

## Conference Paper

# Collaborative Government in Tourism Sector Development

Muh Taufik<sup>1</sup>, Muh Akmal Ibrahim<sup>2</sup>, Badu Ahmad<sup>2</sup>, Muhadjir Suni<sup>3</sup>, Muhammad Nur<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Doctoral candidate in public administration, Faculty of social and political sciences, Hasanuddin University, Lecturer at Makassar Tourism Polytecnic

<sup>2</sup>Lecturer in Public Administration, Faculty of social and political sciences, Hasanuddin University

<sup>3</sup>Lecturer at Makassar Tourism Polytecnic

<sup>4</sup>Lecturer in Public Administration, University of Timor

## Abstract.

The purpose of this article is to delve into the concept of Collaborative Government in the context of tourism development and its implications. The study examines existing literature and research that focuses on the roles, benefits, challenges, and recommendations associated with Collaborative Government in the tourism sector. To accomplish this, a literature review method was employed, as it is effective in providing a comprehensive understanding of Collaborative Government in tourism development. The findings of the study reveal that Collaborative Government necessitates cooperation and partnership among diverse stakeholders, including government agencies, tourism industry participants, local communities, and other relevant actors. This approach promotes joint decision-making, resource sharing, and collective efforts in planning, implementing, and managing tourism initiatives. The concept emphasizes the significance of coordination, communication, and cooperation among stakeholders to achieve common objectives. Collaborative Government presents a promising approach to enhancing the tourism sector by fostering inclusive decision-making, encouraging partnerships, and attaining sustainable outcomes. This literature review contributes to a deeper comprehension of Collaborative Government in tourism and offers valuable insights for policymakers, practitioners, and researchers seeking to improve collaboration and governance in tourism development.

Nevertheless, further empirical research is necessary to explore specific case studies and assess the results and impacts of Collaborative Government initiatives in diverse tourism contexts.

**Keywords:** collaborative government, tourism, development

## 1. Introduction

The tourism sector has become crucial in the Indonesian economy. Indonesia, an archipelagic country with natural wealth, cultural diversity, and attractive tourist attractions, has great potential to develop the tourism sector as one of the main sources of state revenue. In this introduction, we briefly describe Indonesia's tourism sector and outline its important role in the country's economy.

Corresponding Author: Muh Taufik; email: sunitaufik@poltekparmakassar.ac.id

Published 2 October 2023

Publishing services provided by Knowledge E

© Muh Taufik et al. This article is distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use and redistribution provided that the original author and source are credited.

Selection and Peer-review under the responsibility of the 1st DIC Conference Committee.

 OPEN ACCESS

Indonesia is rich in natural beauty such as tropical beaches, beautiful mountains, and abundant biodiversity. In addition, Indonesia has rich cultural heritage, including historical sites, local traditions, and ethnic and religious diversity. This makes Indonesia an attractive destination for both domestic and international tourists. The tourism sector plays an important role in the Indonesian economy is very significant [1]. Tourism has significantly contributed to Indonesia's economic growth. Tourists spend their money on accommodation, food, transportation, and other tourism services. This creates increased consumer spending, encourages business growth in the tourism and other related sectors, and creates jobs for the community.

In Indonesia, the tourism industry is a major contributor to job creation. Starting with hotels, restaurants, transportation, souvenir shops, and tour guides, the tourism sector provides job opportunities for local people. The growth of the tourism sector also encourages the development of tourism-related creative industries such as handicrafts, arts, and traditional culture, which provide additional employment opportunities [2]. Foreign tourists visiting Indonesia bring in foreign exchange through their expenses while on vacation. Foreign exchange earnings from tourism can be used to finance imports, improve the balance of payments, and support a country's economic stability [3]. In addition, the foreign exchange generated can be used for infrastructure development and to improve the quality of tourism services. The development of the tourism sector encourages investment in tourism infrastructure such as the construction of hotels, airports, roads, and other public facilities. A good infrastructure supports the growth of the tourism sector [4]. Through the tourism sector, Indonesia can promote rich culture and traditional heritage to international tourists. In visiting various tourist destinations in Indonesia, tourists have the opportunity to learn about the culture, traditions, and daily lives of local people. This not only increases cross-cultural understanding and tolerance but also strengthens Indonesia's global cultural identity.

Tourism has the potential to develop areas in Indonesia that were previously untouched by economic development [5]. By encouraging investment and development of tourism infrastructure in these areas, the tourism sector can help reduce the economic disparity between urban and rural areas as well as improve the welfare of local people. Along with relying on natural resources and the manufacturing sector, tourism can also act as an economic sector that provides diversification in the Indonesian economy. This economic diversification helps to reduce dependence on other sectors that may be vulnerable to fluctuations in global commodity prices or economic instability [6]. The tourism sector plays an important role in Indonesia's economy. The contributions of tourism to economic growth, job creation, foreign exchange earnings, infrastructure

development, cultural promotion, regional development, and economic diversification are significant. Therefore, the development of the tourism sector needs to be a focus of Indonesia's economic policy to maximize the country's tourism potential and promote sustainable growth.

The collaborative Government in the context of developing the tourism sector illustrates the importance of cooperation and collaboration between the government, private sector, communities, and other stakeholders. In an effort to promote the tourism sector in a sustainable manner, the government acts as a regulator, policymaker, and facilitator in coordinating joint efforts. The government works closely with the private sector, including tourism companies, hotels, and tour operators, to leverage their expertise, resources, and experience in infrastructure development, destination management, and tourism marketing [7]. In addition, the involvement of local communities and stakeholders, such as indigenous peoples' groups and non-governmental organizations, is also important in the decision-making process and management of tourism destinations. Through active participation, social, cultural, and environmental aspects can be better considered in tourism development. Synergy and collaboration between all parties involved in the Collaborative Government are key to achieving sustainable tourism development goals by exchanging knowledge, experiences, resources, and shared responsibilities [8].

The development of the tourism sector and the synergy between the government, the private sector, communities, and other stakeholders have significant benefits [9]. First, collaboration allows for more efficient and optimal resource use. By sharing knowledge, experience, and expertise, the government and private sector can work together to identify opportunities and challenges in tourism development, as well as overcome obstacles that may arise.

Collaborative Government encourages mutual agreement in formulating tourism policies. Through dialogue and consultation with communities and other stakeholders, the government can gain broader insights and consider various perspectives in making decisions that impact the tourism sector. This can result in policies that are more inclusive, sustainable, and support the interests of all the parties involved. In addition, it promotes strategic partnerships in the development of tourism infrastructure. The government can cooperate with the private sector to invest in and build necessary infrastructure, such as roads, airports, ports, and other tourism facilities. Thus, tourism destinations can be developed more effectively and sustainably, increasing the attractiveness and accessibility of tourists.

Community participation and local stakeholders in Collaborative Government also provide important benefits [10]. Through open and participatory dialogue, communities

can contribute to the planning and management of tourism that considers their interests. This includes protection and respect for cultural heritage, the natural environment, and the welfare of the local communities involved in the tourism sector. By applying the Collaborative Government concept to the development of the tourism sector, Indonesia can achieve better results in sustainable tourism management, maximize economic potential, improve people's quality of life, and protect the country's natural and cultural wealth. Collaboration between the government, private sector, communities, and other stakeholders is key to creating a competitive and sustainable tourism sector. The aim of the article on Collaborative Government in Tourism Sector Development" is to investigate and analyze relevant literature on the concept of government cooperation in tourism sector development.

The government can collaborate with the private sector and local communities to plan and develop attractive tourism destinations. Local people have in-depth knowledge of local culture, heritage, and natural attractions, whereas the private sector can provide investment and management expertise. This collaboration can assist in developing a tourism infrastructure, managing sustainable destinations, and developing attractive tourism products.

The government, private sector, and community can work together to promote and market tourism. The government can create policies that support tourism promotion, whereas the private sector can provide funds and resources for marketing campaigns. Communities can also act as local tourism ambassadors and promote their destinations to tourists.

## 2. Literature Review

### 2.1. Theoretical Foundation

#### 2.1.1. Collaborative Government Concept

Collaborative Government is an approach that encourages cooperation and collaboration between the government, private sector, civil society, and other stakeholders in decision-making and public policy implementation. The goal is to create policies that are more inclusive, holistic, and sustainable by leveraging the knowledge, resources, and expertise of various parties involved.

The involvement and active participation of various stakeholders is key. The decision-making process involves open dialogue, consultation, and collaboration between the

government, private sector, civil society, and other stakeholder groups. Through the exchange of diverse ideas, knowledge, and perspectives, public policies that reflect the interests and aspirations of all parties can be formulated. Collaborative Government also encourages synergy and collaboration between various parties [11]. The government acts as a facilitator, regulator, and coordinator to facilitate cooperation among the private sector, civil society, and other stakeholders. The government plays an important role in integrating necessary resources, expertise, and commitment to achieve common goals in developing policies and implementing programs related to the tourism sector.

The collaborative Government emphasizes the importance of sharing responsibility. The government, private sector, civil society, and other stakeholders play their respective roles and responsibilities in achieving collaborative goals [12]. Through close cooperation, the resources and expertise of various parties can be effectively utilized to achieve the desired results in the development of the tourism sector.

Transparency and accountability are also important elements of the Collaborative Government concept [13]. The decision-making process and implementation of public policies must be transparent with good information accessibility and clear accountability. In addition, open monitoring and evaluation of collaboration results are needed to ensure accountability and learning for all parties involved.

By applying the Collaborative Government concept to the development of the tourism sector, better, more effective, and sustainable policies are expected to be realized. Through synergy, active involvement, and close collaboration between the government, private sector, civil society, and other stakeholders, the tourism sector can be developed effectively and sustainably. According to Fairuza [14], collaboration between various parties in the government, tourism industry, local communities, and non-governmental organizations can bring significant benefits. The application of the Collaborative Government concept to the development of the tourism sector can generate various benefits. First, through close cooperation between the government and private sector, resources and expertise can be optimally utilized. The government can provide policies and regulations that support tourism development, whereas the private sector can play a role in investment, managing destinations, and providing quality tourism services. This collaboration could accelerate the growth of the tourism sector and create new jobs.

The participation of local communities and other stakeholders in tourism development through a Collaborative Government framework can increase local empowerment and ensure that community interests are directly involved. By involving communities in planning and decision making, tourism policies can reflect cultural values, strengthen local heritage, and promote sustainable development. Nguyen et al. [15] suggested that

collaboration between various stakeholders can also facilitate the sharing of risks and responsibilities in tourism development. Within the Collaborative Government framework, stakeholders can work together to identify risks, develop mitigation strategies, and share responsibility for overcoming the problems that arise. This can increase the resilience of the tourism sector to environmental changes, natural disasters, or market changes.

Collaborative governments can increase the efficiency of resource use in the development of the tourism sector. Through collaboration, the government can optimize the use of public budgets, while the private sector can provide the investment and expertise needed for the development of tourism infrastructure. It can also drive innovation in product development, marketing, and tourism. Cooperation within a Collaborative Government framework can improve the image and reputation of tourism destinations (Buchori, 2019). By involving various parties in decision-making and policy implementation, mutual agreements and wider support for tourism development are created. This can increase the attractiveness of tourist destinations, increase tourist visits, and positively impact local economies.

The application of the Collaborative Government concept in the development of the tourism sector aims to achieve sustainable, inclusive, and positive growth for all the parties involved. By implementing cooperation between the government, private sector, civil society, and other stakeholders, the tourism sector can become more sustainable in terms of environmental, social, and economic aspects.

## **2.2. Factors that encourage the formation of Collaborative Government in the development of the tourism sector**

The formation of a Collaborative Government for the development of the tourism sector is driven by several factors.

First, the complexity and multidimensionality of the tourism industry encourage collaboration among the various parties involved. The involvement of the government, private sector, civil society, and other stakeholders in tourism development is recognized as an urgent need to achieve sustainability and effectiveness in destination management.

Second, awareness of the importance of inclusive and participatory decision making is increasing. In the development of the tourism sector, decisions that involve only the government or private sector are often unable to reflect the needs and interests of

all stakeholders. The involvement of local communities, advocacy groups, and other stakeholders allows for a broader perspective and holistic problem solving.

Third, understanding the importance of utilizing diverse expertise and resources in tourism development is a driving factor. Each party has a different expertise, knowledge, and experience in certain aspects of tourism. Collaboration between the government, private sector, and civil society can result in strong synergies, knowledge exchange, and innovative approaches in product development, marketing, infrastructure, and destination management.

Fourth, recognition of the importance of transparency, accountability, and good management in tourism development is the driving force behind the Collaborative Government approach. Through the participation of all parties involved, the decision-making process can be conducted in an open and transparent manner. This can increase accountability for the use of resources, financial management, and policy implementation.

Fifth, awareness of the widespread impact of tourism on the environment, society, and culture is a factor that drives the Collaborative Government approach. In the face of challenges such as environmental degradation, social conflict, or cultural erosion, a collaborative approach can enable stakeholders to work together to mitigate negative impacts and protect the long-term interests of local communities and the environment.

These factors encouraged the formation of a Collaborative Government approach to the development of the tourism sector. Recognizing the complexity of the tourism industry, strengthening stakeholder participation, leveraging diverse expertise, implementing transparency and accountability, and safeguarding environmental and cultural sustainability form the foundation for a Collaborative Government approach. In the context of developing the tourism sector, this approach brings benefits, such as strong synergy between the parties involved, innovation in the development of tourism products and experiences, reducing conflicts of interest, empowering local communities, and achieving more sustainable and inclusive results. By applying a Collaborative Government approach, the development of the tourism sector can become more efficient and sustainable. Collaboration between the government, private sector, civil society, and other stakeholders will result in more holistic and integrated policies, ensuring the efficient use of resources and achieving broader benefits for local communities and the environment. Through close cooperation and open communication, challenges and opportunities in tourism development can be addressed, creating sustainable destinations, enriching cultural heritage, improving people's quality of life, and providing positive experiences for tourists.

### 3. Methods

This study used a literature review method. The literature review method is an important approach for exploring a deep understanding of the Collaborative Government concept in the development of the tourism sector. This method involves searching, selecting, evaluating, and analyzing relevant literature related to cooperation between governments and the tourism sector to achieve sustainable tourism development goals.

Identifying pertinent keywords is the first stage in the literature review process. Subsequently, the literature was evaluated, and a selection procedure was performed. Pertinent papers, scientific journals, books, and research reports were selected based on predetermined inclusion and exclusion criteria. After that, a thorough reading of the pertinent literature is conducted to comprehend the notion of collaborative government and its implications for the growth of the tourism industry. A literature analysis was conducted by identifying the key ideas and conclusions that emerged from the chosen literature. To gain a deeper understanding of the successes, problems, advantages, and recommendations surrounding the application of collaborative government in the growth of the tourism industry, pertinent data and information were rigorously gathered and analyzed.

### 4. Results and Discussion

#### 4.1. Research Related to Collaborative Government in Tourism Sector Development

Several case studies have been conducted on the implementation of Collaborative Government in the development of the tourism sector in various countries. The following are some examples of related research.

Research conducted by Ateljevic [16] described the implementation of a Collaborative Government approach in tourism development in New Zealand. This study investigates the collaboration between the government, tourism sector, local communities, and environmental advocacy groups in developing sustainable tourism strategies. The results show that this collaborative approach has resulted in sustainable tourism, better environmental protection, and increased welfare of local communities.

Higgins-Desbilles and Johnston conducted a case study in Scotland to investigate the implementation of Collaborative Government in the development of sustainable tourism. This study describes the collaboration between the government, the tourism sector,



local communities, and environmental organizations in managing tourism destinations. The research results show that this collaboration brings benefits such as sustainable local economic development, preservation of cultural and environmental heritage, and wider community participation in decision-making.

Molinillo et al. [17] studied the implementation of a Collaborative Government in tourism development in Costa Rica. This study describes the collaboration between the government, tourism sector, and local communities in the responsible management of tourism destinations. The research results show that this collaboration has provided benefits, such as sustainable tourism development, preservation of fragile nature, and economic empowerment of local communities.

Graci [18] conducted a case study in the Maldives to investigate the implementation of a Collaborative Government for the development of island tourism. This study describes the collaboration between the government, tourism sector, and local communities in managing tourism islands sustainably. The results show that this collaborative approach has increased local community participation, increased local economic revenues, and protected and restored the fragile environment of the island.

Budeanu et al. [19] conducted a case study in Norway to investigate collaborative efforts to develop sustainable tourism in coastal areas. This research describes the collaboration between the government, tourism sector, and local communities in managing conflicts of interest, planning sustainable tourism development, and strengthening community participation in decision-making related to tourism.

In research by Reed and McGuire, case studies in the United States revealed the implementation of a Collaborative Government in the development of sustainable natural tourism [20]. This study investigates the collaboration between local governments, environmental organizations, and the tourism sector in promoting responsible nature tourism, environmental preservation, and ensuring the involvement of local communities in the management of tourism destinations.

Zeppel [21] described the implementation of a Collaborative Government in tourism development in Australia. This study investigates collaborative efforts between the government, tourism sector, and local communities in developing sustainable tourism strategies, promoting aboriginal tourism, and ensuring the participation of local communities in tourism destination management.

Bauer et al. [22] conducted a case study in Germany to investigate the implementation of Collaborative Government in the development of sustainable tourism in mountainous regions [23]. This study demonstrates collaboration between the government, tourism

sector, and local communities in developing strategies for sustainable tourism, responsible management of nature, and building strong partnerships between the public and private sectors.

Collaboration between the government, tourism, and local communities is key to achieving sustainable tourism development, protecting the environment, improving people's welfare, and promoting wider participation. In addition, other case studies can provide further insights into the implementation of Collaborative Government in the development of the tourism sector. For example, a case study in Spain investigated collaborative efforts to manage cultural and architectural heritage in popular tourist destinations, such as Barcelona and Valencia. This study shows that through cooperation between the government, the private sector, and local communities, tourism development can focus on the protection of cultural heritage, increase economic sustainability, and minimize negative impacts on the environment and society.

Additionally, case studies in Japan have revealed the importance of collaboration in developing sustainable tourism. An example is the collaborative effort to promote rural tourism in Fukui Prefecture. In this study, the local government worked with local communities, non-governmental organizations, and the tourism sector to develop tourism products that prioritize local cultural experiences, environmental conservation, and community involvement in the management of tourism destinations.

Collaborative governments in the development of the tourism sector have provided evidence that a collaborative approach can bring significant benefits. Collaboration between the government, tourism sector, local communities, and other stakeholders opens opportunities to develop sustainable tourism, protect the environment, increase community participation, and strengthen local empowerment.

## **4.2. The difference between the Collaborative Government approach and the conventional approach**

The Collaborative Government approach with the conventional approach in the development of the tourism sector can be explained as follows.

### **4.2.1. Stakeholder Participation**

The conventional approach to developing the tourism sector is often dominated by the government and tourism sector, which make decisions without actively involving other

stakeholders, such as local communities, environmental advocacy groups, or indigenous communities. Meanwhile, the Collaborative Government approach encourages the broad participation of stakeholders from various sectors and backgrounds, so that the decisions taken are more inclusive and reflect the interests of all parties involved.

#### **4.2.2. Distribution of responsibilities**

In the conventional approach, responsibility for the development of the tourism sector is usually carried out exclusively by the government. The government is responsible for planning, managing, and promoting the tourism industry. However, in the Collaborative Government approach, responsibilities are compartmentalized between the government, private sector, civil society, and other stakeholders. Each party has its own role and responsibility in achieving common goals in the development of the tourism sector.

#### **4.2.3. Transparency and accountability**

Conventional approaches often lack transparency and accountability in decision-making and policy implementation. Relevant information is not always available to all parties, and accountability for the tourism sector development results may not be clear. However, the Collaborative Government approach emphasizes transparency and accountability. Decision-making processes are conducted in an open manner, access to information is increased, and evaluations are conducted in an open manner to ensure accountability and learning for all parties involved.

#### **4.2.4. Synergy and collaboration**

The conventional approach tends to work separately for the government, private sector, and civil society. Lack of synergy and collaboration can lead to policy overlap, resource inefficiencies, and conflicts of interest. In contrast, the Collaborative Government approach encourages synergy between the parties involved. Through close cooperation, resources, expertise, and experience can be combined to achieve better results in the development of the tourism sector. Thus, the Collaborative Government approach to the development of the tourism sector offers a more inclusive, transparent, and collaborative approach. Compared with the conventional approach, the Collaborative Government approach has the potential to produce more sustainable results in the

development of the tourism sector. Some of the benefits that can be obtained through this approach are.

#### **4.2.5. Reduction of conflict**

Through the Collaborative Government approach, conflicts of interest that often occur in tourism development can be minimized. By involving all stakeholders in the decision-making process, various interests and issues can be accommodated and resolved collaboratively. This can help reduce conflicts between the government, private sector, local communities, and advocacy groups, and create harmony in tourism development.

#### **4.2.6. Empowerment of local communities**

Through a Collaborative Government approach, local communities can be actively involved in planning and decision-making related to tourism development. This can enhance community empowerment by providing an opportunity for them to voice their needs, aspirations, and concerns. By directly involving local communities, tourism development can provide broader economic benefits, increase awareness about the importance of cultural and environmental preservation, and improve the quality of life of local communities. A Collaborative Government approach is important to achieve the goals of sustainable and inclusive tourism development. By involving various parties in the development of the tourism sector, synergy and cooperation can be realized, resources can be utilized efficiently, and sustainable positive impacts can be achieved.

### **4.3. The Role and Benefits of Collaborative Government in the Development of the Tourism Sector**

The role and benefits of a Collaborative Government in the development of the tourism sector are very important and varied. The following are some of the main roles and benefits of this approach:

#### **4.3.1. Role in holistic planning**

A Collaborative Government approach allows for a more holistic tourism development plan. In collaboration between the government, private sector, and other stakeholders, economic, social, cultural, and environmental aspects can be integrated more effectively

in planning. This allows for balanced and sustainable tourism development, considering the interests of all parties involved.

#### **4.3.2. Benefit from multiple perspectives**

The involvement of various parties in tourism development gives rise to diverse perspectives. The government, private sector, civil society, and local communities have different knowledge and expertise. This collaboration enables the exchange of knowledge and experience as well as the use of diverse expertise in decision-making, tourism product and service planning, and destination management. Thus, tourism development has become more innovative, qualified, and relevant to the market needs.

#### **4.3.3. Increasing community participation and empowerment**

The Collaborative Government approach plays an active role in the tourism development of local communities and other stakeholders. Through wider participation, communities have the opportunity to voice their interests, share local knowledge, and become involved in decision-making. This encourages community empowerment and provides more significant positive impacts, such as increased income, job training, and preservation of the local culture.

#### **4.3.4. Resource efficiency and better management**

Collaboration between the government, private sector, and other stakeholders in the Collaborative Government approach allows for a more efficient use of resources. By sharing responsibilities and leveraging different expertise, infrastructure development, marketing, and destination management can be carried out more effectively. This reduces overlap, improves operational efficiency, and maximizes return on investment and effort.

#### **4.3.5. Increasing sustainability and environmental preservation**

A Collaborative Government approach encourages sustainable tourism development and environmental preservation. By involving environmental stakeholders, tourism policies and practices can be designed to minimize negative impacts on the environment. Collaboration in developing environment-friendly infrastructure, efficient water

and energy management, and protecting natural ecosystems is the main focus. In addition, through a collaborative approach, environmental education and awareness can be carried out for tourists, thus increasing their understanding of and responsibility for the environment they visit.

#### 4.3.6. Increased tourist satisfaction

A Collaborative Government approach can also increase tourist satisfaction. Involving various parties in the planning and development of tourism destinations can improve the tourist experience. Through this collaboration, it is possible to develop diverse products and services, improve tourism infrastructure, and provide accurate and easily accessible information. This helps to create a better travel experience, enhances a destination's reputation, and encourages repeat visits and positive recommendations from travelers.

The Collaborative Government approach provides significant benefits for the development of the tourism sector [24]. Through collaboration between the government, the private sector, civil society, and other stakeholders, tourism development can become more sustainable, inclusive, innovative, and efficient. In addition, involving local communities and stakeholders in decision-making and program implementation also increases their empowerment, and provides broader and more sustainable social and economic impacts

## 5. Conclusion

Collaborative governments in the tourism sector can enhance policy coherence, destination competitiveness, natural and cultural resource preservation, community participation, and sustainable socioeconomic development. However, challenges such as diverse interests, complex stakeholder structures, communication problems, and limited resources require proactive action. Key recommendations include increasing awareness, education, strong partnerships, a clear division of roles, and effective coordination and management. Future research should focus on empirical studies and case analyses to develop the best practices and guidelines for collaboration and governance in the tourism sector.

## References

- [1] Mudrikah A. Kontribusi sektor pariwisata terhadap GDP Indonesia tahun 2004. *Economics Development Analysis Journal*. 2009;3(2):2014.
- [2] Stipanovic C, Rudan E, Zubovic V. Cultural and creative industries in urban tourism innovation—An example of the City of Rijeka. *Tourism in Southern and Eastern Europe*. 2019;5:655–666.
- [3] Rafiq A, Aamir AM, Nadeem M. "Asymmetric impact of tourism on the balance of payments in Pakistan: evidence from nonlinear ARDL," *Journal of Economic and Administrative Sciences*,
- [4] <https://doi.org/10.1108/JEAS-12-2020-0212>.
- [5] Abdullah S, Razak AA, Jaafar M. "Public tourism infrastructure: Challenges in development and maintenance activities," In *SHS Web of Conferences*. 2014;
- [6] <https://doi.org/10.1051/shsconf/>
- [7] Andriyani I, Husnita L. Perubahan sosial ekonomi masyarakat pasca pengembangan wisata bahari di Kepulauan Sikakap, Kabupaten Mentawai. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Mamangan*. 2012;1(2):95–101.
- [8] Freudenburg WR. Addictive economies: Extractive industries and vulnerable localities in a changing world economy. *Rural Sociology*. 1992;57(3):305–332.
- [9] Mariani M, Bresciani S, Dagnino GB. The competitive productivity (CP) of tourism destinations: an integrative conceptual framework and reflection on big data and analytics. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*. 2021;33(9):2970–3002.
- [10] Saputra D. Tatakelola Kolaborasi Pengembangan Kampung Wisata Berbasis Masyarakat. *GOVERNMENT: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*. 2020;13(2):85–97.
- [11] Fifiyanti D, Damanik J. Pemetaan Peran Dan Kontribusi Pemangku Kepentingan Dalam Pengembangan Ekowisata Desa Burai. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Humaniora*. 2021;10(3):448–462.
- [12] Kirana CA, Artisa RA. Pengembangan Desa Wisata Berbasis Collaborative Governance di Kota Batu. *Kolaborasi: Jurnal Administrasi Publik*. 2020;6(1):68–84.
- [13] Arrozaaq DL. Collaborative Governance. *Studi Tentang Kolaborasi Antar Stakeholders Dalam Pengembangan Kawasan Minapolitan Di Kabupaten Sidoarjo*; 2016.
- [14] Kuenkel P, Gerlach S, Frieg V. Working with stakeholder dialogues: Key concepts and competencies for achieving common goals—A practical guide for change agents from the public sector, private sector, and civil society. *BoD—Books on Demand*; 2011.

- [15] Carlo JJPT, Carlo Bertot GJM. "Promoting transparency and accountability through ICTs, social media, and collaborative e-government.," *Transforming government: people, process and policy*. 2012;6(1):78-91.
- [16] Fairuza M. Kolaborasi antar stakeholder dalam pembangunan inklusif pada sektor pariwisata (studi kasus wisata Pulau Merah di Kabupaten Banyuwangi). *Kebijakan Dan Manajemen Publik*. 2017;5(3):1–13.
- [17] Nguyen DN, Imamura F, Iuchi K. Public-private collaboration for disaster risk management: A case study of hotels in Matsushima, Japan. *Tourism Management*. 2017;61:129–140.
- [18] Ateljevic J. Tourism entrepreneurship and regional development: an Example from New Zealand. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research*. 2009;15(3):282–308.
- [19] Molinillo S, Anaya-Sánchez R, Guevara-Plaza A. eTourism Challenges for Urban Tourism Destination. *Routledge Handbook of Tourism Cities*; 2020:374–388.
- [20] Graci S; G. S. Collaboration and partnership development for sustainable tourism *Tourism Geographies*. *Tourism Geographies*. 2013;15(1):25–42.
- [21] Budeanu A, Miller G, Moscardo G, Ooi CS. Sustainable tourism, progress, challenges, and opportunities: an introduction. *Journal of Cleaner Production*. 2016;111:285–194.
- [22] Erkus-Öztürk H, Eraydın A. Environmental governance for sustainable tourism development: collaborative networks and organizational building in the Antalya tourism region. *Tourism Management*. 2010;31(1):113–134.
- [23] Zeppel H. Collaborative governance for low-carbon tourism: climate change initiatives by Australian tourism agencies. *Current Issues in Tourism*. 2012;15(7):603–626.22. AbouAssi K, Bauer Z, Johnston. "Collaboration, Venus, and Mars: The gender factor in intersectoral relations.," *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*. 2019;29(1):18-31.
- [24] Paunovic I, Jovanovic V. Implementation of sustainable tourism in the German Alps: A case study. *Sustainability (Basel)*. 2017;9(2):226.[24] M. (. P. C. G. D. P. K. O. W. G. P. D. K. O. K. U. P. S. S. GINTING, "2022," in (Doctoral Dissertation, Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri).
- [25] Hasbullah J. *Social Capital: Towards Indonesian human cultural excellence*. Jakarta: MR-United Press; 2006.
- [26] Fukuyama F. *Trust in Social Goodness and Prosocial Creation*. Yogyakarta: Qalam; 2010.
- [27] Klijn E, Edelenbos J, Steijn B. Trust in governance networks; its impact and outcomes. *Adm Soc*. 2010;42(2):193–221.



- [28] Klijn E, Koppenjan J. *Governance Networks. The Public Sector*. London: Routledge; 2016.
- [29] McCroskey JC, Teven J. Goodwill: a re-examination of the construct and its Measurements. *Commun Monogr*. 1999;66(1):90–103.
- [30] Jorgensen P, Issakson M. The compassionate organization Contesting the rhetoric of goodwill in public sector value statements. *International Journal of Public Sector Management*. 2015;28(1):72–83.
- [31] Giddens A. *The Consequences of Modernity. Handbook of Trust Research*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Pub; 2006.
- [32] Bachman R, Zaheer A. *Handbook of Trust Research*. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Pub;
- [33] <https://doi.org/10.4337/9781847202819>.
- [34] Creswell J. *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among the five approaches*. 3rd ed. Thousand Oaks (CA): Sage Publications Inc.; 2013.
- [35] Yin R. *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*. 2nd ed. Thousand Oaks, CA and London: Sage; 1994.
- [36] Miles M, Huberman M. *Qualitative Data Analysis*. Jakarta: University of Indonesia Publisher; 1992.
- [37] Iskandar D, Jabbar R. BUREAUCRATIC GOVERNANCE EFFECTIVENESS IN IMPLEMENTATION FAMILY HOPE PROGRAM (PKH) IN PALOPO CITY. *Al Qisthi*. 2021;11(2):91–106.39. Miller AG. "What can the Milgram obedience experiments tell us about the Holocaust?: Generalizing from the social psychology laboratory," 2004.
- [38] Van de Walle S. *The role of trust in public services and public sector reform. Handbook de Administração Pública*; 2013.
- [39] Ansel C, Torfing J. *Theories of Governance*. Edward Elgar Publishing Limited;
- [40] <https://doi.org/10.4337/9781800371972>.
- [41] Dewi NL. *Dinamika Collaborative Governance Dalam Studi Kebijakan Publik. Jurnal Ilmiah Dinamika Sosial*. 2019;2(3):200–210.
- [42] Klijn E, Koppenjan J. *Governance network theory: Past, present, and future. Policy & Politics*. 2012;40(4):587–606.
- [43] Kalimullah NA, Alam KM, Nour MA. *Network Governance: an Overview. JURNAL BUP*. 2014;2(1):1–19.
- [44] Puspasari A. "Faktor-Faktor Yang Mempengaruhi Alih Fungsi Lahan Pertanian Dan Dampaknya Terhadap Pendapatan Petani (Studi Kasus Desa Kondang Jaya, Kecamatan Karawang Timur, Kabupaten Karawang).," Undergraduate Thesis, Institut Pertanian Bogor. 2012.

- [45] Darmawati C. Saleh and I. Hanafi, "Implementasi Kebijakan Rencana Tata Ruang Wilayah (RTRW) Dalam Perspektif Pembangunan Berkelanjutan.," *JISIP: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik*. 2015;2(4):378-384.
- [46] Suryawan MP. Perlindungan Lahan Pertanian Pangan Berkelanjutan dalam Mendukung Pelestarian Subak. *Jurnal Bappeda Litbang*. 2018;2(1):145–52.
- [47] Christiyaningsih, "Republika," 2022. [Online]. Available: <https://news.republika.co.id/berita/ritsmh459/lahan-pertanian-di-makassar-menyusut-600-hektare-dalam-10-tahun>. [Accessed 28 May 2023].
- [48] Miles M, Huberman A, Saldana J. *Qualitative data analysis, a methods sourcebook*. 3rd edition. Sage Publications; 2014.
- [49] Madani M, Iva MI, Amiruddin I. Peran Street Level Bureaucracy dalam Implementasi Kebijakan Perlindungan Lahan Pertanian Pangan Berkelanjutan di Kota Makassar. *Kolaborasi: Jurnal Administrasi Publik*. 2021;3(7):333–343.
- [50] Syawal A, Madani M, Mustari N. Implementasi Kebijakan Perlindungan Lahan Pertanian Pangan Berkelanjutan di Kota Makassar. *JPPM: Journal of Public Policy and Management*. 2021;2(7):93–107.
- [51] Nurfitri and Rasdiyanah. "Portalmedia," 2022. [Online]. Available: <https://portalmedia.id/read/7405/terus-terjadi-penyusutan-lahan-pertanian-dp2-makassar-kita-sudah-usulkan-ra>. [Accessed 28 May 2023].
- [52] Koliban CJ, Meek JW, Zia A, W MR. *Governance networks in public administration and public policy*. New York: Routledge; 2019.
- [53] Kapucu N, Hu Q. *Network governance concepts, theories, and applications*. New York: Routledge;
- [54] <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781351056540>.
- [55] Provan KG, Tilburg K. Modes of network governance: Structure, management, and effectiveness. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*. 2007;18(2):229–252.W9024