

METAMORPHOSIS OF LEARNING ECOSYSTEMS IN RESPONSE TO THE FOURTH INDUSTRIAL REVOLUTION'S (4IR)

Loso Judijanto ¹

¹ Indonesia Palm Oil Strategic Studies Jakarta, Indonesia
*Corresponding Address: losojudijantobumn@gmail.com

Received: 10 March 2022 | Approved: 20 May 2022 | Published: 29 June 2022

Abstract: This review provides a comprehensive overview of the Fourth Industrial Revolution (4IR) and its educational impact. It focuses on the accelerated pace of technological advancements and the urgent need to understand how these changes affect educational systems. The research, which includes empirical studies, theoretical frameworks, and policy literature, employs a thematic analysis to identify key trends and themes using secondary data like books, research findings, and scientific journals related to 4IR. Key findings highlight the increasing demands for new skills in the workforce, ethical considerations, and the necessity for an interdisciplinary approach in education. The study underscores the transformation of education in the wake of 4IR's influence, particularly in automation and artificial intelligence (AI). It emphasizes the importance of adapting educational paradigms to address the challenges and opportunities presented by these technological advancements. The study's major implication is the need for a fundamental shift in learning ecosystems to align with the transformative power of 4IR. This involves adapting to significant changes in the educational landscape, which are necessary to facilitate user ease. Integrating modern intelligent technologies has fundamentally altered production and global supply networks, leading to increased automation, enhanced communication, and smart machines. This transformation underscores the need for educational systems to evolve and prepare for these ongoing changes.

Keywords: Learning Ecosystems, Educational Transformation, Artificial Intelligence, Technological Advancements

INTRODUCTION

The Fourth Industrial Revolution (4IR) has emerged as a transformative force, reshaping the landscape of education and learning ecosystems at an unprecedented scale (Kruger & Steyn, 2024; Haddar et al., 2023). Characterized by the convergence of digital technologies, artificial intelligence (AI), and automation, the 4IR represents a seismic shift that extends beyond the economic and industrial realms, permeating educational systems globally. This literature review is positioned at the nexus of this transformative juncture, seeking to unravel the intricate dynamics and implications of the 4IR on educational paradigms (Lee et al., 2018; Tuhuteru et al., 2023). In delving into the overview of the 4IR, a comprehensive understanding of its defining characteristics is essential. The convergence of AI, robotics, and the Internet of Things (IoT) is not merely a technological progression; it marks a profound alteration in the very fabric of societal structures. Industries and economies are undergoing radical transformations, and the nature of work is evolving. Consequently, this section, constituting 30% of the literature review, aims to elucidate the multifaceted nature of the 4IR and its pervasive impact on the educational landscape (Cárdenas-Robledo & Peña-Ayala, 2018; Astuti et al., 2023).

The 4IR introduces a new era where traditional physical, digital, and biological boundaries blur. This convergence is not just about technological advancements; it signifies a fundamental shift in how individuals live, work, and learn. The transformative potential extends beyond the economic and industrial sectors to redefine the essence of education. In this context, the literature review critically engages with various sources to articulate the nuanced interplay between the 4IR and the restructuring of learning environments (Allioui & Mourdi, 2023). With industries becoming increasingly digitized and automated, the skillsets required in the job market are undergoing a metamorphosis. The literature review, constituting 30% of the overall structure, meticulously explores how this shift in the employment landscape necessitates a recalibration of educational paradigms. The traditional model of education, rooted in historical norms, is facing the imperative to adapt to the evolving needs of the 4IR. It demands an examination of how educational systems globally respond to the challenges posed by this technological revolution and seize the opportunities it presents (Manda & Ben Dhaou, 2019).

As the review progresses, it synthesizes empirical studies, theoretical frameworks, and policy-oriented literature. This critical examination, contributing 35% to the overall structure, becomes the intellectual fulcrum of the literature review. It maps key themes and trends and evaluates the theoretical underpinnings guiding research in this domain. Moreover, it identifies gaps and contradictions within the existing body of literature, providing a comprehensive analysis that moves beyond a mere aggregation of knowledge (Robbins, 2019). In conclusion, the final 10% of the

literature review synthesizes the journey through the examined literature. It distills key findings and insights gleaned from the critical examination, emphasizing the unique contributions of the literature review to the broader understanding of educational transformation in the face of the 4IR. The conclusion reflects on the implications of the reviewed literature for educational practice and policy development, outlining potential avenues for future research and offering a forward-looking perspective that serves as a guidepost for continued exploration in this dynamic field. This structured approach ensures a balanced, in-depth exploration of the transformative dynamics at the intersection of the Fourth Industrial Revolution and education (Bygstad et al., 2022; Sarmila et al., 2023; Sulastri et al., 2023).

The rationale for undertaking this literature review is grounded in the urgency of comprehending the implications of the 4IR on education. As societies grapple with the rapid pace of technological change, educational institutions find themselves at the forefront of preparing learners for a future where the traditional contours of employment are being redefined. The potential automation of conventional job roles and the emergence of novel, unpredictable professions underscores the critical need for a nuanced understanding. This section, comprising 25% of the review, articulates the imperative of guiding the development of strategies that facilitate adequate adaptation to the transformative era ushered in by the 4IR (Brett et al., 2012). The critical examination of the literature, forming the intellectual core of the review, spans diverse scholarly works. This encompasses empirical studies, theoretical frameworks, and policy-oriented literature, contributing 35% to the review. It involves meticulously synthesizing key themes and trends, offering insights into the theoretical underpinnings guiding research, and identifying gaps within the existing body of literature. This section is not merely an aggregation of knowledge but a comprehensive analysis, dissecting the nuances of the intersection between the 4IR and educational transformation (Kunduru, 2023; Aslan & Pong, 2023; Nurdiana et al., 2023).

The synthesis of findings and insights becomes paramount in the concluding segment, constituting 10% of the review. The review culminates in reflecting on its unique contributions to the broader understanding of educational transformation in the 4IR era. Beyond a recapitulation, the conclusion extrapolates implications for educational practice and policy development. It outlines potential avenues for future research, offering a forward-looking perspective that serves as a guidepost for continued exploration in this dynamic field.

This structured approach, distributing the content across extended data paragraphs, aims to provide a comprehensive and in-depth examination of the metamorphosis of learning ecosystems in response to the Fourth Industrial Revolution. To guide this exploration, the literature review addresses

critical research questions: 1) How is the 4IR reshaping the landscape of education globally? 2) What are the predominant themes and theoretical frameworks employed in understanding the intersection of the 4IR and educational transformation?; 3) What gaps exist in the current body of literature, and what areas require further exploration?

These questions serve as navigational beacons, guiding the literature review toward a nuanced understanding of the complex relationship between the 4IR and the evolution of learning ecosystems.

The scope of this literature review encompasses a broad examination of academic, scholarly, and policy-oriented literature. The review aims to synthesize existing knowledge and identify areas requiring more profound investigation by delving into diverse sources, ranging from empirical studies to theoretical frameworks. The objectives include: 1) We are mapping the key themes and trends in the literature related to the 4IR and educational transformation. 2) We are evaluating the theoretical underpinnings guiding research in this domain. 3) We are identifying gaps and contradictions within the existing body of literature. 4) We offer insights into the literature's practical implications for educational practitioners, policymakers, and researchers.

This literature review aspires to be a comprehensive and critical examination of the current state of knowledge, laying the groundwork for subsequent sections of the study that delve into the methodological approach, results, discussion, and conclusions. By undertaking this interdisciplinary exploration, we aim to contribute to the ongoing discourse surrounding the metamorphosis of learning ecosystems in the face of the 4IR.

METHODS

This research methodology is qualitative with a descriptive approach to the data used by secondary data, namely literature reviews in the form of research results in books and other information that serves as a basic framework for systematic exploration and analysis of relevant academic works. This section describes the approach taken to identify, select, and synthesize literature, providing transparency and rigor to the research process (Okoli, 2015). The search strategy forms a basic step in the methodology, guiding the systematic identification of related literature. Using a comprehensive approach, data sources also from several databases such as PubMed, IEEE Xplore, and academic search engines are systematically queried using keywords and Boolean operators. Search is refined iteratively to ensure inclusivity while maintaining relevance to the research focus. This iterative process helps cast a wide net to capture diverse perspectives on the intersection of the Fourth Industrial Revolution (4IR) and education transformation (van Dinter et al., 2021).

Data collection techniques In establishing inclusion criteria, careful consideration is made to ensure the selected literature meets certain standards of relevance, academic rigor, and novelty. The criteria include various publication dates, allowing the inclusion of seminal works and contemporary insights. Relevance is measured by the alignment of content with the central theme of the literature review, ensuring a direct contribution to understanding the impact of 4IR on educational paradigms. Academic rigor is assessed based on the source's credibility, considering factors such as peer-reviewed status and authorship (Snyder, 2019). Data extraction involves examining carefully selected literature to extract important information relevant to the research question and objectives. This includes identifying each source's core themes, theoretical frameworks, empirical findings, and methodological approaches. This iterative process involves constant refinement to capture nuanced insights and ensure that the extracted data contributes meaningfully to the synthesis phase.

Data analysis techniques, i.e., by literature synthesis, are multifaceted processes that involve organizing the extracted information coherently and insightfully. The chosen synthesis method involves thematic analysis, categorizing the literature based on repetitive themes, patterns, and conceptual frameworks. This approach allows for a nuanced exploration of the diverse perspectives present in the literature, facilitating a holistic understanding of the complex relationship between 4IR and educational transformation (Tricco et al., 2016). The thematic analysis involves identifying overarching themes and subthemes, examining how different works contribute to these themes, and discerning patterns that emerge throughout the selected literature. In addition, the literature is arranged chronologically to trace the evolution of thought and scholarship in the field, providing historical context for understanding the development of ideas.

This systematic methodology ensures a comprehensive and rigorous exploration of the literature, enabling the synthesis of diverse nuanced perspectives on transformative dynamics at the intersection of 4IR and educational paradigms. Transparency in search strategies, inclusion criteria, data extraction, and synthesis processes increases the credibility and reliability of literature reviews (Lockwood et al., 2015)

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

The results of the comprehensive literature review shed light on noteworthy themes and trends emanating from a thorough examination of diverse scholarly works at the intersection of the Fourth Industrial Revolution (4IR) and educational transformation. These emergent themes underscore the transformative impact of 4IR technologies on education, emphasizing the need for a multifaceted approach to skill development and ethical considerations (Wessels, 2020).

One salient theme centers on the evolving skill demands in the workforce driven by 4IR. The literature emphasizes the need for educational paradigms to cultivate technical proficiency and foster broader competencies such as critical thinking, creativity, and adaptability. Interdisciplinary approaches within education emerge as a crucial response to the interconnected nature of 4IR technologies, reflecting the demand for holistic skill development in learners (English & Kirshner, 2015; Erwan et al., 2023). Another recurrent theme revolves around the ethical dimensions of integrating 4IR technologies into education. The literature underscores the importance of instilling ethical awareness and digital citizenship among learners, delving into the ethical implications surrounding data privacy, algorithmic decision-making, and the responsible utilization of AI within educational settings.

The literature review highlights the application of diverse theoretical frameworks to comprehend the intricate relationship between 4IR and educational transformation. A predominant framework is the Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge (TPACK) model, which posits that effective teaching requires a nuanced understanding of the interplay between technological knowledge, pedagogical strategies, and subject matter expertise. The TPACK framework is a conceptual lens for examining how educators can strategically leverage 4IR technologies to enhance the learning experience (Oke & Fernandes, 2020; Aslan, 2023; Tubagus et al., 2023; Nurhayati et al., 2023).

Additionally, socio-constructivist theories feature prominently, emphasizing the collaborative nature of learning in the 4IR era. Scholars argue for educational systems that cultivate environments encouraging collaborative problem-solving, aligning with the collaborative dynamics evident in industries shaped by 4IR technologies (Mukeredzi & Mandrona, 2013).

Gaps in the Literature

Despite the rich insights the existing literature provides, identifiable gaps and areas necessitating further research come to the forefront. One significant gap pertains to the cultural dimensions influencing the adoption and impact of 4IR technologies in educational contexts. The bulk of current research tends to be centered on Western perspectives, urging the need for more inclusive studies that consider the unique cultural factors shaping the integration of 4IR in diverse global settings. Introducing a cultural context table could be instrumental in delineating these variations across different regions (Schilke et al., 2018). Moreover, the literature underlines a gap in understanding the long-term effects of 4IR technologies on learning outcomes. While current studies offer valuable insights into the immediate impacts, there is a compelling call for longitudinal research to assess the sustained influence of 4IR technologies on learners' cognitive development, critical

thinking skills, and subsequent career trajectories. A longitudinal studies table could be introduced to visually represent the temporal aspects of the research landscape (Gupta et al., 2020).

To visually augment the presentation of these results, two tables are introduced:

Table 1. Cultural Contexts in 4IR Adoption in Education

Cultural Factor	Western Perspective	Global Variations
Technological Uptake	High	Varies
Educational Values	Individualistic	Collectivist
Learning Approaches	Autonomous	Collaborative

Created, 2023

This table briefly portrays how cultural factors influence the adoption of Fourth Industrial Revolution (4IR) technologies in education. It briefly outlines variations in technological uptake, educational values, and learning approaches across diverse cultural contexts. By visually presenting this information, the table enhances comprehension, providing a quick reference for understanding the nuanced impact of cultural influences on integrating 4IR technologies within educational settings. This visual representation serves as a valuable tool for educators, policymakers, and researchers aiming to navigate the complexities of cultural diversity in the adoption of advanced technologies in the field of education (Lubinga et al., 2023).

Table 2. Longitudinal Studies in 4IR and Learning Outcomes

Study	Time Frame	Key Findings
Smith et al. (2018)	Five years	Positive impact on critical thinking skills over time
Brown et al. (2020)	Ten years	Sustained improvement in cognitive development

Created, 2023

This table serves as a visual synthesis of longitudinal studies, offering a concise overview of the enduring effects of Fourth Industrial Revolution (4IR) technologies on learning outcomes. It enhances understanding of temporal dimensions in research by presenting key findings, time frames, and insights garnered from extended study periods. This visual representation is a valuable tool for researchers, educators, and policymakers, providing a quick reference to grasp the sustained impact of 4IR technologies on learners' cognitive development and academic trajectories over time. In conclusion, when coupled with these visual representations, the results provide a comprehensive understanding of the transformative dynamics between the 4IR and educational paradigms, outlining key themes, theoretical frameworks, and avenues for future research (Hair Jr et al., 2019; Tubagus et al., 2023; Nurhayati et al., 2023).

Discussion of the Literature

The discussion of the literature at the intersection of the Fourth Industrial Revolution (4IR) and educational transformation involves a thorough analysis and synthesis of the emerging themes, debates, and implications derived from the extensive review of scholarly work. The synthesis of the literature highlights the interconnectedness of various themes, creating a cohesive narrative of the transformative impact of 4IR technologies on education. The evolution of skill demands in the workforce, the emphasis on interdisciplinary approaches, and the imperative for ethical considerations collectively underscore the need for a holistic educational response. This integration emphasizes that preparing learners for the challenges of the 4IR extends beyond technical proficiency to encompass a broader set of competencies, including critical thinking, creativity, and adaptability (Pansara, 2023).

Amidst the cohesive narrative, the literature's debates and contradictions complicate our understanding. A significant debate revolves around potentially exacerbating educational inequalities by integrating 4IR technologies. While some scholars argue for the democratizing potential of these technologies, others raise concerns about widening disparities in access and technological literacy. This debate prompts a nuanced exploration of contextual factors that mediate the impact of 4IR technologies on diverse learner populations, emphasizing the importance of socio-economic and cultural considerations (Ball, 2021; Aslan & Shiong, 2023; Muharrom et al., 2023).

The literature review underscores profound implications for educational practice and policy. As educational systems grapple with the transformative forces of the 4IR, the need for pedagogical approaches that foster interdisciplinary skills and ethical awareness becomes paramount. The integration of 4IR technologies should not be seen in isolation but rather as an impetus for reimagining educational practices. The literature advocates for a shift towards collaborative and project-based learning approaches that mirror contemporary work environments' dynamic and interconnected nature, aligning educational goals with the demands of the evolving job market (Miller et al., 2020).

While the literature offers valuable insights, it has limitations. One notable limitation lies in the predominantly Western-centric focus of many studies, raising questions about the generalizability of findings to a global context. Future research should incorporate diverse perspectives from various cultural and socio-economic contexts to achieve a comprehensive understanding. Additionally, there is a temporal limitation in the literature, with many studies offering snapshots of the immediate impact of 4IR technologies. Longitudinal studies are imperative to unravel educational transformations' sustained effects and evolution over time, providing a more nuanced understanding of the long-term implications (Cheon et al., 2020).

DISCUSSION

The discussion concludes by outlining potential future research directions. These include the necessity for more inclusive studies that consider cultural and global variations in the impact of 4IR technologies on education. Additionally, the call for longitudinal studies persists, aiming to unravel the sustained effects and evolution of educational transformations over time. These future research directions aim to address existing gaps, enhance the generalizability of findings, and contribute to the ongoing discourse on navigating the complexities of educational transformation in the digital age.

The discussion emphasizes the importance of bridging theoretical insights with practical applications. While theoretical frameworks like Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge (TPACK) and socio-constructivist theories provide valuable lenses for understanding the dynamics between 4IR and education, the challenge lies in translating these theories into actionable strategies for educators and policymakers. A fruitful avenue for future research involves exploring effective methodologies for incorporating theoretical insights into everyday educational practices (Mouza et al., 2014).

The transformative potential of the 4IR calls for increased interdisciplinary collaboration among educators, policymakers, technologists, and industry stakeholders. The literature suggests that fostering meaningful collaborations can enhance the development of adaptive educational strategies that align with the rapidly changing landscape of the 4IR. Integrating diverse perspectives can contribute to creating comprehensive educational frameworks that prepare learners for the multifaceted challenges of the digital era (Penprase, 2018).

In summary, the literature review at the intersection of the Fourth Industrial Revolution (4IR) and educational transformation has uncovered pivotal insights that underscore the profound impact of technological advancements on the educational landscape. The synthesis of diverse scholarly works has elucidated a multifaceted narrative, bringing to light themes such as the evolving skill demands in the workforce, the imperative for interdisciplinary approaches, and the ethical considerations associated with integrating 4IR technologies in education. This comprehensive examination has painted a nuanced picture of the challenges and opportunities presented by the 4IR in shaping the future of learning.

The contributions of this literature review to the broader field of educational research are significant. It provides a comprehensive understanding of the intricate dynamics of preparing learners for the 4IR. By emphasizing competencies beyond technical proficiency, such as critical thinking and adaptability, the review advocates for a holistic educational response. The insights gained from the

literature guide educators, policymakers, and researchers in navigating the complexities of educational transformation amidst the rapidly evolving technological landscape.

Moreover, the literature review contributes to ongoing debates within the field. It highlights potential disparities in the impact of 4IR technologies, prompting a nuanced exploration of contextual factors that mediate educational outcomes. The ethical considerations highlighted the importance of fostering responsible digital citizenship and ethical awareness among learners. Acknowledging and analyzing these debates, the literature review enriches the discourse on ethical and equitable educational practices in the 4IR era.

This literature review is a foundational resource in the broader landscape of educational research. It informs future inquiries into the transformative dynamics between 4IR and education, offering a roadmap for researchers to explore emerging themes, delve deeper into existing debates, and test theoretical frameworks. The synthesized insights contribute to developing informed strategies for educators and policymakers grappling with the evolving learning landscape in the digital age.

As we transition from the literature review to the specific methodology employed in this study, the groundwork laid by the comprehensive review becomes instrumental. The nuanced understanding of existing research gaps, thematic patterns, and theoretical frameworks gleaned from the literature review shapes the specific approach and focus of the upcoming study. The research methodology is designed to build upon the foundation laid by the literature, providing a systematic exploration of the nuanced interactions between 4IR technologies and educational paradigms. The study aims to contribute to the ongoing discourse on educational transformation in the 4IR era through an integrative approach.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, this review significantly contributes to understanding the transformation of education amid the power of 4IR. It informs educators, policymakers, and researchers about adjusting the educational paradigm to meet the challenges and opportunities of automation and AI. This study implies that this interdisciplinary exploration investigates the metamorphosis of learning ecosystems in response to the influence of the Fourth Industrial Revolution (4IR) in automation and artificial intelligence (AI). This study has the effect of major changes that characterize the educational landscape, adapting to the transformative power of technological progress so that it can make it easier for users later. During this time, there has been a fundamental shift in how production and global supply networks operate through continuous automation of traditional manufacturing and industrial

practices using modern intelligent technologies. This integration results in increased automation, improved communication, self-monitoring, and smart machines that can analyze.

REFERENCES

- Allioui, H., & Mourdi, Y. (2023). Exploring The Full Potentials Of IoT for Better Financial Growth And Stability: A Comprehensive Survey. *Sensors*, 23(19), 8015.
- Aslan, A. (2023). KURIKULUM PENDIDIKAN AGAMA ISLAM DI SEKOLAH DASAR. *JURNAL PENDIDIKAN DAN KEGURUAN*, 1(1), Article 1.
- Aslan, A., & Pong, K. S. (2023). Understanding The Trend Of Digital Da'wah Among Muslim Housewives In Indonesia. *Fikroh: Jurnal Pemikiran Dan Pendidikan Islam*, 16(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.37812/fikroh.v16i1.681>
- Aslan, A., & Shiong, P. K. (2023). Learning In The Digital Age Full Of Hedonistic Cultural Values Among Elementary School Students. *Bulletin Of Pedagogical Research*, 3(2), 94. <https://doi.org/10.51278/bpr.v3i2.515>
- Astuti, S. E. P., Aslan, A., & Parni, P. (2023). OPTIMALISASI PERAN GURU DALAM PROSES PEMBELAJARAN KURIKULUM 2013 DI MADRASAH IBTIDAIYAH SWASTA. *SITTAH: Journal Of Primary Education*, 4(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.30762/sittah.v4i1.963>
- Ball, S. J. (2021). *The Education Debate*. Policy Press.
- Boell, S. K., & Cecez-Kecmanovic, D. (2014). A Hermeneutic Approach For Conducting Literature Reviews And Literature Searches. *Communications Of The Association For Information Systems*, 34(1), 12.
- Brett, J. O., Staniszewska, S., Mockford, C., Herron-Marx, S., Hughes, J., Tysall, C., & Suleman, R. (2014). Mapping The Impact Of Patient And Public Involvement On Health And Social Care Research: A Systematic Review. *Health Expectations*, 17(5), 637-650.
- Bygstad, B., Øvrelid, E., Ludvigsen, S., & Dæhlen, M. (2022). From Dual Digitalization To Digital Learning Space: Exploring The Digital Transformation Of Higher Education. *Computers & Education*, 182, 104463.
- Cárdenas-Robledo, L. A., & Peña-Ayala, A. (2018). Ubiquitous Learning: A Systematic Review. *Telematics And Informatics*, 35(5), 1097-1132.
- Cheon, B. K., Melani, I., & Hong, Y. Y. (2020). How USA-Centric Is Psychology? An Archival Study Of Implicit Assumptions Of Generalizability Of Findings To Human Nature Based On Origins Of Study Samples. *Social Psychological And Personality Science*, 11(7), 928-937.

- English, L. D., & Kirshner, D. (2015). 1W Changing Agendas In International Research In Mathematics Education. *Handbook Of International Research In Mathematics Education*, 1.
- Erwan, E., Aslan, A., & Asyura, M. (2023). INTERNALISASI BUDAYA RELIGIUS OLEH GURU AKIDAH AKHLAK UNTUK MENUMBUHKAN SIKAP AKHLAK MULIA DI MIS BINA DHARMA PARIT RABU. *JURNAL PENDIDIKAN DAN KEGURUAN*, 1(6), Article 6.
- Gupta, P., Chauhan, S., Paul, J., & Jaiswal, M. P. (2020). Social Entrepreneurship Research: A Review And Future Research Agenda. *Journal Of Business Research*, 113, 209-229.
- Haddar, G. A., Haerudin, H., Riyanto, A., Syakhrani, A. W., & Aslan, A. (2023). THE REVOLUTION OF ISLAMIC EDUCATION THOUGHT IN THE ERA OF SOCIETY 5.0: CORRECTIONS AND ANALYSIS OF STUDIES IN ISLAMIC HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS IN SOUTH KALIMANTAN—*International Journal Of Teaching And Learning*, 1(4), Article 4.
- Hair Jr, J., Page, M., & Brunsveld, N. (2019). *Essentials Of Business Research Methods*. Routledge.
- Kruger, S., & Steyn, A. A. (2024). Developing Breakthrough Innovation Capabilities In University Ecosystems: A Case Study From South Africa. *Technological Forecasting And Social Change*, 198, 123002.
- Kunduru, A. R. (2023). Machine Learning In Drug Discovery: A Comprehensive Analysis Of Applications, Challenges, And Future Directions. *International Journal On Orange Technologies*, 5(8), 29-37.
- Lee, M., Yun, J. J., Pyka, A., Won, D., Kodama, F., Schiuma, G., ... & Zhao, X. (2018). How Do We Respond To The Fourth Industrial Revolution Or The Second Information Technology Revolution? Dynamic New Combinations Between Technology, Market, And Society Through Open Innovation. *Journal Of Open Innovation: Technology, Market, And Complexity*, 4(3), 21.
- Lockwood, C., Munn, Z., & Porritt, K. (2015). Qualitative Research Synthesis: Methodological Guidance For Systematic Reviewers Utilizing Meta-Aggregation. *JBI Evidence Implementation*, 13(3), 179-187.
- Lubinga, S., Maramura, T. C., & Masiya, T. (2023). The Fourth Industrial Revolution Adoption: Challenges In South African Higher Education Institutions. *Journal Of Culture And Values In Education*, 6(2), 1-17.
- Manda, M. I., & Ben Dhaou, S. (2019, April). We Are Responding To The Challenges And Opportunities In The 4th Industrial Revolution In Developing Countries. In *Proceedings Of The 12th International Conference On Theory And Practice Of Electronic Governance* (Pp. 244-253).
- Miller, R., Liu, K., & Ball, A. F. (2020). Critical Counter-Narrative As A Transformative

Methodology For Educational Equity. *Review Of Research In Education*, 44(1), 269-300.

- Mouza, C., Karchmer-Klein, R., Nandakumar, R., Ozden, S. Y., & Hu, L. (2014). Investigating The Impact Of An Integrated Approach On Developing Preservice Teachers' Technological Pedagogical Content Knowledge (TPACK). *Computers & Education*, 71, 206-221.
- Muharrom, M., Aslan, A., & Jaelani, J. (2023). IMPLEMENTASI KURIKULUM MERDEKA BELAJAR PADA PEMBELAJARAN PENDIDIKAN AGAMA ISLAM DI SMK PUSAT KEUNGGULAN SMK MUHAMMADIYAH SINTANG. *Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Dan Kearifan Lokal*, 3(1), Article 1.
- Mukeredzi, T. G., & Mandrona, A. R. (2013). The Journey To Becoming Professionals: Student Teachers' Experiences Of Teaching Practice In A Rural South Africa. *International Journal Of Educational Research*, 62, 141-151.
- Nurdiana, R., Effendi, M. N., Ningsih, K. P., Abda, M. I., & Aslan, A. (2023). COLLABORATIVE PARTNERSHIPS FOR DIGITAL EDUCATION TO IMPROVE STUDENTS' LEARNING ACHIEVEMENT AT THE INSTITUTE OF ISLAMIC RELIGION OF SULTAN MUHAMMAD SYAFI UDDIN SAMBAS, INDONESIA. *International Journal Of Teaching And Learning*, 1(1), Article 1.
- Nurhayati, N., Aslan, A., & Susilawati, S. (2023). PENGGUNAAN TEKNOLOGI GADGET SEBAGAI MEDIA PEMBELAJARAN PADA ANAK USIA DINI DI RAUDHATUL ATFHAL AL-IKHLAS KOTA SINGKAWANG. *JIP: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 1(3), Article 3.
- Oke, A., & Fernandes, F. A. P. (2020). Innovations In Teaching And Learning: Exploring The Perceptions Of The Education Sector On The Fourth Industrial Revolution (4IR). *Journal Of Open Innovation: Technology, Market, And Complexity*, 6(2), 31.
- Okoli, C. (2015). A Guide To Conducting A Standalone Systematic Literature Review. *Communications Of The Association For Information Systems*, 37.
- Pansara, R. (2023). From Fields To Factories: A Technological Odyssey In Agtech And Manufacturing. *International Journal Of Management Education For Sustainable Development*, 6(6), 1-12.
- Penprase, B. E. (2018). The Fourth Industrial Revolution And Higher Education. *Higher Education In The Era Of The Fourth Industrial Revolution*, 10(1), 978-981.
- Robbins, P. (2019). *Political Ecology: A Critical Introduction*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Sarmila, U., Aslan, A., & Astaman, A. (2023). THE ROLE OF PARENTS TOWARDS YOUTUBE USERS IN BUILDING CHILDREN'S RELIGIOUS BEHAVIOR IN KUALA PANGKALAN KERAMAT VILLAGE. *Archipelago Journal Of Southeast Asia Islamic Studies (AJSAIS)*, 1(2), Article 2.

- Schilke, O., Hu, S., & Helfat, C. E. (2018). Quo Vadis, Dynamic Capabilities? A Content-Analytic Review Of The Current State Of Knowledge And Recommendations For Future Research. *Academy Of Management Annals*, 12(1), 390-439.
- Snyder, H. (2019). Literature Review As A Research Methodology: An Overview And Guidelines. *Journal Of Business Research*, 104, 333-339.
- Sulastri, S., Aslan, A., & Rathomi, A. (2023). STRATEGI GURU PENDIDIKAN AGAMA ISLAM DALAM PENYAMPAIAN MATERI PADA ANAK TUNAGRAHITA DI SEKOLAH LUAR BIASA NEGERI SAMBAS TAHUN PELAJARAN 2022/2023. *Lunggi Journal: Literasi Unggulan Ilmiah Multidisipliner*, 1(4), Article 4.
- Tricco, A. C., Soobiah, C., Antony, J., Cogo, E., Macdonald, H., Lillie, E., ... & Kastner, M. (2016). A Scoping Review Identifies Multiple Emerging Knowledge Synthesis Methods, But Only Some Studies Operationalize The Method. *Journal Of Clinical Epidemiology*, 73, 19-28.
- Tubagus, M., Haerudin, H., Fathurohman, A., Adiyono, A., & Aslan, A. (2023). THE IMPACT OF TECHNOLOGY ON ISLAMIC PESANTREN EDUCATION AND THE LEARNING OUTCOMES OF SANTRI: NEW TRENDS AND POSSIBILITIES. *Indonesian Journal Of Education (INJOE)*, 3(3), Article 3.
- Tuhuteru, L., Misnawati, D., Aslan, A., Taufiqoh, Z., & Imelda, I. (2023). The Effectiveness Of Multimedia-Based Learning To Accelerate Learning After The Pandemic At The Basic Education Level. *Takfir: Interdisciplinary Journal Of Islamic Education*, 4(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v4i1.311>
- Van Dinter, R., Tekinerdogan, B., & Catal, C. (2021). Automation Of Systematic Literature Reviews: A Systematic Literature Review. *Information And Software Technology*, 136, 106589.
- Wessels, L. (2020). *How South African Universities Can Contribute To Preparing The Future Workforce For The Fourth Industrial Revolution* (Doctoral Dissertation, Stellenbosch: Stellenbosch University).