

UCUENCA

Universidad de Cuenca

Facultad de Filosofía, Letras y Ciencias de la Educación

Carrera de Pedagogía de los Idiomas Nacionales y Extranjeros

Subtitled Audio-visual Material for Teaching EFL Listening Comprehension and Vocabulary

Trabajo de titulación previo a la obtención del título de Licenciada en Pedagogía del Idioma Inglés

Autora:

Erika Jazmina Betancourt Fajardo

Directora:

Mónica Patricia Abad Celleri

ORCID: 0000-0001-8381-5982

Cuenca, Ecuador

2023-05-18

Resumen

El propósito de esta síntesis de investigación es el de explorar y analizar los efectos que tiene el material audiovisual subtulado en la comprensión auditiva y la enseñanza de vocabulario del inglés como lengua extranjera, así como también las percepciones que tienen los estudiantes acerca del uso de este material. Se seleccionaron 16 estudios empíricos publicados en los últimos 20 años y enfocados principalmente en la enseñanza y aprendizaje del inglés como lengua extranjera. Los resultados del análisis demostraron que el uso de material audiovisual con subtítulos afecta de manera positiva en la comprensión auditiva y enseñanza de vocabulario, aunque también se encontró algunos estudios con un efecto negativo y ningún efecto. Del mismo modo, las percepciones de los estudiantes en su mayoría fueron positivas, declarando que el material audiovisual subtulado les ayuda a mejorar su comprensión auditiva, aprender nuevas palabras y obtener una correcta pronunciación. Además, los estudiantes concluyeron que el material audiovisual es una herramienta interesante y motivadora.

Palabras clave: material audiovisual, comprensión auditiva, vocabulario, inglés como lengua extranjera, enseñanza

Abstract

The purpose of this research synthesis is to analyze the effects of subtitled audio-visual material on listening comprehension and vocabulary learning in English as a foreign language as well as the students' perceptions of the use of this material. Sixteen empirical studies published over a period of 20 years and focused mainly on the teaching and learning of English as a foreign language were analyzed. The results of the analysis showed that the use of audio-visual material with subtitles could have a positive effect on listening comprehension and vocabulary learning; however, negative effects and no effects were also found. Similarly, students' perceptions were mostly positive, stating that subtitled audio-visual material helps them to improve their listening comprehension, learn new words, and obtain correct pronunciation. In addition, the students concluded that the audio-visual material is an interesting and motivating tool.

Keywords: audio-visual material, listening comprehension, vocabulary, English as a foreign language, teaching

Índice de contenidos

Resumen.....	2
Abstract.....	3
Índice	4
Table of contents.....	6
Acknowledgments.....	7
Dedication.....	8
Introduction.....	9
CHAPTER 1.....	11
1. Description of the Research.....	11
1.1. Background.....	11
1.2. Statement of the Problem.....	12
1.3. Rationale.....	13
1.4. Research Questions.....	15
1.5. Objectives.....	15
1.5.1. General objective.....	15
1.5.2. Specific objectives.....	15
CHAPTER 2.....	16
2. Theoretical framework.....	16
2.1. Audio-visual material.....	16
2.2. Types of audio-visual materials.....	16
2.2.1. Videos.....	16
2.2.2. Movies.....	17
2.2.3. Computer and the Internet.....	17
2.3. Audio-visual material as a teaching and learning tool.....	18
CHAPTER 3.....	20

3. Literature Review.....	20
3.1. Subtitled Audio-visual Material and Learners' Listening Comprehension.....	20
3.2. Subtitled Audio-visual Material for Teaching Learners' Vocabulary.....	21
3.3. Advantages of Subtitled Audio-visual Material to Learn Vocabulary and Develop Listening Skills.....	22
3.3.1. Interesting and Motivating tool.....	22
3.3.2. Reduction of Verbalism.....	23
3.3.3. Real-life Situations and Culture.....	23
3.4. Disadvantages of Subtitled Audio-visual Material for Learning Vocabulary and Teaching Listening.....	23
3.4.1. Distraction for Students.....	24
3.4.2. Technical Problems.....	24
3.4.3. A Time-consuming Activity.....	24
3.5. Learners' Perceptions of Subtitled Audio-visual Material for Learning Vocabulary and Developing Listening Skills.....	25
CHAPTER 4.....	26
4. Methodology.....	26
CHAPTER 5.....	27
5. Data Analysis.....	27
5.1. Research design.....	27
5.2. Students' level of instruction.....	30
5.3. Students' Perceptions of Using Subtitled Audio-visual Material.....	32
5.4. Effects of Subtitled Audio-visual Material for Teaching EFL Listening Comprehension.....	34
5.5. Effects of Subtitled Audio-visual Material for Teaching EFL Vocabulary.....	36
CHAPTER 6.....	38
6. Conclusions and Recommendations.....	38
6.1. Conclusions.....	38
6.2. Recommendations.....	39
References.....	41

Índice de tablas

Table 1. <i>Research design</i>	27
Table 2. <i>Students' level of instruction</i>	30
Table 3. <i>Students' Perceptions of Subtitled Audio-visual Material</i>	32
Table 4. <i>Effects of Subtitled Audio-visual Material for Teaching EFL Listening Comprehension</i>	34
Table 5. <i>Effects of Subtitled Audio-visual Material for Teaching EFL Vocabulary</i>	36

Acknowledgments

I am very grateful for life since I can finally achieve one of my goals. I thank each person who has always been there for me giving emotional support such as my family, friends, and many other people. A special thanks to my tutor, Lcda. Monica Abad, Ph.D., for her patience, kindness, and guidance. She has been a role model for me because of her professionalism and vocation. I also learned many things from my teachers during these years, so I am thankful for their instruction. Many thanks to all the people who provided me with encouragement to move forward in this project.

Dedication

I dedicate my research synthesis to the pillars of my life: my mom and dad. I am thankful for the support of my parents without which the goal of finishing my major would not have been possible. They taught me not to give up, which kept me striving to reach my goal. With all my love, I dedicate them this work that I have completed with sweat and tears. I hope they feel very proud of me. In addition, to my friends from both high school and college, each one of them has taught me a great life lesson. To my family in Cuenca and my siblings as they made my life much easier and became my great emotional support to not give up.

Introduction

The didactic material used for language teaching has evolved over the years. Additional teaching tools were incorporated to aid books, such as vinyl records, slides, audio cassettes, and films. Also, authentic media documents such as newspaper articles, radio broadcasts, television programs, and songs were and have also been helpful as a tool in teaching English as a foreign language. Many attempts have been made for the effective use of audio-visual material in teaching-learning sessions. For instance, in 1929, sound motion films started to be used in classrooms for teaching purposes and audio-visual aids have proved to be useful in almost all fields of knowledge (Akram et al., 2012). The present research synthesis focuses on two kinds of audio-visual material with English subtitles: videos and movies.

Four language skills (listening, speaking, reading, and writing) should be taken into consideration when teaching and learning a foreign language. To improve their listening skills, which is a complex process, students must distinguish different accents and sounds, learn vocabulary and grammatical structure, and interpret stress and intonation (Silviyanti, 2014). In addition, mastering of vocabulary takes an important place when learning a language since it helps learners to convey messages, develop knowledge, and greatly enhance their language skills (Fauzi et al., 2021). This research synthesis focuses on the development of listening skills and vocabulary learning through the use of subtitled audio-visual material; therefore, the effects, advantages, and disadvantages of this type of material as well as students' perceptions when using it are discussed.

This research synthesis is divided into six chapters. In chapter number one, the research description, background information, problem statement, justification, objectives, and research questions are presented.

The second chapter shows the theoretical framework that includes important terms and definitions related to subtitled audio-visual material as a teaching and learning tool.

In the third chapter, the literature review is found. It provides a summary of research relevant to the topic of study, such as the advantages and disadvantages of audio-visual material with English subtitles.

The methodology used in this research synthesis is found in chapter number four, which includes the selection criteria, research design, and databases.

In chapter five, sixteen articles were analyzed and divided into five categories to answer the research questions.

Finally, chapter number six includes the overall conclusions and recommendations.

CHAPTER 1

1. Description of the Study

1.1 Background

Nowadays, people around the world can communicate, learn, investigate, create, entertain themselves, and do countless actions through technology. It has had great value in many different fields, and in terms of education, it can be said that education and technology go hand in hand. According to Ehteshami (2016), "technology has a vital role in teaching; innovative tools and techniques provide teachers with various teaching sources, including video materials, to be enforced in EFL classrooms" (p. 132). Audio-visual material (such as videos, TV programs, or movies in English) has been of great help when it comes to teaching and learning. According to Putra (2014), the best educational tool to improve students' learning and acquisition of new vocabulary is English subtitled movies (as cited in Caroline & Wei, 2018, p. 46). In addition, Yang et al. (2009) stated that audio-visual material used as a learning resource has become popular among researchers and has been successfully applied to various educational applications.

According to Hsieh (2019), subtitles can improve audio-visual material for English teaching because they make students envision what they hear. Furthermore, audio-visual features can improve understanding when the material is a little beyond the students' level of capability. The use of subtitles when seeing audio-visual material in the target language can also help students not to lose track of the message about any conversation in the film (Liando et al., 2018), and additionally, students will be more attentive to grasp the context. In the words of Xhemali (2013), "films draw students' attention and capture their interest" (as cited in Liando et al., 2018, p.5). Additionally, in Silviyanti's (2014) study, eighty percent of the students agreed that using the Youtube platform can help them improve their English, while the remaining twenty percent strongly agreed. Since there is a lot of audio-visual material available on YouTube, it can be used in the classroom to enhance students' English skills and motivate them.

Danan (1992) asserted that "listening to and reading the text at the same time can at least help students distinguish known from unknown words" (as cited in Hayati & Mohmedi, 2009, p.183). It is also significant to take into account that to improve students' listening skills, translation might not be needed. Hayati and Mohmedi (2009) pointed out that translation does not occur

when watching a movie with subtitles because they pass quickly. Therefore, students will no longer lose track since they will not switch from their mother tongue to English or vice versa.

There are different goals that learners of a target language can seek to achieve; for instance, to understand native speakers and communicate as naturally as possible. According to Liando et al. (2018), “having the ability to listen to fellow EFL speakers is a good skill, but being able to comprehend native English speakers with different kinds of unfamiliar dialects and accents, is another level of skill” (p. 12). Although improving listening skills is vital, it seems to be sometimes ignored since, in several studies, students have declared that their teachers did not give sufficient attention to developing their listening skills. For instance, according to Napikul et al. (2018), students who were interviewed felt that they needed more training to develop their listening skills since their teachers did not give them much importance. Similarly, Saensang’s (2003) study indicated students’ low level of English due to the lack of practice to develop their listening skills. Students should also practice improving their listening skills outside of class so that their performance is not left behind (as cited in Napikul et al., 2018, p. 46). According to Tafani (2009), “students should be encouraged to see as many movies as possible outside the classroom or parts of movies in the classroom. So, their frequencies of watching English movies also influence the effects on English listening and speaking skills development” (p. 2).

On the other hand, vocabulary plays a crucial role in the process of learning a new language. The more extensive learners’ vocabulary is, the better they will communicate. Nguyen (2021) declared that “vocabulary is one element that links the four skills of speaking, listening, reading, and writing all together. Without vocabulary, speakers cannot convey meaning and communicate with each other in a particular language” (p. 69). Similarly, Montero (2020) asserted that extensive vocabulary knowledge could help students to deal with written and spoken input. Moreover, as it was aforementioned, students’ intuition when observing the gestures and body language of the film accompanied by the subtitles can help them put aside translation (Richards & Gordon, 2004). In addition, Liando et al. (2018) considered that films support students to get familiarized with real-life conversation features in English: colloquialisms and vocabulary with a natural speed.

1.2 Statement of the Problem

Using audio-visual material that includes English subtitles to teach English as a foreign language could be an effective way to improve listening skills and acquire new vocabulary. For

instance, Caroline and Wei (2018) showed that students effectively acquire new vocabulary through subtitled English movies since eighty percent of the students concluded that watching movies had a beneficial effect on improving their English proficiency. According to Liando et al. (2018), “subtitles can help respondents to understand conversation in the movies, and English movies are believed to be more effective than other media as teaching tools” (p. 15). Audio-visual material with English subtitles can help students to better grasp the context or topic, grammar aspects, and vocabulary. Similarly, Sari (2017) pointed out that didactic video clips, besides being fun and entertaining, can enhance a lesson and make learning more enjoyable; she also argued that students enjoyed watching videos since they took them out of their comfort zone when learning the target language.

Although audio-visual material seems to be a great tool for teaching listening skills and vocabulary, it also has its limitations. Some studies concluded that when students watch a movie or video, they could be distracted; therefore, students could miss part of the message in the audio-visual material. Hsieh (2019) asserted that “although captions could provide textual aids for learners regarding what they heard or watched in a video, the extra information could also distract learners’ attention” (p. 15). Moreover, according to Mehdi et al. (2011), using subtitles may be a problem since students could feel the necessity of always having them. Therefore, the primary focus, which is improving listening comprehension, will be lost. Furthermore, Napikul et al. (2018) claimed that using audio-visual material could be a disadvantage for those students with less English knowledge since they would need more time to watch and listen to videos or movies to grasp vocabulary.

As a learner of English as a foreign language, I have experienced difficulty in improving my listening and learning vocabulary since some teachers did not consider these skills as crucial when teaching English. Also, during my practicum, I witnessed a lack of audio-visual material for teaching listening skills and vocabulary. In addition, I have seen that some teachers are not well prepared to take advantage of technology for enhancing learning. Therefore, it seems necessary to analyze the effects that subtitled audio-visual material has on developing listening comprehension and learning vocabulary so that English teachers can make informed decisions when using this type of material in their classrooms.

1.3 Rationale

One way to make comprehension easier is to use subtitles while watching videos (Alavi et al., 2010). However, lack of teacher preparation to use audio-visual material properly may affect students' learning, especially if pedagogical practices that do not aim to improve students' listening comprehension and vocabulary learning are used. Merdas (2015) asserted that one of the drawbacks of using audio-visual material appropriately to foster language learning is a poor use of this material by teachers, which can be due to lack of commitment to learning new teaching methods, insecurity in experimenting and innovating, and prejudices on the use of new technologies.

On the other hand, vocabulary mastery can help students with pronunciation and spelling, and in turn, they can learn more about structure, fluency, and vocabulary itself (Nur, 2011). According to Hsieh (2019), captions have significant effects on vocabulary gains, including shape recognition, meaning recognition, and meaning recall. Similarly, Winke et al. (2010) pointed out that subtitles are beneficial since they give better reinforcement of vocabulary acquisition across multiple modalities.

During my practicum, I witnessed how students were more active and participative whenever the teacher planned activities using audio or songs. Nowadays, as students are more involved with technology resources, they can perceive movies or videos with subtitles as a meaningful strategy to improve their listening comprehension and vocabulary learning acquisition. The results of Silvivanti's (2014) study revealed that students found the use of movie videos on YouTube entertaining as they were able to hear the pronunciation and the way the native speakers spoke, which motivated them to practice.

The effectiveness of English subtitled audio-visual material for teaching EFL listening comprehension and vocabulary seems to be supported by many studies such as Ashcroft et al. (2018), Caroline et al. (2018), and Liando et al. (2018); however, other studies such as Emini (2018), Hassiba (2017), Merdas (2015), Mossaab (2013) have shown the flip side in the use of audio-visual material. These studies recognized that the use of audio-visual material also includes some drawbacks since it can cause distraction for students and technical problems in class; in addition, some teachers may need training in ICT management and may take more time choosing appropriate material and activities. Therefore, it is necessary to analyze how audio-visual material has been used for teaching EFL listening comprehension and vocabulary and the perceptions that learners hold on its use in order to provide insights into the understanding of this material to assist EFL teachers and prepare them for potential mishaps during the use of audio-visual

material in class.

1.4 Research Questions

- What are the effects of using subtitled audio-visual material on EFL students' listening comprehension and vocabulary learning?
- What are the students' perceptions about subtitled audio-visual material?

1.5 Objectives

1.5.1 General Objective

- To analyze the effects of using subtitled audio-visual material on EFL students' listening comprehension and vocabulary learning.

1.5.2 Specific objectives

- To discuss the advantages and disadvantages of using subtitled audio-visual material for teaching EFL students' listening comprehension and vocabulary.
- To analyze students' perceptions about subtitled audio-visual material.

CHAPTER 2

2. Theoretical Framework

The following section, which has taken into account the review of several works, includes crucial information necessary for better understanding the area of teaching listening and vocabulary using audio-visual material.

2.1 Audio-visual Material

Audio-visual materials known as audio-visual media, communication technology, educational instructional media, and learning resources have been defined in many different ways from different perspectives. In the words of McKeon and Roberts, "audio-visual aids are supplementary devices by which the teacher through the utilization of more than one sensory channel keeps to clarify, establish and correlate concepts, interpretations and appreciations" (as cited in Malik & Pandith, 2011, p. 20). According to Clark (2002), "computers, television, tapes, videos or DVDs, projectors, and radio are types of audio-visual materials. Posters, cartoon strips, costumes, models, and field trips are also audio-visual materials" (as cited in Nur, 2011, p. 9). Moreover, Malik and Pandith (2011) defined audio-visual materials as those tools that present information and make learning and teaching more interesting, stimulating, reinforcing, and effective.

2.2 Types of audio-visual materials

In general, audio-visual materials can be organized into different categorizations, such as audio aids (cassette, radio, and language laboratory), projected aids (overhead projector, slides and transparencies, and film strips), non-projected aids (pictures and images, graphics, realia, Cuisenaire rods, and boards display), and audio-visual aids (computer / the internet, videos, television, and movies). Since this research synthesis focuses on using videos, movies, or clips to improve students' listening comprehension and vocabulary learning, the categorization of audio-visual aids will be considered.

2.2.1 Videos

Videos have become a common media frequently used by EFL teachers because they can make any message clear and provide motivation. Harmer (2007) stated that with the help of videos, "teachers can show films, TV programs, coursebook excerpts, and home-produced

efforts” (as cited in Merdas, 2015, p. 20). Moreover, Stempleski (2002) asserted that videos on the Internet can engage students to pay attention not only to the pictures but also to the non-verbal gestures and intonation, which makes the video full of productivity.

Using videos can support students to practice the language in a real context or situations in which they have to communicate their ideas. According to Çakir (2006), “language teachers like video because it motivates learners, brings the real world into the classroom, contextualizes language naturally, and enables learners to experience authentic language in a controlled environment” (p. 68). In addition, Nur (2011) declared that since videos are easier to remember than words alone, they are more efficient and practical and that videos expose real-life situations even though they happened long time ago. Moreover, Nur (2011) pointed out some benefits of videos as audio-visual material. They can encourage students to pay attention and participate. Also, they can contribute to the context in which the language is being used and can cue responses to questions or substitutions through control practice. Finally, using videos in class can stimulate and provide information to be referred to in conversation, discussion, and storytelling.

2.2.2 Movies

Movies are an effective instructional medium that awakens students' auditory and visual senses. In the words of Good and Kappa (1973), “audio-visual aids are anything by means of which the learning process may be encouraged or carried on through the sense of hearing or sense of sight” (as cited in Denden & Mezerreg, 2016, p. 10). Movies are appropriate and practical tools for enhancing students' engagement; however, they should not be misconstrued as free class time. Movies as audio-visual material should have an academic purpose; therefore, teachers should be careful in choosing the appropriate material that adequately matches the topic, language focus, objectives, and the students' interests. According to Singh (2007), “the selected film should be suitable to the psychological development and social background of the learners, for whom it is being used” (as cited in Merdas, 2015, p. 22).

2.2.3 Computers and the Internet

Computers along with the use of the Internet have been witnessed over the years as a great educational tool for both teachers and students. According to Merdas (2015), some of the main uses of computers for English language teaching are related to computers' systems and enough memory to provide different kinds of activities and material to students. Also, the Internet could be an outstanding tool for learning and being in contact with native speakers.

The Internet has advanced, improved, and helped people's daily life in any field, be it work, education, business, etcetera. In education, the Internet has helped both students and teachers to streamline the process of searching for material (definitions, videos, worksheets, movies, etcetera.), which decades ago was only done by using books. Furthermore, according to Motteran (2013), "the internet can be a rich source of authentic oral models via recorded songs, talking electronic books, podcasts and video clips that help learners with pronunciation as well as acquisition and reinforcement of new vocabulary" (as cited in Merdas, 2015, p. 19).

2.3 Audio-visual material as a teaching and learning tool

The profession of teaching is not easy; it needs blood, sweat, and tears to make it successful (Malik & Pandith, 2011). Mossaab (2013) asserted that audio-visual material may reinforce main ideas, reach the audience effectively, and make students keep using this material outside the classroom. According to Saripalli et al. (2018), audio-visual material from the 1920s until today has been considered a useful tool for teachers in almost every trend of second language teaching. Moreover, audio-visual material also functions as a support for teachers to bring the real world into the classroom, making learning more meaningful. Jemima (2013) provides some important principles for the use of audio-visual material in teaching:

1. Audio-visual materials should be in line with the intellectual level of the students and with previous experience.
2. The teaching aid used should be exact, accurate, and real as far as possible.
3. The teacher will make the most appropriate use of the audio-visual material for the teaching process so that it fits perfectly in the lesson planning.

Teaching listening is considered one of the most difficult tasks for English teachers. According to Vandergrift and Tafaghodtari (2010), listening skills "involve many simultaneous processes on diverse levels and engage a mixture of linguistic and non-linguistic knowledge" (as cited in Denden & Mezerreg, 2016, p. 30). Moreover, as Napikul et al. (2018) mentioned in their study, many teachers and students do not realize the importance of listening. However, with the development of technology, teaching listening comprehension has become easier. According to Abdullah (2014), teachers can download multiple audio-visual materials from the Internet: audio, videos, movies, and so on, in minutes. Furthermore, by using different audio-visual material and

technology in language teaching, teachers can make learners get used to the native speakers' accents.

“Lexical knowledge is central to communicative competence and to the acquisition of a second language” (Schmitt, 2000, as cited in Hassiba, 2017, p. 32). Visual aids can be good resources for teaching vocabulary. Moreover, it is helpful for students to have realia (images, videos, and movies) with the words (subtitles) so they can have a better understanding of the objects and their meanings. Audio-visual material for teaching new vocabulary with videos and movies can become more effective because it emphasizes what is being taught and presented in class. Allen et al. (2011) stated that audio-visual materials "enable students to use more than one sense at the same time. One picture can elicit unlimited words" (as cited in Abdullah, 2014, p. 19).

CHAPTER 3

3. Literature Review

Listening and vocabulary are fundamental when learning a language; therefore, using techniques, strategies, and educational tools such as audio-visual material enhances the ability to comprehend and become a better communicator. However, based on several studies, it has been shown that both listening comprehension and vocabulary are difficult for educators to teach and challenging for students to learn. This literature review analyzes research conducted on the effects of subtitled audio-visual material on learners' listening comprehension and vocabulary learning.

3.1 Subtitled Audio-visual Material and Learners' Listening Comprehension

The efficacy of English subtitled audio-visual material for teaching EFL listening comprehension has been supported by the study of Hayati and Mohmedi (2009). However, authors such as Hsieh (2019), Napikul et al. (2018), and Mehdi et al. (2011) demonstrated that there is no evident difference in listening comprehension improvement when using this type of material. Hayati and Mohmedi (2009) carried out a study to examine the efficacy of subtitled movies on the listening comprehension of intermediate EFL students. An English language proficiency test and a comprehension test were used. The participants were divided into three groups: English subtitles group (ESG), Persian subtitles group (PSG), and no subtitles group (NSG). The listening comprehension test results showed that those students who made up the ESG had better outcomes compared to the students in the other two groups. In addition, English subtitles not only helped them to understand the film but also allowed them to complete the test satisfactorily. Moreover, it was indicated that compared to films without subtitles, those with Persian subtitles facilitated the recognition of English words by providing the meaning in the learners' native language, which led to a better comprehension of the movies. Thus, the students of the ESG group stated that they were able to understand the spoken language better and needed subtitles less. English subtitles were essential for listening comprehension when the students did not remember the meaning of some words. The students claimed they only needed a glimpse; therefore, the translation process was not used.

Although some studies show improvement in listening comprehension, other studies show that using subtitled audio-visual material does not have any major favorable change in students' listening performance, and in some cases, it was perceived as even detrimental. For instance,

Napikul et al. (2018), who worked with sixty-three tenth-grade EFL learners, aimed to find out what kind of subtitles in the audio-visual material (movie) can be most effective in developing listening comprehension and vocabulary. The sixty-three participants were assigned to the following groups: English Subtitles Group (ESG), Thai Subtitles Group (TSG), and No Subtitles Group (NSG). The results showed that Thai subtitles seem to be an effective tool to help students learn English through audio-visual material. After the students had finished taking a listening comprehension test, four from each group were randomly selected to be interviewed. The interview results were useful to notice students' perceptions of the movie with English subtitles. One student who understood the content in the film declared that English subtitles were helpful since they lessened confusion and reduced the need for translation while the student was listening to English dialogues. Furthermore, when students did not know the meaning of some words, English subtitles and the context given in the film helped them somehow to guess those meanings.

In the same vein, in Hsieh's (2019) study, even though the results showed that English subtitles can provide textual aids about what was heard in a video, the additional information can also distract learners when they process the new information. Likewise, it could become even more difficult for the learner when the material is above their proficiency level. For instance, Mehdi et al. (2011), whose study attempted to capture the possible effects of movies with subtitles on the improvement of listening comprehension, found out that students who worked with no English subtitles showed better IELTS (International English Language Testing System) test results. Consequently, in some cases, English subtitles are not always an essential tool to improve listening comprehension skills.

3.2 Subtitled Audio-visual Material for Teaching Learners' Vocabulary

Authors, such as Merdas (2015), whose study attempted to investigate the effectiveness of subtitled audio-visual material in teaching EFL learner's active vocabulary, demonstrated that teaching vocabulary using this type of material can be beneficial for students since teaching and learning could be easier to cope with. For instance, the use of subtitled audio-visual material can help students to understand and remember words. The study was carried out with fifty university students who were randomly chosen and five teachers. The students were asked if they felt the class became more interesting when the teacher used subtitled audio-visual material. Most of the participants (94%) agreed that the class became more interesting and attractive if the teacher used audio-visual material with subtitles, whereas only one student (6%) disagreed. The findings also indicated that subtitles from the audio-visual material had a favorable effect on teaching EFL

learners' vocabulary since it helped them to concentrate better and learn new active vocabulary. Audio-visual material with English subtitles also eases the teaching and learning process since it makes the classes more realistic, enjoyable, and attractive.

On the other hand, Alavi et al. (2010), whose study focused on the effectiveness of English subtitles on Iranian EFL learners' vocabulary learning, asserted that English subtitles did not exert a major positive effect on vocabulary learning. The participants were given a test to evaluate their level of proficiency. The results showed no significant difference between the proficiency level of the control and treatment groups. The difference was that the treatment groups had the support of English subtitles which allowed learners to acquire new words. Similarly, Ashcroft et al. (2018), who measured the effect of watching a single captioned full-length movie in English on the ability of Japanese students to learn new words, revealed a significant mean gain of 1.77 words per student (4.2%). Therefore, the results showed that watching full-length subtitled movies can result in slight levels of incidental vocabulary learning.

3.3 Advantages of Subtitled Audio-visual Material to Learn Vocabulary and Develop Listening Skills

After reviewing some research articles about the use of subtitled audio-visual material, three major advantages have emerged: a) interesting and motivating tool, b) reduction of verbalism, c) and real-life situations and cultural knowledge.

3.3.1 Interesting and Motivating tool

Subtitled audio-visual materials are engaging and interesting because they capture students' attention in class. Suitable subtitled audio-visual material should be employed so students' desire to get involved in class may emerge spontaneously. According to Merdas (2015), teaching English active vocabulary with subtitled audio-visual material would be suitable for EFL students since it will bring entertainment to the students, making language learning not only learnable but also pleasurable. Similarly, Kim (2015) sought to investigate the effect of the use of video resources with English subtitles on listening comprehension. Eighty-six participants were taught 10 sessions over three weeks. At the end of the sessions, the participants expressed that using subtitled videos was practical and engaging and that the videos increased their motivation to listen to English. According to Selvi (2007), "the sensory appeal of audio-visual aids motivates and stimulates students to learn easily in a relaxed atmosphere" (as cited in Denden & Mezerreg, 2016, p. 23).

3.3.2 Reduction of Verbalism

The constant use of verbalism in classes can become tedious for students; an alternative to this could be the use of subtitled audio-visual material since it can help to provide clear concepts and develop accuracy. For instance, “films are a more sensory experience than reading - besides verbal language, there is also color, movement, and sound” (Mirvan, 2013, p. 65). Learning has to be simple and clear so that it does not become monotonous for students. Anas and Zakaria (2019) confirmed students’ agreement that using videos made studying English more comfortable. The authors discovered that students were more attentive in the classroom as they engaged well with the media presented. In addition, Anas and Zakaria (2019) concluded that audio-visual material with English subtitles could assist students in not feeling unmotivated or bored. Consequently, incorporating subtitled audio-visual material into the classroom can be an alternative to the traditional teaching method, which sometimes overabundances in words and focuses on teaching the content through books, blackboards, dictionaries, and so on.

3.3.4 Real-life Situations and Culture

Subtitled audio-visual material provides students with direct experiences of real-life situations that can make learning meaningful to students. According to Sherman (2003), “videos introduce learners to a wide array of real-life language experiences that enriches their learning environment and contextualizes their learning process” (as cited in Kim, 2015, p. 16). Moreover, Liando et al. (2018) expressed that movies provide a visual context of stories that students can understand by watching situations and having the opportunity to experience semi-real communication in face-to-face interactions. Additionally, the results of Sulaiman et al. (2017) revealed that most of the participants perceived videos as a great tool for their listening assessment as they provided authentic, meaningful, and real-life situation contexts.

Videos and movies can help students better grasp the world and view things from other people’s perspectives. Furthermore, videos and movies can assist to make classroom learning more memorable. “The teacher is also recommended to encourage the students learning with audio-visual aids to help them get a closer look at the culture of the target language so they can be always interested and motivated in learning” (Denden & Mezerreg, 2016, p. 18).

3.4 Disadvantages of Subtitled Audio-visual Material for Learning Vocabulary and Teaching Listening

In general, subtitled audio-visual material as a learning-teaching tool can also have some weaknesses that must be taken into account to make adequate use of this material. The following are some of the disadvantages of using audio-visual materials with English subtitles: distraction for students, technical problems, and time-consuming activity for teachers.

3.4.1 Distraction for Students

Audio-visual material with English subtitles can be sometimes distracting for learners since they need to focus on both the text and the images at the same time. “Too much information can also be distracting because the students will be trying to read and/or take notes while the speaker has moved on to the next subject” (Denden & Mezerreg, 2016, p. 26). In addition, Liando et al. (2018) claimed that when watching movies with English subtitles, students’ attention might be diverted by the target language texts. They also observed that the participants in their study ended up paying less attention to the images and sounds, which caused them to lose track of the content of the film.

3.4.2 Technical Problems

During the presentation of the audio-visual material, technical problems may arise. For instance, the computer battery may run out or the projector may stop working. Abdullah (2014) interviewed some teachers about the difficulties they encountered when using audio-visual material. In fact, educators agreed that technical problems are a major drawback when using audio-visual material. Most of the material they carried on was in their pen drives. Unfortunately, in some cases, teachers realized that all their files had been damaged by computer viruses. Furthermore, the speakers and the video players did not work in the classroom.

Additionally, poor viewing conditions can be considered a technical problem. Sari (2017) declared that teachers must be prepared and convinced that students feel comfortable using subtitled audio-visual material. Hence, the projected images and subtitles must be big enough for the students at the back of the class.

3.4.3 A Time-consuming Activity

If the subtitled audio-visual material is not wisely selected, it can turn the classroom into a tiresome environment, or the learning objectives may not be successfully achieved. Thus, another disadvantage of audio-visual material is that it takes a lot of time to search for the most suitable material. According to Abdullah (2014), choosing the appropriate materials can be very

challenging because teachers depend on ready-made resources from different websites, which sometimes may not match the level of the learners. Additionally, according to the author, subtitled audio-visual material must be relevant to the content checked in class; otherwise, learners may be misled and confused. Accordingly, teachers should be cautious when selecting audio-visual content for their students.

3.5 Learners' Perceptions of Subtitled Audio-visual Material for Learning Vocabulary and Developing Listening Skills

It is necessary to consider students' points of view since their ideas about this material could provide a broader perspective on the use of subtitled audio-visual material. Nalliveettil and Ali (2013) studied the usefulness of subtitled audio-visual aids to provide insights into EFL students' approach to using technological aids. A questionnaire was designed and used to obtain information on subtitled audio-visual material in the EFL classroom. When students were asked if they found the need for English teachers to use audio-visual material at the school, eleven students (73.3 %) agreed, and the remaining four students (26.6 %) did not find the need for the English teachers to use audio-visual aids in the classroom.

In addition, Hassiba (2017) carried out a study in which fifty learners participated and filled out a questionnaire. The study aimed to investigate students' perceptions concerning subtitled audio-visual to develop the learners' vocabulary. Students were asked to what extent audio-visual material with English subtitles helped them enhance their vocabulary. Most of them concluded that subtitled audio-visual material in the teaching and learning process created a more enjoyable class, motivating them to acquire new words in each lesson. Fortunately, when students were questioned about the common issues they faced when using subtitled audio-visual material, forty-six learners (92%) declared that there was no problem using audio-visual material. In contrast, a few learners (8%) asserted that noise and time consumption could be considered a problem in the classroom.

CHAPTER 4

4. Methodology

This research synthesis aimed to collect information about the effects of using subtitled audio-visual material in English on EFL students' listening comprehension and vocabulary learning. A research synthesis is defined as "a review of primary research on a given topic with the purpose of integrating the findings (Koricheva & Gurevich, 2013, p. 3). Moreover, according to Atkinson et al. (2014), "research synthesists should provide detailed descriptions of the strategies used to define problems, gather the literature, make judgments about the relevance of reports, extract information from reports, integrate results, and draw inferences" (p. 87). Accordingly, the studies synthesized were taken from online articles published in databases such as Education Resources Information Center (ERIC), Academia.edu, ELSEVIER, ResearchGate, Semantic Scholar, and Google Scholar because these databases provide reliable, peer-reviewed sources. The following keywords were used to find scholarly articles: audio-visual material, subtitled movies, subtitled videos, EFL, listening comprehension, vocabulary acquisition, and teaching.

In addition, the following criteria were taken into consideration to find appropriate sources for this research. First, there was not any restriction related to the design of the studies. The studies needed to be empirical and have a qualitative, quantitative, and mixed-method research design regarding the use of subtitled audio-visual material. Second, since the present research synthesis focused on audio-visual material as a pedagogical tool, articles concentrated on EFL teaching and learning environment audio-visual were required. Finally, academic articles published since 2003 were assessed. Although updated information about audio-visual material was relevant for this research, articles published more than ten years ago were also helpful because they showed relevant data about the usage and effectiveness of subtitled audio-visual material over time.

Relevant articles for this research synthesis were found in journals such as *Journal of College Teaching & Learning*, *Australian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, *Research Synthesis Methods*, *Acuity: Journal of English Language Pedagogy, Literature, and Culture*, *Creative Education*, *Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*, *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and Translation*, *International Journal Of Applied Linguistics & English Literature*, *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences Journal of Educational Sciences*, *English Education*

and Applied Linguistics (EEAL) Journal, International Journal of Contents, International Journal of Creative Research and Studies, Advances in Social Sciences Research Journal, Journal Dedicasi Pendidikan, Journal of Elementary Education, International Journal of Asian Social Science, Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research, Academic Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies, Studies in English Language and Education, The Journal of Language Teaching and Learning. At the end, 16 articles were selected for the analysis.

CHAPTER 5

5. Data Analysis

To answer the research questions and achieve the goals of this research synthesis (see section 1.4), 16 research articles were analyzed. They were organized according to the following categories: research design, students' level of instruction, students' perceptions, and the effects of subtitled audio-visual material on teaching listening comprehension and vocabulary.

5.1 Research design

The 16 studies were classified according to the research design; including the data, collection instruments (see Table 1).

Table 1

Research design

Design	Instruments	Research study	n	%
Quantitative	Pre-test, post-test, delayed posttest, questionnaire	Saed et al. (2016); Kim, Hea-Suk (2015); Undara (2021); Liando et al. (2018); Nastitie & Sulistyani (2020); Gorjian (2014); Fikri et al. (2020); Hayati & Mohmedi (2009); Ismaili (2013); Mehdi et al. (2011); Başaran & Köse (2013)	11	68,75
Qualitative	Observations, semi-structured interviews	Fauzi et al. (2021); Silviyanti (2014)	2	12,5

Mixed Methods	Pre-test, Listening tests, questionnaires, semi-structured interviews	post-test, comprehension interviews, semi-	Safranji (2015); Mulyani (2021); Napikul et al. (2018)	3	18,75
Total				16	100

According to Table 1, the majority of the 16 studies followed a quantitative design (68,75 %). The remaining studies followed a mixed-method design (18,75 %), and only two studies, a qualitative design (12,5 %).

Researchers like Başaran and Köse (2013), Fikri et al. (2020), Gorjian (2014), Hayati and Mohmedi (2009), Ismaili (2013), Kim (2015), Liando et al. (2018), Mehdi et al. (2011), Nastitie and Sulistyani (2020), Saed et al. (2016), and Undara (2021) used a quantitative design since most of the studies aimed to analyze the possible effects of subtitled audio-visual material. For instance, Saed et al. (2016) examined what kind of treatment (movies with and without subtitles) was the best for developing listening comprehension ability in intermediate EFL students. A quasi-experimental design was used and with the help of an English Language Proficiency Test and a Comprehension test, it was possible to notice that ESG (English Subtitles Group) had a much higher level of comprehension. Similarly, the participants in the study of Gorjian (2014) were assigned to three equal experimental groups after taking a proficiency test. The findings expose that those participants in the English subtitled group had higher English vocabulary scores than those in standard subtitled (English audio and subtitles) and bimodal (English audio and Persian subtitles) groups.

Some studies focused not only on the effects of using audio-visual material with English subtitles but also on the perceptions of students. Therefore, three of the studies used a mixed-method design. For instance, Mulyani (2021) conducted a quasi-experimental study online using one experimental group. The author also used interviews and observations. The results indicated that using movies and videos with English subtitles improve English vocabulary learning and offer

a teaching alternative and new experiences for English learners. In the same vein, Safranji (2015) employed a questionnaire to assess students' knowledge based on the audio-visual material used. Interviews were also used to elicit students' positive and negative opinions of the technique. Most of the participants stated that subtitled audio-visual material enhanced their listening skills. Moreover, the participants added that they gained more vocabulary and understood foreign cultures more.

Only two studies used a qualitative design to find out what learners thought about using audio-visual material. In the case study carried out by Fauzi et al. (2021), the data was collected using a semi-structured interview. Participants stated that movies as a learning tool are highly significant since they may make learning more appealing and can also stimulate students to study harder. Likewise, Silviyanti (2014) included closed and open questions to investigate the students' interest in listening to English movie videos on YouTube. The findings showed that the most important reason for students to use videos was the perception that the videos were beneficial for their English learning. The participants also stated that the material was relevant to what they were studying in class.

5.2 Students' level of instruction

The sixteen studies were also classified based on the participants' level of education (see Table 2).

Table 2

Students' level of instruction

Instruction level	Research study	N	%
Primary school	Undara (2021); Mulyani (2021); Nastitie & Sulistyani (2020)	3	18,75
High school	Napikul et al. (2018); Fikri et al. (2020); Başaran & Köse (2013)	3	18,75

University	Saed et al. (2016); Safranjan (2015); Kim, Hea-Suk (2015); Liando et al. (2018); Gorjian (2014); Ismaili (2013); Silviyanti (2014); Fauzi et al. (2021)	8	50
Institute	Ebrahimi & Bazaee (2016); Mehdi et al. (2011)	2	12,5
Total		16	100

Table 2 shows that 50% of the studies were conducted with university students as participants. The studies were also conducted in primary (18,75 %) and high schools (18,75 %), while only two studies (12,5 %) included participants from English Institutes.

The effects of using subtitled audio-visual with university students have been investigated by authors like Fauzi et al. (2021), Gorjian (2014), Ismaili (2013), Kim (2015), Liando et al. (2018), Saed et al. (2016), Safranjan (2015), and Silviyanti (2014). One of the reasons why some of the authors chose university participants was their familiarity with technology. For example, Silviyanti (2014) affirmed that nowadays, almost all students have smartphones which allow them to access the Internet everywhere and anytime. According to one question from the questionnaire, which asked if students found using YouTube videos beneficial to their English, 87 % of the participants agreed. The participants realized that videos or movies could provide them with different intonations and accents. In the same way, Fauzi et al. (2021) also asserted that they selected university participants because they looked for participants who have sufficient experience regarding movies as a learning tool for individual and classroom tasks. The participants concluded that using subtitled audio-visual material was helpful for learning new vocabulary with the correct spelling of each word.

Table 2 also shows that 18,75 % of the studies were carried out in both primary and high school levels of instruction. Mulyani (2021), Nastitie and Sulistyani (2020), and Undara (2021) studied the effects of audio-visual material with subtitles for teaching listening comprehension and vocabulary on primary school students, while Başaran and Köse (2013), Fikri et al. (2020), and

Napikul et al. (2018) on high school students. For instance, the score results from the study of Undara (2021) showed that primary school students from both the experimental group and controlled group had a significant development of vocabulary in terms of meaning. Furthermore, according to Napikul et al. (2018), when high school students were asked which type of subtitles they would pick if they had the opportunity to watch a movie, the majority replied with English subtitles.

The remaining two studies (12,5 %) chose students from English Institutes. On the one hand, Ebrahimi and Bazaee (2016) concluded that watching English movies with subtitles not only enhances students' motivation to learn vocabulary but also helps them to grasp English with various accents. On the other hand, Mehdi et al. (2011) conducted a study to look into the possible effects of movie subtitling on listening comprehension. However, when it came to improving overall listening comprehension, it was shown that none of the subtitling processes (bimodal and standard) resulted in a better performance.

5.3 Students' Perceptions of Using Subtitled Audio-visual Material

Five of the sixteen studies were classified based on the students' perceptions of subtitled audio-visual material for teaching listening comprehension and vocabulary (See Table 3).

Table 3

Students' Perceptions of Subtitled Audio-visual Material for Teaching Listening Comprehension and Vocabulary

Research study	Improve Listening Comprehension	Vocabulary Learning	Provide Correct Pronunciation	Interesting and Motivating tool
Fauzi et al. (2021)	X	X	X	X
Kim (2015)	X	X		X
Napikul et al. (2018)	X	X	X	

Liando et al. (2018)	X		X	
Silviyanti (2014)	X	X	X	X

¹Note. N=5

Only 5 studies showed results on the participants' perceptions of audio-visual material with English subtitles such as Fauzi et al. (2021), Kim (2015), Liando et al. (2018), Napikul et al. (2018), and Silviyanti (2014). Table 3 shows that only positive opinions were found in the 5 studies. The following observations about the use of subtitled audio-visual material were emphasized: listening comprehension improvement, vocabulary learning, correct pronunciation, and an interesting and motivating tool.

According to Table 3, all the studies showed positive perceptions of how audio-visual material can help students enhance their listening comprehension. For instance, Kim (2015) investigated learners' attitudes and ideas toward using videos with English subtitles and found out that students believed that videos are more useful and effective than traditional lecture-based instruction for developing English listening. Similarly, the findings of Liando et al. (2018) showed that when participants were asked if they believed videos in English could help them improve their listening skills, the majority of the students (50.7%) agreed.

Most of the studies agreed that audio-visual material could also help students learn new words. According to Kim (2015), students found that it was easier to learn vocabulary and idiomatic expressions through video materials with English subtitles. Furthermore, the interviews accomplished by Napikul et al. (2018) showed that listening to and reading English at the same time could help students learn new words and improve English listening and reading skills.

Students also stated that watching movies and videos with English subtitles could provide them with a better idea of native speakers' pronunciation. The participants in the study of Fauzi et al. (2021) declared that it was motivating, especially when they watched movies because they listened to real native speakers. Therefore, they felt more encouraged to speak fluently with the correct pronunciation. Moreover, according to the results of Liando et al. (2018), twenty-nine

¹ Only studies with a research focus on the perceptions of students about subtitled audio-visual material were considered.

participants (43.3%) agreed that they learn the correct pronunciation through movies. Also, the same amount and percentage of participants declared that they could understand unfamiliar accents and dialects better.

Table 3 also shows that in three of the studies, participants agreed on the idea that audio-visual material is a motivating and interesting tool. For instance, the majority of the students in the study by Kim (2015) testified that they found using videos fun, interesting, and useful in developing their English listening. In the same vein, in the study by Fauzi et al. (2021), the participants stated that due to the use of audio-visual material, the learning process was more interesting; consequently, retaining new information was effortless.

5.4 Effects of Subtitled Audio-visual material

Finally, the 16 studies were classified according to the effects that each type of audio-visual material has for teaching EFL listening comprehension and vocabulary (see Table 4 and Table 5).

Table 4

Effects of Subtitled Audio-visual Material for Teaching EFL Listening Comprehension

Severity	Research study	n	%
Positive effects	Saed et al. (2016); Kim (2015); Liando et al. (2018); Safranji (2015); Silviyanti (2014); Nastitie & Sulistyani (2020); Başaran & Köse (2013)	7	77,8
Minor effects	Napikul et al. (2018)	1	11,1
Negative effects	Mehdi et al. (2011)	1	11,1
Total		9	100

²Note. N=9

Table 4 shows that most of the studies that investigated the effects of subtitled movies for teaching EFL listening comprehension reported positive effects (77,8 %), while 11,1 % found minor effects, and the remaining 11,1 %, negative effects.

Researchers like Başaran and Köse (2013), Kim (2015), Liando et al. (2018), Napikul et al. (2018), Nastitie and Sulistyani (2020), Saed et al. (2016), Safranjanj (2015), and Silviyanti (2014) found positive effects in their studies. Kim (2015) revealed that one major outcome of this investigation was the motivation to listen to the English language that participants experienced when watching subtitled movies. Similarly, Safranjanj (2015) demonstrated that most of the participants in the study appreciated the use of audio-visual material as a teaching tool. The participants realized that listening to different dialects, different voices, and pronunciations was worthy. Likewise, the results of Saed et al. (2016) demonstrate that the group with English subtitles (ESG) had a much higher score in the post-test compared to the group without any subtitles (WSG). The participants of the study declared that watching videos with subtitles facilitated remembering words and understanding the videos better.

Some studies have shown that using audio-visual material with English subtitles not always have major positive effects on improving EFL listening comprehension. For instance, according to the results presented in Napikul et al. (2018), the English subtitles helped only some participants learn new words and improve their listening and reading skills. However, most of the students preferred the subtitles in their mother tongue (Thai) as students did not have a high level of English.

Table 4 shows how the results of only one study reported a negative effect on the use of subtitled audio-visual material. For instance, Mehdi et al. (2011), whose study investigated the possible effects of movies with subtitles on enhancing listening comprehension, concluded that participants from the No-captioned group on the IELTS test had better scores. The authors declared that the distracting effect caused by subtitles might clarify the poor performance of the groups that used subtitles on the IELTS test.

² Only studies with a research focus on the effect of subtitled audio-visual for teaching EFL listening comprehension were considered.

Table 5*Effects of Subtitled Audio-visual Material for Teaching EFL Vocabulary*

Positive effects			
Research study	New words learning	Correct spelling	Better understanding
Fauzi et al. (2021)	X		
Undara (2021)		X	
Mulyani (2021)	X		X
Ismaili (2013)			X
Fikri et al. (2020)	X	X	X
Gorjian (2014)	X	X	
No effect on vocabulary learning			
Ebrahimi & Bazaee (2016)		X	

³ Note. N=7

Table 5 shows that the majority of the studies that included results about the effects of using audio-visual material with English subtitles for teaching EFL vocabulary were positive, while only one study exposed negative effects. Most of the authors reported the following positive effects: new word learning, correct spelling, and a better understanding of words.

Fauzi et al. (2021), Fikri et al. (2020), Gorjian (2014), and Mulyani (2021) determined that one positive effect of using subtitled audio-visual material to teach EFL vocabulary was how learners effortlessly learn new words. For example, Gorjian (2014) concluded that students paid

³ Only studies with a research focus on the effect of subtitled audio-visual for teaching EFL vocabulary were considered.

more attention to the English subtitles, which led students to be more concentrated on the spelling of the words shown on the screen, which in turn caused more retention of the new word forms. Indeed, for some authors, improving the spelling of words is another positive effect of learning vocabulary using subtitled audio-visual materials since they can communicate any kind of message correctly and precisely. For instance, Fikri et al. (2020) gave participants multiple-choice, completion, and making sentences tests. The tests addressed vocabulary related to nouns, verbs, and adjectives. The authors found that the students learned how to use vocabulary based on the category of the part of speech from the video, which motivated students to learn English. According to the results, the writers figured out that videos with English subtitles could enhance students' vocabulary related to meaning and spelling.

Vocabulary teaching should seek to raise learners' awareness of word definitions, word connections, and word usage in diverse situations. The results of Mulyani's (2021) study showed that English movies with subtitles have a positive effect on understanding vocabulary when it is watched more than once and help students distinguish new vocabulary and learn new expressions.

Lastly, according to Ebrahimi and Bazae (2016), no relevant effects related to vocabulary teaching and learning were found. The authors concluded that subtitles did not affect L2 vocabulary comprehension since students were only exposed to the movie once. Therefore, the researchers inferred that audio-visual material with English subtitles could exert a positive influence on vocabulary comprehension if learners watch a movie more than once, which can help students recognize vocabulary and learn new expressions and idioms.

CHAPTER 6

6. Conclusions and Recommendations

6.1 Conclusions

This research synthesis sought to analyze the effects of subtitled audio-visual material on EFL learners' listening comprehension and vocabulary learning. In order to accomplish this goal, 16 studies were examined and classified according to research design, students' level of instruction, students' perceptions, and the effects of this type of material on listening comprehension and vocabulary learning.

Regarding the first research question, which inquires about the effects of using subtitled audio-visual material, most of the research shows positive effects on EFL students' listening comprehension and vocabulary learning. In most of the studies related to listening skills, the results indicate a positive impact on students' listening comprehension (Kim, 2015; Liando et al., 2018; Safranjan, 2015; Silviyanti, 2014; Nastitie & Sulistyani, 2020; Başaran & Köse, 2013). Nevertheless, in one of the studies, the participants' listening comprehension improved because of subtitles in the participants' mother tongue.

Furthermore, regarding the positive effects on vocabulary learning, most of the studies showed gains in new word learning, correct spelling, and better understanding (Fauzi et al., 2021; Undara, 2021; Mulyani, 2021; Ismaili, 2013; Fikri et al., 2020; Gorjian, 2014). However, one study showed that there was neither a positive nor a negative effect (Ebrahimi & Bazaee, 2016).

In general, it can be said that audio-visual materials for teaching EFL listening comprehension and vocabulary exert a positive effect on learners. Considering the teaching context in Ecuador, the lack of technological tools in the classroom was seen as a barrier to improving the teaching of English as a foreign language (Correa, 2018); however, nowadays, in most institutions: private or public, the technological resources required to project subtitled audio-visual material to improve students' English skills are accessible; therefore, the results of this research synthesis might help Ecuadorian EFL teachers to enhance their lessons by focusing on the different advantages that the audio-visual material provides.

The second research question focused on learners' perceptions of subtitled audio-visual material. Most of the students claimed that subtitled audio-visual material helped them with their listening comprehension improvement, vocabulary learning, and correct pronunciation. In

addition, the participants stated that audio-visual material is engaging, entertaining, and an interesting tool to learn English.

Indeed, audio-visual material is recognized as a remarkable tool that boosts students' interest in the classroom and helps students to comprehend English and enhance their language skills (Ebrahimi & Bazaaee, 2016). As a student, I used to think that audio-visual material was used in the classroom only for entertainment and for wasting class time; however, watching movies and videos with English subtitles made me realize that I could also learn many aspects of the English language using this material. Teachers should realize that a movie or video in class is not a waste of time because many activities can be designed based on this type of material to enhance student learning.

Regarding the advantages of subtitled audio-visual material, it was emphasized that audio-visual material is an interesting and motivating tool that can reduce verbalism, show real-life situations, and help to gain cultural knowledge. Nevertheless, some disadvantages of using this type of material should not be overlooked. For instance, it is important for teachers to take into account that audio-visual material can sometimes lead to distracting and time-consuming activities and technical problems, so that they can be prepared for any of the mentioned potential shortcomings during the use of audio-visual material in their classes and make the most of it.

The aforementioned disadvantages could be an issue in Ecuador. Although most schools have the necessary technological tools for using audio-visual material in class, during my practicum at Técnico Salesiano High School, I witnessed how the use of technology was still a problem, especially when the computer or audio did not work. Consequently, there is still a need for training in ICT management in order to take advantage of audio-visual material. In addition, to benefit from the use of subtitled movies and videos, such flaws should be anticipated since considerable studies reveal that the use of subtitled audio-visual material helps students with their listening comprehension and vocabulary learning.

6.2 Recommendations

Although there is a wealth of information on subtitled audio-visual material for EFL students, most of the research on this topic has been carried out in Asian and European countries. Hence, studies in Latin America can offer a wider point of view on audio-visual material around the world. I consider that a study conducted in Ecuador could be a good field of research. According to the EF EPI (English Proficiency Index) 2021, Ecuador has been placed in a group

of countries that have the poorest English proficiency level in Latin America. Therefore, the inclusion of audio-visual material with English subtitles could be a useful tool for the improvement of different skills.

References

- Abdullah, A. (2014). *Incidental vocabulary learning through watching movies*. [Master's thesis, BRAC University]. BRAC University Repository.
- Akram, S., Malik, S., & Malik, K. (2012). Use of audio-visual aids for effective teaching of biology at secondary schools. *Elixir International Journal*. 50(1), 10597-10605.
[https://www.elixirpublishers.com/articles/1351336051_50%20\(2012\)%2010597-10605.pdf](https://www.elixirpublishers.com/articles/1351336051_50%20(2012)%2010597-10605.pdf)
- Alavi, Z., Harji, M., & Woods, P. (2010). The effect of viewing subtitled videos on vocabulary learning. *Journal of College Teaching & Learning*, 7(9), 37-42.
<https://doi.org/10.19030/tlc.v7i9.146>
- Anas, F. A., & Zakaria, N. Y. K. (2019). ESL Learners' Perceptions on English Subtitled AudioVisual Materials. *Creative Education*, 10, 2796-2803.
<https://doi.org/10.4236/ce.2019.1012206>
- Ashcroft, R., Garner, J. & Hadingham, O. (2018). Incidental vocabulary learning through watching movies. *Australian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 1(3), 135-147.
<https://dx.doi.org/10.29140/ajal.v1n3.89>
- Atkinson K.M., Koenka A.C., Sanchez C.E., Moshontz H., & Cooper H. (2014). Reporting standards for literature searches and report inclusion criteria: making research syntheses more transparent and easy to replicate. *Research Synthesis Methods*, 6(1), 87–95. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jrsm.1127>
- Başaran, H. F., & Köse, G. D. (2013). The effects of captioning on EFL listening

comprehension. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 70(1), 702 – 708.

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.01.112>

Caroline, V., & Wei, N. (2018). Students` responses in enhancing new vocabulary through subtitled English movies. *Acuity: Journal of English Language Pedagogy, Literature, and Culture*, 3 (1), 45-74. <https://doi.org/10.35974/acuity.v3i1.623>

Çakir, I. (2006). The Use of Video as an Audio-Visual Material in Foreign Language Teaching Classroom. *Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*, 5(4), 67-72. <https://www.learntechlib.org/p/194709/>

Correa, M. (2018). How the use of technological tools help teachers to manage better their classes at an English language Institute in Loja, Ecuador. [Bachelor's thesis, Universidad Técnica Particular de Loja]. RiUTPL Repository. <http://dspace.utpl.edu.ec/handle/20.500.11962/23588>

Denden, H., & Mezerreg, S. (2016). Investigating teachers' and students' attitudes towards the role of audio visual aids in improving EFL learning skills. [Master's thesis, Larbi Ben M'hidi University-Oum El Bouaghi]. University Larbi Ben M'hidi University-Oum El Bouaghi Repository. <http://hdl.handle.net/123456789/3682>

Ebrahimi, Y., & Bazaee, P. (2016). The Effect of Watching English Movies with Standard Subtitles on EFL Learners' Content and Vocabulary Comprehension. *Journal of Applied Linguistics and Language Research*, 3(5), 284-295. <https://www.jallr.com/index.php/JALLR/article/view/394>

Ehteshami, A. (2016). Impact of Audio-viewing Materials on Iranian UpperIntermediate EFL Learners' Listening Comprehension. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics & English Literature*, 5(7), 132-141. <http://dx.doi.org/10.7575/aiac.ijalel.v.5n.7p.132>

- Emini, R. (2018). Teacher's and pupil's views and perceptions about the usage of audio-visual aids in teaching English in primary education. *Journal of Educational Sciences*, 18(1), 67-104. <http://bjes.beder.edu.al/>
- Fauzi, W., Muljanto, S., & Lestari, L. (2021). College students' perceptions on using movies for vocabulary learning. *English Education and Applied Linguistics (EEAL) Journal*, 4(1), 40-47. <https://journal.institutpendidikan.ac.id/index.php/eeal/article/view/1105>
- Fikri., Aminah, S., & Ferry, R. (2020). *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research*, 534(1), 76-86. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.210226.050>
- Gorjian, B. (2014). The Effect of Movie Subtitling on Incidental Vocabulary Learning Among EFL Learners. *International Journal of Asian Social Science*, 4(9), 1013–1026. <https://archive.aessweb.com/index.php/5007/article/view/2695>
- Hayati, A., & Mohmedi, F. (2009). The effect of films with and without subtitles on listening comprehension of EFL learners. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, 42 (1), 181–192. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8535.2009.01004.x>
- Hassiba, T. (2017). *The Effectiveness of audio-visual aids as a didactic support to enhance learners' vocabulary: a case study of fourth-year pupils at Ben Trah Brahim Middle School of Sidi Okba*. [Master's thesis, Mohamed Kheider University of Biskra]. University of Biskra Repository. <http://archives.univ-biskra.dz/handle/123456789/8594>
- Hsieh, Y. (2019). Effects of video captioning on EFL vocabulary learning and listening comprehension. *Computer Assisted Language Learning*, 43(4), 1-23. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09588221.2019.1577898>

- Ismaili, M. (2013). The effectiveness of using movies in the EFL classroom – A study conducted at South East European University. *Academic Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies*, 2(4), 121-132. <https://doi.org/10.5901/ajis.2012.v2n4p121>
- Jemima, D. (2013). Audio-visual aids in teaching of English. *International Journal of Innovative Research in Science, Engineering and Technology*, 2(8), 3811-381. <http://www.ijirset.com/>
- Kim, Hea-Suk. (2015). Using authentic videos to improve EFL students' listening comprehension. *International Journal of Contents*, 11(4), 15–24. <https://doi.org/10.5392/IJOC.2015.11.4.015>
- Koricheva, J. & Gurevitch, J. (2013). 1. Place of Meta-analysis among Other Methods of Research Synthesis. In J. Koricheva, J. Gurevitch & K. Mengersen (Eds.), *Handbook of Meta-analysis in Ecology and Evolution* (pp. 3-13). Princeton University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9781400846184-003>
- Liando, N., Sahetapy, R., & Maru, M. (2018). English major students' perceptions towards watching English movies in listening and speaking skills development. *Advances in Social Sciences Research Journal*, 5(6), 1-16. <http://dx.doi.org/10.14738/assrj.56.4627>
- Malik, H. M., & Pandith, A. A. (2011). *Essentials of instructional technology*. Marsland Press.
- Mehdi, L., Ali, M., & Elham, M. (2011). Movie subtitles and the improvement of listening comprehension ability: Does it help? *The Journal of Language Teaching and Learning*, 1(2), 18-29. <http://www.iltl.org/iltl/>

- Merdas, S. (2015). *Effects of audio-visual aids on teaching English active vocabulary to EFL learners: a case study of second-year students of English at the Mohamed Kheider University of Biskra*. [Master's thesis, Mohamed Kheider University of Biskra]. University of Biskra Repository. <http://archives.univ-biskra.dz/handle/123456789/5826>
- Merriam-Webster. (n.d.). Video. In Merriam-Webster.com dictionary. <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/video>
- Mirvan, X. (2013). The advantages of using films to enhance students' reading skills in the EFL classroom. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 4(13), 62-66.
<https://www.iiste.org/>
- Montero, M. (2020). Incidental vocabulary learning through viewing a video. *Studies in Second Language Acquisition*, 1–25.
<http://www.dx.doi:10.1017/s0272263119000706>
- Mossaab, T. (2013). *The role of audio-visual aids in improving EFL learners' listening skills: A case study of third-year LMD students at the University of Biskra*. [Master's thesis, Mohamed Khider Biskra University]. University of Biskra Repository.
<http://archives.univ-biskra.dz/handle/123456789/4801>
- Mulyani, S. (2021). The use of film clips and video media with subtitled in English vocabulary instruction. *Journal Dedikasi Pendidikan*, 5(1), 61-70.
<https://www.researchgate.net/publication/348929136>

- Nalliveettil, G., & Ali, O. (2013). A study on the usefulness of audio-visual aids in EFL classroom: implications for effective instruction. *International Journal of Higher Education*, 2(2), 86-92. <http://dx.doi.org/10.14738/assrj.56.4627>
- Napikul, S., Cedar, P., & Roongrattanakool, D. (2018). The effects of film subtitles on English listening comprehension and vocabulary. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and English Literature*, 7(6), 104-111. <http://dx.doi.org/10.7575/aiac.ijalel.v.7n.6p.104>
- Nastitie, V., & Sulistyani, E. (2020). Using videos to improving listening comprehension of fourth grade students. *Journal of Elementary Education*, 4(1), 1-11. <http://dx.doi.org/10.22460/pej.v4i1.1299>
- Nguyen T.H. (2021). The effectiveness of learning vocabulary through games in comparison with that in traditional technique. *IJER-International Journal of Educational Research*, 4(05), 68-82. <http://gphjournal.org/index.php/er/article/view/419>
- Nur, T. (2011). *Effects of audio-visual learning toward the English vocabulary of 4th-grade students of Mi Walisongo Kalangan in the academic year 2010/2011*. [Unpublished Bachelor's thesis]. State Islamic Institute of Surakarta.
- Richards, J. C., & Gordon, D. B. (2004). *New interchange intro: Video teacher's guide*. Cambridge University Press.
- Saed, A., Yazdani, A., & Mohsen, A. (2016). Film Subtitles and Listening Comprehension Ability of Intermediate EFL Learners. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and Translation*, 2 (3), 29-32.

- Safranji, J. (2015). Advancing Listening Comprehension Through Movies. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 191, 169–173.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.04.513>
- Sari, I. (2017). *Teaching and learning vocabulary through video clips in the second semester of the seventh grade of SMP PGRI 6 Bandar Lampung in the academic year of 2015/2016*. [Bachelor's thesis, Raden Intan State Islamic University of Lampung]. UIN Raden Intan Lampung Repository.
<http://repository.radenintan.ac.id/id/eprint/189>
- Saripalli, S., Sailaja, M., & Rao, C. (2018). A review of the effectiveness of audio visual aids in teaching learning process, *AGU International Journal of Research in Social Sciences & Humanities*, 6(1), 853-858. <http://www.aguijrssh.com>
- Silvianti, T. M. (2014). Looking into EFL students' perceptions in listening by using English movie videos on YouTube. *Studies in English Language and Education*, 1(1), 42-58. <https://doi.org/10.24815/siele.v1i1.1119>
- Stempleski, S. (2002). 36. Video in the ELT Classroom: The Role of the Teacher. In J. Richards & W. Renandya (Eds.), *Methodology in Language Teaching: An Anthology of Current Practice* (pp. 364-367). Cambridge University Press.
<https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511667190.052>
- Sulaiman, N., Muhammad, A., Ganapathy, N., Khairuddin, Z., & Othman, S. (2017). Students' perceptions on using different listening assessment methods: audio-only and video media. *English Language Teaching Journal*, 10(8), 93-99.
<http://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v10n8p93>

Tafani, V. (2009). Teaching English through mass media. *Acta didactica napocensia*, 2(1), 81-95. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1052325.pdf>

Undara, N. (2021). The implementation of subtitled videos as a tool in teaching vocabulary to elementary ESL students. *International Journal of Creative Research and Studies*, 5(2), 42-48. <http://www.ijcrs.org/issue-details/351>

Winke, P., Gass, S., & Sydorenko, T. (2010). The effects of captioning videos used for foreign language listening activities. *Language Learning & Technology*, 14(1), 65–86. <https://llt.msu.edu/vol14num1/winkegasssydorenko.pdf>

Yang, J., Huang, Y., Tsai, C., Chung, C., & Wu, Y. (2009). An automatic multimedia content summarization system for video recommendation. *Educational Technology & Society*, 12(1), 49–61. <https://www.learntechlib.org/p/75185/>

Annex 1: Preliminary list of studies for analysis.

Akram, S., Malik, S., & Malik, K. (2012). Use of audio-visual aids for effective teaching of biology at secondary schools. *Elixir International Journal*, 50(1), 10597-10605.

[https://www.elixirpublishers.com/articles/1351336051_50%20\(2012\)%2010597-10605.pdf](https://www.elixirpublishers.com/articles/1351336051_50%20(2012)%2010597-10605.pdf)

Alavi, Z., Harji, M. & Woods, P. (2010). The effect of viewing subtitled videos on vocabulary learning. *Journal of College Teaching & Learning*, 7(9), 37-42.

<https://doi.org/10.19030/tlc.v7i9.146>

Ashcroft, R., Garner, J. & Hadingham, O. (2018). Incidental vocabulary learning through watching movies. *Australian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 1(3), 135-147.

<https://dx.doi.org/10.29140/ajal.v1n3.89>

Caroline, V. & Wei, N. (2018). Students` responses in enhancing new vocabulary through subtitled English movies. *Acuity: Journal of English Language Pedagogy, Literature, and Culture*, 3 (1), 45-74.

<https://doi.org/10.35974/acuity.v3i1.623>

Çakir, I. (2006). The Use of Video as an Audio-Visual Material in Foreign Language

Teaching Classroom. *Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology*, 5(4), 67-72.

Retrieved February 18, 2022 from <https://www.learntechlib.org/p/194709/>

Correa, M. (2018). How the use of technological tools help teachers to manage better their classes at an English language Institute in Loja, Ecuador. [Bachelor's thesis,

Universidad Técnica Particular de Loja]. RiUTPL Repository.

<http://dspace.utpl.edu.ec/handle/20.500.11962/23588>

EF epi 2021 – EF English proficiency index. EF Education First - Ecuador. (n.d.). Retrieved September 15, 2022, from <https://www.ef.com/ec/epi/>

Ehteshami, A. (2016). Impact of Audio-viewing Materials on Iranian UpperIntermediate EFL Learners' Listening Comprehension. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics & English Literature*, 5(7), 132-141. <http://dx.doi.org/10.7575/aiac.ijalel.v.5n.7p.132>

Emini, R. (2018). Teacher's and pupil's views and perceptions about the usage of audio-visual aids in teaching English in primary education. *Journal of Educational Sciences*, 18(1), 67-104. <http://bjes.beder.edu.al/>

Hayati, A., & Mohmedi, F. (2009). The effect of films with and without subtitles on listening comprehension of EFL learners. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, 42 (1), 181–192. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8535.2009.01004.x>

Hassiba, T. (2017). *The Effectiveness of audio-visual aids as a didactic support to enhance learners' vocabulary: a case study of fourth-year pupils at Ben Trah Brahim Middle School of Sidi Okba*. [Master's thesis, Mohamed Kheider University of Biskra]. University of Biskra Repository.

Hsieh, Y. (2019). Effects of video captioning on EFL vocabulary learning and listening comprehension. *Computer Assisted Language Learning*, 43(4), 1-23. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09588221.2019.1577898>

Liando, N., Sahetapy, R., & Maru, M. (2018). English major students' perceptions towards watching English movies in listening and speaking skills development. *Advances in Social Sciences Research Journal*, 5(6), 1-16. <http://dx.doi.org/10.14738/assrj.56.4627>

- Mehdi, L., Ali, M., & Elham, M. (2011). Movie subtitles and the improvement of listening comprehension ability: Does it help? *The Journal of Language Teaching and Learning*, 1(2), 18-29. <http://www.jltl.org/jltl/>
- Merdas, S. (2015). *Effects of audio-visual aids on teaching English active vocabulary to EFL learners: a case study of second-year students of English at the Mohamed Kheider University of Biskra*. [Master's thesis, Mohamed Kheider University of Biskra]. University of Biskra Repository. <http://archives.univ-biskra.dz/handle/123456789/5826>
- Montero, M. (2020). Incidental vocabulary learning through viewing a video. *Studies in Second Language Acquisition*, 1–25. <http://www.dx.doi:10.1017/s0272263119000706>
- Mossaab, T. (2013). *The role of audio-visual aids in improving EFL learners' listening skills: A case study of third-year LMD students at the University of Biskra*. [Master's thesis, Mohamed Khider Biskra University]. University of Biskra Repository. <http://archives.univ-biskra.dz/handle/123456789/4801>
- Napikul, S., Cedar, P., & Roongrattanakool, D. (2018). The effects of film subtitles on English listening comprehension and vocabulary. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and English Literature*, 7(6), 104-111. <http://dx.doi.org/10.7575/aiac.ijalel.v.7n.6p.104>
- Nguyen T.H. (2021). The effectiveness of learning vocabulary through games in comparison with that in traditional technique. *IJER-International Journal of*

Educational Research, 4(05), 68-82.

<http://gphjournal.org/index.php/er/article/view/419>

Nur, T. (2011). *Effects of audio-visual learning toward the English vocabulary of 4th-grade students of Mi Walisongo Kalangan in the academic year 2010/2011*. [Bachelor's thesis, State Islamic Institute of Surakarta]. ResearchGate database.

Sari, I. (2017). *Teaching and learning vocabulary through video clips in the second semester of the seventh grade of SMP PGRI 6 Bandar Lampung in the academic year of 2015/2016*. [Bachelor's thesis, Raden Intan State Islamic University of Lampung]. UIN Raden Intan Lampung Repository.

<http://repository.radenintan.ac.id/id/eprint/189>

Silvianti, T. M. (2014). Looking into EFL students' perceptions in listening by using English movie videos on YouTube. *Studies in English Language and Education*, 1(1), 42-58. <https://doi.org/10.24815/siele.v1i1.1119>

Tafani, V. (2009). Teaching English through mass media. *Acta didactica napocensia*, 2(1), 81-95. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1052325.pdf>

Winke, P., Gass, S., & Sydorenko, T. (2010). The effects of captioning videos used for foreign language listening activities. *Language Learning & Technology*, 14(1), 65–86. <https://llt.msu.edu/vol14num1/winkegasssydorenko.pdf>

Yang, J., Huang, Y., Tsai, C., Chung, C., & Wu, Y. (2009). An automatic multimedia content summarization system for video recommendation. *Educational Technology & Society*, 12(1), 49–61. <https://www.learntechlib.org/p/75185/>