting, was the first prominent figure to fall victim to the anti-Holiness legislation. In 1896 Morrison conducted revival services at a camp meeting near Dublin, Texas, after receiving notice from a local Methodist pastor and the presiding elder that he was unwelcome there. When the presiding elder filed a complaint against Morrison, the denomination tried and ejected him from the ministry. Morrison had as many friends as enemies in the church, and after filing an appeal with the Kentucky Annual Conference, the denomination restored his ministerial credentials.2

However, both Brasher and Turley, along with other scholars of the period, fail to note Morrison's active response to organize the Holiness Movement in the South. Clearly, Morrison's trouble within the Methodist Episcopal Church, South was a serious enough danger sign so that just a short eight years later Morrison would launch an effort to unite the Holiness Movement outside of the established denominational structure.

In an unpublished manuscript, holiness historian Delbert Rose added an additional and more complex understanding of the forces beneath this move, while also recognizing the importance of what Morrison was attempting to accomplish,

> Three and one-half years after the "General Assembly for the Promotion of Scriptural Holiness," held in Chicago, May 1901, another important assembly convened. This one was sectional, called "The Holiness Union of the South," and met in Memphis, Tennessee, October 11-14, 1904. The occasion for this meeting can easily and safely be inferred. The 1901 General Holiness Assembly in Chicago had failed to carry through on the good intentions with which it was called, conducted, and closed. They were striving to unite all the "friends of holiness," of the various sectors of the nation, of whatever denominational, or non-denominational group they might be members, into one great, unified national movement. Obviously the 1901 Assembly failed to meet the organizational needs felt by holiness people in the southern states.

According to Rev. S.L.C. Coward of the Louisville Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, for nearly twenty-five years prior to the Memphis meeting there had been very real tensions over the doctrine of sanctification in the M.E. Church South. This controversy had occasioned the sword of criticism being used to hurt reputations, wound spirits of men high and low in the Church, and leave injuries that only time and grace would heal.

Those known as the "holiness people" declared they were often discriminated against in Conference life, and unjustly opposed by unethical means, at times, by an organized opposition within their denomination. Consequently, they felt the only successful way to stand up to this opposition was to organize for the spiritual conflict in which they were embroiled.3

It is also important to recognize that Morrison was adamantly opposed to forming a new denomination, and yet the National Holiness Association was not viewed without skepticism. Turley indicates this skepticism in his history on the Georgia Holiness Association with regards to a NHA camp meeting held in Augusta in 1885,

> The hierarchy was reluctant to forgive what it considered the "undue efforts" of northern church officials who had taken advantage of southern poverty and disarray during Reconstruction in an attempt to regain a foothold in the South. At one southern meeting, National Association evangelists reported that officials of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, "understood that we were there to make a raid upon the church for the purpose of enlarging our own territory... and that the Methodist Episcopal Church had loaned to the committee, not only its official sanction but also its money." Within three weeks of the August meeting's conclusion, Warren Chandler wrote to association president Jarrell concerning the potential "divisions and strifes" among Southern Methodists resulting from fellowship with National Camp Meeting evangelists from the North. Chandler remarked that the northern church could, in his opinion, be using the National Camp Meeting Association as a channel through which they were infiltrating the region.4

With such attitudes prevalent in the South, it was necessary for Morrison to distance any efforts of his own organization from the National Holiness Association.

In response to a letter from the editor of the Free Methodist about the possibility of the upcoming convention of the Holiness Union turning into the organization of a new denomination, Morrison responded,

> There are scattered throughout the country persons who have been turned or driven out of churches because of their devotion to the doctrine of holiness, and their zeal in its promotion. We will welcome them to fellowship. Some may object to this, but their objections will not avail. These persecuted people are human beings, they are our Father's children, they need the nourishment of Christian sympathy, and we will give it to them without apology to any one. There are men who have been robbed of their license to preach, and others who have been refused license. They are called of God to the ministry, the people are perishing for the truths burning in the souls of these men. We do as the Iowa Holiness Association has been doing for years, give them a certificate of good character and soundness in doctrine, and let them go forth to preach the Word. Those who desire such certificates must pass a careful examination before a competent committee.<sup>5</sup>

Yet, Morrison resisted the idea of forming a new denomination. This was to be a unifying organization along the lines of the National Holiness Association, but Morrison rejected working within the national body,

> The National Holiness Association has been in existence for, I think, more than a quarter of a century, and has been able to accomplish nothing for the South as yet... The National has unlimited territory in which to work. There are the great Northern, Eastern, and Western states, which are practically untouched... The holiness people of Massachusetts must not be expected to be guided and controlled in carrying forward their work, by some brother in New Orleans.

> Neither will the holiness people of New Orleans be guided and controlled in their work by some man in Boston, who knows nothing of them and their wants. The Holiness Union just organized has no more business undertaking to organize the holiness work in the State of Maine from the N.H.A. has of undertaking to organize and control the work in Texas.

> This does not mean sectionalism, but it means practical common sense. There are other important reasons for our action, which if occasion arises, we will be able to make very clear to the people of all parts of the country.

The Holiness Union is organized on a much broader basis than some of the older organizations. They answered for their day and their region of operation, but we were in sore need for something for these times and this region.6

In an open letter in The Pentecostal Herald to the President of the National Holiness Association, C.J. Fowler, published in October of 1904 after the organizational meeting of the Holiness Union of the South, Morrison presented a number of arguments for the formation of the Holiness Union of the South. He noted the presence of four large holiness colleges: Asbury College (Wilmore, KY), the Male and Female Colleges (Meridian, MS), and the Holiness University (Peniel, TX). This was supplemented by several Bible Schools (Nashville, TN, Memphis, TN, and in South Carolina). Combined they represented more than 1,000 students. In terms of publishing, the South contained: The Way of Faith (South Carolina), The Christian Standard (Florida), The Living Water (Tennessee), The Holiness Advocate (Texas), and The Pentecostal Herald (Kentucky). These, he argued, reached "not less than one hundred thousand readers each week" with their combined efforts. Morrison also pointed out an orphanage (Peniel, TX), a Rescue Home (Dallas, TX), and "a very large number of holiness campmeetings, reaching from the Virginia shore to the Mexican border, and from the Ohio River to the Florida coast." Morrison also noted, "We have a host of earnest evangelists, and quite a number of full salvation missionaries in the foreign field." While he stresses a desire for good relations with the Christian Holiness Association, he also remarked, "I find that it is the universal opinion among us, that it would be unwise and unfortunate for you to organize National Holiness Associations in the territory represented by our recent convention."7

In March of 1905, H.W. Bromley laid out the vision of the Holiness Union Morrison was promoting.8 Bromley lists three aspects of this work. First, *The Pentecostal Herald* to connect holiness people through a common communication forum. Second, the Pentecostal Publishing Company and a Pentecostal Tabernacle that Morrison was building in Louisville, Kentucky, as a type of organizational center and operation to promote holiness teaching. Third was the work of mission including S.W. Edwards in Cuba, and the work of Brother Sarmast in Persia (who were being supported by Morrison at the time). Alongside of these three elements was a desire to raise funds to help educate young men to be holiness

evangelists at holiness colleges. Morrison's vision was nothing short of a full-blown holiness organization, designed to spread holiness through publishing, missions, and educational training. It sought to bring together smaller holiness churches and organizations across the South in such a way that a pooling of resources could fund a global revival, without becoming an independent denomination.



One of Morrison's concerns was holiness publishing. This is the printing office of the *Holiness Evangel* at Pilot Point, Texas in 1908.

(Image from the Author's Collection, used with Permission.)

## **Holiness Union Conventions 1904-1915**

The principle activity of the Holiness Union was its annual conventions. These became events to bring together holiness leaders from around the South to help create and build the holiness network in the region. At least the first three were recorded in detail in book form, 9 while more of the rest are covered in some detail in The Pentecostal Herald.

1904, Oct. 11-14	Memphis, TN (Masonic Hall)	H.C. Morrison, Pres.
1905, Nov. 22-26	Meridian, MS (Courthouse)	H.C. Morrison, Pres.
1906, Oct. 24-29	Atlanta, GA (Dr. Broughton's Tabernacle	L.P. Brown, Pres.
1907, Oct. 23-27	Louisville, KY (Trinity M.E. Church)	L.P. Brown, Pres.
1908, Oct. 20-25	Birmingham, AL (City Hall)	L.P. Brown, Pres.
1909, Oct. 19-24	Chattanooga, TN (First M.E. Church)	L.P. Brown, Pres
1910, Oct. 19-23	Little Rock, AR (City Auditorium)	L.P. Brown, Pres.
1911, Oct. 17-22	Nashville, TN (Watkins Hall)	L.P. Brown, Pres.
1912, Ap. 30- May 5	Columbia, SC (Main Street Methodist)	L.P. Brown, Pres.
1913, Ap. 29-May 5	Louisville, KY (Trinity M.E. Church)	L.P. Brown, Pres.
1914, Ap. 28-May 3	Louisville, KY (Trinity M.E. Church)	L.P. Brown, Pres.
1915, Ap. 27-May 2	Atlanta, GA (Dr. Broughton's Tabernacle	e) L.P. Brown, Pres.
1916 left up to executive committee in 1915 and never held		

# The Memphis Convention of 1904

The initial meeting of the Holiness Union of the South was well documented, with a book printed by Pentecostal Herald Printing (the early name of the Pentecostal Publishing Company). The meeting was held in the Young Men's Hebrew Association on Second and Adams Streets in Memphis, Tennessee. H.C. Morrison was delayed by a late train, but the elected leadership demonstrated the primary influences of the newly formed union. Morrison was chosen as president, and other Kentucky names filled key spots with L.L. Pickett as first vice-president, John Paul as third vice-president, and H.W. Bromley as secretary. John Wesley Beeson of the Meridian Colleges in Mississippi was second vice-president, and holiness leaders from Texas made up the rest of the executive committee (B.W. Huckabee as fourth vice-president and E.C. DeJernett as treasurer). A glance at the membership list of the first members, emphasizes this strong presence of Kentucky, Mississippi, and Texas holiness groups, but there were significant people present from other parts of the South. C.W. Sherman from St. Louis, Missouri is one such figure who was a charter member of the Holiness Union and attended the convention. He led the Vanguard Mission which was actively involved in publishing, education, and missionary endeavors in India.



Bessie Sherman Ashton, daughter of Vanguard Mission founder C.W. Sherman was the mission speaker at the 1904 Holiness Union convention. She spoke of her work at the Vanguard Mission in India.

(Image from the Author's Collection, used with Permission.)

With Morrison arriving late, J.W. Beeson began by speaking about the Meridian Colleges and the importance of holiness education. This was a major theme of the convention, with J.W. Hughes (President of Asbury College in Wilmore, Kentucky), E.C. DeJernett (representing the Texas Holiness University in Greenville, Texas), and Rev. N.J. Holmes (Superintendent of the Bible School and Missionary Institute in Columbia, South Carolina) all speaking to the convention. Images of these schools and their leaders appear in the convention publication, which also includes an

image of Taylor University. After Beeson's speech, Morrison arrived and the convention began in earnest. In his opening speech in the first convention of the Holiness Union, Morrison noted,

> In the great work of spreading scriptural holiness among the people of the present generation, and handing it down to the coming generations, it will be apparent to all that some sort of organization is necessary.

> If we could succeed against the mighty forces that confront us in the great work God has given us to perform, we must have that strength which comes from

This is evidently the will of God who has baptized us by one Spirit into one body. We have met here to consummate such an organization. It is well understood that there is a great necessity and wide clamor for such an organization as we now propose.

We want to put ourselves into good harness, strong enough to pull our full strength, and yet so loose as in no way to interfere with free and healthful circulation. 10

Morrison ended his speech with a call for 100 sanctified men to cause a revival across the South, but right before this call he said, "We will make much of the coming of the Lord, and warn men to watch, lest He come and find them unprepared. We will seek to explain to people the teachings of the Word of God on the healing of disease, and rejoice with all who find succor from the Lord for their bodies. We will try to stir the hearts of God's people everywhere on the subject of missions; we will not go to the heathen with a grammar, but with a New Testament."11 He called for a union which allowed Holiness people to work together, but without forcing uniformity.

It is also interesting to note that one of the early members listed in 1904 was Rev. L.P. Adams of Memphis. Adams was an independent Holiness pastor in Memphis. By 1907 Adams encountered G.B. Cashwell and received the Pentecostal doctrines, and was one of a small group of white pastors who affiliated with Charles H. Mason and his Church of God in Christ (COGIC) which was founded in Memphis in 1900. He would later join the Assemblies of God. This example lays out how early Pentecostal leaders were involved with the Holiness Movement networks. The Holiness Union of the South is a good example of these networks, and the rise of Pentecostalism was a major problem for the Holiness Union, as will become clear later in this article.

## The Meridian Conference 1905

In November 22-26, 1905, the second meeting of the Holiness Union occurred in Meridian, Mississippi, 12 the home of John Wesley Beeson's Meridian Male and Female Colleges. The original date of October 18-22 was delayed due to an outbreak of yellow fever (announced in the October 4, 1905 issue of *The Pentecostal Herald*). In the reports by Morrison and B.F. Haynes (President of Asbury College) found in the December 6, 1905 issue of The Pentecostal Herald, the primary focus was on strong holiness preaching and the organization of a mission board by the Holiness Union. As Morrison noted, "At this convention a Missionary Board was elected to collect money and assist in the support of several full salvation missionaries in various fields."13 Morrison later went on to elaborate the mission plan of the Holiness Union,

> It was the unanimous decision of this Board of Missions that we should not undertake the organization of churches, or the establishment of independent missions or schools in any of the foreign fields, but that our work should be evangelistic and that we should send out evangelists to travel in the various mission fields, assisting the missionaries of existing churches in promoting revivals of religion. It would be the special work of such evangelists to seek to bring missionaries and native Christians into the experience of entire sanctification. The great desire and purpose of the Holiness Union is to assist in promoting a world-wide revival of full salvation, to help, so far as in them lies, to carry to the ends of the earth the glad news that Jesus Christ is able to save all men from all sin.14

The board was selected to be made up of L.P. Brown (Mississippi), B.F. Haynes (Kentucky), M.A. Beeson (Mississippi), Joshua Sanders (Louisiana), Charles Dunaway, W.P.B. Kinard (South Carolina), and H.C. Morrison (Kentucky). The excitement over the mission program resulted in a collection on the last night of the convention for \$1,721.35 in subscriptions. Morrison also called for a drive to grow the Union to 10,000 members.

An additional report by Rev. Jordon W. Carter in the December 13, 1905 issue of The Pentecostal Herald, noted that B.F. Haynes and Professor Akers of Asbury College travelled to the convention with twentytwo students. In a fascinating letter from a young E. Stanley Jones to his mother (and then passed on to Nellie Logan), dated December 2, 1905, it seems that E. Stanley Jones was one of the students in attendance, and this idea for a Missionary Board was possibly the result of Jones' work. Jones wrote,

> I have just gotten back, or rather it has been several days now, from the sunny South where cotton grows and negros drive ox-carts and sing songs. It was the best short trip I have ever taken. Had more real enjoyment. We left on Tues. 19th at night and having to stop over about "20" miles below here" I hunted up a place to preach in a home and the Lord was there. We got to the Convention after having a service on the train at 2:30 PM on the next day. We went to the Court House, where they were holding the Convention and heard the young man who is with me in the picture preach one of his "big" sermons. We were assigned to our house after that. We were invited to stay at the Meridian Male College but as it was three miles from town we came into town to a private house after we staved out there for a day or so. The preaching was extraordinary. It raised me off my seat several times. H.C. Morrison and others were at their best. The pres. of our college preached several times, and was wonderfully blessed of God. I had prepared a paper to be read before the Convention to get them to organize a board of Mission for the whole South among the Holiness people. This, I read at one of the business sessions and immediately was discussed and declined impracticable by the pres. of the Convention. He however complimented the paper as being well gotten up. But would you believe it, the Convention a day or two after that after much discussion created the very board for which the paper pled. It means a great deal indeed. Of course, the pres. of our college was proud of his boys for they made a good impression on all those people from all over the South.<sup>15</sup>

It was also interesting to note that at the Meridian Convention, when the executive committee was elected, H.C. Morrison chose not to remain as president, but instead chose to be on the mission board. This was commented on in an article in The Christian Witness and Advocate of Bible Holiness, when the writer noted, "Many were surprised when Rev. H.C. Morrison declined renomination for President of the union. Brother L.P. Brown, a capable and devoted layman of Meridian, was almost unanimously elected President of the Holiness Union for the following year..."16



A second concern of the Holiness Union was holiness education. This is a post card of Meridian Male College, about the time of the convention and M.A. Beeson, its President who served on the new mission board of the Union.

(Image from the Author's Collection, used with Permission.)

### The Atlanta Convention of 1906

In 1906, the Holiness Union met in Atlanta at the Tabernacle Baptist Church. Morrison noted that the day before the convention he attended the memorial service for Sam Jones, one of the great holiness evangelists, which was held in the same church with an estimated 4,000 people in attendance. At this time, we also begin to see notes about meetings of the Evangelistic Brotherhood, which were designed to coincide with the conventions. This group was organized by Morrison on September 28, 1904 before the organization of the Holiness Union and many of the same people were involved.<sup>17</sup> It began to meet at the same time as the Holiness Union Conventions after a vote in June 1906.<sup>18</sup> Its purpose seems to have been focused on providing a qualification for evangelists who correctly understood and taught the doctrine of sanctification. There were

also dues which helped pay a death benefit when a member passed away to help cover funeral costs.

While missions remained a key theme, with the presence of S.W. Edwards from Cuba and Ed and John Roberts who were advocating for mission in India both being noted, the convention was also involved in a great deal of street preaching. A total of \$3,500 was raised for mission and the Union noted it would support the Roberts brothers in India, Bro. Sarmast in Persia, Edwards in Cuba, and J.M. Taylor, his wife, and Flora Philips on an evangelistic tour of the West Indies.<sup>19</sup>

Morrison defined the pattern of the conventions in the *Pentecostal* Herald, "We should have each year a few carefully prepared papers on the most vital subjects. But preaching, prayer, and praise, with ample time for altar work should have ample opportunity to bring immediate results, in the conversion of sinners, the sanctification of believers, and the deepening and building up of the spiritual life of the holiness people."2



**Broughton Tabernacle.** 

(Image from the Author's Collection, used with Permission.)

## The Louisville Convention of 1907

The 1907 Convention should have been a highwater mark in Morrison's work with the Holiness Union, as it was held in Morrison's own territory. The reports indicate a strong turnout with delegates from every Southern state and only six states from the entire U.S. not represented. Large crowds were noted, with filled galleries and even the use of overflow areas

in Sunday School rooms in the host church, Trinity Methodist Episcopal. Papers were presented by Rev. Joseph Smith, President Ellyson, President Beeson, and Professor Wray. Schools represented included Asbury College, the Meridian Colleges, Peniel College, Kingswood College, Arkansas Holiness College and a school from Louisiana. But while Morrison's publishing business was booming, his aim to create a Holiness Center in the Pentecostal Tabernacle was not fairing as well due to financial concerns.<sup>21</sup>

In April of 1906, the Azusa Revival had broken out in Los Angeles, California. This is often traced as the starting date of the modern Pentecostal Movement. While this movement was not addressed directly in the accounts of the fourth Holiness Union Convention, it can be read into some of the comments. Great care is taken in the various accounts to emphasize the order and respectability of the meetings. While the description of the closing prayer meeting at Morrison's Pentecostal Tabernacle notes, "There was shouting, laughter and tears, and waves of holy joy swept over us,"22 the focus tended to be more on education than any other theme. In an editorial by James Mailley on the convention, he wrote, "No movement that is not intelligent can endure. The holiness movement is no exception. It must raise up educated teachers of the doctrine or go down in defeat. No amount of zeal can save a cause from the destructive effects of ignorance."23 The only real note on the Azusa Revival comes from Pres. J.W. Beeson in a presentation he published called "What Evangelists Shall We Call?" in which he wrote, "As Bro. L.P. Brown often says, the holiness people need some sanctified common sense. The Dowieites, the Sandfordites, the 'Tongues' people<sup>24</sup> and many others that we might name, have been led off by unwise and dangerous leaders. There is much good in all of these, but much that is dangerous, and our people should be wise and discriminating... It will be a blessed day for the holiness movement when evangelists are expected to have some sort of credentials from a reliable organization of some kind."25 The growth of Pentecostalism would change the religious dynamics of the South and often led to holiness groups joining the new movement. 26 While the Louisville Convention of 1907 was clearly a success, the shadow of the new Pentecostal Movement was beginning to be felt.

# The Birmingham Convention of 1908

The fifth Holiness Union Convention in Birmingham was reported as a success, but it started under a major setback. Just days before the convention, from October 8-11, 1908 the Holiness Church of Christ

(both eastern and western divisions) united with the growing Church of the Nazarene. President Ellyson of the Texas Holiness University at Peniel was made a general superintendent and prominent holiness leaders joined the emerging denomination. C.A. Bromley wrote about the Church of the Nazarene in The Pentecostal Herald and noted, "With the increase from the South this year, we now have three Bible Schools, three publishing plants, and three weekly papers. This adds to our effectiveness to spread scriptural holiness over these lands."27 Given Morrison's initial aims to combine holiness publishing and education efforts across the South, this was a huge blow.<sup>28</sup> While Morrison maintained positive relations with the Church of the Nazarene and his allies in Texas, their influence and presence waned in the remaining activities of the Holiness Union.

Perhaps it is not surprising with these losses, the convention in Birmingham focused more on the issue of missions than on education or publishing. The speakers were heavily from Kentucky and it was reported that 18 states were represented. The colleges present were limited to Asbury College, the Meridian Colleges, and Boaz Seminary in Alabama. Despite the smaller turnout and the exodus of many of the Texas holiness people, the Holiness Union Board of Missions decided to send Morrison, "to make an evangelistic tour around the world preaching full salvation, assisting missionaries in revival meetings, making careful note of the spiritual state of the church, and gathering such information as would be of general use to the Board in future efforts to promote the doctrine and experience of entire sanctification in the various mission fields of the world."29 Financially, the Board supplied the finances not only to pay for Morrison's travelling expenses, but also to support his family in his absence. The trip was fundamentally to preach holiness in foreign fields, but it was also to visit and explore existing holiness mission work and understand the needs for more training and funding to advance the holiness cause. Perhaps, it was with this aim in mind that Morrison called the Birmingham Convention one of the best conventions, "We had a great time at Memphis, a great time at Meridian, a time of power at Atlanta, a powerful time at Louisville, but the tide rolled in more graciously at Birmingham than at any one of the other yearly meetings."30

Morrison spoke at the Convention on "Missionary Evangelism as Distinguished from Regular Mission Work" as well as giving a sermon on "The Office Work of the Holy Ghost in the Salvation of Souls." Both talks seem in many ways to be geared toward Morrison's missional thinking and

planning for his world tour. The main missionary present was Mrs. Ada Beeson Farmer, a sister of J.W. and M.A. Beeson, who had been trained as a teacher in some of J.W. Beeson's earlier schools before Meridian. She also taught for two years at the Meridian Colleges before going to the Christian and Missionary Training School in Nyack, New York. After her time in New York, she went to work with J.O. McClurkan's Pentecostal Mission in Nashville. In 1902 she left as a Christian and Missionary Alliance missionary to Guanxi Province in China, with financial support from the Pentecostal Mission. The goal was to start up a new work of the Pentecostal Mission, but due to various problems, she ended up with the Christian and Missionary Alliance. She had returned on furlough in 1907, and had spoken at the Louisville Convention in 1907. She returned to China in January of 1909 and passed away in March of 1911.31 The missionary connection with the Beesons, Meridian Colleges, and H.C. Morrison was made even stronger through Ada Farmer's involvement in the Louisville and Birmingham Conventions.

# The Chattanooga Convention of 1909

The 1909 convention in Chattanooga is notable for the absence of H.C. Morrison, who was on his world tour of evangelism. Morrison's friend and most frequent ally (and Union Secretary), John Paul ran *The Pentecostal Herald* and promoted the convention as well. Many of the usual holiness speakers were present and gave papers, and Asbury College and the Meridian Colleges were represented as well as Boaz in Alabama, being represented by J.L. Brasher. Almost all states were represented and most of the major evangelical denominations. Paul noted that the decision was made to hold the 1910 convention in Little Rock, Arkansas, in part to draw more deeply from holiness groups in Texas, Oklahoma, Missouri, and Arkansas.<sup>32</sup>

The most significant event was the decision to try and promote the Union through appointing State Secretaries, "who shall canvas his state for funds, securing names of those throughout the state, interested in the propagation of holiness in the church, and soliciting from each at least a small contribution for paying transportation of persons to represent that state in the Fall convention."<sup>33</sup> This included the idea that every ten cents given to the Union work would qualify as a ballot, enabling the donor to nominate a delegate. At a set time, the ballots would be tallied with funds going to pay the way of the person with the most ballots, and so on down

the line until the funds were exhausted. Funds given without naming a delegate would go to pay the expenses of the State Secretary.

It is questionable how well this system worked. In a letter dated April 6, 1910, J.B. McBride from Peniel, Texas, wrote John Paul, "I would like to know my duty as state secretary of the Holiness Union for Texas. I failed to see the Herald which contained the article on the Holiness Union and the object for which all the state secretaries were elected. I want to discharge my duty to the best of my ability and do all I can to make the convention in Little Rock one of the greatest that ever came to the southwest. Prospects are encouraging. I meet many men who expect to attend. I am announcing it everywhere I go, have been in many places in Okla. in the past four months and have two more large meetings before leaving the state and will make a strong pull for it."34 It is clear that the aim of the State Secretaries was to boost attendance at the Holiness Union Conventions, which was likely suffering reduced numbers from competing loyalties to Pentecostalism and Holiness denominations, like the Church of the Nazarene.

#### The Little Rock Convention of 1910

The Convention of 1910 is important for the return of H.C. Morrison from his world tour. He was able to make it back, even though he had experienced some health challenges along his trip, and he was in top speaking form. "Bro. H.C. Morrison, who has recently returned from a world tour of missions sent out by this Convention, gave us a broad vision of the holiness movement from the standpoint of the evangelization of the world. Bro. Morrison was weak in body, but has lost none of his old time force and power as a preacher."35 Morrison had been writing and publishing accounts of his trip in The Pentecostal Herald, and it was noted that the Holiness Union had brought in about \$5,000 for missions over the year because of Morrison's trip and his published accounts.

The Little Rock Convention also looked a bit more like the older conventions, even with a smaller group of around 400 people. There was a presence from Texas with J.B. McBride and E.P. Ellyson taking leadership roles. There was a presence from New Mexico and Nebraska, with an additional Beeson brother, W.J. Beeson representing New Mexico Holiness University.<sup>36</sup> In total Morrison noted some 8-9 holiness schools present and about 1,000 new members added to the roles. Present were also larger groups of representatives from Georgia, Mississippi, Arkansas, Oklahoma,

Texas, Illinois, and Missouri.<sup>37</sup> It is unclear if the State Secretary plan was responsible for any of this growth, but the role of State Secretary is not mentioned again in reports on the Union.

Despite a heavy focus on mission through Morrison's return and his preaching, he actually took a stronger stance on the issue of education in his writing. In a lengthy discourse about the subject, Morrison related four reasons why education is a promising avenue for holiness work, and he also mentioned a couple dangers.<sup>38</sup> He first indicated that holiness efforts at education can revive interest in youth in evangelism and mission, "The holiness movement has put scores of well-equipped soldiers into the field who would have lived and died in ignorance, tobacco and sin, but for the revival of full salvation." Secondly, he noted the importance of holiness scholars, "Some of these men will pursue their studies in fields of literature and science and in the end will write textbooks free from the taints of infidelity and in full harmony with the revelations from God." Third, holiness schools would send out teachers to influence the younger generations. And finally, holiness schools would help produce better-educated business people with holiness values. The dangers were twofold: there might be too many schools which could weaken the movement, and this could cause unholy rivalry within the movement. Such a position is interesting coming on the heels of Morrison's world tour where he encountered many young graduates from holiness schools (especially Asbury College) in mission, but it also is interesting knowing that in 1910 Morrison had been asked to take on the presidency of Asbury College and began his own career in academic leadership.

### The Nashville Convention of 1911

If the Little Rock Convention of 1910 looked like a potential opportunity to return to some of their earlier strengths, the Nashville Convention of 1911 highlighted the problems the organization faced. Nashville was the ecclesiastical center of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. It was also the home of the Pentecostal Mission and J.O. McClurkan, who would have been key members of the Holiness Union, if they had decided to join. They were active in the fields of education, publishing, and mission, and had historic connections to Morrison. Before the Convention began, a comment about the Holiness Union being the only group of Holiness missions from the South by Mrs. Bettie Whitehead in *The Pentecostal Herald*, seems to have caused a heated response. Mrs.

Whitehead (who was made Assistant Editor in 1911 and became the third Mrs. H.C. Morrison in 1916) in an attempt to correct the error wrote,

> ...we had in mind the fact that the Union was the only movable body of holiness people, having their annual meetings for the promotion of the cause of holiness and securing means to put holiness missionaries on the field... We are glad to note the fact that The Pentecostal Mission, at Nashville, Tenn., and the Nazarene Church, in different parts of the country, are doing a great work in indoctrinating the people in the doctrine of entire sanctification and in sending holiness missionaries into every mission field, and we feel in this great work, we are one in heart and purpose.39

As if this were not bad enough, the Holiness Union Convention was scheduled to take place immediately after the Nazarene Church General Assembly in Nashville. Morrison noted that he was able to see Seth C. Rees and talk to Rev. Breese, and visit the publishing house of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South and speak to the editor of *The Christian Advocate*, but in general, "The preachers of Nashville did not extend to us the greeting and gracious Christian spirit that we have met in Louisville, Chattanooga, Birmingham, Meridian, Little Rock and Atlanta."40 He acknowledged strong attitudes against the Holiness Movement which "greatly prejudiced the powers that be" against the movement. Morrison wrote, "They (the Nazarenes) were accused of being too demonstrative, too much noise, too much sectarianism, etc. Such criticisms do not count much with us these days. There was quite a noise in Jerusalem on the day of Pentecost, and the Scriptures certainly give good authority for an enthusiastic and rejoicing Christianity."41

The result of all of this seems to be rather poor attendance, especially with the Evangelistic Brotherhood. This led the Convention to make the decision to move the timing of the yearly meeting to the spring to accommodate the schedules of evangelists and ministers involved in various conferences and revivals. In his articles, Morrison reflected back on his time as a student at Vanderbilt University, which he felt had lost its roots in true Wesleyan theology. He also bemoaned the political situation in Nashville, which needed revival since it was under the forces of "King Alcohol." In retrospect, the 1911 convention in Nashville might be seen as the beginning of the end of the Holiness Union.

The Columbia Convention of 1912

The 1912 Holiness Union Convention was held in Columbia, South Carolina. This was an area of interest for the Holiness Union because it was the headquarters of Rev. J.M. Pike's *The Way of Faith*, which had been founded by Robert C. Oliver (founder of the Oliver Gospel Mission). Pike took over the editorial work for some 25 years after Oliver died in 1893. This paper became instrumental in reporting on A.B. Crumpler's revivals in the Pentecostal Holiness Church and in carrying reports on the Azusa Revival from Frank Bartleman.

Columbia, South Carolina was also near to the Bible School and Missionary Institute. This school was represented at the first Holiness Union in Memphis in 1904, where founder N.J. Holmes spoke on behalf of the school as its superintendent, and is listed as one of the founding members of the Holiness Union. The school had been founded in 1893 outside of Greenville, and then moved in 1898 to property on Paris Mountain. In 1901 the entire school moved to Atlanta until October 1903 when it relocated to Columbia using the Oliver Gospel Mission building until June of 1905 when it returned to Paris Mountain. In 1907, an early Pentecostal advocate, Miss Pinkie Blake, had introduced the Pentecostal experience, and its leader and students experienced speaking in tongues. In 1911 it had received its formal charter from South Carolina and in 1915 it moved to Greenville. Currently, the school is Holmes Bible College, known as "the oldest Pentecostal school in the world." Perhaps, this choice of location by the Holiness Union was an attempt to move those inclined toward Pentecostalism to return to traditional Holiness teaching.

Another interesting participant in the 1912 convention was A.B. Crumpler, a minister in the Methodist Episcopal Church, South who had been influenced by Beverly Carradine. Like Morrison, he had been charged and tried for conducting a revival against the objections of the presiding minister in 1899. He was acquitted, like Morrison, but chose to leave the denomination and founded the Pentecostal Holiness Church in Goldsboro, North Carolina. This small denomination was torn apart when one of its ministers, G.B. Cashwell advocated the teachings of the Pentecostal experience, and in 1908 most of the ministers supported this doctrine and Crumpler returned to the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. Crumpler was not only present at the 1912 convention, but preached there and joined the Holiness Union at that time as well. W.P.B. Kinard of Epworth, South Carolina was also present at this convention (he was also a charter member of the Holiness Union from 1904) and was made second vice-

president. He later founded the Epworth Camp Meetings, near Ninety Six, South Carolina, along with John Paul and other people with ties to the Holiness Union.

While these ties are interesting, the convention was not well attended. John Paul noted that it was "delightful" and "well-received," but "It was probably not as big as the conventions usually are, but this can be partially explained by the fact that only six months have intervened between the last two conventions."42 While Morrison's account was also positive, it is difficult to miss another article in the same issue noting that the Church of the Nazarene was combining The Pentecostal Advocate (Peniel, Texas) with The Nazarene Messenger (Los Angeles) into a new paper, The Herald of Holiness, and hiring B.F. Haynes of Tennessee (a longtime holiness ally and president of Asbury College for three years) as its new editor.<sup>43</sup> The Pentecostal Advocate (formerly The Holiness Advocate) was one of the papers Morrison had highlighted as a prominent part of the publishing mission of the Holiness Union back in 1904. In terms of holiness publishing, it is interesting to note when The Way of Faith ended in 1931 it merged with Morrison's Pentecostal Herald, and perhaps the connections made at this time laid the groundwork for that future merger.



The 1907, 1913, and 1914 conventions of the Holiness Union all met in Trinity Methodist Church in Louisville, KY.

(Image from the Author's Collection, used with Permission.)

## The Louisville Convention of 1913

In what was perhaps an attempt to regroup and rethink his strategy, H.C. Morrison held the tenth annual convention back in his own territory. It may have been aimed to return to the strength the Holiness Union had in 1907, when the convention was last in Louisville. Mrs. Bettie Whitehead sought to promote the convention before its start by promoting Morrison and his world tour,

> Dr. H.C. Morrison, in his world-tour, touched thousands of hearts and led them to a knowledge of Christ our Lord. Many of the missionaries of different denominations, heard the message of complete deliverance from sin, actual and inbred, and sought Jesus in his sanctifying power. Those who had received the experience previously, but whose constant giving out had left them in need of a refreshing, found fresh anointing from the Holy Spirit. He touched heathendom as no other man since the days of Bishop Taylor.44

This appears to be part of a push to focus back on missions at this convention. The Holiness Union had sent out Rev. Joseph H. Smith on a smaller version of a world tour to the Philippines, China, Korea, and Japan earlier that year.

Morrison described in his account mostly filled churches with an "auspicious" opening, and "quite a large number of states" represented by delegates. 45 However, J.B. McBride from Penial, Texas was absent and J.L. Brasher had to take his place. J.W. Beeson was present as always, but most of the names show more of Morrison's strong Kentucky influence then a wide presence of holiness leaders from the South. The Cowman's and "young Bro. Kilbourne" were present from the Oriental Mission Society. 46 They had interacted with Morrison on his world tour of evangelism, and so they spoke on missions at this convention as well. In perhaps one of the most telling acts of the convention, it was decided to meet in 1914 back in Louisville. Morrison's influence and circle were growing smaller, even as a Rev. Joseph Owen declared, "it proved to be one of the best conventions that has yet been held."47

### The Louisville Convention of 1914

In 1914 the convention again returned to Louisville, which had become a shrinking center for Morrison's type of holiness, embedded within the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. It is extremely interesting that in the

run up to this convention it was even announced that Dr. C.J. Fowler of the Christian Holiness Association would speak at the convention.<sup>48</sup> This was announced in late April before the convention, but Fowler does not seem to appear in the reports about the convention which followed. Instead Bud Robinson takes the opening spot on the program. Was Morrison seeking to reach out to the very man and organization who he had essentially told to stay out of the South back in 1904? Perhaps, he was beginning to reconsider the role of the Holiness Union and wonder if it should be brought under the wing of the Christian Holiness Association after all. In any case, Fowler's appearance never materialized.

Once again, the convention was reported as a success with full altars, good speakers mostly from among Kentucky holiness people or people with strong personal connections to Morrison, and Asbury College had a presence with the Asbury College Male Quartet. 49 Right before the convention, Morrison had visited Pilot Point, Texas for the meeting of the Texas Holiness Convention and he reported that most of those attending were now members of the Church of the Nazarene.<sup>50</sup> One of the new attendees of the Holiness Union who made a big impression was E.E. Shelhamer who was located in Atlanta, Georgia. He not only spoke at the convention but offered to host the following year in Atlanta. Shelhamer was a radical holiness leader who had been a part of the Pentecost Bands and was involved in the early development of the Free Methodist Church in the South.



The final convention of the Holiness Union met in 1915 in Atlanta at the newly rebuilt Broughton Tabernacle.

(Image from the Author's Collection, used with Permission.)

#### The Atlanta Convention of 1915

The Atlanta Convention of 1915 was held in the new Broughton Tabernacle, reflecting back on the 1906 convention, but without the same impact. The numbers were definitely down as Morrison admitted, "The attendance was not as large as it would have been, but for the financial pressure occasioned by the war in Europe, although quite a number were present and the blessing of the Lord was on us."51 Missions seemed to be a strong focus of this convention as well. L.P. Brown, in a report in The Pentecostal Herald gave some detail on the missions of the Holiness Union, when he wrote, "Support in full of Rev. E. Stanley Jones in India, support in full of the various fields of India of three native preachers and pastors, support and educating in India of four native boys and four native girls, to Rev. S.W. Edwards, Utuado, Porto Rico, \$10.00, to Rev. B.L. Sarmast, Oroomiah, Persia, \$82.00."52 This report is interesting, since at this time both Jones and Edwards were full time missionaries for the Methodist Episcopal Church. In an ominous note, on the same page as Brown's report is a letter from Sarmast noting the slaughter of Armenian Christians as part of the start of the Armenian Genocide of 1915-1916. Sarmast was Armenian and his work in Persia was among the Armenian people. Later reports would reveal that his entire family except for one son, was killed in the genocide while Sarmast was fundraising in the U.S. He and his son would become refugees in the U.S. and he would end up as a Methodist Episcopal Church pastor in Michigan, ending the Holiness Union's mission work in Persia.

E.E. Shelhamer was active in this convention speaking on "The Need of the Holiness Press," as was G.W. Matthews from Georgia, but most of the speakers were common names from Morrison's circle. J.W. Hughes spoke on "The Fall of Man- Atonement Needed," John Paul spoke on "The Next Great Revival and Its Groundwork," Morrison spoke on "Evangelism-Formative and Reformative," and J.W. Beeson gave a speech on "Do Our Holiness Schools Meet the Demand for Present Day Education." W.P.B. Kinard, J.T. Upchurch, and C.F. Wimberly were others from the past, who shared the stage with a few other speakers from Georgia. <sup>53</sup> In the end, Morrison noted, "The time and place for the next Annual Convention was left in the hands of the Executive Committee."

While this marks the end of the short-lived Holiness Union of the South, what is more interesting is Morrison's write-up of the convention before it was held. In a lengthy article, Morrison seems to be trying to

reframe or reorganize the Union along different lines than in 1904. He starts by rooting the entire foundation of the Union in Wesley, and almost seeking to make it a group of holiness leaders within the various branches of Methodism, rather than creating a safe place for holiness people outside of denominations as he had proposed in 1904. He still argued for a Southern regional focus, "It's membership, reaching into many thousands, may be found in all that tier of states extending from Virginia to Texas, and up as high as the Ohio border."55 His focus is much more clearly missional, referring to his tour around the world, the efforts of Joseph H. Smith in his tour of Asia, and in noting that the Union wanted to send another evangelist on a world tour after "the present war is over." Morrison also calls for the work of building more camp meetings, and schools and education continue to play a role, but the participants have changed. The Meridian Colleges and Asbury College are still mentioned, and even Trevecca College (the previous Pentecostal Mission's Missionary Institute) and Peniel, Texas (although both of those institutions were now firmly Nazarene). In addition, he mentions Ruskin Cave, Tennessee, Vilonia, Arkansas, and Hamlin, Texas. Morrison also continues to call for an army of evangelists, but all of this seems to be framed within Methodism more than as an independent organization. It could be that the growing rise of Pentecostalism and the Church of the Nazarene was forcing Morrison to take a crucial stand on encouraging holiness people to remain within their traditional denominations, a stance that he took all of his life.

### The End of the Holiness Union of the South

By 1916, the religious landscape in the South was very different from 1904 when the Holiness Union of the South was formed. Pentecostalism had exploded and grew expansively in the South drawing away key holiness allies. The growth of the Church of the Nazarene as a holiness denomination practically eliminated the participation of Texas holiness groups, and ended up assuming the work of the Pentecostal Mission on the death of McClurkan. While the end of the Holiness Union is not quite clear, there are several hints about what might have happened. In Morrison's paper, *The Pentecostal Herald*, it noted a revival of the Kentucky State Holiness Convention at about the same time as the usual Holiness Union convention. The former secretary of that organization, Andrew Johnson wrote,

The last separate annual convention of the Association was held at Ashland, Ky., in 1912. At that convention a motion was made by Dr. Morrison to hold the next convention at Louisville, Ky., in connection with the big Holiness Union Convention. The two conventions merged at Louisville the spring of 1913. The Union was like the allegory of the snake that swallowed the frog- it was "all snake and no frog." The people were so busy with the large convention they entirely overlooked the state convention. The Holiness Union Convention met the following year in Louisville and the state convention met at the same time incognito.

The Holiness Union went South in 1915 with a convention in Atlanta, Ga., while the Kentucky State Holiness Association was left outdoors and failed to hold a convention that year. But the Association has gotten itself together, and has resumed its independent and separate existence..."56

The state convention in 1916 was held in Wilmore, Kentucky, Morrison's new center as the president of Asbury College, and it was "reorganized" with Morrison being named as president. Morrison's close friend John Paul, who tended to be a frequent speaker and actively involved with the Holiness Union was one of the principal speakers at the Kentucky Convention. Also present was E. Stanley Jones, the missionary from India, who one year earlier had been supported by the Holiness Union as one of their missionaries. Clearly Morrison was making a statement about both consolidating his position and focusing more on local holiness work. Comparing the Holiness Union to a "snake" also seems to indicate some underlying tensions within the Holiness Union and local state holiness associations. Morrison's successful conventions in 1907, 1913, and 1914 in Louisville showed the strength Morrison had in Kentucky holiness circles, even while his broader regional strength was fading.

However, Morrison tended to stay above the issue, focusing his editorials on other topics in 1916. He did finally comment in a September 1916 editorial, on an upcoming "Interdenominational Holiness Convention" in Brooklyn, New York during the first October dates usually assigned to the early Holiness Union conventions. Morrison wrote, "Nothing has occurred in the South that has meant so much for the holiness movement as the great conventions held in Meridian, Miss., Memphis, Chattanooga, and Nashville, Tenn., Little Rock, Ark., Birmingham, Ala., Atlanta, Ga., Louisville, Ky., and Columbia, S.C. These meetings brought the gospel of full salvation home

to many thousands of hearts and swept away much misunderstanding and prejudice on the subject of sanctification."57 He encouraged his readers to pray for and support the Brooklyn convention from October 6-16, and in a follow up article on the convention, Morrison even revealed he was a speaker at that convention.<sup>58</sup> Perhaps Morrison was simply trying to aim for a larger leadership role in organizing the Holiness Movement on a national level. The pull of both greater local focus and greater national forms of organization would definitely have impacted a regional group such as the Holiness Union.

In any case, Morrison was clearly not accomplishing the goals he set out to achieve. In 1915 the Pentecostal Mission in Nashville joined the Church of the Nazarene. Back in 1907 the Holiness Union asked for the Pentecostal Mission to send a delegation to Louisville for the convention.<sup>59</sup> Morrison and McClurkan of the Pentecostal Mission frequently preached together and were in the same holiness circles, however, they were known to have minor theological and personality differences. Benson refers to one such encounter where Morrison seems to have publicly rebuked the mild McClurkan, possibly in August of 1908 at the Lebanon Camp Meeting where both were speaking. 60 Benson only guesses at some of the possible tensions, but it could also stem from McClurkan's reluctance to join Morrison's Holiness Union. In what might be linked to an earlier conflict, Timothy Smith noted an account which likely occurred at the second convention of the Holiness Union, "At a conference at Meridian, Mississippi, for example, McClurkan expressed to the assembled leaders of the holiness movement in the South his anxiety that in preaching the eradication of the carnal mind they might fail sufficiently to stress the human frailties of those who enjoyed this exalted grace. Henry Clay Morrison, so one account has it, interrupted and took McClurkan sharply to task. The reproof went on some time. At its end, the Nashville pastor, famous above everything else for his gentleness rose quietly, pointed to Morrison, and said, 'Brethren, that is exactly what I mean."61 Such conflict may have been part of the reason why the Pentecostal Mission did not join the Holiness Union.



Postcard of the Pentecostal Mission Training Home, an orphanage in Nashville, TN. Morrison had hoped that McClurkan and his Pentecostal Mission would join the Holiness Union, but this never happened. The Mission ultimately joined the Church of the Nazarene.

(Image from the Author's Collection, used with Permission.)

As far as organizing holiness people in the South, it is interesting that the two main players were McClurkan and Morrison. McClurkan's work began as a loose alliance of holiness people in 1898, and by 1904 had its own publication, Zion's Outlook (which became Living Water), as well as a Missionary Institute (which would become Trevecca College), and a strong missionary presence.<sup>62</sup> Morrison would have desired McClurkan's support, and this might account for the first convention being held in Memphis, Tennessee in 1904. But in the list of member organizations and individuals in the account of this convention, there are no representatives from Nashville or McClurkan's Pentecostal Mission present. Groups such as the Christian and Missionary Alliance and the Church of the Nazarene had been involved in conversations with McClurkan about joining their organizations, and they were expanding their own presence in the South. McClurkan died in 1914, but when asked about the future of the Pentecostal Mission before he passed, he had encouraged their joining the Church of the Nazarene. Thus, a major holiness organization of the South, with connections to publishing, education, and mission work, chose not to align with the Holiness Union, and this would represent a huge blow to Morrison's aims.

A different, but equally serious, problem from the growth of holiness denominations was the growth of Pentecostalism. C.W. Sherman, leader of the Vanguard Mission of St. Louis was a charter member of the Holiness Union in 1904, and his daughter, Bessie Sherman Ashton, who led the Vanguard mission work in Sanjan, India was the missionary speaker at this convention. She had been active in the Pentecost Bands before leaving them to work with the Vanguard Mission work. The Vanguard Mission was another important part of holiness work in the South, with a missionary presence and a holiness paper, The Vanguard (and even an Indian version, The India Vanguard). In what is perhaps one of the most tragic events in the history of the early Holiness and Pentecostal conflict, the Vanguard Mission of St. Louis had its camp grounds and printing offices taken over by early Pentecostals. John W. Harris relates the events of a Mr. B, who had returned from California with the teaching of tongues, and Harris writes,

> Mr. B., the leader of this doctrine, with his followers had taken full possession of the Vanguard Missionary Home with the grounds, saying the Holy Ghost had given it to them. The former leaders C.W. Sherman, his wife and Miss Anna Abrams, his wife's sister, who were aged, in terror had left the grounds and gone to St. Louis where they had a small mission on Chauteau Avenue. They were there at the time we came. The new occupants of the Home had destroyed all of the old files of "The Vanguard" which had been saved for several years, and had changed the name of the paper to "The Banner." The early garden which had been planted sometime before was given up to the weeds or destroyed, saying such work was of the devil. The meetings were being held day and night while everything around was going to ruin. Even the food became scarcer and scarcer, because all that had been laid up was consumed, and nothing was coming in.63

While this event seems to have occurred about April 1918, the loss of the Marvin Camp Grounds to the Pentecostals was a major blow to the Vanguard Mission, even though it continued to publish some version of The Vanguard at least through 1924.64 While this episode occurred after the end of the Holiness Union, similar, although less dramatic, movements had been taking place across the South, and in the process removing potential or existing members of the Holiness Union. The impact of the growing influence of Pentecostalism is perhaps best seen in the 1912 convention in Columbia, South Carolina, where a recently ousted A.B. Crumpler had joined the Union, and where J.M. Pike's paper, while remaining holiness had helped promote the Pentecostal Revival in the region. The April 1914 formation of the Assemblies of God in Hot Springs, Arkansas also likely drew from holiness people in that region as well, some of whom had likely attended the 1910 convention in Little Rock.

Along with holiness people and churches joining holiness denominations or affiliating with the growing Pentecostal Movement, the impact of the war in Europe was also causing difficulties. In the account of the 1915 convention in Atlanta, references are made to lower attendance than normal due to the economic difficulties, and also to putting off another missionary tour until after the conflict. Travel would have been impacted and the absence of many younger men due to military service would have definitely disrupted the typical Holiness Union convention.

# Publishing Education and Mission: The Themes of the Holiness Union

The Holiness Union of the South gradually faded with the last known convention held in Atlanta in 1915. Its end, perhaps due to pressures from World War I, the growing rise of Pentecostalism which spilt the Holiness Movement, and the rise of holiness denominations such as the Church of the Nazarene, the Free Methodists, and the Christian and Missionary Alliance in the South, had made the work of the Holiness Union obsolete. But what of Morrison's three principle goals: publishing, education, and missions? It is important to take a moment and see the end result of these goals. Morrison likely saw his work with the Holiness Union as a failure. Even in his own autobiographical work, Morrison refers to the organization as the "Southern Holiness Association." This change of name in a very cursory chapter might well be a Freudian slip, indicating his larger ambition to create competition for the Christian Holiness Association. In the following chapter on his world tour of evangelism, he corrects the slip and mentions the Holiness Union only in passing, 66 spending many subsequent chapters on the tour itself, and seldom referring to the organization which sent him. But did this organization really fail to meet Morrison's expectations?

In terms of publishing, in 1904 Morrison had aimed to unite the efforts of Southern presses for the work of holiness in a concerted effort. His 1904 outline included: *The Way of Faith* (South Carolina), *The Christian Standard* (Florida), *Living Water* (Tennessee), *The Holiness Advocate* (Texas), and *The Pentecostal Herald* (Kentucky). *The Christian Standard* seems to have merged several times and ultimately moved to being published in

Chicago as the Christian Standard and Guide to Holiness in 1912, so it was no longer part of Southern publishing. Both Living Water (from the Pentecostal Mission) and *The Holiness Advocate* became part of the Church of the Nazarene and ended as independent titles, replaced with *The Herald* of Holiness as a denomination publication in 1912. The Way of Faith would merge with The Pentecostal Herald in 1932, leaving Morrison's publishing work as the only major holiness publication left in the South. Morrison's Pentecostal Publishing Company and The Pentecostal Herald and Way of Faith (as it was known till Morrison's death in 1942) were some of his most important efforts in the day, and even today they remain key elements for any researcher looking into the teachings and influence of the Southern Holiness Movement. 67 Morrison's vision documented this period more than any other publishing effort.

With regard to education, some of the schools mentioned in 1904 moved toward Pentecostalism (the Bible School and Missionary Institute of Columbia, South Carolina) and others fell under the Church of the Nazarene (Holiness University, Peniel, Texas and the early school of the Pentecostal Mission in Nashville). Morrison took charge of Asbury College in 1910, so many of his ideas and efforts went that direction. His most reliable ally in the Union was J.W. Beeson of the Meridian, Mississippi colleges. Beeson would sell his schools in 1919 after the end of the Holiness Union due to health problems. The schools eventually ended under the Methodist Episcopal Church with a lack of holiness emphasis. Beeson moved to Atlanta and became involved in the insurance business. His faithfulness to Morrison is perhaps best seen in the gift his son Ralph Waldo Beeson gave to Asbury Seminary in 1990 of close to 39 million dollars, one of the largest gifts of its day. Most of this gift was focused on programs focused on evangelism and mission, which was part of the shared concerns of Morrison and J.W. Beeson back in the Holiness Union. Meanwhile, Morrison carved out a vision for holiness education in Asbury College and later Asbury Seminary, and much of this was likely influenced by many of the connections he made in the Holiness Union with educational leaders, such as Beeson.



J.W. Beeson, a longtime holiness ally of H.W. Morrison from the Holiness Union.

(Image from Asbury Theological Seminary's Archives and Special Collections, used with Permission.)

The Holiness Union's work with mission is perhaps one of the most interesting stories. While they never supported a large number of missionaries, a number of them were significant, but almost all of them ended up as part of the Methodist Episcopal Church. Perhaps the most wellknown name was E. Stanley Jones, who surprisingly seems to have received his earliest support from the Holiness Union, although that is seldom reported anywhere. S.W. Edwards started out in Cuba, did significant work in Puerto Rico with the Methodist Episcopal Church, and ended up essentially starting the Methodist Church in Costa Rica before he left the mission field under a scandal.<sup>68</sup> James M. Taylor was another important holiness evangelist and missionary who traveled throughout the West Indies, Central America, and South America before becoming involved in the Methodist Episcopal Church Board of Foreign Missions as the Secretary for Missionary Evangelism in 1917, where he was sent to Mexico and throughout Asia. He would ultimately become president of Taylor University for a brief time (April 1921- January 1922) before an unexplained scandal forced him to resign. He then disappeared into the Chautauqua circuit speaking about his adventures around the world. The Holiness Union also funded Morrison's

evangelistic tour around the world, which heavily influenced his view on missions and brought him into connection with the Cowmans and the Kilbournes of the Oriental Mission Society, who even attended and spoke at Holiness Union Conventions. OMS (now One Mission Society) still maintains contact with Asbury and keeps its archives at Asbury Theological Seminary. When Morrison established Asbury Theological Seminary, from its first full class (the graduates of 1927), all five students spent time in the mission field.<sup>69</sup> While Morrison is most known for his work in publishing and religious education, these elements often overshadow his foundational interest in mission as well, and this was heavily shaped by his experience in the Holiness Union of the South.

## Conclusion

The Holiness Movement in the South was not a poorly organized amalgam of independent holiness churches, camp meetings, and small state organizations. It was a complex network of relationships which crossed state lines in intricate ways. This can be seen most clearly in the Holiness Union of the South, a short-lived attempt to form a regional association based on these relationships. H.C. Morrison, its founder, was able to bring together holiness leaders from South Carolina, Georgia, Alabama, Tennessee, Mississippi, Arkansas, and Texas, as well as other Southern states. In many ways, this was a successful venture, but happened too late to be truly effective. The rapid growth of Pentecostalism, the rise of Holiness denominations, especially the Church of the Nazarene, and the economic impacts of World War I split this organization apart before it really became established. But Morrison seems to have maintained connections across these various divisions, even as he encouraged holiness people to remain within the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. Through a creative use of publishing, a focus on education, and a common concern for missions, Morrison was able to produce a non-denominational organization in which holiness people could thrive from 1904-1915. That in itself was a major accomplishment.

While challenging the more well-known Christian Holiness Association within the South, Morrison established an environment in which holiness connections and networks could form and develop. While the growth of holiness denominations and Pentecostalism likely contributed to the collapse of the Holiness Union, it also provided the space for networks to grow which also fueled the growth of groups like the Church of the Nazarene and gave birth to Pentecostal networks as well. With more research, it might turn out that the Holiness Union of the South was even the birthplace of subsequent holiness and Pentecostal groups. While that would certainly not be a part of Morrison's broader vision, it can provide greater insight into the rapid growth of Pentecostalism and holiness denominations throughout the South in the early twentieth century.

#### **End Notes**

- <sup>1</sup> J. Lawrence Brasher, The Sanctified South: John Larkin Brasher and the Holiness Movement, University of Illinois: Urbana and Chicago, IL (1994): 40.
- <sup>2</sup> Briane K. Turley, A Wheel Within a Wheel: Southern Methodism and the Georgia Holiness Association, Mercer University Press: Macon, GA (1999): 186.
- <sup>3</sup> Delbert Rose, "The Holiness Union of the South, 1904" labelled "chapter 5" pages 1 and 2. Undated manuscript. Papers of Delbert Rose, box 19, folder 19, "Historical Subject Files, Holiness Movement in the South, 1904-1914."
  - <sup>4</sup> Turley, A Wheel Within a Wheel, 109.
- <sup>5</sup> H.C. Morrison, "The Christmas Conference," The Pentecostal Herald. (June 1, 1904): 1.
- <sup>6</sup> H.C. Morrison, "Harmony in the Holiness Movement," The Pentecostal Herald. (October 19, 1904): 8.
- <sup>7</sup> H.C. Morrison, "An Open Letter to the President of the National Holiness Association," The Pentecostal Herald. (October 26, 1904): 1.
- <sup>8</sup> H.W. Bromley, "Several Real Needs; An Earnest Letter." The Pentecostal Herald. (March 1, 1905): 7.
- <sup>9</sup> Until recently only one of these books was readily available, *The* Yearbook of the Holiness Union for 1904 (Memphis, Tennessee), which was reprinted by Charles Jones in 2001. While it is clear from *The Pentecostal Herald* that *The Yearbook of the Holiness Union for 1905* (Meridian, Mississippi) was published, no extant copy has yet been located. *The Yearbook* of the Holiness Union for 1906 (Atlanta, Georgia) was discovered in the archives of Asbury Theological Seminary during the course of this research and has been made available electronically from Asbury's First Fruits Press (https://place.asburyseminary.edu/firstfruitsheritagematerial/214/). smaller pamphlets were printed following some of the later conventions and contain some information, and these are located in the Papers of Delbert Rose at Asbury Theological Seminary, box 19, folder 19. These will also be made available through First Fruits as well.

- <sup>10</sup> H.C. Morrison, "The Opening Address," in Yearbook of the Holiness Union: Containing a Full Report of the Holiness Convention Held at Memphis, Tenn., Oct. 11-14, 1904. Pentecostal Herald Print: Louisville, KY (1904): 19.
  - <sup>11</sup> Ibid., 22.
- <sup>12</sup> For more on the Meridian Holiness Union Convention, see Katharine Elizabeth Smith, "Let the Lower Lights be Burning: An Historical Study of the 1905 Meridian Holiness Union." University of Mississippi Honors https://egrove.olemiss.edu/cgi/viewcontent. Thesis (2012).cgi?article=3440&context=hon\_thesis. Smith's work does a good job exploring the nature of the Meridian Convention and its implications for the relationship between Morrison and the Beesons, however it does not really deal with the full nature of the Holiness Union of the South and often treats the Meridian Convention as if it were a single occurrence.
- <sup>13</sup> H.C. Morrison, World Tour of Evangelism. Pentecostal Publishing Company: Louisville, KY (1911): 8. https://place.asburyseminary.edu/ firstfruitsheritagematerial/20/
  - 14 Ibid.
- <sup>15</sup> E. Stanley Jones, copy of a letter to his mother, dated Dec 2 1905, from Asbury Theological Seminary, B.L. Fisher Library, Special Collections, E. Stanley Jones Papers ARC 1982-002, box 2, folder 3. The letter requests his mother to pass on the letter to Nellie Logan, an important correspondent and first grade teacher of Jones, which may explain why it is found among the correspondence with Nellie Logan.
- <sup>16</sup> The Christian Witness and Advocate of Bible Holiness. (December 28, 1905): 13.
- <sup>17</sup> "The Evangelistic Union." The Pentecostal Herald. (October 19, 1904): 8.
- <sup>18</sup> The Evangelistic Brotherhood: Constitution and Points of Information. Pentecostal Herald Print: Louisville, KY (n.d.). This pamphlet is located in the Papers of Delbert Rose, box 19, folder 19, subject file on Conventions, Holiness, Holiness Movement in the South (1904-1914). B.L. Fisher Library Archives and Special Collections, Asbury Theological Seminary, Wilmore, Kentucky.
- <sup>19</sup> J.M Taylor's book Campaigning for God in Caribbean Waters (J.M. Taylor: Knoxville, TN 1912) is an account of this mission work begun in 1906 (originally published in 1909 it was re-edited in 1912). The Pentecostal Herald from the time period of the Holiness Union frequently contains letters, articles, and missionary reports from Jones, Edwards, Sarmast, and Taylor as the major missionaries for the Union.
- <sup>20</sup> H.C. Morrison, "The Atlanta Convention, chapter IV." The Pentecostal Herald. (November 21, 1906): 1.

- <sup>21</sup> Robert A. Danielson, "From the Archives: The Pentecostal Herald, The Pentecostal Publishing Company, and the Pentecostal Tabernacle: H.C. Morrison Dreams Big." The Asbury Journal 78 (1): 210-228 (Spring 2023).
- <sup>22</sup> H.C. Morrison, "The Holiness Union Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (November 6, 1907): 1.
- <sup>23</sup> James Mailley, "Personal Impression of the Great Louisville Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (November 6, 1907): 8.
- <sup>24</sup> The Dowieites were followers of John Alexander Dowie (1847-1907) who founded his own city in Zion, Illinois and was a well-known faith healer. He was deposed for questionable business dealings by followers in 1905. Frank Sanford (1862-1948) was an influential leader of a faithbased group called "The Kingdom" located in Shiloh in Durham, Maine (called Sandfordites by Beeson). Sanford became an absolute ruler of the commune, claiming to be an incarnation of Elijah and King David. He was responsible for the death of a number of followers and ended up serving time in prison. Since Pentecostalism was not a formal movement at this time, it is often referred to by their primary sign of speaking in "tongues."
- <sup>25</sup> Pres. J.W. Beeson, "What Evangelists Shall We Call?" The Pentecostal Herald. (November 18, 1907): 8.
- <sup>26</sup> See especially Chapter five in Randall I. Stephens, The Fire Spreads: Holiness and Pentecostalism in the American South (Harvard University Press: Cambridge, MA 2008), which relates much of this emerging conflict. He notes of early Pentecostalism, "Converts were drawn largely from holiness fellowships. Consequently, battles between Pentecostals and their nonpentecostal holiness foes became commonplace." (187).
- <sup>27</sup> C.A. Bromley, "General Assembly of the Pentecostal Church of the Nazarene." The Pentecostal Herald. (October 28, 1908): 4.
- <sup>28</sup> For more on the development of the Texas Holiness Association see, Ryan Kristopher Giffin, "'Launched Upon Its God-Ordained Career': The Founding of the Holiness Association of Texas." The Asbury Journal 78(1): 75-102 (Spring 2023).
- <sup>29</sup> H.C. Morrison, World Tour of Evangelism. Pentecostal Publishing Company: Louisville, KY (1911): 8-9. https://place.asburyseminary.edu/ firstfruitsheritagematerial/20/. For more on the world tour, see Luther Oconer, "A World Tour of Evangelism: Henry Clay Morrison's Radical Holiness Meets 'Global Holiness,' 1909-1910," in Holiness and Pentecostal Movements: Intertwined Pasts, Presents, and Futures, edited by David Bundy, Geordan Hammond, and David Sang-Ehil Han. The Pennsylvania State University Press: University Park, PA (2022): 96-116.
- <sup>30</sup> H.C. Morrison, "The Birmingham Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (November 18, 1908): 1,8.

- <sup>31</sup> Ada Beeson Farmer's presence at the convention is confirmed in a copy of the program for the 1908 Birmingham Convention found in the Papers of Delbert Rose, box 19, folder 19, subject file on Conventions, Holiness, Holiness Movement in the South (1904-1914). B.L. Fisher Library Archives and Special Collections, Asbury Theological Seminary, Wilmoré, Kentucky. More on Ada Beeson Farmer can be found in Ada Beeson Farmer: A Missionary Heroine of Kuang Si, South China by Wilmoth Alexander Farmer (Foote and Davies Company: Atlanta: GA 1912).
- <sup>32</sup> John Paul, "The Convention as the Secretary Saw It." The Pentecostal Herald. (November 5, 1909): 5.
- 33 Bud Robinson, "My Impressions of the Holiness Union at Chattanooga." The Pentecostal Herald. (November 5, 1909): 4.
- <sup>34</sup> Letter from J.B. McBride to John Paul, dated April 6, 1910. This letter is located in the Papers of Delbert Rose, box 19, folder 19, subject file on Conventions, Holiness, Holiness Movement in the South (1904-1914). B.L. Fisher Library Archives and Special Collections, Asbury Theological Seminary, Wilmore, Kentucky.
- 35 Prof. J.W. Beeson, "Some Features of the Holiness Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (November 9, 1910): 5.
- <sup>36</sup> John Paul, "Some Things That Happened at the Holiness Union Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (November 2, 1910): 5.
- <sup>37</sup> H.C. Morrison, "The Holiness Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (November 16, 1910): 1.
- 38 H.C. Morrison, "The Holiness Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (November 16, 1910): 8.
- <sup>39</sup> Mrs. Bettie Whitehead. "Lest We Be Misunderstood." The Pentecostal Herald. (November 15, 1911): 4.
- <sup>40</sup> H.C. Morrison, "The Holiness Convention at Nashville, Tenn., Part I." The Pentecostal Herald. (November 8, 1911): 1.
- <sup>41</sup> H.C. Morrison, "The Holiness Convention at Nashville, Tenn., Part II." The Pentecostal Herald. (November 22, 1911): 1.
- 42 John Paul, "The Holiness Union Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (May 15, 1912): 9.
- <sup>43</sup> H.C. Morrison, "The Holiness Union Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (May 22, 1912): 1, with the announcement of the new Herald of Holiness on page 8. The "Minutes of the Nineth Annual Session of the Holiness Union Convention" were published on page 12-13 of this issue as well and note a number of the new members who joined in South Carolina.

- <sup>44</sup> Mrs. Bettie Whitehead, "Greeting!" The Pentecostal Herald. (April 30, 1913): 4.
- <sup>45</sup> H.C. Morrison, "Convention Notes." The Pentecostal Herald. (May 7, 1913): 1.
- <sup>46</sup> H.C. Morrison, "Resume of the holiness Union Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (May 14, 1913): 1.
- <sup>47</sup> Rev. Joseph Owen, "The Holiness Union Convention." *The Pentecostal Herald*. (May 14, 1913): 4.
- <sup>48</sup> Mrs. Bettie Whitehead, "Welcome to Our City." The Pentecostal Herald. (April 29, 1914): 4.
- <sup>49</sup> Mrs. Bettie Whitehead, "The Holiness Union Convention." *The Pentecostal Herald.* (May 13, 1914): 4. See also, H.C. Morrison, "The Holiness Convention at Louisville, Kentucky." The Pentecostal Herald. (May 20, 1914): 1, and C.F. Wimberly, "Holiness Union Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (May 20, 1914): 7.
  - <sup>50</sup> H.C. Morrison, *The Pentecostal Herald*. (May 6, 1914): 8.
- <sup>51</sup> H.C. Morrison, "The Atlanta Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (May 19, 1915): 1.
- <sup>52</sup> L.P. Brown, "Report from Bro. L.P. Brown." The Pentecostal Herald. (May 19, 1915): 10.
- <sup>53</sup> From the program of the 1915 Atlanta Convention, a copy of which is found in the Papers of Delbert Rose, box 19, folder 19, subject file on Conventions, Holiness, Holiness Movement in the South (1904-1914). B.L. Fisher Library Archives and Special Collections, Asbury Theological Seminary, Wilmore, Kentucky.
- <sup>54</sup> H.C. Morrison, "The Atlanta Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (May 19, 1915): 1.
- 55 H.C. Morrison, "The Atlanta Holiness Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (April 28, 1915): 1, 8-9.
- <sup>56</sup> Andrew Johnson, "The Kentucky State Holiness Convention." The Pentecostal Herald. (April 26, 1916): 13.
- <sup>57</sup> H.C. Morrison, "The Holiness Convention," The Pentecostal Herald. (September 6, 1916): 1.
- <sup>58</sup> H.C. Morrison, "The Interdenominational Holiness Convention," The Pentecostal Herald. (November 8, 1916): 1, 8.
- <sup>59</sup> Wynkoop, Mildred Bangs, The Trevecca Story: 75 years of Christian Service. Trevecca Press: Nashville, TN (1976): 75.

- 60 Benson, John T., A History 1898-1915 of the Pentecostal Mission, Inc. Trevecca Press: Nashville, TN (1977): 96-97.
- <sup>61</sup> Timothy L. Smith, Called Unto Holiness. Vol. 1, The Story of the Nazarenes: The Formative Years. Nazarene Publishing House: Kansas City, MO (1962): 192.
- 62 For more on the mission work of the Pentecostal Mission see, R. Jeffrey Hiatt, "A Historical Account of the Pentecostal Mission and Its Contributions to the Church of the Nazarene." The Asbury Journal 71(2): 102-114 (Fall 2016).
- 63 John William Harris, Tears and Triumphs: The Life Story of a Pastor-Evangelist. Pentecostal Publishing Company: Louisville, KY (1948): 334-335.
- 64 Mrs. A.E. Stevenson, "The Vanguard's Crisis." The Vanguard 44 (1): 10-11 (April 1924).
- <sup>65</sup> H.C. Morrison, Some Chapters of My Life Story. First Fruits Press: Wilmore, KY (2014). Reprint, originally published Pentecostal Publishing Company: Louisville, KY (1941): 195. Chapter 28 is entitled, "An Enlarged Effort in the Holiness Movement" but passes over much of the detail of the Holiness Union.
  - 66 Ibid., 201.
- <sup>67</sup> For more on Morrison's publishing see Robert A. Danielson, "From the Archives: *The Pentecostal Herald*, The Pentecostal Publishing Company, and the Pentecostal Tabernacle: H.C. Morrison Dreams Big." *The* Asbury Journal 78 (1): 210-228 (Spring 2023).
- <sup>68</sup> For more on S.W. Edwards and his mission work see Robert A. Danielson, "Sidney W. Edwards: Early Holiness/Methodist Missionary Pioneer in Cuba, Puerto Rico, and Costa Rica." The Asbury Journal 78 (1): 121-150 (Spring 2023).
- 69 See Robert A. Danielson, "The Missionary Class of 1927." Alumni Link (March 2, 2023), https://asburyseminary.edu/elink/themissionary-class-of-1927/.