Hindustani Classical Music and Education: 'Tradition', Values, and Identity in post-1991 India

Aditi Krishna

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Royal Holloway, University of London

March 2021

Declaration of Authorship

I, Aditi Krishna, hereby declare that this thesis and the work presented in it is entirely my own. Where I have consulted the work of others, this is always clearly stated.

Signed: Aditi Krishna

Date: March 16, 2021

Acknowledgements

PhD process has been a rollercoaster ride, a time where I gained immense experience, met wonderful people, and learnt so much about *Hindustani* classical music over its course. It was not just a degree I wished to attain, but it proved to be a personal journey as well. This journey and project would have been incomplete without the support of many. First and foremost, my deepest gratitude to my supervisor Professor Anna Morcom, who has guided and supported me throughout this PhD journey from start to end. Supervisions and discussions with her on anything under the sun related to my research was always extremely fruitful. Even as she moved to the United States to take up a new post in 2018, her unwavering support and regular supervisions involving detailed discussions even from afar motivated me to improve throughout the doctoral process. I have learnt a lot from her and will always value her guidance. I am extremely grateful to Dr. Shzr Ee Tan who has been an immensely supportive internal supervisor. She helped me stay patient and adequately motivated as I slogged through the long writing process. My thanks also to Dr. Antara Datta, my second supervisor from 2016-2018, and Dr. Prarthana Purkayastha, who took over from 2018 until March 2021. Their involvement in my PhD process was extremely valuable as well.

I am thankful for the rich interactions with fellow students and the faculty at the Department of Music, made possible through formal and informal departmental interactions such as PG Days, seminars, and TA work. I also thank the Department of Politics and International Relations for opportunities of interaction with fellow PhD students. Their varied departmental seminars contributed to my development as an interdisciplinary researcher in the first two years of my PhD. I extend my gratitude to my good friends at Royal Holloway – Katie Young, Shanika Ranasinghe, and Solène Heinzl – for their friendship and huge support ever since I arrived at the UK, a totally new country for me. Their support and friendship mean a lot to me. I am also blessed to have close friends of many years in India, Shubhi Khandelwal and Ancy Thomas who have been a wonderful support during my PhD journey.

I am indebted to the Department of Sociology, South Asian University (SAU). It was here my interest in Sociology of music began and took shape through academic research, presentations, and rigorous coursework writings. My special thanks to Dr. Dev Pathak for always encouraging my research interests and to Dr. Sasanka Perera for all his words of wisdom and encouragement while in SAU and after. I acknowledge that this research was supported by the Leverhulme Magna Carta Doctoral Studentship from 2016 to 2019. In

Abstract

This thesis examines the ideological structures, values, and ethos that define the teaching and transmission of *Hindustani* (North Indian) Classical music in private and semi-private schools, as well as music organisations in present-day northern India, in the cities of Delhi, Gurugram and Patna. *Hindustani* music was traditionally transmitted orally within families or family-based guilds called *gharanas*, mostly formed by hereditary Muslim musicians. There were also immense artistic/teaching connections between patrons (Hindu or Muslim) and musicians (mostly Muslim). The modern music schools of Indian classical music, however, emerged within the context of music reform and rising cultural nationalism in the late nineteenth-early twentieth centuries. This impacted a dominant discourse around *Hindustani* music which now defined it as a 'sacred' art that declined under Muslim patronage and the Muslim hereditary performers of the time. This discourse continued in different ways in post-independence India, and a second-wave of well-known music institutions were established by the central and state governments or key private individuals during this period.

In the post-1991 period of economic liberalisation and intensified globalisation in India, however, a third-wave of new, small-scale and medium-scale music schools have mushroomed in the cities, many of them privately-owned and operating as businesses, but many also semi-private, with a majority registered mostly under the Societies Registration Act, 1860. These exist alongside some important pre-1991 and pre-1947 music institutions. Some pre- and post-1991 organisations in Delhi like SPIC MACAY have also gained immense popularity over the last few decades and engage in a new kind of education beyond formal or informal education. In this thesis, I investigate these different types of music institutions and organisations in Delhi, Gurugram, and Patna. I explore how the values, traditional concepts, and reform-era ideas associated with this art are redefined, approached, subverted or challenged today in a post-1991 neo-liberal India defined by increasing consumerism. I see these schools as heterotopic spaces (Foucault 1998), straddling often contradictory ideological stances of 'tradition' and neo-liberal notions of flexibility and individual choice. As I explore these questions, I also look to address the broader interaction between *Hindustani* classical music, neoliberalism, regionalism, tradition and modernity in India today.

Table of Contents

List of Figures and Illustrations

Chapter 1: Introduction – Understanding Indian society, identity, and music education through north Indian classical music

Hindustani or north Indian classical music teaching, training and transmission in India have traditionally been defined through one-to-one teacher-student methods: the *guru-shishya parampara* (master-disciple tradition) drawn from a Hindu cultural worldview and traditionally reserved for learned men like teachers, or the *ustad-shagird* (master-apprentice) tradition drawn from Islamic/Urdu-speaking cultures (Neuman 1990, 44; Slawek 2000). To many South Asian musicians and connoisseurs of Indian classical music, both in India and across the globe, these are still considered the most valuable pedagogic methods for students of *Hindustani* music who aim to be performers. The *Hindustani* music education scene in India, on the other hand, also includes several renowned institutions and music departments that operate outside the one-to-one format of training. This institutionalisation process was part of a music reform movement tied to the Indian nationalist project of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries (Bakhle 2005; Kobayashi 2003; Rosse 1995). Today, many of these institutions are also respected for their high-quality teaching that informs the national cultural scene, thereby constituting an intrinsic part of a national music heritage.

Yet, economic liberalisation in post-1991 India has also seen the intensification and diversification of new waves of small- and medium-scale, private and semi-private music schools. These schools often present flexibility in adapting to the needs of the present-day learners, while also drawing on certain traditional concepts and ideologies of the past associated with *Hindustani* music in general. Traditional ideologies here include those mostly associated with the music reform period of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries, but also the syncretic values this music entailed historically. By private schools, I refer to those that operate on business-driven and for-profit goals. The semi-private schools constitute those which are registered under the Societies Registration Act 1860 or Indian Trusts Act 1882 as not-for-profit societies, even if they were founded privately, and which also consider taking music to economically-weaker sections of society.[1] Alongside these music schools, there also exist some important music organisations and societies which mainly promote Indian classical music among other Indian art forms. These engage in a kind of music education process distinct from music schools, institutions, and departments in general. All such organisations I have explored during my fieldwork are registered primarily under the

---

[1] I discuss these government acts in detail in Chapter 3.

Societies Registration Act 1860, but also either the Indian Trusts Act 1882 or the Companies Act 2013 as charitable organisations promoting Indian art forms, particularly Indian classical music. The new teaching and transmission methods, the ethos, and the complexities defining these music schools and different renowned organisations shed important light not just on contemporary *Hindustani* music pedagogies but also more generally on post-1991 Indian neoliberal capitalism. As Aditi Deo also notes, in India '[t]he music today weaves together traditional ideas and methods with modern sensibilities, technologies, and institutions' (2011, 2). This presents the opportunity to notice the intersection of traditional and neoliberal capitalist ethos in present-day India, which is characterised by the rise of conspicuous consumption-based new middle-classes and widening wealth inequality. Throughout this thesis, I divide the diverse music institutions, schools and societies or organisations in three broad time-frames. The 'first-wave' of institutions and organisations are those established before Indian independence in 1947 and amidst the period of social reform and cultural nationalism of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries. The 'second-wave' include those that emerged after 1947 but before 1991. By the 'third-wave,' I mean those that emerged and mushroomed after 1991, a period that marked yet another important shift in Indian society. The third-wave of schools, that are the focus of Chapters 4 and 6 in particular, are primarily small- and medium-scale schools that expanded during this period.

Through an ethnographic approach, this thesis explores the teaching, learning, transmission, and propagation of Indian classical music in contemporary India, focusing on the third, new wave of music schools of the post-91 period, and some important (both pre and post-91) music organisations that have made their way to the forefront in twenty-first century music transmission. This third-wave of schools, or *new schools* as I call them, showcase different characteristics that set them apart from the older, pre-1991 institutions. I aim to examine the ideological structures that operate in and define these varied schools and organisations today in three distinct field sites – the cities of Delhi, the national capital territory of India; Gurugram, a national capital region (hereafter referred to as NCR, flanking New Delhi); and Patna, the state capital of Bihar in eastern India.[2] Channelling Michel Foucault's (1998) concept of 'heterotopias' as spaces of contestation, my research includes investigating the kind of heterotopic spaces these schools and organisations constitute within the different settings of these three chosen cities. The aim of these ethnographic observations is to use music pedagogy as a lens through which to examine the interplay of cultural

---

[2] New Delhi, the capital of India, is one of the districts of the national capital territory of Delhi.

nationalism, tradition, syncretism, regionalism and regional identity, and neoliberalism in the present time. The specific research questions I ask in this thesis are: how do new, third wave of private music schools approach the traditional concepts linked to *Hindustani* music, like the idea of *guru-shishya parampara*? How do such traditional ideologies interact with the neoliberal focus on competition, individual as collection-of-skills, individual subjectivity, as well as self-care? I explore similar questions in the context of music organisations in Delhi-NCR, through the lens of music citizenship in particular and cultural citizenship more generally. Furthermore, how do the traditional ideologies associated with the dominant discourse of the early-twentieth century interact with the various activities of these organisations and intertwine with the everyday lived realities on the ground, particularly for those who participate in such organisations and their activities? In the context of Patna, I go a step further to ask: how do the regional (that is, Bihari) identity and issues intertwine with the traditional ethos associated with *Hindustani* music as well as the ideas of adaptability and flexibility of the post-91 neoliberal India? How is Bihari identity emphasised in the institutional setups teaching *Hindustani* music as a national heritage? I explore these questions in the context of different kinds of music institutions in Patna, particularly the small- and medium-scale private and semi-private schools.

A wide number of important publications provide much-needed historical analysis of Indian music in general as well as of *Hindustani* music, the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method, and the institutionalisation of music in India in particular through varied perspectives. These range from ancient Indian context, to the institutionalisation and classicisation process of Indian music in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries (Bakhle 2005; Kobayashi 2003; McNeil 2018; Miner 1993; Scarimbolo 2014; Schofield, 2010; Wade 1998; Widdess 1995; Williams 2014;). Among them, Eriko Kobayashi (2003), Janaki Bakhle (2005), Michael Rosse (2010) and Aneesh Pradhan (2014) have specifically discussed the history and emergence of modern music schools in India's socio-political milieu. Some Indian scholarship has also recognised the coexistence of different methods of teaching Indian classical music in India today – the *guru-shishya* method, the institutional method (music institutions and departments), and also the impact of technology on the teaching of Indian classical music (Bansal 2016; Pandeya 2016). Deepti Bansal briefly discusses the pros and cons of one-to-one learning from a *guru* versus group teaching in institutions (2016, 52-53). However, the new private and semi-private music schools, new and old music organisations existing today, and the music education they engage in, have escaped adequate scholarly attention. Furthermore, such diverse music institutions in

peripheral centres for *Hindustani* music, such as Patna in Bihar, are even less explored. In the context of private schools, the study that comes closest to my area of research is that of Jayasri Banerjee's (1986), which discusses methodologies of teaching Indian classical music and briefly mentions the increasing (and large) number of private and semi-private schools. However, while Banerjee's article is critical of these schools, it does not examine these new music schools in detail in terms of the pedagogy they adopt, the diversity of courses offered besides Indian classical music, and the values underpinning the teaching and learning in these spaces.

Important recent scholarly discourses offer new debates around traditional methods of teaching and learning Indian music. For instance, Greg Booth (1983), Huib Schippers (2007; 2009), Rohan Krishnamurthy (2013) and Jeff Roy (2016) have discussed the *guru-shishya* method, its sustainability in the context of *Hindustani* classical music and adaptations of the method through the use of video-conferencing tools even by *guru*s and *ustad*s today (these predate but are also more closely linked to the current needs of an ongoing pandemic). They also interrogate its presence in Indian classical music training outside the Indian context, albeit in an institutionalised setup such as the Ali Akbar College of Music in the United States (Booth 1983). Most of these studies do give a starting point to understand the classroom setting of music institutions in India; however, they do not discuss the methods by which this music tradition is taught in such schools or the varied ideologies and values interwoven with such teaching. Many scholarly works on teaching and pedagogy in Indian music have, however, focussed on the *guru-shishya parampara* or *ustad-shagird* relationship (Neuman 1990; Schippers 2007; Schippers 2016; Silver 1984; Roy 2016). The contemporary discourse on *Hindustani* classical music in India (particularly its performers) has also downplayed the role of music institutions in general, with a lot of value placed on *gurus* or *gharana*s of the past and present. While certain studies have included the study of music schools and institutions in contemporary India, the focus has been either on larger, older national-level institutions teaching Indian classical music, such as the study of Bhatkhande Music Institute by Max Katz (2017); on music institutions in the context of western art music in India (Marsden 2018); or on bi-musical curricula involving both western art music and Indian classical music (Avis 2019). This thesis aims to fill the gap with a study on how traditional, music reform, as well as neoliberal ideologies function in these diverse institutions and music organisations in Delhi, Gurugram and Patna. I look at them through the lens of concepts like heterotopia, music citizen and regionalism.

This thesis argues that the study of new, private music schools and music organisations in India's social, cultural, economic, and media contexts in the period post-1991 is a crucial one. These institutions and their ethos are significant because they shed light on the complexities and co-existing contradictions that inform contemporary Indian society at large. For example, it is interesting to note that while no famous performing artist and classical musician has studied at a music institution, at least exclusively, there are many who have started them, including the new wave of small- and medium scale music schools, thus bringing together seemingly divergent ideas of *parampara* and pedagogic innovation. Noticing a dearth of scholarly publications on music education and transmission in new private and semi-private small- and medium-scale music schools, as well as renowned music organisations in India, this thesis turns to numerous theoretical endeavours that highlight the manner in which educational institutions contribute to the transmission of certain dominant ideologies as well as show complexities in their everyday *Hindustani* classical music education. Through the intersection of these theoretical concepts and the different methods of music education in this thesis, I show that the study of these schools and organisations are crucial in order to fully understand the ecosystem of *Hindustani* music and its education.

To locate this endeavour, this chapter in section 1.1 provides a historical background of *Hindustani* classical music – from a brief overview of the syncretic context in which *Hindustani* music as we know today developed, to the dominant cultural values that have influenced its propagation in the twentieth century in the period of anti-colonialism, nationalism and post-independence nation-building. In Section 1.2, I present an overview of major socio-political influences and changes in the post-91 period; including the debates on secularism, and socio-economic changes following India's entry into the free market in 1991, the rise of new middle classes, and the impact this has had on *Hindustani* classical music pedagogy. Section 1.3 introduces the research fields of this thesis: Delhi, Gurugram, and Patna. Section 1.4 offers the theoretical and conceptual framework that informs this ethnographic study on new wave of music schools, old and new music organisations, and the values or ethos informing them. Finally, in section 1.5, I provide the organisation and structure of this thesis.

1.1 Historical context and background

This section argues that the music reform and Indian nationalist revival process of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries in the context of *Hindustani* music was a re-

invention of an already existing tradition rather than an 'invention of tradition' as put forth by Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (1983). For them, an invented tradition

> includes both 'traditions' actually invented, constructed and formally instituted and those emerging in a less easily traceable manner within a brief and dateable period – a matter of a few years perhaps - and establishing themselves with great rapidity. (Hobsbawm and Ranger 1983, 1)

In the context of Indian classical music, the tradition being re-invented had direct links to earlier practices, which adapted with the varied changes in society at the national as well as the local/regional level over various centuries. This period of reinvention of tradition is also the one in which the first-wave of music institutions and schools to teach Indian classical music in a curriculum-based manner emerged in India. I will discuss these institutions specifically in Chapter 3, but this section provides a context to it. The section also explores how the ideas of spirituality and religion were interpreted and re-interpreted at different stages of *Hindustani* music's development.

1.1.1   *Syncretism and spirituality in Hindustani music until the late-nineteenth century*

In popular discourse among musicians, music students and connoisseurs today, Indian classical music traces its origin to ancient Hindu sacred texts such as the *Vedas.* While it is difficult to trace a recorded history of treatises on music techniques to this ancient period, Richard Widdess has noted that the 'earliest texts on musical theory to have survived are the *Natyashastra* of Bharata and the *Dattilam* of Dattila (DD)' (1995, 4). While there are crucial *raga*-based texts from this period, scholars like Widdess (1995), Bonnie Wade (1998), Jon Barlow and Lakshmi Subramanian (2007), and Katherine Schofield (2010), among others, have attributed important developments in *Hindustani* music as we know it today to the period following sixth century, and particularly thirteenth century onwards with the advent of Muslim rulers and Sufi traditions with them. With immense additions in its practice and theory since then, *Hindustani* music gradually developed as a form different from the ones described in texts such as the *Natyashastra* (Widdess 1995).

The largely stable and centralised rule in the peak of Mughal period, particularly under Akbar, was extremely important for *Hindustani* music as we know it today.[3] Barlow and Subramanian have noted that Akbar's period witnessed a considerable shift in imperial taste, from preference for Persian and Turkoman music to preferential patronage of the

---

[3] I acknowledge that there were important pre-Mughal regional centres as well, like Jaunpur, Gwalior and Bijapur, that contributed to the cultivation of music (Trivedi 2010).

indigenous *Dhrupad* (2007, 1782), whilst Manuel mentions that this period often involved writing and singing of songs in *Braj-bhasha* based on Lord Krishna (2005). For Schofield, this period of the Mughal rule in India witnessed its own way of 'veneration, canonisation, and systemisation' and can be called the classicisation of Indian music much before the one under the British rule (2010, 489-490). She calls the developments in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries as the 're-classicisation' process, which was unique given its focus on developing a 'prescriptive notation system for Indian music' during this time (Schofield 2010, 489). In the context of Delhi, many believe that there was a break in continuity of musical engagements in the Mughal empire under Aurangzeb's reign – a ruler rather infamous due to his supposed ban on music. However, scholars like Katherine Brown (now, Schofield) have debunked this notion, arguing that musical performances still flourished under his rule even though Aurangzeb himself abstained from it personally for 'reasons of personal religious integrity' (2007, 112). Therefore, music thrived among nobles and in other artistic centres of Delhi (the capital city at the time) as private performances (Brown 2007). This ensured the continuity of music cultivation and of Delhi as an important centre for music.

Varied aspects of this syncretic history are still prevalent in the popular imagination today, alongside certain ideologies and values of the music reform and nationalist period, in the broader discourse around *Hindustani* music. For instance, the hagiographical accounts of the legendary thirteenth century Sufi poet, writer and musician Amir Khusrau exists as popular knowledge of classical music even today. As Barlow and Subramanian (2007) note, he is credited with inventing some important styles and instruments that are an integral part of the current *Hindustani* music repertoire, such as *khyal* and *sitar* (2007). While Khusrau's contribution to the development of north Indian music is indeed crucial in bringing together the central Asian music and local forms (Manuel 2005), scholars including Miner (1993) and Schofield (2010) have effectively indicated that instruments like the *sitar* and genres like *khyal* may have only emerged in the centuries following him.

1.1.2 *Emergence of regional centres for Hindustani music*

The period following the death of Aurangzeb in the early-eighteenth century saw a rapid decline in resources and the debilitation of the Mughal empire amidst a succession of weak emperors, increased wars of succession, and extremely divisive nobility (Chandra 2009). Series of invasions, violence, and wars over time also had a serious impact on the

social and cultural life of Delhi – particularly after the 1857 revolt by Indians against British rule (Spear 1951). Between the late-eighteenth century and the mid-nineteenth century, many musicians and artists fled Delhi to escape political crisis and uncertainty (Barlow and Subramanian 2007). They sought and found patronage in other emerging regional kingdoms that were wealthy and could provide them with economic stability (Brown 2007; Williams, 2014). Consequently, important centres of patronage gradually emerged over this time, like Jaipur in Rajasthan; smaller ones like Darbhanga and Bettiah in Bihar; Banaras in Uttar Pradesh; and Rewa in Madhya Pradesh (Barlow and Subramanian 2007). Lucknow became one of the most important centres where the Nawabs heavily patronised art, including music and dance (Oldenburg 1984, 17; Williams 2014).[4] James Kippen (1988) and Richard Williams (2014) have shown that Wajid Ali Shah, the last Nawab of Lucknow, was particularly known to enjoy and patronise many talented artists. Delhi still remained a centre for *sitar* and was known for *qawwali* and Sufi devotional music performers as well as teachers (Brown 2010).

This development of regional centres at this time also played a crucial role in the development of *gharanas* or family/lineage-based guilds by the late-nineteenth century and early-twentieth centuries (Neuman 1990). The founders of many of these *gharanas* were Muslim musicians, existing alongside some Hindu *gharanas* such as Darbhanga and Bettiah in Bihar. While various scholars have discussed important centres like Bengal, Maharashtra, and Delhi in their historical context, work on the history of *Hindustani* music in Bihar during this period is scarce. There are biographies of musicians from Bihar, such as on Pandit Ramchatur Mallick of Darbhanga *gharana* by Prof. C.L. Das (2012), and anecdotes related to Kumar Shayamanand Singh (a vocalist and patron of music) of the Banaili estate in Bihar by Gajendranarayan Singh (2008). Selina Thielemann (1997) has also interviewed Pandit Vidur Mallik of the Darbhanga *gharana*, with Shiv Narayan Mishra (2016) also describing different *gharanas* in Bihar. However, there have been no historical studies as such that chronologically trace the history of Indian classical music in Bihar. I will discuss this in detail in Chapter 6 on Patna and Bihar.

Nawab Wajid Ali Shah of Lucknow played an important role in the emergence of Bengal as another important region for *Hindustani* music. With Wajid Ali Shah exiled to Matiyaburj in Calcutta soon after the British annexation of Awadh in 1856, the Awadhi culture, informal court, musical engagements and patronage moved with him as well (McNeil

---

[4] Lucknow at the time was the capital of the independent kingdom of Awadh.

2018, 303; Williams 2014).[5] Adrian McNeil (2018) and Richard Williams (2014) note that as the power of regional kingdoms declined and patronage from the aristocracy weakened by this time, *Hindustani* music found new patrons in the new, English-educated Bengali (Hindu) elites of the second half of the nineteenth century. These elites had started to take interest in varied texts, including Persian and vernacular languages, and practices of this music tradition (Williams 2014). The patronage now gradually moved from landed aristocrats or *zamindars* of Bengal to the noveau riche Bengali middle-class elites or *bhadralok* by the late-nineteenth century (McNeil, 2018). This new bourgeois class was now also learning music from prominent *Hindustani* musicians in Calcutta who arrived with Wajid Ali Shah (Williams 2014). This was an implicit attempt to imitate royalty, the elite nawab culture (Williams 2014). This middle-class or *bhadralok* community, which had developed into an intellectual elite by now, came to contribute immensely to reform movements, including that of music, and cultural nationalism in India (Bakhle, 2005; Kobayashi, 2003; McNeil, 2018).

Scholars have shown that there were similar developments in the state of Maharashtra in Western India. Through the example of the musician family of *Ashtavale*-s, Scarimbolo makes it clear that the Hindu elites and middle-classes had started patronising and learning *Hindustani* music from mostly Muslim hereditary musicians, even though these patrons would not perform publicly (2014). Aditi Deo also notes that many hereditary master-musicians, the *ustad*s, were teaching apprentices who were both hereditary and non-hereditary, particularly in Maharashtra, even amidst the increasing institutionalisation of music in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries (2011, 23). Urban centres like Bombay also had musicophiliacs, as Tejaswini Niranjana (2020) calls it, or music lovers, irrespective of their religious affiliations and bound together by their love of classical music. Niranjana notes the emergence of a *metropolitan unconscious* resulting from India's encounter with modernity from the nineteenth century onwards, which she defines as 'a collectivized unconscious that includes the diverse pasts and experiences of the migrants who came to settle here under conditions of colonial modernity from the nineteenth century onward' (2020 10). Therefore, many such music lovers also learnt one-to-one from hereditary musicians as well – one of the spaces where musicians and musicophiliacs met (Niranjana 2020). This too contributed to the development of *Hindustani* classical music during this

---

[5] The present-day Kolkata was known as Calcutta until 2001. Similarly, the present-day city of Mumbai was known as Bombay during the colonial period as well as in the post-independent India until 1995. I use both names of the cities in this thesis depending upon the time period I am discussing. Therefore, while discussing the social and musical changes under the British rule, I call them Calcutta and Bombay respectively.

period. It is therefore important to note scholarly consensus on the syncretic musical interactions in *Hindustani* music, which featured extensive artistic/teaching connections between Hindu patrons and Muslim musicians (Scarimbolo 2014; Williams 2014).

1.1.3 *Classicisation of Indian performing arts: late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries*

While close interactions between Hindu elites and Muslim hereditary musicians were prevalent in musical communities as described above, a dominant discourse began to develop around Indian classical music from the late-nineteenth century onwards. By the early-twentieth century, this strengthened at the pan-India level amidst the advent of cultural nationalism as part of an anti-colonial resistance within the country. The social reform initiatives and an emergent cultural nationalism at this time were primarily led by urban middle-class and high-caste elites, initially in response to British claims to superiority and later to challenge the British rule. Dance scholars like Prarthana Purkayastha (2014) and Margaret Walker (2014) have critiqued the way Indian cultural nationalism impacted predominant discourses surrounding 'purity' in Indian classical dance. Similarly, music scholars like Eriko Kobayashi (2003), David Trassof (2010) and Michael Rosse (2010) have noted the impact of Indian cultural nationalism on the idea of 'sacredness' in music. Much of this dominant ideology of cultural purity and sacredness informing the Indian classical performing arts was deeply influenced by the manner in which British and European orientalist scholars viewed Indian society and culture (Trasoff, 2010).

For the purposes of administration and to effectively rule the subject populace, the officials of the British East India Company in the eighteenth century took interest in learning the languages and culture of the local populations (Marriot 2006, x-xv; Walker 2014). An orientalist scholarship also emerged during this time that extensively discussed an ancient Indian past and its contemporary society (Marriot 2006). Indian society, as recorded in these writings, was once great in the ancient past, only to deteriorate in recent times. It was hence in need of serious reforms (Chakravarty 1990; Chatterjee 1993) and music (along with dance and theatrical traditions) was viewed as deserving of the reformist's attention (Srinivasan 1985). William Jones, the English orientalist writer and Indologist, in his work titled *The musical modes of the Hindoos* suggested the existence of an ancient, Hindu, history 'and the status of a canonical art' for *rag*-based Indian music which declined under the Muslim practitioners (Deo 2011, 18). This idea was supported by other orientalists like Augustus Willard (Deo 2011, 11). By the nineteenth century, the Anglicist approach and colonial

governance had strengthened, and administrative control passed from the East India Company to the British Crown in 1858. By now, Indian society was considered racially inferior and unfit for self-rule. In the field of education, for instance, while the orientalists had earlier emphasised the study of local languages and culture, the focus now was on English education and the study of European culture (Marriot 2006, xx, cited in Walker 2014, 12). Inter-mixing between locals and the British was now frowned upon, an approach that ultimately emphasised British supremacy.

Trasoff notes that 'throughout the colonial period, the British attempted to further their understanding of multifarious group of peoples and cultures that had come within their control by imposing an intellectual order upon it' (2010, 335). Therefore, European ideals of appropriateness and inappropriateness were also imposed on Indian society, with those deviating from them attracting immense criticism. The census and the population surveys, initiated by the British around this time to map the Indian population, are one of the initial examples through which this was done. This census clearly introduced and hardened various problematic categories of religion and caste in Indian society, constructing rigid and homogenous groupings out of an extremely diverse population (Cohn 1990).

The homogenisation of such complex categories had an impact on the Indian performing artists too, like the *tawa'ifs* or courtesans in north India, as documented by various scholars. The *tawa'ifs* were dancers, and leading *khyal* and *thumri* singers among other genres. Anna Morcom (2013), Regula Qureshi (2006), Shweta Sachdeva (2008), and Veena Talwar Oldenburg (1990) have discussed that many of these traditional north Indian dancers or performers historically held an important place in the elite circles of society and were patronised by Mughal as well as regional kings. They had a close relationship with, and were able to exert some influence over, their affluent male clientele despite remaining outside the realm of marriage.[6] The female performing communities were very flexible as social groups, with 'various caste and religious affiliations' (Sachdeva 2008, 308). The colonial census as a system of enumeration, however, overlooked the complexities embodied by these performing women, whether they were *devadasis* or dedicated temple dancers in southern India, or *tawaifs* in northern India. It divided them into rigid and homogenised categories under the large umbrella label *nautch* (Sachdeva 2008; Walker 2014; Morcom 2013). The

---

[6] I do not get into the detail on the *tawa'ifs* as a number of scholarly works have extensively discussed the history in this context. However, I do understand that that the relationship between *tawa'ifs* and their patrons were complex as well. They too were controlled by patriarchal structures but were able to subvert them in some ways.

term *nautch* is an anglicised term for the Urdu word *naach* which literally means dance and is used in several Indian languages. The British referred to the dancing women and girls as *nautch* women (Sachdeva 2008). While these women, did not always dance, were not always prostitutes, and remained outside the realm of heteronormative marriage; all of them, including *tawaifs* and *devadasis*, were now seen as a moral threat and their performances were deemed inappropriate (Morcom 2013; Soneji 2012; Srinivasan 1985). The reform and revival movements turned out to be devastating for many such performing communities. The intolerance towards these performers culminated into the anti-*nautch* or 'anti-dance' discourse movement in south India by the late-nineteenth century through to the early-twentieth century, where the *devadasis* came under the scanner of the British laws (Soneji, 2012). Purity campaigns like this one, while initially started by the British and the Christian missionaries, later received huge support from the Indian intelligentsia/elites, middle-classes, reformers and later, Hindu nationalists all over the country with the motive of reforming Indian society (Morcom 2013; Purkayastha 2014; Sachdeva 2008; Soneji 2012; Srinivasan 1985; Walker 2014). This movement culminated in the Madras Devadasis (Prevention of Dedication) Act of 1947, soon after the Indian independence. These, and similar, ideas set the stage for the emergence of Indian reform and revival ideas, including that of cultural (mainly Hindu) nationalism that defined the freedom struggle by the early-twentieth century.

While aiming to write its own history in response to the colonial discourse of a corrupt Indian society, Indian reformers and nationalist revivalists invoked the idea of a golden, classical ancient India by borrowing from orientalist writings. In eastern India, the nationalistic discourse had its basis in what is referred to as the period of 'Bengal Renaissance'; a cultural, social and intellectual movement that emerged in Bengal in the nineteenth and continued until the early-twentieth century (Samanta 2008). This, said to have begun with Raja Ram Mohan Roy (1772-1833), saw some major initiatives to reform Indian society and Hindu religion and to free it from the clutches of regressive practices; like child marriage, widow immolation or *sati*, and prohibition on widow remarriage (Samanta, 2008). Hindu reform movements like the Brahmo Samaj, led by Raja Ram Mohan Roy and established in 1828, and the Arya Samaj led by Dayanand Saraswati and founded in colonial Bombay in 1875, began in this period with a similar motive.

Similar social reform movements were also taking place in other parts of the country; though not all reformers and reform initiatives reflected an equally and deeply religious bent of mind but were driven to fight conservative social practices. In the present-day state of Maharashtra, the colonial cities of Bombay and Poona were important centres of social

reform movements. Rosse (1995) and Pradhan (2014) in their studies on pre-1947 Bombay also mention the young graduates from Poona College, the Elphinstone Institution, and Grant Medical College who were active in reforming their communities in the nineteenth century; fighting for female education and in combating social evils like infant marriage, prohibition against remarriage of Hindu widows, and the caste system. Prarthana Samaj in Bombay was also a product of socio-religious reform movement in the Hindu society which aimed at removing orthodoxy and modernise Indian society (Chandra 2009). In south India, the establishment of the Theosophical Society was one of the important developments. It was founded in the United States by Madam H.P. Blavatsky and Colonel Olcott, with its Indian headquarters established in 1886 in Adyar, close to Madras (Chandra 2009). Under Mrs. Annie Besant, a British theosophist, this society aimed to reform and revive the Indian religions on modern lines (Chandra 2009).[7] As I will discuss further in chapter 3, Indian classical music reform and revival processes, particularly in the late-nineteenth century, often moved hand-in hand with these social reform movements, with certain social reform societies also establishing music schools and academies as well as organising conferences and seminars on music.

This restructuring of Indian society by Indian middle-class elites in the early-twentieth century has been called by M.N. Srinivas as the 'Sanskritisation' of Indian society or the country. Srinivas coined the term Sanskritisation in his 1952 book *Religion and Society among the Coorgs of South India*, in which he proposed that the lower castes and those outside the caste hierarchy aimed to climb up this hierarchy by changing their lifestyle, customs and ideology in order to better their social and economic position (2003[1952]). With a 'spread of Sanskrit theological ideas; under the British rule, this Sanskritisation process reached a much broader population across the country and certain aspects of Indian society was Sanskritised accordingly (Srinivas 2003[1952], 486). Sanskritic values, though mostly post-Vedic, were emphasised over the values of the majority of the population (Srinivas 2003[1952], 486). Consequently, in this process, upper caste values became hegemonic from above, rather than lower castes and classes being able to use Sanskritisation to become upwardly mobile (Srinivas 2003[1952]).

---

[7] Around the same period, there were similar initiatives of socio-religious reform were emerging in other religious communities as well. In Bombay, educated Parsis were taking initiatives to reform Zoroastrianism and shed regressive practices (Chandra 2009; Rosse 1995). Additionally, there were similar reform initiatives among the Muslims in India as well (Chandra 2009).

This was also reflected in the institutionalisation, classicisation, modernisation, and *revitalisation* process of Indian music at pan-India level by the early-twentieth century, particularly under the tutelage of musicologists and musicians Vishnu Narayan (VN) Bhatkhande and Vishu Digambar (VD) Paluskar (Bakhle 2005). By the early-twentieth century, the reform and revitalisation of Indian music on *scientific* lines were approached predominantly as per the values and aesthetics of the Hindu middle-class, high-caste elites (Bakhle 2005; Moro 2004; Rosse 1995). Scholars like Kobayashi (2003), Bakhle (2005), Rosse (2010), and others, have discussed that this revitalisation process involved the idea that Indian classical music was spiritual and yet had the capability of being modernised in scientific terms which made it superior to its British counterpart. As Partha Chatterjee notes, 'anticolonial nationalism creates its own domain of sovereignty within colonial society well before it begins its political battle with the imperial power' (1993, 6). It is done through clearly dividing the existing social institutions into the material, and inner or spiritual domain. In Bengal, for instance, the Hindu elites of the nineteenth century defined the Western world as scientifically advanced and superior in the material sense (Chatterjee 1993). The east for them, on the other hand, was superior in the inner world i.e. spiritually, which the west could not achieve (Chatterjee 1993). The main purpose of such a (Hindu) nationalist project was 'to fashion a *modern* national culture that is nevertheless not Western' (Chatterjee 1993, 6). As society was being restructured thus, these developments impacted Indian performing arts as well. Hereditary performers, particularly Muslims, gradually lost their status, although women performers bore the brunt rather suddenly and explicitly (Bakhle 2005; Katz 2017; Kobayashi 2003; Walker 2014). Sanskritisation in broader discourse around music became evident in, among other things, the increasing usage of the *guru-shishya parampara* in the dominant discourses of Indian classical music in general. It was amidst these developments in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries that the first-wave of institutions and societies for Indian classical music were established.

1.1.4 Post-1947 developments

By the first half of the twentieth century, much of the dominant ideologies associated with Indian classical music, based on an elite middle-class culture, were firmly etched into Indian society. This dominant discourse continued through into post-independent India as well, visible particularly through government's key cultural institutions like the All India

Radio (hereafter AIR).[8] The AIR, as we know today, goes back to a state-owned Indian State Broadcasting Service (ISBS) that was initiated by the British in 1930 and which was renamed as All India Radio in 1936 (Lelyveld 1994; Pradhan 2019, 4). Neuman mentions that Indian classical music 'provided much of the programming for the new radio stations from the 1930s onward, and for the film industry, now the second largest in the world' (1990, 21). In a newly-independent India post-1947, state patronage to Indian classical music ensured that the state-owned AIR became a crucial tool to promote this music tradition. The initiatives of the first Information and Broadcasting Minister of India BV Keskar (1950-62), which included banning film songs and not preferring hereditary musicians and those of courtesan backgrounds to perform on AIR (Lelyveld 1994), reflects a continuation of certain aspects of the dominant music reform ideologies. I discuss this in further detail in Chapter 3.

At the ground level, however, the values and ideologies embedded in traditional methods of teaching Indian classical music still remained complex. Some scholarship view syncretism as still showcased by teaching methods in day-to-day pedagogy (Neuman 1990; Silver, 1984; Urita, 2016). The idea of spirituality that *Hindustani* music often encapsulates and promotes even today can be understood in either a Hindu or Sufi sense (Neuman 1990). Michiko Urita has discussed various examples from the contemporary music context that presents similar ideas around religious syncretism (2016). Music education via the *guru-shishya* method takes place between both the communities. Urita notes that

> the mentor-protégé tradition (*guru-shishya parampara*) is a main conduit for the transmission of Hindustani music, and the transmission runs in both directions, from Hindu *guru* to Muslim protégé and vice versa. (2016, 201)

Nevertheless, while it is also widely claimed that there is no religion in music (Katz 2017, 10), this claim is indeed simplistic given that music discourse is influenced by a largely Hindu middle-class aesthetic of the pre-1947 period.

Given this context and complexities entailed in the teaching and transmission of *Hindustani* music historically, it becomes interesting and crucial to analyse how these complexities manifest in the new music schools and present-day organisations of a post-1991 neoliberal India. It is first necessary to outline the post-1991 period of major economic shift in India, the new music schools as products of this period, and the teaching and transmission of *Hindustani* classical music in these spaces.

---

[8] Aditi Deo calls All India Radio a state cultural agency that helped promoted Indian classical music (2011, 24).

1.2 Post-1991 India, the new middle-classes, and *Hindustani* music: socio-economic and socio-political changes

The post-1991 period is a crucial point of departure in the Indian postcolonial context and is important for the purpose of this study. Although the decade preceding this era had already witnessed initiatives and attempts towards economic liberalisation (Fernandes, 2006), the Indian government undertook fast-paced and significant reforms in 1991. This period marks major economic reforms as well as India's entry into a competitive free market, seeing marked economic liberalisation, globalisation, growing commercialisation, increased job opportunities, as well as a digital revolution (Pedersen, 2000; Arnold, 2010; Sen, 2014; Venkatnarayanan, 2015). New professional middle-classes also emerged at this time with surplus income and the ability to spend on non-essentials and leisure. This middle-class was defined by new consumption patterns, in turn characterised by conspicuous consumption (Brosius, 2010; Fernandes, 2006). Another key development was an expansion of the idea of citizenship, which moved beyond the national to include global citizenship. Within India, this period marks a shift from national politics, emphasising a pan-Indian national identity, to identity-politics based on class, caste, and religion. These economic, political, and technological shifts have directly or indirectly had an impact on the pedagogic methods of Indian classical music.

1.2.1 Socio-economic changes, Hindustani music, and the new middle-classes in the post-1991 period

Efforts towards liberalisation and privatisation of the Indian economy began in the 1980's by the then Indian Prime Minister Mr. Rajiv Gandhi (Fernandes 2006). The initiatives under his regime marked, as Fernandes puts it, 'an important shift in the state's policies on consumer goods and middle-class consumption' (2006, 36). In other words, the ideologies of state-managed economy of the past gave way to a 'middle-class based culture of consumption' (Fernandes 2006, xv). The post-1991 period, however, saw an economic boom with market economy gaining predominance, the consumerist approach taking shape, and the expansion of a new middle-class (Brosius 2010; Fernandes 2006).

This opening up of the economy and the neoliberal reforms of 1991 were in the backdrop of an economic crisis caused by problems in the balance of payments. Hence, in the union budget of 1991, the then finance minister of India, Dr. Manmohan Singh proposed to end the 'licence/permit raj' and introduced open competition into the economy through its liberalisation (Venkatnarayanan 2015). The licence or permit raj indicated the set of licences

required by private companies to operate their business in India and a set of regulations to govern them. These economic reforms eased restrictions on the private sector and limited government's control over the market, barring some crucial sectors like defence. There was a drastic reduction in the import tariffs, paving the way for numerous international companies and products to enter India. Hence, many foreign multi-national and new Indian private companies started emerging. These initiatives led to a drastic recovery of India's economy and improvement in its Gross Domestic Product (GDP), in addition to increased job opportunities (Arnold 2010; Pedersen 2000). Thus, globalisation along with improved economic conditions enabled (some) Indians to access and utilise an overseas market as well as products from around the world.

These economic and technological shifts during this period also impacted other aspects of Indian society, including media and Indian performing arts. Multi-channel and satellite television made its way into India in 1991 via the Hong Kong-based company known as Star TV. It gradually offered five channels including the increasingly global MTV on Indian television, which was earlier dominated by the government-owned channel, *Doordarshan* (Booth 2013; Kvetko 2005). Zee TV, a locally-produced television channel was also introduced in 1992 (Booth 2013). The introduction of commercial and private FM broadcasting also reflected the emergence of consumer culture in post-1991 India. Though FM broadcasting first emerged in Chennai in 1977, it was in 1993 that the government-controlled AIR decided to privatise radio broadcasting and gave some slots to private companies (Sen 2014). In 1999, the central government expanded Indian radio broadcasting and allowed private companies to enter this field (Sen 2014). By the beginning of the twenty-first century, various private radio stations like Radio *Mirchi* and Radio-City emerged, becoming extremely popular, particularly in the major metropolitan cities (Sen 2014). However, musician-scholar Aneesh Pradhan notes that *Hindustani* music are rarely a part of and are not promoted by the private television and radio channels: its broadcasts are still mostly on public media channels, 'howsoever erratic they may be' (2019, 64). He provides examples of the very few shows or series on *Hindustani* music telecasted by private TV Channels in the 1990's, like *Ninaad* and *Sadhana* on Star Plus, and even these telecasts stopped in the 2000's (2019, 64-65). Similarly, the private radio channels too have broadcasted much less *Hindustani* music (Pradhan 2019).

Furthermore, although the Hindi music industry emerged in the 1930s with the beginning of Hindi sound films, it has diversified significantly ever since the cassette revolution in the 1980's and even more so after 1991. The popularity of Bollywood or *filmi*

music has gained new heights as well – both in India and overseas – in the last 25 years (Bhattacharjya and Mehta 2008; Morcom 2007; Sarrazin 2013). Various new genres also came into the Indian music scene after 1991 and made their place in the music market during this period; for instance, Indipop, along with those reflecting the collaboration and fusion of Indian styles with Western ones, such as Sufi-pop, classical-rock, etc. These genres are discussed directly or indirectly by ethnomusicologists and music scholars such as Amanda Weidman (2017), Jayson Beaster-Jones (2013), Peter Manuel (2008), Natalie Sarrazin (2013), Niko Higgins (2013), and Peter Kvetko (2013).[9]

Technological developments in this post-91 period of liberalisation and globalisation, such as access to the Internet, also radically impacted the teaching and transmission of Indian classical music. Online teaching, for instance, emerged as a viable tool to reach students beyond the local space and is being increasingly used today by not only music schools and institutions, but also by *gurus* and *ustads* as they expand their student base within and outside India, the latter much visible through the writings of Jeff Roy (2016) and Rohan Krishnamurthy (2013). Gradually emerging Indian publications on music teaching and curriculum are also engaging with distance learning and its usefulness in music teaching today (Chourasiya 2013). The advent of social media in particular, in the form of social networking sites such as Facebook and Instagram, has also made it easier for people to create and share information, and for artists to showcase their talent on a larger scale without having to rely on gatekeepers (Pradhan 2019). Pradhan also mentions that YouTube, particularly, has become useful for young musicians' professional career (2019). It acts as a medium where a musician can upload the recordings of their performances for larger audiences with Internet access (Pradhan 2019, 118). Indeed, during the Covid-19 pandemic, social networking sites and YouTube emerged as interactive spaces where musicians, old and young, are increasingly performing for music lovers around the world. The Internet has also enhanced the music digitisation process, with many websites as repositories of old and new recordings of renowned musicians of the past and present (Pradhan 2019).

Despite changes over a period of time, old music festivals of Indian classical music such as Hariballabh Sangeet Sammelan or Hariballabh music festival in Jalandhar have

---

[9] Kvetko describes Indipop as 'a shortened form of 'Indian Pop,' demonstrating its inclusive, national parameters' (2005, 35). However, 'indi' in Indipop also means 'independent' indicating its independence from the mainstream Bollywood music industry (Kvetko 2005).

continued to take place.[10] There has even been an increase in important music festivals of *Hindustani* music in post-1947 and post-1991 India, even as some musicians and music connoisseurs are critical of the changing nature of audiences in such festivals and performances; these audiences, for them, has resulted in decreasing standards of classical music performance in the post-1991 period of commercialisation (Pradhan 2019: 52-58). Nevertheless, some major music festivals around the country today includes ITC Sangeet Sammelan in Kolkata, Dover Lane conference in Kolkata, Vishnu Digambar Jayanti Sangeet Samaroh in Delhi (Pradhan, 2019), and Saptak Music Festival in Ahmedabad, among many others. Such festivals indicate, according to Pradhan, the corporate and civil society's patronage of music, although he concedes that such patronage is not free from its own share of problems (2019).

1.2.2 The new middle-classes of post-1991 period: Global citizens yet representatives of Indian tradition

One of the crucial characteristics of the post-91 period, also affecting Indian classical music and its present popularity, is the emergence of a new middle-class bolstered by the new intensity of the market economy and commercialisation (Fernandes 2006; Brosius 2010; Donner 2013). This new middle-class is considered clearly different from the old middle-class of the preceding decades. The middle-class of a newly independent India was largely, as Dwyer calls it, a service elite (2014, 15).[11] For Amita Baviskar and Raka Ray, the old middle-classes defined themselves as open-minded and egalitarian (2011). They saw themselves as 'following the rule of law and not being swayed by private motive or particularistic agenda; being scally prudent and living within one's means; and, embracing science and rationality in the public sphere' (Baviskar and Ray 2011, 5-6). Evoking Bourdieu's (1984) concept of the 'dominant fraction' of the 'dominant class' which has more cultural but less economic capital, Chloe Alaghband-Zadeh argues that listening to Indian classical music in the contemporary period becomes a means 'for largely old-middle-class listeners to distinguish themselves from the superrich or nouveau riche (above), the "masses" (below), and the new-middle-class lifestyle of consumption' (2017, 216).

---

[10] Hariballabh Sangeet Sammelan is one of the oldest music festivals in India. See Radha Kapuria (2015; 2018) on the pre-1947 and post-1947 trajectory of this festival.

[11] Dwyer notes that these service elites 'were mostly educated in schools, colleges and universities modelled on the British system, including an administrative cadre who had studied overseas, usually in the UK' (2014, 15).

The new middle-class, on the other hand, is defined by embodied consumerism, conspicuous consumption, and characterised by access to the commodity market offered by a new liberalised economy as indicated in the publications of Brosius (2010), Fernandes (2006), Munshi (2008) and Uberoi (2008). This rise of a new middle-class has also led to the development of middle-class consumption patterns and lifestyle, something which different groups aspire to achieve (Appadurai and Breckenridge 1995; Fernandes 2000; Varma 1998). The concept of conspicuous consumption was first conceptualised by economist and sociologist Thorstein Veblen and discussed in 'The Theory of Leisure class,' where he adds that

> good repute in any highly organised industrial community ultimately rests in pecuniary strength; and the means of showing pecuniary strength, and so of gaining or retaining good name, are leisure and a conspicuous consumption of goods. (2007[1899], 59).

In the context of consumption among the new middle-classes in India, Fernandes also notes that '[t]he most visible cultural coding of economic reforms is the emergence of consumption patterns and lifestyles associated with newly available commodities' (2006, xxii).

This consumption indeed became an important basis of defining the new middle-class. Shoma Munshi (2008) has shown that the consumption, lifestyle and luxury, defined by (the possession of) certain tangible products and services make people of different groups, particularly women, feel part of the *big city* or a *global culture*. The key consumer of this new 'services sector' of a neo-liberal India is the new 'middle-class,' 'attempting to join the bandwagon of pleasure and celebration of consumption and lifestyle at any cost' (Brosius 2010, 260). This middle-class sees itself as the primary representative of the global India, now that India is on the world stage, as well as keeps its grip on local and traditional identities (Brosius 2010). Using Mazzarella's (2003) term 'aspirational pleasure' which connect individual desire with universal progress, Brosius (2010) also stresses individual pleasure and the 'good life' in post-liberalisation and globalised India, showing the increased focus on consumer subjectivity. This links with the emergence of many service-providers in the form of 'experts' in different areas such as real estate, and particularly in events like weddings (Brosius 2010).

This emergence of consumerism, commodity and service driven market, and market economy has had a crucial impact on music training in the context of *Hindustani* music. Not only has there been a burgeoning of private and semi-private music schools, diversification of courses offered here, and an expansion of music organisations; but the very outlook of these schools and organisations reflect, in varying degrees, individual subjectivity, self-care, a

skills-based society, and commercialisation, among other features of a neoliberal India. Yet, the discourse of *Hindustani* music is still largely dominated by the idea of spirituality, sacredness, the relationship between the *guru* and their *shishya*, Indian classical music as Indian heritage, etc. Additionally, these institutions and organisations present to us the complexities emerging from the coexistence of seemingly contradictory traditional and neoliberal approaches. They also highlight a broad dominant discourse surrounding Indian classical music, and the complex interactions with this discourse shown by musicians, music connoisseurs, students, and keen listeners of different socio-religious and socio-economic backgrounds at the ground level. In this thesis, I explore if the ideas of sacredness and spirituality either serve or counter neoliberal capitalism in *Hindustani* classical music pedagogy. How do the ideas of heterotopic spaces, regional identities in a *national* heritage of Indian classical music, music citizenship, and neoliberal identity interact with each other in such a pedagogy?

1.2.3 *Socio-political changes in post-1991 India: secularism and the politics of identity*

The post-91 period in India is also characterised by a renewed emphasis on tradition and social identities (fanning the rise of identity-politics) by the new middle-classes, albeit in a manner that is different from the past, and is in sync with a neoliberal, global outlook and conspicuous consumption. While Indian traditional identity and neoliberal society may come across as opposites, Fernandes notes '[s]ocial identities in fact serve as an important source of symbolic resources that help to manage the uncertainties associated with policies of economic liberalization and the broader processes of globalization that such policies invoke' (2006, 61). There have also been, during this period, changes (and upheavals) in terms of religious ideologies, and revival of debates around secularism and nationalism. Varied scholars such as Rajeev Bhargava (1998), Needham and Rajan (2007), Tambiah, (1998), and Vanaik (1997) have explored and discussed the idea of secularism in India and its crisis through various perspectives.

As Anuradha Dingwaney Needham and Rajeswari Sunder Rajan argue, the 'crisis of secularism' in India and the world today is not about religion as an idea or belief, but religion as a basis of identity, 'with co-religionists constituting a community, nation, or civilisation – that comes to be the ground of difference and hence conflict' (2007, 3). In this context, scholars such as Anderson and Jaffrelot (2018), David Ludden (2005), Jaffrelot (1996), Rupal Oza (2006), Bhargava (1998), and Stanley Tambiah (1998) among many others, have

discussed the resurgence of Hindu nationalism in the 1980s and its increased significance in the 1990s with its entry into national politics. This has, in some ways, existed in tandem with the re-emphasis of tradition, which has been largely Hindu, by the new middle-class of a post-1991 India (Chacko 2019; Oza 2006). Priya Chacko has argued that, to reach out to the new middle-classes and its 'support base,' Hindu nationalism makes itself relevant to the changing times by adopting prevalent dominant economic ideas, which in post-1991 are the neoliberal ones of the market economy (2019, 379). Oza (2006) and Chacko (2019) argue that Hindu nationalism, in this period, finds similarity in terms of ideology to that of early-twentieth century nationalism, which emphasised the revival of the great ancient Indian past, often defined in the dominant Hindu, Brahmanical terms. While they become important today in the conservative Hindu sense as indicated by scholars above, the 'tradition', spirituality, and spiritual experience in the present times also become a marker of a modern, neo-liberal experience. Brosius's publication, particularly her case study of the Akshardham commercial complex in Delhi, has presented how spiritual experience can also represent a good life for the new middle-classes (2010). Jyotsna Kapur also discusses the idea of tradition embodied in the Bollywood-style weddings today where the neoliberal subject is also governed by "the stress of asserting individuality and style, through consumption of market-produced goods," and these goods can only be acquired by intense hard work and money (2009: 227).

In *Hindustani* classical music, there has been the continued existence of a dominant nationalist discourse, which is evident even today in varying degrees and ways within different organisations, institutions and among different musicians as I discuss in the later chapters. However, ethnomusicologists and music scholars such as Kobayashi (2003) and Niranjana (2020) have shown that the practice and extra-musical aspects of *Hindustani* music cannot be viewed through a single or a simplistic lens. *Hindustani* music was, historically, fraught with complexities on the ground that ensured this music's continuity until the present-day.

The complexities in the *Hindustani* classical music education also reflects that in the Indian society in general. In the broader Indian socio-political context, Amit Pandya (2010) has noted that minorities, particularly Muslims have felt socially and politically disadvantaged over the years, with an underrepresentation in the economic sphere as well. Even in independent India, a discontent has emerged among the Muslims on being treated as mere vote banks by politicians and political parties (Tambiah 1998). Many scholars in the recent past have documented inter-communal violence targeting religious minorities, indicating, what Williams (2015) calls, the diverse geographies of Hindu-Muslim violence.

However, as various recent academic works aim to understand these instances, many of them have positioned themselves to a common narrative – that inter-community relations (in India) are largely characterised by violence resulting from the emergence of capitalist modernity and the crisis of Indian secularism (Engineer 1995; Kakar 1996; Nandy 1998; Tambiah 1996; Tambiah 1998). Interestingly, however, Philippa Williams (2015) points out that in such varied publications on Hindu-Muslim relations in India, Muslims are often portrayed as passive victims. On the contrary, setting the Indian city of Varanasi as her field to analyse inter-communal relations between Muslim weavers and Hindu merchants, she demonstrates the active engagement of Muslims in the negotiation and maintenance of peace with Hindus in everyday lives as they participate and work together in the textile business (Williams 2015). She argues that the focus on violence between these two communities ignores the lived realities in India, features of which are included in everyday peace and co-existence (Williams 2015, 4). Minorities often define and redefine their citizenship and aim to contribute in their own way to secularism in India. Despite compromises, secularism still constitutes an 'opportunity for marginalised religious groups to make their claims to the nation and their right to equality and justice' (Williams 2015, 3-4). Peace as a process is often produced within and through civil society and everyday interaction, 'shaped by individual agencies and local contexts' (Williams 2015, 9). The peace process is itself political, "constituted through uneven geographies of power" (Williams 2015, 9).

This suggests that, while a dominant discourse based on a Hindu view of life, particularly as propagated by Hindu nationalism, has been prevalent in certain ways at different times in India, lived realities can be complex at the ground level; this complexity has been a characteristic of Indian society in general. Within Indian classical music, this complexity has manifested since the time of institutionalisation and systematisation of Indian music. While the dominant discourse around music in the early-twentieth century was being defined in Hindu, high-caste, and elitist terms, the interaction between 'musicophiliacs' and musicians of different social, religious, and regional backgrounds contributed to the sustenance of this music form and went beyond religious and regional lines. While the historical analyses by various scholars examine interactions of tradition with modernity and British colonialism, this thesis explores the everyday interactions between hegemonic traditions, neoliberal discourses, and the agency of participants and learners within the spaces of a new wave of private and semi-private medium and small-scale music schools; as well as that of some well-known music organisations of post-91 India.

1.3 Overview of the field(s): Delhi, Gurugram and Patna

Various factors informed my choice of fields – Delhi, Gurugram, and Patna – besides the fact that all three of them are familiar spaces for me, either as my home or that of my extended family. Today, Delhi is the national capital territory of India with New Delhi, one of its administrative districts, as the national capital. Following the 1857 Indian revolt against the British and shift of control to the British crown, the changes in music patronage were disruptive and Delhi's importance as a cultural centre declined severely (Barlow and Subramanian, 2007). Since then, however, Delhi has not received adequate attention in terms of Indian classical music. Today, the national capital territory (NCT) of Delhi has re-established itself as one of India's cultural epicentres and includes its own share of cultural activities to boast about. It has important music institutions, organisations, cultural centres, and performance spaces established either in pre-independent or newly-independent India, some of which I discuss in the later chapters. There are government funded institutions such as Indira Gandhi National Centre for the Arts (or IGNCA) which acts as an important venue for varied cultural and art-related events, classical music performances and lecture demonstrations, among others.[12] Most of these important cultural centres, government-funded institutions, popular venues like Kamani auditorium that host Indian classical music performances, and spaces where organisations like SPIC MACAY operate from, are situated in the New Delhi and central Delhi area of the NCT of Delhi. Central and New Delhi area are also home to well-known institutions teaching Indian classical music like Triveni Kala Sangam, Gandharva Mahavidyalaya, and Shriram Bharatiya Kala Kendra, thus making them the cultural hub of the city. Apart from formal and large-scale institutions, Delhi is also home to one of the prominent *gharanas* of Indian classical music – the Delhi *Gharana* headed by vocalist Ustad Iqbal Ahmed Khan (as the *Khalifa*) until his demise in December 2020. Various musicians of other *gharanas* also reside here today, much of which can be due to better opportunities in terms of performances, the number of good institutions for those wanting to teach, and considerable numbers of interested students. For instance, some musicians of the Dagar *gharana*, such as Ustad Wasifuddin Dagar, reside here. A few young artists of the Darbhanga *gharana* as well as the Kirana *gharana* have also made Delhi their home. They are involved in either teaching, performance, or both. Many of the performing artists I met during fieldwork, resided or had institutes either in south Delhi, central Delhi or the New Delhi area of the NCT of Delhi.

---

[12] IGNCA is an autonomous institution functioning under the Ministry of Culture of the central government. For more details, please see IGNCA (n.d.).

Therefore, for the above-mentioned reasons, in Delhi my research focussed largely on South, New, and Central Delhi. South Delhi area is also viewed by the people in Delhi as one of the posh ones: home to businessmen and professional middle-classes, particularly of the corporate sector. Therefore, it became important space for me to understand the new wave of music schools and their adaptability in the present context while catering to this new elites and professional middle-class with good earning capacity. All these parts of Delhi that I focus on are also home to extremely diverse private and semi-private small and medium-scale schools.

On the other hand, Gurugram (colloquially known as Gurgaon), a city in the state of Haryana but a part of the national capital region of Delhi owing to its closeness to the national capital territory, has seen rapid development since the turn of century.[13] The National Capital Region (hereafter NCR) planning Board of the Ministry of Housing and Urban affairs, Government of India, defines the NCR as "a unique example of inter-state regional planning and development for a region with NCT-Delhi as its core. The NCR as notified covers the whole of NCT-Delhi and certain districts of Haryana, Uttar Pradesh and Rajasthan, covering an area of about 55,083 sq. kms.[14]" Gurugram is also one of Haryana's largest cities and is situated to the south west of the national capital territory of Delhi.[15] With an increase in offices of well-known multi-national companies here, Gurugram, particularly the new Gurugram area, emerged as an important urban centre (supplementing Delhi), with many professional middle-classes with good earning capacity working in the offices here as well as increasingly also making Gurugram their home. Therefore, in Gurugram, I focussed on East and South Gurugram for my thesis, which constitutes the new Gurugram area, since much of it was developed in the post-1991 period and more drastically after 2000 (Narain, 2009).

As an extended fieldwork, the city of Patna - which is the capital of the eastern state of Bihar – also became an important field for this research. It has historically been an important, although peripheral, centre for *Hindustani* classical music. Yet, in recent decades this state in general and Patna in particular has hardly been associated with *Hindustani* music and its role has long been forgotten. Scholars such as Akshaya Kumar (2018), Dev Pathak (2018), Kathryn

---

[13] The National Capital Region (NCR) of Delhi is the "interstate regional planning and development for a region with the NCT (National Capital Territory) of Delhi as its core". The Delhi-NCR includes Delhi and the cities or districts of the neighbouring states like Gurugram and Faridabad in the state of Haryana; Ghaziabad and Noida in the state of Uttar Pradesh; among many others.

[14] Government of India, Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs, *NCR Constituent Areas*. India: Government of India, n.d., http://ncrpb.nic.in/ncrconstituent.html (accessed on March 8, 2021).

[15] It is important to mention that Delhi is a semi-state and union territory of India of which New Delhi (the capital of India is one of the districts. However, in this thesis, I often use the two interchangeably.

Hardy (2010), and Ratnakar Tripathy (2007), have conducted insightful studies on the performing arts, folk art (including music) of Bihar, and Bhojpuri popular music and cinema through the lens of socio-economics, gender, and politics. Yet, there has been a dearth of literature on *Hindustani* classical music and training in the context of private or semi-private, medium- and small-music schools and university departments in Patna or Bihar, which I discuss in detail in Chapter 6.

Owing to a paucity of time in Patna (I had only about a month for fieldwork there), I focussed largely on central, western, and north-western Patna with certain exceptions – areas which within a fair distance from my base.

1.4 Theoretical Framework

This thesis draws upon concepts, ideas and perspectives from various scholars and disciplines; ethnomusicology, anthropology, sociology, philosophy, history, and politics. For its main conceptual frameworks, the thesis primarily derives from theories on neoliberal capitalism; Foucauldian thought on discipline and heterotopic spaces; and 'hidden curriculum', a concept often used in the field of education. I also apply, at places, Pierre Bourdieu's idea of taste and cultural capital (1984). These theories and approaches of the different scholars that I discuss in this section are useful for me to understand and analyse the ideologies, norms, and values dominating the music education of music schools and organisations in Delhi, Gurugram and Patna. I also discuss the idea of music and cultural citizenship in detail in this thesis, mainly in chapters 5 and 6.

1.4.1 Education and Neoliberalism

Theoretically, neoliberalism, as David Harvey defines it, entails that 'human well-being can best be advanced by liberating individual entrepreneurial freedoms and skills within an institutional framework characterized by strong private property rights, free markets, and free trade' (2005, 2). In a neoliberal society, interference of the state in the market is minimal and the state only needs to facilitate the existence of 'institutional framework appropriate to such practices' (Harvey 2005, 2). Scholars such as Harvey (2005) and Ilana Gershon (2011) have indicated neoliberalism's stress on individualism, self, subjectivity, and individual responsibility. Furthermore, competition and risk are at the core of a neoliberal society and human relations. Therefore, 'managing the self' becomes important, given that it entails 'taking oneself to be a collection of skills or traits that can

enter into alliances with other such collections,' (Gershon 2011, 539). Gershon also adds that 'these skills, traits, or marketable capacities are what the neoliberal agent brings to relationships' (2011, 539). Therefore, skills and their acquisition become important in neoliberalism and for neoliberal subjectivities to survive.

Interestingly, we know from Foucault that in any given society, knowledge and the dominant discourse become crucial in influencing legitimation and power and the ways in which these are maintained (1975). Discourse, in a Foucauldian sense, can be defined as 'systems of thoughts composed of ideas, attitudes, courses of actions, beliefs and practices that systematically construct the subjects and the worlds of which they speak' (Lessa 2006, 285). Therefore, in neoliberal capitalist societies, it is neoliberal discourse that is predominant, and which drives society. In such a state, while individual freedom is acknowledged, and subjectivity and individuality become crucial, the individual is still restrained by the dominant discourse of the market economy through power structures and functions in accordance with it (Foucault 1975). I also draw on the work of some scholars such as Sangeeta Shresthova (2011) and Anna Morcom (2013), who have explored neoliberalism, performing arts, and institutions in the Indian context, and have discussed the neoliberal emphasis on individual self-care, motivation and hard work as propagated through the Bollywood dance industry in the present context.

The impact of neoliberalism on education today is evident too. Bronwyn Davies and Peter Bansel point out,

> Since the shift to neoliberal governance refigured relations between government, private enterprise and society, with the economic imperatives of the private sector situated as central to government economic and social policies, public institutions, such as schools and hospitals, previously supported as essential to collective well-being were reconstituted under neoliberalism as part of the market (2007, 254).

Ed Chung and Carolan McLarney have also noted that while in a pre-capitalist era, education was seen as an important social institution that contributed to the 'improvement of 'human capital',' the emergence of services sector in neoliberal societies has meant that education becomes a service which students can get as they pay for it (2000). The university here, then, becomes a service provider (Chung and McLarney 2000). In this scenario, where the market influences the education system, students become important stakeholders (Laing and Laing 2016).[16] The student, then, is a consumer, a customer, and customer satisfaction become

---

[16] Chung and McLarney have also discussed in detail the other important stakeholders in higher education (which included parents, employers, among others) while keeping students as important ones in the education process (2000).

crucial for any organisation to work towards (Chung and McLarney 2000). Therefore, many higher education institutions tend to be student-centric and involve participation of students in determining the pedagogy and teaching process, among other things, particularly through the feedback process every year (Chung and McLarney 2000; Laing and Laing 2016). The medium- and small-scale private music schools that I explore in this thesis display certain similar characteristics in varied ways, making them very student-centric. Here, I explore the ways they interact with the extra-musical aspects, values, and ideologies associated with *Hindustani* music tradition. Therefore, this study aims to understand how neoliberal education works in these diverse settings – societies, and small- and medium-scale private or semi-private schools – to promote and transmit *Hindustani* music. How do tradition, regionalism, syncretism, secularism, and neoliberalism interact in these institutions and organisations at a broader level, as well as in day-to-day experiences? How does this interaction affect the kind of education the participants in such institutions and organisations are involved in? In what ways do they differ from the older institutions and music departments?

It is crucial to note here that the private and semi-private music schools I discuss in this thesis are different from the mainstream private or public schools in India that impart general education in subjects beyond music; music may or may not be offered as a separate subject here. This thesis does not focus on these mainstream schools or the state of music as a subject in them. The music schools I examine here are primarily music and dance schools, which can also include various other art, dance, and music forms beyond Indian classical performing arts.

1.4.2   *Music institutions and organisations as 'Heterotopic spaces'*

In this thesis, following the French social theorist Michel Foucault (1998), I argue that the new wave of music schools as well as (old or new) music organisations can constitute complex, 'heterotopic' spaces. Heterotopic spaces or heterotopia is distinct from utopia in Foucault's thesis. Utopias are unreal and imaginary – an ideal that is non-existent. For Foucault, they 'are society perfected or the reverse of society, but in any case, these utopias are spaces that are fundamentally and essentially unreal' (Foucault 1998, 178). On the other hand, heterotopia or heterotopic spaces, as Foucault describes, are the

> real places, actual places, places that are designed into the very institution of society, which are sorts of actually realized utopias in which the real emplacements, all the

other real emplacements that can be found within the culture are, at the same time, represented, contested, and reversed. (1998, 178)[17]

Thus, heterotopic spaces, which are present in every culture or civilisation, are these 'different' or 'other' spaces in which we live and are the spaces of contestation (real or mythical) (Foucault 1998, 179). Post-colonial scholar Partha Chatterjee (2004) has also shown, with his use of Foucault's concept in the postcolonial Indian setting, that local practices and particularistic identities can and do exist alongside the universalistic, secular ones. Chatterjee asserts that 'the real space of modern life consists of 'heterotopia',' (Chatterjee 2004, 7). He points towards a conflict that 'lies at the heart of modern politics in most of the world,' which is

> the opposition between the universal ideal of civic nationalism, based on individual freedoms and equal rights irrespective of distinctions of religion, race, language, or culture, and the particular demands of cultural identity, which call for the differential treatment of particular groups on grounds of vulnerability or backwardness or historical injustice, or indeed for numerous other reasons. (Chatterjee 2004, 4)

Here, Chatterjee (2004) critiques Benedict Anderson's (1983) idea of civic nationalism where any resistant or 'other' identities are not recognised. For Anderson, Chatterjee notes, 'nation lives in an empty homogeneous time' (2004, 4). Chatterjee calls this empty homogeneous time a *utopia* and not a real space, while modernity entails the creation of heterotopic spaces in different societies around the world (2004).

A related concept coined by Anurima Banerji in her analysis on Odissi dance, gender and state is 'paratopia' (2019). Paratopia are the spaces of alterity or a parallel space that exists alongside the dominant values. Subjects produce these spaces of alterity on 'their own terms' without referring 'to the dominant valuations' (Banerji 2019, 22). In the context of this dance form, Banerji defines paratopic performances as 'those political and cultural enactments engendered by dance in the contemporary moment and which exist adjacent to the prevailing norm (Banerji 2019, 22). In the Indian context, the institutionalisation and classicisation of Indian dance and music forms in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries also defined the dominant discourse surrounding them, which still frames dance and music practice in India today. However, Banerji notes that while adherence to the dominant discourse, ancient treatises, and the ancient historical identity of Odissi in producing this art form is considered important in many ways and by various artists even today, it is also a 'paratopic force that contains the possibility to challenge dominant discourse and power'

---

[17] Foucault defines emplacement as 'the relations of proximity between points or elements' (1998, 176).

(2019, 19). This thesis examines how various music schools and organisations offer the possibility of being heterotopic or paratopic spaces, where seemingly-contradictory ideologies, ethos, and values co-exist, albeit in varying degrees, and where dominant discourses on *Hindustani* classical music are at once adhered to and disrupted.

While the concept of heterotopia does inform this thesis in general, I have particularly used this concept in detail in Chapter 4 to discuss the new wave of small-scale and medium-scale music schools in Delhi-Gurugram area. Chapter 5 looks at the heterotopic spaces of music organisations through the lens of music and cultural citizenship, and their interaction with neoliberal citizenship. Chapter 6 adds to this discussion by also exploring the concept of citizenship in the context of different music institutions in the regional centre of Patna.

1.4.3   Institutions, Ideology, Taste, and hidden curriculum

The concept of ideology is key in my analysis. This concept can be approached theoretically in different ways. French philosopher Louis Althusser (1971) discusses the Ideological Apparatus extensively, distinguishing it from the repressive state apparatus where the dominant ideology (that of the ruling class) is implemented by force and enforced by the state through police, prison, courts and even the army). The Ideological Apparatus, on the other hand, works to re-establish and preserve elite dominance through ideologies (Althusser 1971). Institutions and schools constitute an important space where these ideological systems (or apparatuses) are produced, reproduced, and re-enforced (Althusser 1971). Schools become a space where the students, along with the skills and knowledge, also

> … learn the 'rules' of good behaviour, i.e. the attitude that should be observed by every agent in the division of labour, according to the job he is 'destined' for… (Althusser 1971, 89)

Therefore, besides the skills required for different classes in a capitalistic society, the schools become a space for extra-curricular training as well (Althusser 1971).

Ethnomusicologist Max Katz extended this idea to his study on music institutions, particularly his case study of the iconic Bhatkhande music institute in Lucknow (2017). Institutional communalism, a concept he devised, explains the reproduction of the dominant ideological structures associated with *Hindustani* music in this institute even in the post-independence period (Katz 2017). For instance, the traditional, hereditary (Muslim) musicians had a crucial role to play in the development of the Bhatkhande music institute, even after Indian independence. While the early years of the institute saw many hereditary musicians as teachers, their involvement dwindled over time, and today this contribution is

greatly downplayed with a negligible number of Muslim musicians as teachers (Katz 2017). Therefore, Katz' work emphasises the continuation of the ideological foundations that dominated the twentieth century music reform period and classicisation of music even to the post-colonial discourse on Indian classical music's institutionalised teaching.

Other important scholars and theorists have also recognised and discussed the crucial role educational institutions, particularly schools, play in the socialisation process and in ideological reproduction in any society. Pierre Bourdieu, a French sociologist, pointed to the cultural reproduction that schools engage in, whereby they are a place for secondary socialisation where dominant tastes and ideas are systematically taught and reproduced (1984). The culture, including taste and aesthetics, of the dominant classes (whether economically, symbolically or socially) are put forth as legitimate (Bourdieu 1984). Indeed, those with better access to the different forms of capital – whether cultural, social or symbolic – are better positioned to easily access and acquire the required skills, network, and the dominant traits (Bourdieu 1984). For Bourdieu, even if the dominated class may enter the field of higher education, nevertheless

> …in part because they lack sufficient cultural capital, they remain less likely to obtain educational credentials, and are less able to translate the credentials they do obtain into highly rewarded positions in the labor market. (Weininger and Lareau 2018, 253-254)

The role of family, therefore, as the primary space is important, determining one's access to cultural capital and where the associated norms, values and taste are first encountered and internalised.

On the other hand, there have been many more direct engagements with education as the means of teaching societal norms and to ensure conformity to the dominant discourse. The concept of a 'hidden curriculum' is crucial here. This concept is said to be first introduced by Philip W. Jackson (1968), an education scholar, in his analysis in the book *Life in the Classrooms*. Drawing from a functionalist perspective, and while discussing students of primary school, he emphasised the importance of schools as the place of socialisation process in order to prepare students for the industrialised, capitalist society (Jackson 1968). Other scholars who have theorised this concept further include Michael Apple (1979), in his book *Ideology and Curriculum*. Apple discusses the ideological function of schools and knowledge transmission and adds:

For not only is there economic property, there also seems to be symbolic property – cultural capital – which schools preserve and distribute. (Apple 1979, 2-3)[18]

One of the key means of building this cultural capital is through curriculum structures in these schools, that is, a *hidden curriculum* – the aspects of knowledge transmission which are not overt and is beyond the clear transmission of skill sets via technical knowledge (Apple 1979). Hidden curriculum in schools, for Apple, is 'the tacit teaching to students of norms, values, and dispositions that goes on simply by their living in and coping with the institutional expectations and routines of schools day in and day out for a number of years' (1979, 13). This everyday exposure to the norms, values and dispositions is in the means through which students learn the dominant ideologies of a given society. On the other hand, Apple also recognises the need for educators to recognise their own ideological commitments they may accept and use unconsciously or tacitly (1979, 13).

Therefore, in this thesis, I seek to understand the different ideological structures and the hidden curricula existing primarily in the new wave of small- and medium-scale private and semi-private music schools, and music organisations of India in their endeavour towards music education in the commercial, market economy of the present times. How do these schools and organisations in the cultural capital and in peripheral regions such as Bihar create a space for both traditional beliefs (primarily the dominant narrative of music reform period) and neoliberal ideas to co-exist, if they do? This understanding of the complex sites of diverse new music schools of post-91 India and important music organisations will shed light on the broader complexities prevalent in contemporary neoliberal Indian society, whereby social and particularistic identities based on region, religion, and caste among others become important alongside a consumption-based lifestyle. In this thesis, I explore how dominant ideologies associated with *Hindustani* music exist with a different set of ethos on the ground.

1.4.4   *Formal versus informal Education in Music*

Many studies on music education have discussed the contexts of formal music education in institutionalised setups like music schools and departments. In recent decades, however, a new strand of studies in music education has recognised the important role of informal learning processes that takes place outside institutionalised settings like schools. This process not only includes musical training in practical terms, but also the value systems

---

[18] Apple calls the dominant views of the elites as 'unquestioned truths' which are reinforced by various forces of the state (1979).

that accompany them i.e. the hidden curriculum (Pitts 2003; Folkestad 2005). Göran

Folkestad points out that

> the great majority of all musical learning takes place outside schools, in situations where there is no teacher, and in which the intention of the activity is not to learn about music, but to play music, listen to music, dance to music or be together with music (2005, 280)

Glen Carruthers adds to this view, mentioning that 'important learning occurs in formal contexts outside schools (e.g., in outreach programmes of community-based arts organizations) as well as in informal settings', and these informal settings do not necessarily have to prohibit the participation of professional educators (2008, 127-128). The fact that more value is put on extra-curricular activities over curricular ones by some students in Stephanie Pitts' (2003) research on music in University of Sheffield also puts weight on the above argument.

Besides formal and informal settings, however, education scholars like, Don Coffman (2002), Huib Schippers (2009), Kari Veblen (2012) and N.J. Colletta (1996) also discuss a third category. Veblen (2012) has also provided a detailed discussion on how different scholars have defined formal, nonformal, and informal settings of music education. None of these categories are mutually exclusive. He broadly defines formal transmission as a mode of learning that 'is typically institutionalized, graded, and hierarchical,' where the teacher guides the training and interaction within it (Veblen 2012, 247). This kind of transmission includes training in institutionalised setups like university departments, music schools, etc. (Schippers 2009). In the Indian context, university departments, old music institutions, and new private and semi-private music schools teaching *Hindustani* music can fall under this category – even though, as I discuss in the following chapters, the new schools differ from the other music institutions in many ways.

Informal practices, for Veblen, 'comprise those extensive aspects of knowledge and skill acquisition that are largely experiential,' and that 'such knowledge often comes about through unsystematic, accidental, unpurposeful, and incidental exposure to what is happening in a person's environment' (2012, 250). Such learning, for Schippers, takes place outside the music institutions and is an organic process with no teacher 'assigned to take responsibility for the learning experience' (2009, 91). The interesting new category of non-formal education consists of 'systematic and deliberate but less regulated pursuits that occur outside of educational structures, [that] are often chosen by adult students continuing their musical lives' (Veblen 2012, 248). Sometimes called participatory or self-directed education, this

non-formal transmission differs from the formal one in its approach of accommodating 'new participants or players since the members own and control the group interactions,' (Veblen 2012, 248). Schippers does not explicitly name the non-formal type of music transmission but mentions it as the one that falls between the formal and the informal types (2009). This is where he places the traditional *guru-shishya* method of training in *Hindustani* classical music (Schippers 2009). Such typology is, indeed, relevant in the present context, when there are varied institutions and methods co-existing in India to teaching Indian classical music. However, I differ with this classification of the *guru-shishya* method here: the traditional *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method of music training has traditionally been, in the Indian context, a formal method of teaching and learning to become a performer, even before the institutions imparting formal music education started to emerge in India from the nineteenth century onwards. It is indeed, in the present context, different from the typical formal method of training represented by schools/institutions that Schippers (2009) and Veblen (2012) describe. Yet it still constitutes a formal method for many students in order to become a performing artist. Therefore, in this thesis, I use the term 'traditional-formal music transmission' for the *guru-shishya* method of training rather than non-formal.

However, all of these discussions on the different settings of learning and music education are student-centric and involves those engaged in music making or learning music full-time. This approach to music education is often closed since it is restricted to the students only (whether adult or children). Conversely, my thesis looks at music organisations and societies in present-day Delhi and Gurugram, which are often open education spaces and may not, in most cases, be segregated demographically for a specific group of people. As they organise different activities going beyond performances or concerts and include workshops, lecture demonstrations, interactive sessions, seminars, these are usually open for all and free to attend in most cases. Such initiatives by different organisations in my field may fall under the non-formal method of music education as discussed by Veblen (2012), yet its reach is much wider in terms of the audience. Therefore, I present two new categories which could include such initiatives, organisations, and societies, that reach out to the wider public and engage with educating the audience in general, irrespective of their musical background. I call the first one *Volunteer or Citizen-based Participatory music education* – music education or transmission through voluntary organisations like SPIC MACAY. The second category I introduce is the *Public engagement-based music education*. Both of these types overlap in many respects – i.e. engage with the public and yet contribute immensely to music education

discourse. Yet the former has a much larger base and reach around the country (and abroad) and calls for direct engagement of the youth.

I argue that several music societies and organisations existing today constitute an important part not only of the cultural scene of a city but also of the music education beyond the institutional setup and with much wider reach. They can act as a mediator between the institutionalised form of music learning – via university, institutions, or *guru-shishya* method – and the general populace, listeners, or 'musicophiliacs' as Niranjana (2020) calls them, who are interested in Indian classical music. Yet, similar to any other form, this form of music education is also not value-free (Veblen 2012) and propagates certain traditional ideological structures and ethos whilst also adapting to a contemporary music market. Therefore, in this thesis, I explore these ideologies in the organisations and societies today and the characteristics of these as possible heterotopic spaces. I explore the way they define a *Hindustani* music citizen, alongside a neoliberal and ideal Indian citizen.

1.5 Organisation of Thesis

In this thesis, Chapter 2 will first discuss the research methodology and research methods adopted throughout the course of this research. It will also address in detail the issues of positionality in my ethnographic fieldwork – relative to the insider v/s outsider debate, reflexivity and reciprocity, as well as the ethical issues arising over the course of the fieldwork and the ways I addressed them. Following this, Chapter 3 will provide an overview of the history of music education, music schools, institutions, and societies (for *Hindustani* music) in India. It will explore the initial efforts to institutionalise and systematise Indian music at a regional level in the late-nineteenth century, followed by the institutionalisation and classicisation process of music at a pan-India level by the early-twentieth century in the context of music reform movements and cultural nationalism in India. Therefore, I will discuss the first two waves of music institutions in India in this chapter – the pre-1947 ones and the post-1947 but pre-1991 initiatives.

This is followed by Chapters 4, 5 and 6, which are ethnography-based chapters situated in the cities of Delhi, Gurugram and Patna. Chapter 4 will explore the new, third-wave of music schools in Delhi and Gurugram, looking at them as heterotopic spaces (Foucault 1998) where such schools incorporate traditional ideas associated with *Hindustani* classical music (as propagated in the late-nineteenth and the early-twentieth centuries) in their music training, yet also feature immense flexibility in the method of teaching and

pedagogy of this music tradition. Chapter 5 examines the ways in which music education and transmission can be reinterpreted and redefined by some Delhi-based organisations that work to promote and transmit Indian classical music. Here, I analyse the different ideological structures propagated by these organisations today, the kind of heterotopic spaces they constitute, the complexities they entail on the ground, and the kind of musical citizenship they define. I will also explore here questions like – how does this notion of heritage operate in a post-1991 neo-liberal India defined by increasing consumerism? Amongst other organisations, the chapter specifically examines one of the most renowned movements in the field of music education – the Society for Promotion of Indian Classical Music and Culture amongst Youth (SPIC MACAY) that operates from Delhi as its centre.

In Chapter 6, I explore music education in the context of Patna, the capital city of the state of Bihar. This chapter will put forth the way musical citizenship is defined in a peripheral centre such as Patna. The different institutions, I argue in this chapter, are intersectional spaces of regional identity, national heritage, as well as neoliberal subjectivity; and this also impacts the kind of a music citizen they create. This chapter also explores the different ways local, regional aspirations and issues coexist with the traditional values associated with *Hindustani* music. This chapter provides briefly a socio-political and cultural history of the state of Bihar, and an overview of the *Hindustani* classical music scene in this state, particularly in the city of Patna. It also maps the post-1991 period, which witnessed rapid changes in the socio-political climate of Bihar (and consequently, Patna) in terms of caste politics; deterioration in education, law and order; political instability; and serious socio-economic and development-related issues. Finally, Chapter 7 will sum up the core arguments of this thesis and offer concluding observations on the findings of this project.

Chapter 2: Research Methods – Approaches and Challenges in the field

This chapter is focused on a discussion of the process of my fieldwork in the three main areas of Delhi, Gurugram, and Patna. Here I will present the main theoretical underpinnings and debates that have informed my methodology, as well as the rationale behind the selection of specific field research techniques. I will also separately consider ethical issues that have arisen while conducting research; which will also discuss the manner in which I have sought to find resolutions for particular problems in the field. Ethnography was an essential part of my research where my focus was to understand the ideologies or ethos dominating the music schools or institutions and music organisations. I investigated how musicians and teachers approached *Hindustani* classical music education; as well as the values that musicians, music schools, and music organisations associated with this music form, among other things. Therefore, it became important for me to meet various musicians and performing artists, *gurus* or *ustads*, teachers in music schools and institutions, as well as music connoisseurs (musicophiliacs) involved with music organisations.

Ethnography is a sum total of experiences and relationships and a continuous process, whether we are in the field or outside it (Barz 2008; Beaudry 2008; Clifford 1988). It is an ongoing process which shapes experiences and behaviours (including personal experiences), as well as ways in which we respond to challenges (Beaudry 2008; Titon 2008). My own fieldwork experience in India was not any different. Meetings with diverse stakeholders in the world of *Hindustani* classical music, particularly in the initial days of my PhD, led to gaining of experience on how to approach people in an appropriate manner. I also learnt how important it was to have at least the basic knowledge, respect, and appreciation for the music style of the musician-expert if I wished to ask for a meeting. For instance, when I started with a pilot study and began attending concerts, I hardly knew about or enjoyed the form of *dhrupad*, given that I was more exposed to *khyal* instead, while growing up. I was trained in Indian classical music for two years in a music school in Gurugram before the commencement of my PhD project, and much of this training was in *khyal*.[19] As a youngster, I was acquainted with Indian classical music at home through immediate and extended family. These experiences largely revolved, yet again around, *khyal* rather than *dhrupad*. It was only when I began attending *dhrupad* performances as a part of my PhD research, that I started to understand its technical and cultural aspects better so as to interact with musicians,

---

[19] I took classes in one of the branches of Tansen Sangeet Mahavidyalaya in Gurugram.

teachers, or listeners – all of which was crucial if I were to understand the ideologies and values people associated with *Hindustani* classical music in general (whether practising *khyal* or *dhrupad*). My concert-going exercises were then followed by rich and first-hand interactions with classical musicians and experts of both *khyal* and *dhrupad* during the course of my pilot study as well as my main fieldwork. These experiences made me much more aware of my own positionality. As a cultural insider (a middle-class Indian woman who grew up in Delhi), I often questioned myself: did I necessarily have to *like* a particular music genre (*dhrupad*) and know everything about it beforehand, particularly so as researcher with a focus on educational institutions? Why and how did I adapt myself, as a listener, to *dhrupad* fairly quickly? Is it because of previous exposure to Indian classical music that put me into an advantageous position? With my primary music training from a music school, how did I fit in among other performing artists, teachers, and students of Indian classical music? What role did my background as a middle-class, higher-caste Indian play in adapting to the changes and new challenges? Most importantly, what role did my gender play in the field? Questions like this emerged from my pilot study in the initial period of my PhD research fieldwork. All of them shed light on the insider vs. outsider dilemma mentioned above, and forced me to think about further sub-circles of 'deep-insider' communities. Over a period of time, I also forged new relationships, experienced setbacks, and learnt ways to conduct ethnography.

In this chapter, I discuss many such dilemmas pertaining to my positionality as well as ethics. I explore my status in the field as both an insider and an outsider, which presented a complicated position for myself. On the one hand, as a middle-class Indian woman who has lived for a long period of time in Delhi-NCR and with extended family in Bihar, I am an insider. On the other hand, I am not a professional musician, nor have I learnt to sing in a *guru-shishya parampara* for any extensive period of time. This made me an outsider to that training method. I was not aware of the *adab*, to use Silver's term (1984), of the *Hindustani* music *ta'alim* or master-apprentice transmitted education in great detail. Yet, learning in a music school for two years was still useful for understanding the basic behavioural norms of this music form, and the ideologies that surrounded them. For example, my classes entailed leaving shoes outside rooms designed for teaching, learning to take blessings from the teacher and the instruments, and knowing to sit quietly cross-legged at the start of each class. As I learnt *Hindustani* music this way, I slowly began to think about the significance of these 'accepted norms' and to question why we followed them, particularly after the commencement of my PhD when my work took on a more reflexive turn. I was not technically intending to call out any of these behaviours but was more interested in critically

engaging with new questions that had come to my mind; of decorum, student-teacher hierarchy, and so on. These are the questions that informed my research investigation as I later visited the new music schools in Delhi, Gurugram and Patna with a formal project.

This chapter will first discuss the pilot study I had undertaken in the initial years of my PhD, where I also considered rationales behind my choice of field site and scoping of research questions in context to my positionality. The discussion is then followed by mapping out of my main fieldwork, including a summary of research methods used and ensuing challenges encountered. Using primarily ethnographic methods, I adopted techniques including interviews, participant and non-participant observations, online research, and desk-based analysis among others; each with its own pros and cons. I also discuss the ethical issues faced and the manner in which I dealt with them at each step. My "insider-outsider" status presented mini-crises of identity and location of it within a community: I had grown up in Delhi and have extended family in Patna, making these locales familiar spaces; however, I am not a performing artist, nor a music student. I have never run a music school or, formally learn in one anymore, although I did join some school classes as part of my research.

2.1 The Research begins

Prior to the undertaking of my PhD, I received various types of exposure to Indian classical music. This was basic but proved to useful for my PhD research. For two years (2009-2011), I had undertaken training in *Hindustani* classical music at one of the branches of TSM in Gurugram. This education gave me an opportunity to understand this music form from a learner's perspective.[20] At the same institution I also took examinations via Prayag Sangeet Samiti, to which TSM was affiliated. Before TSM, I also had slightly inconsistent exposure to *Hindustani* music as a student. I learnt from a *guru-ji* in his school for some months when I was around 7 or 8-years old (late-1990's), of which I do not have much memories of. Finally, as a teenager, I went to another music teacher twice weekly for about a year (in 2005) in Gurugram – I cannot recall their name; again, memories of actual sessions remain hazy. While I did have an education in *Hindustani* music at different periods, I have never learnt via a *guru-shishya* method.

Nevertheless, I did receive relatively consistent exposure to this music in the context of my domestic home life. Some of my immediate and extended family members have been connected with Indian classical music for long periods of time, mostly as aficionados and

---

[20] TSM has multiple branches around the country, including Delhi-NCR.

keen listeners. My childhood is filled with memories of the recordings of Ustad Faiyaz Khan, Ustad Vilayat Khan, Pandit Omkarnath Thakur, and bhajans by MS Subbalakshmi (a renowned *Carnatic* musician), among others. Additionally, Kumar Shyamanand Singh of the Banaili estate near the village of Champanagar, a respected classical singer and one of the important patrons of classical music in the state of Bihar, was one of my ancestors from the maternal side. I remember being exposed to his recordings at home from an early age and being told about him. However, it was not before the start of my master's degree (in Sociology) that I began engaging with Indian music academically.

Despite this background, when I started my PhD, I had no visible connections with anyone in the world of Indian classical music outside my family – whether musicians, teachers, performing artists, or music connoisseurs – and had to start from a scratch. Not many musicians or performing artists, and *guru*s and *ustad*s directly engage with the kind of music school I learnt at (which is much similar to a new music school I discuss in this thesis). TSM provided little to no connections with the Indian classical music performance world important for interaction opportunities with well-known performing artists. I do not remember being overtly encouraged to attend concerts of *Hindustani* music; neither were classical music performances organised at school during my time there. This meant that I had no personal or institutional connections to bank on during fieldwork. And yet, my PhD research required me to interview not only *Hindustani* classical music teachers employed by the new wave of music schools (which are comparatively easier to approach), but also musicians, performing artists, *guru*s and *ustad*s, music professors in universities, and connoisseurs. These, I found, often constituted a closed community of sorts, in which many of individuals knew each other personally and where non-performing connoisseurs had extensive musical knowledge.

In order to work out a plan for ethnography, I first had to understand my field in a better fashion and learn to establish contacts before formal investigations. To this endeavour, a pilot study became crucial. This preliminary phase also helped in finalising the disciplinary scope of my research and the sites for fieldwork, based on a number of factors. I will name and explore them in the following section.

2.1.1   *Pilot Study and Planning*

 […] I would suggest that the experience led me to understand how a pilot study can enhance research in general: How a pilot is just as important in finding the way through the 'waves' of

> the field as one is in navigating the somewhat more physically formidable waves of the ocean.

> – Helen Sampson (2004, 384).

Is a pilot study necessary for any ethnographic research? This question is subjective and depends on the individual researcher or a group of researchers involved, and the nature of research they are engaged in. Whether they prefer to gather pre-information for assessment of feasibility or wish to enter the field as a complete stranger, depends on the positionalities and research methods applied (Sampson 2004). There are advantages to going into the field fresh, without prior access to it. Sampson mentions some of these, including the fact that 'the novelty of a new and strange environment lends the researcher an openness to new information' (2004, 389). However, the field I was entering was neither a strange nor a new environment for me; being an Indian who grew up in Delhi-NCRI am aware of the cultural sensibilities here. Nevertheless, a pilot study turned out to be useful. It helped in gauging the feasibility of my research, gathering pre-information in order to refine my questions, and establishing contacts for potential interviews. It also proved crucial in my experimenting with and deciding on a set of research tools to be used in my main fieldwork. For instance, I had to decide whether to use participant observation, non-participant observation or both methods; whether or not to go for a case study analysis; and if and how to adopt focused group interviews if needed; among others. The pilot study also became a means, as Edwin van Teijlingen and Vanora Hundley (2002) have also noted, of learning to resolve issues or problems arising from the research itself. It helped me formulate a plan for the major tranche of fieldwork in 2018. More importantly, after this preliminary field trip, I was able to narrow down areas to focus on and systemise in my thesis. During my pilot study, I often wondered whether any or all data I had collected would ever make it to my final project. As it turns out, much of it was not included. However, many ideas I explored during this period have stayed. In qualitative research like mine, pilot studies can be used effectively in the main study through re-mapping of methodologies (van Teijlingen and Hundley 2002, 35).

With broadly defined research questions after intensive reading, I undertook multiple trips to India (I was based in the UK for my PhD) for my pilot study and preliminary fieldwork – in December 2016, the summer of 2017 and December 2017-January 2018. My focus at the time was on Delhi, Mumbai and Patna. I was looking to test my ideas and explore the field; including important music institutions (including the new music schools) and well-known musicians who taught in them. I was also interested in music organisations,

possible corporate patronage, and different centres of music transmission like All-India Radio in these cities. My early work also included identifying and establishing connections with some musician-performers, *ustads* or *gurus*, music professors in music departments, and teachers in big and small music institutes for future interviews. I needed to understand the power dynamics underlying some music organisations, schools/institutions, musicians, and the cultural scene of these cities. Another area that I was exploring at this time was the fusion scene in Delhi and collaborations of *Hindustani* classical musicians with those of other genres in my fields. While my preliminary fieldwork included interviews with certain such musicians, this aspect did not ultimately become a part of my main fieldwork later as well as thesis.

2.1.2   Main fieldwork

> In common with our cousins in the social sciences, we engage in fieldwork primarily as a means of collecting data, not only in terms of facts and figures but also in the form of the results of our own observations and, most recently, our direct participation. – Caroline Bithell (2003, 81)

With the above quote in mind and after the consolidation of lessons learnt from my pilot study, I finally began to conduct my main fieldwork between July 2018 to December 2018, for the purposes of my PhD. By this time my research was much more focussed, and I now chose to examine, specifically, the new music schools and music organisations in the cities of Delhi, Gurugram (NCR) and Patna. Experience gained through my pilot study taught me how to recognise and identify potential schools I could get in touch with and the owners as well as music teachers I could meet. Therefore, I extensively searched for music schools online in different parts of the three cities. A simple google-search itself was helpful in preparing such a list, with websites and contact details. Initially, I mostly contacted musicians and music schools via phone numbers I found online. There were other contacts I received through networking (that is, from people I already knew). I also intended to get in touch, in my main fieldwork, with people I had already met before in the pilot research for further interview with more focussed questions and for suggestions regarding institutions or individuals I could visit. Social networking sites like Facebook also helped me get in touch with some music schools and their owners (these were often music teachers themselves). Facebook was also useful in helping me identify respondents, and (via school pages) provided background information on certain schools. An increasing number of scholarly engagements have recognised the Internet as an important site for conducting fieldwork and ethical concerns

around it (Murthy 2008; Reich 2015). Murthy has, in particular, mentioned the usefulness of social networking sites for researchers in mapping out 'their social networks meticulously' and interacting with these constituents on a public platform (2008, 844). Social networking sites become de facto 'virtual 'gatekeepers' with chains of 'friends' who are potential research respondents' (Murthy 2008, 844).

Pre-planning for my main fieldwork involved selecting in advance, as much as possible, performing artists who were teaching in music institutions, universities or via *guru-shishya* (or *ustad-shagird*) method. This, I thought, would be useful in getting a complete picture of the music education scene in the cities of Delhi-Gurugram and Patna. In the case of teacher-cum-performing artists and music professors I did not have a phone number of, I would email them or send a message via Facebook. While many did not respond, a few came back with contact details. Once in the field in India itself, I first contacted musicians (particularly those who also taught) and asked for a personal meeting so that I could speak to them about their expertise in *Hindustani* classical music, and their work, administrative and performing experiences.[21] In rare cases, if a one-to-one meeting was not possible, Skype was an alternative. Only two meetings were conducted on Skype as a consequence of travel restrictions at the time of my enquiry, such as the case of one of the owners of Shankar Mahadevan Academy based in Mumbai.[22] This school, I felt, was crucial to know more about, given that it was the only one I found was dependent heavily on online teaching and on its overseas students. One of the drawbacks of relying on the internet and including digital ethnography in research is the fact that it is can only be successful among those who have access to the world wide web, something Murthy calls 'Digital social capital' amongst the 'digital haves' and 'have-nots' (2008, 845). With this in mind, I arranged for almost all of my interviews to take place in person, where I travelled to the school, home, or, in few cases, to a neutral meeting venue (like a restaurant).

It is important to mention here that my complete fieldwork (preliminary and main) was conducted over the few years of my PhD, at regular intervals of a few of months at a stretch. In between, I returned to London and worked on the data I had gathered. Beaudry points out certain advantages of such an ethnographic approach in the context of her own experience, stating that it gave her 'relief from a situation with strong emotional overtones –

---

[21] There were instances when I had contacted certain musicians and music schools before reaching my field, to schedule my appointments in advance. However, many of them would insist calling them back when I was in India.

[22] Shankar Mahadevan Academy is a well-known institute for music in the city of Mumbai.

a break that allows me to revert to my normal self while considering the field period with some perspective' (2008, 232). This helped her to weave in both the in-the-field and outside-the-field aspects in as much objective lens as possible, and to understand the strengths and weaknesses (Beaudry 2008). My fieldwork involved intensive and often long conversations with different individuals. With multiple interviews and class observations lined up during fieldwork, doing fieldwork in chunks meant that I could take a break from it after a spell, distance myself, think and reflect on the fieldwork as a whole, and analyse the data as I made transcriptions. This also meant I could record important anecdotes and notes from the fieldwork before I forgot them. These stream-of-consciousness notes are an important aspect of fieldwork, reminding us of what we know in relation to our research questions and the manner in which we got to know about it (Barz, 2008). While ethnography involves creating these writings and texts in the field as we observe and gather experiences to interpret, that ethnography is composed outside of the field (Clifford 1988).

Over the course of my research, I used different research techniques in order to answer my questions. First and foremost, the qualitative fieldwork I conducted involved formal open-ended semi-structured to unstructured interviews as well as informal conversations. Unstructured or open-ended interviews and conversations, as Amir Marvasti notes, 'allow more fluid interaction between the researcher and the respondent' (2004, 20). These in-depth interviews help understand the manner in which the respondent sees the world around him, and also 'has the potential to reveal multiple, and sometimes conflicting, attitudes about a given topic' (Marvasti 2004, 21). These can also work well to know in detail the 'culturally specific insider musical knowledge about the musical tradition, and maintain rapport' (Rice 2014, 37).[23] In my research too, informal interviews helped in creating rapport. 'Organic' conversations put the interviewees at ease and helped me understand their complex perspectives. My interviews were generally between thirty minutes to two hours long, depending on the discussion resulting from open-ended questions.

Additionally, my research involved issues that could be considered sensitive – I sought to understand the ideologies entailed in the new music schools and music organisations, along with the idea of tradition, and secularism in the transmission of Indian classical music. Here, I was careful with the kinds of questions I asked. My interviews always respected the viewpoints of the interviewees and I avoided posing sensitive questions which could put one on the spot. I did not want to place my consultants in any dilemma, and I

---

[23] Timothy Rice (2014) discusses interviews from the point of view of ethnomusicologists.

aimed to make them feel comfortable with my presence. I ensured that no religiously or politically delicate discussions took place, and that the interactions only happened around Indian classical music and music teaching, as well as values surrounding them. I avoided asking questions related to the government or the current socio-political issues. I adhered to the questions directly relevant to the socio-cultural and extra-musical aspects of Indian classical music. I tried my best to phrase my questions such that interviewees would be able to answer at ease from their own positionalities – for instance, I asked for views on the idea of the *guru-shishya parampara* in context to notions of reverence for the *guru*, or of music and instruments as sacred, or of *sanskar* (values). Much later, feedback came to me that my interviewees found me friendly, respectful and likeable. Knowing this was a relief; I was satisfied that I had forged friendly relationships. In all the situations above and in each step of ethnography, it was important for me to be considerate of the values and sentiments of the people (Beaudry 2008; Nettl 2015).

To some extent, my data analysis went side-by-side with fieldwork as I revised my set of questions for each new round of interviewees. With this approach, which is often associated with grounded theory research, the data already collected sometimes acted as what Corbin and Strauss call 'cues' by which to 'incorporate all seemingly relevant issues into the next set of interviews and observations' (1990, 419). This iterative method helped me discard strategies and questions which showed themselves be not so useful. I gradually gained confidence to approach the next interview or observation in a better fashion (van Teijlingen and Hundley 2002). The bulk of data analysis, however, was taken care of after the fieldwork and took place mostly alongside the writing of my actual PhD chapters. I conducted a few follow-up interviews in late 2019-early 2020, even though I could not continue further after that, given the unfortunate coronavirus pandemic and the consequent lockdown.

Figuring out ways to interview Indian classical musicians about new, private music schools remained a challenge until the beginning of the main fieldwork in 2018. Many Indian classical performing artists still teach in a traditional *guru-shishya* method, although this method itself has changed immensely today.[24] The new music schools usually do not find support among many of these traditional artists. This is because music schools and institutions are not seen by them as capable of creating performing artists. Interestingly, some hereditary musicians or practising musicians I met often questioned my decision to study these small-scale schools, even though a few of them have themselves established similar

---

[24] Some performing artists/teachers also run a school simultaneously.

schools under the banner of their *gharana* or style. The idea of classical music as *guru-mukhi vidya*, that is. best learnt from a *guru*, still dominates Indian classical music discourse. In an initial informal chat with a well-known performing artist, I realised how similar my quest of approaching musicians/performing artists was to the way in which a new *shishya* would approach his potential *guru*; with respect for their knowledge and with willingness to learn from them (and about them). At the same time, I recognise the challenges this approach may have brought up as well – with the need for more 'cushioning conversation' interviews with these figures sometimes ended up being longer than planned.

Besides open-ended interviews, I used largely non-participant (and participant if required) observations of the music classes in the new music schools. As discussed previously, besides attending concerts (that are space for networking with musicians and music connoisseurs), I used the 'snowball method' to meet new people. This involved receiving suggestions and contact details from people I already knew or had interviewed. With music schools, the selection was mostly random, wherein I would do an online search for schools teaching *Hindustani* music and contact them. I interviewed the founder of SPIC MACAY twice. I also observed the meetings of this movement as I volunteered for it, of which I discuss the experiences in Chapter 5. Furthermore, I attended and observed various interactive sessions and performances organised in Delhi under *Gunijan Sabha* by Ustad Imamuddin Khan Dagar Indian art, music and Culture society – a Jaipur-based organisation. My analysis of *Gunijan Sabha* in this thesis are based on these non-participant observations of the *Sabha* as an audience. Besides these, I researched through the websites of many organisations and music institutions discussed in this chapter, on which much of the background information of them are based.

2.2 Positionality and reflexivity

In this section, I discuss my position in the field and the manner in which it could have impacted my fieldwork and my approach to it. I also look at my position in the insider-outsider spectrum in the field, since in many ways, I was both an outsider and insider.

2.2.1   *Insider v/s Outsider dichotomy*

A number of publications, including that of Girija Godbole (2014), Timothy Cooley (2003), and Stan Stevens (2001), have discussed the position or role of a researcher (whether an outsider or an insider) in conducting ethnographic fieldwork and the manner in which they

navigate the field. Recent ethnomusicological doctoral studies also place importance on reflecting on one's own position (of privilege and power) in the field (Deo 2011; Marsden 2018; Young 2019).

Throughout my PhD research, I juggled between different identities as an outsider as well as insider, as I looked to fit my position into one category. This was not an easy task. Ethnomusicologists have been often expected to know how to play an instrument or be a musician (albeit amateur), and this is seen as something that can enable them to participate in the field they are examining through music (Bigenho 2008). In this regard Michelle Bigenho poses:

> Does being a musician provide a privileged form of insider-ship, and is that insider-ship anything like being a native ethnographer? (2008, 30)

As someone researching music, I have often wondered whether it was imperative to also be a performing artist, a musician, or a person who could play an instrument or sing. This is something I was often asked in India and the UK. I would answer that I did have basic training in Indian classical vocals for two years but was not a practising musician in the context of *Hindustani* music, nor had I undertaken formal *guru-shishya* apprenticeship.

In the context of my research, I would look back and ask myself – Was not being an active musician a hinderance? I would not want to believe so, since I was still able to meet and interact with musicians and music teachers who were keen to share their views with me. Yet, being a musician might have made it easier to access the world of Indian classical music, and some of those involved, in a better fashion. Being a performing artist or a student of a *guru* or *ustad* may have helped me to better connect with fellow students and opened up new opportunities to meet other *guru*s or *ustad*s. If I were a *shishya* or a *shagird*, I would have automatically become part of this big family; it could have become an important part of my identity. I would have become a complete insider in that case by being so-and-so's student. As mentioned before, as an Indian and a local of the city of Delhi, Gurugram and Patna, I was an insider. However, I was also as good as an outsider in the relative closed circle of classical musicians and connoisseurs, who in many cases are personally known to one another.

As a novice, thus, it took me a while to make my place in the network of musicians and music connoisseurs so that I could approach them directly rather than look or wait for an intermediary. In the days of preliminary fieldwork, there were people who were wary of my (lack of) musical knowledge and who cross-questioned me often, and expected me to attend as many concerts of young and old musicians as possible. They expected me to have prior detailed technical knowledge of music before interviewing them. This was irrespective of the

fact that I was not researching on the technicalities of music. It made me aware that as an Indian, I was expected by them to have a detailed prior knowledge of Indian classical before conducting any interview, something which may not have been expected of me as rigidly if I were a foreign researcher. Such instances, albeit only a couple, did force me to question whether or not I would be taken seriously by the musicians, connoisseurs, and music activists. As my fieldwork progressed, however, I found that in certain cases my affiliation to a foreign university helped me obtain appointments, comparatively easily, to interview some important musicians and music teachers or professors, which otherwise may have been difficult if I had been studying in an Indian university. Many times, I generated curiosity among them in terms of potential connections to Indian classical music scenes outside India, particularly among those who were looking for performance opportunities there. Being an outsider also came with its concessions: when I approached well-known classical musicians and performing artists, I was viewed as someone who may not have in-depth knowledge in comparison with the *shishya*s or *shagird*s, but who wanted to learn more about it and about the musician's style. Hence, they would often agree to a meeting.

During my time in the field, all of this did not become an issue while interacting with the music schools, although approaching them had their own challenges. In any case, no method or technique is free from challenges, whether one is a musician, insider, or outsider aiming to become an insider over a period of time. Although, I do not have a prolonged exposure to the *guru-shishya* method of learning, my training in a music school did provide me with an overview of the musical form I was researching on. While this was useful, at the end of the day the focus in this thesis was now on the new music schools and music organisations, rather than the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method of training. I followed this area where I was much more of insider. If I was studying the *guru-shishya* system of learning, it would have probably necessitated learning a style of *Hindustani* music via this method, at least for some time. All the studies on this method have been done by people who learnt music via this method, for instance Brian Silver (1984), James Kippen (1988), Daniel Neuman (1990), Rohan Krishnamurthy (2013), Justin Scarimbolo (2014), Jeff Roy (2016), among others.

Via my preliminary fieldwork, I came to understand fairly early that no prior planning can prepare anyone fully for the actual experience on the field. It was not an easy task to break through the barrier of the Indian classical music world, including those of performers and teachers (i.e. the *guru*s and *Ustad*s). In the initial stages of my fieldwork, I was not even a *Rasika* and a regular a concert-goer. While the term today *Rasika* can be used to describe

'music lover' or 'audience member' (Alaghband-Zadeh, 2017: 214), I use it here to mean an 'informed listener'.[25] Because I still did not consider myself as possessing enough technical knowledge of *Hindustani* classical music in comparison with *shishya* or *shagirds* – who were intensively training, I would feel jittery before meeting renowned musicians during my pilot study. What if they tested me on my knowledge?

At the outset of my research, issues as these may seem absurd for one who has some degree of insider's (Indian, and caste) advantage. Girija Godbole, in the context of her research among rural, mostly lower-caste women where she is a high-caste researcher, mentions that it is often assumed implicitly that 'doing research at 'home' or in a familiar place is somehow easier, but I would caution against this' (2014, 86). She was well-aware of her position of power and privilege as well as the social distance owing to her caste, class, and education and this helped her approach the respondents in varied manners (Godbole 2014). I found this to be the same as I set off for fieldwork. I know the language and cultural references in most of the cases in the cities I have identified for study, and broadly understand the socio-political issues. Yet, there were challenges as well. Caste has also been an important regional issue in the state of Bihar. However, throughout my fieldwork in Patna, I was not able to find or explore in detail the caste dynamics of the students in these diverse institutions. Caste is still a highly sensitive issue and asking about someone's caste identity directly may come across as offensive. Such conversations require careful planning, a much-extended stay in the field for an in-depth analysis, as well as making relevant contacts who can be mediators. As an upper-caste woman in the field myself, it would have been problematic entering the field without appropriate connections or support that could facilitate the interaction between myself and the lower-castes in particular. Without their views, it would be difficult to get a complete picture of the caste-dynamics in *Hindustani* music teaching in schools. Therefore, I had to let go of this caste analysis in the study of these schools. It also important to note, however, that while *Hindustani* music has historically been and even today is an elite art form dominated by higher-castes and classes amongst Hindus, caste has not been a major debate here as much it has been in *Carnatic* music. Rather, it has been religion that has been the most analysed aspect in this music form. A study on how caste plays a role in the teaching and learning of *Hindustani* music is indeed critical. However,

---

[25] Alaghband-Zadeh describes the idea of *Rasika* as 'the music lover, connoisseur, or ideal listener for North Indian classical music' (2017: 214).

apropos of the focus on institutions in my thesis, this is a subject of separate research which I only hope to undertake later.

In conducting my research on *Hindustani* music, I was not a performer or an eager student in search of a *guru*, but a querent interested in understanding their world, and their opinions on the new music schools as well as music education scenes in general. Why would musicians and teachers have any interest in meeting me? Often, I could not find answers. While I interviewed rival teachers in different systems of music training, I ensured that no criticism of one towards the other clouded my judgement or made me biased towards any particular method of music education and training – whether it was *guru-shishya parampara* or new music schools. As Stevens points out, 'Learning local customs of courtesy and respect help. So, too, will developing ways to put people at ease, establish your good intentions and trustworthiness, spark interest in talking with you, into two-way conversations' (Stevens 2001, 71). In the spirit of building rapport, I had to be accommodating and considerate of my interviewers' busy schedules and classes, while also not being too over-bearing or compliant. I did not intend to be authoritative in any way. If they agreed and took out time to meet me or let me access their classes, I aimed to be less intrusive. While interviewing people about the ideologies and belief systems that they considered important to their pedagogies, I ensured that I respected their views, even if they did not necessarily match mine.

In the case of Indian music, an insider-researcher will, to some extent, be aware of traditional values associated with the Indian classical music tradition, but may not know the extent of expectations of teachers from students or generally from the classical music milieu, nor of the extent of value put on concepts like *guru-shishya*, and other socio-cultural aspects. I did and do accept that I might also have these disadvantages, given my little exposure to the *guru-shishya* method. In writing about her research in rural India among the lower caste women, Godbole discusses her own positionality as the upper-caste woman in the field and mentioned that '…in the field, I was simultaneously an insider, an outsider, both, and neither (Gilbert, 1994) …' (2014, 86). For her, as an Indian, she was aware of the caste hierarchy, but her experiences were different, and she had to devise ways to gain trust of her respondents (Godbole 2014, 86).

Throughout my fieldwork, I often wondered whether I was a complete insider, outsider or someone in between – there but still not 'there'. In this situation, Jonathan Stock and Chou Chiener's (2008) analysis reveals insights on insider advantages demonstrated through ways of knowing the culture beforehand (for example, language and manner of approaching the field), and how they did not need a pre-requisite of spending time in the field

for full cultural immersion before the actual fieldwork. However, being an insider does come with its own share of responsibilities and difficulties (Stock and Chiener 2008). Researching at one's home has not been touched upon in great detail in ethnomusicological or anthropological research (Stock and Chiener 2008).

Timothy Rice (2008), too, challenges the typical and clear-cut distinctions between the insider and the outsider. His concept of 'hermeneutic arc' puts forth that

> All individuals operating within tradition continually reappropriate their cultural practices, give them new meanings, and in that process create a continually evolving sense of self, of identity, of community, and of "being in the world." (Rice 2008, 58)

Through his example of learning Bulgarian bagpipes outside its cultural origin, Rice argues that a researcher, even if an outsider, learns about a culture through direct involvement with it. Additionally, they gain insights into their own changing positions within this culture, as well as the culture's constituent members' understandings of the world around them. The fluidity between insider and outsider distinctions and the resultant complexified issues are reflected in my research too. Despite initial struggles in entering the world of Indian classical music even as I am an insider, I did gradually immerse myself, as much as I could, into the *Hindustani* classical music scene. I got to know in detail about the important *Hindustani* classical music venues in these cities, and interacted with much more diverse musicians and music schools, among many other things. This long fieldwork process immensely expanded my knowledge of Indian classical music in general on a personal level, which also enabled me to interact with concerned people more comfortably on it.

2.2.2   *Positionality and Reflexivity*

I have written about the advantageous position(s) I maintain in the field. My previous (school-based) training in *Hindustani* music (vocals) and middle-class family background with an interest in and association with music provided me with basic exposure to this music tradition since an early age. Therefore, despite Bollywood or Hindi film songs dominating my life as a school-going child alongside most of my friends and classmates, I remained connected to *Hindustani* classical music in other, multifarious ways. My background was useful for networking, getting connected to interview subjects, and creating rapport with them as well as with musicians and listeners of Indian classical music in general, which would have been difficult otherwise. It must be noted that learning and listening to Indian classical music, as discussed before, was increasingly connected to the middle-class (largely

Hindu elites) during the music reform and classicisation process in the early-twentieth century (Moro 2004; Bakhle 2005; Scarimbolo 2014; Williams 2014). This, in many ways, is still true. Many *Shishya*s in the *Hindustani* classical music can still hail from a middle-class background, particularly so since it is still considered by some as music for an elite class rather than for the masses. There are organisations (like SPIC MACAY) and music institutions who are reaching out to the masses, but we are yet to get a complete picture on the extent to which members of these classes learn Indian classical music so as to become a performer. On the other hand, Alaghband-Zadeh argues that

> the ethical formation of the good listener in North Indian classical music is classed, so that the act of situating oneself as a good listener is also a way of performing "middleclassness" … (2017, 214-215)[26]

In many ways, influence of family (whether immediate or extended) plays a role in building interest in young minds. Therefore, my exposure to Indian classical music was enough to know how to appreciate it, and to claim this as both a privilege as well as advantage.

Language was never a barrier in the field, given that I am a local in all three cities of my research and would speak Hindi and English, depending on the person I was interacting with. Many interactions and interviews, particularly the informal ones, would also take place in what is informally known as Hinglish.[27] Being an insider in these contexts helped blend in and interact within conversational flows. In terms of age, some music teachers and owners of music schools were around my own, in their late-twenties and early-thirties, and this made interactions easier. However, in certain schools, some teachers were much more senior. I also met performing artists who were clearly elders. It must be noted that in Indian classical music performance, those in their 40s are considered 'young', given that many musicians give much of their life to learning and teaching this form. I tried my best to stabilise age-dynamics and ensured I was respectful at all times, though it was often difficult to gauge the manner in which the other person perceived it. While new school teachers may be flexible, the senior performing artists, I assumed, would take respect for them and their art seriously. At some meetings (particularly initial ones) with *gharana* musicians or senior artists, I took initiative in touching their feet or bending over to take their blessings when I came in or left. At the very least, I would put my hands together in *Namaste* respectfully. In many cases, this proved extremely positive. My subconscious awareness (sometimes, if not all the time) of what was

---

[26] Although she points out that she interviewed largely old middle-class listeners in her research as against the new ones (that emerged post-1991) (Alaghband-Zadeh 2017).

[27] Hinglish is a 'blend of Hindi and English,' commonly spoken among the youth in Hindi speaking areas. An interesting article by Steven Baker on the British Council website discusses this (Baker 2015).

expected of me, even if not explicitly asked, and understanding the subtle actions that musicians and music connoisseurs expected has much to do with my middle-class family background. On the other hand, I also acknowledge that foreign researchers may get a lot more advantages in terms of ease of meeting renowned, fairly inaccessible musicians; willingness of bigger institutions to interact with them; among other things.

Dress code was also an important factor in the field, particularly when interviewing senior musicians. In many new music schools, the dress code depended on the school, the vocal teacher, and occasion. I nevertheless made a rule throughout my fieldwork to wear Indian attire wherever I went and whoever I met, including the new music schools. Since Indian classical music upholds the idea of an Indian culture and the sacredness of music as an art form for many performers, 'appropriate' clothing can be important to show respect to the *guru*, musician, and most importantly, to the art form. This can constitute the *adab* or the code of 'proper behaviour' within this music form, to use Silver's idea (1984). Even in many bigger music institutions like the Gandharva Mahavidyalaya, there can be an unsaid 'code of conduct' which those who are learning music should follow unsaid guidelines, and dress/attire is included in these unofficial regulations.[28]

My role as a researcher affiliated to the University of London also put me in a comparatively advantageous position. Aditi Deo, while talking about positionality in her own research field, mentioned that her identity as a researcher in a North American university helped her gain access to individuals (particularly senior-level bureaucrats and senior executives) (2011, 39). In my context, my affiliation sometimes helped get appointments with senior professors of music with relative ease. It cannot be completely denied that this privilege also enabled me to get multiple appointments with some musicians, music teachers, or stakeholders as follow-up interviews. Emails from my official account proved even more useful. My affiliation sparked interest in musicians and performers as well as curiosity in music teachers. I was at times also seen, by some, as one of the important connections in London researching their music. Some respondents, particularly performing artists (young and old) and younger music school teachers, tried to find out more of study or performance opportunities there. They saw in me, probably, someone who could help them directly or indirectly connect with relevant people for performances overseas. I do understand this may or may not be entirely correct nevertheless.

---

[28] Brief observation of classes at Gandharva Mahavidyalaya, July 26, 2018.

Another aspect or a special position that had helped me contact people in the initial days of my PhD was the fact that my immediate and extended family also knew individuals (as friends or acquaintances) involved with *Hindustani* classical music as teachers, learners, performing artists, and/or those working in the field of Indian classical music as officials or bureaucrats in government institutions. This put me into an advantageous position in terms of access to networks.

2.3 Ethics, Reciprocity and Representation

2.3.1   Ethics

Ethnography involves the making of crucial human relationships in the field, which are complex yet meaningful in many ways (Beaudry 2008). It is precisely the complexity and unpredictability of these human interactions that raises a number of ethical concerns. A fixed code of ethics is impossible in ethnomusicology for a researcher conducting qualitative research in their home culture, because so much depends on context.[29] However, while it is important to come up with a broader sense of ethics for the fieldwork process beforehand, it is eventually upon the individual to decide on the ethical behaviour at the ground level depending on the situation and culture (Shelemay 2013). As David Calvey says, 'it is in the particular cases of the here and now with participants that ethics are situationally accomplished' (2008, 908). Engagement with ethics in research is not a one-off planning act but an ongoing process, (Calvey 2008, 909).[30] Nevertheless, as per the Belmont Report, published in the United States in 1978 for ethical research on 'human-subject research,' one can find three broad principles (Barrow 2019; Buchli 2020). The first one is Beneficence, or the idea of focussing on maximising good for the informants or avoiding any harm to them. This is followed by the Respect for Human Dignity, or the right of the participant to choose whether or not he/she wishes to participate as well as the right to full disclosure. Finally, there is the principle of Justice, which includes right to fair treatment, confidentiality and privacy (Barrow 2019; Buchli 2020).

Keeping these debates in mind, in my pilot study, I did not feel the need to use consent forms before interviews with my consultants, thinking it would result in suspicion of

---

[29] Some literature suggests strict ethical code of conduct with a format of consent forms for qualitative fieldwork (Marvasti 2004; Sieber 2009), but it is difficult to ascertain if it will work in such an ethnomusicological study.

[30] Calvey calls it ethical reflexivity (2008, 909).

my motives and their unwillingness to proceed with interviews. In India, many people are wary of such forms and often associate them with the government. In such situations, attempts to forging personal relationships with the interviewees could be hampered as a result of requesting signatures, making it difficult to even have informal conversations with them later. This is particularly so in Patna, where a couple of people in music schools were not comfortable even with recording of interviews. When queried, the owner of one of the schools in Patna countered, 'why do you need to record, you are taking notes anyway?' I, however, obtained their informed consent for participation verbally by telling them about my research first – about the transmission and music education of *Hindustani* music and the kind of ethos defining it in the present-times – and that this a part of my PhD project that I am undertaking in in London. I met musicians and teachers only when they agreed to do so and did not coerce anyone to participate in my research, thus keeping in mind the second principle of the Belmont report.

Transparency is key in any ethnographic research. Every music school and institution I visited and interviewed at (whether well-established or small-scale), was clearly informed of my research aims. I asked them a range of questions, from thoughts on the *guru-shishya parampara* today, to classroom teaching in Indian classical music, and the importance of imparting certain values associated with Indian classical music as imbibed in their schools, among other queries. With musicians and *guru*s or *ustad*s (those who are not running any institutions or schools), I informed them of my intent of understanding the music education scene (particularly the institutions) in Delhi-NCR and Patna. The second principle of the Belmont report also includes the fact that, in a research, the researchers can be careful with what to share with people in order to avoid any bias, or to get in-depth perspectives about an aspect under study. It is important to give interviewees enough information to 'make an informed decision about research participation' (Barrow 2019). However, there were people and schools who chose not to talk to me, some indicating that clearly and others simply ignoring my request for a meeting. I respected their decisions and quickly moved on. I found it interesting that many among the well-established *Hindustani* classical musicians have researchers visiting them for research-related interviews. These were familiar with a recorder and did not mind me recording, sometimes even asking whether or not I would like to switch one on. In Delhi and Gurugram particularly, these instances were usual.

Since my PhD is based on qualitative fieldwork, I did not follow a strict questionnaire and relied more on open-ended conversations. This made my interactions with people more free-flowing and enabled organic conversations to develop. However, I did prepare a basic

list of questions before embarking on each interview, which were adapted in the field according to the musician and music teacher I was visiting for the day. I would share these lists with people before the interview if they asked. Some of whom I interviewed, particularly those via video-conferencing, did request me to e-mail a list of questions beforehand.[31] It may be possible that this is the way in which they gauged my authenticity as a researcher, to understand what I knew about them already, as well as acquiring a template for the interaction. Very few people in one-to-one interviews demanded to see a full-fledged written questionnaire.

2.3.2   Reciprocity and Representation

Reciprocity, i.e. the ways of giving back to the community or the people of the culture one is researching on, is a crucial aspect of any ethnomusicological, anthropological or sociological study. While some consider monetary payments as the best form of compensating the respondents, there has not been stark economic disparity between me and my respondents for me to assist them financially. Furthermore, paying people for the kind of information I sought would have not been considered appropriate, as it may otherwise be the case in, say, in a medical study. In my research, teachers in music schools were either earning a monthly income there or were running schools as owners. Among musicians and teachers, giving money for questions may also be considered rude, particularly so if you are not their student. This is especially true of the *guru*s. Within the second principle of the Belmont report discussed above in the respect to Human Dignity, Barrow (2019) in her video points out that paying someone to participate in your research can be coercive, particularly if they need it. This does not give them the freedom to say yes or no to participate in the study (Barrow 2019).[32] In the case of organisations or movements I explore in this thesis, I have also volunteered off and on for SPIC MACAY, helping them with my administrative skills, even if in a smaller way given the paucity of time. Additionally, no vulnerable, sensitive, or marginalised sections were looked at or interviewed as respondents during my research – such as children, HIV patients, mental health patients, prisoners in jail, and the like.

---

[31] Even certain schools with large-scale operations, like the Shankar Mahadevan Academy, asked me to send in a rough questionnaire in advance of video-call with them, so that they can answer them in the best manner that they can (as told by them).

[32] Jenny Barrow (2019), however, talks of the significance of Belmont report in the context of researches on nursing.

Nevertheless, the performing artists in many cases had expectations of me. It is sometimes believed that a connection in London may provide them with the possibility of getting concerts or workshops. Here, I tried to be as much clear and transparent as possible, mentioning that I was just a student and did not have contacts within a wide network of organisations or institutions there; the little I could do was to keep myself alert to any such opportunities and let them know. With younger music teachers and musicians interested in academia in the UK or in general, I would share my experiences. Interestingly, in many cases, my respondents were simply happy that a researcher was studying this art form and promoting it outside India. This comes from wide thinking that Indian classical music is losing its importance today, particularly in India, and that it is crucial to preserve it.

In such situations, the researcher all the more feels responsible for what contribution to knowledge their endeavours will ultimately achieve. Research, and representation of it in a particular way, becomes another crucial way of giving back to the respondents. Writing ethnography or fieldwork, where this representation of culture and people studied takes place, becomes an equally important task which requires careful planning (Clifford, 1988). Stan Stevens notes that 'fieldwork requires accepting responsibilities' (2001, 71). The academic responsibilities of the researcher include to ensure that the research is conducted carefully, is of high quality, and that the setting, the people, the field, as well as different views are adequately and as much unbiasedly represented as possible (Stevens 2001, 71). In this process, providing thick description is also considered one of the ways by which a qualitative researcher can ensure the validity of the data as much as possible (Creswell 2009). Conducting proper research which involves engaging the respondents and having a dialogue is key in the writing process (Clifford 1988). Another crucial aspect here is to not harm any of the respondents of the thesis, adhering to the principle of Beneficence under the Belmont Report. To do this, I use pseudonyms for the names of all the small and medium-scale music schools, as well as music departments I visited and interviewed at during fieldwork. I have also used pseudonyms for the names of owners and music teachers of these diverse schools, students in these varied institutions, and music professors (in Patna) whom I interviewed. By this, I hope to protect their confidentiality; even as most of them did not explicitly asked me to do so. I have mentioned the original names of the schools, institutions, and concerned people explicitly only if any information has been directly taken from their website (a public domain), in which case I have clearly cited their website. I have also used the original names of schools, institutions, and people while discussing the history and backgrounds of institutions across different Indian cities. Additionally, I have not used pseudonyms for or

anonymised the names of music organisations and their founders, since they are unique in terms of their activities and could be easily recognisable even if the names are changed. They are also big and well-known organisations, open to public in general, which anyone can join either as a volunteer, audience to their concerts, and/or participants in many of their activities/events. Here, I have aimed to provide as much balanced and unbiased analysis as possible in my writing. I have, however, hidden the real names of students or young volunteers in movements like SPIC MACAY. Anonymity, however, became all the more crucial in case of any conflicting opinions, if at all, found during interviews and/or observations within music schools and with classical musicians/performing artists. Unpleasant experiences with any music school, musician, organisation, or a music connoisseur (if found necessary to include to explain a point) are also anonymised, or pseudonyms are used.

Thick description, a concept first introduced by Gilbert Ryle (1949), was expanded by Geertz (1973). For Geertz, ethnography not only involves the methods used, the process of selecting of informants, taking notes, rapport development, etc., but also an intellectual effort called 'thick description'. This description not only includes the in-depth understanding and interpretation of a particular social and cultural phenomena, but also the context in which it takes place. Furthermore, this description considers the point of view of the ethnographer alongside those who are observed in order to give a total picture.[33] Clifford also notes that ethnographic writing should primarily involve a diverse range of voices, taken directly from the field. Writing solely about one's own (researcher's) experience and interpretation of observations in the field makes the writing 'monologic' (1988, 55) and not representative of the community in question. Good ethnographic practice should be dialogic or even polyphonic, including not just the researchers' voice but also those of the participants, informants, and the interviewees as much as possible (Clifford 1988). These factors have been important to my writing process as well.

In this writing process and in representing my research, I have attempted to interpret and present the gathered data with as much sensitivity as possible. While I recognise reflexivity and see that it is not possible to completely discard one's own subjectivity in ethnographic writing, I aim as much as possible to present the data the same way I receive it. Importantly, as mentioned, I have used pseudonyms and anonymised all relevant data

---

[33] It is important to note here that there are several scholarly engagements since decades engaging with the interaction between anthropology and ethnomusicology as fields (Hellier-Tinoco 2003; Jairazbhoy 1984; Merriam 1964; Shelemay 2013; Titon 2008)

wherever required. I have also in my writing generalised the findings wherever possible. I have used specific examples of music schools and quotations from teachers and owners of the music schools wherever necessary. Overall, while I need to engage in critical analysis in my research, I do not wish harm to come to any one I have encountered during my fieldwork, even those with whom I have had unpleasant or awkward experiences.

While writing this chapter, I once posted on Facebook:

> I realised, writing research methodology for PhD thesis is indeed like reliving one's own fieldwork much later and feeling nostalgic about the people you met, experiences you gained, and lessons you learnt. Just reminds us that the PhD process is indeed about working towards getting a degree by the end of it, but it is also about learning so much beyond along the way. (17th May 2020)

The fieldwork process for me has been a journey. I have met many new people, learning more about the technicalities of *Hindustani* classical music from certain musicians despite not being their students and only meeting or observing their classes on a few occasions. Fieldwork for me has also been about creating friendships, relationships, and a process of personal development.

To summarise, the ethnography I engaged with involved extensive interviews, participant and non-participant observations of music sessions and trial classes, and online browsing to look for details of various new music schools via their websites. I faced certain ethical dilemmas during fieldwork, particularly when some musicians and music schools refused to engage with me. Nevertheless, these were dealt with carefully and ethically. The interdisciplinary approach of my research, which involved continuous and extensive reading within ethnomusicology and beyond it, enriched my research questions in particular, as well as my understanding of the socio-political and cultural aspects of Indian performing arts broadly. The struggle due to the ambiguity in defining my role as an insider vis-à-vis an outsider is another which has emerged and which I am coming to terms with.

Chapter 3: The History of Music Schools and Societies in India

This chapter lays out the development of first and second wave of modern music schools and societies in India from a regional to pan-India level, as a part of the modernisation and institutionalisation process from the late-nineteenth century onwards. I provide a broad overview of the scale of music institutions in India today, which were established at different periods and amidst two important shifts in Indian social history: the rise of socio-religious reform movements and cultural nationalism before 1947, and after Indian independence in 1947. This discussion provides a background for the third-wave of music societies and schools in the post-1991 period, which is the focus of this thesis. In the post-1991 period, there was a significant expansion in the numbers of small and medium-scale music schools, particularly private and business-like for-profit schools, while there has been comparatively less increase in music societies. In addition to this historical development, this chapter explores the ideologies and values that have defined these spaces of music transmission. Taking cue from Michel Foucault (1998), I argue that heterotopia can exist at various points in history, albeit in different ways. I thus show how the first two waves of modern music schools are heterotopic spaces as well and different from the new, post-1991, private and semi-private small- and medium-scale schools.

The general perceptions about music schools and institutions shared among musicians and music connoisseurs today, and the possible reasons behind them, are effectively summarised by Namita Devidayal,[34]

> At the Gamdevi music school, I got a basic introduction to the ragas. We were taught a basic grammar for each raga – how to go up the notes and then come down –followed by a simple, manicured composition. We learned one raga every two weeks and then moved on to the next. The curriculum was unabashedly devoid of nuance; the idea was to build a repertoire that would culminate in an examination and a certificate. This was Indian Classical Music 101. (Devidayal 2008, 13)

Given their fixed-syllabus-based method of teaching, professional performers and connoisseurs tend to not think highly of music schools and institutions in general, although certain institutions have gained respect over the years. The private, post-1991 schools in particular, it is believed, are promoters of quantity over quality. In the hierarchy evident

---

[34] Devidayal, a journalist by profession, started learning *Hindustani* classical music from Dhondutai at the age of 10, after learning music in a school (2008). In her book, *The Music Room*, she shares the story of her teacher and Devidayal's experience of learning with her. Dhondutai was a legendary *khyal* vocalist from the Jaipur-Atrauli gharana and known to be the only student of the celebrated vocalist Kesarbai Kerkar (Devidayal 2008).

today in the general discourse surrounding Indian classical music training among musicians today, critics, serious learners, and connoisseurs consider the *guru-shishya* relationship to be at the top as crucial to quality music learning and becoming a performer (Kumari 2016, 17; Patwardhan, 2016). In this educational hierarchy, select university departments and music universities, and bigger institutions such as Gandharva Mahavidyalaya in Mumbai and Prayag Sangeet Samiti in Prayagraj, come second.[35] Small-scale, private and semi-private music schools, particularly of the post-1990s period, are usually considered to be at the bottom and are viewed as not reflecting 'strikingly high academic standards and values' (Banerjee 1986, 20). Despite such views, post-1990's music schools attract a large number of students today, whether or not they are serious music learners, making these schools a part of the music education scene in the country that cannot be ignored. There are also a number of organisations in Delhi founded in both the pre- and post-1991 period that are well-respected for their initiatives to promote Indian classical music, particularly among the youth. As discussed in Chapter 1 and 5, these organisations engage in a unique kind of education that has often been overlooked in the music education discourse in general.

Despite such general contemporary views of music institutions, modern music schools and music societies were a key part of the reform process of *Hindustani* classical music in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries (Kobayashi 2003). The emergence of these music schools, institutions, and societies in India, initially at the regional and later at the pan-India level, represented the desire for a 'scientific,' systematic and standardised form of teaching and disseminating Indian music to the (largely middle-class) masses (Rosse 1995). These initiatives in music were undertaken amidst growing social reform movements in colonial India, and within the waves of cultural (particularly Hindu) nationalism that drew heavily on the British orientalist writings of the eighteenth century (Kobayashi 2003; Bakhle 2005). Apart from the 'scientific pursuit,' this revitalisation process was also focused on reviving the 'spiritual' element of Indian classical music in north and south India (Kannan 2013; Kobayashi 2003). As mentioned in Chapter 1, this reform process entailed a reinvention of tradition according to the dominant values and ideologies of the time. This reinvention also involved the idea of reverence towards this music tradition and its propagation to the masses. During this process, the *guru-shishya* method of training, which has been the core of *Hindustani* music tradition for centuries, also underwent changes. As I explore in chapter 4, it was significantly diluted in practice in the music schools and

---

[35] Prayagraj was earlier officially known as Allahabad.

institutions that were primarily based on classroom teaching, even if the idea and its essence was idealised.

In this chapter, I present a broad overview of the emergence of modern music schools, institutions, and societies in India from the music reform period to the post-1947 period, something that has not yet been presented in existing scholarship. I show that the first wave of music schools and societies were heterotopic, though in a different manner to the ones that exist today. During this initial period of music reform, music education existed in a space clearly defined not only by tradition versus modernity, but also in terms of sacred versus secular and outer versus inner domain, with Indian music being reconceived as being traditional yet modern (Chatterjee 1993). Two different and seemingly contradictory spaces were thus converging within the both north and south Indian classical music domains during this period of history; a period which was increasingly defined by the fully realised political consciousness of Indians, their struggle for their own identity and self-rule, and, eventually, freedom from foreign rule. Music schools and societies have continued to develop until the post-1991 period and now consist of three kinds: those directly established, run or recognised by government; semi-private institutions that may not be established by the government but are registered under one of the acts of government and adhere to the rules thus laid out; and the fully private schools that are run and funded completely privately without any governmental or institutional obligation. The final category is the one that expanded the most after 1991. In appendices 1 to 5 provide, I provide a list of institutions and societies emerging amidst the context of these three major shifts in Indian history, up to the present-day, in different cities around India including Delhi, Gurugram and Patna. This is not an exhaustive list but provides a sense of scale of the phenomenon.

I begin this chapter by briefly discussing the traditional *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method, which is still considered the primary method of music training, and the focus of the majority of research on music education and transmission in India as discussed in Chapter 1. The discussion and re-emphasis on the characteristics, features, and extra-musical aspects of the *guru-shishya* method of training are crucial to understand the manner in which this term has been appropriated by new and recent wave of music schools, and applied by the music organisations in the present context. The music institutions and schools at different periods, particularly the post-1991 ones, borrow from as well as subvert the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* methods and values associated with it; such as loyalty, discipline, authority of the teacher, and the teacher-student bond. I then provide, in section 3.2, an overview of music societies and the modern music schools in India from the late-nineteenth century onwards and

the context within which they emerged both at the regional and pan-India level. Here, I also briefly present how India's encounter with modernity not only pushed a reinvention of tradition by tracing it to its ancient Hindu past, but also created at ground level, what Tejaswini Niranjana calls, a 'metropolitan unconscious' or a new kind of subjectivity that gave rise to 'musicophiliacs' in the urban centres (2020, 10-11). These musicophiliacs, Niranjana notes, could sidestep the divisions based on caste, class, religion, and gender 'to create a community of musical affect' based on *Hindustani* music (2020, 10). However, it is important to note that the Hindu patrons, musicians, and connoisseurs of Indian classical music here have mostly been upper-class and higher-caste elite. I therefore explore the context, ethos, and ideologies within which the institutionalisation and systemisation process in India took place, as well as the regional and national efforts to establish music schools and societies. This history of the institutionalisation of Indian music and its ideological underpinnings is crucial, since these developments have continued to affect the manner in which music institutions, musicians, and music aficionados view and reproduce *Hindustani* music and related extra-musical aspects in post-independence India as well.

The next section, 3.3, explores the post-1947 institutions and music teaching in India. These music schools and institutions expanded during this period. Before concluding this chapter, I also describe the different legislations that enable music institutions and organisations to register themselves as a not-for-profit society (Aiyer 1966).[36] I particularly describe the Societies Registration Act of 1860, which still holds importance for many music institutions and organisations (Aiyer 1966).

3.1 The *guru-shishya* and *ustad-shagird* method of teaching

Before the advent of music schools in India, Indian classical music was taught through an intensive, often one-to-one, oral method. It was traditionally transmitted within families, usually to one's own sons and nephews (Neuman 1990), except for the *tawa'ifs* who learned music primarily from the *ustads* (Walker 2014). In the nineteenth century, the family-based method of teaching started to develop into larger guilds or *gharanas* that extended beyond

---

[36] Government of India, Ministry of Corporate Affairs, *Societies Registration Act 1860*. India: Government of India, n.d., https://www.mca.gov.in/Ministry/actsbills/pdf/Societies_Registration_Act_1860.pdf (accessed on March 8, 2021).

Government of India, Legislative Department, Ministry of Law and Justice*, Indian Trusts Act 1882*. India: Government of India, n.d., https://legislative.gov.in/actsofparliamentfromtheyear/indian-trusts-act-1882 (accessed on March 8, 2021).

family and upheld a particular style (Neuman 1990). Daniel Neuman sees the emergence of *gharana*s in the context of increasing mobility of musicians in this era as a result of the introduction of railways by this period and the need to preserve one's style, pedigree, and lineage (1990). In Calcutta, McNeil attributes the emergence of *gharanas* around this time when outsiders (non-hereditary Bengali musicians) were increasingly becoming disciples of hereditary musicians (2018, 310). Wim van der Meer (1980), on the other hand, argued that Indian classical music was the primary source of livelihood for *gharanedar* or hereditary musicians and it became crucial for them to invest in and preserve their musical style, as they would their land or property. This attitude often made them wary of teaching music freely to outsiders. Nevertheless, some studies such as those by McNeil (2018), Scarimbolo (2014), and Williams (2014) have shown that outsiders were learning from hereditary musicians in significant numbers, particularly by the second half of the nineteenth century.

Historically, many royal and aristocratic patrons learned from their own court musicians, which added to their appreciation for the art (Scarimbolo 2014; Raja 2015; Williams 2014). However, the patrons at the time did not perform as that would have been considered lowly and inappropriate. By the second half of the nineteenth century, teaching extended further even beyond family, *tawa'if*s, and aristocratic or royal patrons. As scholars McNeil (2018) and Williams (2014) have shown, in response to the decline in feudal patronage, the *ustads* moved to urban centres and started to teach the new urban Hindu elites who had now become patrons of music, particularly in Bengal. The method of teaching music within this *gharana* system is thus characterised by the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* relationship, and this, for a musician, is the 'primary social relationship' that 'provides the continuity of the musical tradition between generations' (Neuman 1990, 31).

Whether within family or an extra-familial *guru-shishya* and *ustad-shagird* method, what makes one-to-one training important to analyse is that it has existed continually in Indian music for centuries and is still considered, among musicians, music scholars, and connoisseurs, the best method of training students who wish to become performing artists (Deshpande, 1987; Patwardhan 2016). Hereditary musicians were increasingly marginalised to the background of a new public culture and the institutionalisation process of Indian music in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries (McNeil 2018), but Muslim performers nevertheless 'regained their authority for the hereditary master-musician – the *Ustad*,' by the first half of the twentieth century (Deo 2011, 23). Deo also notes that the 'master-musicians of Khyal,' particularly in Maharashtra, apprenticed both male and female non-hereditary

musicians alongside hereditary ones even in the changing scenario (2011, 23).[37] This illustrates the complex social context of *Hindustani* music practice in this period, even as a dominant discourse that subsumed it with elite upper-class and upper-caste Hindu values. On the one hand, the Hindu nationalist discourse was defining 'a new Hindu subject in the early twentieth century' (Niranjana 2020, 25) as well as music in the broader sense. On the other hand, the love of music or musicophilia of people on the ground, beyond their religious or, at times, caste affiliation, also manifested in different spaces and manners; such as in concert halls as listeners, in music schools as owners or teachers, and even as students or *shishya*-s of well-known musicians (Niranjana 2020). It is also important to note here that, in a strict sense, the term *guru-shishya* is used in case of a Hindu teacher and *ustad-shagird* in the context of Muslim musicians and teachers (Neuman 1990; Silver 1984). These terms, however, reflect the same method of music training at ground or practical level (Neuman 1990, 44). Citing Neuman (1990) and Slawek (2000) on *ustad-shagird* and *guru-shishya* method, Aditi Deo also points out that

> While minor differences existed between the two, scholars as well as musicians regard their practice in classical music as alike in structure and spirit (2011, 47).

Yet, the *guru-shishya parampara* is more often associated with *Hindustani* music in the dominant discourse or in a theoretical sense since the reform period, because it is a Sanskrit term evoking a Hindu ethnoscape (Appadurai 1986) rather than a Muslim one.

The *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method of learning is considered crucial in *Hindustani* music, where the students are expected to become immersed in music and must spend years under the teacher's guidance (Kumari 2016; Neuman 1990; Patwardhan 2016). Vamanrao Deshpande argued that only a *guru* can patiently nurture the *swara* or the 'singing voice' of a disciple over the course of many years (1987, 11). In this method, the relationship between a teacher and his pupil is like that of father and son, as van der Meer (1980) and Neuman (1990) have pointed out in relation to male musicians. More recently, similar familial relationships with female *guru*s and their students have emerged; a recent example is Devidayal (2008) and her *guru* Dhondutai.

Ideally, the students live with the *guru*, becoming part of their household, and not only receive musical but also extra-musical training; although in reality this is less and less possible in the present environment (Neuman 1990; Pradhan 2019; Silver 1984). Silver

---

[37] The best-known examples are Sawai Gandharva (1886-1952), Kesarbai Kerkar (1892-1977), Mogubai Kurdikar (1904-2001).

(1984) calls this extra-musical training *adab,* or the proper behaviour for musicians, and identifies it as an integral part of the process of *ta'alim* or music education in *Hindustani* music. Devotion to the *guru* includes obedience and *izzat,* i.e. respect from the students, not only in music learning and practice but also in the lifestyle (Neuman 1990, 46). Given that the student lives with the *guru* as his or her child, this entails *sewa* or service to the teacher in which the students take care of the *guru*'s everyday needs, attend to their daily household chores, and run errands for them (McNeil 2018; Neuman 1990). In this ideal, the *guru* and *ustad* is expected not to charge fees or take remuneration from their students, if possible (Morcom 2020, 9; Neuman 1990, 51; Silver 1984, 317). Traditionally, the musicians had court patronage and their daily needs were taken care of and the senior students were thus often fully supported by the *ustads* (Silver 1984). Anna Morcom also notes that knowledge of *Hindustani* music and its transmission is seen as an 'inalienable possession' and ideally not exchangeable via money (2020, 9). However, in the post-1947 period when royal patronage had ceased to exist, and particularly in the present context, this is an ideal, or for musicians who have a stable income from another source (Morcom 2020).

In this *guru-shishya* tradition, usually a student, with the willingness to learn from a particular well-known musician, approaches the teacher. It thus becomes crucial for students outside the family of hereditary musicians or *gharana* to prove their 'worthiness' and talent in order 'to be a true heir to the tradition' (Morcom 2020, 8). There are many stories that involve *guru*s employing different kinds of methods to test a student's patience, discipline, and loyalty. One of the best examples is provided by Devidayal in which a strict vegetarian Hindu singer gave up his revulsion towards meat and prepared lamb curry as per his *ustad's* wish, so as to please him (2008, 56). As Anna Morcom has explored stories create and maintain *Hindustani* music as what Annette Weiner terms as an 'inalienable possession,' ensuring that its authority is 'outside of or transcending the present' (Morcom 2020, 8; Weiner 1992). Not only is allegiance to one's own *guru* or *ustad* important in this method of music education, the teachers wield immense authority as well. Neuman notes that the *ustad* can be 'very reluctant to take a person as a disciple' and can 'discourage him unless he demonstrates his sincerity' (1990, 55). Sincerity is often tested through a trial period during which the student 'performs duties of a disciple without having much – if any – reward of being one' (Neuman 1990, 55). Only when the teacher is sure of the student's dedication is the student able to become a part of the *guru*'s inner circle and can now be taught rare *ragas* of the *gharana* (Neuman 1990). This is very different from the trial classes of the new, private, small-scale schools in Delhi-NCR of today.

The *guru* is the absolute authority as far as the training is concerned. Therefore, the direction and time a student's *ta'alim*, or a particular aspect of it, is dependent on the *guru*. There are no periodic examinations in the way the music schools or institutions have. The traditional education process also extended beyond direct training from the teacher to the 'arena of the actual performance' where 'the *ustad* involves his disciples one way or the other' (Silver 1984, 318). In many cases, some students will be asked to play the *tanpura*, and 'occasionally join the duet' as a support to their *ustad* (Silver 1984, 318). This was, and still is, a learning experience as well as a form of test for the students in this traditional-formal teaching method. The most formalised test of a student, however, arrives during the *ganda bandhan* ceremony in which he or she performs solo (with the *guru* or *ustad*) for the first time in public (Silver 1984, 318), although this stage may come at different age for different *shagirds* and *shishyas*. The *ganda-bandhan*, or tying the thread ceremony, is important here. In this ceremony, which is one of the many similarities between the *guru-shishya parampara* and the *ustad-shagird* method, the teacher ties a thread to the hands of his students, which then binds the teacher and student to a lifelong loyalty and formally makes the student his or her disciple (Silver 1984). Again, this ceremony takes place once the teacher is sure of the talent, dedication and loyalty of the student.[38]

In the field of music, there are also stories associated with great musicians about the sincerity and dedication with which they practised their art, without thinking about the time and the discomforts surrounding them (Neuman 1990). Whether or not such stories and legends are true, *riaz* or practice definitely constitutes the major part of the day for the students learning through the *guru-shishya* method and for a musician (Neuman 1990). As Neuman (1990) explains, *riaz* 'is held to be important as a source of idea, an institution of continuing discipline, a route for continual refinement, and a way of maintaining a level of performance' (35). For the students, it is important to create an adequate environment for regular practice, and to possess the required discipline and concentration for it to become a habit (Neuman 1990).

Most of the literature on the traditional *guru-shishya* and *ustad-shagird* method, particularly the sources cited here, have been written in the post-independent context, long after the institutionalisation and music reform process of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries. These sources present to us the continuity of this traditional-formal method of teaching, i.e. *guru-shishya* and *ustad-shagird* method, to the present day, despite

---

[38] Silver (1984) describes the full *ganda-bandhan* process in his article.

many changes including the marginalisation of the hereditary musicians within the broader dominant discourse of the music reform process that continued through Indian independence. This one-to-one way of learning also often ensured the close interaction between musicians and music connoisseurs of different religious backgrounds in various ways and in different spaces (Niranjana 2020). While interviewing those who once participated in the reform movements, Kobayashi encountered contrasting stories about hereditary artists: their denigration of, but also the esteem with which the Hindu upper-caste musicians held them and the musical relations with them (2003, 253). Even renowned twentieth-century reformers such as VN Bhatkande and VD Paluskar had themselves learned on a one-to-one basis from an *ustad* or *guru* and not in an institution (Bakhle 2005; Kobayashi 2003). Even in present, syncretism in this method becomes evident in different ways: through the *ganda-bandhan* ceremony, celebration of festivals like *guru-purnima* by musicians of different religious backgrounds, and the way the *riaz* process or music performance is seen as a quest to spirituality in both a *Bhakti* (Hindu) and *Sufi* sense by musicians and students (Morcom 2020; Neuman 1990; Urita 2016). However, the impact of music reform ideologies on the broader discourse surrounding *Hindustani* music also resulted in the music being redefined as a national heritage by the early-twentieth century and the increasing dominance of an upper-caste Hindu milieu. In this process, the term *guru-shishya parampara* gained much more prominence in the dominant discourse than *ustad-shagird silsila* (Kobayashi 2003).

Despite varied changes, *Hindustani* music is ubiquitously associated with the idea of *guru-shishya parampara* in the general parlance, consciously or unconsciously. The *guru-shishya* tradition is still often evoked in conversations about this music form, despite the fact that we still hear the terms like *ustad* for Muslim (*gharanedar*) musicians and *guru* (and *pandit)* for the Hindu artists who teach. Some recent Indian publications trace the Indian education system, including music, to the ancient *gurukul* system and *guru-shishya parampara* (Pandeya 2016, 18-27), and in recent decades, *gurukul* institutions for the study of music emphasise their true embodiment of the *guru-shishya parampara*. Thus, the *guru-shishya* tradition has immense ideological potency, even in forms of teaching which practice something quite at odds with it, as I discuss in the context of the third wave of music schools.

3.2 History of Music Reform, Institutionalisation and Systemisation in India and the Emergence of Music Schools and Societies

The history of music institutions and societies in India can be traced back to the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries amidst socio-religious reform movements that

gradually paved the way for nationalist ones as part of the Indian struggle for independence. Along with these reforms (particularly of the Hindu society), there were also number of musicians and musicologists who took up the task of modernising Indian music on scientific lines. During this period, the Indian performing arts in general, and Indian music in particular, thus underwent a process of standardisation and sacralisation (Kobayashi 2003; McNeil 2018; Rosse 1995). It is important to note that the standardisation process involved the creation of a curriculum-based approach to education. This also involved devising a notation system suitable for institution-based teaching of Indian music. In this process, key reformers considered Indian classical music a sacred and a spiritual quest rather than or as much as a profession, an ideology that gradually came to inform the dominant discourse around *Hindustani* music (Bakhle 2005; Kobayashi 2003; Rosse 1995). The meeting of these two contradictory zones and ethos of scientific pursuit and spirituality were one of the foundational ways that shaped these institutions as heterotopic spaces. While the ideologies surrounding *Hindustani* music have changed and adapted with the times, for example, absorbing typically neoliberal characteristics in recent decades, there remain contradictory strands, as I explore in Chapters 4 and 5.

One key aspect of the reform was the framing of Muslim hereditary musicians as secretive and of treating music as property, where it had formerly been sacred (Bakhle 2005). This music tradition, for key reformers and nationalists, though not all, emphasised Hindu ideals and traditions 'but in the frame of reference that is Western, or at least Westernised' (Qureshi 1991, 159). The dominant discourse that emerged from the music reform period defined Indian classical music in terms of inner spiritual domain, in contrast to the outer material domain represented by the West, and yet which was capable of being modern (Chatterjee 1993). For these music reformers, Indian music could be notated and standardised, but specifically in an Indian way (Bakhle 2005; Scarimbolo 2014). Hereditary Muslim musicians, in this context, were believed by the famous musicologist Bhatkhande in particular, to be unable to adapt to the westernised and middle-class manners required of the modern musicians (Kobayashi 2003; Qureshi 1991). Hence, we see that a new set of values and elite (middle-class) culture by the late-nineteenth century were emerging in which music was defined in terms of its new patrons: the English-educated Indian middle-class, who wished to claim this music as a national heritage from the hereditary musicians (McNeil 2018).

Such initiatives to modernise and institutionalise were simultaneously taking place in southern India with similar ideologies at play (Kannan 2013; Soneji 2012; Subramanian

2006; Weidman 2006). By the early-twentieth century, the patronage of Carnatic music shifted from the royal courts to the urban elite intelligentsia of Madras (Kannan 2013; Subramanian 2006). This Madras intelligentsia were largely 'educated Brahmins and upper-class non-Brahmins' who 'saw a need for a "cultural identity" not only to unite diverse groups of people against the colonizers but also to establish and emphasize their cultural distinctiveness and superiority against that of the colonizers' (Kannan 2013, 120). The music reform initiatives here too aimed to divide the religious realm represented by Indian culture from the secular one that 'is represented by the "materialistic West"' (Kannan 2013, 121). For Madras elites as well, Carnatic music was 'ancient and divinely inspired,' but could also be understood in systematic and 'scientific' terms, thus making it superior to Western art music (Kannan 2013, 128). It is within this context that the institutionalisation of Carnatic music also took place and institutes, such as the Madras Music Academy, were founded in the early-twentieth century. Subramanian (2006) and Kannan (2013) also discuss regional efforts to modernise and systematise music in southern India in the context of the Tanjore (or Thanjavur) court, particularly under King Serfoji II.

Such efforts in northern and southern India crossed paths multiple times in the early-twentieth century when figures such as VN Bhatkhande, VD Paluskar, and the Wodeyar rulers of Mysore aimed to create national curricula for scientific music that included both *Hindustani* and *Carnatic* music (Bakhle 2005; Kannan 2013; Kobayashi 2003; McNeil 2018; Subramanian 2006; Trasoff 2010). At this time, the All-India Music conferences had also taken place and exerted a significant influence, with the first one held in 1916 (Bakhle 2005; Subramanian 2006). It is by this period, as Subramanian notes, that the idea of music representing the Indian nation and heritage took force and music reformers found 'its preservation and cultivation through [a] national system of education' crucial and urgent (2006, 75). The institutionalisation and classicisation process of Indian music by this point was also markedly defined by middle-class and upper-caste Hindu values (Bakhle 2005; Kobayashi 2003; McNeil 2018; Scarimbolo 2014).

It is important to note here that pan-India efforts to establish music schools and institutions, in particular those associated with musicologist Bhatkhande and musician Paluskar in the early-twentieth century, were preceded by equally important regional initiatives in north India that aimed to modernise Indian music. These initiatives were informed by ideological underpinnings that often went beyond religious affiliations but were guided by the same pursuit of modernisation. While ideologically, music was increasingly defined in an overarching manner around cultural (Hindu) nationalism or the middle-class

(Hindu) values, on the ground, things were not reducible to religious groupings, as Niranjana has shown in the case of Bombay (2020). Modernity in this era was thus defined not just by the process of reinventing the tradition by tracing music history to the ancient past, in an upper-caste, upper-class Hindu mould. This conception of modernity was also informed by more diverse group of 'musicophiliacs' in everyday music making, learning, and listening (Niranjana 2020).

While the musicophiliacs did not constitute a fixed and formal association, they utilised their interest in music and came together through varied ways. They discussed and debated about music, wrote 'on music in newspapers and magazines,' formed and participated in music societies and conferences, attended concerts as audiences at different venues, engaged with music education in music schools, and even attained *Ta'alim* from *guru*s and *ustads* (Niranjana 2020, 24; Rosse 1995; Trasoff 2010). This, too, presented a 'practice of modernity' on the ground or in the everyday social life around *Hindustani* music (Niranjana 2020, 24). It can, then, be said that many of the regional efforts to create music schools and systematise music in the late-nineteenth century came from musicians and musicophiliacs of different sociocultural and religious backgrounds, though they were predominantly upper caste and middle-class Hindus. This is also evident in the high regard some non-hereditary musicians of Hindu upper-castes held for hereditary musicians in the post-reform period (Kobayashi 2003). Since there were many *ustads* at the time who were the most prestigious musicians, many of these non-hereditary musicians were also learning from them in the early-twentieth century (Deo 2011).

While Niranjana's (2020) book focusses on the urban centre of colonial Bombay, similarities can be found in other important urban centres of *Hindustani* music, such as Bengal. It is important to note that these are the renowned regional centres that have contributed to the continuity of *Hindustani* music and have been widely researched (Bakhle 2005; Deo 2011; Kobayashi 2003; McNeil 2018; Niranjana 2013; Niranjana 2020; Pradhan 2014; Rosse 1995; Rosse 2010; Scarimbolo 2014; Williams 2014). However, Bihar has rather been a peripheral music centre and has not received a similar scholarly attention.

3.2.1   *Eastern India: The Brahmo Samaj and Sourindra Mohun Tagore (1840-1911)*

Bengal, particularly Calcutta, was undoubtedly one of the most important centres in terms of cultural reform movements. It was here that some of first moves towards the modernisation of Indian music were made. In the early-nineteenth century, Bengal witnessed

reform movements impacting Indian (specifically Hindu) society. Here, the new, Westernised, educated Hindu elites played a crucial role in devising the concept of an Indian nation that was modern yet deeply rooted in tradition. One such initiative was the Brahmo Samaj, founded in 1828 by Raja Ram Mohun Roy (Kopf 1969). Drawing from various European philosophies and writings, predominantly the orientalist works, the Brahmo Samaj aimed to work towards the eradication of social evils prevalent in Hindu society at the time, that included child marriage and *sati* or widow immolation, as well as to reform Hinduism according to its most ancient texts, the *Vedas* (Kopf 1969, 1988). The Brahmo Samaj's direct engagement with music became evident in collective singing as part of their services. They also organised regular performances of professional classical singers (Rosse 1995; Scarimbolo 2014, 347). These performances were often held under the leadership of Debendranath Tagore, a Bengali Hindu philosopher, reformer, and an active member of the Brahmo Samaj (Scarimbolo 2014, 347). This society also made important contributions to music education in Bengal. For instance, Jyotirindranath Tagore (1849-1925), son of Debendranath Tagore, established the Adi Brahmo Sangeet Vidyalaya in 1875 and the Bharat Sangeet Samaj in 1897 to promote and teach Indian music (Rosse 1995).

Dwijendranath Tagore, the younger son of Debendranath Tagore, inaugurated an annual conference and festival called the Hindu Mela in 1867 (Rosse 1995, 21-22; Scarimbolo 2014, 347-348). The aim of such a Mela was to unite the Hindus, encourage self-reliance among them, and arouse nationalist sentiments (Rosse 1995, 22). It was in one such Hindu Mela in 1870 that Sourindro Mohun Tagore became known in public as a social and music reformer (Rosse 1995; Scarimbolo 2014). Among other initiatives, Sourindra Mohun established two music schools in the region in order to introduce a systematic and accessible teaching of *Hindustani* classical music: the Bengali Music school in 1871, which was one of the first-known music schools in India, and the Bengal Music academy in 1882 (Rosse 1995). It thus becomes evident that several individuals and groups played a crucial role in the Indian music *revival* in this region (Rosse 1995, 12).

Sourindra Mohun Tagore was hugely influenced by the orientalist writers of his time, such as William Jones, and furthered their claims of a golden age of a classical Hindu past and traditions that had deteriorated over time, particularly as a result of Islamic interventions, which called for reform (Scarimbolo 2014, 348-349). Citing Tagore's editorial in the 1872 volume of *Sangit Samalochani* or the The Music Review, Scarimbolo (2014) points out that for Tagore, Muslim rulers initiated the decay of Hindu music 'by "burning down," "looting," and "obliterating" Sanskrit musical treatises with iconoclastic zeal' (349). In the case of

Indian music specifically, Muslims, Tagore accused, were not open to teaching Hindus, a claim which Scarimbolo (2014), Williams (2014), and others have convincingly refuted. While supporting the British rule in India, Tagore did not completely discredit or reject the local customs and traditions. He instead sought to reform those following Eurocentric scientific discourses. Tagore sought to accommodate certain western ideals that he thought were scientific and could fit in the Indian context, believing that the scientific and spiritual were not incompatible. He agreed with the colonialist claims that Indian music required a modern notation system but believed that western staff notation could not be used in the context of Indian music (Scarimbolo 2014, 343). For Tagore, each 'country had a notation system that was uniquely suited to its own music' (Scarimbolo 2014, 344) and he thus sought to invent a Bengali notation for *Hindustani* music. The above-mentioned ideologies informed his publications and initiatives to establish schools or create a notation system for Indian music.

3.2.2 *Western India: Developments in the Baroda State and Bombay Presidency*

Similar initiatives took place in the western part of India, with the present-day states of Maharashtra and Gujarat at the forefront. One of the important centres was the Baroda state (in present-day Gujarat) under the rule of Sayajirao Gaekwad III in the late-nineteenth century, with Maula Baksh Ghisse Khan as a prominent court figure. When Sayajirao came into power in 1875, the state of Baroda was already on its way to becoming modernised along colonial lines and the working of the court, in general, was being restructured by the previous ruler to make it 'bureaucratically efficient' (Bakhle 2005, 21); this included music.

As Bakhle (2005) explores, Maula Baksh, a Muslim musician, was the pioneer of music education here in the court of Baroda. He exhibited a more secular approach to Indian music in comparison to some of his Bengali and Maharashtrian counterparts. Maula Baksh believed in a future of music that did not align itself towards any sect, could be modern (in colonial terms) through standardisation and systemisation and still remain very much Indian (Bakhle 2005, 21). His intent and efforts received support from the ruler, who had also made him the head of his *kalavant karkhana* or 'warehouse of artists' (Bakhle 2005, 23). Maula Baksh finally established a school on 1st February 1886 and is credited with integrating *ragas* of *Carnatic* music into the teaching of *Hindustani* music in his school. Additionally, he also formed a female orchestra in 1895 that emerged from his efforts to create a class 'designed to teach girls to sing to the accompaniment of musical instruments' (Bakhle 2005, 43). After his

death in 1896, Maula Baksh's sons, including Alauddin Khan, continued his legacy by expanding the schools and their teaching curriculum. Among Maula Baksh's students, Sadashiv Manohar founded The Bombay Moulabux Music School/Mumbai Gayan Vadan Shala in Bombay (Bakhle 2005, 44).

In the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century, Bombay, in the present-day state of Maharashtra, too was home to important societies that aimed to promote Indian classical music and had music education as their primary goal.[39] In terms of class, Bombay had parallels to the Bengali *bhadralok* or English-educated middle-class in the form of Parsis, Gujarati Hindu *banias*, and Maratha Hindus who were culturally and commercially active in Bombay and Gujarat (Niranjana 2020; Pradhan 2014; Rosse 1995, 2010). Music reform in this city can thus be traced back to the young graduates of elite institutions and colleges such as Poona College, the Elphinstone Institution, and Grant Medical College. Such young graduates came together to form societies and initiatives with the aim to combat the prevalent social evils in society. Furthermore, the Students' Literary and Scientific Society (established in 1848) and the Dyan Prasarak Mandali (established in 1851), initiated the concept of voluntary associations in the region. Social reforms as these were not limited to Hindu society but extended to other socio-religious groups and society at large. For instance, Parsis in Maharashtra also sought to reform Zoroastrianism. By the middle of the nineteenth century, Parsi reformers, such as Dadabhai Naoroji and Kaikhusro Naoroji Kabraji (Parsi elites), who were highly influenced by European reform ideas, became a part of social reforms and music 'revival' (Rosse 1995). The music reform movement in Bombay thus included participation from middle-class elites of different religious backgrounds.

The Parsi elites and reformists also contributed immensely towards the dissemination of musical knowledge through publications and societies, which was a part of the general and larger reform movements within Parsi society. One of the most important music societies was the Gayan Uttejak Mandali, which was founded in Bombay on 1st October 1870 by an active Parsi leader Kaikhusro Naoroji Kabraji (Rosse 1995, 69). Various political elites and economically well-off families supported this society from the very start. Furthermore, various schools, institutions, and music societies that were opened during this period by music reformers of different socio-religious backgrounds had a different approach towards Muslim hereditary musicians (Rosse 1995). Rosse mentions that while the Poona Gayan

---

[39] Bombay is now known as Mumbai, but I use the older name that was used in the period I am discussing.

Samaj hardly had any Muslim teachers, Gayan Uttejak Mandali 'employed teachers from both the Hindu and Muslim communities' (1995, 34). Maula Baksh's Baroda Music School also included teachers from different communities and the Marris College of Music in Lucknow included 'several Muslim teachers among a predominantly Hindu staff' (Rosse 1995, 34). Therefore, while Maharashtra did experience similar narratives as Bengal, the Parsis and Muslims also took an active role. For them, the primary aim was to scientifically reform Indian music along western lines.

3.2.3   V.N. Bhatkhande, V.D. Paluskar, and the Pan-India Initiatives

These crucial initiatives in different parts of the country informed the pan-India efforts of Vishnu Narayan Bhatkhande (1860-1936) and Vishnu Digambar Paluskar (1872-1931), both Maharashtrian-Brahmins who have had towering influence in the modern institutionalisation of Indian classical music education and the systematisation of the music (Bakhle 2005; Kobayashi 2003). Both of them travelled across India to study and directly or indirectly engage with regional schools and societies in order to learn about different ways to systematise Indian music pedagogy (Bakhle 2005; Kobayashi 2003; Rosse 1995, 2010). These influential Maharashtrian-Brahmins, though different in approach and ideas, exhibited certain similarities in their quest towards the standardisation of Indian music through a new notation system, a systematic syllabus for universities and schools, and establishing institutions (Bakhle 2003; Rosse 1995, 2010; Trasoff 2010).

Bakhle (2005) described Paluskar as ideologically the 'neotraditional counterpart to Bhatkhande' (137). Paluskar's view on music was similar to that of many conservative Hindu reformers. He focused on the spiritual and sacred aspect of music, tracing origins to the ancient Hindu past i.e. the Vedas and Sanskrit treatises, most notably, the *Natyashastra*. For Bhatkhande, on the other hand, music and religion needed to be strictly kept apart for *Hindustani* music to truly represent Indian culture and nation: a more secular approach as compared to many of his contemporaries (Bakhle 2005). He rejected the notion that Indian classical music as practiced today traces a continuous history back to the *Vedas* or the *Natyashastra*. Rather, for him, it was actually not more than two hundred years old (Bakhle 2005). Bakhle also notes that Bhatkhande considered the seventeenth century music treatise, the *Chaturdandi Prakashika* by Venkatamakhin, to be an authoritative text on Indian music (2005). However, both Bhatkhande and Paluskar were critical of Muslim hereditary musicians and *ustads* and alleged a closed approach by them when it came to the

dissemination of this classical tradition (Bakhle 2005). Therefore, for Bakhle, while Paluskar was known for his Brahmanical and Hindu approach, Bhatkhande can also been criticised for his elitism and bias against Muslims (2005). His account of music history deliberately kept out Muslim history and contributions to Indian music (Bakhle 2005; Katz 2017).

Another common ground between Bhatkhande and Paluskar, despite ideological differences, was that both established institutions to teach Indian classical music in a university environment, through a modern curriculum and regular examinations that tested students on their practical and theoretical knowledge of music. They were also involved in organising and attending a number of conferences around the country to discuss the systematic curriculum for Indian classical music in an institutional setup. The first and the most famous All-India Music conference was held in 1916 and was convened under the leadership Bhatkhande (Rosse 1995, 176). Paluskar also participated in it. It was in this conference that Begum Fyzee Rahamin presented the idea of establishing a national academy of music, although her idea was not ultimately realised.[40] Bhatkhande's attempts to establish an institution did, however, materialise in the form of the Marris College of Music in 1926, set up along with Rai Rajeshwar Bali, Rai Umanath Bali, and Raja Nawab Ali (Bakhle 2005; Kobayashi 2003). This school later came to be known as the Bhatkhande Music Institute (Bakhle 2005; Bhatkhande Music Institute n.d; Kobayashi 2003; Rosse 1995) and since 2000, has been recognised as the Bhatkhande Music Institute Deemed University (Bhatkhande Music Institute, n.d).

Paluskar's role in this institutionalisation process has been equally pervasive. He established Gandharva Mahavidyalaya in Lahore, his first music school, in 1901. Although it was later closed due to lack of funds, he went on to establish a *vidyalaya* or school, in Bombay in 1908 (Akhil Bhartiya Gandharva Mahavidyalaya Mandal, n.d; Bakhle 2005). This institution also became the centre for public performances and conferences from 1918 onwards, along with innovations in the music education. After his demise in 1936, his students carried on his legacy by founding a board called the Akhil Bharatiya Gandharva Mahavidyalaya Mandal (ABGMM) in Mumbai in 1931, under which they established Gandharva Mahavidyalaya schools (GMVs) across the country (Akhil Bhartiya Gandharva Mahavidyalaya Mandal, n.d; Kobayashi 2003, 99). ABGMM has continued to exist and expand, not only through various GMVs around the country but also by providing affiliations

---

[40] Begum Fyzee Rahamin was one of the prominent figures involved in the music reform process at the time. She 'regularly attended and spoke at the Conferences, especially on the topic of creating a national academy of music' (Kobayashi 2003, 201).

to smaller schools. Pradhan (2019) notes that today the Mandal 'has 1200 affiliated institutions and 800 examination centres around the country' (76). Indeed, many private and semi-private new music schools of today are also affiliated with it. For example, in Delhi, Pandit Vinay Chandra Maudgalya established GMV in 1939 and it is still considered one of the leading institutions for Indian classical music there (Kobayashi 2003). The GMVs have played an important ideological role in the reform of *Hindustani* music and the building of the upper caste upper class Hindu-dominance. As Rosse states, for example, 'the Gandharva Mahavidyalaya movement, which in historic retrospect we can now recognize as a subsidiary manifestation of the overall musical renaissance in India, had a religious bent,' given its deep emphasis 'on bhajans and *Ram bhakti,* the use of unimpeachably proper lyrics, and insistence on disciplined personal conduct' (1995, 169).

We have seen that the pre-1947 period witnessed the establishment of a first-wave of music schools. Some of these schools and institutions exist today (I found four, see Appendix 1); they either continued as schools, or eventually became music colleges or departments in the recent past. However, besides the Bhatkhande Music Institute-Deemed To Be University (that was made a university only recently), I found that Visva-Bharati University was established in 1921 out of Rabindranath Tagore's School for Performing Arts in Santiniketan (Pal 2016; Visva-Bharati, n.d). Today, it has a Sangit Bhawan, a department or institute of music, in which *Hindustani* classical music is taught (Visva-Bharati, n.d). Two other pre-1947 music departments in universities existing today in which music is taught include the Department of Music and Performing Arts, Faculty of Arts, University of Allahabad (1926) and the Department of Performing Arts, Banasthali Vidyapith in Banasthali (1943). Pradhan notes that one of the earliest attempts to get a graded course into university level teaching was the Indian Women's University in Mumbai 'which offered music as a discipline at the degree level' (2019, 88). Today, this university is known as Shreemati Nathibai Damodar Thackersey Women's University (Pradhan 2019). He further adds that the Patna University senate 'also introduced music as a subject in the 1930's' (Pradhan 2019, 89). As I discuss in the next section, it was only in the post-1947 period that many more university departments developed around the country, including Bihar, as a result of a second-wave of music institutions and schools.

In conclusion, it is interesting to note that despite many regional initiatives preceding the pan-India ones of Bhatkhande and Paluskar, not all of them operated with the same ideological base as those of (Hindu) nationalists of the later period. Also, in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries, urban centres such as Bombay contained people

coming together for musical affect in ways that cannot not be entirely reduced to the dominant Hinduised nationalism. However, as the broader discourse at the time defined Indian music in terms of spiritual versus material and traditional versus modernity, it demonstrates a kind of contradictory, heterotopic space in many ways.

3.3 The Second Wave of Music Schools and Societies in Newly-Independent India

Following Indian independence in 1947, there was a continuation of certain values associated with the music reform period. The concept of one Indian heritage and national culture continued to be upheld and Indian classical arts were seen as a key part of it (Deo 2011). This has continued to cement *Hindustani* music as an essentially Sanskritic and Hindu sacred tradition in many respects, although there are many high-profile Muslim musicians and a fair understanding of syncretism in *Hindustani* music even today. State patronage of music also emerged in different quarters, directly or indirectly, with the new Republic of India promoting 'performing arts, through bodies such as Sangeet Natak Akademi (inaugurated in 1953), and the state-owned All India Radio' (Deo 2011, 24). The government of India created Sangeet Natak Akademi in 1952 and inaugurated it a year later (Deo 2011; Sangeet Natak Akademi, n.d.). Such institutions worked towards defining a national public culture that included Indian classical music and making it 'accessible to the nation' (Deo 2011, 25).[41]

The initial efforts of All India Radio, which Deo (2011) calls the state cultural agency, in the post-1947 period reflected continuity of certain values and ideologies associated with Indian classical music that had made a mark in the reform period of pre-1947 period. For instance, BV Keskar, the first Information and Broadcasting Minister of India, famously refused to include female performers of the courtesan community, who were some of the most prominent artistes at the time (Lelyveld 1994). Additionally, he made clear his preference for musicians who had learned in a music institution as opposed to *gharanedar* musicians, as performers on All-India Radio (Lelyveld 1994). Keskar's initiatives included broadcast of Indian classical music only, both *Hindustani* and *Carnatic*, on radio. He significantly reduced the broadcast of Hindi film songs, calling it vulgar owing to its erotic lyrics (Lelyveld 1994, 118-121). The development of the new national culture in the pre-1947 period had itself seen a ban on the harmonium in All India Radio in 1940, since it was seen as

---

[41] Deo (2011) notes that in post-independent India, both Indian classical music, as well as folk performances, were included in the in the national public culture by the state and was equally promoted. This is a departure from the pre-1947 period of classicisation of music.

foreign and 'deemed inappropriate for national radio' (Rahaim 2011, 673). This ban was lifted only in the 1970s (Rahaim 2011). However, Keskar's efforts were not popular among the masses and not everyone among the leadership agreed with his measures (Lelyveld 1994). This presents existence of different viewpoints and worldviews among the Indian subjectivities in the postcolonial context.

Post-1947 India also saw the emergence of more renowned music schools, institutions, music departments, and organisations around the country, particularly in Delhi and Patna, to impart systematic music education and promote it as 'Indian cultural heritage.' Thus, these diverse institutions and organisations hugely impacted and revived the cultural scene of Delhi. The government founded some of these institutions, while others were established privately. Nevertheless, most of them existing today are registered through the Societies Registration Act 1860, so supported indirectly by the government and governed by the rules of the act. These institutions generally emphasise the concept of the *guru-shishya* method as part of their training, despite the fact that they mostly utilise a classroom environment.

In the post-1947 period, there were also attempts to bring music as a discipline to be on par with other disciplines at school and university level. However, music teaching in the mainstream schools has not been very fruitful even today in comparison to the full-fledged music institutions. Attempts to create a music curriculum for schools had started in the nineteenth century, particularly in Calcutta and Bombay, but it was only after Indian independence that there were government initiatives and attempts 'to shape a standardized teaching methodology at the school level' (Pradhan 2019, 82). The Education and Industries department of the government of Bombay established a music education committee in 1948 and made recommendations on incorporating music at the school-level, but it did not prove to be enough (Pradhan 2019). Pradhan also discusses in detail the Education Commission reports in 1948-49 and 1964-66 and notes that they lacked suggestions on how to put music on a par with other subjects in schools in terms of systematic teaching (2019, 81-85). In the recent past, there have been increasing initiatives by individual musicians and organisations to develop a curriculum for mainstream schools that could introduce young students here to Indian music, or music in general. They create syllabi and publish books that can be used for this purpose. The foremost example of this in Delhi is the Music4All initiative by the Shubhendra and Saskia Rao Foundation, which sitarist Shubhendra Rao and *Hindustani* cellist Saskia Rao-de Haas started, which creates syllabi for bringing music to children as early as possible (Shubhendra and Saskia Rao Foundation, n.d.). The Music4All music

curriculum can be incorporated in these schools to introduce Indian classical music (and in music in general) to children from a very young age, particularly those from non-musical families.[42] The goal of such an organisation is to bring music education into the mainstream schools, where quality music training is incorporated along with other subjects.[43] Nevertheless, the struggle for recognition of music as a full-fledged discipline on a par with others, like those in social and natural sciences, continues and some musician-professors mentioned it in interviews. Hence, quality music training in mainstream schools is an important issue today, although outside the scope of this thesis.

Since independence, the number of music departments in universities and specific universities or deemed universities devoted to music has increased greatly. Although not a comprehensive list, Appendix 1 gives some of the important ones in different states around the country, that emerged in this period. Many music universities and departments in this list, such as Indira Kala Sangit Vishwavidyalaya or Khairagarh University in Raipur, and the music departments in Banaras Hindu University and University of Mumbai, are well-respected within the Indian classical music world. So is the music department in Allahabad University, a pre-1947 department. While Bhatkhande Music institute is also a pre-1947 one, it is a full-fledged performing arts institute including music, rather than a music department.

Focusing on eight Indian states, I found 13 music departments within universities or music universities that were established between 1947 and 1991. Three out of thirteen music departments and music and arts universities in Appendix 1 were established after 1991: department of music and dance, Kannada University in Hampi in the state of Karnataka, established in 1997; department of performing arts and theatre studies, Christ (Deemed to be) University in Bangalore in the state of Karnataka, established in 2010; and Raja Man Singh Tomar Music and Arts University in Gwalior, established in 2008 (Christ Deemed to Be University, n.d.; Kannada University Hampi, n.d.; Raja Man Singh Tomar Music & Arts University, n.d.). I could not, however, find a year or date of establishment for the majority of music departments (18) listed in Appendix 1 but it is likely that many of these are pre-1991. It is important to note that the Amity School of Performing Arts is a part of Amity University Noida, which is the only fully private university in the list.

The Department of Music in the University of Mumbai has also become an important centre. The university itself was founded in 1857 and is one of the oldest universities in India.

---

[42] Shubhendra Rao and Saskia Rao-de Haas, interview by author, Delhi, August 8, 2018.

[43] Interview by author, 8th August 2018.

Historically, a music centre was founded at the university of Mumbai in 1969 with a two-year diploma in *Hindustani* music (University of Mumbai, n.d.). This course was converted to a regular one in 1978 and, thereafter, a BA in vocal music was introduced (University of Mumbai, n.d.). The website mentions that 'the teaching methods and pattern here are based on the age-old and time tested "*guru-shishya parampara*",' (University of Mumbai, n.d.). Many such institutional structures that involve classroom teaching, directly or indirectly, emphasise the *guru-shishya parampara*, demonstrating contradictory ideas and spaces. Therefore, important university-based music departments established after independence in 1947, propagated the ideology of tradition such as the emphasis on *guru-shishya parampara* while also framing themselves as modern.

There are some first-wave or pre-1947 schools that were converted, mostly by the government, into colleges, universities, or music departments after independence. For instance, the Faculty of Performing Arts at the Maharaja Sayajirao University of Baroda in the state of Gujarat 'evolved from the School of Music and the educational activities conducted by Sangeet Shala founded in 1884 by Sayajirao Gaekwad III, the ruler of Baroda' (Pradhan 2019, 89). The school of music was converted into the College of Indian Music, Dance, and Dramatics in 1949 and into the present faculty only in 1986 (Pradhan 2019, 89).

The scale of music departments that exist today is evident in the state of Bihar itself, of which Patna is a capital. I found 16 of them, out of which five had their year of establishment between 1949-1987, and the rest had no information on them (see Appendix 1). Magadh Mahila College at University of Patna is one of the best-known for music in Patna and Bihar and the department of music here was founded in 1949 (Magadh Mahila College Music, n.d). I found more music departments through online searches and list them in the Appendix, though it may be that some are not functioning anymore. For many departments in the list, I could not find a website, and for some among them, I was not even able to find phone numbers on the internet. Nevertheless, this search shows that there are many music departments in universities in Bihar and across India, established at different periods, the earliest dating from before independence. It is thus highly probable that music departments also exist in significant numbers in other Indian states, which could only be determined by further research and studied in detail.[44]

---

[44] It is important to note that I did a detailed online survey only for my field sites with an overview of other states.

Delhi is home to several of the most nationally-renowned music institutes and departments established soon after Indian independence. For instance, the Department of Music, Faculty of Music and Fine Arts at the University of Delhi was established in 1960. According to the department website, it is a 'unique institute, which is a mixture of an age-old education system, i.e. the *guru-shishya parampara* and institutionalized modern education system,' and that 'the atmosphere of teaching-learning is indeed that of an extended family' (Faculty of Music and Fine Arts University of Delhi, n.d.). The website also emphasises that they have adapted the 'traditional *gurukul* system to that of the university system' (Faculty of Music and Fine Arts University of Delhi, n.d.). This is an example of the inner versus outer dichotomy that characterised the nationalist period of pre-1947. There is also a focus on skill, and on the training of students who can make a career in music (Faculty of Music and Fine Arts University of Delhi, n.d.). Therefore, it presents a mixture the ideologies of the reform, of tradition and an inner sanctity of music, combined with career-focused pragmatism that more characteristic of the current period of India. Such heterotopia is even more evident in the third wave of music schools, post-1991, which also emphasise business.

In post-independence India, therefore, a new type of institutionalisation emerged that reflects an amalgamation of a modern institution and the idea of *gurukul*s: what can be termed as *institutionalised gurukuls*. In the context of *khyal*, Deo (2011) has pointed out that these *gurukuls* too, in some ways, are influenced 'by the continued hegemony in the twentieth century of a Hindu interpretation of *Khyal* culture' (130). One of the most renowned examples of a *gurukul*-institution for training in Indian classical music is the ITC Sangeet Research Academy (ITC-SRA) in Kolkata, which was established in 1977 as a public charitable trust (ITC-Sangeet Research Academy, n.d.).[45] This institute was one of the initial examples of the big scale corporate patronage or support for this art form in the country, given that it was envisioned and established by India Tobacco Company or the ITC (Deo 2011; ITC-Sangeet Research Academy, n.d.). ITC-SRA is a residential institution 'modelled on the concept of *gurukul*—the master's home where disciples reside during master-disciple training' (Deo 2011, 127). Similar to the traditional *guru-shishya parampara*, it has no system of formal examinations, syllabi, and does not offer any degree courses. ITC-SRA also has well-known *Hindustani* classical performers as residential *gurus*, and selected students (known as scholars) get the opportunity to live with them in the academy and learn

---

[45] Deo (2011) has discussed this institution in detail in her thesis.

through a traditional *guru-shishya* like model. Deo succinctly explains the selection process of the students to learn from the 'master-musicians' in ITC-SRA (2011, 149). One has to be accepted as a scholar here to be able learn from these master-musicians and *gurus*, and there are two types of scholars here. Student day-scholars are those who do not live on campus nor receive any scholarship. Then there are a smaller number of residential scholars, who are receiving scholarships and living on campus (Deo 2011). Besides teaching, this institution engages in various activities and initiatives, including organising the ITC Sangeet Sammelan annually (since 1971), with the participation of famous classical musicians (ITC-Sangeet Research Academy, n.d.).

ITC-SRA is an unprecedented initiative. However, there are examples of other institutional structures today identifying as *gurukul*, such as the Dhrupad Sansthan in Bhopal set up by the Gundecha brothers (Dhrupad Sansthan, n.d). This *gurukul* is different from the Dhrupad Kendra established in 1981 by the Department of Culture, government of the state of Madhya Pradesh with Ustad Zia Fariduddin Dagar of the Dagar *gharana* as its first director.[46] Dhrupad Kendra was run by Dhrupad singer Ashish Sankritayayan until recently, but I have not been able to find out if it is still functioning. There is also the Lalit Kala Kendra in Pune established in 1987, another *gurukul*-style institution that Deo (2011) discusses. It is also known as the Centre of Performing Arts under Savitribai Phule Pune University (University of Pune, n.d.).

I mention a brief list of institutionalised *gurukul*s in Appendix 3, which also shows that this pre-1991 phenomenon has continued into the twenty-first century, such as Pandit Hariprasad Chourasia establishing the Vrindavan Gurukul in 2002. These institutions have been little examined as yet. Although the contemporary *gurukuls* are presented as the traditional *guru-shishya* method, there are key differences. For example, the traditional method involves staying in or close to master's home for a long time. While the institutionalised *gurukul*s and the people involved emphasise close interactions between teachers and student as a part of the *gurukul* system, they also 'maintain clear spatial and social distinctions between pedagogic and non-pedagogic interactions' (Deo 2011, 130). This reflects significant changes in the teaching of Indian classical music and that, in many cases, older ideologies mostly remain only in essence. This is even more the case with the third wave of music schools that have emerged post-1991.

---

[46] Dr. Deepak Raja, video correspondence with author, November 22, 2020.

There is another kind of music schools and institutions in India among the second-wave ones that are private and semi-private. By semi-private music schools, I mean those that are registered under the Societies Registration Act of 1860. They are not government-established institutions but are bound by the rules of this act of government. Since all of them continue to exist and thrive, I have included again a non-exhaustive list of these private and semi-private schools in Appendix 2 under the heading 'Renowned and Other Pre-1991 Institutions in India Today.' All these institutions, established at different periods, still continue to exist and thrive. Six out of thirteen in the list are second-wave of music schools, most of them renowned even among musicians and performing artists; two are undated, since I could not find their date and year of establishment; and five are from the pre-independence era. All the post-1947 schools in Appendix 2 are registered under the Societies Registration Act. It is important to reiterate that these institutions are the ones, besides the ABGMM in Mumbai and GMVs around the country, that are considered some of the premium institutes today for Indian classical music training among music scholars and connoisseurs.

Among these (mostly) semi-private schools, Pracheen Kala Kendra in Chandigarh, which was established in 1956, is renowned today and provides affiliations to music schools around the country, including the new, private ones that mushroomed after 1991 (Pracheen Kala Kendra, n.d.). Interestingly, I also found that all post-1947 institutions in my list have their own examination systems and courses, and are not affiliated with any other school. This is also true of almost all pre-1947 institutions, except for Saraswati Music College in Delhi which today is affiliated to Prayag Sangit Samiti (Saraswati Music College, n.d.). Prayag Sangeet Samiti, a registered school, is a pre-independence institution established in 1926 (Prayag Sangeet Samiti, n.d.). Prayag Sangeet Samiti, along with ABGMM and Bhatkhande Sangit Vidyapith, have also been providing affiliations to various schools for quite some time.

In Delhi too, such semi-private institutions and schools emerged and enriched the Delhi cultural scene. Sriram Bharatiya Kala Kendra, founded by Mrs. Sumitra Charat Ram and set up as a registered society in 1952, provides various diploma degrees in music today (Shriram Bharatiya Kala Kendra, n.d.). This society organises various festivals, gives awards, has a college, and creates dance drama productions performed all over the world. Sriram Bharatiya Kala Kendra emphasises on its website that 'it is a lively cultural centre reflecting a fusion of rich artistic traditions and contemporary insights' (Institute of Music and Dance Shriram Bharatiya Kala Kendra, n.d.). However, it also advertises that they have 'eminent *gurus*' for each music and dance types taught there. Interestingly, I found this institute to be

the only one among the second-wave of institutes that openly promotes the idea of fusion. The mention of *guru* here is a familiar reference to 'tradition', but the emphasis on the ideas like fusion conflicts with Eurocentric beliefs popular in the pre-1947 period, that Indian classical music teaching is rigid, demanding, and lacking what it takes to become a modern musician. The values presented on this institution's website combine the old and the new world (or approach) in the teaching of Indian classical music, at least on the website, and reflects flexibility in the institution.

A similar institution is the Triveni Kala Sangam, founded by Mrs. Sundari K. Shridharani in 1950 (Triveni Kala Sangam, n.d.). Today, it has three separate departments: Department of Art, Department of Dance, and Department of Music (Triveni Kala Sangam, n.d.). The department of music at this institute was established in 1956 (Department of Music Triveni Kala Sangam, n.d.). What makes these institutes different from the new small- and medium-scale music schools of post-1991 period is that the latter presents an explicit business-like outlook and for-profit approach, flexibility in examinations, a student-centric approach, and courses beyond Indian classical arts, particularly the inclusion of Bollywood music. I explore these new-wave of small- and medium-scale private schools, with for-profit approach, in Delhi in chapter 4.

In addition to these institutions, there have been some private initiatives by musicians and music connoisseurs in Delhi-NCR that were established in the post-1947 period. For instance, Siddheshwari Devi Academy of Music, established in 1977 by Vidushi Savita Devi, still functions today in the city of Gurugram, (Devi, n.d.). Named after the *Hindustani* classical singer Smt. Siddheshwari Devi, this school states that it aims to keep alive the *guru-shishya parampara* (Devi, n.d.), although it can be questioned how much this manifest in reality. The website states that 'Siddheshwari Devi strongly believed in "Guru Shishya Parampara" which has been kept alive by her daughter Vidushi Savita Devi' (Devi, n.d.). It is not clear from the website of the academy if it is registered under the Societies Registration Act of 1860. Nevertheless, this school shows that the private and semi-private schools for teach Indian classical music surfaced before 1991, as Banerjee (1986) also notes. However, as I show later, they expanded considerably in the post-1991.

Patna (or the state of Bihar in general), which is another geographical focus of my research, did not play a major role in the reform period of late-nineteenth and the early-twentieth centuries despite sharing a border with West Bengal. Even today, it is rather a peripheral centre than a major one such as Delhi, Mumbai, and Banaras, and has not been greatly researched. With the decline of Delhi as a cultural centre by the late-nineteenth

century as discussed in Chapter 1, Darbhanga and Bettiah in Bihar emerged as two important centres of this region for *Hindustani* music. The local kings and *zamindars* here became important patrons of music. Musicians and music connoisseurs in Patna provided significant support for Indian classical music in the few decades post-independence, particularly until 1970s, which is evident in the varied events organised around the city. These events became a hub for classical musicians from cities around India. Patna has also witnessed some important developments in the teaching and transmission of Indian classical music in the form of institutions and music departments. Hari Uppal, a dance exponent in the 1950s, established *Bharatiya Nritya Kala Mandir* in 1963, which is an arts and crafts museum as well as a multipurpose cultural centre with an auditorium and regular music and dance classes.[47] In addition, the regional branch of Sangeet Natak Akademi also exists in Patna and works in sync with the state government (Pandeya 2016). While Pradhan (2019) notes that music was introduced as a subject by the Patna University Senate in the 1930's, the music department of Magadh Mahila College University of Patna was founded only in 1949, Mrs. Shanti Goverdhan as the founder head (Magadh Mahila College Music, n.d.). This department is one of the most respected institutions for music in the city and in Bihar, and one of the few music departments in the city. In the pre-1991 period, Patna was a hub for *Hindustani* music, as home to music institutions and important performers of different *gharanas* as well as a host of concerts attracting famous artists. However, it lost its importance as a centre of classical music after 1991 with a shift in power in the state government and as caste-based identity-politics started dominating Bihar's society and politics. I discuss Patna and Bihar in detail in Chapter 6, including music schools and university departments where music is taught.

In addition to the many new music teaching institutions, organisations or societies with objectives beyond direct teaching were also established in post-independence India, either by the government or privately. Besides the government cultural centres such as Sangeet Natak Akademi and Indian Council of Cultural Relations (ICCR), I found twenty-eight music societies or organisations around the country that had a presence on the Internet (see Appendix 5). Only two were established in the pre-1947 period, six of them after 1947 but before 1991, and seven post-1991, and the others I could not ascertain a year of establishment. Those I could access through a website or fieldwork interviews are registered societies either under the Societies Registration Act of 1860, the Indian Trusts Act of 1882,

---

[47] Most of the information on Bharatiya Nritya Kala Mandir in Patna was received by a retired official of the All India Radio Patna.

or the Companies Registration Act of 2013. I thus found that the post-1991 period has seen a sort of resurgence of music organisations that are well-known and respected in the cities they operate. Hardly any scholarly publications have discussed the societies and organisations in the newly-independent India in detail, so the extent and scale of them is not clear.

Among the second-wave of music organisations, Dadar Matunga Cultural Centre in Mumbai, the capital city of present-day Maharashtra, is quite well-known. It was started in 1953 as Dadar Matunga Social Club by 'some music lovers and connoisseurs' of the city led by Dr. S.G. Joshi (Dadar Matunga Cultural Centre, n.d.). Today it is an important cultural centre that organises music festivals, cultural programmes, workshops, lectures and seminars by well-known classical musicians (Dadar Matunga Cultural Centre Festivals, n.d.; Dadar Matunga Cultural Centre Programmes, n.d.). The centre also offers classes in classical and light-classical vocal music, as well as harmonium and tabla (Dadar Matunga Cultural Centre Classes, n.d.). The centre's website explains that it emerged in central Mumbai as a response to growing middle-class residents in the area 'caught in the maelstrom of burgeoning metropolitan growth and a deep psychic need to revive and consolidate their cultural roots' (Dadar Matunga Cultural Centre, n.d.). This quote highlights the interest of the middle-classes in encompassing *Hindustani* music as their culture. The website of the Dadar Matunga Cultural centre also mentions as one of its aims and initiatives to organise 'the youth festival of music and dance' (Dadar Matunga Cultural Centre, n.d.), thus clearly seeking to bring this art form to the young people.

The most important music organisation of this period is without a doubt. Dr. Kiran Seth established it in 1977, and it has become a huge phenomenon today with nation-wide reach, still immensely popular in the Indian classical music world. This voluntary movement is also registered under the Societies Registration Act 1860. I discuss this specifically in Chapter 5.

3.4 Institutes and Organisations as Not-for-Profit: Government Acts and Registration

In newly-independent India, the state became the primary patron of Indian classical music through All India Radio and institutions such as Sangeet Natak Akademy (Deo 2011; Neuman 1990; Rosse 1995; Schippers 2016). This was important particularly since royal patronage no longer existed after Indian independence. Additionally, pre-1991 India saw the state-control of the economy and most of the industries, and the Nehruvian idea of welfare state was in place. Thus, we can say that direct or indirect government support was

considered crucial for the development and sustenance of Indian classical music, and this is when music organisations, societies, and big institutions were increasingly registering themselves as charitable organisations. In the contemporary neoliberal period, direct or indirect government support to promote and preserve Indian classical music has waned but is still important. Indirect support, however, continues. In the Indian context, there are three important Acts of government under which music organisations or societies, as well as certain music institutions, have registered: The Societies Registration Act of 1860, the Indian Trusts Act of 1882, and the Companies Act of 2013. Any music institution and organisation can apply for registration under any of these acts and are accordingly governed by a set of rules. My research shows the Societies Act of 1860 to be the most popular one and I thus discuss it in detail here. Most of the third-wave of private schools today in a metropolitan city such as Delhi are not registered under any of these three acts and are essentially run as businesses, marking an important shift. Many older institutions are registered under one of these acts, and music societies and organisations have also continued to register under one of them.

The Societies Registration Act of 1860 was an important development during the colonial period in India. This act continues to be in effect today and is a way of securing indirect government support for charitable activities that include the promotion of Indian classical music. The act is important in the context of this research in that a number of music institutions established since the early-twentieth century have been registered under it, and have therefore been positioned as not-for-profit and a part of the civil society. Even today, a number of organisations, societies, institutions, and even some new schools (particularly in Patna) are registered under this act.

The Societies Registration Act of 1860 was to a great extent based on the previous similar one: Literary and Scientific Institutions Act of 1854 (Aiyer 1966). The Literary and Scientific Institutions Act included within its scope any existing institution, whether registered or not, promoting the fields of science, fine art, and literature, among others. This Act also included those institutions that founded or maintained reading rooms, museums, or galleries on the work of art and music among other things, for 'general use among the members or open to the public' (Aiyer 1966, 64). Societies founded for the purpose of recreation fell outside the scope of the act (Aiyer 1966). Consequently, the Societies Registration Act of 1860 enabled those interested to establish and register (through the Act) any charitable societies or clubs in the such fields as science, art, or literature. This Act also sets rules for establishment and governance of such societies (International Centre for Not-

for-profit Law, n.d.). The preamble of this Act suggests that it aims to improve the 'legal condition of the societies established for the promotion of literature, or the fine arts, or for the diffusion of useful knowledge [the diffusion of political education], or for charitable purpose' (Aiyer 1966, 1). Since Indian independence, various states have had amendments to the preamble of the main act; adding, removing or modifying certain sections and/or terminologies (Aiyer 1966).

As per the Act today, an association of minimum of seven people coming together for 'any literary, scientific or charitable purpose, or for any such purpose as is described in section 20 of this Act' can form a society, and registration of such a society is through the memorandum of association (Aiyer 1966; Narayana Swamy 1987; International Centre for Not-for-profit Law, n.d.). As a registered body under this act, the societies and trusts are governed by a set of rules and regulations laid down under this act.[48] They are also accountable to the general populace and the authorities in relation to functioning. The societies and institutions registered under this act fall under the more recent Right to Information (RTI) Act of 2005. This means that any member of the public has the legal right to seek and receive from the government any information about a registered society. Section 19 of this act provides scope for the general public to look and inspect any document of any such society.[49]

Additionally, Section 8 of the Companies Act of 2013 allows some not-for-profit organisations for charitable purposes and for the promotion of art, culture and the like to register themselves as not-for-profit 'companies' rather than Societies. As a registered company under this section of this act, such organisations do not aim to make profits (IndiaFillings, n.d.). According to Section 8, the profit an organisation earns should go towards the promotion of the objectives. The members here are not paid dividends, unlike a non-charitable company registered under the Companies Act outside Section 8. Naadyatra Foundation in Gurugram is the only music organisation I found that is registered under the Companies Act. In this section, I do not get into the detail of the differences between the Section 8 of the Companies Act 2013 and the Societies Registration Act 1860, as this is outside the scope of this thesis.

---

[48] Aiyer (1966), and Narayana Swamy (1987) among others discuss this act, along with State amendments, in detail. More information on this act and the state amendments can also be found online via various sources.

[49] Government of India, Ministry of Corporate Affairs, *Societies Registration Act 1860*. India: Government of India, n.d., https://www.mca.gov.in/Ministry/actsbills/pdf/Societies_Registration_Act_1860.pdf (accessed on March 8, 2021).

There is also a Section 135 in the Companies Act 2013 that discusses the Corporate Social Responsibility for businesses and the companies today.[50] Schedule 7 in the Section 135 of the Companies Act 2013 'mandates that companies with specified or higher turnover have to spend a portion of their net profits on Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) activities' (Pradhan 2019, 60). One of the clauses of this Schedule 7 does include the 'protection of national heritage, art and culture including restoration of building and sites of historical importance and works of art; setting up public libraries; promotion and development of traditional art and handicrafts.'[51]

Another important Act of the parliament for the context of my research is Indian Trusts Act of 1882, which is 'an act to define and amend the law relating to private trusts and trustees,'[52] under which one can establish a not-for-profit organisation, society, or a trust. Among the two prerequisites of who can or cannot create trusts under this act, one of them states that a trust can be established by 'any person competent to contracts.'[53] According to point 11 of Chapter 2 of the Indian Contract Act 1872, 'Every person is competent to contract who is of the age of majority according to the law to which he is subject, and who is of sound mind and is not disqualified from contracting by any law to which he is subject.'[54] Among the music societies and organisations today, I found only one that is registered under Indian Trusts Act of 1882: Pandit Siyaram Tiwari Memorial Trust (Anand, n.d.), which, according to its Facebook page, is a not-for-profit society.

Historically, one of the first attempts to register a music institution in India under the Societies Registration Act of 1860 was the National Academy of Music, the establishment of which Begum Fyzee Rahamin proposed in the All-India Music Conference on 21st March 1916 (Rosse 1995). As Rosse explains, Rahamin and Vishnu Narayan Bhatkhande worked on it until the next conference in 1918 and 'a Memorandum of Association had been drawn up,

---

[50] Government of India, Ministry of Corporate Affairs, Section 135, *Companies Act 2013*. India: Government of India, n.d., http://ebook.mca.gov.in/Actpagedisplay.aspx?PAGENAME=17518 (accessed on March 15, 2021).

[51] Government of India, Ministry of Corporate Affairs, *Schedule 7, Section 135, Companies Act 2013*. India: Government of India, n.d., http://ebook.mca.gov.in/Actpagedisplay.aspx?PAGENAME=17923 (accessed on March 8, 2021).

[52] Government of India, Legislative Department, Ministry of Law and Justice, *Indian Trusts Act 1882*. India: Government of India, n.d., https://legislative.gov.in/actsofparliamentfromtheyear/indian-trusts-act-1882 (accessed on March 8, 2021).

[53] See Point 7 of chapter 1 in Indian Trust Act of 1882.

[54] Government of India, Legislative Department, Ministry of Law and Justice, *The Indian Contract Act, 1872*. India: Government of India, n.d., https://legislative.gov.in/actsofparliamentfromtheyear/indian-contract-act-1872 (accessed on March 8, 2021).

in which it was proposed to register the Academy under the Societies Registration Act of 1860' (1995, 181). This memorandum reflected the dominant music reform ideologies that were becoming entrenched in Indian society; it suggested that music had deteriorated as an art form since Emperor Akbar and Mian Tansen and there was thus an urgent need to revive its past greatness. The major aim of this academy, as mentioned in its preamble as well, was to impart music education.[55] The details Rosse (1995) shares about the National Academy of Music provided in the memorandum were in sync with what was required to register under the Societies Registration Act. However, despite these efforts, the establishment of the academy did not materialise due to lack of adequate funds.

With the plans for the Academy of Music on hold, Vishnu Narayan Bhatkhande established the Marris College of Music a few years later in 1926, which is 'registered under the registration of Societies Act 1860 and is an autonomous institution' (Bhatkhande Music Institute , n.d.). The Societies Act along with the Indian Trusts Act and the Companies Act, therefore, reinforces the idea that state involvement and support, albeit indirect, continues to be important in the promotion of *Hindustani* classical music. This is evident in attempts by newer organisations and institutions seeking to register under the Act. Therefore, the state remains crucial in this market economy to some extent, in order to at least regulate the functioning of these enterprises, organisations, or establishments.

There may be many motivations for people to register their organisation, though one of the clearly stated ones is the ease, albeit still competitive, of being considered for government funds and grants for events featuring *Hindustani* classical music they plan to organise. Some charitable organisations, such as SPIC MACAY, are exempt from income tax as well. In my fieldwork, I found that the institutions registered under this act do not, at least always, receive any direct financial help from the government for establishing the organisation.

In conclusion, this chapter has explored the diverse regional and national efforts towards institutionalisation, systematisation, and classicisation of Indian music in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries. We saw the context within which the music societies, organisations, and institutions developed in India and the varied ideological structures defining them. Ideologically, while the broader discourse surrounding Hindustani classical

---

[55] See Rosse (1995) for a detailed discussion on the objectives and aims, funding for the organisation (through donations), degrees offered, and other information that the memorandum included.

music was informed by the conservative Hindu middle-class and upper-caste values, the everyday lived realities and social life around *Hindustani* music was much more complex with musicophiliacs of different religious backgrounds coming together in different spaces to enjoy and learn this music from well-known *ustad*s. This chapter has also argued that the attempt to define the broader discourse on *Hindustani* classical music in terms of scientific versus spiritual, sacred versus secular, and inner versus outer domain gives rise to heterotopic spaces that are different from those apparent in the new schools of contemporary period. This analysis of ideologies around music institutions and societies in the pre- and post-1947 period will help us understand the manner in which the new music schools and contemporary organisations appropriate or interpret them in Delhi-NCR, and varied institutions in Patna. The following chapters will explore the manner in which characteristics associated with the traditional *guru-shishya parampara* or *ustad-shagird silsila* are applied in the music institutions and organisations of today at the national and regional level.

Chapter 4: Teaching music, transmitting ideologies – Music education and teaching in the new wave of music schools in Delhi, post-1991

This chapter explores the ideologies, both traditional and neoliberal, that new music schools in Delhi and Gurugram propagate and transmit while teaching a traditional art form in a neoliberal period. Here, I move from the discussion of the older music institutions – some of which still exist, are extremely well-known even among musicians today, and are mostly registered under the Societies Registration Act 1860 – to the newer wave of small- and medium-scale private music schools that are often business-centric, for-profit and are many in numbers. As detailed in Chapter 1, the present ideological-political climate bears many differences from the one within which the old music institutions emerged. Therefore, I explore here how, and to what extent, do the new music schools differ from their older counterparts while approaching important concepts linked with *Hindustani* music; such as *guru-shishya* relationship, loyalty, discipline, and spirituality, among others? What roles do values and (cultivated) taste (Bourdieu 1984) play within the music tradition in new wave of schools? I argue that, in terms of ideological approach towards Indian classical music training, these new schools constitute heterotopic spaces where the focus on tradition and related values of the past are either applied as it is, like the idea of *Sanskar*; are maintained in essence though not followed in its entirety, such as *guru-shishya parampara*; or are often given new meanings in the neo-liberal context of today, for instance, the idea of spirituality and individual well-being. I reiterate here that every society and aspects of it possess a dominant ideology or values specific to it. In this chapter, I aim to understand the interaction between the traditional values or ideologies associated with *Hindustani* classical music, and the present, dominant ones of neoliberal India.

MNZ Music Academy is one such new music school, situated in a posh economically-affluent neighbourhood in Delhi and teaching diverse music and dance forms, including Indian classical music. It is a private school housed in the basement of a three-storeyed building in a residential area. Having explored their website during my fieldwork, I was intrigued by their focus on the concepts of discipline and devotion, and placed a request at the reception to attend a trial class. Upon attending my trial class, I found that the music students removed their shoes outside as they went into the classroom. The vocal class included around fifteen students, sitting on the floor in a semi-circle with the teacher at the

centre on another side.[56] The students comprised of different age-groups, from school-goers to middle-aged pupils. The teacher starts with an *alaap* and the students repeat after him and are then asked to sing individually. A few minutes later someone came in to play *dholak* (although it is usually Tabla instead in the majority of the schools), followed by the *alaap* and *bandish* of *raga* Malhar where everyone sang together. As the class neared its end, the teacher discussed and made the students sing an old Hindi film song based on this *Raga*. In all of this, respect for the *guru* or the teacher was somewhat evident as some students touched the feet of the teacher when they left the class, though not everyone did so.

On the other hand, another private school GAD Academy of Art, Music and Dance – situated in South-west Delhi – is located in one of the prime markets of the area. It offered a slightly different setup in the classroom, with a smaller group of six people.[57] The *chappals* (sandals), again, were neatly left outside by everyone and the students sat on cushions kept on the floor. The teacher held a mic in front of her and was playing the notes on a keyboard, unlike the Harmonium used by many other schools. A similar style of teaching, as seen in MNZ music academy, was adopted by the teacher here as well. The class started with *alaap*, followed by the teacher asking her group of students to sing *raga Kalyan* in *Chhota Khyal* as she sang along with them repeating the lines and tunes. She reminisced about the *guru-shishya parampara* of the earlier times and found the changes in it unfortunate even though they are inevitable.[58] However, according to her, she aims to maintain as much of that tradition here as possible and has a loyal band of students who have been learning from her for a long time. This class was to end with another *Raga* and a *Bhajan*.

These examples are just two of many diverse private (and semi-private) schools that exist around Delhi-NCR. Within them, we can see numerous continuities in the teaching methods and ideologies of the past; but the new schools of contemporary India show a new phase in the *Hindustani* classical music pedagogy, making it an important site of study. From the above examples, we see the diversity among these new schools in terms of setup within the classroom, instruments and technology used, and different style of teaching in each of them. Such schools incapsulate the tension and attempts to exist between the old and the new, the inner and the outer domain, or more specifically, between what is seen as 'tradition' in *Hindustani* music and the neo-liberal age – the seriousness or rigidity in teaching of the *guru-*

---

[56] MNZ Music Academy, Indian vocal music class observation, Delhi, July 28, 2018.

[57] GAD Academy of Art, Music and Dance, Indian vocal music class observation, November 25, 2018.

[58] Mrs. Singha, interaction with the author, Delhi, November 25, 2018.

shishya parampara, and the flexibility or the student-centric approach that the neoliberal period entails.[59] Tradition becomes important in these new schools as well. This is similar to the larger Indian society, where in many ways, post-1991 neoliberalism has also brought with itself a renewed focus on tradition, albeit in a new light, and this also becomes evident in the various lifestyle choices of people (Brosius 2010; Uberoi 2008).[60] There has also been a shift from old middle-classes to the new ones, which, as Brosius (2010) and Fernandes (2006) argue, are seen as the representatives of the globalising India as well today. Therefore, it is in this context I explore the heterotopic space that the new wave of private music schools constitutes in their teaching of *Hindustani* classical music. To also understand the ideological underpinnings inherent in them, I also look at Michael Apple's notion of 'hidden curriculum' and examine it in the light of Indian classical music teaching in these new schools of contemporary India (Apple 1982; Apple and King 1977).

Certain studies have discussed in detail the different forms of music education prevalent in societies around the world, which includes formal, informal and nonformal music transmission (Schippers 2009; Veblen, 2012).[61] Whichever the form of training and institutional setup, educational institutions include hidden curriculum or extra-musical training that goes beyond just skill training and propagates the predominant structures of the society (Althusser 1971; Apple 1979). The *guru-shishya* method too included extra-musical training, either explicitly or implicitly (Neuman 1990; Silver 1984). In contemporary India, still existing older curriculum-based music schools and the new wave of music schools feature aspects of hidden curriculum that propagate predominant structures of the society (Althusser, 1971; Apple, 1979). This chapter focuses on the complexity of hidden curriculum embedded within new school systems. However, while the new music schools, that have largely been a post-1991 phenomenon, can be called a formal setup of training, they are visibly different from the older music institutions and the university departments in many ways. The new wave of private schools reflects, in a much more direct manner, both the traditional ideologies associated with *Hindustani* music tradition as well as the neoliberal

---

[59] See Davies and Bansel (2007) and Gershon (2011) on neoliberal period as well as education.

[60] In this regard, Uberoi's (2008) chapter on 'aspirational wedding' and Brosius (2010) on Akshardham Temple complex discuss the manner in which tradition and spirituality is being reinvented for the present context. Paul McCartney (2019) on Yogatopia puts forth the invocation of ideologies that yet again traces India's history and culture to the ancient Hindu past and Yoga, that represents individual well-being in present context, becomes a medium that subtly enculture people into similar, dominant (Hindu) ideology.

[61] As discussed in Chapter 1, I call the *guru-shishya* method a 'Traditional-Formal method of transmission,' differing slightly from Schippers (2009) classification that puts this method between the formal and the informal.

characteristics or values and business-like model of the post-1991 period; thus, constituting a heterotopic space.

This chapter, in section 4.1, first provides an overview of the new music schools in Delhi and Gurugram, exploring the diversity of music institutions in these cities and the changing nature of *guru-shishya parampara* in this context. Here, I will examine relevant literature on formal and informal music training in the Indian context. Importantly, I will also introduce and discuss the new music schools in my fieldwork sites of Delhi and Gurugram. Section 4.2 will then aim to answer the research questions and discuss the myriad ways in which the new, private music schools constitute heterotopic spaces (Foucault 1998) where two seemingly contrasting spaces co-exist and intertwine with each other in different ways. This section will also explore Bourdieu's (1984) concept of taste and values as well as Foucault's concept of discipline and authority (1975) in relation to the research questions. It further analyses the manner in which ideas of sacredness, heritage, and ancientness often associated with *Hindustani* classical music, interact with the secular neo-liberal domain, characterised and dominated by Bollywood and market economy in these schools.[62]

4.1 *Hindustani* music and education in India: Introducing the present-day initiatives

The music education scene in India in general and particularly in Delhi and Gurugram is extremely diverse today. Along with other formal methods of music learning in schools, *guru-shishya* as a traditional-formal method is also prominent here, given that this city is home to various performing artists who also teach one-to-one.[63] Schippers (2009), in his discussion, accounts for three different types in the category of 'formal systems of music education' in different Asian, African, and European countries. His classification includes:

1. Music teaching in mainstream schools, which acts as an introduction for students to the basic principles of music.

2. Public and private institutions to learn music without pursuing professional aspirations, irrespective of age groups. This mostly becomes an extra-curricular activity. This is the largest category.

---

[62] Here I use secular as a non-religious approach which is opposed to sacred, religious and traditional one. I do understand that India is constitutionally a secular state where state protects and ensures the rights to all its citizens irrespective of their religious backgrounds. Yet a number of scholars have discussed the complexities surrounding this term at the ground level (Tambiah 1998; Nandy 1998; Chatterjee 1998).

[63] I have discussed Schippers' (2009) and Veblen's (2012) classification of music transmission in detail in Chapter 1.

3. The conservatories of music (Schippers 2009, 91-92).

Contemporary Delhi-NCR includes the first two of these methods of music teaching and transmission. Teaching in mainstream schools is very limited in India and there is no national curriculum for music, so this does not represent an important arena for *Hindustani* music transmission at present (Pradhan 2019). Despite initial efforts to introduce music education in mainstream schools in Bombay in 1948, it was only in 2005 when the National Curriculum Framework (NCF) recognised the discouraging state of arts education, particularly Indian classical music, in these schools that saw it as a hobby (Pradhan 2019, 85).[64] NCF is published by the National Council for Educational Research and Training in India (NCERT), 'an autonomous organisation set up in 1961 by Government of India to assist and advise the Central and State Governments on policies and programmes for qualitative improvement in school education' (NCERT, n.d.). Pradhan notes that despite various suggestions by the NCF that included making arts education 'a compulsory subject' until grade 10, '…the reality is that no real headway seems to have been made in introducing music as a subject in school across the country and in putting together a music curriculum which reflects the approach of NCF' (Pradhan 2019, 86).[65] As mentioned in Chapter 3, today there are musicians and organisations today like Shubhendra and Saskia Rao foundation in Delhi are increasingly working towards devising a curriculum for mainstream schools.

Additionally, there are no conservatoires as such, solely for *Hindustani* classical music, in India. The closest is the ITC-Sangeet Research Academy in Kolkata that focuses only on teaching Indian classical music in an intensive environment, thus emulating the conservatoire model to some degree. Other *gurukuls* or residential schools, as already mentioned before, are also set up and look to be a more important locus of *Hindustani* music teaching, such as the Dhrupad Sansthan in Bhopal. Here we know that a version of the traditional *guru-shishya* method is institutionalised, given that this method is considered the essence of *Hindustani* music training. At the moment, thus, the second category of private and public schools, with a strong appeal to amateurs, are the main institutions beyond one-to-one teaching. The new schools that I focus on in my research represent a significant expansion of them. However, as I show in the later sections, not all small-scale private

---

[64] Bombay was the official name of Mumbai in Maharashtra until 1995. Since the period in question here is before 1995, I use the former name.

[65] Pradhan (2019) discusses about these further in his book 'Chasing the Raag dream.'

schools seem to have a formal, systematic method of teaching. This makes them different from many formal music institutions across India and the world.

Another distinction that fits well in the context of Delhi-NCR is that by Jayasri Banerjee, who has laid out and discussed the different types of institutionalised music training in India (1986).[66] In her work, she distinguishes between three such types:

1. The Master-disciple (*guru-shishya*) method or relationship – the traditional method.

2. Music schools with private or semi-private management

3. University music departments and (statutory) music schools/institutions (Banerjee 1986)

At the time of my fieldwork, I realised these categories remained mostly the same, even in the present context. The traditional method of *guru-shishya* manifests in different ways today: through hereditary musicians teaching their family members; by taking disciples within a *gharana*; and the institutionalised *gurukul* like ITC-SRA and the Dhrupad Institute, among others. Nevertheless, I also recognised another category of music institution enriching the cultural scene of the city of Delhi: the older (pre- and post-1947) ones that are still popular today and offer different types of degrees and certifications as already discussed. These exist independently from the university departments and yet demand respect even today, for instance Gandharva Mahavidyalaya, Triveni Kala Sangam, and Sriram Bharatiya Kala Kendra.[67]

In the context of the private or semi-private schools, as she calls it, Banerjee points out clearly that these are the kinds of schools that one can find in every little neighbourhood of a city, existing in large numbers, 'as many as 8000 such schools and colleges within the municipal area of Greater Calcutta' (1986, 20).[68] It is these private music schools that I call *new schools* or *new wave of schools*, which may have begun before 1991 yet intensified and diversified, particularly in terms of courses offered, in the post-1991 period. They include not only other Indian arts but also varied international art forms, including western art music, international instruments, and dances. Even within Indian music, they go beyond the classical

---

[66] The private music schools are not entirely a post-1991 phenomenon, given that such schools had started to emerge from 1947 through to the 1990's as Banerjee's (1986) articles shows.

[67] I have discussed some such pre- and post-1947 institutions in Chapter 3.

[68] I did not find any such scholarly work that presented the scale of such schools in Delhi, Gurugram or Patna.

and offer light classical music, Sufi music, Bhajans, and Bollywood.[69] Most of these private and semi-private schools are affiliated to older, large-scale, and well-known institutions like ABGMM, Prayag Sangeet Samiti, and Pracheen Kala Kendra for the purposes of examinations on *Hindustani* music. These new schools provide degree courses similar to the older music institutions they are affiliated to, which are different from the university departments. For instance, unlike Bachelor of Arts in Music as the first degree in a university-system, they may provide certificate for a *Prarambhik*, a one or two-year beginner's course. The advanced course on music here can be called *Sangeet Visharad*, which is a five to six-year course. What the post-1991 period has also seen is the trend of some *gharanedar* musicians and performing artists establishing private music schools, which is outside Banerjee's classification mentioned above, or at best, can be said to fall between the first two categories.

While recognising that the *guru-shishya* method of training and *gharanas* still exist, Banerjee, in her article, also pointed to the disintegration of the *gharana* system and hailed this downfall by adding that it can now pave the way for newer deliberations on more scientific methods of teaching (1986). For her, the university system can be the space where this scientific method can be forwarded even today, although the universities have fallen into unsystematic management and lowering quality in the recent past (1986). On the other hand, increasing number of scholars have emphasised the importance of this *guru-shishya* tradition time and again in general, whether in vocal music or instrumental, and stressed the importance of regular and disciplined *riyaz* or practice in order to become a serious performer (Kumari 2016; Patwardhan 2016).[70] There are recent publications from around the world with a focus on this method of teaching (Roy 2016; Schippers 2007), given that it is integral to *Hindustani* music even today. Some classical musicians, scholars, and connoisseurs in the present times complain that music institutions, particularly the private new schools I focus on, do not create performers; the reasons for which presented include a lack of good teachers available in these settings and a lack of practice on the part of students. However, the question arises then – how many students in such new, private music schools wish to

---

[69] We do not know the kind of courses the private and semi-private schools, which Banerjee (1986) discusses, offered at the time. We are not sure if all of them focussed only on Indian classical music or included other Indian and non-Indian art forms too.

[70] Kumari discusses the importance of *guru-shishya parampara* in the present times (2016). She emphasises the importance of teacher as god in the Indian tradition (2016, 17).

embrace professional careers as classical performers? Many of them may not, which is also why the new schools offer courses on other forms of Indian and international music forms.

The development of the new schools indeed showcases the commercialisation and commodification of music – a characteristic which Banerjee believes as the reason for this music's impoverishment (1986). Yet these schools also reflect the 'increasing demand for music education, even if part time, on the part of the middle-classes' (Banerjee 1986, 20). Analysing whether or not these new private schools led to music's impoverishment is beyond the scope of this research, since I aim instead to look at the reproduction of ideologies and value-systems in music teaching and learning in these settings. Nevertheless, the post-1991 period becomes a crucial time-frame wherein these new schools have become key part of *Hindustani* music education scene. They adapt to the market economy dominated by the services sector and reach out to the general populace, particularly the new (professional) middle-class, through varied means. Also, there are new schools still coming up in different localities, even today. This shows that while the phenomenon of private music schools may not exclusively be a post-1991 phenomenon; the post-1991 privatisation and liberalisation of Indian economy has intensified commercialisation and commodification through the emergence of a clear services sector, a sense of entrepreneurship, and neoliberal features like business, risk-taking, and focus on individual subjectivity.

With the ease of doing business since post-1991, a sense of entrepreneurship leads each of these schools to work towards achieving the best as compared to others in the field, in terms of offering courses on Indian music in the best and the most authentic way possible. This is also where the ideas of remaining closer to or having the essence of *guru-shishya* method are incorporated in their teaching: idea of smaller classes, affiliation to the best older schools for examinations, among other things, become important. Competition is the characteristic of neoliberal society. Indeed,

> [a] neo-liberal perspective requires interpreting social organization in terms of unequal alliances and competitions, all revolving around navigating the autonomy, interdependency, and responsibility of each (corporate) entity involved. (Gershon 2011, 542)

In many ways, these schools are more like a cultural enterprise, closer to the service sector offering cultural services and advertising the services they offer on various mediums to reach out to students of all ages (or the parents of young students). The use of technology, particularly in the form of the Internet, is immensely popular today and becomes a useful tool when advertising one's business. Websites, social networking sites, and phone directory apps

like JustDial become useful spaces for advertisement and promotion of the schools and their activities. These characteristics of many new music schools are in contrast with most of the old and predominant music schools that were registered as not-for-profit under the Societies Registration Act 1860, like Gandharva Mahavidyalaya in Mumbai, Prayag Sangeet Samiti, and Bhatkhande institute.

In contemporary India, it is also often said that opening a music school becomes, for a music admirer or musician, one of the ways in which to contribute to the field they are 'passionate about.' What we also see arising increasingly in the present scenario, therefore, is the role of virtual space or the Internet in providing advice, tips, information, and related details on opening and advertising one's own music schools.[71] Whether or not a person is a musician or a music connoisseur, the easy availability of such advice and strategies online enables any person with enough resources to start a school. One can also find business and marketing advice and a clear business model before establishing a school. Thus today, the 'business' aspect of music education is widely recognised and can be seen as emerging as an 'industry' in itself. This is indeed a marketplace of music education.[72] Such phenomena and its impact on the new, private music schools is a unique characteristic that represents post-1991 India.

Given the above context, I identify three loose categories of new, private and semi-private music schools based on my fieldwork (while acknowledging that these are not mutually exclusive and that the distinctions are not absolute):

1. *Gharana schools* – named after a particular *gharana* which is usually established by a classical musician. They focus on teaching music in their *gharanas*-specific style. For instance, the Kirana Gharana Music Academy (Kirana Gharana Music Academy, n.d.).

2. *Music schools capitalising on the global success of a celebrity classical musician* – named after a renowned musician of the past and established by his family or students further the style of that particular musician. For instance, the Pandit Bhimsen Joshi Sangeet Academy in Gurugram (Pandit Bhimsen Joshi Academy, n.d.). This is

---

[71] I came across some of the websites while looking for music and marketing on Google. Please see websites like https://www.wellnessliving.com/knowledge-sharing/marketing-strategies-music-schools-social-media/ or https://www.postcardmania.com/blog/advertising-music-lessons-get-more-new-students/ (Last accessed on 15th March 2021). Such websites are quick introductions to the marketing strategies, among other things, required to set up a music school.

[72] Please see https://loudest.in/2018/04/17/rise-of-music-education-in-india/ (Last accessed on 15th March 2021).

particularly so if this well-known artist has learnt from different *gurus* in their lifetime and are known to amalgamate two-or-more styles into their music and teaching. This is indeed capitalising on the brand that the name of this renowned musician is, and this can act as an assurance in providing quality training.

3. *General music schools* – those which do not fall under the first two categories but are largest in number (Krishna 2020).[73]

To avoid any confusions owing to certain overlaps between these types, in this chapter, I focus on the third category. Additionally, the first two types also work alongside a not-for-profit society, which also makes it slightly different from the third type. The new general music schools vary greatly even among themselves in terms of specialisation, courses offered, and the method of teaching. There are some that specialise in vocal music only, like Sangeet Stuti – The Vocal Academy in south Delhi (Sangeet Stuti, n.d.). Others, meanwhile, tend to focus on arts in general, with courses on Indian (classical) music; Western art music; Indian and western instruments; and Indian and non-Indian dance forms – examples being Pradeep Adwani institute of performing arts (PAIPA, n.d.), Arohi Music Academy (Arohi Music Academy, n.d.), among others. This a shift from the older music institutes existing today, which tend to focus solely on the teaching and learning of Indian performing arts. Furthermore, these new and private general schools have and welcome students from all age groups and occupations to learn music. They run classes almost all days of the week, at different times to cater to all sections of society. From school to college students, from homemakers to professionals, and from 4-year-olds to a 60-year-olds – anyone can learn music in these schools. This presents their openness. Additionally, evidently, it caters to the new middle-class with enough money to spend towards the fee.

Usually, the teaching and transmission of *Hindustani* music in the first two categories of the new schools are done either by the founder of the school, his/her relatives, or their past and present (senior) students whom the founder has taught mostly on a one-to-one basis or at times in a classroom setting. This can be to ensure that their own style is transmitted even in a school-setup. They can nevertheless hire outsiders for other courses like dance. The third category of general music schools are open to teachers from outside whether one has learnt via *guru-shishya* method or has a music degree from other institutions. Preference for one

---

[73] Some of the material in this chapter has been published as 'Teaching music and transmitting ideologies: The heterotopic spaces of the new schools in contemporary India' in the Finnish Journal of Music Education (Krishna 2020).

over the other again depends on the worldview of the owner of such schools. All these schools however can be said to share one thing in common today, a sense of entrepreneurship.[74]

Furthermore, although not asked explicitly about this during my fieldwork, many general new schools that I contacted, interviewed, or visited were businesses, as opposed to those registered under the societies Registration Act, 1860.[75] This act can help these musicians and music teachers to organise music festivals around in the city via government support and reach out to the under-privileged children who are not able to afford admission to these music schools. Although a few private schools like LHJ Sangeet Vidyalaya in Gurugram may be planning to register themselves under this act, they have not realised it yet.[76] Additionally, not being registered under this act also means they are not bound by its rules, which may expect them to promote *Hindustani* music for free through events or conduct charitable activities. It all depends on the school.

Before I discuss the new music schools in Delhi and Gurugram in terms of ideological structures, it is important to reiterate that hidden curriculum in any kind of institution involves teaching of norms and values dominant in a society in a subtle and tacit way (Apple 1979). Therefore, the new music schools reproduce the contradictory elements of neoliberal and traditional ideologies in different ways, as they teach Indian classical music.

4.2 Ideological structures in heterotopic spaces: The neo(liberal) music schools in Delhi and Gurugram

Educational institutions in general can become integral sites of ideological reproduction (Althusser 1971) and cultural production, where dominant ideas and tastes are reproduced (Bourdieu 1984). Although the contemporary small-scale schools are a product of a very different India than older institutions such as Bhatkhande Music institute and Gandharva Mahavidyalaya, the ideological gambit of their teaching and learning show many continuities. I found that the many beliefs and ideological structures of the past that are viewed as 'tradition', some of them associated with the reform era of the late-nineteenth and

---

[74] Nayar (2007) mentions the emergence of sense of entrepreneurship in his work when he discusses the geopolitics and globalisation in India after 1991. There has been an expanding market economy post this period.

[75] The *gharana* schools and the schools commemorating a particular musician may as well be registered under this act, although I have not explored It further as my focus was on the general private music schools.

[76] Mr. Vinay of LHJ Sangeet Vidyalaya, follow-up interview by author, Gurugram, January 30, 2020.

early-twentieth centuries, manifest in these new schools in many ways as far as *Hindustani* music is concerned. However, it cannot be denied that in the contemporary context, the new music schools also embody typical neoliberal ideological structures, which include flexibility, business-like and for-profit approach, more emphasis on music as skill, individual-centric approach, student as a customer attitude, along with an emphasis on hard work, discipline, and self-realisation (Chung and McLarney 2000; Davies and Bansel 2007; Gershon 2011; Laing and Laing, 2016). Shresthova (2011) and Morcom (2013) delved into these issues with reference to Bollywood dance and dance schools, in their respective books.

These schools are a contradictory mix of the older and newer ideologies, with the ideology of the older schools arguably more emulated than actually integrated in practice. This makes new schools a unique, heterotopic space. Going beyond the dichotomy of inner versus outer domain, the spaces of new schools also become a site of interaction between rigidity and fluidity; traditional and the neoliberal structures; and sacred v/s secular. Nevertheless, it is important to reiterate that the new music schools show diversity even among themselves in terms of courses, method of teaching, and differ from each other in terms of intensity of traditional and neoliberal approach they adopt. It is important also to reemphasise that every society and the different aspects associated with each of them have an underlying ideology and value systems attached to it. Therefore, in this section, I will discuss the myriad ways in which the new, private music schools constitute heterotopic spaces where two seemingly-contrasting spaces co-exist and intertwine with one other.

4.2.1   *Tradition in the new music schools of neo-liberal India*

An initial search through the websites of some new music schools demonstrated that these schools typically advertise in various ways the ideas *of guru-shishya parampara*, *gurukul*, devotion and spirituality as integral to their teaching methods. Schools like Arohi Music Academy emphasise on their website their efforts in maintaining the *guru-shishya parampara* through the 'pattern of one-to-one teaching in very small groups which is truly a *guru-shishya parampara* in modern times' (Arohi Music Academy, n.d.). Similarly, while promoting the professional aspirations of (potential) students, the Pradeep Adwani School of Performing Arts also addresses the idea of inculcating devotion and spirituality in their students while training them in a music or dance form, pointing out that they 'believe in the ideology of 3-D's: Duty, discipline, and devotion' (PAIPA, n.d.). However, as my fieldwork progressed, I also found that at the same time, new music schools like these have their own

specific method of teaching that involves flexibility and giving primacy to students' choices and aspirations. This is different from what the tradition of *guru-shishya parampara* espoused in terms of strict discipline, and loyalty and dedication to the *guru* as symbolised by the *ganda-bandhan* ceremony between them (Neuman 1980; Silver 1984). Importantly, however, in the trial classes I attended in the new schools during fieldwork, I found that these strict ideas of *guru* and devotion may not actually manifest themselves to a great extent in one hour of classroom teaching. Thus, it can be said that many of these schools are advertising an ideology more than a pedagogical reality.

In certain aspects, however, the idea of the sacrality of the *Hindustani* music tradition is clearly manifest in many new schools. Even today, students' deep respect for the *guru* and dedication to this music form are considered virtues of the *guru-shishya* tradition by the owners and music teachers in these schools, albeit in varying degrees. While reminiscing the *guru-shishya* of one-to-one teaching in which Mrs. Singha (the founder of GAD Academy) was trained, she feels that the *guru-shishya* method does not exist anymore; there is time limitation today, due to busy lifestyles, and no one lives with their *guru* anymore.[77] However, she feels that among the few schools that are aiming to maintain this method, her school too is attempting to do the same. Mrs. Singha teaches her students, youngsters, what she learnt from here *guru-ji* via *guru-shishya parampara*, and these students will take it forward in their own way and keep this music tradition alive.[78] In these schools, however, the tradition is being transmitted along with the neoliberal ones and the students learn both the values and ideologies simultaneously.

Exploring the classroom teaching becomes useful in understanding in detail the traditional ideologies surrounding it as well as the *Hindustani* music which is being taught. The teaching pattern in the classrooms of these new music schools follow a pattern similar, in many respects, to those in any other renowned music institutions teaching *Hindustani* classical music.[79] Within themselves, however, the new general music schools can also differ in the manner in which the teacher leads the class. For instance, in MNZ Music Academy, the classroom involves students sitting in a semi-circle with the teacher in the centre.[80] The setup is different in MHL Academy of Music where the students sit in a group in front of the

---

[77] Mrs. Singha, conversation with author, Delhi, November 25, 2018. This interaction happened alongside her ongoing vocals class.

[78] Conversation with author, November 25, 2018.

[79] Huib Schippers (2007) has discussed the teaching method in the Rotterdam conservatory.

[80] Class observation, July 28, 2018.

teacher.[81] What defines many new schools I visited during my fieldwork is the informal relationship between students and teacher during the class. However, very few students here had contact with the teacher outside the classroom.

In the learning and teaching process within the new schools,[82] the teacher took an active role at the beginning of the class with all the students repeating together after the teacher, each and every *alaap* or the *Aaroh*, *Avroh* and *Pakad* of the particular *Raga* being taught. For instance, in the MHL Academy, the teacher would also ask the students to individually repeat after him.[83] Similarly, in the GAD Academy of Art, Music and Dance, the teacher took the lead.[84] There are other times in the classroom when the students are asked to sing the entire *Raga* together as a group and, at times, one by one, with teacher's interference being minimal until the singing ends. In these new schools, however, a single class can have students who are at different levels of their training: there can be a first-year and a third-year student in the same class.[85] In such a situation, those at the same level take turns to sing (together or individually) their bit. Those not singing are either asked to write down the details of the *Raga* being taught to them, or they can listen to their fellow students in the class.

The size of the class depends on the discretion of the school and on their approach to group teaching. Many owners believe that the smaller the group is, the better. The average students in one class in these schools is 4-6, such as CRF School of Performing Arts and GAD Academy. On the other hand, the schools like MNZ Music Academy had 10-15 students in their class. It is also interesting to note that, during the classroom teaching in some new schools like GAD Academy, the students are ideally expected to gradually learn and be able to sing the entire phrases of the *raga* – including the *Aaroh*, *Avroh*, *Pakad*, *Bandish* and the *Taan* – without looking at the notation in their notebook.[86] However, non-adherence to this does not usually invite a strict punishment of any sort. This is a shift in the

---

[81] Class observation, March 2, 2020.

[82] Based on the classes observed in different new schools.

[83] Class observation, March 2, 2020.

[84] Class observation, November 25, 2018.

[85] Many schools, including CRF School of Performing Arts, would say that they attempt to divide the classes based on the same pitch and scale and, if possible, same level, though the first basis is considered primary.

[86] Before the teachers starts with a *raga* in these schools, students are usually made to write it down, which includes the *Aaroh*, *Avroh*, *Pakad*, the *Taan*s of a *raga*, along with the *bandish* and its notation. Along with this, features of the *raga* that includes its *Jaati*, *Vaadi*, *Samvadi*, *Pakad* and *Gayan Samay* are also written at the top of the notebook.

teaching of *Hindustani* music, given that in the traditional method, students lived with the teacher and rigorous *Riyaz* or practice for long hours was considered desirable (Neuman, 1990). In this method, the students could be punished for being lax (Neuman, 1990).[87] Therefore, in this aspect too, we witness a flexible approach within these new schools. Additionally, there is no uniform method of teaching, and approach to the extra-musical aspects associated with Indian classical music, between any two of the new music schools.

In the classroom or the school set-up, the unspoken idea of sacredness associated with *Hindustani* music becomes clearly manifest in leaving shoes outside the classroom, mirroring the practice of entering any other sacred place – whether a Hindu temple or a Muslim mosque or shrine. Whether or not the meaning of this is explained to the students, it is expected and done so by everyone, and counts as a subtle understanding between those using the space for learning. MHL Academy and LHJ Sangeet Vidyalaya have it written down explicitly outside their classrooms. Additionally, in schools like MNZ Music Academy in South Delhi, considerable number of students touch the feet of the teacher. We see that it is an important way in which respect to the teacher is shown in the traditional *guru-shishya and ustad-shagird* relationship and constitutes a part of the *Adab* (Silver 1984). Furthermore, it would be very easy to find a statue of goddess Saraswati, the Hindu goddess of knowledge and art, even in many such private schools. Bharat Academy in South Delhi has a painting or a statue of Goddess Saraswati in the school.[88] Therefore, the latent function or the hidden aspect[89] of music education in these schools in many cases includes making students aware of these extra-musical aspects. If they are not aware, they are generally told about it explicitly. This becomes important particularly since these schools also attract and welcome amateur learners of *Hindustani* classical music.

---

[87] The traditional method of teaching Indian classical music did not involve written notation at all.

[88] School visit, November 14, 2018. I was not able to meet anyone there as, it seemed, no classes were going on and I was told that the owner or music teacher was not available until evening.

[89] Borrowing from 'hidden curriculum' (Jackson 1968; Apple 1979).

Figure 4.1.: 'Please Keep Your Shoes Outside.' Board outside the Music room in a music Academy (Photo by author).

Rohan Krishnamurthy, in his thesis on virtual '*gurukulvasam'* in Carnatic music, for example, describes how even in the virtual method of teaching, 'traditional' values are reiterated and are considered important to maintain with students; such as 'patiently sitting on the floor cross-legged, respect for instruments beyond their status as inanimate objects and even akin to God, and a deep respect for learning and sources of knowledge, namely teachers' (2013, 212). In the new music schools, certain traditional ideologies associated music may even extend to musical genres beyond the classical. For example, Mr. Vinay at LHJ Sangeet Vidyalaya suggests that young and growing students should have the *Sanskar* or values of respecting the teacher, for instance, by touching their feet; the instruments, by taking their blessings since the instruments themselves are considered sacred; and paying respects to goddess Saraswati, whatever the style of Indian music they are learning.[90] For him, notions of music as spirituality and meditation[91] are a feature of (Indian) music teaching, irrespective of whether students are learning pure *Hindustani* music, Bollywood, or any other form of Indian music. As Morcom (2013) has also presented in the context of private dance

---

[90] Mr. Vinay of LHJ Sangeet Vidyalaya, follow-up interview by author, Gurugram, January 30, 2020.

[91] The teachers did not explicitly mention or categorise this spirituality strictly in a sense of a particular religion, whether Hindu or Muslim.

schools like Shiamak Davar's institute of performing arts, a for-profit institute, the idea of spirituality is clearly manifest even in the neoliberal period, albeit in the context of self-care and welfare.

Furthermore, depending on the choice of the owner and their worldview (which in turn also depends on the method in which they were musically trained), festivals like Saraswati Puja and Guru Purnima become important celebrations. While the former is the worship of the goddess of knowledge and art, the latter is a traditional festival celebrated in the honour of teachers. As discussed in the earlier chapters, festivals like Guru Purnima have become important celebrations in both *ustad-shagird* and *guru-shishya* method, thus presenting a syncretic aspect of *Hindustani* music tradition (Morcom 2020). In January 2020, MHL Academy organised a music performance of a classical musician for Saraswati Puja. In Guru Purnima: in schools like LHJ Sangeet Vidyalaya, the students visit the school dressed in Indian attire, to celebrate the day with their teacher and take their blessings. If they wish, the students can gift something to the teacher as well.[92] Interestingly, the dress code becomes important in certain cases like these, though it is not a strict rule otherwise for the music classes - at least in most of such schools. Though difficult to generalise, music teaching in these schools tend be dominated by the belief system reminiscent of the traditional method of Indian music education and related extra-musical aspects, despite the mass outlook and competitive, as well as business-oriented, nature of these schools.

Even today, respect for the *guru* and dedication on the part of the students are considered virtues of the *guru-shishya* tradition by some owners and/or music teachers in the new schools. This '*Guru Bhakthi*' or the devotion towards the teacher is, according to Krishnamurthy (2013), a fundamental Indian value that is manifested in many ways, even in online teaching. Nevertheless, these ideas may not come out as rigidly in the new music schools as compared to the older music institutions. Also, the new music schools in Delhi-NCR are not uniform in their adoption of traditional ideologies around Indian classical music teaching. For instance, the music teacher running MHL Academy (who learned in a *guru-shishya* style) shared with me that he is not rigid with his students about touching his feet to show their respect to him as a *guru*. Respect, for him, is when his students take him seriously by doing their *riaz*, or regular practice, at home.[93] Nevertheless, he also added that teaching the young students explicitly about touching the *guru's* feet and taking blessings of the

---

[92] Mr. Vinay, follow-up interview by author, Gurugram, January 30, 2020.

[93] Mr. Suresh of MHL Academy, follow-up interview by author, Delhi, March 2, 2020.

instruments before the class starts are important, as these actions constitute the building of their *Sanskar* (values).[94] I take Bourdieu's (1984) concept of Habitus to relate to this idea of *Sanskar* as values here. This shows that it is important to pass on the musical and general Indian values to the young students, so that it becomes a part of their long-term disposition. Krishnamurthy also adds, although in the context of Carnatic music,

> the manner in which the musical sounds are communicated, and indeed the very aesthetic nature of the sound structures, is embedded in Indian cultural practices and values. (2013, 212)

On the other hand, one of the owners of CRF School of Performing Arts, where I was briefly learning *Hindustani* classical music during my fieldwork, also exclaimed that we cannot expect the students in today's time to respect their teachers in the *guru-shishya* way – which traditionally demanded deep loyalty and dedication from the students.

During my fieldwork, I also found that the respect for the teacher, the close student-teacher relationship, and teacher's authority in the new music schools can also depend on the teacher's availability and interaction outside their classes. This is primarily via phone nowadays, where the students can share their practice recordings through messaging applications like WhatsApp.[95] Indeed, this becomes crucial, given that actual teaching timings are much reduced here and are much less like the free-flowing traditional master-disciple setting where students live with their teachers. In some schools like CRF School of Performing Arts, the strict rules of the administration do not allow the teacher to share their contact details with their students. This is something that Mr. Sunil of AGE Music School touched upon, saying that some schools do not wish to go beyond the stipulated time for the classes. However, Mr. Sunil encourages his students and their parents to share videos of their *riaz* with him, or with the other music teacher in his school, to get their feedback on the progress.[96] He mentioned to me once that as a part of the examination preparation:

> I tell my students to ask me any doubts or queries before the examination. … I tell them to call me anytime, even at 2 AM at night, they can message me, and I have no problem. They can WhatsApp me or e-mail me (with any questions).[97]

---

[94] Follow-up interview by author, March 2, 2020.

[95] Alternatively, this can also be seen as one of the services offered by these music schools as a service provider in terms of music classes in the present neoliberal society. I discuss the neoliberal aspects in the next the next subsection.

[96] It is interesting that Mr. Sunil has learnt from a *guru*, and also received a music degree from a well-established institution. He brings forth the two worldviews together.

[97] Mr. Sunil of AGE Music School, interview by author, Gurugram, November 22, 2018. Roughly translated from Hindi.

However, even if the respect for the teacher is emphasised in many such new schools, the authority of the teacher in these cases is indeed less potent when compared to the *guru-shishya* method and the older music institutions. Another very contemporary approach reflected in the above quote is the use of technology here. Technology is crucial in the competitive neoliberal society, where 'the neoliberal theory of technological change relies upon the coercive powers of competition to drive the search for new products, new production methods, and new organizational forms' (Harvey 2005, 68). Nevertheless, technology in these new schools is also useful in mapping student progress, an aspect that appeals to the masses in the contemporary competitive market.

It is also important to note here that these schools reach out to a large number of people, many of whom have no classical music background. Hence, in these heterotopic spaces, the idea of a 'true' *guru-shishya* tradition and its demands may be misunderstood today by those students who are unaware of what this tradition entails and whose primary interest is not to become a classical performer. This is particularly true of institutes or schools like the new private ones, where Indian classical music is not the only music form being taught. Discussing students' experiences on bi-musical curricula at the KM Music conservatory, Avis records one student's dissatisfaction with Carnatic music learning from a *guru*, where she finds the *guru* very demanding and like a dictator, expecting the student to 'invest so much time with so little investment on their side' (2019, 45-46). Amidst such clashes today, the new private schools must be mindful of the flexibility versus rigidity in various aspects of music training. Indeed, such characteristics of the schools show that there has been a significant shift from the *guru* as a centre of music education, to the student as the centre. Therefore, we see that the teaching and learning spaces in these schools oscillate between different value systems and ideologies.

As I conclude this section, it is important to note here that the traditional aspects related to Indian classical music become useful even today since in this commercial, neoliberal and fluid world: they become one aspect of social life that is fixed and structured.[98] A neoliberal society is often described as marked by risk and individual responsibility of all actions (Gershon 2011). As Harvey notes, '[w]hile personal and individual freedom in the marketplace is guaranteed, each individual is held responsible and accountable for his or her own actions and well-being' (2005, 65). Therefore, here, tradition becomes a constant and

---

[98] I borrow this idea from Hobsbawm and Ranger's discussion on the invention of tradition (1983). I develop this idea in detail in Chapter 5, where it becomes much more relevant in the context of music organisations in Delhi.

provides a connect to the community. Additionally, the new, professional and the 'globalised' middle-class has also become the representative of 'national identity' along with the neoliberal one in the present context (Fernandes 2006) and the tradition that defines Indian-ness may become important for these classes.

4.2.2 The 'contemporary-ness' and neoliberal ideologies of new music schools

The new music schools in Delhi-NCR, similar to their other counterparts, represent the kind of society it exists in, reflecting the dominant ideas as well as prevalent tastes. Thus, along with the ideas dominant in the discourse around *Hindustani* classical music, they also adapt to the changing times of consumer society and to myriad interests of the people. The latter is similar to any business organisation. Therefore, the new schools constitute a crucial heterotopic space. The neoliberal characteristics that I discuss here include the idea of services, business-like model, student-as-a-customer metaphor and student as a stakeholder, individual agency, and the idea of individual self-care and improvement (Chung and Mclarney 2000; Gershon 2011; Harvey 2005; Laing and Laing 2016), which have also been discussed with reference to dance schools as well (Morcom 2013; Shresthova 2011).

As we know, in the *guru-shishya* method of training, the *ta'alim* also often extended outside direct training and into the domain of actual performance, where the teacher involved his students to his performance in some way or the other (Silver, 1984). Additionally, the main test of the students involved their first public performance at the *ganda-bandhan* ceremony. Therefore, in what can be identified as traditional-formal music transmission, there is no shared curriculum or fixed structure for all the students, and no tests or grading system at the end of the year. However, as the modern music schools and institutions developed gradually, they devised and adopted different methods of testing students to ensure quality training. Gandharva Mahavidyalaya, being affiliated to ABGMM in Mumbai, conducts examinations based on the ABGMM's syllabus and timeline. The Music departments in a university setup conducts compulsory end-of-year or end-of-semester exams, with the syllabus including a specific number of *ragas* to cover every year. There is a timeframe in which to complete a particular degree, as per any university guidelines. In the university of Delhi, the music department is following the semester system as introduced by the university in 2011.[99] The new music schools, on the other hand, do not have an external

---

[99] Dean of Department of Music (at the time), University of Delhi, interview by author, Delhi, July 9, 2018.

body running them or having an influence on them, from what I gathered from my fieldwork. I did not find any visible regulatory body. The government, in any case, plays less role in a neoliberal, market and privatised society (Harvey 2005). As Gershon states, 'Government's role, instead, is to protect businesses from the exigencies or of other businesses' bad practices' (2011, 541). While the new schools are affiliated to the older ones like Prayag Sangeet Samiti, ABGMM, and Pracheen Kala Kendra among others, these affiliations do not have any control over how these new schools should function. The older schools focus on conducting examinations at their different centres and at schools affiliated to them, for those students who have filled up the form.

What differentiates the new schools from the old ones and the university departments is that the students here can choose, if they wish, to take exams via any of the old music institutes that the school is affiliated to. They can do so by filling up the examination form and paying an examination fee. This flexibility again presents the importance of student as a customer as Laing and Laing (2016) discuss. This examination fee is separate from the one charged by the school for classes. For instance, if a new school is affiliated to Prayag Sangit Samiti (hereafter PSS), the students from this particular new school can pay the PSS's examination fee and fill up the forms, which are then sent back to PSS's main centre. These examination forms are usually either made available by the owner of the school or the music teacher. However, in one respect, the metaphor of student-as-a-customer becomes problematic here. The students may not have any influence on factors like the evaluation structure or syllabus, which are decided by the old schools that the new ones are affiliated to. This aspect itself can make for a separate, detailed study. Nevertheless, we can say that examinations in the educational institutions of the modern period indeed become a means to discipline individuals and to create docile bodies by creating a hierarchy and assigning ranks and roles based on knowledge and skills (Foucault 1975). In a neoliberal framework marked by individuality, individuals have freedom, choice, and can exercise subjective agency. Yet this freedom is not absolute and is guided by the external forces and discipline through which power is exercised (Foucault 1975). In the new music schools, the students have the freedom to choose whether or not they wish to take examination; yet, being the neoliberal subjects, Indian classical music learning becomes not just an end in itself, but a means to an end for them. One can either learn it as a skill which will be helpful in the long run, or as a stress-

buster and meditative exercise. This can help increase productivity and creativity at a time when one needs to take risks to realise one's full potential in a neoliberal society.[100]

The examinations via affiliated institutions become useful for those who wish to make some sort of career in music, particularly music teaching, through music degrees and certificates from a renowned music institute. Through affiliations to a large number of small- and medium-scale private and semi-private music schools around the country, the older music institutions take a quality testing method to a larger number of people. In this manner, the new private music schools indirectly propagate the idea of skill-development to be able to make a career in music; as a music teacher, in Bollywood, bands, or reality television. These schools' pragmatic music-as-a-profession outlook in this sense, outside that of classical music performance, is another important way in which they make themselves relevant for the general populace. The ease with which these new schools can be accessed by novices and amateurs in Indian classical music in order to learn music, in comparison to older music institutions and the *guru-shishya* method, further adds to this mass relevance. This emphasis on skill presents a neoliberal character of such new schools. To quote Gerson again, '[m]anaging the self involves taking oneself to be a collection of skills or traits that can enter into alliances with other such collections' (2011, 539). Additionally, for young students (particularly school children), learning music as a hobby also becomes one of the many achievements to have, given the increased emphasis on extra-curricular activities today.

This flexibility in examinations also leads to less rigidity in classroom teaching. The curriculum and the structure to be followed for each student in the new schools are dependent on whether or not they are taking the examination: for the ones who are not, teaching and progress is more relaxed, where the student's vocal quality and progress determine the future course of their classes. Additionally, unlike the university or college system, there is no fixed 'academic year' in the new music schools. Those interested i.e. the students, can join in any time of the year and learn for as long as they like. Therefore, this fluidity makes these schools more subjective and individual-based, even though they do preserve certain traditional beliefs directly or indirectly.

Typically, in a *guru-shishya* method of training, the teacher is the judge of the student's progress and improvement, with strict analysis of the students' progress throughout. As we know from Chapter 3, the *ustads* and *gurus* have traditionally been extremely conscious of who their *shagird* or *shishya* would be and take in only those who could prove

---

[100] Gershon (2011) identifies the idea of risk-taking to prosper as integral to neoliberalism.

their devotion and loyalty to the teacher. The new music schools, on the other hand, have a more student-centric approach. They provide students with the opportunity to have a trial class with the teacher before enrolment, to see for themselves the manner in which the music is taught there. These trial classes, whether or not called so explicitly by all the schools alike, are usually free of cost. The vocal quality and the needs of the students can be discussed here, with the teacher's viewpoint often made evident instantly in the process. On the other hand, these trial classes also become an opportunity for the teachers to decide on the group that the students could be kept into, depending on their scale, pitch, level, and voice. This resonates with the idea of student as a customer in a neo-liberal framework. The vocal teacher will not refuse to teach a student in most cases however. Once I paid the fee and if they had the available slot, I could start the classes. In MNZ Music academy, in my first visit, I went to the reception and discussed the reason for my visit to the receptionist. I gathered basic information about the school from and asked if I can attend one of the trial classes to observe it. I was asked directly if I was also willing to learn and if interested, I can join one of the vocal classes after the trial class. In CRF School of Music and Dance, the trial class was largely about understanding my voice quality and to discuss how the class is conducted by the teacher.[101]

The vocal classes in these schools are usually for one hour, twice a week. Many are extremely strict with the timings. There are a few that may be slightly flexible about it; they do not mind even if the class goes beyond an hour if the next batch is free. Mr. Sunil of AGE music school in Gurugram told me that, despite the fact his students have two classes a week (1 hour each), there have been times when the parents of young (school-going) students have often waited for their children outside the class for good 20 minutes. He says,

> A student is singing well. We, too, feel like teaching and singing with them more. Our next batch is free, but still we are teaching…[102]

On the other hand, CRF School had a strict timing of classes and extra-classes were only available if the students have missed a class due to pressing reasons. Some schools may offer three classes a week and even individual classes if the student or their parents decide to take so, but they usually have higher charges. The time and day of the class does depend on the convenience of the 'customer' (the student) though, depending on the time best suited for them based on their engagements (jobs, classes, etc.).

---

[101] Trial class, September 25, 2018.

[102] Mr. Sunil, interview by author, Gurugram, November 22, 2018. Translated from Hindi.

The sacred-secular conflict in the teaching of *Hindustani* music in the new schools also manifests in adjusting the teaching according to the student-costumer's needs. Drifting from the typical content of the *bandish*es and even *raga*-based learning, it was interesting to find from Mr. Sunil of AGE music school that he adopts various new songs while teaching little 4 or 5-year-olds to make notes or *Sargam*-practice interesting to them. He adds that he even teaches Twinkle Twinkle little Star to them – an English Nursery rhyme written in 1806 by Jane Taylor (All Nursery Rhymes, n.d.). While the hereditary musicians also adapt when they teach young kids, an important question to consider is whether or not and to what extent they go beyond *Hindustani* music (and related musical exercises) to ensure the focus of these little children. This calls for another research. Therefore, this approach makes the new schools visibly different from the traditional method. Furthermore, for private schools to function effectively and ensure its smooth running, they charge a specific fee for their services. Mr. Vinay of LHJ Sangeet Vidyalaya mentioned that even though they charge less fee to economically-weaker children, they have to charge a specific amount to the students in general in order to survive in the market; to pay the rent of the property, make resources available (such as the instruments), pay salary of the staff, among other things.[103] This is particularly true, as these enterprises are not established by the government or registered under the Societies Act.[104] In any case, the state intervention is kept minimal in the neoliberal market, once it is created (Harvey 2005, 2). In the present context, even for many musicians involved in one-to-one training, 'teaching is their bread and butter,' (Morcom 2020, 9). It is no surprise, therefore, that there are musicians who also run a school with course fees, alongside the one-to-one or *guru-shishya* method of teaching. Even amidst the *guru-shishya* method, some teachers may be selective in who they charge a fee and who they do not. They may charge certain students, for instance foreign students, although the senior ones may be exempt (Morcom 2020). Nevertheless, the idea of generosity and music as possessing inalienable value plays an important role here: as mentioned in Chapter 3, the ideal of not taking any remuneration for teaching *Hindustani* music is considered important for many in the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method (Morcom 2020).

Another respect in which the new music schools are unique is that they move beyond the courses on Indian classical music. Owing to the diversification of services in such

---

[103] Mr. Vinay, follow-up interview by author, Gurugram, January 30, 2020.

[104] Follow-up interview by author, January 30, 2020. Mr. Vinay, nevertheless, was interested in registering under the act at some point owing to its benefits and that it can help him reach the underprivileged children more.

schools, many of them (irrespective of the type) not only teach Indian classical music and other Indian musical forms but also include international music forms such as piano, guitar, western vocals and even saxophone. CRF School and GAD Academy are even affiliated with institutes outside India for the purposes of exams; such as the Trinity College of Music, UK. Trinity College of Music has been conducting examinations in western art music in India since the late-nineteenth century (Marsden, 2018, 64).[105] In Mumbai, learning western music today becomes popular, especially among the upper middle-class (Marsden 2018). In the post-1991 India, there are a number of new music schools or institutions in other metropolitan cities of India as well that teach western art and popular music and conduct examinations through international boards of different kinds. Avis gives examples in the context of Chennai, particularly of Musée Musical that offers western music as well as *Hindustani* and Carnatic Music (2019, 30). Avis (2019) and Marsden (2018) have also shown, in their respective scholarly works, the increasing (ideological) dominance of western music in India in the present times among the young music learners as well as important stakeholders involved in music schools. This can be for various reasons. Marsden, in her PhD thesis on the western classical music scene in Mumbai, notes that,

> ideologies of Western classical music being a universal language and an autonomous art form were embedded within certain pro-Western classical music local discourses in Mumbai, and were at the root of many of the tensions and debates surrounding musicking in the city. (2018, 25)

This does not absolve the fact that the ideologies and values associated with western classical musicking often clashed and were incompatible with the local ones, particularly when a right-wing political party is in power (Marsden 2018). This clash is a typical characteristic of post-colonial society, similar to the contradictions presented by the existence of both universalistic and particularistic views in such a society as discussed by Chatterjee (2004). On the other hand, Avis too has provided student experiences from the KM Music conservatory, where western art music is considered structured 'and important in developing the foundational skills required of the "modern" musician,' (Avis 2019, 43).[106] This is so because, among students in KM music conservatory ''Critical engagement' and understanding are mobilised as signifiers of Western education and its suitability for a 'modern' and 'globally interconnected' world' (Avis 2019, 43). This belief system as presented by Marsden (2018)

---

[105] Western music in India goes before that, as Marsden (2018) has shown.

[106] KM Music conservatory was established in 2008 by a renowned Indian musician and composer AR Rahman. This conservatory offers a bi-musical curriculum involving western music and Indian classical music.

and Avis (2019), however, resonates yet again with the prevalent Eurocentric view which similarly defined colonial discourse in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries and which had attracted a response from the Indian reformers and nationalists. The existence of such beliefs today overlooks the adaptation of the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method to a new environment, not just in terms of technology but also in teaching styles within and outside India (Booth 1983; Roy 2016; Schippers 2007). In addition to this, not only music schools and universities, but also institutionalisation of *guru-shishya* method through ITC-SRA (that exists as a brand name even today) is a testimony to the changes in Indian classical music teaching.

Also related to this is the popularity of Bollywood music learning in many new music schools. The fact that the new schools offer Bollywood music is in stark contrast with the older music institutions like Prayag sangeet Samiti in Allahabad and Triveni Kala Sangam in Delhi, within which Indian music forms will not go beyond light classical music like *thumri* and *dadra*. At the maximum, these old institutions will include Bhajans, Sufi music, Rabindra sangeet, etc. While some music teachers and owners of the new music schools such as Monty Singh of CRF School have shared that the western music courses are more popular among youngsters and their parents (as something their child can learn), Bollywood music also becomes one of the popular choices in such schools. It is interesting to note here that Monty Singh connects the students' increased interest in Bollywood to the fact that Bollywood also incorporates western music forms. Western as well as 'Hollywood style' music has indeed impacted the Bollywood music industry as well (Morcom 2001; 2007). Mr. Suresh of MHL Academy shared with me that in the present times, more and more people want to learn Bollywood music, while pure Indian classical music is losing its importance. He continued, 'It is today's motto that we have to do Bollywood singing.'[107] He also stated that it is a bitter reality that even the parents of the young students are not interested in their children taking up Indian classical music and would often say '*Woh kaun seekta hai*?' (Who learns this today?).[108]

However, Mr. Suresh further added that whichever form of music one learns, particularly Bollywood, the base of it is classical music. Therefore, even in his Bollywood music classes, he makes his students start with the basics of the *Hindustani* music, where the practice of *Sargam* or notes in the form of *paltas* or different combination of notes becomes

---

[107] Mr. Suresh, interview by author, Delhi, November 19, 2018.

[108] Interview by author, November 19, 2018.

important to prepare the throat of the singer in such a way that they are able to sing any kind of song.[109] In LHJ Sangeet Vidyalaya , learning some of the basic *ragas* is important in order to be able to recognise the notes and become equipped to improvise or for creativity.[110] The owner-teacher at GAD Academy also shared the similar view.[111] Learning the basics of Indian classical music becomes indispensable, irrespective of the path one chooses in their endeavour to make a career in music: whether one wishes to become a playback singer in Bollywood, perform on stage, have a YouTube channel or create a band.[112] Therefore, we see here that many such, if not all, new music schools approach music training as attaining a skill in one's own leisure time. This, in a way, challenges the prevalent Eurocentric view among people, which Avis (2019) presents above, since Indian classical music training can also create a 'modern musician,' but in an Indian context rather than a western one.

In most of the new music schools, it is usually the same person teaching Indian classical music as well as other Indian vocal forms including Bollywood. Interestingly, one can also find that the classes on *Hindustani* classical music in certain new schools usually end with a Hindi film song or a Bollywood song: although, in the case of GAD Academy, it ended with a Bhajan.[113] In MNZ Music academy, Mr. Jagdeep ended his class with an old Hindi film song based on the *raga* of the day he was teaching – *Raga Malhar*.[114] Therefore, there is a clear overlap between the Indian classical music and the Bollywood music teaching. Therefore, despite Bollywood representing a very secular form of music which is also mass-centric, the ideologies that dominate *Hindustani* music also becomes evident in the Bollywood music teaching. The shoes are still left out of the classroom, for instance, and the instruments remain sacred.

In the system of *gharana*, the role of family (or *guru's* family in the case of *shishya*) becomes important not only in determining the 'taste' or accessing the cultural capital in the musical arena, but in also getting access to the social capital (Bourdieu 1984). The extra-musical aspects of learning through *guru-shishya* method is called *Adab* or 'proper behaviour by professional or aspiring musicians' (1984, 315). This also relates to the building of the

---

[109] Mr. Suresh, interview by author, Delhi, November 19, 2018.

[110] Mr. Vinay, interview by author, Gurugram, November 19, 2018.

[111] Mr. Kuldeep, owner and music teacher at GAD Academy, interview by author, Delhi, November 12, 2018.

[112] Playback singing involves recording a song beforehand in a studio by playback singers, which the actors lip-sync to during shooting/filming (Booth 2008; Morcom 2007).

[113] Class observation, November 25, 2018.

[114] Class Observation, July 28, 2018.

Sanskar, values or cultivated taste, that is crucial for the musicians and also often associated with serious music aficionados. The students and aspiring performers become acquainted with the ways of the musical world until it becomes their 'habitus', i.e. a part of their everyday lives unconsciously (Bourdieu 1984). Many of these behaviours and activities embedded in the *guru-shishya* and *ustad-shagird* method may not be reproduced entirely by the older music institutions, but the idea of sacred music and the primacy of the *guru* is aimed to be replicated.

Things, however, become even more complex in the new music schools. Many new waves of music schools indeed appreciate and hold in high regard the values, traditions, and *guru-shishya parampara* associated with *Hindustani* music. However, the rules associated with the *guru-shishya* relationship and beliefs of the reform era come out much less rigidly in the new music schools. One of the primary reasons for this is that these schools attract students and music learners from different social and cultural background in great number; they may or may not constitute serious music learners, aware of Indian classical music. The students – who can be of different age, profession, and social background – can have different reasons for learning music. The younger students may wish to learn it as a skill or extra-curricular, whilst homemakers and middle-aged or young professionals may learn it as a '*Shauk*' or hobby. Therefore, while these schools may encourage certain practices to build up the *Sanskar* or extra-musical values, particularly for younger pupils, it may not be their primary goal in most cases. What these schools, however, may indirectly do to a great extent is to create *Sanskar* as a cultivated taste, i.e. create interest towards Indian classical music among amateurs with no prior background of this music form. Indeed, there are music teachers like Mr. Vinay of LHJ Sangeet Vidyalaya who find it important to preserve the essence of *Hindustani* music and Indian performing arts; respect for the *guru* and the instruments is a part of this.[115] Yet, given the flexible nature of the school, it is difficult to gauge how many of them incorporate these in the personal lives and to what extent. Additionally, the students do not have more than two classes per week of an hour each – with a gap of one week until their next class and the possibility of comparatively less musical exposure in between. Unless one has a such background at home (in the form of values/taste in the form of *Sanskar*) already to make up for that week's gap, the extra-musical musical aspects of music learning will have less impact on the students in the new schools.

---

[115] Mr. Vinay, follow-up interview by author, Gurugram, January 30, 2020.

The contemporary characteristic of the new schools becomes increasingly evident in its emphasis on individual self-care through the ideas of productivity, meditation and concentration. As Anna Morcom points out in the context of Bollywood dance revolution and institutionalisation: even in the private institutions like Shiamak Davar's institute of performing arts, which is a business-based establishment, the new Bollywood dance is 'imbued with a sense of spirituality and higher purpose' (2013, 123). Morcom further adds that,

> …with the Bollywood institutions, spirituality tends to be woven with the idea of personal development and mental and physical health, so rather than a strict Hindu (or Sufi) devotional ideology, as in classical performing arts, there is also a global and even new age philosophy. (2013, 123)

This embourgeoisement of the Indian performing arts and the idea of spirituality see some sort of parallel in the private music schools. Nevertheless, it is important to note that the music schools I look at are not purely for Bollywood music. Here, *Hindustani* music classes in some schools, which often overlaps with the Bollywood ones as discussed above, approach this music form as spiritual in traditional Hindu or Sufi sense. Nevertheless, many schools also look at this music as impacting mental and physical health in a positive way.

I would often hear from the music teachers during my fieldwork that learning Indian classical music in particular improves concentration, productivity, and helps young students with their studies, given its meditative capacity.[116] Not only that: this music genre is believed to bring positive changes in people's life in general. As Mr. Kuldeep of GAD Academy mentions, it becomes important to convince people of the pros and cons of learning Indian classical music.[117] One of the pros is that it can help young students to increase their productivity, which in turn can be useful in their studies. He also gave an example of student who was not doing well in studies and how learning music helped him improve. When asked about the ways in which we can take this music to the masses, particularly the younger generation, Mr. Sunil of AGE music school told me that one of the main reasons one should learn Indian classical music is that it is a stressbuster, a medicine, and a therapy. Mr. Sunil provides an example of the super-busy lives that people lead today, telling of a person working in a corporate sector where he is always busy on his laptop. Here, only one hour of

---

[116] Besides seeing these on the websites of many of these new private schools.

[117] Mr. Kuldeep, interview by author, Delhi, November 12, 2018.

playing guitar and/or singing properly (with all the rules) can destress the person through the melodic sound of music.[118] He also adds that

> *...hum log, joh youngsters hain, unke liye hum teachers hi nahi, ek therapist hain. Kyunki unki stress ko hum kum kar rahe hain* (We are not only teachers for the youngsters, we are a therapist. Because we are helping them de-stress).[119]

It is indeed a very contemporary, neoliberal and twenty-first century focus on the subjective, self-care, mental-wellbeing, and overall personal development of individuals (Morcom 2013; Shresthova 2011).

The new, private (small and medium-scale) music schools, as we have seen, constitute an ideologically-flexible and a heterotopic space. The seemingly-contradictory ideological structures, the traditional and the neo-liberal, co-exist in such spaces in many ways. Nevertheless, there are music schools that aim to advertise the idea of *gurukul* and *guru-shishya parampara*, along with a variety of other typically post-reform traditional concepts, as a crucial characteristic of their pedagogy and ethos that sets them apart from other schools. Even when it is said that learning from a *guru* is the best of learning even today, it is rarely in a traditional '*gurukul*' system since, particularly in a city like Delhi and NCR, the *shishya* do not live with the *guru* in many cases but learn from them a couple of days in a week for a few hours. Yet schools like GAD Academy of art, music and dance claim to maintain the essence of it through a personal relationship with the students and having a small class to give as much attention to all the students present during the class as possible.[120] There are other schools like TAR school in Gurugram, which cites music as a means to 'spiritual happiness.' However, in the classroom setting where the actual teaching takes place, this traditional method of teaching and learning may not manifest in its entirety but remains an ideal or exists in traces. Additionally, the new music schools offer immense flexibility to the students in terms of examinations, with the option of pursuing music only as a hobby rather than a skill. The traditional *guru-shishya* (or *ustad-shagird*) relationship, on the other hand, means a complete devotion and utmost loyalty towards the *guru*, where the latter determines the time and path of the students' training and is the judge of their progress.

On the other hand, the values or *sanskar* associated with *Hindustani* classical music become important in these schools and manifest variously (through festivals, music instruments and classroom as sacred, among others), particularly for the children. Yet, in

---

[118] Mr. Sunil, interview by author, Gurugram, November 22, 2018.

[119] Interview by author, November 22, 2018.

[120] Mrs. Singha, interaction with author, Delhi, November 25, 2018.

general, it is not forced upon to the students and the students' agency is recognised. The rules associated with the *guru-shishya* and the *gharana* method of teaching or the traditional (particularly the reformist era) beliefs do not come out as rigidly in these new music schools as compared to the older music institutions, though the old ideologies and values are still mentioned and given weight. Therefore, the student-centric approach of these schools finds similarity in the student as a customer metaphor (Laing and Laing 2016).

As I conclude, I also recognise that the new music schools are extremely diverse and are abundant around the country beyond my field sites as well. They may display school-specific and region-specific characteristics, which I could not cover given the enormity.

Chapter 5: Organisations, Tradition, and Music Education Reinterpreted with a Special Focus on SPIC MACAY

Indian classical music education in India today usually takes place in classroom settings or by the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method. In this chapter, I argue that there are currently music organisations that, in addition to being promoters of Indian classical music, provide important alternative spaces for music education. Focusing on Delhi and Gurugram, the organisations I discuss in this chapter are involved in a kind of education that cannot be categorised as formal, informal, or nonformal methods of music education that scholars have described (Carruthers 2008; Folkestad 2006; Pitts 2003; Schippers 2009; Veblen 2012). It is also important to note that studies of music education have primarily focussed on singing and instrumental instruction or learning through participation in music-making. In this chapter, I explore societies that do not teach people to perform. Rather, I argue that they are involved in one of two other kinds of music education: *volunteer or citizen-based participatory music education* and *public engagement-based education* Within public engagement-based music education, there are also societies that are simultaneously involved in the traditional-formal method of music education. All the initiatives of organisations under these new categories are generally open to the general public. I examine the first category of the citizen-based approach through the large and influential organisation called the Society for the Promotion of Indian Classical Music and Culture Amongst the Youth (SPIC MACAY).[121] For the second category of public engagement-based education, I focus briefly on the monthly sessions of Gunijan Sabha that the Ustad Immamuddin Khan Dagar Music, Art, and Culture Society organises in Delhi. I also provide a brief overview of important organisations operating in Delhi and involved in such a public engagement-based music education. It is important to note that this category also includes two societies – Sangeetam and the Amir Khusro Institute of the Delhi gharana – that engage in the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method of direct music education but also organise events such as concerts and workshops.

In many ways, we can compare music organisations and schools today with those of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries when societies and schools were emerging at a regional and national level (Rosse 2010). Establishing music academies was key at the time to developing a systematic and scientific method of teaching *Hindustani* music. However, the manner in which the music organisations I examine in this chapter engage in music education

---

[121] In this chapter, I anonymise the names of young student volunteers in SPIC MACAY.

today is much more diverse. These organisations host a myriad of interactions between practitioners/musicians, academics, and the lay audience. I also found two societies that are engaged with the *guru-shishya* and *ustad-shagird* method of teaching, which is different from the pre-1947societies in general. In addition, these organisations today look for innovative ways to reach out to different classes, particularly the new professional class, and age-groups through various initiatives. At the same time, they, registered under the Societies Registration Act 1860, also differ from the new for-profit schools I discuss in Chapter 4.

These organisations are crucial spaces for creating awareness of Indian classical music and dance traditions and educating people about them. They also inform the general public about extra-musical aspects of these traditions, such as the different ideologies, beliefs, symbols, and values associated with them. While their activities consist of organising concerts, talks, workshops, and engaging volunteers, particularly youngsters, there is also a hidden curriculum of ideological values, to use the concept introduced by Jackson (1968) and furthered by Apple (1979).[122] These organisations are also an important site for studying the complexities of Indian society, where dominant ideologies can be broadly propagated while at the same time, music lovers gather for different personal reasons.

A study of such complexities within these societies is important since it provides a lens to explore the broader contradictions in India post-1991, particularly in terms of tensions between neoliberal and traditional values. The market economy, increasing notions of individual freedom and responsibility, and a new middle-class characterised by conspicuous consumption, has dominated post-1991 India (Brosius 2010; Fernandes 2006; Uberoi 2008; Veblen 1957). There has also been a renewed dependency on tradition that is redefined and viewed through a fresh lens by these new middle-classes (Brosius 2010; Fernandes 2006; Kapur 2009; Oza 2006; Uberoi 2008). Neoliberalism, as contradictory as it may seem, is combined with strong notions tradition in this period, and the new middle-classes today are viewed as representatives of global India as well as of Indian tradition.

In this chapter, I explore how music organisations and societies are part of this heterotopic space, as they promote *Hindustani* music and educate, in a broad sense of the word, the Indian public. I ask in what way do these not-for-profit organisations reflect the complexities of Indian classical music as well as the larger Indian society of the present-day, at a time increasingly dominated by the market economy? I also seek to understand how the

---

[122] When I say extra-musical or traditional values, it often includes those of the reform period but is not restricted to that only.

functioning of these organisations both produces and disrupts conservative and hegemonic ideas of tradition regarding this music tradition and Indian society in general.

In addition, I examine the ideological structures and ethos that define these organisations. How do they define heritage in post-1991, neoliberal India? How do the traditional ideologies associated with *Hindustani* music, notably those honed during the reform process of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries, manifest in the activities of these organisations today? In what way do these organisations make *Hindustani* music relevant in the present context? How do the ideological complexities and contradictions manifest in and influence their everyday functioning? Through this, I explore ways in which these organisations create a musical citizen in the cultural space of contemporary Delhi-NCR. Before turning to the music organisations, I will discuss the idea of musical citizenship and how it helps us understand the social and ideological operation of the music organisations.

5.1 Music Organisations, Education, and Music Citizenship in India: *Hindustani* Music as a Site of Negotiation

Various scholars have sought to define citizenship, with many emphasising that social and cultural differences are as important as political and economic considerations.[123] Toby Miller has identified 'three zones of citizenship, with partially overlapping but also distinct historicities,' including: political citizenship encompassing 'the right to reside and vote'; economic citizenship or 'the right to work and prosper'; and cultural citizenship reflected in 'the right to know and speak' (2006, 35). Scholars have also defined culture and cultural citizenship in further detail. Miller argues that it 'concerns the maintenance and development of cultural lineage through education, custom, language, and religion and the positive acknowledgment of difference in and by the mainstream' (2001, 2). Beaman points out that it 'is a claim for full societal inclusion, despite one's difference from others' (2016, 853). However, Nick Stevenson notes:

> Cultural understandings of citizenship are not only concerned with 'formal' processes, such as who is entitled to vote and the maintenance of an active civil society, but crucially with whose cultural practices are disrespected, marginalised, stereotyped and rendered invisible. (2010, 276)

---

[123] Social citizenship and cultural citizenship have also been distinguished. Other types of citizenship (e.g. sexual and ecological) have also been recognised for a society to be inclusive of all identities irrespective of culture, social status, sexuality, among others. See Isin and Turner (2002).

As these scholars attempt to theorise citizenship, they identify that recognition of individual and cultural differences is an important aspect of a multicultural democracy. Citizenship, as Beaman notes, 'is not only solely based on laws but also on socially agreed-upon norms, practices, meanings, and identities' and considering the relationship between citizen and marginalisation, it applies 'differently to different populations,' (2016, 851). Christian Joppke (2002) and Beaman (2016) have recognised multicultural citizenship that overlaps with the cultural aspects of a society and emphasises the existence of a plural democratic society in which individuals are free to practice their cultural and religious practice.

While the concept of music citizenship is still developing, some writers have looked at music in the cultural life of a community through the lens of cultural citizenship. As Stevenson notes, 'issues of exclusion and inclusion are at the heart of cultural citizenship' (2003, 334), similar to the notion of citizenship in general. In other words, it works by defining the 'other' in relation to those who are part of the nation. Rhian Jones explains that music 'can play a significant part in the consolidation of individual and collective identity, including aspects of subcultural, class and national consciousness' (2018, 50-51). In the context of Indian classical music, the pan-India initiatives towards its classicisation, institutionalisation, and systematisation in late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries aimed to define a national music largely according to middle-class and upper-caste values. This process resulted in the marginalisation of hereditary musicians, especially courtesans, who the Hindu middle-class elites considered, consciously or unconsciously, as the 'other.' It was thus these urban intelligentsia who defined the collective identity. In this context, we can say that amidst the rise of cultural (Hindu) nationalism in the early-twentieth century, the broad discourse around Indian classical music defined a music citizen according to the aesthetics and ideologies of the elite, English-educated middle-classes, who were mostly high-caste Hindus.

We also know that musical modernity in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries was not always and entirely defined in terms of religion. As Niranjana has discussed in the context of *Hindustani* music in nineteenth-twentieth century Bombay, musicophiliacs provided an alternative through which a 'modern subject' or a 'metropolitan unconscious' was defined, which went beyond socio-religious differences. This was a new avenue for the continuity of *Hindustani* music (2020, 10-11). Kobayashi (2003) has similarly argued that there were upper-caste middle-class Hindus who held their Muslim *ustad* in fondness and esteem despite the existence of music reform ideas that gradually marginalised Muslim musicians and their contribution. These scholarly works display a sense of agency on

the part of musicians and music lovers to, if not subvert, perhaps evade the dominant ideology in some way in the everyday socio-musical interactions, even though they do not completely discard it. In this sense, we can see the creation of heterotopic spaces, or rather, paratopic spaces, or spaces of alterity, that exist alongside dominant values but also challenge them (Banerji 2019, 22). Therefore, the musicophiliacs, whether keen amateur listeners or musically well-informed *rasikas* (connoisseurs), and musicians, constitute a kind of music citizen. This concept of citizen was comparatively more inclusive and multicultural than that represented by the dominant discourse.

In this chapter, I explore how present-day music societies and organisations embrace this idea of exclusivity reminiscent of the dominant discourse of the music reform period, as well as inclusivity reflected in the everyday socio-musical interactions since the late-nineteenth century. Additionally, in contemporary society, the musical citizen has to navigate not only tradition and syncretism, but also neoliberal Indian society as characterised by a vastly expanded middle-class, conspicuous consumption, commercialism, and the competitive market economy.

In the context of music, Niranjana's (2020) and Kobayashi's (2003) research shows the possibility of complexities on the ground versus homogeneity at the overarching ideological level in the reform and post-1947 period. However, these scholars, among others, do not discuss such developments in relation to music citizenship (Kobayashi 2003, Niranjana 2020). The study of musical citizenship, particularly pertaining to the new kind of music education in which music organisations engage, is important since it enables us to understand developments on the ground in *Hindustani* music in a better manner. This is crucial to exploring the way in which the concept of exclusion and inclusion within *Hindustani* music, and in Indian society in general, manifests amidst the socio-political and economic developments of the twenty-first century.

In this chapter, I look at how the different organisations draw in and educate a range of existing or potential musical citizens, from artists, performers, and teachers to audiences, learners, and volunteers, or some combinations thereof, through various concerts and activities. Thus, I look more in terms of the everyday lived and heterogenous presence of the overarching, conservative ideologies. I argue that these dominant ideologies from the reform period, representing a Hinduisation of Indian classical music, exist alongside more syncretic or secular views as well as the many new strands interpreting tradition alongside pragmatism and business in the neoliberal era today.

While in some respects, the traditional and conservative ideologies are dominant, they are not the only values or ideologies at play here. People come together in different contexts, such as at concerts, in societies or organisations, or in the teaching space of a *guru* or *ustad*, to some extent irrespective of their religious affiliations and with different motivations. These motivations may be an interest in performing, in socialising, in wanting to become more responsible and cultured, or to gain experience and skills from volunteering. Yet one still finds certain ideals propagated by reformers of the past in the broad discourse or musical language today, such as the concepts of *guru-shishya parampara*, the *gurukul*, and the (Hindu) sacredness of music. These ideas have been both amplified and diluted in the post-1991 period as other ideologies and imperatives have come into play. As discussed in Chapter 4, in the new, small- and medium-scale private schools in Delhi, dominant ideologies are dislodged in many ways at the same time as the maintaining of certain traditional ideals is emphasised. Hence, these dominant ideologies are hardly a pedagogical reality. This chapter explores whether music organisations today are operating in comparable ways ideologically and how far they ensure inclusivity.

There is great complexity in the co-existence of different ideologies and beliefs systems among the music lovers or musicophiliacs of today, which we can see from a more ground-up exploration of musical citizenship than from a sole focus on overarching ideologies. Contemporary classical music has been seen little in such terms. Robert Morris (2004) is one of the only scholars who discusses such issues in the context of *Carnatic* (*Karnatak*) music. He identifies *rasika*s as music citizens, similar to those Niranjana (2020) categorises as musicophiliacs. Morris points out that 'each musical citizen, professional musician or not, has internalized aspects of the entire tradition and passes it on as one interacts with others, sings or plays instruments, and teaches and learns' (2004, 79). The *rasika*s too have to be 'aware of all the features and details of Karnatak music' (Morris 2004, 79). Particularly the performers, whether vocalists or instrumentalists, need to be familiar with all aspects of the performance (Morris 2004, 83). However, the participants, volunteers, and audiences of the initiatives of current music organisations that I examine in this chapter are, in many cases, amateurs and may not be as knowledgeable as a typical *rasika*. In this way, my exploration of musical citizenship, music education, and *Hindustani* music looks beyond performers and connoisseurs, and traditional or modern forms of learning music as performance.

Laura Leante has observed that concerts of *Hindustani* music often reflect the status of audiences in terms of how they are seated, with the music connoisseurs and other musicians

sitting closer to the stage as they are those 'who are more likely to display their appreciation of the concert through gestures, verbal interjections, or by following the rhythmic cycle' (2017, 36). Such performances, organised by various societies and organisations, are nevertheless open to audiences at different levels of musical and technical knowledge. This creates a space in which interest in music can be generated among novices as well, giving rise to a new kind of music citizen. My focus, therefore, is on the organisations that make such listening practices possible.

I argue that music societies or organisations, particularly SPIC MACAY with its vast reach, aim to create a music citizen by developing their interest in and knowledge about music, and by exposing them to music and performances. Through diverse initiatives, such organisations and movements aim to get young people, who have not yet been exposed to Indian classical music, close to the performers and the *ustad*s/*guru*s. In doing so, they propagate traditional (including reform as well as syncretic) ideologies alongside the contemporary, neoliberal ones. Furthermore, people with different motivations and value systems join these initiatives. Additionally, the artists, volunteers, and audiences involved in the varied initiatives of these organisations come and go, and also attend events organised by other societies and institutions around the city. Therefore, the ideological impact of a single organisation on the participants may or may not be particularly strong when compared to older music institutions in India, such as Gandharva Mahavidyalaya and Bhatkhande College, in which students learn music for a prolonged period. I would also add that different organisations promoting *Hindustani* music do not define their ethos in exactly same manner, with ideological structures varying to some degree, as well as incorporating familiar tropes.

Importantly, I explore these complexities and the idea of music citizenship through a new kind of music education employed by diverse music organisations. I introduce primarily two kinds of non-school-based music education: *public engagement-based music education* and *volunteer or citizen-based participatory music education*. In *public engagement-based music education*, unlike the classroom session or the *guru-shishya* tradition, the audience, participants, or learners do not have to pay or enrol themselves with a long-time commitment. The activities arranged by organisations within this category include concerts of *Hindustani* music, related seminars, conferences, and interactive sessions, all aimed to reach a larger audience. These organisations do not teach people to make them performers or teachers of Indian classical music but instead work towards creating awareness among the general public. However, some seminars and workshops also appeal to, and are useful for, performers

and music students seeking to hone their musicianship. Some organisations also create performance opportunities for artists, particularly young artists, and a space for research.

This kind of education is mass-centric, aiming at those without prior knowledge of Indian classical music who can both learn about it and enjoy it. There are also two societies I found in Delhi that directly engage in *Hindustani* music education either through the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method or via schools and are also involved alongside in public-engagement based education. Those involved in the *guru-shishya* method are different from their counterparts in the pre-1947 period, which were primarily involved in establishing music schools for systematic music education and often looked down on the *gharana* system as secretive and undemocratic. Such societies today can also be categorised as the public engagement-based education, since they organise a number of events around the year either for their students, for the general populace, or for both.

The second type of non-school music education, and the one central to the chapter, is *volunteer or citizen-based participatory music education*, which I explore through a renowned movement and voluntary organisation, SPIC MACAY. This organisation requires a separate category given that, in the present-day, it is already a pan-India phenomenon that attracts volunteers from across the country and abroad. SPIC MACAY has also employed certain initiatives that are unique to this organisation. While discussing these two types of non-school-based music education in this chapter, I draw extensively from interviews as well as participant and non-participant observations conducted as a part of my fieldwork, as well as from the information available on the websites of organisations.

5.2 Promoting music and Repurposing Tradition in Neoliberal India: SPIC MACAY as Volunteer-Based Participatory Education

As volunteer or citizen-based participatory music education, SPIC MACAY is a prime example of youth engagement in Delhi. With its vast reach around the country, this organisation is as much an important player in the Indian classical music scene in India today as major older institutions such as Gandharva Mahavidyalaya in Mumbai and the Bhatkhande Institute in Lucknow. Professor Emeritus Dr. Kiran Seth founded SPIC MACAY in 1977 in the Indian Institute of Technology Delhi (IIT-D) (SPIC MACAY, n.d). SPIC MACAY is often referred to not as an organisation or a society but as a voluntary movement, primarily

(or solely) depending on volunteers.[124] While anyone of any age and occupation can join, it mainly aims to attract youngsters and college-goers as volunteers; this is crucial since SPIC MACAY works to promote Indian music and culture among the youth. In Delhi, SPIC MACAY generally attracts volunteers from a broad middle-class rather than elite levels of society, such as students, teachers, professors, homemakers, corporate professionals, bureaucrats, with specific (though not explicit) focus on the leisure time of the volunteers.[125]

This movement is supported through various means. SPIC MACAY is a registered society under the Societies Act and 'the donations to it are tax exempted under Section 80 (G) of the Income Tax Act, 1961' (Pradhan 2019, 107). It gets direct financial support from the state as well, most notably, from the Ministry of Culture and Ministry of Youth Affairs & Sports (SPIC MACAY Supporters, n.d.). There are also corporate and individual sponsors and donors. In addition, SPIC MACAY has continuously received support from institutions such as the Indian Institute of Technologies around the country, through hosting concerts and conventions.[126]

The SPIC MACAY movement started in the pre-1991 period but has expanded greatly since then, while still operating with Delhi as its headquarters. Over the years, it has established itself nationally and internationally with different Indian cities having their own local chapters, sub-chapters, and office-bearers (Pradhan 2019). Musician-scholar Aneesh Pradhan notes that the 'Delhi-based Central State Facilitators links the centre with local chapters' (2019, 108). This 'has ensured that the organization has a mechanism to host concerts across the country provided the finances are in place' (Pradhan, 108). Each chapter conducts weekly meetings, with the Delhi meeting taking place every Saturday at the time of my fieldwork. Although not exactly a hierarchy, one can see a power dynamic within this movement/organisation in relation to organising events: the founder is at the top, followed by the senior volunteers (retired or working professionals) working closely with the founder, regular student volunteers who have been working with the movement for around six months or more uninterrupted, and new volunteers. Furthermore, the young volunteers often coordinate SPIC MACAY activities in their respective colleges (and even schools) with the help of the senior (older) volunteers, if needed.

---

[124] SPIC MACAY senior volunteer, interview by author, Delhi, July 17, 2017.

[125] Interview by author, July 17, 2017.

[126] Interview by author, July 17, 2017.

As a movement reaching out to the young school and college-goers, SPIC MACAY organises a variety of events, workshops, lecture-demonstrations, conventions, and other one-of-a-kind initiatives. They have *modules* that cover different art forms: *Hindustani* music, *Carnatic* music, Indian classical dances, and other Indian arts such as folk arts and crafts, theatre, talks, and heritage walks.[127] All of these are included in activities that, according to their website, are of 'numerous formats' and operate 'either as stand-alone events or as longer series of events' (SPIC MACAY Activities, n.d.). It is primarily the Virasat series, which is an annual event organised in educational institutions around India, that includes modules on the above-mentioned Indian art forms.[128] This series can be an event that lasts anything from one to eighteen days, including *intensives* and multiple-day workshops on Indian classical performing arts, yoga, cinema screening, heritage walks, and other above-mentioned activities.[129] It is important to note that this movement also reaches out to the schools and children in rural areas through its Rural School Intensives, which is out of scope of this study but constitutes an important phenomenon. The vast scale of activities and places SPIC MACAY aims to reach, therefore, makes this movement truly mass-centric. This is unlike the classicisation process at the pan-India level that Bhatkhande and Paluskar spearheaded, which they deemed democratisation of music but was largely middle-class and upper-caste centric.

Interestingly, I found that while the activities this movement organised showcase diversity in art forms, most of the events include Indian classical performing arts. Even the Virasat series usually has at least one module on Indian classical music and one on dance. For instance, as per the annual activity chart of SPIC MACAY for the year 2017-2018, approximately 72% of the recorded events/activities involved Indian classical music (including flute and *Hindustani* cello) and dance forms. For the year 2015-2016, it was approximately 73%.[130] Among Indian performing arts, Indian classical music was around

---

[127] There are modules on world heritage as well.

[128] In one of the meetings, I found that SPIC MACAY encouraged schools and colleges to organise at least a heritage walk or cinema screenings that are free of cost, if they do not have funds to conduct full, multiple-day Virasat series or conventions. Every year, SPIC MACAY aims to invite and organise a meeting of different schools and colleges in (and, if possible, outside) Delhi in order to encourage them to host SPIC MACAY events and activities.

[129] *Intensives* includes modules of a particular art form in which registered participants can learn directly from the *gurus* or *ustads* in different arts. Registration is free.

[130] These statistics are from the events that are recorded; this movement organises many more activities that may go unrecorded, both within colleges and schools (primarily for students) or outside them (for a general audience).

53% in the year 2017-2018. In this context, therefore, it becomes crucial to consider what kind of musical citizen SPIC MACAY's initiatives intend to create, particularly among young people, in the contemporary metropolitan Delhi. I argue that this movement may, intentionally or not, promote certain ideologies or values that we associate with the period of music reform and cultural (Hindu) nationalism of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries, but there are also other strands, some of which are disruptive either broadly at the organisational level or at the ground level.

5.2.1   *Repurposing Tradition in the Post-1991 India*

A number of scholars have demonstrated that in the post-1991 India, neoliberal values, material life, wealth, and consumption-based living can co-exist with the traditional and the inner domain of spirituality that is often subtly defined in a Hindu way to this day (Brosius 2010; Fernandes 2006; Kapur 2009). As global citizens, the new middle-class of India view tradition in their everyday lives in a new manner that is compatible with a consumption-based lifestyle (Brosius 2010, Uberoi 2008). On the other hand, in the context of music and training through online methods (a fairly recent phenomenon among *gurus/ustads*), Krishnamurthy has noted,

> Although online lessons focus on the transmission of specialized sounds and sound structures from teacher to student, the manner in which the musical sounds are communicated, and indeed the very aesthetic nature of the sound structures, is embedded in Indian cultural practices and values. (2013, 211)

Even within the promotion and transmission of Indian classical music in contemporary times along with other non-mainstream art forms, SPIC MACAY emphasises certain traditional ideas in different ways. As mentioned in chapter 3, the term *guru-shishya parampara* has gained predominance in the dominant discourse around *Hindustani* music tradition since the reform period. It is evident that this term is commonly used even today in the interaction among many musicians, music activists, and connoisseurs, which was evident in my fieldwork as well. One way by which SPIC MACAY promotes the idea of *gurukul* and the *guru-shishya* method, albeit symbolically, is through the Gurukul Anubhav scholarship scheme (hereafter, Gurukul scheme), which is a flagship program of SPIC MACAY for the youngsters between 15 and 26 years of age.[131]

---

[131] Weekly meeting, July 21, 2018.

The symbolic manner of using these terms finds similarity with the new schools discussed in Chapter 4 that borrow the term *guru-shishya parampara* and mention preserving it, but in practice operate with a very different setting of classroom teaching. SPIC MACAY, however, goes a step further by providing youngsters with a one-month experience, through the *Gurukul* scheme, of this traditional method of learning and its ethos. The SPIC MACAY website too states that this scheme started 'to enable students to have a glimpse into the age-old guru-shishya tradition' (SPIC MACAY Gurukul Scheme, n.d.). The name of the scheme itself suggests the ancient Indian method of teaching and learning, the *gurukul,* a term which gained significance particularly in the 1970s with the establishment of institutionalised *gurukul*s. This scheme is not only open to the volunteers but also to the general populace within this age bracket. SPIC MACAY invites applications to it every year to provide students with the opportunity to spend a month with an expert of a particular field in various areas even beyond Indian classical music and dance. After undergoing competitive selection process, the candidates are sent to stay with these experts during the summer. For those (particularly volunteers) who have been a part of this scheme, this kind of education often becomes a life-changing experience.[132]

The Gurukul scheme includes host of art forms, activities, and fields that students can choose to apply for. These include Indian classical music, Indian classical dance forms, spirituality, Yoga and Social work. An expert of each of these areas are involved with this scheme as a *guru*. There was only one student volunteer who spoke of his experience of this scheme in one of the weekly meetings, but he went to stay in the monastery of His Holiness the Dalai Lama for spirituality, rather than any *guru* or *ustad* of *Hindustani* music for music. Yet he shared that for him, this experience had a deep impact. As indicated by the founder and other volunteers in the weekly meetings, initiatives like these expose the young people to the lifestyle of the *guru*. This was emphasised in multiple weekly meetings. The SPIC MACAY website also states that this scheme aims 'to expose school and college students to a way of life with people who have dedicated their lives to the pursuit of their work with single-minded devotion' (SPIC MACAY Gurukul Scheme, n.d.). Indeed, such an experience of Indian classical music for a month at a young age can impact a student in many ways. It may even encourage them to further cultivate their talent in that particular Indian art form once the month-long experience with a *guru* is over. This continuation may consist of

---

[132] The selection process and details on this scheme are available on the SPIC MACAY website (SPIC MACAY Gurukul Scheme, n.d.).

learning from the same or another teacher, or by ensuring that future generations learn the art form. At the least, this scheme can create an informed listener, or *rasika*. Whether a performer, a *rasika*, or a keen listener of this art form irrespective of detailed technical knowledge, such initiatives can create a musical citizen of a new kind.

The importance of the *guru-shishya parampara* and related values often came up in other contexts as well, particularly in the weekly meetings when initiatives like the Gurukul scheme were discussed, and during my interviews with Dr. Seth. For Dr. Seth, it is crucial for the student to stay with the *guru* when learning Indian classical music, since creativity and the *guru*'s creative thoughts 'come[s] out at random instance of time.'[133] The essence of this system is that the *guru* teaches how to learn, and once a student imbibes this, they can learn anything and everything.[134] The *guru* or *ustad* is the authority in this learning method and the student is expected to be loyal to them for life.

SPIC MACAY is not involved in direct music training of any sort and is only engaged in *citizen-* or *volunteer-based music education* that is mass-centric. The intensives on classical music in SPIC MACAY's Virasat series, as well as the Gurukul Scheme, take place over a limited time and with limited participation, which is different from the actual *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method of teaching requiring lifelong loyalty, discipline, and commitment. In this regard, SPIC MACAY can be seen as parallel to the new, small-to-medium-scale schools in Delhi in which *guru-shishya* is only symbolic rather than an actual pedagogical practice. Additionally, the volunteers of SPIC MACAY and the participants or audiences that attend their events do not pledge allegiance by any means to this movement or attend only SPIC MACAY concerts. They are free to attend events of other organisations too as a music enthusiast or *rasika*. This reflects flexibility that the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method traditionally did not allow. However, what the above discussion shows us is that even the weekly meetings become spaces where existing, new, or potential volunteers, many of whom do not have a music background, learn about the extra-musical aspects of this tradition.

Closely tied to the traditional method of *guru-shishya parampara* is the idea of experiential learning, which is also important here. While talking of this method, Dr. Seth mentioned to me,

---

[133] Dr. Seth, interview by author, Delhi, September 29, 2018.

[134] Interview by author, September 29, 2018.

When *guru* tells the student, he never questions. That is something the tangible and intangible – the Western world has tangible, so the questions are there. Oriental world has no tangibles, that is why there is no questions asked, but it is accepted.[135]

For Dr. Seth, it is important to experience any art form through dedication and the seriousness needed to fully grasp it. This idea of experience, I found, also implies the meditative aspect of Indian classical music, which in turn helps in developing concentration. He further explained this aspect through the idea of experience versus experiment. A scientist and a professor by profession, who has studied both in India and the United States, Dr. Seth explained that in the East (including India), acceptance of things is based on experience.[136] In the West, he mentioned that things are questioned, and answers are based on experiment. Both, for him, are scientific approaches.[137] The idea of experience, for instance, requires sitting and concentrating regularly in a disciplined manner, and once this is done for a few minutes every day for a year, one can experience its crucial effect on one's concentration and life.[138] This presents to us a yogic view of music, based on experiencing the effects of music, similar to meditation. This association of experimental and technological rigour with the west and experience and intuition with Indian culture also resonates with the dichotomy of an inner domain of the east versus outer domain of the west in contemporary society that scholars such as Fernandes (2006) and Patrick McCartney (2019) have critiqued. One of the consequences of neoliberalism, as presented by these authors, is neo-conservatism in varying degrees; i.e. the revival of tradition, particularly the high-caste and elite view of Hindu tradition as coexisting with neoliberal values today rather than being contradictory (Fernandes 2006; Kapur 2009; Oza 2006).

The website of the SPIC MACAY movement also states its aim of sensitising school and college students about the ancient Indian heritage that is losing importance today through initiatives such as workshop demonstrations (SPIC MACAY Workshop Demonstrations, n.d.). As various authors have highlighted in work on teaching and training in this art form, the idea of spirituality, getting closer to God, compassion, and the positive impact on memory and concentration, are among characteristics often associated with training in and listening to Indian classical music (Kar 2013; Kumari 2016; Pandeya 2016). Therefore, we see that the music citizen that is developed, through various SPIC MACAY initiatives and weekly

---

[135] Dr. Seth, interview by author, Delhi, December 1, 2018.

[136] Interview with author, December 1, 2018.

[137] Interview with author, December 1, 2018.

[138] Interview with author, December 1, 2018.

meetings, is the one who is aware of these extra-musical aspects of this music tradition and other art forms.

5.2.2 *Nishkaam Sewa as the core of the movement: The Making of a Good Citizen*

The idea of *nishkaam sewa*, literally translated as selfless service, is the crucial ethos of SPIC MACAY. As discussed in Chapter 3, the idea of *sewa* or service was a crucial part of the traditional *guru-shishya* and *ustad-shagird* method in which students attend to their teacher's everyday needs and household chores with utmost loyalty and, ideally, with no wish for material reward (Neuman 1990). There is perhaps an echo of these meanings in the context of SPIC MACAY, but the focus of this movement is more broadly on the spirit of volunteerism that aims towards 'inculcating a spirit of service' in people (SPIC MACAY Modules, n.d.). Service and volunteerism in SPIC MACAY means working for the society in general through the preservation of Indian art forms (as Indian heritage) that are believed to be fading away. With all SPIC MACAY events free to attend, this movement reaches out to institutions and youngsters in both urban areas like Delhi and remote villages. For such endeavours in remote areas to be successful, participation of young, student volunteers who travel with the artists to ensure the smooth completion of these initiatives are important. Here, the aim of creating good people and citizens who can give back to society becomes evident.[139]

This approach of SPIC MACAY, therefore, goes beyond simply creating a *musical* citizen. Rather, it adds to it the broader idea of an *upright and good* citizen who contributes to society through what can be termed *cultural activism*. Thus, through its varied activities, this movement seeks to create active and productive citizens, who contribute to society and to the development of its various cultural aspects, including music. Dr. Seth is an extremely active person and, as a charismatic leader, someone who the volunteers and artists respect immensely. A senior volunteer at SPIC MACAY informed me that during an event, she has even seen Dr. Seth arranging shoes of the children in order outside the venue without any qualms or discomfort.[140] She added that his doing so encourages others to do the same.[141] The

---

[139] The idea of 'giving back to the society' was also emphasised by a SPIC MACAY senior volunteer subtly in the 17th July 2017 interview.

[140] SPIC MACAY senior volunteer, interview by author, Delhi, July 17, 2017.

[141] SPIC MACAY senior volunteer, interview by author, Delhi, July 17, 2017.

focus on service to society and actively participating in initiatives of the movement is thus significant.

This musical, upright citizen is also disciplined and makes the most of the day in a useful manner. There is no better initiative that reflects this vision than the international and school conventions, which are like a seven-day retreat filled with events such as classical music and dance concerts, intensives, and workshop-demonstrations on different art forms, yoga, cinema screenings that introduce people to Indian heritage. These conventions are open to public, who can participate by registering on the website.

Figure 5.1. "A typical day at the convention" in SPIC MACAY's quarterly newsletter *Sandesh* Vol. 23, no. 3 (May 2018).

Each day of the convention involves waking up early and starting the day with yoga and meals consist of holistic healthy food, reflecting a healthy lifestyle. The morning yoga is followed by what they call *shramdaan* in which the participants and volunteers themselves clean the venue of the convention, instead of outside works being employed.[142] Additionally,

---

[142] SPIC MACAY senior volunteer, interview by author, Delhi, July 17, 2017.

no mobile phones are allowed the whole week, so people are cut off from the outside world. Initiatives like these thus present an active lifestyle with a fully-packed day and without distractions, notably, phones and internet. In this sense, even though this movement reflects the repurposing of tradition at the organisational level and acquainting people with the traditional aspects of *Hindustani* music, their objective is actually much broader. SPIC MACAY defines its core ethos as forming an Indian citizen who is also a good human, cultured, upright, productive, hardworking, disciplined, and active, as well as someone who contributes to Indian society and culture today. In this sense, Indian classical music, among other Indian arts, becomes a means to promote music as a social service. SPIC MACAY also stresses the 'affirmation of … all that is beautiful, lofty and wholesome, of the sensitive, kind and gentle human being who is inspired and in turn inspires' (SPIC MACAY, n.d.). Such core values can be viewed as going beyond any religious affiliation and can appeal to people of different backgrounds.

5.2.3   *Beyond the Dominant: SPIC MACAY as Encompassing Diverse Individuals*

SPIC MACAY not only presents contradictions and complexities at the organisational level, but also in its every day functioning. Even as aspects of the dominant upper caste, upper class, Hindu-dominant discourse surrounding *Hindustani* music can find a place here, I observed in the multiple weekly meetings I attended that this movement attracts volunteers and artists from various sociocultural, religious, and economic backgrounds, and different age groups.[143] In addition, although the dominant discourse is present to some extent, not everyone has to fully sign-up for or agree with it, and the movement also presents them with its own particular 'spin.' I found as a volunteer that it is not overbearing or ideologically-inflexible in the everyday meetings and functioning. As long as I was helping with an aspect of the various events and appreciated Indian classical music as a music lover, I was welcomed as a volunteer irrespective of my personal ideological stance, values, and belief systems.[144] The meeting space of this movement is also never a place for debate on politics

---

[143] I did not ask anyone about their religious affiliation, but it is often clear from names. Caste is another important consideration in the context of volunteers in SPIC MACAY. This is not clear from first names, or even always from surnames, and is a highly sensitive matter and would require much more immersive fieldwork to explore properly.

[144] As a student volunteer, I could help with such aspects as the media, managing the artists, and designing posters.

and religion, and the interaction is often mediated by the founder or the regular volunteers conducting the meeting.

Volunteers join SPIC MACAY for a variety of reasons, including their love for music, and may have different worldviews. Indeed, among such diverse volunteers, many of them may be: conservative Hindu musicophiliacs; individuals who are critical of the dominant ideologies in music that could marginalise another socio-religious community; or yet others who may even fall somewhere in between. Additionally, there are some student-volunteers, I found, who are learning or have learnt classical music or dance before and wish to work towards preserving these art forms. One of the students (as of 2018) informally told me once that she has learnt Bharatanatyam before she wished to work towards the promotion of this dance form, among other Indian arts. There was another student who had learnt Carnatic music, while yet another was a dhrupad student. There are many others who have not learnt any Indian art forms as such but have been volunteering for a long time owing to the 'life-changing experience' they had listening to a classical musician live in a SPIC MACAY concert, or attending a workshop, intensives, or convention. All of them can also bring in their pre-existing worldview, particularly in relation to family and one's *guru/ustad*, when they joined SPIC MACAY as volunteers. Yet all these different people can coexist here as volunteers and musicophiliacs. Volunteers often came together to successfully organise various events around Delhi. Given such diverse backgrounds, can we then really generalise that life-changing experience can mean the same thing for everyone here? Indeed, it is difficult to fit this form of volunteer-based music education into a single box.

Over the course of my engagement with the SPIC MACAY movement, I saw how the idea of a 'life-changing' experience was often attached to this movement's various activities. One of the student-volunteers shared with me in a brief interview that she intended initially to stay in the movement for only a couple of months, but attending the annual international convention organised by SPIC MACAY proved to be a 'life-changing experience' and she stayed on as a volunteer ever since.[145] However, I observed that this idea most often came up during meetings with new volunteers being introduced to the movement. It was much less discussed in the everyday functioning of the organisation where people of different backgrounds come together. It is also important to note that just as the idea of spirituality, this idea of life-changing experience can also mean differently for individuals, whether in a

---

[145] Student Volunteer, interview by author, Delhi, December 1, 2018.

sufi, Hindu (Bhakti), or neoliberal manner. Thus, many volunteers can find some connect with this idea.

5.2.4 *Pragmatism and Skill Development: Challenging Ideologies at the Organisational Level and Adaptability in Neoliberal India*

The broader, dominant approach to Indian classical music is not only disrupted at the everyday level among the volunteers and participants, but also at the organisational level; or rather, it is repurposed from an uncompromising traditional (Hindu) worldview to one that suits the present time and is relevant to people with different thought processes, or to those not familiar with Indian classical music. We know that SPIC MACAY calls for new volunteers to join them, particularly among college students, the majority of whom are not aware of the different Indian art forms and live in a world dominated by conspicuous consumption. As Brosius notes about new middle-classes and post-1991 India,

> conspicuous consumption is not only valued as investment in a better lifestyle but as a sign of one caring for oneself. Soul, mind and body must all be trimmed in good shape in a 'world-class' life. Above all, one's satisfaction and happiness must be visible for all. (2010, 23)

Thus, SPIC MACAY must appeal and be relevant to such types of young people. During fieldwork, I would often consider what motivates youngsters of the contemporary neoliberal society to volunteer here, even without any monetary benefit. There were, at the time of my fieldwork, very few paid staff members who worked full-time for the movement, and none of the student volunteers are paid. How, then, does SPIC MACAY reach out to potential volunteers, particularly amongst the youth?

In the process of reaching out to as many youngsters as possible to acquaint them with their heritage and create better citizens, I found SPIC MACAY also adapts to the changing times of the present day and caters, at least indirectly, to the preferences of the urban youth in Delhi. The most basic manner in which the flexibility of this movement is apparent is that there are no entry requirements for people looking to volunteer here, unlike the rigid ones of formal institutional music education or the *guru-shishya* and *ustad-shagird* method. Rather, the movement attracts new volunteers regularly, whether short-term or long-term ones.

In order to stay relevant, particularly to those with little exposure to Indian classical music or SPIC MACAY, Dr. Seth views the *Hindustani* music tradition in particular as something that can improve one's concentration and productivity, which in turn becomes important for those school or college students who wish to excel in a particular field and

job.[146] Dr. Seth mentioned to me how it works best to give a bright student of today a tangible explanation. For instance, he adds that if one wishes to become a CEO of a renowned company or a top person in any field, one requires a 'laser beam' concentration that engaging with this music tradition can provide.[147] He also points out that while making money dominates today, and young minds wish to follow business leaders and success stories like Mark Zuckerberg, the idea of happiness cannot be related to such material things.[148] Therefore, the aim of SPIC MACAY's varied initiatives is to bring forth the positive side of attributes like discipline, dedication, and patience for the youngsters, things that can help them as individuals. These are the attributes which the youngsters can learn from the *guru*s and experts of different art forms and fields. SPIC MACAY and its initiatives can also be seen as creating a disciplined and efficient subject for neoliberal India, i.e. a neoliberal citizen who is also a musical citizen or appreciates Indian classical music.

Additionally, the idea of dedication towards one's *guru* is highly idealised in the *guru-shishya* (and *ustad-shagird*) method today, including in SPIC MACAY, where it is promoted as a valuable attitude for young students to inculcate in the present times. However, we must not forget that while the SPIC MACAY often invokes the concept of the *guru-shishya* method, the initiatives are not like learning music through the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method for a prolonged period; even in the intensives in a virasat series, students may only spend a few hours of couple of days to musically interact with a *guru* or *ustad*.

SPIC MACAY also focusses extensively, directly or indirectly, on skill development as significantly useful for the young volunteers, something which is a key focus in neoliberal discourse. As Gershon states of neoliberal society, 'managing the self involves taking oneself to be a collection of skills or traits that can enter into alliances with other such collections' (2011, 539). SPIC MACAY recognises that volunteers joining it can come 'from all walks of life with varied aspirations and skills' (SPIC MACAY, n.d.). For many potential and existing volunteers, this movement offers an opportunity to learn skills. As a student or young volunteer, one can obtain experience working in different sub-areas under this movement which include media (promotion and publicity of events), funding, the newsletter, handling the artists during events, and volunteering in the public events under the aegis of SPIC MACAY. Taking a lead in organising or helping with events (like the Virasat series) in their

---

[146] Dr. Seth, interview with author, Delhi, December 1, 2018.

[147] Dr. Seth, interview by author, Delhi, September 29, 2018.

[148] Interview by author, December 1, 2018.

respective colleges also puts students to the forefront, which eventually adds to the experience of managing an event.[149] Additionally, some of the available sub-areas can even directly align with the full-time university course in which the student is enrolled and enable them to get hands on experience. For instance, at the time of my fieldwork, a couple of journalism students were directly helping the media director of SPIC MACAY with event publicity. Such involvement with the movement and the resultant experience provides a CV-building opportunity to the students. Through the various initiatives of this movement, those who are learning one of the Indian classical performing arts such as *Hindustani* classical music, can get the opportunity to network with renowned artists in their respective fields. This can also help building networking skills that can in turn be useful for them in a long-term musical career.

Even the idea of volunteering, which is emphasised by the SPIC MACAY movement, is a way towards building *soft skills* that are viewed as extremely useful in the contemporary world (Khansanzyanova 2017; Pratt 2002). Albina Khansanzyanova argues that soft skills (personal and interpersonal skills) are 'needed to complement professional skills and expertise, and become an essential part of an individual's personality,' and this is something that tertiary education does not provide (2017, 363). One of the ways of attaining these soft skills is through non-governmental organisations (NGOs) (Khansanzyanova 2017). Khansanzyanova (2017) further adds that 'globalised economies have amplified the demand for workers who possess flexible, adaptive and transversal skills' (364). The experience gained in working in the various areas surrounding SPIC MACAY's initiatives can leads to skill development that goes beyond Indian classical music, which will be useful in the job market, whether or not the students wish to work in the fields of Indian performing arts or heritage. Therefore, SPIC MACAY hones citizens that are practically prepared for work in contemporary India.

SPIC MACAY as a movement thus broadly creates a musical citizen through active volunteering for and exposure to different non-mainstream Indian art forms, primarily Indian classical performing arts. These musical citizens, nevertheless, are multifaceted. They are also good (upright) and responsible citizens, productive and active citizens, as well as neoliberal and global citizens. These are also musicophiliacs of urban Delhi that a movement like SPIC MACAY brings together with musicians. Therefore, in the everyday work and

---

[149] A SPIC MACAY senior volunteer also mentioned the manner in which SPIC MACAY helps youngsters gain such experiences. Interview by author, July 17, 2017.

activities, SPIC MACAY is far broader than the dominant discourse of post-reform *Hindustani* music, although it encompasses it or repurposes it in many ways.

5.3 Public Engagement-based Music education: The case of Gunijan Sabha

Delhi and Gurugram are also home to a host of other organisations that have informed the cultural scene of Delhi for years and are involved in what I term *public engagement-based music education*. I provide a list of many such societies in Delhi and beyond in Appendix 5. These organisations promote not only Indian classical music, but also various traditional ideologies associated with it, whether syncretic, or the dominant post-reform discourse, or both.

Many organisations under this type of public education are well-known within Delhi-NCR, if not outside it, for organising concerts or performances in different venues that are often free to attend and attract large audiences. There are also other kinds of organisations and entities in this city, that are centred on creating archives for Indian classical music. For example, the NaadSaagar Archives and Documentation Society for South Asian Music is among those who collaborate with others in organising events. There are yet other organisations that organise seminars and talks. These diverse organisations also often collaborate with certain well-known music institutions in the city with the aim of organising varied events and activities centred on *Hindustani* music.

Besides the common ground of promoting Indian classical performing arts, different organisations define their own ethos, values, and ideologies, which they associate with this music tradition and accordingly work to promote it. This may or may not adhere to the dominant discourse and ideologies associated with *Hindustani* music since the reform period. In this section, I aim to analyse these varied ideologies as embodied by diverse music organisations in their quest to promote *Hindustani* music, and the kinds of musical citizen that can be created out of it. I begin by discussing a range of such organisations in the Delhi-NCR area, exploring the kind of spaces they provide and the kind of ethos and education they give to music citizens. I then focus in more detail on a Jaipur-based organisation called the Ustad Imamuddin Khan Dagar for Music, Art and Culture society and its initiative Gunijan Sabha, which is held in Delhi. In terms of approaches and ethos, three strands come together, albeit in varying degrees, in the initiatives and efforts of music societies and organisations today: the traditional but syncretic; dominant discourse of music reform; and the more pragmatic neoliberal approach. This section also includes a brief discussion of public

engagement-based societies that are simultaneously involved in traditional-formal music education (the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method).

5.3.1 Overview of Organisations engaging in Public-based Education in Delhi-NCR

The late Mr. Syed Haidar Raza established the Raza Foundation in 2001, which is one of the most active organisations in Delhi-NCR. The foundation focuses on 'creating spaces for various art and culture programs, publications and fellowships to the younger talent and also carrying a deeper research into the work of the masters' (Raza Foundation, n.d.). It has created spaces for up-and-coming performers to display their talent through events such as the Aarambh series and Uttaradhikar festival.[150] The Raza Foundation has also promoted academic endeavours through its myriad publications as well as seminars or initiatives like the Kumar Gandharva memorial lecture (Raza Foundation KGML, n.d; Raza Foundation Swarmudra). In the performances under such banners as *Aarambh* and *Uttaradhikar*, the idea of a *gharana* and the name of the *guru* or *ustad* with whom one has studied, is still an integral part of the introduction of artists and strongly emphasised. The audiences, whether or not they are acquainted with this music form, get introduced to these concepts as they begin attending such concert series.

These concerts and seminars are also important spaces for social interaction in which music lovers (including amateurs and listeners), connoisseurs, and other musicians besides the performer of the day come together. I vividly remember that while attending the concerts mentioned above during my fieldwork, I found I was not only familiar with some people attending it as an audience but also found a few other musicophiliacs who were happy to interact with me despite meeting me for the first time. Such instances not only provide opportunities to meet new people, but also to discuss music, share each other's thoughts, and get to know new things about the music form being performed on the day. This is irrespective of whether or not one is an expert in music or a starter. Additionally, if there is not a big crowd or if they are with someone known to the performing artist, the music lover can also get to interact with the artist. I considered myself an amateur and an outsider to the world of *Hindustani* music in many ways. Yet I often sought to take this opportunity after concerts to meet the performer by approaching them myself or through someone who could introduce me. In one of the performances in the Aarambh series by renowned Dhrupad vocalist Pelva Naik, I managed to meet her in the green room after performance, introduce myself, and ask

---

[150] Both Hindi words, *Aarambh* literally means 'start' and *Uttaradhikar* means 'heir.'

questions on *dhrupad*.[151] A different instance was a *baithak* organised by Mr. Vinod Kapur, a renowned music patron who regularly organised such home concerts before COVID-19, where it was far easier to approach the artist.

Another important organisation is the Anad Foundation. Registered as a charitable trust, it is a cultural and non-government organisation established by Bhai Baldeep Singh. The foundation works towards preservation, propagation, and teaching of *Hindustani* classical music and Sikh *Gurbani Kirtan* through various means (Anad Foundation, n.d.). According to its website, this foundation was formed 'for the purpose of service, promotion and preservation of the traditional human values and heritage in general, and in the devotional music of our tradition, in particular' (Anad Foundation, n.d.). For the Anad Foundation, preserving the heritage is important, although their focus is on South Asian heritage. This is crucial since *Hindustani* classical music, Carnatic music, and Sikh Kirtan are also practiced, taught, and heard outside India, in other South Asian countries and beyond.[152] Therefore, the idea of sacredness and spirituality can go beyond religious and regional affiliations, and some societies focus on a more humanistic, non-religiously-specific ethos; a music citizen is created here that embodies plurality and multiculturalism, rather than exclusion on religious lines. It also has a subsidiary foundation called the Ustad Rahim Fahimuddin Khan Dagar Foundation (Anad Foundation URFKD, n.d.).

The Naadyatra Foundation is yet another organisation situated in Gurugram (NCR).[153] This foundation organises: music concerts; music retreats that include workshops, lessons, live concerts; and outreach programmes for underprivileged children in schools (Naadyatra Foundation Projects, n.d.). This last initiative is particularly important as a charitable organisation under the Companies Act, 2013. One of the mottos of this foundation is 'to connect people to *dhyan* or meditation through music' (Naadyatra Foundation, n.d.), which goes beyond the direct claim of preserving the art form. The concept of *dhyan* is crucial here, in that it emphasises the spiritual or the meditative aspect of this music tradition. I have not

---

[151] Pelva Naik's performance in *Aarambh*, Delhi, October 12, 2018.

[152] One of the issues of *Vageeshwari*, the journal of the Department of Music University of Delhi carried proceedings of an international seminar "Indian classical music: Teaching and Performing abroad" held in February 2018. Here, Gayan (2018) discusses the teaching of Indian classical music in the context of Mauritius. Roy (2018) looks at it in the context of Bangladesh, Regmi (2018) analysed it in Nepal, and Rodrigo (2018) in Sri Lanka.

[153] The Naadyatra Foundation is registered under the Section 8 of Companies Act, 2013, an act allowing organisations to register themselves as not-for-profit companies rather than societies. Furthermore, participation in some of its activities, even if not all, like retreats and workshops, can be through paid registration.

visited or interacted with anyone in Naadyatra Foundation, Raza Foundation, or Anad Foundation. However, many, if not all, events and workshops they organise are open to all and free, and the public engaged must be reasonably heterogenous.

These organisations are not phenomena of the scale of SPIC MACAY but are respected in Delhi and in a few other cities where they have established branches. Additionally, there are likely many smaller organisations that exist in Delhi and around India of which I am not aware. One unique initiative that I did find in Delhi is the Kirana Gharana Foundation. Ustad Amjad Ali Khan, a vocalist from Kirana *gharana*, founded this foundation and he also runs an academy called the Kirana Gharana Academy (Kirana Gharana Music Academy, n.d.).

Through this discussion, I show that these organisations, even just through their websites, transmit varied music and extra-musical ideas in the neoliberal twenty-first century India. However, the attempt by these organisations to maintain the core values and traditional aspects of the *Hindustani* music does not mean that they do not think of innovative ways of taking this tradition to a larger audience with no prior musical knowledge. In the next section, I will present the manner in which these dichotomies, heterotopia, and complexities manifest in the initiative of Ustad Imamuddin Khan Dagar of the music, art, and culture society called Gunijan Sabha ('the assembly of wise people' or 'talented ones') and explore how it engages musical citizens. In the context of *Hindustani* music, a *gunijan* can be a musician, music connoisseur, anyone with good musical knowledge, or someone with an interest in music.

5.3.2 *Gunijan Sabha and Public Engagement-Based Music education*

The Ustad Imamuddin Khan Dagar Indian Music, Art, and Culture Society (UKDIMACS) is a Jaipur-based organisation (UKDIMACS, n.d.). This society is much more localised than SPIC MACAY and much smaller in scale, organising events specifically in Delhi and Jaipur. As a registered society, UKDIMACS aims to promote different Indian art forms, particularly Indian classical music, as a part of Indian heritage and culture. In pursuit of this endeavour, the society organises various events in Jaipur and Delhi, including annual events such as the Veena Utsav and Malhar Utsav, and a monthly event called Gunijan Sabha (hereafter, Sabha) (UKDIMACS Events, n.d.). In order to promote the Dagar tradition of *dhrupad*, this society has also established the Dagar archives in Jaipur (UKDIMACS Archives, n.d.). This organisation has very clearly set goals that include not only promoting Indian classical traditions of *khyal* and *dhrupad*, but also to support talented music students

and undertake other social activities that support the economically weaker sections of the society, which is a crucial goal for a registered society (UKDIMACS About, n.d.). Furthermore, the Sabha's good reputation among music lovers and musicians, particularly in Delhi and Jaipur, can be attributed to the fact that it was founded and is run by Ms. Shaabana Dagar as its president, who belongs to the renowned Dagar family and *gharana* of the *dhrupad* style of *Hindustani* music.[154]

Among the different events of this society, I focus on the monthly session of Gunijan Sabha. My analysis is based on my observations as an audience member of multiple Gunijan Sabhas I attended over the course of my fieldwork. I did not formally interview the president of the society. I did, however, aim to attend those Sabha sessions that included at least one *Hindustani* classical performance.

Gunijan Sabha, as a monthly session, started in Delhi in 2015. What makes these sessions different and innovative as compared to a standard concert is that they not only involve inviting artists and musicians to perform, but also include, as much as possible, an interaction between the audience and the performer. In many cases, the main performance is also followed by requests and questions from the audience to the artist or a demonstration by the artist if he or she wishes. Gunijan Sabha is free for anyone interested to attend. It was interesting to observe that many of the Sabha sessions (particularly involving classical musicians) attracted fellow *Hindustani* musicians and music connoisseurs who attend to enjoy the music of another musician; novices who come to appreciate and understand more about this music form; and others seeking a break from their busy lives. The participating performers, artists and academics in the events like this Sabha come from different socio-religious backgrounds and the same is the case is with the audience. Organisations such as UKDIMACS, very evidently, seem to aim to bring classical music to as many people as possible through initiatives like Gunijan Sabha.

Gunijan Sabha in general does not focus on Indian classical performing arts only, although it can be the featured art form. UKDIMACS also includes lectures and interactive sessions on other Indian art forms such as painting, sculpting, poetry, literature in general, history, and other Indian music and dance forms (such as folk, *Gurbani sangeet* or Sikh religious music, *Qawwali*, and Sufi music) in the Gunijan Sabha sessions. Such events, in themselves, present the syncretic culture of Indian society. This organisation itself is

---

[154] Ms. Shaabana Dagar is a twentieth-generation member of this family and is involved with music primarily as a promoter than a performer (UKDIMACS Gunijan Sabha, n.d.).

associated with the name of the Dagars, the bastions of the Dhrupad tradition which is considered to trace its roots to the ancient Indian texts in the general parlance and associated with divinity (though the Dagar family themselves are Muslim).

According to the UKDIMACS website, Gunijan Sabha promises to present 'India's ancient arts and lineages' (UKDIMACS Gunijan Sabha, n.d.). At the ground level, one can find that an event like this also presents to us those aspects of tradition that scholars have recognised as a part of both the *guru-shishya* and *ustad-shagird* methods of music teaching, thus reflecting a syncretic practice. One such aspect is the practice of *ganda-bandhan*[155], which is reflected in one of the first acts of the day in Gunijan Sabha called *mouli-bandhana*. As discussed in Chapter 3, the tying of the thread ceremony (*ganda-bandhan*) has been one of the important stages of the *ta'alim* of *Hindustani* classical music that 'binds the pupil symbolically to the teacher' (Silver 1984, 317) and calls for a lifelong loyalty. In the Sabha, the session usually starts with the society president tying a thread or *mouli* on the hand of the artist(s) or participant(s) of the day and presenting them a symbolic gift of respect. Here, this thread-tying symbolically binds the artists to the society and Gunijan Sabha, though in reality, of course, the artists are not bound to the society the way students (*shishya* or *shagird*) were bound with their *guru* or *ustad* for life.[156] We know that artists need to perform in various events organised by different organisations or societies around the country, and even outside India, in order to maintain their musical career. However, this practice captures the essence of a practice that is iconic of the traditional method of teaching *Hindustani* music.

The sense of music as a meditation, which has risen to prominence in the post-reform period, was also visible in one of these Sabhas which I attended. The audience were requested to not clap in between the performances as music is supposed to take people to their spiritual self or is a meditation.[157] This association of spirituality and meditation can nevertheless be viewed in a Hindu or a Sufi sense, depending on the worldview of the audience. This is particularly so given that the head and founder of this society belongs to the Dagar *gharana*, who are Muslim hereditary musicians practicing a form often associated with Hindu divinity and sacredness. Therefore, events like Gunijan Sabha not only engage in a

---

[155] A *ganda-bandhan* ceremony would happen in traditional teaching in *Hindustani* classical music teaching irrespective of the religious affiliation of the teacher or the student (Silver 1984).

[156] It is important to note that the *ganda-bandhan* ceremony that this process symbolises traditionally involved a long procedure in many cases, as discussed by Silver (1984).

[157] Gunijan Sabha, Delhi, January 17, 2018.

dialogue with the artists, but also introduce a general audience to the music form, along with the idea of *gharanas* and symbols associated with it.

This monthly session can also be seen to be unique given that it not only involves performance, but, in many cases, also includes interaction between the audience and the performer, which is often moderated. While the website of the society also promises Gunijan Sabha to be a platform where one can have a 'dialogue with the maestros' and can 'question, challenge and understand the deeper aspects of Art' (UKDIMACS Gunijan Sabha, n.d.), I heard an announcement in one of the Sabhas, just before it started, that no politically or religiously sensitive questions are allowed.[158] Interestingly, Michiko Urita does mention that musicians in India 'generally are reluctant to express their ideas in public, especially their political ideas' and sees it as the musicians' way of maintaining harmony, although some of them have participated in political organisations (2016, 202).

This seems relevant in the context of the Gunijan Sabha disclaimer as well, which can be interpreted as an attempt to keep *Hindustani* music as a space separate from political issues, social and religious distinctions, or as a way of maintaining a status quo, although such a disclaimer could limit the critical scholarly discourse. This is where the complexities are reflected in the promotion and practice of *Hindustani* music. At one point during my fieldwork, I found that certain connoisseurs believe that the *guru*s and *ustad*s generally do not discuss their music in public because for them, performance is their primary expression and their art is something to be passed on to their students. Gunijan Sabha creates a different structure in which the audience can ask any question to the artist in relation to their vocal or instrument style, irrespective of the level of the questions. Many questions here indeed do come from a lay point of view and include those about the technical details of the instrument being played on the day; for instance, asking the name for the plectrum sarodists hold to play the sarod (it is called *javaa*).[159] The question-answer round in these sessions can also involve general questions on a particular *gharana* to which the performing artist belongs (if they do), and the history or the technicalities that distinguish them from others.[160] There are also academic questions from music students attending the session, particularly if it is a lecture by a musician-academic of renown. One such Sabha was of particular interest to me since it involved debate on whether age should be a barrier in learning *Hindustani* music from a

---

[158] Gunijan Sabha, Delhi, July 31, 2018.

[159] Sarod performance and interactive session by Pandit Mukesh Sharma, Delhi, July 31, 2018.

[160] For example, the performance and interaction with Ustad Saeed Zafar Khan (Sitar player) of Delhi gharana on January 17, 2018.

guru, for example for those extremely interested in learning music but who had to leave their passion in the past for some reason.[161] This debate stretched on for a quite a while. I thus realised that this space is not only one for the *rasika*s in the form of other musicians and knowledgeable connoisseurs, who often sit on the front rows here too as Clayton and Leante (2015) have pointed with reference to *Hindustani* music concerts in general.[162] Rather, it is also a place where amateurs can become good listeners and an attentive audience, and can improve their technical and musical knowledge by asking any question about *Hindustani* music.

Depending on the preference of the artist or the format of the evening, the Sabha may start with a performance (vocal or instrumental) followed with the question and answer round or they may happen simultaneously. This sets up a model of authority in music transmission that is different from the *guru-shishya* method in which loyalty and devotion to the teacher is key and the students do not question their teacher (Pradhan 2019, 72). Indeed, as Pradhan notes, rather than questioning a *guru*, the students 'had to wait for his decision to explain or unravel the mysteries of traditional knowledge' (2019, 72). The *guru-shishya* method includes, in this way, stricter structures of discipline, authority, and maintaining quality, which is followed even today among traditional musicians. Therefore, this is where platforms like Gunijan Sabha provide an opportunity to ask questions and engage with the art of these very artists and teachers, which makes musicians, performing artists, or teachers much more approachable.

This sabha, then, provides public access to musicians and musical knowledge beyond music schools, a *guru-shishya* relationship, or typical concert settings. Initiatives like this create a space, albeit not on a grand scale like SPIC MACAY, for the general populace to better understand music. It is true that Indian classical music and other non-mainstream art forms do not attract as huge a crowd as a Bollywood singer would; or even within Indian classical music, not all artists attract the same kinds of audiences as the few celebrity performers. However, spaces like Gunijan Sabha regularly attract a substantial crowd, which is perhaps due in part to the association of this organisation with the Dagar *gharana*. With the freedom for anyone to interact and question the artists, it provides a potential for an amateur

---

[161] Gunijan Sabha, Delhi, October 27, 2018.

[162] Martin Clayton and Laura Leante have stated that the performances of *Hindustani* music today happen 'in a wide variety of settings, from an informal baithak or mehfil – a small-scale event, often in a patron's home, in which most listeners sit on the floor, either at the same level or just below that of the stage – to large concert halls or arenas in which listeners are seated on chairs at some distance from the performers' (2015, 417).

to become to some degree an active *rasika*, not in a narrow technical sense of knowledge of *raga*, but instead a knowledgeable and good listener and a musical citizen. Albeit partially (due to its curtailment of religious and political questions), interactions like these between audiences and artists also question the Eurocentric claims that Indian classical music, particularly in the *guru-shishya* method, cannot involve critical questioning or questioning at all (see Avis 2019).

It becomes important to note here that events like Gunijan Sabha are very distant from the actual space of music learning and teaching involving formal education, but they have become a space supporting the continuity of this music tradition in recent decades. They create a space not only for musicophiliacs and already existing music citizens to come together, but also to create new ones. Such events do so not only by means of performances and transmitting the technicalities of *Hindustani* music, but also by promoting (subtly or explicitly) various traditional ideologies associated with this music form.

5.3.3 Music Societies with Traditional Formal Education and Public Engagement-based Music education

Delhi is also home to societies that offer direct training in music performance primarily through the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method. They also organise events under the aegis of the society that reach out to a larger audience and thus engage in *public engagement-based music education*. Here too, different societies can show variations in terms of ideology and ethos. I engaged with two such societies in the Delhi-Gurugram area over the course of my fieldwork. Both societies were established by performing artists who learnt music in a traditional setting as a *shishya* or *shagird*, including as a hereditary musician, in a specific style of a *gharana*. These are the Sursagar Society of the Delhi Gharana, under which the Amir Khusro Institute functions (Dilli Gharana Organisations, n.d.); and Sangeetam, which Pandit Arun Kumar Chatterjee and the late Mrs. Shefali Chatterjee conceptualised in 1972 (Sangeetam, n.d.). Their son, Pandit Sarathi Chatterjee (a renowned *Hindustani* classical musician) ran Sangeetam from Gurugram until his death in December 2020 (Chatterjee, n.d.).[163] The late Ustad Iqbal Ahmed Khan (the *khalifa*, or head of, the Delhi *gharana*) ran the Amir Khusro Institute until passing away in December 2020.

---

[163] Pandit Sarathi had learnt music from his father (in Kirana *gharana* style) and from Pandit Rajan-Sajan Mishra in Banaras *gharana* style (Chatterjee, n.d.).

These two organisations were established many years apart but are important to the cultural scene of Delhi-NCR today. Both Pandit Chatterjee and Ustad Iqbal Ahmed Khan taught music in a traditional one-to-one method in their home and institute respectively, while their societies also organised activities such as concerts, seminars, and *baithaks*. Sangeetam also had an annual event called the Golden Greats of Indian Music to bring together well-known classical musicians on one stage (Sangeetam, n.d.). Additionally, such events also provided opportunities for Pandit Chatterjee's students to perform and a *baithak* was regularly organised for them at his home (where he also taught).[164] He also regularly organised a kind of discussion forum (not exactly a seminar, as he believed it is not in a grand scale to be called so) with a musician/artist for his students to attend and listen.[165]

The Ameer Khusro Institute, working alongside the Sursagar Society of the Delhi *gharana*, is a unique contemporary example of the institutionalisation of a *gharana*. I mention some examples of institutionalised *gharanas* in Chapter 4, including those with classroom-based music education and the diversification of courses, even including classes on Bollywood. The Ameer Khusro Institute is more *ustad-shagird* based education, primarily focused on Indian classical music and going beyond only to include wider traditions of Sufi music.

Ustad Chand Khan established the Sursagar Society in 1940, when the institute also came into being, and it is registered as a not-for-profit (Dilli Gharana Organisations, n.d.). What makes the Ameer Khusro Institute distinct from Sangeetam is that it is based on one *gharana* and its style, although the events the institute organises are not restricted to this *gharana* only. Students of this institute, particularly those of the late Ustad Iqbal Ahmed, come from Delhi and other parts of the country such as Mumbai, Jaipur and Baroda, and even outside of India, including the United States.[166]

The Sursagar Society comes into the picture here as it organises various events and activities under its aegis, such as the Ustad Chand Khan Music Festival, which took place in 2018 on 22nd and 23rd October in Kamani Auditorium in central Delhi. The students of the institute, during festivals like these, can get an opportunity to perform on the stage. In the 2018 festival, the students of the institute had the opening group performance of *raga*

---

[164] Pandit Sarathi Chatterjee, interview by author, Gurugram, August 10, 2018.

[165] Pandit Sarathi Chatterjee, interview by author, Gurugram, August 10, 2018.

[166] Ustad Iqbal Ahmed Khan, interview by author, Delhi, October 20, 2018. The students of this institute and of Ustad Iqbal Ahmed Khan can also be called the student of the *gharana*.

Bahaar.[167] Such exposure can help students if they wish to become a performing artist and cultivate their musical skill. Organisers of these events also invite renowned musicians of *Hindustani* classical music such as Pandit Vishwamohun Bhatt to perform; the events are open to a general audience and also provide students an opportunity to interact with or listen to prominent artists. The Ustad Chand Khan Music Festival, in particular, attracts huge and heterogeneous crowds, with many *gharanedar* or non-*gharanedar* musicians as audiences, as well as people with or without prior knowledge of Indian classical music and dance.

Such societies also find varied ways to put emphasis on and preserve the older practices of teaching *Hindustani* music and associated ideologies. However, these traditional concepts can be interpreted differently by such societies, which in turn can be transmitted to their students. For example, Ustad Iqbal Ahmed Khan, in an interview with me, mentioned that the Ameer Khusrau Institute of the Delhi *gharana* is not a music school but a *gurukul*. For him, the idea of *gurukul* encompasses how he attempts to maintain the tradition of *Hindustani* classical music as he received it from his elders.[168] Even as *gurukul* reflects the predominantly Hindu view of music education, a Muslim hereditary musician uses it here to explain that he does not conduct any sort of examinations in the institute, since the best form of learning is directly from the *guru* or *ustad*.[169] Hence, despite the dominant concepts of reform and post-reform period used here, this also indicates a complex situation, not neatly demarcated across religious divides. Thus, in the everyday language and discourse around *Hindustani* music there is an immense overlap between different ideologies and concepts associated with this music tradition.

In conclusion, this chapter has discussed primarily two new kinds of music education beyond formal and informal types: *volunteer or citizen-based participatory music education* and *public engagement-based education*. By exploring them, I have shed light on diverse ideologies that define different types of organisations in Delhi as well as some of the lived everyday realities and the ideological complexity. Indeed, the dominant discourse may still be defined very much in terms of the reform discourse of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century, particularly given the renewed importance of tradition even in today consumption-based lifestyle (Fernandes 2006; Kapur 2009; Oza 2006; Uberoi 2008).

---

[167] Ustad Chand Khan Music Festival, Delhi, October 22, 2018.

[168] Ustad Iqbal Ahmed Khan, Interview by author, Delhi, October 20, 2018.

[169] Ustad Iqbal Ahmed Khan, Interview by author, Delhi, October 20, 2018.

Concepts such as *guru-shishya parampara* and the *gurukul* become predominant in some organisations like SPIC MACAY. The lived realities, however, show a different picture, more contradictory and/or multifarious. Furthermore, a variety of people attend and participate, and the everyday use of various concepts and ideas in different activities is thus open to interpretation by people according to their own worldview and understanding.

It is important to note that in formal music education (whether institutional or through the master-disciple method), the student learns music from a particular *guru* or *ustad* or in a single institution until the completion of their training. However, the participants, volunteers, and audiences of various initiatives of a particular organisation are free to simultaneously attend events organised by other organisations. So, the broad ethos of a single organisation cannot be systematically internalised in a sustained manner by the people participating in it. These organisations thus define a new kind of music citizen based on interest in music, irrespective of their background. Furthermore, this music citizen is also formed by a blend of tradition (whether in terms of dominant conservative discourse or a syncretic one) and neoliberal discourse, which includes individual agency and skill development. Furthermore, some such societies or movements are not only restricted to creating music citizens and acquainting young people with Indian classical music and other Indian art forms, but also hope to create a cultured individual as well as a good, upright, active, and productive citizen.

Chapter 6: *Hindustani* Music and Music Education on the Peripheries of Neoliberalism – Case Studies from Patna

This chapter returns to the formal method of music transmission (i.e., in music departments, institutions, and new schools) but in the setting of Patna, which is the state capital of Bihar. Through the study of these diverse institutional settings, I explore the idea of musical citizenship in a peripheral centre for *Hindustani* music. I argue that the music citizen in this city displays a unique amalgamation of regional Bihari identity and Indian national heritage. These institutions become a space in which three different concepts meet in relation to *Hindustani* music, all of which impact the Bihari musical citizen of today: a national tradition, regionalism (regional identity and region-specific music concerns), and neoliberal subjectivity.

In this chapter, I ask: what similarities or (regional) differences do different institutions teaching *Hindustani* music display in relation to the overarching ideologies associated with this art form as a national tradition? What kinds of regional issues, concerns, and characteristics emerge in these institutions? How is Bihari identity asserted or emphasised in its practice, not just from the point of view of music institutions and the students there but also of musicians? I argue that, similar to the quest for Bihari identity and regionalism of the past, Bihari identity in the practice of *Hindustani* music represents, in explicit and direct or subtle and indirect ways, a struggle to assert or reclaim Bihar as an important regional centre for a national heritage form such as *Hindustani* music.

Patna is not known as a centre for Indian classical music. When I mentioned the city to certain people in Delhi as my planned field, they often reacted with amusement at the idea of studying it. I would often get a surprised response, 'What classical music is there in Patna, anyway?' This shows that many people are not able to connect art music with a state whose image has been dominated by a struggle with issues of development and political stability. However, there were musicians, such as Ustad Iqbal Ahmed Khan of the Delhi *gharana*, who shared immensely interesting stories of his visits, performances, and the cultural aspect of Patna in the 1970s.[170] Additionally, since my family is from Bihar, I heard engaging stories about *Hindustani* music in Patna at the time from them as well, particularly from my maternal grandparents. Such different accounts and experiences fed my curiosity to explore the Indian classical music scene in Patna, of which the diverse institutions, including small-

---

[170] Ustad Iqbal Ahmed Khan, interaction with author, Delhi, October 20, 2018.

and medium-scale music schools play an important role today. This study was a unique extension to my fieldwork in Delhi, providing insights into the regional differences.

Bihar has struggled for its regional identity despite holding an important place in Indian history in general, and in *Hindustani* music practice in particular, since the pre-independence period. The state has experienced some serious economic and social stagnation in the post-1991 period, which has resulted from the increasing dominance of caste politics in the region (Mukherji and Mukherji 2012). Bihar, therefore, has seen a very different trajectory in the post-1991 neoliberal period than the Delhi region. This chapter explores the different spaces of music teaching and training in Patna in the context of the troubled recent history of Bihar, and its peripheral position in relation to India's neoliberal transformation.

There is a dearth of research on contemporary Bihar and *Hindustani* classical music, despite the state being home to some important *gharanas* and centres like Bettiah *gharana* and Darbhanga *gharana* of *dhrupad*. Patna in particular was in fact an important cultural centre in pre- and post-independence India, where various music festivals used to be organised all year long and renowned musicians would visit the city to perform. Many scholars have looked at main centres like Bengal and Maharashtra, well-known for their history in relation to Indian classical music and for being home to some renowned institutions, classical musicians of India, and musicophiliacs (particularly elites) who enjoyed listening to this music (McNeil 2018; Niranjana 2020; Scarimbolo 2014; Williams 2014). Yet no one has explored regional aspects of *Hindustani* music beyond Bengal and Maharashtra, or in what is now a peripheral region not only in terms of development but also in relation to classical music. In this chapter, I explore whether Bihar, as with much of its history, is attempting to restore its regional distinctness and identity in the context of Indian classical music; and to what degree national identity and tradition exist alongside regional or Bihari identity in the teaching and transmission of *Hindustani* music? Importantly, I examine how distinct Patna is from a national centre, such as Delhi, for *Hindustani* music teaching.

In order to address these questions and explore regionalism in *Hindustani* music, I look at three kinds of institutions in Patna in detail: the music department in Rohini College for Women; one medium-scale school, the Kala Sangam School of Music, Dance and Theatre, whose students mostly come from different neighbourhoods in the city beyond the one the school is situated at; and five small-scale schools, in which students are largely from the neighbourhood of the school, but few also hail from areas beyond. Kala Sangam was established before 1991 (in 1980) and has been able to make a name for itself and attract students from a wider area. Almost all the small-scale new schools I examine are post-1991,

even post-2000. Importantly, almost all the small and medium-scale schools I visited in Patna are registered under the Societies Registration Act, 1860, unlike their counterparts in Delhi. However, I do not divide the schools based on pre-1991 and post-1991 in Bihar as neoliberalism has had a peripheral impact on the state as opposed to Delhi. I use pseudonyms for the names of people and institutions in the fieldwork sections of this chapter, which are 6.3 and 6.4. When I do not, I clearly mention it. However, I do not use pseudonyms in the background sections 6.1 and 6.2, but when I do, I mention it clearly.

I argue in this chapter that the music institutions in this city, particularly the small-scale music schools, constitute a space in which regional and local aspirations can coexist with the traditional values linked with the *Hindustani* music practice at a national level as well as the dominant ideologies of post-1991 neoliberal India. I start this chapter with the socio-political and cultural history of Patna in particular and Bihar in general, particularly from the British rule onwards through to independent India. This also sheds light on the development of regional consciousness and the struggle for a distinct identity by Bihari intellectuals based on region and language. Section 6.2 provides a historical analysis of Indian performing arts and institutionalisation in the state of Bihar. Following this, in section 6.3, I discuss in detail the manner in which the traditional ideologies associated with *Hindustani* music and the idea of national heritage is interpreted and asserted even in the varied institutions and schools of a regional centre like Bihar. Lastly, in section 6.4, I give a detailed analysis of the manner in which an Indian national tradition interacts with regional issues in Bihar and the quest for regional identity of Biharis, as well as with the neoliberal ethos as it is evident in Patna.

6.1 A Brief Socio-political and Cultural History of Patna and Bihar

Patna as a city has played an important part in Indian history, being one of the oldest cities in India and an important political centre (Basham 1959).[171] Bihar, as one politico-geographical unit, was shaped particularly in the medieval period and during the Mughal rule when it became an independent province controlled by various elites, and at times, by Mughal princes (Jha 2012). Patna also remained an important centre of trade and of intellectuals and elites, even during early British rule (Boyk 2015; Gopal 1982). This contrasts greatly with its current image of backwardness and poverty.

---

[171] For instance, it was the capital of the Mauryan empire (321 BCE – 185 BCE) and was then known as Patliputra.

As a geographical region, Bihar has a rich history and has a culturally diverse society. The recognition of this among the inhabitants of the region has contributed to their political consciousness, which eventually led to the demand for a separate state (Boyk 2015; Jha 2012). Scholars have noted cooperation, acceptance, and accommodation among different religious communities, particularly Hindus and Muslims, which was characteristic of the cultural life of Bihar (and Patna) in the nineteenth century (Gopal 1982; Jha 2012).[172] Today, the state is predominantly Hindu, with Muslims constituting a dominant minority. It is also home to other religious groups, and numerous important religious sites of different faiths: Hindus, Sikhs (Patna Sahib), Jains, Buddhists (Bodh Gaya), and also some important Sufi shrines, such as Maner Sharif. Linguistically, present-day Bihar is plural, featuring various languages and dialects used by different communities, such as Angika, Bajjika, Maithili, Bhojpuri, and Magahi, of which Maithili is the only constitutionally-recognised language from the state.[173] Urdu and Hindi, too, developed in this politico-geographical unit and are now prominent, being the state's two official languages.

6.1.1   Regionalism Versus Nationalism in Bihar: Pre-1947

As a political entity, Bihar does not have a very long history and traces its roots to the early-twentieth century under British rule. Bihar was a part of the Bengal province of British India until 1912 when Bihar and Orissa were carved out as one province (Jha 2012). The earlier amalgamation of the three regions of Bengal, Bihar and Orissa in 1765 by the British for administrative and political purposes was seen as the 'submergence of this (Bihari) identity' (Jha 2012, 44). This provided 'the local people the powerful myth of neglect and deprivation of the region by the colonial rulers' (Jha 2012, 44).[174] Efforts to gain recognition for Bihar, as well as for Biharis as a collective identity, thus gained momentum during this period in response to the perceived preferential treatment the British gave to Bengalis in jobs and education (Jha 2012). Therefore, this struggle for a separate regional and politico-

---

[172] It is recorded that some Hindu and Muslim festivals included participation from both the communities. Also, there were well-educated Muslim elites in Bihar as well along with their Hindu counterparts (Jha 2012; Sajjad 2014).

[173] As per the eighth schedule in Article 344(1) and 351 of the constitution of India, there are twenty-two constitutionally recognised languages in India which include: Assamese, Bengali, Gujrati, Hindi, Kannada, Kashmiri, Konkani, Malayalam, Manipuri, Marathi, Nepali, Oriya, Punjabi, Sanskrit, Sindhi, Tamil, Telugu, Urdu, Bodo, Santhali, Maithili, and Dogri. Government of India, Legislative Department, Ministry of Law and Justice, *The Constitution of India*. New Delhi, India: Ministry of Law and Justice, 2015, https://legislative.gov.in/constitution-of-india (accessed on March 15, 2021).

[174] The East India Company received the *Diwani* of Bengal, Bihar, and Orissa in 1765 (Jha 2012).

administrative identity was first recognised and realised in 1912, when Bihar and Orissa separated from Bengal, and finally in 1935, when Bihar and Orissa eventually became separate states as per the Government of India Act (Jha 2012). This struggle for regional identity involved not only Hindu, but also Muslim intellectuals and elites in the state (Sajjad 2014).

Demand for a separate state of Bihar at the time by various local leaders was as important a movement for many Biharis as that of working with the nationalists to fight against British rule and gain Indian independence. It is thus interesting to note that this regional consciousness existed alongside the national consciousness. Jha (2012) observes that regionalism and the assertion of regional identity display similar characteristics to nationalistic identity and nationalism as proposed by Benedict Anderson (1983): the creation of a consciousness, a common identity based on language or common history, a sense of common disadvantage, and the importance of media (particularly print media at that time).[175] Jha (2012) identifies many significant factors that made Bihar's quest for a separate identity possible. First among these included finding an objective base as a mark of distinctiveness, which included its own history, ethnic identity, and linguistic identity as separate from the Bengalis. Therefore, it was important to stress the historical importance of the state and develop its own history (Jha 2012). Among many other things, the introduction of English as the official language, its comparatively poor development in Bihar, and consequently, better job opportunities available to the Bengalis, added to the discontent among the Biharis (Boyk 2015; Jha 2012). The spread of English education and the rise of educated elites (irrespective of religion) in Bihar after the 1870s led to increasing regional and national consciousness among the Biharis and more demands for jobs in the region. However, Mukherji and Mukherji (2012) point out that since its formation during the colonial period, Bihar has suffered from a lack of adequate financial support and resources from the central government compared to other states. Quoting the *Memorandum for the Indian Statutory Commission* (1930) on the *Working of the Reforms in Bihar and Orissa*, Mukherji and Mukherji argue that the expenditure on the administration of Bihar and Orissa was lower than even Bengal (Presidency), which in itself was the lowest when compared to the Bombay and Madras Presidencies (2012, 19). With not enough revenue allocated to the state of Bihar and Orissa at

---

[175] Narendra Jha (2012) addresses regionalism versus nationalism in the context of Bihar and the Bihari identity in-the-making during the late-nineteenth and the early-twentieth centuries. In contrast, Mithilesh Kumar Jha (2018) discusses this in the context of the Maithili Movement in Bihar, a language-based movement, in the post-independence period.

the time, the money spent per capita in important areas such as health, administration, and education was very low (Singh and Stern 2013, xxii).

Language has not been a particularly significant factor in defining regional identity in Bihar as a political entity, given the coexistence of five regional languages in the state besides Hindu and Urdu. Interestingly, however, besides the identity-politics discussed above, the Maithili language movement has also found a strong foothold in Bihar, particularly in the post-1947 period push for separate statehood based on language (Jha 2018). It is important to note that this quest for regional identity does not seek establishment of a political entity separate from the Indian union, but rather due recognition of a separate region within the country. Therefore, historically, the most prominent factors binding the Biharis are developmental issues and, in the recent past, caste mobilisations, which I discuss in the next sub-section.

6.1.2   Politics, Caste, and Economic Instability in Bihar: Post-1947

Bihar was an active centre during the Indian freedom struggle[176] and has remained politically active in independent India as well, with various important socio-political movements based there (Singh and Stern 2013). For instance, the students of Bihar initiated the Bihar (or JP) movement in 1974 in resistance to the corruption of the state government (Singh and Stern 2013). Over time, it became a pan-Indian phenomenon challenging the central government at the time of nationwide emergency in 1975.

Despite the culturally rich past of the region, some scholars have noted that Bihar struggled economically along with being directly or indirectly discriminated against over time by the (central) government. These scholars conclude that the uneven distribution of resources under British rule that marginalised the state in comparison to major regional centres of British India continued in the post-independence period, adversely affecting the overall development of Bihar (Ghosh 2007; Kumar 1982; Mukherji and Mukherji 2012; Singh and Stern 2013). As Mukherji and Mukherji (2012) and Singh and Stern (2013) have noted, in the newly independent India, there were other external factors as well that contributed to the difficult situation of the state. These factors included the division of Bihar into two states in 2000 – Bihar and Jharkhand – and the freight equalisation policy, which

---

[176] For instance, the first *Satyagraha* (literally meaning 'insistence of truth') movement by Mahatma Gandhi took place in Champaran, Bihar, and is famously known as the Champaran Satyagraha (Singh and Stern 2013).

was predominantly in force from 1948 to 1991 (Mukherji and Mukherji 2012; Singh and Stern 2013, xxi).[177] Mukherji and Mukherji also argue that the political division of the state in 2000 proved to be disadvantageous for Bihar due to the 'asymmetric distribution of assets and liabilities, where Jharkhand inherited three-fourths of all the assets of the erstwhile Bihar and picked-up only a fourth of all liabilities' (2012, 11).

Caste politics has also dominated the political scenario in Bihar, even more vigorously since the 1980s (Mukherji and Mukherji 2012; Witsoe 2011, 2012).[178] During the regime of Lalu Prasad Yadav, who came to power as the chief minister of the state in 1990, followed by his wife Rabri Devi from 1997, the minister's approach to caste-politics directly or indirectly played a role in the mis-governance, and administrative problems in the state (Mukherji and Mukherji 2012).[179] Jeffrey Witsoe calls Yadav 'a charismatic lower-caste leader who challenged the dominance of Bihar's upper-caste elite,' but whose politics of lower-caste empowerment came to marginalise 'development-related issues' (2012: 318). Witsoe attributed this marginalisation to Yadav's sole focus on honour and voice to the marginalised lower-castes over development and redistributive policies (2012, 319). This led to increased corruption and inefficient utilisation of both state and central government resources, as well as an increasing law and order problem over a period of time (Matthew and Moore 2011; Mukherji and Mukherji 2012).

The condition of education in the state was also worrying, with education institutions underfunded, un-trained or semi-trained teachers, and almost non-existent classroom teaching (Mukherji and Mukherji 2012). Public institutions that were seen as dominated by upper-castes were left to degrade (Witsoe 2012, 319). The literacy rate was very low in Bihar, much lower than the national average, and poverty and low economic development became entrenched (Mukherji and Mukherji 2012). Witsoe points out that while people during this period would have expected the government to improve the health and education sector of the state to help the poor, 'public institutions were instead allowed to deteriorate, including education and health, and few pro-poor policy initiatives were even attempted' (2012, 319).

---

[177] Bihar was rich in minerals and raw materials such as steel and coal, but as per the Freight equalisation policy, the raw materials from all the states would be made available at a constant rate all over the country. Therefore, no industry had the incentive anymore to move into Bihar, and Bihar's advantage was compromised (Mukherji and Mukherji 2012).

[178] Arnab Mukherji and Anjan Mukherji (2012) discuss the political (power) scenario since the 1980s. Witsoe (2011, 2012) talks about the lower caste politics in Bihar in detail.

[179] Lalu Prasad Yadav and his wife were in power until 2005 when the current chief minister, Nitish Kumar, came to power.

The liberalisation and privatisation of the Indian economy in the post-1991 period has impacted the state of Bihar as well, but in a much more peripheral manner compared to many other states in India, particularly a metropolitan area such as Delhi-NCR. Mukherji and Mukherji have noted with respect to Bihar that there has been a 'very limited expansion of economic output' in the state between 1980 and 2000 and also, comparatively, a 'very limited change in employment structure' here during this period (2012, 9). While the employment in services did grow in the post-1991 period, particularly in the big urban centre of Patna, it was still much less than the national average. There was a significant dependence on agriculture as late as 1999-2000 (Mukherji and Mukherji, 2012). Poverty was also higher than the national average, and 'the 1990s saw an increase in the proportion of the total poor in India who were from Bihar' (Mukherji and Mukherji, 2012, 10). Aseema Sinha has also noted that liberalization 'saw an increase in growth rate disparities across states. Bihar's state domestic product growth rate in the 1990s was 2.7% per year, while Gujarat's was 9.6% annually – more than 3.5 times greater' (2004, 31).

Some scholars like Mukherji and Mukherji (2012) have argued that things began to change for the better with Nitish Kumar (the present chief minister of Bihar) winning the 2005 assembly election by a huge majority. This does not mean that caste does not impact politics in Bihar anymore or that caste-politics is necessarily problematic, as it can be essential to providing voice to the marginalised. For instance, Nitish Kumar, himself from an OBC background (Witsoe 2012, 318), is seen by certain section of masses and critics as someone who could appeal to the masses to come together again as Biharis for the upliftment of the state (Singh and Stern 2013).[180] The focus of the Nitish Kumar-led government in 2005 was primarily on development of the state (Das Gupta 2010). His first term in particular saw a significant decline in law and order problems and corruption among other things, though there is still a long way to go for Bihar on these issues as well as in education (Singh and Stern 2013). Bihar is still one of the BIMARU states,[181] indicating that there is a lot of development work still to be done towards development of infrastructure, healthcare, education, among others (Hiteshi 2020; Yadav 2017).

---

[180] OBC refers to the Other Backward Castes.

[181] BIMARU stands for Bihar, Madhya Pradesh, Rajasthan and Uttar Pradesh. The economic analyst Ashish Bose coined this term in the 1980s (Som and Mishra 2014, 34; Yadav 2017, 192). This term has been used to indicate the states which are still lagging behind at different developmental and economic parameters (Som and Mishra, 2014; Yadav 2017).

6.1.3 *The Post-1991 Context: Bhojpuri Music and Cinema as a Regional Marker of Bihar*

In light of the discussion above, I found during my fieldwork that while the 1960s and 1970s were considered the best decades for *Hindustani* music in Patna and Bihar by musicians, teachers, music connoisseurs, and keen listeners, the 1990s was viewed as the opposite. Even though it was not said directly, it became fairly clear in my interactions in the field that from the 1990s onwards, there was not much happening in the Indian classical music scene during this time. What this period did see was the growth of popular culture, particularly the emerging prominence of Bhojpuri popular culture in both music and cinema. These developments furthered the notion outside of the state that Bihar and Indian classical music are incompatible.

Bhojpuri music and cinema are one space in which the struggle between regional and national identity, and the consequent impact on the debates on taste and values, become evident. Peter Manuel notes that the emergence of Bhojpuri commercial popular and folk-pop music can be attributed to the 'cassette boom of the 1980s' (2012, 229). Before this, 'Bhojpuri music had little mass media presence, aside from local radio broadcasts of folk music and the several dozen Bhojpuri commercial films produced between 1963 and 1981' (Manuel 2012, 229). As indicated by Hardy (2014) and Manuel (2012), it was from the year 2000 onwards that there was yet another boom in both Bhojpuri music and cinema, which put this language and Bihar to the fore in the national eye. Interestingly, regional cinema and music in other Bihari languages has not been able to make as big of an impact as the Bhojpuri language ones. This can be attributed to the fact the Bhojpuri music and cinema finds audiences not only among Biharis but also among Bhojpuri-speaking people in the neighbouring state of Uttar Pradesh. There are, however, some emerging scholarly publications on folk music in different Bihari languages, such as Dev Pathak's (2018) book, which offer a sociological discussion on Maithili folk songs.[182]

Ratnakar Tripathy attributes the increased production of Bhojpuri cinema (and music) to the movement of the unskilled and semi-skilled labourers to major metropolises and 'different agricultural hubs' around the country to seek better jobs (2013, 152).[183] It is these

---

[182] Folk music in different Bihari languages is an integral part of everyday lives of people in this state.

[183] Economic distress in Bihar in recent decades has forced labour migration out of Bihar to different parts of the country (Kumar, 2018: 70; Tripathy, 2013: 152).

labourer-migrants who have become the biggest consumers of Bhojpuri cinema and music as well as their major economic supporters, in that they earn and send remittances back home that enables their production (Tripathy 2013, 152). As they travelled for work, these lower-class migrants also took their music with them and made it known across the country. It is important to note that the Bhojpuri cinema and music industry are often associated with the labour classes and viewed from that lens (Manuel 2012; Tripathy 2013). As Manuel observes,

> Most North Indians may have rather mixed images of Bhojpuri culture, associating it with the notorious corruption and backwardness of Bihar, and with the tide of under-educated Bhojpuri migrants who populate slums in Delhi, Kolkata, and other cities (2012, 229).

In this context, scholars such as Kumar (2018), Manuel (2012) and Tripathy (2013) recognise that Bhojpuri cinema and music has often been poorly valued, particularly by the middle-class, for their supposed crassness, crude-ness, and vulgarity. Tripathy, in his article, takes this 'disdain as an important cultural marker that divides the middle-class culture from that of the masses' (2013, 151). In such a scenario, the image of Bhojpuri pop music and cinema present an antithesis of the image of classical music, an elite art form as presented by varied Indian classical music scholars.

Akshaya Kumar (2018) has described recent efforts on the part of certain Bhojpuri film-makers to bring this cinema industry to the mainstream and appeal to educated middle-class Bhojpuri speakers to reclaim it. Cinema thus often becomes a means to evoke Bihari identity as well, albeit within the context of Indian identity. Kumar observes, through Nitin Chandra's 'unreleased' Bhojpuri film *Deswa*, that 'language and cinema become key sites to host contestations furthering unresolved conflicts over taste, linguistic community, and the representation of cultural archetypes' (2018, 82-83). Regional language movies (in different languages of Bihar) can thus also become a medium to create a sense of imagined community among the Biharis based on such common issues as development, education, and law and order. This finds similarity to Benedict Anderson's (1983) emphasis on the role of (print) media in evoking a sense of imagined community, identifying with the nation, and consequently nationalism.

Hardy (2014) has presented the manner in which neoliberalism has also resulted in the marginalisation of Bhojpuri regional cinema in comparison to Bollywood. Hardy notes that since 1991,

> India's neoliberal policies have transformed the relationship between cities and villages, privileging urban middle-class consumers over rural laborers even as the pace of rural-to-urban migration has increased. (2014, 11)

In the context of the Bhojpuri film industry, this is evident in the rise of multiplexes since 1997 (a product of neoliberalism) that aim, through marketing and pricing, towards 'upper-middle-class urban cinemagoers' as consumers (Hardy 2014, 11). Regional cinema often does not find a place in such multiplexes. The makers of the Maithili film *Mithila Makhan* recently experienced this when their film did not find any major Over the Top (OTT) platforms who agreed to release their film (Vats 2020).[184] In such a situation, the still-growing Bhojpuri film industry has been at a loss and 'depends on pre-liberalization financial networks, exhibits in pre-existing single-screen theatres, and brings into being a lower-class migrant audience' (Hardy 2014, 12), distancing it further from the mainstream.

This analysis shows that regional identity is often marginalised and lost in the background of the national and neoliberal image of post-1991 India. Many academic studies have focused on India's big metropolitan cities and the historical transformations in music there (McNeil 2018; Pradhan 2014; Rosse 1995; Niranjana 2020). Even among the general masses, these big cities have become a centre to look to for a better life economically. However, it is important to consider how regional centres have responded to the post-1991 phase of economic liberalisation. This is a particularly complex question when examined in sync with the teaching of *Hindustani* music, a national heritage and tradition, in these peripheral zones. Therefore, I analyse, in the later sections of this chapter, the manner in which regional identity and region is manifest in *Hindustani* music education and among *Hindustani* classical musicians in Patna, whether directly or indirectly, subtly or explicitly.

6.2 Indian Classical Music in Bihar: The Making of Cultural Regionalism

The continuing co-existence and struggle between the regional and the national can be seen in the world of the classical performing arts as well. In addition, this conflict reflects debates around taste and values often associated with a particular language, region, media, music, and film industry. Therefore, in this section, I discuss the importance of Patna and Bihar as a peripheral yet important centre in the field of *Hindustani* classical music in post-independence India. It has been home to music institutions, departments, and even important *gharanas*, and there is a dearth in scholarship on these. Although many institutions in the state, particularly Patna, do not feature among the nationally-renowned departments and institutions, similar to the Department of Music in University of Delhi or Gandharva

---

[184] Over the Top (or OTT) platforms includes streaming over the internet rather than television or cinema screens.

Mahavidyalaya, it is still important to consider the important role they play in music education in Bihar, and in India in general.

There has been a long-standing, albeit dwindling, presence of *Hindustani* music in Bihar, in and beyond institutions. However, Bihar today is mostly associated with Bhojpuri music and cinema, which in turn is connected with low class and vulgarity (Kumar 2018; Tripathy 2013). This identification of the state by non-Biharis shifts the focus away from the practice of *Hindustani* music in Bihar and from the region-specific features and issues surrounding it in the present scenario. My intention in this chapter is not to reinsert the high or elite status of *Hindustani* classical music and history in this region in binary opposition to the low and vulgar image of Bihar's Bhojpuri popular music. Instead, I wish to examine, through conversations with my fieldwork respondents such as musicians and teachers in Patna, how these music forms with such diverging images co-exist in music teaching spaces such as those in private and semi-private music schools. Through this, I call attention to the tensions and contestations that exist between different musical values and ideologies. I did not find many academic works, barring of some local writers, that put forth a concrete timeline of the historical development of *Hindustani* music in Bihar. Therefore, the historical analysis of *Hindustani* music in this section is largely based on conversations with musicians and music professors, and some online research.

6.2.1   *Patna as a Historically Important Regional Centre of Hindustani Classical Music*

Bihar today is primarily known among classical musicians as home to the famous Darbhanga *gharana* and Bettiah *gharana*, the latter of which some believe to be dwindling (Ranganathan 2015, 45-46, 47). When the *gharanas* began to emerge in the nineteenth century (Neuman 1990), princely patronage in estates, such as Darbhanga and Bettiah, in Bihar were of great importance. Thus, rulers and *zamindars* here patronised Indian classical music, and it remained an elite art form. For instance, even beyond Darbhanga and Bettiah, landed aristocrats or erstwhile *zamindars* such as Kumar Shyamanand Singh of the Banaili became patrons of music and were even musicians themselves. Interestingly, unlike the claim of the later middle-class Hindu elites and nationalists that associated hereditary musicianship with Muslims (McNeil 2018), the Darbhanga and Bettiah *gharanas* are Hindu *gharanas*. I found one publication, by Shiv Narayan Mishra, in which the author talks of other *gharanas* existing in Bihar, including a Patna *gharana* that according to him was started by Pandit

Naresh Mishra Nahar who travelled to Patna from Bhagalpur and settled there (2016, 137). Mishra also mentions Bhagalpur and Gaya *gharana*s as well, among some others.

Even as Darbhanga and Bettiah emerged as important centres in Bihar for *Hindustani* music, I found that there is a dearth of scholarly publications that indicate parallel developments taking place in Bihar to those in Maharashtra and Bengal in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries in terms of music reform, standardisation and institutionalisation. Patna, nevertheless, remained an important centre of Indian classical music following Indian independence (particularly before late 1980s). It was still home to musicians of different *gharanas* beyond those local to Bihar, as well as various programmes and events. During my fieldwork in Patna, stories of the past from my grandparents often included the mention of a grand overnight classical music concert during the festival of Durga Puja or Dussehra every year. Sopam (2013) discusses these concerts in detail. These annual classical music festivals were held in different parts of Patna from the mid-1940s during *Durga Puja* celebrations and were organised largely by the Bengalis (Sopam 2013, 99). They were mostly middle-class and indeed, as Niranjana (2020) terms them, musicophiliacs who, as lovers of music, organised concerts for the larger audiences that enjoyed this music. Therefore, these events brought together musical subjects irrespective of region and religion. By the 1960s and 1970s, such classical music events had become a regular affair, as I heard from my family and from interviewees. Sopam calls this 'an exclusive cultural tradition of Patna which added a new chapter in the history of Bihar and also influenced the society in Bihar' (2013, 98). Thus, Patna was also a centre of *Hindustani* music, even if not as big or important as Bengal or Maharashtra.

Furthermore, Dr. Kalpana (name changed for confidentiality), professor of music in one of the universities in Patna, discussed the various opportunities available for students to learn Indian classical music (instrumental or vocal) before 1991, particularly in the 1960s through the 1970s.[185] She mentioned that there were musicians and connoisseurs at the time who had established institutes and schools dedicated to Indian classical music and also taught privately.[186] There were also institutions like Bharatiya Nritya Kala Kendra which Shri Hari Uppal (an exponent of Manipuri and Kathakali, two of the eight Indian classical dance forms) opened in 1963 and has since provided training in Indian classical music and dance traditions as well as certain other Indian art forms. This institute still acts an important cultural centre in

---

[185] Dr. Kalpana, Interview by author, Patna, August 27, 2018.

[186] Interview by author, August 27, 2018.

Patna, hosting a range of music performances and teaching Indian classical music among other art forms. A sense of nostalgia also prevailed among Dr. Shalini and Dr. Ajeet of Rohini College (names changed for confidentiality) who remembered the period of 1960s and 1970s when a lot of well-known classical musicians lived in Patna and also visited from around the country to perform.[187] According to them, the students in this city, therefore, had the opportunity to hear renowned artists, unlike today when such visits are much rarer.

6.2.2 Indian Classical Music and Institutionalisation in Post-1947 Patna

Bihar in general, and Patna in particular, today is home to various music institutions and schools established at different times, but mostly after 1947. Through internet searches on music institutions in Bihar, I found music departments existing today in 15 colleges or universities (see Appendix 1). I also found 41 private or semi-private schools in just three cities: Patna, Gaya and Muzaffarpur (see Appendix 4).[188] There are likely more, including those without websites, and some may no longer be active. It is, however, interesting to see that despite being home to many institutions, I did not find any music departments or institutions in Bihar that were established during the institutionalisation and classicisation process of the pre-1947 period.

Today, Bihar is home to some important universities, such as Patna University, Magadh University, and the newly-established Patliputra University (in 2018), with each having their constituent colleges. I found that while some of the colleges may have been established before 1947, the music departments were founded after independence. Patna itself is home to three colleges with music departments. Sri Arvind Mahila College was established in 1960, and JD Women's College (Patliputra University) in 1971 (Sri Arvind Mahila College, n.d.; JD Women's College, n.d.).[189] I was not able to find out when the music departments were established here. Magadh Mahila College, Patna University, one of the oldest colleges for women in Bihar, was established in 1946 (Magadh Mahila College, n.d.).

The small- and medium-scale schools that are so numerous in Delhi and Gurugram have also emerged in Patna and Bihar, though on a lesser scale than Delhi. I was able to find

---

[187] Dr. Shalini and Dr. Ajeet, conversation with author, Patna, September 7, 2018.

[188] By semi-private school, I mean those registered under the Societies Act and bound under the obligations under it.

[189] Sri Arvind Mahila college falls under the Patliputra University since 2018, as per the website of Patliputra University (Patliputra University Colleges, n.d.). This conflicts slightly with the information on the website of Sri Arvind Mahila College, where the top-left corner of its homepage still calls it a constituent college of Magadh University, as of 6th March 2021 (Sri Arvind Mahila College, n.d.).

18 such schools in Patna, 12 in Gaya and 11 in Muzaffarpur through an online search (see Appendix 4). I explored five such schools in Patna during my fieldwork. There are likely more neighbourhood-specific schools on the ground, in different areas of the city, with no website or detailed information on the internet. In Patna, it was much less common for schools to have their own websites than in Delhi.

Hence, Patna, as an important urban centre of the state, does have a significant number of university departments and music schools today despite the common understanding that it is not a place for *Hindustani* music. One can broadly find three types of music institutions/schools teaching *Hindustani* classical music in Patna:

1. The university departments;

2. Small or medium-scale private schools, which may or may not be registered under the Societies Act; and

3. Government established, funded, or supported institutions.

The third category describes institutions that are large in scale, established by the government and/or registered under the Societies Act. Although some of the new and private schools in Patna are registered under this act, they differ from the third category in terms of scale, the kind of focus or ethos they have, or the extent of direct government involvement. For instance, the Principal Secretary, Education Department of the Government of Bihar established Kilkari Bihar Bal Bhawan in 2008 to cater to children between 8 and 16 years of age. It has its own campus in the Rajendra Nagar area in Patna and is registered under the Societies Act (Kilkari Bihar Bal Bhawan, n.d.). Kilkari also focusses on a variety of art and crafts beyond Indian classical music or Indian performing arts in general. Bharatiya Nritya Kala Mandir is another important art and music institution in the city which was established by Shri Hari Uppal in 1963 (Atulya Bihar, 2018). Today, the Art, Culture and Youth Department of the Government of Bihar calls it a 'govt. aided Cultural Institution', providing training in Indian classical dance, Indian classical vocal, as well as instruments (Art, Culture & Youth Department Government of Bihar, n.d.). This institution is an important one in the cultural scene of Patna and Bihar today, which reflects in the initiatives to reconstruct and restore it under the Bihar Vikas Mission of the government of Bihar (Bihar Vikas Mission, n.d.), although I have not explored this institute in detail in my research. Therefore, the two examples of Kilkari Bihar Bal Bhawan and Bharatiya Nirtya Kala Mandir demonstrate direct government intervention, where the government has either established them or are directly

involved in its renovation and development. The small or medium-scale schools, in contrast, are usually privately established and then aim to get registered.[190]

In this chapter, I focus primarily on the first two types of institutions: university departments, and the small- and medium-scale schools. I call small and medium-scale schools registered under the Societies Act *semi-private* music schools; while those that are not registered, I refer to as *private schools*. It is difficult to historically trace the development of private and semi-private schools in Patna, or to understand its extent, in the manner in which Jayasri Banerjee (1986) does in the context of pre-1991 Calcutta and music schools. Out of 18 such schools I found in Patna, I was able to identify the year of establishment for only four schools either from a website or during interview. All four of them are post-1991 schools.

6.3 National Heritage, Tradition, *Hindustani* classical music in Music Schools in Patna today

In Chapter 3, I have discussed that by the early-twentieth century, the idea of Indian classical music as national heritage was fully developed and actively promoted by music reformers at the pan-India level, particularly through their efforts towards institutionalisation and systematisation of Indian classical music. Even as Bihar remained a peripheral centre for *Hindustani* music as compared to Bengal and Maharashtra, and later Delhi, the idea of a national tradition as well as myriad values and ideologies associated with it are evident in music institutions in Patna as well. In this sense, one can find some parallels between music schools/institutions in Delhi and those in Patna, irrespective of regional differences between the two cities in terms of infrastructure, opportunities, and government support. Thus, these educational institutions do also reproduce aspects of the now-familiar dominant ideologies of *Hindustani* music through a hidden curriculum (Apple 1979). I describe this here briefly, before exploring the more distinct aspects of music schools in Bihar.

---

[190] It is important to mention here that I did not find any *gharana* schools in Patna similar to the ones in Delhi. There are gharana schools or schools commemorating a renowned musician that teach in the style of Darbhanga gharana, but they are either based in the city of Darbhanga (in Bihar) or in Delhi. There is a Pandit Vidur Mallick Sangeet Gurukul in Darbhanga (Pandit Vidur Mallick Sangeet Gurukul, n.d.). Prashant and Nishant Mallick of Darbhanga gharana have founded Pandit Vidur Mallick Dhrupad Academy in Allahabad (Pandit Vidur Mallick Dhrupad Academy, n.d.). In Delhi, Pandit Uday Mallick, along with his father Pandit Chandra Kumar Mallick, established a Dhrupad Academy in 1999 (Dhrupad Academy Delhi, n.d.).

Figure 6.1. A typical set-up of *Hindustani* music vocal training in a university department (Photo by the author).

Hindustani classical music is, even today, considered a sacred and revered art form. This manifests in Patna in a classroom setting with the sandals/shoes left outside the building or classroom entrance in all the diverse institutions I visited. A music department or other institutions and schools, in all likelihood, will also have a statue or photo of Goddess Saraswati (the goddess of knowledge) mostly in the classrooms, as indicated in Figure 6.1. Institutes such as the music department at Rohini College have at least a statue of the goddess in the classroom and, and as I inferred from it, may also perform a *puja,* at least on some occasions and festivals. Indeed, in the Hindu middle-class household in Patna in general, as in many other Indian cities, there is at least a small temple in the house for everyday *puja* or prayers. While I did not do a comparative study of the music departments in Delhi, such aspects of tradition and culture form an important part in different types of institutions in Delhi as well.

Even in small-scale schools like Shukla Sangeet Kendra, there is a huge photograph of goddess Saraswati in the classroom. No regional difference detracts from the belief among the teachers and students that Indian classical music is a sacred art form, that the classroom is a sacred space, and that the teacher, if not revered like a *guru*, should be respected. The

students will, in many cases, also touch the feet of the *guru*, although it is not mandatory, and no one will be reprimanded for not doing so. The seating arrangements in all the music institutions I visited is also usually on the floor (See Figure 6.1. above and 6.2. below).

Figure 6.2. A typical set-up of *Hindustani* music vocal training in small-scale music school in Patna (Photo by the author).

Furthermore, the owner of Vishal Sangeet Vidyalaya pointed out that in contemporary times, it is the music schools that 'still hold on to and reflect these traditions associated with Indian classical music, Indian culture, and heritage' as compared to mainstream public schools.[191] Of course there is much that is not tradition, as these schools are, as we have seen in Delhi and similarly in Patna, rather flexible and teach in a classroom setting. These schools are much more ideologically-flexible, and people of any background or worldview can learn music here. However, this does also bring forth the importance given to maintaining Indian culture, at least symbolically. The traditional outlook associated with Indian classical music is also evident in other ways. The concept of the *guru-shishya* method and the importance accorded to it is often subtly visible or, sometimes, explicitly pointed out in different institutions around Patna. Some institutions directly mention the manner in which they incorporate this tradition into their teaching method, even though what they really mean is some kind of symbolic essence of this tradition.

---

[191] Owner of Vishal Sangeet Vidyalaya, interview by author, Patna, September 1, 2018.

Additionally, different institutions interpret this essence in different ways. Mrs. Kanika of Kala Sangam School of Music, Dance and Theatre, a medium scale semi-private school, understands that the Indian classical music traditionally was a *guru-mukhi vidya* (knowledge which can only be attained directly from a *guru*/teacher) and this is still the best way of learning, thus leading her to adopt this one-to-one learning style in her school.[192] She informed me that, while she teaches in group and has to ensure completing the syllabus for those who have opted to take the examinations, she usually adapts her teaching according to the individual students, depending on their learning capacity.[193] If a student seems to lack patience and concentration, despite having talent, Mrs. Kanika looks to tactfully handle them and teach them. Mr. Rohit, her husband, who also teaches tabla here, told me that a good *guru* is also someone who encourages individuality and creativity among her/his students.[194]

While the *guru-shishya* method may not manifest in its entirety in such a classroom setting, Mrs. Kanika believes that irrespective of the music form a student chooses to learn, music in general helps them develop concentration.[195] In the *Hindustani* classical vocals class, Mrs. Kanika makes it a point to start with a five-minute meditation with the sacred syllable *om* and ensures that her students sit up straight as they recite it.[196] This is something she believes improves concentration in the young minds, as it helps them create a habit of sitting for a long time (to focus) and do something positive. Thus, Mrs. Kanika believes, there is a sense of the restlessness in young minds today, which can be calmed by something as meditative as music. This also resonates with the manner in which even the idea of *riaz*, for some *gharanedar* musicians, was not just about practice for some musicians, but also a spiritual quest (Neuman, 1990). The disciplining and the creation of the docile body here (Foucault 1975), thus reflects an indirect attempt to ensure that the students realise the idea of discipline in the traditional sense, as represented by the *guru-shishya parampara* or *ustad-shagird* method. This disciplining also entails recognising the values and ideas this tradition entails. It is also important to note that even as the *guru-shishya* and *ustad-shagird* method are often used interchangeably in musical discourse as discussed in chapter 3, I found that it is the former that is used the most in different institutional settings in Patna, as is the case in

---

[192] Mrs. Kanika, interview by author, Patna, September 8, 2018.

[193] Interview by author, September 8, 2018.

[194] Mr. Rohit, informal interaction, Patna, September 16, 2018.

[195] Mrs. Kanika, interview by author, Patna, September 8, 2018.

[196] Indian vocal class observation at Kala Sangam School of Music, September 2, 2018.

Delhi. This, once again, reflects dominant music reform ideologies in *Hindustani* music teaching in Patna.

The importance of extra-musical aspects of *Hindustani* music also becomes evident in institutes like Kala Sangam School. For instance, Mrs. Kanika referred to music as helping with an overall social development in the context of youngsters, rather than just the musical one. In her classroom, she also encourages her students to help as well as share with each other.[197] We can interpret this building a sense of camaraderie among her students, which is similar to the *shishya*s or *shagird*s in a traditional method of learning. This also goes further and reflects building good citizens who care for each other, irrespective of the course or art form another student is learning in the school. While the idea of overall (personality) development is also very student and individual-centric, preparing students to adapt to rapidly changing times, this process can be seen building up a certain kind of *sanskar* or taste and values among the youngsters. Therefore, institutions like Kala Sangam presents to us that whether or not a student possesses economic capital, she or he can surely learn about and possess cultural capital in a contemporary, neoliberal society even if they are amateurs with no family background in music. In other words, irrespective of the socio-economic background, one can learn Indian classical music as well as associated values (whether dominant reformist, or syncretic ones) in these small- and medium-scale schools in Patna.

Figure 6.3. A typical class setup in a medium and small-scale school (Photo by the author).

---

[197] Mrs. Kanika, interview by author, Patna, September 8, 2018.

In the small-scale schools, the essence of *guru-shishya parampara* is often evoked as well, but in a different manner than it originally entailed. Unlike Delhi where I found small- and medium-scale schools often advocating a smaller group in a class to advertise their attempt of preserving *guru-shishya parampara*, similar schools in Patna have much bigger classes (See Figure 6.3). For instance, Vishal Sangeet Vidyalaya, a small-scale school, has around 20-25 students in a class. However, the owner of this school maintains that the classes involve direct training and one-to-one learning, which is the essence of the *guru-shishya* method. He adds that when a teacher is giving attention to each and every student for some minutes, that particular student is learning directly from the *guru*.[198] Additionally, all the other students in the class are listening and learning. For him, listening can also be called direct learning and counts as very crucial.[199] Indeed, in the *guru-shishya* method, learning is not restricted to only one's own *riaz* or practice, but also diligent listening while other students and the *guru* sing (Neuman, 1990).

Therefore, in this section, we see that the ideologies, values, and concepts associated with the national tradition or heritage that is *Hindustani* classical music broadly remain the same, irrespective or regional differences. This is what the aim of the institutionalisation process as represented by Bhatkhande and Paluskar was: to create a music that represents the Indian nation. What I have observed in Patna shows that their project has been successful to a large degree. Given the history of this music form, the syncretic aspects and associated terminologies are also recognised and used by musicians, teachers, and students in everyday musical practice and teaching.

6.4 Regionalism, Adaptation and Changes in Post-1991 Patna: *Hindustani* Music, and Ideas of Tradition and Education

The *Hindustani* music education in institutional settings I explore in this chapter, I found, are spaces in which national tradition, regional issues and identity, and adaptability according to the changing times interact and intertwine. As explored in the previous section, the *Hindustani* music tradition, the musical technicalities and the ethos or values associated with it remain unchanged in varied institutions around the city. Yet they also reinforce regional identity and present important regional concerns. This is in addition to an ethos of flexibility enshrined in the post-1991 neoliberal India. I argue in this section that the musical citizen in

---

[198] Owner of Vishal Sangeet Vidyalaya, interview by author, Patna, September 1, 2018.

[199] Interview by author, September 1, 2018.

Patna thus also embodies a neoliberal subjectivity as well as the idea of being a proud Bihari and a *good* Indian citizen.

6.4.1 *Hindustani Music and Regional Identity: The Challenges of Peripherality*

A common regional concern that emerged during my fieldwork while listening to musicians and music teachers related to infrastructural issues in institutional music education, adequate opportunities available for local artists in the state, and general perceptions of music as a subject. These issues, albeit a matter of general discussion in *Hindustani* music discourse, concern music education particularly in university settings. If the infrastructural facilities are not ideal, this will adversely affect the kind of training the students in these institutions receive, which in turn will impact the kind of future musicians/performers, music teachers, and *rasikas* that are created. Ms. Kalpana, who is both a professor and a performing artist, said to me that while there are universities in Bihar, there are still very few places where talent is cultivated, or where adequate opportunities are available to students.[200] For her, the music institutes, schools, and departments need many good trainers as, unlike folk music and light music, to become an Indian classical music performer requires intensive training and the right guidance.[201]

It is indeed a general view among various music connoisseurs and musicians concerning institutional teaching today a strict syllabus system does not necessarily create successful performers. Yet even among Bihari institutions, certain music teachers or professors view Delhi as a place with better music institutions as well as job and educational opportunities for musicians, music teachers, and students, given its reputation for being home to famous and quality institutions with great facilities. For Ms. Kalpana, the universities and institutions in Bihar still require adequate facilities to be able to provide good training to students for them to become performing artists or future teachers. This is where, for her, the role of government is crucial in terms of providing spaces where talented students in Bihar can receive sufficient training, and the institutions can have good, knowledgeable teachers who are able to produce students who in turn can become great teachers.[202] She believes that there is no dearth of talent in Bihar but quality of education has gone down.[203] Furthermore,

---

[200] Ms. Kalpana, interview by author, Patna, August 27, 2018.

[201] Interview by author, August 27, 2018.

[202] Interview by author, August 27, 2018.

[203] Interview by author, August 27, 2018.

Ms. Kalpana said she thought local artists of Bihar were rarely given performance opportunities, even by bigger organisations operating here, such as SPIC MACAY, unlike in Bengal, for instance, where local artists are nurtured.[204]

Another aspect that emerged in my interaction with musicians and music professors in and from Patna/Bihar is the negative attitude towards music in Bihar in general, and the lesser importance given to *Hindustani* music and musicians in Patna in particular. Ms. Kalpana said she found it disappointing that in university settings in Bihar art and music are not often a priority compared to other subjects.[205] Even the environment and the general mindset of people here, I was told, is not very amenable to *Hindustani* music. She mentioned that Bihari society in general is conservative (about music); music is not very highly regarded even today, unlike Bengal, Maharashtra, and southern India, where music has become a part of everyday life.[206] A musician from Darbhanga *gharana*, living in Delhi, informed that not many people in Mithila (the Maithili-speaking region in Bihar) are aware of the rich folk songs of the region, for example those written by poet Vidyapati, or the Darbhanga classical tradition, let alone the manner in which Pandit Vidur Mallick brought Vidyapati *geet*[207] and *dhrupad* forms together.[208]

Dr. Shalini and Dr. Ajeet of Rohini College also felt that even the parents of students at the university would not take their *riaz* at home seriously enough, since proper *riaz* is very time-consuming.[209] They mentioned that Bihar in general was such an important centre for classical music (particularly cities such as Patna and Muzaffarpur) in the past but today, if a musician is practicing at home, the neighbours too will complain about the disturbance.[210] Therefore, according Dr. Shalini and Dr. Ajeet, although there has been an increase in the quantity of students in Bihar who want to learn Indian classical music today for various reasons, there is a decrease in the quality due to a lack of adequate *riaz* and the right environment for it.[211] Ideologically, this attitude towards *riaz* in an institutional setup and

---

[204] Interview by author, August 27, 2018.

[205] Interview by author, August 27, 2018.

[206] Interview by author, August 27, 2018.

[207] Vidyapati *geet* or songs, based on the Maithili-language poems of Vidyapati, are a huge part of the Maithili folk traditions. Vidyapati was a 14th/15th Century Maithili-language poet (Britannica Vidyapati, n.d.). This young musician of Darbhanga *gharana* told me that Late Pandit Vidur Mallick, a well-known musician of this *gharana*, often sang Vidyapati *geet* in *dhrupad*.

[208] Interview by author, Delhi, January 6, 2018.

[209] Dr. Shalini and Dr. Ajeet, conversation with author, Patna, September 7, 2018.

[210] Interview by author, September 7, 2018.

[211] Interview by author, September 7, 2018.

teaching also departs from the traditional *guru-shishya* method, which requires a long-term serious commitment of students to music and to the teacher, who in turn commits to teach his or her students (Neuman 1990; Silver 1984). *Riaz* is a crucial aspect of this traditional method of training, embodying discipline and a quest for refinement (Neuman 1990). Students are expected to create the adequate environment for a regular *riaz* in this method, as discussed in Chapter 3.

How does, in such a situation, this music department of Rohini College ensure that the students are able to do *riaz* adequately despite the above-mentioned issues? This becomes crucial, as even today Bihar is one of the economically weaker states and owning a harmonium or tanpura may not be feasible for all students. I was informed that there are spare instruments, including harmoniums, in the department, and students who do not own musical instruments can stay back after classes to practice with them. The department is open and the teachers (at least one of them) are usually there between 10 AM to 4 PM. This illustrates an attempt on the part of the institutions to address the regional issue of economic deprivation and their aim to promote talent despite one's economic status.[212]

Private, semi-private small-scale and medium-scale schools in Patna approach regional concerns and the role of the government in music promotion or transmission rather differently. The owner of Vishal Sangeet Vidyalaya, who learnt *Hindustani* music from Prayag Sangeet Samiti, mentioned that music learning has increased tremendously in Patna and Bihar in general. He attributes this to television through which children are exposed to music reality television, as well as the role of Bihar government which is now organising more events on it.[213] Mr. Shukla of Shukla Sangeet Kendra, on the other hand, mentioned that his school does not receive any regular direct financial support from the state government, even though the school is a registered society, and he charges his own fee.[214]

6.4.2 Sustaining a Small- or Medium-Scale Private Music School in Patna and Reaching Poorer Students

In the small- and medium-scale schools, the idea of classes on *Hindustani* music as services for which one is paid, becomes evident instantly from the regular fee charged to the students. Indeed, to sustain oneself, the music schools in Patna depend on regular fees from

---

[212] Dr. Shalini and Dr, Ajeet, conversation with author, Patna, September 7, 2018.

[213] Owner of Vishal Sangeet Vidyalaya, Interview by author, Patna, September 1, 2018.

[214] Mr. Shukla, interview by author, Patna, September 9, 2018.

the students, similar to their counterparts in Delhi, particularly when they are not taking any support from the government. Similar to Shukla Sangeet Kendra, even medium-scale schools like Kala Sangam depends on its own fee to run the school. However, unlike Delhi where such schools seem more business-oriented, among the varied small-scale schools in Patna, at least two of the five schools I visited or talked to are registered under the Societies Act, including Kala Sangam School. A different set of ethos can also be seen in such music schools. For example, Mrs. Kanika of Kala Sangam School mentioned that she had not increased the fee of her school in the last decade, since any increase in it would mean lesser students would be inclined to join the school and learn an art form.[215] This presents a different picture than a for-profit model, which is comparatively common in new music schools in Delhi and Gurugram. That Mrs. Kanika has not raised the fee also reflects her school's status as a not-for-profit institution as well as the aim to reach as many students of different socio-economic background as possible. In order to ensure the unhindered functioning of this school, Mrs Kanika has sought new ways to generate revenue. For instance, she informed me that she provides an option of paying a fee on a quarterly or yearly basis, for which she gives a discount. While people are saving some money on it, she too is able to get enough cash on hand to do some development work, organise events, and obtain prizes to be distributed to the students in events (in total 300-400 prizes are distributed every year).[216]

These fee-based courses in such small- and medium-scale schools are, nevertheless, a departure from the traditional *guru-shishya parampara*. However, Mrs. Kanika's (of Kala Sangam) attitude towards course fees is slightly different from the neoliberal practice of competition that has defined the post-1991 India in every sector and aspect of social life. As discussed earlier in the chapter, the state of Bihar has been economically weaker compared to others states in India and has been struggling with poverty. Whether or not the conditions have improved since the regime change in 2005, music education in different kinds of institutions in Patna seem to reflect economic concerns either directly or indirectly. Kala Sangam attracts students from different socio-economic backgrounds and those who are economically disadvantaged pay nominal to no fee. The school thus stays true to the idea of promoting and teaching music as part of Indian heritage as a not-for-profit effort. In one of

---

[215] Mrs. Kanika, interview by author, Patna, September 8, 2018.

[216] Interview by author, September 8, 2018.

the vocal classes in this school I encountered a music student who is not very well-off and works as house help and who Mrs. Kanika identified as a talented singer.[217]

Such efforts, as Mrs. Kanika employs in her school, also demonstrate a region-specific focus on talented students, thus providing no-cost opportunities to underprivileged people with talent in Bihar in general, and Patna in particular. I found that even a small-scale and a specific locality-based school like Shukla Sangeet Kendra, registered under the Societies Act, charges a low fee (500 rupees), especially in comparison to Delhi. The owner-musician of the school, Mr. Shukla, informed me that he also makes provision for economically-weaker students and teaches some students for free.[218] Taking pride in this, he told me in Hindi, '*Aisa kahi aur nahi hota hai*' (this does not happen anywhere else) and that 'I am not a businessman that runs a business.'[219] This low-fee approach is very different from that of Delhi where the small-scale and medium schools are mostly not registered under the Societies Act and many of them charge a fee of around 3000 rupees per month. From what I observed, the students in the classes of Shukla Sangeet Kendra and Vishal Sangeet Vidyalaya seem to have varied economic backgrounds. This distinction between Patna and Delhi can also be attributed to a completely different standard of living as well. Delhi-NCR is a large metropolis and cosmopolitan space, epitomising a neoliberal India steeped in a consumption-based economy, while Patna is a comparatively smaller city and peripherally neoliberal with a much lower cost of living and much reduced consumption-based practices.

6.4.3 Adaptation and Regional Music in Small- and Medium-Scale Schools in Contemporary Patna

I found that the music institutions in the city of Patna have witnessed a diversification of courses, similar to those in Delhi, but to a comparatively lesser degree and with a regional rather than an international focus. This diversification demonstrates these schools' and their owners' efforts to keep up-to-date in order to be in sync with the changing aspirations of the younger population in terms of their career and lifestyle choices. When I say that the diversification of courses has been lesser in Patna than in Delhi, I mean that in Delhi many small and medium-scale private schools not only offer courses on varied international art forms (including western art music) alongside *Hindustani* music but are also affiliated to

---

[217] Vocal class observation, September 2, 2018 and September 16, 2018.

[218] Mr. Shukla, interview by author, Patna, September 9, 2018.

[219] Interview by author, September 9, 2018.

internationally-renowned music institutions for their examinations. Students taking examinations get accredited degrees from internationally-renowned institution. I did not encounter any similar affiliations in Patna, perhaps because institutions focus much more on regional folk or pop music and Bollywood here.

The close interaction between the regional and a more neoliberal ethos of choice and flexibility, nevertheless, becomes extremely evident in the small and medium-scale schools in Patna. As I spent considerable time observing the music schools in this city, I found that a medium-scale school like Kala Sangam School includes classes on various art forms besides *Hindustani* music, such as drawing and painting, guitar, Indian classical dance forms, and acting.[220] The courses offered in this school are much more diverse than even the smaller schools I visited in the city. While Mrs. Kanika takes the vocals classes and Mr. Rohit (her husband) teaches tabla, this school does hire teachers for other courses. Thus, each skill has its experts, and students can acquire different skill sets. Students thus have the choice to opt for and learn the art form of their choice.

Figure 6.4. Teacher and students in a music, dance and art school in Patna (Photo by the author).

Amidst this diversity of courses, the medium and small-scale schools I visited directly or indirectly emphasised folk music as well, whether taught as a separate course or as a part of *Hindustani* music classes. Small-scale schools like Kala Mandir Society teach folk music from Bihar and mention it as a course separate from Indian classical music, even though it is

---

[220] Mrs. Kanika gave me a school tour on 2nd September 2018 and allowed me to sit in on any classes I wished to observe. I visited this school a couple of times more later, to observe *Hindustani* music classes and interview the owner/music teacher.

taught by the same teacher. During my brief visit to this school, I observed that the vocal teacher, Ms. Arti, was helping her students prepare for the school's upcoming annual festival. She was suggesting to a woman, as she practiced a Maithili-language folk song, to sing one in the programme as well, particularly a famous Maithili language poem by the poet Vidyapati entitled *Sunu sunu rasiya*.[221] In Shukla Sangeet Kendra, on the other hand, Mr. Shukla told me that folk music is not taught separately but can be learnt from the same music teacher along with Indian classical music, although folk music is mentioned separately in its advert hoarding outside.[222] Irrespective of whether or not taught as distinct course, folk music can still be taught and learnt in any given school within or alongside the Indian classical music classes.[223]

This direct or indirect focus on the state's folk music forms is crucial in demonstrating the importance of regionality or regional identity along with a national tradition of *Hindustani* music and the values associated with it. In this sense, a music citizen in these diverse institutions is someone who is aware of and preserves their regional heritage and identity along with the national one. These music institutions thus become a space in which the regional and the national can co-exist together. This is similar to much of the history of Bihar, where the quest for regional identity is recognised within the national structure rather than challenging it. In Delhi, there are new schools of different sizes offering a number of courses, yet they would hardly have any form of folk music being taught. Instead, many of them offer Bollywood and/or western music as separate courses.

Folk is not the only music beyond classical music that is taught in these schools. Despite differences with Delhi, Bollywood as a mass music, with its nation-wide popularity, is represented here in Patna too with some of these schools offering classes on Bollywood music, whether as a separate course or as a part of *Hindustani* music classes. Not all schools in Patna explicitly mention it as a separate course though. Melody School of Music clearly mentions training in Hindi film songs as one of the courses on its website and is the only school I found that does not offer Indian classical music directly. In Nishaad Sangeet Academy, its website mentions that light classical music training includes training in playback singing and the Kala Mandir Society mentions Bollywood and karaoke on its poster

---

[221] Ms. Arti, interaction with author, Patna, September 1, 2018. Class observation at Kala Mandir Society, September 1, 2018.

[222] Mr. Shukla, interview by author, Patna, September 9, 2018.

[223] The folk music taught in these small- and medium-scale private and semi-private music schools which can be in Maithili, Bhojpuri or any other language of Bihar, depending on the teacher's native language.

but no playback singing. Bollywood music may be taught in the new schools in Patna mostly under the purview of Indian classical music rather than a separate course, unless the school is offering a professional course on playback singing that may require a specific kind of training.

In many cases, Indian classical music training remains central in such schools, no matter which form of music one wishes to pursue as a career. This also resonates with what many teachers or owners of new schools told me in Delhi-Gurugram. Mr. Shukla of Shukla Sangeet Kendra told me that they only focus on Indian classical music, but a lot of his students are leaving Patna to make a name for themselves in other arenas, such as music reality television and Bollywood music, which also makes the school proud.[224] One of his students had recently participated in *Indian Idol* (a popular singing-based reality television competition), although she got eliminated before reaching the finals. For Mr. Shukla, this was because her classical training was not yet complete, which she is completing now. Indian classical music for him is the grammar of music and is the base. It is imperative to have a training in it to make a career in music. Mr. Shukla explains this through an analogy,

> *Jab tak* building *ka* base *tayyar nahi hoga toh uchi building bhi khadi nahi ho paayegi* [Until a strong base is not ready, one will not be able to construct a tall building].[225]

Talent, hard work, and rigorous training in Indian classical music are all important to music schools like Shukla Sangeet Kendra.[226] These, for Mr. Shukla, can help one attain success.[227]

For the owner of Vishal Sangeet Vidyalaya (who learnt *Hindustani* classical from Prayag Sangeet Samiti), those wanting to learn Bollywood or playback singing from the very start will not learn much.[228] For him, a student should get the basic training of classical music (or *shastriya sangeet*, as he called it) that his school provides. Once they receive it they can do anything in the future, and whatever they eventually do will depend on talent and hard work.[229] Nevertheless, these attempts by certain schools in this city to train students for playback singing and or competition shows like *Indian Idol* suggests that a young talented

---

[224] Mr. Shukla, interview by author, Patna, September 9, 2018.

[225] Interview by author, September 9, 2018.

[226] Interview by author, September 9, 2018.

[227] Anna Morcom (2013) has also discussed the emphasis on the idea of hard work, subjectivity, and success irrespective of socio-economic background in the context of private and renowned dance institutions teaching Bollywood dance.

[228] Owner of Vishal Sangeet Vidyalaya, interview by author, Patna, September 1, 2018.

[229] Owner of Vishal Sangeet Vidyalaya, interview by author, Patna, September 1, 2018.

student, irrespective of their socio-economic background and region, can reach Mumbai and participate in a reality television. This reflects, what Desai-Stephens (2017) calls, an 'aspirational economy'; a result of post-1991 neoliberal changes. Therefore, it not just the big cities like Mumbai and Delhi that can create such a commodified and aspirational society, but the far away city of Patna in the region of Bihar can also aspire to participate in neoliberal music economies. These ideas of talent and hard work also finds similarities with the private Bollywood dance institutions discussed by Morcom (2013) which in turn reflect a neoliberal outlook.

In such a neoliberal society of commercialisation, conspicuous consumption, and competition, *Hindustani* music becomes a means to an end rather than an end in and of itself. The end here, for the youngsters in Bihar, can be either Bollywood or the local/regional pop music industry like that of Bhojpuri language, or both, depending on their individual interest. The Bhojpuri pop music industry has also emerged as a possible market, albeit in a localised manner specific to Bihar and eastern Uttar Pradesh, in which the students from these schools can seek success. I did not notice Indian classical music training in small- and medium-scale schools directly catering to the Bhojpuri music industry. Neither did I note if such schools deliberately choose to stay away from the Bhojpuri industry due to this music's association with lower-class. However, there was one instance in Shukla Sangeet Kendra when one of the students learning vocals went on to become a Bhojpuri pop singer. Mr. Shukla informed me that one of his students entered the regional (Bhojpuri) popular music scene. This student had recorded an album, the poster of which Mr. Shukla proudly showed on the wall of his office.

This attempt to showcase engagement with the regional music industry contributes to the maintenance of the regional identity in the midst of the comparative economic underdevelopment of the state. This emphasis also displays a complexity in which Indian classical music training, an 'elite' art form, is presented as the foundation for a career in any music form, even the Bhojpuri pop music industry. It is important to mention here that despite offering various courses, the small- and medium-scale schools in Patna do not offer separate courses in western art music (vocal or instrumental), which differentiates them from many new, small-scale schools in Delhi. Some schools I visited here, such as Kala Sangam, Kala Mandir Society, and Shukla Sangeet Kendra, did offer classes in keyboard and guitar, but not beyond that.

As mentioned before, such schools are also trying to reach out to different sections of people of society beyond the middle-class and working professionals by offering lower fees,

which can be seen as a democratisation of music. Nevertheless, a question can always be raised regarding how many of those from the lower-middle and lower classes join a school like this to learn Indian classical music, for we know that often it is the regional or vernacular language (and also Bollywood) movies and music that are popular among them (Kumar 2018; Tripathy 2013). Even if they do join a school like Kala Sangam, do they really know what Indian classical music is and entails? Do they wish to be a classical performer or want to learn music for a different purpose? These questions become important to explore in further research.

Unlike the small- and medium scale schools, the university departments in Patna employ a comparatively stricter institutional form of music education, in which diversification of courses has been almost nil. This approach reflects what the music reformers would have envisaged: providing a systematic, curriculum-based way of learning Indian classical performing arts and, if at all, not going beyond Indian folk art. Rohini College too primarily focusses on Indian classical music, with an introduction to folk music in its syllabus. This shows the regional focus of music departments as well, but with limited flexibility as compared to other types of music institutions in Patna. Despite performances on folk music being accepted here at times in the different events it organises,[230] the music syllabus is dominated by classical music.[231] The national features more than the regional one as the old, large-scale and well-known institutions teaching *Hindustani* music still tend to focus exclusively on Indian performing arts, whether classical, folk, or devotional music.[232] Nevertheless, this music department, despite the restrictions of time due to a strict syllabus system for each year, does aim to create different performance opportunities for its students, such as dance-dramas and plays involving classical music, as well as monthly *baithak* with students of all levels getting opportunities to perform.[233] In some musical events, other music forms like folk music is also encouraged.[234]

---

[230] Dr. Shalini and Dr. Ajeet of Rohini College, conversation with author, Patna, September 7, 2018.

[231] I explored the syllabus followed by this college.

[232] Aditi Deo has mentioned that after Indian independence, the state cultural agencies like All India Radio were defining the 'national public culture.' Unlike the pre-independence period, folk performances of different states, along with *khyal*, also became a part of this culture (2011, 24-25).

[233] Dr. Shalini and Dr. Ajeet of Rohini College, conversation with author, Patna, September 7, 2018.

[234] onversation with author, September 7, 2018.

6.4.4 *Individual-Focus, Skill-Development and Fostering Productiveness in Institutions*

The ideas of productivity, concentration, and individuality is much more visible in the small- and medium-scale schools in Patna, similar to the ones in Delhi. Similarly, talent and hard work is equally emphasised in these settings. Some schools in Patna have argued that Indian classical music improves concentration among students learning this music form, which is similar to the neoliberal idea of self-care that the new schools in Delhi also reflect. I found this to be comparatively more visible in these schools than the university departments. The owner of Vishal Sangeet Vidyalaya observed that learning through listening requires immense concentration, and thus one can develop it through this music form.[235]

It is Kala Sangam that I find represents a unique example in Patna of a school that recognises the individuality and agency of the students, alongside individual freedom and wellbeing. As Mrs. Kanika explained, the school stresses confidence building rather than putting a strain on students by teaching them *ragas* of higher level beyond one's capacity or forcing them to learn something with which they might struggle.[236] She added that she witnesses a sense of competition among the students as well as their parents who want their children to do better than others.[237] This is true of post-1991 India more generally and the increasingly competitive market that neoliberalism encourages; competition and risk-taking are key features of such a neoliberal society (Gershon 2011; Harvey 2005). Mrs. Kanika believes in distancing herself from competition that she feels is disastrous for a child, given that every child has a different capacity and talent. In this school, she added, this kind of comparison between students is discouraged as much as possible.[238] Even in various events of Kala Sangam, such as annual events and Autumn celebration, she points out that while she does award prizes based on rank to encourage better performance, she distributes consolation prizes to students as well with the hope to motivate as many students as possible.[239]

While Mrs. Kanika is critical of one neoliberal characteristic of competition, her school embraces another, which is the recognition of individuality and self-improvement. Her idea of giving counsel to students and parents is interesting, and something I have not found in any other institution in Delhi or Patna. When I asked Mrs. Kanika about her approach

---

[235] Owner of Vishal Sangeet Vidyalaya, interview by author, Patna, September 1, 2018.

[236] Mrs. Kanika, interview by author, Patna, September 8, 2018.

[237] Interview by author, September 8, 2018.

[238] Interview by author, September 8, 2018.

[239] Mrs. Kanika, interview by author, Patna, September 8, 2018.

towards students she finds are bored and not paying enough attention when learning *Hindustani* music, she told me that she discusses this personally with the student and his or her parents in order to understand the cause. In most cases, she finds that it is due to the demands and pressure of other academic subjects in their schools that the students are not willing to continue or lose interest in music. There is also pressure from parents on their children to do better than others. Mrs. Kanika's counselling is thus useful in these instances.[240] I view this as an attempt to engage more students in some kind of art form or the other and develop artistic talent in the state of Bihar. Even within the classroom, Mrs. Kanika emphasises individual attention to all the students according to their different capabilities and levels of experience (in terms of the year and level they are in), particularly to encourage those who are either very talented or to motivate those who, for various reasons, are not doing too well. While interacting with young vocal students of Mrs. Kanika in the classroom, I once unanimously heard that Mrs. Kanika was a friendly teacher who explained everything in detail and lovingly to them, so much so that she like felt like family to them.[241] The students genuinely enjoyed coming to the class and learning music.

I also found a much more informal setting in semi-private small and medium-scale schools in Patna than in Delhi. Even in smaller locality-based schools like Shukla Sangeet Kendra, I observed a parent or two also sitting or standing by the door watching as their children were learning or practicing music with the teacher.[242] In one of the classes I observed, a student who was singing a *raga* in front of the teacher was continuously getting the *taan* of the *raga* wrong and the teacher corrected him each time. Sometime later, the student's father also arrived and listened, and hearing the student getting it wrong again, the father came in and complained to the teacher that his son does not listen to him when he corrects him at home [243] Such parental involvement while the class is happening is something I did not find in Delhi. In Delhi, the only time I saw parents sitting through the class was in the case of little four- or five-year olds, and even that was rare. Hence, we see a lot of flexibility in the classroom setting in this regard in Patna, which definitely is not the case in the university departments or older schools anywhere in India.

---

[240] Interview by author, September 8, 2018.

[241] Class observation followed by interaction with some music students, September 2, 2018.

[242] Class observation at Shukla Sangeet Kendra, September 9, 2018.

[243] Class observation, September 9, 2018.

In conclusion, this chapter has aimed to discuss the different kinds of institutions teaching *Hindustani* classical music that exist in Patna today. While all of them are different, they do share and emphasise, albeit to varying degrees, a sense a regional identity in music and concerns around it, as well as the familiar values of *Hindustani* music as a national tradition. The music citizen they deliberately or unconsciously create out of the students is, therefore, defined through a Bihari identity as they negotiate a national musical tradition and associated values in pursuit of different goals. These goals rarely include becoming a classical musician but instead may be a means to reach Bollywood or the regional musical industry. The knowledge of different forms of folk music in Bihar is also often embedded in such an identity as well. In short, the musical citizen here represents regional identity, a national music tradition, and a neoliberal subjectivity to varying degrees. This discussion around regional versus national in the context of this music tradition is crucial since it also reflects the larger contradictions and values embedded in Bihari society. Here the Bihari lens in relation to spaces of *Hindustani* music teaching also reflect the need to further improve the education infrastructure in the state, particularly for music. This could be accomplished by providing adequate support for effective music teaching; changing the way music is viewed so that it is recognised as a disciple at par with others; and to create adequate opportunities for those interested in making *Hindustani* music their career. Finally, these institutions are also spaces, which blur value-based distinctions between Indian classical music, folk music, and regional popular music in different ways. They become spaces which resist the prevalent hierarchies of national classical music, folk music, and regional or vernacular language music forms, even as they are not able to fully subvert them.

Conclusion: The fluidity of *Hindustani* music education in contemporary India

This thesis has explored *Hindustani* classical music education as undertaken in the diverse new small- and medium-scale private and semi-private music schools, as well as renowned music organisations in Delhi, Gurugram, and Patna. This study of the different kinds of music education they are engaged in offers a new lens to approach the social life and the everyday reality of the *Hindustani* classical music tradition. The new wave of music schools as well as music organisations today, I argue, are a fluid and complex space, where regional, neoliberal, and national identity interact and intertwine with each other. They constitute a heterotopic space, particularly the new music schools, where traditional ideologies and values of *Hindustani* music coexist with the neoliberal ones. Indian society in the post-91 period in general represents the coexistence of such seemingly-dichotomous ethos, as discussed by scholars such as Brosius (2010), Fernandes (2006), McCartney (2019), among others. In other words, these spaces constitute an intersection of the national heritage and tradition reflected by *Hindustani* classical music; neoliberal subjectivity, which focusses on skills, self-care, and self-enhancement; and regional concerns and identity. The music citizen as thus defined within these spaces is an amalgamation of all of these. The organisations, in particular SPIC MACAY, also add to it the idea of an upright, good Indian citizen who is not only musical and creative, but also productive, active, responsible, and disciplined. Among these organisations and music schools, the ideologies dominating the music reform period are also clearly visible in many respects.

The post-1991 Indian has, in general, seen the reemphasis of tradition (mostly Hindu) which goes hand-in-hand with the neoliberal, consumption-based lifestyle embodied by the new middle-classes, as scholars like Brosius (2010), Fernandes (2006), Oza (2006), among others have shown. Tradition in the neoliberal India is interpreted and appropriated in a different manner than it was in the past, and which now aligns with this new middle-class consumption-based lifestyle. These music schools and organisations, nevertheless, are also a space where students, participants, audience, and musicians of different backgrounds and worldviews can come together in the everyday practice, promotion, and transmission of Indian classical music. This aspect ensures the sustenance of *Hindustani* music in the contemporary scenario. The adaptability of these music schools and organisations while teaching and promoting the *Hindustani* classical music tradition, in accordance with the changing times, also ensures its sustenance in the post-1991 context.

Core Arguments and findings

The history of *Hindustani* classical music, as discussed in Chapter 1, has presented to us one important thing: this music tradition has not been static, but has undergone numerous changes in its practice at different stages and important shifts in Indian history. This has ensured its continuity at a stretch from its earliest recorded texts in the ancient period like *Natyashastra* and *Dattilam*, until the present time dominated by market economy and neoliberalism; even as *Hindustani* music as practiced today is very different from that which existed in the ancient period.[244] Different period and socio-political shifts ever since have added something new to the *Hindustani* music repertoire and its practice. The changes this music form underwent over time also meant similar transformations in the manner in which *Hindustani* music was taught and learnt.

The major shifts in history of India and Hindustani classical music education

In Chapters 1 and 3, I have mentioned that by the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries, *Hindustani* music, which was primarily taught within families, and since 1857, family-based guilds called *gharanas* (Neuman 1990), was now moving to a new setting for music training: namely, that of music schools and institutions. These changes were taking place in the context of major social shift in the form of increasing social and national consciousness of English-educated Indian elites, and the Indian struggle for Independence. India's initial institutions, schools, and music societies were established during this period. Indian independence in 1947 marked a second major shift in Indian history and witnessed increased state patronage to *Hindustani* music through cultural institutions like AIR and Sangeet Natak Akademi (Deo 2011). This period too involved the establishment of important music institutions and departments; some of which were established by the government, and others by private individuals but registered through Acts like Societies Act or the Indian Trusts Act. Post-independence, there have been musicians and music connoisseurs establishing big- and small-scale music institutions, both private and semi-private, in Delhi and other major Indian cities. Banerjee (1986) noted private and semi-private music schools in huge numbers in Kolkata for *Hindustani* classical music training were already existing by the 1980s. This post-1947 period was also a period when the institutionalisation of *guru-*

---

[244] As discussed in Chapter 1, Widdess (1995) has examined the recorded development of *Hindustani* music and important texts such as these since the ancient period of Indian history. His discussion points out that the *Hindustani* music practiced today is different from that of ancient history as recorded in these texts (Widdess 1995).

shishya parampara through initiatives like the ITC-SRA also started to emerge. These developments as reflected by the establishment of such diverse institutions, particularly the institutionalised *gurukuls*, depicts immense importance given to music institutions and a shift from one-to-one training to an institutionalised music education. The *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method did not diminish, however, and many hereditary musicians were engaging in this method even in the post-1947 period. This continuity is evident through scholarly publications of Neuman (1990) and van der Meer (1980) that discuss the social organisation and various aspects of the *gharana* method of learning. Yet by now, it was not the only method of music training.

In the post-1991 period, the small- and medium-scale schools expanded considerably. This period marks the third significant shift, and an important one from the point of view of this thesis since this timeframe is marked by economic liberalisation and privatisation. As discussed in Chapter 4, these new or third wave of music schools are characterised by diversification of courses among other things. Furthermore, not only did the trend of institutionalisation of *guru-shishya parampara* have continued during in period, but so has the institutionalisation of *ustad-shagird* method. There are varied small- and medium-scale *gharana* schools also increasingly emerging in the contemporary period. There is, of course, the Ameer Khusro Institute of Delhi Gharana which has existed since the pre-1991 period. This institute, like the ITC-SRA, has continued to focus primarily on the Indian classical music training, which was undertaken under the tutelage of Ustad Iqbal Ahmed Khan until his death in December 2020. Then there are also schools like the Kirana Gharana Academy in Delhi: a recent establishment, that, unlike these pre-1991 institutions, have gone beyond Indian classical music to teach Bollywood music, Sufi music, bhajans, and even non-Indian instruments. Gharana schools like this one have adapted to the present times and the needs of the larger masses; they reflect characteristics I associate with the new wave of music schools in Chapter 4. Besides, musicians and music connoisseurs, like the pre-1991 period, have continued to establish music schools in the post-1991 period. However, they not only establish bigger institutions like the Shriram Bharatiya Kala Kendra, but also small- and medium-scale private and semi-private music schools like Pandit Bhimsen Joshi Academy, which works alongside the society called Swar Kala Sangam, and Pandit Dargahi Mishra Music Academy working alongside Society for Action through Music (SAM). While not all such schools go beyond Indian classical music and dance teaching, many of them do, such as Pandit Bhimsen Joshi Academy.

Amidst all these developments, the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* methods have continued to exist not only in my field sites, but around the country; it is still viewed as the best method of learning Indian classical music. There are also musicians that teach both in their schools as well as through *guru-shishya/ustad-shagird* method. As Morcom has also noted, these schools can become a source of regular fee for *guru*s and *ustad*s; they may also have *shishya*s and *shagird* to whom ideally, they would not charge fee (2020, 9). What these developments over time, and more so in the contemporary neoliberal period, reflect is that the diverse institutions and the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method are not mutually exclusive and cannot be studied in isolation. Today, both the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method and the varied institutions as well as schools are necessary to understand the *Hindustani* classical music ecosystem. Studying them in tandem helps us understand better how both contribute to the sustenance of this music tradition in contemporary India.

The music organisations that I explore in Delhi-NCR also engage with two new kinds of music education – *Volunteer or Citizen-based Participatory music education* and *Public engagement-based music education*. These organisations and movements educate and acquaint the general populace, particularly youth, about the *Hindustani* classical music as well as the extra-musical aspects, such as values and ideologies, associated with it. They do so through varied activities and initiatives like concerts, workshops, lecture-demonstrations, and interactive sessions, among other things. As I have showed in Chapter 5, to this endeavour, these organisations involve a musicians and artists of varied socio-religious backgrounds, whether *guru*s or *ustad*s, in their initiatives. Additionally, they also attract people with different worldviews and backgrounds as volunteers, participants, and audiences in their activities. This makes these organisations a crucial part of the *Hindustani* music education scene in particular and of the cultural life of Delhi in general, thus ensuring the continuity of this music tradition.

Important concepts and arguments in the thesis: analysis by chapter

In this thesis, I use and discuss varied concepts like music citizen, neoliberalism, regionalism, hidden curriculum, and the Foucauldian idea of Heterotopia, among others. Each chapter in this thesis delves into specific concepts while examining new music schools in Delhi, music organisations in Delhi-NCR, and diverse institutions in Patna; yet, all the chapters are interconnected, overlap, and explore similar broader ideas. For instance, in Chapter 4, I discuss the ways in which new music schools in a metropolitan city like Delhi-

NCR oscillate between the traditional and the neoliberal ideologies, thus making them a unique heterotopic space. The diversification of courses in the post-1991 period that these schools represent, is a prime example of flexibility and individual choice, where students can choose which art form they wish to learn as long as they are paying the fee for them. Music learning, thus, becomes a service offered by these music schools, who act as service providers. Additionally, students with different motivations can join these schools and learn *Hindustani* music here: as a hobby; to acquire skill through classes and by taking examinations (through older institutions their school is affiliated to); for a career as a school teacher. For yet other students, *Hindustani* music can become a means to join Bollywood or to become an independent artist. Skill development, therefore, becomes important here.

Hindustani music learning also becomes the base for those who are learning any other Indian music form in these schools, including Bollywood music, Sufi music and bhajans; in this manner the *Hindustani* music training serves a particular purpose rather than being an end in itself.[245] In this context, when students with different age-groups, interests, and goals join such schools, flexibility becomes imperative for these to survive. This makes them different from most of the older music schools, which primarily focuses on Indian art forms, and from the traditional *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method. These schools show flexibility in various other aspects, like students can join the music classes any time of the year and learn for as long as they like. The students also have the choice of (not) taking the examinations in such schools. The approach of these schools is much student-centric, when compared to the older music institutions on *Hindustani* music and the *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird method*. However, along with this neoliberal approach of flexibility, individual subjectivity, self-care, and skill development, these schools also transmit traditional concepts, ideas, and extra-musical aspects associated with *Hindustani* music, such as *guru-shishya parampara* and the values associated with it; music and instruments as sacred; and classroom as a sacred space as well. Therefore, these schools represent an amalgamation of neoliberal and traditional, making it a crucial heterotopic space.

The dominant discourse, ideologies and concepts of the music reform period have continued to the present-day and are interpreted in different ways by varied music institutions and organisation in my fields. These concepts and terminologies are also heavily internalised by many people related to this music tradition. It is important to note that while varied new

---

[245] By 'end-in-itself' I mean that many students in such schools may intend to become *Hindustani* classical musicians and performers.

schools may evoke certain ideas that have been a part of this dominant discourse, they do not necessarily do so with the intention of overlooking the *ustads* or *gharanedar* musicians. They may, actually, have a high respect for them in many cases. Also, the use of terminologies like *guru-shishya parampara* by music teachers and owners here can, in many cases, also include *ustad-shagird* method in essence. Neuman (1990) and Slawek (2000) have indicated that these two terms essentially indicate a similar structure and method of teaching.

In Chapter 5, I explore music organisations through the concept of musical and cultural citizenship. However, the music citizen, as defined by these organisations, also presents the coexistence of the seemingly dichotomous neoliberal approach and tradition, making these organisations heterotopic spaces as well. Values associated with *Hindustani* classical music tradition, whether the dominant discourse or the syncretic ones, exist alongside the focus on skill development, music as a stress-buster, discipline, individualism, among others. The music citizen in these spaces, such SPIC MACAY, also represents a productive, active, and disciplined citizen in the neoliberal period. These organisations also entail flexibility in the kind of music education they are engaged in. The volunteers and participants here can join and leave the movement or the organisations any time they wish. They are also not bound by the organisation like how a student is bound by his/her *guru* or *ustad*, and can participate in any other event and initiatives organised by other organisations simultaneously. In many ways, these old and new organisations find similarities with the new-wave of music schools in Delhi. However, there is one main difference between these organisations, particularly SPIC MACAY, and the small and medium-scale private schools. The music citizens as defined by these organisations not only becomes an amalgamation of a creative music citizen aware of the extra-musical aspects of *Hindustani* music, as well as a productive, active citizen; but is also a good and upright citizen that contributes to the welfare of the country and its people. Additionally, most of these organisations, unlike many small-scale schools in Delhi I looked at, are registered under either the Societies Act, the Indian Trusts Act, or the Companies Act.

In Chapter 6, the focus is primarily on the regional identity and issues related to *Hindustani* classical music education in different types of music institutions in Patna. However, in this chapter I also posit that we cannot think of studying music in Patna without touching the concepts of neoliberalism as well as music citizenship. This is despite the fact that post-1991 liberalisation and privatisation have had a peripheral impact in this region, when compared to the metropolitan cities like Delhi and states like Punjab and Gujarat as shown my scholars like Mukherji and Mukherji (2012) and Sinha (2004). The small- and

medium-scale music schools in Patna also demonstrate diversification of courses to some extent, even if not as much as their counterparts in Delhi. A subtle focus on skill development also becomes important in these schools, where *Hindustani* music is also seen as a means-to-an-end to try for Bollywood, music reality television like *Indian Idol*, and at times, even the local or regional language pop music industry (such as that of Bhojpuri). Such schools here, unlike Delhi, also give attention to folk music, which not only presents diversification of courses but also a focus on regional identity in music. As discussed in Chapter 6, *Hindustani* classical music training here acts a base for any kind of Indian music form one wishes to learn and whichever career in music one chooses. Additionally, in *Hindustani* music practice and teaching, the idea of a national tradition and the extra-music aspects related to it in a classroom setting, are very similar to that in Delhi or possibly, anywhere in India. Therefore, in Patna, I found that the music citizen is not only a neoliberal citizen, a music citizen aware of the national music tradition, but also an Indian citizen who is equally aware of their region and regional identity in and beyond music.

Therefore, all the chapters in this thesis are interconnected and overlap, while also discussing specific concepts relevant to the discussion in that chapter. We cannot view the new wave of private and semi-private music schools, whether in Delhi or Patna, and the music organisations as independent of each other, or through a single concept or theory. All the concepts such as neoliberalism, music citizenship, hidden curriculum, regionalism, among others, inform these different institutions and organisations in varying degrees. This intersection between different concepts and methods of music education is crucial in understanding the ecosystem of *Hindustani* music today and the sustenance of this art form in different regions as well as in different spaces of music education.

Methods used

This research has been largely a qualitative one, and an ethnography, to reflect the ideological underpinnings and value systems of the institutions and organisations within India. In this process, I accepted my difficult position in the field, which included oscillating between insider – as an Indian middle-class woman, local to her fields – and an outsider in the world of *Hindustani* music. Open-ended questions, informal conversations, and formal interviews as a part of semi-structured and unstructured interviewing techniques, I found, are useful in a study where an in-depth understanding was needed of why people followed what they did; what kind of belief systems they associated with *Hindustani* music; and the

convoluted social life of *Hindustani* music beyond the dominant discourse, among other things

Contribution to the discipline and beyond

This thesis has aimed to contribute, directly or indirectly, to the areas of ethnomusicological study of *Hindustani* classical music, South Asian studies, Music education, anthropology of music, and the sociology of music. In this study, I have argued that *Hindustani* classical music education acts broadly as heterotopic spaces wherein the diverging ideological structures of neoliberalism and dominant ideological structures around *Hindustani* music can co-exist. Yet, the social life of music on the ground or in its everyday practice and listening, can both challenge as well as conform to the dominant ideologies of the music reform period. In this sense, it also acts as paratopic spaces, which Banerji (2019) calls the 'spaces of alterity' and where the dominant ideologies can also be challenged. Even as neoliberalism and (predominantly Hindu) tradition interact closely at the broad level in Indian society, as indicated by scholars like Brosius (2010) and Fernandes (2006), the everyday practice of *Hindustani* music is complicated, similar to the complex ground realities of Indian society broadly. Williams (2015) for instance, has argued that even as there are communal tensions at different times in the Indian context, the minorities are not necessarily always passive victims, but actively negotiate and maintain peace with their Hindu counterparts in the everyday lives. Minorities play a crucial role in contributing to the sustenance of secularism in India through such instances. In this sense, this study furthers such an analysis of peace studies as furthered by Williams (2015), but through the lens of *Hindustani* music. *Hindustani* music education can become a space where dominant ideologies are sustained as well as challenged at different points.

This thesis also contributes to the discipline of music education. I present that music education and transmission cannot be restricted to the formal, informal and nonformal types, or studied in relation to institutional settings only. Music education can include the variety of other spaces that transmit and promote Indian classical music to the general audience, particularly youth, and which are not restricted to simply organising concerts and performances of renowned musicians. The different kinds of music organisations in Delhi-NCR engage in a variety of activities such as workshops, lecture-demonstrations, interactive sessions, seminars, among many other initiatives, that not only acquaint people with the *Hindustani* music techniques, but also extra-musical aspects and ideologies associated with

this music tradition. In the arena of music education in *Hindustani* music, through this study, I show how the new wave of small- and medium-scale private and semi-private schools of post-1991 India are also an integral part of the *Hindustani* music education scene in India but has often been ignored. My study is crucial for a complete understanding of the ecosystem of *Hindustani* music and its education. Even as they are not thought highly of by certain sections of musicians and music connoisseurs, there are musicians and *rasikas* who are establishing them as well; sometimes to promote and transmit their *gharana* style or the style they had learnt from their *guru* or *ustad* via *guru-shishya parampara*. The interaction between such small and medium-scale private and semi-private schools, big and older (pre-1991) institutions, and the *guru-shishya* and *ustad-shagird* method, present a complete picture of the *Hindustani* music ecosystem and the different ways in which this music tradition is sustained today. None of these teaching spaces are mutually exclusive in the contemporary times: they regularly interact with each other. The new kind of music education undertaken by music organisations also adds to this interaction. There are some music organisations that also have music schools running simultaneously like the Kirana gharana academy, Pandit Bhimsen Joshi Academy, and Pandit Dargahi Mishra Music Academy, among others. There are others that also engaged in *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method of teaching, like Sursagar Society of Delhi Gharana through the Ameer Khusro Institute, and Sangeetam. Additionally, there are varied musicians who run schools, teach in *guru-shishya* method, whilst also performing for and participating in different activities of certain music organisations in Delhi-NCR and around the country.

The time frame that informs much of this thesis, the post-1991 period, is an important part of the historical analysis of the *Hindustani* classical music scene in India. The dominant discourse of the pre-1947 period, which also marginalised the *gharanedar* musicians and the idea of *gharana*, continued through to the post-independence period when more music institutions were established. Yet, this period also witnessed the continuity of teaching and learning relationships between hereditary Muslim musicians and non-hereditary learners (Kobayashi, 2003). While this dominant discourse has continued in the post-1991 period as well, it now also interacts with the neoliberal ideology of individual subjectivity, self-care, conspicuous consumption, skill-enhancement, competition, and commercialisation. Some hereditary musicians have also adapted to the changing times, establishing the small- and medium-scale private or semi-private *gharana* schools. In such cases, *gharanas* become a brand that can appeal to the larger audience and masses. I have also shown through Niranjana's (2020) concept of musicophiliacs, that they exist in different periods, albeit in

different forms with different motives to learn Indian classical music: whether as a skill to make a career in teaching, as a hobby, for the love of music, to join the Bollywood music industry, among others. Even in the present context, the musicians and musicophiliacs of different religious backgrounds can interact in these diverse spaces of music schools, renowned institutions and music departments, *guru-shishya* or *ustad-shagird* method, as well as music organisations.

Today the musicophiliacs can also include those from the new, professional middle-classes, particularly in the metropolitan urban centres like Delhi. They join small and medium-scale private schools in Delhi-NCR to learn music as a hobby, or for any other reason. They also attend concerts and initiatives on *Hindustani* classical music as arranged by varied organisations for amateurs to learn more about Indian classical music. In the contemporary times, nevertheless, we also see efforts of certain small- and medium-scale schools, particularly those in Patna, to take *Hindustani* music learning, often seen as an elite art form, to the economically-disadvantaged-but-talented students. Even movements with a pan-India reach as SPIC MACAY, registered under the Societies Act, try to reach remote villages and underprivileged students and introduce them to this music tradition. What these diverse engagements of music schools and organisations, that are the focus of this study, show us is that *Hindustani* music has survived through different periods in different forms. The musicians, music students, and connoisseurs, have always looked for new ways to ensure this music tradition's sustenance in the changing times. Along with this music tradition, the ideologies associated with it, whether syncretic ones or the dominant (Hindu) music reform ones, have also continued to this period and are interpreted and understood in different ways. This detailed analysis of *Hindustani* music and its everyday practice in different music schools and organisations contribute to the study of not only this music tradition, but also opens a space for discussion on the dominant versus the non-dominant practices in other musical practices around the world. This also paves the way for its theorisation within the discipline of ethnomusicology in general.

This thesis has included varied concepts and theories that include Foucauldian concepts of heterotopia, discipline, authority, and power; Althusser's (1971) concept of ideological apparatus; Bourdieu's (1984) concept of taste; hidden curriculum; the concept of neoliberalism and neoliberal subjectivities; and the idea of formal and informal music education and transmission. All of them contribute to the sociological understanding of music practice and the everyday social life of *Hindustani* music as in the case of this thesis. In this way, my research contributes to the interdisciplinary study of the music and the socio-

musical worlds, particularly in the context of *Hindustani* music, and paves the way for more engagement for sociologists with music.

Further Research

This research offers a new way of looking at and understanding the social life of *Hindustani* classical music through the lens of music education, in the new wave of music schools and important music organisations within Delhi, Gurugram and Patna. It also offers a different manner to approach music pedagogy beyond the study of *guru-shishya parampara* and *ustad-shagird* method, and bigger and old music institutions. Indeed, they are the primary systematised teaching methods and processes considered important for a career in Indian classical music: either as a classical musician, or in order to expand better opportunities in the music field which includes teaching, writing about music, musical event management involving this music form, among other things. The new wave of music schools, despite its image as low-quality teaching institutions, can be viewed as reaching out to a larger number of people of different age groups and varied reasons for learning this music form. Additionally, not all of them can be put into one frame, as these schools are extremely diverse within themselves and are established by different people, including classical musicians and performing artists to reach out to more people.

This calls for a further research on such an engagement of performing artists with these schools, a closer look at the ideological structures and ethos of such schools established by musicians, whether or not they only focus on Indian classical performing arts and why, among other things. I have mentioned the *gharana* schools and those schools commemorating a renowned musician of the past, but I do not explore them fully, so this is a crucial area to explore in the future. In such schools, the idea of branding, the reasons, and its impact in the *Hindustani* music world and outside can also be explored further in the context of the contemporary society marked with competition and conspicuous consumption. Does it give some sort of validity to these small- and medium-scale private and semi-private music schools among well-known musicians and music scholars? What kind of students do they attract? Why would performing artists open these schools if they feel one-to-one training is the best method of learning, and how to they apply this concept of this kind of training in their school? These are just couple of questions out of many possible ones.

More study could be done on the small- and medium-scale private and semi-private music schools in other cities of India beyond my fields, particularly those that have

historically been a centre of *Hindustani* music. This could help us understand the way these schools and organisations inform the musical scene and social life in these cities. The music organisations, on the other hand, provide a new lens to understand music education beyond formal, informal, and non-formal education that Schippers (2009) and Veblen (2012) have classified. This expands the way we view and approach music education in general and particularly in *Hindustani* music. Here, in the context of SPIC MACAY in particular, while my focus has been on its functioning, volunteers, and activities in Delhi-NCR, its initiatives like the rural intensive scheme are an interesting area of further investigation. This scheme takes *Hindustani* music to the villages and economically weaker sections of society, making it interesting given *Hindustani* music's status as a historically elite art form and which continues to be so. What does this scheme entail, logistically and musically, in order to reach those students who, possibly, know nothing of this art form? How do these children and students respond to this music?

The state of Bihar is an understudied one in general in relation to *Hindustani* classical music, despite being an important centre for it historically. Understandably so, as it has been rather peripheral compared to other major centres like Bengal; Maharashtra; Lucknow and Banaras in Uttar Pradesh; and the post-1947 Delhi. There are scholarly publications on the social, economic and political life (including JP, caste and linguistic movements) in Bihar before and during the nineteenth century, and the period following it (Boyk 2015; Gopal 1982; Jha 2018; Ghosh 2007; Kumar 1982; Mukherji and Mukherji 2012; Singh and Stern 2013). Scholarly works on the history of Bihar as a region, from the ancient period to the independent India, are fairly many in number (Jha 2012; Sajjad 2014). Yet, more scholarly attention is needed on a chronological history of Indian classical music in Bihar and the manner in which this music form developed within this state into its present form, particularly from the nineteenth and twentieth centuries onwards. What happened to the patronage and practice of *Hindustani* music in the state of Bihar in different periods of socio-political changes in history?

Bihar offers a rich material of unexplored research opportunities, and this thesis aims to open the door towards that unchartered territory. Some of the contemporary aspects of Bihar that can be explored in relation to *Hindustani* music, is how different institutions teaching this music can become a space of caste politics and Dalit empowerment. In this thesis, my focus has been on the ideological underpinnings (whether traditional or neoliberal) informing Indian classical music teaching in Patna, the idea of regionalism, and how a music citizen is defined in this sense in this city. Caste politics, however, has and continues to

impact everyday lives in Bihar; and the question is, how does it interact with *Hindustani* music and it's teaching here? This can be explored further. Patna, as a state capital, is one of the few important urban centres in Bihar. Other cities, towns, and villages are yet to be explored in this state, in relation to *Hindustani* music teaching and promotion. The role of music organisations in music education and transmission in this peripheral state for *Hindustani* music, and the regional disparities in this analysis, is also another unexplored area.

This thesis explores the largely overlooked spaces of *Hindustani* music education in India, represented by the third and new wave of private and semi-private, small and medium-scale music schools in India. Considered by the musicians and *rasikas* to be at the bottom of the *Hindustani* music education hierarchy after *guru-shishya* method and the older as well as bigger institutions like Gandharva Mahavidyalaya, these schools act as important spaces reaching out to a larger audience in terms of amateurs as well as (particularly in the case of Patna) students of economically-disadvantaged sections of society who may or may not be acquainted with this music form. I have also explored the two new kinds of music education the music organisations are involved in, going beyond the distinctions between formal, informal and non-formal methods and reaching out to a much wider audience. I have examined them through the lens of varied concepts and theories like that of heterotopia; neoliberalism; hidden curriculum; regionalism; music citizenship; and ideological apparatus, among others. To this endeavour, my research was based on extensive ethnographic study involving qualitative method of research, which included open-ended interviews as well as participant and non-participant observations. Throughout this study, I present how the ground reality and everyday social life of *Hindustani* music encompasses divergent viewpoints and people of different worldviews, whilst co-existing alongside the dominant ideologies of music reform in Indian classical music. Additionally, just as with Indian society in general, there is also close interaction between the neoliberal approach and tradition, even within the *Hindustani* classical music education undertaken by diverse institutions and organisations. Therefore, these spaces become an important arena to understand Indian society more generally.

Appendix 1: *Statewise Music departments in Colleges and Music Universities in India*

Bihar:

Name	Year of Establishment	City
Music department, Magadh Mahila college, University of Patna	1949	Patna
Arvind Mahila college, Magadh University	1960	Patna
Tilka Manjhi Bhagalpur University	1960 (Music Department in 1985)	Bhagalpur
JD Women's college, Patliputra University	1971	Patna
RK Saha Women's College, Purnea University	1982 (College)	Kishanganj
Vidya Bhawan Mahila Mahavidyalaya		Siwan
Bisheshwaar Dayal Sinha Memorial Mahila College, Jai Prakash Vishwavidyalaya		Chapra
Gautam Buddha Mahila College, Magadh University		Gaya
Gokhul Karpoori Phuleshwari Degree College, Lalit Narayan Mithila University Darbhanga		Samastipur
MMTM College, Lalit Narayan Mithila University Darbhanga		Darbhanga
Madan Ahilya Mahila College, Tilka Manjhi Bhagalpur University		Bhagalpur
RCSS College, Lalit Narayan Mithila University Darbhanga		Begusarai

Names		Location
Raj Narain College, BR Ambedkar Bihar University		Hajipur
Ram Briksh Benipur Mahila (RBBM) College, BR Ambedkar Bihar University		Muzaffarpur
Ramesh Jha Mahila College, Bhupendra Narayan Mandal University		Saharsa
Sunderwati Majila College, Tilka Manjhi Bhagalpur University	---	Bhagalpur

Delhi:

Names	Year of Establishment	Location
Department of Music, Faculty of Music and Fine Arts, University of Delhi	1960	North Campus, University of Delhi
Ramjas College, University of Delhi	College in 1971	North Campus, University of Delhi
Amity School of Performing Arts, Amity University		Noida (NCR)
Indraprastha College for women, University of Delhi		North Campus, University of Delhi
Daulatram College, University of Delhi		North Campus, University of Delhi
School of Performing and Visual Arts, Indira Gandhi National Open University		Maidangarhi, Delhi
Vidyavati Mukundlal Girls College		Ghaziabad (NCR)
Vivekananda College, University of Delhi		South Campus, University of Delhi

Uttar Pradesh:

Name	Year of Establishment	City
Department of Music and Performing Arts, Faculty of Arts, University of Allahabad	1926	Prayagraj (Allahabad)
Bhatkhande Music Institute Deemed to be University	1926	Lucknow
The Faculty of Performing Arts, Banaras Hindu University	Established as School of Music and Fine Arts in 1949.	Banaras

Gujarat:

Name	Year of Establishment	City
Department of Music (Vocal/Instrumental), Faculty of Performing arts, The Maharaj Sayajirao University of Baroda (https://www.msubaroda.ac.in/Academics/Department)	1884	Vadodara

Chattisgarh:

Name	Year of Establishment	City
Indira Kala Sangit Vishwavidyalaya (http://www.iksv.ac.in/)	1956	Khairagarh

Maharashtra:

Name	Year of Establishment	City
Department of Music, University of Mumbai (https://mu.ac.in/department-of-music)	1978	Mumbai

215

Centre for Performing Arts, Savitribai Phule Pune University
(Also known as Lalit Kala Kendra)
(http://www.unipune.ac.in/dept/fine_arts/centre_for_performing_arts/default.htm)   1987   Pune

Madhya Pradesh:

Name	Year of Establishment	City
Raja Man Singh Tomar Music and Arts University (http://rmtmusicandartsuniversity.com/index.htm)	2008	Gwalior

West Bengal:

Name	Year of Establishment	City
Sangit Bhavana, Visva-Bharati University (http://www.visvabharati.ac.in/SangitBhavana.html)	1921	Santiniketan
Department of Vocal Music and Department of Instrumental Music, Rabindra Bharati University (http://www.rbu.ac.in/home/page/12)	1962 and 1976 respectively	Kolkata

Rajasthan:

Name	Year of Establishment	City
Banasthali Vidyapith (http://banasthali.org/banasthali/wcms/en/home/lower-menu/faculties/fine-arts/dept_of_music_and_dance/index.html)	1943	Vanasthali

Karnataka:

Music Departments and colleges in Karnataka	Year of Establishment	Location
Karnataka State Music University		Mysore
Faculty of Arts, Karnatak University Dharwad (http://www.kud.ac.in/)		Dharwad
Department of Performing Arts, Bangalore University (https://eng.bangaloreuniversity.ac.in/performing-arts/)	1973	Bangalore
Department of Music and Dance, Kannada University (http://kannadauniversity.org/english/department-of-music-and-dance/)	1997	Hampi
Department of Performing Arts and Theatre Studies, Christ (Deemed to be University) (https://christuniversity.in/school-of-arts-and-humanities/performing-arts,-theatre-studies-and-music)	2010	Bangalore

Appendix 2: *Renowned and other pre-1991 schools/institutions in India today*

Name	Year of Establishment	City
The Calcutta School of Music (https://www.calmusic.org)	1915	Kolkata
Saraswati Music College (http://www.saraswatimusiccollege.org/)	1924	Delhi
Prayag Sangeet Samiti (https://www.prayagsangeetsamiti.co.in)	1926	Prayagraj (Allahabad)
Akhil Bharatiya Gandharva Mahavidyalaya Mandal (https://abgmvm.org/)	1931	Mumbai
Gandharva Mahavidyalaya (http://gandharvamahavidyalayanewdelhi.org)	1939	Delhi
Bhaatkhande Sangit Vidyalaya (https://www.bhaatkhandesangit.com/about.html)	1939 (in Burma), 1942 (moved to India)	Delhi

Bengal Music College (http://bengalmusiccollege.org)	1940	Kolkata
Kamala Devi Sangeet Mahavidyalaya (https://www.kdsm.ac.in/)	1950	Raipur
Triveni Kala Sangam (http://trivenikalasangam.org)	1950	Delhi
Sri Ram Bharatiya Kala Kendra (https://www.thekendra.com)	1952	Delhi
Pracheen Kala Kendra (http://www.pracheenkalakendra.org)	1956	Chandigarh
Sangit Mahabharati (http://sangitmahabharati.org)	1956	Mumbai
Saptak School of Music (https://www.saptak.org/saptakDesk/)	1980	Ahmedabad
Bhatkhande Sangit Vidyapith (http://www.bsvidyapith.org/index1.htm)		Lucknow
Navras school of performing Arts (Facebook Page)		Patna
VN Bhatkhande Sangeet Mahavidyalaya (http://vnbhatkhandegzb.com)		Ghaziabad

Appendix 3: *Institutionalised gurukul or conservatoire-style institutes*

Name	Year of Establishment	City
ITC Sangeet Research Academy (http://www.itcsra.org/)	1977	Kolkata
Dhrupad Kendra	1981	Bhopal
Lalit Kala Kendra (Centre for Performing Arts, Savitribai Phule Pune University) (http://www.unipune.ac.in/dept/fine_arts/centre_for_performing_arts/default.htm)	1987	Pune

Name	Year of Establishment	Location (within the city)
Vrindaban Gurukul (http://www.hariprasadchaurasia.com/vrindaban-gurukul)	2002 (Mumbai), 2010 (Bhubaneswar, Odisha)	Mumbai, Bhubaneswar
Taalkyogi Ashram Gurukul (http://www.sureshtalwalkar.com/)	2011	Pune
Dhrupad Sansthan (http://dhrupad.org/dhrupad-institute/)		Bhopal
Sudarshan Music by Pt. Ajoy Chakraborty (online *guru-shishya parampara*) (https://surdarshanmusic.com/)		Online

Appendix 4: *Statewise broad List of private and Semi-private schools in India*

Delhi/NCR:

Name	Year of Establishment	Location (within the city)
Aangikam Dance and Music institute		Dwarka
Amrapaali Kala Peeth http://www.amrapaalikalapeeth.co.in		Dwarka
Arohi Music Academy		Dwarka
Dwarka School of Music		Dwarka
Kalakendra	2006	Dwarka
Kirana gharana Music academy	2015	Dwarka
Maa Saraswati Music school		Dwarka
Puneet Academy of Music https://puneet-academy-of-music.business.site/?utm_source=gmb&utm_medium=referral		Dwarka
Sadhna Sangeet College		Dwarka

Sangeet Vandana (School of Kathak Dance and Music) https://sangeetvandanaschoolofkathakdancemusic.business.site/	2004	Dwarka
Satrang Kala Foundation		Dwarka
Academy of Music and Performing Arts (AMPA)		Lajpat Nagar
Bansuri Flute Academy		Lajpat Nagar
Mouj School of Music		Lajpat Nagar
Pradeep Adwani's Institute for Performing Arts https://paipa.in/		Lajpat Nagar
Sa Re Ga Ma Music Academy		Lajpat Nagar
Indian School of Music		Malviya Nagar
Pushkala Sangeet Kendra		Malviya Nagar
Shiv Shankar Music class https://shivshankarmusic.com/		Malviya Nagar
Sur Varsha Music Academy		Malviya Nagar
Divya Bharati school http://www.divyamusic.com/	2004	Vasant Kunj
Madhur Mann https://www.madhurmann.com/		Vasant Kunj
Nishtha Vocal classes		Vasant Kunj
Sai School of Music		Vasant Kunj
Sangeet Stuti: The vocal Academy		Vasant Kunj
Sangeet Vidhyalaya http://sangeetvidhyalaya.com/	2004	Vasant Kunj
Shivali Music centre		Vasant Kunj

Name	Year of Establishment	Location (City)
Swarangan		Vasant Kunj
Dhwani Sangeet Mahavidyalaya https://dhwanisangeet.com/		Gurugram (NCR)
Indian Music Academy		Gurugram (NCR)
Indian Idol Music academy		Gurugram (NCR)
MPGM Music Academy		Gurugram (NCR)
MusicTek		Gurugram (NCR)
Pandit Bhimsen Joshi Academy Gurgaon https://www.bhimsenjoshisangeet.com/#gsc.tab=0	37 years ago.	Gurugram (NCR)
Raagaaz Music Academy http://www.ragaaz.com/	2018	Gurugram (NCR)
Reet Sangeet Music Academy	2019	Gurugram (NCR)
Sai Blessed Music School http://sbmusicschool.com/		Gurugram (NCR)
Sangeet Kala Kendra		Gurugram (NCR)
ShrishtiShakti music school http://shrishtishakti.com/		Gurugram (NCR)
Sur Noopur		Gurugram (NCR)

Bihar:

Name	Year of Establishment	Location (City)
Amar Sir Arts Music and Dance classes		Patna
AMBA music classes		Patna
Aradhana Music classes		Patna
Chandrakala Sangeet Vidyalaya		Patna

Chromatic Art Dance and Music school		Patna
Dhurv Music academy		Patna
Kalakriti School of Music Art and Theatre		Patna
Manorama Music and dance academy	1995	Patna
Nalanda Sangeet Mahavidyalaya	2005	Patna
New Sangeet Academy		Patna
Octave music classes		Patna
Prabhakar institute of Dance Music and Arts		Patna
Sangeet Sudha Foundation		Patna
Sargam Music classes		Patna
Smart Music		Patna
Swar Sadhna Music and dance Academy		Patna
Symphobia Music Academy	2004	Patna
Vyas Sangeet Kala Kendra	2011	Patna
Being Musician Institute of Music		Gaya
Dr. Shivanand Smriti Chitrakala Samiti		Gaya
Guitar class by Surender Sir		Gaya
Kalamandir Music & Dance classes		Gaya
Kunal's guitar class		Gaya
Mahamaya Art and Culture		Gaya
Mausiiqi		Gaya
Raaga institute of music		Gaya
Saarang art & music institute		Gaya
Sharda Music classes		Gaya
Sur Sadhna Sangeet Siksha Kendra		Gaya
Swaranjali Music school		Gaya
Badshah Music Academy		Muzaffarpur
Bhairavi (Institute of Music)		Muzaffarpur
Divya Jyoti Music Institute and Recording Studio		Muzaffarpur
Drawing and Music classes		Muzaffarpur
Guruvar Sangit Mahavidyalaya		Muzaffarpur
Melodious Music institute		Muzaffarpur

Name	Location
Pandit Saryu Pathak Dhrupad Kendra	Muzaffarpur
SSR Music and dance institute	Muzaffarpur
Sangeetalaya classical and light music academy	Muzaffarpur
Srijaya Arts Coaching centre	Muzaffarpur
Sur Saptak School	Muzaffarpur

Uttar Pradesh:

Name	Location
Bharti Music classes	Lucknow
DNT Music academy	Lucknow
Dhun Music Academy	Lucknow
Gunjan Musical Academy	Lucknow
Horizon Institute for Performing Arts	Lucknow
Indian Idol Academy	Lucknow
Indie school of Music	Lucknow
Jhankar Sangeet Vidyalaya	Lucknow
Lyrics Academy of Music (Multiple branches) http://lyricsacademy.in/	Lucknow
Laxmi Sangeet Vidyalaya	Lucknow
Maa Vaishno Music and Dance Academy	Lucknow
Manjari's Institute of Music and Fine Arts	Lucknow
Parth Mudic classes	Lucknow
RJ Musical classes	Lucknow
SD Music classes	Lucknow
Sangeet Kala Sansthan	Lucknow
Sarthak Music Institute	Lucknow
Sur Jhankar Music School	Lucknow
Sur sangeet Centre	Lucknow
Surmayy Academy of Music	Lucknow
Symphony Music and Dance Academy	Lucknow
Usha Sagar Sur Musical Institute	Lucknow

A R Dance and Music Academy	Prayagraj
ASA Music academy https://asa-music-academy.business.site/	Prayagraj
Abhikalp School of Arts and Culture	Prayagraj
Abhiruchi Academy	Prayagraj
Allahabad Music institute	Prayagraj
Atamjeet Institute of Dance & Arts	Prayagraj
Bhartiya Sangeet Kala Kendra	Prayagraj
Divya Sangeet Kala Kendra	Prayagraj
Ganpati Sangeet Samiti	Prayagraj
Geetanjali Kala Kendra	Prayagraj
HS Music	Prayagraj
Indian Idol Academy	Prayagraj
Lyrics Academy of Music (Also in Lucknow)	Prayagraj
Madhuvan Music Classes	Prayagraj
Sangam Academy of Music	Prayagraj
Sangeet Pathsala – MANGALAYATAN	Prayagraj
Sangitanjali Sangit Vidyalaya	Prayagraj
Saraswati Sangeetalaya	Prayagraj
Shri Vrinda Prasad Sangeet Mahavidyalaya	Prayagraj
Suruchi School of Arts	Prayagraj
VNS Music Academy	Prayagraj
Vishwas Music Classes https://vishwas-music-classes.business.site/?utm_source=gmb&utm_medium=referral	Prayagraj

Rajasthan:

Name	Location (city)
Always Musical | Music Academy	Jaipur
Angels Music Academy (no classical but playback vocals) https://angelsmusicacademy.com/best-music-courses-in-india/	Jaipur

Anant Sangeet	Jaipur
Anurag Sangeet Sansthan http://jaipurmusic.com/	Jaipur
Bhatkhande Music academy	Jaipur
Devranjani Music School https://devranjani.com/	Jaipur
Dhwani Music Academy	Jaipur
Jaipur Sangeet Mahavidyalaya (Registered) https://www.jaipursangeetmv.com/index.html	Jaipur
Kalakar School of Dance and Music	Jaipur
Kavya's Music academy	Jaipur
Leading Note Music Academy	Jaipur
Malhar Music & Dance Academy https://business.google.com/website/malhar-music-dance-academy	Jaipur
Music Guruz https://musicguruz.weebly.com/we-are-the-guruz-of.html	Jaipur
Music movement school of Art	Jaipur
Rajasthan Sangeet Sansthan	Jaipur
Royal Music institute	Jaipur
Saraswati Sangeet Sasthan	Jaipur
Sargam Music School	Jaipur
Shriram Sangeet Vidyalaya	Jaipur
Shrumani the music Academy	Jaipur
Stars music academy	Jaipur
Sur Music academy	Jaipur
Suravee: Sudesh Sharma Music Academy	Jaipur
Surbhi Sangeet Sanstha http://surbhisangeetsanstha.com/?utm_source=gmb&utm_ medium=referral	Jaipur
Surganga – Institute for Music and Dance	Jaipur
Surtaal Music and Dance Academy	Jaipur
Swaranjali Music class	Jaipur
Swar Sudha Music Academy	Jaipur

Symphonie Music academy		Jaipur
Talent Academy of music
http://talentstudioz.com/singing-classes-in-jaipur.php		Jaipur
The Harmonic music Academy		Jaipur
The Plectrum institute of music
https://theplectruminstituteofmusic.business.site/		Jaipur
Xenith School of Music and Creative Arts		Jaipur

Appendix 5: *Music Societies, Organisations, and NGO's in India*

Name	Year of Establishment	City
Pune Bharat Gayan Samaj (http://www.punebharatgayansamaj.org/)	1991	Pune, Maharashtra
Kalakshetra Foundation (https://www.kalakshetra.in/newsite/)	1936	Chennai, Tamilnadu
Sursagar Society of Delhi Gharana (http://dilligharana.com/organisations/)	1940	Delhi
Sangeet Natak Akademi (https://www.sangeetnatak.gov.in)	1952	Delhi and branches around India
Dadar Matunga Cultural Centre (https://dadarmatungaculturalcentre.org)	1953	Mumbai
Darshak College of Music and Arts (http://www.darshaksanstha.com)	1960	Jaipur, Rajasthan
Sangeetam (http://www.sangeetam.org/index.php)	1972	Gurugram, Haryana (NCR)
Society for Promotion of Indian Classical Music and Culture Amongst Youth (SPIC MACAY) (https://spicmacay.org)	1977	Delhi

Centre for Cultural Resources and Training (http://ccrtindia.gov.in/index.php)	1979	Delhi
Ustad Immamuddin Khan Dagar Indian Music Art & Culture society (https://www.dagars.org)	2003	Jaipur, Rajasthan
Hindustan Art and Music Society (https://www.hamsociety.com/)	2010	Kolkata, West Bengal
Nadsadhna Institute for Indian Music and Research Centre (http://nadsadhna.com/)	2010	Jaipur, Rajasthan
Naadyatra Foundation (https://www.naadyatra.com/)	2014	Delhi and Gurugram, Haryana (NCR)
Kirana Gharana Foundation (Facebook Page)	2015	Delhi
Snehlata Memorial Foundation (https://snehalatamemorialfoundation.com/)	2018	Gurugram, Haryana (NCR)
Geetanjali Music Society		Jaipur, Rajasthan
ICMA Foundation (http://www.icmafoundation.org/)		
Music Basti		Delhi
Pandit Siyaram Tiwari Memorial Sangeet Trust (http://www.sumeetanand.com/pstmst.html?fbclid=IwAR35Eq0-EzHzsk3Np4XtUwYXHZjkO97XxdBK5eLO2tsubkrQhDA4rcy_BC0)		Delhi/Patna
Rajasthan Sangeet Sansthan		Jaipur, Rajasthan
Satrang Kala Foundation		Delhi
Shubhendra and Saskia Rao Foundation (http://www.music4all.org/)		Delhi
Society for Action through Music (SAM)		Gurugram, Haryana (NCR)

Swar Dharohar Foundation		Ghaziabad, Uttar Pradesh (NCR)
Swaranjali		Delhi
The Anad Foundation (https://anadfoundation.org/)		Delhi
The Ravi Shankar Centre (http://www.ravishankar.org/)		Delhi
The Raza Foundation (https://www.therazafoundation.org/)	2011	Delhi

Appendix 6: *List of Interviews, interactions, and vocal class observations*

All interviews were conducted face-to-face, unless otherwise stated; either in Delhi, Gurugram, or Patna. I have also used pseudonyms here for those institutions and people for whom I have used so throughout the thesis.

Music departments, institutions, and their teachers or owners (pseudonyms used or anonymised):

Music teachers and director of ART Music School, Interview by author, Delhi, December 19, 2016

Manager of a branch of TRN Sangeet Vidyalaya, Interview by author, Gurugram, July 17, 2017

Dean (at the time) of Faculty of Music and Fine Arts, University of Delhi, interview by author, Delhi, July 9, 2018.

Dr. Kalpana, Interview by author, Patna, August 27, 2018.

Ms. Arti, interaction with author, Patna, September 1, 2018.

Owner of Vishal Sangeet Vidyalaya, interview by author, Patna, September 1, 2018.

Dr. Shalini and Dr. Ajeet of Rohini College, conversation with author, Patna, September 7, 2018.

Mrs. Kanika of Kala Sangam School of Music, interview by author, Patna, September 8, 2018.

Mr. Shukla of Shukla Sangeet Kendra, interview by author, Patna, September 9, 2018.

Mr. Rohit of Kala Sangam School of Music, informal conversation, Patna, September 16, 2018.

Mr. Singh, owner of CRF School of Performing Arts, interview by author, Delhi, September 25, 2018.

Mr. Kuldeep of GAD Academy of art, music and dance, interview by author, Delhi, November 12, 2018.

Mr. Singh, owner of CRF School of Performing Arts, interview by author, Delhi, November 14, 2018.

Mr. Suresh of MHL Academy, interview by author, Delhi, November 19, 2018.

Mr. Vinay of LHJ Sangeet Vidyalaya, interview by author, Gurugram, November 19, 2018.

Mr. Sunil of AGE Music School, interview by author, Gurugram, November 22, 2018.

Mrs. Singha of GAD Academy of art, music and dance, interaction with author, Delhi, November 25, 2018.

Mr. Vinay, follow-up interview by author, Gurugram, January 30, 2020.

Mr. Suresh, follow-up interview by author, Delhi, March 2, 2020.

Indian classical music (vocals) class observation or trial class (pseudonyms used):

AGE music school, class observation, November 29, 2018.

CRF School of Performing Arts, trial class, September 25, 2018.

Department of Music, Rohini College, class observation, September 11, 2018.

GAD Academy of Art, Music and Dance, Indian vocal music class observation, November 25, 2018.

Kala Sangam School of Music, observation of class by Mrs. Kanika, September 2, 2018.

Kala Sangam School of Music, observation of class by Mrs. Kanika, September 16, 2018.

Kala Mandir Society, observation of class by Ms Arti, September 1, 2018.

LHJ Sangeet Vidyalaya, class observation, December 3, 2018.

LHJ Sangeet Vidyalaya, school tour, December 3, 2018.

MNZ Music Academy, Indian vocal music class observation, Delhi, July 28, 2018.

MHL Academy, class observation, March 2, 2020.

Rohini College, class observation and its photos at Department of Music, September 14, 2018.

Shukla Sangeet Kendra, class observation, September 9, 2018.

Vishal Sangeet Vidyalaya, class observation, September 1, 2018.

Musicians and participants of music organisations:

SPIC MACAY senior volunteer, Interview by author, Delhi, July 17, 2017 (Anonymised).

Darbhanga gharana musician, Interview by author, Delhi, January 6, 2018 (Anonymised).

Pandit Sarathi Chatterjee and Saptak Chatterjee, interview by author, Gurugram, August 10, 2018.

Pandit Sarathi Chattejee, conversation with author, Gurugram, October 23, 2018.

Pandit Sarathi Chattejee, phone conversation and follow-up interview by author, April 20, 2020.

Pandit Vijay Shankar Mishra, interview by author, August 4, 2018.

Pandit Shubhendra Rao and Vidushi Saskia Rao-de Haas, interview by author, Delhi, August 8, 2018.

Dr. Seth, interview by author, Delhi, September 29, 2018.

Dr. Seth, interview by author, Delhi, December 1, 2018.

Student Volunteer, interview by author, Delhi, December 1, 2018 (Anonymised).

Ustad Iqbal Ahmed Khan, interview by author, Delhi, October 20, 2018.

Ustad Iqbal Ahmed Khan, interview by author, Delhi, November 15, 2018.

Other Interviews:

Mr. Girijanand Singh, conversation with author, Delhi, December 20, 2016.

Mrs. Aparna (Music student), Interview by author, Mumbai, December 28, 2016.

Mrs. Urvashi, conversation with author, Mumbai, December 30, 2016.

Mr. Prashant (Singer and Music composer), Interview by author, Mumbai, December 31, 2016.

Prof. Suneera Kasliwal, interview by author, Delhi, June 14, 2017.

Prof. Suneera Kasliwal, interview by author, Delhi, July 9, 2018.

Mr. Santosh Nahar, conversation with author and written interview, Delhi, June 14, 2017.

Mr. Irfan Zuberi, conversation with author, Delhi, June 19, 2017.

Mr. Rajkumar Nahar, conversation with author, Patna, June 22, 2017.

Mr. Matthew, conversation with author, Patna, June 26, 2017.

Mr. Rajkumar Nahar, interview by author, Patna, June 30, 2017.

Pandit Gajendranarayan Singh, Interview by author, Patna, June 26, 2017.

Pandit Uday Mallick (Darbhanga gharana), interview by author, Gurugram, July 13, 2017.

Pandit Uday Mallick (Darbhanga gharana), interview by author, Gurugram, August 2, 2017.

Pandit Uday Mallick (Darbhanga gharana), interview by author, Gurugram, December 20, 2017.

Pandit Naresh Malhotra, interview by author, Delhi, July 18, 2017.

Dr. K. Vageesh, interview by author, Delhi, July 18, 2017.

Babar Latif, interview by author, Delhi, July 19, 2017.

Ujwal Nagar, interview by author, Delhi, July 22, 2017.

K. Ganesh Kumar, interview by author, Mumbai, August 19, 2017

Shridhar Ranganathan, Smita Chakravorty, and Ms. Tara Kini, interview by author, Skype, August 16, 2017.

Ustad Wasifuddin Dagar, interview by author, Delhi, August 17, 2017.

Pandit Madhup Mudgal, interview by author, July 17, 2018.

Prof. Ojesh Pratap Singh, phone conversation with author, July 26, 2018.

Prof. Ojesh Pratap Singh, conversation with author, August 1, 2018

Pandit Vijayshankar Mishra, interview by author, August 5, 2018.

Pandit Devanand Thakur (*Hindustani* classical musician and music teacher), conversation with author, Patna, August 26, 2018.

Ms. Shyama, interview by author, Patna, August 29, 2018.

Sawani Mudgal, interview with author, Delhi, October 7, 2018.

Pandit Vidyadhar Vyas, interview by author, Delhi, November 6, 2018.

Mr. Monish at Pandit Bhimsen Joshi Sangeet Academy, interview by author, November 24, 2018.

Ms. Shrishti of Shrishtishakti, conversation with author during vocals class, December 1, 2018.

Sumeet Anand, interaction with author, December 12, 2018.

Glossary

Aaroh – The ascending order of a set of notes in a *Raga* (Shrivastava 2016, 119).

Akhil Bharatiya Gandharva Mahavidyalaya Mandal – All India Music university board.

Adi Brahmo Sangeet Vidyalaya – Adi Brahmo Music school

Alaap – literally 'Discourse,' where 'the musician typically unfolds the raga note by note, phrase by phrase, in a leisurely manner' (Schippers 2016, 81).
Or, it is when the notes of a *raga* are sung in a detailed or leisurely manner in a slow tempo (Shrivastava 2016, 127).

Allahabad – The colloquial and most used name of state capital which is officially known as *Prayagraj* in the state of Uttar Pradesh. *Allahabad* was also the official name before it was changed to *Prayagraj* in 2018 by the state government.

Antara – 'The second stanza of a composition in a raga' (Hindustani Classical Music, n.d.).

Anuvadi – Other *swara*s or notes besides the *vadi* and *samvadi* in a *raga* is called *anuvadi* (Shrivastava 2016, 124).

Avroh – descending order of a set of notes in a *Raga* (Shrivastava 2016, 119).

Bandish – The main text of a *Raga*.

Bania – one of the business or merchant castes and classes in India.

Bharat Sangeet Samaj – Indian Society of Music

Bombay – Mumbai, capital city of the state of Maharashtra today, was known as Bombay under the colonial rule in the pre-1947 period.

Braj Bhasha – It is a north Indian language and a dialect of Hindi. It is primarily spoke in the western part of India, specifically cities like Mathura, Agra, Etah, and Aligarh which are situated in the western Uttar Pradesh (Britannica, n.d.).

Carnatic music **or** ***Karnatak Sangeet*** – South Indian classical music tradition, usually practiced in the southern Indian states of Tamilnadu, Kerala, Andhra Pradesh, Telangana, and Karnataka, (Shrivastava 2016, 106). Karnataka, however, had a significant influence of the *Hindustani* or north Indian classical music with renowned musicians in this field coming from this state (Niranjana 2013). It can also be spelt *Karnatak* or *Karnatik sangeet*/music.

Devadasis – *Devadasis* were the temple dancers in south India who were dedicated to a deity, but some of them also performed in courts and for Brahmin patrons (Soneji 2012).

Dhrupad – one of the styles or genres of *Hindustani* classical music which is 'considered to be one of the oldest of the three principal genres and is associated with alap, the improvised raga prelude that is considered by some to constitute a separate genre' (Widdess 2010, 117).

Durga Puja – Nine-day annual Hindu festival commemorating goddess Durga.

Dyan Prasarak Mandali – the Society for the Dissemination of Knowledge (Rosse, 1995).

Gaayan Samay – Time of the *Raga*. Each *Raga* is associated with a time of the day and evokes the desired mood during that time. One of the important information on a *raga* that students are made to write in an institutional music training.

Gharana – family or lineage-based guilds in *Hindustani* classical music, with each having a unique style (Neuman 1990).

Gharanedar – Of a *gharana*. The term *gharanedar* musician has been traditionally used for hereditary musician of any *gharana*.

Gurgaon – Colloquial and most often used name of the city officially known as *Gurugram*. *Gurgaon* was the official name until 2016 before it was changed to *Gurugram* by the state government of Haryana.

Gurukul – *Gurukul* literally means the lineage (*kul*) of the teacher (*guru*), which means that a child, in order to complete his education, was sent to the teacher's home where he grew up becoming a part of the teacher's household and also getting his education. The *guru-shishya parampara* in the ancient India was intertwined with the *gurukul* system.

Guru mukhi vidya – literally means knowledge from the *guru*'s mouth. One-to-one training from a *guru* in a *guru-shishya* method is considered the best way of learning Indian classical music.

Guru-shishya Parampara – Master-Disciple relationship, often associated with the *gurukul* system of training.

Hindustani music – North Indian classical music tradition, largely practiced in the northern part of India and including Bengal in the east, and Karnataka in the South (Shrivastava 2016, 106).

Jaati – *Jaati* is used to recognise the number of notes being used in a *raga* (Shrivastava, 2016: 122).

Khyal – One of the three styles of three principal styles of *Hindustani* classical music today, the other two being *dhrupad* and *thumri* (Widdess 2010).

Natyashastra – Ancient Indian book written in Sanskrit on Indian performing arts, particularly containing all aspects of dramatic art or Theatre – acting, dancing, and music.

Pakad – The smallest group of notes by which a *Raga* is recognised (Shrivastava 2016, 121).

Pandit – A title used by *guru* and accomplished performing artist, usually a Hindu. *Ustad* is the title used for the Muslim counterparts.

Parampara - Tradition

Parsis in India – The *Parsi* community in India 'trace their ancestry and religious identity to pre-Islamic, Zoroastrian Iran (pre-651 CE),' (Pelsatia 2001, 1).

Pataliputra – recorded ancient Indian name of city of Patna, capital of the state of Bihar (Basham 1959).

Prayag Sangeet Samiti – Prayag Music Committee

Prayagraj – official name of the city of Allahabad in the Indian state of Uttar Pradesh. Allahabad was the official name until 2018.

Pracheen Kala Kendra – Centre of Ancient arts

Samvadi – The second-most important *Swar* or note of a *Raga* (Shrivastava 2016, 123).

Sangit Samalochani – The Music Review

Sanskar – values or cultivated taste.

Saptak – Seven pure notes in sequence – *Sa re ga ma pa ni* – are together known as Saptak.

Sargam – Seven basic notes in Indian music

Sriram Bharatiya Kala Kendra – Sriram Centre for Indian arts

Sthayi – 'The first stanza of a composition in a *raga*' (Hindustani Classical Music, n.d.).

Swaralipi – Notation (system)

Tawa'ifs - Courtesans

Thaat – Group of main 7 *Swara*s or notes out of 12 *swara*s of a Saptak out of which *ragas* are born (Shrivastava 2016).

Triveni Kala Sangam – Confluence of different arts (DHNS 2014).

Ustad-Shagird relationship – Master-apprentice relationship (Neuman 1990).

Vadi – The most important *swar* or note in a *Raga* (Shrivastava 2016, 123).

Important Note

I have not used any transliterations in the text. All the non-English words are in *Italics* throughout except the names of music schools, institutions, and organisations. I have also used italics for the names of books, if written in the text, and to emphasise important concepts if needed. Meanings of most of the non-English words are provided in the glossary above, including the names of music institutions.

Bibliography

Hindi-language publications:

Bansal, Dipti. 2016. "Bharatvarsh mein Sangeet-Shiksha pranaaliyon ka vikaas: Ek Avlokan." In *Sangeet Chintan*, edited by Ambika Kashyap. New Delhi: Kanishka Publishers.

Kumari, Anamika. 2016. "Vartaman samay mein guru-shishya parampara evam abhyaas ka mahatva (Tabla vaadan ke sandarbh mein)." In *Sangeet Chintan*, edited by Ambika Kashyap. New Delhi: Kanishka Publishers.

Mishra, Shiv Narayan. 2016. "Bihar ke Sangeet gharane evam paramparayein." In, *Sangeet Chintan*, edited by Ambika Kashyap. New Delhi: Kanishka Publishers.

Pandeya, Kritanand. 2016. *Tabla-Vaadan Shiksha Ke Badalte Aayaam*. New Delhi: Kanishka Publishers.

Patwardhan, Sudha. 2016. *Sangeet Shiksha*. Second ed. New Delhi: Kanishka Publishers.

Shrivastava, Harishchandra. 2016. *Rag Parichay*. Allahabad: Sangeet Sadan Prakashan

Singh, Gajendranarayan. 2008. *Sureele Logon ki Sangat*. New Delhi: Kanishka Publishers

Hindi and English language publications:

Chourasiya, Om Prakash, ed. 2013. *Distance Education in Music: Durasth Sangeet Shiksha*. New Delhi: Kanishka Publishers.

English-language publications

Aiyer, S. K. 1966. *The Societies Registration Act 1860*, edited by T. N. Hukku. Third Edition ed. Allahabad: University Book Agency.

Alaghband-Zadeh, Chloë. 2017. "Listening to North Indian Classical Music: How Embodied Ways of Listening Perform Imagined Histories and Social Class." 61 (2): 207-233. https://doi.org/10.5406/ethnomusicology.61.2.0207.

Althusser, Louis. 1971. "Ideology and Ideological State Apparatuses: Notes Toward an Investigation." In *Lenin and Philosophy and Other Essays*. New York: Monthly Review.

Anderson, Benedict. 1983. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. London: Verso.

Anderson, Edward and Christophe Jaffrelot. 2018. "Hindu nationalism and the 'saffronisation of the public sphere': an interview with Christophe Jaffrelot." *Contemporary South Asia* 26 (4): 468-482. https://doi.org/10.1080/09584935.2018.1545009.

Appadurai, Arjun. 1986. "Introduction: Commodities and the Politics of Value." In *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective*, edited by Arjun Appadurai, 3-63. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Appadurai, Arjun and Carol A. Breckenridge. 1995. "Public Modernity in India." In *Consuming Modernity: Public Culture in a South Asian World*, edited by Carol A. Breckenridge, 1-20. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Apple, Michael and Nancy R. King. 1977. "What Do Schools Teach?" *Curriculum Inquiry* 6 (4): 341-358. https://doi.org/10.2307/1179656.

Apple, Michael W. 1982. *Education and Power*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Apple, Michael W. 1979. *Ideology and Curriculum*. First ed. Oxon: Routledge.

Arnold, David. 2010. "Another India." In *A History of India*, edited by Burton Stein and David Arnold. Second ed., 398-420. Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell.

Avis, R. 2019. "Bi-musical Curricula and "Abyssal Thinking": The Case of KM Music Conservatory, India." *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 18 (3): 26-55. https://doi.org/10.22176/act18.3.26

Bakhle, Janaki. 2005. *Two Men and Music: Nationalism in the Making of an Indian Classical Tradition.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Banerjee, Jayasri. 1986. "The Methodology of Teaching Indian classical music: A Statement on the Problem." *Journal of the Sangeet Natak Akademi* 79: 11-48

Banerji, Anurima. 2019. *Dancing Odissi: Paratopic Performances of Gender and State*. Pennsylvania, USA: Seagull Books.

Basham, A.L. 1954. *The Wonder that was India: A Survey of the History and Culture of the Indian sub-continent before the coming of the Muslims*. London: Sidgwick & Jackson

Barlow, Jon and Lakshmi Subramanian. 2007. "Music and Society in North India: From the Mughals to the Mutiny." *Economic and Political Weekly* 42: 1779-87. https://www.jstor.org/stable/4419584.

Barz, Gregory F. 2008. "Confronting the Field(Note) in and Out of the Field." In *Shadows in the Field: New Perspectives for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology*, edited by Gregory F. Barz and Timothy J. Cooley, 206-223. New York: Oxford University Press.

Baviskar, Amita, and Raka Ray, eds. 2011. *Elite and Everyman: The Cultural Politics of the Indian Middle Classes*. New York: Routledge.

Beaman, Jean. 2016. "Citizenship as cultural: Towards a theory of cultural citizenship." *Sociology Compass* 10: 849-857. https://doi.org/10.1111/soc4.12415.

Beaster-Jones, Jayson. 2013. "Film Song and its Other: Stylistic Mediation and the Hindi Film Song Genre." In *More than Bollywood: Studies in Indian Popular Music*, edited by Gregory Booth and Bradley Shope, 97-113. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Beaudry, Nicole. 2008. "The Challenges of Human Relations in Ethnographic Enquiry: Examples from Artic and Subartic Fieldwork." In *Shadows in the Field: New Perspectives for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology*, edited by Gregory F. Barz and Timothy J. Cooley, 63-83. New York: Oxford University Press.

Bhargava, Rajeev. 1998. "Introduction." In *Secularism and its Critics: Themes in Politics*, edited by Rajeev Bhargava, 1-28. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Bhattacharjya, Nilanjana and Monika Mehta. 2008. "From Bombay to Bollywood: Tracking Cinematic and Musical Tours." In *Global Bollywood: Travels of Hindi Song and Dance*, edited by Sangita Gopal and Sujata Moorti, 105-131. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Bigenho, Michelle. 2008. "Why I'm Not an Ethnomusicologist: A view from Anthropology."
In *The New (Ethno)musicologies*, edited by Henry Stobart, 28-39. Maryland: Scarecrow
Press Inc.

Bithell, Caroline. 2003. "On the Playing Fields of the World (and Corsica): Politics, Power,
Passion and Polyphony." *British Journal of Ethnomusicology* 12 (1): 67-95.
https://doi.org/10.1080/09681220308567353

Booth, Gregory. 2013. "The Beat Comes to India: The Incorporation of Rock Music into the
Indian Soundscape." In *More than Bollywood: Studies in Indian Popular Music*, edited
by Gregory D. Booth and Bradley Shope, 216-237. Oxford: Oxford Scholarship Online.
https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199928835.001.0001.

Booth, Gregory. 2008. *Behind the Curtain: Making Music in Mumbai's Film Studios*. New
York: Oxford University Press.

Booth, Gregory. 1983. "The Teaching of North Indian Music: Three Case
Studies." *Contributions to Music Education* 10 (10): 1-
7. https://www.jstor.org/stable/24127372.

Bourdieu, Pierre. 1984. *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. United
States of America: Routledge & Kegan Paul Ltd.

Brosius, Christiane. 2010. *India's Middle Class: New Forms of Urban Leisure, Consumption
and Prosperity*. London; New York; Delhi: Routledge.

Brown, Katherine Butler. 2007. "Did Aurangzeb Ban Music? Questions for the
Historiography for His Reign." *Modern South Asian Studies* 41 (1): 77-
120. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0026749X05002313.

Brown, Katherine Butler. 2010. "The Origins and Early Development of Khayal." In
Hindustani Music: Thirteenth to Twentieth Centuries, edited by Joep Bor, Françoise
'Nalini' Delvoye, Jane Harvey and Emmie te Nijenhuis, 159-191. New Delhi: Manohar.

Calvey, David. 2008. "The Art and Politics of Covert Research: Doing 'Situated Ethics' in
the field." *Sociology* 42(5): 905-918. https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038508094569.

Carruthers, Glen. 2008. "Educating Professional Musicians: Lessons Learned from School Music." *International Journal of Music Education* 26 (2): 127-135. https:/doi.org/10.1177/0255761407088487.

Chacko, Priya. 2019. "Marketizing Hindutva: The state, society, and markets in Hindu nationalism." *Modern South Asian Studies* 53 (2): 377-410. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0026749X17000051.

Chakravarty, Uma. 1990. "Whatever Happened to the Vedic *Dasi*?: Orientalism, Nationalism, and a Script for the Past." In *Recasting Women: Essays in Indian Colonial History*, edited by Kumkum Sangari and Sudesh Vaid, 27-87. New Brunswick, N.J.: Rutgers University Press.

Chandra, Bipan. 2009. *History of Modern India*. India: Orient Blackswann

Chatterjee, Partha. 1993. *The Nation and its Fragments: Colonial and Postcolonial Histories*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Chatterjee, Partha. 1998. "Secularism and Tolerance." In *Secularism and its Critics: Themes in Politics*, edited by Rajeev Bhargava, 345 - 379. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Chatterjee, Partha. 2004. *The Politics of the Governed: Reflections on Popular Politics in most of the World*. New York; Chichester: Columbia University Press.

Chung, Ed and Carolan McLarney. 2000. "The Classroom as a Service Encounter: Suggestions for Value Creation." *Journal of Management Education* 24 (4): 484-500. https://doi.org/10.1177/105256290002400407

Clayton, Martin and Laura Leante. 2015. "Role, Status and Hierarchy in the Performance of North Indian Classical Music." *Ethnomusicology Forum* 24 (3): 414-442. https://doi.org/10.1080/17411912.2015.1091272

Clifford, James. 1988. *The Predicament of Culture: Twentieth-Century Ethnography, Literature, and Art*. Cambridge, Mass.; London: Harvard University Press.

Coffman, Don D. 2002. "Adult Education." In *The New Handbook of Research on Music Teaching and Learning*, edited by Richard Colwell and Carol Richardson, 199-209. New York: Oxford University Press

Cohn, Bernard S. 1990. *An Anthropologist among the Historians and Other Essays*. New Delhi; Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Colletta, N. J. 1996. "Formal, Non-Formal and Informal Education." In *International Encyclopedia of Adult Education and Training*, edited by Albert Tuijnman, 22-27. Oxford: Pergamon Press.

Cooley, Timothy J. 2003. "Theorizing Fieldwork Impact: Malinowski, peasant-love and friendship." *British Journal of Ethnomusicology* 12 (1): 1-17. https://doi.org/10.1080/09681220308567349.

Corbin, Juliet and Anselm Strauss. 1990. "Grounded Theory Research: Procedures, Canons and Evaluative Criteria." *Zeitschrift Für Soziologie* 19 (6): 418-427. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00988593.

Creswell, John. W. 2009. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. London: Sage.

Das, C.L. 2012. *King of Dhrupad: Pandit Ramchatur Mallick*. Delhi: Kanishka Publishers.

Das Gupta, Chitrashee. 2010. "Unravelling Bihar's 'Growth Miracle'." *Economic and Political Weekly* 45 (32): 50-62. https://www.jstor.org/stable/27917964.

Davies, Bronwyn and Peter Bansel. 2007. "Neoliberalism and education." *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education* 20 (3): 247-259. https://doi.org/10.1080/09518390701281751

Deshpande, Vamanrao H. 1987. *Indian Musical Traditions: An Aesthetic Study of the gharanas in Hindustani Music*. Mumbai: Popular Prakashan Private limited

Devidayal, Namita. 2008. *The Music Room*. Gurgaon: Penguin Random House India Pvt. Ltd.

Donner, Henrike. 2013. *Being middle-class in India: a way of life*. London: Routledge

Dwyer, Rachel. 2014. *Bollywood's India: Hindi Cinema as a guide to contemporary India*.
    London: Reaction books

Engineer, A.A. 1995. *Lifting the Veil: Communal Violence and Communal Harmony in
    Contemporary India*. Bombay: Sangam Books.

Fernandes, Leela. 2000. "Restructuring the New Middle Class in Liberalizing
    India." *Comparative Studies of South Asia, Africa and the Middle East* 20 (1): 88-104.
    https://doi.org/10.1215/1089201X-20-1-2-88.

Fernandes, Leela. 2006. *India's New Middle Class: Democratic Politics in an Era of
    Economic Reform*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Folkestad, Göran. 2005. "Here, there and everywhere: music education research in a
    globalised world." *Music Education Research* 7 (3): 279-287.
    https://doi.org/10.1080/14613800500324390.

Foucault, Michel. 1975. *Discipline & Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. Translated by Alan
    Sheridan. Second Vintage Books ed. New York: Random House Inc.

Foucault, Michel. 1998. "Different Spaces." In *Essential Works of Foucault, Vol. 2:
    Aesthetics, Method and Epistemology*, edited by James D. Faubion, 175 - 185. New
    York: New Press.

Geertz, Clifford. 1973. *The Interpretation of Cultures: Selected Essays*. Basic Books: United
    States.

Gershon, Ilana. 2011. "Neoliberal Agency." *Current Anthropology* 52 (4): 537-555.
    https://doi.org/10.1086/660866

Ghosh, P. P. 2007. "Change from the Middle?" *The Paradox that is Bihar: A Symposium on
    the State's Efforts at Overcoming a Troubled Past*. Seminar (580). https://www.india-
    seminar.com/2007/580.htm.

Gilbert, Melissa R. 1994. "The Politics of Location: Doing Feminist Research at "Home"."
The Professional Geographer 46 (1): 90-96. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0033-
0124.1994.00090.x

Godbole, Girija. 2014. "Revealing and Concealing: Ethical Dilemmas of Maneuvering
Identity in the Field." In Fieldwork in the Global South: Ethical Challenges and
Dilemmas, edited by Jenny Lunn, 85-95. London; New York: Routledge.

Gopal, Surendra. 1982. Patna in the 19th Century: A Socio-Cultural Profile. Calcutta: Naya
Prokash.

Hardy, Kathryn C. 2010. "Mediating Bhojpuriya: Migration, Circulation, and Bhojpuri
Cinema." South Asian Popular Culture 8 (3): 231-244.
https://doi.org/10.1080/14746689.2010.501543

Harvey, David. 2005. A Brief History of Neoliberalism. New York: Oxford University Press
Inc.

Hellier-Tinoco, Ruth. 2003. "Experiencing People: Relationships, Responsibility and
Reciprocity." British Journal of Ethnomusicology 12 (1): 19-34.
https://doi.org/10.1080/09681220308567350.

Hobsbawm, Eric and Terence Ranger, eds. 1983. The Invention of Tradition. Cambridge:
Cambridge University Press.

Isin, Engin F. and Bryan S. Turner, ed. 2003. Handbook of citizenship studies. London: Sage.

Jackson, Philip W. 1968. Life in Classrooms. First ed. New York: Holt, Rinehart, and
Winston.

Jaffrelot, Christophe. 1996. The Hindu Nationalist Movement and Indian Politics, 1925 to the
1990s: Strategies of Identity-Building, Implantation and Mobilisation (with Special
Reference to Central India). London: Hurst.

Jairazbhoy, Nazir Ali. 1984. "Ethnomusicology in the Indian Context." NCPA Periodical 13:
31-39.

Jha, Mithilesh Kumar. 2018. *Language, Politics, and Public Sphere in North India: Making of the Maithili Movement*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Jha, Narendra. 2012. *The Making of Bihar and Biharis: Colonialism, Politics and Culture in Modern India, c. 1870-1912*. Daryaganj, New Delhi: Manohar.

Jones, Rhian E. 2018. "Music, Politics and Identity: From Cool Britannia to Grime4Corbyn: The Radical Tradition in Music, in its Multifarious Forms, has Never Gone Away." *Soundings: A Journal of Politics and Culture* (67): 50-61. https://muse.jhu.edu/article/685598.

Joppke, Christian. 2002. "Multicultural Citizenship." In *Handbook of Citizenship Studies*, edited by Engin F. Isin and Bryan S. Turner. London: SAGE.

Kakar, S. 1996. *The Colours of Violence: Cultural identities, Religion and Conflict*. Chicago: Chicago University Press

Kapur, Jyotsna. 2009. "An "Arranged Love" Marriage: India's Neoliberal Turn and the Bollywood Wedding Culture Industry." *Communication, Culture & Critique* 2: 221-233. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1753-9137.2009.01036.x

Kapuria, Radha. 2018. "National, modern, Hindu? The post-independence trajectory of Jalandhar's Harballabh music festival." *The India Economic and Social History Review* 55 (3): 389-418. https://doi.org/10.1177/0019464618778412.

Kapuria, Radha. 2015. "Rethinking Musical Pasts: The Harballabh Festival of Punjab, c. 1875-1950." *Social Scientist* 43 (5/6): 77-91. https://www.jstor.org/stable/24642348.

Kar, Amitabha. 2013. "Music Education – Its indispensability and Mechanism of its positive effects." In *New Dimensions of Indian Music*, edited by Tripti Watwe, 6-8. New Delhi: Kanishka Publishers

Katz, Max. 2017. *Lineage of Loss: Counternarratives of North Indian Music*. Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press.

Khansanzyanova, Albina. 2017. "How volunteering helps students to develop soft skills." *International Review of Education* 63 (3): 363-379. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11159-017-9645-2.

Kippen, James. 1988. *The Tabla of Lucknow: A Cultural Analysis of a Musical Tradition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Kopf, David. 1969. *British Orientalism and the Bengal Renaissance: The Dynamics of Indian Modernisation, 1773-1835*. California: University of California Press.

Kopf, David. 1988. *The Brahmo Samaj and the Shaping of the Modern Indian Mind*. New Delhi: Archives Publishers PVT. LTD.

Krishna, Aditi. 2020. "Teaching Music and transmitting Ideologies: The heterotopic spaces of the new schools in contemporary India." *Musiikkikasvatus: Finish Journal of Music Education* 23 (1&2): 22-33. https://issuu.com/sibelius-akatemia/docs/fjme_vol23_nro1_2_web__1_ .

Kumar, Akshaya. 2018. "*Deswa*, the film and the movement: taste, industry and representation in Bhojpuri cinema." *Contemporary South Asia* 26 (1): 69-85. https://doi.org/10.1080/09584935.2018.1430746.

Kumar, D. 1982. "The Fiscal System." In *The Cambridge Economic History of India, Volume 2: C1757-1970*, edited by Dharma Kumar, 905-912. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Kvetko, Peter. 2013. "Mimesis and Authenticity: The Case of "Thanda Thanda Pani" and Questions of Versioning in North Indian Popular Music." In *More than Bollywood: Studies in Indian Popular Music*, edited by Gregory D. Booth and Bradley Shope. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Laing, Linda C. and Gregory K. Laing. 2016. "The Student - as - Customer Metaphor: A Deconstruction using Foucauldian Constructs." *Australasian Accounting, Business and Finance Journal* 10 (1): 40-54. https://doi.org/10.14453/aabfj.v10i1.5.

Leante, Laura. 2017. "Observing musicians/audience interaction in North Indian classical music performance." In *Musicians and their audiences: Performance, Speech and Mediation*, edited by Loannis Tsioulakis and Elina Hytönen-ng, 34-49. Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge

Lelyveld, David. 1994. "Upon the Subdominant: Administering Music on All-India Radio." *Social Text*, Vol. 39: 111-127. https://doi.org/10.2307/466366.

Lessa, Laura. 2006. "Discursive Struggles within Social Welfare: Restaging Teen Motherhood." *British Journal of Social Work* 36: 283-298. https://doi.org/10.1093/bjsw/bch256.

Ludden, David. 2005. "Introduction - Ayodhya: A Window on the World." In *Making India Hindu: Religion, Community, and the Politics of Democracy in India*, edited by David Ludden. Second ed., 1-23. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Manuel, Peter. 2005. "Music, the Media, and Communal Relations in North India, Past and Present." In *Making India Hindu: Religion, Community, and the Politics of Democracy in India*, edited by David Ludden. Second ed., 119-139. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Manuel, Peter. 2008. "North Indian Sufi Popular Music in the Age of Hindu and Muslim Fundamentalism." *Ethnomusicology* 52 (3): 378-400. https://www.jstor.org/stable/20174605.

Manuel, Peter. 2012. "Popular Music as Popular Expression in North India and the Bhojpuri Region, from Cassette Culture to VCD Culture." *South Asian Popular Culture* 10 (3): 223-236. https://doi.org/10.1080/14746689.2012.706012.

Marriot, John. 2006. "Introduction." In *Britain in India, 1765-1905, Vol. 3: Education and Colonial Knowledge*, edited by John Marriot, Bhaskar Mukhpadhyay and Partha Chatterjee. London: Pickering and Chatto.

Marvasti, Amir. 2004. *Qualitative Research in Sociology*. London; Thousand Oaks; New Delhi: Sage Publications Ltd.

Matthew, Santhosh and Mick Moore. 2011. "State Incapacity by Design: Understanding the Bihar Story." *IDS Working Papers* (366): 1-31. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.2040-0209.2011.00366.x.

Mazzarella, William. 2003. *Shoveling Smoke: Advertising and Globalization in Contemporary India*. London: Duke University Press

McCartney, Patrick. 2019. "Stretching into the Shadows: Unlikely Alliances, Strategic Syncretism, and De-Post-Colonizing Yogaland's "Yogatopia(s)"." *Asian Ethnology* 78 (2): 373-402. https://www.jstor.org/stable/26845332.

McNeil, Adrian. 2018. "Hereditary Musicians, Hindustani Music and the 'Public Sphere' in Late Nineteenth-Century Calcutta." *South Asia: Journal of South Asian Studies* 41(2): 297-314. https://doi.org/10.1080/00856401.2018.1436875.

Meer, Wim van der. 1980. *Hindustani Music in the 20th Century*. The Hague; London: Nijhoff.

Merriam, Alan. 1964. *The Anthropology of Music*. Evanston: Northwestern University.

Miller, Toby. 2006. *Cultural Citizenship: Cosmopolitanism, Consumerism, and Television in a Neoliberal Age*. United States: Temple University Press

Miller, Toby. 2001. "Introducing … Cultural Citizenship" *Social Text* 19 (4): 1-6. https://doi.org/10.1215/01642472-19-4_69-1.

Miner, Allyn. 1993. *Sitar and Sarod in the 18th and 19th Centuries*. Intercultural Music Studies; Wilhelmshaven: Florian Noetzel

Morcom, Anna. 2001. "An Understanding between Bollywood and Hollywood? The Meaning of Hollywood-Style Music in Hindi Films." *British Journal of Ethnomusicology* 10 (1): 63-84. https://doi.org/10.1080/09681220108567310.

Morcom, Anna. 2007. *Hindi Film Songs and the Cinema*. Aldershot, Hants, England; Burlington, VT: Ashgate.

Morcom, Anna. 2013. *Illicit Worlds of Indian Dance: Cultures of Exclusion* London: Hurst & Company.

Morcom, Anna. 2020. "Music, exchange, and the production of value: A case study of Hindustani music." In The *Oxford Handbook of Economic Ethnomusicology*, edited by Anna Morcom and Timothy Taylor. Oxford Handbooks Online.

Moro, Pamela. 2004. "Constructions of Nation and the Classicisation of Music: Comparative Perspectives from Southeast and South Asia." *Journal of Southeast Asian Studies* 35: 187-211. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022463404000116.

Morris, Robert. 2004. "The Survival of Music: Musical Citizenship in South India" *Perspectives of New Music* 42 (2): 66-87. https://www.jstor.org/stable/25164556.

Mukherji, Arnab and Anjan Mukherji. 2012. "Bihar: What Went Wrong? and what Changed?" *National Institute of Public Finance and Policy (NIPFP),* (*Working Paper* No. 107). https://econpapers.repec.org/scripts/redir.pf?u=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.nipfp.org.in%2Fnewweb%2Fsites%2Fdefault%2Ffiles%2FWP_2012_107.pdf;h=repec:npf:wpaper:12/107

Munshi, Shoma. 2008. "Yeh Dil Maange More ... Television and Consumer Choices in a Global City." In *Patterns of Middle-Class Consumption in India and China*, edited by Christophe Jaffrelot and Peter van der Meer, 263-276. India: SAGE Publications India Pvt Ltd.

Murthy, Dhiraj. 2008. "Digital Ethnography: An Examination of the use of New Technologies for Social Research." *Sociology: Special Issue on the Future of the Research Relationship* 42 (5): 837-855. https://doi.org/10.1177/0038038508094565.

Nandy, Ashis. 1998. "The Politics of Secularism and the Recovery of Religious Toleration." In *Secularism and its Critics: Themes in Politics*, edited by Rajeev Bhargava, 321 - 344. New Delhi: Oxford University Press

Narain, Vishal. 2009. "Growing city, shrinking hinterland: land acquisition, transition and conflict in peri-urban Gurgaon, India." *Environment & Urbanization* 21 (2): 501-512. https://doi.org/10.1177/0956247809339660.

Narayana Swamy, V. 1987. *The Law of Clubs and Societies in India: The Societies Registration Act, 1860, the Karnataka Societies Registration Act, 1960 and Rules*. Bangalore: G. V. Murthy.

Nayar, Baldev Raj. 2007. "Globalization, Geopolitics, and India: An Introduction." In *Globalization and Politics in India*, edited by Baldev Raj Nayar, 1-44. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Needham, Anuradha Dingwaney and Rajan, Rajeswari Sunder. 2007. "Introduction". In, *The Crisis of Secularism in India*, 1-42. Ranikhet: Permanent Black

Nettl, Bruno. 2015. *The Study of Ethnomusicology: Thirty-Three Discussions*. Urbana-Champaign: University of Illinois Press

Neuman, Daniel M. 1990. *The Life of Music in North India: The Organization of an Artistic Tradition*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Niranjana, Tejaswini. 2013. "Music in the Balance: Language, Modernity and Hindustani Sangeet in Dharwad." *Economic and Political Weekly* 48 (2): 41-48. https://www.jstor.org/stable/23391182.

Niranjana, Tejaswini. 2020. *Musicophilia in Mumbai: Performing Subjects and the Metropolitan Unconscious*. New Delhi: Tulika Books

Oldenburg, Veena Talwar. 1990. "Lifestyle as Resistance: The Case of the Courtesans of Lucknow, India." *Feminist Studies* 16 (2): 259-287. https://doi.org/10.2307/3177850.

Oldenburg, Veena Talwar. 1984. *The Making of Colonial Lucknow, 1856-1877*. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Oza, Rupal. 2006. *The Making of Neoliberal India: Nationalism, Gender, and the Paradoxes of Globalisation*. New York: Routledge.

Pandya, Amit. 2010. "Muslim Indians: Struggle for Inclusion". Washington: The Henry L. Stimson centre. https://www.files.ethz.ch/isn/116310/Muslim_Indians-Complete.pdf.

Pathak, Dev Nath. 2018. *Living and Dying: Meanings in Maithili Folklore*. Delhi: Primus Books.

Pedersen, JØrgen Dige. 2000. "Explaining Economic Liberalization in India: State and Society Perspectives." *World Development* 28 (2): 265-282. https://doi.org/10.1016/S0305-750X(99)00132-1

Pelsatia, Jesse S. 2001. *The Parsis of India: Preservation of Identity in Bombay City*. Boston: Brill

Pitts, Stephanie. 2003. "What do Students Learn when we Teach Music?: An Investigation of the 'hidden' Curriculum in a University Music Department." *Arts and Humanities in Higher Education* 2 (3): 281-292. https://doi.org/10.1177/14740222030023005.

Pradhan, Aneesh. 2014. *Hindustani Music in Colonial Bombay*. Gurgaon: Three Essays Collective

Pradhan, Aneesh. 2019. *Chasing the Raag Dream: A look into the world of Hindustani Music*. India: HarperCollins Publishers

Pratt, Brian. 2002. "Volunteerism and Capacity Development." *Development Policy Journal* 2: 95-118.

Purkayastha, Prarthana. 2014. *Indian Modern Dance, Feminism and transnationalism*. Basingstoke, England: Palgrave Mcmillan

Qureshi, Regula. 2006. "Female Agency and Patrilinieal Constraints: Situating Courtesans in Twentieth-Century India." In *The Courtesan's Arts: Cross-Cultural Perspectives*, edited by Martha Feldman and Bonnie Gordon, 312-331. New York: Oxford University Press.

Qureshi, Regula. 1991. "Whose Music? Sources and Contexts in Indian Musicology." In *Comparative Musicology and the Anthropology of Music: Essays in the History of Ethnomusicology*, edited by Bruno Nettl and Philip Bohlman, 152-168. Chicago.

Rahaim, Matt. 2011. "That Ban(e) of Indian Music: Hearing Politics in The Harmonium."
The Journal of Asian Studies 70 (3): 657-682.
https://doi.org/10.1017/S0021911811000854.

Raja, Deepak. 2015. *Hindustani music: A Tradition in Transition*. India: D.K. Print World
Ltd.

Regmi, Dhrubesh Chandra. 2018. "The Classical Music Education and Performances in the
Indian Sub-continent: A scenario of Nepal." *Vageeshwari: Department of Music,
University of Delhi* XXXII: 49-57

Reich, Jennifer A. 2015. "Old Methods and New Technologies: Social Media and Shifts in
Power in Qualitative Research." *Ethnography* 16 (4): 394-415.
https://doi.org/10.1177/1466138114552949.

Rice, Timothy. 2008. "Toward a Mediation of Field Methods and Field Experience in
Ethnomusicology." In *Shadows in the Field: New Perspectives for Fieldwork in
Ethnomusicology*, edited by Gregory Barz and Timothy J. Cooley. New York: Oxford
University Press.

Rice, Timothy. 2014. *Ethnomusicology: A Very Short Introduction*. New York: Oxford
University Press.

Rodrigo, Nirmala Kumari. 2018. "The Teaching and Performance of Hindustani classical
music in Sri Lanka." *Vageeshwari: Department of Music, University of Delhi* XXXII:
62-69

Rosse, Michael D. 2010. "Music Schools and Societies in Bombay c.1864-1937." In
Hindustani Music: Thirteenth to Twentieth Centuries, edited by Joep Bor, Françoise
'Nalini' Delvoye, Jane Harvey and Emmie te Nijenhuis, 313-330. New Delhi: Manohar.

Roy, Asit. 2018. "Indian classical Music: Teaching and Performance in Bangladesh."
Vageeshwari: Department of Music, University of Delhi XXXII: 58-62

Roy, Jeff. 2016. "The Internet Guru: Online Pedagogy in Indian classical music traditions."
Asian Music 41(1): 103-135. https://doi.org/10.1353/amu.2016.0001.

Ryle, Gilbert. 1949. *Concept of Mind*. London: Hutchinson and Company

Sajjad, Mohammad. 2014b. *Muslim Politics in Bihar: Changing contours*. London: Routledge

Samanta, Soumyajit. 2008. "The Bengal Renaissance: A Critique." 20th European Conference of Modern South Asian Studies, Manchester, United Kingdom, 8th - 10th July, 2008. https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/33413137.pdf

Sampson, Helen. 2004. "Navigating the Waves: the usefulness of a pilot in qualitative research." *Qualitative Research* 4 (3): 383-402. https://doi.org/10.1177/1468794104047236.

Sarrazin, Natalie. 2013. "Global Masala: Digital Identities and Aesthetic Trajectories in Post-Liberalization Indian Film Music." In *More than Bollywood: Studies in Indian Popular Music*, edited by Gregory D. Booth and Bradley Shope, 38-59. Oxford: Oxford Scholarship Online. https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199928835.001.0001.

Schippers, Huib. 2007. "The Guru Recontextualized? Perspectives on Learning North Indian Classical Music in Shifting Environments for Professional Training." *Asian Music* 38 (1): 123-138. https://doi.org/10.1353/amu.2007.0020.

Schippers, Huib. 2009. *Facing the Music: Shaping Music Education from a Global Perspective*. Oxford: Oxford Scholarship Online. https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195379754.001.0001.

Schippers, Huib. 2016. "Hindustani Music: Resilience and Flexibility in Recontextualizing an Ancient Tradition." In *Sustainable Futures for Music Culture: An Ecological Perspective*, edited by Huib Schippers and Catherine Grant. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Schofield, Katherine Butler. 2010. "Reviving the Golden Age Again: "Classicization," Hindustani Music and the Mughals." *Ethnomusicology*, Vol. 54(3): 484-517. https://doi.org/10.5406/ethnomusicology.54.3.0484.

Sen, Biswarup. 2014. "A New Kind of Radio: FM Broadcasting in India." *Media, Culture & Society* 36 (8): 1084-1099. https://doi.org/10.1177/0163443714544998.

Shelemay, Kay Kaufman. 2013. "The Ethics of Ethnomusicology in a Cosmopolitan Age." In *The Cambridge History of World Music*, ed. Philip V. Bohlman, 786-806. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Shresthova, Sangita. 2011. *Is it all about Hips?: Around the world Bollywood dance*. India: Sage Publications India

Sieber, Joan E. 2009. "Planning Ethically Responsible Research." In *The SAGE Handbook of Applied Social Research Methods*, edited by Leonard Bickman and Debra J. Rog, 106-143. Second ed. Los Angeles, California: Sage.

Silver, Brian. 1984. "The Adab of Musicians." In *Moral Conduct and Authority. The Place of Adab in South Asian Islam*, edited by Barbara D. Metcalf, 315–29. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Singh, N. K. and Nicholas Stern. 2013. "Introduction." In *The New Bihar: Rekindling Governance and Development*, edited by N. K. Singh and Nicholas Stern, xvii-xxx. India: HarperCollins Publishers.

Sinha, Aseema. 2004. "The Changing Political Economy of Federalism in India: A Historical Institutionalist Approach." *India Review* 3 (1): 25-63. https://doi.org/10.1080/14736480490443085.

Slawek, Stephen. 2000. "The Classical Master-Disciple Tradition." In *Garland Encyclopedia of World Music Vol. 5: South Asia*, edited by Alison Arnold. New York: Garland Publishing.

Som, Kalyan Sundar and Mishra, R.P. 2014. "BIMARU States: Need a Rethinking." *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science* 19 (7): 34-41. https://doi.org/10.9790/0837-19713441.

Soneji, Devesh. 2012. *Unfinished Gestures: Devadasis, Memory, and Modernity in South India*. Chicago; London: University of Chicago Press.

Sopam, Reena. 2013. "Ragas and Rhythms of Patna: In Context of the Durga Puja Celebrations." In *New Dimensions of Indian Music*, edited by Tripti Watwe, 98-101. New Delhi: Kanishka Publishers

Spear, Percival. 1951. *Twilight of the Mughals: Studies in the Late Mughal Period*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Srinivas, M.N. 2003[1952]. *Religion and Society among the Coorgs of South India*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Srinivasan, Amrit. 1985. "Reform and Revival: The Devadasi and Her Dance." *Economic and Political Weekly* 20 (44): 1869-1876. https://www.jstor.org/stable/4375001.

Stevens, Stan. 2001. "Fieldwork as Commitment." *Geographical Review* 91 (1/2): 66-73. https://doi.org/10.2307/3250806.

Stevenson, Nick. 2010. "Cultural citizenship, education and democracy: redefining the good society." *Citizenship Studies* 14 (3): 275-291. https://doi.org/10.1080/13621021003731823.

Stevenson, Nick. 2003. "Cultural Citizenship in the 'Cultural' Society: A Cosmopolitan Approach." *Citizenship Studies* 7 (3): 331-348. https://doi.org/10.1080/1362102032000098904.

Stock, Jonathan P.J. and Chou Chiener. 2008. "Fieldwork at home: European and Asian Perspectives." In *Shadows in the Field: New Perspectives for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology*, edited by Gregory F. Barz and Timothy J. Cooley, 108-124. New York: Oxford University Press.

Subramanian, Lakshmi. 2006. "Court to Academy: Karnatik Music." *India International Centre Quarterly* 33 (2): 125-138. https://www.jstor.org/stable/23005877.

Tambiah, Stanley J. 1998. "The Crisis of Secularism in India." In *Secularism and its Critics: Themes in Politics*, edited by Rajeev Bhargava, 418 - 453. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Tambiah, Stanley J. 1996. *Levelling Crowds: Ethnonationalist conflicts and Collective Violence in South Asia*. Berkeley: University of California Press

Theilemann, Selina. 1997. *The Darbhanga Tradition: Dhrupada in the School of Pandit Vidur Mallik*. Varanasi, India: Indica Books

Titon, Jeff Tod. 2008. "Knowing Fieldwork." In *Shadows in the Field: New Perspectives for Fieldwork in Ethnomusicology*, edited by Gregory Barz and Timothy J. Cooley, 25-41. New York: Oxford University Press.

Trasoff, David. 2010. "The All-India Music Conferences of 1916-1925: Cultural Transformation and Colonial Ideology." In *Hindustani Music: Thirteenth to Twentieth Centuries*, edited by Joep Bor, Françoise 'Nalini' Delvoye, Jane Harvey and Emmie te Nijenhuis, 331-356. New Delhi: Manohar.

Tripathy, Ratnakar. 2013. "Mapping the Invisible World of Bhojpuri cinema and its changing Audience." In *Routledge Handbook of Indian Cinemas*, edited by K. Moti Gokulsing, Wimal Dissanayake and Rohit K. Dasgupta, 150-161. Abingdon: Routledge

Tripathy, Ratnakar. 2007. "Bhojpuri Cinema: Regional resonances in the Hindi heartland." *South Asian Popular Culture* 5 (2): 145-165. https://doi.org/10.1080/14746680701619552.

Trivedi, Madhu. 2010. "Music Patronage in the Indo-Persian Context: A Historical Overview." In *Hindustani Music: Thirteenth to Twentieth Centuries*, edited by Joep Bor, Françoise 'Nalini' Delvoye, Jane Harvey and Emmie te Nijenhuis, 65-93. New Delhi: Manohar.

Uberoi, Patricia. 2008. "Aspirational Weddings: The Bridal Magazine and the Canons of 'Decent Marriage'." In *Patterns of Middle-Class Consumption in India and China*, edited by Christophe Jaffrelot and Peter van der Meer, 230-262. India: SAGE Publications India Pvt Ltd

Urita, Michiko. 2016. "Transreligious and Intercommunal: Hindustani music in Classical and Contemporary North India." *Common Knowledge* 22 (2): 190-206. https://doi.org/10.1215/0961754X-3464792.

van Teijlingen, Edwin and Vanora Hundley. 2002. "The Importance of Pilot Studies." *Nursing Standard (through 2013)* 16 (40): 33-36.

Vanaik, Achin. 1997. *The Furies of Indian Communalism: Religion, Modernity and Secularization*. London: Verso

Varma, Pavan Kumar. 1998. *The Great Indian Middle Class*. London: Viking.

Veblen, Kari K. 2012. "Adult Music Learning in Formal, Nonformal, and Informal Contexts." In *The Oxford Handbook of Music Education*, edited by Gary E. McPherson and Graham F. Welch. Vol. 2, 243-256. U.S.: Oxford University Press.

Veblen, Thorstein. 2007[1899]. *The Theory of the Leisure Class*, edited by ProQuest (Firm). Oxford: Oxford University Press Inc.

Venkatnarayanan, S. 2015. "Economic liberalisation in 1991 and its impact on Elementary education in India." *Sage open*: 1-13. https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244015579517.

Wade, Bonnie C. 1998. *Imaging Sound: An Ethno-Musicological Study of Music, Art, and Culture in Mughal India*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Walker, Margaret E. 2014. *India's Kathak Dance in Historical Perspective*. Farnham, Surrey, England: Ashgate Publishing Limited.

Weidman, Amanda J. 2006. *Singing the Classical: Voicing the Modern: The Postcolonial Politics of Music in South India*. Durham; London: Duke University Press.

Weiner, Annette. 1992. *Inalienable possessions: The paradox of keeping while giving*. Berkeley; Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Weininger, Elliot B. and Annette Lareau. 2018. "Pierre Bourdieu's Sociology of Education: Institutional Form and Social Inequality." In *The Oxford Handbook of Pierre Bourdieu*, edited by Thomas Medvetz and Jeffrey J. Sallaz, 253-272. Oxford: Oxford Scholarship Online. https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199357192.013.11.

Widdess, Richard. 1995. *The Rāgas of Early Indian Music: Modes, Melodies, and Musical Notations from the Gupta Period to c. 1250*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Widdess, Richard. 2010. "The Emergence of Dhrupad." In *Hindustani Music: Thirteenth to Twentieth Centuries*, edited by Joep Boer, Françoise 'Nalini' Delvoye, Jane Harvey, and Emmie te Nijenhuis, 117-139. New Delhi: Manohar

Williams, Philippa. 2015. *Everyday Peace?: Politics, Citizenship and Muslim lives in India*. UK: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.

Witsoe, Jeffrey. 2012. "Caste and democratization in postcolonial India: an ethnographic examination of lower caste politics in Bihar." *Democratization* 19 (2): 312-333

Witsoe, Jeffrey. 2011. "Corruption as power: Caste and the political imagination of the postcolonial state." *American Ethnologist* 38(1): 73-85. https://doi.org/10.1080/13510347.2011.593327.

Yadav, Vikas. 2017. "Status of BIMARU States in Socio-Economic Development of India." *Journal of Economics and Sustainable Development* 8 (22): 192-199. https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/234648087.pdf.

PhD Dissertations:

Boyk, David Sol. 2015. "Provincial Urbanity: Intellectuals and Public Life in Patna, 1880-1930." PhD, University of California, Berkley

Desai-Stephens, Anaar Iris. 2017. "Singing through the Screen: Indian Idol and the Cultural Politics of Aspiration." PhD, Cornell University.

Deo, Aditi. 2011. "Alternative Windows into Tradition: Non-Hereditary practices in *Hindustani Khyal* Music." PhD, Indiana University

Hardy, Kathryn C. 2014. "Becoming Bhojpuri: Producing Cinema and Producing Language in Post-Liberalization India." PhD, University of Pennsylvania

Higgins, Niko. 2013. "Confusion in the Karnatic Capital: Fusion in Chennai, India." PhD, Columbia University.

Kannan, Rajalakshmi Nadadur. 2013. "Performing 'Religious' Music: Interrogating Karnatic Music within a Postcolonial Setting." PhD, University of Sterling.

Kobayashi, Eriko. 2003. "Hindustani Classical Music Reform Movement and the Writing of History, 1900s to 1940s." PhD, The University of Texas at Austin.

Krishnamurthy, Rohan. 2013. "Virtual *Gurukulavasa*: Tradition and Innovation in Online *Carnatic* Percussion Pedagogy." PhD, University of Rochester, New York.

Kvetko, Peter. 2005. "Indipop: Producing Global Sounds and Local Meanings in Bombay." PhD, The University of Texas at Austin.

Marsden, Hannah. 2018. "Western Classical Music in Mumbai: Global Music, Local Meanings." PhD, Royal Holloway University of London.

Ranganathan, Sumitra. 2015. "Dwelling in my Voice: Tradition as musical judgment and aesthetic sense in North Indian classical Dhrupad." PhD, University of California Berkeley.

Rosse, Michael David. 1995. "The Movement for the Revitalisation of "Hindu" Music in Northern India, 1860-1930: The Role of Associations and Institutions." PhD, University of Pennsylvania.

Sachdeva, Shweta. 2008. "In Search of the Tawa'if in History: Courtesans, Nautch girls and Celebrity entertainers in India (1720's-1920's)." PhD, School of Oriental and African Studies

Scarimbolo, Justin. 2014. "Brahmans Beyond Nationalism, Muslims Beyond Dominance: A Hidden History of North Indian Classical Music's Hinduization." PhD, University of California, Santa Barbara

Williams, Richard David. 2014. "Hindustani Music between Awadh and Bengal, c.1758-1905." PhD, King's College, University of London.

Young, Katherine. 2019. "Hindi Film Songs and Musical Life in Tamale, Northern Ghana, 1957-Present." PhD, Royal Holloway University of London.

E-Magazines and Websites

Akhil Bhartiya Gandharva Mahavidyalaya Mandal. n.d. "About us." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://abgmvm.org/about-us/.

All Nursery Rhymes. n.d. "Twinkle Twinkle Little Star." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://allnurseryrhymes.com/twinkle-twinkle-little-star/

Anad Foundation. n.d. "About Anad." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://anadfoundation.org/about/

Anad Foundation URFKD. n.d. "Ustad Rahim Fahimuddin Khan Dagar Foundation." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://anadfoundation.org/ustad-rahim-fahimuddin-khan-foundation/.

Anand, Sumeet. n.d. "Pandit Siyaram Tiwari Memorial Trust." Accessed March 15, 2021. http://www.sumeetanand.com/pstmst.html.

Art, Culture & Youth Department Government of Bihar. n.d. "Academies." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://state.bihar.gov.in/yac/Content.html?links&page=Academy.

Arohi Music Academy. n.d. "Home." Accessed March 15, 2021. http://www.arohimusicacademy.com.

Atulya Bihar. 2018. "Bharatiya Nritya Kala Mandir: Patna mein Stith Ek Bahu-uddesheeya Saanskritik Kendra." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://atulyabihar.com/facts-about-bharatiya-nritya-kala-mandir-a-multi-purpose-cultural-centre-located-in-patna/.

Baker, Steven. 2015. "Will we all be speaking Hinglish one day?" British Council, October 30, 2015. https://www.britishcouncil.org/voices-magazine/will-we-all-be-speaking-hinglish-one-day.

Bihar Vikas Mission. n.d. "Cultural Affairs Directorate." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://www.bvm.bihar.gov.in/content/3756/publicdialogueandbrandbiharmission.

Bhatkhande Music Institute. n.d. "History." Accessed March 15, 2021. http://bhatkhandemusic.edu.in/history/.

Britannica. n.d. "Braj Bhasha language." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://www.britannica.com/topic/Braj-Bhasha-language.

Britannica Vidyapati. n.d. "Vidyapati: Indian Writer and Poet." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://www.britannica.com/biography/Vidyapati-Indian-writer-and-poet.

Chatterjee, Sarathi. n.d. "Profile." Accessed March 15, 2021.
http://sarathichatterjee.com/profile.php

Christ Deemed to Be University. n.d. "Department of Performing Arts, Theatre Studies and
Music." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://christuniversity.in/departments/main%20campus/school%20of%20arts%20and%
20humanities/performing%20arts,%20theatre%20studies%20and%20music.

Dadar Matunga Cultural Centre. n.d. "Preamble." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://dadarmatungaculturalcentre.org/preamble.

Dadar Matunga Cultural Centre Classes. n.d. "Classes in Music." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://dadarmatungaculturalcentre.org/classes.

Dadar Matunga Cultural Centre Festivals. n.d. "Festivals." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://dadarmatungaculturalcentre.org/festivals.

Dadar Matunga Cultural Centre Programmes. n.d. "Cultural Programmes." Accessed March
15, 2021. https://dadarmatungaculturalcentre.org/programmes.

Department of Music Triveni Kala Sangam. n.d. "Department of Music." Accessed March
15, 2021. http://trivenikalasangam.org/department-of-music/.

Devi, Savita. n.d. "Siddeshwari Academy of Indian Music." Accessed March 15, 2021.
http://savitadevi.com/academy.html.

Dilli Gharana Organisations. n.d. "Organisations." Accessed March 15, 2021.
http://dilligharana.com/organisations/

DHNS. 2014. "A hub of cultural, artistic activity: Triveni Kala Sangam." *Deccan Herald*, March 8, 2021. https://www.deccanherald.com/content/440942/a-hub-cultural-artisitic-activity.html.

Dhrupad Sansthan. n.d. "Dhrupad Sansthan." Accessed March 15, 2021. http://dhrupad.org/dhrupad-institute/.

Dhrupad Academy Delhi, n.d. "Home." Accessed March 15, 2021. http://www.dhrupadacademy.com/

Faculty of Music and Fine Arts University of Delhi. n.d. "About the Department of Music." Accessed March 8, 2021. http://music.du.ac.in/about.php.

Hindustani Classical Music. n.d. "Basic Terms." Accessed March 15, 2021. http://hindustaniclassicalmusic.in/article1.php?sub_type_id=37.

Hiteshi, Bharat. 2020. "Why is Bihar getting poorer?" *Tehelka*, October 29, 2020. http://tehelka.com/why-is-bihar-getting-poorer/

IGNCA. n.d. "Home." Accessed March 15, 2021. http://ignca.gov.in/.

ITC-Sangeet Research Academy. n.d. "ITC-SRA's Origin." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://www.itcsra.org/Origin-of-ITC-SRA.

IndiaFillings. n.d. "Documents Required for Section 8 Companies Registration." Accessed March 8, 2021. https://www.indiafilings.com/learn/documents-required-for-section-8-company-registration/.

International Centre for Not-for-profit Law. n.d. "The Societies Registration Act." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://www.icnl.org/research/library/india_indiasocieties/.

Institute of Music and Dance Shriram Bharatiya Kala Kendra. n.d. "Institute of Music and Dance." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://sbkk.in/institute-home/#about.

JD Women's College. n.d. "About JDWC." Accessed March 15, 2021. http://www.jdwcpatna.com.

Kannada University Hampi. n.d. "Department of Music and Dance." Accessed March 15, 2021. http://kannadauniversity.org/english/department-of-music-and-dance/.

Kilkari Bihar Bal Bhawan, n.d. "History." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://kilkaribihar.org/Kilkari.php?index=0.

Kirana Gharana Music Academy. n.d. "About." Accessed March 15, 2021. http://kiranagharanamusicacademy.com/about/.

Magadh Mahila College. n.d. "Brief Profile of the college." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://magadhmahilacollege.org/welcome-to-magadh-mahila-college/.

Magadh Mahila College Music. n.d. "Highlights of the Department." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://magadhmahilacollege.org/music/.

NCERT. n.d. "About Us." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://ncert.nic.in/about-us.php?ln=.

Naadyatra Foundation. n.d. "What We Are." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://www.naadyatra.com/naadyatra-foundation.

Naadyatra Foundation Projects. n.d. "What We Do." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://www.naadyatra.com/our-projects.

PAIPA. n.d. "Home." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://paipa.in.

Pal, Sanchari. 2016. "#Travel Tales: Exploring Tagore's Santiniketan, an Abode of Learning unlike Any in the World." The Better India, August 31, 2016. https://www.thebetterindia.com/66627/santiniketan-rabindranath-tagore-bengal/.

Pandit Bhimsen Joshi Academy. n.d. "Home." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://www.bhimsenjoshisangeet.com/.

Pandit Vidur Mallick Dhrupad Academy. n.d. "Academy." Accessed March 15, 2021. http://dhrupadmusic.org/academy.html.

Pandit Vidur Mallick Sangeet Gurukul, n.d. "Gurukul." Accessed March 15, 2021. http://www.darbhangagharana.com/gurukul.html.

Pracheen Kala Kendra. n.d. "Home." Accessed March 15, 2021.
http://www.pracheenkalakendra.org/.

Prayag Sangeet Samiti. n.d. "Home." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://www.prayagsangeetsamiti.co.in/index.php.

Raja Man Singh Tomar Music & Arts University. n.d. "About Us." Accessed March 15,
2021. http://rmtmusicandartsuniversity.com/About%20Us.htm.

Raza Foundation. n.d. "Social Contributions." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://www.therazafoundation.org/sayed-haider-raza-s-social-contributions

Raza Foundation KGML. n.d. "Kumar Gandharva Memorial Lecture." Accessed March 8,
2021. https://therazafoundation.org/Kumar-Gandharva-Memorial-Lecture.

Raza Foundation Swarmudra. n.d. "Swarmudra." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://therazafoundation.org/Swarmudra.

Sangeet Stuti. n.d. "Business site." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://sangeet-stuti-music-
academy.business.site/.

Sangeetam. n.d. "About." Accessed Accessed March 15, 2021.
http://sangeetam.org/about.php.

Saraswati Music College. n.d. "The Organisation." Accessed March 15, 2021.
http://www.saraswatimusiccollege.org/organisation.html.

Shriram Bharatiya Kala Kendra. n.d. "About Us." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://sbkk.in/about-us/.

Sangeet Natak Akademi. n.d. "Introduction." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://www.sangeetnatak.gov.in/sna/introduction.php.

Shubhendra and Saskia Rao Foundation. n.d. "Music4All." Accessed March 15, 2021.
http://www.music4all.org/music-4-all.html.

SPIC MACAY. n.d. "About SPIC MACAY." Accessed March 15, 2021.
http://www.spicmacay.com/about

SPIC MACAY Activities. n.d. "Our Activities." Accessed March 15, 2021.
http://www.spicmacay.com/about/activities

SPIC MACAY Gurukul Scheme. n.d. "Gurukul Anubhav Scholarship Scheme." Accessed
March 15, 2021. https://spicmacay.org/gurukul.

SPIC MACAY Modules. n.d. "Modules at Glance." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://spicmacay.org/modules.

SPIC MACAY Supporters. n.d. "Our Supporters." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://spicmacay.org/our-supporters.

Sri Arvind Mahila College. n d. "Welcome to Sri Arvind Mahila College, Patna." Accessed
March 15, 2021. http://samcpatna.com/.

Triveni Kala Sangam. n.d. "About Triveni. Accessed March 15, 2021.
http://trivenikalasangam.org/about-triveni/.

University of Mumbai. n.d. "Department of Music." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://mu.ac.in/department-of-music.

University of Pune. n.d. "Centre for Performing Arts." Accessed March 15, 2021.
http://www.unipune.ac.in/dept/fine_arts/centre_for_performing_arts/default.htm.

UKDIMACS. n.d. "Home." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://www.dagars.org.

UKDIMACS About. n.d. "About." Accessed March 15, 2021. https://www.dagars.org/about/.

UKDIMACS Archives. n.d. "The Dagar Archives." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://www.dagars.org/the-dagar-archives/

UKDIMACS Events. n.d. "Events." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://www.dagars.org/events1/

UKDIMACS Gunijan Sabha. "Gunijan Sabha." Accessed March 15, 2021.
https://www.dagars.org/gunijan-sabha/

Vats, Rohit. 2020. "No OTT Wanted To Buy Mithila Makhaan, So We Launched Our Own
Platform, Says Neetu Chandra." *News18*, October 2, 2020.
https://www.news18.com/news/movies/no-ott-wanted-to-buy-mithila-makhaan-despite-
national-award-says-neetu-chandra-2925449.html.

Visva-Bharati. n.d. "Home." Accessed March 15, 2021.
http://www.visvabharati.ac.in/index.html

YouTube Videos:

Barrow, Jenny. "Research Ethics: The Belmont Report." Jenny Barrow, June 27, 2019.
YouTube Video, 08:47. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NYjY-SRvWcQ

Buchli, Doe. "3 Belmont Report, Ethical Principles." Dr. Buchli's Psychology videos, August
14, 2020. YouTube Video, 47:42. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1m7cVWd1Zqg

Legislations and Government websites:

Government of India. Legislative Department, Ministry of Law and Justice. *The Constitution
of India*. New Delhi, India: Ministry of Law and Justice, 2015.
https://legislative.gov.in/constitution-of-india (accessed on March 15, 2021).

Government of India. Legislative Department, Ministry of Law and Justice. *The Indian
Contract Act, 1872*. India: Government of India, n.d.,
https://legislative.gov.in/actsofparliamentfromtheyear/indian-contract-act-1872
(accessed on March 15, 2021).

Government of India. Legislative Department, Ministry of Law and Justice. *The Indian
Trusts Act, 1882*. India: Government of India, n.d.,
https://legislative.gov.in/actsofparliamentfromtheyear/indian-trusts-act-1882 (accessed
on March 15, 2021).

Government of India. Ministry of Corporate Affairs. *Section 135*, *Companies Act 2013*.
India: Government of India, n.d.,

http://ebook.mca.gov.in/Actpagedisplay.aspx?PAGENAME=17518 (accessed on March 15, 2021).

Government of India. Ministry of Corporate Affairs. *Schedule 7, Section 135, Companies Act 2013*. India: Government of India, n.d., http://ebook.mca.gov.in/Actpagedisplay.aspx?PAGENAME=17923 (accessed on March 15, 2021).

Government of India. Ministry of Corporate Affairs. "Societies Registration Act, 1860." India: Government of India, n.d., https://www.mca.gov.in/Ministry/actsbills/pdf/Societies_Registration_Act_1860.pdf (accessed on March 15, 2021).

Government of India. Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs. "NCR Constituent Areas." India: Government of India, n.d., http://ncrpb.nic.in/ncrconstituent.html (accessed on March 15, 2021).