Utah State University
DigitalCommons@USU

Making Connections | Empower Teaching Open Access Book Series

5-15-2023

Introduction

David Law
Utah State University, david.law@usu.edu

Nora Domínguez
University of New Mexico

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.usu.edu/makingconnections

Part of the Education Commons

Recommended Citation

Law, David and Domínguez, Nora, "Introduction" (2023). *Making Connections.* Paper 32.
https://digitalcommons.usu.edu/makingconnections/32

This Front Matter is brought to you for free and open access by the Empower Teaching Open Access Book Series at DigitalCommons@USU. It has been accepted for inclusion in Making Connections by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@USU. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@usu.edu.

MAKING CONNECTIONS

A Handbook for Effective Formal Mentoring Programs in Academia

DAVID LAW; NORA DOMÍNGUEZ: BOB GARVEY; MARK J. HAGER; KIM HALES; AUDREY J. MURRELL; GLORIA O. ONOSU; RACHEL AROCHO; BENJAMIN A. JOHNSON; NEAL LEGLER; JAMES Y. TAYLOR; GREG DART; MICHAEL A. CHRISTIANSEN; DON BUSENBARK; LISA Z. FAIN; JAMIE CRITES; PAUL HERNANDEZ; NATASHA MICKEL; DIONNE CLABAUGH; ASSATA ZERAI; NANCY LÓPEZ; LAURA GAIL LUNSFORD; NICOLE VOUVALIS; ANDY HARRIS; JIM LAMUTH; MONICA CASTAÑEDA-KESSEL; SHIRLEY L. YU; ARIANNA BLACK; GÖNÜL KALETUNÇ; TIMOTHY SCHROEDER; TARA S. HACKEL; YADÉEH E. SAWYER; JEFF SPEARS; HANNAH M. LEWIS; JENNIFER GREWE; HARRISON KLEINER; KATHLEEN M. COWIN; BENJAMIN C. FLORES; JESSICA SHENBERGER-TRUJILLO; MILKA MONTES; VALERIE ROMERO-LEGGOTT; ORRIN MYERS; ANDREW SUSSMAN; REBECCA HARTLEY; SARAH MARSHALL; AMY HAWKINS; KAREN ENGLER-WEBER; DAWN E. CHANLAND; VALERIE PAQUETTE; WENDY MURPHY; AND SUSAN DUFFY

Utah State University
Logan, Utah

Making Connections by Utah State University is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License, except where otherwise noted.

CONTENTS

Land Acknowledgement i

Praise for Making Connections ii
Kathy E. Kram; Andrew J. Hobson; and Dave R. Woolstenhulme

Acknowledgements iii

Foreword: Mentoring Programs in Academia iv
David Clutterbuck

Introduction 1
David Law and Nora Domínguez

PART I. MENTORING ARENA

1. Mentoring Origins and Evolution 5
Bob Garvey

2. Recognizing Mentoring Program Identity and Applying Theoretical Frameworks for Design, Support, and Research 33
Mark J. Hager; Kim Hales; and Nora Domínguez

3. Cultivating Diverse Forms and Functions of Mentoring Relationships Within Academia 59
Audrey J. Murrell and Gloria O. Onosu

4. Formal Mentoring Programs: Characteristics, Benefits, and Outcomes 84
Rachel Arocho and Benjamin A. Johnson

PART II. DESIGNING, IMPLEMENTING, AND EVALUATING EFFECTIVE MENTORING PROGRAMS

5. Needs Assessment and Data Analytics: Understanding Your Constituencies 104
Neal Legler

6. The Mentoring Context: Securing Institutional Support and Organizational Alignment 131
James Y. Taylor and Greg Dart

7. The Crucial Role and Responsibilities of the Mentoring Program Coordinator 151
Michael A. Christiansen and Don Busenbark

8. Outlining the Goals, Objectives, and Outcomes of the Mentoring Program 173
Lisa Z. Fain and Jamie Crites

9. Defining Recruitment, Selection, and Matching Strategies
Paul Hernandez; Don Busenbark; Kim Hales; and David Law 200

10. Preparing the Effective Mentor
Natasha Mickel 222

11. Preparing the Effective Mentee
Dionne Clabaugh 247

12. A New Vision for Promoting Equity and Inclusion in Academic Mentoring Programs
Assata Zerai and Nancy López 274

13. Improving Mentoring Relationships and Programs Through Assessment and Evaluation
Laura Gail Lunsford 301

14. The Mentoring Program as a Research Project
David Law; Nicole Vouvalis; Andy Harris; and Jim LaMuth 326

15. Funding the Mentoring Program
Monica Castañeda-Kessel 351

PART III. MENTORING CASE STUDIES

16. Becoming AWARES: Mentoring Undergraduate Women in Engineering and Sciences
Shirley L. Yu; Arianna Black; and Gönül Kaletunç 336

17. Mentoring Redesigned to Attract Entry-Level Students
Timothy Schroeder; Tara S. Hackel; and Yadéeh E. Sawyer 347

18. Case Study of the Statewide Faculty-to-Student Mentoring Program at Utah State University
Jeff Spears; Kim Hales; and Hannah M. Lewis 359

19. The Connections Program: Integrating Mentoring Into the First-Year Experience
Jennifer Grewe and Harrison Kleiner 369

20. Facilitating Leadership Learning Using Co-Mentoring Circles
Kathleen M. Cowin 377

21. Mentoring Graduate Underrepresented Minorities in STEM
Benjamin C. Flores; Jessica Shenberger-Trujillo; and Milka Montes 387

22. The Well-Prepared Adjunct: Peer Mentoring, Autonomy Supports, and Values-Based Pedagogy
Dionne Clabaugh 396

23. Advancing Institutional Mentoring Excellence (AIME): An Institutional Inclusion Initiative 405
Valerie Romero-Leggott; Orrin Myers; Andrew Sussman; and Rebecca Hartley

24. Intentional Onboarding and Mentoring of New Faculty at Central Michigan University 419
Sarah Marshall

25. Mentoring Programs for Staff of Educational Institutions: UNM Staff Council Mentorship Program 427
Amy Hawkins

26. Staff Mentoring and Development at Arizona State University 436
Karen Engler-Weber

PART IV. NETWORK MENTORING PROGRAMS

27. Networked Mentoring Programs in Academia 446
Dawn E. Chanland

28. Networked Mentoring Programs: Targeted Developmental Relationships and Building a Broader Community 463
Valerie Paquette; Wendy Murphy; and Susan Duffy

29. Conclusion 474
David Law and Nora Domínguez

Contributors 482

The Empower Teaching Open Access Series 497

LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

As a land-grant institution, Utah State University campuses and centers reside and operate on the territories of the eight tribes of Utah, who have been living, working, and residing on this land from time immemorial. These tribes are the Confederated Tribes of the Goshute Indians, Navajo Nation, Ute Indian Tribe, Northwestern Band of Shoshone, Paiute Indian Tribe of Utah, San Juan Southern Paiute, Skull Valley Band of Goshute, and White Mesa Band of the Ute Mountain Ute. We acknowledge these lands carry the stories of these Nations and their struggles for survival and identity. We recognize Elders past and present as peoples who have cared for, and continue to care for, the land. In offering this land acknowledgment, we affirm Indigenous self-governance history, experiences, and resiliency of the Native people who are still here today.

PRAISE FOR MAKING CONNECTIONS

Kathy E. Kram; Andrew J. Hobson; and Dave R. Woolstenhulme

This handbook is a must-read for anyone who wants to design an effective mentoring initiative in academia. The contributors include scholars and practitioners who have examined the challenges of creating high quality mentoring experiences in highly complex settings. Collectively, they address multiple target populations including undergraduate students, graduate students, faculty and staff—as well as multiple approaches to mentoring ranging from traditional hierarchical mentoring, to co-mentoring, group mentoring and developmental networks. This is not a book to read cover to cover and then put on a shelf—instead, consulting a particular chapter at the moment that the reader is tackling yet another design, implementation, or evaluation challenge is the way to go.

-Dr. Kathy E. Kram, Shipley Professor in Management Emerita Boston University Questrom School of Business

Mentoring programs can have significant positive impacts for those who participate in them, including enhanced thinking, learning, development, effectiveness, well-being, retention, and can foster enhanced organizational cultures. Yet, depending on how the programs are established and maintained and how mentoring is enacted, these and other potential benefits are not always realized, and participation in mentoring programs can even have detrimental impacts. This handbook will be invaluable to colleagues seeking to develop or enhance mentoring programs in Higher Education. It will help such colleagues to understand how to maximize the positive impacts of mentoring and to minimize and avoid any adverse effects. It will help them to lobby organizational leaders for appropriate (and necessary) resources and support for mentoring programs in academia. Written and edited by experts in the field and informed by research and first-hand experience of leading mentoring programs in academia, I expect that *Making Connections: A Handbook for Effective Formal Mentoring Programs in Academia* will have a profound positive impact on and in universities in the United States and worldwide.

-Dr. Andrew J. Hobson, Professor of Education, University of Brighton, UK, and Editor–in–Chief, "International Journal of Mentoring and Coaching in Education"

Making Connections is an invaluable resource for anyone seeking to cultivate a culture of belonging on campus through an effective mentorship program. As Commissioner of the Utah System of Higher Education, I have witnessed the profound impact of mentoring on the retention and achievement of our valued students, faculty, and staff. This handbook offers practical guidance on navigating the processes and resources involved in creating and sustaining a meaningful mentoring program. I highly recommend this book to anyone seeking to improve retention rates and enhance professional development within their university community. This indispensable and approachable guide is one that readers will come back to again and again.

–Dr. Dave R. Woolstenhulme, Utah Commissioner of Higher Education

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Editor's Acknowledgements

David: To my mentors, Wesley (Father), Dean (High School Coach), and Russ (Dissertation Chair). To my wife, Shirlene, who continues to provide unwavering love and support.

Nora: To Dr. Patsy Bovery for introducing me to the mentoring world. To Kathy Kram, David Clutterbuck, Lois Zachary (decd), Brad Johnson, Fran Kochan, and Joe Pascarelli (decd) for their lifelong career dedicated to mentoring and their unconditional support. To Juan, Gaby, and Iván Pineda, the pillars of my life. To my parents, Juan and Carmen Domínguez, for being exemplary role models.

The National Institutes of Health partially supported research reported in this publication under the NIH/NIGMS U01GM132175-01 award.

To Tamara Thorpe, the Millennials Mentor and founder of Real Mentors Network, for her thorough podcast preparation resulting in engaging and insightful interviews with contributing authors. To learn more about Tamara and Real Mentors Network, visit www.realmentors.net.

To Kim Hales for her availability and professionalism in providing countless hours of internal copyediting.

To Jennie Swanson for providing helpful, clear, concise external copyediting and always adhering to deadlines. We highly recommend Jennie's copyediting. Those seeking Jennie's services can contact her at jennie@jennieswanson.com.

To Diana Negus for efficiently and effectively coordinating the author's final reviews, pictures, and profile links.

To Travis Thurston, series editor, for guidance in preparing the handbook from concept to publication, designing the associated webpage, and ensuring the website functions as intended.

To Shelley Arnold, Heather Jensen, Christina Hartman, Neal Legler and Claire Mantz for your contributions in organizing and editing the webpages, troubleshooting Pressbooks, and captioning podcast episodes. And to Erica Finch and our colleagues in USU Libraries for supporting this book series.

To students, staff, faculty, and administrators in the Utah State University statewide campus system for their support and involvement in the faculty-to-student mentoring program.

To the University of New Mexico's students, staff, faculty, and executive leaders for their trust and confidence in the Mentoring Institute.

To all the contributing authors for their dedication and commitment to mentoring. Thanks for entrusting us with your submitted work.

FOREWORD: MENTORING PROGRAMS IN ACADEMIA

David Clutterbuck

In institutions devoted to formal education, mentoring often takes the role of a poor sister – unglamorous and often unnoticed but providing pivotal support. Formal learning requires informal learning to release its potential for change within and beyond the learner. In every area of my professional practice, formal learning has given me frameworks and access to sources of knowledge that I can subsequently draw. I can rarely recall the detail; when I do, it is rarely completely accurate. The most impactful learning comes from experience — my own and what I glean from the experience of others.

The rise of artificial intelligence has helped in recent years to illustrate this formal-informal yin and yang. What distinguishes a human mentor, coach, or tutor from an AI is the depth and quality of their respective wisdom. The original mentor in the Odyssey was Athena — the Goddess of Wisdom (and other things). To help Odysseus and his son Telemachus become wiser, she enabled them to reflect upon their experiences — learning from within and without. Computer intelligence can offer what I call 'skinny wisdom". Skinny wisdom consists of vast information resources and algorithms that structure and order it into accessible knowledge. Skinny wisdom lacks two essential ingredients of the other two kinds of wisdom. Firstly, it cannot make judgments outside of the boundaries of its algorithms; it can only extrapolate and make analogies within those boundaries. Secondly, it cannot offer the qualities of humanity (although it can do an excellent job of emulating compassion within set routines).

Broad wisdom comes from experience, both personal and vicarious. It is as much an emotional quality as an intellectual one. The key to broad wisdom lies in the quality of our reflection — how we make sense of experience regarding our own identity and how the world around us works. We constantly adapt our conscious and unconscious algorithms in light of these reflections.

Meta-wisdom integrates multiple sources of knowledge, skinny and broad wisdom. It is a process of constant creation and recreation. It requires curiosity and seeing connections between disciplines, philosophies, and perspectives.

Mentoring generally involves broad wisdom. However, in some environments (especially in academia), it also requires meta-wisdom. The essence of great science is seeing connections that others have missed or dismissed.

A wisdom perspective suggests that effective mentoring programs should:

- Avoid matching people within narrow disciplines or traits because that may steer the relationship toward skinny wisdom. It's a myth that mentoring is primarily about knowledge transfer. Athena used her wisdom to help Odysseus reflect and become wiser in turn. Mentees can acquire skinny wisdom in many other ways, and the more the relationship focuses on it, the less time and space for different aspects of mentoring, which are far more deeply developmental.
- Ensure mentoring program managers have their resources for building and sharing wisdom.
- Emphasize the co-learning that takes place when mentoring relationships are at their best. If a mentor learns nothing from their mentee/protege, they probably weren't mentoring!

There are at least two standards for mentoring programs, one from the International Mentoring Association and one from the European Mentoring and Coaching Council. Both provide a baseline for constructing and evaluating a mentoring program.

These are, however, just a starting point for effective programs. Building on the standards requires insights into programs in practice. That's where this book comes in. *Making Connections: A Handbook for Effective Formal Mentoring Programs in Academia* offers practical experience from mentoring across the academic world. It is, in effect, a source of collective wisdom. The authors of Part I of this book provide a macro perspective on the foundational elements of mentoring that program coordinators must reflect on as they create the underpinnings of their respective programs. The authors of Part II share their meta-wisdom as they help coordinators understand and reflect on the various elements and interconnectedness of design, implementation, and evaluation. Finally, in Part III, the authors of the case studies share their broad wisdom based on years of personal and vicarious experiences overseeing mentoring programs in academia.

The systemic perspective is the most important theme for mentoring programs this decade. In particular, universities have many mentoring programs, each aimed at a distinct audience — pre- Uni, students, faculty, alums, and more. Each program tends to have its own mission, program management, and evaluation processes. They may also address a fairly narrow audience (such as women in STEM). This approach has stood us well overall, but only when we integrate them into a systemic approach will we harness the full power of mentoring. For example, if we want to have more professors of color, then the role model for a school leaver is not a student or junior faculty member but a professor who can open the young person's eyes to the journey ahead and inspire them to pursue a vision of the person they want to become.

If we see mentoring in academia as a smorgasbord of interlocking, mutually supportive programs, we open the door for far more benchmarking and sharing of good practice. We also enable mentees to plan better and take charge of their mentoring journey, seeing each stage as a progression of co-learning.

The systemic perspective requires program managers to be comfortable with managing increasing levels of complexity; to see beyond the limited boundaries of individual programs to the possibilities of influencing the whole system of education, from school to university, to the world of work.

In *Making Connections: A Handbook for Effective Formal Mentoring Programs in Academia*, a systems perspective is evident in two ways. First, as the editors explain in their introduction, the chapters in this book provide a "one-stop shop" for program coordinators and university leaders wishing to create mentorship programs. Though each chapter has unique content, it is only through a systemic lens that the interconnections between chapters are understood and valued. It is through this holistic view that makes creating a comprehensive theory of change possible. Second, a systems perspective is evident in Part IV, theoretically and practically focusing on developmental networks.

The range of mentoring applications in academia is gradually expanding. A significant trend is to innovate around specific societal needs. For example:

- Mentoring is playing an increasing role in supporting students at all levels who have cognitive or neuro-diversity
- Mentoring has significantly supported students from less privileged backgrounds in entering higher education and staying the course.
- Increasing attention is being directed to the problem of gender and racial/ cultural origin in the context of professional advancement. We are still far from gender equality in achieving tenure or professorial status, but mentoring is helping.

A few years ago, I coined the term pracademic to describe the practitioner and academic person. Nowhere else, to my knowledge, is this fertile role so prevalent as in the world of coaching and mentoring. An academic perspective provides rigor to field research; a practitioner approach ensures the research conclusions have practical application. For example, every participant in the senior practitioner mentoring programs I facilitate globally has to complete a research project as part of their accreditation. This same principle could usefully be applied in the accreditation of program managers. Indeed, it could be argued that it is an essential element of their personal development in the role. In academia, it might be regarded as a vital role.

Mentoring has a long history in academia, but the next decade will be important in shaping just how influential mentoring will be in shaping the agenda for change. Many forces in play suggest the traditional view of an academic institution is less and less relevant in an evolving, online, AI-assisted world. Now is an appropriate time to use this book as a comprehensive resource to bring together current good practices and design mentoring for tomorrow's world of education.

INTRODUCTION

David Law and Nora Domínguez

Introduction

This book, *Making Connections: A Handbook for Effective Formal Mentoring Programs in Academia*, makes a unique and needed contribution to the mentoring field as it focuses solely on mentoring in academia. This handbook is a collaborative institutional effort between Utah State University's (USU) Empowering Teaching Open Access Book Series and the Mentoring Institute at the University of New Mexico (UNM). This book is available through (a) an e-book through Pressbooks, (b) a downloadable PDF version on USU's Open Access Book Series website), and (c) a print version available for purchase on the USU Empower Teaching Open Access page, and on Amazon.

The Purpose of This Handbook

This handbook aims to create a comprehensive resource for those in academia who want to understand how to develop, implement, evaluate, sustain, and fund mentorship at their respective universities. We want the chapters in this book to provide a "one-stop shop" for program coordinators and university leaders wishing to create mentorship programs. Our primary goal in creating this handbook is to help mentoring programs in academia move from an ad hoc culture to one of intentionality and effectiveness. This handbook's chapters provide a retrospective and prospective overview of the mentoring field. The audience for this book is practitioners, university leaders, and researchers, with a primary focus on novice program coordinators. We selected the chapter authors because of their national reputations in specific content areas or previous scholarship. Our challenge to the authors was to write their chapter in a way that takes complex ideas or processes and makes them relatable to a novice program coordinator or university leader. For example, entire university courses and professional workshops cover topics in this book, such as conducting a needs assessment, theoretical frameworks, research methodology, or program evaluation. Recognizing that many of our authors write in a formal style consistent with academic journals, we asked them to write as if they were speaking to a room full of novice program coordinators and university leaders who wanted to know more about mentorship for their university. Thus, many authors employ a conversational writing style.

Organization of Handbook

This book has four parts. Part I contains four chapters that position the reader to understand the origins and evolution of the mentoring arena in academia. Part II includes 11 chapters designed to help practitioners, researchers, and university leadership design, implement, evaluate, and fund effective mentoring programs. Part III provides four case studies on undergraduate students as mentees, two on graduate students as mentees, three for mentoring faculty, and two on mentoring university staff. Each case study used an outline we created to address as many components of the mentoring process as possible. Finally, Part IV, which focuses on future directions of mentoring in academia, has a chapter and case study devoted to networked approaches. These networked approaches show great promise for maximizing mentorship in universities. We begin each of the book's four parts with an introduction section. The book ends with conclusions and four recommendations.

How to Read This Handbook

Generally speaking, most people do not read handbooks from beginning to end. Instead, they skim the table of contents and read the chapters most salient to their interests. We anticipate the same for this book. However, we have specific recommendations for novice program coordinators trying to orient themselves to this large and complex discipline of mentorship, especially as it applies to mentorship in academia. University leaders will also find this content helpful in understanding the processes and resources needed to create and sustain an effective mentoring program. For the novice reader for whom this book is primarily intended, we recommend starting with Christiansen's and Busenbark's Chapter 7, specifically Figure 7.1. This figure summarizes the crucial role and responsibilities of the mentoring program coordinator. In summarizing these responsibilities, Christiansen and Busenbark give an overview of the handbook and reference corresponding chapters that address specific content areas in more depth.

After Chapter 7, we recommend focusing on the case studies in Chapters 16, 17, 18, 19, and 20. As you read these case studies, ask yourself questions such as: What is the operational definition? What theories are driving this program? What is the program's mentoring structure or typology? How were mentors and mentees matched? How was the program evaluated? What were program outcomes reported? How was the program funded, and how will it be sustained?

After reading Chapter 7 and reviewing the 12 case studies, we encourage the reader to review the table of contents and the introductions to Parts I, II, and IV. These introductions give a summary of each corresponding chapter. Next, we advise reading the abstract of each chapter. By following these suggestions, we anticipate the reader will become aware of what they do and do not know regarding mentorship in academia and which chapters to delve into depending on their needs and priorities.

A Note from the Editors Regarding University Culture

When university leaders support a formal mentoring program at their respective universities, they hope to increase engagement, resulting in a prioritized outcome, such as higher retention rates for undergraduate students or improving tenure-achievement rates for faculty of color. University leaders must understand that cultural change takes time, often years. Changing culture does not happen overnight. It usually takes a few years to achieve the cultural change needed for a formal mentoring program to function as intended.