HOW WELL DOES GLOBE PREDICT VALUES IN ADVERTISING? A CONTENT ANALYSIS OF PRINT ADVERTISING FROM THE UK, IRELAND, POLAND AND HUNGARY

Barbara Czarnecka, Middlesex University, United Kingdom Ross Brennan, Middlesex University, United Kingdom

Corresponding author Barbara Czarnecka Middlesex University Business School The Burroughs Hendon NW4 4BT United Kingdom Email: <u>b.czarnecka@mdx.ac.uk</u> Tel: +44 (0)20 8411 5000

HOW WELL DOES GLOBE PREDICT VALUES IN ADVERTISING? A CONTENT ANALYSIS OF PRINT ADVERTISING FROM THE UK, IRELAND, POLAND AND HUNGARY

ABSTRACT

This cross-cultural comparative study investigated differences in the frequency and types of value appeals used in print advertising from Poland, the UK, Hungary and Ireland. The methodological approach was content analysis; Pollay's (1983) value appeals were linked to the GLOBE dimensions (House et al 2004). While there were some consistent value appeals across the four countries, there were also marked differences. The differences did not vary consistently with, and could not be explained by, the GLOBE cultural dimensions. Further research is needed to determine how the differences and similarities between the four countries may be explained.

INTRODUCTION

The subject of cross-cultural differences in advertising has received considerable prior attention. This article contributes further to this research stream by investigating if the cross-cultural model GLOBE can be used to predict and explain differences and similarities in the use of value appeals in four countries, two from each of two cultural clusters. Content analysis was applied to print advertisements collected over a period of one year (May 2007 – May 2008). Two coders from each country analysed the advertisements using Pollay's (1983) 42 value appeals, which were linked to the GLOBE dimensions. The results were inconclusive; there was only limited support for the idea that advertising appeals could be explained using the GLOBE cultural dimensions. However, there are inter-country differences in advertising appeals, for which other explanations must be sought.

In the remainder of this paper we provide a brief review of the literature on cross-cultural research in advertising, an overview of the methods of data gathering and analysis, then a discussion of the results from the analysis and of their implications. This is followed by some observations on the opportunities for further research.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Advertising in a cross cultural context has long been the subject of debate. Levitt (1983) is frequently cited; he argued that world markets will converge, so creating opportunities for the standardisation of marketing and in turn advertising. In contrast Sheth (1986) argued that fully globalised markets do not exist, and that companies should adopt a segmented rather than a global approach. A similar perspective is supported by Usunier (1996): "globalization is a process which occurs mainly at the competition level" (p.192).

Numerous studies have been conducted in the area of cross-cultural advertising. Researchers have examined advertising messages in terms of: use of humour (Biswas, Olsen, & Carlet, 1992); celebrity endorsement (Choi, Lee, & Kim, 2005); gender roles (Al-Olayan & Karande, 2000; Gilly, 1988; Wee, Choong, & Tambyah, 1995; Wiles, Wiles, & Tjernlund, 1995); beauty (Frith, Shaw, & Cheng, 2005); standardisation extent (Nelson & Paek, 2007); visual components (Cutler, Javalgi, & Erramsilli, 1992); and cultural values (Cheng & Schweitzer, 1996; Cho, Kwon, Gentry, Jun, & Kropp, 1999; Lin, 2001). The results confirm that there are

inter-country differences in advertising and that consumers usually react differently to advertising from different countries (Dahl, 2004).

Okazaki and Mueller (2007) reviewed recent developments in cross-cultural advertising research. They looked at 106 articles published between 1995 and 2006 from the point of view of research methods, research topics, and countries studied. The conclusion was that certain countries, topics and methods are more widely researched and used than others. The most frequently studied countries were the USA and Canada with 71 studies (26%) followed by Western European countries (58 studies, 21%), while Central and Eastern European countries featured in only 5 studies (1.8%). The authors emphasised that "Some regions are clearly understudied, in particular, developing or emergent economies in Central and Eastern Europe, Middle Eastern countries, and both Latin America and Africa" (p. 503). Content analysis (the most popular method) was used in 37 of the studies (34%), surveys in 35 studies (33%), and experiments in 19 studies (17%). The most common research topic was cultural values (39 studies, 36%), followed by the standardisation/localisation issue (23 studies, 21%), then by consumer responses to advertising (17 studies, 16%). Okazaki and Mueller (2007) also discussed the frequent use of cross-cultural models in advertising research, and suggested that the use of the GLOBE cultural dimensions would be a fruitful avenue for future research.

Prior research into value appeals in cross-cultural advertising has most commonly used Hofstede's (2001) cultural dimensions. Albers-Miller and Gelb (1996) investigated advertising from eleven countries using Hofstede's cultural dimensions and Pollay's value appeals. They used content analysis on print advertisements and compared the results with Hofstede's scores on cultural dimensions. Al-Olayan and Karande (2000) also used content analysis on print advertisements: the USA, Egypt, Lebanon and UAE. They used Hofstede's individualism/collectivism dimension, and Hall's high/low context dimension to compare the use of comparative appeals, information cues and price information. The results were as expected: advertising from Arab countries featured fewer comparative appeals, fewer information cues and less price information than advertising from the USA.

Terlutter et al. (2006) discussed a number of cross-cultural frameworks (Schwartz's cultural values; Inglehart's World Value Survey and GLOBE dimensions) in terms of their applicability to cross-cultural marketing in general, and advertising specifically. They suggested that the GLOBE dimensions "may prove relevant for advertising and marketing purposes" (p. 431). The authors draw on a previous study of assertiveness (one of the GLOBE dimensions) which involved consumers from Germany, the USA, France and England. The results showed that there were differences between consumers of different countries in perception and evaluation of a standardised advertisement incorporating an assertive appeal. The authors suggested that more research based on GLOBE dimensions could be useful, especially by incorporating other cultures.

In this study we take up the suggestion of Okazaki and Mueller (2007) and of Terlutter et al (2006) that a cross-cultural study of advertising using the GLOBE cultural dimensions would be valuable. GLOBE stands for Global Leadership and Organisational Behaviour study. The study identified nine cultural dimensions: Power Distance; Uncertainty Avoidance; Humane Orientation; Institutional Collectivism; In-Group collectivism; Assertiveness; Gender Egalitarianism; Future Orientation and Performance Orientation (House et al 2004).

METHODS AND RESEARCH PROCESS

Pollay (1983) identified 42 value appeals used in advertising. Albers-Miller (1996) used 29 of the 42 appeals to study advertising from 11 countries, and linked the appeals to Hofstede's cultural dimensions. Dahl (2004) also used Pollay's value appeals and linked them to Hofstede's dimensions and to Schwartz's value types to study TV commercials from three European countries. In this study Pollay's value appeals are linked to GLOBE dimensions. The values and dimensions are presented in Table 1.

Value appeals were assigned to each of the dimensions by the authors of this study, based on the expert, independent advice of two researchers knowledgeable in the field who have not participated in the study. Only eight out of the nine dimensions were used in this study. Gender egalitarianism was excluded because only one value appeal was considered to correspond to this cultural dimension.

The study addressed the following research question: Can inter-country differences and similarities in value appeals in advertising be explained using the GLOBE cultural dimensions and Society Values scores?

[Insert Table 1 about here]

Content analysis is an "observational research method" (Kolbe & Burnett, 1991, p.243) which Neuendorf (2002) defines as "the systematic, objective, quantitative analysis of message characteristics" (p.1). It has been widely used in cross-cultural advertising research (Biswas et al., 1992), and seems to be an adequate method for measuring value appeals in printed advertisements. However, it has been criticised for being purely descriptive. The results presented here are the first phase of a larger study in which further analytical procedures will also be used. As a first step it was important to measure the frequency of value appeals and compare this against the GLOBE model.

The advertisements were gathered over a period of one year: May 2007 – May 2008. Weekly TV listings magazines with the highest circulation were selected from each country; these were Szines RTV (Hungary), Tele Tydzien (Poland), What's On TV (England), and TV Now (Ireland). There were 283 English advertisements, 207 Irish advertisements, 180 Polish advertisements, 178 Hungarian advertisements, which were coded by two coders from each country. Each coder was given a full description of the 'value appeals' and trained in how to analyse the advertisements. Coders had to note which of the appeals appeared in the advertisement. The inter-coder reliability using Cohen's *kappa* (Neuendorf, 2002) was the following: Poland 0.9; the UK 0.8; Ireland 0.8; and Hungary 0.9.

RESULTS

[Insert Table 2 about here]

Inter-country differences and similarities in the use of value appeals were identified (Table 2). Some of the appeals were used more frequently than others. Some of them were not found at all. The most popular appeals in **Poland** were: 'cheap' (found in 57.8% of advertisements), 'distinctive' (32.8%), 'modern' (31.1%), 'wisdom' (25%), 'convenient' (23.3%), and 'family' (22.2%). The appeals 'tamed', 'modesty', 'humility', 'frail' and 'casual' did not feature in Polish advertisements at all. The most popular appeals in **Hungary** were:

'convenient' (55.1%), 'cheap' (52.8%), 'effective' (37.1%), 'enjoyment' (34.8%), 'technological' (30.3%), 'adventure' (21.3%) and 'modern' (20.2%). The appeal 'casual' was not used at all in Hungary. The most popular appeals in the **UK** were: 'cheap' (51.9%) and 'wisdom' (37.5%). The appeals 'vain', 'plain', 'modesty', 'humility' and 'frail' were not used at all in England. The most popular appeals in **Ireland** were: 'wisdom' (39.6%), 'affiliation' (29.5%), 'modern' (29%), 'enjoyment' (26.1%), 'healthy' (24.2%) and 'vain' (23.2%). Four appeals were not used at all in Ireland: 'succorance', 'modesty', 'humility' and 'casual'.

Some of the appeals were in common use across more than one country. For example, 'cheap' was used in over 50% of Polish, Hungarian and English advertisements. 'Wisdom' was used in over 25% of Polish, English and Irish advertisements.

[Insert Table 3 about here]

Table 3 shows a cross-tabulation of the GLOBE cultural dimensions against selected advertising appeals. The figures in Table 3 show the percentage of advertisements in which the specified advertising appeal was found. For each cultural dimension, one of the advertising appeals in Table 3 represents the high end of that dimension (for example, "modern" represents the high end of "future orientation") and the other advertising appeal represents the low end of that dimension (for example, "adventure" represents the low end of uncertainty avoidance).

The systematic comparison of the advertising appeals used in the four different countries, and the detailed analysis of the degree of correspondence between the advertising appeals and the mean scores of the four countries on the GLOBE cultural dimensions cannot be presented in detail here owing to constraints of space. Pair-wise comparisons were carried out for each country against all other countries for all 42 advertising appeals (6 comparisons, times 42 appeals, yielding a total of 252 pair-wise comparisons). Table 3 represents an illustrative snap-shot from this analysis. For each of the 252 pair-wise comparisons, the null hypothesis tested was that there was no underlying difference between the two countries in the frequency with which the specified advertising appeal was used; the expectation was that systematic differences would be found between countries in advertising appeals, and that these would be associated with the countries scores on the GLOBE cultural dimensions.

In general, it was expected that there would be greater similarities in advertising appeals between the UK and Ireland (western European countries with relatively high GDP per head and long-term members of the EU, members of the GLOBE Anglo cluster) and between Hungary and Poland (eastern European countries with relatively low GDP per head and recent members of the EU, members of the GLOBE Eastern Europe cluster). However, this proved not to be the case. In addition, although the differences between advertising appeals between countries were frequently found to be statistically significant, there was little evidence that advertising appeals varied systematically with scores on the GLOBE cultural dimensions. For example, Poland has the lowest score of the four countries on the cultural dimension 'institutional collectivism', and would therefore be expected to have the lowest number of advertisements featuring the 'community' appeal, whereas it had the highest number of advertisements featuring this appeal (see Table 3); meanwhile Ireland should have the highest number of advertisements featuring this appeal, but actually has the lowest. Overall, the conclusion was that the GLOBE national scores for cultural dimensions showed very little statistical association with the frequency of use of advertising appeals. In short, whatever is driving the advertising appeals used in these countries, it does not appear to be underlying cultural dimensions.

CONCLUSION

The results of the study confirm what was already known, that advertising differs from country to country. Both Table 2 and Table 3 show marked differences between the four countries in terms of the frequency with which particular advertising appeals are used. There were some similarities in advertising appeals (for example 'cheap' was used very frequently in three out of four countries) which may be explained with what Huang (1998) calls 'global appeals'. Some appeals may indeed be globally used, or there might be a global trend to use a certain appeal or characteristic at a certain point in time. For example, Czarnecka (2006) investigated appeals in food advertisements from Poland and the UK and discovered that the appeal 'natural' was frequently used in both countries.

However, GLOBE dimensions do not seem to be explaining the differences in advertising appeals successfully. The advertisements in this study did not reflect the cultural values as predicted by GLOBE. This may be because of several reasons. The advertisements may not have been produced by local agencies thus not displaying 'local culture'. Global advertisements are usually cheaper to use even though they may be less effective. Additionally, this study focused only on value appeals which are a small part of an advert. Further investigation into factors such as creative strategies and information content may reveal results in line with GLOBE dimensions.

REFERENCES

- Al-Olayan, F. S., & Karande, K. (2000). A content analysis of magazine advertisements from the United States and the Arab World. Journal of Advertising, 29(3), 69-82.
- Albers-Miller, N. (1996). Designing cross-cultural advertising research: a closer look at paired comparisons International Marketing Review, *13*(5), 59-75.
- Albers-Miller, N., & Gelb, B. (1996). Business advertising appeals as a mirror of cultural dimensions: a study of eleven countries. Journal of Advertising, 25(4), 57-70.
- Biswas, A., Olsen, J. E., & Carlet, V. (1992). A comparison of print advertisements from the United States and France. Journal of Advertising, 21(4), 73-81.
- Cheng, H., & Schweitzer, J. C. (1996). Cultural values reflected in Chinese and US television commercials. Journal of Advertising Research, *36*(3), 27-45.
- Cho, B., Kwon, U., Gentry, J. W., Jun, S., & Kropp, F. (1999). Cultural values reflected in theme and execution: a comparative study of US and Korean television commercials. Journal of <u>Advertising</u>, 28(4), 59-73.
- Choi, S. M., Lee, W.-N., & Kim, H.-J. (2005). Lessons from the rich and famous: a cross-cultural comparison of celebrity endorsement in advertising. *Journal of Advertising*, *34*(2), 85-98.
- Cutler, B. D., Javalgi, R. G., & Erramsilli, K. M. (1992). The visual components of print advertising: a five-country cross-cultural analysis. <u>European Journal of Marketing</u>, 26(4), 7-21.
- Czarnecka, B. (2006). Cross-cultural advertising: content analysis of printed advertisements from the UK and Poland. <u>Unpublished masters dissertation</u>. Middlesex University London.
- Dahl, S. (2004). Euro-commercials: Cultural values in TV advertisements in Germany, the Netherlands and UK: University of Luton.
- Frith, K., Shaw, P., & Cheng, H. (2005). The construction of beauty: a cross-cultural analysis of women's magazine advertising. Journal of Communication, 55(1), 56-70.

- Gilly, M. C. (1988). Sex roles in advertising: a comparison of television advertisements in Australia, Mexico, and the United States. Journal of Marketing, 52(2), 75-86.
- Kolbe, R., & Burnett, M. (1991). Content-analysis research: an examination of applications with directives for improving research reliability and objectivity. <u>Journal of Consumer Research</u>, 18, 243-250.
- Levitt, T. (1983). The globalization of markets. <u>Harvard Business Review</u>, 63(May/June), 92-102.
- Lin, C. A. (2001). Cultural values reflected in Chinese and American television advertising. Journal of Advertising, 30(4), 83-94.
- Nelson, M. R., & Paek, H.-J. (2007). A content analysis of advertising in a global magazine across seven countries. International Marketing Review, 24(1), 64-86.
- Neuendorf, K. A. (2002). The content analysis guidebook. London: Sage Publications.
- Okazaki, S., & Mueller, B. (2007). Cross-cultural advertising research: where we have been and where we need to go. <u>International Marketing Review</u>, 24(5), 499-518.
- Pollay, R. W. (1983). Measuring the cultural values manifest in advertising. <u>Current Issues and</u> <u>Research in Advertising</u>, 6(1), 71-92.
- Sheth, J. (1986). Global markets or global competition? <u>The Journal of Consumer Marketing</u>, *3*(2), 9-12.
- Terlutter, R., Diehl, S., & Mueller, B. (2006). The GLOBE study applicability of a new typology of cultural dimensions for cross-cultural marketing and advertising research. In S. Diehl & R. Terlutter (Eds.), <u>International advertising and communication: current insights</u> and empirical findings. (pp. 420-438). Wiesbaden Gabler Edition Wissenschaft.
- Usunier, J.-C. (1996). Marketing across cultures (2 ed.). London: Prentice Hall.
- Wee, C.-H., Choong, M.-L., & Tambyah, S.-K. (1995). Sex role portrayal in television advertising. <u>International Marketing Review</u>, *12*(1), 49-65.
- Wiles, J. A., Wiles, C. R., & Tjernlund, A. (1995). A comparison of gender role portrayals in magazine advertising: the Netherlands, Sweden and the USA. <u>European Journal of</u> <u>Marketing</u>, 29(11), 35-49.

Dimensions	Value appeals				
	High	Low			
PD	Tamed, Dear, Maturity, Status, Vain	Youth, Cheap			
UAV	Safety, Neat	Adventure, Casual, Magic, Popular			
НО	Nurturance, Succorance, Morality	Untamed			
IC	Community	Independence			
IGC	Family, Affiliation	Distinctive, Freedom			
ASSERT	Healthy, Security	Humility, Modesty, Frail			
GE	-	-			
FO	Durable, Modern	Traditional			
PO	Effective, Technological,	Relaxation, Enjoyment			
	Productivity, Wisdom, Convenient				

Table 1: GLOBE dimensions and value appeals

	Poland	Ireland	Hungary	United Kingdom
1	Cheap	Wisdom	Convenient	Cheap
2	Distinctive	Affiliation	Cheap	Wisdom
3	Wisdom	Modern	Effective	Family
4	Modern	Enjoyment	Enjoyment	Effective
5	Convenient	Healthy	Technological	Convenient
6	Family	Vain	Adventure	Modern
7	Community	Relaxation	Modern	Freedom
8	Technological	Technological	Affiliation	Distinctive
9	Effective	Security	Distinctive	Natural
10	Enjoyment	Distinctive	Youth	Nurturance

Table 2: Top 10 advertising appeals in each country

Cultural		Advertising	Poland	Ireland	Hungary	United
Dimension		Appeal				Kingdom
Power	Hi	Vain	2.8	23.2	1.1	0.0
Distance	Lo	Cheap	57.8	11.1	52.8	51.9
Uncertainty	Hi	Safety	10.6	2.9	10.7	1.1
Avoidance	Lo	Adventure	8.9	4.8	21.3	3.5
Humane	Hi	Nurturance	2.8	6.3	4.5	8.5
Orientation	Lo	Untamed	1.7	1.0	1.7	1.8
Institutional	Hi	Community	17.0	3.4	7.3	6.7
Collectivism	Lo	Independence	5.0	2.4	9.0	2.5
In-group	Hi	Family	22.2	13.0	13.5	19.4
Collectivism	Lo	Distinctive	32.8	15.5	18.0	10.6
Assertiveness	Hi	Healthy	5.0	24.2	7.9	8.1
	Lo	Humility	0.0	0.0	1.1	0.0
Future	Hi	Modern	31.1	2.0	20.2	13.4
Orientation	Lo	Traditional	6.7	1.0	2.8	1.1
Performance	Hi	Effective	15.0	5.8	37.1	14.1
Orientation	Lo	Relaxation	10.0	18.8	12.4	9.9

Table 3: Cultural dimensions & selected advertising appeals by country