"Theorising Affective Habitus in Historical Geographies of Mobilities: Unfolding Spatio-

**Temporal Modalities**"

**Abstract** 

This paper applies a case study approach to theorise a research agenda for critical explorations

of emotions and mobilities centred on three core concepts and key phenomena: affective

habitus, spatio-temporal modalities and historical geographies. The analysis offers novel

perspectives on the interplay between the affectivity of geographies of social difference and

the multiscalar dynamics shaping social relations through mobility. This is demonstrated in

how emotions linked to agency provide a generative lens to explore how social relationships

and political subjectivities intersect to inform mobile identities/lifeworlds. The case studies

offer critical insights of how migrants/refugees/indigenous people in navigating challenging

structural conditions can reflect conceptualisations of the mutually constitutive contexts of

emotionality and intersectional inequity with indigeneity and (im)mobility. A temporal-

historical lens reveals how emotional mobilities are shaped by structural/social dynamics

including, but not limited to, trauma and exclusion, historical divisions, cultural identities,

border and racialised regimes, intergenerationality. These exemplifications through a case

study empirical lens draw from research focusing on indigenous and Palestinian peoples.

**Keywords:** affective habitus, emotional mobilities, intersectional inequalities, indigeneity,

Palestine

1

#### **Introducing relational emotional mobilities**

The unpredictability of how mobile lives can, in an instant, become immobilised while on an emotional rollercoaster, are some of the common threads through which the current COVID-19 pandemic has woven together in our otherwise remarkably different global lifestyles. Mobility and emotion are the central foci of this paper and in response to the challenge that: 'A long, promising and still little-trodden way ahead lies out there, stemming from the crossroads between migration studies and studies of emotion', and, the paper takes up this challenge.<sup>1</sup>

To clarify, the core issue that outlines the paper's research agenda on the relationship between emotions and mobilities is the discussion of the conceptual value of time and space to this literature. This core focus is supplemented by firstly, highlighting the relevant contemporary and historical research on emotions and mobilities; and, secondly, linking to understandings of social change, embodied experience and the nuances of agency/structure in how the empirical cases as examples present these objectives. More specifically, the *central question* addressed in this paper is the following: *How can we theorise emotion in mobilities research while operationalising historical and social time*? Thus, the *unifying argument* of this piece is the *importance of bringing in timespace* in developing theoretical tools to understand emotions in mobilities research.

### **Methodological Note**

This paper builds on two case studies while theorising through an analytical lens that draws on that of Creswell et al. capturing the depth and breadth of how case study concepts and descriptions are 'a methodology, a type of design in qualitative research, an object of study and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Paolo Boccagni and Loretta Baldassar, 'Emotions on the move: Mapping the emergent field of emotion and migration', *Emotion, Space and Society*, no. 16 (2015): 79.

a product of the inquiry'. They include in this definition the core features and hallmarks of a case study as a detailed, over time and in-depth collection of data from multiple sources including observations, interviews, audio-visual materials, documents, repots, etc. to present themes emerging. Thus, the case studies have been constructed on this basis, with data interpreted and analysed through a reflexive lens to situate indigeneity as the heuristic approach to understanding what is unsettling about decolonisation. This aligns with what Tuck and Yang state as seeing decolonisation not as a metaphor for what we want to do to improve Global North societies and pedagogies to reconcile settler guilt and complicity, but rather as 'an ethic of incommensurability' recognising what is meaningful for potential alliances within transnational critical space-place social justice pedagogies and endeavours.3 In this way, indigeneity offers a way forward to also rethink the Palestinian political project where indigenous people are facing erasure, hence placing it within a global context of settler colonial projects and drawing solidarity links while recognising intertwining links of indigenous threads of oppression. Such a theoretical paradigm aligns with decolonial thinking, but also sees a reshifting of the political paradigm as a recalibrated vision, re-centring struggles for justice and freedom as decolonial ones.

As a methodological insight, it is important to underscore here the practice of 'reflexivity as self-observation' in referring to the notion of reflexivity in qualitative research understood as a researcher's examination of their feelings, motives, and position when embarking on particular research projects, case studies, as well as all throughout the data collection, analysis

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>John W. Creswell, et al., 'Qualitative research designs: Selection and implementation', *The Counseling Psychologist*, 35(2007): 245. DOI: 10.1177/0011000006287390

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>Eve Tuck and K. Wayne, Yang, 'Decolonization is not a metaphor', *Decolonization: Indigeneity, Education & Society*, 1(2012): 1.

and writing up of the findings.<sup>4</sup> It is particularly crucial to embed processes of reflecting on our positionalities as researchers in any kind of research we do, but it is certainly imperative when we proceed to research topics and groups where issues of 'sensitivity', 'vulnerability', 'inequality', etc. emerge, or, are entangled with intersectional categories such as race, ethnicity, gender, age, dis/ability, class, generation.<sup>5</sup> In this intersectional context, the author self-identifies as a working-class academic activist, trade unionist, feminist and anti-racist (second generation) migrant woman.

This positionality includes multiple negotiations and struggles in embracing interdisciplinary critical scholarship, engaging with global research in the humanities, social sciences and the arts, in the pursuit of a *public sociology* which is inclusive and impactful. These struggles emerge within affordances of 'unhoming pedagogies' and the affectivities of being a working class migrant woman academic activist in the neoliberal Academy of the 'hostile environment' in Brexit Britain. In a sense, this is a positionality that grapples with how societal trauma triggered by a number of crises, exacerbated by exclusions and divisions, is a challenging arena in theorising affectivities while experiencing those, and one which for academic activists trying to imagine futurities of freedom and utopias of social justice, equity and humanity, demands an intersectional awareness.

Moreover, these struggles extend to having to 'legitimise' interdisciplinarity as worthy research and writing endeavour when it incorporates cultural politics, intersectional and feminist approaches, decolonial and anti/post-colonial epistemologies, narrative analytics and the

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>Monica Krause, 'On Sociological Reflexivity', *Sociological Theory*, 39, no 1 (2021):4. doi:10.1177/0735275121995213

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>Anastasia Christou and Kate Bloor, 'The Liminality of Loneliness: Negotiating Feminist Ethics and Intersectional Affectivity', *Journal of Cultural Analysis and Social Change*, no. 1 (2021): 03. <a href="https://doi.org/10.20897/jcasc/11120">https://doi.org/10.20897/jcasc/11120</a>

critical sociologies of public scholarship, and, while embracing a feminist ethics of care and a social justice for community development activist and anti-racist agenda. These reflections contextualise the public and pedagogic spheres as spaces of what I term 'unhoming' and can yield experiences of displacement through processes of rupture, exclusion, racialisation. And, by extension, as a form of gendered violence which is psychosocially and emotionally saturated in the toxicity of how classed and ethnicised groups are othered through everyday sexisms, ageisms and racisms. Moreover, research encounters through fieldwork are also 'field-re/workings' in negotiating the emotional labour that the 'field' as a contested and spatially/temporally bounded accumulation of sites, sightings, signs and sighs in the feminist epistemological stance of engaging, yields. Yet, it is also 'shared messy and co-constituitive...further expanding our understanding of who and what counts in the production of knowledge in the field'. These core methodological reflections on positionality and the politics of critical research and academic writing situate the analytical parameters that unfold subsequently.

In what follows, through linking conceptualisations of indigeneity and settler colonialism with recent case study events, the paper articulates the theorisation of emotional mobilities within historical geographies of spatial and temporal affective experiences. These theorisations illustrate empirical and experiential insights of affective habitus, power and the politics of exclusion. Following the next section, the paper concludes with an overview of productive analytical possibilities for a research agenda acknowledging the emotive context of mobilities and transnational affectivities.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>Natalie Marr, et al. 'Sharing the Field: Reflections of More-Than-Human Field/work Encounters', *GeoHumanities*, (2022), doi: 10.1080/2373566X.2021.2016467

### Emoscapes and ethnoscapes: indigeneity and ethno-nationalisms as affective habitus

Deconstructing the historicity of criteria of how 'time-bound modern emotions' are included in the conceptual work that follows, is an important aim, which builds on other interventions. This analytical section brings together conceptual parameters to discuss 'emoscapes' and 'ethnoscapes' as conduits to 'affective habitus' in having intersectional understandings of migrancy, inequalities and indigeneity. Here, we connect the emotional dimensions of globalisation as diverse, intersecting, trasnational flows and scales as locations for the social, spatial and cultural formations of identities. More specifically, Appadurai defines 'global ethnoscapes' as: 'the landscape of persons who make up the shifting world in which we live: tourists, immigrants, refugees, exiles, guestworkers, and other moving groups and persons constitute an essential feature of the world and appear to affect the politics of and between nations to a hitherto unprecedented degree'. Following this definition by Appadurai, the term 'emoscapes' is advanced by Kenway and Fahey who use it to link the mobilisation and movement of emotion on the intersecting personal, national and global scales.

These two avenues of 'emoscapes and ethnoscapes' merge to link the 'affective habitus' of contemporary exclusions and inequalities in the two case studies discussed in this empirical

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>Thomas Dixon, 'What is the History of Anger a History of?', *Emotions: History, Culture, Society*, 4, no 1 (2020): 1-34. doi: <a href="https://doi.org/10.1163/2208522X-02010074">https://doi.org/10.1163/2208522X-02010074</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup>Jane Kenway and Johannah Fahey, 'Public pedagogies and global emoscapes', *Pedagogies: An International Journal*, 6, no 2 (2011): 167-179, DOI: 10.1080/1554480X.2011.554626; Arjun Appadurai, 'Global Ethnoscapes. Notes and Queries for a Transnational Anthropology', in *Recapturing Anthropology. Working in the Present*, ed. by Richard G. Fox (Santa Fe: School of American Research Press, 1991), pp. 191–210; Anastasia Christou and Hania Janta, 'The significance of things: Objects, emotions and cultural production in migrant women's return visits home', *The Sociological Review*, 67 no 3, (2019):654-671. doi:10.1177/0038026118816906

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup>Appadurai, 'Global Ethnoscapes', 192.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup>Jane Kenway and Johannah Fahey, 'Getting emotional about "brain mobility", *Emotion, Space and Society*, 4(2011):187 - 194.

section. They become 'two roads to public sociology' reflecting what Nira Yuval-Davis describes as a feeling of exasperation when stating that: 'given the state of contemporary Israeli society and politics — as well as other parts of the region and the world as a whole — I often feel close to despair, even though I try to cling to Gramsci's politics of hope, optimism of the will and pessimism of the intellect'.<sup>11</sup>

This effort builds on recent endeavours in interdisciplinary projects on affect recognising the need to develop working concepts bridging the theoretical study of human affect and emotion with the empirical investigation of affective phenomena. This kind of conceptual terrain of 'affective arrangements' aligns to emerging perspectives of 'situated affectivity'. In this section, while connecting bodies of cultural affect studies with scholarship on affective phenomena, we can understand how critical analysis emerges when exploring interactive dynamics between social actors and the materialities of their spatiotemporal settings.

Experiencing emotions (and moods) are integral to the human existence, but, the intensity of such and the frequency and duration of affective experiences will vary in different individuals and will be shaped by a number of personal, social, cultural conditions and conditioning. Emotional affectivity is the overall tendency to experience a variety of emotions and moods while varying levels and expressions of such destabilise notions of *emotional belonging* which are not always straightforward, thus revealing the ambivalence of 'home' and feelings of 'homing' in everyday life.<sup>12</sup> Here, 'mood' is an equally useful analytical category where through 'moodscapes' we are directed to the materialities of our attunement with the world as

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup>Nira Yuval-Davis, 'Two Roads to Public Sociology', Global Dialogue, 5 (2015): 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup>Jan Slaby et al. 'Affective Arrangements', *Emotion Review*, no. 11(2019): 3-12. DOI: 10.1177/1754073917722214; David Watson, *Mood and Temperament* (New York: Guilford Press, 2000); Nitzan Shoshan, *The Management of Hate: Nation, Affect, and the Governance of Right-Wing Extremism in Germany* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2016).

a productive political project. Layers of comparative insights and intersections are important, and so is the consideration of historical geographies of movements and emotions. That is, in the case of Palestine, 'refugeeness' is by definition an experience of affective liminality and trauma. It is a state of 'the unspeakability of loss'. 13 Refugees are forced into powerless situations, passively objectified as they cannot live lives to their full potential with independence and incorporation into the 'majority' (settler) society. Everyday practices of refugees involve not just cross-border mobility and 'inhabiting' the grey zones where different national jurisdictions intersect, but also building relationships with local residents. These interactions can generate frictions that open up spaces of autonomy, termed the 'interstices' which involve geopolitical, social and judicial interstices as outcomes of nation-state power relations. These discussions in the academic literature point to the 'border as method' which enables new perspectives to emerge from researching migration crises and transformations of the nation-state, and to make reassessments of political concepts such as citizenship and sovereignty. 14

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup>Ben Highmore, 'Feeling Our Way: Mood and Cultural Studies, Communication and Critical/Cultural Studies', no. 10 (2013): 427-438, DOI: <u>10.1080/14791420.2013.840387</u>; Evropi Chatzipanagiotidou and Fiona Murphy, "Devious silence': Refugee art, memory activism, and the unspeakability of loss among Syrians in Turkey", *History and Anthropology*, (2020): DOI: 10.1080/02757206.2020.1830383

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup>Claudia Olivier-Mensah, 'Refugee Social Work Positioned Between Transnationalization, State Services and Volunteering: A Review from the German Context', in Refugee Protection and Civil Society in Europe, eds. Margit Feischmidt, Ludger Pries and Celine Cantat (Cham: Palgrave Macmillan, 2019), 353-378; Elena Fontanari and Maurizio Ambrosini Into the Interstices, 'Everyday Practices of Refugees and 'Crisis', Sociology, Their **Supporters** Europe's Migration 52(2018):587-603. in DOI:10.1177/0038038518759458; Sandro Mezzadra and Brett Neilson, Border as Method, or the Multiplication of Labor, (Durham, NC and London: Duke University Press, 2013); Claudia Aradau, et al., 'Acts of European Citizenship: A political sociology of mobility', JCMS: Journal of Common Market Studies, 48(2010):945-965 <a href="https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-">https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-</a> 5965.2010.02081.x; Ayelet Shachar, The Shifting Border: Legal Cartographies of Migration and Mobility (Ayelet Shachar in Dialogue), (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2020);

In application therefore, the empirical analysis draws on two key case studies that have been central in the public imagination recently, but more importantly, poignant in the emotional repertoires of my current research. I am therefore thinking and feeling trauma along with indigenous peoples and the people of Palestine. I am feeling this trauma as a form of gendered violence and societal struggle, conflict and crisis. It is important to recognise here that the historical geographies of emoscapes and ethnoscapes are compounded by the complexification of migrancy, decoloniality and historical marginalisations. These are central to how the state and related deathscapes experienced by indigenous and Palestinian peoples render them in an affective habitus of dispossession, death and neo-colonial exclusions. If, to conceptualise indigeneity, as 'infinite' is a representation in its unbounded sense of space, then racialised markers of bordering indigeneity in the racist logics of settler colonialism have a relational connection to time and space: 'Crucially, Indigenous peoples are now increasingly being conceptualized as "colonized peoples" rather than simply "first peoples", thus partially uncoupling indigeneity from space and time. ... relational ideas associated with indigeneity are perpetually changing and are best considered through the lens of time and space, concepts that serve as the foundation for assertions related to who is Indigenous and who is not'. 15

At the same time, occurrences of increasing migrations of indigenous people signal new conceptual horizons for the term of indigeneity, which is complexly understood as subjectivities, knowledges, and practices of the earliest human inhabitants of a particular place

Martina Tazzioli, *The Making of Migration: The Biopolitics of Mobility at Europe's Borders*, (New York: SAGE Publications Limited, 2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup>Anastasia Christou, 'Mapping Gendered Violence-Contemplating Conflict and Crisis in Contemporary Societal Struggles', *Frontiers: A Journal of Women Studies*, 39, no. 2 (2018): vii-xii; Anastasia Christou, 'Infinite Indigeneity', *Feminist Review*, 122, no 1 (2019): 205-206. doi:10.1177/0141778918810212; Ian G. Baird, 'Thinking about Indigeneity with Respect to Time and Space: Reflections from Southeast Asia', *Espace populations sociétés* (2020), DOI: https://doi.org/10.4000/eps.9628

and including legal and racial identities that refer to these people.<sup>16</sup> Rituals recalling homelands through social imaginations regarding 'being and belonging' in the world, shaped by mobilities, diasporic and transnational relations, encompass the glocal and shared meanings and values of humanity. Such meaning making practices have also been analysed as 'cosmopolitanism in practice'.<sup>17</sup>

But while cosmopolitanisms can be seen in how 'global citizenship' as an emotive and ethical project of belonging offers inclusivity for global communities to celebrate co-existence, on the extreme end of the spectrum, the continuous colonising genocidal projects against indigenous peoples in the Global North and those in the Middle East exacerbate an affective habitus of what I term 'uncivilising eco-aesthetics'. The latter is delineated to describe the negative quality of bleakness and inability to imagine possible futures beyond the current collapse of peace and humanity. This is signified by an indigenous nation in Canada recently saying that it has found 751 unmarked graves at the site of a former residential school in Saskatchewan. The Cowessess First Nation said the discovery was 'the most significantly substantial to date in Canada'. <sup>18</sup> The fact that a residential school which should represent a space where pedagogies of possibility, knowledges and practices of social justice, equity and freedom should emerge, is in reality designated as a *deathscape*, triggers representations of *emoscapes of death* and *genocidal ethnoscapes*. Indigenous people in the Global North and the Global South have been historically displaced, died of disease and killed by Europeans through slavery, rape, and war, while currently many continue to die in police and prison custody, in what can only be

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup>Robin Maria Delugan, 'Indigeneity across Borders: Hemispheric Migrations and Cosmopolitan Encounters', *American Ethnologist* 37, no. 1 (2010): 83-97, <a href="http://www.jstor.org/stable/40389880">http://www.jstor.org/stable/40389880</a>. <sup>17</sup> ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup>Leyland, Cecco, 'Canada discovers 751 unmarked graves at former residential school', *The Guardian*, June, 24, 2021, <a href="https://www.theguardian.com/world/2021/jun/24/canada-school-graves-discovery-saskatchewan">https://www.theguardian.com/world/2021/jun/24/canada-school-graves-discovery-saskatchewan</a>

described as an 'Indigenous Holocaust'.<sup>19</sup> In developing affective solidarities and affective dissonance, we recognise this affective habitus of what we previously explained as an 'uncivilising eco-aesthetics' culminating with such deathscapes.

Additionally, in the second case study, while used in both religious and secular discourses, the contextualisation of 'indigeneity' into the Israeli-Palestinian conflict has enormous emotional resonance on how the scholarly conversation is taken up, of an ongoing, and devastating for humanity, conflict. As this paper is first written in the summer of 2021 (and revised in the summer of 2022), the bombing of Gaza City has stopped for now, but pain and destruction remain, as does the colonising project. In the aftermath of the recent bombardment of Gaza, designed to destroy infrastructure and to make Gaza City uninhabitable, combined with the racist attacks on Palestinians in Israeli cities and the new and aggressive attempts to ethnically cleanse East Jerusalem of Palestinian residents, such are the descriptive summaries of what is happening in the world witnessing another chapter in the murderous cruelty of the colonising project. Widely unequal power and capabilities make peace an impossible achievement, and this should matter to policymakers, ironically, as Hamid 2021 suggests 'whether they see Palestinians as fully deserving of rights and dignity', but, recognising the 'centrality of the occupation' and 'the basic fact of a lopsided power dynamic, in which Israel is the aggressor and Palestinians are the aggressed'. 20 As Chandler and Reid explain: 'The appropriation and occupation of indigenous lands, the dispossession of indigenous peoples, including notably, but not exclusively, the Palestinians, has led not simply to arguments for the return of those

\_\_\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup>David E. Stannard, *American Holocaust: Columbus and the Conquest of the New World* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup>Hamid, Shadi, 'Don't Take the Narrow View of What's Happenning in Gaza: Wars and skirmishes don't occur in a vaccum', *The Atlantic*, 15 May 2021: <a href="https://www.theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2021/05/israel-palestine-gaza-hamas-history/618896/">https://www.theatlantic.com/ideas/archive/2021/05/israel-palestine-gaza-hamas-history/618896/</a>

lands to their original owners but also to the articulation of the experience and condition of dispossession itself as a basis on which to theorize political subjectivity'. <sup>21</sup>

The political metaphor of settler colonialism in analysing the implications of Israeli state violence refers to the political struggles and goals for Palestinians as indigenous peoples and the actualisation of their full belonging within the nation-state. <sup>22</sup> In this context, the meaning of indigeneity and self-determination for the Palestinian peoplehood is inextricably linked to how engaging with indigenous struggles is a pathway to peace. At the same time, the culturalisation of indigeneity, (e.g. in international indigenous rights law and in the production of Bedouin indigeneity), puts at risk and compromises long-term claims against settler colonialism of indigenous peoples to land. This happens by conditioning them upon the perpetual practice of 'authentic' culture, operating as an essentialising and racialising instrument subjectivising the reproduction of settler colonialism racialising logics and racial imageries of indigenous peoples. <sup>23</sup> The central question for scholarship and committed liberatory movements is an arrival at a praxis that brings back decolonisation and liberation as the imperative goal. Specifically, in the case of Palestine, it translates to a reiteration of the Palestinian peoplehood as an indigenous people, while aligning scholarship in this domain with indigenous and native studies. <sup>24</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup>David Chandler and Julian Reid, "Being in Being": Contesting the Ontopolitics of Indigeneity', *The European Legacy*, 23, no 3, (2018): 254, DOI: 10.1080/10848770.2017.1420284

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Mark Rifkin, 'Indigeneity, Apartheid, Palestine: On the Transit of Political Metaphors', *Cultural Critique*, 95 (2017): 25-70. doi:10.5749/culturalcritique.95.2017.0025.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup>Lana Tatour, 'The culturalisation of indigeneity: the Palestinian-Bedouin of the Naqab and indigenous rights', *The International Journal of Human Rights*, 23, no 10 (2019): 1569-1593, DOI: 10.1080/13642987.2019.1609454

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup>Omar Jabary Salamanca, et al., 'Past is Present: Settler Colonialism in Palestine', *Settler Colonial Studies*, 2, no 1(2012): 1-8, DOI: <u>10.1080/2201473X.2012.10648823</u>; Ilan Pappe,

As such, Israel's occupation of Palestine as an exemplary settler colonial project and one embedded in the early framing of Zionism unfolds in the logics of theorists of settler colonialism.<sup>25</sup> The biopolitics of settler colonialism require that we trouble both the politics and the epistemologies of those logics, in thinking through, beyond, and with, new histories after the postcolonial temporality.<sup>26</sup> The continuity of ongoing suffering underscores an affective habitus of trauma and how cultural productions remain complicit with such proliferating settlement. This is manifested in everyday practices and scholarly projects, as Rowe and Tuck indicate, the political stakes and complicity in Indigenous erasure and anti-Blackness of, for example, cultural studies and other intellectual projects, such as: queer studies, feminist studies and critical race studies.<sup>27</sup> This is what I term a 'double dis/possession' as the incommensurability (from a philosophy of science perspective) of epistemic modalities of racialised knowledge navigate through the historical geographies of the academic habitus by norms of whiteness. This analytical navigation is important in how the geo-politics of knowledge production are buffered through discourses of 'post-racial' societies and decolonising curricula in historically white universities. Although beyond the scope of this paper, more controversial instances of the rationalisation of redundancies of academics on the basis of 'decolonising curricula' or censorship of particular research critical of the politics of state violence in Israel, not only render marginalised and devalued particular scholarship, but

<sup>&#</sup>x27;Indigeneity as Cultural Resistance: Notes on the Palestinian Struggle within Twenty-First-Century Israel', *South Atlantic Quarterly* 117, no 1 (2018): 157–178. doi: <a href="https://doi.org/10.1215/00382876-4282082">https://doi.org/10.1215/00382876-4282082</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup>David Lloyd, 'Settler Colonialism and the State of Exception: The Example of Palestine/Israel', Settler Colonial Studies, 2, no 1, (2012): 59-80, DOI: 10.1080/2201473X.2012.10648826

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup>Jane Carey and Ben Silverstein, 'Thinking with and beyond settler colonial studies: new histories after the postcolonial', *Postcolonial Studies*, 23, no 1, (2020): 1-20, DOI: 10.1080/13688790.2020.1719569

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup>Aimee Carillo Rowe and Eve Tuck, 'Settler Colonialism and Cultural Studies: Ongoing Settlement, Cultural Production, and Resistance', *Cultural Studies* ↔ *Critical Methodologies*.17, no 1 (2017):3-13. doi:10.1177/1532708616653693

more alarmingly, the epistemic entitlement within academic communities generates dangerous new double dis/possessions through zones of non-being.

Thus, returning to the key concept connections (linking emotions and mobilities) in the case studies, it is important to remember that extending from the spatial turn, the new mobilities paradigm expanded theorisations of *space* and when linked to *time*, offers a platform for relational *emotional mobilities*. While the corpus of mobilities literature (developing over the last fifteen years) has contributed a multifaceted set of conceptualisations on varying kinds of mobilities from corporeal to digital to travel movements, there is a relatively new acknowledgement of how mundane, ordinary and everyday life mobility shapes and is shaped by social practices, the temporal imprints of the life course, and, the unfolding spatial social relations in each phase of public and private life.<sup>28</sup> Timespace provides a broad spectrum for mobilities to showcase how particular rhythms of daily lives engage with spatialities and temporalities across international boundaries, national borders and transnational communities.<sup>29</sup>

Furthermore, the migration and mobilities work can find conceptual depth when situated within relational theories of personal life and emotion, so the complexities of identities, values and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup>James Faulconbridge and Allison Hui, 'Traces of a Mobile Field: Ten Years of Mobilities Research', *Mobilities* 11, no 1(2016): 1-14, DOI: 10.1080/17450101.2015.1103534

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup>Mimi Sheller, 'From spatial turn to mobilities turn', *Current Sociology* no 4 (2017): 623-639. DOI:10.1177/0011392117697463; Kirsty Finn, 'Multiple, relational and emotional mobilities: Understanding student mobilities in higher education as more than "staying local" and "going away", *British Educational Research Journal*, 43 (2017): 743-758. https://doi.org/10.1002/berj.3287; James Faulconbridge and Allison Hui, 'Traces of a Mobile Field: Ten Years of Mobilities Research', *Mobilities* 11, no 1(2016): 1-14, DOI: 10.1080/17450101.2015.1103534; John Urry, *Mobilities* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2007); Elizabeth Mavroudi, Ben Page and Anastasia Christou, eds. *Timespace and international migration*, (Edward Elgar, Cheltenham, UK, 2017).

relationships can be understood in becoming central to making sense of how we engage in the experiences of mobile sociality. The complexities of such dynamic relations and experiences unfold within the social and cultural spaces of personal and public lives, always infused by emotionalities that fundamentally emerge as we relate to new circumstances, others and ourselves. It is crucial to underscore how such emotional experiences play fundamental role in all aspects of personal and social lives. Incorporating sociologically the analysis of 'affective structures' and 'emotional dynamics' as objects of study makes a fourfold contribution to the discipline of a sociology of emotions, in turn advancing a number of perspectives, while integrating 'feelings', 'affects', 'moods', and 'emotional states'. Such contributions sociologically have, firstly, yielded the complexity of emotional processes; secondly, have exposed the social nature of emotions alongside the emotional nature of social phenomena; and, thirdly, have advanced a number of theorisations and emotional analyses in the development of a sociology of emotions.

As such, drawing from the case study material discussed earlier in this section, affective habitus as 'a performative repertoire imbued with affective connotations' and 'processes as acts of material consciousness which are embodied, emotional, performative and narrated accounts' and having a centrality in practices of everyday mobile lives, finds utility in connections among people, place, feelings and things, when employing subjectivities and mediations of experiences as analytical resources.<sup>30</sup> We thus *theorise* through the case studies from multiple

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup>Suruchi Thapar-Björkert and Fataneh Farahani, 'Epistemic modalities of racialised knowledge production in the Swedish academy', *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 42, no 16, (2019): 214-232, DOI: 10.1080/01419870.2019.1649440; Alex Regan, 'Anger at University of Leicester's "decolonised curriculum" plans', *BBC News*, 4 February, 2021, <a href="https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-leicestershire-55860810">https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-leicestershire-55860810</a>; Malia Bouattia, 'A war is being waged against academic freedom in Britain: The accusations of anti-Semitism against David Miller aim to silence pro-Palestinian voices on university campuses', *Aljazeera*, 28 February, 2021, <a href="https://www.aljazeera.com/opinions/2021/2/28/a-war-is-being-waged-against-academic-freedom-in-britain;">https://woftcensurepledge.wordpress.com/</a>; Ramon

locations, multi-layered positionalities and complex contexts. At the same time, when deploying the empirical significance of emoscapes and ethnoscapes of indigeneity for transformative knowledge production, it is significant to embrace the *analytical and political tools* of how intersectional inequities are imbued in such conversations. In saving social justice theorisations of indigenous and refugees populations from 'ornamental' perspectives, we have to be open to conceptualisations shaped by voices of social actors who are multiply minoritised.<sup>31</sup>

Multiple minoritisations (e.g. who is worthy to be a citizen or who is legitimised to be indigenous to a land to claim that citizenship) lead to multiple marginalisations and such interlocking oppressions amplify the impact of injustice and the adverse emotionalities it produces for participants and researchers as an emotional burden and crucial stage of data analysis.<sup>32</sup> The latter has implications beyond how we theorise such a research agenda, to how we can sustain the *burden* (emotional labour) of such research, as to do so is in a sense a validation of the reproduction, even the proliferation of such phenomena. Yet, if we theorise modalities and emotionalities of intersectional indigenous inequities as phenomena of double dis/possessions in epistemic and social terms, and as such, exacerbating an affective habitus of

Grosfoguel, et al., "Racism', intersectionality and migration studies: framing some theoretical reflections", *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power*, 22, no 6 (2015): 635-652, DOI: 10.1080/1070289X.2014.950974; Anastasia Christou and Hania Janta, 'The significance of things: Objects, emotions and cultural production in migrant women's return visits home', *The Sociological Review*, 67 no 3, (2019):654-671. doi:10.1177/0038026118816906

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup>Sirma Bilge, 'Intersectionality Undone: Saving Intersectionality From Feminist Intersectionality Studies', *Du Bois Review* 10, no 2 (2013): 405–424.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup>Kali Cyrus, 'Multiple minorities as multiply marginalized: Applying the minority stress theory to LGBTQ people of color', *Journal of Gay & Lesbian Mental Health*, 21, no 3 (2017):194–202. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/19359705.2017.1320739">https://doi.org/10.1080/19359705.2017.1320739</a>; Ava Kanyeredzi, 'Feeling 'like a minority . . . a pathology': interpreting race from research with African and Caribbean women on violence and abuse', *Qualitative Research*. 19, no 4 (2019): 399-417, doi:10.1177/1468794118777921

uncivilising eco-aesthetics, then in our scholarship we make further visible the seriousness of social (policy) responsibility and the liability that inactivity will have for peace and humanity.

Thus, this paper brings together in an interdisciplinary dialogue literatures on historical geographies of intersectional inequalities to frame an analysis of bodies of work on emotions, timespaces and modalities of habitus in the lives of mobile and indigenous populations. The core objective of the analysis, drawing on the earlier case study empirical exemplifications, has been to theorise ways emotion can be conceptualised in mobilities and indigenous research, while operationalising historical and social time, in situating mobilities with inequalities and intersectionalities. It is important however, to understand the boundaries of the analytical endeavour here: when it comes to the nation/state and power, affectivity and emotions have been examined from a number of angles that produce understandings of 'affective citizenship'. This requires attention to how feelings attach themselves to citizenship, and to how citizenship itself can evoke certain feelings which do not occur 'naturally' but require research into the dynamics of agency, disciplining power and those resisting social subjects of such power. These include, affective dynamics in protest movements, and, 'caretizenship' as a community of practice that develops through forged times of caring relationships within contexts of vulnerability, among migrant and non-migrant populations.<sup>33</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup>Anne-Marie Fortier, 'Afterword: acts of affective citizenship? Possibilities and limitations', Citizenship Studies, 20(2016): 1038-1044, doi: 10.1080/13621025.2016.1229190; James M. Jasper, 'Constructing Indignation: **Dynamics** Protest Movements', Emotion Review. 6(2014):208-213. Anger in doi:10.1177/1754073914522863; Eduardo Bericat, 'The Sociology of Emotions: Four Decades of Progress', Current Sociology, 64, no 3 (2016):491-513. doi:10.1177/0011392115588355; Sylvia Walby, et al., 'Intersectionality: Multiple Inequalities in Social Theory', Sociology, 46, no 2 (2012):224-240. doi:10.1177/0038038511416164; Anne-Marie Fortier, 'Afterword: acts of affective citizenship? Possibilities and limitations', Citizenship Studies, 20(2016): 1038-1044, doi: 10.1080/13621025.2016.1229190; James M. Jasper, 'Constructing Indignation: Movements', Emotion **Dynamics** Protest Review. 6(2014):208-213. doi:10.1177/1754073914522863; Maribel Casas-Cortes, 'Care-tizenship: precarity, social movements, and the deleting/re-writing of citizenship', Citizenship Studies, 23(2019): 19-42, doi: 10.1080/13621025.2018.1556248

Another central insight here, is that conceptually, there is always a need to problematise and situate in our research the terms of 'migrant', 'asylum seeker', 'refugee', 'returnee', 'transnational', 'diasporic', 'mobile' and 'indigenous', in relation to individuals and groups. In this paper, the adoption of the term 'migrant' and 'indigenous' is a methodological decision to denote 'migrancy' and 'indigeneity' as a *social space* encompassing: identity processes, personal capacities and group capabilities when the governance, politics, practicalities and everyday negotiations with families, nation-states, policies, civil society institutions are engaged by those who have been affected by *mobile* and *settler colonialism* phenomena in shaping aspects of their lifeworlds.

Apart from research participants self-identifying as migrants and/or indigenous at the spatiotemporal crossroads of the research and data collection, specific acts and circumstances in their lives (e.g. forced or protracted displacement due to conflict, environmental, political etc. causes; independent mobility choices, etc.) can also categorise them as asylum seekers, refugees, returnees, transnationals and diasporans when they either choose or are forced to move across borders. Here, there is agreement with Tazzioli in avoiding prescriptive definitions: 'That is, on the one hand the question "who is a migrant?" can never be answered once for all and the putative answer will always depend on "where" and "when"; yet, on the other hand, the lives of those who are racialised and governed "here and now" as "migrants" or as "underserving refugees" are daily affected and obstructed by those laws and policies'. So, the intention is not to conflate 'migrant' or 'indigenous' with degrees of agency or layers of power and exclusions, as these will be particular to each group, individual and even changeable according to circumstances, opportunities and lack thereof. It is also beyond the scope of the paper to provide a terminological typology or to assert representation of groups and experiences. On the contrary, the paper is eclectic in showcasing less known case studies,

geographies, histories and societies in shedding a light on the hidden matrices of emotionalities and mobilities. The conceptual links of settler colonialism with affective habitus endeavours to bridge the cultural politics of emotional mobilities with indigeneity. Finally, it is important to recognise that gendered and intersectional approaches to indigeneity offer insights on identities and communities while maintaining a critical focus on power. This because any methodological starting point should be from the margins and not the centre, the focal attention to plural social positioning and cultural interfaces.<sup>34</sup>

Overall, in maintaining an interdisciplinary analysis of how mobilities and emotionalities can offer productive possibilities to theorise intersectional insights, inequalities and identities, it is important to situate how some of these key terms are conceptualised in this paper, such as, affect, emotion, mobility, embodiment, intersectionality, identity, inequality. This is not intended as a historical conceptual trajectory, but more so as an exercise to distil the initial nodes of how these concepts are operationalised in a number of research studies. We see the theoretical formulations advanced in this section as emerging within these dialogues.

The insertion of embodiment here reflects a growing corpus of research where bodily sensations shape emotions which are in a circular interaction with affectivities/affordances in the social, environmental and subjective resonance, so much so that motion/movement and emotion are connected. These inter-affectivities of embodied and social understandings are

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup>Martina Tazzioli, 'Excavating the genealogies of struggles and of the migrant mob', *Dialogues in Human Geography*. 11(2021):523-526. doi:10.1177/2043820621989596; Tabar, Linda and Chandni Desai, 'Decolonization is a global project: From Palestine to the Americas', *Decolonization: Indigeneity, Education & Society*, 6 (2017): i-xix; Lila Abu-Lughod, 'Imagining Palestine's Alter-Natives: Settler Colonialism and Museum Politics', *Critical Inquiry*, 47(2020):1-27, doi: <a href="https://doi.org/10.1086/710906">https://doi.org/10.1086/710906</a>; Torjer A. Olsen, 'This Word is (Not?) Very Exciting: Considering Intersectionality in Indigenous Studies', *NORA–Nordic Journal of Feminist and Gender Research*, 26(2018): 182-196, DOI: 10.1080/08038740.2018.1493534

considerations to how identities are shaped by affective and embodied affordances. And, it is from a social constructionist view of identities that we understand them as historically and culturally contingent, as well as shaped by power, fluid, situational, communicative and operative across space and time when we question 'who is the Palestinian', 'who is the indigenous', etc.

By placing emotion at a central analytical node in the context of intersubjective and unequal identity construction, emphatically mediated by feelings in social relations, we can understand affect as the 'how of emotions' and the communicative and literal conduit, the 'motion of emotion'. Migrants as emotional social subjects negotiate identities through social relations, their place in the world and the cultural politics, discourses, psychosocial narratives and the relationality of intersubjectivities. The cultural politics of emotion become political affectivities also in feminist theorisations with encounters with 'the Other' and when othering occurs in social contexts for particular social subjects such as the Palestinian, the indigenous and the refugee. Such understandings on the politics of emotion, as including works on feelings, sensibilities, passions and affect, are important methodological and theoretical tools to develop affective solidarities, affective feminisms and affective dissonance in the experiences highlighted in the case studies.<sup>35</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup>Thomas Fuchs and Sabine C. Koch, 'Embodied affectivity: on moving and being moved', Frontiers in Psychology, 5, no 508 (2014), doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2014.00508; Deborah Thien, 'After or beyond Feeling? A Consideration of Affect and Emotion in Geography', Area, 37, no. 4 (2005): 450-54. <a href="http://www.jstor.org/stable/20004485">http://www.jstor.org/stable/20004485</a>; Sara Ahmed, The Cultural Politics of Emotion (Edinburgh/New York: Edinburgh University Press/Routledge, 2004); Anastasia Christou, 'Narrating lives in (e)motion: Embodiment and belongingness in diasporic spaces of home and return', Emotion, Space and Society, 4, (2011): 249-257; Carolyn Pedwell and Anne Whitehead, 'Affecting feminism: Questions of feeling in feminist theory', Feminist Theory, 13, no 2 (2012):115-129. doi: 10.1177/1464700112442635; Clare Hemmings and Amal Treacher Kabesh, "'The Feminist Subject of Agency: Recognition and Affect in Encounters with 'the Other'", in Gender, Agency, and Coercion. Thinking Gender in Transnational Times, eds. Samantha Madhok et al. (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), 29-46; Linda Ahäll, 'Affect as Methodology: Feminism and the Politics of Emotion', International Political Sociology, (2018) doi: 10.1093/ips/olx024; Christiana Karayianni and Anastasia Christou, 'Feminisms, Gender and Social Media: Public and Political Performativities

In other research for instance, with young people on emotional relationships and embodiment of habitus, Holt et al. combine Bourdieu and Butler to substitute for theoretical shortcomings to address some limitations as a conceptual launch-pad examining (conflictual, unequal, problematic, yet) emotionally reciprocal relationships to the development of habitus. Indeed, other researchers have also enhanced Bourdieu's concept of habitus through intergenerational relational insights when considering conflictual conscious and unconscious processes emerging in relationships.<sup>36</sup> In this direction, more psychosocial, relational and object psychoanalytic theories can offer depth to understandings of agency and change. Within a system of meaning-making we make sense of emotions as going through the world affecting and being affected by the encounters we have in our personalised embodied expressions. The notion of affect as a potentiality is conceptually and politically important in bringing about social change in the form of social justice.<sup>37</sup>

While research across the social sciences has explored, from a number of angles, issues of emotion and its centrality to social life and understanding of social action, a sociological lens of emotion has increasingly factored its link to politics and power and its purpose as emotional

Regarding Sexual Harassment in Cyprus', Feminist Encounters: A Journal of Critical Studies in Culture and Politics, 4, no 2 (2020): 34, https://doi.org/10.20897/femenc/8522; Clare Hemmings, 'Affective Solidarity: Feminist Reflexivity and Political Transformation', Feminist Theory, 13, no 2 (2012):147-161. doi:10.1177/1464700112442643; Anastasia Christou, 'Feminisms, Crises and Affect: Women in Academia Contemplating Publics and Performativities', Interface: a Journal for and about Social Movements, 8, no 1 (2012): 34-44; Linda Ahäll, 'Affect as Methodology: Feminism and the Politics of Emotion', International Political Sociology, (2018) doi: 10.1093/ips/olx024

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup>Louise Holt, et al., 'Emotions and the habitus: Young people with socio-emotional differences (re)producing social, emotional and cultural capital in family and leisure spacetimes', *Emotion*, *Space and Society*, 9, (2013): 33-41, <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.emospa.2013.02.002">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.emospa.2013.02.002</a>; Helene Aarseth, et al., 'Conflicts in the Habitus: The Emotional Work of Becoming Modern', *The Sociological Review*, 64, no 1 (2016):148-165. doi:10.1111/1467-954X.12347

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup>Deborah Gould, *et al.*, 'Affect and Activism: An Interview with Deborah Gould', *disClosure: A Journal of Social Theory*, 28, no 12. (2019): DOI: <a href="https://doi.org/10.13023/disclosure.28.08">https://doi.org/10.13023/disclosure.28.08</a>

capital in spheres of life such as educational contexts.<sup>38</sup> More specifically, research on second generation youth migrants in educational contexts has revealed that the entangled webs of social crises, economic austerity and political instability can exacerbate deeply emotional experiences of exclusion in higher educational institutions, where critical and feminist conceptual agendas advocate for inclusive educational citizenship and social justice policies for migrants and minoritised groups. Wider socialisation processes through gendered emotional experiences of belonging for migrant youth are emotional challenges of combined contestation, creativity, hope and change. This is clearly illustrated in cases of second and subsequent migrant generations that often have to straddle the conflictual spaces of ethnic practices the first generation seeks to preserve that are in opposition to lifestyles in the receiving country, e.g. women migrants and freedom of choice when it comes to their bodies and sexual relationships, education and employment, etc.<sup>39</sup> While there are numerous examples from my own and wider research that illustrate these experiences within a wide spectrum of migrant descendants, what conceptually captures the interlocking systems of oppression can be referred back to both hooks through the 'white supremacist capitalist patriarchy' and Crenshaw's

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup>Jonathan G. Heaney, 'Emotions and Power: Reconciling Conceptual Twins', Journal of Political Power, 4, no 2, (2011): 259-277, DOI: 10.1080/2158379X.2011.591171; Jonathan G. Heaney, 'Emotion as Power: Capital and Strategy in the Field of Politics', Journal of 2, (2019): 224-244, DOI: 10.1080/2158379X.2019.1618485; Political *Power*, 12, no 'Emotional Capital and Education: Theoretical Insights From Michalinos Zembylas, Bourdieu', British Journal of Educational Studies, 55, no 4 (2007): 443-463, DOI: 10.1111/j.1467-8527.2007.00390.x; Anastasia Christou and Domna Michail, "A window to knowledge is a window to the world": socio-aesthetics, ethics and pedagogic migrant youth journeys in crisis-shaped educational settings in Greece', Discourse: Studies in the Cultural **Politics** Education, 42, 2 (2021): 308no 322, DOI: 10.1080/01596306.2019.1636210

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup>Anastasia Christou and Domna Michail, "'A window to knowledge is a window to the world": socio-aesthetics, ethics and pedagogic migrant youth journeys in crisis-shaped educational settings in Greece', *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 42, no 2 (2021): 308; Domna Michail and Anastasia Christou, 'Diasporic youth identities of uncertainty and hope: second-generation Albanian experiences of transnational mobility in an era of economic crisis in Greece', *Journal of Youth Studies*, 19, no 7, (2016): 957-972, DOI: 10.1080/13676261.2015.1136052

'intersectionality' as a term to reflect the entangled relations of sexisms, patriarchies and racialised oppressions, as well as, a critique to any essentialist approaches to the experiences of women, who should not be treated as a homogenous group.<sup>40</sup>

But, more fragile contexts of social crises such as those in Palestine and indigenous geographies can also become an emotional trope and symbolic signifier of a social morphology of inequalities for migrant youth when identities, values and aspirations are shaped by affectivities of dispossession and austerity. Finally, it is important to encourage scholarly conversations on transnational mobilities from the angles of gender and race, but also, from an intersectional perspective in how power geometries articulated through sexisms and racisms are challenged in a migration and minority context. These glimpses are imperative in acknowledging the historical present as affectively understood in the face of precarity, contingency and crisis in modes of temporality and the cruel optimisms of ordinariness to those traumas.<sup>41</sup>

# Concluding reflections: theorising a research agenda of (e)motions and modalities of mobilities

In the previous empirical section on 'emoscapes and ethnoscapes' key concepts and theoretical framings were unpacked while linking to the case study material on indigeneity and ethno-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup>Tania Golash-Boza, et al., 'White Supremacy, Patriarchy, and Global Capitalism in Migration Studies', *American Behavioral Scientist*.63(2019):1741-1759. doi:10.1177/0002764219842624; bell hooks, *Feminist Theory: From Margin to Center*, (London: Pluto Press, 1984/2000); Kimberlé, Crenshaw, 'Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Color', *Stanford Law Review* 43(1991): 1241–99.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup>Anastasia Christou, 'The "Wretched of Europe": Greece and the Cultural Politics of Inequality', *Humanity & Society*, 42, no 1 (2018):102-127. doi:10.1177/0160597616664169; Laura Oso, Ramon Grosfoguel, Anastasia Christou, *Interrogating Intersectionalities*, *Gendering Mobilities*, *Racializing Transnationalism* (London: Routledge, 2017); Lauren Berlant, *Cruel Optimism* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2011).

nationalisms as 'affective habitus'. This conclusion brings together the contributions of the paper and draws some key insights for future research.

Through the empirical case studies, the *central question* addressed in this paper has explored how we can *theorise emotion in mobilities research while operationalising historical and social time*. As a *unifying argument* of this piece, the *importance of bringing in timespace* in developing theoretical tools to understand emotions in mobilities research has been demonstrated in case studies situating 'indigeneity'. This paper grapples with a conceptual and theoretical terrain that illuminates debates on emotions and mobilities. It has done so through charting how further explorations into the diverse affectivities of spatialities and temporalities of mobility, centred on questions of inequity and intersectionality, can significantly advance scholarly debates within interdisciplinary dialogues.

Modalities of (e)motions and the politics of im/mobility can chart a strong theoretical framing of research agendas for a 'live sociology' in social research and its futures. <sup>42</sup> This reflects the urgency to expand research into how migrants (and citizens alike) are governed by and through affect. <sup>43</sup> This urgency is interconnected to research on *affective neoliberalism* and the engagement of emotions in the governmentality of social subjects and institutions. For instance, these points link well with wider issues of affectivity and trauma, in what can be termed, a turning point for public emotional discourses during a historical moment which for the UK can be characterised as a 'Brexistenial' crisis. <sup>44</sup> Both migration and the trauma of Brexit, further dividing social relations in the UK, are phenomena which require attention to how affect is as

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup>Les Back, 'Live sociology: social research and its futures', *The Sociological Review*, 60, (2012): 18-39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup>Anne-Marie D'Aoust, 'Ties that Bind? Engaging Emotions, Governmentality and Neoliberalism: Introduction to the Special Issue', *Global Society*, 28, no 3 (2014):267-276.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup>Colin Hay, 'Brexistential Angst and the Paradoxes of Populism: On the Contingency, Predictability and Intelligibility of Seismic Shifts', *Political Studies*, 68, no 1 (2020):187-206.

much an explanatory device, as it is an analytical signifier, for understanding these publics. Making robust and nuanced links between history, public discourses and personal experiences in understanding how emotions shape these figurations underscores the potentialities of 'affective habitus'.<sup>45</sup>

The continuing importance of the politics of mobility requires a greater consideration of the mobility of ideas and not just that of people and objects. The conceptualisation of such mobilities requires depth of consideration of the modalities I have engaged with in this paper. A research agenda with, and, for social justice, is one that recognises the importance of affective and feminist solidarity as affordances for knowledge co-production, and that indigenising and decolonising Academia is a global project. The inclusion of indigenous knowledges and research methodologies sheds light on the genealogy of Indigenous studies, while for scholars of emotion, history and society, viewing indigenous people as active agents in time and space, with their own complex narratives and liberation projects is a recognition of social responsibility. The inclusion of the projects is a recognition of social responsibility.

This paper has engaged with the politics, geographies and histories of emotion as affective dissonance and the discrepancy between actualising change and the possibility of an ethics of solidarity and social responsibility. With the emotional resonance of how 'emoscapes' and 'ethnoscapes' figure in the case study material, the notion of affect can become both

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup>Anastasia Christou and Hania Janta, 'The significance of things: Objects, emotions and cultural production in migrant women's return visits home', *The Sociological Review*, 67 no 3, (2019):654-671. doi:10.1177/0038026118816906

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup>Tim Cresswell, 'Mobilities II: Still', *Progress in Human Geography*. 36, no 5 (2012):645-653. doi:10.1177/0309132511423349

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup>Pirjo Kristiina Virtanen, et al., 'Contemporary Indigenous Research within Sámi and Global Indigenous Studies Contexts', in *Indigenous Research Methodologies in Sámi and Global Contexts*. Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill (2021) (p.7-32). doi: <a href="https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004463097\_002">https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004463097\_002</a>

conceptually and politically important in bringing social change, global citizenship and belonging as ethical inclusivity for the marginalised, minoritised and dispossessed in experiences of indigeneity. Anything else, renders socio-temporal modalities of indigeneity within a context of what this paper theorised as 'uncivilising eco-aesthetics'; reproduced through the double dis/possessions of our epistemic and social racialisations.

Remarkably, international relations scholars are only recently increasingly paying attention to the 'emotional' as a pathway to the understanding of global politics, while also missing the feminist knowledge on affect and discussions about feminist methodologies. Such feminist knowledge on affect offers opportunities to 're-tune, reset, and reimagine research on the politics of emotion'. The interconnected tools of emotion, feminist and indigenous methodologies can further nuance the conceptualisations of how local, global and transnational social justice and mobilities research as spheres of emotional practices require the unpacking of affect as a *feminist* question. Indeed, it is the fact that synergies between feminist approaches in their scholarly critiques of white settler western thinking, as seen in critical projects of anticolonial and postcolonial nationalisms, and those with Indigenous, Black, Global South feminisms have produced decolonial and transnational feminisms as alliances of scholarship in gender and sexualities research. 49

The political affectivities as shaped by critical geographies of indigeneity are relational, deeply historical and interrelated with questions of subjectivity, power and identity. This engagement with how oppression and indigenous ontologies can theorise the colonial present of settler

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup>Linda Åhäll, 'Affect as Methodology: Feminism and the Politics of Emotion', *International Political Sociology*, 12, no 1 (2018): 36–52, <a href="https://doi.org/10.1093/ips/olx024">https://doi.org/10.1093/ips/olx024</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup>Scott Lauria Morgensen, 'Theorising Gender, Sexuality and Settler Colonialism: An Introduction', *Settler Colonial Studies*, 2, no 2 (2012): 2-22, DOI: 10.1080/2201473X.2012.10648839

power offers accounts to rethink 'the always-inproduction-and-spacing dynamic of power and difference signalled by Indigenousness and a critical vantage point on dominant narratives around the nation-state, humanitarianism, postcolonial subalterns, and the more-than human'. <sup>50</sup>

It is inevitable that a project of affective politics should embrace 'a social cartography of responses to the violences of modernity' in mapping interpretative framings of decolonising pedagogies.<sup>51</sup> This requires refusing engagement with normative knowledge and instead advancing engagement with feeling. These are encounters with the politics of discomforting with difficult subjects, such as those of violent settler colonialisms, and engaging with emotional memories and productive possibilities that affective indigeneity can offer. The embodiments, subjectivities and social positionalities of indigeneity in temporal and spatial framings epistemically produce relations of power at varying scales through analyses of intersectional hierarchies and differing agencies.<sup>52</sup> The striking conceptual multi-dimensionality of such theorising is in unsettling and disrupting embodied identities and practices with the reading of theoretical starting points that inform such analyses. These involve efforts through entangled emotionalities within assemblages and figurations of dynamics of politics, personhood and performativities.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup>Sarah A. Radcliffe, 'Geography and indigeneity I: Indigeneity, coloniality and knowledge', *Progress in Human Geography*, 41, no 2 (2017): 225-226. doi:10.1177/0309132515612952 
<sup>51</sup>Vanessa de Oliveira Andreotti, *et al.*, 'Mapping interpretations of decolonization in the context of higher education', *Decolonization: Indigeneity, Education & Society*, 4, no 1 (2015): 21–40; Anastasia Christou, 'Feminisms, crises and affect: women in academia contemplating publics and performativities', *Interface: a Journal for and about Social Movements*, 8, no 1 (2016): 34-44; Anastasia Christou and Domna Michail , "'A window to knowledge is a window to the world': socio-aesthetics, ethics and pedagogic migrant youth journeys in crisis-shaped educational settings in Greece', *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 42, no 2 (2021): 308.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup>Christy Guthrie, 'How does it feel: On emotional memory and difficult knowledge in education', *Curriculum Inquiry*, 46, no 5, (2016): 427-435, DOI: 10.1080/03626784.2016.1254415; Sarah A. Radcliffe, 'Geography and indigeneity II: Critical geographies of indigenous bodily politics', *Progress in Human Geography*, 42, no 3, (2018): 436-445. doi:10.1177/0309132517691631

## Acknowledgements

I gratefully acknowledge the opportunity to finalise this paper during the first year of my appointment as Honorary Associate Professor by The Australian National University, Humanities Research Centre, while I appreciate the support of the Head and Director, Australasian Consortium of Humanities Research Centres, Professor Kylie Message.