

# WestminsterResearch

http://www.westminster.ac.uk/westminsterresearch

'Self-surveillance practices of factory women migrant workers receiving SRH interventions in Malaysia: The effects of salience, gendered subjectivity and universalism'

Freeman, T., Miles, L. and Ying, K.

This is a copy of the accepted author manuscript of the following article: Freeman, T., Miles, L. and Ying, K. 2023. 'Self-surveillance practices of factory women migrant workers receiving SRH interventions in Malaysia: The effects of salience, gendered subjectivity and universalism'. Economic and Industrial Democracy. The final definitive version will be available from the publisher Sage at:

https://uk.sagepub.com/en-gb/eur/journal/economic-and-industrial-dem...

# © The Author(s) 2023

The WestminsterResearch online digital archive at the University of Westminster aims to make the research output of the University available to a wider audience. Copyright and Moral Rights remain with the authors and/or copyright owners.

'Self-surveillance practices of factory women migrant workers receiving SRH interventions in Malaysia: The effects of salience, gendered subjectivity and universalism'

Author 1: Professor Tim Freeman\* ORCiD: 0000-0002-9317-811X

Middlesex University Business School, The Burroughs, Hendon, London NW4 4BT

Tel: (0) +44 (0)20 8411 5750 Email: <u>t.freeman@mdx.ac.uk</u>

Author 2: Professor Lilian Miles ORCiD: 0000-0001-7224-757X

School of Organisations, Economy and Society, Westminster Business School, University of Westminster, 35 Marylebone Road, London NW1 5LS

Tel: +44 (0)20 8411 4584 Email: <u>l.miles@westminster.ac.uk</u>

Author 3: Mr. Kelvin Ying

PhD Candidate / Research Assistant

School of Health Sciences, Universiti Sains Malaysia (USM)

Tel: +60 17 567 1224 email: klvnying@gmail.com

Self-surveillance practices of factory women migrant workers receiving SRH interventions in Malaysia: The effects of salience, gendered subjectivity and universalism

#### **Abstract**

Managing sexual and reproductive health (SRH) needs remains a challenge for many women migrant workers in developing countries. Nonetheless, the extent to which they can be supported in meeting these needs remains underexplored, with implications for worker health and working life. Drawing on semi-structured interviews with 25 factory women migrant workers in Penang, Malaysia, we apply a Foucauldian lens of governmentality to explore directly their agency in managing their SRH. We consider the self-surveillance practices they adopt in response to a programme of SRH interventions. Our findings reveal varied degrees of compliance with programme expectations. We demonstrate empirically the importance of the perceived salience of SRH as a motive force in self-surveillance practices, drawing out the disempowering effects of self-consciousness and shame in gendered subjectivity. We further consider the impact of universalist prescriptions for SRH within locales in the developing world, and the implications for SRH interventions with factory women migrant workers in such settings.

Key Words: governmentality, self-surveillance, SRH, women migrant workers

#### Introduction

Rapidly changing social and economic conditions in global labour markets have encouraged increasing levels of migration as individuals seek better employment prospects outside their home countries. This is particularly evident within South East Asia. In 2019, it was estimated that Intra-regional migrants made up over 92% of the migrant population in the region (Capaldi, 2023). Women's migration has far reaching implications for their health, including sexual and reproductive health (SRH). The extent to which women migrant workers in these countries are able to manage their SRH needs is an important one. We draw attention to the challenges that they face in managing their SRH below. An equally important question is the

extent to which they and their advocates are able to influence workplace practice to support these needs. What would interventions or practices to support their SRH needs look like? Development initiatives are an important vector for global reproductive health rights. Yet, the priorities embedded in them have long been determined within developed settings (Alfonso & Korten, 1981), reflecting universalist, global aspirations. Programmes informed by SDGs thus frame 'appropriate' and 'modern' SRH practices (Ginsburg & Rapp, 1995), promoting a standardised model. Abstracted from socioeconomic, political and cultural contexts and realities in the developing world, the unintended consequences of such programmes may reinforce existing inequalities (Chan, 2022). All programmes require local enactment, their effects a function of the agency of those involved. Evidence of the unintended consequences of SRH programme implementation in fertility (Maternowska, 2006) and reproductive health (Smith-Oka, 2009) signal the importance of local contours in programme design and delivery (Chan, 2022). It is important that the socio-cultural contexts which shape women's SRH practices are considered, to ensure that services are designed to be both safe and accessible (Metusela et al, 2017; Agu et al, 2016). Smith-Oka (2009) provides valuable insights into instantiation processes in the context of SRH programmes, exploring ethnographically the inscription on indigenous women's bodies of population-based SRH policies in Mexico. Tracing the interplay between population policies, development programmes and medical practitioners, her analysis reveals the choices and strategies adopted by women in the face of institutional constraint. Her sensitive ethnography draws attention to the dynamics between local religious and social identities which may preclude programme adoption (Manderson & Whiteford, 2000), or the creation of moral selves congruent with programme expectations (Laveaga, 2007).

In this paper, we apply these concerns related to identity and creation of moral selves to the experience of factory women migrant workers in Malaysia in receipt of SRH interventions informed by international SHR standards.

Women migrant workers form a large social group within ASEAN. Of the 10.1 million international migrants living in ASEAN's net destination countries, 7.1 million are intra-ASEAN migrants. Women make up 48 per cent of intra-ASEAN migrant workers, an increase of 2 per cent from three decades ago. (The ASEAN, 2022). The challenges facing women migrant workers in managing SRH within ASEAN are well documented. Within South East Asia, the evidence suggests that these needs remain unmet; women migrant workers contend with many barriers preventing access to SRH care and support in their host countries. In Thailand, migrant workers exhibit lower levels of knowledge) of SRH than local workers, likely to cause reproductive health problems in society (Khamthanet & Suthutvoravut, 2020). Women migrant workers in Industrial Zones (IZs) in Vietnam experienced barriers when attempting to access SRH services, including inconvenient clinic opening times, distance of clinic from work location, and prohibitive cost (Ha et al, 2023). Female migrant workers in Cambodia are reluctant to use modern contraception methods, incurring higher risks of unwanted pregnancies; resulting in a need for comprehensive abortion care and contraceptive counselling (Masuda et al, 2020). In Laos, young, female migrant beer promoters seldom use contraception, deferring to their male partners preference to not using condoms. They are often also subject to sexual harassment within this sexualised environment. Poor contraceptive practices result in STIs and unwanted pregnancies (Sychareun et al., 2022). Yet, little remains known about the long-term health needs of temporary migrant workers in East and Southeast Asia (Turnbull et al., 2023). Elsewhere, research is only beginning to uncover ways in which workplace hazards within the oil, gas and mining industry (Razafimahefa et al, 2022) and manufacturing sector (Patangia et al, 2023) affect women's SRH.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Migration data in ASEAN is, however, notoriously unreliable, even for documented workers. It is almost impossible to estimate numbers of undocumented migrant workers, and significant fieldwork is necessary to produce better estimates. The International Labour Organization 'Measuring Labour Migration in ASEAN' Report (2022) recently drew attention the fact that more accurate data around labour migration trends with ASEAN is required, identifying a need for "ongoing coordination, data sharing and transparency among Member States".

Malaysia offers a unique site for our investigation for two reasons. First, it is one of the largest migrant-receiving country in South East Asia, where they provide cheap labour in manufacturing, hospitality and construction (IoM). The significant proportion of its migrant workers are from Indonesia and Bangladesh, but also from the Philippines, Myanmar and Vietnam. The women in our study are from Indonesia and Vietnam. Second, the dominant religion in the country, shared by many migrant workers from Indonesia, creates a particular moral context that may militate against effective SRH initiatives. Indeed, within Malaysia disciplinary discourses of ethnicity and sexuality underpin national migration narratives – and migrants must negotiate these discourses in order to resist the bodily inscriptions to which they are subjected (Hilsdon & Giridharan, 2008). Women migrant workers' SRH needs in Malaysia are severely neglected in policy and practice (Loganathan et al., 2020a; Miles et al, 2022). Their cultural diversity, and the institutional contexts within which they are embedded, require sensitivity in addressing their SRH needs (Devadason & Meng (2014). Adoption of the analytic lens of governmentality (Foucault, 2007) enables us to consider the extent to which their agentic responses were informed by processes of regulation and power / knowledge nexus in context. Such analysis draws attention to the extent to which women engaged with the interventions in the manner intended, and the motive force behind their self-surveillance practices. Considerations of the degree of the women's engagement in such initiatives are crucial for researchers interested in improving their quality of working life. How advocates (e.g. NGOs, unions) can exercise influence to accommodate women migrant workers' SRH needs is also a critical concern (Miles et al, 2022). We explore empirically the extent to which an intervention designed to extend influence over the workplace to enhance SRH care was able to do so, drawing attention to the choices exercised by programme recipients.

#### Governmentality: regulatory power and surveillance

Foucault rejects the idea that power is wielded through domination, instead framing power as dispersed and pervasive within modern society. He observed that the surveillance

systems of prisons, mental hospitals and schools, were not rooted in force or violence - on the contrary, those subject to these institutions undertook it upon themselves to behave in expected ways (Foucault, 1980b). A central concern here is the notion of a subject constituted by exposure to surveillance, the normalising expectations of behaviour and disciplinary regimes (Foucault, 1979). Regulatory power provides an efficient means of control, extending pervasive influence through self-surveillance. It requires discipline (Foucault, 1980a), through which power relations are inscribed on the body.

Foucault introduces the neologism Governmentality to convey the processes by which selfsurveillance operates within governance regimes. Governmentality is generative, to the extent that it creates subjects who freely choose to comply with requirements, removing the need for compulsion. Governmentality thus relies on self-surveillance by the subject (Fleming & Spicer, 2014), such that personal ambition is shaped to be consistent with external requirements. At its core, governmentality consists of three interrelated processes (Foucault, 2007). The first requires creation of a series of 'taken-for-granted' practices; an amalgam of existing procedures and expectations together with reflections on their value and use. Such practices are thus culturally situated and not simply 'invented' out of nothing (Foucault, 1997). The second process concerns the use of knowledge within a powerknowledge nexus comprised of actors within state and professional institutions. The third and final process concerns development of technologies of the self which constitute the personal identities of the governed (Foucault, 1982). This draws attention to the active construction of 'selves' by actors – an endeavour in which agents become 'entrepreneurs of their selves' (Cooper, 2015). Governmentality operates in the interplay between the three processes above, binding the ambitions, projects and creativity of agents to institutional requirements (Clegg, 2019).

# Limitations of governmentality – the role of emotion / affect in self-surveillance

Foucault's abstract formulation of the subject is curiously silent on the nature of disciplinary practices which produce gendered subjects (Bartky, 1988). It lacks consideration of what

women feel about such norms; the extent to which self-surveillance and normalisation processes are experienced as differentiated rather than totalising; and the degree to which women are docile or active in relation to discipline (Deveaux, 1994).

Such abstraction of (de-gendered) agents in networks of power relations fails to adequately theorise women's internal, subjective experience of power (Held, 1991). Such experiences may manifest in the disempowering effects of self-consciousness, shame and / or unreciprocated emotional care (Bartky, 1991) - the experience of which is gendered. Foucault's failure to consider such internal obstacles to agency thus offers an inadequate model of female agency (McNay, 1991; Deveaux, 1994). Any adequate feminist analysis requires due consideration of women's subjective experience of power, informed by dynamics of self-actualisation, to explore possibilities for resistance and change through individual and collective endeavour.

Below, we outline the three interrelated processes of governance in the context of SRH interventions with women migrant workers in Malaysia i.e. the 'taken-for-granted' amalgam of existing procedures and expectations; the contested power–knowledge nexus of actors within state and professional institutions; and the technologies of the self which constitute the personal identities of the governed. We explore the first two processes by drawing on political economy, health care and feminist literatures, and policy documents. We explore the third process empirically, in an original qualitative analysis of narratives in interview data with women migrant workers in receipt of a suite of SRH interventions detailed below. We explore the subjectivities revealed in their narratives, in the context of the SRH governance systems within which they are embedded.

# Existing procedures and expectations

Malaysia's migration regime is intolerant of the SRH needs of women migrant workers (Loganathan et al., 2020a). These women are subject to two phases of health screening to certify that they are healthy and free from dangerous or contagious diseases prior to

employment. Pregnancy is a breach of work permit conditions, rendering them liable to deportation (Immigration Department of Malaysia, 2021). Employers are legally required to report pregnancies to the government. In many cases, women migrant workers who become pregnant run away and become undocumented (Loganathan et al., 2020b). Others resort to dangerous means of terminating their pregnancies (Loganathan et al., 2020a).

Women migrant workers lack access to SRH care. The high cost of health care, inconvenient location of health institutions, and discrimination by healthcare providers against migrants, all reduce the ability of women migrant workers to manage their health needs. Language barriers discouraged access to healthcare. Migrant populations are thus unreached by national SRH programmes (Lasimbang et al, 2016; Loganathan et al, 2020a). Tan (2020, p. 611) recently noted that in Malaysia, care was unambiguously delimited by nationality. Access to care by foreign workers and refugees was a risk, leading to arrest, either for being illegal or for being unable to pay medical bills.

Secondly, access to several SRH services remain a low priority in Malaysia's universal health coverage plans. The level and extent of prioritisation is influenced by its socio-cultural and religious norms (Lim et al, 2020). These values dictate that SRH is taboo and shameful, and set moral injunctions on behaviours considered acceptable. Sexual relations before marriage is considered unacceptable, and unmarried women and young women who fall pregnant face barriers in accessing pregnancy and safe delivery services (Huang & Lim, 2018). Social cultural norms which regard abortion as immoral affects the decision making of medical practitioners (Huang et al, 2013). It is argued that expanding SRH rights to women requires more than simply technically expanding access to these services; a move from a technical, to an empowering approach that addresses patriarchy and heteronormativity, is required (Sciortino, 2020).

These values and practices run counter to those encoded within international SRH standards, which place SRH rights at the heart of development. International SRH standards prescribe that, at a minimum, women will be able to access SRH information; access

affordable and acceptable contraception methods of their choice; be empowered to protect themselves from STIs; and have the right to make informed choices about their SRH (Table 1).

### Power-knowledge nexus of actors within state and professional institutions

The second process concerns the use of knowledge by actors within state and professional institutions within a power–knowledge nexus. This process mediates between regulatory requirements, and the self-regulation of individuals subject to such regulation.

Clinical knowledge is embedded in power relations. In Malaysia, one important group of actors are those clinicians who administer tests which verify the SRH status of women migrant workers on behalf of the government. The Foreign Workers' Medical Examination Screening System ("FOMEMA"), a company appointed on behalf of the Ministry of Health screens women migrant workers for multiple conditions, including HIV, syphilis, breast abnormalities / swelling, malaria, tuberculosis and pregnancies (FOMEMA, 2023). Failure of screening tests results in deportation, and those who pass are re-screened each year for the first 3 years of their stay, then every alternate year up to a maximum of ten years. Also, clinical services may be denied to women migrant workers who often cannot afford the full cost of health care. Although they may rely on the mandatory 'SPIKPA' Foreign Worker's Health Insurance Protection Scheme which covers some medical costs, such cover is limited (Lim et al., 2020). Factory clinic staff, as well as off-site hospital staff, are required to report pregnancies and other SRH conditions which affect the ability of women migrant workers to work (Loganathan et al., 2020a). Unfitness to work renders women migrant workers liable to deportation. It is also well documented that hospital staff may discriminate against migrants by withholding services (Loganathan et al, 2019).

Conservative cultural and / or religious mores related to SRH and embedded within patriarchal values may be upheld - including by women migrant workers themselves.

Women migrant workers subscribing to conservative values may report others who are

pregnant, as extra-marital sex transgresses such mores. In this way, unmarried women may be 'policed' by their married counterparts, older women exerting moral authority over younger women. Shell-Duncan et al, (2018) demonstrate how older women are steadfast guardians of adition, using their power to perpetuate the tradition of FGM/C in Senegambia and resisting those who challenge the practice.

A final group of actors are the representatives of NGOs, who organise and deliver services congruent with international SRH standards. They do so in an environment inimical to women migrant workers' SRH needs. Many have collaborated to lobby the government to change laws and protect the SRH needs of migrant workers in the country. Prominent NGOs include the Reproductive Rights Advocacy Alliance Malaysia (RRAAM), Asian-Pacific Resource and Research Centre for Women (ARROW), and Penang Family Health Development Association (FHDA). Collectively, these actors make a strong moral case for SRH self-actualisation, running counter to the moral agency implied in conservative sociocultural and religious norms.

# Technologies of the self

The third and final process concerns active construction of selves by actors, in dynamic relation to both existing procedures and expectations, and the power-knowledge nexus of actors within state and professional institutions. This is a creative and generative process, in which actors are 'entrepreneurs of their selves' (Cooper, 2015). We explore these dynamic constructions through analysis of narratives within semi-structured interviews with women migrant workers in receipt of a suite of SRH interventions, presented below.

#### Methodology

The data here reported were collected as part of a research study funded under the British Council Newton Fund Impact Scheme (grant #536753284) in which we implemented three interventions in two factory sites to support the SRH needs of women migrant workers. Our

interventions were informed by a prior literature review, identifying education, access to health care and counselling and support services as critical in supporting these needs. Our interventions comprised education on reproductive hygiene, anatomy, contraception, urinary tract infections, and menstruation; a mobile clinic operating as a well-women clinic offering blood tests, pap smears and general information on SRH; and a counselling and referral service for more complex SRH conditions through the medium of 'Facebook' and a hotline number. Our analysis draws on 25 interviews with women migrant workers in the factories. They are documented workers, authorised to enter the country and engage in paid work. Data were collected between October 2021 and January 2022.

Women migrant workers were selected by collaborating factories to participate in the interventions, or else volunteered to do so. The two participating factories are from the electronics assembly sector within Penang, Malaysia, which is heavily reliant on migrant labour. In both factories, women migrant workers comprised at least 50% of the workforce. We secured full co-operation of two factory sites by working closely with factory HR personnel.

Women migrant worker interviewees were of Vietnamese or Indonesian heritage, and received a small honorarium. Due to the sensitive nature of the topic, Interviews were conducted only by female members of the research team.

All of the women interviewed had education up to secondary school level. Members of the research team spoke Bahasa Malaysia, a language familiar to the Indonesian women. Interviews with women from Vietnam were conducted in Bahasa Malaysia or English, depending on their preference. Women migrant workers were fully briefed on the purpose of the research and invited to ask questions to clarify their understanding. Interviews were all conducted online, due to Covid-19 restrictions in force at the time. Ethical approval was granted by the ethics committee of one of the authors' University.

The interview schedule included questions on the benefits of each of the interventions; any improvements that women wished to make to them; and what (if any) impact the interventions had on their SRH knowledge, attitudes and / or practice. Interviews were recorded, transcribed and analysed thematically (Braun and Clarke, 2006) to surface narratives related to the 'selves' that they formed in response to the existing procedures and expectations regulating SRH and power–knowledge nexus that they are embedded in. The data are available on reasonable request from the lead author.

# **Findings**

Our findings reveal three narratives drawn on by interviewees in constituting their 'selves' in response to the complex governance environment in which they are embedded:

Progressive; Conservative; and Passive. We elaborate each in turn below, reporting data segments typical within each narrative.

# A: Progressive self

This narrative is consistent with the idealised moral self, envisaged within international SRH standards (Table 1). This includes feeling confident to engage with SRH needs; applying learning to practice; and valuing empowerment for all women.

# (a) Feeling confident to engage with SRH

Women informed by a progressive narrative developed a sense of safety, confidence and trust sufficient to allow them to engage with programme health providers and address their SRH needs. Women appreciated the respect shown to them by the doctors. These interactions led to ongoing contact with health care providers - an important factor in women's ability to manage SRH over time:

'I did not visit any doctor in Malaysia, only in Indonesia [because] I am afraid of how to interact with doctors, are they going to serve me well? Because I am a foreigner.

But now that I have visited [the clinic], the service is very good; the doctor listens to

me and they will give advice. ... They explain, and treat me well. So, I think if I have any health issue, I will just refer back to [them].' [J3(Ai)]

# (b) Applying learning to practice

Women demonstrated a curiosity about SRH which enabled them to change their existing practice. The educational intervention improved knowledge of women's anatomy, the relevance of contraception and the importance of breast self-examination / cervical smears:

'For the education programme, I benefitted a lot from this, especially ways to use condom, breast self-examination ... for my own health. Previously, I had no idea about what was within my body, what was SRH. Now at least I know the shape of my vagina, and how to perform breast self-examination'. [R2(K)]

... you have to use a condom, then throw it away. You can't have [unprotected sex].

Don't get the HIV virus. [J5(F)]

'Before this, I thought the condom is like a dangerous thing ... but after I listened to the lecture, now I know we need to wear it to prevent STIs.' [J6(Ai)]

'I practice breast self-examination once a month, following what was taught by the service provider...' [J5(F)]

'I also experienced the Pap Smear check for the first time, I have never done it before. In the beginning, I was very shy but later I thought I should just do it, so I can get early detection and get treatment.' [R1(F)]

In addition to changes in practice related to their own bodies, women also indicated a new attitude towards their relationships with their partners, including deciding when to have a family, and the unacceptability of sexual coercion:

'Husband and wife are not obliged to have children. When you're married, it's okay if you are not planning to have a child, you are not forced to have a baby.' [J5(F)]

'We must be mutually happy, no coercion. There must be communication with each other, so that the relationship is harmoniously maintained... There is one friend, she was always abused by her partner, so <I> told her how to communicate; before sex, there should be communication, don't let any violence happen... Afterwards, she explained to (her) partner ... In the past month she said that her partner understood, and is no longer forcing her to have sex.' [R4(Z)]

### (c) Valuing empowerment for all women

Interviewees shared their new knowledge with family and friends:

My friend is also Vietnamese. She wasn't sure what a pap smear was so I explained to her. I told her that I wanted to do a pap smear and explained to her what it is about and she agreed to also... [R1(F)]

I told my three [close] friends .... I shared that in having sex, we have to take precaution, and not just jump in and do it, we don't know of any diseases the boy may transmit to your body, so I shared the purpose of condoms. [R7(Z)]

The agency reflected in this narrative enables the accumulation of knowledge and adoption of practices necessary for women to control their fertility, avoid STIs and ensure their continued fitness to work - while simultaneously allowing for sexual expression. The subjectivity reflected in the progressive narrative is consistent with both the ideal self, underpinning SRH standards while at the same time enabling women to comply with migration regime requirements to avoid pregnancy and STIs.

#### **B**: Conservative self

Within this narrative, marriage confers entitlement to specific forms of SRH knowledge and associated practices – an entitlement denied to unmarried women. Our interventions were delivered to mixed groups - of 25 interviewees, three were married, one widowed, and two divorced. As conservative sexual mores ascribe very different expectations of SRH behaviour to married and unmarried women, interventions in which these two groups were combined provided a site in which these expectations unfolded. We consider the behavioural expectations of married and unmarried women in sequence below.

### (a) Behavioural expectations (married women)

Some married interviewees were conservative in their expectations of how women should behave. They drew distinctions between the types of knowledge – and by implication behaviours - considered appropriate for married and unmarried women.

One educational component included discussion of the benefits of contraception and a demonstration of the application of barrier methods on anatomical models. Access to such knowledge was considered taboo for unmarried women by some interviewees. Specifically, objections were raised about unmarried women being in the same class talking about contraceptives. One married interviewee [R3(AK) – see Table 2] stated that:

". ... the doctors show the genitals in explaining how to insert contraceptives into the vagina (female condom) ... That's kind of disgusting right? A little bit shy... if I can suggest maybe a separate program for those who are married and unmarried. Not everyone who joins is married. Not everyone already has a partner."

The implication is that certain types of SRH knowledge are inappropriate for unmarried women. The married interviewee believed that she had a right to police this boundary. This perception arose in the context of cultural beliefs that unmarried women are 'little sisters' i.e. that they are to be protected from engaging in sexual relations until they are married. The inclusion of both married and unmarried women in the same learning environment provided the context for disapproval to arise.

The importance and exclusivity of the marriage bond is such that the invasive nature of pap smears may even be experienced by married women as embarrassing – the body is owned by the husband and not for sharing:

R3(Ak) So, I have a [sexual] relationship just with my husband only, I never see a doctor for a check ... So, I do feel a little embarrassed.

The implication here is that there are limitations to the entitlement afforded to married women. While marriage confers certain privileges in relation to SRH knowledge, marriage also restricts the willingness of married women to share their body with health care providers.

# (b) Behavioural expectations (unmarried women)

Another element of the conservative narrative reflects the reluctance of unmarried women to reveal concerns about their vaginal health to others, as discussion of vaginal health may be interpreted by others as evidence of promiscuity:

'... for example, checking vaginal health ... sometimes there are those women who, sorry to say, aren't married but are sexually active ... these women want health care providers to check their vaginal health, but are embarrassed because [in fact] they are still single, so I'm afraid they did not get themselves checked.' R10(F)

Differences in the perceived relevance of information by marital status were also reflected in the narratives of unmarried women. This may be clearly seen in the following extract, in which R9(Z) – who is 24 and unmarried (Table 2) – explained that lessons about abortion were not relevant to her because unmarried women do not get pregnant:

INTERVIEWER: "But do you know about safe sex? Do you remember? Have you learned any of that knowledge from the program?"

R9(Z): "What knowledge? About the abortion?" "No, it has no relation to me."

R3(AK) – another unmarried participant - noted that unmarried women may be inhibited from asking questions about contraception because they fear that this would be frowned upon as they are unmarried:

R3(AK): '... there are some women who are not married ... they are interested in knowledge about sexual health, but are reluctant to ask questions because they don't want to be judged negatively by their peers, as their peers know they are not married ... those who are strongly religious may also not want to ask such questions until they are married'

To avoid stigma, unmarried women wait for married women to ask the very questions that they themselves want to ask:

R3(AK): .... The unmarried ones are kind of shy, but keep listening, because the married ones dare to speak up. The unmarried ones don't dare to ask, but listened until the end. So, they were able to learn in the end. [unmarried women] ... dare not speak up because they don't want to be judged'.

While the subjectivity reflected in the conservative narrative is congruent with migration regime expectations with regard to avoidance of pregnancy and STIs, it contrasts sharply with the 'empowered woman' envisaged by international SRH standards. The traditional mores embedded within this narrative hamper unmarried women from developing the types of SRH knowledge, attitudes and practices which would empower them in the manner encoded within international standards.

### C: Passive self

A third narrative indicated a passive construction of subjectivity with regard to SRH. This narrative indicates the importance of following directions from authority figures - supervisors,

labour agents<sup>2</sup> and programme service providers. Supervisors and labour agents were responsible for work planning / shift patterns. Without their permission, these women felt that they could not participate in the programme (R4Z):

"[some] supervisors would permit, others, wouldn't." R4(Z):

Even when granted access to the programme, women were unable to engage with the content to draw out meaning for themselves. This runs counter to the model of agency anticipated under international standards – rather, women attended because they were directed to do so by their supervisors, without necessarily understanding the nature of the programme:

### J4(Ai) (Table 2):

The agent told me [ as part of the programme] that we are going to have a check-up at clinic. So, I asked why, because I don't have any health issues ... he told me that we will have an interview with the doctor. That they [the programme providers] are going to teach us something. So, I just agreed.

Once inside the classroom, many women indicated a passive orientation to the educational sessions; not wishing to interrupt the tutors, or inconvenience their peers by taking up time within the session to explore their own questions. Given the narrow window for delivery of the educational component agreed with the factory, women were reluctant to interrupt as they were aware of the time constraints.

<sup>2</sup> Supervisors oversee work patterns for migrant women, drawn from multiple factories, within a specific factory. Labour agents work in parallel with supervisors, allocating women to the factory from a pool of labour.

18

R1(F): We're afraid we might drag their time by asking so many questions. We felt that we might disturb the flow for the others. So, we are a little [nervous]...

INTERVIEWER: So, you do have questions but you are too afraid to ask and that you might take too much of their time?

R1(F) For me, if we keep asking we'll be disturbing.

INTERVIEWER: Disturbing the trainers or the participants?

R1(F): The trainers. Them too including the operators. Their supervisors only let them out for one hour so they can't afford to stay much longer. So, I don't want to be of inconvenience, Disturbing people.

Similar passive behaviours were exhibited within the clinic setting. J9(F) (Table 2) submitted to a blood test. What is striking is her lack of understanding about what the clinic visit was for, what would happen and why the clinic was providing the specific interventions offered. Indeed, she simply accepted the service without question:

J9(F): I didn't know that they were going to take blood... So, I was surprised when they took my blood.

INTERVIEWER: ... you don't like giving blood or were you surprised that the doctor took blood?

J9(F): I was a bit surprised because I thought <clinic name> was simply for a kind of consultation, that we were not going to be examined....

A final element of this narrative concerns those who participated in the interventions, yet were not able to retain or act on information – such that they were unable to change their SRH knowledge, attitudes or practice. Passivity towards the programme is a function of its relative lack of importance compared to the need to make money for transfer remittance.

Any time that is not taken up by work is spent in ways that women choose – and the

programme was not considered important enough compared with the need to sleep, recuperate and socialise:

INTERVIEWER: May I know why you didn't follow the [lesson]?

J3(Ai): Because I don't have time. I am working and I sleep right after coming back from work. I only have one day off a week ... I'm not really interested and because I don't have time too.

Similarly, J2(Ai) indicated study as a competing priority and a factor in limited engagement with the programme:

J2(Ai): T: I felt so tired ... I also need to attend [my own] class right afterward... Just simply because I don't have time. If I got time then I will definitely join it [the programme of interventions]. Because I study and work at the same time so I need to split my time.

The consequences, in terms of engagement and retention of knowledge, were stark. One indicative example shows how low engagement was for such participants:

R4(Z): "I joined 5 [sessions] but I do not remember the titles. Don't remember the kinds of program. The first program, I joined the session, what's the name, gender, is that correct?"

INTERVIEWER: "Gender, yes."

R4(Z): "And then, what else... (laugh) forgot, Miss."

Interviewees drawing on this narrative did not improve their knowledge, attitudes and practices toward SRH - the interventions were not central to their lives. This narrative provides limited scope for agency in relation to SRH- it falls short of international expectations of empowered women taking charge of their SRH.

#### Discussion

Governmentality (Foucault, 2007) hypothesises the active self-governance of subjects through three interlocking processes: existing procedures and expectations; power-knowledge nexus; and self-surveillance through technologies of the self. Our findings reveal three narratives of engagement with, and agentic use of, the SRH interventions provided by the programme. These narratives - identified as 'progressive', 'conservative' and 'passive' - reveal strikingly different orientations to programme interventions and the subjectivities constructed by women (Clegg, 2019). Three important aspects which inform women migrant workers self-surveillance practices related to SRH are contained within these narratives: salience; the role of affect in gendered subjectivity; and the promotion of a universalist 'ideal' moral self within programme design and delivery.

#### Salience

Our findings demonstrate empirically the importance of perceived salience of SRH as a motive force in self-surveillance practices. The three narratives reveal differentiated strategies of self-surveillance, informed by the dynamics operating between procedures and expectations, and knowledge-power nexus. Two of these narratives – progressive and conservative - are clearly related to active self-surveillance with regard to SRH practices. The difference between them is that they are informed by opposing cultural expectations. The third - passive narrative - reveals evidence of agency, but does not indicate active self-regulation with regard to SRH. Self-surveillance is generated in response to incentives encoded within procedures and expectations and the operation of knowledge-power nexus regimes. Implicitly, where such incentives are perceived as weak or irrelevant to the individual agent, self-surveillance will not be undertaken.

The progressive narrative presupposes high salience, in which women manage their SRH concerns proactively, to avoid unwanted pregnancy and reproductive health disease. This

very salience encourages them to undertake the entrepreneurial work on their selves (Cooper, 2015) necessary to comply with the SRH requirements of Malaysia's strict migration regime - revealed most clearly in use of barrier methods of contraception (both pregnancy and STIs render women liable to deportation). This progressive narrative also enables women to meet many of the universalist standards of the idealised empowered woman in terms of avoiding STIs, rejecting sexual coercion, and making choices about their SRH.

The conservative narrative also reflects high salience of SRH. However, this is refracted through a patriarchal lens (Agu, et al, 2016; Metusela et al, 2017; Sciortino, 2020), placing restrictions on who may legitimately access SRH knowledge and practices. The need to secure external approval of one's moral character provides the motive force for self-surveillance. Our findings show an important contour of patriarchal values embedded within the narrative – that SRH is only appropriate for married women. Specifically, married women are afforded entitlement to SRH services, including cervical smears and contraception, and are empowered to ask questions within educational settings. However, such agency is discouraged for unmarried women. Due to the patriarchal value-base, unmarried women proved reticent in engaging with programme interventions, and expressed embarrassment about sexual behaviour before marriage. They also comply with the 'policing' of boundaries of SRH knowledge by married women. For unmarried women, self-surveillance may thus be enforced socially, through self-consciousness (Bartky, 1991) and fear of being seen to transgress mores, leading to guilt and social shaming (Held, 1991).

The conservative narrative enables women to meet the expectations and procedures of the migration regime through two routes. The first of which, abstinence, is open to all. The second route, involving SRH knowledge and practices (e.g. use of contraceptives), is open only to married women – unmarried women are subject to a power-knowledge nexus on the part of those married women who seek to place restrictions on their part. In turn, married

women's own empowerment is circumscribed to the extent that they are bound by patriarchal values inimical to international standards (e.g. sharing the body only with the husband – excluding medical professionals).

The passive narrative is consistent with a subjectivity which does not recognise the salience of SRH. Agency in relation to the SRH programme here is framed broadly in terms of compliance with the requirements of supervisors, labour agents and programme service providers. It reveals an active decision not to engage with the programme in the face of issues accorded greater salience – such as income maximisation, sending remittances home, and even pleasing supervisors. The proximal issues associated with work and its location in the factory and the pressing concerns associated with production targets and continued fitness for work are accorded primacy - the need to attend to their SRH was simply not a priority. On this narrative, women felt no need to become entrepreneurs of their selves (Cooper, 2015) in order to accommodate the demands of procedures and expectations and power-knowledge nexus with regard to SRH. In such circumstances, self-surveillance is considered unnecessary.

The relationship of this passive narrative to Malaysia's strict SRH requirements for migrant workers is ambiguous, in the sense that it does not provide a clear pathway for compliance through either pro-active SRH management or abstinence. Women drawing on this narrative were unable to extract meaning for themselves and did not connect programme content to their lives. They also failed to meet the universalist prescriptions of an 'empowered woman' – such as making choices in relation to their fertility, applying SRH knowledge to their lives, and viewing SRH as a right for all women.

# Gendered subjectivity

Foucault never specifically applied his theory of power to women. Feminist analysis of women's agency, however, requires sensitivity to women's subjective experiences of power,

Feminists argue that women may have a propensity to internalise the belief that they are subordinate to men, entrenching gender inequity by harnessing women's own agency to reproduce inequality through time (Rowlands, 1995; 1997). We see this in the 'passive' narrative where women migrant workers accept - without question - direction from their male supervisors and labour agents. If their supervisors did not permit them to engage with SRH interventions, due to the requirements of shift work, women complied with the direction not to attend [RZ(4)]. Similarly, women who were directed to engage with the interventions complied with the direction, even though they did not understand the nature of the programme [J4(Ai)]. Thus, while technical interventions may improve the availability of SRH care, the gendered and patriarchal norms embedded within these women's lives may continue to limit their autonomy, decision-making power and control over resources (Lim et al, 2020). In order for SRH interventions to be truly transformational, provision needs to be contextualised, challenging such unequal power structures (Sciortino, 2020; Chan, 2022).

Foucault's failure to address directly the role of affect in subjectivity (Bartky, 1988; Held, 1993) is a serious omission. Within the conservative narrative, affect informed agency such that women's self-consciousness and sense of shame may prevent them from engaging with SRH interventions. Indeed, our findings indicate the active and agentic role of other women in 'policing' engagement with SRH interventions. Unmarried women were reluctant to share concerns about their sexual health, and reticent in asking questions in class. They distanced themselves from the interventions, avoiding the stigma and shame associated with transgression of SRH behaviours expected of them. Self-surveillance and normalisation processes were thus differentiated on the basis of marital status, rather than experienced as totalising (Deveaux, 1994). Our findings demonstrate the importance of considering the role of affect in SRH agency - Foucault's failure to do so offers an inadequate model of female agency (McNay, 1991; Rowlands, 1995; 1997).

#### Universalism

Considerable efforts have been expended internationally to secure empowerment for women migrant workers across south east Asia, so that they may confidently and proactively manage their SRH. Many such efforts focus on raising awareness of SRH, and providing women migrant workers access to health care services (Brody et al, 2016; Thein and Thepthien, 2020; Chhoun et al, 2019). Overwhelmingly, interventions reflect universalist aspirations and promote a standardised model (Ginsberg & Rapp, 1995).

While our programme was informed by universalist standards, it was implemented by local NGOs in a culturally sensitive manner. Careful attention was made to the language used, and discussion contextualised within local lifestyles and cultures. The images used were of local people and places and consideration taken of social etiquette, and clinical and medical personnel were women, reflecting cultural preferences (Smith-Oka, 2009; Chan, 2022). Despite these sensitivities, the majority of women within our study remained passive.

A point which invites reflection is the extent to which universalist assumptions are desirable and / or practical in meeting such women's SRH needs – however culturally sensitively they are implemented. In considering the former, our programme logic was that women would regard SRH as an important aspect of their health, and engage with interventions to improve their knowledge, practice and attitudes. Yet, our interview data revealed that some participants challenged universalist global aspirations. Specifically, this related to the composition of groups; married women expressed a preference for group composition to be organised on the basis of marital status, and unmarried women themselves felt uncomfortable engaging in debate with SRH issues such as contraception in a mixed environment.

In considering the latter, the institutional constraints facing women migrant workers are significant. Given the dominant interest of the government in recruiting low-paid labour, worker protection is a secondary consideration. Existing policies are designed to defend

national security rather than protect migrant workers, resulting in weak rights for them (Sok, 2019), including rights to appropriate SRH care (Lasimbang et al, 2016; Loganathan et al, 2020a). Their stay is designed by the state to be temporary and short term, with most workers returning to their home countries upon completion or termination of employment (Anderson & Franck, 2019). Women migrant workers also live in dormitories or housing provided by the company, often located away from urban centres. They may thus be linguistically and socially detached, preventing them from acquiring knowledge of or access to local resources (Anderson & Franck, 2019: 1214). Given their transience, language barriers and exclusion from rights and resources, the extent to which it is practicable for these women to attain the 'idealised empowered' selves anticipated by universalist SRH standards is questionable. The lack of a sympathetic context and the limited resources discourages self-actualising behaviours. More fundamentally still, those whose moral frame of reference rejects universalist assumptions will not engage with programme content.

#### Conclusion

Our primary theoretical contribution is in identifying the importance of perceived salience as the motive force within self-surveillance practices. While salience is implicit within Foucault's formulation of governmentality processes, its role remained underexplored. We draw this out empirically, identifying the conditions required for active self-surveillance on the part of women migrant workers in Malaysia in receipt of SRH interventions. They face significant challenges in managing SRH in a country unsympathetic to their needs. For women's advocates in such contexts, an understanding of salience is vital in ensuring women's engagement with SRH interventions.

Additionally, we empirically assess the importance of affect in gendered subjectivities - specifically, the role of self-consciousness and shame in moderating the SRH self-surveillance practices of these women, and their effects on programme engagement. Our findings concur with feminist frameworks that emphasise the importance of recognising

women's experiences as women. This is underdeveloped within governmentality, but is crucial in understanding the self-surveillance practices of women. These considerations of affect are likely to be highly relevant in other South East Asian countries, given the predominance of patriarchal assumptions about SRH. Some of the barriers to SRH service access experienced by women migrant workers within South East Asia are technical and easily addressed – such as location of services, and prohibitive costs. However, those barriers which are derived from patriarchal assumptions – such as deference to male partners' preference not to use condoms, are more difficult to counter. We encourage careful reflection on the implications for developing SRH interventions within these contexts.

Finally, with regard to universalism, and notwithstanding the emphasis on the importance of cultural sensitivity in SRH interventions within the literature, we found that cultural sensitivity was not sufficient cause to ensure women's engagement with our programme. For many women, institutional constraints informed their value judgements of the practicality of universalist interventions. Our findings suggest that ultimately, the desirability, or otherwise, of such programmes is a function of the extent to which women migrant workers' own moral values accord with the value base inscribed within universalist global aspirations about SRH. This incongruence between competing values poses a serious dilemma for women's advocates in seeking change to workplace practice designed to secure SRH care.

# **Acknowledgements**

The authors would like to thank anonymous reviewers for their constructive comments on the draft of this paper, and also the British Council for their generous funding of the project 'Health Interventions to advance the Sexual and Reproductive Health of Women Migrant Workers in Malaysia' under the Newton Fund Impact Scheme (Grant Number 536753284) on which we draw. A special thanks also to Professor Noraida Endut, Dr Susiana Mat Yasin and Dr Lai Wan Ten for their roles in the funded research project.

#### References

Anderson, JT. & Franck, A. K. (2019) The public and the private in guestworker schemes: examples from Malaysia and the U.S., Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 45:7, 1207-1223

Alfonso, F. B., & Korten, D. C. (Eds.). (1981). Bureaucracy and the poor: Closing the gap. Singapore: McGraw-Hill International for the Asian Institute of Management.

Agu, J., Lobo, R., Crawford, G., & Chigwada, B. (2016). Migrant sexual health help-seeking and experiences of stigmatization and discrimination in Perth, Western Australia: Exploring barriers and enablers. International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health, 13(5), 485

Bartky, S (1988) 'Foucault, Femininity, and the Modernization of Patriarchal Power'. In I. Diamond and Quinby, L. Feminism and Foucault: Reflections on Resistance. Boston:

Northeastern University Press, 63.

Bartky, S. (1991) Shame and Gender. In Feminism and Domination: Studies in the Phenomenology of Oppression. New York and London: Routledge, pp 97 -.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. Qualitative Research in Psychology, 3(2), 77–101. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp0630a">https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp0630a</a>

Brody, C., Dhaliwal, S., Tuot, S., Johnson, M., Pal, K., and Yi, S. (2016). Are text messages a feasible and acceptable way to reach female entertainment workers in Cambodia with health messages? A cross-sectional phone survey. JMIR mHealth and uHealth, 4, e52

Capaldi, M.P. (2023). Present-Day Migration in Southeast Asia: Evolution, Flows and Migration Dynamics. In: Petcharamesree, S., Capaldi, M.P. (eds) Migration in Southeast Asia. IMISCOE Research Series. Springer, Cham

Chhoun, P., Kaplan, K. C., Wieten, C., Jelveh, I., Lienemann, M., Tuot, S. and Brody, C. (2019). Using participatory methods to build an mHealth intervention for female entertainment workers in Cambodia: The development of the Mobile Link project. mHealth, 5, 24.

Chan, IL (2022) Translating international health policies into lived realities: Maternal health, social support programs, and obstetric violence in highland Peru. Women's Studies International Forum https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2022.102600

Clegg, S. (2019). Governmentality. Project management journal, 50, 3, 266-270.

Cooper, C. (2015). Entrepreneurs of the self: The development of management control since 1976. Accounting, Organizations and Society, 47, 14–24.

Deveaux, M. (1994) Feminism and Empowerment: A Critical Reading of Foucault, Feminist Studies, 20, 2, 223-247.

Devadason ES and Meng CW (2014) Policies and Laws Regulating Migrant Workers in Malaysia: A Critical Appraisal. Journal of Contemporary Asia 44(1): 19-35 commenting on the lack of gender sensitive policies to address the needs of women migrant workers p.31).

Fleming, P., and Spicer, A. (2014) Power in Management and Organization Science, The Academy of Management Annals, 8 <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/19416520.2014.875671">https://doi.org/10.1080/19416520.2014.875671</a>

Foreign Workers' Medical Examination. (2023) FOMEMA information. Available at https://www.fomema2u.com.my/fomema-information/

Foucault, M. (1979) Discipline and Punish, trans. Alan Sheridan, New York: Vintage Books, 25.

Foucault, M. (1980a) History of Sexuality, vol. 1, Introduction, trans. Robert Hurley, New York: Vintage Books, 139.

Foucault, M. (1980b) Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977.

C. Gordon (Ed.), New York: Pantheon Books.

Foucault, M. (1982). The subject and power. In H. Dreyfus & P. Rabinow (Eds.), Michel Foucault: Beyond structuralism and hermeneutics (pp. 208–226). Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Foucault, M. (1997). Ethics: Subjectivity and truth. The essential works of Michel Foucault, 1954–1984 (Vol. 1). New York, NY: The New Press.

Foucault, M. (2007). Security, territory, population: Lectures at the Collège de France, 1977-78. Berlin: Springer.

Ginsburg, F. D., & Rapp, R. (Eds.). (1995). Conceiving the new world order: The global politics of reproduction. Berkeley: University of California Press

Ha T, Givens D, Shi H, Nguyen T, Nguyen N, Shrestha R, Frank L, Schensul SL. Assessing Barriers and Utilization of Sexual and Reproductive Health Services among Female Migrant Workers in Vietnam. Int J Environ Res Public Health. 2023 Jul 15;20(14):6368

Held, V. (1991) Feminist morality: Transforming Culture, Society and Politics. Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Hilsdon A-M and Giridharan B (2008) Racialised sexualities: the case of Filipina migrant workers in East Malaysia. Gender, Place and Culture 15(6): 611-628.

Huang MSL & Lim SC. (2018). Overprotected and underserved – the influence of law on young people's access to sexual and reproductive health in Malaysia. International Planned Parenthood Federation – East & South East Asia and Oceania Region (IPPF-ESEAOR)

Huang MSL, Jegasothy R. & Lim SC. (2013). Study of medical doctors' knowledge, attitudes and willingness to provide abortion related services as a reproductive right of women, issues of safe abortions in Malaysia – reproductive rights and choice. United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), Malaysia.

Immigration Department of Malaysia. (2021). Foreign worker. Available at https://www.imi.gov.my/index.php/en/main-services/foreign-worker/

International Labour Organization (2022) Measuring labour migration in ASEAN: Analysis from the ILO's International Labour Migration Statistics (ILMS) Database, available at (<a href="https://www.ilo.org/asia/publications/WCMS\_839321/lang--en/index.htm">https://www.ilo.org/asia/publications/WCMS\_839321/lang--en/index.htm</a> accessed 22 October 2023)

International Organisation for Migration (2023) 'Facts and figures: Malaysia ', available at https://www.iom.int/countries/malaysia accessed 27 October 2023

Khamthanet, R., and Suthutvoravut, S. (2020) "Comparison of Knowledge, Attitude, and Behavior of Reproductive Health Between Thai and Immigrant Women Workers in Factories in Samut Sakhon, Thailand" Ramathibodi Medical Journal, 43, 24-34

Lasimbang, H. B., Tong, W. T., & Low, W. Y. (2016). Migrant workers in Sabah, East Malaysia: The importance of legislation and policy to uphold equity on sexual and reproductive health and rights. Best Practice & Research Clinical Obstetrics & Gynaecology, 32, 113–123.

Laveaga, G.S. (2007) "Let's become fewer": Soap operas, contraception, and nationalizing the Mexican family in an overpopulated world, **4**, 19 https://doi.org/10.1525/srsp.2007.4.3.19 Lim, SC. Yap, YC. Barmania, S. Govender, V. Danhoundo, G. & Remme, M. (2020) Priority-setting to integrate sexual and reproductive health into universal health coverage: the case of Malaysia, Sexual and Reproductive Health Matters, **28**, 2

Loganathan, T., Rui, D., Ng, C. W., Pocock, N.S. (2019) Breaking down the barriers: Understanding migrant workers' access to healthcare in Malaysia. PLoS One, **14**, 7, :e0218669.

Loganathan, T., Chan, Z. de Smalen, A. & Pocock, N. (2020a) Migrant Women's Access to Sexual and Reproductive Health Services in Malaysia: A Qualitative Study. International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health. **17**, 5376

Loganathan T, Rui D, Pocock NS. (2020b) Healthcare for migrant workers in destination countries: a comparative qualitative study of China and Malaysia. BMJ Open. 2020 **10**, 12, :e039800.

McNay, L. (1991) The Foucaultian Body and the Exclusion of Experience, Hypatia 6, p.125 Manderson, L., & Whiteford, L. M. (2000). Introduction: health, globalization, and the fallacy of the level playing field. In L. M. Whiteford, & L. Manderson (Eds.), Global health policy, local realities: The fallacy of the level playing field (pp. 1–19). Boulder: Lynne Rienner Publishers.

Masuda C, Oreglia E, Ly S, McLaren M, Free C, Tijamo C, Ou A, van Velthoven MH, Williamson A, Smith C. (2020) "Family planning practices of women working in the Cambodian garment industry: a qualitative study" Contracept Reprod Med. doi: 10.1186/s40834-020-00116-7. PMID: 32793378; PMCID: PMC7418303.

Maternowska, C. (2006). Reproducing inequities: Poverty and the politics of population in Haiti. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press.

Metusela, C., Ussher, J., Perz, J., Hawkey, A., Morrow, M., Narchal, R., et al. (2017). "In my culture, we don't know anything about that": Sexual and reproductive health of migrant and refugee women", International Journal of Behavioural Medicine, **24**, 836-845.

Patangia, B. Sathiyaseelan, A. Dias, N. Ashwini, M. (2023) "Occupational, environmental and psychosocial factors impacting reproductive health of women working in manufacturing sector in India: a systematic review" Life Research 2023;6(2):7.

https://doi.org/10.53388/LR20230007

Razafimahefa, RH. Pardosi, JF. & Sav, A. (2022) "Occupational Factors Affecting Women Workers' Sexual and Reproductive Health Outcomes in Oil, Gas, and Mining Industry: A Scoping Review" Public Health Review, 43:1604653. doi: 10.3389/phrs.2022.1604653. PMID: 35574566; PMCID: PMC9096608.

Rowlands J (1995) Empowerment examined. Development in Practice **5**, 2, 101–107.

Rowlands J (1997) Questioning Empowerment: Working with Women in Honduras. Oxford:

Oxfam

Sciortino, R. (2020) Sexual and reproductive health and rights for all in Southeast Asia: more than SDGs aspirations. Culture, Health & Sexuality, **22**, 7, 744-761.

Shell-Duncan, B., Moreau, A., Wander, K., Smith, S. (2018) The role of older women in contesting norms associated with female genital mutilation/cutting in Senegambia: A factorial focus group analysis. PLoS One, 13, 7:e0199217.

Smith-Oka, V. (2009) 'Unintended consequences: Exploring the tensions between development programs and indigenous women in Mexico in the context of reproductive health', Social Science and Medicine, **68**, 11, 2069-2077 <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2009.03.026">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2009.03.026</a>

Sok, S. (2019) Challenges and constraints in achieving appropriate working and living conditions for Cambodian temporary migrant workers in Malaysia, South East Asia Research, **27**, 4, 361-377.

Vanphanom Sychareun, Jo Durham, Molina Choummanivong, Chansathit Taikeophithoun, Phouthong Phommavongsa, Vathsana Somphet, Vassana Thammavongsa & Pascale Hancart Petitet (2022) Lifestyles, sexuality and gender: vulnerability to STIs and unplanned pregnancy among female migrant beer promoters in Lao PDR, Culture, Health & Sexuality, 24:8, 1047-1061

Tan Z H (2020) Xenophobic Malaysia, Truly Asia: metonym for the invisible. Inter-Asia Cultural Studies 21(4): 601-613.

The ASEAN (2022) ASEAN Advances Migrant Workers' Rights in the Changing World of Work, at < https://theaseanmagazine.asean.org/article/asean-advances-migrant-workers-rights-in-the-changing-world-of-work/> accessed 26 March 2023

Thein, S. S., and Thepthien, B. O. (2020). Unmet need for family planning among Myanmar migrant women in Bangkok, Thailand, **28**, 182-193

Turnbull M, Ching T and Yu C (2023) Perceptions of health and coping strategies among temporary migrant workers in East and Southeast Asia: a systematic review. International Journal for Equity in Health 22(1): 32 DOI: 10.1186/s12939-023-01840-7)

Table 1: Attributes of women required to obtain good SRH (idealised 'selves')

Nations Planned Health Nations Conference Population Parenthood Organisatio High on Front Federation (UNFPA) (IPPF) Propulation oner for and Refugees Development (UNHCR) (ICPD)  Ability to rate the relative value of different kinds of information  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Ability to apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Ye		United	International	World	United	International
Front (UNFPA) (IPPF) (IPPF) (IVPF) (I		Nations	Planned	Health	Nations	Conference
(UNFPA) (IPPF) oner for Refugees Development (UNHCR) (ICPD)  Ability to rate the relative value of different kinds of information  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Ability to make informed choices  Ability to Yes		Population	Parenthood	Organisatio	High	on
Refugees Development (UNHCR) (ICPD)  Ability to rate Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes  the relative value of different kinds of information  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes  Apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes		Front	Federation	n (WHO)	Commissi	Population
Ability to rate Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes the relative value of different kinds of information  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes About SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes		(UNFPA)	(IPPF)		oner for	and
Ability to rate Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes the relative value of different kinds of information  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes About SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes					Refugees	Development
the relative value of different kinds of information  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes  Make informed choices  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes  Apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes  Tyes Yes Yes Yes					(UNHCR)	(ICPD)
value of different kinds of information  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes make informed choices  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes  Apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes  About SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes	Ability to rate	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
different kinds of information  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes make informed choices  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes to learn about SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes	the relative					
kinds of information  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Make informed choices  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Ability to apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes About SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes	value of					
information  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Make informed choices  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Ability to apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes About SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes	different					
Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Make informed choices  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes About SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes	kinds of					
make informed choices  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes to learn about SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes	information					
informed choices  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes to learn about SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes	Ability to	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
choices  Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes to learn about SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes	make					
Ability to Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes to learn about SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes	informed					
apply SRH knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes to learn about SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes	choices					
knowledge to own life  Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes to learn about SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes  Yes Yes Yes  Yes Yes  Yes	Ability to	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
own life Yes Yes Yes Yes   Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes   to learn about SRH Yes Yes Yes Yes   Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes	apply SRH					
Confidence Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes to learn about SRH Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes	knowledge to					
to learn about SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes	own life					
about SRH  Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes	Confidence	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Autonomy Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes	to learn					
	about SRH					
over their	Autonomy	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
	over their					

own sexual					
lives					
Assertion of	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
SRH as a					
right for all					
women					
Determinatio	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
n to achieve					
a state of					
well-being					
Valuing	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Empowerme					
nt for all					
Proactive in	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
asserting					
own SRH					
rights					

Note: Statements on SRH from each organisation

Table 2: Attributes of women participants in the study

Code	Age	Country	Marital	Years in Malaysia
R1(F)	41	Vietnam	Married	13 to 14
R2(K)	25	Indonesia	Single	7
R3(Ak)	31	Indonesia	Married	6
R4(Z)	42	Indonesia	Widowed	8
R5(F)	25	Indonesia	Single	2.5
R6(Ak)	30	Indonesia	Single	6
R7(Z)	22	Indonesia	Single	2.5
R8(F)	23	Indonesia	Single	4
R9(Z)	24	Indonesia	Single	6
R10(F)	38	Indonesia	Divorced	10
R11(Ak)	26	Vietnam	Single	8
R12(F)	24	Indonesia	Single	6
R13(F)	25	Indonesia	Single	7
R14(Ak)	24	Indonesia	Single	3
R15(F)	26	Indonesia	Single	2
J1(Ai)	24	Indonesia	Single	4
J2(Ai)	20	Indonesia	Single	2 to 3
J3(Ai)	25	Indonesia	Married	3
J4(Ai)	21	Indonesia	Single	3
J5(F)	23	Indonesia	Single	3
J6(Ai)	26	Indonesia	Single	2
J7(F)	20	Indonesia	Single	2
J8(Ai)	22	Indonesia	Single	4
J9(F)	Unknown	Indonesia	Single	Unknown
J10(Ai)	23	Indonesia	Single	5