Complementary therapies in controlling side-effects during cancer

treatment: A systematic review and meta-analysis

Vinicius Teixeira Botelho, Meline Rossetto Kron-Rodrigues, Guilherme Augusto Rago Ferraz, Cassiana Mendes Bertoncello Fontes, Maria Helena Borgato, Antônio Francisco Godinho, Silvana Andrea Molina Lima

Abstract

This systematic review evaluated whether reiki had an impact on patients undergoing chemo-therapy, with possible improvement of the following outcomes: fatigue, pain, anxiety and quality of life. Method: Systematic review study with meta-analysis conducted at a tertiary care center. The following databases were searched until July 2020: MEDLINE, LILACS and CENTRAL. Two re-viewers independently examined eligible articles, extracted data and assessed the risk of bias using the Cochrane tool. Results: The analyzes included eight studies and showed that there was a sta-tistically significant for anxiety control (MD = -2-09; 95% CI: -3.00 to -1.19; I2 = 51%) and Quality of life (MD = -5.97; 95% CI: -10.70 to -1.25; I2 = 97%) but no statistically significant difference was found for the other outcomes analyzed. An analysis of the risk of bias has uncertain methodological limitations in the studies. Conclusions: Although there is anxiety control and improved quality of life, there is a need for the elaboration of randomized clinical trials with larger populations to verify their real performance in controlling some side effects during chemotherapy.

Keywords: Spirituality; Therapeutic Touch; Neoplasms; Complementary therapies

1. Introduction

Cancer is among the diseases that are associated with fear and suffering. People have been trying to deal with cancer for the past decades, but studies show that cancer is still affecting all kind of ages, social background and cultures (MATOURYPOUR ET AL., 2016).

Several treatments are used for cancer, being chemotherapy one of the oldest and most common types, besides radiotherapy, surgery and gene therapy. Chemotherapy is often followed by a number of distressing symptoms, including fatigue, nausea, vomiting, and loss of appetite, as well as behavioral change, i.e. anxiety and depression. Despite the use of medications, patients continue to feel a range of side effects. (LAFRENIERE ET AL., 199; POST-WHITE ET AL., 2013)

Therefore, integrative oncology are seeking for complementary and alternative medi-cine that is divided into five categories to help diminishing the side effects of cancer and conventional cancer therapies (e.g. surgery, chemotherapy, radiotherapy, and molecular therapy): biological based practices: medicinal herbs, vitamins, and dietary supplements; mind-body techniques: yoga; meditation; mindfulness; art, music and dance therapies; body manipulations: massage, reflexology, physical exercises; energy-based therapies: Reiki, healing touch, qigong; and whole systems: traditional Chinese medicine and Ayur-vedic medicine.

These modalities alongside conventional care can be effective and reduce adverse side-effects (LEE,PITTLER, & ERNST 2008; VANDERVAART ET AL., 2009; FERRAZ ET AL., 2017)

Although, there is no scientific based-evidence on complementary therapies efficien-cy, such natural healing has been practiced for millenniums. Those therapeutic ap-proaches are mostly from oriental countries, e.g. India with Ayurvedic therapy; China with acupuncture; and Japan with reiki healing touch.

Whether such therapies are prac-ticed either alone or alongside conventional occidental treatments, it will benefit patient, since has a holistic approach that involves body, mind and soul. Among them, there is meditation, massages, healing touch and other procedures that are within complementary practices, according to the National Centre for Complementary and Alternative Medicine (VITALE, 2007; LEE,PITTLER, & ERNST 2008; VANDERVAART ET AL., 2009; AGHABATI, MOHAMMADI & POUR 2010; FITZHENRY ET AL., 2014; DEMIR ET AL., 2015; TABATABAEE ET AL., 2016; FERRAZ ET AL., 2017 & SUZUKI ET AL 2020).

Reiki comes from Japan, is based in hands-on healing, such term is a combination of two Japanese words: rei, a universal spirit; and ki, life energy (MATOURYPOUR ET AL., 2016). Nowadays, it has been practice all over the world and mostly used for pain relief (VANDERVAART ET AL., 2009). As a holistic approach, it does not only improve the physical being, but also psychological, social and spiritual health (FERRAZ ET AL., 2017).

Previously, a systematic review of clinical trials compared reiki and prayer therapy with the usual care among women undergoing childbirth. Although, the review proved great methodological standards, it also has serious limitations regarding the number of published studies so far (FERRAZ ET AL., 2017).

In this way, the current review is necessary to provide more data on the topic, since literature has shown a few studies reporting that complementary therapies in-creased quality of life of patients undergoing several illnesses (FITZHENRY ET AL., 2014; DEMIR ET AL., 2015; TABATABAEE ET AL., 2016; FERRAZ ET AL., 2017 & SUZUKI ET AL 2020). Moreover, non-pharmacological practices should be taken into consideration to reduce excessive use of allopathic medication in western countries that costs a lot in public health.

Given the above, the aim of this systematic review of randomized controlled trials (RCTs) was to evaluate if reiki is effective for controlling fatigue, pain, anxiety and im-proving quality of life among patients undergoing chemotherapy.

2. Materials and Methods

The Cochrane Handbook for Intervention Reviews (HIGGIN, GREEN; 2011) guided our choice of methods. The reports adhered to the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Me-ta-analysis (PRISMA) (MOHER, LIBERATI, TETZLAFF, ALTMAN, 2009).

2.1 Eligibility criteria

We included RCTs or quasi-RCTs that compared whether reiki or healing touch is effective among patients undergoing chemotherapy, including any of the following out-comes after receiving the intervention or usual care: fatigue, pain, anxiety and quality of life.

2.2 Data source and searches

Pertinent literature was identified through MEDLINE (from 1966 to July 2020); LI-LACS (from 1982 to July 2020); and Cochrane controlled trials (CENTRAL) (up to July 2020), using the terms spirituality, reiki and neoplasm (Fig 1). A review of relevant references in previous systematic review and primary studies was carried out.

Medline via Pubmed #1"Spirituality"[Mesh] OR Spiritualities OR "Reiki"[Mesh] OR "Touch, Therapeutic" OR "Laying on of Hands" OR "Spiritual Healing" [Mesh] OR "Spiritual Therapies" #2 "Neoplasms" [Mesh] OR Benign Neoplasms OR Malignancy OR Neoplasm OR "Neoplasms, Benign" OR "Benign Neoplasm" OR Cancers OR Malignancies OR "Neoplasm, Benign" OR Tumor OR Cancer OR Tumors STRATEGY: #1 AND #2 CENTRAL "Spirituality" OR "Spiritualities" OR "Reiki" OR ("Touch, Therapeutic" OR "Laying on of Hands" OR "Spiritual Healing" OR "Spiritual Therapies") AND Neoplasias OR Câncer OR Cancro OR (Tumor Maligno) OR Neoplasmas OR Tumor OR Tumores OR (Tumores Malignos) OR Neoplasia OR (Neoplasia Benigna) OR (Neoplasia Maligna) OR Malignidade Lilacs Espiritualidade OR Reiki OR (Toque terapêutico) OR (Superposição de mãos) OR (Cura Espiritual) OR (Terapias espirituais) AND Neoplasias OR Câncer OR Cancro OR (Tumor Maligno) OR Neoplasmas OR Tumor OR Tumores OR (Tumores Malignos) OR

Fig. 1 Search strategies for MEDLINE via PUBMED; CENTRAL and LILACS.

Neoplasia OR(Neoplasia Benigna) OR (Neoplasia Maligna) OR Malignidade

2.3 Selection of studies

Randomized controlled trials (RCT) or quasi-RCTs. Two reviewers independently screened all titles and abstracts that were identified through literature search. Moreover, both selected potential studies by analysing full-text articles, according to eligibility criteria. There was no language restriction in the selection of articles.

2.4 Data extraction and risk-of-bias assessment

Two reviewers independently screened all the potential quantitative results or critical data from some preselected studies, regarding participants, interventions, control, outcome measurements, follow-up and results. Subsequently, disagreements between reviewers were discussed with a field supervisor to reach a consensus.

Also, reviewers independently assessed risk of bias by using a version of the Cochrane Collaboration's tool for assessing risk of bias (HIGGIN ET AL., 2011), including nine domains: adequacy of sequence generation; allocation sequence concealment; blinding of participants and caregivers; blinding of data collectors; blinding for outcome assessment; blinding of data analysts; incomplete outcome data; selective outcome reporting; and presence of other potential sources of bias not accounted for in the previously cited domains. When incomplete outcome data was reported, reviewers stipulated that low risk of bias consisted of loss to follow-up of less than 10% and a difference in missing data between the intervention and control groups of less than 5%.

2.5 Data synthesis and statistical analysis

We pooled the data to calculate pooled risk ratios (RRs) or mean differences, with 95% confidence intervals (CIs), using a fixed effect model by considering the last follow-up outcome that had been measured in each study included. Heterogeneity was assessed by means of the I2 statistic. All analyses were performed in the Review Manager software (RevMan) (REVIEW MANAGER, 2014).

3. Results

3.1 Selection of titles

A total of 6,171 titles were identified in the databases cited above, but only 34 studies were selected for detailed evaluation. Ultimately, it was found that only eight studies (POST-WHITE ET AL.,2003;TSANG, CARLSON & OLSON,2007; AGHABATI, MOHAMMADI & POUR 2010; CATLIN & TAYLOR-FORD 2011; FITZHENRY ET AL., 2014; DEMIR ET AL., 2015; ORSAK ET AL., 2015; TABATABAEE ET AL., 2016)

that included 644 patients met eligibility criteria for the current review (Fig 2). Full-text articles excluded, with reasons are present in the exclusion table (Table 1).



Fig. 2 Flowchart for identifying eligible studies

Reason for exclusion	Reference
The interventions in the	
studies were:	
Spiritual counseling	Sajadi M, Niazi N, Khosravi S, Yaghobi A, Rezaei M, Koenig HG5.Effect
	of spiritual counseling on spiritual well-being in Iranian women with
	cancer: A randomized clinical trial. Complement Ther Clin Pract. 2018
	Feb;30:79-84. doi: 10.1016/j.ctcp.2017.12.011. Epub 2017 Dec 13.
Relaxation meditation	Steinhauser KE, Alexander S, Olsen MK, Stechuchak KM, Zervakis J,
(RM)	Ammarell N, Byock I, Tulsky JA. Addressing Patient Emotional and
	Existential Needs During Serious Illness: Results of the Outlook
	Randomized Controlled Trial. J Pain Symptom Manage. 2017
	Dec;54(6):898-908. doi: 10.1016/j.jpainsymman.2017.06.003. Epub 2017
	Aug 10.
Palliative care	Betty R. Ferrell, Carly L. Paterson, Mark T. Hughes, Vincent Chung,
	Marianna Koczywas, and Thomas J. Smith.Journal of Palliative
	Medicine.Dec 2017.ahead of printhttp://doi.org/10.1089/jpm.2017.0158
Effectiveness of mind	Yun MR, Song M, Jung KH, Yu BJ, Lee KJ. The Effects of Mind
subtraction meditation	Subtraction Meditation on Breast Cancer Survivors' Psychological and
(MSM)	Spiritual Well-being and Sleep Quality: A Randomized Controlled Trial in
	South Korea. Cancer Nurs. 2017 Sep/Oct;40(5):377-385. doi:
	10.1097/NCC.00000000000443.
Therapeutic touch (TT)	Vanaki Z , Matourypour P , Gholami R , Zare Z , Mehrzad V , Dehghan
	M . Therapeutic touch for nausea in breast cancer patients receiving
	chemotherapy: Composing a treatment. Complement Ther Clin
	Pract. 2016 Feb;22:64-8. doi: 10.1016/j.ctcp.2015.12.004. Epub 2015 Dec
	11.
Online spirituality	Rickhi B, Kania-Richmond A, Moritz S, Cohen J, Paccagnan P, Dennis C,
	Liu M, Malhotra S, Steele P, Toews J. Evaluation of a spirituality
	informed e-mental health tool as an intervention for major depressive
	disorder in adolescents and young adults - a randomized controlled pilot
	trial. BMC Complement Altern Med. 2015 Dec 24;15:450. doi:
	10.1186/s12906-015-0968-x.
Brief Psychotherapy (PB)	Elias AC, Ricci MD, Rodriguez LH, Pinto SD, Giglio JS, Baracat EC. The
	biopsychosocial spiritual model applied to the treatment of women with
	breast cancer, through RIME intervention (relaxation, mental
	images, spirituality). Complement Ther Clin Pract. 2015 Feb;21(1):1-6.
	doi: 10.1016/j.ctcp.2015.01.007. Epub 2015 Feb 3.
Raining intervention,	Henoch I, Danielson E, Strang S, Browall M, Melin-Johansson C.
where the focus is on	Training intervention for health care staff in the provision of existential
existential issues and	support to patients with cancer: a randomized, controlled study. J Pain

nurses' perceived	Symptom Manage. 2013 Dec;46(6):785-94. doi:
confidence in	10.1016/j.jpainsymman.2013.01.013. Epub 2013 Jun 10.
communication	
Tibetan Sound Meditation	Milbury K, Chaoul A, Biegler K, Wangyal T3, Spelman A, Meyers CA4,
(TSM) program	Arun B5, Palmer JL, Taylor J, Cohen L. Tibetan sound meditation for
	cognitive dysfunction: results of a randomized controlled pilot trial.
	Psychooncology. 2013 Oct;22(10):2354-63. doi: 10.1002/pon.3296. Epub
	2013 May 9.
Intercessory prayer	Olver IN, Dutney A. A randomized, blinded study of the impact of
	intercessory prayer on spiritual well-being in patients with cancer. Altern
	Ther Health Med. 2012 Sep-Oct;18(5):18-27.
Spiritual therapy	Jafari N, Zamani A, Farajzadegan Z, Bahrami F, Emami H, Loghmani A.
	The effect of spiritual therapy for improving the quality of life of women
	with breast cancer: a randomized controlled trial. Psychol Health Med.
	2013;18(1):56-69. doi: 10.1080/13548506.2012.679738. Epub 2012 Apr
	26.
Individual Meaning-	Breitbart W, Poppito S, Rosenfeld B, Vickers AJ, Li Y, Abbey J, Olden M,
Centered Psychotherapy	Pessin H, Lichtenthal W, Sjoberg D, Cassileth BR.Pilot randomized
(IMCP)	controlled trial of individual meaning-centered psychotherapy for patients
	with advanced cancer. J Clin Oncol. 2012 Apr 20;30(12):1304-9. doi:
	10.1200/JCO.2011.36.2517. Epub 2012 Feb 27.
Relaxation response	Beard C, Stason WB, Wang Q, Manola J, Dean-Clower E, Dusek JA,
therapy (RRT)	Decristofaro S, Webster A, Doherty-Gilman AM, Rosenthal DS, Benson
	H. Effects of complementary therapies on clinical outcomes in patients
	being treated with radiation therapy for prostate cancer. Cancer. 2011 Jan
	1;117(1):96-102. doi: 10.1002/cncr.25291. Epub 2010 Aug 27.
Meaning Centered Group	Breitbart W, Rosenfeld B, Gibson C, Pessin H, Poppito S, Nelson C,
Psychotherapy (MCGP)	Tomarken A, Timm AK, Berg A, Jacobson C, Sorger B, Abbey J, Olden
	M. Meaning-centered group psychotherapy for patients with advanced
	cancer: a pilot randomized controlled trial. Psychooncology. 2010
	Jan;19(1):21-8. doi: 10.1002/pon.1556.
Palliative care	Steinhauser KE, Alexander SC, Byock IR, George LK, Olsen MK, Tulsky
	JA. Do preparation and life completion discussions improve functioning
	and quality of life in seriously ill patients? Pilot randomized control trial. J
	Palliat Med. 2008 Nov;11(9):1234-40. doi: 10.1089/jpm.2008.0078.
Music therapy (MT)	Hanser SB, Bauer-Wu S, Kubicek L, Healey M, Manola J, Hernandez M,
	Bunnell C. Effects of a music therapy intervention on quality of life and
	distress in women with metastatic breast cancer. J Soc Integr Oncol. 2006
	Summer;4(3):116-24.

Therapeutic touch (TT)	Lafreniere KD, Mutus B, Cameron S, Tannous M, Giannotti M, Abu-
	Zahra H, Laukkanen E. Effects of therapeutic touch on biochemical and
	mood indicators in women. J Altern Complement Med. 1999
	Aug;5(4):367-70.
Therapeutic touch	Samarel N, Fawcett J, Davis MM, Ryan FM. Effects of dialogue and
	therapeutic touch on preoperative and postoperative experiences of breast
	cancer surgery: an exploratory study. Oncol Nurs Forum. 1998
	Sep;25(8):1369-76.

Table 1. Exclusion table and reason

3.2 Study characteristics

Table 2 describes the characteristics of the studies relating to their designs, settings, numbers of participants, interventions and usual care treatments received by the patients; and according to the hospital protocol, mean age, inclusion and exclusion criteria and assessment follow-up.

International Journal for Innovation Education and Research www.ijier.net Vol:-9 No-XX, 2021

Table 2. Study characteristics related to setting, number of participants, mean age, intervention and control group description, inclusion and exclusion criteria, assessed outcomes and follow-up.

Author, year	Locatio n	No.* participant s	Mean age	Description of intervention group	Description of control groups	Inclusion criteria	Exclusion criteria	Measured outcomes	Follow -up
Aghabati, 2010 [9]	Iran	90	Interventio n: 38.86 Control: 43.30 Placebo: 42.70	Centering, assessment, TT administratio n (directing human energies, modulating human energies, changing patterns in human energy field), reassessment of the patient's energy field and	Placebo: Mimic TT treatments were provided to the placebo group by the practitioner. She performed the same movements used by the practitioner during the TT process (the duration was the same as the experimental group). However, instead of	Residents who: had a diagnosis of cancer; had a normal level of consciousnes s Glasgow Coma Scale, GCS=15); aged 15–65 years, an had resided in the unit for at least 5 days.	Residents who had any diseases leading to experienc e of pain (such as arthritis rheumatoi d and osteo- sarcoma).	Pain using Visual Analogue Scale (VAS) and fatigue using Rhoten Fatigue Scale (RFS)	5 days

International.	Iournal for	Innovation Ed	ucation and Re	<u>search</u>	ISSN 2411-2933	01-07-20	021		
				additional	centering and				
				treatments as	holding the				
				needed. 30	intent to help				
				min TT given	the subject, as				
				once a day	the practitioner				
				for 5 days	did in the TT				
				between	intervention,				
				10:00 a.m.	here, she				
				and 10:30	simply began				
				a.m.	the treatment				
					and counted				
					back from 100				
					by serial				
					sevens during				
					the whole				
					treatment.				
					Control:				
					routine				
					interventions				
					in				
					the ward.				
			Interventio	Usual care:	Placebo: Usual	Informed			
Tabatabaa			n: 54	(not	care (not	consent of			
	Iron	00		specified,	specified,	participants;	Not	Pain using	4 week
C, 2010	Iran	90	Control:	same) and	same) and	male patients	reported	Brief Pain Inventory	4 week
			55.93	therapeutic	between 10-15	aged 20 to			
				touch in 7	minutes hands	65 years;			

International Educative Research Foundation and Publisher © 2021

International	Journal fo	r Innovation E	ducation and	<u>Research</u> wi	ww.ijier.net	Vol:-9 No-XX,	2021	
			Placebo:	sessions for a	were placed	being		
			53.6	4-week	around the	conscious;		
				period	body as a	having		
				between 10-	gesture, with	cancer		
				15)	distance from	related pain		
					the body, and	confirmed		
					were moved	by		
					without a	physician;		
					certain order.	being		
					Control:	diagnosed		
					routine	and treated		
					interventions	at least for		
					in the ward.	one year;		
						being in		
						remission		
						stage; no		
						plan for		
						surgery as		
						treat-ment		
						during the		
						intervention;		
						and no		
						history of		
						using		
						therapeutic		
						touch.		

International	Journal for	Innovation Ed	lucation and Re	<u>search</u>	ISSN 2411-2933	01-07-2	021		
				Usual care					
				and five		Patients over			
				distant Reiki		the age of			
				sessions, one		18, who			
				each night in		were willing			
				a day for 30		to be part of			
				min. A single		the study. All			
				Reiki		of them			
				practitioner		knew			
				located over		Turkish well,			
			Interventio	8 km away,		and had at			
			n: 38.62	who was		least a			
Demir,			11. 50.02	trained in the	Usual medical	primary	Not	Pain stress and fatigue	
2014	Turkey	18	Usual care	Usui line of	and nursing	school	reported	1 and, success and range	5 days
[11]			28 70	Reiki (Level	care	education.	reported		
			20.70	2) and has		The study			
				been		population			
				practising		was			
				Reiki for		composed of			
				over 4 years.		patients with			
				Followed the		cancer at any			
				Traditional		stage and			
				Usui Reiki		receiving			
				protocol for		any kind of			
				distant		chemotherap			
				healing.		У			
				Reiki					

International Educative Research Foundation and Publisher © 2021

International	Journal for	r Innovation E	ducation and	Research w	ww.ijier.net	Vol:-9 No-XX,	2021		
				practitioner					
				first					
				undertake a					
				name of					
				patient and					
				then send the					
				healing					
				energy to the					
				patient.					
				The		Histologicall	Patients		
				intervention		y proven	with stage		
				was a 45-		breast cancer	IV cancer		
				minute		surgically	were		
				session of		treated with	excluded	Fatigue using Brief	
			Interventio	HT therapy	The	lumpectomy	because of	Fatigue Inventory.	
			$n \cdot 52.1$	once a week	intervention	or	the poorer	Quality of life using	
FitzHenry,			11. 52.1	during RT.	was a 45-	mastectomy.	prognosis	Functional Assessment	57
2009	USA	41	Control	Neither HT	minute session	English-	with this	of Cancer Therapy-	J-7
[12]			50.8	nor sham	o sham therapy	speaking	stage of	Breast.Anxiety/depressi	WCCK5
			50.8	practitioners	once a week	adults aged	cancer. In	on using Hospital	
				physically	during RT.	21 to 75	addition,	Anxiety and Depression	
				touched or		years old,	patients	Scale.	
				spoke to the		with an	with		
				participant,		Eastern	active		
				since it is		Cooperative	psychiatri		
				believed that		Oncology	c illness		

International	Journal for	Innovation Ed	ucation and Re	<u>search</u>	ISSN 2411-2933	01-07-2	021		
				the work on		Group	were		
				the energy		(ECOG)	excluded.		
				field does not		performance			
				require		status of 0,			
				physical		1, or 2.			
				touch.					
						Diagnosed			
				Reiki for 5		with cancer			
				consecutive	Rested for	in			
				daily	approximately	stages I to IV		Fatigue using Functional	
				sessions,	1 hour each	who had		Assessment of Cancer	
				followed by a	day for 5	recently		Therapy Fatigue	
				1-week	consecutive	completed		subscale and overall	
				washout	days, followed	chemotherap		Quality of life	
Tsang				monitoring	by a 1-week	y treatment,	Not	Functional	
2007 [13]	Canada	16	59	period of no	washout	understood	reported	Assessment of Cancer	28 days
2007 [15]				treatments,	monitoring	English, and	reported	Therapy General	
				then 2	period of no	were		Version	
				additional	scheduled	currently		Tiredness pain and	
				Reiki	resting and an	living at		anxiousness using	
				sessions, and	additional	home with a		FSAS	
				finally 2	week of no	score of 3 or		Lono.	
				weeks of no	treatments.	higher on the			
				treatments.		ESAS			
						tiredness			

International Journal for Innovation Education and Research www.ijier.net

et Vol:-9 No-XX, 2021

						an ati an a in			
						questionnair			
Orsak 2014 [14]	EUA	36	Interventio n: 49.13 Control: 51.73	During chemotherap y, there was a 30-minute Reiki session. To simulate a more naturalistic environment and demonstrate real-world applicability, the companion and Reiki sessions were held at a hospital's chemotherap y unit. The patient's room was in a common	For patients in the control group, data were collected but no therapeutic intervention or physical contact was administered.	Have breast cancer (stages I through III) and be seen at the Magee Women's Cancer Center and / or the Pittsburgh University Medical Center Cancer Cancer Center in the hospital ward.	Not reported	Quality of life Anguish Mood Fatigue	4 session s

International.	Journal for	Innovation Ed	ucation and Re	<u>esearch</u>	ISSN 2411-2933	01-07-20	021		
				area					
				separated by					
				Curtains.					
				Each Reiki					
				session					
				involved a					
				series of					
				hand					
				positions					
				over the body					
				for about 3					
				minutes.					
				Positions					
				included					
				placing					
				hands on					
				hands, ears,					
				solar plexus,					
				hips, knees					
				and feet.					
			Mean age	All	All subjects	patients from			
			was 54.7	intervention	received the	2 outpatient		Profile of Mood States	
Post-			years for	sessions	control	Midwestern	Nat	Anviety Mood	4
White	EUA	164	both	(HT) were 45	condition,whic	chemotherap	roported	Disturbance and	4 woolco
2003 [15]			samples	minutes in	h consisted of	y clinics who	reported	Entique Dain Analogaia	weeks
			(range, 27-	length. HT	4weekly	had a		raugue, rain, Anaigesic	
			83 years).	therapie was	sessions of	histologicall			

International Educative Research Foundation and Publisher © 2021

International Journal for Innovation Education and Research www.ijier.net

Vol:-9 No-XX, 2021

		provided by	standard	у						
		certified and	cancer	documented						
		credentialed	treatment	cancer						
		and	alone. Subjects	diagnosis						
		registered	came to the	and were						
		nurses.	same location	receiving						
		Except for an	as the	chemotherap						
		occasional	intervention	y with an						
		substitution,	sessions,	identical						
		the same	completed the	repeating						
		practitioner	same	cycle for 2						
		provided all	preintervention	or more						
		4sessions.	symptom	remaining						
		Intervention	assessments,	cycles. They						
		technique	and had vital	also had						
		was	signs assessed.	pain, nausea,						
		documented	Subjects left	or fatigue						
		through	after the	rated 3 or						
		written notes	assessments	more on a						
		of the	were	scale of 0 to						
		practitioners.	done.	10 (where 10						
		A customized		is the worst						
		CD of soft		imaginable)						
		piano and		and were						
		nature music		able to read						
		was played in		and write						
		the		English and						

International Journal for Innovation Education and I	<u>Research</u>	ISSN 2411-2933	01-07-2	021	
	background,		give		
	and a sign		informed		
	was posted		consent.		
	outside the				
	closed door				
	to prevent				
	interruptions.				
	Sessions				
	started with a				
	3-minute				
	scripted				
	centering				
	message,				
	with				
	messages to				
	focus on				
	breathing and				
	letting go of				
	extraneous				
	thoughts.				
	followed the				
	protocol				
	developed by				
	Healing				
	Touch				
	International				
	Levels 1-3,				

International Journal for Innovation Education and Research www.ijier.net

Vol:-9 No-XX, 2021

memutional	Journal joi	mnovation		www.ijici.iict	2021		
			using both				
			touch and				
			nontouch				
			techniques.				
			Energy				
			techniques				
			included				
			centering,				
			unruffling,				
			magnetic				
			unruffling,				
			full-body				
			connection,				
			mind				
			clearing,				
			chelation,				
			and				
			lymphatic				
			drain to				
			modulate the				
			energy field				

International Journal for Innovation Education and Research				ISSN 2411-2933	01-07-2	021													
				Reiki: was	Sham Reiki	Potential													
				administered	placebo: The	participants													
				by a trained	sham Reiki	were													
				and	placebo	receiving													
				experienced	provider	outpatient													
				Reiki	pretended to	chemotherap													
				therapist who	perform a	y in an													
				delivered the	Reiki session	infusion		In Comfort, Well-Being (Physical well-being Mental well-being											
				healing	by moving her	clinic													
				energy to the	hands on the	located in													
			The typical	patient as is	patient's body	northern													
		189	participant	customary in	in a specific	California.	Not reported												
Catlin			in any of	biofield	order for a 20-	Inclusion			1										
2011 [16]	EUA		the groups was aged	therapies.	minute period	requirements			session										
2011 [10]				The	following	were that		Physical comfort	30351011										
			69–78 years	intervention	strictly	participants		Mental comfort)											
			(76%)	lasted 20	operationalize	had to be													
				minutes and	d measures.	aged 18													
				consisted of	The sham	years or													
				the provider	Reiki therapist	older and													
				treating the	was chosen in	able to speak													
														patient's	part because of	or read			
				body,	her disbelief in	enough													
				emotions,	biofield energy	English to													
				mind, and	transfer. In an	fill out two													
				spirit by	effort to	assessment													
				following	prevent any	tools, a													

International Journal for Innovation Education and Research

www.ijier.net

Vol:-9 No-XX, 2021

specified	noggihla	domographia		
specified		demographic		
hand	healing energy	survey, and		
positions on	from coming	the consent		
a completely	through the	form.		
clothed body	sham therapist,			
to cover all	the sham			
seven main	therapist was			
chakras and	asked to do			
all major	math problems			
organs	or create a			
beginning at	shopping list			
the head and	in her head.			
moving				
down. Six				
major energy				
centers were				
administered				
to, including				
the crown,				
the brow, the				
throat, the				
heart, the				
solar plexus,				
and the				
sacrum.				
During the				
Reiki therapy				

International Journal for Innovation Education and R	ISSN 2411-2933	01-07-202	1		
	session, the				
	Reiki				
	therapist				
	managed the				
	energy to				
	treat "dis-				
	ease" and				
	improve				
	physical,				
	mental,				
	emotional,				
	and spiritual				
	well-being				

3.3 Risk-of-bias assessment

Figure 3 describes the risk-of-bias assessment for RCTs. In the random sequence generation domain, one study was considered low risk (FITZHENRY ET AL., 2014), one high risk study (CATLIN & TAYLOR-FORD 2011) and six studies were considered uncertain because they did not report this process in the study POST-WHITE et al.,2003; TSANG, CARLSON & OLSON,2007; AGHABATI, MOHAMMADI & POUR 2010; DEMIR ET AL., 2015; ORSAK ET AL., 2015; TABATABAEE ET AL., 2016). In the allocation concealment domain, two studies were considered low risk (CATLIN & TAYLOR-FORD 2011; FITZHENRY ET AL., 2014), one high risk study (ORSAK ET AL., 2015) and five studies were considered uncertain because they did not report this process (POST-WHITE et al.,2003; TSANG, CARLSON & OLSON,2007; AGHABATI, MOHAMMADI & POUR 2010; DEMIR ET AL., 2015; TABATABAEE ET AL., 2015; TABATABAEE ET AL., 2016).

In the blinding domain of participants and professionals, three studies were considered low risk (CATLIN & TAYLOR-FORD 2011; FITZHENRY ET AL., 2014;TABATABAEE ET AL., 2016), four studies high risk (TSANG, CARLSON & OLSON,2007;CATLIN & TAYLOR-FORD 2011; FITZHENRY ET AL., 2014; ORSAK ET AL., 2015;TABATABAEE ET AL., 2016) and one study was considered uncertain (CATLIN & TAYLOR-FORD 2011). Blinding of outcome evaluators has not been reported in any study (POST-WHITE ET AL.,2003;TSANG, CARLSON & OLSON,2007; AGHABATI, MOHAMMADI & POUR 2010; CATLIN & TAYLOR-FORD 2011; FITZHENRY ET AL., 2014; DEMIR ET AL., 2015; ORSAK ET AL., 2015; TABATABAEE ET AL., 2016).

Finally the domains incomplete outcomes, report of selective outcome and other sources of bias were considered low risk in all studies included in the analysis (POST-WHITE ET AL.,2003;TSANG, CARLSON & OLSON,2007; AGHABATI, MOHAMMADI & POUR 2010; CATLIN & TAYLOR-FORD 2011; FITZHENRY ET AL., 2014; DEMIR ET AL., 2015; ORSAK ET AL., 2015; TABATABAEE ET AL., 2016).



Fig. 3 Assessment of bias risk of studies included.

3.4 Meta-analyses

Fatigue

Results from 6 RCTs indicated that there is no statistically significant: mean difference (MD) = -0.24; 95% confidence interval (CI): -2.15 to 1.67; I2 = 98% (Fig 4).

	Exp	erimenta	al		Control			Mean Difference	Mean Difference
Study or Subgroup	Mean	SD	Total	Mean	SD	Total	Weight	IV, Random, 95% CI	IV, Random, 95% CI
Aghabati 2008	0.56	0.9031	30	0.46	1.1017	60	18.2%	0.10 [-0.33, 0.53]	- - -
Demir 2015	1.75	0.7	8	3.8	2.25	10	16.6%	-2.05 [-3.53, -0.57]	
Fitz Henry 2015	2.91	2.45	21	1.85	2.06	20	16.8%	1.06 [-0.32, 2.44]	
Orsak 2015	5.64	0.0387	15	2.63	0.0663	11	18.4%	3.01 [2.97, 3.05]	· · · ·
Post-White 2003	9.8	6.7	56	12	6.6	56	14.1%	-2.20 [-4.66, 0.26]	
Tsang 2007	1.56	1.55	8	3.67	1.95	8	16.0%	-2.11 [-3.84, -0.38]	
Total (95% CI)			138			165	100.0%	-0.24 [-2.15, 1.67]	
Heterogeneity: Tau² =	5.17; C	hi² = 278	.84, df :	= 5 (P <	0.00001)); I ² = 98	3%		
Test for overall effect:	Z = 0.24	(P = 0.8	1)						Reiki or Healing Touch Control

Fig. 4 Meta-analysis on mean fatigue

Pain

The results of 4 randomized clinical trials indicated that there is no statistically significant difference between the groups: MD = -1.01; 95% CI: -2.72 to 0.70; I2 = 95% (Fig 5).



Fig. 5 Meta-analysis on mean pain

Anxiety

Results from 5 RCTs indicated a statistically significant difference favoring reiki or healing touch over usual care: MD = -2-09; 95% CI: -3.00 to -1.19; I2 = 51% (Fig 6).



Fig. 6 Meta-analysis on mean anxiety

Quality of life

The results of 3 randomized clinical trials indicated a statistically significant difference favoring reiki or healing touch over usual care: MD = -5.97; 95% CI: -10.70 to -1.25; I2 = 97% (Fig 7).

	Reiki or	Healing T	ouch	(Control			Std. Mean Difference	Std. Mean Difference
Study or Subgroup	Mean	SD	Total	Mean	SD	Total	Weight	IV, Random, 95% CI	IV, Random, 95% CI
Fitz Henry 2015	82.8	2.4	21	90.1	2.7	20	43.6%	-2.81 [-3.69, -1.92]	
Orsak 2015	105.53	0.2324	15	114.48	0.2322	11	13.0%	-37.31 [-48.34, -26.27]	_ - -
Tsang 2007	83.12	12.52	8	80.53	11.96	8	43.4%	0.20 [-0.78, 1.18]	•
Total (95% CI)			44			39	100.0%	-5.97 [-10.70, -1.25]	•
Heterogeneity: Tau ² = Test for overall effect:	13.12; Ch Z = 2.48 (F	i² = 60.23, P = 0.01)	df = 2 (P	< 0.0000	01); I² = 9	7%			-50 -25 0 25 50 Reiki or Healing Touch Control



4. Discussion

4.1 Evidence summary

The analyzes showed that there was a statistically significant for anxiety control (MD = -2-09; 95% CI: -3.00 to -1.19; I2 = 51%) and increased quality of life (MD = -5.97; 95% CI: -10.70 to -1.25; I2 = 97%).

This evidence should be interpreted with extreme caution, as there was great heterogeneity between

International Educative Research Foundation and Publisher @ 2021

studies. For the other outcomes analyzed, how pain and fatigue no statistically significant difference was found.

The World Health Organization (WHO) defines Quality of Life as an individual's perception of their position in life in the context of the culture and value systems in which they live and in relation to their goals, expectations, standards and concerns (WHO,1978). It is a broad ranging concept affected in a complex way by the person's physical health, psychological state, personal beliefs, social relationships and their relationship to the environment (WHO,1978; BENOR, 2001).

Vital energy is a millenary practice, therefore, carrying different names, such as chi (China), prana (India), axé (Africa). Among these therapies, there is Reiki, a technique of imposing hands in which vital energy is channelled onto patient's body to re-establish balance in their body, spirit and soul (TSANG, CARLSON & OLSON,2007; AGHABATI, MOHAMMADI & POUR 2010).

The exercise of channelling is performed through symbols and sacred sounds; they work as keys that open up the channel. The application is carried out with manual touches on to the body of the patient. Yet, such energy is not quantified by physics; nevertheless, reiki practitioners believe that it can restore health (TSANG, CARLSON & OLSON,2007; AGHABATI, MOHAMMADI & POUR 2010).

In 2016, a study carried out by the Brazilian Ministry of Health revealed that Reiki was the most applied technique of all complementary and integrative practices in the national health system, due to the non-invasive kind; non- contraindication does not require physical effort; and promotes an easy and simple practice for energy balance (TELESI, 2016).

In 2006, Brazilian Health Ministry created the Política Nacional de Práticas Integrativas e Complementares (PNPIC) under the Sistema Único de Saúde (SUS) on Integrative and Complementary Practices; therefore, homeopathy; acupuncture and traditional Chinese medicine; medicinal plants and phytotherapy; and anthroposophic medicine began to be part SUS treatments (TELESI, 2016). In 2016, this policy extended to other treatments, such as social therapy, circle dance, yoga, massage and auricular therapy. In addition, art and music therapy, meditation, naturopathy, osteopathy, chiropractic and Reiki were just introduced in January 13, 2017 (WHO,1978; BENOR, 2001).

4.2 Limitations

One of the study's major limitations was very small number of studies considering reiki or healing touch in patients undergoing chemotherapy. Therefore, there is still a need for high-quality papers on this issue, bias risk analysis showed that the studies have a great methodological bias in their elaboration, especially in the random sequence generation and in the blinding of evaluators of outcome.

In addition to the low number of studies on the subject, the number of participants included in each study was low, evidencing the need to elaborate more studies with larger populations. There was high heterogeneity among the studies, this factor may have occurred due to the design of the studies, being able to be a source of clinical heterogeneity.

Another limitation of this study may be that it did not include observational studies, but this fact was to find better evidence available in the literature.

5. Conclusions

5.1 Implications for practice

Evidence has suggested that reiki or healing touch is effective in reducing anxiety, in-creased quality of life for patients undergoing chemotherapy however and the bias risk analysis of studies has shown important flaws and should be used very carefully.

5.2 Implications for future research

The current systematic review reinforces the importance of the need to carry out new trials on the application of complementary therapies, such as reiki, alongside conventional treatments. These complementary therapies enrich the public health system for its low cost and absence of side effects and proved to be effective on the reduction of anxiety and increased quality of life in this study.

6. References

Aghabati, N., Mohammadi, E., & Pour Esmaiel, Z. (2010). The effect of therapeutic touch on pain and fatigue of cancer patients undergoing chemotherapy. Evidence-based complementary and alternative medicine : eCAM, 7(3), 375–381. <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/ecam/nen006</u>.

Benor DJ. Spiritual healing: scientific validation of a healing revolution. Southfield: Vision Publications, 2001.

Catlin, A., & Taylor-Ford, R. L. (2011). Investigation of standard care versus sham Reiki placebo versus actual Reiki therapy to enhance comfort and well-being in a chemotherapy infusion center. Oncology nursing forum, 38(3), E212–E220. <u>https://doi.org/10.1188/11.ONF.E212-E220</u>

Demir, M., Can, G., Kelam, A., & Aydıner, A. (2015). Effects of Distant Reiki On Pain, Anxiety and Fatigue in Oncology Patients in Turkey: A Pilot Study. Asian Pacific journal of cancer prevention : APJCP, 16(12), 4859–4862. <u>https://doi.org/10.7314/apjcp.2015.16.12.4859</u>

Ferraz, G.A.R., Rodrigues, M.R.K., Lima, S.A.M., Maia, G.L, Pilan Neto, C.A, Omodei, M.S, Molina, A.C, El Dib, R., Rudge, M.V.C.(2017). Is reiki or prayer effective in relieving pain during hospitalization for cesarean? A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. Sao Paulo Med J. March;135(2):123-32.

FitzHenry, F., Wells, N., Slater, V., Dietrich, M. S., Wisawatapnimit, P., & Chakravarthy, A. B. (2014). A randomized placebo-controlled pilot study of the impact of healing touch on fatigue in breast cancer patients undergoing radiation therapy. Integrative cancer therapies, 13(2), 105–113. https://doi.org/10.1177/1534735413503545

Higgins JPT, Green S (editors). Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions Version 5.1.0 (updated March 2011). The Cochrane Collaboration, 2011. Available from <u>www.handbook.cochrane.org</u>.

ISSN 2411-2933

Higgins, J. P., Altman, D. G., Gøtzsche, P. C., Jüni, P., Moher, D., Oxman, A. D., Savovic, J., Schulz, K. F., Weeks, L., Sterne, J. A., Cochrane Bias Methods Group, & Cochrane Statistical Methods Group (2011). The Cochrane Collaboration's tool for assessing risk of bias in randomised trials. BMJ (Clinical research ed.), 343, d5928. <u>https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.d5928</u>

Lafreniere, K. D., Mutus, B., Cameron, S., Tannous, M., Giannotti, M., Abu-Zahra, H., & Laukkanen, E. (1999). Effects of therapeutic touch on biochemical and mood indicators in women. Journal of alternative and complementary medicine (New York, N.Y.), 5(4), 367–370. <u>https://doi.org/10.1089/acm.1999.5.367</u>

Lee, M. S., Pittler, M. H., & Ernst, E. (2008). Effects of reiki in clinical practice: a systematic review of randomised clinical trials. International journal of clinical practice, 62(6), 947–954. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1742-1241.2008.01729.x

Matourypour, P., Vanaki, Z., Zare, Z., Mehrzad, V., Dehghan, M., & Ranjbaran, M. (2016). Investigating the effect of therapeutic touch on the intensity of acute chemotherapy-induced vomiting in breast cancer women under chemotherapy. Iranian journal of nursing and midwifery research, 21(3), 255–260. https://doi.org/10.4103/1735-9066.180373

Moher, D., Liberati, A., Tetzlaff, J., Altman, D.G. (2009).PRISMA Group. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. BMJ;339:b2535.

Orsak, G., Stevens, A. M., Brufsky, A., Kajumba, M., & Dougall, A. L. (2015). The effects of Reiki therapy and companionship on quality of life, mood, and symptom distress during chemotherapy. Journal of evidence-based complementary & alternative medicine, 20(1), 20–27. https://doi.org/10.1177/2156587214556313

Post-White, J., Kinney, M. E., Savik, K., Gau, J. B., Wilcox, C., & Lerner, I. (2003). Therapeutic massage and healing touch improve symptoms in cancer. Integrative cancer therapies, 2(4), 332–344. https://doi.org/10.1177/1534735403259064

Review Manager (RevMan) (Computer program). Version 5.3. Copenhagen: The Nordic Cochrane Centre, The Cochrane Collaboration, 2014.

Suzuki, K., Uchida, S., Kimura, T., Tanaka, H., & Katamura, H. (2020). International Cross-Sectional Study on the Effectiveness of Okada Purifying Therapy, a Biofield Therapy, for the Relief of Various Symptoms. Journal of alternative and complementary medicine (New York, N.Y.), 26(8), 708–720. https://doi.org/10.1089/acm.2019.0264.

Tabatabaee, A., Tafreshi, M. Z., Rassouli, M., Aledavood, S. A., AlaviMajd, H., & Farahmand, S. K. (2016). Effect of therapeutic touch on pain related parameters in patients with cancer: a randomized clinical trial. Materia socio-medica, 28(3), 220–223. https://doi.org/10.5455/msm.2016.28.220-223

Telesi EJ.(2016). Práticas integrativas e complementares em saúde, uma nova eficácia para o SUS.Estudos Avançados. 30(86):99-112.

Tesser, C.D., Sousa, I.M.C., Nascimento, M.C. (2018). Práticas Integrativas e Complementares na Atenção Primária à Saúde brasileira. Saúde Debate. Sept;42(1):174-188.

Tsang, K. L., Carlson, L. E., & Olson, K. (2007). Pilot crossover trial of Reiki versus rest for treating cancer-related fatigue. Integrative cancer therapies, 6(1), 25–35. https://doi.org/10.1177/1534735406298986

vanderVaart, S., Gijsen, V. M., de Wildt, S. N., & Koren, G. (2009). A systematic review of the therapeutic effects of Reiki. Journal of alternative and complementary medicine (New York, N.Y.), 15(11), 1157–1169. https://doi.org/10.1089/acm.2009.0036.

Vitale A. (2007). An integrative review of Reiki touch therapy research. Holistic nursing practice, 21(4), 167–181. <u>https://doi.org/10.1097/01.HNP.0000280927.83506.f6</u>.

World Health Organization. The Ninth Revision of the International Classification of Diseases and Related Health Problems (ICD-9). Geneva: World Health Organization, 1978.