



Implementation of APPGM-SDG Solutions Projects and Impact Evaluations in Malaysia's Central Region

Nurul Hidayat Ab Rahman^{1*}, Adrian Yuen Beng Lee², Raan Hann Tan³

¹Faculty of Law,
National University of Malaysia, Bandar Baru Bangi, 43650, MALAYSIA

²Department of Film and Performing Arts, School of Arts,
Sunway University, Bandar Sunway, 47500, MALAYSIA

³Institute of Malaysian and International Studies,
National University of Malaysia, Bangi, 43600, MALAYSIA

*Corresponding Author

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.30880/jtet.2023.15.03.016>

Received 26th July 2023; Accepted 17th August 2023; Available online 29th September 2023

Abstract: The Malaysian Parliament established the All-Party Parliamentary Group Malaysia on the Sustainable Development Goals (APPGM-SDG) in response to growing public awareness of Sustainable Development Goals 2030 (SDG, 2030). One of the purposes of this research is to examine the SDG implications of beneficiary solution projects as part of a bipartisan endeavour to improve the implementation of SDG targets in Malaysian parliamentary seats. In the Central Region, which encompasses the parliamentary seats of a few districts in Selangor, Kuala Lumpur, and Pahang, a team is entrusted with compiling a report to combine the impact evaluation of SDG efforts. From October to December 2022, the regional research examined the effects of psychology and these projects' knowledge, skills, networks, and systems on the beneficiaries of the solution projects via document analysis, focus group discussions, and site visits. The effectiveness of solution providers in managing and carrying out projects, the effect on the beneficiaries, the alignment and mapping of the impact evaluations of the solution providers with the SDG goals and APPGM-SDG modules, and the identification of challenges and suggested fixes are also covered in the paper. The research also presents the quantitative analysis performed by the evaluators using standardised questionnaires that gauge six (6) essential factors: Deep, Wide, Clear, High, SDG, and Gender. The main finding is that eradicating poverty is the aim of every solution projects. Most participants are unacquainted with the SDG, and COVID-19 has stifled most of the discourse. The research recommends combining online and offline approaches and adding employment possibilities to enhance communication between parties and give more significant opportunities for society after project execution.

Keywords: APPGM-SDG, central region, impact evaluation, Malaysian parliament, SDG, TVET

1. Introduction

1.1 SDG 2030 and the APPGM-SDG Initiative

The Sustainable Development Goals 2030 (SDG, 2030) is the framework for creating a better, more sustainable future for everyone. It addresses various global issues, such as poverty, inequality, climate change, environmental degradation, peace, and justice. It was shaped by pertinent United Nations (UN) agreements and conventions and the knowledge and

achievements acquired through the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) 2015 (Mishra et al., 2023). It encompasses broader economic, social, and environmental objectives than the MDGs, concentrating on peace, participation, and inclusiveness with a brand-new theme, "Leave No One Behind" (LNOB). LNOB is the revolutionary pledge at the heart of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (Jones, P. et al., 2017). It signifies the unambiguous devotion of all UN Member States to eliminate poverty in all forms, end discrimination and exclusion, and reduce the inequalities and vulnerabilities that abandon people and undermine the potential of both people and humanity (Gupta et al., 2023).

In September 2015, Malaysia and 192 other world leaders at the United Nations General Assembly in New York adopted the sustainability plan, which includes 17 objectives and 169 targets (Joseph, C., et al., 2021). The 15-year plan for 2015 covers five (5) essential dimensions: people, planet, prosperity, peace, and partnership. Although SDG 2030 is not legally binding, it reflects the moral obligation of every UN member state to take the necessary measures within the allotted time to achieve all goals without prejudice. This may involve taking all the required steps, such as ratifying the relevant international treaties and retracting any reservations against them. Therefore, there is no reason for any country, including Malaysia, not to strengthen its policies and laws to achieve the 17 Sustainable Development Goals, which include SDG 1 (No Poverty), SDG 2 (Zero Hunger), SDG 3 (Good Health and Well-being), SDG 4 (Quality Education), SDG 5 (Gender Equality), SDG 6 (Clean Water and Sanitation), SDG 7 (Affordable and Clean Energy), SDG 8 (Decent Work and Economic Growth), SDG 9 (Industry, Innovation, and Infrastructure), SDG 10 (Reduced Inequality), SDG 11 (Sustainable Cities and Communities), SDG 12 (Responsible Consumption and Production), SDG 13 (Climate Action), SDG 14 (Life Below Water), SDG 15 (Life on Land), SDG 16 (Peace and Justice Strong Institutions) and SDG 17 (Partnerships to achieve the Goal). Malaysia's disregard for its global responsibilities would tarnish its reputation if it did not take the appropriate actions to comply with its legal obligations (Pederson et al., 2023; Khairin Nazry Karim, 2021).

Therefore, among others, the All-Party Parliamentary Group Malaysia on the Sustainable Development Goals (APPGM-SDG) was prompted by a growing awareness of Malaysia's Sustainable Development Goals. The APPGM-SDG programme has 4 phases of implementation: issue mapping, project design, solution implementation, monitoring, and impact assessment, which will complement the final report writing. In the final analysis of the APPGM-SDG 2021 Annual Report, many projects encountered difficulties in a 12-month delivery at the community level due to two (2) main challenges: the COVID pandemic and the prolonged lockdown. Nonetheless, the initiatives could be completed based on online communication and the tenacity of the local population (APPGM-SDG, 2021). As part of a bipartisan's continuous effort to improve the implementation of SDG goals in Malaysian parliamentary constituencies, the team will have numerous new opportunities in 2023 to implement more SDG projects within this country (Danial Mohd Yusof & Zainal Abidin Sanusi, 2021). Thus, it is essential to examine the SDG implications of beneficiary solution initiatives (please see Tables 1 and 2 for reference).

1.2 Solutions Projects in Malaysia's Central Region

In 2022, a team was tasked with producing a regional report incorporating the impact assessment of 18 SDG initiatives in the Central Region. The Central regional committee comprises three members, and the Central region is comprised of the districts of Kuala Selangor (4 projects), Selangor (3 projects), and Petaling Jaya (2 projects) in Selangor; Lembah Pantai (5 projects) in Kuala Lumpur; Temerloh (3 projects) and Bentong (1 project) in Pahang; and Lembah Pantai (5 projects) in Kuala Lumpur. The assessed solution initiatives were primarily from 2020 and 2021. It varied in how the SDG objectives were implemented, and these programmes addressed SDGs that predominantly affected women, young people, and individuals from the B40 communities.

The Central Region team evaluated 18 initiatives in these three locations (refer to Table 1). A few terms require explanation in this writing. 'Solution Providers' (SP) refers to a service provider that manages projects comprehensively from conceptualisation to execution for the advantage of the beneficiaries, while 'Beneficiaries' (BF) are those who benefit from the implementation of initiatives carried out by SP. In this article, the terms 'beneficiaries' and 'participants' were used interchangeably about the same group of individuals.

1.3 Objectives of Solutions Projects in Malaysia's Central Region

Before evaluating the impacts of APPGM-SDG Solutions Projects implemented in the central region, it is crucial to identify the 18 projects' distinct objectives based on the delineation of SDG objectives. The study determined eight (8) SDGs closely related to these 18 projects. First is SDG 1, which aims to eliminate all forms of impoverishment worldwide. It seeks to ensure that everyone, particularly the impoverished and most vulnerable, has the same rights to economic resources, access to fundamental services, property and land control, natural resources, and new technologies. Inequality is exacerbated by poverty, which hinders social cohesion and economic advancement.

Table 1 - Summary of the 18 initiatives evaluated by the central region

Project Code	District	State
Y21-SP017	Bentong	Pahang Darul Makmur
Y21-SP021	Selayang	Selangor Darul Ehsan
Y21-SP022	Selayang	Selangor Darul Ehsan
Y21-SP023	Selayang	Selangor Darul Ehsan
Y21-SP025	Kuala Selangor	Selangor Darul Ehsan
Y21-SP026	Kuala Selangor	Selangor Darul Ehsan
Y21-SP027	Kuala Selangor	Selangor Darul Ehsan
Y21-SP028	Kuala Selangor	Selangor Darul Ehsan
Y21-SP029	Lembah Pantai	Wilayah Persekutuan Kuala Lumpur
Y21-SP030	Lembah Pantai	Wilayah Persekutuan Kuala Lumpur
Y21-SP031	Lembah Pantai	Wilayah Persekutuan Kuala Lumpur
Y21-SP040	Lembah Pantai	Wilayah Persekutuan Kuala Lumpur
Y21-SP041	Lembah Pantai	Wilayah Persekutuan Kuala Lumpur
Y21-SP046	Petaling Jaya	Selangor Darul Ehsan
Y21-SP047	Petaling Jaya	Selangor Darul Ehsan
Y21-SP077	Temerloh	Pahang Darul Makmur
Y21-SP078	Temerloh	Pahang Darul Makmur
Y21-SP079	Temerloh	Pahang Darul Makmur

Next is SDG 2, whereby hunger is the leading cause of death in the world, so SDG 2 seeks to eradicate it. Our planet has given us a great deal, but only some have access to it or know how to utilise it effectively, so millions of people are famished. If new technologies and equitable distribution systems are used to promote sustainable agriculture, it will be possible to feed the entire world's population and eradicate hunger forever (Nik Athirah Nik Mahdi et al., 2022). The fourth Sustainable Development Goal focuses on education quality and equity, while SDG 5 addresses gender equality by emphasising eliminating discrimination against women and girls everywhere. Other than that, there is also Goal 8, which is about respectable work and development, vital for promoting sustained, inclusive, and sustainable economic growth, full and productive employment, and decent work for everyone. SDG 10 aims to reduce inequality, which is also essential to note. SDG 12 is intended to ensure resource efficiency, enhanced energy efficiency, sustainable infrastructure, access to critical services, green and adequate employment, and a higher quality of life for everyone. Lastly, SDG 14 is to conserve and sustainably use the oceans, waters, and marine resources for sustainable development. This is because the welfare of humans and the planet depends on ocean life's diversity. Marine-protected areas must be well managed and adequately funded, and rules must be enacted to prevent exploitation, pollution, and ocean acidification (Sharafa Dauda & Nik Norma Nik Hasan, 2018). An overview of the goals and objectives of 18 programmes implemented in the Central Region based on the SDGs is as follows (refer to Table 2).

Table 2 - The outcomes of 18 projects based on the delineation of SDG implemented in the central region

Project Code	Outcomes	SDG
Y21-SP017	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> To provide B40 students with online learning access. To provide students with hands-on experience in environmental labour. To establish a network of individuals with comparable interests from various Bentong constituency communities. To provide seedlings to support river riparian projects in Bentong. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ●SDG 1 - No Poverty ●SDG 2 - Zero Hunger ●SDG 8 - Decent Work and Economic Growth
Y21-SP021	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> To train participants from economically disadvantaged families in air conditioning techniques. To provide participants with human capital training to acquire employable skills. To develop entrepreneurial values and skills in participants and to expose them to high-income-generating industries. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ●SDG 1 - No Poverty ●SDG 4 - Quality Education ●SDG 8 - Decent Work and Economic Growth
Y21-SP022	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> To assist B40 women in investigating skill training opportunities in the food and beverage (F&B) industry. To empower and train ten women to acquire employable skills. To assist B40 women in investigating self-employment options and comprehending the opportunities and challenges associated with self-employment. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ●SDG 1 - No Poverty ●SDG 2 - Zero Hunger ●SDG 5 - Gender Equality ●SDG 8 - Decent Work and Economic Growth ●SDG 10 - Reduced Inequality

Y21-SP023	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To provide individuals from marginalised communities with an alternative income source to enhance their living standards. 2. To implement autonomous solutions for the community to produce 100% recycled plastic coasters and instil a sustainability mindset. 3. To establish a framework for the Malaysian and refugee communities to collaborate. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ●SDG 1- No Poverty ●SDG 2 - Zero Hunger ●SDG 8 - Decent Work and Economic Growth ●SDG 12 - Responsible Consumption and Production
Y21-SP025	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To educate participants on the fundamentals of e-commerce and e-marketplace in Malaysia by providing them with the necessary tools, training, and mechanisms. 2. To assist micro-entrepreneurs in adopting and utilising e-commerce. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ●SDG 1 - No Poverty ●SDG 2 - Zero Hunger ●SDG 5 - Gender Equality ●SDG 8 - Decent Work and Economic Growth ●SDG 10 - Reduced Inequality
Y21-SP026	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3. To enable youth and entrepreneurs to attain sustainable economic development in the community. 4. To provide equal business opportunities. 5. To improve technology awareness. 6. To enhance business and community partnerships. 7. To contribute to the community's prosperity. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ●SDG 1 - No Poverty ●SDG 8 - Decent Work and Economic Growth
Y21-SP027	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To increase access to nutritious food they choose to produce. 2. To reduce food costs and provide a potential source of supplemental income. 3. To expose participants to participatory decision-making, facilitating stakeholder engagement with other government agencies by bridging SDG gaps. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ●SDG 1- No Poverty ●SDG 2 - Zero Hunger ●SDG 8 - Decent Work and Economic Growth ●SDG 14 - Life Below Water
Y21-SP028	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To empower micro-entrepreneurs in the community to accomplish sustainable economic growth, equal business opportunities, social mobility, and an awareness of the environment. 2. To assist the community with mental health issues by employing an ecotherapy session. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ●SDG 14 - Life Below Water
Y21-SP029	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> A. To provide marginalised youth in Malaysia with the agency and skills necessary to launch their ventures for social change. 3. To provide youth with locally-tailored solutions while enhancing their credibility through professional mentoring. 4. To provide them with the tools and frameworks to identify issues around them and independently create novel solutions. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ●SDG 4 - Quality Education ●SDG 10 - Reduced Equality
Y21-SP030	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To provide a sustainable solution to enable PPR households to start businesses based on their talents or skillsets to become self-reliant and independent and improve their living conditions using proven online learning and mentoring methodology. 2. To increase participants' self-esteem and equip them with new entrepreneurial skills to enhance their social standing and break the cycle of destitution for future generations. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ●SDG 1 - No Poverty ●SDG 8 - Decent Work and Economic Growth
Y21-SP031	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To introduce the concept of 'urban farming' as one of the elements of sustainable development to the 'Stakeholders' and communities so they can participate in creating a sustainable urban area. 2. To confidently provide participants with knowledge of the sowing method so they can also apply the horticulture method in a secure environment. 3. To expose participants to the potential of urban agriculture through technological advancement. 4. To develop and strengthen roles and social relationships. 5. To increase the cost of family auxiliary income from optimal between communities through urban farming programmes of urban agricultural activity. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ●SDG 1 - No Poverty ●SDG 2 Zero Hunger

Y21-SP040	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To enable women in the community to maintain an income to reduce monthly domestic expenses. 2. To promote the realisation of women's potential through skill development and self-employment, focusing on eradicating poverty. 3. To enhance women's ability to earn income outside of traditional occupations, to attain economic independence, and to assure equal access to the marketplace. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SDG 1 - No Poverty ● SDG 2 - Zero Hunger ● SDG 5 - Gender Equality ● SDG 10 - Reduced Inequality
Y21-SP041	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To propose an innovative and new business operation model to assist women in business in facing business challenges and seizing opportunities during and beyond pandemics. 2. To increase employment opportunities via online businesses. 3. To increase household income via online businesses. 4. To improve participants' financial management abilities. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SDG 1 - No Poverty ● SDG 2 - Zero Hunger ● SDG 5 - Gender Equality ● SDG 8 - Decent Work and Economic Growth
Y21-SP046	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To provide free, equitable, high-quality education to primary and secondary students to enhance their literacy. 2. To eliminate the difficulty and disparity in education to guarantee equal access to all levels of education for students in Petaling Jaya. 3. To ensure that male and female youths achieve functional literacy. 4. To empower and promote the social and economic inclusion of the community regardless of race, religion, social, economic status, or gender. 5. To ensure that all youths achieve a functional literacy level. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SDG 1 - No Poverty ● SDG 4 - Quality Education ● SDG 10 - Reduced Inequality
Y21-SP047	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To encourage and help the women of the B40 community who have lost their jobs, experienced financial constraints, etc., due to the Covid-19 pandemic and the implementation of the Movement Control Order and the Recovery Movement Control Order in their efforts to restore their family's economic stability. 2. To give each participant a subsidy to sell their cookies/products. 3. To provide skills and knowledge training for producing high-quality, highly marketable products consistent with the digital economy and a reasonable and long-term business plan. 4. To provide information on government and private sector grants and financing that can assist each participant in developing a more robust business plan. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SDG 1 - No Poverty ● SDG 2 - Zero Hunger ● SDG 5 - Gender Equality ● SDG 8 - Decent Work and Economic Growth ● SDG 10 - Reduced Inequality
Y21-SP077	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To equip farmers with skills in financial management, sustainable agricultural management, and diversification, such as the reproduction of fish fry, to generate fish fry to meet the needs of farmers. 2. To establish a confined fish technology centre by trainees to construct enclosures to reduce the initial investment cost for confined fish aquaculture. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SDG 1 - No Poverty ● SDG 2 - Zero Hunger ● SDG 8 - Decent Work and Economic Growth ● SDG 14 - Life Below Water
Y21-SP078	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To enable women in the B40 group categorised as homemakers to develop their personal, financial, and entrepreneurial skills, with the support of their families, to achieve sustainable social and economic development within the family environment. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SDG 1 - No Poverty ● SDG 2 - Zero Hunger ● SDG 5 - Gender Equality ● SDG 8 - Decent Work and Economic Growth ● SDG 10 - Reduced Inequality
Y21-SP079	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 4. To enable local fish producers to achieve sustainable economic development by implementing sound aquaculture practices and disease control to increase income production. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SDG 1- No Poverty ● SDG 2 - Zero Hunger ● SDG 8- Decent Work and Economic Growth ● SDG 14 - Life Below Water

2. Methodology

The evaluators were required to generate two sets of reports: - (i) 18 individual reports, six (6) per evaluator, and one (1) consolidated report known as the central regional report. By employing the Impact Identification documents, the evaluators determined the impact evaluation according to the domains, namely personal, skills, network, system, SDG target, and gender dimension, by correlating the evidence in the proposal or final reports. In addition, the evaluators identified and listed the issues encountered by the SP. The evaluators then planned six focus group discussions (FGD) in Kuala Selangor (Selangor), Lembah Pantai (Kuala Lumpur), Temerloh, and Bentong (Pahang) to gain a deeper understanding of the beneficiaries' domains and issues. It is known as "impact verification." The initiatives were chosen based on their availability and the response of the person in charge of SP. Ultimately, the evaluators secured participants from six projects for the FGD (refer to Table 3).

Table 3 - Details on focus group discussion (FGD) by central region team

Project Code	Number of Respondents	Date/ Time/Location
Y21-SP017	5	27 th November 2022 /10.00am Bentong, Pahang
Y21-SP026	4	25 th November 2022 /11.00am Zoom
Y21-SP028	5	17 th November 2022/ 03.00pm Kuala Selangor
Y21-SP040	5	24 th November 2022/ 08.00pm Wilayah Persekutuan Kuala Lumpur
Y21-SP078	10	26 th November 2022/ 03.00pm Mentakab, Pahang
Y21-SP079	3	26 th November 2022/ 06.00pm Temerloh, Pahang

FGD could be conveniently conducted via Zoom if face-to-face meetings were not possible. While face-to-face meetings were required, the evaluators travelled to the FGD location. At least two evaluators conducted the FGD, one as a discussion leader and the other as a notetaker. The discussions were conducted following the organisers' provided guidelines. The conversations were recorded as audio files as well. After the deliberations concluded, all documents were uploaded to Google Drive, and transcription began. The evaluators will then, where applicable, incorporate the information gathered from the FGD into the previously drafted impact identification documents. In six (6) impact identification documents, the information obtained from FGD was included. In addition, evaluators must fill out standard forms that evaluate six (6) fundamental variables, including deep, wide, clear, high, SDG, and gender, which will be shared in the Discussion and Analysis section. Finally, the evaluators were required to produce the central regional report by analysing and discussing the information in the 18 impact identification documents.

3. Discussion and Analysis

3.1 Impact Evaluations

During the evaluation of the APPGM-SDG's impact, four (4) primary factors are being assessed. 'Deep' refers to a change in stakeholder experience where self-evaluations, psychometrics, satisfaction surveys, and mood inventories are examined. 'Clear' is evaluating change in stakeholder performance based on skills assessments, analytic tools, observational instruments, and key performance indicators. Aside from this, 'Wide' has an effect that determines how stakeholder relationships will change. It employs 360-degree assessments, relationship mapping, interviews, and social impact evaluations. Finally, is 'High,' which monitors the evolution of stakeholder systems through environmental impact assessments, financial impact assessments, input indicators, and key performance indicators. The impact evaluation also required the evaluators to determine two additional aspects: SDG and Gender. 'SDG' refers to the beneficiaries' comprehension of SDG, its indicators, and its objectives. The 'Gender' component will evaluate the proportion of women on committees and among beneficiaries and other disaggregated data. Based on the qualitative analysis, the evaluators identified a few apparent effects of each factor in the projects evaluated, which can be referred to in the table below (refer to Table 4).

Table 4 - Obvious impacts on beneficiaries using qualitative analysis

Factor	Impacts	Explanation
Deep	Self-Empowerment Youth Participation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Participants learned about financial skills from structured activities, particularly those from low-income households. ● Economic empowerment necessitates multiple skills, such as tailoring, cooking, and farming, to accommodate a person's lifestyle. ● Women became empowered by achieving economic independence and providing for their offspring. ● The programme also enables women to unwind, develop themselves, and encounter new individuals. ● Children in the programme with different abilities are proud of their plant-growing abilities. ● Children and adolescents find enjoyment in acquiring new skills with clear rewards. Many SPs collaborated with youths to develop their talents. This helps prevent adverse effects and social misconduct.
Clear	New Knowledge and Skills	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The tasks imparted new abilities and information. Diverse agricultural products were grown by women. ● This programme instructed participants on enhancing agriculture, aquaculture, and other industries. ● Everyone gains knowledge and loves the class. Female bakers may acquire new skills and interests and utilise social media to promote their baked products. This programme teaches entrepreneurial skills to women. ● Coordinated courses that taught women more, such as how to make sarees and other festive attire.
Wide	New Social Support Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Participants in the programme created a new support system that enables facilitators to communicate. ● Due to the necessity of two-way communication, they engage in social media to facilitate local sales. ● They will also communicate with programme administrators for guidance and updates.
High	New Developed System	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Some programmes taught modern techniques for cultivating plants, needlework, cooking, and plantation.

To complete the evaluation, a quantitative analysis is performed, with evaluators filling out standard forms to assess six (6) fundamental variables, including deep, wide, clear, high, SDG, and gender, by assigning numerical scores ranging from one (1) to five (5). As can be seen in the table below (refer to Table 5), a scale extending from one (1) to five (5) indicates a range of performance.

Table 5 - Scale indicators in quantitative analysis

Impacts	1	2	3	4	5
Deep	No changes	Indicated some areas of self-awareness in confidence	Some changes in self-confidence, self-esteem	Profound changes in self-confidence, self-esteem	Grateful for the changes in self and for becoming an agent of change
Clear	No new skills gained	Improvement in presentation skills	Learn new skills	New skills can be used to improve own work	Skills can be used to generate income
Wide	Did not form any network	Identify some possible networks	Made new friends and network after the programme	Connected with the new network after the programme	Planning to cooperate with the network in the future
High	No new guidelines/ Standard of Procedure (SOP)/Term of	Indication of intent to create SOP	Starting to create guidelines/ SOP/TOR in place	Draft guidelines /SOP/TOR in place	New guidelines /SOP/TOR in place

Reference (TOR)					
SDG	Low understanding of SDG	Some understanding of SDG	Able to indicate clearly which SDG	Able to prioritise SDG relevant to their work	Apply SDG in their work
Gender	Gender consideration is not apparent at all in any stage (examples: Proposal, Monthly Report, Final Report)	Gender consideration is apparent in at least any stage	Gender Consideration is apparent in at least two (2) stages	Gender Consideration is apparent in three (3) stages	Gender Consideration is apparent in all four (4) stages

The following are the quantitative analysis results of the 18 solution projects evaluated by the Central Region team (refer to Table 6).

Table 6 - Quantitative analysis of the 18 solution projects evaluated by the central region team

Number	Project Code	Deep	Wide	Clear	High	SDG	Gender	Total
1.	Y21-SP017	3	3	3	3	4	3	19
2.	Y21-SP021	5	5	4	0	4	2	20
3.	Y21-SP022	4	4	3	2	4	3	20
4.	Y21-SP023	4	4	3	2	4	1	18
5.	Y21-SP025	1	4	3	3	4	4	19
6.	Y21-SP026	4	4	4	4	4	3	23
7.	Y21-SP027	4	5	5	4	4	4	26
8.	Y21-SP028	5	5	4	4	4	4	26
9.	Y21-SP029	4	3	4	1	3	3	18
10.	Y21-SP030	5	5	5	4	4	4	27
11.	Y21-SP031	0	0	0	0	0	2	2
12.	Y21-SP040	5	5	5	4	4	4	27
13.	Y21-SP041	0	0	2	0	2	2	6
14.	Y21-SP046	4	4	4	4	4	3	23
15.	Y21-SP047	4	5	4	5	4	4	26
16.	Y21-SP077	5	4	3	4	4	3	23
17.	Y21-SP078	5	5	4	1	4	4	24
18.	Y21-SP079	4	4	3	1	3	1	17
Total		66	69	63	46	64	54	-

The programmes successfully implemented have shown a wide range of sound effects, such as fostering self-empowerment, enhancing adolescent engagement, facilitating the acquisition of new information and skills, establishing social support networks, and enhancing existing systems. Participants, particularly those from low-income households, learn about financial skills and empowerment from engaging in activities such as tailoring, cooking, and farming, facilitating economic empowerment, particularly among women responsible for their family’s well-being. The programmes provide women with opportunities for leisure, personal development, and networking. The participants in the programme develop contemporary abilities and gain knowledge in marketing items via social media, which generates strong interest in the potential for future iterations of the programme. Additionally, these programmes facilitate the establishment of a communication link via social media platforms to facilitate local sales and provide advice. Furthermore, these programmes enhance the self-assurance and eagerness of young individuals to acquire novel abilities via concrete incentives.

It is also essential to highlight the LNOB principle. This principle highlights the unwavering dedication to guaranteeing that every person and collective entity is not excluded or marginalised throughout the global development endeavour, for discrimination, is a substantial obstacle that might impede the actualisation of this ideal (Mensah, J., et al., 2022; Gabay, C., & Ilcan, S., 2017). The programmes mentioned above have been specifically developed to assist disadvantaged individuals and those with limited resource access. These programmes provide valuable skills such as sewing and cooking, which may enable individuals to generate income independently. Social media platforms allow individuals to engage in commercial transactions and seek guidance, enhancing the overall efficacy of these programmes. These programmes align with the global objectives, including the promotion of gender equality and empowerment of women (SDG 5), the provision of decent work and economic growth for all individuals (SDG 8), and the pursuit of social

justice and reduction of inequalities within societies (SDG 10). Furthermore, they collaborate with many stakeholders to collectively accomplish these objectives, as outlined in SDG 17 (Butcher, S., & et al., 2021). Moreover, these programmes include children's participation, enabling them to contribute to and instigate constructive transformations within their communities actively. This serves as a testament to the notion that even individuals in their early stages of development possess the capacity to effect meaningful change.

3.1 Issues Faced During the Evaluation Process

3.2.1 Solution Providers (SP)

The SP encountered several issues. First, budget constraints. Y21-SP040 had to limit the number of training participants despite obtaining an overwhelming response. Y21-SP078 also stated that their intention to extend the programme to include children as BF must be paused. In addition, they required more funding to purchase stitching devices. The budget issue of Y21-SP017's implementation is being addressed by purchasing inexpensive devices from the supplier. However, the tablets' quality could improve; some become defective after a few months. Second, the challenges posed by the COVID-19 pandemic. As physical activities were not allowed, activities had to be carried out online. This virtual space reduced human interaction required to achieve a complete connection or impression. Third, manpower constraints. Requests to expand activities depended on the number of available volunteer instructors restricted by locations and the feasibility of online activities. Fourth is the issue of flooding. Several locations with inundation issues caused participants to miss training sessions. There was vegetation in the area that was devastated by the inundation. Unforeseeable weather conditions also hindered the organisation of outdoor planning.

3.2.2 The Beneficiaries (BF)

The first issue was the internet connection. This is a significant issue faced by most BFs due to Covid-19 restrictions. Many events, meetings, and training were required to be held online, causing many students to be initially unfamiliar with online learning. Second, the lack of devices among some participants also caused them to be unable to attend online classes because they had to share mobile phones and laptops with other family members. Third, participants were still learning about the SDGs. Many believed the SDGs were a complex subject and were still learning how to incorporate them into their learning. Fourth, more face-to-face communication was needed. Many BF found that providing feedback via WhatsApp makes it challenging to evaluate their progress compared to a physical site visit.

3.2.3 The Evaluators

In carrying out their duties as assessors, the evaluators faced two main issues. First, better communication methods are required to facilitate better participant feedback. Many participants needed time and encouragement to become accustomed to the evaluators. Once this was achieved, the participants actively participated in the discussions. Secondly, there is a need for better planning mechanisms to ensure a smoother evaluation process. A database of participants could help the evaluators to plan the dates, times, locations, and number of participants for field visits and FGDs.

4. Recommendations

After analysing the feedback, the beneficiaries and SPs provided, the evaluation team would like to make the following recommendations: First, for SPs and their beneficiaries to have more activities. After completing the initial programmes, additional follow-up projects, refresher courses, and extended courses should be made available. It is essential to ensure the beneficiaries can continue the initiatives after the initial project has ended. The Member of Parliament could provide employment opportunities for participants after they have acquired more skills. Second, the evaluator would suggest that future research be conducted using a hybrid physical-online method. Integrating online and offline methods would increase participant engagement and provide practical training.

5. Conclusion

In conclusion, the Central Region evaluation task was completed without encountering many complications. The overall findings showed that the results were mostly positive. The Central Region team evaluated 18 programmes and generated 18 impact identification documents (six of which included information obtained from focus group discussions). The Central Region of Malaysia evaluated the reports from the districts of Kuala Selangor (4 projects), Selayang (3 projects), and Petaling Jaya (2 projects) in Selangor; Lembah Pantai (5 projects) in Kuala Lumpur; Temerloh (3 projects) and Bentong (1 project) in Pahang; and Lembah Pantai (5 projects) in Kuala Lumpur. When possible, the team also conducted a site visit during FGS visits. The Central Region team was responsible for 18 distinct initiatives in three states and determined the effects of these initiatives on the Central Region's communities. Most initiatives targeted the B40 communities, with a particular emphasis on women and children. One initiative targeted B40 communities and immigrants, distinct from the other projects evaluated by the committee. The focus group discussions and site visits allowed the team members to better understand the beneficiaries by giving a face and a personality to the statistics. The

team members were able to understand better the struggles, needs, and desires of the communities, and it is hoped that this report will be able to provide some solutions to the issues currently facing the members of these communities when presented to policymakers and decision-makers.

Acknowledgements

The authors thank APPGM-SDG Malaysia for providing financial support for this impact assessment research. We thank the beneficiaries, solution providers, higher education institutions, and all other stakeholders for their valuable contributions throughout this impact evaluation endeavour.

References

- APPGM-SDG (2021). 2021 Annual Report. Retrieved from <https://www.parlimen.gov.my/images/webuser/jkuasa/LAPORAN%20KRPPM/APPGMSDG%202021%20Annual%20Report%20.pdf>
- Butcher, S., & et al. (2021) Leaving no urban citizens behind: An urban equality framework for deploying the sustainable development goals. *One Earth (4)* 11 1548-1556 doi: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.oneear.2021.10.015>
- Danial Mohd Yusof & Zainal Abidin Sanusi (2021) The APPGM-SDG (All Parliamentary Group Malaysia for Sustainable Development Goals): Towards Mainstreaming SDG in Issues and Solutions of Parliamentary Constituencies. *Journal of the Malaysian Parliament* 1, 228-242. doi: <https://doi.org/10.54313/journalmp.v1i.39>
- Gabay, C., & Ilchan, S., (2017) Leaving No-one Behind? The Politics of Destination in the 2030 Sustainable Development Goals. *Globalizations* 14(3) 337-342. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1080/14747731.2017.1281623>
- Gupta, J., et al. (2023) Inclusive development, leaving no one behind, justice and the sustainable development goals. *Int Environ Agreements* 23, 115–121. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10784-023-09612-y>
- Jones, P., et al. (2017) The Sustainable Development Goals d Information and Communication Technologies. *Indonesian Journal of Sustainability Accounting and Management* doi: <https://unpas.id/index.php/ijsam>
- Joseph, C., et al., (2021) Development of a Sustainable Development Goals Disclosure Index (SDGDi) for Malaysian Local Authorities. *IPN Journal of Research and Practice in Public Sector Accounting and Management* doi:<https://doi.org/10.58458/ipnj.v11.01.04.070>
- Khairy Nazrin Karim (2021) A Review f the Sustainable Development Goals Policy Framework for Malaysian Local Governments. *Malaysian Journal of Sustainable Environment* doi://<https://doi.org/10.24191/myse.v8i2.13245>
- Mensah, J., et al., (2022) Understanding and Promoting the ‘Leaving No One Behind’ Ambition Regarding the Sustainable Development Agenda: A Review. *Visegrad Journal on Bioeconomy and Sustainable Development*, 11 (1) 6-15. doi: <https://doi.org/10/2478/vjbsd-2022-0002>
- Mishra, M., et al. (2023) A bibliometric analysis of sustainable development goals (SDGs): a review of progress, challenges, and opportunities. *Environ Dev Sustain*. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10668-023-03225-w>
- Nik Athirah Nik Mahdi et al., (2022) Understanding Sustainable Development Goals Concept: Malaysia Report and Trend. *Journal of Governance and Integrity (JGI)*. doi: <http://doi.org/10.5282/jgi/5.3.2022.8938>
- Pedersen, A.B., et al. (2023) SDGs at the halfway point: How the 17 global goals address risks and wicked problems. *Ambio* 52, 679–682. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13280-023-01837-0>
- Sharafa Dauda & Nik Norma Nik Hasan (2018) Framing the Sustainable Development Goals in Malaysian Online News. *SEARCH: The Journal of Southeast Asia Research Centre for Communication and Humanities* 1(10).