# Can $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$exist in bent or cyclic forms? 

A.K. Füzéry ${ }^{\text {a }}$, R. Burcl $^{\text {b }}$, L.L. Torday ${ }^{\text {a,c }}$, P. Császár ${ }^{\text {a }}$, O. Farkas ${ }^{\text {d,e }}$, A. Perczel ${ }^{\text {e,f }}$, M.A. Zamora ${ }^{\text {g }}$, J.G. Papp ${ }^{\text {b }}$, B. Penke ${ }^{\text {h }}$, P. Piecuch ${ }^{\text {b }}$, I.G. Csizmadia ${ }^{\text {a,* }}$

${ }^{\text {a }}$ Department of Chemistry, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada, M5S 3H6
${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$ Department of Chemistry, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI 48824, USA
${ }^{\text {c }}$ Department of Pharmacology and Pharmacotherapy, University of Szeged, H-6701, Hungary
${ }^{\text {d }}$ Department of Chemistry, Wayne State University, Detroit, MI 48202, USA
${ }^{\mathrm{e}}$ Department of Organic Chemistry, Eotvos University, Budapest, Hungary
${ }^{\mathrm{f}}$ Department of Biochemistry, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK
${ }^{\mathrm{g}}$ Departamento de Química, Universidad Nacional de San Luis, Argentina
${ }^{\text {h }}$ Department of Medical Chemistry, University of Szeged, H-6701, Hungary
Received 7 May 2000; in final form 3 October 2000


#### Abstract

Calculations of $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$at HF, CBS-4, CASSCF, MBPT(2), MBPT(3), and MBPT(4) theory levels, using 3-21G and $6-31 \mathrm{G}(\mathrm{d})$ basis sets, found two $\mathrm{C}_{2 \mathrm{~V}}$ structures along with the linear geometry. Computations using MBPT(2) and $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T})$ approaches and the aug-cc-pvtz basis set confirmed these results. Harmonic vibrational frequency calculations, performed with $\operatorname{MBPT}(2)$ and $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T})$ theories, indicated that the linear structure was the global minimum while one of the bent structures ( $\angle \mathrm{ONO}=80^{\circ}$ ) was a higher energy local minimum. The second $\mathrm{C}_{2 \mathrm{~V}}$ structure $\left(\angle \mathrm{ONO}=45^{\circ}\right)$ exhibited a large imaginary vibrational frequency along the asymmetric stretching ( $\mathrm{B}_{2}$ ) mode, indicating its saddle point nature. © 2001 Elsevier Science B.V. All rights reserved.


Based on spectroscopic data, obtained in the middle of the 20th century, $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$is regarded as a linear molecule [1]. The description of the electronic structure of this linear molecule is straightforward, both in terms of qualitative valence bond theory (structure I in Fig. 1) and in terms of qualitative molecular orbital representations (see Fig. 2). Numerous ab initio computations support [2-16] the linear structure. This, however, does not

[^0]exclude the possibility of other isomeric forms. For instance, qualitative valence bond structures can be written for cyclic $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$involving either $4 \pi$ (structure II in Fig. 1) or $6 \pi$ (structure III in Fig. 1) electrons. One can also construct a bent valence bond structure (structure IV in Fig. 1) with four electrons. This suggests that bent or cyclic structures could perhaps exist on the potential energy surface (PES) as local minima. This implication would be particularly significant for understanding reactions where the nitronium ion interacts with nucleophiles, such as in nitration, and where it must go from its initial linear form into a bent one during the reaction process. Such a bending


Fig. 1. Qualitative valence bond structures of $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$.


Fig. 2. Qualitative molecular orbital description of linear $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$.
motion, without the presence of a reacting nucleophile, may be regarded as a reference process to which the effect of various nucleophiles may be compared. In addition to this, while bent forms of the isoelectronic $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ have been known for quite some time [17], a full study of the $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$PES has, to our knowledge, not yet been done and hence this paper is presented with the aim to do this.

Spectroscopy [18-25] and reaction kinetics [2631] of $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$have been studied previously. However, no optimized bent or cyclic $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$structure has been reported in the literature, even though on the basis of four single point calculations $\left(\alpha=110^{\circ}\right.$, $100^{\circ}, 90^{\circ}$ and $80^{\circ}$ at $r=1.1205 \mathrm{~A}$, where $\alpha$ is the ONO bond angle and $r$ is the NO distance), Hopper has suspected [5] the existence of a high energy cyclic minimum in the vicinity of $\alpha=90^{\circ}$.

In order to test this possibility, the potential energy curve, $E=E(\alpha)$, where $\alpha$ is the ONO bond angle, was scanned using ab initio computations, at various levels of approximation. A preliminary scan at the Hartree-Fock (HF) level of theory using a 3-21G basis set yielded three potential energy curves, each of which originated from a totally symmetric wave function (see Fig. 3).


Fig. 3. The crossing of three potential energy curves associated with three different electronic configurations, as computed at the HF/3-21G level of theory. The horizontal axis corresponds to the ONO bond angle ( $\alpha$, in degree); the vertical axis describes the total energy ( $E$, in hartree). The three curves correspond to the following ${ }^{1} \mathrm{~A}_{1}$ electronic configurations: A: $\ldots a_{2}^{2} b_{2}^{2} a_{1}^{0} b_{1}^{0}$; B: $\ldots a_{2}^{2} b_{2}^{0} a_{1}^{2} b_{1}^{0}$; C: $\ldots a_{2}^{2} b_{2}^{0} a_{1}^{0} b_{1}^{2}$. The $C_{2 v}$ symmetry is employed throughout.

Based on the shapes of the curves obtained and based on the 'non-crossing rule', it is reasonable to expect that the correlated ground state potential energy curve may have up to three $C_{20}$-symmetric minima. These minima should correspond to the linear $\left(\alpha=180^{\circ}\right)$, a higher energy bent $\left(\alpha>60^{\circ}\right)$, and an even higher energy cyclic $\left(\alpha<60^{\circ}\right)$ structures. The same can be seen by analyzing the crossings of the MO energy levels (see Fig. 4). Starting with the three minima, predicted by the HF/3-21G scans, geometry optimizations have been carried out at six levels of the theory: HF, complete active space self-consistent field (CASSCF), second through fourth-orders of the many-body perturbation theory (MBPT(2), $\operatorname{MBPT}(3)$, and $\operatorname{MBPT}(4)$ ), using a standard $631+G(d)$ basis set, and complete basis set approximation (CBS-4). The results are summarized in Table 1.

Beyond these exploratory computations, an in depth study has been carried out on the linear and $C_{2 v}$ structures of $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$. The calculations were performed using two approaches, the MBPT(2) approach and the coupled cluster approach with single, double, and noniterative perturbative triple excitations (the $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T})$ method) [32], both with the aug-cc-pvtz basis set [33]. All electrons were correlated in the $\operatorname{MBPT}(2)$ calculations, whereas in all $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T})$ calculations performed


Fig. 4. A Walsh type diagram, illustrating the HOMO/LUMO level crossings as a function of the ONO bond angle $(\alpha$, in degree) in $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$. Of the computed MO energy levels, $\epsilon_{\mathrm{i}}$ (in hartree), only those with $i=10,11,12,13$, and 14 are shown.
Table 1
Results ${ }^{\text {a }}$ of exploratory geometry optimizations for $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$at various levels of theory using a standard $6-31 \mathrm{G}+$ (d) basis set

| Method | Linear |  |  |  | Bent |  |  |  | Cyclic |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $\alpha$ | $r$ | E | $\Delta E$ | $\alpha$ | $r$ | E | $\Delta E$ | $\alpha$ | $r$ | E | $\Delta E$ |
| HF | 180.0 | 1.091 | -203.682385 | 0.0 | 74.97 | 1.228 | -203.509745 | 108.33 | 38.16 | 1.746 | -203.348737 | 209.37 |
| CAS(4,6) | 180.0 | 1.102 | -203.776520 | 0.0 | 86.20 | 1.229 | -203.638585 | 86.56 | 47.46 | 1.513 | -203.497434 | 175.13 |
| CAS $(8,8)$ | 180.0 | 1.115 | -203.841256 | 0.0 | 86.26 | 1.260 | -203.719213 | 76.85 | 41.72 | 1.720 | -203.572209 | 168.83 |
| CBS-4 (0 K) |  |  | -204.501607 | 0.0 |  |  | -204.343483 | 99.22 |  |  | -204.138882 | 227.61 |
| CBS-4 E | 180.0 | 1.111 | -204.498860 | 0.0 | 73.10 | 1.349 | -204.340525 | 99.36 | 38.50 | 1.872 | -204.135865 | 227.78 |
| CBS-4 H |  |  | -204.497916 | 0.0 |  |  | -204.339580 | 99.35 |  |  | -204.134921 | 227.78 |
| CBS-4 G |  |  | -204.522341 | 0.0 |  |  | -204.366576 | 97.74 |  |  | -204.136236 | 242.28 |
| MP2 | 180.0 | 1.157 | -204.246347 | 0.0 | 82.17 | 1.282 | -204.075301 | 107.33 | 47.80 | 1.629 | -203.874875 | 233.1 |
| MP3 |  |  | -204.175726 | 0.0 |  |  | -204.017788 | 99.10 |  |  | -203.833086 | 215.01 |
| MP4D |  |  | -204.211135 | 0.0 |  |  | -204.058830 | 95.57 |  |  | -203.874167 | 211.45 |
| MP4DQ | 180.0 | 1.181 | -204.191964 | 0.0 | 84.39 | 1.313 | -204.033298 | 99.56 | 45.06 | 1.690 | -203.857770 | 209.71 |
| MP4SDQ |  |  | -204.216121 | 0.0 |  |  | -204.067311 | 93.38 |  |  | -203.880686 | 210.49 |
| MP4SDTQ |  |  | -204.275063 | 0.0 |  |  | -204.121608 | 96.29 |  |  | -203.919135 | 223.35 |

${ }^{\text {a }}$ The ONO angle $(\alpha)$ in degree, the NO bond length $(r)$ in $\AA$, the total energy $(E)$ in hartree, and the relative energy $(\Delta E)$ in $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$.

Table 2
The MBPT(2)/aug-cc-pvtz geometries and harmonic vibrational frequencies

| Parameter $^{\mathrm{a}, \mathrm{b}}$ | Linear | Bent | Cyclic |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $r$ | 1.1377 | 1.2690 | 1.6104 |
| $\alpha$ | 180.0 | 81.3 | 46.5 |
| $E$ | -204.46673380 | -204.29123176 | -204.09150732 |
| $\Delta E$ | 0.0 | 110.13 | 235.46 |
| $v_{1}$ | $602.2\left(\Pi_{\mathrm{u}}\right.$, bend $)$ | $759.7\left(\mathrm{~A}_{1}\right.$, bend $)$ | $845.4 \mathrm{i}\left(\mathrm{B}_{2}\right.$, asym $)$ |
| $v_{2}$ | $1306.7\left(\Sigma_{\mathrm{g}}\right.$, sym $)$ | $1371.7\left(\mathrm{~B}_{2}\right.$, asym $)$ | $720.3\left(\mathrm{~A}_{1}\right.$, bend $)$ |
| $\nu_{3}$ | $2536.6\left(\Sigma_{\mathrm{u}}\right.$, asym $)$ | $1542.5\left(\mathrm{~A}_{1}\right.$, sym $)$ | $1014.4\left(\mathrm{~A}_{1}\right.$, sym $)$ |

${ }^{\text {a }}$ The NO bond length $(r)$ in $\AA$, the ONO bond angle $(\alpha)$ in degree, the total energy $(E)$ in hartree, the relative energy $(\Delta E)$ in $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$, and the harmonic vibrational frequencies $\left(v_{1}, v_{2}, v_{3}\right)$ in $\mathrm{cm}^{-1}$.
${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$ sym $=$ symmetric stretch, asym $=$ asymmetric stretch.

Table 3
The $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T}) /$ aug-cc-pvtz geometries and harmonic vibrational frequencies

| Parameter $^{\text {a,b }}$ | Linear $^{\mathrm{c}}$ | Bent | Cyclic $^{\mathrm{d}}$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $r$ | 1.1253 | 1.2739 | 1.7046 |
| $\alpha$ | 180.0 | 80.0 | 41.2 |
| $E$ | -204.47063267 | -204.31612455 | -204.13292431 |
| $\Delta E$ | 0.0 | 96.96 | 211.91 |
| $v_{1}$ | $626.2\left(\Pi_{\mathrm{u}}\right.$, bend $)$ | $682.5\left(\mathrm{~A}_{1}\right.$, bend $)$ | $518.4 \mathrm{i}\left(\mathrm{B}_{2}\right.$, asym $)$ |
| $v_{2}$ | $1382.4\left(\Sigma_{\mathrm{g}}\right.$, sym $)$ | $748.4\left(\mathrm{~B}_{2}\right.$, asym $)$ | $596.5\left(\mathrm{~A}_{1}\right.$, bend $)$ |
| $v_{3}$ | $2389.9\left(\Sigma_{\mathrm{u}}\right.$, asym $)$ | $1461.6\left(\mathrm{~A}_{1}\right.$, sym $)$ | $1418.4\left(\mathrm{~A}_{1}\right.$, sym $)$ |

${ }^{\text {a }}$ The NO bond length $(r)$ in $\AA$, the ONO bond angle ( $\alpha$ ) in degree, the total energy $(E)$ in hartree, the relative energy ( $\Delta E$ in $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$, and the harmonic vibrational frequencies $\left(v_{1}, v_{2}, v_{3}\right)$ in $\mathrm{cm}^{-1}$.
${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$ sym $=$ symmetric stretch, asym $=$ asymmetric stretch.
${ }^{c}$ Experimental values from [21,25]: $v_{1}=626.90, v_{2}=1386.84, v_{3}=2362.0 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$.
${ }^{\mathrm{d}}$ The $\mathrm{O}-\mathrm{O}$ distance in the cyclic structure of $1.1995 \AA$ is virtually identical to the $\mathrm{O}-\mathrm{O}$ distance in the isolated $\mathrm{O}_{2}$ molecule $(1.20752 \AA)$.

Table 4
The $\operatorname{CCSD}(T) /$ aug-cc-pvtz geometries and harmonic vibrational frequencies of dissociation products $\mathrm{N}^{+}, \mathrm{O}_{2}, \mathrm{~N}, \mathrm{O}_{2}^{+}$

| Species $^{\mathrm{a}}$ | $E$ <br> (hartree) | $R_{\mathrm{e}}$ <br> $(\mathrm{A})$ | $v$ <br> $\left(\mathrm{~cm}^{-1}\right)$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $\mathrm{N}\left({ }^{4} \mathbf{S}\right)$ | -54.51692394 | $\mathrm{n} / \mathrm{a}$ | $\mathrm{n} / \mathrm{a}$ |
| $\mathrm{N}\left({ }^{2} \mathrm{D}\right)(*)$ | -54.41750320 | $\mathrm{n} / \mathrm{a}$ | $\mathrm{n} / \mathrm{a}$ |
| $\mathrm{N}^{+}\left({ }^{3} \mathbf{P}\right)(*)$ | -53.98500355 | $\mathrm{n} / \mathrm{a}$ | $\mathrm{n} / \mathrm{a}$ |
| $\left.\mathrm{O}_{2}{ }^{3} \Sigma_{\mathrm{g}}^{-}\right)$ | -150.14102005 | 1.2132 | 1574.7 |
| $\mathrm{O}_{2}^{+}\left({ }^{2} \Pi_{\mathrm{g}}\right)(*)$ | -149.6992259 | 1.1215 | 1907.0 |

${ }^{a}$ The species denoted with $\left({ }^{*}\right)$ requires a multi-reference description. The expected quality of these data is lower than in the remaining cases.

Table 5
The $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T}) /$ aug-cc-pvtz dissociation energies for the linear $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$corresponding to the dissociation channels of the $\left(\mathrm{N}+\mathrm{O}_{2}\right)^{+}$type

|  | $D_{\mathrm{e}}$ <br> $(\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$ | $D_{0}$ <br> $(\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $\mathrm{N}\left({ }^{2} \mathrm{D}\right)+\mathrm{O}_{2}^{+}\left({ }^{2} \Pi_{\mathrm{g}}\right)$ | 222.08 | 218.52 |
| $\mathrm{~N}^{+}\left({ }^{3} \mathrm{P}\right)+\mathrm{O}_{2}\left({ }^{3} \Sigma_{\mathrm{g}}^{-}\right)$ | 216.25 | 212.21 |
| $\mathrm{~N}\left({ }^{4} \mathrm{~S}\right)+\mathrm{O}_{2}^{+}\left({ }^{2} \Pi_{\mathrm{g}}\right)$ | 159.69 | 156.13 |

in this study, the core orbitals (three lowest orbitals in $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$, two lowest orbitals in $\mathrm{O}_{2}$ and $\mathrm{O}_{2}^{+}$, and the lowest orbital in N and $\mathrm{N}^{+}$) were kept frozen. The $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T})$ calculations for the openshell dissociation products $\left(\mathrm{O}_{2}, \mathrm{O}_{2}^{+}, \mathrm{N}\right.$, and $\left.\mathrm{N}^{+}\right)$ were performed using the unrestricted HF (UHF) reference (we tried the restricted open-shell HF (ROHF) reference, too, but the results turned out to be virtually identical). It is necessary to point
out that some of these species are not properly described by a single determinant; the calculations of dissociation energies are therefore only semi-quantitative. The $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T})$ and $\operatorname{MBPT}(2)$ calculations for $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$(a closed-shell species) used the restricted HF (RHF) reference. All MBPT(2) and $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T})$ calculations employing the aug-ccpvtz basis set (geometry optimizations and harmonic frequency calculations) were performed with Gaussian 98 [34] (the MBPT(2) and $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T})$ calculations) and Aces II [35] (the $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T})$ calculations). The $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T})$ analytic gradient capability of Aces II turned out to be very useful and greatly facilitated our optimization efforts.

We characterized three stationary points on a $C_{2 v}$-symmetric PES, referred to as the linear, bent, and cyclic structures. In spite of numerous efforts, we were unable to locate any asymmetric minimum. All our attempts to locate the asymmetric structures failed, giving us the bent, $C_{2 v^{-}}$ symmetric structure. We cannot rule out the existence of an asymmetric local minimum, but it is likely that if such a minimum exists, it is very shallow or high lying or has both these features.

The main findings of our calculations are collected in Tables 2 (MBPT(2)/aug-cc-pvtz results) and Table 3 (CCSD(T)/aug-cc-pvtz results). Table 4 lists the $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T}) /$ aug-cc-pvtz results for the dissociation products of the $\left(\mathrm{N}+\mathrm{O}_{2}\right)^{+}$type and Table 5 provides information about the energetics of dissociation of the linear $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$into the spinallowed $\mathrm{N}\left({ }^{2} \mathrm{D}\right)+\mathrm{O}_{2}^{+}\left({ }^{2} \Pi_{\mathrm{g}}\right)$ and $\mathrm{N}^{+}\left({ }^{3} \mathrm{P}\right)+\mathrm{O}_{2}\left({ }^{3} \Sigma_{\mathrm{g}}^{-}\right)$ channels and spin-forbidden $\mathrm{N}\left({ }^{4} \mathbf{S}\right)+\mathrm{O}_{2}^{+}\left({ }^{2} \Pi_{\mathrm{g}}\right)$ channel.

The harmonic vibrational analysis for the stationary points reveals that while all three structures represent minima within the $C_{2 v}$ symmetry, only the linear and bent structures are true local minima. The saddle-point nature of the cyclic structure, observed initially at the MBPT(2)/aug-cc-pvtz level, was confirmed in the subsequent $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T}) /$ aug-cc-pvtz calculations. The cyclic structure is a saddle point dividing two mirrorimage $C_{\mathrm{s}}$ valleys representing asymmetric bent $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$geometries (notice that the imaginary frequency corresponds to asymmetric stretch). Fol-
lowing the coordinate corresponding to the negative eigenvalue of the Hessian leads to the lowering of the symmetry of the $C_{2 v}$ structure to $C_{\mathrm{s}}$. Consequently, both HOMO and LUMO become the $a^{\prime \prime}$ orbitals and the path between the cyclic and bent structures, which is forbidden in Woodward-Hoffmann sense when the $C_{2 v}$ symmetry is preserved, becomes allowed when the $C_{2 v}$ symmetry is broken. Since the cyclic structure seems to represent the $\mathrm{N}^{+} \ldots \mathrm{O}_{2}$ configuration, the above described process of going from the cyclic saddle point to the bent minimum structure of $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$may play a role in the reaction $\mathrm{N}^{+}+\mathrm{O}_{2} \rightarrow \mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$.

Both the linear and bent local minima are located below all dissociation channels of the $\left(\mathrm{N}+\mathrm{O}_{2}\right)^{+}$type listed in Table 5. Finally, we should note that our $\operatorname{CCSD}(\mathrm{T})$ geometries and frequencies of the linear $\mathrm{NO}_{2}^{+}$molecule agree remarkably well with the experimental $[24,25]$ and theoretical $[14,16]$ results reported earlier. Also, our results are similar, although not identical, to the findings of Xantheas et al. [17] on the isoelectronic $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$. They found a bent ${ }_{1}^{\mathrm{A}}\left(\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{v}\right)$ local minimum for $\alpha \cong 70^{\circ}$ and a $C_{2 v}$-symmetric transition state for $\alpha \cong 95^{\circ}$, the latter dividing the former from the linear minimum. This exploratory work on the bent and cyclic isomers of the otherwise linear triatomics is now being extended to the isoelectronic $\mathrm{CO}_{2}$ and $\mathrm{BO}_{2}^{-}$systems.

## Acknowledgements

This work has been partly supported by the MSU Intramural Research Grant Program (the New Faculty, Science and Engineering Award received by P.P.).

## References

[1] C.K. Ingold, D.J. Milen, H.G. Poole, J. Chem. Soc. (1950) 2576.
[2] G.V. Pfeiffer, L.C. Allen, J. Chem. Phys. 51 (1969) 190.
[3] S.-K. Shih, S.D. Peyerimhoff, R.J. Buenker, Chem. Phys. Lett. 46 (1977) 201.
[4] P.A. Benioff, J. Chem. Phys. 68 (1978) 3405.
[5] D.G. Hopper, J. Chem. Phys. 72 (1980) 4676.
[6] N.C. Baird, K.F. Taylor, Chem. Phys. Lett. 80 (1981) 83.
[7] I. Mayer, Int. J. Quantum Chem. 26 (1984) 151.
[8] D.W.J. Cruickshank, M. Eisenstein, J. Comp. Chem. 8 (1987) 6.
[9] P. Siddarth, M.S. Gopinathan, J. Am. Chem. Soc. 110 (1988) 96.
[10] P. Pyykkö, Chem. Phys. Lett. 156 (1989) 337.
[11] K. Hiraoka, S. Yamabe, J. Chem. Phys. 90 (1989) 3268.
[12] P. Pyykkö, Y. Zhao, Mol. Phys. 70 (1990) 701.
[13] T.J. Lee, J.E. Rice, J. Phys. Chem. 96 (1992) 650.
[14] T.J. Lee, Chem. Phys. Lett. 188 (1992) 154.
[15] L. Eberson, R. González-Luque, J. Lorentzon, M. Merchán, B.O. Roos, J. Am. Chem. Soc. 115 (1993) 2898.
[16] G. Theodorakopoulos, I.D. Petsalakis, M.S. Child, J. Mol. Struct. (THEOCHEM) 434 (1998) 177.
[17] S.S. Xantheas, S.T. Elbert, K. Ruedenberg, Chem. Phys. Lett. 166 (1990) 39.
[18] G.K.S. Prakash, L. Heiliger, G.A. Olah, Inorg. Chem. 29 (1990) 4965.
[19] F.X. Campos, Y. Jiang, E.R. Grant, J. Chem. Phys. 93 (1990) 2308.
[20] F.X. Campos, Y. Jiang, E.R. Grant, J. Chem. Phys. 94 (1991) 5897.
[21] G.P. Bryant, Y. Jiang, E.R. Grant, J. Chem. Phys. 96 (1992) 4827.
[22] G.P. Bryant, Y. Jiang, E.R. Grant, Chem. Phys. Lett. 200 (1992) 495.
[23] F. Châteauneuf, H. Lefebvre-Brion, J. Chem. Phys. 98 (1993) 7657.
[24] G.P. Bryant, Y. Jiang, M. Martin, E.R. Grant, J. Chem. Phys. 101 (1994) 7199.
[25] H. Matsui, J.M. Behm, E.R. Grant, Int. J. Mass Spectrosc. Ion Process. 159 (1996) 37.
[26] W. Lindinger, J. Chem. Phys. 64 (1976) 3720.
[27] S. Matsuoka, H. Nakamura, T. Tamura, J. Chem. Phys. 75 (1981) 681.
[28] K. Hiraoka, J. Chem. Phys. 91 (1989) 6071.
[29] H.S. Rzepa, W.A. Wylie, J. Chem. Soc. Perkin Trans. 2 (1991) 939.
[30] N.C. Marziano, A. Tomasin, C. Tortato, J. Chem. Soc. Perkin Trans. 2 (1991) 1575.
[31] A. Delon, R. Jost, M. Lombardi, J. Chem. Phys. 95 (1991) 5701.
[32] K. Raghavachari, G.W. Trucks, J.A. Pople, M. HeadGordon, Chem. Phys. Lett. 157 (1989) 479.
[33] T.H. Dunning Jr., J. Chem. Phys. 90 (1989) 1007.
[34] M. J. Frisch et al., Gaussian 98, Revision A.6, Gaussian Inc., Pittsburgh, PA, 1998.
[35] J.F. Stanton, J. Gauss, J.D. Watts, W.J. Lauderdale, R.J. Bartlett, Int. J. Quantum Chem. Symp. 26 (1992) 879 (Aces II is a quantum chemical program package written by J.F. Stanton et al.).


[^0]:    ${ }^{*}$ Corresponding author. Fax: +1-416-978-3598.
    E-mail address: icsizmad@alchemy.chem.utoronto.ca (I.G. Csizmadia).

