

# **Towards a Philosophy of Education in the NSW Clinical Pastoral Education (CPE) Movement**

**James Bernard Flood**

**STL (St Patrick's College, Manly), BA (Hons),  
MEd (Hons), PhD (UNE), APD (Fordham NY)**

**A Portfolio of Papers submitted for the Degree**

**Doctor of Education of the University of New England**

**November 2011**



## **Acknowledgements**

I wish to thank my Supervisors, Adjunct Professor T.W. Maxwell and Associate Professor J. Hardy for their wise guidance throughout this project and their patient encouragement in seeing it through to completion. No student could have wished for supervisors more gracious or genial; I have benefited greatly from their tutelage and have gained a richer understanding of Liberal Education in theory and practice. Yet the limitations and faults of this Portfolio are mine and mine alone.

The University Librarian and staff of the Dixson Library played a special role during the period of my candidacy. Two staff in particular warrant special mention: first Ms S. Ransom the Faculty Librarian, and second Mrs C. McMaugh of the Inter-Library Loans. Their help was efficient, reliable, wise and practical. They ensured a ready access to materials in other Australian and Overseas Libraries making it feasible to follow a line of inquiry not otherwise possible. Accordingly, I express my warm appreciation to them.

I record also my appreciation to Associate Professor S. Tobias, Acting Head of School, for the grant for the formatting of the papers and preparing the Portfolio for submission, and to Mrs Lynne Chapman who did that task so competently.

I am indebted in a special way to the NSW College of CPE, to its Supervisors and Students; they introduced me to the rich professional practice of CPE. I appreciate that not all members of the NSW College of Clinical Pastoral Education will concur automatically with the case argued here, but hopefully it may contribute to the ongoing professional discourse within the College. And in that way I hope that this Portfolio may in some way repay the debt that is there.

Finally, on a more personal level, I wish to express my appreciation to my brother Professor Emeritus P.G. Flood, and his wife and family, (Tricia, Paula, Emma and Nick) for their unflagging support and the needed encouragement at those times when the project had become a burden.



## **Abstract**

This professional Portfolio, developed within Maxwell and Kupczyk-Romanczuk's (2009) model, proposes a philosophical concept of education that articulates a Liberal concept of professional education reflecting Clinical Pastoral Education (CPE) as practised by the NSW College of Clinical Pastoral Education Inc.

The seven closely related Papers are cognizant of the historical heritage of CPE. The need for a different underpinning concept of education for CPE is noted. Drawing upon R.S. Peter's writings in the context of school education, CPE is characterised as an initiation into Pastoral Care within three worthwhile traditions: of CPE tradition, of a Denominational Pastoral Care tradition, and of Liberal education. Utilising Aristotle's *Rhetoric*, it is argued that the strategy of the educational initiation is rhetorical; the tactic used is the student's Verbatim of the pastoral conversation brought to supervision, the signatory pedagogy of the profession; the student's Verbatim enjoys a family resemblance to case reasoning or casuistry on the one hand, and on the other, to case studies in Qualitative Research Methodology. It is shown that both casuistry and case studies methodology are profoundly rational and therefore congruent with the tradition of Liberal Education. CPE uses both a rhetoric of identity and a rhetoric of invitation and the consequences are articulated for the concept of Liberal Education espoused. Further, because CPE praxis has a tertiary context and a raft of Commonwealth awards are possible for CPE graduates, drawing upon the work of J. H. Newman, the heart of Liberal Tertiary Education is characterised as being able to reason clearly and accurately. The outcome sought in CPE programmes is the honed professional practice of the Student-Chaplain. It is contended that Aristotelean phronesiology, enhanced by Aquinas' and Newman's insights, articulates how "wisdom" is not "taught" but is honed through mentored reflective practice. Further insights are drawn from Vygotsky's "zone of proximal development" and from Winnicott, Klein and Bion to enrich the concept of professional education being proposed.

The Portfolio offers suggestions for the improvement of professional practice and areas of further research are noted. A hermeneutic of recovery is proposed suggesting the return of CPE programmes to a tertiary postgraduate context.



## Abbreviations

<b>ANZACPE</b>	Australia and New Zealand Association for Clinical Pastoral Education
<b>Apo.</b>	Newman, J. H. 1976. <i>Apologia Pro Vita Sua</i> , (Ed.) Svaglic, M. J. Oxford: Clarendon Press
<b>b</b>	Year of birth
<b>CPE</b>	College of Pastoral Education
<b>d</b>	Year of death
<b>EN</b>	<i>The Nicomachean Ethics of Aristotle</i> , Trans. and introduced by Sir Ross, The Word's Classics No. 546. Oxford: Oxford University Press. 1963.
<b>Idea</b>	Newman, J. H. 1976. <i>The Idea of a University</i> . Described and illustrated In I: nine discourses delivered by Catholics of Dublin; II. Occasional lectures and essays addressing the members of the Catholic University. Edited with introduction and notes by I. T. Ker. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
<b>IQ</b>	Intelligence Quotient
<b>L&amp;D</b>	<i>The Letters and Diaries of John Henry Newman</i> . (Ed.). C. S. Dessain et al., Vols. i–vi, Oxford: Clarendon Press. 1978–84. xi–xxii, London: Nelson. xxiii–xxxii, Oxford: Clarendon Press. 1973–77.
<b>NSWCCPE Inc.</b>	NSW College of Pastoral Education Incorporated
<b>NSW</b>	Australian state of New South Wales
<b>Phil. N. i. ii.</b>	Sillem, E. (Ed.). 1969–70. <i>The Philosophical Notebook of John Henry Newman</i> , 2 Vols. Louvain: Nauwelaerts Publishing House.
<b>Pol</b>	Aristotle. 1972. <i>The Politics</i> . Trans. & introduction by T. A. Sinclair. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books Ltd.
<b>Rhet</b>	Aristotle. 1994. <i>The “Art” of Rhetoric with an English Translation by J. H. Freese</i> . The Loeb Classical Library 193. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
<b>SCD</b>	Sydney College of Divinity
<b>ST</b>	Aquinas, St Thomas, <i>Summa Theologiae cum textu recensione Leonina</i> , 3 Vols. Turin: Marietti.
<b>TB</b>	Tuberculosis
<b>Trans.</b>	Translated by
<b>US</b>	Newman, J. H. 1970. <i>Newman's University Sermons. Fifteen Sermons preached before the University of Oxford 1826–43</i> with introductory essays by D. M. MacKinnon and J. D. Holmes. London: SPCK.
<b>VET</b>	Vocational Education and Training
<b>ZPD</b>	Zone of Proximal Development

## Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	iii
Abstract	v
Certification	vii
Abbreviations	viii
<b>PAPER 1: LINKING PAPER.....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>2. The argument of the Portfolio Papers</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>3. Methodology</b>	<b>6</b>
a) Philosophical perspective	6
b) Positioning of the author in the Portfolio	7
<b>PAPER 2: BACKGROUND ISSUES.....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>2. Insights from Medical Practice</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>a. Practices Doctors and Chaplains share in common</b>	<b>20</b>
i) Insights from Palliative Care—not “to cure” but “to heal”	21
ii) Two faces of Medicine—Hippocratic and Asklepian	22
iii) Explanations of the psychological dynamic involved in the Asklepian mode	23
iv) Theological explanation of the dynamic involved	25
<b>3. The Hospital Chaplain</b>	<b>26</b>
a) Chaplain’s role	26
b) Training and forming Hospital Chaplains as an educational strategy	26
c) Associate membership of the Sydney College of Divinity	30
<b>4. Educational Background of the CPE Movement</b>	<b>33</b>
a) Insights of key figures	33
b) Signature pedagogy in the profession	41
<b>5. Methodology: The issue of “Modernity”</b>	<b>42</b>



<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>50</b>
<b>PAPER 3: TOWARDS A PHILOSOPHY OF EDUCATION IN THE CLINICAL PASTORAL EDUCATION (CPE) MOVEMENT.....</b>	<b>52</b>
<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>55</b>
<b>Outline of this paper</b>	<b>55</b>
<b>2. Towards a Philosophy of Education for CPE</b>	<b>56</b>
<b>a) The concept of “education” and its insight for CPE</b>	<b>57</b>
i) Education as initiation	60
ii) Tradition	63
iii) Worthwhile	67
<b>b) The rhetorical process of initiation</b>	<b>69</b>
i) The rhetorical proofs of persuasion	73
ii) <i>Ethos</i> or character of the speaker as evidenced in the spoken word.	74
iii) Aristotle’s second means of persuasion— <i>pathos</i>	<b>77</b>
iv) Aristotle’s third means of persuasion— <i>logos</i>	<b>79</b>
α) the enthymeme	81
β) example—rhetorical induction	84
<b>c) Metaphor</b>	<b>88</b>
<b>3. Conclusion</b>	<b>89</b>
<b>PAPER 4: THE HEART OR ESSENCE OF EDUCATION IN A TERTIARY CONTEXT .....</b>	<b>90</b>
<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>92</b>
<b>2. Newman and the core element of university education</b>	<b>95</b>
<b>a) The concept of “Idea”</b>	<b>99</b>
<b>b) Three outcomes of liberal education</b>	<b>106</b>
i) The well-trained mind	<b>107</b>
ii) The enlargement or illumination of the mind	107

iii) “The Gentleman”	109
<b>c) The moral dimension of University Education</b>	<b>112</b>
i) Locke’s utilitarian position on Moral Education	112
ii) Is Newman’s view of University education elitist?	116
<b>d) Summary of Newman’s concept of Liberal University Education</b>	<b>118</b>
<b>3. Knowing “that”, and knowing “how”</b>	<b>122</b>
<b>4. Conclusion</b>	<b>123</b>

**PAPER 5: AN EPISTEMIC WARRANT FOR CASE STUDIES IN CLINICAL PASTORAL EDUCATION PROGRAMMES ..... 125**

<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>127</b>
<b>2. Insights from Casuistry</b>	<b>130</b>
a) Historical legacy—pejorative connotation	129
b) Rehabilitation and rational warrant of casuistry	132
<b>3. Insights from Case Studies in Qualitative Research Methodology</b>	<b>136</b>
a) Introduction	136
b) Case Studies in Medicine—historical insights	137
c) Inductive logic	140
d) Insights from Case Studies in Qualitative Research	143
e) Epistemological warrant for the use of the Case Study	145
<b>4. Insights from Action Research in Qualitative Research Methodology</b>	<b>152</b>
<b>5. Conclusion</b>	<b>154</b>

**PAPER 6: EDUCATING THE WISE PRACTITIONER..... 155**

<b>Introduction</b>	<b>161</b>
<b>1. The shaping of well-informed practitioners who can use their professional knowledge in the concrete, particular setting</b>	<b>162</b>
The Harvard experience	165
<b>2. Practical Wisdom—a conversation with three thinkers</b>	<b>166</b>

a) Practical Wisdom— <i>phronesis</i> —Aristotle	166
b) Practical Wisdom— <i>prudentia</i> —Aquinas	178
c) Practical Wisdom— <i>the illative sense</i> —Newman	182
<b>3. Macmurray on the “Self” and “Persons in relation”</b>	<b>194</b>
<b>4. Insights drawn</b>	<b>196</b>
<b>5. Further insights from Social Sciences</b>	<b>198</b>
a) The Zone of Proximal Development (Vygotsky)	198
b) Definitional Ceremonies and remembering conversations (Myerhoff)	200
i) Re-membering conversations	201
ii) Definitional ceremonies	202
<b>6. Conclusion</b>	<b>204</b>
<b>PAPER 7: SUMMARY AND IMPLICATIONS FOR PROFESSIONAL PRACTICE, FUTURE DIRECTIONS.....</b>	<b>201</b>
<b>1. Introduction</b>	<b>207</b>
<b>2. The Argument of this Portfolio</b>	<b>207</b>
<b>A postgraduate setting for professional training</b>	<b>208</b>
<b>3. The outcome of the CPE programme: the wise practitioner</b>	<b>211</b>
a) Not a competence issue	211
b) Clinical reasoning	216
c) The two faces of medicine	219
d) Chaplains as Stewards of the Profession	222
e) Followership	223
<b>4. Cultural influences that might undermine CPE programmes</b>	<b>224</b>
a) Secularisation	224
b) The <i>La Perruque</i> phenomenon of late Western Capitalism	225
c) Liquid modernity	225
d) The “Sixties”—the American cultural revolution	228
<b>5. Pastoral identity of the Chaplain</b>	<b>230</b>

<b>6. Liberal Education and ethical formation in a tertiary context</b>	<b>230</b>
a) Three views	231
b) How does the <i>akratic</i> person go wrong?	238
<b>7. Implications and further research.</b>	<b>245</b>
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY .....</b>	<b>248</b>