
Harvesting Intelligence: A Comprehensive Study on Transforming Aquaponic Agriculture with AI and IoT

Dr. R. Arthy[1], B.Bala Chibi Hariesh[2], K.Kabilesh[3], M.Vishal[4], A.Sandeep Joe[5]
[1]Assistant Professor, Department of Information Technology, Kamaraj College of Engineering and Technology, Madurai, India,
arthyit@kamarajengg.edu.in
[2,3,4,5]Third Year Information Technology, Kamaraj College of Engineering and Technology, Madurai, India.

Abstract

Aquaponics, an agricultural technique that merges aquaculture and hydroponics, is on the brink of a transformative advancement with the amalgamation of Machine Learning (ML), Deep Learning (DL), and the Internet of Things (IoT). The incorporation of these cutting edge technologies in the field of aquaponics is bringing about a profound transformation in the realm of sustainable agriculture. This extensive investigation delves into the profound influence of these cutting-edge technologies on aquaponics, with a focus on predictive analysis, system optimization, environmental monitoring, and disease prevention. By means of ML and DL algorithms, historical and real-time data are scrutinized in order to forecast environmental fluctuations, optimize resource allocation, and facilitate the growth of crops and fish. IoT devices consistently gather data pertaining to crucial parameters, thereby enabling real-time monitoring and control of the aquaponic system. Furthermore, IoT technology enhances resource utilization and grants the ability to remotely monitor and manage the system. The detection of abnormalities in fish behavior and plant health through the utilization of ML and DL algorithms allows for the implementation of proactive measures aimed at preventing outbreaks and minimizing losses. Furthermore, these advanced technologies also offer personalized recommendations for effective management of various crop and fish species. The incorporation of ML, DL, and IoT into the field of aquaponics signifies a substantial advancement towards a more sustainable, efficient, and productive form of agriculture. These innovative technologies possess the capability to effectively address the challenges associated with global food security by optimizing the utilization of resources, maintaining environmental equilibrium, and mitigating the occurrence of disease outbreaks. In the context of the examined research endeavors presented in this article, it is anticipated that the utilization of smart control units in conjunction with the aquaponics system will yield greater profitability, increased intelligence, enhanced precision, and heightened efficacy. In the context of the examined research endeavors presented in this article, it is anticipated that the utilization of ML, DL and IoT in conjunction with the aquaponics system will yield greater profitability, increased intelligence, enhanced precision, and heightened efficacy.

Keyword: Aquaponics, Internet of Things, Machine Learning, Deep Learning, Cloud platform.

I. Introduction

Aquaponics, a sustainable agricultural system, represents a groundbreaking approach that fuses aquaculture with hydroponics to create an ecosystem where fish and plants mutually benefit. This innovative method stands out for its potential to significantly transform traditional agriculture by conserving water, reducing the reliance on chemical fertilizers, and minimizing environmental impact. However, the true significance of aquaponics emerges when integrating it with machine learning, deep learning, and the Internet of Things (IoT) into the equation.

In this context, machine learning proves indispensable for aquaponics as it enables predictive analytics, real-time monitoring, and automatic adjustments. By analyzing vast datasets, machine learning algorithms can predict potential issues, such as disease outbreaks in fish or nutrient imbalances in the system. This proactive approach can lead to a substantial improvement in sustainability and resource efficiency.

Moreover, real-time monitoring and control through IoT sensors provide immediate insights into crucial parameters like water quality, temperature, and pH levels, allowing for quick, data-driven decisions. Deep learning, with its ability to process complex patterns and data, plays a crucial role in optimizing crop yields. By analyzing the growth patterns of plants and their responses to various conditions, deep learning models can provide recommendations to aquaponic farmers on how to adjust the system for maximum productivity. This technology-driven approach significantly enhances crop yields and contributes to the economic viability of aquaponic systems.

The potential of this field is multifaceted and impressive. It can lead to improved sustainability, enhanced crop yields, local food production, and increased economic viability. With the integration of these advanced technologies, aquaponics systems can be set up in urban areas, reducing the need for food to travel long distances from farm to table and promoting locally-sourced, sustainable food options. The purpose of our survey paper is to delve deep into the integration of machine learning, deep learning, and IoT in aquaponics, elucidating how this convergence is poised to redefine the landscape of sustainable agriculture.

The motivate of this study is to summarize the research opportunities in aquaponics, exploring its environmental benefits; examine specific applications of machine learning and deep learning in aquaponic systems; scrutinize the role of IoT in real-time monitoring and control of aquaponic environments; provide insights into practical implementations and case studies showcasing the potential of these technologies; and, finally, discuss the challenges and future directions of research in this exciting and promising field. By addressing these objectives, this survey paper seeks to serve as an invaluable resource for researchers and practitioners, offering a complete understanding of the synergy between technology and aquaponics and its implications for sustainable agriculture.

II. Research Scope

2.1. Machine Vision-Based Approaches in IoT Environment

Machine vision-based methodologies in an IoT (Internet of Things) milieu encompass the utilization of computer vision methodologies and technologies to amplify and enable diverse applications and use cases within the IoT ecosystem. Machine vision, which is a component of artificial intelligence, centers on empowering machines to decipher and comprehend visual information derived from the tangible world. When amalgamated with IoT, it has the potential to substantially broaden the capabilities and functionalities of IoT devices and systems [16]. [3] used an AutoML model with an XGradientboost algorithm and mask R-CNN image segmentation to monitor environmental parameters and fish count in aquaponics. This system controlled actuators, resulting in improved yield and water conservation.

2.2. Disease Monitoring in Smart Aquaponics

Monitoring diseases in intelligent aquaponics systems is a crucial element of effectively managing and upholding the well-being of both the piscine and botanical constituents within the system. Aquaponics is a sustainable agricultural technique that merges the practices of fish cultivation (aquaculture) and plant growth sans soil (hydroponics) in a closed-loop system. [9] conducted a comparative study using K-Nearest Neighbours, Logistic Regression, and Linear Support Vector Machine to monitor diseases in lettuce using vision features. [10] focused on detecting diseases in lettuce leaves, employing feature selection processes [17], [19], [20]. [11] used Convolutional Neural Network [24] and Artificial Hydrocarbon Network to predict nutrient deficiencies in tomato plants. [12] implemented Deep Neural Networks for apple foliar disease classification.

2.3. Soil Improvement and Nutrient Regulation

Enhancing soil quality [21], structure, and fertility, as well as effectively managing nutrient levels for optimal plant nutrition, are indispensable measures in the fields of agriculture and horticulture. They play a crucial role in promoting healthy plant growth and maximizing crop yields. [13] used multiple ML algorithms for regression analysis to strengthen soil behavior. [14] worked on smart nutrient regularization using genetic algorithms to optimize nutrient levels for crop production.

2.4. IoT-Driven Innovations in Aquaponics for Sustainable Agriculture

Internet of Things (IoT)-driven [18] innovations in aquaponics has the potential to significantly enhance the sustainability and productivity of this farming method, which combines aquaculture and hydroponics. These innovations leverage connectivity, data, and automation to optimize resource usage and monitor the health of both fish and plants. [3] shifts the focus to aquaponics in the context of the Indian agricultural economy. It highlights the importance of greenhouse farming and IoT-based monitoring systems in addressing challenges in the agricultural sector. The paper underlines how these technologies enhance year-round crop cultivation and water conservation.

In the Indian context, where agriculture contributes significantly to the GDP and employs a large workforce, addressing challenges related to factors like heavy reliance on monsoons is crucial. Greenhouse farming, as discussed in this paper, offers several advantages. It enables year-round crop cultivation, protecting plants from pests and adverse weather conditions. In the context of aquaponics, this approach significantly reduces water consumption compared to traditional agriculture.

IoT-based monitoring systems play a pivotal role in aquaponics, as emphasized in [3]. These systems are equipped with various sensors, including those for pH, temperature, humidity, and water levels, enabling real-time data collection and analysis. The paper also discusses the use of deep learning algorithms for disease diagnosis and crop growth prediction. The incorporation of wireless technology further facilitates seamless data transmission.

Fish detection [25] and counting are fundamental components of aquaponics, and the paper highlights the use of image-based detection, specifically Mask R-CNN, to address the challenges posed by the irregular shape, size, and varying water conditions of fish. This technology ensures accurate monitoring of fish populations, a critical aspect of aquaponic systems.

The paper also stresses the criticality of maintaining water pH levels in the aquaponics system. To accomplish this, an Atlas scientific digital pH value reader is employed. The ideal pH range for fish is between 7 and 8, underscoring its importance in the aquaponics system.

Automatic control systems in aquaponics are crucial for maintaining optimal conditions, and in [3], [16], the heart of the control system is the AutoML algorithm. The TPOT library for AutoML is utilized to identify the best-performing algorithm, XGradientboost, with an impressive K-10 validation result of 0.98.

Evaluating the performance of various events, such as water pumping, UV light control, fan operation, and fish detection and counting, is crucial, and this paper discusses the use of accuracy and F1 scores as evaluation metrics. Additionally, ROC curves and IoU (Intersection over Union) are employed to assess fish detection accuracy.

The paper also emphasizes online monitoring via cloud platforms, such as ThingSpeak, which provides remote access for authorized technical staff. It offers password-protected access and real-time data visualization, making it a valuable tool for managing aquaponics systems.

The author in [3] highlights how IoT-based monitoring and control systems enhance aquaponics and fish growth in the Indian agricultural context. It underlines the potential for further research to refine and expand upon these innovative solutions, which can significantly impact agricultural practices in the region

[5] continues the exploration of IoT-driven systems in aquaponics, with a specific focus on monitoring water quality. The paper highlights the significance of using IoT technology to expand monitoring capabilities and reduce the need for extensive human labor in aquaponic systems.

Three-Tiered IoT Architecture: The paper describes a three-tiered IoT architecture model that includes the perception layer (sensors), the network layer (data transmission), and the application layer (data storage and visualization). In the perception layer, the study harnesses pH level sensors, water level sensors, and ambient light sensors to collect vital data. These sensors furnish real-time data indispensable for sustaining optimal conditions conducive to the flourishing of both aquatic life and plant cultivation in the aquaponic ecosystem.

Transmission and Storage: The network layer leverages Wi-Fi for localized network connections via the device's local IP address and 3G signals for Internet connectivity, necessitating port forwarding and dynamic DNS services to enable remote access. Within the application layer, the study deploys a combination of local and cloud storage. It employs a log file, DAT files, and the InfluxDB time-series database (TSDB) software for local storage, while resorting to Google Firebase TSDB cloud service for cloud-based storage.

Hardware and Software Configuration: On the hardware front, the central core of this setup is the Raspberry Pi 3 Model B+, ably assisted by an Arduino Nano microcontroller. These components interface with various sensors, including pH level sensors, water level sensors, and ambient light sensors. The Arduino adeptly manages independent data collection from the sensors, and a USB cable serves as the conduit for power supply and data transmission to the Raspberry Pi. A portable Wi-Fi modem is harnessed to furnish both Wi-Fi and Internet connectivity. The software configuration revolves around the utilization of the Raspbian operating system. Docker technology is employed to instantiate containers for housing software components. Grafana, InfluxDB, and Telegraf are accommodated within the Docker framework, while Portainer offers a user-friendly interface for Docker container management. An Arduino script is employed for processing sensor data and recording it in log files and DAT files. Another script dispatches this data to Google Firebase, serving as an interim step for future integration with mobile applications.

International Journal on Recent and Innovation Trends in Computing and Communication
ISSN: 2321-8169 Volume: 11 Issue: 8s
***Article Received:** 26 April 2023 **Revised:** 30 June 2023 **Accepted:** 17 August 2023*

III. Data Collection and Management

Aquaponics, an innovative and sustainable agricultural practice that combines aquaculture and hydroponics, has emerged as a promising solution to address global food security and environmental sustainability challenges. In this extended comparative study, we scrutinize eight research papers, each contributing valuable insights into different aspects of aquaponics, data collection, analysis, and plant disease management [22]. The goal is to discern common themes and distinctions among these papers, offering a more comprehensive and detailed analysis of their methodologies and findings.

[1] focuses on aquaponics and presents a detailed study of data collection and analysis in this agricultural practice. It primarily centers on data collected from three commercial aquaponic facilities in Texas, USA. The paper underlines the significance of data in optimizing aquaponic systems and ensuring the well-being of both fish and plant components. The data collection process in [1] involves the systematic collection of data from three distinct aquaponic facilities: Aquatic Greens Farm, Wolff Family Farms, and Texas US Farms. Each facility contributes samples from various tanks and greenhouses, providing a diverse dataset for analysis. This multi-facility approach is critical as it reflects the real-world diversity of aquaponic setups, each with its unique conditions and challenges.

One noteworthy aspect is the inclusion of various types of samples. For instance, samples from Aquatic Greens Farm include those from tanks housing goldfish, tilapia, and greenhouses cultivating lettuce [23]. This diversity ensures that the dataset covers a broad spectrum of conditions, which is crucial for comprehensive analysis. Data analysis in [1] encompasses the utilization of clustering techniques, specifically the K-means clustering algorithm. Clustering is applied to categorize data points into groups based on similarities, helping identify patterns or anomalies. The paper highlights the importance of nutrient measurements in aquaponics, as these measurements are pivotal for maintaining a balanced aquaponic environment. The approach to dimensionality reduction using the K-means algorithm is a significant part of the paper. By reducing data dimensionality, it becomes easier to visualize and analyze complex datasets. However, this method also presents its own challenges, as it requires determining the optimal number of clusters and interpreting the results effectively.

[2], continues the exploration of aquaponics, but with a different dataset and research focus. The study embarks on predicting nitrate levels in aquaponic systems using a time-stamped dataset with a high-dimensional feature space. The dataset comprises various parameters, including temperature, turbidity, dissolved oxygen, pH, ammonia, and nitrate, along with temporal and fish-related attributes. One significant aspect of this paper is the selection of the dataset.

The aquaponics dataset proposed by Ogbuokiri et al. is chosen due to several compelling reasons. It is a recent dataset, ensuring its relevance in contemporary contexts. The data quality is emphasized, as it consists of reliable sensor measurements. Furthermore, it encompasses a rich array of pertinent parameters, making it well-suited for this study. Normalization plays a pivotal role in [2] due to the significant variation in feature values.

The paper highlights that without normalization, there's a risk of the training model becoming unstable. This instability could potentially lead to NaN (Not-a-Number) values if gradient updates are excessively large. Normalization is crucial for various machine learning algorithms, and in this study, min-max normalization is adopted. This technique rescales each input to a value between 0 and 1, reducing the influence of noise and ensuring efficient parameter updates during network training. The dataset in [2] is also subjected to a minimal percentage of missing values, approximately 0.001%, which are meticulously cleaned. This data preparation step ensures that the dataset is of high quality and suitable for analysis.

[3] shifts our attention to the Indian agricultural landscape, highlighting the role of greenhouse farming and IoT-based monitoring systems. The use of deep learning algorithms for disease diagnosis and crop growth prediction aligns with the trend of leveraging machine learning for agricultural solutions. Moreover, the paper underlines the importance of wireless technology for data transmission and emphasizes data accessibility and real-time monitoring, a theme common to several of the papers. Ensuring that data is easily accessible and interpretable is crucial for the success of aquaponic systems.

[4] delves into the data gathering process in aquaponics and emphasizes the use of IoT-driven systems to accumulate data related to essential parameters for optimal aquaponics. The paper discusses the diverse array of sensors, actuators, and data transmission mechanisms employed in the system.

Data Gathering and Sensors: The paper emphasizes the importance of data in aquaponics and how IoT-driven systems play a pivotal role in collecting data related to parameters

International Journal on Recent and Innovation Trends in Computing and Communication
ISSN: 2321-8169 Volume: 11 Issue: 8s
***Article Received:** 26 April 2023 **Revised:** 30 June 2023 **Accepted:** 17 August 2023*

crucial for aquaponics. The system harnesses a diverse array of sensors, including pH sensors, sunlight sensors, water level detectors, water temperature gauges, electrical conductivity sensors (EC), soil moisture sensors, Total Dissolved Solids (TDS) sensors, and Ion sensors. These sensors are instrumental in monitoring essential factors such as ammonia, nitrate, and nitrite levels within the fish tank.

Actuators and Environmental Control: The use of actuators, such as relays and water pumps, is pivotal for modulating environmental parameters. These actuators facilitate control over factors like illumination, humidity, electrical conductivity, ammonia content, CO2 levels, and temperature, all of which directly influence the growth of plants and fish within the aquaponics system.

Data Transmission and Security: The paper discusses the data transmission mechanism highlighting the use of the NodeMCU microcontroller as the central hub for collecting data from sensors via Grove connectors. Subsequently, this data is transmitted to the cloud through the MQTT (Message Queuing Telemetry Transport) protocol. The system ensures data security through a robust WebSocket connection integrated with Transport Layer Security (TLS), safeguarding the confidentiality and integrity of the data transmitted.

Energy Efficiency and Data Management: One of the distinguishing features of the system is its energy-efficient design, enabling it to harness solar panels as a primary power source. This energy efficiency is paramount for extended operational periods, particularly in self-contained electronic systems. The paper also discusses data management, including the handling of out-of-range data and scalability in data management, both locally and in the cloud.

Interoperability and Integration: The system's reliance on the MQTT protocol, coupled with JavaScript Object Notation (JSON), facilitates interoperability. This characteristic empowers integration into existing home systems like Home Assistant and OpenHAB while enabling seamless interaction with a variety of MQTT brokers.

Thus, [4] underscores the intricacies of data acquisition, analysis, and system monitoring within the context of an IoT-enabled aquaponics system. It highlights the fusion of diverse sensors, actuators, and IoT technologies to form a comprehensive solution for the optimization of aquaponics cultivation

[6] takes a distinct path by focusing on plant diseases, particularly those affecting leafy green crops. The study compiles a comprehensive dataset of images, representing both healthy and diseased states of four distinct plant varieties: lettuce, basil, parsley, and spinach. The paper highlights the meticulous curation of this dataset from diverse sources.

Rich and Diverse Dataset: The dataset forming the cornerstone of this research is the culmination of a meticulous assembly process, carefully sourced from the wealth of resources available within PlantVillage. This repository is a publicly accessible goldmine of plant disease images, and within it, a vast and multifaceted dataset has been compiled, boasting an impressive count of 54,306 individual instances. Each instance is a unique representation, collectively painting a rich tapestry of the numerous faces of plant diseases. To ensure systematic analysis and coherent categorization, this extensive dataset has been thoughtfully divided into eight distinct plant classes, featuring prominent members like tomato, potato, pepper, soya beans, grape, orange, apple, and more. These plant classes are pivotal to the research, serving as the foundation for in-depth exploration.

In-Depth Categorization: The paper emphasizes the meticulous categorization of the dataset, dividing it into eight distinct plant classes, with each class containing both healthy plant leaves and various disease classes. The focus on leafy green crops, including lettuce, basil, parsley, and spinach, ensures that the dataset covers a broad range of crops that are significant in agriculture and culinary contexts.

Data Standardization: To ensure a level playing field for subsequent evaluations and comparisons, all images within the dataset have been uniformly resized to a standardized 256 by 256-pixel format. This thoughtful standardization is a critical step that not only fosters fairness and consistency but also streamlines the research process. Notably, all experiments, analyses, and assessments undertaken within the framework of this research have been rigorously executed on this meticulously standardized image dataset. This strategic approach underscores the integrity of the findings, enabling comprehensive and nuanced comparisons across diverse parameters, thus significantly enhancing the depth and comprehensiveness of the research endeavor.

The paper also features an engaging visual representation, Figure 4, that offers a glimpse into the dataset by presenting a selection of classes for vivid illustration. This curated selection includes visually captivating representations of both the thriving, healthy plant categories and the visually distinctive disease classes, vividly showcasing the diversity and complexity encapsulated within the dataset.

Article Received: *26 April 2023* ***Revised:*** *30 June 2023* ***Accepted:*** *17 August 2023*

3.1. Data Collection in Aquaponic Systems

Effective data collection is the foundation of informed decision-making in aquaponic systems. It provides crucial insights into water quality, nutrient levels, plant health, and fish well-being. Various methods and technologies are employed to gather this data.

Sensors and Monitoring Systems: Modern aquaponic systems extensively rely on sensors to collect real-time data. These sensors can measure parameters such as pH, temperature, dissolved oxygen, ammonia, nitrate, and more. For instance, IoT-based monitoring systems use sensors for pH, temperature, humidity, and water levels to ensure optimal conditions [7].

Water Sampling: Traditional methods involve manual water sampling and laboratory testing. Water samples are collected from different parts of the system, including fish tanks and plant beds, and analyzed for nutrient concentrations. This method is labor-intensive and time-consuming but can provide accurate data [1].

Remote Sensing: Remote sensing techniques, such as aerial imagery and satellite data, are increasingly being explored to monitor large-scale aquaponic facilities. They offer a bird's-eye view of the system and can provide valuable information on crop health and growth [3].

Camera Systems: In some studies, cameras have been used to capture images of plant leaves, allowing for visual analysis of plant health and disease detection [6].

3.2. Data Management in Aquaponic Systems

Data management in aquaponics involves organizing, storing, and analyzing the collected information to make informed decisions and optimize system performance. Several key studies have explored data management techniques in aquaponics.

Database Systems: Establishing a database to store data is a common practice. It allows for organized storage and retrieval of information. The data collected from sensors, water samples, and other sources can be efficiently managed within a database system. These databases can be locally hosted or cloud-based [1].

Decision Support Systems (DSS): DSS are designed to provide actionable insights based on the collected data. They analyze various parameters to optimize nutrient delivery to plants and ensure a healthy environment for fish. These systems use algorithms and models to make real-time adjustments [4].

Visualization Tools: Data visualization tools, like graphs, charts, and dashboards, are employed to represent data in a visually accessible manner. These tools help aquaponic system operators quickly grasp the system's status and make informed decisions. For example, in one study, Principal Component Analysis (PCA) was used to create visual representations of data variance, facilitating decision-making in aquaponic systems [4].

Machine Learning and Artificial Intelligence (AI): Advanced data analysis techniques, such as machine learning and AI, are increasingly being used to extract valuable insights from aquaponic data. For instance, one study used IoT technology and decision support based on machine learning models to manage nutrient concentrations effectively [7].

3.3. Common Elements in Data Collection and Management

While different studies explore unique approaches to data collection and management, there are common elements and trends that emerge from the literature.

Real-time Monitoring: Many studies emphasize the importance of real-time monitoring using sensors and automated systems. This allows for immediate responses to deviations from optimal conditions [1] [7].

Data Integration: Integrating data from various sources, such as sensors, water samples, and cameras, is a common practice. Data integration ensures a comprehensive view of the system and enables more accurate decision-making [4] [6].

Data Security: As data collection and management increasingly rely on digital systems, data security is a critical concern. Protecting sensitive data from unauthorized access and ensuring data integrity are paramount [1].

3.4. Differences and Innovations in Data Collection and Management

Each study brings its unique perspective and innovations to the field of aquaponic data collection and management. [1] focuses on traditional data collection methods, including manual water sampling and laboratory analysis. It emphasizes the importance of maintaining accurate records and using these records for data management. While it acknowledges the labor-intensive nature of these methods, it provides valuable insights into nutrient concentrations and water quality. [3] introduces the concept of remote sensing in aquaponics. By using aerial imagery and satellite data, this study explores the potential for large-scale monitoring and management. This innovation allows for a broader perspective on aquaponic systems and can be especially beneficial for commercial operations. [4] emphasizes the use of decision support systems (DSS) and visualization tools. It highlights the significance of making data-driven decisions in aquaponic systems. DSS enables real-time adjustments based on data analysis, while visualization tools provide a clear representation of the system's status. [5] explores the use of cameras for plant leaf imaging. This innovative approach allows for visual analysis of plant health, which can complement other data collection methods. The study indicates that combining visual data with sensor data can provide a more comprehensive understanding of the system. [7] leverages IoT technology and machine learning for data management. It focuses on real-time monitoring through sensors and uses machine learning algorithms to optimize nutrient concentrations. This approach represents a more automated and data-driven method for aquaponic system management.

In summary, data collection and management in aquaponic systems have evolved significantly, with various methods and technologies being explored. While some studies focus on traditional data collection and laboratory analysis, others introduce innovative approaches, such as remote sensing, decision support systems, and machine learning. Common elements in data collection and management include real-time monitoring, data integration, and data security. The choice of data collection and management methods depends on the specific goals and scale of the aquaponic system, but all approaches aim to optimize plant growth and fish health while reducing resource consumption and environmental impact. Aquaponic farming holds promise as a sustainable and efficient method of food production, and effective data collection and management are integral to its success

IV. Predictive Analytics and Optimization

Each paper addresses different aspects of aquaponics, such as water parameter monitoring, crop growth stage classification, and feature normalization. By synthesizing their findings and comparing them, we can gain a more comprehensive understanding of how these approaches contribute to optimizing aquaponic systems. [1] introduces an integrated monitoring system that combines water parameter data with Bolstered Error Estimation (BEE) to predict water parameters accurately. Accurate monitoring of water parameters is crucial for maintaining the optimal conditions necessary for the growth of both plants and fish in aquaponic systems. The study utilizes historical data and real-time sensor readings to make predictions, resulting in a high degree of accuracy. This contributes significantly to improved resource allocation within aquaponic systems, ultimately leading to better crop yields and system performance.

[9] focuses on image-based lettuce growth stage classification in aquaponics. The research employs image preprocessing techniques and machine learning models like K-Nearest Neighbors (KNN) to classify lettuce growth stages accurately. This classification is pivotal for forecasting crop yields as it allows for optimized resource allocation at each stage of plant development. The study highlights KNN's superior accuracy in classifying growth stages, emphasizing its potential to improve crop yield forecasting significantly and ultimately enhancing the sustainability of aquaponic systems.

[10] delves into the segmentation and classification of lettuce growth stages using color-based superpixels and watershed transformation. In this approach, machine learning models, including Linear Discriminant Analysis (LDA), Artificial Neural Network (ANN), and Quadratic Support Vector Machine (QSVM), are employed for growth stage classification. The use of color-based segmentation helps identify lettuce plants, while machine learning models classify growth stages based on morphological features. The results reveal that QSVM outperforms LDA and ANN, achieving higher accuracy in classifying lettuce growth stages. This precise classification is instrumental in forecasting crop yields and optimizing resource allocation within aquaponic systems, underscoring the importance of accurately assessing growth stages.

[15] addresses the normalization of features in aquaponic datasets, focusing on the application of min-max normalization. Feature normalization is essential to mitigate variational differences among parameters, ensuring that all features are equally important in predictive modeling. This technique prevents the dominance of specific parameters and results in more accurate predictive models for crop yield forecasting and system optimization. The study demonstrates how feature normalization contributes to improving the performance of predictive models and resource allocation. [1] focuses on accurate water parameter monitoring, [9] on precise growth stage classification, [10] on combining segmentation and classification, and [15] on feature normalization. While their methodologies differ, each paper underscores the importance of predictive models in improving crop yield forecasting, system performance, and resource allocation. Combining the findings from these papers, it is evident that accurate monitoring of water parameters, precise growth stage

classification, and feature normalization are all essential components for optimizing aquaponic systems. These techniques collectively contribute to improved resource allocation, resulting in better crop yields and increased system efficiency. Ultimately, the integration of these approaches can lead to more sustainable and productive aquaponic systems, benefiting both food production and resource conservation.

4.1. Accuracy in Predictive Modeling

[1] introduces an integrated monitoring system for aquaponic water parameters. The primary objective of this study is to accurately predict water parameters, a crucial aspect of maintaining optimal conditions in aquaponic systems. The study employs Bolstered Error Estimation (BEE) to estimate parameter values and predict their future trends. Through historical data and real-time sensor readings, the model achieves high accuracy in monitoring and forecasting water parameters.

The data provided in [1] demonstrates that the accuracy achieved in predicting water parameters contributes to more efficient resource allocation within aquaponic systems. By maintaining optimal conditions for plant and fish growth, this model significantly enhances crop yields and the overall performance of the aquaponic system. The high accuracy in monitoring and forecasting water parameters directly translates to sustainability and resource efficiency, key goals in aquaponics.

4.2. Image-Based Classification

In addition to [9], which is dedicated to image-based classification, [10] also touches upon this approach as part of its broader analysis of machine learning models for lettuce growth stage identification [9], [10]. While [9] introduces the K-Nearest Neighbors (KNN) model for image-based classification, [10] presents machine learning models, including Linear Discriminant Analysis (LDA), Artificial Neural Network (ANN), and Quadratic Support Vector Machine (QSVM), to classify lettuce growth stages, with a particular focus on quantitative phytomorphological features.

[10] utilizes a diverse set of features extracted from images, including color-based superpixels and multifold watershed transformations for image segmentation and a wide range of morphological attributes [10]. These features are employed to train machine learning models, enabling the classification of lettuce growth stages into categories like vegetative, head development, and harvest based on their phytomorphological profiles. This approach not only captures visual information but also extends into the quantitative analysis of plant characteristics, providing a comprehensive view of lettuce growth stages. While the image-based classification in [9] primarily relies on the KNN model, [10] explores a more extensive range of machine learning models [9][10]. The study compares Linear Discriminant Analysis (LDA), Artificial Neural Network (ANN), and Quadratic Support Vector Machine (QSVM) to evaluate their performance in classifying lettuce growth stages [10]. These models are chosen for their ability to discern patterns and differences in the input data, which is crucial for the accurate identification of growth stages. Both [9] and [10] recognize the significance of accuracy in growth stage identification, and they employ different approaches to achieve this goal. [9] focuses on visual information and image preprocessing techniques, ultimately leveraging KNN for classification [9].

In contrast, [10] combines quantitative phytomorphological features with machine learning models to classify lettuce growth stages [10]. The use of images for classification in aquaponic systems, as showcased in [9], emphasizes the importance of visual data in improving crop yield forecasting accuracy. On the other hand, [10] extends beyond visual cues to include quantitative features in the classification process, providing a more comprehensive analysis of lettuce growth stages. These two papers collectively demonstrate the growing interest in image-based and machine learning approaches for aquaponic system optimization, underscoring the significance of accurate growth stage identification in enhancing crop yield predictions.

4.3. Machine Learning Models

In [10], the focus is on utilizing machine learning models for lettuce growth stage classification. Three key models are explored: Linear Discriminant Analysis (LDA), Artificial Neural Network (ANN), and Quadratic Support Vector Machine (QSVM). These models are selected based on their ability to maximize pattern recognition and distinguish different data classes, a crucial requirement for accurately classifying lettuce growth stages.

The Artificial Neural Network (ANN) is a fundamental part of this study. It is known for its versatility in prediction, supervised and unsupervised classification, and pattern recognition. ANN's learning process, involving backpropagation, allows it to adapt to input and output data through iterative adjustments in its internal parameters. The study uses a three-layer feedforward neural network with specific architecture, including input and hidden layers. The data provided indicates that optimizing the number of hidden neurons plays a critical role in enhancing the accuracy of the model.

On the other hand, the Quadratic Support Vector Machine (QSVM) offers a distinct approach. It is a controlled machine learning model and discriminative classifier used for regression and classification tasks. The choice of QSVM in this study is supported by data showing superior performance compared to other SVM variants, such as linear, cubic, fine Gaussian, medium Gaussian, and coarse Gaussian SVM models. QSVM is equipped with a quadratic kernel function and features like automatic kernel scale and box constraints to optimize training accuracy.

4.4. Normalization Techniques

In [15], the focus is on the importance of data normalization, particularly in the context of aquaponic systems where parameters exhibit significant variation. The study recognizes that without normalization, the training model could encounter issues, such as NaNs, due to excessively large gradient updates. To tackle this challenge, the study employs min-max normalization, a technique that performs better than its counterparts in time-series-based analysis. The data provided in [15] clearly shows the variational differences among the sensor-based attributes in the aquaponics dataset. To address this, the study normalizes the features, ensuring that no single attribute dominates the predictive model. The provided dataset statistics, including averages and standard deviations, illustrate the initial variability in attributes like temperature, turbidity, dissolved oxygen, pH, ammonia, and nitrate. Furthermore, the study highlights the need for cleaning the dataset, as it initially contains missing values. By addressing these issues, the study prepares the data for analysis. The chosen interval length for data reporting, shifting from 20 seconds to 60 seconds, aims to reduce noise in the dataset and improve its overall quality. Additionally, [15] introduces the concept of Extreme Learning Machines (ELM), an algorithm that differs from gradient-based models. ELM is particularly sensitive to high-variance input data, which can lead to input saturation. This data-driven approach is essential to maintain the model's capacity to understand underlying patterns and relationships. In conclusion, [10] and [15] provide valuable insights into machine learning models and data normalization techniques. While [10] focuses on the selection and optimization of models like ANN and QSVM for lettuce growth stage classification, [15] underlines the significance of normalization in handling variational differences in aquaponic datasets. Both papers use data and findings to support their respective approaches, contributing to the broader goal of enhancing predictive accuracy and resource allocation in aquaponic systems.

V. Environmental Monitoring and Control

In the realm of aquaponics, environmental control plays a vital role in ensuring the optimal growth of both fish and plants within a closed-loop system. [5], [3], [4], [7] delve into IoT-based solutions to enhance the efficiency and sustainability of aquaponics, addressing various aspects of this technology-driven approach. Each paper offers valuable insights into the importance of environmental control and the methods and technologies employed to achieve it.

5.1. Monitoring Critical Environmental Parameters

[5], [3], [4], [7] underscore the significance of monitoring and maintaining critical environmental parameters. While [5] places its focus on nutrient regulation, [3], [4], and [7] primarily center their attention on pH levels. In the realm of aquaponics, the meticulous management of the correct pH balance is essential for the well-being of fish and plants. The implementation of automated monitoring and control of these parameters significantly contributes to increased yield and overall sustainability.

5.2. Diverse and Intricate Sensor Arrays

[3] and [4] stand out by incorporating a wide array of sensors, demonstrating both diversity and intricacy in their approach. These sensors encompass pH sensors, sunlight sensors, water-level sensors, temperature sensors, and more. The versatility in sensor deployment allows for comprehensive environmental monitoring, proving especially valuable in complex aquaponics systems.

5.3. Machine Learning and Deep Learning

[3] introduces the application of machine learning and deep learning algorithms for fish detection, introducing a more advanced dimension to aquaponics management. This technology-driven approach ensures precise monitoring of fish populations, consequently enhancing the overall health of the system. [5], [4], [7] predominantly focus on monitoring and control aspects, not delving into the application of advanced algorithms for specific tasks.

5.4. Cost-Efficient Solutions

[7] emphasizes the pivotal importance of cost-effective solutions, employing a combination of a Raspberry Pi and an Arduino to establish an efficient system. The aspect of cost-effectiveness assumes critical significance, particularly for

widespread adoption, as it aligns with the financial constraints often encountered in the realm of agriculture. [5] also underscores the cost-saving potential through enhanced yield, signifying the imperative nature of affordability in aquaponics solutions.

5.5. Flexibility and Scalability

[5], [3], [4], [7] underscore the vital attributes of flexibility and scalability within aquaponics systems. This emphasis ensures that the systems can readily adapt to diverse environmental conditions and be seamlessly expanded as necessitated. [4] specifically highlights modularity and flexibility as essential components in its design criteria, emphasizing the need for adaptability.

5.6. Integration of IoT Technology

The convergence of [5], [3], [4], [7] underscores the transformative capacity of integrating IoT technology into aquaponics. IoT empowers real-time monitoring, automated control, and data-driven decision-making, effectively reducing the dependency on human intervention. The amalgamation of sensors, actuators, and IoT technology offers a holistic approach to environmental control.

5.7. Environmental and Economic Sustainability

Both [3] and [7] explicitly articulate the imperative of attaining environmental and economic sustainability within aquaponics. [3] delves into the reduction of water consumption and the diminished reliance on pesticides and fertilizers, underlining the quest for sustainability amid a burgeoning global population. [7] reiterates the significance of sustainability in the context of aquaponics.

5.8. Geographical Relevance

[3] strategically addresses the geographical relevance of aquaponics, drawing attention to its applicability in India, a region confronted with unique agricultural challenges. It underscores the pertinence of enabling season-independent crop growth and safeguarding against unpredictable weather conditions, rendering aquaponics an ideal solution in areas characterized by variable climates.

5.9. Challenges and Advancements

[5], [3], [4], [7] conscientiously acknowledge the challenges pervading the realm of aquaponics and concurrently offer innovative advancements hinged on technology. Whether it pertains to nutrient regulation, pH control, or the comprehensive monitoring of environmental parameters, the papers collectively provide solutions designed to elevate the efficiency of aquaponics systems.

5.10. Robustness and Reliability

Both [4] and [7] underscore the critical importance of endowing environmental control systems with robustness and reliability. These attributes are indispensable in ensuring the sustained success of aquaponics, as system failures can precipitate detrimental consequences for the health of fish and plants.

5.11. Future Prospects

[5] and [7] offer glimpses into the future prospects for aquaponics technology. [5] broaches the prospect of incorporating heavy metal monitoring via a spectrometer, thereby enhancing safety and sustainability within aquaponics. [7] champions the potential of IoT technology to revolutionize agriculture, propelling it toward a future where it plays a pivotal role in feeding the expanding global population while preserving the environment.

In sum, these four papers collectively underscore the escalating significance of IoT-based environmental control within aquaponics systems. Whether it revolves around nutrient regulation, pH monitoring, or the application of advanced technologies like machine learning and deep learning, these solutions culminate in augmented yield, heightened sustainability, and amplified economic viability in the field of agriculture. The hallmark attributes of flexibility, scalability, and cost-effectiveness that permeate these systems position them as apt choices for diverse geographical contexts, imbued with the potential to transfigure the future of food production. As the world grapples with the exigencies of sustaining a burgeoning population, aquaponics and IoT technology represent a propitious avenue forward.

VI. Disease Detection and Prevention

6.1. Early Disease Detection

[9] concentrates on leafy green crops and uses lightweight CNN architecture for crop classification and disease localization. The implementation of a ResNet-50 base model showcases a preference for established architectures known for their accuracy and suitability for smaller datasets. The adoption of a three-phase detection process, with a dedicated phase for disease detection, ensures that resources are utilized efficiently, and unnecessary processing is avoided.

In contrast, [10] delves into IoT integration, emphasizing the creation of an automated hydroponic system. This system involves real-time disease detection through image processing and object detection algorithms. It's notable for providing a cost-effective solution for small-scale hydroponics, making it accessible to a broader range of users. The comparative evaluation of Faster-RCNN and YOLOv5 models demonstrates a commitment to optimizing disease detection while considering computational efficiency.

[1] extends the scope to nutrient monitoring but lacks the explicit emphasis on disease detection. While nutrient monitoring is its primary focus, the dataset used for this study is worth highlighting. The utilization of Machine Learning classifiers trained on small datasets places a particular emphasis on the need for robust models that can perform well even with limited training data. This aspect of the paper indirectly contributes to disease prevention by maintaining optimal crop health through nutrient regulation.

6.2. Strategies for Disease Prevention

While early disease detection is crucial, the development of effective preventive strategies is equally vital. [9] primarily focuses on disease detection and localization, without delving into specific disease prevention strategies. It provides a strong foundation for identifying disease presence but its primary objective is to flag issues rather than solve them.

In [10], the emphasis shifts towards energy-efficient IoT devices for real-time data collection and monitoring, contributing to disease prevention by maintaining ideal growth conditions. The addition of features like disease tracking and cooling systems during hot weather months demonstrates a holistic approach to aquaponic system management. This paper combines disease detection with practical solutions, effectively bridging the gap between identification and mitigation.

[1], while not directly addressing disease prevention, highlights the importance of nutrient regulation for high crop production, indirectly influencing disease prevention by ensuring optimal crop health. By presenting a Machine Learning algorithm that monitors the nutrient status of irrigation water and provides a recommendation system for regulation, [1] bridges the gap between nutrition and disease prevention. The consistent availability of essential nutrients indirectly mitigates disease outbreaks by maintaining crop health.

6.3. Nutrient Monitoring and Regulation

[1] stands out by focusing on nutrient monitoring and regulation in hydroponic systems. It employs a machine learning algorithm to monitor the nutrient status of irrigation water and provides a recommendation system for regulating these parameters. The paper emphasizes the selection of vital nutrients in aquaponic environments through Machine Learning classifiers trained on small datasets. This approach bridges the gap between nutrient monitoring and disease prevention by ensuring that crops receive the essential nutrients needed for healthy growth, thus indirectly mitigating disease outbreaks.

The concept of nutrient monitoring and regulation is particularly significant in the context of aquaponics and hydroponics. This soil-less systems rely on nutrient-rich water to nourish the plants. The ability to measure and adjust nutrient levels in real-time is a game-changer, as it allows for precise control over crop health. Healthy plants are better equipped to resist diseases, making nutrient management a critical component of disease prevention.

6.4. Datasets and Experimental Setup

Data quality and experimental setups significantly impact the outcomes of machine learning models. While [9] and [10] do not explicitly disclose the datasets used, [1] references the utilization of Machine Learning classifiers trained on small datasets. It highlights the challenge of sparse data and dimensionality, which is a common issue in machine learning applications for aquaponic and hydroponic systems.

[9] and [10] demonstrate the practical applicability of their models by deploying them on edge devices, such as the Raspberry Pi. This showcases the feasibility of implementing these solutions in real-world aquaponic scenarios. The accessibility and affordability of such edge devices make them valuable tools for a broad range of users, including small-scale aquaponic and hydroponic enthusiasts.

[1] focus on small datasets reflects a common challenge in agriculture-related machine learning. Agricultural datasets are often limited in size, making it challenging to train complex models effectively. The need for feature selection and dimensionality reduction techniques becomes paramount in such situations. [1] addresses this challenge by emphasizing the importance of feature selection in managing small datasets, which can be a bottleneck for machine learning models' performance.

Article Received: *26 April 2023* ***Revised:*** *30 June 2023* ***Accepted:*** *17 August 2023*

VII. Challenges and Future Directions

[9] and [10] provide a significant contribution to disease detection but do not delve into challenges and future research directions. [1] underscores the challenge of sparse data and dimensionality, addressing it through feature selection techniques and error estimation methods. This paper's approach provides valuable insights into handling small datasets, an issue that often plagues machine learning applications in aquaponic and hydroponic systems.

The dimensionality challenge, often referred to as the "Curse of Dimensionality," can lead to sparse data, making it difficult to build accurate machine learning models. Feature selection techniques like Recursive Feature Elimination and ensemble methods such as ExtraTreesClassifier, as discussed in [1], are essential tools for mitigating this challenge. These methods allow researchers to identify the most relevant features for their models, reducing dimensionality without losing valuable information.

Overfitting is another common issue in machine learning, particularly when working with small datasets. Traditional machine learning and deep learning algorithms often struggle with limited data, as they tend to memorize the training data rather than generalize from it. [1] references a solution to this problem in the form of deep Reinforcement Learning algorithms, such as MONEADD, which demonstrated better scalability when distributed on multiple GPUs. This innovative approach offers a promising solution for handling overfitting in the context of machine learning for aquaponics and hydroponics.

In a similar vein, [1] introduces the Bolstered Error Estimation method as a way to combat overfitting. By using the same data for both classifier design and error estimation, this method minimizes the risk of overfitting, particularly for linear and non-linear classifiers.

[9], [10], and [1], offers diverse insights into the use of machine learning for disease detection, prevention, and nutrient management in aquaponic and hydroponic systems. While [9] and [10] excel in disease detection and monitoring, [1] significantly advances the field by introducing nutrient regulation as an indirect means of disease prevention. Each paper contributes unique perspectives, emphasizing the need for holistic approaches in managing the complex dynamics of smart aquaponics and hydroponics.

The intersection of machine learning, aquaponic and hydroponic systems holds immense promise. Challenges like data sparsity, dimensionality, and overfitting are being addressed through innovative techniques and algorithms. With continued research and development, these systems are poised to become more resilient, efficient, and accessible, contributing to sustainable agriculture and food security.

This comprehensive analysis underscores the collective impact of these three papers, shedding light on the dynamic landscape of smart aquaponics and hydroponics. By contrasting and comparing their distinctive contributions, we gain a broader understanding of the role of machine learning in these sustainable agricultural practices, paving the way for more resilient and efficient systems in the future.

VIII. Conclusion:

In conclusion, the field of aquaponics is witnessing a significant transformation with the integration of advanced technologies and predictive models. The array of research papers examined in this comprehensive comparative study collectively underscores the remarkable progress and innovation in the domain. The papers encompass a wide spectrum of key aspects, from predictive modeling and optimization techniques to image-based crop stage classification, smart IoT implementations, and efficient disease detection systems. While each paper carries its unique contributions, several common themes and achievements are evident, shaping the future of aquaponics. First and foremost, a resounding emphasis on accuracy and efficiency resonates throughout the examined papers. [1] showcases the power of predictive modeling using BEE, enhancing the precision of resource allocation within the aquaponic system. Similarly, [4] highlights the significance of feature normalization in predictive modeling, ensuring reliability for crop yield forecasting and system optimization. These approaches collectively exemplify the critical importance of accuracy in aquaponics, leading to more sustainable and efficient practices. Machine learning models play a pivotal role in the predictive and optimization aspects of aquaponics, as evidenced by [3]. This study showcases the superiority of QSVM in classifying lettuce growth stages, thereby offering a robust tool for forecasting crop yields and resource allocation optimization, aligning with the overarching goals of the other papers. Image-based classification, as introduced in [2], represents a unique approach. By leveraging visual data, this paper presents a promising path for classifying lettuce growth stages, emphasizing the potential to revolutionize crop yield forecasting in aquaponics. Furthermore, the adoption of IoT and predictive analytics in [2] contributes significantly to the automation and real-time monitoring of aquaponics systems, allowing for remote control and improved system health, reducing maintenance costs and improving productivity. In [8], the integration of advanced technology for crop diagnostic systems offers a practical solution to identify and manage diseases affecting leafy green crops in aquaponics. The development of a cloud-based application further enhances its practicality, making it a valuable tool for agricultural practitioners. Lastly, the introduction of low-power models for plant disease detection, as elaborated in [6], addresses the vital issue of power consumption in smart hydroponics. The model's high accuracy and energy efficiency make it a significant contribution to the field, showcasing the potential for more sustainable and resource-efficient systems. In synthesis, these papers collectively present a comprehensive picture of the transformative trends and advancements in aquaponics. They demonstrate the importance of accuracy, efficiency, and the role of technology in shaping the future of aquaponics. These studies collectively pave the way for a more sustainable and optimized future for aquaponic systems, where the integration of advanced technologies and predictive models plays a pivotal role in ensuring efficient resource utilization, accurate crop forecasting, and healthier, more productive aquaponic environments. As this field continues to evolve, the interdisciplinary collaboration between agriculture and technology will undoubtedly lead to further innovations and breakthroughs, helping to address global challenges in food production and sustainability.

References

[1] Sambandh Bhusan Dhal, Muthukumar Bagavathiannan, Ulisses Braga-Neto, Stavros Kalafatis, "Nutrient optimization for plant growth in Aquaponic irrigation using Machine Learning for small training datasets, Artificial Intelligence in Agriculture", Volume 6, 2022, Pages 68-76, ISSN 2589-7217, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aiia.2022.05.001.

[2] Karimanzira, Divas & Rauschenbach, Thomas. (2019). Enhancing Aquaponics Management with IoT-based Predictive Analytics for efficient Information Utilization. Information Processing in Agriculture. 6. 10.1016/j.inpa.2018.12.003.

[3] C. S. Arvind, R. Jyothi, K. Kaushal, G. Girish, R. Saurav and G. Chetankumar, "Edge Computing Based Smart Aquaponics Monitoring System Using Deep Learning in IoT Environment," 2020 IEEE Symposium Series on Computational Intelligence (SSCI), Canberra, ACT, Australia, 2020, pp. 1485-1491, doi: 10.1109/SSCI47803.2020.9308395.

[4] Khaoula, T.; Abdelouahid, R.A.; Ezzahoui, I.; Marzak, A. Architecture design of monitoring and controlling of IoT-based aquaponics system powered by solar energy. Procedia Comput. Sci. 2021, 191, 493–498.

[5] Dhal, S.B.; Jungbluth, K.; Lin, R.; Sabahi, S.P.; Bagavathiannan, M.; Braga-Neto, U.; Kalafatis, S. A Machine-Learning-Based IoT System for Optimizing Nutrient Supply in Commercial Aquaponic Operations. Sensors 2022, 22, 3510. https://doi.org/10.3390/s22093510.

[6] Musa, A.; Hassan, M.; Hamada, M.; Aliyu, F. Low-Power Deep Learning Model for Plant Disease Detection for Smart-Hydroponics Using Knowledge Distillation Techniques. J. Low Power Electron. Appl. 2022, 12, 24. https://doi.org/10.3390/jlpea12020024.

[7] Muhamad Farhan Mohd Pu'ad et al, IoT based water quality monitoring system for aquaponics, 2020 J. Phys.: Conf. Ser. 1502 012020.

[8] Abbasi, Rabiya & Martinez, Pablo & Ahmad, Dr Rafiq. (2023). Crop diagnostic system: A robust disease detection and management system for leafy green crops grown in an aquaponics facility. Artificial Intelligence in Agriculture. 10. 10.1016/j.aiia.2023.09.001.

[9] Sandy C. Lauguico, et. al, A Comparative Analysis of Machine Learning Algorithms Modeled from Machine Vision-Based Lettuce Growth Stage Classification in Smart Aquaponics, IJESD 2020 Vol.11(9): 442-449 ISSN: 2010-0264, doi: 10.18178/ijesd.2020.11.9.1288.

[10] Concepcion II, Ronnie & Alejandrino, Jonnel & Lauguico, Sandy & Tobias, Rogelio Ruzcko & Sybingco, Edwin & Dadios, Elmer & Bandala, Argel. (2020). Lettuce growth stage identification based on phytomorphological variations using coupled color superpixels and multifold watershed transformation. International Journal of Advances in Intelligent Informatics. 6. 261-277. 10.26555/ijain.v6i3.435.

[11] Hiram Ponce, et. al., Estimation of Low Nutrients in Tomato Crops Through the Analysis of Leaf Images Using Machine Learning, Journal of Artificial Intelligence and Technology, Vol. 1, No.2, 2021, 131-137, https://doi.org/10.37965/jait.2021.0006.

[12] Yadav, Anju & Thakur, Udit & Saxena, Rahul & Pal, Vipin & Bhateja, Vikrant & Lin, Jerry. (2021). AFD-Net: Apple Foliar Disease Multi Classification using Deep Learning on Plant Pathology Dataset. 10.21203/rs.3.rs-1158879/v1.

[13] Maleki, Mahdi & Azarhoosh, Mohammad & Senji, Sina & Aghaeinejad Meybodi, Abbas. (2022). Urease production using corn steep liquor as a low-cost nutrient source by Sporosarcina pasteurii: biocementation and process optimization via artificial intelligence approaches. Environmental Science and Pollution Research. 29. 10.1007/s11356-021-16568-6.

[14] Usman Ahmed, Jerry Chun-Wei Lin, Gautam Srivastava, Youcef Djenouri, A nutrient recommendation system for soil fertilization based on evolutionary computation, Computers and Electronics in Agriculture, Volume 189, 2021, 106407, ISSN 0168-1699, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compag.2021.106407.

[15] Metin, Ahmet & Kaşif, Ahmet & Catal, Cagatay. (2023). Temporal fusion transformer-based prediction in aquaponics. The Journal of Supercomputing. 79. 1-25. 10.1007/s11227-023-05389-8.

[16] M. M. Elsokah and M. Sakah, "Next Generation of Smart Aquaponics with Internet of Things," 2019 19th International Conference on Sci- ences and Techniques of Automatic Control and Computer Engineering (STA), pp. 106–111, 2019.

[17] Guo, J.; Yang, L.; Bie, R.; Yu, J.; Gao, Y.; Shen, Y.; Kos, A. An XGBoost-based physical fitness evaluation model using advanced feature selection and Bayesian hyper-parameter optimization for wearable running monitoring. Comput. Netw. 2019, 151, 166–180.

[18] Yanes, A.R.; Martinez, P.; Ahmad, R. Towards automated aquaponics: A review on monitoring, IoT, and smart systems. J. Clean. Prod. 2020, 263, 121571

[19] Chandrashekar, G.; Sahin, F. A survey on feature selection methods. Comput. Electr. Eng. 2014, 40, 16–28. [Google Scholar] [CrossRef]

[20] Kira, K.; Rendell, L.A. A practical approach to feature selection. In Machine Learning Proceedings 1992; Morgan Kaufmann: San Francisco, CA, USA, 1992; pp. 249–256.

[21] Zhang, X.; Zhang, J.; Li, L.; Zhang, Y.; Yang, G. Monitoring Citrus Soil Moisture and Nutrients Using an IoT Based System. Sensors 2017, 17, 447.

[22] Singh, V.; Misra, A. Detection of plant leaf diseases using image segmentation and soft computing techniques. Inf. Process. Agric. 2017, 4, 41–49.

[23] Lu, J.Y.; Chang, C.L.; Kuo, Y.F. Monitoring growth rate of lettuce using deep convolutional neural networks. In Proceedings of the ASABE Annual International Meeting, Boston, MA, USA, 7–10 July 2019.

[24] Hasan, N.; Ibrahim, S.; Aqilah Azlan, A.J. Fish diseases detection using convolutional neural network (CNN). Int. J. Nonlinear Anal. Appl. 2022, 13, 1977–1984.

[25] Jalal, A.; Salman, A.; Mian, A.; Shortis, M.; Shafait, F. Fish detection and species classification in underwater environments using deep learning with temporal information. Ecol. Inform. 2020, 57, 101088.