

Palaeobiology and palaeoecology

The unexpected occurrence of enigmatic 'percevalicrinids' (Echinodermata, Crinoidea) in the Lower Jurassic strata of North Africa — Implications for their stratigraphic and palaeogeographic distribution and discussion on their belonging to the subfamily Balanocrininae



Mariusz A. Salamon^{a,*}, Madani Benyoucef^b, Karolina Paszcza^a, Fayçal Mekki^b, Imad Bouchemla^b, Bartosz J. Płachno^c

 ^a University of Silesia in Katowice, Faculty of Natural Sciences, Będzińska 60, PL-41-200 Sosnowiec, Poland
^b Laboratoire de Géomatique, Ecologie et Environnement, Mustapha Stambouli University, 29000 Mascara, Algeria

^c Jagiellonian University in Kraków, Faculty of Biology, Institute of Botany, Gronostajowa Street 9, PL-30-387 Cracow, Poland

Abstract The marl and limestone alternations of the Lower Jurassic Ain Ouarka and Ain Rhezala formations (Pliensbachian—Toarcian) in the western Saharan Atlas, Northwest Algeria, yield a diverse micro- and macrofauna, including moderately numerous crinoids, which are represented by remains of isocrinids, i.e., *Balanocrinus ticinensis* Hess and columnals of the genus *Percevalicrinus*. So far, the latter genus has been observed from the Upper Jurassic—Lower Cretaceous strata of Eurasia, North America, and the African continent. Thus, the present find is the oldest record of this crinoid genus, and the second one from the southern Tethyan margin. In this paper, it is shown that *Percevalicrinus*, which is traditionally regarded as a representative of the subfamily Balanocrininae, displays several features of the subfamily lsocrininae. The crinoid assemblage and associated facies and invertebrate fauna are typical of a low-energy deep outer shelf/ ramp (below the storm wave-base) setting.

Keywords Echinoderms, Crinoids, Isocrinids, Percevalicrinids, *Percevalicrinus*, Lower Jurassic, Algeria, Maghrebian Tethys

* Corresponding author.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jop.2023.05.002

E-mail address: paleo.crinoids@poczta.fm (M.A. Salamon).

Peer review under responsibility of China University of Petroleum (Beijing).

^{2095-3836/© 2023} The Author(s). Published by Elsevier B.V. on behalf of China University of Petroleum (Beijing). This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

435

© 2023 The Author(s). Published by Elsevier B.V. on behalf of China University of Petroleum (Beijing). This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/).

Received 13 March 2023; revised 1 April 2023; accepted 19 May 2023; available online 23 May 2023

1. Introduction

'Percevalicrinids' belong to the order Isocrinida Sieverts-Doreck — one of the nine post-Paleozoic crinoid orders. They are known from Jurassic and Cretaceous strata, mostly from the Boreal Province. These crinoids are characterized by the presence of large basals that form a contiguous circle. Moreover, the lower edge of the basals possesses an inconspicuous median prolongation that partially covers the edge of the topmost columnal. Their arms are at first divided at primibrachial 2, and are divided further once or twice with variable intervals (e.g., Klikushin, 1979, 1981, 1992; Hess and Messing, 2011). Columnals are quite characteristic: circular to pentagonal and covered by short, uniform crenular pattern. With one exception, Percevalicrinus inderensis, adult specimens have a very similar, basically indistinguishable pattern of the columnal articular surface, which makes them classified as true 'isocrinids' rather than balanocrinids (Balanocrininae). In contrast, juvenile columnals are extremely tall and all representatives of 'percevelicrinids' are identical. They are usually covered with short and thick crenulae, which to some extent resemble millericrinids (Millericrinida). The internodes consist of 5–17 columnals. Hess and Messing (2011) distinguished four genera within the subfamily Balanocrininae Roux of the family Isocrinidae. These are: Balanocrinus Agassiz in Desor, Laevigatocrinus Klikushin, Singularocrinus Klikushin, and Percevalicrinus Klikushin. However, the affiliation of Percevalicrinus with Balanocrininae is not obvious. Rasmussen (1961) and Jäger (1981a, 1981b, 1981c) included Percevalicrinus tenellus (Eichwald) known from Spitzbergen as Neocrinus Thomson or Chladocrinus Agassiz. The last two genera are included, along with Isocrinus von Meyer, Chariocrinus Hess, Hispidocrinus Hess, Hypalocrinus A.H. Clark, Raymondicrinus Klikushin, and Tyrolecrinus Klikushin, to the subfamily Isocrininae Gislén. In contrast, Klikushin (1982, 1992) pointed out that the genus *Percevalicrinus* strongly differs from representatives of the genera Neocrinus and Chladocrinus. The same author (Kliksuhin, 1992) also stated that Percevalicrinus is remarkably similar (or even identical) to the genus Singularocrinus Klikushin, which is also included in the Balanocrininae; however, we do not agree with this statement.

Columnals of Singularocrinus represent typical balanocrinid-type remains (comp. e.g., Hess and Messing, 2011, fig. 30/2a-c). According to Klikushin (1992), the only difference is in the fact that the latter genus is known only from the Upper Triassic (Carnian-Norian) of the Caucasus. Jäger (2010) included columnals with lateral surfaces distinctly ornamented with spines, bumps, and thickenings also in Percevalicrinus. Similarly, Benyoucef et al. (2022) classified specimens from Berriasian and Valanginian strata of the Ouarsenis Massive in western Algeria (Fig. 1A) as belonging to this genus. Jäger (2010) suggested that this type of columnals may belong to another isocrinid. He also mentioned smaller individuals as "listed under Isocrinus? bleytonensis and might belong to *Percevalicrinus* sp. in fact". Jäger (2010) summarized that some cirrals, radials, brachials, or pinnulars classified by him as Isocrinus? bleytonensis may belong to Percevalicrinus. All of the above suggest that this group of crinoids should be referred to as 'percevalicrinids' in working terms, as it is difficult to unambiguously place this taxon either in Balanocrininae or Isocrininae (see also the discussion in section 8.2). There is also a problem with the ornamentation of unnaturally tall juvenile columnals, which are more like millericrinids than isocrinids. Finally, it becomes even more confusing when we look at the stratigraphic ranges of these crinoids. Hess and Messing (2011) noted Percevalicrinus from the Upper Jurassic (Tithonian)-Lower Cretaceous (Valanginian) interval, ignoring the fact that Jäger (2010) had recorded them from the Barremian of France. Current data show that the stratigraphic range of 'percevalicrinids' must be drastically shifted down to the Lower Jurassic (Pliensbachian), that is, by more than 40 million years.

2. Geological background

The Maghrebian orogenic domain comprises two different systems: the Tell-Rif to the north and the Atlas (High and Middle Atlas in Morocco, Saharan Atlas and Aurès Mountains in Algeria, and Tunisian Atlas in Tunisia), and also poorly deformed, broadly tabular domains (the so-called Western, or Moroccan, and Eastern or Oran Mesetas) only present in its western part (Fig. 1A).



Fig. 1 Geographic location of the study area in northern Africa. A) Main palaeogeographic units of the Maghreb; the red asterisk denotes the bearing crinoid species described in the text; B) Satellite image showing the position of the studied section (see also Fig. 2).

The Saharan Atlas extends between the Moroccan High Atlas and the Aures Range. It can be subdivided into a series of subranges (Ritter, 1902): the Ksour Mountains in the west, which is the focus of the present study, the Djebel Amour in the center, and the Ouled Nail Mountains in the east (Fig. 1A).

At the end of Triassic times and probably at the beginning of the Hettangian, Maghreb (north of the South Atlas Fault; Fig. 1A) was occupied by land and large sabkhas extending far south to the Lower Sahara (Choubert and Faure-Muret, 1960–1962). Magmatic events occurred, related to the first rift activities that are known all around the future central Atlantic Ocean. At the Hettangian—early Sinemurian an extended carbonate shelf (dolostone of Chemarikh Formation in the Ksour Mountains), post-dating the Triassic rifting, was established all over the Maghreb. From the

Pliensbachian to the early Bathonian, more open shelf conditions developed in the future Atlas (Kazi Tani, 1986; Aït Ouali, 1991; El Kochri and Chorowicz, 1996) in response to the persistence of the thermal subsidence (Piqué et al, 2002). Deposits of this interval times, are represented in the Ksour Mountains, by the Ain Ouarka, the Ain Rhezala, the Breccia of Raknet El Kahla, the Tniet El Klakh, and the Tifkirt formations (Bassoullet, 1973; Mekahli, 1998). From the Bathonian to the Early Cretaceous, the decrease in subsidence rate led to the progressive filling of the Atlasic trough with the deposition of initially fine, then coarse siliciclastic sediments ('Grès des Ksour' of Delfaud and Zellouf, 1993) representing the northward progression of the palaeo-Niger river and delta system by which the detrital material from the Saharan shield was transported to the Tethys. The Middle Jurassic-Late Toarcian

Pliensbachian

Sinemurian

Sinemurian

Formation

early

Hettangian-



Fig. 2 Ain Ouarka section of the Lower Jurassic at the western foot of Djebel Chemarikh. A) Measured stratigraphic section; B) Panoramic view showing the contact between the dolostone of the Chemarikh Formation (infra-Liassic dolostone) and the Ain Ouarka Formation (Sinemurian-Pliensbachian); C) Panoramic view showing the lower part (the filament-bearing marl-limestone member) of the Toarcian Ain Rhezala Formation; D) Panoramic view showing the upper part (the Zoophycos-bearing limestone-marl member) of the Ain Rhezala Formation.

U

Slumps \land Ripple marks

Zoophycos

ノ

Cretaceous sedimentary record has been ascribed to successive cycles of sea-level fluctuations during a post-rift stage unaffected by significant tectonic deformation (Frizon de Lamotte *et al*, 2008).

3. Stratigraphic section and age assignments

The general lithostratigraphy of the Mesozoic succession in the Ksour Mountains matches the subdivisions proposed by Bassoullet (1973) and Mekahli (1998) that have subsequently been accepted by most investigators (see Sebane *et al*, 2007; Benyoucef *et al*, 2017; Mekki *et al*, 2019; Bouchemla, 2021; Ferrari and Benyoucef, 2021; Mahboubi *et al*, 2021). The studied section ($32^{\circ}42'51.10''N$; $0^{\circ}9'49.30''W$), called the Ain Ouarka, is located 2.5 km south of the hydrothermal source of Ain Ouarka (Fig. 1B), and is divided into two formations.

3.1. Ain Ouarka Formation

Disconformably overlying the dolostone of Chemarikh Formation (Hettangian-lower Sinemurian) and underlying the Ain Rhezala Formation (Toarcian) (Fig. 2), the Ain Ouarka Formation (Mekahli, 1998) is divided into two informal members.

(i) The chert-bearing limestone—marl member, consists mainly of dark gray regular alternations of thin, hard, chert-bearing limestone beds (4–5 cm-thick) and dark green marl bands (2–5 cm-thick). The limestone beds contain ammonites and belemnites. The microfacies consist predominantly of mudstone to wackestone containing sponge spicules, radiolarians, microfilaments, benthic and planktic foraminifers, and echinoderm bioclasts.

The lower part of the chert-bearing limestone—marl member was placed by Bassoullet (1973) and Mekahli (1998) in the Sinemurian Semicostatum and Turneri zones based on ammonites (Asteroceras sp., Arnioceras miserabile, Arnioceras aff. miserabile, Arnioceras aff. semicostatum, and Arnioceras cf. speciosum) and in the Obtusum Zone (Asteroceras sp., Asteroceras meridionale, Asteroceras aff. margarita, Phylloceras sp., Gleviceras gr. doris, and Lytoceras sp.).

(ii) The spaced limestone—marl alternation member is represented by an alternation of soft green laminated marl (10-50 cm-thick) and limestone beds (5-10 cm-thick) with an undulating surface at the base and/or at the top. It contains ammonites and belemnites. The limestone beds are laterally continuous over hundreds of meters. The microfacies consist mainly of biomicrites (mudstone to wackestone) with filaments, spherical radiolarians, planktonic foraminifers, and rare calcispheres.

This member yielded Pliensbachian ammonites. They represent the passage from the Sinemurian-lower Pliensbachian (Oxynoticeras sp.), the Ibex Zone (Tropidoceras mediterraneum, Tropidoceras calliplocum, Protogrammoceras sp., and Lytoceras sp.), the Davoei Zone (Protogrammoceras cf. volubile, Juraphyllites sp., Phylloceras sp., Lytoceras sp.), the Algovianum Zone (Reynesoceras sp., Protogrammoceras sp., Arieticeras algovianum, Lioceratoides aff. inclytum, Arieticeras gr. bertrandi, Protogrammoceras gr. bonarelli, Pygope aspasia, and Securithyris erbaensis), and the Emaciatum Zone (Tauromeniceras elisa) (see Bassoullet (1973) and Mekahli (1998) for details).

3.2. Ain Rhezala Formation

The Ain Rhezala Formation (Mekahli, 1998) overlies the Ain Ouarka Formation and underlies the Breccia of the Raknet El Kahla Formation (Aalenian—Bajocian) (Fig. 2). It is subdivided into two informal members, based on their respective faunal, ichnological, and lithological features.

(i) The filament-bearing marl-limestone member is made mainly of green to whitish laminated marl (10-50 cm-thick) and gray limestone (5-10 cm-thick) alternations bearing thin-shelled posidoniid bivalves ('filaments') and ammonites. The limestone beds show rare, highly branched burrows assigned to Chondrites isp. The microfacies consists of mudstone-wackestone containing microfilaments and ostracods.

The member contains Toarcian ammonites of the Polymorphum Zone (*Eodactylites* sp., *Eodactylites* gr. *mirabile*), the Bifrons Zone (*Hildocerasbifrons angustisiphonatum, Hildocerasbifrons* gr. *sublevisoni crassum, Hildocerasbifrons sublevisoni, Hildocerasbifrons* semipolitum, *Hildocerasbifrons lusitanicum*, and *Phymatoceras* gr. *elegans*), the Gradata Zone (*Crassiceras* gradatum, *Calliphylloceras nilssoni, Pseudogrammoceras subregale, Polyplectus discoides, Polyplectus pinnai, Alocolytoceras* sp., *Collinites*, and *Phylloceras* sp.), the Bonarelli Zone (*Pseudogrammoceras* sp.), and the Speciosum Zone.

(ii) The Zoophycos-bearing limestone—marl member consists of a regular and monotonous alternation of thin-to medium-bedded limestones (7–15 cm-thick) and green to light gray marl (15–40 cm-thick). The limestone beds contain numerous ammonites and belemnites and are commonly rich in trace fossils, represented by well-preserved Zoophycos, associated with Chondrites and Thalasinoides. In mudstone—wackestone, quartz grains, calcispheres, sponge spicules, very thin bivalve shells ('filaments'), pelagic crinoids (Saccocoma) and other fine bioclasts are observed. The ammonites (Grammoceras aff. striatulum, Pseudogrammoceras gr. fallaciusum, Pseudogrammoceras cf. muelleri, Harpoceras cf. serpentinum, Harpoceras sp., Hammatoceras gr. bonarellii, Esericeras sp., Lytoceras sp., and Phylloceras sp.) collected by Mekahli (1998) and Bouchemla (2021) indicate the upper Toarcian Bonarellii Zone.

4. Material and methods

The Early Jurassic crinoid collection from the Ain Rhezala and Ain Ouarka formations of the western Saharan Atlas (Algeria) is housed in the Faculty of Natural Sciences, Institute of Earth Sciences of the University of Silesia in Katowice, Poland, and acronymed under the catalogue number of GIUS 8–3689/ Per.

The marl and limestone were sampled at a more or less close intervals; loose samples (marls) were soaked in water for several days and then washed in a series of sieves with decreasing mesh size (300 µm, 250 µm, 180 $\mu m,\,125~\mu m)$ under a strong jet of water. The residuals recovered from each sieve were dried and steamed and then sorted with a Euromex Dz and Optika ST-40-2L binocular magnifier to pick the micropaleontological content. For hard samples, the thin sections were made for both microfacial and microfaunal purposes. The sorted crinoid specimens were fixed on stubs using double-sided carbon adhesive tape and then covered with a thin layer of gold. They were then photographed with a Hitachi S-4700 scanning electron microscope (SEM), housed at the Institute of Geological Sciences, Jagiellonian University in Kraków, Poland.

5. Results

Thirty-six columnals/pluricolumnals belonging to 'percevalicrinids' were collected. They were found in two Pliensbachian samples (Ao15 and Ao18) and two Toarcian samples (Ao23 and Ao34). Additionally, from the Pliensbachian samples Ao15 and Ao18, 7 columnals, 11 cirrals, 2 primibrachials, and 3 secundibrachials were picked. The ornamentation of the articular facets of the columnals was mostly poorly visible; however, these specimens resemble the remains of *Balanocrinus ticinensis* Hess known from the Pliensbachian strata of Switzerland.

The smallest columnals of Balanocrinus cf. ticinensis are nearly as high as wide. Their diameter is about 0.7 mm. The diameters of the larger columnals vary between 1.8 mm and 2.6 mm. The columnals are pentagonal to subpentalobate. The adradial face is covered by a maximum of 35 marginal crenulae and probably 50 adradial crenulae. The petal floors are rhombic and relatively large, which is typical for Balanocrinus. The lumen is rather small and circular. The latera are covered by tubercles, and in one specimen they are arranged in rows or smooth. Cirrals have smooth surfaces and are elliptical in cross-section. Their length varies from short in the proximal case to long in distal cirrals. The proximal facets of the primibrachials are muscular. They have large muscle faces. Their lateral surfaces are smooth. Secundibrachials also have smooth surfaces and large muscular facets with distinct muscle fields.

6. Palaeoenvironment of the Lower Jurassic deposits in the Ain Ouarka area

The fine-grained sediment is interpreted as suspension deposits. The abundance of open marine macrofauna (ammonites and belemnites) and microfauna (thin-shelled bivalves and calcispheres, regarded as possibly calcified radiolarians), and Zoophycos trace fossils, all indicate a low-energy deep outer shelf/ramp setting below the storm wave base (e.g., Bruhwiler et al, 2009; Lukeneder et al, 2012), which is supported by the lack of benthic marine fauna and absence of sedimentary textures indicative of strong bottom currents. This interpretation is also supported by the presence of pelagic crinoids (Saccocoma) and radiolarians at some intervals. The trace fossils Zoophycos and Chondrites were produced by the members of endobenthic fauna adapted to nutrient exploitation within sediments. Both these traces reflect Zoophycos ichnofacies. An outer shelf (outer ramp) environment was also proposed by Bouchemla (2021) and Mahboubi et al. (2021) for the Lower Jurassic rocks of the Ain Ouarka area.

7. Systematic paleontology

In the absence of a complete revision of the genus *Percevalicrinus*, we use the systematics proposed by Hess and Messing (2011).

Order: Isocrinida Sieverts-Doreck, 1951. Suborder: Isocrinida Sieverts-Doreck, 1951. Family: Isocrinidae Gislén, 1924. Subfamily: Balanocrininae Roux, 1981. Genus: Percevalicrinus Klikushin, 1977. Type species: Picteticrinus beaugrandi de Loriol, in de Loriol and Pellat (1875, p. 298).

Percevalicrinus sp. (Fig. 3).

Material: 36 columnals and pluricolumnals.

Repository: Laboratory of Palaeontology and Stratigraphy of the University of Silesia in Katowice, Poland, with the catalogue number: GIUS 8–3689/Per.

Description: Only juvenile columnals were found. The distal-most columnals are circular or pentagonal and extremely high; even five times higher than wide. The medial and proximal-most columnals are pentagonal to substellate. They are moderately high. The articular face is covered with thick and short crenulae. They occur in numbers from 8 up to 24. Cirrus scars are placed at the lower part of the nodals. They are medium to large and directed obliquely upward. These scars are distinct depressed, circular to slightly oval. The distal lip is prominent and may protrude beyond the lower margin. A shallow cupule may develop above the cirral scar of the nodals and the distal part of the adjacent supranodals. In some cases, the central pore of the cirral scar interrupts a thickened transverse ridge at each end. Lateral surfaces are smooth and synarthrial.

Distribution: Representatives of 'percevalicrinids' occur from the Lower Jurassic (Pliensbachian) to the Lower Cretaceous (Barremian) of Africa (Algeria), Eurasia (England, France, Germany, Spitsbergen, Russia) and North America (Greenland, United States).

8. Discussion

8.1. Palaeogeographic and stratigraphic distribution of 'percevalicrinids'

According to Klikushin (1979, 1981, 1982, 1992; see also Benyoucef et al, 2022) five species of the genus Percevalicrinus are known. Meek and Hayden (1859) described Pentacrinus asteriscus from the Oxfordian of Nebraska, United States. The same taxon was later classified as Isocrinus knighti Springer by Springer (1909), and both were included in *Percevalicrinus* asteriscus (Meek and Hayden) by Klikushin (1992). Pentacrinus asteriscus and/or I. knighti were also mentioned from the Oxfordian of the central United States (Dakota, Idaho, Missouri, Nebraska, Wyoming) by Meek and Hayden (1859, 1861, 1864), Meek and Engelmann (1861), Meek (1864), Peale (1879), Boyle (1893), Clark (1893a, 1893b), Stanton (1899), Knight (1900), Logan (1900), Schuchert (1905), Fisher (1906), Whitfield and Hovey (1906), Grabau and Shimer (1911), Clark and Twitchell (1915), Shimer

(1921), Mansfield (1927), Neely (1937), Imlay (1947), Moore and Laudon (1948), Moore *et al.* (1952), and Pipiringos (1957) (Fig. 4). Darton (1899; 1905) identified extremely long columnals from the Oxfordian of South Dakota as *Pentacrinoides aristicus* and *Pentacrinoides asteristicus* [sic!], but Klikushin (1992) classified this material as belonging to *Percevalicrinus*.

Somewhat later, Eichwald (1868) distinguished another 'percevalicrinid', Pentacrinus tenellus Eichwald, which was synonymized with Percevalicrinus tenellus by Klikushin (1982). This form was originally described from the Berriasian near Moscow. Sokolov and Bodylevsky (1931) indicated the presence of Pentacrinus? sp. in the Berriasian of Spitsbergen, Norway. This taxon was also recognized by Klikushin (1992) as a 'percevalicrinid' (Percevalicrinus tenellus). The same author, referring to the unpublished research of Simonov and Alekseev, indicated the presence of this taxon in Berriasian strata of the Volga Basin and the west Siberian Plain (Klikushin, 1979, 1981). In addition, Klikushin (1992 and the literature cited therein) claimed that this taxon also occurs in the Berriasian of eastern Greenland (Fig. 4).

Another representative of the genus *Percevalicrinus* is *Percevalicrinus beaugrandi* (Loriol), first described from the Tithonian of France by de Loriol (1877–1879, 1882–1889) as *Picteticrinus beaugrandi*. *Picteticrinus* Étallon was treated by de Loriol and Pellat (1875, in p. 298), as a junior homonym and classified by Hess and Messing (2011) as nomina dubia; however, Klikushin (1981, 1982, 1992) included it in genus *Percevalicrinus*. This taxon was mentioned in France also by Pellat (1880), Biese (1930), and Dacqué (1933). Moreover, Klikushin (1981) recorded this species in the Tithonian (Volgian) of Russia (environs of Moscow, Volga Basin, Arctic Ural (Jatrina River)) and Taimyr (Fig. 4).

The next two 'percevalicrinids' were distinguished by Klikushin (1979, 1981). First, the most completely preserved Percevalicrinus aldingeri Klikushin, was known from the lower Valanginian of the west Siberian plain, Taimyr (Boyarka, Maymecha, Sabyda, and Suolema rivers), and the Anabar River. Spath (1947) mentioned remains of isocrinids from the Berriasian of Greenland, which were assigned to P. aldingeri by Klikushin (1992). The latter was included in the synonymy of P. aldingeri. The remains of Neocrinus tenellus (Eichwald) mentioned by Rasmussen (1961) are from the Hauterivian rocks of England, France, and the Valanginian and Hauterivian strata of Germany. Benyoucef et al. (2022) described the stem and cup remains of this taxon from the Berriasian and Valanginian of Algeria, and so far, this was the only African find of 'percevalicrinid'. The last representative of the



Fig. 3 Juvenile 'percevalicrinids' and true 'balanocrinids' (*Balanocrinus* cf. *ticinensis* Hess) from the Pliensbachian Ain Ouarka Formation of Algeria. Acronym number: GIUS 8–3689/Per. Scale bar equals 1 mm. A–B) Extremely tall distal columnals, oblique view (latera plus articular surface); C) Distal columnal, oblique view (latera plus articular surface covered with thick and short crenulae resembling those of millericrinids); D) Medial? columnal, oblique view (latera plus articular surface covered with thick and short crenulae resembling to millericrinid); E) Extremely tall distal columnal, lateral view; F) Pluricolumnal consisting of two medial columnals, oblique view (latera plus articular surfaces with invisible crenulation); G) Medial/proximal nodal columnal, lateral view (G1) and oblique view (G2) (latera plus articular surface). H–I) *Balanocrinus* cf. *ticinensis* Hess, medial/proximal (H) and proximal (I) columnals, articular surface.



Early Jurassic (Pliensbachian) occurrence of "percevalicrinids" (current study)

Fig. 4 Palaeogeographic map showing the distribution of 'percevalicrinids' during the Late Jurassic–Early Cretaceous. Maps slightly modified after Scotese (2014) and Salamon *et al.* (2019). Data from Rasmussen (1961), Klikushin (1979, 1981, 1992), Jäger (1981a, 1981b, 1981c, 2010), Hess and Messing (2011), and Benyoucef *et al.* (2022).



Fig. 5 'Percevalicrinid' cups and different isocrinid columnals showing the differences between them. A) Cup of *Percevalicrinus aldingeri*; B) Cup of *Percevalicrinus asteriscus*; C) Cup of *Percevalicrinus beaugrandi*; D) Cup of *Percevalicrinus tenellus*; E) Medial columnal of *Percevalicrinus inderensis*; F) Typical balanocrinid (*Balanocrinus subteres*) distal/medial columnal; G) Typical isocrinid (*Isocrinus*) medial columnal; H) Medial columnal of *Percevalicrinus beaugrandi*. Not to scale. All data compiled and redrawn after Rasmussen (1961), Klikushin (1979, 1981, 1992), Jäger (1981a–1981c, 2010), Hess and Messing (2011), and Benyoucef *et al.* (2022).

genus *Percevalicrinus* is *P. inderensis* Klikushin, erected by Klikushin (1981) based on columnals and pluricolumnals. This form was known only from the latest Tithonian of western Kazakhstan (Klikushin, 1992) (Fig. 4).

Jäger (2010) illustrated interesting material from Serre de Bleyton (France) of Barremian age and described it as *Percevalicrinus* sp., shifting the known stratigraphic range of 'percevalicrinids' from lower Hauterivian to Barremian. The current finds push further back the first appearance of these crinoids into the Pliensbachian. Additionally, this is the second finding of 'percevalicrinids' from a low latitude (Fig. 4).

8.2. Are there five 'percevalicrinid' species?

Juvenile columnals of all known representatives of 'percevalicrinids' are indistinguishable. They are all very tall, oval, or pentagonal in outline and their articular surfaces are covered by thick and short crenulae (Fig. 3; e.g., Jäger, 2010; Benyoucef *et al*, 2022), which makes them similar to millericrinids. On the contrary, the columnals of adults more closely resemble the columnals of isocrinids (Isocrininae Gislén) than those of balanocrinids (Balanocrininae Roux). Typical columnals of balanocrinids are pentagonal, occasionally with sharp edges. Their facet is covered with sharply terminated and rhombic petal

floors. The petal floors are separated by thin adradial crenulae; each petal floor is surrounded by 5-8 marginal crenulae. The adradial crenulae are narrow (Fig. 5F; e.g., Salamon, 2008a, 2008b, 2008c, 2009; Hess, 2014a; 2014b). Columnals of this type are found in Balanocrinus, Laevigatocrinus, and Singularocrinus, which beyond any doubt should be associated with Balanocrininae. In the case of Percevalicrinus, such columnals have never been documented (Fig. 5E, H; Klikushin, 1977, 1992; Jäger, 2010; Hess and Messing, 2011; Benyoucef et al, 2022). This calls into the question: what prompted Klikushin (1977) to include the genus Percevalicrinus in the Balanocrininae? The question is all the more pertinent because Roux (1981) established this subfamily solely based on the columnal facets, with characters of the crown identical to Isocrininae. The columnal facets of all the abovementioned representatives of Percevalicrinus, except P. inderensis (Fig. 5E), are similar or almost identical to each other (Eichwald, 1868, fig. 1, pl. 16; Hucke, 1904, fig. 5, pl. 23; Aldinger, 1935, fig. 10; Spath, 1947, figs. 10 and 11, pl. 5; Rasmussen, 1961, figs. 1a, 2, 3, pl. 10; Klikushin, 1979, figs. 4–6, pl. 7; Klikushin, 1992, fig. 7/ 1-2, 9/1-6; Jäger, 2010, figs. 3a and 6a, pl. 3; Hess and Messing, 2011, fig. 27/3b, 3c; Benyoucef et al, 2022, fig. 5i, l). All these columnals are pentagonal, stellate to substellate with slightly embayed sides and fairly sharp angles (Fig. 5H). The articular surfaces are

covered by a circular or slightly elongated lumen in the case of distal and medial columnals; it is elongated or even drop-shaped in the case of proximal columnals. Crenulae may be thicker and less numerous in the distal columnals; they become thinner and more numerous in the proximal columnals. The latera may be smooth or covered with fine outgrowths or nodules forming a characteristic keel. The only exception is the columnals of Percevalicrinus inderensis Klikushin, which is known from stem fragments. Klikushin (1992, figs. 1–10, pl. 8) illustrated stellate and substellate columnals that were covered by thin and very numerous crenulae in a maximum numbering up to 96, which were grouped around very long, remarkably thin, and deep petal floors (Fig. 5E). Therefore, the affiliation of this taxon to Percevalicrinus seems even more doubtful. Hess and Messing (2011) recalled that typical Isocrininae (Fig. 5G), such as Isocrinus pendulus (von Meyer) or *Isocrinus nicoleti* (Thurmann in Thurmann and Étallon), have diameter/height ratios of 6 or even more in columnals from the mesistele, whereas those of typical Balanocrininae such as Balanocrinus subteres (Münster in Goldfuss) or Balanocrinus pentagonalis (Goldfuss) are below 3. In Percevalicrinus inderensis the diameter/height ratio ranges from 5 to even more than 7.

In the case of the four remaining 'percevalicrinids' (Percevalicrinus aldingeri, Percevalicrinus asteriscus, Percevalicrinus beaugrandi, Percevalicrinus tenellus; Fig. 5A–D), the structure of their cups is known. Here it can be also seriously doubted whether they do indeed belong to four different species. The cup of Percevalicrinus aldingeri is the largest of all Percevalicrinus, but more importantly, it has a first primibrachial (IBr1) with a unique trapezoidal shape (inverted trapezoid), whose upper (distal) base is strongly concave in aboral view. At the same time, the base of its primaxillary (IAx) in the aboral view is strongly convex. The size of the cups of the other forms is comparable, but only the cup of Percevalicrinus beaugrandi clearly differs from the others mentioned above. While the shapes of its radials, IBr1 and IAx are identical to those of Percevalicrinus astericus and *Percevalicrinus tenellus*, its radials are the only ones with a small teardrop-shaped protuberance in the lower part (Fig. 5C). The only slight difference that distinguishes the cup of Percevalicrinus asteriscus from Percevalicrinus tenellus is the shape of IAx. All other elements of the cup are identical in shape and size. In both cases, the IAx is flattened pentagonal, but in Percevalicrinus tenellus it is only slightly higher (Fig. 5D).

9. Conclusions

In the Pliensbachian and Toarcian strata of Algeria (North Africa), abundant high columnals and pluricolumnals have been documented and classified as Percevalicrinus within the subfamily Balanocrininae. As the systematic affiliation of Percevalicrinus to Balanocrininae was guestioned, these crinoids were given the provisional name of 'percevalicrinids'. The basis of distinguishing five species of Percevalicrinus has been questioned and it has been suggested that they probably only belong to two, at most three, taxa. So far, the oldest representatives of 'percevalicrinids' were known only from the Tithonian sediments (Upper Jurassic); they have now been found in the Pliensbachian and Toarcian (Lower Jurassic), as well. Thus, globally, this is the oldest Early Jurassic record of 'percevalicrinids', and only the second documented occurrence from the African continent.

Availability of data and materials

Data supporting the findings of this research are available upon request from the corresponding author.

Funding

This research project has been supported by the National Science Centre, Poland (www.ncn.gov.pl) — Grant No. 2020/39/B/ST10/00006.

Authors' contributions

M.A. Salamon: Conceptualization, data curation, formal analysis, funding acquisition, investigation, methodology, project administration, writing original draft, writing, review and editing; M. Benyoucef: Data curation, field works, resources, software, writing original draft; K. Paszcza: Writing original draft, writing, review and editing; F. Mekki: Methodology, writing original draft; I. Bouchemla: Data curation, formal analysis, methodology, software, visualization; B.J. Płachno: Investigation, methodology, writing original draft, writing, review and editing. All authors read and approved the final proof.

Conflict of interest

All authors declare no conflict of interest.

In addition, all authors disclose any financial relationships in the submitted manuscript (Funding and Acknowledgements sections).

Acknowledgements

We thank Prof. Franz Fürsich, an anonymous reviewer and journal editors for their useful comments that improved this manuscript.

References

- Aït Ouali, R., 1991. Le Rifting des Monts des Ksour au Lias: Organisation du bassin, diagenèse des assises carbonatées, place dans les ouvertures mésozoïques au Maghreb. Thèse de Doctorat Ès-Sciences, Université de Pau, pp. 1–302.
- Aldinger, H., 1935. Geologische Beobachtungen im oberen Jura des Scoresbysundes. *Meddelelser om Grønland*, 99, 1–128.
- Bassoullet, J.P., 1973. Contribution à l'étude stratigraphique du Mésozoïque de l'Atlas Saharien occidental (Algérie). Thèse de Doctorat d'État, Sciences Naturelles, Université de Paris VI, pp. 1–497.
- Benyoucef, M., Ferré, B., Płachno, B.J., Bouchemla, I., Salamon, M.A., 2022. Crinoids from the Ouarsenis Massif (Algeria) fill the Lower Cretaceous (Berriasian and Valanginian) gap of northern Africa. *Annales de Paléontologie*, 108, 102555.
- Benyoucef, M., Mebarki, K., Ferré, B., Adaci, M., Bulot, L.G., Desmares, D., Villier, L., Bensalah, M., Frau, C., Ifrim, C., Malti, F.Z., 2017. Litho- and biostratigraphy, facies patterns and depositional sequences of the Cenomanian–Turonian deposits in the Ksour Mountains (Saharan Atlas, Algeria). Cretaceous Research, 78, 34–55.
- Biese, W., 1930. Über Isocrinus H. v. Meyer und Cainocrinus Forbes. Jahrbuch der Königlich Preussischen Geologischen. Landensaltsalt, 50, 702–719.
- Bouchemla, I., 2021. Etablissement d'un modèle d'evolution des Zoophycos sur des coupes de Rréférences pendant le Phanérozoïque (Algérie). Thèse de Doctorat Ès-Sciences, Université d'Oran 2 Mohamed Ben Ahmed, pp. 1–264.
- Boyle, C.B., 1893. A catalogue and bibliography of North American Mesozoic Invertebrata. *Bulletin of the United States Geological Survey*, 102, 7–315.
- Bruhwiler, T., Goudemand, N., Galfetti, T., Bucher, H., Baud, A., Ware, D., Hermann, E., Hochuli, P.A., Martini, R., 2009. The Lower Triassic sedimentary and carbon isotope records from Tulong (South Tibet) and

their significance for Tethyan palaeoceanography. *Sedimentary Geology*, 222, 314–332.

- Choubert, G., Faure-Muret, A., 1960–1962. Evolution du domaine atlasique marocain depuis les temps paléozoïques. Livre à la mémoire du Professeur Paul Fallot. Mémoire hors série, Société Géologique de France, 1, 447–527.
- Clark, W.B., 1893a. The Mesozoic Echinodermata of the Unites States. *Bulletin of the United States Geological Survey*, 12, 51–52.
- Clark, W.B., 1893b. A preliminary report on the Cretaceous and Tertiary formations of New Jersey, with especial reference to Monmouth and Middlesex counties. *Annales report of the Geological Survey of New Jersey for the year*, 1892, 169–239.
- Clark, W.B., Twitchell, M.W., 1915. The Mesozoic and Cenozoic Echinodermata of the United States. *Monograph of the Unites States Geological Survey*, 54, 1–341.
- Dacqué, F., 1933. Wirbellose des Jura. *Leitfossilien*, 7, 1–272.
- Darton, N.H., 1899. Jurassic formations of the Black Hills of South Dakota. The Geological Society of America Bulletin, 10, 383–396.
- Darton, N.H., 1905. Description of the Sundance Quadrangle. Bulletin of the Geological Society of America, 10, 383-396.
- de Loriol, P., 1877–1879. Monographie des crinoïdes fossiles de la Suisse. *Mémoires de la Société paléontologique suisse*, 4, 1–52; 5, 3–124; 6, 125–300.
- de Loriol, P., Pellat, E.P.E., 1875. Monographie paléontologique et géologique desétages supérieurs de la formation jurassique des environs de Boulogne-sur-Mer. Memoires de la Societe de Physique et d'Histoire Naturelle de Geneve, 24, 1–185.
- de Loriol, P., 1882–188. Crinoïdes. Paléontologie française. Terrains Oolitiques et Jurassiques. Masson, Paris pt. 1, 1882–1884, pp. 1–627; pt. 2, 1884–1889, pp. 1–580.
- Delfaud, J., Zellouf, K., 1993. Existence, durant le Jurassique et le Crétacé inférieur, d'un Paléo-Niger coulant du sud vers le nord au Sahara occidental. *118ème Congrès national des sociétés historiques et scientifiques, Pau, et 4ème Colloque de Géologie africaine* 93–104.
- Eichwald, E., 1868. Lethaea Rossica ou Paléontologie de la Russie. E. Schweizerbart, Stuttgart, pp. 1–556.
- El Kochri, A., Chorowicz, J., 1996. Oblique extension in the Jurassic trough of the central and eastern High Atlas (Morocco). *Canadian Journal of Earth Sciences*, 33, 84–92.
- Ferrari, M., Benyoucef, M., 2021. Middle Jurassic (upper Bajocian) marine vetigastropods from the Western Saharan Atlas, Algeria. *Annales de Paléontologie*, 107, 102467.
- Fisher, C.A., 1906. *Geology and water resources of the Bighorn Basin, Wyoming*, vol. 53. U.S. Geological Survey Professional Paper, pp. 1–72.
- Frizon de Lamotte, D., Ziz, M., Missenard, Y., Hafid, M., El Azzouzi, M., Maury, R.C., Charrière, A., Taki, Z., Benammi, M., Michard, A., 2008. The Atlas system. *Lecture Notes in Earth Sciences*, 116, 133–202.
- Gislén, T., 1924. Echinoderm Studies. Zoologiska Bidrag från, Uppsala, pp. 1–9.

- Grabau, A.W., Shimer, H.W., 1911. North American Index Fossils: Invertebrates. *The Journal of Geology*, 19(5), 470–472.
- Hess, H., 2014a. *Balanocrinus* and other crinoids from Late Jurassic mudstones of France and Switzerland. *Swiss Journal of Palaeontology*, 133, 47–75.
- Hess, H., 2014b. Balanocrinus (Crinoidea) from the Jurassic: species concept, reconstruction, ontogeny, taphonomy and ecology. Swiss Journal of Palaeontology, 133, 35–45.
- Hess, H., Messing, C.G., 2011. Treatise on Invertebrate Paleontology. *Part T, Echinodermata 2, Crinoidea, 3*. The University of Kansas, Paleontological Institute, Lawrence, pp. 1–262..
- Hucke, K., 1904. Gault in Bartin bei Degow (Hinterpommern). Zeitschrift der Deutschen Geologischen Gesellschaft, 56, 165–173.
- Imlay, R.W., 1947. Marine Jurassic of Black Hills area, South Dacota and Wyoming. *Bulletin of the American Association of Petroleum Geology*, 31, 227–273.
- Jäger, M., 1981a. Crinoidea uit het Onderkrijt van het Duits-Nederlandse grensgebiet. *Grondboor en Hamer*, 35, 128–152.
- Jäger, M., 1981b. Die Crinoiden des Osning-Sandsteins (Unterkreide) in der Umgebung von Bielefeld. Veröff. Naturkunde Museum Bielefeld, 3, 5–18.
- Jäger, M., 1981c. *Die Crinoiden der nordwestdeutschen Unterkreide*, vol. 19. Mitteilungen aus dem geologischen Institut der Universität, Hannover, pp. 7–136.
- Jäger, M., 2010. Crinoids from the Barremian (Lower Cretaceous) of the Serre de Bleyton (Drôme, SE France). Annalen Naturhistorisches Museum Wien, 112, 733-774.
- Kazi Tani, N., 1986. Evolution géodynamique de la bordure nord-africaine: le domaine intraplaque nord-algérien.
 Approche megaséquentielle, Thèse de Doctorat Ès-Sciences, Université de Pau, France, pp. 1–871.
- Klikushin, V.G., 1977. Sea lilies of the genus *Isselicrinus*. *Paleontological Journal*, 11, 87–95.
- Klikushin, V.G., 1979. Sea-lilies of the genera Balanocrinus and Laevigatocrinus. Paleontological Journal, 3, 96–97.
- Klikushin, V.G., 1981. Sea-lilies of genus *Percevalicrinus*. *Paleontological Journal*, 4, 81–90.
- Klikushin, V.G., 1982. Taxonomic survey of fossil isocrinids with a list of the species found in the USSR. *Geobios*, 15, 299–325.
- Klikushin, V.G., 1992. Fossil pentacrinid crinoids and their occurrence in the USSR. Leningrad Palaeontological Laboratory, Sankt Petersburg, pp. 1–358.
- Knight, W., 1900. Jurassic rocks of Southeastern Wyoming. Bulletin of the Geological Society of America, 11, 377–388.
- Logan, W.N., 1900. The stratigraphy and invertebrates fauna of the Jurassic formation in the Freeze-Out Hills of Wyoming. *The Kansas University Quarterly*, 9, 109–134.
- Lukeneder, S., Harzhauser, M., Islamoglu, Y., Krystyn, L., Lein, R., 2012. A delayed carbonate factory breakdown during the Tethyan-wide Carnian Pluvial Episode along the Cimmerian terranes (Taurus, Turkey). *Facies*, 58, 279–296.
- Mahboubi, M.C., Ouali Mehadji, A., Chevalier, N., 2021. Microfacies and stable isotope features of the

Lower–Middle Jurassic carbonate rocks of Western Saharan Atlas (Aïn Ouarka area, Algeria). *Geological Journal*, 56, 4201–4216.

- Mansfield, G.R., 1927. Geography, geology and mineral resources of part of southeastern Idaho. Professional Papers of the United States Geological Survey, 152, 1–453.
- Meek, F.B., 1864. Check list of the invertebrate fossils of North America. Cretaceous and Jurassic. Smithsonian Miscellaneous Collection, 7, 1–40.
- Meek, F.B., Engelmann, H., 1861. Notices of geological discoveries, made by Capt. J.H. Simpson. Topographical Engineers, U.S. Army, in his recent exploration across the Continent. Proceedings of the Academy of Natural Sciences of Philadelphia, 12, 126–131.
- Meek, F.B., Hayden, F.V., 1859. Description of new organic remains collected in Nebraska Territory in the year 1857, by Dr. F.V. Hayden. Proceeding of the Academy of Natural Sciences of Philadelphia, 10, 41–59.
- Meek, F.B., Hayden, F.V., 1861. Systematic catalogue, with synonyms of Jurassic, Cretaceous and Tertiary fossils collected in Nebraska. In: Proceeding of the Academy of Natural Sciences of Philadelphia, 12, pp. 417–432.
- Meek, F.B., Hayden, F.V., 1864. Paleontology of the Upper Missouri. Smithsonian Contributions to Knowledge, 172, 1–135.
- Mekahli, L., 1998. Evolution des Monts des Ksour (Algérie), de l'Hettangien au Bajocien: Biostratigraphie, sédimentologie, paléogéographie et stratigraphie séquentielle. Documents des Laboratoires de Géologie de Lyon, 147, 1–319.
- Mekki, F., Zhang, L.J., Vinn, O., Tomm, U., Benyoucef, M., Bendella, M., Bouchemla, E., Bensalah, M., Adaci, M., 2019. Middle Jurassic Zoophycos and Chondrites from the Mélah Formation of Saharan Atlas, Algeria. Estonian Journal of Earth Sciences, 68, 190–198.
- Moore, R.C., Lalicker, C.G., Fischer, A.G., 1952. *Invertebrate Fossils*. McGraw-Hill Book Company, New York, pp. 1–766.
- Moore, R.C., Laudon, L.R., 1948. Class Crinoidea. In: Shimer, H.W., Shrock, R.R. (Eds.), *Index fossils of North America*. John Wiley and Sons, Inc., New York, pp. 137–209.
- Neely, J., 1937. Stratigraphy of the Sundance Formation and related Jurassic rocks in Wyoming and their petroleum aspects. Bulletin of the American Association of Petroleum Geology, 21, 715–770.
- Peale, A.C., 1879. Jura-Trias section of Southeastern Idaho and Western Wyoming. *Geological and Geographical Survey of the Territories*, 5, 119–124.
- Pellat, E., 1880. Le Terrain Jurassique Moyen et Supérieur du Bas-Boulonnais. *Bulletin de la Societe Geologique de France*, 8, 647–699.
- Pipiringos, G.N., 1957. Stratigraphy of the Sundance, Nugget and Jelm formations in the Laramie Basin, Wyoming. Bulletin - Geological Survey of Wyoming, 47, 1–63.
- Piqué, A., Tricart, P., Guiraud, R., Laville, E., Bouaziz, S., Amrhar, M., Aït Ouali, R., 2002. The Mesozoic–Cenozoic Atlas belt (North Africa): An overview. *Geodinamica Acta*, 15, 185–208.
- Rasmussen, H.W., 1961. A monograph on the Cretaceous Crinoidea. Kongelige Danske Videnskaberne Selskab Biologiske Skrifter, 12, 1–428.

- Ritter, E., 1902. Le Djebel Amour et Monts des Ouleds Nail. Bulletin du Service géologique del'Algérie, 2^{ème} Série, 3, 1–100.
- Roux, M., 1981. Echinodermes: Crinoïdes Isocrinidae. In: Résultats des CampagnesMusorstom I, Philippines. Mémoires ORSTOM, 91, 477–543.
- Salamon, M.A., 2008a. The Callovian (Middle Jurassic) crinoids from the black clays of the Łuków area, eastern Poland. *Neues Jahrbuch für Geologie und Paläontologie*, *Abhandlungen*, 247, 133–146.
- Salamon, M.A., 2008b. Jurassic cyrtocrinids (Cyrtocrinida, Crinoidea) from extra-Carpathian Poland. *Palaeontog*raphica Abteilung A, 285, 77–99.
- Salamon, M.A., 2008c. The Callovian (Middle Jurassic) crinoids from northern Lithuania. *Paläontologische Zeitschrift*, 82, 269–278.
- Salamon, M.A., 2009. Early Cretaceous (Valanginian) sea lilies (Echinodermata, Crinoidea) from Poland. Swiss Journal of Geosciences, 102, 77–88.
- Salamon, M.A., Ferré, B., Szydło, A., Brachaniec, T., Bubík, M., 2019. New data on crinoid assemblages from the oldest sedimentary rocks of the Polish Outer Carpathians (Jurassic–Cretaceous). *Annales de Paléontologie*, 106, 102357.
- Schuchert, C., 1905. Catalogue of the type specimens of fossil invertebrates in the Department of Geology, United States National Museum. Bulletin of the United States National Museum, 53, 1–74.

- Scotese, C.R., 2014. Atlas of Jurassic Paleogeographic Maps. PALEOMAP Atlas for ArcGIS, Volume 3, The Jurassic and Triassic, Maps 32–42. Mollweide Projection, PALEOMAP Project, Evanston, IL.
- Sebane, A., Marok, A., Elmi, S., 2007. Évolution des peuplements de foraminifères pendant la crise toarcienne à l'exemple des données des Monts des Ksour (Atlas Saharien Occidental, Algérie). Comptes Rendus Palevol, 6, 189–196.
- Shimer, H.W., 1921. An Introduction to the Study of Fossils (Plants and Animals). The Macmillan Co., New York, pp. 1–450.
- Sieverts-Doreck, H., 1951. Articulata. In: Moore, R.C., Lalicker, C.G., Fischer, A.G. (Eds.), *Invertebrate fossils*. McGraw-Hill, New York, Toronto, London, pp. 48–159.
- Sokolov, D., Bodylevsky, W., 1931. Jura- und Kreidenfaunen von Spitzbergen. Skrifter om Svalbard og Ishavet, 35, 1–151.
- Spath, L.F., 1947. Additional observations on the Invertebrates (chiefly Ammonites) of the Jurassic and Cetaceous of East Greenland. *Meddelelser om Grønland*, 132, 1–70.
- Springer, F., 1909. A new American Jurassic crinoid. Proceedings of the United States National Museum, 36, 179–190.
- Stanton, T.W., 1899. Mesozoic fossils. The Units States Geological Survey, 32, 600–640.
- Whitfield, R.P., Hovey, E.O., 1906. Remarks on and description of Jurassic fossils of the Black Hills. *Bulletin of the American Museum of Natural History*, 22, 389–402.