IEEE P802.11
Wireless LANs

LB272 CR for OST CIDs (11.55.1.1 Overview)

Date: 2023-05-09

Author(s):

Name	Affiliation	Address	Phone	email
Stephan Sand	German Aerospace Center (DLR)			stephan.sand@ieee.org

Abstract

This submission discusses resolutions to the following 15 CIDs from LB272 of TGbf D1.0.
The CID list is:
1027, 1057, 1060, 1061, 1062, 1064, 1175, 1176, 1342, 1520, 1703, 1704, 1942, 1962, 1963

Proposed changes in this document are with reference to TGbf D1.0.

Revisions:
- Rev 0: Intitial version of the document

Proposed comment resolution
<mark>Presented and discussed, no open discussion points</mark>
<mark>Under discussion</mark>

CID	Cat	Page	Comment	Proposed Change	Resolution
1520	T	167.14	No need for the word 'first' in this paragraph. It may be interpreted that there is 'second', 'third' or 'last' where there is not.	Remove the word 'first'	Accepted
1942	E	167.17	First "Sensing" should be lower case, and ":" is not necessary in the following text "with termination frame exchanges: Sensing measurement setup termination and sensing session termination."	Change text to read: "with termination frame exchanges sensing measurement setup termination and sensing session termination."	Revised Agree with comment and changes due to CID resolution 1330 in 23/0477r3 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0477-03-00bf-lb272-sensing-session.docx) need to be accounted for See also CID 1027 **TGbf Editor:** Please change "Sensing measurement setup termination" to "sensing measurement setup termination".
1027	E	167.18	Use lower case for sensing in " ... with termination frame exchanges: Sensing measurement setup termination ..."	As in comment	Revised Agree with comment and changes due to CID resolution 1330 in 23/0477r3 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0477-03-00bf-lb272-sensing-session.docx) need to be accounted for See also CID resolution 1942
1057	T	167.20	Sensing session setup does not result in an "agreement... to participate in a WLAN sensing procedure". Instead, it is simply a capabilities exchange - as defined in 170.38-41.	Replace the first sentence of the paragraph with the following text that is aligned with 170.38-41: "In the sensing session setup, sensing capabilities are exchanged between an AP and a non-AP STA."	Revised Changes due to CID resolution 1330 in 23/0477r3 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0477-03-00bf-lb272-sensing-session.docx) deleted this sentence.

1342	T	167.20	"A sensing session is an agreement between an AP and a non-AP STA" Couldn't the sensing session be an agreement between an AP and a number of non-AP stations which is more efficient in terms of protocol overhead and may better refelect the most of the sensing scenarios.	As in comment	Revised Changes due to CID resolution 1330 in 23/0477r3 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0477-03-00bf-lb272-sensing-session.docx) deleted this sentence.
1060	T	167.27	Sentence doesn't read well, mention of the implicit termination case is vague.	Replace sentence with "A sensing measurement setup is active until either explicitly terminated in a sensing measurement setup termination or implicitly terminated with the expiration of a measurement setup expiry timer (see 11.55.1.6 (Sensing Measurement setup termination))."	Revised Agree with comment. See also CID resolution 1703 **TGbf Editor:** Please replace sentence with "A sensing measurement setup shall be active until either explicitly terminated in a sensing measurement setup termination or implicitly terminated with the expiration of a measurement setup expiry timer (see 11.55.1.6 (Sensing measurement setup termination))."
1703	T	167.28	Change the text "A sensing measurement setup is active until either explicitly" to	A sensing measurement setup shall be active until either explicitly	Accepted

1061	T	167.30	Mix of non-normative ("sensing session is terminated") and normative ("setups shall be terminated automatically") text.	Replace sentence with: "In the sensing session termination, a sensing session, and all of its associated sensing measurement setups, is terminated (see 11.55.1.7 (Sensing session termination))." Leave normative statements to 11.55.1.7.	Revised Changes due to CID resolution 1330 in 23/0477r3 (https://mentor.ieee.org/802.11/dcn/23/11-23-0477-03-00bf-lb272-sensing-session.docx) deleted this sentence.
1176	E	167.34	The sentence is hard to understand. A STA acting as a sensing initiator may participate in a sensing measurement instance as a sensing transmitter, a sensing receiver, both a sensing transmitter and a sensing receiver, or neither a sensing transmitter nor a sensing receiver.	I suggest to separate this sentence and combine with the note. A STA acting as a sensing initiator participate in a sensing measurement instance as a sensing transmitter, a sensing receiver, or both a sensing transmitter and a sensing receiver A STA acting as a sensing initiator may choose not to participate in a sensing measurement instance as a sensing transmitter nor sensing receiver, but may still initiate the WLAN sensing procedure and optionally obtain sensing measurement reports.	Revised In principle agree with comment. See also CID resolutions 1963 and 1962

1963	T	167.39 addressing 167.34-38	"A STA acting as sensing initiator" -- a sensing initiator is a STA (per definition) so the "STA acting" part is unecessary. The participation possibilities are clearer if we repeat "as" with each permutation.	Change to "A sensing initiator may participate in a sensing measurement instance as a sensing transmitter, as a sensing receiver, as both a sensing transmitter and sensing receiver, or as neither a sensing transmitter nor a sensing receiver. A sensing responder may participate in a sensing measurement instance as a sensing transmitter, as a sensing receiver, or as both a sensing transmitter and a sensing receiver."	Accepted
1175	E	167.36	A STA acting as a sensing responder "may" participate in a sensing measurement instance as a sensing transmitter, a sensing receiver, or both a sensing transmitter and a sensing receiver. The "may" here sounds like the sensing responder can also choose not to participate.	remove "may"	Rejected According to IEEE SA Standards Style Manual: "The word *may* is used to indicate a course of action permissible within the limits of the standard (*may* equals *is permitted to*)" See also CID resolution 1963
1062	E	167.39	Letter a missing	Replace with "... as a sensing transmitter nor a sensing receiver..."	Revised In principle agree with comment. See also CID resolution 1962.

1704	T	167.39	Change the text "A sensing initiator may choose not to participate" to	"A sensing initiator can choose not to participate" since it is part of a NOTE	Revised In principle agree with comment. See also CID resolution 1962.
1962	T	167.39	Notes are informative and must avoid using normative verbs. Also, inappropriate use of "nor". Finally, is transmitting and receiving is not a necessary condition for particiation so we need another verb to describe role the STA uses when participating.	"A sensing initiator that does not act as a sensing transmitter or sensing receiver in a sensing measurement instance might still obtain sensing measurement reports for that sensing measurement instance."	Accepted
1064	E	167.49	Choice of words	Replace "During a WLAN sensing procedure..." with "In a WLAN sensing procedure..."	Accepted

Straw Poll

Do you support the resolution of the following 15 CIDs and instruct TGbf editor to incorporate the changes into the latest TGbf draft: 1027, 1057, 1060, 1061, 1062, 1064, 1175, 1176, 1342, 1520, 1703, 1704, 1942, 1962, 1963?

Y/N/A