Chapter 3

Women's Compiled Scores in Early Film Music

—Kendra Preston Leonard

In my previous work, I have written about the careers of female accompanists and music directors in the early cinema. That research reveals that women from across the United States were highly successful and effective composers, arrangers, and recording artists.[1] In this essay I address an area of cinematic musical development where the importance of women's contributions has gone un(der) noticed: the compiled score, a film score created for early film primarily from pre-existing pieces, in both its written and recorded varieties.[2] I examine written and recorded compiled scores created by Hazel Burnett, Alice Smythe Burton Jay, and Carrie Hetherington. All three were music directors at some of the largest motion picture houses in the United States between 1908 and 1927, but despite their contributions to cinema music, they are today unknown. Jay and Hetherington were also entrepreneurs whose desire for better musical accompaniment for motion pictures eventually led them from compiling written scores to developing the technology and processes necessary for creating recorded compilations for automated instruments for use in the early cinema.

It is important to recognize the overall participation of women in early cinema music. Although no census of cinema accompanists was ever taken, reports from trade and industry publications suggest that while male musicians were in the majority in the earliest days of cinema accompaniment, women, both White and of color, soon outnumbered them.[3] Women almost certainly comprised the majority of cinema accompanists after the spring of 1917, when the United States joined the war effort and many all-male cinema orchestras were dissolved so that their members could join the military.

Even before the war, women were crucial to cinema music making. The job of cinema accompanist was a respectable one for women, and its salary compared positively with secretarial work, teaching, and nursing.[4] The presence of a female accompanist indicated that a cinema was intent on being an artistic and moral institution, especially as the film industry worked to establish itself as a legitimate business producing respectable and creative works.[5] These accomplished pianists encompassed those who made the cinema their career as well as musicians who went on to work in other arenas, like Florence Price, who accompanied films before she became recognized as a symphonic composer; and blues great Victoria Spivey, who played in the cinema when she was a teenager.[6] After 1918, when all-men's cinema orchestras were disbanded so that their members could serve in the military, the sounds of the cinema—the music that evolved into modern soundtracks—were thus chosen, developed, created, curated, and circulated primarily by women, although a handful of men continued to play or conduct in large cinemas and remained in control of the rather monopolistic business of creating the cue sheets.[7] Composers for early sound films like Max Steiner would likely have heard women's accompaniments far more frequently than those that adhered exactly—or even closely—to men's scores or suggestions for music when they experienced cinema music as young people. Women in the audience may well have witnessed the work of female accompanists and felt empowered to pursue similar careers.

RACE AND WOMEN MUSICIANS IN THE EARLY CINEMA

In this essay, I discuss the contributions of three White women to music for the early cinema, and it is important to understand why I have not included any Black women. As I have written in my study of women as accompanists and spirit mediums, a primary reason is the institutional racism present in the historiographies of the United States. Just as the hierarchies of historiography have traditionally privileged historical records documenting men's work and lives over women's, they privilege the work and lives of White women over those of women of color. Despite the efforts of archives to preserve the documents of Black, Asian, Latinx, Native American, and other communities of color, the fact remains that primary source materials in the cultural history of the United States are overwhelmingly those of White people. Thus, while scholars have digital and physical access to both large and small White newspapers from all over the country, for example, we have only limited access to even the most important Black newspapers. Census records, often an excellent source of information about occupational training and employment, include more detailed and correct information on White residents of the United States than those of color, and other government sources have only very limited materials documenting the lives of people of color.[8] The National Archives only began to collate information on its holdings regarding Black Americans in 1947, and that effort has been woefully underfunded.[9] The multiple diasporas of people of color, such as the Great Migration, which took place between 1916 and 1970, caused the displacement and loss of many records and histories.

Despite this lack of extant sources, I have managed to find some information about Black women musicians in cinemas, mostly on the East Coast and in Chicago. However, because there were no industry-specific publications about or for the Black cinema, many of the references I've found are isolated mentions of individuals. Olive Ormes, writes the *New York Age* in 1909, is the up-and-coming "musical directress" of the Princess Theater in Cleveland, Ohio, where she "is filling the position with great credit," having studied classical music and worked at several other theaters including an Edison cinema.[10] At the Manilla Theater in Indianapolis, "music is furnished by Mrs. Allura [*sic*] Mack who sings and plays the piano."[11] At the Booker Washington Theatre in Washington, DC, the cinema orchestra is comprised of five musicians including pianist Ruth Heath.[12]

Cultural and political differences also contributed to discouraging women of color—Black women in particular—from becoming professional cinema musicians. The philosophy of "racial uplift" was omnipresent in Black communities during the time period considered here, and as Kevin K. Gaines has written, this ideology meant that simply matching the artistic successes of Whites was not enough for Americans of color to be considered equals: they had to be better.[13] As Amy Absher writes, "classically trained musicians resisted [vernacular musics] in both the South and Chicago by demanding a place in higher education and by bringing African American folk traditions to their classical compositions."[14] Lawrence Schenbeck has detailed how uplift was articulated in the perceived conflict between art music and vernacular music:

> Within the cultural sphere, black elites often resorted to an aesthetic based on European models as a vehicle for cultural vindication. Their response to white America's pervasive minstrelsy-based constructions of blackness was to champion African American art that, while safely grounded in forms and styles derived from Shakespeare or Dvořák, was morally positive and politically inoffensive and represented the Race in heroic, idealized terms.[15]

Playing for the pictures was a reputable and desirable job for white women, but uplift philosophy instructed Black musicians—both men and women—to aim for more traditionally elite careers in their musical ambitions. Because of the much higher value Black communities invested in uplift placed on concert performance, Black American musicians did not generally view playing in the cinema as a profession of status for women. A report in the *Crisis* from January 1911 decried the conditions that forced a woman who was a recent graduate from the Chicago Conservatory of Music to take a job playing "in a low concert hall in one of the worst sections of the city, from 8 in the evening till 4 in the morning," for just $18 a week when other female musicians of color were touring in Europe and making recordings.[16] In comparison, a church organist could reasonably expect to make $500 a year for playing services only, and up to $1200 a year if they also taught music at the church or directed the choir.[17] The *Chicago Defender*, a leading Black newspaper, also stressed the greater significance of concert appearances and performances of classical music over those of cinema musicians or those performing in vernacular traditions. It was not until the very end of the era in 1927—when sound technologies were already regularly appearing in the cinema—that the *Defender*'s music critic began discussing musical accompaniment for film as an acceptable form of employment in music for men and a legitimate topic of discussion for readers interested in the arts.[18]

The fact that Black women do not seem to have worked as cinema musicians as frequently as did White women could also stem from the fact that in much of the country, cinemas were far more White-owned and -operated theaters than those owned and/or operated by Blacks. As Esther Morgan-Ellis writes, "These white-managed cinemas hired white musicians and, while many allowed Black audiences, they kept audiences segregated by relegating people of color to the balcony."[19] Black vaudeville houses began showing films in the 1910s, where the house musicians, usually all-male bands, accompanied them. In addition, Black cinemas were often the targets of community and competitor discrimination and more extreme forms of mistreatment. In 1914 the *Crisis* wrote that despite the outstanding new theaters being built for Black audiences in Black communities, they were not always safe places. "A crowd of two hundred white men wrecked a moving picture house for colored people in Jackson, Miss.," reported the journal. "They ran the ticket seller out of the office, cut the wires, disconnected the moving picture apparatus and locked the doors." Events like this were not uncommon, and as a result, cinema employment became viewed as potentially too dangerous for women of color.

Contemporary newspapers generally indicate that Black cinemas employed individual men as pianists or organists and men and boys' bands to accompany films. These bands, many of them developed out of the male confraternities that were active in Black communities in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, consisted of players from a wide range of musical training and aptitude. These confraternity bands—which might be a brass band with vocal soloists one day and an ensemble of singers with a pianist the next, depending on the event—performed for weddings, funerals, cotillions, parades, charity fundraisers, and in theaters. Although many of the musicians in the confraternity bands and the groups that came out of them remained amateurs, those with talent and drive became professionals. These gigging musicians performed throughout the Midwest in ensembles of three to eight players, providing music for Black cinemas, sometimes alternating parts of a screening with professional male pianists or organists.[20]

THE COMPILED SCORE

As Richard Abel, Rick Altman, Julie Hubbert, Martin Marks, and other scholars of early film sound have documented, there were no standardized practices among musicians for supplying music for films.[21] Music for accompanying films initially came from vaudeville music libraries, popular song, pre-existing art music, and original compositions, only some of which were committed to paper, piano rolls, or shellac. In the 1910s, publications of music expressly for film accompaniment began to proliferate, offering what is known as genre music or mood music for actions, events, and emotions commonly found in film scenarios. Using published collections of genre music called photoplay albums, cinema pianists, organists, or ensemble directors could patch together a handful of pieces to create a compiled score of pieces that in some way matched or supported the action on screen. For example, works for "hurry" or "gallop" were quick in tempo, mimicked the sound of hoofbeats or heartbeats, and employed short note values and a quick tempo, all of which suggested the associated speed of motion given in the title.

The compiled score was the most popular type of musical accompaniment for film. Martin Marks writes that the compiled score blossomed in the United States between 1910 and 1914 and especially following the success of Joseph Carl Breil's full-length compiled score for D. W. Griffith's 1915 picture *The Birth of a Nation*, with studios regularly producing compiled scores for their pictures, but it was far from the first and seems to be heralded as unique only because of the film's notorious reputation.[22] Most of the full-length film scores produced by studios during the late teens and early twenties were compiled scores with a few original sections; only the most prestigious films with the largest budgets received fully original scores for their presentation in cinemas. The presence of a compiled score for a film suggests that the film's makers expected it to be popular. In some cases, however, compiled scores were created after a film, suggesting that the longer a film was shown on a regular basis in a cinema, the more cinema managers believed it to be deserving of an individual score.

Cinema musicians also created compiled scores for recordings used to accompany films. During the early film era, there were also numerous mechanical methods of producing sound for film accompaniment including piano rolls, wax cylinders, and shellac discs. Inventors developed several versions of player pianos with added percussion and other elements for use in the theater. Companies like the Victor Talking Machine Company, Warner Brothers, the Mastertouch Piano Roll Company, and others sought to provide music, sound effects, and/

or speech for films in addition to their recordings of well-known musicians like Gustav Mahler and Teresa Carreño. Such recordings came in multiple formats, of which two were the most successful: those designed so that each disc or piano roll was meant to accompany a single reel of film, and those designed to be quickly swapped out between scenes.[23] Hetherington promoted this kind of scoring through the use of the Fotoplayer, invented by Hetherington in 1910 or 1911 and enormously popular with cinemas after becoming available in 1912 for its technology that allowed operators to switch between piano rolls seamlessly, creating a continuous accompaniment. These recordings had to be carefully made using music arranged and performed by an expert film accompanist. For example, Phonotone issued a set of records for the 1928 film *Four Sons*. The recordings included forty pieces that were used for sixty-seven cues. Each individual piece was recorded onto a separate disc for playing with the screening of the film. Excerpts ranged in duration from fifteen seconds to three and a half minutes and were timed precisely by the recording artist. At the cinema, an employee (sometimes the regular accompanist, sometimes an usher) worked from a list of cues and durations, quickly swapping records on and off multiple turntables to match the music with the film. This process created a compiled score from the recordings.

Far more male composers are represented in the published repertoire for early film, including photoplay albums, full scores, and cue sheets. The vast majority of published music was by a group of mostly European-trained White men, including William Axt, Erno Rapée, and J. S. Zamecnik. The editors of photoplay albums included only a few pieces by women in their collections, and cue sheet creators rarely recommended works by women in cue sheets. Only five women composers appear in Rapée's enormous *Motion Picture Moods*, and of the approximately 5,000 individual cues listed in the cue sheets that belonged to accompanists Adele V. Sullivan and Claire Hamack, only five are by women.[24] Music for the early cinema was also highly ephemeral, and of that which remains extant, the vast majority is by male composers. However, there is considerable evidence of music by women for the cinema: contemporary periodicals document women's compiled scores, as do archival collections including the Silent Film Music Collection at the University of Colorado Boulder and the Josephine Burnett Collection at the Harry Ransom Center. Collections like Sullivan's demonstrate that women were active in compiling scores. Sullivan unbound all of her photoplay albums so that she could rearrange the order of pieces for specific films.[25] While Sullivan did not leave behind enough cues in order for scholars to attach pieces to film titles, it is clear that she used martial music and chase music from three *Academic Edition Albums of Photo-Play Music* edited by G. Martaine (1914), and the 1915 B. F. Wood Music Co. *Collection of Characteristics Selections for the Motion Pictures*. Music and materials having belonged to other accompanists also show evidence of women compiling scores for film, both for their own and for other cinemas. The collections of Inez Garrison, the accompanist at the Garden Theater in Marion, Kansas; Pauline Alpert, an Eastman School of Music graduate who was called the "Whirlwind Pianist" for her technical facility and who not only played for multiple New York City theaters but also recorded piano rolls for automated accompaniment machines, like Jay and Hetherington; and Charlotte Stafford, a Rochester, New York, accompanist, all indicate that these women compiled scores for film.

Ironically, the gendered musical education popular in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries uniquely positioned women for creating cinema accompaniment: women whose upbringing during this period had included traditional piano lessons had generally been taught song and opera repertoire and short descriptive or characteristic pieces that worked well in cinematic accompaniment, and particularly well in compiled scores. Compiled scores often required several dozen brief pieces intended to depict very specific scenes, emotions, or actions, and the vast repertoire of such pieces by composers like Felix Mendelssohn, Arthur Sullivan, and Carrie Jacobs-Bond fit the bill. Such pianists also often already owned a large selection of recent or contemporary popular songs, as music publishers marketed these for playing at home by women. These women came from a variety of ethnic, socioeconomic, and educational backgrounds to take up positions as cinema musicians and were not, in general, members of the elite, male-mentored group of female art music composers and performers of the period, exemplified by Amy Beach and Maude Powell, although women from the upper economic echelon and those with advanced musical training also worked in the cinema.

Industry insiders credited outstanding accompanist-composers with the success of many theaters and for providing artistic excellence in the burgeoning medium.[26] Many cinema managers found that a thoughtful, competent female pianist would draw in bigger and (socially) "better" audiences than many male organists or ensembles who were more interested in displaying their technical skills and less interested in the art of playing to the picture.[27] Reporting on the success of the Madrid Theater in New York City, *Motion Picture News* noted that the "musical program of the Madrid is entrusted to Miss Lillian Greenberg, who is a graduate of a Leipsic [*sic*] conservatory of music. She has made the incidental music accompanying pictures a matter of neighborhood comment."[28] In an issue of *Motion Picture Magazine* from March 1914, Stanley Todd, a regular commentator on music for the cinema, described women as more emotional and passionate players, making them appropriate accompanists for film. Film, he claimed, needed performers with three essential skills found primarily in female accompanists: technical skill, a sensibility about romantic and dramatic repertoire, and a willingness to put the success of a picture before personal ego. Reporting from Denver, he noted:

> Theatres are large, the entrances dazzlingly brilliant, and like as not you will find a wonderful pipe-organ, ready in an instant to change its song of sadness to paeans of joy. It is in Denver, too, where a mere slip of a girl presides at the console of one of these reat instruments, and each night plays, with her heart and soul, to the finest of screen projections. . . . In this way, music lends its valuable aid in interpreting the gamut of emotions, which only the picture can bring into play with that subtle power that has been one of its secrets of success.[29]

Female accompanists, including celebrated cinema organist Edith Lang, the lead author of a textbook on cinema accompaniment, agreed with Todd.[30] Thus, the history of women in early film music is a case in which theater managers valued women performers for what were widely thought to be the superior accompaniments women could create for films. When cinema musicians like Lang, Burnett, Jay, or Hetherington made suggestions about scoring and issued recordings for accompaniment, their male colleagues often paid attention, hoping to glean insight into how to improve their own film accompaniment. Journals and magazines like *Melody* and *American Organist* frequently included reviews of and features about women accompanists and their approaches, reviewing their work in the cinema on the same terms and using the same language they applied to reviews of male performers.

I examine the compiled scores of Hazel Burnett, Alice Smythe Jay, and Carrie Hetherington here because of the three women's large spheres of influence. Each of these women compiled scores for cinemas in major metropolitan areas; these cinemas seated at least 750 people and had at least three screenings a day. Burnett's scores were frequently reviewed by large regional and national publications, and Jay and Hetherington directed cinema ensembles and were frequent correspondents with national journals on the topic of photoplaying. This is not to devalue the importance of women playing in smaller communities, as they too influenced what audiences came to hear as the sound of the cinema, but rather to make use of the larger bodies of material relating to the work of Burnett, Jay, and Hetherington.

Hazel Burnett performed daily at Texas's largest motion picture palaces, including San Antonio's Aztec and Queen Theaters and the Majestic Theater in Austin, throughout the 1910s and 1920s.[31] In addition to creating her own cue sheets and editing published sets of cues, Burnett created compiled scores from both the theater libraries and from her own personal library of thousands of short, characteristic pieces, many of which were clipped from *The Etude* and *Melody* magazines.[32] Burnett's compiled scores in particular reflect on repertoire specifically designed for women: several of the music anthologies in Hazel Burnett's music library came with *ossia* parts "for small hands" or are blatantly marketed for women through the use of cover art, title, and/or other factors. Burnett wrote the titles of accompaniment-appropriate pieces on the covers of the photoplay albums that contained the pieces, often including the page number for quick access in playing a compiled score. She also interleaved pieces of sheet music and pieces cut from magazines between pages of her photoplay albums and taped together musical selections cut from *Melody* and *The Etude* to create original modular scores, such as she did for the 1920 melodrama *Humoresque*. Burnett appears in some cases to have included pieces that would have local resonances into her compiled scores; her Texan audiences would have heard songs by Texan composers and pieces about Texas and the Southwest in Burnett's accompaniments.[33] And like Lang, Burnett apparently took an interest in promoting works by women, frequently scoring films with pieces written by Black English composer Amanda Aldridge (under the pseudonym Montague Ring); Carrie Jacobs Bond; Esther Gronow; Mae Davis; and many others.

Burnett's archival materials include notes and music for several compiled scores, including *Humoresque*, which I discuss at length elsewhere, and the 1922 feature film *My Old Kentucky Home*.[34] At seven reels, *My Old Kentucky Home* ran about seventy minutes.[35] For this score, Burnett used music from several issues of *The Etude* published between October 1920 and August 1921, a few pieces of sheet music, and songs by Stephen Foster. She opened the film with "Plaisantrie" [*sic*] by film composer Irenée Bergé and used Chapman Tyler's "Afternoon at the Villa" when the hero arrives at his mother's home. In keeping with the practice of assigning leitmotivs to characters, Burnett assigned "Merry Hunting Party" by Emil Söchting to the character of Calamity Jane and accompanied workouts at the horse track with "Saltarello" by Richard Goerdeler.[36] At the end of the film, Burnett led the audience in a sing-along of the title song. The film was widely advertised as a picture for the entire family: it did well and ran for several months in large cinemas such as the ones in which Burnett played.[37] At the Majestic in Austin, Burnett's compiled score for *My Old Kentucky Home* could have been heard by as many as 3,810 people a day during the height of the film's popularity.[38]

In addition to clippings, Burnett also used published collections of characteristic or descriptive pieces in her compiled scores. For the 1925 film *Old Home Week*, she drew most of the music from Cedric Wilmot Lemont's *Dream Pictures*, a collection of character pieces for intermediate-level pianists published in 1916. Lemont had published a number of short pieces in *The Etude*, which may be how Burnett came to know his music; he was the composer of about seventy works in total, most for solo piano and highly descriptive. "On the Bayou," "Cinderella: a fairy tale for piano," and "Children at Play" were among his popular titles. Burnett accompanied *Old Home Week*, which is now lost, with Lemont's "At Eventide" as an introduction as the camera focuses in on a wreath on a door, a dance titled "The Nautch Girl" for several conflicts, and a "Valse Intermezzo" to depict a "Grouch" and "Bitter Taste." Because all of the pieces in *Dream Pictures* were related by the composer in theme and style, using them as the basis for a compiled score resulted in the kind of holistic film score that was valued at the time.

Burnett's compiled scores indicate that she drew from a variety of genres, using music from the Western art tradition, what we might call "light classical" today, and vernacular song. Most of the pieces she used were widely available either through sheet music vendors or publications marketed for home performance. Although the theaters at which she worked had large music libraries, Burnett used those holdings less frequently than her personal collection of pieces and the clippings from the magazines. This suggests that Burnett required a selection of works she either already knew or could learn quickly for accompanying, and that she was always seeking new music to use in the cinema. The pieces from *The Etude* and *Melody*, intended for wide use (*Melody* advertised itself as "for the Photoplay Musician and the Musical Home"), were ideal for her needs. The multiple handwritten notes and cue numbers on individual pieces indicates that Burnett maintained some kind of system or had excellent recall for what pieces she had used for what kinds of scenes; it is clear that she reused both sheet music and clippings in compiled scores for various films. The one source Burnett does not seem to have used for her accompaniments is opera, which was also eschewed by Jay because of its pre-existing associations.

Alice Smythe Burton Jay, a highly regarded cinema organist, conductor, composer, and inventor, spent most of her accompanying career on the West Coast and in Hawaiʻi with occasional tours to other parts of the United States. She was a strong proponent for using compiled scores that included complete sections of pieces either fully realized for keyboard or for ensemble. While she did not "intend to give [the cue sheet] a black eye," in advocating for holistic scores, Jay wrote that cue sheets often stuck together pieces that may have been fine for scenes shown separately, but when played in sequence created jarring changes of key and even more abrupt changes of character within short timespans. "I do not think it necessary to change music every time a man runs up and down stairs," she wrote. Synchronizing music to the picture was "to adapt correct music to the scene," she declared, not match each and every action on screen with a musical gesture. The compiled score that used only a handful of pieces was more "sympathetic" to a film's nature than the cue sheet and even some complete scores.[39] Jay encouraged musicians to edit cue sheets heavily to better fit the film to be accompanied, replacing many of the printed suggestions with other works or to compile their own scores. In a 1915 letter to Ernst Luz's "Music and the Picture" column in *Motion Picture News*, titled "A Woman's Suggestion for Musical Scores," she held that scores should be compiled according to an understanding of the film acquired through a prescreening for the accompanist (which was not always common or practical for cinema managers to arrange), common sense, and a mix of works from various origins that themselves included a variety of tempi, keys, and "moods," as characters were known in cinema accompanying. It was essential, she wrote in the letter, that cinema musicians have a comprehensive knowledge of Western art music as well as current popular songs. She noted that her own sources were the Western European canon of art music, often as offered in piano or organ arrangement; vernacular songs that were well established in the common culture of her audiences, who would have been primarily White and middle to upper class; and new music, both that written for the screen and published as photoplay music and new popular songs.[40] She certainly knew the repertoire very well herself: her letters to various journals often identify other compilers' and composers' borrowings of preexisting material, which ranged from the concert hall to vaudeville hall to recent popular songs and sheet music.

Jay had very specific ideas about how a compiled score should be constructed. She critiqued the practice of using too many pieces in a single score, suggesting that performers should not be too quick to switch between multiple pieces, but rather to select a handful of pieces that could be adapted to a complete film; this was her own practice, and she often chose a single album of characteristic pieces that she used to outfit an entire film.[41] She also objected to the use of music from grand opera (although not popular operetta), which, she felt, brought "the words [of the libretto] to a person's mind, and seldom if ever fit the scene." Her one exception from this was her response to the studio-produced score composed by Hugo Riesenfeld and based on Georges Bizet's opera score, for Cecil B. DeMille's famous 1915 screen adaptation of Prosper Mérimée's novella *Carmen*. Eschewing Riesenfeld's score, Jay's program for the film used just Bizet's Overture, "Toreador Song," and "Cigarette Song" along with Elgar's "Liebes Gruss," a "Mazurka-Satanelle" by contemporary film composer Charles J. Roberts, "Solveig's Song" by Grieg, and her own "Improvisation-Agitato."[42] This score, one of the few by Jay that has extant documentation, is otherwise very much in keeping with her score-creation philosophies and is likely a fair representation of her work in that it draws minimally but crucially from a small selection of useful sources, includes music both old and new, and incorporates Jay's own compositional and improvisational skills.

Jay's method of selecting music for compiled scores is on display in her criticism of the studio-issued score by Edward J. Howe for the Mary Pickford–produced *Less Than the Dust* (1916). Although the score (now lost), which used Amy Woodforde-Finden's song "Less Than the Dust" from her orientalist suite *Four Indian Love Lyrics*, was described in *Motography* magazine as "appropriate in every detail to the mysticism and superstition of the far East and portrays beyond criticism of a small village of modern India," Jay and her sixteen orchestral players found it "misfitting."[43] Other contributors to the *Motion Picture News* also complained that the score as "impossible"; one asked for a cue sheet instead, indicating that perhaps not only was the music of the score poorly composed (or, as Jay's notes about plagiarism suggest, chosen) for the subject but may also not have fit the film's screening time. In response, Ernst Luz, the editor of the column, provided his own cue suggestions for the film. Like the score issued by the studio, it consisted of a plethora of different pieces—thirty-four individual titles, all of them linked through their exoticism. Jay's score, compiled according to her philosophy and in contrast with Luz's, drew from a suite from Rudolf Friml's operetta *Katinka*, whose pieces had long become synonymous for exoticism, a several other "Oriental pieces," and her own improvisations, which she notated for her orchestra. It was this compilation—not Howe's score or Luz's cue sheet—that audiences heard in conjunction with screenings of the film in Jay's California cinemas, where it apparently was well received.

Jay's belief in the superiority of the compiled score sourced from classical art music, the occasional new song, and improvisations modeled after those of nineteenth-century virtuoso pianists like Liszt and her frequent frustration with poor accompaniments led her to begin making cylinder recordings of her scores. Jay emphasized not only her production of rolls for individual films, but also shorter rolls that could be used for specific kinds of scenes and combined to create a compiled soundtrack of rolls.[44] As more theaters began to use automated instruments in the 1920s, Jay's recorded compilations and short rolls designed to be used in compilations would likely have been quite popular: the late 1910s saw the development of automated instruments with dual rolls so that users could easily change out recordings and more from one to another just as Jay predicted, in part thanks to her colleague and rival Carrie Hetherington.

Carrie Hetherington, who, like Jay was a celebrated film accompanist and cinema music director, spent the first part of her career in Los Angeles and the second part in Illinois.[45] She too advocated for compiled scores over cue sheets and, eventually, made and marketed recorded accompaniments. Hetherington's philosophy of playing for the pictures incorporated a belief that cinema musicians should be as well informed as possible, and that their responsibilities included rejecting poorly constructed cue sheets and studio-provided scores. As the music director at Miller's Theater in Los Angeles, Hetherington also placed some responsibility for the creation of good accompaniments with theater managers, stating that it was essential for cinemas to screen films for their accompanists ahead of public screenings so that the accompanists had time to create informed and intelligent compiled scores. The musician's role, she wrote, was "being there to break the silence and improve the picture with proper and correct music," and she urged cinema musicians to avoid "fancy" music that called attention to themselves rather than the film, arguing for scores created from classical and popular favorites rather than virtuoso showpieces.[46] It is possible that she too found male musicians inclined to play showy works to the detriment of the film, and hoped to put an end to the practice through her editorializing and advice.

She had little use for new generic works written for cinema accompaniment, finding them unnecessary:

> All the Cue Sheets I ever read, when it came to a part of the picture where heavy music is needed, it will read something like this: "Dramatic Tension No. 9," or "Mysterioso Dramatic No. 22." Will some one tell me why on earth some of these musicians don't use some of the old masters' works on the heavies?[47]

She excoriated studio and magazine score compilers for not being familiar with the vast repertoire available for use in accompanying. "The musical programs as are gotten out by the different companies, or are, as a rule, printed in different magazines, are 'impossible,'" she wrote in a letter published by Luz in his "Music and the Picture" column, echoing Jay's criticism. Hetherington continues:

> I am very particular as to the proper and correct selections being used to fit scenes, and all the explanation I can find for these poor miserable apologies for programs, is that the one who picks them has never played for pictures, but reads over the synopsis and if one scene is preceded by the title "Dawn," they place At Title . . . . . . Dawn . . . . . . use Dawn . . . . . . by Vamah. [The compiler] does not know if a midnight party is breaking up at dawn or if the lover is killing his sweetheart at dawn, or what the scene is, nor does he stop to think of the effect of the music[;] if Dawn appears on the music, that is enough.[48]

As opposed to Jay, Hetherington's compiled scores show that she didn't think preexisting significations were problematic in creating a score, and so her compiled scores use a mix of genres from the Western canon—often including opera—and popular songs. In her score for the 1915 Fox production *Princess Romanoff*, Hetherington demonstrates her method of score compilation, using contemporary compositions and popular songs alongside works by Bizet, Grieg, Massenet, Bellini, Beethoven, Mozart, and Gounod. At a time when film composers were only starting to recognize the value of using leitmotifs in their work, Hetherington's score is more holistic than many cue sheets of the period; its use of repeated themes from classical music for individual characters and settings, selective incorporation of more recent tunes that were evocative of the scenes they accompanied and familiar to the audience, and careful arrangement of transitions made it a model for accompanists compiling their own scores. She assigns Bizet's "Pastorale" as the primary theme for the movie overall and likewise appoints Anton Rubinstein's "Melody in F" as a leitmotif for the title character. She incorporates several pieces common to film accompaniment as background music and employs Mozart, Beethoven, and Gounod for suspenseful scenes. Her sources also include five contemporary songs with relevant lyrics, such as "Last Night Was the End of the World" (1912) and "Love Is a Weaver of Dreams" (1912).

Hetherington's compiled score for a second Fox film from 1915, the Theda Bara vehicle *Lady Audley's Secret*, displays a similar approach, using a mix of established and newer pieces, quoting liberally from opera, particularly *Semiramide*, and employing music she used in *Princess Romanoff*, most notably Massenet's *Phèdre* overture.[49] Miller's Theater (now demolished), where Hetherington was music director, seated approximately 800 and ran seven shows a day, all of them accompanied by her compiled scores.[50] But Hetherington remained frustrated with the quality of published scores and cue sheets. Although her published recommendations for compiled scores reached thousands of readers, she sought to improve both upon the quality of scores and her reach in film music. Hetherington began working closely with the American Photoplayer Company to develop a new kind of player piano called the American Fotoplayer that made it easier for cinemas to use recordings to accompany films.[51] At the same time, Hetherington produced and marketed compiled scores using rolls for the instrument, becoming the company's primary spokesperson and traveling the United States demonstrating the instrument. Hetherington was able to provide cinemas with hundreds of rolls with which music directors could compile scores that could be performed even in their absence.

Ultimately, the role of women in early film music was a crucial one, and their compiled scores were essential in creating long-lasting sounds and the structures of music in the cinema. Burnett, Jay, and Hetherington were only three of the many women who accompanied film and created materials for the accompaniment of film during the early film era, and hundreds if not thousands of people heard their compiled scores in cinemas across the United States. Although much of their music is lost today, we can nevertheless analyze what does exist in terms of aesthetics movements in cinema music. All three women had a deep and broad knowledge of the Western art music repertoire, and included works from the canon in their scores as a matter of course. As a whole, they insisted on the importance of developing this knowledge as essential to being able to create effective scores and to communicate with audiences. At the same time, they also recognized the value of descriptive, characteristic, and "light" music: music written in the traditional "classical" manner but intended not for the symphonic stage, but for the amateur home musician. They further regarded popular song as an equally valid genre for accompaniment, using recent hits as they saw fit. Studios often released new songs as movie tie-ins, and while Burnett, Jay, and Hetherington may also have used those as part of their accompaniments, they were very careful about identifying and applying the ideal music for each scene. They were constantly scouring the music magazines and new publications for new material they could use, and Burnett's archival materials show that she often set aside pieces for future use even when she didn't have a film to use them in immediately. Audiences who heard and accompanists who made use of compiled scores by Jay and Hetherington experienced a blend of musical genres and sources that can be located in scores to the present. Such scores thus helped solidify the practice of American film accompaniment drawing from multiple spheres of music. In addition, through their consistent approaches and frequent performances, Burnett, Jay, and Hetherington contributed to audience expectations for film music by codifying the relationship between film genres and types of music, by creating now-standard audio-visual significations, and developing standard musical approaches to specific topics, scenes, events, and characters. As prominent taste-makers in their communities, all three women—and countless others who worked in the same ways—influenced their audiences' understandings of film narrative and musical representation and set the direction for future film composers.

Furthermore, Burnett, Jay, and Hetherington were among those film accompanists who argued for and created highly cohesive scores using leitmotifs and specific musical signifiers for characters, events, and places in films. While this was hardly unusual in early film accompaniment, there remained considerable variation in actual practice and in published suggestions like cue sheets. In presenting consistently unified scores and presenting them to large audiences, the three women profiled here contributed to the development of the holistic music score for films. This approach to scoring presaged and influenced the highly thematic scores of the 1930s, such as those by Erich Wolfgang Korngold, Jerome Moross, Alfred Newman, and Max Steiner—any of whom might have heard one or even many scores by Burnett, Jay, or Hetherington as young cinemagoers thinking about music.

NOTES

1. Kendra Preston Leonard, "Women at the Pedals: Female Cinema Musicians during the Great War," in *Over Here, Over There: Transatlantic Conversations on the Music of World War I*, ed. William Brooks, Christina Bashford, and Gayle Magee (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2019), 149–73.

2. There is some controversy in musicology about the use of the term *silent film* and its lexicographical cousins. Some scholars object to the labeling of film during this period as "silent," because such film was almost never silent: it was most frequently accompanied by live music, but was at times also provided with external sound via the means of sound-on-disc, unscored sound effects, and other sonic technologies that preceded the invention and widespread use of sound-on-film technology. In this essay, I refer to this body of film as "early film" or "early cinema."

3. I capitalize Black and White in concordance with the Center for the Study of Social Policy's statement "Recognizing Race in Language: Why We Capitalize 'Black' and 'White,'" by

Ann Thúy Nguyễn and Maya Pendleton, posted March 23, 2020 at https://cssp.org/2020/03/recognizing-race-in-language-why-we-capitalize-black-and-White/.

4. Sidney Steinheimer, advertisement, *American Organist* 2, no. 5 (1919): 212. "Union Scale of Wages and Hours of Labor, Union Scale of Wages and Hours of Labor, May 15, 1921: Bulletin of the United States Bureau of Labor Statistics, No. 302 | FRASER | St. Louis Fed," accessed November 2, 2017, https://fraser.stlouisfed.org/scribd/?item_id=492986&filepath=/files/docs/publications/bls/bls_0302_1922.pdf&start_page=68; "Letter to the Editor," *American Organist* 3, no. 7 (1920): 263; "Trade Notes," *American Organist* 3, no. 9 (1920): 339.

5. Leonard, "Women at the Pedals."

6. Victoria Spivey, *The Blues Is Life* (LP, Folkways Records, 1976), https://folkways-media.si.edu/liner_notes/folkways/FW03541.pdf.

7. "Abandon Orchestras," *Film Daily*, August 28, 1918.

8. Henry S. Shryock and Jacob S. Siegel, *The Methods and Materials of Demography* (US Department of Commerce, Bureau of the Census, 1980), 262.

9. Walter B. Hill Jr., "Institutions of Memory and the Documentation of African Americans in Federal Records," National Archives, August 15, 2016, https://www.archives.gov/publications/prologue/1997/summer/institutions-of-memory.html.

10. Lester A. Walton, "Music and the Stage," *New York Age*, March 25, 1909, 6.

11. "The Manilla Theater," *Indianapolis Recorder*, May 24, 1913, 2.

12. "Dramatics and Athletics," *New York Age*, October 16, 1913, 6.

13. Kevin K. Gaines, *Uplifting the Race* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2012), 6, https://uncpress.org/book/9780807845431/uplifting-the-race/.

14. Amy Absher, *The Black Musician and the White City: Race and Music in Chicago, 1900–1967* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2014), 11.

15. Lawrence Schenbeck, *Racial Uplift and American Music, 1878–1943* (Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 2012), 6–7.

16. "Employment of Colored Women in Chicago from a Study Made by the Chicago School of Civics and Philanthropy," *Crisis* 1, no. 3 (1911): 24.

17. "Church and Parish," *Churchman* (October 30, 1909): 639.

18. Dave Peyton, "The Musical Bunch: How to Play Picture Music," *Chicago Defender* (National Edition) (1921–1967); Chicago, August 13, 1927, sec. *The Defender*'s Movie and Stage Department, 6.

19. Esther M. Morgan-Ellis, *Everybody Sing! Community Singing in the American Picture Palace* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2018), 8–9.

20. Kendra Preston Leonard, *Music for the Kingdom of Shadows: Cinema Accompaniment in the Age of Spiritualism* (Humanities Commons, 2019), https://doi.org/10.17613/HWVW-WG90.

21. Richard Abel and Rick Altman, ed., *The Sounds of Early Cinema* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2001); Julie Hubbert, *Celluloid Symphonies Texts and Contexts in Film Music History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2011); Martin Miller Marks, *Music and the Silent Film: Contexts and Case Studies, 1895–1924* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997).

22. Marks, 62.

23. These shellac soundtrack discs, of which the 1926 Vitaphone motion picture sound system was an early example, were the forerunners of the LP. The discs were 16-inch discs played at 33⅓ RPM to match the eleven-minute running time of a standard (1,000 foot) reel of film. They used the same "standard groove" size and single-use steel needles as the 78s that were produced at the same time for home use. Richard Osborne, *Vinyl: A History of the Analogue Record* (New York: Routledge, 2016), 90.

24. Works by Cecile Chaminade (1), Theodora Dutton (pseudonym for Blanche Ray Alden) (3), Alice Hawthorne (1), Lily Strickland (2), and N. Louise Wright (1), are included in *Motion Picture Moods*. Cues from the Sullivan and Hamack collections are in the Silent Film Music Collection, American Music Research Center at the University of Colorado-Boulder. The women represented are Cecile Chaminade (1), Patricia Collinge (2), María Grever (1), and Carmen Santos (1).

25. Silent Film Collection, American Music Research Center, University of Colorado-Boulder.

26. Leonard, "Women at the Pedals."

27. Pray, "Good and Bad M. P. Theaters," *Motion Picture Magazine*, July 1914, 102.

28. "His Three Rules," *Motion Picture News* 9, no. 12 (March 28, 1914), 27.

29. Stanley Todd, "Music and the Photoplay," *Motion Picture Magazine*, March 1914.

30. Jerry Lorenz, *The National Magazine: An Illustrated Monthly* (Bostonian Publishing, 1922), 64.

31. Josephine Burnett Collection, Harry Ransom Center, University of Texas at Austin.

32. Kendra Preston Leonard, "Cue Sheets, Musical Suggestions, and Performance Practices for Hollywood Films, 1908–1927," in *Music and Sound in Silent Film: From the Nickelodeon to the Artist*, ed. Ruth Barton and Simon Trezise (New York: Routledge, 2018), 45–60.

33. Josephine Burnett Collection, Harry Ransom Center, University of Texas-Austin.

34. Leonard, "Cue Sheets, Musical Suggestions, and Performance Practices for Hollywood Films, 1908–1927."

35. "*My Old Kentucky Home* Technical Specifications," IMDb, http://www.imdb.com/title/tt0013421/technical?ref_=tt_dt_spec. Accessed May 18, 2017.

36. A clip of Calamity Jane synched with "Merry Hunting" can be viewed at https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OMhjfhPsQcQ.

37. "What the Picture Did for Me," *Exhibitors Herald*, December 1921–March 1923.

38. The Majestic Theater (now the Paramount), built in 1915, has a seating capacity of 1,270.

39. Alice Smythe [Burton] Jay, letter, "Music and the Picture," ed. Ernst Luz, *Motion Picture News* 15, no. 8 (February 24, 1917), 1278.

40. Alice S. Burton, "A Woman's Suggestion for Musical Scores" in "Music and the Picture," ed. Ernst Luz, *Motion Picture News* 12, no. 2 (July 17, 1915), 191.

41. Alice S. Burton Jay, letter, "Music and the Picture," *Motion Picture News* 15, no. 8 (February 24, 1917), 1278.

42. Alice Smythe Jay, letter, "Music and the Picture," ed. Ernst Luz, *Motion Picture News* 15, no. 11 (March 17, 1917), 1739.

43. "Artcraft Film to Open Coast Houses: Edward J. Howe has Completed Elaborate Score for Pickford Picture," *Motography* 16, no. 20 (November 11, 1916), 1082. Jay also found several instances of plagiarism in the score, which was marketed as wholly original other than the Woodforde-Finden piece, and not a compilation. Uncredited works included "Serenade" by Drdla and "Dance Parisian" by Lee S. Roberts.

44. Smythe Jay Music Company advertisement, *Motion Picture News* 13, no. 9 (March 4, 1916), 1365.

45. Clarence Sinn, "Musical Accessories to Motion Pictures," *Moving Picture World*, July 11, 1914, 534.

46. Carrie Hetherington, letter, "Music and the Picture," ed. Ernst Luz, *Motion Picture News* 14, no. 9 (November 11, 1916), 3049.

47. Carrie Hetherington, letter, "Music and the Picture," ed. Ernst Luz, *Motion Picture News* 14, no. 9 (November 11, 1916), 3049.

48. Carrie Hetherington, letter, "Music and the Picture," ed. Ernst Luz, *Motion Picture News* 14, no. 15 (October 14, 1916), 2426.

49. Carrie Hetherington, "Lady Audley's Secret," in "Music for the Picture," ed. Clarence E. Sinn, *Moving Picture World* 26, no. 3 (October 16, 1915), 495.

50. "Miller's Theater, Los Angeles," *Moving Picture World* 25, no. 2 (July 10, 1915), 263.

51. These names sometimes cause confusion. The American Photoplayer Company (sometimes written as "American Photo Player Company") manufactured the American Fotoplayer, using an alternate spelling to avoid consumer confusion with other automated instruments known generically as "photoplayers," or even human accompanists, who were also sometimes referred to as "photoplayers."

BIBLIOGRAPHY

"Abandon Orchestras." *Film Daily*, August 28, 1918.

Absher, Amy. *The Black Musician and the White City: Race and Music in Chicago, 1900–1967*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2014.

"Dramatics and Athletics." *New York Age*, October 16, 1913.

Gaines, Kevin K. *Uplifting the Race*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2012. https://uncpress.org/book/9780807845431/uplifting-the-race/.

Hill, Walter B., Jr. "Institutions of Memory and the Documentation of African Americans in Federal Records." National Archives, August 15, 2016. https://www.archives.gov/publications/prologue/1997/summer/institutions-of-memory.html.

Leonard, Kendra Preston. *Music for the Kingdom of Shadows: Cinema Accompaniment in the Age of Spiritualism*. Humanities Commons, 2019. https://doi.org/10.17613/HWVW-WG90.

Leonard, Kendra Preston. "Cue Sheets, Musical Suggestions, and Performance Practices for Hollywood Films, 19081927." In *Music and Sound in Silent Film: From the Nickelodeon to the Artist*, edited by Ruth Barton and Simon Trezise. New York: Routledge, 2018.

Leonard, Kendra Preston. "Women at the Pedals: Female Cinema Musicians during the Great War." In *Over Here, Over There: Transatlantic Conversations on the Music of World War I*, edited by William Brooks, Christina Bashford, and Gayle Magee. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2018.

Lorenz, Jerry. *The National Magazine: An Illustrated Monthly*. Bostonian Publishing, 1922.

"The Manilla Theater." *Indianapolis Recorder*, May 24, 1913.

Morgan-Ellis, Esther M. *Everybody Sing! Community Singing in the American Picture Palace*. Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2018.

Peyton, Dave. "The Musical Bunch: How to Play Picture Music." *Chicago Defender (National Edition)*, August 13, 1927, sec. *The Defender*'s Movie and Stage Department.

Schenbeck, Lawrence. *Racial Uplift and American Music, 1878–1943*. Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 2012.

Shryock, Henry S., and Jacob S. Siegel. *The Methods and Materials of Demography*. US Department of Commerce, Bureau of the Census, 1980.

Sinn, Clarence. "Musical Accessories to Motion Pictures." *Moving Picture World*, July 11, 1914.

Spivey, Victoria. *The Blues Is Life*. LP, Folkways Records, 1976. https://folkways-media.si.edu/liner_notes/folkways/FW03541.pdf.

Todd, Stanley. "Music and the Photoplay." *Motion Picture Magazine*, March 1914.

"Union Scale of Wages and Hours of Labor, Union Scale of Wages and Hours of Labor, May 15, 1921: Bulletin of the United States Bureau of Labor Statistics, No. 302 | Fraser | St. Louis Fed." Accessed November 2, 2017. https://fraser.stlouisfed.org/scribd/?item_id=492986&filepath=/files/docs/publications/bls/bls_0302_1922.pdf&start_page=68.

Walton, Lester A. "Music and the Stage." *New York Age*, March 25, 1909.