

Current Biology Magazine

Correspondence

Asymmetric architecture is non-random and repeatable in a bird's nests

Nicolas M. Adreani^{1,2,6,*}, Mihai Valcu³, Citizen Scientists⁴, and Lucia Mentesana^{5,6}

Bilateral, or left-right, asymmetry has evolved independently in many life forms and can be randomly, genetically or environmentally determined¹. In a population, the frequency of left and right phenotypes can vary randomly or be fixed depending on, for example, their adaptive value¹. Bilateral asymmetry has been described and quantified in individual morphological or behavioral traits, such as internal organ asymmetry or handedness¹⁻³, but rarely in extended phenotypes. Bilateral asymmetry is present in animal architecture, such as snail shells or bird nests. How common and important asymmetry is in animal architecture remains to be quantified⁴. Here, we use a citizen-science approach to quantify the occurrence of left-right asymmetry in the complex nest of a bird, the rufous hornero (Furnarius rufus). We assess the possible evolutionary mechanisms underlying asymmetric nest architecture and predict a genetic underpinning.

Male and female horneros contribute equally to building a 'clay-oven' mud nest, with the entrance on either the left or the right side (Figure 1A,B)^{5,6}. We collected data from 12,606 nests throughout the species' entire range (ca. 4,8 million km²; Figure 1C). Using a smartphone application, citizen scientists collected data on nest asymmetry, nest site properties (height, cover, substrate, entrance cardinal orientation and urbanization context) and photographed the nest. Based on the nests' GPS locations we also collated a dataset of large-scale environmental variables (i.e. temperature, precipitation, and altitude). Horneros pair for life and defend their territory year-round, and although a nest can last several years birds do not reuse it across seasons⁶. Thus, nests from consecutive breeding seasons can be

found in one territory, allowing repeated measures of nest asymmetry from the same pair (Figure 1E).

At the population level, we found 12% more right-entrance nests than left-entrance nests, which differed

from random expectation (Figure 1D; $P_{(df)} > 99.99\%$ for the comparison rightentrance mean estimate [95% Credible Interval (CrI)] = 0.56 [0.55–0.57] vs. Random mean estimate [95% CrI] = 0.50 [0.48–0.52]; n= 12,606; Supplemental





0.0

3

Λ

(n = 447) (n = 93) (n = 23) (n = 7) (n = 4) (n = 4)

Number of nests in territory

5

6

Mixed asymmetry

Check for

Current Biology

Magazine



Environmental variables can be important drivers of bilateral asymmetries¹. For each nest location we thus gathered data on altitude, temperature and precipitation, as these can be correlated with ecological factors such as predation pressure7, which among others is hypothesized to influence bird nest design⁸. Through the vast geographic area covered by our study, we found no support for a relationship between the occurrence of nest asymmetry and environmental variables (Tables S1 and S2). Nest asymmetry was also not explained by nest site selection properties (Tables S1 and S2), another aspect that is proposed to influence nest architecture8. The occurrence of left or right nest asymmetry could be driven by unmeasured micro-climatic variables. However, this is at odds with the pattern (i.e. positive autocorrelation) that we found whereby nests with the same asymmetry are clustered spatially (beyond the territory level; Figure S1), or by the fact that territories with more nests have smaller probability of shared asymmetry (Figure 1F; P_(dif) > 95% comparing territories with two, three and four nests; Table S3). The latter more likely reflects changes in the territory holders (e.g. territory shift or mortality increasing with time) rather than temporal changes in micro-climatic conditions.

Although a cultural contribution cannot be totally disregarded, the

occurrence of bilateral asymmetry in nest architecture could be genetically determined. The repeatability of a trait sets the upper limit to its heritability values9. The repeatability of nest bilateral asymmetry was R = 0.65 (i.e. a pair is very likely to build nests with the same asymmetry through consecutive breeding seasons; p < 0.001; Supplemental information), which is among the highest values reported for animal behaviors (associated to innate courtship displays) and the highest for a nest phenotypic trait¹⁰. The outstanding repeatability of nest bilateral asymmetry explains the higher probability of multiple nests having the same asymmetry in one territory (i.e. 'shared asymmetry'; Figure 1E) compared to a randomly generated pattern (Figure 1F; $P_{(dif)} > 99.99\%$ for model estimates vs. random simulations, Table S3; n = 544 territories). Horneros reside and breed in one territory for three consecutive years on average (with a maximum of seven years) and territories do not overlap⁶; hence, we confidently attribute the repeatability estimate to territorial pairs.

Here, we describe and quantify a bilateral asymmetry in an extended phenotype and the first one in an avian nest. The lack of support for environmental factors explaining the occurrence of nest asymmetry and the high repeatability observed at the pair level suggests that an individual, or pair, is capable of building one asymmetric phenotype only. It will be necessary to evaluate whether the 'decision' on the nest's asymmetry depends on both or one individual. Nest asymmetry could also be consequence of individual's lateralized behavior where coordination during nest building might be important. Nest asymmetry could be an assortative trait too. Follow-up observational and experimental studies will resolve such questions. The binary nature and the remarkable repeatability of asymmetric nest architecture makes it a candidate trait to seek for the genetic basis of nest building.

SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION

Supplemental information including one figure, three tables, a list of citizen scientists, experimental procedures and supplemental data can be found with this article online at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2022.03.075.



We thank: Michaela Hau and Manfred Gahr for their extensive support; Francesca Raffini and her scale-eating fish for inspiring this research; Tomas Cordoba for helping us develop the smartphone application HORNERO; Maude Baldwin, Ralf Schneider, Esteban Botero-Delgadillo and Bart Kempenaers for their constructive discussions and criticisms; Aves Argentinas, Aves Uruguay, Aves Bolivianas and Guyra Paraguay for promoting the project; IMPRS for Organismal Biology for financial support; Juan Carlos Reboreda and Sonia Kleindorfer for support; Pablo Fernandez for providing the photograph of Figure 1A. We are also grateful to all the Citizen Scientists who helped with data collection and preferred not to be listed in the detailed co-authors list. Finally, we thank Mark Laidre and another reviewer for their constructive and thought-provoking revisions.

CellPress

DECLARATION OF INTERESTS

The authors declare no competing interests.

REFERENCES

- 1. Palmer, A.R. (2004). Symmetry breaking and the evolution of development. Science *306*, 828–833.
- Raffini, F., Fruciano, C., and Meyer, A. (2018). Morphological and genetic correlates in the leftright asymmetric scale-eating cichlid fish of Lake Tanganyika. Biol. J. Linn. Soc. Lond. 124, 67–84.
- Frasnelli, E., and Vallortigara, G. (2018). Individuallevel and population-level lateralization: Two sides of the same coin. Symmetry 10, 739.
- Laidre, M.E. (2021). Animal architecture. Curr. Biol. 31, R1458–R1464.
- Massoni, V., Reboreda, J.C., López, G.C., and Aldatz, M.F. (2012). High coordination and equitable parental effort in the rufous hornero. Condor 114, 564–570.
- Fraga, R.M. (1980). The breeding of rufous horneros (*Furnarius rufus*). Condor 82, 58–68.
- 7. Romero, G.Q., Gonçalves-Souza, T., Kratina, P., Marino, N.A.C., Petry, W.K., Sobral-Souza, T., and Roslin, T. (2018). Global predation pressure redistribution under future climate change. Nat. Clim. Chang. 8, 1087–1091.
- Mainwaring, M.C., Hartley, I.R., Lambrechts, M.M., and Deeming, D.C. (2014). The design and function of birds' nests. Ecol. Evol. *4*, 3909–3928.
- Boake, C.R. (1989). Repeatability: Its role in evolutionary studies of mating behavior. Evol. Ecol. 3, 173–182.
- Bell, A.M., Hankison, S.J., and Laskowski, K.L. (2009). The repeatability of behaviour: A metaanalysis. Anim. Behav. 77, 771–783.

¹Department of Behavioural Neurobiology, Max Planck Institute for Ornithology, Seewiesen 82319, Germany. ²KLF, University of Vienna, Grünau im Almtal 4645, Austria. ³Department of Behavioural Ecology and Evolutionary Genetics, Max Planck Institute for Ornithology, Seewiesen 82319, Germany. ⁴See Supplemental information. ⁶Research Group of Evolutionary Physiology, Max Planck Institute for Ornithology, Seewiesen 82319, Germany. ⁶Contributed equally.

*E-mail: mnadreani@orn.mpg.de

Supplemental information

Asymmetric architecture is non-random and repeatable in a bird's nests

Adreani Nicolas Mauricio, Valcu Mihai, Citizen Scientists & Mentesana Lucia

Data availability statement

The raw data supporting the conclusions of this article will be made available by the authors, without undue reservation upon acceptance. [https://data.mendeley.com/datasets/9745v8tj9h/1; DOI:10.17632/9745v8tj9h.1]

Author contributions

Conceptualization, N.M.A. and L.M.; Methodology, N.M.A. and L.M.; Analysis, N.M.A. and M.V.; Data Collection, N.M.A., L.M. and C.S.; Writing – Original Draft, N.M.A.; Writing – Review & Editing, N.M.A. and L.M.; Funding Acquisition, N.M.A. and L.M.; N.M.A. and L.M. contributed equally.

Fixed effects β (95% CrI)		Back-transformed estimate (95 % Crl)
Intercept	0.256 (0.188; 0.323)	0.56 (0.54; 0.59)
Temperature	0.017 (-0.048; 0.084)	0.5 (0.48; 0.53)
Precipitation	0.001 (-0.067; 0.067)	0.5 (0.48; 0.53)
Altitude	-0.02 (-0.084; 0.054)	0.5 (0.47; 0.52)
Nest Height	-0.022 (-0.08; 0.037)	0.49 (0.47; 0.51)
Nest substrate	-0.027 (-0.095; 0.034)	0.49 (0.47; 0.52)
Urbanization	-0.049 (-0.113; 0.007)	0.49 (0.47; 0.51)
Nest Cover	-0.055 (-0.113; 0.012)	0.49 (0.46; 0.51)
sin(Entrance Orientation)	0.049 (-0.007; 0.100)	0.51 (0.50; 0.53)
cos(Entrance Orientation)	-0.033 (-0.088; 0.021)	0.49 (0.48; 0.51)
Autocorrelation term	0.070 (0.005; 0.135)	0.52 (0.49; 0.54)
Random factors σ2 (95% Crl)		
Observer ID 0.061 (0.054; 0.067)		

Supplemental Tables and Figures

 Table S1. Nest site properties and large-scale environmental condition do not explain the variation in

 nests' bilateral asymmetry. The response variable 'nest asymmetry' (0=Left, 1=Right) was modelled with a

 binomial generalized linear mix effect model. Estimates of fixed and random parameters with their 95% Credible

 Intervals (CrI) are shown in brackets. Statistically meaningful effects are marked in bold.

Nest asymmetry (0=Left, 1=Right)			
Fixed effect	sβ	Back-transformed estimate	
(95% Crl)	(95 % Crl)	
Intercept	0.250 (0.200; 0.300)	0.56 (0.55; 0.57)	
Temperature	-0.017 (-0.006; 0.03p)	0.5 (0.48; 0.51)	
Precipitation	0.010 (-0.037; 0.056)	0.5 (0.49; 0.51)	
Altitude	-0.032 (-0.077; 0.014)	0.49 (0.48; 0.50)	
Nest Height	0.016 (-0.021; 0.054)	0.5 (0.49; 0.51)	
Nest substrate	-0.010 (-0.055; 0.035)	0.5 (0.49; 0.51)	
Nest Cover	-0.047 (-0.092; 0.002)	0.49 (0.48; 0.50)	
Urbanization	-0.011 (-0.05; 0.031)	0.5 (0.49; 0.51)	
Spatial Autocorrelation	0.066 (0.006; 0.125)	0.52 (0.50; 0.53)	
Random facto			
(95% Crl			
Observer ID	0.048 (0.044; 0.051)		

Table S2. Environmental sources of variation of nest asymmetry in hornero's nests excluding the nest entrance orientation as a co-variate. The response variable 'nest asymmetry' was modelled with a binomial error distribution. Estimates of fixed (β) and random (σ^2) parameters with their 95% Credible Intervals (CrI) are shown in brackets. Statistically meaningful effects are those where the CrI do not overlap cero and are marked in bold.

Probability of shared asymmetry (0=Mixed asymmetry, 1=Shared asymmetry)			
Fix	ced effects β	Back-transformed value	Probability expected by
(95% Crl)		(95% Crl)	chance (95 % Crl)
Intercept*	1.12 (0.90; 1.33)	0.75 (0.71; 0.79)	0.25 (0.21; 0.29)
Three-nest territories	-0.47 (-0.95; 0.007)	0.66 (0.55; 0.74)	0.125 (0.065; 0.194)
Four-nest territories	-1.03 (-1.89; -0.188)	0.52 (0.32; 0.71)	0.063 (0.000; 0.174)
Five-nest territories	-0.83 (-2.34; 0.644)	0.57 (0.23; 0.85)	0.030 (0.000; 0.143)
Six-nest territories	-2.23 (-4.55; 0.09)	0.25 (0.03; 0.77)	0.015 (0.000; 0.25)
Seven-nest territories	-1.14 (-3.11; 0.83)	0.5 (0.12; 0.87)	0.008 (0.000; 0.25)

* The reference value (intercept) belongs to two-nests territories

Table S3. Probability of shared asymmetry in territories with increasing number of nests. The response variable shared asymmetry' was modelled with a binomial error distribution (n = 544 territories). Estimates of fixed (β) parameters with their 95% Credible Intervals (CrI) are shown in brackets. Statistically meaningful effects are those where the CrI do not overlap cero and are marked in bold. This is not the case for 'Three-nest territories' but we marked in bold because it is a remarkable effect size with a minimal overlap with zero.



Figure S1. Neighboring nests share the type of bilateral asymmetry. (A) Dirichlet polygons approach (See STAR Methods). The spatial correlation of the asymmetric phenotype from each focal nest ('F', black square in the center) with that from its neighbors (grey dots) was calculated for different proximities (i.e., neighbors proximity order; color coded). **(B)** Spatial correlation index (Join Count Statistic) calculated for right-entrance neighbors of different proximity order (1st-10th). The median distance between a focal nest and its neighbors is depicted between brackets for spatial reference. Asterisks and red dots indicate the spatial correlation indexes with statistical support for a positive spatial correlation (i.e., grouped pattern of nests with the same asymmetry; 1st order: p < 0.0001; 2nd: p = 0.03). Running the same analysis we found comparable results, for left-entrance nests.

Supplemental experimental procedures

Data collection

Citizen-science method

We designed and released a free smartphone application available for Android and iOS devices both in Spanish and Portuguese language (i.e., the primary languages in the studied countries). To increase our reach, we advertised the project through social media platforms (@nidohorneros in Facebook, Instagram and Twitter) in Spanish, Portuguese, and English. The application was downloaded and used across the 5 countries where the rufous hornero (*Furnarius rufus*, hereafter termed 'hornero') occurs: Argentina, Uruguay, Brazil, Bolivia, and Paraguay. Horneros and their nests are cultural symbols in each of these countries (e.g., it is the national bird of Argentina) and most of the people can recognize the 'clay-oven' nest, which is distinct from the nest of every other bird species across most of its distribution. This assured us, first, that data collection would be a motivating task for the citizen scientists, and second, that nest identification by citizens would be reliable.

Data collected via HORNERO smartphone application

The smartphone application consisted of an eight steps pseudo multiple choice questionnaire that the users had to complete *in-situ* every time they encountered an hornero's nest. The questions were designed carefully so that their interpretation was unequivocal and were accompanied with guiding schemes when necessary. The different variables requested were: i) asymmetry type (whether the nest was left- or right-sided); ii) nest height (citizen scientist's height estimation of the nest between 0 and 15 m); iii) nest substrate (whether the nest was built on a natural or an artificial structure), iv) urbanization level (whether the nest was in a natural, rural or urban habitat); v) nest cover (whether the nest was covered or uncovered); vi) nest entrance cardinal orientation (the nest entrance cardinal orientation estimated by the magnetic sensor of the mobile phone); vii) nest picture; and viii) nest location (GPS coordinate automatically acquired). A detailed description of the data curation and validation process can be found in the Section 1.3.

Multiple-nest pictures data acquisition

The longevity record for the hornero so far is of 7 years¹ (Adreani & Mentesana, personal observation) and pairs have been found to reside (and breed) in the exact same territory during up to 7 consecutive years¹. Furthermore, horneros are territorial year-round and build a new nest every breeding season¹. Given that the nest is very resistant it is not rare that old nests

persist over consecutive breeding seasons and new nests are built in the exact same location (i.e., by the side or on top of the old one; Figure 1C; Adreani & Mentesana personal observation). For these cases a picture may contain more than one nest (e.g., Figure 1C). This represents a unique opportunity to explore the repeatability of the trait at the territory level and given the life history of the birds (i.e., long-lived birds and territorial year-round) it is also valid to extend the interpretation of the results to the pair-level.

To assess the probability of shared asymmetry and to calculate the repeatability of the trait at the territory level we generated a data base with pictures that contained two or more rufous hornero nests with distinguishable asymmetry. The main source of pictures was our own database but here rufous hornero's nests from Brazil were underrepresented. Thus, for the data collection period, we also screened two additional sources of pictures: 1) the WikiAves database (https://www.wikiaves.com.br/) using the advanced search with the keywords 'Furnarius rufus' in the species and selecting 'nests' in the photo content and 2) all the pictures from Instagram (https://www.instagram.com/) with the hashtags: #multinido; #condominio, #hornero; #joaodebarro; #rufoushornero and #furnariusrufus. Although in some cases multiple nests in the same location appeared in different pictures (i.e., presumably the same territory), we excluded these cases. We only considered the cases where all the nests (and their asymmetry) were visible in one. Thus, we assumed that each picture represented one territory. In total we found 583 nests that met these criteria: 427 from our dataset, 96 from Instagram and 60 from WikiAves. For each picture (i.e., territory) we counted the total number of nests and assigned a label of 'shared asymmetry' if all the nests had the same asymmetry and 'mixed asymmetry' if at least one nest had a different asymmetry. We only used categories with at least 4 photos (i.e., 2-7).

Statistical analyses

All the analyses were performed in R v. $3.6.1^7$. Except for the Join Count Statistics analysis, which was performed and interpreted under a frequentist framework, we performed all our analyses using the packages '*Ime4*² and '*arm*³ under a pseudo-Bayesian framework with non-informative priors. For every linear model (package "*Ime4*") the restricted maximum likelihood estimation method was applied, and all the assumptions were checked *via* visual inspection of the residual plots. We used the '*sim*' function to simulate posterior distributions of the model parameters. Based on 10,000 simulations, we extracted the mean values and 95% credible intervals (CrI) of the model parameters⁴. Assessment of statistical support was obtained from the posterior distribution of each parameter⁵. We considered an effect to be statistically meaningful when the posterior probability of the mean difference (termed *p(dif)*) between

compared estimates was higher than 95% or when the effect size did not overlap with zero. For details on this approach see Korner-Nievergelt et al. (2015) ⁵.

1.3.1 Intercept-only model to test for stochasticity of the asymmetry

To determine the population-level proportions of right and left nest asymmetry we carried out an intercept only generalized linear mixed effect model (*'glmer'*) with a binomial distribution. Nest asymmetry (binomial, left or right) was the dependent variable and we included the citizen scientist ID as a random factor to account for the among-observer variation.

Effect of geographic and nest site environmental variables on nest asymmetry

To investigate if environmental factors could explain the variation in nest asymmetry, we ran two generalized linear mixed effect models (*'glmer'*) with binomial distribution. Here, we only used nests for which we had GPS data (12,255 out of 12,606). We ran one model without considering the information of the nest entrance cardinal orientation and another one including this as an explanatory variable. The reason for this separation is that some devices with which photos were taken did not have the sensor that allows to determine cardinal information. Thus, for the first model we used 12,255 nests and for the second one we only used a subset of 5,557 nests corresponding to those recorded by smartphones with the corresponding sensor.

In both models the dependent variable was the binomial trait: nest asymmetry. The large-scale explanatory variables were: i) Annual mean temperature of the warmest quarter; ii) annual mean precipitation of the warmest quarter and iii) altitude (m asl). This information was extracted from Karger et al. (2017)⁶. The local-scale explanatory variables were extracted from the HORNERO App database (see section 11.1.2 for details) and consisted of i) user-estimated height of the nest (m); ii) structure where the nest was built (natural or artificial); iii) the urbanization level at the nest location (natural, rural or urban) and iv) nest cover (protected or not). Furthermore, we added a spatial covariate to account for spatial autocorrelation (see details in the last paragraph of this section). Finally, we also included 'User ID' as a random factor. All the variables included in the models were z-transformed using the function 'scale' from the package Base ⁷. Details on the first model estimates are in Table S2.

For the second model we included the nest-entrance orientation following Pinheiro & Bates (2006)⁸. This information was recorded by the smartphone application in degrees. 0° corresponded to north, 90° corresponded to east, 180° corresponded to south and 270° to west. Given the circular properties of nest orientation data some transformation was required before its inclusion in the model⁸. First, degrees were transformed into radians. Then, each value was decomposed into its sine and cosine, corresponding to north-south and east-west

contributions, respectively. Hence, the model had two explanatory variables related to the nest orientation. Details on this model are available on Table S1.

To account for spatial autocorrelation, we added a spatial covariate to our models based on Bardos et al. (2015)⁹. Specifically, we first extracted the response residuals from a non-spatial model¹⁰ and computed the spatial auto covariation using a symmetric neighborhood matrix ⁹, a neighborhood distance of 10 km and an inverse squared weighting scheme. To do so we applied the function *'autocov_dist'* from the package SPDEP v.1.1-3 ^{11,12}.

Spatial distribution of the nest asymmetry: Join Count Statistics

A join count test was used to test for spatial autocorrelation of nest asymmetry. The test was run with R package SPDEP v.1.1-3 using the function '*joincount.multi*' ^{11,12}. The test counts the occurrences of neighbor pairs and compares it to an expected count. Specifically, the number of observed 'right asymmetry-right asymmetry' (and left asymmetry-left asymmetry) neighbor joins are compared to an expected value, under complete spatial randomness, by a z-test statistic. Consequently, positive spatial autocorrelation occurs if the number of 'right asymmetry' detections is significantly higher than what would have occurred with random spatial distribution. The spatial neighborhoods were computed based on Dirichlet polygons ¹³ (i.e., the space that is closer to a given nest than to any other nests). The join count statistic was first computed for close neighbors (i.e., 1st order) and then subsequently for neighbors of increasing distance (2nd order, 3rd order, and so on; Figure S1). P-values of these analyses were corrected to account for false discovery rate. We only present the results for the right-entrance nests phenotype, but the same results were obtained for left-entrance nests.

To assess the generality of the spatial autocorrelation pattern, we repeated the analyses on six quadrants that were selected from the full dataset (i.e., Cross validation). We selected the quadrants based on the number of nests and surface area. We looked on the map of observations and aimed to find quadrants of different areas that had representative amounts of nests and were evenly distributed (i.e homogeneous nest density). Furthermore, we selected quadrants that were widely distributed both latitudinally and longitudinally. The area of each quadrant and the number of nests where: 1) 10400|1980 [BA city]; 2) 3700km²| 839 nests [Montevideo]; 3) 3200 km² | 2366 nests [Hugo & Co.]; 4) 234 km² | 259 nests [Neuquén]; 5) 350 km² | 310 nests [Misiones]; and 5) 625000 km² | 8553 nests [Pampas].

After the cross validation we found that the only consistent pattern across quadrants was the one related to 1st order neighbors, and only in the largest quadrant (i.e.,the one with the most heterogenous density) we found a positive spatial autocorrelation with 2nd order neighbors. The discrepancy of 2nd order neighbors with the whole dataset is possibly due to

the heterogenous density of nests is in our dataset. Thus, it is likely that the spatial correlation with 2nd order neighbors is an artifact consequence of this.

Nest asymmetry at the territory-level

We ran a generalized linear model ('g/m') to estimate the probability of shared asymmetry across territories (i.e.,pictures) with different nest numbers. The dependent variable was binomial: 'shared asymmetry' or 'mixed asymmetry' (see section 1.2.3 for details on the definition) and the explanatory variable was the number of nests within each territory. Details on this model estimates can be found in the Table S3. In addition, we ran 10,000 simulations of our dataset assuming that left and right asymmetry were equally probable to occur in consecutive building events. Here, we calculated the probability of "shared asymmetry" (Mean and 95% CrI) for the different number of nests within a territory. Finally, we also calculated the repeatability of the nest asymmetry following Nakagawa & Schielzeth (2010)¹⁴. To do so, we first ran an intercept-only generalized linear mixed effect model ('g/mer') considering each of the nests within a territory (i.e.,picture). The dependent variable was the nest asymmetry (left or right asymmetry) and the territory (i.e.,picture ID) was set as random factor with random intercept. Then, we applied the function '*rptBinary*' from the package '*rptR*' ¹⁵ and calculated the repeatability (R) on the original scale (See¹⁴ for details).

Curation and validation of the data set

One of the major concerns in citizen-science is the accuracy with which the data is generated ^{16,17}. While volunteers can perform as good as specialists (e.g., ^{18,19}), it is also possible that volunteers do not comply with the accuracy standards expected by the researchers (reviewed in ¹⁷).

Prior to the design of the application, we considered five possible factors that could affect the reliability of our data due to implementing a citizen-science approach through a smartphone application. These where:

- **A.** Input of nests that did not belong to the target species.
- B. Input of fake data.
- C. Incorrect assessment of the nest characteristics.
- **D.** Repeated entries of the same nest by one user (within-user pseudo replication).
- **E.** Repeated entries of the same nest by different users (between-user pseudo replication).

To minimize possible biases from A-C, we proceeded as follows:

(1) During the design process, we decided to include a picture of the observed nest as a mandatory step in the application. This allowed us to perform *a posteriori* control of the data quality (see below).

(2) During data collection, we curated the incoming data on a regular basis. On average we received 34.5 nests per day. These data points were uploaded in an almost-daily basis to an online record map available in the project's homepage. We took this as an opportunity to screen newly collected data in search for errors and inconsistent data, and therefore remove such data when necessary.

(3) Once data collection was finished, we performed a data-quality validation. In order to do so, we randomly selected sets of 100 pictures from the final dataset and assigned to each figure a 'valid' or 'invalid' label. A nest was labelled as 'valid' whenever it contained a nest with a visible asymmetry, otherwise it was labelled as 'invalid'. We then calculated the proportion of valid data points over the total. We did this repeatedly, adding new sets of 100 nests until we found that the proportion of valid/invalid labels stabilized. A plateau was reached after 1000 nests. We named this final set as 'Validation subset'. Out of the 1000 pictures from this validation subset (~10% of the total number of pictures), 95,3% had a complete hornero nest with a clearly visible asymmetry. The remaining 4,7 % were composed of: 'unfinished nests' (3,1%), 'Nest in indistinguishable state' (1,3%) or 'absence of nest' (0,3%). From the 953 pictures that had a complete nest, 98,11% had correctly assigned nest properties and only 1.89% had wrongly assigned the nest asymmetry. Nest height estimation was the only nest property that we could not control from the picture. Altogether, we are confident that less than

5% of the data collected by the citizen scientists constituted a source of statistical noise in our analyses and given our final sample size, it is unlikely that this would influence our results.

To minimize and quantify possible pseudo-replication problems (points D and E) we took the following actions:

(1) Prior to the release of the application we set the duration of the data collection period to one year: from the 22nd of October of 2018 until the 31st of October of 2019 (370 days in total). Horneros are territorial year-round, breed seasonally and build a new nest every season^{1,20}. Given that the nests are very resistant and that birds are territorial year-round it is not rare to find multiple nests from one pair (from current and previous seasons) in one territory¹. By restricting the data collection period to one year we captured a 'snapshot' of the nests distribution by minimizing the collection of multiple nests from the same individuals.

(2) During data collection we encouraged the users to avoid registering the same nests multiple times weekly *via* social media platforms and developed an 'almost live' online map of observations (updated daily) that was made available in the project's homepage. We constantly brought the users attention to this resource and encouraged them to discover unexplored places and to avoid areas that were already covered by other users. In this way, we minimized between-users pseudo replication.

(3) We used the GPS information to quantify the proportion of nests in our data set that were closer than 25 m to another nest. We did pairwise distance comparisons between all nests and only 3.8% of the nests were closer than 25 m to another nest. When examining the pictures of these nests we noticed that in fact very few of these cases were duplicate records of the same nest but rather multiple different nests in the same location, which then turned out useful for other analyses (See section 1.2.3).

Except for the intercept-only model and the repeatability picture-analyses (see details above), all the nests that were registered from smartphones without an internal GPS were excluded from the analyses (351 out of 12,606 nests lacked precise GPS information).

Detailed co-author list

	Surname	Name	Country
1	Aberg Cobo	Barbara María	Argentina
2	Abrego Veizaga	Virna Lissy	Bolivia
3	Acosta	Haydée Julia	Argentina
4	Acosta	Monica	Uruguay
5	Adreani	Reinaldo Mauricio	Argentina
6	Aquilar	Juan Martin	Argentina
7	Aguirre	Marcos María	Argentina
8	Aiub Robledo	Bruno Ismael	Argentina
9	Albuerne	Irene	Argentina
10	Alcaraz	Martha Elena	Argentina
11	Algorta	Масо	Uruguay
12	Alianak	Guillermina	Argentina
13	Allenspach	Natalia	Brasil
14	Almiron	Mónica	Argentina
15	Alonso	Patricia Laura	Argentina
16	Alterino	Dora	Argentina
17	Alvarez de Quevedo	Micaela	Argentina
18	Amarillo	Ariel Alexis	Argentina
19	Angerosa	Santiago	Argentina
20	Aparicio Arias	Avelen Alina	Argentina
21	Aramavo	Rodrigo Sebastián	Argentina
22	Arandia	Gisela	Argentina
23	Arburúas	Ana V.	Uruquav
24	Arce	Carina	Argentina
25	Arce	Eduardo	Argentina
26	Arestiqui	Margarita	Argentina
27	Armand Ugon	Gustavo	Argentina
28	Arrascaeta Plus	Walter Celso	Argentina
29	Arruti	Maria Fabiána	Argentina
30	Asaroff	Pablo	Argentina
31	Aurtenechea Salar	Nuria	Argentina
32	Avalos	Abigail	Argentina
33	Azurmendi	Paola	Argentina
34	Bagnis	Maria Aleiandra	Argentina
35	Baranello	Giovanna	Argentina
36	Bareiro Guiñazú	Adolfo Leandro	Argentina
37	Basedas	Adrián	Uruquav
38	Bastida	Amparo	Argentina
39	Battaglia	Roberto Eduardo	Argentina
40	Battista	Marisa	Argentina
41	Belaus	Analía	Argentina
42	Beltrocco	Eduardo Luis	Argentina
43	Benavídez	Analía	Argentina
44	Bender	J. Benjamin	Argentina
45	Benítez Romero	Beatriz Concepción	Paraguav
46	Bernad	Lucia	Argentina
47	Bernárdez	María de los Ángeles	Argentina
48	Berrios	Pamela	Argentina
49	Bianchi	Rocío	Argentina
50	Biazzi	Fabricio	Argentina
51	Bigliardi	Aleiandro	Argentina
52	Boasso	Susana	Argentina
53	Bonavita	Bruno	Uruguav
54	Boquete aquiar	Jose manuel	Argentina

55	Borello	Agustina	Argentina
56	Borgo	Raúl Gustavo	Argentina
57	Borsellino	Laura	Argentina
58	Bossio	Carlos	Argentina
59	Brasesco	Gustavo	Argentina
60	Brasesco	Agustin	Argentina
61	Bruna	Fabián celestino	Argentina
62	Brutti	Celin	Argentina
63	Buda	Mariel	Argentina
64	Buglione Rodríguez	Fiorella	Argentina
65	Burgi	María Virginia	Argentina
66	Burgos	Adriana	Argentina
67	Caballero-Sadi	Diego	Uruquay
68	Cáceres	María Gabriela	Argentina
69	Caceres Galin	Jorge	Uruquay
70	Calamante	Guillermo	Argentina
71	Campá	Juan	Uruquav
72	Campero	Agustin	Argentina
73	Camuzzi	Graciela Gladis	Argentina
74	Canepa	Maru	Argentina
75	Capovilla	Pablo	Argentina
76	Capponi Leban	Agostina Soledad	Argentina
77	Caprotti	Hugo Javier	Argentina
78	Caraballo	Rubén Darío	Argentina
79	Carbaial	Mirta	Argentina
80	Carbajal	Mirta Noemi	Argentina
81	Cárdenas Cáceres	Romina Soledad	Argentina
82	Cardoso	Daniel	Argentina
83	Carle	Susana	Uruquay
84	Carneiro	Fllen	Brasil
85	Caro	Pedro Roberto	Argentina
86	Carro	Valentina	Uruquay
87	Castelló	Aleiandra	Uruquay
88	Castiñeira	Marìa Belèn	Argentina
89	Castro	Andrés	Argentina
90	Cervantes	Tomy	Uruquay
91	César	Irma Adriana	Argentina
92	Chivo	Luciana	Brasil
93	Cianciaruso	Andrés	Uruquay
94	Clifton Goldney	Gonzalo	Argentina
95	Collavino	Pablo	Argentina
96	Collo	Mariela	Argentina
97	Contreras	Sandra	Argentina
98	Corvera	Paula Isabel	Argentina
99	Corvera	Andrea Victoria	Argentina
100	Corvera	Paula Isabel	Argentina
101	Coulin	Carolina	Uruquav
102	Creciente	Gabriela	Argentina
103	Cristi	Elisa	Uruquav
104	Cuestas	Marcela	Argentina
105		Gustavo	Argentina
106	Curcho	Sofia	Uruquav
107	Cuscione	Paula	Argentina
108	Cuyckens	Griet An Frica	Argentina
109	D'Alessio	Silvana	Argentina
110	Da Costa	Víctor	Uruguav
111	Damonte	Adriana	Argentina
112	Daniele		Argentina

113	Danzé	Miguel Angel Marcelo	Argentina
114	de Campo	Marcos	Uruguay
115	de los Hoyos	Camilo Raul	Argentina
116	de los Santos Ghirardelli	Maite	Uruguay
117	Del Pozo	Ezequiel Pablo	Argentina
118	Delpino	Claudia	Argentina
119	Desposito	Cristian Daniel	Argentina
120	Di Battista	Cristian	Argentina
121	Di Giuseppe	Luis	Argentina
122	Diaz	Marcos Nahuel	Argentina
123	Díaz Cámera	Orlando	Uruguay
124	Diez	Sabrina Analía	Argentina
125	Domnanovich	RodolfoE.	Argentina
126	D'Onofrio	Julia	Argentina
127	Duartes	Juan Gabriel	Argentina
128	Duimich	Mirko	Argentina
129	Durante	María Teresa	Argentina
130	Echenique	Edgar	Argentina
131	Echevarria	Ada Lilian	Argentina
132	Elizalde	Gabriela	Uruguay
133	Elosegui	Clara	Argentina
134	Escalante	Silvana	Argentina
135	Escobar González	Lourdes	Argentina
136	Esper Bordigoni	Tamara Sabrina	Argentina
137	Espindola	Ronaldo	Argentina
138	Espínola	Diana Belén	Argentina
139	Etchegaray	Pablo Nicolas	Argentina
140	Faggiani	Andrea	Argentina
141	Failla	Mauricio	Argentina
142	Falip	Fabio	Argentina
143	Falla	Gastón	Uruguay
144	Farfán	Elías Gabriel	Argentina
145	Farías	Flavia	Argentina
146	Faydella	Guillermo	Argentina
147	Fernández	Pablo G.	Uruguay
148	Fernandez Ocampo	Jeremías Emanuel	Argentina
149	Ferrero	Gustavo	Uruguay
150	Ferrero	Bruno	Uruguay
151	Firpo	Jesica Araceli	Argentina
152	Flores	Analía Andrea	Argentina
153	Flores Galarza	Luciana	Argentina
154	Forte	Pablo	Argentina
155	Francia	Matías	Argentina
156	Freitas Guimarães	Letícia	Brasil
157	Galea	José Maria	Argentina
158	Garay	Manuela	Uruguay
159	Garcia	Laura Mariela	Argentina
160	García	Danilo Antonio	Argentina
161	García	Elena	Argentina
162	Garcia Arena	Pablo	Argentina
163	Garcimuño	Mayra	Argentina
164	Garraza	Marcos	Argentina
165	Gatti Rodrigues	Juliana	Brasil
166	Gavilan	Valeria	Argentina
167	Gazzaniga	Enzo	Argentina
168	Gazzaniga	Luisella	Argentina
169	Gazzaniga	Fabrizio Ciro	Argentina
170	Geremia	Marcelo	Argentina

171	Ghiorzo	Joaquín	Argentina
172	Gigy Gregoret	Pablo	Argentina
173	Gil	Jose German	Uruguay
174	Gil	Carlos	Argentina
175	Gilabert	Gonzalo	Argentina
176	Giménez	José Alberto	Paraguay
177	Giorda	Gustavo	Argentina
178	Giqueaux	Viviana	Argentina
179	Gomez	Valentina	Argentina
180	Gonzalez	María Florencia	Argentina
181	González Abraham	María Eugenia	Uruguay
182	González De Toro	Nora	Uruguay
183	González Rozada	Virginia	Argentina
184	González Táboas	Francisco	Argentina
185	Gorosábel	Antonella	Argentina
186	Grande	Marcelo	Uruguay
187	Grassi	Emanuel	Argentina
188	Greco	Carlos Alejandro	Argentina
189	Groisman	Gaston	Argentina
190	Grünfeld	Ariela	Argentina
191	Gualde	María Soledad	Argentina
192	Guerra	Mauro	Uruguay
193	Guerra	Ivana Carolina	Argentina
194	Gutiérrez	Andrea del Valle	Argentina
195	Guzmán	Andres	Argentina
196	Guzman Ortega	Aided	Bolivia
197	Habrantes	Virginia	Argentina
198	Hanaini	Laura	Argentina
199	Hernandez	Miguel Francisco	Argentina
200	Herrera	Maria isabel	Argentina
201	Herrera	Venecia Nuria	Argentina
202	Herrera	Maria Isabel	Argentina
203	Horjales	Sofia	Uruguay
204	Hoyos Arnedo	Andrea Raquel	Argentina
205	Indelicato	Evangelina	Argentina
206	Irizar	Juan	Argentina
207	Isola	Pablo Leopoldo	Argentina
208	Katzenstein Berro	Rafael	Uruguay
209	Klekailo	Graciela	Argentina
210	Konverski	Pablo Nicolás	Argentina
211	Kuzminski	Nicolás Ernesto	Argentina
212	Labiano	Dora	Argentina
213	Lagarejo	Juan Pablo	Argentina
214	Ledda	Silvia	Argentina
215	Ledesma	Matilde	Uruguay
216	Leithner	Ricardo	Argentina
217	Lera		Argentina
218	Lera		Argentina
219			
220		Silvana	Argentina
221	LOIS		Argentina
222			Argentina
223			Argentina
224			Argentina
220			Rolivio
220			Argonting
221			Argonting
220	Luiia	Juan Fabio	луенша

229	Luna	Juan Gabriel	Argentina
230	Machado Corral	Soledad	Uruguay
231	Maestri	Luis	Argentina
232	Mansilla	Ana Paula	Argentina
233	Mantica	Flavio	Argentina
234	Maraggi	Pilar	Argentina
235	Martelli	Ana	Argentina
236	Martín	Lucía Belén	Argentina
237	Martina	Daniela Verónica	Argentina
238	Martinengo	María Laura	Argentina
230	Martinez	Fernando	
240	Martinez	Carolina soledad	Argentina
240	Martinez		Argentina
241	Martinez	Aivaio Moría Laura	Argonting
242	Martinez		Argentina
243			Uruguay
244	Martinez Gutierrez	Magie Angel	Oruguay
245	Martins	Mario Andres	Argentina
246	Masi	Victor	Paraguay
247	Mattana	Ricardo Raúl	Argentina
248	Matteri	Martina	Argentina
249	Mazini	Marcos	Uruguay
250	Mazzei Soto	Patricia	Uruguay
251	Medel	Ricardo	Argentina
252	Melo-González	Valentina	Uruguay
253	Mendez	Martin	Argentina
254	Mendez	Carlos Fernando	Argentina
255	Mendez	Pablo	Argentina
256	Méndez	Cecilia	Uruguay
257	Méndez	Brenda	Uruguay
258	Mendoza	Juan Carlos	Argentina
259	Mendoza	Fabiana Cintia	Argentina
260	Mentesana	Marcelo	Argentina
261	Mentesana	Carolina	Argentina
262	Michelini	Marcos	Uruquay
263	Migliavacca	Graciela	Argentina
264	Miguenz	Viviana Denise	Argentina
265	Milicich	Ezequiel	Argentina
266	Mindlin	Gabriel	Argentina
267	Minghetti	Carla Avelen	Argentina
268	Miraglia	María Isabel	Argentina
269	Miró	Micaela	Argentina
270	Mirolo	Cecilia	Argentina
271	Moff	Sabrina	Argentina
277	Molfino	Dedro	Argenting
212	Molina		Argenting
213	Νόροοο	Juan Ingrid Datriaia	Argonting
214	Monior		Argonting
2/5		Franco Mallas	Argentina
2/0		Alejandro	Argentina
2//	IVIONTENEGRO	IVIIguel Angel	Bolivia
2/8	Monteoliva	Mariela	Argentina
2/9	Montes	Carolina	Argentina
280	Montiel	Sara	Paraguay
281	Monzón	Nicolás Oscar	Argentina
282	Morel	Emiliano	Argentina
283	Moreno	Lautaro Sebastian	Argentina
284	Moris	Edmundo	Uruguay
285	Moscoso Pantoja	Patricio Marcelo	Bolivia
286	Mrozek	Graciana	Argentina

287	Mrozek	Paula	Argentina
288	Mrozek	Graciana	Argentina
289	Mugnolo	Angela	Argentina
290	Muraca	Ricardo	Argentina
291	Mussato	Luis	Argentina
292	Navío	German	Argentina
293	Nazabal	Olivia	Argentina
294	Nesich	Cynthia	Argentina
295	Noni	Mariana	Argentina
296	Noro	Aníbal	Argentina
297	Nullo	Sebastian	Argentina
298	Olivera	Noelia	Uruguay
299	Olmos	Silvia Cristina	Argentina
300	Ontivero	Roberto Emanuel	Argentina
301	Orlando	Luis	Uruguay
302	Ottero	Yohama	Argentina
303	Otto	Otto Heringer	Brasil
304	Pacheco	Luis E.	Argentina
305	Paiz	Daniel Alejandro	Argentina
306	Pantaleone	Abril	Argentina
307	Pastarini	Silvana Paola	Argentina
308	Pasutti	Luciano	Argentina
309	Paz	Rubén Orlando	Argentina
310	Paz	María Clara	Argentina
311	Peloche	Jorge	Uruguay
312	Peña Caballero	Ruben Darío	Uruguay
313	Peralta Núñez	Eduardo	Bolivia
314	Pereira	Daniel	Uruguay
315	Pereyra	Paula	Argentina
316	Pereyra	Bárbara	Argentina
317	Pereyra	Natalia Patricia	Argentina
318	Pérez Fabbio	Diego	Argentina
319	Pérez Jimeno	Guillermo	Argentina
320	Perrone	Franco	Argentina
321	Peveroni	Adriana	Uruguay
322	Pi	Sofía	Uruguay
323	Pini	Hermenegildo	Argentina
324	Pinto	Priscila	Argentina
325	Polla	Daniela	Argentina
326	Polo	Tamara	Argentina
327	Ponce	Alexis	Argentina
328	Pucci	Elena	Uruguay
329	Pucheta	Ricardo	Argentina
330	Pucheta Wanderflit	Noelia	Argentina
331	Quintans Cabrera	Sandra Isabel	Uruguay
332	Quintero	Lucas	Argentina
333	Quipildor	Rodolfo Nelson	Argentina
334	Quiroga	Paula	Argentina
335	Quiroga	Maria Fernanda	Argentina
336	Racedo	Martin	Argentina
337	Raggio Galmés	Julián	Uruguay
338	Ramos	Carolina Samanta	Argentina
339	Re	Mariano	Argentina
340	Rebruk	Eduardo	Paraguay
341	Reinaldi	María Alejandra	Argentina
342	Revello Mouriz	Natalia	Uruguay
343	Riccardi	Analia	Argentina
344	Riffel	Fernanda	Argentina

345	Rios Benitez	Patricia	Argentina
346	Roca	Donna	Argentina
347	Roca	Maria de las Victorias	Uruguay
348	Roda	Luis	Argentina
349	Rodrigo	Leandro	Argentina
350	Rodriguez	Fabiola	Argentina
351	Rodríguez	Teresita	Argentina
352	Rodríguez	Graciela Betina Viviana	Argentina
353	Rodriguez Carra	Gabriel	Argentina
354	Rodriguez Duch	Martin	Argentina
355	Rodríguez Martínez	Federico	Uruguay
356	Rodriguez Persico	Juan	Argentina
357	Rodriguez Pimienta	Lara	Uruguay
358	Rogado	Graciela	Argentina
359	Rolandi	Carmen	Argentina
360	Romera	Paula	Argentina
361	Romero	Edgar	Paraguay
362	Rosati	Facundo	Argentina
363	Rovera	Alcides	Argentina
364	Rovera	Alcides Eduardo	Argentina
365	Rudolf Piermattei	German	Argentina
366	Ruiz	Alicia Noemi	Argentina
367	Ruvtinchsc	Micaela	Argentina
368	Saavedra	Yara Belkis	Argentina
369	Sacks	Lorenza Maria	Argentina
370	Saldanha Wagener	Thuani Luísa	Brasil
371	Salvav	Natalia Lorena	Argentina
372	Sanchez	Patricia	Argentina
373	Sánchez	Maite	Uruguav
374	Sánchez	Javier Emiliano	Argentina
374 375	Sánchez Santillan	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel	Argentina Argentina
374 375 376	Sánchez Santillan Santos	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos	Argentina Argentina Brasil
374 375 376 377	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan	Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina
374 375 376 377 378	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón	Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Argentina
374 375 376 377 378 379	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel	Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Argentina Uruguay
374 375 376 377 378 379 380	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Aleiandro	Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Argentina Uruguay Argentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Aleiandra Giselle	Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Argentina Uruguay Argentina Argentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel	Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Argentina Uruguay Argentina Argentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel	Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Argentina Uruguay Argentina Argentina Argentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo	Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Argentina Uruguay Argentina Argentina Argentina Brasil
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Serra	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario	Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Argentina Uruguay Argentina Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Serra Siberio	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula	Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Argentina Uruguay Argentina Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Uruguay
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Serra Siberio Sifuentes	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Marcela Roxana	Argentina Argentina Argentina Argentina Uruguay Argentina Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Uruguay Argentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387 388	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Serra Siberio Sifuentes Silva	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Marcela Roxana Celeste	Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Argentina Uruguay Argentina Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Uruguay Argentina Uruguay
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387 388 389	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Serra Siberio Sifuentes Silva Silva	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Marcela Roxana Celeste María Regina	Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Argentina Uruguay Argentina Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Uruguay Argentina Uruguay Argentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 384 385 386 387 388 389 390	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Sérgio de Amorim Siberio Siberio Siberio Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Marcela Roxana Celeste María Regina Sofia	Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Argentina Uruguay Argentina Argentina Argentina Brasil Argentina Uruguay Argentina Uruguay Argentina Argentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387 388 389 390 391	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Sérgio de Amorim Sérgio de Amorim Siberio Sifuentes Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Solsona	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Marcela Roxana Celeste María Regina Sofia Walter	ArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387 388 389 390 391 392	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Sérgio de Amorim Sérgio de Amorim Siberio Sifuentes Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Solsona Sonmaro	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Marcela Roxana Celeste María Regina Sofia Walter Andrés David	ArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387 388 389 390 391 392 393	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Sérra Siberio Sifuentes Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Solsona Solsona Sommaro Soria	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Marcela Roxana Celeste María Regina Sofia Walter Andrés David Gabriela	ArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387 388 389 390 391 392 393	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Sérra Siberio Sifuentes Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Solsona Sommaro Soria Soria	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Marcela Roxana Celeste María Regina Sofia Walter Andrés David Gabriela Carlina	ArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387 388 387 388 389 390 391 392 393 394 395	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Sérgio de Amorim Sérgio de Amorim Siberio Siberio Siberio Siberio Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Solsona Sonmaro Soria Soria Soria Lui Sorroche	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Mario Paula Marcela Roxana Celeste María Regina Sofia Walter Andrés David Gabriela Carlina Silvina Andrea	ArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387 388 389 390 391 392 393 394 395 396	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Sérgio de Amorim Sérgio de Amorim Silva Siberio Siberio Siberio Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Soria Sona Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Marcela Roxana Celeste María Regina Sofia Walter Andrés David Gabriela Carlina Silvina Andrea Rosa Gladis	ArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387 388 389 390 391 392 393 394 395 396 397	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Sérgio de Amorim Sérgio de Amorim Siberio Siberio Siberio Siberio Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Solsona Sona Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Marcela Roxana Celeste María Regina Sofia Walter Andrés David Gabriela Carlina Silvina Andrea Rosa Gladis Juan Carlos	ArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387 388 389 390 391 392 393 394 395 396 397 398	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Serra Siberio Sifuentes Sifuentes Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Soria Sona Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Sosa Sosa Sosa	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Marcela Roxana Celeste María Regina Sofia Walter Andrés David Gabriela Carlina Silvina Andrea Rosa Gladis Juan Carlos Raul	ArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387 388 389 390 391 392 393 391 392 393 394 395 396 397 398 399	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Serra Siberio Sifuentes Siberio Sifuentes Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Soria Sona Sosna Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Sosa Sosa Sosa Sosa Sosa Sosa Sosa Sos	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Marcela Roxana Celeste María Regina Sofia Walter Andrés David Gabriela Carlina Silvina Andrea Rosa Gladis Juan Carlos Raul Maximiliano	ArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387 388 389 390 391 392 393 391 392 393 394 395 396 397 398 399 400	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Serra Siberio Sifuentes Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Solsona Solsona Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Sosa Sosa Sosa Sosa Sosa Sosa Sosa Sos	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Marcela Roxana Celeste María Regina Sofia Walter Andrés David Gabriela Carlina Silvina Andrea Rosa Gladis Juan Carlos Raul Maximiliano Sonia Dominique	ArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentina
374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387 388 389 390 391 392 393 391 392 393 394 395 396 397 398 399 400 401	Sánchez Santillan Santos Sanz Sanz Satelier Scapusio Schaaf Schwartz Schwerdt Scigliano Sérgio de Amorim Sérgio de Amorim Sérgio de Amorim Silva Siberio Siberio Siberio Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Silva Solsona Solsona Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Soria Sosa Sosa Sosa Sosa Sosa Sosa Sosa Sos	Javier Emiliano Juan Gabriel Sidnei Sampaio dos Santos Juan Diego Gastón Lisel Alejandro Alejandra Giselle Daniel Roberto Abel Paulo Mario Paula Marcela Roxana Celeste María Regina Sofia Walter Andrés David Gabriela Carlina Silvina Andrea Rosa Gladis Juan Carlos Raul Maximiliano Sonia Dominique Thomas	ArgentinaArgentinaBrasilArgentinaArgentinaUruguayArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentinaUruguayArgentina

403	Steinkamp	Florencia	Argentina
404	Sturzenegger	Eugenia	Argentina
405	Tabares	Ramón	Argentina
406	Taboada	César Augusto	Argentina
407	Tadey	Luciana	Argentina
408	Tassino	Bettina	Uruguay
409	Terendi	Miriam Roxana	Argentina
410	Thompson	Carlos Federico	Argentina
411	Tinte	Ana Laura	Argentina
412	Tissera	Daniel	Argentina
413	Tomassini	Aldo	Uruguay
414	Тора	Pablo	Argentina
415	Torres Etchegorry	Milagros	Argentina
416	Torres Morel	Cristian David	Paraguay
417	Tosi-Germán	Rafael A.	Uruguay
418	Trivero	Eduardo	Argentina
419	Turlione	Luciana	Argentina
420	Uhart	Manuel Edmundo	Argentina
421	Vacchino	Flavia Inés	Argentina
422	Valdez	Silvia Patricia	Argentina
423	Vanotti	Ralph	Argentina
424	Vargas	Santiago Luis	Argentina
425	Vega Gentile	Graciela	Argentina
426	Velasco	Vanina	Argentina
427	Vera	Ezequiel Ignacio	Argentina
428	Vercellone	Adolfo	Argentina
429	Verdini	Adriana	Argentina
430	Verón	Sebastián Gabriel	Argentina
431	Vértiz	Gabriela	Argentina
432	Vigo	Santiago	Uruguay
433	Villa	Gustavo	Uruguay
434	Villarroel	Mauro Tadeo	Argentina
435	Villaverde	Cecilia	Argentina
436	Vitores	Marcelo	Argentina
437	Vivian	Feres Jose	Brasil
438	Winter	Marina	Argentina
439	Wlodek	Sabina	Uruguay
440	Yaben	Camila	Uruguay
441	Zorrilla	Gonzalo	Uruguay
442	Zorrilla de San Martín	Gonzalo	Uruguay
443		Reserva Natural Urbana Huayra	Argentina

1.6 Supplemental References

- 1. Fraga, R.M. (1980). The breeding of rufous horneros (Furnarius rufus). Condor *82*, 58–68.
- 2. Bates, D., Mächler, M., Bolker, B., and Walker, S. (2015). Fitting Linear Mixed-Effects Models Using {Ime4}. Journal of Statistical Software 67, 1–48.
- 3. Gelman, A., and Su, Y.-S. (2015). Data Analysis Using Regression and Multilevel/Hierarchical Models {arm}. R package.
- 4. Gelman, Andrew., and Hill, J. (2007). Data analysis using regression and multilevel/hierarchical models (Cambridge University Press).

- 5. Korner-Nievergelt, F., Roth, T., Von Felten, S., Guélat, J., Almasi, B., and Korner-Nievergelt, P. (2015). Bayesian data analysis in ecology using linear models with R, BUGS, and Stan (Academic Press).
- 6. Karger, D.N., Conrad, O., Böhner, J., Kawohl, T., Kreft, H., Soria-Auza, R.W., Zimmermann, N.E., Linder, H.P., and Kessler, M. (2017). Climatologies at high resolution for the earth's land surface areas. Scientific data *4*, 1–20.
- 7. R Core Team (2015). R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing (R Foundation for Statistical Computing).
- 8. Pinheiro, J., and Bates, D. (2006). Mixed-effects models in S and S-PLUS (Springer Science & Business Media).
- 9. Bardos, D.C., Guillera-Arroita, G., and Wintle, B.A. (2015). Valid auto-models for spatially autocorrelated occupancy and abundance data. Methods in Ecology and Evolution *6*, 1137–1149.
- 10. Crase, B., Liedloff, A.C., and Wintle, B.A. (2012). A new method for dealing with residual spatial autocorrelation in species distribution models. Ecography *35*, 879–888.
- 11. Bivand, R.S., Pebesma, E., and Gómez-Rubio, V. (2013). Applied Spatial Data Analysis with R (Springer New York).
- 12. Bivand, R.S., and Wong, D.W.S. (2018). Comparing implementations of global and local indicators of spatial association. TEST 27, 716–748.
- 13. Turner, R. (2021). deldir: Delaunay Triangulation and Dirichlet (Voronoi) Tessellation.
- 14. Nakagawa, S., and Schielzeth, H. (2010). Repeatability for Gaussian and non-Gaussian data: a practical guide for biologists. Biological Reviews *85*, 935–956.
- 15. Stoffel, M.A., Nakagawa, S., and Schielzeth, H. (2017). rptR: repeatability estimation and variance decomposition by generalized linear mixed-effects models. Methods in Ecology and Evolution.
- 16. Lukyanenko, R., Parsons, J., and Wiersma, Y.F. (2016). Emerging problems of data quality in citizen science. Conservation Biology *30*, 447–449.
- Aceves-Bueno, E., Adeleye, A.S., Feraud, M., Huang, Y., Tao, M., Yang, Y., and Anderson, S.E. (2017). The Accuracy of Citizen Science Data: A Quantitative Review. The Bulletin of the Ecological Society of America 98, 278–290.
- Canfield Jr, D.E., Brown, C.D., Bachmann, R.W., and Hoyer, M.V. (2002). Volunteer lake monitoring: testing the reliability of data collected by the Florida LAKEWATCH program. Lake and Reservoir Management 18, 1–9.
- Hoyer, M.V., Wellendorf, N., Frydenborg, R., Bartlett, D., and Canfield Jr, D.E. (2012). A comparison between professionally (Florida Department of Environmental Protection) and volunteer (Florida LAKEWATCH) collected trophic state chemistry data in Florida. Lake and Reservoir Management 28, 277–281.
- 20. Massoni, V., Reboreda, J.C., López, G.C., and Aldatz, M.F. (2012). High Coordination and Equitable Parental Effort in the Rufous Hornero. The Condor *114*, 564–570.