

## A COMPARISON OF THE THOUGHTS OF HADITH HERMENEUTICS FIGURES FATIMAH MERNESSI AND SYUHUDI ISMA'IL

**Budi Ichwayudi & Mukhammad Alfani**

UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya

budi.ichwayudi@gmail.com; alfania853@gmail.com

### Abstract

*This article discusses the comparison of Hadith Hermeneutics thought between two prominent figures, namely Fatimah Mernessi and Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il. Both have similarities in understanding Hadith in a socio-historical manner, but have differences in the focus of study and methods of analysis. Hadith Hermeneutics is a new breakthrough in finding answers to new problems that arise in modern times. The journal Islamika, a journal of Islamic and educational science, is a place to discuss the comparative thinking of the two figures. The method used is the comparative method to find out the similarities and differences between the thoughts of Fatimah Mernessi and Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il. This article also reviews the biography and thoughts of Fatimah Mernessi and her academic career. Fatimah Mernessi, a well-known writer whose works have been translated into various languages, has a deep interest in misogynistic hadiths. She strongly emphasizes the need for intense research into the Prophetic Hadiths, and her work deals with sex and the role of women, women and politics, women's leadership, and women/angels and paradise. Mernessi opposes the patriarchal system that gives men dominance in various aspects of life, with women often being neglected. On the other hand, Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il, an intellectual in Indonesia, has contributed greatly to the development of hadith science. He taught the evolutive and dynamic concept of sunnah and divided hadith based on their context. He also identified asbab al-wurud in understanding hadith. From this comparison, it can be concluded that both figures made important contributions in eliminating stereotypes against women.*

**Keywords :** *Comparison ; Hermeneutics ; Hadith ; Fatimah Mernessi ; Syuhudi Isma'il*

## INTRODUCTION

In addition to the Qur'an, the Hadith also has the authority to determine the actions of Muslims in carrying out their lives. This growing security has led to new problems whose legal provisions are not explicitly explained in the Qur'an or Hadith. So that new efforts have emerged to interpret and understand the Qur'an and Hadith not only textually. The existence of new methods in interpreting the Qur'an aims to find answers to new problems. As we know, Islam has the basic principle of *Salih li kulli Zaman wa al-Makan*. Therefore, every new problem that occurs in this era, Islam is able to answer it even though it is not explicitly explained in religious texts.

The Qur'an as the "*language of heaven*" alone, cannot just be understood textually, as well as the Hadith of the Prophet which was born from social events at that time. Of course there is an attachment to space and time in it. Therefore, it is necessary to dynamize and negotiate the Hadith without losing the spiritual values contained therein. It cannot be denied that the authenticity of the Hadith is different from that of the Qur'an, which is guaranteed. Both in terms of the certainty of the existence of the text, or the certainty of the authenticity of the narrators. Therefore, the Hadith is considered *Dzanni* in contrast to the Qur'an which is *Qath'i*. This lack of assurance of the authenticity of the Hadith has caused scholars to take great pains to neutralize the Hadith of the Prophet from false Hadiths. The study of the Hadith through *Matan*, *Sanad*, *Tahammul wa al-Ada'*, *Jarh wa al-Ta'dil*, the state of the narrators, and many other things (Hauqola, 2013).

Therefore, it is very necessary to make an effort to produce the right understanding of Islamic teachings derived from the Qur'an and hadith. This is especially true of the hadith, which was originally a loose and flexible oral tradition that became a standardized written tradition. Hadiths related to political, social, economic and cultural issues provide room for in-depth study. As with other texts, it cannot be presented perfectly what the Prophet wanted to convey.

So it is necessary to have a new breakthrough in addressing the rigidity and silence of the Hadith. In understanding the Hadith of the Prophet, it cannot only be a textual understanding. Socio-historical or contextual understanding is needed to find answers to new problems that have never occurred during the Prophet's time. Of course this does not change and eliminate the substance of the spiritual values contained therein.

One of the figures of Hadith Hermeneutics that is interesting to study is the thought of Fatimah Mernessi. Fatimah Mernessi often studies misogynistic hadiths. For the author, she is a true feminist who wants to fight for the justice of women who are often put on the back burner. In addition to Fatimah Meressi, Hadith Hermeneutics figures from Indonesia are also worth studying, namely Syhudi Isma'il, seeing the many contributions he has made to the science of Hadith. The thoughts of the two figures are then compared to find out the style and characteristics in Hadith Hermeneutics.

## **METHODS**

In this journal about the hermeneutical thought of hadith Fatimah Mernessi and Syuhudi Ismail, we use the comparative method. This comparative method has the meaning of research with the intention of knowing the differences and similarities between two or more groups. The comparative method can also be used to compare one object, between different objects and their causes and effects. We try to find out the similarities and differences between Fatimah Mernessi and Syuhudi Ismail's hadith hermeneutics. By making comparison as our method to conduct research, we intend to draw a conclusion by comparing the hermeneutical thoughts of Fatimah Mernessi and Syuhudi Ismail. While comparison according to KBBI is a comparison. According to Winaro Surakhmad, comparison is a descriptive investigation that seeks to find solutions through analysis of causal relationships, and compares one factor with another (Kuswati & Zulaikha, 2020).

## RESULTS

### Similarities and Differences between Fatimah Mernessi's Hadith Hermeneutical Thought and Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il's

**Table. 1 Results of Similarities and Differences in the Thought of the Two Figures**

Similarities	Differences
Understanding Hadith is not only textual. It also looks at the socio-historical context of the Hadith.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Fatimah Mernessi focuses more on Hadiths that are misogynistic or discriminate against women.</li> <li>• Syuhudi Isma'il examines all Hadiths, which according to him need a deeper study in order to implement the values contained therein.</li> </ul>
It is necessary to criticize the sanad and Matan to determine the authenticity of the Hadith.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Fatimah Mernessi emphasized the continuity and quality of the transmitters at the first level, namely the companions. Because she added provisions about the proximity of the first narrator to the Prophet.</li> <li>• Syuhudi Isma'il, does not require the proximity of the first level of narrators to the Prophet.</li> </ul>
<p>Having steps in understanding Hadith steps include:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Conducting Text Analysis</li> <li>b. Historical Emergence of Hadith</li> <li>c. Contextualizing the Hadith</li> </ol>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The benchmarks for the acceptance of Hadith based on Fatimah Mernessi's perspective include: The structure of the statement shows the characteristics of the prophetic word, does not contradict the Qur'anic instructions, does not contradict the Prophet's hadith and sirah, and does not contradict common sense, senses, and historical facts. In addition, the method used is tarjih by favoring the stronger hadith.</li> <li>• Syuhudi Ismail in accepting a Hadith conducts several analyses including: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. analyzing the text by processing the hadith text by examining the form of the matan, the relationship between texts (hadith and other arguments), and linguistic analysis.</li> <li>b. analyzing the historical context of the hadith by looking for substantive indicators. After that, adjustments are made to the indicators that exist in the present. So that the substance of the hadith is always relevant even in different times and spaces.</li> </ol> </li> </ul>

In the table above, it can be concluded that in understanding hadith in depth, the two figures Fatimah Mernessi and Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il represent two unique hermeneutical approaches. Although both rely on common principles, the differences in focus and criteria for acceptance of hadith make their approaches distinctive. Fatimah Mernessi, with great care, focuses her analysis on traditions that she considers misogynistic or discriminatory against women. Her approach involves a critical examination of both the sanad and the matan, but more prominently she emphasizes the quality of the first level narrators, the companions of the Prophet. According to Mernessi, the proximity of the first transmitter to the Prophet is a key factor in assessing the authenticity of a hadith.

On the other hand, Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il takes a more inclusive approach. For him, all traditions need to be carefully examined so that the values contained in them can be implemented appropriately. Syuhudi Isma'il does not place any special conditions on the proximity of the narrator to the Prophet, seeing that all traditions have the potential to provide valuable wisdom and guidance.

Both thinkers agree that the understanding of hadith cannot be limited to the textual dimension. They embrace a holistic approach that involves contextualizing the history and society of the time in question. However, in assessing the authenticity of the hadith, the criteria they apply provide different colors.

Mernessi sets a strict benchmark, requiring that a hadith not only conforms to the Qur'anic instructions but also does not contradict common sense and historical facts. Meanwhile, Syuhudi Isma'il emphasizes more on the analysis of the text and the historical context of the hadith, with the aim of maintaining the relevance of its substance despite the changes in time and space. Thus, in framing a hermeneutical understanding of hadith, the difference in focus and acceptance criteria between Fatimah Mernessi and Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il creates two unique approaches and makes a valuable contribution to the interpretation of hadith in the contemporary context.

## **The Impact Of The Role Of The Two Figures Fatimah Mernessi and Syuhudi Isma'il In Today's Education**

The impact of the roles of both Fatimah Mernessi and Syuhudi Isma'il is significant in today's educational context. Fatimah Mernessi, with her focus on intense research into Prophetic Hadiths that mention women, has contributed to the fight for gender equality and criticized Hadiths that discriminate against women. Her impact has been felt in raising awareness of the importance of education for women as a strategic measure to improve their status. Mernessi's thinking also encourages understanding religion in all its aspects in order to identify how religion itself can be used to legitimize acts of violence, which can be the basis for inclusive and progressive religious education.

On the other hand, Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il's contribution to the development of hadith science, by teaching the evolutive and dynamic concept of sunnah and dividing hadith based on their context, has also had a significant impact. Isma'il's thinking encourages a contextual approach in the reading of hadith, which can serve as a foundation for religious education that is more relevant to social and historical realities. Moreover, the identification of *asbab al-wurud* in understanding hadith can also provide a deeper understanding of the historical and social context in which the hadith was revealed, which can be a valuable learning material in religious education.

Thus, the role of these two figures has had a positive impact on the development of religious education that is inclusive, progressive, and relevant to the social and historical context of today. Their thoughts can be a source of inspiration and a foundation for the development of a more holistic religious education curriculum.

The thoughts of both Fatimah Mernessi and Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il have a significant impact on students who study hadith. From Mernessi's thoughts, students will learn to examine traditions that offend and discriminate against women and understand the importance of gender equality in Islamic teachings. Mernessi also emphasizes the need for intensive research into the Prophetic traditions, which will encourage students to develop critical analysis skills of religious sources. From Isma'il's perspective, students will be encouraged to understand the evolutive and dynamic concept of sunnah and learn to categorize hadith based on their context. This will help students to develop a more holistic understanding of the hadith as well as encourage them to understand the hadith in its relevant socio-historical context. Thus, the thoughts of these two figures will have a positive impact

on students in studying hadith by encouraging them to develop an understanding that is more inclusive, progressive and relevant to the social and historical context of today.

## DISCUSSION

### Biography and Thought of Fatimah Mernissi

Quoted from one of Fatima Mernissi's books entitled *Islam and Democration* Fatima Mernissi, or often called Mernissi, is a professor of sociology at the University of Muhammad V Rabat. The woman who was born in the city of Fez, Northern Morocco, experienced a quite heartbreaking childhood. She grew up in the middle of a frenzied battle between Christian Spain and France. Her first education, she got from her grandmother who was so diligent in teaching her about Islamic knowledge. Such as the story of the Prophet Muhammad SAW. along with the circumstances of the previous women (Fahrudin & Ansari, 2019).

As a scholar, Mernissi is very active in writing, especially on women's issues, and is currently involved in a research project at the Moroccan Institut Universitaire de Recherche Scientifique. Mernissi comes from a middle-class family and her childhood was filled with happiness, living with ten cousins, both male and female, in a large house.

Her early education began with attending a Koranic school, a traditional education system similar to schools in medieval times. Koranic schools were the most economical option and were expected by many parents to provide the best education for their children. One of the less pleasant experiences for Mernissi during her Quranic school days was that she did not have a melodious voice to recite Quranic verses, so she was never given the opportunity to perform in the front row in the commemoration of historical days in Islam (Siti Zubaidah, 2018).

Mernissi's next education was junior high school at the National School and also senior high school at a Special School for Women, an institution supported by the French Government. In her teenage years, she was active in the resistance movement against French colonialism with the aim of gaining national independence. Together with other teenagers, both boys and girls, she took to the streets of the city and sang the struggle song "*Al-Hurriyat Jihaduna Hatta Narba*" (We will fight for freedom until we get it).

After completing her secondary education, Mernissi continued her studies at the Muhammad V University of Rabat, where she obtained a degree in Sociology and Politics. Later, she moved to Paris and worked as a journalist for a while. Subsequently, she continued her undergraduate education in the United States, and in 1973, she earned a Ph.D. in Sociology from Brandeis University with a dissertation entitled "*Sexe Ideologie et Islam*", which was later translated into Arabic with the title "*Al-Jins Kabandasat Ijtima 'iyat*" (Siti Zubaidah, 2018).

Mernissi's academic career began in 1974, when she was confirmed as Professor of Sociology at Muhammad V Rabath University, and at the same time also taught at the university until 1980. Furthermore, she also had a research contract with Maroco's Institute Universitaire de Recherche Scientifique as a Middle Eastern feminist sociologist. Mernissi is actively involved in various forms of international seminars and conferences (Khasanah, 2018).

In the social field, Mernissi is active in movements or organizations that fight for women's rights such as After returning to Morocco, Mernissi began working at the Sociology Department of Muhammad V University in Rabat. She was a regular participant in international conferences and seminars. In addition, she was also a Visiting Professor at the University of California at Berkeley and Harvard University. As an Arab Muslim feminist, her influence extends beyond her intellectual world and she is recognized both at home and abroad, especially in France.

Her works have been translated into many languages, including English, German, Dutch and Japanese. Mernissi often traveled to Islamic countries such as Turkey, Kuwait, Egypt, and others to give lectures. From the experience of her visits, she realized that many countries use Islam as a tool for censorship, which significantly affects the intellectual climate in various places. Things that can be discussed safely in Morocco or Turkey may not be expressed elsewhere. In terms of Fiqh (Islamic law), Mernissi is a Sunni Muslim who follows the Maliki school, which corresponds to the majority of Muslims in Morocco (Siti Zubaidah, 2018b).

In the early stages of her thinking, the main influence on Fatima Mernissi came from her grandmother, Yasmina. She describes her grandmother as a very critical person with a talent for poetry. Mernissi often listened to these stories about Medina and the Prophet from her grandmother. She could not ignore the fact that her grandmother recounted the beauty



of Medina and the respect the Apostle had for equality in those days. This is what inspired Mernissi to develop an obsession with the Islamic Medina.

Furthermore, Mernissi explains that her grandmother was different from most Moroccan women of the time who were less concerned with the mistreatment experienced by women in everyday life. For her, her grandmother was the first person who opened Mernissi's eyes to the injustices experienced by women. The teachings she received from her grandmother became the main foundation that led her to pursue research and special attention to women's issues (Nuroniyah, 2019).

Mernissi's interest in misogynistic hadiths began in childhood. One day, her teacher read to her a hadith narrated by Imam Muslim in the Chapter on the Kadar that Mushalli should cover, index number 510, which reads:

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو بَكْرِ بْنُ أَبِي شَيْبَةَ. حَدَّثَنَا إِسْمَاعِيلُ بْنُ عَلِيَةَ. ح قَالَ وَحَدَّثَنِي زُهَيْرُ بْنُ حَرْبٍ. حَدَّثَنَا إِسْمَاعِيلُ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ يُونُسَ، عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ هِلَالٍ، عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ الصَّامِتِ، عَنْ أَبِي دَرٍّ؛ قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ إِذَا قَامَ أَحَدُكُمْ يُصَلِّي، فَإِنَّهُ يَسْتَوِّهُ إِذَا كَانَ بَيْنَ يَدَيْهِ مِثْلُ آخِرَةِ الرَّحْلِ. فَإِذَا لَمْ يَكُنْ بَيْنَ يَدَيْهِ مِثْلُ آخِرَةِ الرَّحْلِ، فَإِنَّهُ يَنْقَطِعُ صَلَاتُهُ الْحِمَارُ وَالْمَرْأَةُ وَالْكَلْبُ الْأَسْوَدُ". قُلْتُ: يَا أَبَا دَرٍّ! مَا بَأْسُ الْكَلْبِ الْأَسْوَدِ مِنَ الْكَلْبِ الْأَحْمَرِ مِنَ الْكَلْبِ الْأَصْفَرِ؟ قَالَ: يَا ابْنَ أَخِي! سَأَلْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ كَمَا سَأَلْتَنِي فَقَالَ الْكَلْبُ الْأَسْوَدُ شَيْطَانٌ

Textually, the Hadith seems to say that women are the cause of the invalidation of one's prayer. Hearing the Hadith, Mernissi felt cut to the heart, and thought, is it possible for a Prophet Muhammad who loves his people so much, to say that? Coupled with an experience about her question to a vegetable seller she subscribed to, "can a woman be the leader of the Muslims?", he (the vegetable seller) answered "*na'udzubillah min dzalilik*". Since then, Mernissi has wanted to study misogynistic traditions by tracing the historical-sociological context of a hadith (Muslim Ibn al-Hajjaj Abu al-Hasan al-Qusairy al-Naisabury, n.d.).

As for some of the works produced by Mernissi:

There are some of the works produced by Mernissi:

1. "Beyond the Veil: Male-Female Dynamics in Modern Muslim Society (Revised Edition)", 1987, published by Indiana University Press in English edition. This book reviews sex and the role of women.

2. "Women and Islam: An Historical and Theological Enquiry", translated into Indonesian by Yaziar Radianti, published by Pustaka Bandung in 1994. This book discusses women and politics.
3. "Islam and Democracy: Fear of Modern World", translated from French by Mary Jo Lakeland in 1992. This book discusses women and democracy.
4. "The Forgotten Queens of Islam", translated into Indonesian by Rahmani Astuti and Enna Hadi, published by Mizan - Bandung in 1994. This book discusses women's leadership.
5. The article "Women in Moslem Paradise", included in the book "Equal Before Allah", was translated into Indonesian by the Institute for the Study and Development of Women and Children (LSPPA) team at Yayasan Prakarsa Yogyakarta in 1995. This article discusses women/angel and paradise.
6. The article "Women in Muslim History: Traditional Perspectives and New Strategies", included in the book "Equal Before Allah" and translated into Indonesian by the LSPPA Team at Yayasan Prakarsa Yogyakarta in 1995. This article discusses women and politics.
7. The article "Can We Women Head A Muslim State?", which is also included in the book "Equal Before Allah" and translated into Indonesian by the LSPPA Team at Yayasan Prakarsa Yogyakarta in 1995. This article discusses women and politics.
8. The article "The Fundamentalist Obsession With Women: A Current Articulation of Class Conflict in Modern Muslim Societies", which is also included in the book "Equal Before Allah" and translated into Indonesian by the LSPPA Team at the Yogyakarta Initiative Foundation in 1995. And there are many others (Nuroniayah, 2019).

Fatimah Mernessi strongly emphasizes a very intensive research on the Prophetic Hadiths. Seeing that there were some people in the past who made false Hadiths only for their personal or group interests. Therefore, every Hadith needs to be re-examined in all its aspects. Both in terms of Asbab al Wurud, the condition of the narrators (*Jarh wa al-Ta'dil*), and the motives that influenced the narrators in narrating the Hadith. This includes Hadiths that seem to discriminate against women or are misogynistic. In addition, Fatimah Mernessi also emphasizes the continuity of the sanad and the quality of the narrators. However, Mernessi's attention is more focused on the first transmitter, namely the level of companions, who narrated the hadith directly from the Prophet. Therefore, she added the requirement of

the narrator's proximity to the Prophet. Therefore, when she examined two misogynistic traditions, namely the traditions about women's leadership and the invalidation of prayer, the transmitters she criticized were the first transmitters, namely Abu Bakrah and Abu Hurairah (Muniroh Muniroh, 2016).

In addition to criticizing the sanad, Fatimah Mernissi also criticized the matan of Hadith. The benchmarks for the acceptance of the Hadith matan based on Fatimah Mernissi's perspective are usually, the arrangement of the statements shows the characteristics of the prophetic word, does not contradict the instructions of the Qur'an, does not contradict the Prophet's hadith and sirah, and does not contradict common sense, senses, and historical facts. In addition, Mernissi uses the tarjih method by favoring the stronger hadith.

Here are some of Fatimah Mernissi's thoughts, Mernissi firmly opposes the patriarchal system that gives men dominance in various aspects of life, with women often neglected. Mernissi's views on resistance to this patriarchal system were influenced by her cultural experiences while studying in France. She realized that the feminist movement in the West had exposed the extent to which male dominance was still strong in Arab countries. Western influences in Mernissi's thinking were not simply accepted without consideration. Instead, she sought to pursue a deep understanding of religion, with a progressive approach, in order to understand its social dynamics and forces.

She underlined that it is important to understand religion in all its aspects in order to identify how religion itself can be used to legitimize acts of violence. Fatima believes that differences between men and women will always exist, but should exist within reasonable limits without compromising the inherent human rights of individuals, both socially and individually. For her, education is a force that can help overcome these gender differences. She believes that education for women is a strategic step towards improving their status. She also noted that education for women could help reduce the rate of early marriage.

Apart from being influenced by her learning experience in France, Fatima Mernissi was also inspired by the thoughts of Muhammad Al-Ghazali. The style of Muhammad Al-Ghazali's Hadith Hermeneutics is more philosophical-contextual, based on the argumentation of the dynamism of every aspect of life, thus giving birth to a contextual reading model. The object of Hadith criticism is more emphasized on the study of Hadiths that offend women, and it is limited to Misogynistic Hadiths (Sauda', 2015). such as the Hadith about women's leadership, the Hadith raises considerations in Mernissi's mind,

encouraging her to fight for gender equality between men and women. She linked the misogynistic hadith to the interpretation in surah al-Mukminun in the Quran which includes the story of the leadership of Queen Saba (Sutrisno & Salsabela, 2023).

In her work entitled "The Veil and the Male Elite," Mernissi describes women who are active and have high intellectual capacity so that they can play a role in public life. One example is Khadijah, the Prophet's first wife, who had a strong initiative both in the household and in public life. Khadijah not only became an advisor to the Prophet, but also managed to lead a successful trading business in both fields (Munfarida, 2016).

### **Biography and Thought of Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il**

In Indonesia, Muhammad Syuhudi Ismail is known as an intellectual who mastered various Islamic sciences. In addition, his thoughts and dedication to the development of Hadith in Indonesia are numerous and helpful. born on April 23, 1943 in Rowo Kangkung Lumajang, East Java, Syuhudi Ismail is the fourth son of a wealthy merchant who obeys religion H. Ismail Bin Misrin Bin Soemaharjo with Sufiyatun Binti M. Ja'far. His Madurese father married a Javanese woman (Ilyas & Bin Hj. Suliaman, 2017).

In the field of education, Syuhudi Ismail began his formal education at the age of 12 at the State People's School in the Sidorejo area. Then, he continued his education at the State Religious Teacher Education (PGA) in Malang city from 1955 to 1959. In 196, he continued his education in the Special City of Yogyakarta at the State Islamic Judge Education (PHIN). After that he continued his education for 4 years at the Faculty of Shari'ah IAIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta Makassar branch, which is currently known as IAIN Alauddin Makassar. Not finished there, Syuhudi Ismail is apparently an academic who always wants to develop his quality, in 1973 successfully completed his education at IAIN Alauddin Ujung Padang. Then he continued his postgraduate studies in 1978-1979 along with a study program at the Postgraduate Faculty of IAIN Syarif Hidayatullah, Jakarta (Nasrullah, Husna, & Waharjani, 2022).

In addition to formal schooling, he also studied non-formal education in various places such as the field of phalac science in Jakarta (1976), upgrading IAIN secretaries throughout Indonesia, and upgrading P4 Type A South Sulawesi in Ujung Padang (1979). After completing his education, he began his career at the High Religious Court in Ujung Padang from 1962 to 1976. Syuhudi Ismail also became a lecturer at the Islamic University

in Ujung Padang. In 1994-1995, he also served as director of IAIN and was confirmed as a professor of hadith and hadith science. In 1993, he was entrusted as the head of the team that compiled the Hadith I-IX curriculum for IAIN throughout Indonesia in Cimahi (Handayana, 2019).

Syuhudi Ismail was also active in various organizations, such as the Indonesian Muslim Student Union (SEMMI) under the auspices of the Indonesian Islamic Union Party. This experience made him entrusted as the head of youth in the South Sulawesi region in 1970 - 1973 and became the youngest DPRD member in South Sulawesi in 1973 - 1996 (Rifai, Syafik R, & Masruhan, 2023).

Regarding personal life, in 1965, when he was 22 years old. Syuhudi Isma'il married Nurhaedah Sanusi from this marriage, he was blessed with 4 children. In early 1972, his wife passed away and Syuhudi Ismail remarried with his wife's younger sister named Habibah Sanusi. From this second marriage, he was blessed with 2 children. Syuhudi Ismail passed away on Sunday, November 19, 1995, at Cipto Mangonkusumo Hospital, Jakarta.

During his lifetime, Syuhudi Ismail is estimated to have produced 164 titles of scientific works both related to hadith and other scientific studies. His works that have become the standard of hadith and hadith science courses in all faculties of religion in Indonesia include: Introduction to Hadith Science (1987), Methods of Hadith Sanad Validity: A Critical Analysis and Review with a Historical Approach (1988), Practical Ways of Finding Hadith (1991), The Sunnah According to Its Defenders and Efforts to Preserve the Sunnah by Its Defenders (1991), The Sunnah According to Its Deniers and Efforts to Preserve the Sunnah by Its Defenders (1991), Hadith Research Methodology (1992), Textual and Contextual Prophetic Hadith: A Ma'anil Hadith Analysis of Universal, Temporal, and Local Islamic Teachings (1994), Prophetic Hadith According to its Defenders, Deniers, and Forgers (1995) (Amrulloh, 2017).

The concept of Sunnah according to Syuhudi Ismail, is all things that are more general in nature than Hadith related to the Prophet Muhammad SAW. according to him Sunnah is an action that is continuously carried out by the Prophet and his companions, then continues to be practiced by the next generation until it reaches us. It can be concluded that in his view the sunnah is evolutive and moves dynamically continuously. The Sunnah referred to here is not just about the physical actions of the Prophet. But also the moral values

contained therein that can be implemented and exemplified across time and space (Muhammad Hasbi Ash-Shiddieqy, 2002).

There are several main principles used by Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il in understanding Hadith including:

#### 1. Understanding Hadith through Textual Analysis

Syuhudi Ismail distinguishes the hadith matan into five forms:

- a. *Jawami'ul Kalim* is a short expression but has a broad meaning with this wording generally understood textually and shows universal Islam but does not rule out the possibility that this Hadith is understood contextually. This can happen if the hadith does not mention a specific time and place (Syuhudi Isma'il, 1994).
- b. *Tamsil (simile)* The redaction of this hadith is in the form of a simile of something with a similar thing this hadith is also understood contextually in order to obtain a universal understanding.
- c. Symbolic expressions, the text uses symbols that have caused pros and cons among scholars. Scholars who justify the symbolic language in the Hadith, then require understanding the Hadith contextually.
- d. Dialogue, this type is commonly known that there are traditions that appear in the form of conversations or questions and answers between the Prophet and companions sometimes the Prophet answers differently in the same question. Therefore, according to Syuhudi Ismail, these different answers are not universal but more likely conditional.
- e. The expression analogy of analogy here is defined as a figurative comparison with the existing form of ready data *simi* appears when the prophet compares something with something else to facilitate the understanding of those who listen (Partanto, 2015).

#### 2. Understanding Hadith by Considering the Hadith Context

According to Syuhudi Ismail, in understanding the Hadith in addition to paying attention to the wording, it is necessary to understand a Hadith based on its context. So Syuhudi divides the Hadith into 2 categories based on the context. The first is in terms and position of the Prophet, the second, in terms of the conditions and situations in which the Hadith appeared (Anggoro, 2019). In understanding a hadith, it can be done by connecting

the position of the Prophet because the Prophet has many roles, among others, as head of state warlord judge head of family and personal. However, Syuhudi Ismail himself admits that trying to identify traditions based on function is not something easy to do (Musahadi., 2000).

For example, the Hadith about the prophet's reclining position according to Syuhudi Ismail is related to the prophet's personality. Again sleeping in that position because at that time that position was comfortable for the prophet so this hadith is not a race to lie down as mentioned in the hadith.

3. The hadith clues are connected with the background of the occurrence.

Syuhudi Ismail said that *Asbab al-Wurud* is important in understanding hadith. Based on the existence of the hadith, Syuhudi Ismail identifies the form of *asbabul wurud* into 3 types:

- a. Hadiths that do not have a specific cause, for example, the Hadith about *Zakat-ul-Fitr*. This Hadith is understood textually and contextually, the artist is understood textually to be about the obligation to pay *Zakat-ul-Fitr* which is universal. This artist is understood contextually in relation to the material used to pay zakat is staple food.
- b. Prophetic Hadiths that have special causes. For example, the Hadith that explains the virtue of taking a bath on Friday. This hadith can be understood textually or contextually. Those who understand it textually will say that bathing before the Friday prayer is obligatory. The opposite is true for those who understand the Hadith contextually. They will argue that bathing before the Friday prayer is not an obligation because the emergence of the Hadith is due to the conditions of the companions at that time which were still difficult so that they used clothes made of thick wool and rarely washed when Friday prayer time arrived they went straight to the mosque which was held during the day and the weather was very hot, the narrow conditions of the mosque caused an unpleasant smell and then spread in all directions until it was smelled by the prophet, therefore bathing for Friday prayer was required. But in contrast to the current situation where facilities are abundant then to obtain water and the habit of bathing twice a day then bathing before Friday prayer is not an obligation.

- c. Hadiths that relate to the current situation. For example, the Hadith about turning off the light when going to bed. At the time of the Prophet, lighting was still in the form of oil lamps and it was feared that it might cause a fire in case of negligence. This is considered to be the background of the hadith. The values contained in this hadith are considered contextual and understood contextually when looking at the current situation where lighting devices are safer and minimize the possibility of unwanted things happening, therefore social conditions are very important to understand a hadith (Amrulloh, 2017).

In conclusion, both Fatimah Mernessi and Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il have played important roles in understanding Hadith Hermeneutics. Mernessi, with her focus on intense research into Prophetic Hadiths that mention women, has contributed to the fight for gender equality and criticized Hadiths that discriminate against women. Mernessi's thinking also encourages understanding religion in all its aspects in order to identify how religion itself can be used to legitimize acts of violence, which can serve as a foundation for inclusive and progressive religious education. On the other hand, Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il's contribution to the development of hadith science, by teaching the evolutive and dynamic concept of sunnah and dividing hadith based on their context, has also had a significant impact. Isma'il's thinking encourages a contextual approach in the reading of hadith, which can be the basis for religious education that is more relevant to social and historical realities. Thus, the thoughts of these two figures can be a source of inspiration and a foundation for the development of a religious education curriculum that is more holistic, integrates a gender perspective, and is relevant to the social and historical context of today.

## CONCLUSION

Hermeneutics of Hadith between Fatimah Mernessi and Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il, it can be concluded that both have an important role in eliminating stereotypes against women in Islam. Despite differences in the focus of study and methods of analysis, both have made significant contributions in understanding Hadith in a socio-historical manner. Hadith hermeneutics, which is a new breakthrough in finding answers to new problems that arise in modern times, is the foundation for their thinking. Fatimah Mernessi, a renowned writer whose works have been translated into many languages, has a deep interest in misogynistic hadiths. She strongly emphasizes the need for intense research into the



Prophetic Hadiths, and her work deals with sex and the role of women, women and politics, women's leadership, and women/angels and paradise. Mernissi opposes the patriarchal system that gives men dominance in various aspects of life, with women often being neglected. She believes that education for women is a strategic step to improve their status. Inspired by the thought of Muhammad Al-Ghazali, Mernissi championed gender equality and criticized traditions that offended women. On the other hand, Muhammad Syuhudi Isma'il, an intellectual in Indonesia, contributed greatly to the development of hadith science. He taught the evolutive and dynamic concept of sunnah and divided hadith based on their context. He also identified asbab al-wurud in understanding hadith.

## REFERENCES

- Amrulloh, A. (2017). Kontribusi M. Syuhudi Ismail dalam Kontekstualisasi Pemahaman Hadis. *Mutawatir*, 7(1), 76–104. <https://doi.org/10.15642/mutawatir.2017.7.1.76-104>
- Anggoro, T. (2019). Analisis Pemikiran Muhammad Syuhudi Ismail Dalam Memahami Hadis. *Jurnal Ilmu Hadis*, 3(2), 93–104.
- Fahrudin, & Ansari. (2019). Penolakan Hadis Missoginis (Telaah Pemikiran Fatima Mernissi dalam Hermeneutika Hadis). *an-Nur*, 11(2), 1–22.
- Handayana, S. (2019). Pemikiran Hadis Syuhudi Ismail. *TAJDIR: Jurnal Ilmu Keislaman dan Ushuluddin*, 16(2), 255–236. <https://doi.org/10.15548/tajdir.v16i2.101>
- Hauqola, N. (2013). HERMENEUTIKA HADIS: Upaya Memecah Kebekuan Teks. *Jurnal THEOLOGIA*, 24(1), 261–284. <https://doi.org/10.21580/teo.2013.24.1.324>
- Ilyas, F., & Bin Hj. Sulieman, I. (2017). Muhammad Syuhudi Ismail (1943-1995); Tokoh Hadith Prolifik, Ensiklopedik Dan Ijtihad. *Jurnal Ilmiah Islam Futura*, 17(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.22373/jiif.v17i1.1604>
- Khasanah, F. Z. (2018). Studi Pemikiran Said Aqiel Siradj tentang Kesetaraan Hak-Hak Politik Perempuan untuk Menjadi Kepala Negara. *Eprints.Walisongo.Ac.Id*, 1–206. Diambil dari <http://eprints.walisongo.ac.id/9165/1/132211066.pdf>
- Kuswati, S. N., & Zulaikha, S. R. (2020). Preservasi Arsip Pascabencana Banjir (Studi Komparasi di LIPI Jakarta, Depo Arsip Koran Suara Merdeka Semarang dan Perpustakaan Ceria Demak). *Acarya Pustaka*, 7(2), 1–15. Diambil dari <https://ejournal.undiksha.ac.id/index.php/AP/article/download/25683/19688>
- Muhammad Hasbi Ash-Shiddieqy. (2002). *Sejarah dan Pengantar Ilmu Hadits*. Semarang: Pustaka Rizki Putra.
- Munfarida, E. (2016). Perempuan Dalam Tafsir Fatima Mernissi. *Maghza*, 1(2), 21. <https://doi.org/10.24090/mza.v1i2.2016.pp21-34>
- Muniroh Muniroh. (2016). Hermeneutika Hadis Ala Fatima Mernissi. *Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Ushuluddin*, 15(1). Diambil dari <http://103.180.95.17/index.php/ushuluddin/article/view/1069>
- Musahadi. (2000). *HAM. Evolusi Konsep Sunnah (Implikasinya pada Perkembangan Hukum Islam)*.

Semarang: Aneka Ilmu.

- Muslim Ibn al-Hajjaj Abu al-Hasan al-Qusairy al-Naisabury. (n.d.). *Sabih Muslim* (1 ed.). , Dar Itha' Turats al-'Arabiy.
- Nasrullah, M., Husna, J., & Waharjani. (2022). Syuhudi Ismail Dan Pengembangan Pemikiran Hadis Di Indonesia: Studi Analisis Konsep Pemahaman Hadis Syuhudi Ismail and the Development of Hadith Thought in Indonesia: a Study of the Hadis Understanding. *Risalah, Jurnal Pendidikan dan Studi Islam*, 8(2), 441–458. <https://doi.org/10.30863/ekspose.v16i1.94.4>
- Nuroniyah, W. (2019). Perempuan Arabia Dalam Lingkaran Perkawinan Era Pra-Islam : Sebuah Kajian Untuk Memahami Posisi Perempuan Dalam Sistem Perkawinan Islam. *Yinyang : Jurnal Studi Islam, Gender dan Anak*, 14(2), 175–200. <https://doi.org/10.24090/yinyang.v14i2.2019.pp>
- Partanto, P. A. dan M. D. al-B. (2015). *Kamus Ilmiah Populer*. Surabaya: Arkola.
- Rifai, S., Syafik R, M., & Masruhan, M. (2023). Analisis Pemikiran Hermeneutika Muhammad Syuhudi Ismail. *CENDEKLA: Jurnal Studi Keislaman*, 8(2), 227–244. <https://doi.org/10.37348/cendekia.v8i2.210>
- Sauda', L. (2015). Hadis Misoginis dalam Perspektif Hermeneutika Fatima Mernissi. *Mutawatir*, 4(2), 292. <https://doi.org/10.15642/mutawatir.2014.4.2.292-308>
- Siti Zubaidah. (2018a). *PEMIKIRAN FATIMA MERNISSI (TENTANG KEDUDUKAN WANITA DALAM ISLAM"*. Medan: CV. Widya Puspita.
- Siti Zubaidah. (2018b). *PEMIKIRAN FATIMA MERNISSI (TENTANG KEDUDUKAN WANITA DALAM ISLAM)*. Medan: CV. Widya Puspita.
- Sutrisno, A., & Salsabela, D. (2023). Konsep Kesetaraan Gender Perspektif Fatima Mernissi. *Sophist : Jurnal Sosial Politik Kajian Islam dan Tafsir*, 4(2), 225–241. <https://doi.org/10.20414/sophist.v4i2.73>
- Syuhudi Isma'il. (1994). *Hadis Nabi yang Tekstual dan Kontekstual: Telaah Ma'anil Hadis tentang Ajaran Islam yang Universal, Temporal, dan Lokal*. Jakarta: Bulan Bintang.