

2023

Buddhas' Respect for the dhamma – a commentarial exposition

Bhikkhu Gyanabodhi (Sajal Barua)
International Buddhist College, Thailand

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.linfield.edu/iijbs>



Part of the [Buddhist Studies Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Gyanabodhi, Bhikkhu (Sajal Barua) (2023) "Buddhas' Respect for the dhamma – a commentarial exposition," *The Indian International Journal of Buddhist Studies*: Vol. 22, Article 4.

Available at: <https://digitalcommons.linfield.edu/iijbs/vol22/iss1/4>

This Article is protected by copyright and/or related rights. It is brought to you for free via open access, courtesy of DigitalCommons@Linfield, with permission from the rights-holder(s). Your use of this Article must comply with the [Terms of Use](#) for material posted in DigitalCommons@Linfield, or with other stated terms (such as a Creative Commons license) indicated in the record and/or on the work itself. For more information, or if you have questions about permitted uses, please contact digitalcommons@linfield.edu.

Buddhas' Respect for the dhamma – a commentarial exposition

Cover Page Footnote

This article contains basically two related parts - a discussion and an original annotated translation of a section on the subject matter from the Pāli commentaries. The article deals with the subject of how exactly a Buddha honors the Dhamma and what are the activities that he carries out in his respect for the Dhamma. It also explores the intention of the commentators to bring out this particular discussion on Buddhas' respect for the Dhamma. I believe that this discussion reveals how seriously the Buddha took his duty as a Buddha in respect for the Dhamma to propagate his teaching following diverse approaches. And thus, it gives us a different understanding of the Buddha and his complete engagement to the truth (Dhamma) and inspires us to be more serious in our efforts and commitments in understanding and spreading the Dhamma for the benefit of the many.

Buddhas' Respect for the *dhamma*: A Commentarial Exposition

Bhikkhu Gyanabodhi (Sajal Barua) *

ABSTRACT

This essay points out that even though due to the development of perfect human qualities a Buddha is regarded as the supreme person (*purisottama*) and highly respected by the followers in the tradition, a Pāli commentarial exposition depicts that the Gotama Buddha placed the Dhamma above him and paid his due respect to the Dhamma. This essay explores what kind of *dhamma* a Buddha pays respect to? Why and how? It also contains an original annotated English translation of sections from a commentary and sub-commentary to the Rathavinītasutta dealing with the subject. The study is carried out following a critical and analytical approach to the discussions presented in both Pāli canonical and commentarial texts and related secondary literature. For the translation I tried to remain as literal as possible. The primary sources of my study are the Pāli Nikāya texts and their commentaries and available Pāli-English dictionaries.

Keywords

dhamma, dhammagāravatā, awakening, anatta, vimutti,
yathābhūtañāṇadassana,

* International Buddhist College, Thailand. Email: gyanabodhi@gmail.com

Introduction

In all the Buddhist traditions a Buddha holds the highest position among the sentient beings. He is considered as the supreme person (*purisottama*) possessing all necessary characteristics defining a great man (*mahāpurisa*).¹ The Pāli canon, especially the *Jātaka* literature demonstrates how the Buddha (that is, the Gotama Buddha) obtained this unique position among all beings in the world through the cultivation of perfections (*pāramitā*).² He did not only accumulate merits and wisdom to assume such a position, but also taught his followers how to achieve perfect wisdom through the realization of the true nature of existence.³ Thus he came to be known as the perfectly awakened

¹ The *Brahmāyu-sutta* of the *Majjhima-nikāya* (M II 134ff) mentions thirty-two physical endowments of the Buddha that make him a great man. However, several places in the Pāli canon a great man is so defined both due to having spiritual qualities and being freed from the negative psychological dispositions. For example, a *sutta* in the *Samyutta-nikāya* (V 158) states that a great man is someone whose mind is released (*vimutta*) from cankers (*āsava*); the Sn 199 defines a great man to be someone who is devoid of craving (*taṇhā*); and the Dh 51 describes he is one who possess great wisdom (*mahāpaññā*); for details on the qualities of the Buddha see Endo 2002.

² Regarding the presentation of the Buddha as a perfect being, Powers (2009: 131) remarks: “Throughout Indian Buddhist literature the Buddha’s body is presented as the pinnacle of human physical perfection and is testament to his perfection of wisdom, compassion, and morality. People who see him are overwhelmed by his magnificent physique and gaze at him in wonder.”

³ See, for example, D I 87-88: *Taṃ kho pana bhagavantaṃ gotamaṃ evaṃ kalyāṇo kittisaddo abbhuggato: itipi so bhagavā arahamaṃ sammāsambuddho vijjācaraṇasampanno sugato lokavidū anuttaro purisadammasārathī satthā devamanussānaṃ buddho bhagavā. So imaṃ lokaṃ sadevakaṃ samāraṃ sabrahmakaṃ sassamaṇabrāhmaṇiṃ pajamaṃ sadevamanussaṃ sayamaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā pavedeti. So dhammaṃ deseti ādikalyāṇamaṃ majjhekalyāṇamaṃ pariyosānakalyāṇamaṃ sātthamaṃ sabyañjanaṃ kevalaparipuṇṇamaṃ parisuddhamaṃ brahmacariyaṃ pakāseti. Sādhu kho pana tathārūpānaṃ arahataṃ dassanaṃ hotī ti* [A good report has been spread about Gotama, the blessed one thus: this blessed one is a worthy one, the perfectly awakened one, one endowed with knowledge and conduct, a well-gone one, the knower of the worlds, a supreme coachman of training man, a teacher of men and gods, a Buddha, a blessed one. Having himself realized he declares it (=the *dhamma*) to the world with gods, tempters, brahmas, generations of ascetics and Brahmins, and gods and men. He teaches the *dhamma* that is good in the beginning, good in the middle and good in the end with its meaning and letter; he illustrates the holy life which is fully

one (*sammā-sambuddha*), the teacher of humans and gods (*satthā devamanussānaṃ*), who was worthy (*araham*) of the highest respect. But a certain texts in the Pāli canon address that the Buddha gave more importance to the *dhamma*, the truth, to which even the Buddha himself was reverential and it is in respect to this *dhamma* that he seemed to have carried out the duty of a guide (*maggadesaka*) and a teacher (*satthā*) pointing out the paths leading to the *dhamma* ensuring complete deliverance from the cyclic existence of *saṃsāra*.

In this paper, I explore following questions to get an understanding of the idea of 'a Buddha's respect for the *dhamma*'.

- 1) What does it mean to respect the *dhamma*?
- 2) Why and how does a Buddha pay his respect to the *dhamma*?
- 3) What does the term '*dhamma*' signify in this context?

Besides, I also provide an annotated English translation of a commentarial exposition regarding the nature of Buddhas' respect for the *dhamma*.

In carrying out my study I have followed a critical and analytical approach and based myself primarily on the Pāli canonical and commentarial literatures and wherever necessary I have also consulted related secondary literature. For the translation I have consulted available Pāli-English dictionaries which I have listed in the bibliography section and I tried to remain as literal as possible.

The context

Specifically, the two texts mentioning the Buddha paying respect to the *dhamma* are the *Uruvela-sutta* of the *Aṅguttara-nikāya* (A II 20-21) and the *Gārava-sutta* of the *Samyutta-nikāya* (S I 138-140). The two *suttas* describe in similar accounts how this came

perfect and purified. It indeed is good to see such an *Arahat*.]. Among the paths of practices in the secondary literature, for the discussion on the noble eightfold path, see Bodhi (1999) and Ledi Sayadaw (2008); on the discussion of the fourfold foundation of mindfulness, see Anālayo (2003). Also see Gethin (1998) and Karunadasa (2013) for a more general discussion on the teachings and practices of Buddhism.

to be. Just after his awakening the Buddha reflects that it is unpleasant to live a life without paying respect to another (S I 138: *dukkham kho agāravo viharati appatisso...*). But he soon finds out that there is no one more accomplished in virtue and other spiritual qualities than himself that he can pay respect to. Thus, he decides to pay respect to the *dhamma* to which he is awakened.

Interestingly, apart from just stating the Buddha's noble thought of respecting the *dhamma*, neither the *suttas* nor their commentaries provide any clear exposition as to the nature of his respect for the *dhamma*. It is in the commentary to the *Majjhima-nikāya* that we find a discussion on the subject in question.

This elaboration on the topic of a Buddha's respect for the *dhamma* appears in relation to a particular incident in the *Rathavināta sutta* of the *Majjhima-nikāya*. An understanding of the incident will help us better comprehend the respectful nature of the Buddhas.

The *sutta* presents an occasion of a group of monks coming to visit the Buddha in Rājagaha from a certain place referred to as 'jātibhūmi' (birthplace) which, as per the commentary, is Kapilavatthu, the birthplace of the Buddha himself.⁴ The Buddha exchanges pleasantries with the group of monks, and enquires about their master Puṇṇa Mantāniputta. Puṇṇa Mantāniputta is highly regarded by his fellow practitioners (*sabrahmacārī*) for his attainments and dedication to the propagation of the teachings of the Buddha in Kapilavatthu.⁵

The commentary to the *sutta* raises a question as to why the Buddha, knowing that the group of monks has come from his birthplace Kapilavatthu, inquires only about their master Puṇṇa Mantāniputta, and not about his own family and relatives instead. In response to this question, the exposition provided by the commentator is that anyone who is a path-attainer (*paṭipannaka*) is dear and pleasant to the Buddhas; and that because Buddhas have regard for the *dhamma* that they inquire about such spiritually

⁴ According to the commentary (Ps II 135) the term 'jātibhūmi' should be understood as the birthplace of the Buddha alone, not of any other beings such as kings, ascetics or any of his great disciples.

⁵ M I 145ff; also see DPPN, s.v. Puṇṇa Mantāniputta.

accomplished individuals. Puṇṇa Mantāniputta clearly falls into this category of individuals. Why is the category of spiritually accomplished individuals a subject of a Buddha's interest? The answer, as per the commentary, is in the *Uruvela-sutta* and the *Garava-sutta* where a Buddha's concern for reverence and obedience is emphasized. Respecting the *dhamma* is in fact described as a general law (*dhammatā*) of the Buddhas; the Buddhas of the past have done so and the Buddhas of the future will also do the same (A II 21; S I 139-40).

The nature of Buddhas' respect for the *dhamma*

How does a Buddha pay his respect to the *dhamma*? Or what does he do in his respect for the *dhamma*?

The commentary to the *Rathavinīta-sutta* elaborates that the Buddha out of his respect for the *dhamma* had been engaged in activities that include: travelling various length of distances to assist both monastics and lay followers become established in different stages of liberation, such as 'stream entry' (*sotāpatti*), 'once return' (*sakadāgāmi*) and so on; giving company as a form of encouragement to individuals who renounce the home-life in his name; teaching *dhamma*; showing appreciation for his followers who have been vigorously carrying out the practice and/or teaching others; listening to and appreciating the talks on *dhamma* delivered by his disciples and so on (Ps II 135-137).

The commentary, for example, narrates that the Buddha, out of his regard for the *dhamma*, travelled a three hundred *yojana* path to teach and establish the elder Mahākappina and his assembly in *Arahat*-hood; he travelled a forty-five *yojana* path to help Pukkusāti, a clansman, become established in the fruition of non-returning; he travelled a two thousand *yojana* path to assist Tissa, a forest-dwelling novice (*vanavāsi-tissasāmaṇera*) in his practice. Further the Buddha approached the elder Anuruddha in the eastern bamboo forest just to appreciate his engagement in the 'thoughts of a great man' (*mahāpurisavitakka*); he accompanied the elder Mahākassapa a three *gāvuta* path (=about two miles)⁶ on the day of

⁶ In PED a *gāvuta* refers to 'a quarter of a *yojana* which is about eighty *usabhas*' or 'a little less than two miles' or 'a league'; in DOP too a *gāvuta*

his renunciation; he went to an assembly hall just to listen to a *dhamma*-talk delivered by elder Nandaka without even taking a bath (*anahāta*),⁷ when at the end of the talk elder Nandaka confessed to the Buddha for making him wait for as long as he was teaching, the Buddha said that he could listen to such a talk for an aeon if Nandaka was able to preach for an aeon.

Furthermore, while staying in a place, if the Buddha feels the goal of his propagation of *dhamma* is sufficiently achieved, he moves to a different place where he thinks he is most needed. Thus, he keeps on moving from one place to another in the hope of establishing people in the *dhamma*.⁸

The Papan̄casūdanī in this respect mentions a moving incident of the Buddha and a slave girl named Puṇṇā. As the story goes, the Buddha, after completing his service in Jeta's forest, was leaving for a suitable place to carry on his duty. Many including the king Pasenadi and the millionaire Anāthapiṇḍika requested the Buddha to stay back, but he refused their requests. Anāthapiṇḍika's slave girl Puṇṇā, knowing that her master was upset as the Buddha was leaving Jeta's forest, approached the Buddha and requested him to stay back, because then she would be able to take refuge in the triple gem and be established in the *dhamma*. The Buddha stayed back and Puṇṇā renounced her home-life and soon after having *dhamma*-instructions from the Buddha she was established in *Arahat*-hood (Ps II 136-137).

All these activities are said to have been carried out by the Buddha merely for his respect for the *dhamma*. In other words, the incidents presented in the commentary clearly shows that Buddhas respect and honor the *dhamma* by being engaged in the activities of teaching, guiding, and encouraging people in understanding the

is defined as 'a quarter of a *yojana*'. A *yojana* in PED denotes 'a distance of about seven miles'. See PED, s.v. *Gāvuta* and *Yojana*; and DOP, s.v. *Gāvuta*.

⁷ The *Papañcasūdanī-purāṇāṭikā* (Ps-pt 1.252 [CST4]) comments: *anahātovāti dhammasavanussukkena sāyanhe buddhāciṇṇaṃ nhānaṃ akatvāva* (and *anahāto* means that [the Buddha] due to his eagerness to listen to the *dhamma*, [went there] without doing the usual practice of the Buddha, i.e. taking a bath in the evening). Cf. DOP, s.v. *nahāyati*.

⁸ On the wandering the Buddhas, see Gyanabodhi (2019).

dhamma or the truth about the nature of existence and thus helping them achieve different stages of liberation (*vimutti*).

Such a commitment to sharing the enlightenment experience by a Buddha and his disciples purely for the benefit and happiness of as many people as possible is seen in the expression of the Buddha in the *Vinaya-piṭaka*. When there were as many as sixty *Arahats* the Buddha asked them to go to different directions to preach the *dhamma* for the benefit and happiness of the multitude.⁹ As the canonical texts testify, the Buddha had carried out his duty as an awakened one for forty five years until his final passing away.¹⁰ Not just in the human world, but he travelled to different celestial worlds to deliver the message of the *dhamma*.¹¹ His regards for the *dhamma* or the truth about the nature of existence and his engagement in unfolding that truth to people and gods represent his utmost sincerity and commitment for the *dhamma*, the truth. This, in fact, is what defines a Buddha. According to the *Vinaya* commentary a Buddha is so defined as he himself being awakened to the truth makes others awakened to the same truth.¹²

⁹ Vin I 21: *Caratha bhikkhave, cārikaṃ bahujanahitāya bahujanasukhāya lokānukampāya atthāya hitāya sukhāya devamanussānaṃ. Mā ekena dve agamittha. Desetha bhikkhave, dhammaṃ ādikalyāṇaṃ majjhe kalyāṇaṃ pariyoṣānakalyāṇaṃ sātthaṃ sabyañjanaṃ kevalaparipuṇṇaṃ parisuddhaṃ brahmacariyaṃ pakāsetha.*

¹⁰ The Pāli canon testifies the Buddha's engagement in teaching the *dhamma* throughout his life travelling to different parts of ancient India. As discussed in Ps (II 148-152), the Buddha took basically twofold journey – a quick journey and a slow journey – in communicating the *dhamma* to the people. See *Jinacārita* (verses 437- 456) for a discussion on the Buddha's 45 years of rains retreat (*vassa*), and Author 2019 on the wandering of the Buddhas.

¹¹ Nidd I 445, for example, states that the Buddha had descended in a city called Saṃkassa after preaching *Abhidhamma* to the beings in the Tāvātimsa heaven. It should be noticed that in different Buddhist and non Buddhist countries, the legacy of practicing and teaching the *dhamma* for the benefit of the multitude is being very well carried out by his followers for over two and a half millennia now.

¹² Sp I 122: *Yasmā vā cattāri saccāni attanāpi bujjhi, aññe pi satte bodhesi; tasmā evamādīhi pi kāraṇehi buddho* (As he himself has understood the four truths, and also made other beings known (the same truths); so, due to these reasons, he is a Buddha.).

A canonical text (A III 121) wonderfully illustrates with the simile of a lion a Buddha's respect for the *dhamma*. Just as a lion surveying four quarters roars to the animals in all directions respectfully, a Buddha too teaches the *dhamma* to the four assemblies respectfully. The text states (in brief):

The lion, the king of beasts, coming out of his abode surveys the four quarters thoroughly and roars the lion's roar for three times and when it gives a blow to each different animal starting with the elephant to the cat, it does so respectfully, not disrespectfully. The Tathāgata is like a lion. His teaching is like the roar of a lion (*sīhanāda*). Just like the lion he teaches the *dhamma* to assemblies of monks, nuns, male lay devotees, female lay devotees, ordinary men (*puthujjanā*), and even food carriers and hunters (*annabhāraṇesādā*) respectfully, not disrespectfully. And this is because the Tathāgata has respect for the *dhamma*.

This clearly shows his complete engagement for upholding and unflinchingly communicating the *dhamma* to his followers. And this is what he does out of his respect for the *dhamma*.

The *dhamma* defined

The discussion so far was focused on how a Buddha honors the *dhamma* by being engaged in upholding and communicating it to his followers, especially the four assemblies. But what does it exactly mean by the '*dhamma*' which he had awakened to, and which he taught to others?

The Pāli canon records that the Buddha, after his six years of ascetic practices, attained full awakening (*sambodhi*) on a full moon day of May under the 'bo-tree' at the river bank of Nerañjara. With his attainment of awakening, he gained three knowledges (*tevijja*) respectively in the three phases of the night: the knowledge about remembering one's past lives (*pubbenivāsānussatiñāṇa*), the knowledge about vanishing and reappearing of beings (*cutūpapātañāṇa*), the knowledge about the destruction of the cankers (*āsavakkhayañāṇa*). He realized the process of causality both in direct as well as in reverse order (Vin I 1: *paṭiccasamuppādaṃ anulomapaṭilomaṃ manasākāsi*). He

understood that everything that arises must cease (*yaṃ kiñci samudaya dhammaṃ sabbaṃ taṃ nirodha dhamman ti*).¹³

Being completely free from the *āsavas*, the Buddha perceived the world in conformity with the truth (*yathābhūta*) and hence he was dwelling in a state of perfect bliss.¹⁴ The state of being completely free from the *āsavas*, and the knowledge and vision with regard to the world as it really is (*yathābhūtañānadassana*), represent an understanding of selflessness (*anatta*), that there is nothing that is permanent and everlasting in so-called existence. In other words, things arise and cease depending on causes and conditions and are characterized by impermanence (*anicca*), dissatisfaction (*dukkha*), and selflessness (*anatta*). As stated in the *Visuddhimagga*, 'only the empty phenomena roll on and that view alone is right and true' (*Vism* 602: ...*suddhadhammā pavattanti, ev'etaṃ sammadassanaṃ*). Failing to understand the true nature of reality leads to suffering whereas its opposite leads to peace and happiness. This is the ultimate reality of existence, the truth, the absolute law, the *dhamma*.¹⁵ This is what he communicated to the four assemblies, and he showed the paths to achieve an experience of complete freedom for themselves. The Buddha says in *Dhammapada* that 'I can only show you the path; you need to carry out the journey by yourself'.¹⁶ And whoever takes up the journey would most certainly experience the same result of liberation (*vimutti*) as the Buddha himself, because the *dhamma* has just a single taste, the taste of freedom (*vimuttirasa*).¹⁷

¹³ The *Mahāvagga* of the *Vinaya-piṭaka* (*Vin* I 1-43) contains a detailed account of the Buddha's awakening, investigation into his realization, decision to preach the teaching, conversion of his early disciples and so on.

¹⁴ I.e. The Buddha is living in a state of *nibbāna* which is described as having the characteristics of supreme bliss (*nibbānaṃ paramaṃ sukhaṃ*).

¹⁵ The *Ariyapariyesanā-sutta* of the *Majjhima-nikāya* (*M* I 167) presents a wonderful discussion on the Gotama Buddha's attainment of awakening and his initial decision of not teaching the *dhamma* as it is too profound to be comprehended by the common worldling (*puthujana*).

¹⁶ *Dhp* 40: *Tumhehi kiccaṃ ātappaṃ akkhātāro tathāgatā*.

¹⁷ *A* IV 203: ... *ayaṃ dhammavinayo ekaraso, vimuttiraso*. Further it should be mentioned here that Prof. Skilling (2012, 21-31) in his essay 'All Buddhas Venerate the Dhamma: Recontextualizations of the Uruvela-sutta In 14th - 15th –century Southeast Asia' remarks that it is the scriptural teaching, the

The supremacy of the *dhamma*

The *dhamma* appears to assume the supreme position in the discussions within *suttas* and the commentarial literature. However, a certain text in the Pāli canon (see S III 120) equates the Buddha himself with the *dhamma*. As described in this text, Vakkali, a disciple of the Buddha, once became seriously ill and wished to see the Buddha. The Buddha, having been informed of Vakkali's illness, went to meet him at his residence and knowing his eagerness to see him said: 'Vakkali, what do you [gain] by looking at this foul body? One who sees the *dhamma* sees me, one who sees me sees the *dhamma*; indeed, by seeing the *dhamma* one sees me, and by seeing me one sees the *dhamma*'.¹⁸

The above statement of the Buddha seems to suggest that if *dhamma* is understood to represent the truth about the nature of existence, the Buddha represents the embodiment of that truth. In other words, he lives by the truth and acts according to the same truth.

In any case the *dhamma* is given the supreme position. As stated in the *Paṭhama Uruvela-sutta* (A II 20) the Buddha is awakened to this *dhamma* and lives in dependence on this *dhamma*. This is described to be a general rule (*dhammataṅ*)¹⁹ of the Buddhas of the past, present and future.²⁰ And as narrated in the commentary

Pariyatti dhamma that Buddhas venerate and suggests that by honoring the scriptural teaching we honor the Buddha. But the commentarial exposition as pointed out above seems to suggest that the *dhamma* honored by the Buddha represents the ultimate reality of existence in its true form and the scripture contains descriptions of the truth about existence and the methods of its realization. And as the noble awakening of the Buddha precedes the existence of scripture, the Buddha honoring specifically the scriptural teaching seems to be implausible.

¹⁸ *Kiṃ te iminā pūtikāyena diṭṭhena, yo kho vakkali, dhammaṃ passati so maṃ passati, yo maṃ passati so dhammaṃ passati, dhammaṃ hi vakkali, passanto maṃ passati. Maṃ passanto dhammaṃ passati.*

¹⁹ In the Pāli canon, the *Mahāpadāna-sutta* (D II 12ff.) presents a list of *dhammataṅ*s that are common to all the Buddhas. Among them are 'descending of a *Bodhisatta* into his mother's womb from Tusita heaven', 'dying of his mother seven days after the birth of a *Bodhisatta*' etc.

²⁰ A II 20-21: *Ye c'abbhatīṭā sambuddhā ye ca buddhā anāgatā
Yo c'etarahi sambuddho bahunnaṃ sokanāsano
Sabbe saddhammagaruno vihaṃsu viharanti ca*

in question, he is also the one who in respect for the *dhamma* engages in activities to awaken others to that same *dhamma*. Endo, evaluating the *dhammatā* and *vemattā* mentioned in the Pāli literature, opines that this concept of *dhammatā* is an extension by the Buddhists to establish the supremacy of the Buddha's teachings (Cf. Endo 1997: 207). The commentator of the *Rathavinīta-sutta* might have the same intention of positing the sovereignty of the Buddha and his teaching in the world while discussing the idea of *dhammagāravatā* in the commentary. The Buddha is thus represented to inquire from the group of monks about the monk Puṇṇa Mantāniputta, who is ordained in his name and has devoted his life for the *dhamma*, rather than inquiring about his father and relatives.

But does it mean that asking about his kith and kin would go against the *dhammagāravatā* and that is why the Buddha avoided doing it?

From the commentarial descriptions, it appears that it simply was not an occasion for inquiring about the well-being of his kith and kin. Otherwise, many instances are found in the canonical texts where the Buddha spoke highly of the parents' contributions towards the life of their children. He also spoke about how a child should act towards his parents for repaying the debts of their immeasurable kindness and altruism by guiding and establishing them in the *dhamma*.

The *Āṅguttara-nikāya* (A I 61-62), for example, states that one can never repay the debts of one's parents by providing them with all kinds of material comforts. Because the sacrifices, love and affection of the parents towards their children are truly boundless.²¹ They can be repaid only if they are established in the

*Athopi viharissanti esā buddhāna dhammatā
Tasmā hi attakāmena mahattaṃ abhikkhaṅkatā
Saddhammo garukātabbo saraṃ buddhāna sāsanan ti.*

(The perfectly awakened ones of the past, the awakened ones of the future, and the awakened ones of the present who destroy grief of many, all dwell, now dwell and will dwell [in future] respecting the *dhamma*; this is a general rule of the awakened ones. Therefore, with the desire for good and aspiring greatness, one should respect the true *dhamma* recollecting the teaching of the Buddhas.)

²¹ Also see A I 132: “*Brahmāti mātāpitāro pubbācariyāti vuccare,
Āhuneyyā ca puttānaṃ pajāya anukampakā.*”

wholesome psychological qualities such as faith (*saddhā*), virtue (*sīla*), generosity (*cāga*), and wisdom (*paññā*).²²

Furthermore, the Buddha himself is said to have established his father, King Suddhodhana, in the fruition of stream-entry after giving a *dhamma*-talk on the practice of virtue.²³ He also went to the Tāvātimsa heaven to preach *abhidhamma* to his mother, queen Mahāmāya, so that she can be freed from this wearisome *samsāra*.²⁴ Sāriputta, one of the Buddha's two eminent disciples, before his passing away converted his mother into the true *dhamma* by making her a stream-enterer (*sotāpanna*).²⁵ These acts are definitely carried out by the Buddha and his disciples not just because of their trivial concern for their family, but out of their respect for the *dhamma*.

Concluding remark

The commentarial exposition that the Buddha asks the monks about their wellbeing and the wellbeing of their teacher as he is pleased with them and also because of his respect for the

(Father and mother are like the Brahma, they are called the first teachers; they are worthy of offering by their children and are compassionate towards them.)

²² A I 62: *Yo ca kho bhikkhave matāpitāro assaddhe saddhā-sampadāya samādapeti niveseti patiṭṭhāpeti dussīle sīla-sampadāya samādapeti niveseti patiṭṭhāpeti maccharī cāga-sampadāya samādapeti niveseti patiṭṭhāpeti duppaññe paññā-sampadāya samādapeti niveseti patiṭṭhāpeti ettāvataṃ kho bhikkhave mātāpitūnaṃ katañca hoti paṭikatañ ca atikatañ cā ti* (O monks, one who instigates, settles and establishes his parents in the fortune of faith when they lack faith; he instigates, settles and establishes them in the fortune of virtue when they lack virtue; he instigates, settles and establishes them in the fortune of generosity when they are miser; and he instigates, settles and establishes them in the fortune of wisdom when they lack wisdom, to that extent he has done the duty to his parents, repaid and has done enough to them.)

²³ Dh-p-a III 165: *Desanāvasāne rājā sotāpattiphale patiṭṭhahi* (at the end of the teaching, the king was established in the fruition of stream-entry). Also cf. J IV 55.

²⁴ See Dh-p-a III 223; also cf. DPPN, s.v. *Suddhodana*, *Mahāmāya*; and Nārada Thera (2010: 68).

²⁵ Cf. DPPN, s.v. *Sāriputta*.

dhamma seem to suggest his complete engagement with the *dhamma* and his concern for those upholding the *dhamma* in his name. It demonstrates the supremacy of the *dhamma* which should be the guiding principle for those desiring to enter into the *sāsana* of the Buddha. This might have been the intention of the commentator probably to encourage generations of the Buddha's followers to engage, regard and live a life according to the *dhamma*.

A translation of the section on the discussion of the nature of respecting the *dhamma*

[In what follows I present a translation of the commentaries preceded by the root text that was commented upon. The numbering of paragraphs and the page numbers in square brackets are from the PTS edition of the text. The words or phrases in bold represent quoted texts from the *sutta* upon which the commentator then commented.]

[Root Text]

When they sat down at one side the Blessed One said thus to those monks: “O monks, who in the birthplace is thus esteemed among the native monks who are fellow practitioners?”

[Commentary]

Explanation of the nature of respect for the *dhamma* (*dhammagarubhāvavaṇṇanā*)

4. The expression “**the Blessed One said thus**” means that [the Buddha], after greeting the visitors [i.e. the monks] with words such as “O monks, I hope it is bearable” etc., gave a speech beginning with “who is it, o monks”. It seems that the monks, being asked [by the Buddha] in a manner of greeting: “O monks, I hope it is bearable; I hope it is sustainable;²⁶ I hope you have

²⁶ The Pāli phrase is ‘*kacci, bhikkhave, khamanīyaṃ, kacci yāpanīyaṃ*’ (see, for example, M I 206 and II 192; S III 120 and 125). In the PTS reading of the

travelled a path with little exhaustion and were not short of food; and O monks, where have you come from? etc.”, replied: “O Blessed One, we have come from the birthplace, which is a dwelling place in Kapilavatthu in the country of the Sākiyas”. But the Blessed One neither asked about the health of the great king Suddhodana, nor of Sukkodana, nor of Sakkodana,²⁷ nor of Dhotodana, nor of Amitodana, nor of queen Amitā, nor of Mahāpajāpatī, nor of the whole of Sākiyan community.²⁸ But asking [about] a monk who is endowed with practice (*paṭipatti*), and who has obtained the ten subjects of discourse (*dasakathāvatthu*) for himself and who therein [136] instigates others, he said these words beginning with ‘who is it, O monks’.

5. But why did the Blessed One, without asking about the health of Suddhodana etc., ask only about such a monk? Because he (=Puṇṇa) was dear to him. Indeed, the monks, nuns, male lay devotees, and female lay devotees, who have entered the path, are dear and pleasant to the Buddhas. Due to what? Due to their reverence for the *dhamma*. Indeed, the Tathāgatas respect the *dhamma*. And the nature of their respect for the *dhamma* should be understood with the intention arisen [in the Buddha] at the root of the Goatherders’ Banyan-tree,²⁹ that is, “one who lives without respect and disobediently suffers”.³⁰

text, the latter half of the phrase ‘*kacci yāpanīyaṃ*’ is absent; but it is present in its CST4 reading.

²⁷ In the CST4 reading *sakkodhana* comes first, followed by *sukkodhana*.

²⁸ Among the Sākiyas mentioned in the list, except Mahāpajāpatī, who was Siddhattha’s step mother, the others were siblings. One would expect Pamiṭā, the last of the seven siblings, to be included in the list, but as we can see she is left out. For more information on the Sākiyan Race, see, Mhv 14; and also cf. DPPN, s.v. *Sīhāṇu* and *Pamiṭā*.

²⁹ According to Vin I 2, the Buddha, after his awakening, spent the first week at the foot of the tree of awakening (*bodhirukkhamaṭṭhā*), and then moved to the foot of the Goatherders’ banyan tree (*ajapālanigrodhamūle*) where he spent the second week meditating. This latter tree was on the bank of the river Nerañjarā in Uruvelā, not far from the Bodhi-tree. See DPPN, s.v. *Ajapālanigrodha*.

³⁰ As stated in the discussion above this expression appears in two instances in the Pāli Canon: the *Gārava-sutta* (S I 139) and the *Uruvelā-sutta* (A II 20-21).

6. Indeed, only due to his reverence for the *dhamma*, the Blessed One, on the day of the renunciation of the elder Mahākassapa,³¹ went along a three *gāvuta*³² path to meet him. After going on a path³³ of more than three hundred *yojanas*, he established the elder Mahākappina³⁴ together with his assembly in *Arahat*-hood by teaching them *dhamma* on the bank of the Ganges River.³⁵ Once, after the meal, having gone along a path of forty-five *yojanas*, and having given a *dhamma*-talk for three watches of the night in a potter's house, he established Pukkusāti,³⁶ a clansman, in the

³¹ Mahākassapa was one of the eighty chief disciples of the Buddha. He was considered to be foremost among the disciples who upheld ascetic practice (*dhutaṅga*) (A I 23). His personal name was Pippali, the young man. According to the tradition, he and his wife, Bhaddā Kāpilānī, renounced home life together on the same day. It is said that the earth trembled on the day of their renunciation. The Buddha, who was dwelling in Veḷuvana, understood its meaning and went three *gāvutas* to meet Mahākassapa (Mp I 161-182). He was said to be the only disciple with whom the Buddha exchanged his robe (S II 221). This incident was said to signify the authority bestowed upon him by the Buddha to preside over the first council that was held three months after the passing away of the Buddha (cf. Vin II 284-292; Dīp 30-32, Mhv Ch. III; Sp I 4-32). As recorded in the Nikāya texts, at various occasions the Buddha praised him highly for his spiritual attainments and held him up as an example to others. He was, for example, regarded to be equal to the Buddha in terms of attaining the *jhānas* (S II 210) and teaching and guiding the monks (S II 205). Also cf. DPPN, s.v. Mahākassapa, Bhaddā Kāpilānī.

³² A *gāvuta* is a measure of length which is equal to 'one quarter of a *yojana*' (DOP, s.v. *gāvuta*); a *yojana* is understood to be a distance of about seven miles. Another measurement of a *yojana* as stated in the PTS dictionary is that it is 'as much as can be travelled with one yoke (of oxen)'. A *gāvuta* is there said to be 'a little less than two miles' (PED, s.v. *yojana*, *gāvuta*).

³³ The term '*maggam*' is absent in the PTS reading.

³⁴ He was one of the eighty great disciples of the Buddha who was regarded as the foremost among those who can preach well. Cf. A I 25; Mp I 318-323; and DPPN, s.v. Mahā Kappina Thera.

³⁵ The Gaṅgā is mentioned as one of the five great rivers in ancient India; the others are: Yamunā, Aciravatī, Sarabhū and Mahī (Vin II 237). Malalasekera remarks that 'Gaṅgā formed one of the most important means of communication and trade for the districts through which it flowed'. Cf. DPPN, s.v. *Gaṅgā*.

³⁶ He is a clansman who renounced worldly-life in the name of the Buddha, but without ever meeting him. The Buddha, knowing that, goes to meet him in a potter's house, engages in an interesting conversation and teaches him

fruition of a non-return. Having gone for two thousand *yojanas*, he favoured a forest-dwelling novice. After going along a sixty *yojana* path, he taught *dhamma* to the elder Khadiravaniya.³⁷ Having understood that the elder Anuruddha, sitting in the eastern bamboo forest, was thinking ‘the thoughts of a great man’ (*mahāpurisavitakka*),³⁸ [the Buddha] went there through the sky, and descended before the elder, and said well-done (*sādhū*). After preparing a bed and chair in a perfumed chamber for the Koṭikaṇṇa-Soṇa Thera,³⁹ he (i.e. Soṇa) was invited to deliver a *dhamma*-talk in the early morning, at the end of his recitation, the Buddha said well-done. Having gone along a three *gāvuta* path, [the Buddha] spoke about the benefit of sweet concord to three clansmen in [their] dwelling place in the Gosīṅgasāla forest.⁴⁰

dhamma without revealing his identity. At the end of the conversation Pukkusāti recognizes that it is the Buddha who appeared before him to give instructions and asked for full ordination. For more information about Pukkusāti and the incident, see: M III 237-247 and DPPN, s.v. Pukkusāti.

³⁷ He was one of the eighty great disciples of the Buddha (A I 23) who was foremost among the forest dwellers (*ārañṇakānaṃ*). His another name was Revata. Also cf. Mp I 223-229; DPPN, s.v. Revata.

³⁸ The *Anuruddhamahāvitakka-sutta* (A IV 229) presents a list of eight “thoughts of a great person” that the elder Anuruddha was reflecting about. They are: the *dhamma* is 1) for one with few wishes, not for one with great wishes; 2) for one who is contented, not for one who is discontented; 3) for one who is secluded, not for one delighting in society; 4) for the one who is strenuous, not for the one who is indolent; 5) for one who is attentive, not for one who is forgetful; 6) for one with composed mind, not for one with un-composed mind; 7) for the wise, not for the unwise; and 8) for one who delights in the absence of proliferation, not for one who delights in proliferation. It also states that engaging in these thoughts would lead one to the attainment of the four *jhānas* and finally to *Nibbāna*. The *Dasuttara-sutta* (D III 287) states that these eight thoughts of a great man are factors to be generated by a monk.

³⁹ He is said to be the best among the excellent monk speakers in the Buddha’s time. A I 24: *Etadaggaṃ, bhikkhave, mama sāvakānaṃ bhikkhūnaṃ Kalyāṇavākkaraṇānaṃ yadidaṃ Soṇo Kuṭikaṇṇo*. Also see DPPN, s.v. *Sona Kutikaṇṇa*.

⁴⁰ Malalasekera says that it was ‘a forest tract near Vesāli’ (see, DPPN, s.v. *Gosīṅgasālanadāya*). Two *suttas* in the *Majjhima-nikāya*, namely the *Cūḷagosiṅga-sutta* and the *Mahāgosiṅga-sutta*, are recorded to have been delivered in this forest.

7. And also [once] Kassapa, the Blessed One,⁴¹ having gone to the house of the potter Ghaṭikāra, rising trust [in him], thought “this noble disciple has been established in the fruition of a non-return”, took food with his own hand and ate it. When the time for the rains retreat was approaching, our Blessed One, accompanied by the assembly of monks, left Jeta’s forest for a journey. Even the great king of Kosala, Anāthapiṇḍika and others were not able to turn him back. Anāthapiṇḍika returned home and sat down dejected. Then a servant by the name Puṇṇā said to him: “you look dejected, master”. [He replied to her:] “Yes dear, I could not turn the Teacher (*sattha*) back, and now [137] a thought has arisen to me, that in these three months I will not get an opportunity either to hear the *dhamma* or to offer gifts as I wish.” She said: “Lord, I will turn the Teacher back.” [And Anāthapiṇḍika promised:] “if you are able to turn him back, you are a free woman.” She went to the One of Ten Powers (*dasabala*), laid down at his feet, and said: “May the Blessed One turn back.” [The Buddha then asked her:] “Puṇṇā, as you depend on others for a livelihood what would you do for me?” [And Puṇṇā replied:] “O Blessed One, you too know that I do not have gifts to offer (*deyyadhamma*).⁴² Nevertheless, as a condition for your return, I will establish [myself] in the three refuges and in the five precepts.” The Blessed One approved saying “good, Puṇṇā!”, and he turned back and entered the Jeta’s forest. This story became popular. The wealthy merchant (i.e. Anāthapiṇḍika), after hearing that the Blessed One had been turned back by Puṇṇā, made her a free woman and placed her in the position of a daughter. After requesting the going forth, she went forth; and after going forth, she undertook insight practice. Once

⁴¹ Kassapa is said to be one of the Buddhas to have arisen in the present eon known as *bhaddakappa*; other Buddhas mentioned to have arisen are: Kakusandha, Koṇāgamana and Gotama (D II 2). Also cf. DPPN, s.v. *Kassapa*.

⁴² The *Cūlaniddesa* (Nidd II 233), one of the fifteen texts of the *Khuddakanikāya*, provides a list of fourteen items as gifts to be offered. They are: 1) robe (*cīvara*), 2) alms (*piṇḍapāta*), 3) lodging (*senāsana*), 4) medicine and other requisites for the sick (*gilānapaccaya bhesajjaparikkhāra*), 5) food (*anna*), 6) drinks (*pāna*), 7) clothing (*vattha*), 8) carriage (*yāna*), 9) garlands (*mālā*), 10) scents (*gandha*), 11) ointments (*vilepana*), 12) a bed (*seyya*), 13) a dwelling place (*āvasatha*), and 14) materials for lighting (*padīpeyya*).

118 *The Indian International Journal of Buddhist Studies* 22, 2021-22

the Teacher knew the condition of her undertaking of insight practice, he uttered this splendid stanza:

O Puṇṇā, you fulfilled the true *dhamma*, just as the moon on its fifteenth day;
With complete wisdom [of the truth], you will make an end to suffering.⁴³

At the end of the stanza, she⁴⁴ attained *Arahat*-hood and became a well-known disciple. Such is the Tathāgata's respect for the *dhamma*.

8. Again, when the elder Nandaka was expounding the *dhamma* in an assembly hall, the Blessed One went there without taking a bath,⁴⁵ stood for three watches of the night, listened to the *dhamma*-talk and at the end of the teaching, he said 'well-done'. The elder came [to the Buddha], paid his respect and asked: "Venerable sir, at what time did you come?" [The Buddha replied:] "Just as when you have started the discourse." [The elder said:] "Venerable sir, as a Buddha you are delicately nurtured, it must have been very difficult for you." The Blessed One replied: "Nandaka⁴⁶ if you were able to preach [the *dhamma*] for an aeon, I too would be able to stand for an aeon and listen to it. Such is the

⁴³ Originally the stanza appears in *Therīgāthā* (II 123), but with slight changes. The original stanza is:

puṇṇe pūrassu dhammehi cando pannarase-r-iva;
paripuṇṇāya paññāya tamokhandhaṃ padālayā.

(Norman (1971: 1) translates: Puṇṇā, be filled with things sublime, as the moon on the 15th day (is full); with fulfilled wisdom tear asunder the mass of darkness (of ignorance).)

And the one found in Ps II 137 is:

puṇṇe pūresi saddhammaṃ cando pannaraso yathā;
paripuṇṇāya paññāya dukkhassantaṃ karissasīti.

⁴⁴ The word for *sā* (she) is absent in the CST4 reading.

⁴⁵ The *īkā* says the following of the expression *anahāta* (Ps-pṭ CST4 1.252): *anahātovāti dhammasavanussukkena sāyanhe buddhāciṇṇaṃ nhānaṃ akatvāva* (and *anahāto* means that [the Buddha] due to his eagerness to listen to the *dhamma*, [went there] without doing the usual practice of the Buddha, i.e. taking a bath in the evening). Cf. DOP, s.v. *nahāyati*.

⁴⁶ In the CST4 reading, the word is Nanda, not Nandaka, it might be an error, because Nanda and Nandaka are two distinct persons (cf. DPPN, s.v. *Nanda*, *Nandaka*). A IV 358 records the story of elder Nandaka's preaching to a group of monks and the Buddha's visit to him in full.

Tathāgata's respect for the *dhamma*. It is due to their respect for the *dhamma* that the path-attainers are dear [to them], and therefore they interrogate⁴⁷ the path-attainers.

9. A path-attainer is of four types: one who follows the path for his own good, not for others' good; one who follows the path for others' good, not for his own good; one who follows the path neither for his own good nor for others' good; and one who follows the path both for his own good and for others' good.⁴⁸ Herein, one who obtains the ten subjects of discourse himself, but like the venerable [138] Bākula,⁴⁹ does not advise others:⁵⁰ this is one who follows the path for his own good, not for others' good. The Blessed One does not interrogate such monks. Why? Because [the Buddha thinks:] “He is not steadfast in the growth of my dispensation.”

One who does not obtain the ten subjects of discourse, but like Upananda, son of the Sakyans, instructs others with them, for the

⁴⁷ While in the PTS reading the word is in the present tense 3rd person plural ‘*pucchanti*’, in the CST4 reading it is in the past tense 3rd person singular ‘*pucchi*’.

⁴⁸ In the CST4 reading, the fourth type of path-attainer is exchanged with the third one.

⁴⁹ One of the eighty great disciples of the Buddha (A I 24) who is regarded as foremost among those with good health (*appābādhānam*). He is said to have led an extraordinarily long spiritual life himself, but have never given any teaching to anyone else (cf. M III 124-127). Among the disciples of the Buddha, elder Bākula is said to have lived the longest lifespan of 160 years. The passage at Sv II 413 reads: *Evaṃ dīghāyuko pana atidullabho, asuko kira evaṃ ciraṃ jīvātī tatha tatha gantvā daṭṭhabbo hoti. Tatha visākhā upāsikā vīsavassasataṃ jīvati, tathā pokkharasāti brāhmaṇo, brahmāyu brāhmaṇo, selo brāhmaṇo, bāvariyabrāhmaṇo, ānandatthero, mahākassapatthero. Anuruddhatthero pana vassasatañceva paññāsañca vassāni, bākulatthero vassasatañceva saṭṭhi ca vassāni. Ayam sabbadīghāyuko. Sopi dve vassasatāni na jīvati* (Extremely rare are those who have such a long lifespan, such a one who thus lives so long should be visited going to wherever they are. Therein, Visākhā, the female devotee, lived 120 years, Similarly, Brahmin Pokkharasāti, Brahmin Brahmāyu, Brahmin Sela, Brahmin Bāvari, elder Ānanda, and elder Mahākassapa. The elder Anuruddha lived 150 years. The elder Bākula lived 160 years. He was the one with longest lifespan. But even he did not live 200 years.). Also cf. Mp I 304-309 and DPPN, s.v. Bākula.

⁵⁰ The phrase *na anusāsati* (he does not advise) is missing in the PTS reading.

purpose of enjoying the duty that is done on account of that: this is one who follows the path for others' good, not for his own good. Such a monk too, the Blessed One does not interrogate. Why? Because [the Buddha thinks:] "His craving, which is like a huge basket, is not abandoned."

One who, like Lāḷudāyī, neither himself obtains the ten subjects of discourse, nor instructs others with them: this is one who follows the path neither for his own good nor for others' good. Such a monk too, the Blessed One does not interrogate. Why? Because [the Buddha thought:] "The defilements inside him, like one who has been cut by a hatchet, are massive."

One who obtains the ten subjects of discourse and also instructs others with them is like the eighty great disciples, i.e. Sāriputta, Moggallāna, Mahākassapa and so on: this is one who follows the path both for one's own good and for others' good. The Blessed One interrogates such a monk. Why? Because [the Buddha thinks:] "He is steadfast in the growth of my dispensation. And here, interrogating only such monks, he said: **“who is it, o monks and so forth.”**

10. Those monks were thus questioned by the Blessed One: "Therein, who was it?"; he questioned the monks, who were from his birthplace, who followed the path for the good of both, and who were possessed of the ten subjects of discourse and were neither thinking nor discussing with one another. Why? Because the venerable Mantāniputta was famous and renowned in this country like the sun and the moon standing in the middle of the sky. Therefore, those monks, like a bunch of peacocks that, after hearing the thunder, assemble in one place, and like the monks who had begun to make a unified recital, announcing to the Blessed One that their teacher was the elder Puṇṇa, in order to speak of the virtue of the elder with their inadequate mouths, all at once said: "Sir, the venerable known as Puṇṇa" etc.

11. Herein "**Puṇṇa**" is the name of this elder. He was the son of Mantānī, thus "**Mantāniputta**" (son of Mantānī) is said. "**Esteemed**" means that he was esteemed due to his development of (good) qualities.

[Sub-commentary]**Explanation of the nature of the *dhamma* to be honoured
(*garudhammabhāvanavāṇṇanā*)**

“**Of the Sākiyan community**” means ‘of the multitude of Sākiyas’. ‘The ten subjects of discourse’ means the subjects of the ten [talks] beginning with the talk of few wishes, such as the fewness of wishes and so on. “**One who has obtained the ten subjects of discourse**” refers to an obtainer of that, on account of being well-established therein. “**Therein**” means in the ten subjects of discourse.

As the *dhamma* should be respected, respecting the *dhamma* means paying respect to it; its nature is the honourableness to the *dhamma*, [it is said] on account of that. Having said that it “**should be understood with the intention**” he said “**indeed only due to his reverence for the *dhamma* and so forth**” exhibiting that it should be understood not only with that intention but also with bodily and verbal undertakings. Herein, “**having given a *dhamma*-talk for three watches of the night**” means having given a *dhamma*-talk for three watches of the night dwelling in a potter’s house, thus the meaning should be understood according to the last expression. Otherwise, it shows that the *dhamma*-talk was given for three watches of the night, while the meaning was being grasped according to whatever one gains, but it is not that. And, he will say “many such nights were only with one and a half watch.” Like the special qualities such as the ten powers, even the practice for others’ good causing respect for the *dhamma* is thus compared to splitted-gold among all the Buddhas; in praise of the respect for the *dhamma* of this Blessed One,⁵¹ he points out Kassapa, the Blessed One’s respect for the *dhamma* with words beginning with “**also Kassapa, the Blessed One**”.

“**[Our Blessed One...] left [Jeta’s forest] for a journey**” means that he left to make a journey to the city. Because of leaving at an unsuitable time for the journey to the city, the king of Kosala and others made an effort to stop [the Buddha]. Indeed, having

⁵¹ The expression ‘this Blessed One’ probably refers to the Gotama Buddha.

celebrated the *pavāraṇā*,⁵² wandering is practised by the Buddhas. The Blessed One said **“what would you do for me?”** expecting [it be] the right practice for Puṇṇā.

“Even without taking a bath” means that even having not taken a bath, as [generally] practised by the Buddhas in the evening, due to being eager to listen to the *dhamma*. **“Path-attainer is of four types”** is said, because among the practices for the good of oneself and others, [considering if it is] for one or two, there is fourfoldness in terms of what is practised and what is being accomplished. This is the meaning of entering a path, that is, one, intelligently, enters a path even refusing the former one. One who has entered the path for the good of oneself adorns the order with this right practice, but does not increase the order as he is less eager; neither does he always fulfil the wish of the Blessed One who is compassionate. Thus, indeed, the Blessed One, at the beginning of his awakening, when sixty-one *arahants* were born, incited the monks in the practice for the good of others, saying words beginning with ‘walk, o monks, for the good of the many’. Due to that, it is said: **“the Blessed One does not interrogate such monks. Why? Because [the Buddha thinks:] “He is not steadfast in the growth of my dispensation.”**

“Like the eighty great disciples” is said keeping elder Bākula outside the fourth category,⁵³ and thinking that a multitude appears to be complete even with a little deficiency. And the designation ‘eighty great elders’ should be understood as the state of recluship with eight attainments as its constituents. In such a place, many people speaking together and with a big sound is only for satisfying the heart of the teacher; **“those monks after hearing a thunder”** etc. is said showing that it is done in this way by those monks who have entered upon a path. **“Due to his development of**

⁵² A Buddhist monastic ceremony that takes place at the end of three months rains retreat; cf. PED, s.v. *pavāraṇā* & *pavāreti*.

⁵³ In the discussion of the four types of ‘path-attainers’ (*paṭipannaka*) in the commentary to the RVS, elder Bākula, who is regarded as one of the eighty great disciples of the Buddha, is categorized as someone who, even though he possesses the ten subjects of discourse, does not teach them to others. This characteristic of his nature is contrary to the other great disciples. Thus Dhammapāla points out that at least in this particular context Bākula should not be counted as one of eighty great elders.

qualities” means that he has been esteemed because of the reverence caused by the qualities that were spoken of, not because of [his] ability for any other service and so on.

Explanation of the nature of the *dhamma* to be honoured has ended.

Acknowledgements

I am eternally grateful to Venerable Dr Wei Wu (founder of International Buddhist College, Thailand) and Prof. Dr KL Dhammajoti Bhante (Chair Professor, Renmin University of China) for their constant encouragements and supports in my academic endeavor and spiritual journey. I am deeply indebted to Dr Giuliano Giustarini, and Bhante Ānandajoti for going through an earlier draft of the paper and providing me with valuable suggestions. My thanks are due to Upali Sraman, Priyarakkhit Sraman, Kazal Barua and the anonymous reviewers for going through the final version of the article and suggesting necessary improvements. I express my gratitude to Bhante Rāhula for his enthusiasm, encouragements and kindness throughout the writing of this paper.

Abbreviations:

A	Aṅguttara Nikāya
CST4	Chatṭha Saṅgāyana Tipiṭaka, Version 4
D	Dīgha Nikāya
Dhp	Dhammapada
Dhp-a	Dhammapada Aṭṭhakathā
Dīp	Dīpavaṃsa
DOP	'Dictionary of Pali' of M. Cone

124 *The Indian International Journal of Buddhist Studies* 22, 2021-22

DPPN	‘Dictionary of Pāli Proper Names’ of G.P. Malalasekera
J	Jātaka
M	Majjhima Nikāya
Mhv	Mahāvamsa
Mp	Manorathapūraṇī
Nidd I	Mahāniddeśa
Nidd II	Cullaniddeśa
PED	‘Pali-English Dictionary’ of PTS
Ps	Papañcasūdanī (Majjhima Nikāya Aṭṭhakathā)
Ps-pt	Papañcasūdanī-purāṇaṭīkā
PTS	The Pali Text Society, London
S	Saṃyutta Nikāya
Sv	Sumaṅgalavilāsinī
Sp	Samantapāsādikā
Sn	Suttanipāta
Thī	Therīgāthā
Vin	Vinaya Piṭaka
Vism	Visuddhimagga

Bibliography

- Anālayo. 2003. *Satipaṭṭhāna: The Direct Path to Realization*. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society.
- Anuruddha Thera, K. 2004. *Dictionary of Pāli Idioms*. Kowloon: Chi Lin Nunnery.
- Bhikkhu Bodhi & Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli. 1995. *The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha*. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society.

- Bhikkhu Bodhi. 2000. *The Connected Discourses of the Buddha*. Boston: Wisdom Publications.
- Bhikkhu Gyanabodhi, 2019. The Wandering of the Buddhas – a Commentarial Exposition. *IBC Journal of Buddhist Studies* 1: 79-96.
- Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli. 1992 & 1998. *The Life of the Buddha*. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society.
- Bodhi, B. (1999). *The Noble Eightfold Path*. Retrieved from http://www.buddhanet.net/pdf_file/noble8path6.pdf
- Bodhi, Bhikkhu. 1996. “Nibbāna, Transcendence and Language” In *Buddhist Studies Review*, 13(2), 163-76. doi: [10.1558/bsrv.v13i2.14923](https://doi.org/10.1558/bsrv.v13i2.14923).
- Cone, M. 2001. *A Dictionary of Pāli* (part 1). Oxford: The Pali Text Society.
- Cone, M. 2010. *A Dictionary of Pāli* (part 2). Oxford: The Pali Text Society.
- Dhammaratana, U. 2011. *Guide Through The Visuddhimagga* (2nd ed.). Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society.
- Endo, T. 1997. *Buddha in Theravada Buddhism*. Dehiwela: Buddhist Cultural Centre.
- Endo, T. 2013. *Studies in Pāli Commentarial Literature*. Hong Kong: Centre for Buddhist Studies.
- Gethin, R. (1998). *The Foundations of Buddhism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Giustarini, G. 2014. Liberations: The Notion of Release (*vimokkha*) in the Paṭisambhidāmagga. *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 44 (2): 241-266.
- Harvey, P. 2004. *An Introduction to Buddhism: Teaching, History & Practices*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hazra, K. L. 2000. *Studies on Pali Commentaries*. New Delhi: B.R. Publishing Corporation.
- Horner, I. B. 1971. *The Book of the Discipline (vinaya piṭaka)* (vol 4). London: Luzac & Company Ltd.

126 *The Indian International Journal of Buddhist Studies* 22, 2021-22

- Jayatilleke, K. N. 1994. *The Message of the Buddha*. New York: The Free Press.
- Jayawickrama, N. A. 2003. Papañcasūdanī: The Commentary to the Majjhima Nikāya. *Journal of the Centre for Buddhist Studies Sri Lanka* 1: 73-119.
- Karunadasa, Y. 2013. *Early Buddhist Teachings: The Middle Position in Theory and Practice*. Hong Kong: Centre of Buddhist Studies.
- Ledy Sayadaw. (2008). *The noble Eightfold Path and its factors explained (Maggaṅga-dīpanī)* (U Saw Tun Teik, Trans., Bhikkhu Khantipālo, Ed.). Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society.
- Malasekera, G.P. 2002. *Dictionary of Pāli Proper Names* (Vols. I-II). New Delhi: Munshiram Manoharlal Publisher's Pvt. Ltd.
- Nyanatiloka. 1980. *Buddhist Dictionary*. Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society.
- Powers, J. 2009. Why Practicing Virtue is Better than Working Out: Bodies and Ethics in Indian Buddhism. *Chung-Hwa Buddhist Journal* 22: 125-152.
http://chinesebuddhiststudies.org/previous_issues/chbj2206powers.pdf
- Powers, J., & Prebish, C.S. 2009. *Destroying Mara Forever: Buddhist Ethics Essays in Honor of Damien Keown*. New York: Snow Lion Publication.
- Rhys Davids, T.W., & Stede, W. 1952. *The Pali Text Society's Pali-English Dictionary*. London: The Pali Text Society.
- Skilling, P. 2012. All Buddhas Venerate the Dhamma: Recontextualizations of the Uruvela-sutta In 14th -15th-century Southeast Asia. *Journal of the Centre for Buddhist Studies Sri Lanka* Vol. X: 21-31.
- Woods, J.H., & Kosambi, D. 1979. *Papañcasūdanī: Majjhimanikāyaṭṭhakathā of Buddhaghosācariya*. London: The Pali Text Society.