

The creative process of two Indonesian NFT artists from the perspective of actor-network theory

Proses kreatif dua seniman NFT Indonesia dalam perspektif teori jaringan aktor

Rendy Pandita Bastari ^{a*}, Idhar Resmadi ^b, Wahyu Lukito ^c

^{a b c} Telkom University, Indonesia

Submitted: January 13, 2023; Accepted: August 25, 2023; Published: August 31, 2023

KEYWORDS

NFT;
actor network
theory;
material
semiotics;
creative
process;
visual culture

ABSTRACT

The development of crypto has resulted in NFT (non-fungible token) derivation. Artists began to explore the NFT market with its potential. NFT artists have different ways to get engagement and establish themselves in the world of NFT, whether in terms of artwork substance or in the social field. This study aims to deconstruct the actors behind NFT artists to elucidate the visual style and the social engagement of artists in the world of NFT. The method used in this study is a qualitative approach with data validation from interviews and NFT artwork samples. The data was subsequently processed using actor-network theory (ANT) to analyze and trace the actors behind the NFT artists. Two Indonesian artists, namely Angga Tantama and Mufti Prianka, became the study cases in this research. The result of this study shows heterogeneous actors who support the artists in their work's substance and social engagement. In the case of Mufti Prianka, NFTs influenced him to explore the possibilities of creating digital artworks, whereas for Angga, NFT platforms became one of his well-established channels to publish artworks. Based on their networks, the two Indonesian artists studied have different approaches and motivations in creating and engaging with NFTs.

KATA KUNCI

NFT;
teori jaringan
aktor;
semiotika
material;
proses kreatif;
budaya visual,

ABSTRAK

Perkembangan kripto telah menghasilkan derivasi NFT (non-fungible token). Para seniman mulai menjajaki pasar NFT dengan potensinya. Seniman NFT memiliki cara yang berbeda untuk mendapatkan keterlibatan dan memantapkan diri di dunia NFT baik dari segi substansi karya seni maupun dalam bidang sosial. Gaya visual dalam kategori ini bervariasi dengan seniman yang berbeda yang merupakan pencipta di belakangnya. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mendekonstruksi aktor di balik seniman NFT untuk menjelaskan gaya visual dan keterlibatan sosial seorang seniman di dunia NFT. Metode yang digunakan dalam penelitian ini adalah pendekatan kualitatif dengan validasi data dari wawancara dan sampel karya seni NFT. Data tersebut selanjutnya diolah menggunakan teori jaringan aktor (ANT) untuk menganalisis dan menelusuri aktor di balik seniman NFT. Dua seniman Indonesia menjadi studi kasus dalam penelitian ini, yaitu Angga Tantama dan Mufti Prianka. Hasil penelitian ini menunjukkan aktor heterogen yang mendukung seniman dalam substansi karya dan keterlibatan sosialnya. Dalam kasus Mufti Prianka, NFT memengaruhinya untuk mengeksplorasi kemungkinan dalam menciptakan karya seni digital, sedangkan pada Angga, platform NFT menjadi salah satu salurannya yang mapan untuk mempublikasikan karya seni. Berdasarkan jaringan mereka, dua seniman Indonesia yang diteliti memiliki pendekatan dan motivasi yang berbeda dalam menciptakan dan terlibat dengan NFT.

How to cite this article:

Bastari, R, P. Resmadi, I. & Lukito, W. (2023). The creative process of two Indonesian NFT artists from the perspective of actor-network theory. *Bahasa dan Seni: Jurnal Bahasa, Sastra, Seni, dan Pengajarannya*, 51(2), 176–209. <https://dx.doi.org/10.17977/um015v51i22023p193>

* Corresponding author: rendypanditabastari@telkomuniversity.ac.id

Introduction

The world of crypto has spread exponentially. Crypto can be defined as an exchange medium with decentralized authority which can be conducted through a digital network. One thing derived from the world of cryptocurrency is NFT (non-fungible tokens) or as many people call it crypto art. The most prominent network for trading NFTs is the Ethereum blockchain, with many visual features being presented by the artists, this include art based images, collectibles, game related NFTs, and metaverse (Nadini et al., 2021). The prominence of NFT can be traced back in 2014 while it gained its peak of eminence in early 2021. The rise of NFT leads to the emergence of many NFT markets which allows people to “mint” (the terms they use for uploading digital assets to the blockchain) their works or their digital assets as an NFT. From this point of phenomenon, many artists found new ways to channel their works to many possible collectors. NFT allows artists to explore and engage with new peers, giving them access to improve (Franceschet et al., 2019), whereas conventional galleries engagement to the community is done by the curator. Although the NFT market is able to make a lot of money, the NFT system is in the early stage of development (Wang et al., 2021).

However, with a lot of money gained from the sales of NFTs there is a “gold rush” to this NFTs world. This also leads artists to interact in digital communities to gain recognition of their works. Through digital social interaction many artists can support each other besides gaining support from each other as artists, digital social interaction can give a positive impact on their social well-being which also can lead to the positive behavior in helping the community to improve (Chou et al., 2021). With the interaction from the community, artists can obtain influence on each other, this influence can be broken down into action and visual adaptation. This study will aim to do the inquiries of where the style is coming from. With this discussion we can conclude that the form of art is growing rapidly, although there are many who argue that NFTs is not a form of art but it still leaves a mark in the history of art. It’s still quite unclear whether this form of art is unprecedented or it’s always been there, as it shares dematerialization traits as conceptual art. Nevertheless, this study will be focused on the association of art and its social network context.

The association between art and its social context is not some kind of contrivances as Dawn Ades suggested in “Reviewing Art History”, art is not hermetic and autonomous but bound up with the current social and economic movement, which is also attached with the condition of aesthetic ideology and artistic tradition (Newall et al., 2008). From that point of view, it can be concluded that art is based on its association from political condition, economic condition, social condition, and culture, this association can form visual style. Art and its social practice is bound up, as it is also part of cultural actions (Gray & Schubert, 2018). The context of art can’t be separated from its social network.

As technology and art is developing as in the case in NFTs, it’s quite impossible to separate all aspects from technologies including human, art and technology. Interaction of humans triggered by technologies with the vast access of internet connection for everyone. This is one of the proofs that humans and technologies correlate which became the base for actor network theory (ANT). Actor network theory coined by many scholars

in the 1980s which suggests that in terms of social interactions and actions, human and non-human objects can't be separated, in other words that ANT is not anthropocentric. ANT will dissect all the elements contained in one network entity, this includes all humans that are acting in a certain network and all non-human actors that's delegated to take part in certain roles in a network.

Previous study that's connecting art and ANT explores art as a product which in this case is the intermediary of the social network. This study concludes that art as a product is shaped by the interconnections of other actors which act in the art network. This study approves that the aspect of production and distribution is affected by actors within the network (Wickham et al., 2020). This previous study can be the basis of this study, however it remains inconclusive whether it applies in certain countries or not, as the study is conducted in Australia. Although this previous study focused on art as a product, this paper aims to discuss the characteristics of the art itself, not art as a product. To put it into other words, this study discusses how social networks can shape certain characteristics of an art which include the analysis of the formal aspect and the substance of the art. Another study shows the design of ASR using actor network theory which proves that the method can be a suitable tool of analysis for art and design-based actions (Kraal, 2007). Another previous study connecting art and social actions discussed how art movement formed by current social and political conditions (Landau, 2016), many stakeholders/actors are involved in the forming of the art movement through political critique. This study proves that art is not autonomous, it is a part of a vast network of actors which can form the visual characteristics of the artist. Although the relation of the art and social and political situation is irrevocable, NFT is still in the early stage and needs an empirical inquiry. As the characteristic of NFTs as art varies, the inquiries pertaining to this are still needed. The study of applicability of ANT in art was conducted in 2011 with the case study of Rembrandt (Zell, 2011). Although this study was very relevant to the art world, this previous study sees the art as the intermediary or circulating object between actors, while this study aims to see what constructed the art. Similar study has been conducted and published pertaining to the art world and ANT in 2016, this study is discussing how the concept of ANT is really similar and related to the aesthetic of contemporary art (Halsall, 2016). Although this previous study is really relevant to our current study, we still maintain our focus on unraveling the digital artwork of NFTs.

NFT contains a lot of different visual styles, the visual style of certain artists contains different social networks that formed their artwork. This study is expected to reveal the visual style and the creative process through social theory approach more specifically actor network theory. The artists which will be the base of the case study are Angga Tantama and Mufti Prianka, both are well established artists in the Indonesian NFT community. Through this study we also conducted a comparative study between the two artists which revealed the difference in methods and visual style based on their social network. In addition, the question pertaining to whether the visual style influenced by the technology or technology influenced by the visual style is expected to be concluded in this study. There's still a lack of empirical studies pertaining to art and actor network theory. We're hoping this study will add contribution to the field of art and ANT.

Method

The methodology used in this study is a qualitative approach, the process will be started by obtaining a sample of artwork. Subsequently the artists who created the artwork were interviewed to breakdown the visual elements composed in the artwork. Certain methodology is related to the research topic and it also gives an impact to the output of the study (Valtakoski, 2020). Since the objective of this study is to obtain the association within a work of NFT art, the qualitative approach is considered the most suitable method in order to achieve the objective of the study. This study will not seek the meaning behind the artwork rather than to seek the sociological association within the artwork.

Two Indonesian NFT artists will be the study object of this research namely Angga Tantama and Mufti Prianka. Angga Tantama is one of the most prominent NFT artists in Indonesia, his work involves digital apparatus and surrealistic images with a pop art visual approach. Mufti Prianka is one of Indonesian artists who also converts his artwork into NFT, prior to the prominence of NFT in Indonesia, Mufti Prianka is already a well-established name in the world of Indonesian art. His art involves critique imagery often incorporating subcultural visual elements. These 2 artists will be the base for the study case. The study case approach is considered suitable for this research, since it creates a bridge between quantitative and qualitative methods, other than that, case study creates the potential for further development and also captures the complexity of certain cases (Johansson, 2007).

The next stage is processing the data obtained through interviews and the artists' artwork. The sample of one of their NFT artwork will be obtained and the artist will be interviewed pertaining to the artwork. The interview is driven towards the social network that constructed the artwork as a whole.

Material semiotics and actor-network theory

The actor network theory approach for this study is also known as material semiotics. Material semiotics is a set of tools of analysis that elucidate and explore the social context within a certain object (Law, 2019). It is called the semiotic approach because it's relational (everything has its relation and carry meaning) and material because we can sense the objective reality of the object. Material semiotics explores elements that are contained in the study object, this includes: objects, architecture, people, technologies, natural objects etc. All of the elements contained in the study object are equally social, meaning they hold equivalent social role, they are not differentiated between human and non-human. ANT is able to affirm the ability to act for both human and non-human. While art and design are quite imminent, Previous study shows that the design process involved many actors including non-human actors, which will go through many stages including the initial stage namely, navigating the problems (Ekomadyo & Yuliar, 2015). Although this previous study case is not similar to the process of art, there is certainly a close connection between the two methods of creation. In the process of creation entities in the network do not preexist and predefined roles rather they emerge, shift and fuse in the process of assemblages of human and non-human (Storni, 2015). The process of action and creation is de-centered in the perspective of ANT, the stable network is constantly in the process and becomes open ended. Associations in

the network are not based on the necessity or the influence of powerful actors, they are based on the possibility and enabling actors to continue the process of creation.

Actor network theory is a heterogeneous approach in analyzing the social network. The social differentiation of ANT shares the same conception as modern sociology, communities formed in decentralized manner in self-governing spheres. This is much different than classic sociology which focused on the unifying factor of people. Every field has its own system and subsystem, and it has its respective relevance of codes, this might be quite elusive, but an example might give ample explanation. A judge came from the field of law, and an entrepreneur came from the field of economy. The code of purchasing power might have strong relevance for entrepreneurs, but it has no relevance to the judge. Therefore, every system in every field came with its own code, its own meaning of things. They became self-governing spheres. This is what differentiate the centered manner of classic sociology and the decentralized manner of modern sociology.

The ANT frame of research also unravels the socio-technical aspect. The aspect of socio-technical is what supports the network to be stable or well established. Stable network comprises well translated action between actors. The heterogeneous elements which are bound up in a certain network are defined by the set of translations of actors (Yuliar, 2009). Translation in this sense means to define and a part of negotiation, cooperation, and strategy between actors. Translation can produce intermediaries such as: texts, machinery, knowledge, skills, objects. Through the process of translation actions are conducted. However, translation is also based on the conventions such as culture, tradition, and law, therefore the process of translation is not exempt, there are restraints which drive the translation.

When translation becomes an action, and action is conducted in the heterogeneous network it will involve many technical objects which in the perspective of ANT holds the equal social position as the human. The term for these technical objects is sociotechnogram. Sociotechnogram is encrypted within, this means that a certain object or non-human actors is not an extension of human, rather they are delegated the role they got in the network. When a human actor initiates an action, the other actors can accept to continue the action. When an actor decides not to continue the action, they can create an anti-program to counter the action and create a new network. Well translated actions can construct a stable network. A stable network of actors can make influence to other actors outside the network creating another set of translations to create another network.

The perspective of ANT in an art object can be seen in the construction of the artwork. As previously discussed, art itself is not autonomous, it comprises many actors that influence the creation of artwork. The process of creation itself is a translation. The process of translation include as follows: (1) interestment, voluntary action by the artist, what makes the artist assigned to their role as they are, and they planned the program of actions; (2) enrollment, the artists translate the program of actions with other actors and inscribed themselves to the network; (3) point of passage, how artists assign roles to other actors in the network (for example, NFT marketplace, creation devices, NFT communities etc.); and (4) adoption/trial of strength how artists adopt

their role as they are assigned to, here stable translation is continuous and the network is sustained (Kraal, 2007).

Results

Interview result with Angga Tantama

Interview with Angga Tantama was conducted in July 2022 through mobile video call. He grew up in the city of Tangerang in west Java prior to his moving to the city of Wonogiri in central Java. Angga began his interest in art especially during the kindergarten years. The access to the pop culture sparks Angga's afflatus to take a leap to making art. Several pop cultures that became Angga's catalyst in his childhood are Dragon Ball comics and Kamen Rider television series which were the most prominent entertainment for kids back in 1990s. The art subject which taught in the kindergarten made an impact on Angga's career as an artist for he received affirmation through a compliment from his teacher in the art subject. Comic books, more specifically manga (Japanese comics) have created a huge impact in Angga's art. During the interview he mentioned several manga which influenced his art besides Dragon Ball, there is Detective Conan and Doraemon. He also mentioned a Hong kong based comics called Tiger Wong. However, he admitted the impact that the other comics created is not as huge as Dragon Ball. After the childhood he moved to Wonogiri central Java, as he is in central Java the access to comic books wasn't as easy as in Tangerang, therefore during the adolescence he rarely read comics however, the access to television shows were widely open he mentioned several television shows that he watched during the adolescence namely, Crayon Shin-Chan, Detective Conan, and Ninja Hatori-kun which was aired in the national television. Other than television and comics, Angga also oftenly purchased posters and read books. One book that he mentioned during the interview that created an impact to his works is Harry Potter. The climax of his artistry journey is during his college year in which he was introduced to the digital tool for art creation namely, Adobe Illustrator by his professor. During his college year he learned vector-based image creation in a course. As his friends and acquaintances began to adopt the creation method, he also began to adopt the vector-based image creation. During this time Angga also oftenly purchased design magazines such as Babyboss and Concept, these were widely prominent magazines for graphic designers and illustrators, which made a huge influence to Angga's current artworks. His environment such as friends and university also motivated him to look for many references of artworks as he majored in Graphic Design/Visual Communication Design. On the other hand, the access to internet connection also made a huge impact on his artworks as he was able to browse the internet to look for references of other artist's works. Prior to the introduction to the vector-based image creation method, he tried digital photo manipulation and digital painting. Throughout his college year he was also being introduced to an online platform called mtees.com, an online platform for artists to sell their artworks. Through the aforementioned online platform, he was able to sell his artworks, from this huge appreciation from the audience he was determined to continue to work as an artist. The habituation of using digital gives a significant impact on his current creative process of creating NFTs. Throughout his career he mostly conducts his artistry activities online. As he continues to act in the world of digital art, in 2019 he began his career in the NFT

world. He received an invitation from an online platform called [markersplace.com](https://www.markersplace.com) to contribute to their platform. Since he received the invitation from [Markersplace.com](https://www.markersplace.com), he started to study all about NFTs and cryptocurrencies. As he grows from the appreciation of NFT collectors he continues to create NFTs in other platforms as well such as [Foundation.io](https://www.foundation.io), [Objkt.xyz](https://www.objkt.xyz), and [Formfunction.xyz](https://www.formfunction.xyz) a solana based NFT network. Angga also supported local artists by collecting their artworks, more specifically the artists who engaged in Tezos network where Indonesian artists mainly published their NFT artwork. These local artists also gave influence to his artwork, although he didn't really state huge influence from these local artists.

Artwork sample of Angga Tantama

This section will discuss the network of Angga Tantama's artwork. We obtained one of Angga Tantama's artwork from [makersplace.com](https://www.makersplace.com), the platform used by the artist to publish his NFT artworks. Below is the artwork titled "Dopamine" which was published in 2021.



Figure 1. "Dopamine" by Angga Tantama (source: [Makersplace.com](https://www.makersplace.com), 2022)

Angga uses vector based digital image creation as his method, this also applies in this particular artwork. The capability of digital imaging to produce constant lines and brush strokes gave Angga the ability to create the image that he was planning. One of many artists that gave a huge influence to Angga's artwork is Maxim Cyr also known as [RecycledWax](https://www.recycledwax.com), a vector image based digital artist and comic book author. Through the work of Maxim Cyr, Angga was able to see the line works and the brush strokes as the base for his artworks. Another artist that has influenced Angga is Kepala Kardus. "Dopamine" contains many colors, Angga stated that he got the influence for color decision in most of his artworks came from the artist Dan Mumford an England based artist. Other than colors, we can also see solid shadings in "Dopamine", the shading from this artwork came from when he started to sell artworks in [mtees.com](https://www.mtees.com). This particular platform was basically sold t-shirt designs through the internet. Cel-shaded artworks made the t-shirt production more efficient and more applicable for screen printed

t-shirts although there is also limitation in regards to color selection because the production expenses of t-shirts are determined by the number of colors contained within the design. However, through the habituation of applying cel-shadings, Angga found convenience of this one particular method, therefore he continues to use cel-shading method in his artworks.

“Dopamine” also contains a lot of objects and figures in it, through the interview Angga stated that the decision of these subject matters is influenced by street arts and graffiti. Through this particular artwork we can see a figure of cat’s head, mouse, a shoe, a cell phone, a yarn ball, dollar sign, a speaker, UFO, soda can, and a paintbrush can. The decision of these objects is based on his intuition as he stated that these figures purely came out of his imagination. As for the creation of “Dopamine”, he started from the creation of the cat’s head and subsequently he created the appropriate composition to fit the whole artwork. For example, there is a constructed relation between cats and yarn balls as shown in popular culture therefore, he re-created that relation in this artwork. On the other hand, Angga was also determined to pursue the same atmosphere of western street art/graffiti artworks as he draws influence from many of western street art. He found many references of similar artworks from online platforms such as Behance.com and Pinterest.com. Most of these random objects and figures on “Dopamine” came from other people’s artworks that he saw randomly on the internet such as Behance.com and Pinterest.com.

Interview result with Mufti “Amenkcoy” Prianka

The interview with Mufti Prianka also known as Amenkcoy was conducted in July 2022 in Bandung. His sense in art began to develop from early childhood when he started to doodles on tables, walls. Mufti began his career in art in his ad-olescence, more specifically in his college years when he learned how to use Chinese ink. During his college years when he was on his thesis, he had many rejected revisions papers that he had already printed. He used those pa-pers as a medium to experiment with Chinese ink. His friend also made a huge influence on his artistry, during the interview he mentioned one friend who had internet access at that time and often downloaded a lot of music and pictures, one of them being Black Flag, an American punk rock band known to popularize hardcore sub-genre. From that point the chain of influence from western music started to emerge including Sonic Youth and Nirvana. Explicitly he got introduced to the western underground music scene from his friends which gave huge influence to his art. Although there were a lot of influences in music, he stated that the influence actually came from the visuals of the music such as album cover. He used to visit a music store in Bandung city called Aquarius where he usually looked for new music. He stated that he really looked at the visual of the album first before the music, during the interview he stated how he looked at The Cure’s *Disintegration* started from the visual although he later grew fond of the music. He mentioned several music album covers that has a huge influence in his artwork including Sonic Youth’s “Goo”, several album from Black Flag which de-signed by subculture artist Raymond Pettibone (this includes “Slip It In”, “My War”, and “Nervous Breakdown”) and Nirvana’s “Nevermind”. During his college years, when he lacked semiotic knowledge, he shared a lot of bands and music with his friends. This wished him up that the quality of a music artwork from an album cover doesn’t determine the quality of the music inside.

When discussing his method of work, he mentioned five essential artmaking tools, including Chinese ink, snowman marker, pen, pencil and drawing pen. But the most important tool for his art creation is Chinese ink. There is an economical and practical value contained within Chinese ink, during the interview he mentioned that Chinese ink is easy to carry, lasts very long and easy to use.

Mufti began creating NFT in 2021, he was introduced to NFT by his friend Pam who is an active musician with a local band called Runtah. Pam created a small workshop to support contemporary artists to earn income from NFT. Although Mufti wasn't participating in the workshop, he received several pieces of information from other participants. In addition, his artist friend Muhammad Akbar also recommended him to create NFT to monetize the artworks.

Mufti was pretty established as an artist before the prominence of NFT in Indonesia, therefore many of his NFT artworks are pretty much the same as his regular artworks. The difference is that there is conversion from physical artwork into digital artwork which involves many apparatuses such as scanner and computer software. Mufti started his journey in the world of NFT around October 2021 with the help of Muhammad Akbar through a workshop. He was taught step by step on how to make a digital wallet and set the price of an artwork. Even after he has his own NFT page, he still needs to expand his connection with people in the NFT world in order to establish himself. Despite the conventional methods on his works, NFT made him explore digital works such as animating his works, Mufti felt that this was needed because the NFT world opens new possibilities for his works. NFT also brings new networks into his works for the locals already familiar with both of his name and his works, but the international market is starting to acknowledge him through this NFT world.

Gradually, his junior friends from his university began to notice his involvement in the world of NFT. They invited him to a digital community space in form of a Whatsapp group (one of the most prominent communication platforms in Indonesia) called ASN an abbreviation of "Asosiasi Seni NFT" can be translated to Association of NFT Art, from there he received more information pertaining NFT world, in addition, the community also gave supports to each other in terms of promoting NFT works. The promotion was conducted through the internet platform most prominently Twitter. Twitter is the most prominent place for NFT newcomers to promote their works and to gather information, the community helps each other through "retweet" feature which helps certain posts to get more engagement to the public. Other than that, the community also organizes other agenda such as gathering, art making events, discussions and workshops. ASN also has a Discord space, Discord is also a prominent online platform in Indonesia which focuses on forum and discussion for communities. Mufti was very interested in this community; he was eager to know the people and the works of other artists.

Mufti published all of his NFT works in Tezos network, the platform for this previously known as Hicetunc the URL currently displayed as Hic.af. One of the reasons why he chose this platform is merely economical. The expense to upload the work to the platform known as the term "gas fee" is relatively inexpensive. In a way, through Hic.af he was able to "mint" multiple works with minute capital. Although the Mufti NFT

world is relatively new, his friends and community help him to get more engagement with the public.

Artwork sample of Mufti “Amenkcoy” Prianka

The sample of the artwork that we obtained is titled “Membasuh Kaki Ibu”. The source of this artwork is from hic.af an NFT platform based on Tezos network which rose to prominence in early 2021 in Indonesia. “Membasuh Kaki Ibu” was created to celebrate Mother’s Day, this artwork was published in 2021. Below is the visual appearance of “Membasuh Kaki Ibu”.



Figure 2. “Membasuh Kaki Ibu” by Mufti Prianka (source: Hic.af, 2022)

“Membasuh Kaki Ibu” can be translated as washing mother’s feet. He believes the ritual of washing mother’s feet can only be found in Indonesia because there’s a spiritual connection between a mother and a child. This cultural activity symbolizes the form of devotion of a child to a mother. He stated in the interview that he really wanted to conduct that form of ritual to his mother which has never been done in his life. He has never seen such cultural activity in his life although he’s in the right environment for such a ritual. He stated that the punk kid figure which is presented in his artworks is supposed to represent himself. He perceived himself as a rebellious figure and not too obedient to certain rules and had a high sense of survival. Punks in Indonesia can be seen in the street busking in street vendors, restaurants and public transportations with appropriation of western subculture attributes in order to earn some money. The punk kid figure in “Membasuh Kaki Ibu” is the metaphor of his acts. The punk influence came from the western culture penetrated through music and fashion which as previously discussed made a huge impact in his artistry. He saw many self-proclaimed “punks” working in big corporations, wearing branded clothes and shoes, coming from the middle class and still consumed mass produced capitalism products which in his perspective doesn’t really portrays punks as it should. Through his artworks he tries to

counter that “fake punks” idea, the busking punk kids in his sense are the authentic ones.

In “Membasuh Kaki Ibu” and most of his NFTs artworks we can see there are texts. He stated that these texts are influenced by Indonesian comics. He has a really huge interest in Indonesian comics such as Wayang comics which were popularized by R.A Kosasih, romance comics, superheroes comics, action comics also known as Silat comics. His college senior who is also an artist and a collector of comics and magazines introduced him to Indonesian comics. In his perspective, comics contain many dialogues between characters. He began to experiment to incorporate comics elements in his artworks. On the other hand, during his college years pop art risen to prominence. Artists such as Roy Lichtenstein and Andy Warhol were mentioned as influences during the interview. The popular media portrayed by pop artists such as posters and comics made a huge influence on Mufti's artworks. The content of the texts draws influence from music and poetry. According to Mufti, Indonesian musicians such as Iwan Fals gave an influence to the texts that he wrote on his artworks, in addition poets such as Widji Tukul, Khairil Anwar and W.S Rendra also mentioned as influence to his artworks. These artists gave him a basis of practicing and experimenting texts as he analyzed the diction from reading the lyrics and poetry. Lastly, the element of Arabic text that reads “Allah” which means God, represents his belief in religion. He stated that no matter how deviant and depraved he is, he is still a believer.

Analysis

Through the interview result we can conclude that certain artworks consist of heterogeneous elements. Certain artworks contain relations between human actors and non-human actors. As one art comprises heterogeneous elements, the artist on the other hand began reassembling those elements into one artwork. As Latour stated that everything is ready made waiting to be assembled and reassembled (Halsall, 2016). Assembling and reassembling is the creation process basis which in the perspective of actor-network theory is a translation process. In this section the translation process of the artist will be elucidated and unraveled. The translation process analysis comprises four stages including: interestment, enrollment, point of passage, and adoption/trial of strength.

Actor-network theory analysis on Angga Tantama

In the interestment stage the catalyst that determined the artist to assign themselves to become an artist and what is their plan of actions. Angga's artistry began in early childhood, especially during his kindergarten years. During this year Angga got appreciation from his Kindergarten teacher in the art subject. His early childhood was also filled with many popular cultures. The easy access to popular culture determined Angga to create art. In the interview Angga mentioned several pop culture references which became catalysts including Dragon Ball comics and Kamen Rider television series, in addition Detective Conan and Tiger Wong also stated as his influence. When he moved to Wonogiri, the access to comic books became rare. The popular culture that he mentioned when he moved to this city are mostly television shows including Crayon Shin-Chan, Detective Conan and Ninja Hatori-kun. Angga also stated he is really keen on Harry Potter books and films and it implicitly gave him an influence as an artist. His college year was a major stepping stone in his career as an artist, during these

moments he was introduced to Adobe Illustrator which became his main tool to create NFT. The college years were also when he was introduced to design magazines such as Babyboss and Concept where he found many references to other artist's works. His environment in graphic design major shaped him and also encouraged him to look for references of works. There are several artists who became the reference for Angga's artworks namely, Maxim Cyr (also known as RecycledWax), Dan Mumford and Kepala Kardus. With the help of internet connection, he was able to explore the art world and NFT world, which became the basis of most of his artworks. During these years Angga was also being introduced to Mtees.com an online platform for artists to sell t-shirt designs. Mtees.com is currently not active, however the format that Mtees.com requires to sell design in their platform became the basis of Angga's current NFT works. The limited colors and solid cel-shaded figures became the basic format of his current artworks. As he kept creating digital artworks an online NFT platform began to notice him and invited him to use their platform to publish and sell his artworks. The visual style of his artworks came from many references, but a huge impact of influence came from western street art or commonly known as graffiti and also works by other artists which have been published on online platforms such as Behance.com and Pinterest.com. To conclude this stage, Interestment actors includes Kindergarten teacher, comic books such Dragon Ball, Doraemon, Detective Conan and Tiger Wong, Kamen Rider, Television Set, Crayon Shin-Chan, Detective Conan television series, Adobe Illustrator, campus environment, design magazine such as Babyboss and Concept, internet connection, Mtees.com, Makersplace.com, Maxim Cyr, Kepala Kardus, Dan Mumford, street art/graffiti, Behance.net, Pinterest.com.

In the enrollment stage the common translation between 2 actors in the case of Angga will be elucidated. The action of the artist is based on the interaction and common purpose of other actors around them. In this case, Angga received an invitation from markesplace.com to sell his works in the form of NFT. Through this interaction there are translation process between Angga and the representative of Markersplace.com, when Makersplace.com needs artists to engage in their platform and Angga as an artist also put an interest in NFT market as a platform to sell his works, the result is a common translation to put it into action. The invitation from Markersplace.com motivates him to study pertaining to NFT, blockchain and cryptocurrencies. As he published his NFT works on the platform he got the appreciation from the collectors which motivated him to continue to create NFT. Through this appreciation from collectors, Angga inscribed himself to the network. From this elucidation we can conclude that the actors for this stage are: Makersplace.com, and collectors.

The next stage is point of passage, in this stage the artist assigns roles to other actors in order to sustain and expand the network. In Angga's case, the habituation of utilizing Adobe Illustrator as the tool for his NFT creation made the software hold an important role in NFT creation. In utilizing the software, the hardware such as computer and electricity is needed, therefore Angga assigned the role to his computer and the electricity. In the enrollment stage he gained appreciation which resulted in the inscription of himself as an artist. The appreciation from the collectors of Markersplace.com made him keep publishing works on the platform. Moreover, Angga also began to use other platforms as his other publication channel such as Foundation.io, Objkt.xyz and Form-function.xyz. In a way, these platforms have been assigned by Angga to become a part

of the network. In conclusion this stage includes actors such as Adobe Illustrator, computer, electricity, Makersplace.com, Foundation.io, Formfunction.xyz, Objkt.xyz and collectors.

The final stage is adoption or trial of strength, in this stage the artist begins to adopt their role as an artist, in addition the other actors also begin to adopt the role that they are assigned. In this stage the network of an artist becomes stable. In Angga's case, the appreciation from the collectors in Makersplace.com made him adopt his identity as an artist, this also impacted other actors in Angga's network such as Adobe Illustrator, computer, and electricity to be sustained. In addition, there are also other platforms that's been assigned by Angga to be his publication channel. In this case the appreciation from collectors made him publicize his NFT works in other platforms as mentioned in the point of passage stage. Angga also supports local NFT artists through the Indonesian NFT community, the inspiration to continue to create distinctive visual style still came from Behance.com, Pinterest.com, and also several local artists. In conclusion actors in this stage is almost similar to the actors in point of passage stage, however there are several other actors which acts in this stage, this includes Adobe Illustrator, computer, electricity, Makersplace.com, Foundation.io, Formfunction.xyz, Objkt.xyz, Behance.net, Pinterest.com and collectors. Below is the table of sociotechnogram which constructed the NFT work of Angga Tantama.

Table 1. Sociotechnogram table of Angga Tantama

Human Actors	Non-Human Actors
<i>Kindergarten teacher, Maxim Cyr, Kepala Kardus, Dan Mumford, collectors, college friends</i>	<i>comic books such Dragon Ball, Doraemon, Detective Conan and Tiger Wong, Kamen Rider, Television Set, Crayon Shin-Chan, Detective Conan television series, Adobe Illustrator, campus environment, design magazine such as Babyboss and Concept, internet connection, Mtees.com, Makersplace.com, street art/graffiti, Behance.net, Pinterest.com, computer, electricity, Foundation.io, Formfunction.xyz, Objkt.xyz</i>

Actor-network theory analysis on Mufti "Amenkcoy" Prianka

The interestment stage of Mufti "Amenkcoy" Prianka began from his early childhood when he began to doodles on tables and walls. Mufti stated that his interest in art occurs naturally. In his adolescence he started to use Chinese ink and he experimented on rejected thesis papers. This Chinese ink can be highlighted as one of the most non-human actors that constructed his artistry along with other essential tools that he mentioned namely marker, pencil, and drawing pen. During college, his friend who had internet access introduced him to American punk rock music, the most prominent is Black Flag, in addition Sonic Youth and Nirvana also stated as a major influence in his artistry, the visual of western underground music. Subsequently he began to explore visual references from music albums, he frequently visited Aquarius music store and saw several albums covers, he stated that the visuals of the music come first before the music itself. Several music album covers are mentioned including Sonic Youth's "Goo" and several albums from Black Flag which were designed by American artist Raymond Pettibone and Nirvana's Nevermind. This music album also catalyzed the emergence of punk figures in his works which is also supposed to represent himself. The style of his artworks prior to the NFT prominence are pretty much well known in the social field of art. Mufti's visual style comprises many actors namely, local comic books including R.A Kosasih, Silat comics/action comics, superhero comics, and romance comics. In addition,

Mufti was also influenced by pop art, artists such as Roy Lichtenstein and Andy Warhol. Comics and pop art were being introduced by his college senior, who in this case is one of the highlighted actors in the construction of Mufti's artwork as he stated in the interview that he tries to mimic the visual style and elements of comic books. Another actors that influenced Mufti's artworks in terms of linguistic style are Indonesian musicians and poets, in the interview he stated that musician such as Iwan Fals influenced him to create the text in his artworks, in addition, poets such as W.S Rendra, Widji Tukul, and Khairil Anwar also stated as his influence in creating the texts in his artworks. Lastly, Mufti's artwork contains Indonesian culture themes in the interview about his artworks, he mentioned that he always looks at phenomena that only occurs in Indonesia, therefore Indonesian culture is one of the actors that helps form Mufti's artworks.

The phase of *interessement* continued when he began to enter the NFT world in 2021. Several actors who took an important role in this phase are Muhammad Akbar, an artist friend who recommended him to enter the NFT world, and Pam who also introduced him to the NFT world. ASN (Asosiasi Seni NFT) or translated as the Association of NFT Art is also an important factor in the *interestment* stage along with his junior from college. Through this actor he was able to obtain much information pertaining to NFTs and gather support from the community. The community uses Whatsapp, Discord and Twitter to interact with other members and to help other artists. These platforms are essentials for Mufti's network.

In conclusion the actor in the *interestment* stage in Mufti Prianka's case includes essential art creation tools such as Chinese ink, pencil, drawing pen and marker, music and album covers including Black Flag, Sonic Youth and Nirvana, friends which includes Muhammad Akbar and Pam, ASN (Asosiasi Seni NFT), college senior, Indonesian comics, pop art, Indonesian musicians such as Iwan Fals, Indonesian poets such as W.S Rendra, Widji Tukul, and Khairil Anwar, Indonesian culture, Twitter, Whatsapp, Discord

The stage of *enrollment* began when he was introduced to NFT by his friend Muhammad Akbar and Pam as previously mentioned, both friends recommended Mufti to start creating NFTs. As his junior friends from college noticed that he's starting to create NFTs, he's being invited to an ASN community group through platforms such as Whatsapp and Discord where he receives various information pertaining to NFTs. In the interview he stated that he learned the technical aspect on NFTs from Muhammad Akbar. As he learned the technical aspects and the characteristics of NFT, Mufti began to convert his artwork into digital form and experiment with digital tools. From this point, he began to animate and colorize his artwork. In the case of Mufti, his exploration in digital art was influenced and shaped by the advancement of technology. In this stage he mentioned two apparatuses that supported him in creating NFTs namely computer and scanner which were also supported by electricity, although he didn't specify what kind of computer software, he used for creating digital artworks. the program of action in this case came from his friends and the community and Mufti began to inscribe himself into the network of NFT, therefore it can be concluded that the actors in this stage includes Muhammad Akbar, ASN (Asosiasi Seni NFT), computer, scanner, electricity, internet connection and computer software.

The third stage is point of passage where the artist assigns roles to other actors in the network, in the case of Mufti, the delegation bestowed on computer software, scanner, electricity and online platform. In the interview Mufti stated that he uses Hic.af or Objkt.xyz as the platform to publicize his NFT works. Hic.af, previously known as Hic et Nunc, is an NFT platform based on Tezos network. The reason he chose this network as his channel on publishing NFT works is purely economic. The gas fee is relatively inexpensive and his purchasing power is quite affordable. To promote his NFTs he got support from ASN. The community gave support through Twitter's retweet feature he was able to gain engagement to the public. Regarding the substance of his NFT art, there isn't much difference between his NFTs artwork and his regular artwork. The only difference is the exploration of color and addition of animation. The theme and art elements are pretty much the same. The conclusion of actors in this stage includes online platforms such as Hic.af/Hic et Nunc and Objkt.xyz, Tezos network, ASN, computer software, scanner, computer, internet connection and electricity.

The last stage is adoption or trial of strength, in the case of Mufti Prianka as he gained appreciation from the community and the collectors, he began to adopt his role as an NFT artist. As he continues to publish his works in online platforms such as Hic.af (previously known as Hicetunc) and Objkt.xyz he also gets support from ASN community and continues to use Twitter as the platform for his artwork promotion. In this stage the NFT network of Mufti Prianka became stable as he began to adopt the role and assign other actors as previously mentioned in the point of passage stage. As for the artwork he continues to explore digital artwork with colors and animation. The conclusion of actors in this stage are online platforms such as Hic.af/Hicetunc and Objkt.xyz, Tezos network, ASN, computer software, scanner, computer, internet connection and electricity. These actors sustained from the previous stage as the network became stable. Below is the table of sociotechnogram which constructed the NFT work of Mufti "Amenkcoy" Prianka.

Table 2. Sociotechnogram table of Mufti "Amenkcoy" Prianka

Human Actors	Non-Human Actors
<i>friends which include Muhammad Akbar and Pam, ASN (Asosiasi Seni NFT), college senior, Indonesian musicians such as Iwan Fals, Indonesian poets such as W.S Rendra, Widji Tukul, and Khairil Anwar, college junior friends</i>	<i>essential art creation tools such as Chinese ink, pencil, drawing pen and marker, music and album covers including Black Flag, Sonic Youth and Nirvana, Indonesian comics, pop art, Indonesian culture, Twitter, Whatsapp, Discord, computer, scanner, electricity, internet connection, computer software, Hic.af/Hic et Nunc and Objkt.xyz, Tezos network</i>

Conclusions

Through the case study of Angga Tantama and Mufti Prianaka it can be seen there are heterogeneous actors behind their works, in addition there are also heterogeneous actors behind their social engagement. Angga is unable to carry out his program of action in the NFT world and the art world in general without the appreciation from his kindergarten teacher in his childhood and the collectors of his artworks. Through Angga's NFT works we can see several actors who act behind it, namely several pop culture, the works from other artists, and design magazines such as Babyboss and Concept. The access to internet connection assists him to publish his works on various

internet platforms. During his college years Angga was introduced to vector-based image creation by his professor. And the requirements of artworks stipulated by Mtees.com impacted the habituation of using Adobe Illustrator as his method of art creation. Therefore, in the case of Angga the advancement of NFT didn't really make a significant impact in his substance of works and in his social engagement, as he's already established himself as an artist in the digital world. As for Mufti Prianka there is an endeavor to adapt to the advancement of NFT, as he began to explore and adopt the digital based art creation such as animating his works and colorizing his works with computer software. There are also several actors who encouraged him to enter the world of NFT which previously discussed in the stage of interestment. Mufti is also supported by a local NFT community called ASN (Asosiasi Seni NFT). Through this community Mufti was able to gather information pertaining to the NFT world as his capital to engage in it. The stages of translation in both artists contain heterogeneous actors which constructed them in their artistry and in social engagement. However, the human actors in Angga Tan-tama's network are less than in Mufti's network. Firstly, Angga's NFTs artwork are the result of his utilization of technology from the beginning, therefore his visual style is formed by his familiarity with technology, in contrast, Mufti adapted the use of technology to his NFT artworks while still retaining his established visual style Secondly, this impacted in the dynamics in their career as an artist in the world of NFT, Mufti might has more social approach than Angga in terms of NFT creation, as Mufti's stated that he entered the world of NFT from his friend and his community, whereas Angga already engaged in the digital world entered the world of NFT through an invitation. This study needs more samples for future research as the visual style of NFTs varies. Therefore, different artist and artwork samples might produce different results. Art seen through the perspective of actor network theory is not universal as a network is constantly changing dialectically, therefore, the result of this study might not be relevant in the future as works from artists constantly develop. However, for future studies research regarding the NFT communities and platforms is needed as these actors are the main support of the artist.

References

- Chou, C. Y., Leo, W. W. C., & Chen, T. (2021). Servicing through digital interactions and well-being in virtual communities. *Journal of Services Marketing*. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JSM-01-2021-0009>
- Ekoady, A., & Yuliar, S. (2015). Social reassembling as design strategies: A review under the responsibility of the Scientific Committee of Arte-Polis 5. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 184, 152-160. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.05.075>
- Franceschet, M., Colavizza, G., Smith, T., Finucane, B., Ostachowski, M. L., Scalet, S., Perkins, J., Morgan, J., & Hernández, S. (2019). Crypto art: A decentralized view. *ArXiv*, 1-8. https://doi.org/10.1162/leon_a_02003
- Gray, M., & Schubert, L. (2018). Connecting social work and art: Reflections on theory and practice. *Art in Social Work Practice*, 68-79. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315144245-8>
- Halsall, F. (2016). Actor-network aesthetics: The conceptual rhymes of Bruno Latour and contemporary art. *New Literary History*, 47(2/3), 439-461. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/24772788>
- Johansson, R. (2007). On case study methodology. *Open House International*, 32(3), 48-54. <https://doi.org/10.1108/OHI-03-2007-B0006>

- Kraal, B. (2007). Actor-network inspired design research: Methodology and reflections. *IASDR07 Proceedings: Emerging Trends in Design Research*. [http://www.sd.polyu.edu.hk/iasdr/proceeding/papers/Actor-Network Inspired Design Research_Methodology and Reflections.pdf](http://www.sd.polyu.edu.hk/iasdr/proceeding/papers/Actor-Network%20Inspired%20Design%20Research_Methodology%20and%20Reflections.pdf)
- Landau, F. (2016). Articulations in Berlin's independent art scene: On new collective actors in the art field. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, 36(9–10), 596–612. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJSSP-11-2015-0129>
- Law, J. (2019). Material semiotics. <http://www.heterogeneities.net/publications/Law2019MaterialSemiotics.pdf>
- Nadini, M., Alessandretti, L., Di Giacinto, F., Martino, M., Aiello, L. M., & Baronchelli, A. (2021). Mapping the NFT revolution: Market trends, trade networks and visual features. *ArXiv, arXiv:2106*, 1–34. <http://arxiv.org/abs/2106.00647>
- Newall, D., Pooke, G., & Newall, D. (2008). Art history: The basics. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203098806>
- Storni, C. (2015). Notes on ANT for designers: Ontological, methodological and epistemological turn in collaborative design. *Design Studies*, 11(3–4), 166–178. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15710882.2015.1081242>
- Valtakoski, A. (2020). The evolution and impact of qualitative research in Journal of Services Marketing. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 34(1), 8–23. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JSM-12-2018-0359>
- Wang, Q., Li, R., Wang, Q., & Chen, S. (2021). Non-fungible token (NFT): Overview, evaluation, opportunities and challenges. *ArXiv, arXiv:2105*. <https://arxiv.org/abs/2105.07447v1>
- Wickham, M., Lehman, K., & Fillis, I. (2020). Defining the art product: A network perspective. *Arts and the Market*, 10(2), 83–98. <https://doi.org/10.1108/AAM-10-2019-0029/FULL/HTML>
- Yuliar, S. (2009). Tata kelola teknologi: Perspektif teori jaringan aktor (1st ed.). Penerbit ITB.
- Zell, M. (2011). Rembrandt's gifts: A case study of actor-network-theory. *Journal of Historians of Netherlandish Art*, 3(2). <https://doi.org/10.5092/JHNA.2011.3.2.2>