



ACADÉMIE  
DES SCIENCES  
INSTITUT DE FRANCE

# *Comptes Rendus*

---

# *Mathématique*


Ji-Zhen Xu and Yong-Gao Chen

**On subsets of asymptotic bases**

Volume 362 (2024), p. 45-49

Online since: 2 February 2024

<https://doi.org/10.5802/crmath.513>

 This article is licensed under the  
CREATIVE COMMONS ATTRIBUTION 4.0 INTERNATIONAL LICENSE.  
<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>



*The Comptes Rendus. Mathématique are a member of the  
Mersenne Center for open scientific publishing*  
[www.centre-mersenne.org](http://www.centre-mersenne.org) — e-ISSN : 1778-3569



Research article / *Article de recherche*  
Number theory / *Théorie des nombres*

# On subsets of asymptotic bases

Ji-Zhen Xu <sup>a,b</sup> and Yong-Gao Chen <sup>\*,a</sup>

<sup>a</sup> School of Mathematical Sciences and Institute of Mathematics, Nanjing Normal University, Nanjing 210023, People's Republic of China

<sup>b</sup> Nanjing Vocational College of Information Technology, Nanjing 210023, People's Republic of China  
E-mails: 965165607@qq.com (J.-Z. Xu), ygchen@njnu.edu.cn (Y.-G. Chen)

**Abstract.** Let  $h \geq 2$  be an integer. In this paper, we prove that if  $A$  is an asymptotic basis of order  $h$  and  $B$  is a nonempty subset of  $A$ , then either there exists a finite subset  $F$  of  $A$  such that  $F \cup B$  is an asymptotic basis of order  $h$ , or for any  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists a finite subset  $F_\varepsilon$  of  $A$  such that  $d_L(h(F_\varepsilon \cup B)) \geq hd_L(B) - \varepsilon$ , where  $d_L(X)$  denotes the lower asymptotic density of  $X$  and  $hX$  denotes the set of all  $x_1 + \dots + x_h$  with  $x_i \in X$  ( $1 \leq i \leq h$ ). This generalizes a result of Nathanson and Sárközy.

**2020 Mathematics Subject Classification.** 11B13, 11B05, 11P99.

**Funding.** This work is supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China, Grant No. 12171243.

*Manuscript received 25 January 2023, accepted 13 May 2023.*

## 1. Introduction

Let  $\mathbb{N}_0$  denote the set of all nonnegative integers. Let  $h \geq 2$  be an integer. For  $A \subseteq \mathbb{N}_0$ , let

$$hA = \{a_1 + \dots + a_h : a_1, \dots, a_h \in A\}.$$

We define

$$d_L(A) = \liminf_{x \rightarrow +\infty} \frac{A(x)}{x},$$

where  $A(x)$  is the number of positive integers in  $A$  which do not exceed  $x$ . Usually,  $d_L(A)$  is called the *lower asymptotic density* of  $A$ . If

$$\lim_{x \rightarrow +\infty} \frac{A(x)}{x}$$

exists, then the limit value is called the *asymptotic density* of  $A$  and denote it by  $d(A)$ .

A set  $A$  is called an *asymptotic basis of order  $h$*  if  $hA$  contains all sufficiently large integers. An asymptotic basis  $A$  of order  $h$  is called *minimal* if no proper subset of  $A$  is an asymptotic basis of order  $h$ . The notation of minimal asymptotic bases was introduced by Stöhr [10] in 1955. In 1956, Härtter [4] proved that for each integer  $h \geq 2$ , there exist minimal asymptotic bases of order  $h$ . In 1988, Erdős and Nathanson [3] constructed a minimal asymptotic basis  $A$  with  $d(A) = 1/h$ . For related research, one may refer to Chen and Chen [1], Chen and Tang [2], Jańczak and Schoen [5], Nathanson [7, 8], Sun [11] and Tang and Lin [12].

Nathanson and Sárközy [9] proved the following results:

---

\* Corresponding author.

**Theorem A.** *If  $A$  is an asymptotic basis of order  $h$  and  $B$  is a subset of  $A$  with  $d_L(B) > 1/h$ , then there exists a finite subset  $F$  of  $A$  such that  $F \cup B$  is an asymptotic basis of order  $h$ .*

**Theorem B.** *If  $A$  is a minimal asymptotic basis of order  $h$ , then  $d_L(A) \leq 1/h$ .*

In this paper, the following results are proved.

**Theorem 1.** *Let  $h \geq 2$  be an integer. If  $A$  is an asymptotic basis of order  $h$  and  $B$  is a nonempty subset of  $A$ , then either there exists a finite subset  $F$  of  $A$  such that  $F \cup B$  is an asymptotic basis of order  $h$ , or for any  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists a finite subset  $F_\varepsilon$  of  $A$  such that  $d_L(h(F_\varepsilon \cup B)) \geq hd_L(B) - \varepsilon$ .*

**Remark.** Theorem A is a corollary of Theorem 1. Let  $A$  be an asymptotic basis of order  $h$  and  $B_1$  a subset of  $A$  with  $d_L(B_1) > 1/h$ . We take  $\varepsilon = (hd_L(B_1) - 1)/2$ . Then  $hd_L(B_1) - \varepsilon = (hd_L(B_1) + 1)/2 > 1 \geq d_L(h(E \cup B_1))$  for any finite subset  $E$  of  $A$ . By Theorem 1, there exists a finite subset  $F$  of  $A$  such that  $F \cup B_1$  is an asymptotic basis of order  $h$ .

**Corollary 2.** *Let  $h \geq 2$  be an integer and let  $B$  be a nonempty set of nonnegative integers. Then either there exists a finite set  $F$  of nonnegative integers such that  $F \cup B$  is an asymptotic basis of order  $h$ , or for any  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists a finite set  $F_\varepsilon$  of nonnegative integers such that  $d_L(h(F_\varepsilon \cup B)) \geq hd_L(B) - \varepsilon$ .*

**Theorem 3.** *Let  $h \geq 2$  be an integer. If  $A$  is a minimal asymptotic basis of order  $h$  and  $B$  is a nonempty subset of  $A$ , then for any  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists a finite subset  $F_\varepsilon$  of  $A$  such that  $d_L(h(F_\varepsilon \cup B)) \geq hd_L(B) - \varepsilon$ .*

**Theorem 4.** *Let  $h \geq 2$  be an integer. If  $A$  is a set of nonnegative integers with  $d_L(A) > 0$ , then there exists a subset  $B$  of  $A$  with  $d_L(B) > 0$  such that  $F \cup B$  is not an asymptotic basis of order  $h$  for any finite set  $F$ .*

## 2. Proofs

We will use a well known result of Kneser. If two sets  $X$  and  $Y$  of nonnegative integers coincide from some point on, then we write  $X \sim Y$ . For any set  $X$  of nonnegative integers and any positive integer  $g$ , let  $X^{(g)}$  be the set of all nonnegative integers  $n$  with  $n \equiv x \pmod{g}$  for some  $x \in X$ .

In 1953, Kneser [6] proved the following profound result.

**Lemma 5 (Kneser [6]).** *Let  $h \geq 2$  be an integer and  $X$  a nonempty set of nonnegative integers. Then either  $d_L(hX) \geq hd_L(X)$  or there exists a positive integer  $g$  such that  $hX \sim hX^{(g)}$  and*

$$d_L(hX) \geq hd_L(X) - \frac{h-1}{g}.$$

**Proof of Theorem 1.** If there exists a finite subset  $F$  of  $A$  such that  $F \cup B$  is an asymptotic basis of order  $h$ , then we are done. Now we assume that for any finite subset  $F$  of  $A$ ,  $F \cup B$  is not an asymptotic basis of order  $h$ . Let  $\varepsilon > 0$ . For any positive integer  $g$ , let  $A_g = \{a_{g,1}, \dots, a_{g,s_g}\}$  be a subset of  $A$  such that for every  $a \in A$ , there exists  $1 \leq i \leq s_g$  with  $a \equiv a_{g,i} \pmod{g}$ . It is clear that  $A_g^{(g)} = A^{(g)}$ . Let

$$F_\varepsilon = \bigcup_{1 \leq g < (h-1)/\varepsilon} A_g.$$

Then  $F_\varepsilon$  is finite. It is enough to prove that

$$d_L(h(F_\varepsilon \cup B)) \geq hd_L(B) - \varepsilon.$$

By Lemma 5, either

$$d_L(h(F_\varepsilon \cup B)) \geq hd_L(F_\varepsilon \cup B),$$

or there exists a positive integer  $g_1$  such that  $h(F_\varepsilon \cup B) \sim h((F_\varepsilon \cup B)^{(g_1)})$  and

$$d_L(h(F_\varepsilon \cup B)) \geq h d_L(F_\varepsilon \cup B) - \frac{h-1}{g_1}.$$

Since  $F_\varepsilon$  is finite, it follows that  $d_L(F_\varepsilon \cup B) = d_L(B)$ . Hence, either

$$d_L(h(F_\varepsilon \cup B)) \geq h d_L(B),$$

or there exists a positive integer  $g_1$  such that  $h(F_\varepsilon \cup B) \sim h((F_\varepsilon \cup B)^{(g_1)})$  and

$$d_L(h(F_\varepsilon \cup B)) \geq h d_L(B) - \frac{h-1}{g_1}.$$

If

$$d_L(h(F_\varepsilon \cup B)) \geq h d_L(B),$$

then we are done. Now we assume that there exists a positive integer  $g_1$  such that  $h(F_\varepsilon \cup B) \sim h((F_\varepsilon \cup B)^{(g_1)})$  and

$$d_L(h(F_\varepsilon \cup B)) \geq h d_L(B) - \frac{h-1}{g_1}.$$

If  $(h-1)/g_1 \leq \varepsilon$ , then we are done. Now we assume that  $(h-1)/g_1 > \varepsilon$ . We will derive a contradiction. By  $(h-1)/g_1 > \varepsilon$ , we have  $g_1 < (h-1)/\varepsilon$ . Thus,

$$A \subseteq A^{(g_1)} = A_{g_1}^{(g_1)} \subseteq F_\varepsilon^{(g_1)} \subseteq (F_\varepsilon \cup B)^{(g_1)}.$$

Hence

$$hA \subseteq h((F_\varepsilon \cup B)^{(g_1)}) \subseteq \mathbb{N}_0. \quad (1)$$

Since  $A$  is an asymptotic basis of order  $h$ , we have  $hA \sim \mathbb{N}_0$ . It follows from (1) that  $h((F_\varepsilon \cup B)^{(g_1)}) \sim \mathbb{N}_0$ . Noting that  $h(F_\varepsilon \cup B) \sim h((F_\varepsilon \cup B)^{(g_1)})$ , we have  $h(F_\varepsilon \cup B) \sim \mathbb{N}_0$ . This means that  $F_\varepsilon \cup B$  is an asymptotic basis of order  $h$ , a contradiction.

This completes the proof of Theorem 1.  $\square$

**Proof of Corollary 2.** Since  $\mathbb{N}_0$  is an asymptotic basis of order  $h$  and  $B \subseteq \mathbb{N}_0$ , Corollary 2 follows from Theorem 1 immediately.  $\square$

**Proof of Theorem 3.** Since  $A$  is a minimal asymptotic basis of order  $h$ , it follows that  $hA \sim \mathbb{N}_0$ . So  $d_L(hA) = 1$ . By Theorem B,  $d_L(B) \leq d_L(A) \leq 1/h$ . Thus,  $h d_L(B) \leq 1$ . Let  $\varepsilon > 0$ . If  $A \setminus B$  is finite, then for  $F_\varepsilon = A \setminus B$ ,

$$d_L(h(F_\varepsilon \cup B)) = d_L(hA) = 1 \geq h d_L(B) - \varepsilon.$$

Now we assume that  $A \setminus B$  is infinite. Thus, for any finite subset  $F$  of  $A$ , we have  $F \cup B \neq A$ . Since  $A$  is a minimal asymptotic basis of order  $h$ , it follows that for any finite subset  $F$  of  $A$ ,  $F \cup B$  is not an asymptotic basis of order  $h$ . Now Theorem 3 follows from Theorem 1 immediately.  $\square$

**Proof of Theorem 4.** Let

$$B = \bigcup_{n=0}^{\infty} \left( \left( (h+1)^{n^2+1}, (h+1)^{(n+1)^2} \right) \cap A \right).$$

For a sufficiently large  $x$ , let  $k$  be the integer with

$$(h+1)^{k^2} \leq x < (h+1)^{(k+1)^2}.$$

Let  $t$  be the integer with

$$(h+1)^{t-1} < \frac{h(h+1) + d_L(A)}{(h+1)d_L(A)} \leq (h+1)^t.$$

It is clear that  $t \geq 1$ . If  $x \leq (h+1)^{k^2+t}$ , then

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{B(x)}{x} &\geq \frac{B((h+1)^{k^2})}{x} \geq \frac{1}{(h+1)^t} \frac{B((h+1)^{k^2})}{(h+1)^{k^2}} \\ &> \frac{d_L(A)}{h(h+1) + d_L(A)} \frac{B((h+1)^{k^2})}{(h+1)^{k^2}}. \end{aligned}$$

Since

$$\begin{aligned} B((h+1)^{k^2}) &\geq A((h+1)^{k^2}) - \sum_{n=0}^{k-1} \left( (h+1)^{n^2+1} - (h+1)^{n^2} + 1 \right) \\ &\geq A((h+1)^{k^2}) - k(h+1)^{(k-1)^2+1}, \end{aligned}$$

it follows that

$$\frac{B((h+1)^{k^2})}{(h+1)^{k^2}} \geq \frac{A((h+1)^{k^2})}{(h+1)^{k^2}} + o(1) \geq d_L(A) + o(1).$$

Hence

$$\frac{B(x)}{x} \geq \frac{d_L(A)}{h(h+1) + d_L(A)} (d_L(A) + o(1)).$$

If  $x > (h+1)^{k^2+t}$ , then

$$\begin{aligned} B(x) &\geq A(x) - \sum_{n=0}^k \left( (h+1)^{n^2+1} - (h+1)^{n^2} + 1 \right) \\ &= A(x) - h \sum_{n=0}^k (h+1)^{n^2} - k - 1 \\ &\geq A(x) - h(h+1)^{k^2} - hk(h+1)^{(k-1)^2} - k - 1 \\ &> A(x) - \frac{h}{(h+1)^t} x - \frac{hk}{(h+1)^{2k-1+t}} x - k - 1. \end{aligned}$$

It follows that

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{B(x)}{x} &\geq \frac{A(x)}{x} - \frac{h}{(h+1)^t} - o(1) \\ &\geq d_L(A) - \frac{h(h+1)d_L(A)}{h(h+1) + d_L(A)} - o(1) \\ &= \frac{d_L(A)^2}{h(h+1) + d_L(A)} - o(1). \end{aligned}$$

Combining the above arguments, we have

$$d_L(B) \geq \frac{d_L(A)^2}{h(h+1) + d_L(A)} > 0.$$

Let  $F$  be a finite set of nonnegative integers. Then there exists a positive integer  $m$  such that

$$F \subseteq [0, (h+1)^{m^2+1}].$$

For any integer  $n > m$ , by the definition of  $B$ ,

$$[(h+1)^{n^2}, (h+1)^{n^2+1}] \cap (F \cup B) = [(h+1)^{n^2}, (h+1)^{n^2+1}] \cap B = \emptyset.$$

Since

$$(h+1)^{n^2+1} > h(h+1)^{n^2},$$

it follows that  $(h+1)^{n^2+1} \notin h(F \cup B)$ . Therefore,  $F \cup B$  is not an asymptotic basis of order  $h$  for any finite set  $F$ .

This completes the proof of Theorem 4.  $\square$

## References

- [1] E.-J. Chen, Y.-G. Chen, "On minimal asymptotic bases", *Eur. J. Comb.* **32** (2011), no. 8, p. 1329-1335.
- [2] Y.-G. Chen, M. Tang, "On a problem of Nathanson", *Acta Arith.* **185** (2018), no. 3, p. 275-280.
- [3] P. Erdős, M. B. Nathanson, "Minimal asymptotic bases with prescribed densities", *Ill. J. Math.* **32** (1988), no. 3, p. 562-574.
- [4] E. Härtter, "Ein Beitrag zur Theorie der Minimalbasen", *J. Reine Angew. Math.* **196** (1956), p. 170-204.
- [5] M. Jańczak, T. Schoen, "Dense minimal asymptotic bases of order 2", *J. Number Theory* **130** (2010), no. 3, p. 580-585.
- [6] M. Kneser, "Abschätzung der asymptotischen Dichte von Summenmengen", *Math. Z.* **58** (1953), p. 459-484.
- [7] M. B. Nathanson, "Minimal bases and maximal nonbases in additive number theory", *J. Number Theory* **6** (1974), p. 324-333.
- [8] ———, "Minimal bases and powers of 2", *Acta Arith.* **51** (1988), no. 5, p. 95-102.
- [9] M. B. Nathanson, A. Sárközy, "On the maximum density of minimal asymptotic bases", *Proc. Am. Math. Soc.* **105** (1989), no. 1, p. 31-33.
- [10] A. Stöhr, "Gelöste und ungelöste Fragen über Basen der natürlichen Zahlenreihe", *J. Reine Angew. Math.* **194** (1955), p. 111-140.
- [11] C.-F. Sun, "On a problem of Nathanson on minimal asymptotic bases", *J. Number Theory* **218** (2021), p. 152-160.
- [12] M. Tang, D.-R. Ling, "On asymptotic bases and minimal asymptotic bases", *Colloq. Math.* **170** (2022), no. 1, p. 65-77.