

April 2023

Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation through Livestreaming in Indonesia: Unequal Power Relations at the Root of Child Victimization

Ni Luh Tasya Prathisthita Tanaya
Universitas Indonesia, Jakarta, Indonesia

Ni Made Martini Puteri
Universitas Indonesia, Jakarta, Indonesia

Follow this and additional works at: <https://vc.bridgew.edu/jiws>



Part of the [Women's Studies Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Prathisthita Tanaya, Ni Luh Tasya and Puteri, Ni Made Martini (2023) "Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation through Livestreaming in Indonesia: Unequal Power Relations at the Root of Child Victimization," *Journal of International Women's Studies*: Vol. 25: Iss. 3, Article 6.

Available at: <https://vc.bridgew.edu/jiws/vol25/iss3/6>

This item is available as part of Virtual Commons, the open-access institutional repository of Bridgewater State University, Bridgewater, Massachusetts.

This journal and its contents may be used for research, teaching, and private study purposes. Any substantial or systematic reproduction, re-distribution, re-selling, loan or sub-licensing, systematic supply, or distribution in any form to anyone is expressly forbidden. Authors share joint copyright with the JIWS. ©2022 Journal of International Women's Studies.

Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation through Livestreaming in Indonesia: Unequal Power Relations at the Root of Child Victimization

By Ni Luh Tasya Prathisthita Tanaya¹ and Ni Made Martini Puteri²

Abstract

Child sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming is a rising phenomenon of online child sexual abuse and exploitation in Indonesia. This phenomenon takes place in both offline and online spaces. Moreover, due to the active involvement of the viewers, these content viewers can also be considered as offenders. Thus, it is necessary to recognize this phenomenon as a crime against children, instead of merely a sexual act. By using a criminology perspective, this research explores the roots of this phenomenon, the impact on survivors, and the child protection system's actions against it. This qualitative study used secondary data analysis, derived from a total of nineteen Indonesian news articles as well as five cases of child sexual exploitation and abuse through livestreaming. Power relations theory by Michel Foucault is used to explain the power relations and victimization in this phenomenon. The analysis shows that unequal power relations between adults and children contribute to the phenomenon. The unequal power relations include how societies perceive children, victim-blaming, gender inequality, and the existing situation of the porn industry, which places the children in vulnerable positions. The child survivors in these case studies were found to experience multiple victimizations, including sexual abuse in real life and online in conjunction with economic victimization. These victimization processes are prolonged due to the fact that sexual content is rapidly shared by the offenders; thus, the situation can be described as chronic revictimization. Indonesian systems for protecting children against such crimes were found to be inefficient due to the absence of legal terminology to define child sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming and the lack of laws that can be used to punish the viewers.

Keywords: Child sexual abuse, Child sexual exploitation, Criminology, Livestreaming, Victimization, Indonesia, Legislation

Introduction

There are various forms of sexual abuse and exploitation that have been facilitated by the Internet to assault children in various countries. One form involves child sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming, which according to Dingle (2014) might be the worst form of online child sexual abuse and exploitation (Ramiro et al, 2019). In this format, it is possible to view the livestream of a child being sexually abused, as if one were watching a live TV show (Desara, 2019). Many children become the object of sexual livestreaming content. In a 2017 study conducted by the Internet Watch Foundation (IWF) on the distribution of captures of livestreamed child abuse, 2,082 image and video captures of livestreamed child sexual abuse were discovered. In 2020, ECPAT Indonesia, which works to end child pornography,

¹ Ni Luh Tasya Prathisthita T. holds a Bachelor of Criminology from the Department of Criminology, Universitas Indonesia. Her research focuses on exploitation and abuse issues related to women and children. Email id: tasyatanaya@gmail.com

² Ni Made Martini P. is the Chairperson of the Department of Criminology, Universitas Indonesia. Her research centers on the juvenile justice system, women, children, vulnerable people, and crime. Email id: nimademartini@departemenkriminologiui.org, tinduk.NM@gmail.com

prostitution, and trafficking, found a high demand for sexual livestreamed content of Indonesian children from viewers around the world (Binus Law, 2020).

The huge demand results from the fact that viewers find livestream content more engaging than non-live content. Livestream content is considered a cheaper option and leaves no trace (Horsman, 2018; Desara, 2020). Through livestreaming, viewers are offered an active role, where they can force children to perform certain sexual acts that match their preferred sexual fantasies as if they were the ones performing the sexual acts on the children without having to be physically present (Whittle & Giachritsis, 2017; Desara, 2020). Thus, it provides a new, thrilling experience for the viewers that other forms of sexual abuse and exploitation do not provide.

Former research reveals two roles of offenders in this crime: operators who physically carry out the abuse and create livestreaming content, and viewers who request live streaming and sexual acts (Terre des Hommes, 2013; Desara, 2019). Viewers who passively watch the live broadcasts can also be considered offenders (Elsheranki, 2020). The range of people who can be operators is large, from strangers to the children's parents. Meanwhile, a larger range of people from local, national, and international regions can be viewers (Terre des Hommes, 2013). Some offenders were also found to play both roles as operators and viewers. This type of offender has been found to virtually direct children to perform certain sexual acts and produce their own livestreaming content (Kopecky, 2016; IWF, 2017).

Both operators and viewers were found to be predominantly male adults (IWF, 2017; Carback, 2018), while the majority of survivors were girls (Terre des Hommes, 2013; Desara, 2019). Based on these findings, it can be seen that offenders use their position as adults and also as men to force children, especially girls, to be involved in sexual activities. Online child sexual abuse and exploitation are characterized by an imbalance of power between adults and children (Lilley, 2017), and between men and women. This unequal power relation is often exploited by offenders and puts children in vulnerable positions.

Although child sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming is an online phenomenon, it has caused significant harm to survivors offline. This phenomenon crosses borders and takes place in two spaces at once, offline and online. Therefore, children can be victimized even when they stay at home (Terre des Hommes, 2013; Carback, 2018), leaving victims with no safe spaces. The survivors were found to experience other forms of victimization alongside sexual abuse (Terre des Hommes, 2013; Desara, 2019). Research conducted by Cruz and Sajo (2015) found that survivors of sexual livestreamed content are also survivors of economic abuse. Moreover, the sexual livestreamed content of the children was found to be captured and distributed by the offenders a potentially unlimited number of times (IWF, 2017; Horsman, 2018), thus extending their victimization indefinitely.

Child sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming is a growing phenomenon, especially in this modern age. Thus, the government needs to recognize the causes and impacts of this phenomenon as a serious crime against children, instead of merely a sexual act (Powell & Henry, 2017; Desara, 2020). From there, appropriate measures can be developed to protect children from this abuse. Criminology defines crime as a pattern of behavior committed by an individual, group, or organization in society that harms others, either materially, physically, or psychologically (Mustofa, 2010, p. 23). By using a criminology perspective, sexual abuse and exploitation of children can be considered a crime. According to Mustofa (2010, p. 24), aspects that are discussed in criminology include the causes and impacts of a crime. However, criminological research on this phenomenon, especially in Indonesia, is still very limited. Therefore, this article aims to identify child sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming in Indonesia as a serious crime against children, as well as to explore the phenomenon using Michel Foucault's power relations theory. Hopefully, by understanding the

causes and impacts of this unequal power dynamic, this paper will delineate strategies and actions to protect children.

Research Method

This article uses secondary data analysis methods that center on data collected from other sources, such as research results, surveys, and news (Neuman, 2014). The data, sourced from national and regional online news media that have been verified by the Press Council, derives from five cases of child sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming in Indonesia from 2017 to 2020. However, some unverified media were also selected as complementary data sources. One case requires three to four online news articles, with a total of nineteen online news articles used. The sequence of the five cases is based on the time period when the events occurred, namely one case in 2017 (Case 1), two cases in 2019 (Case 2 & Case 3), and two cases in 2020 (Case 4 & Case 5). These five cases were analyzed using a criminology-based qualitative approach, allowing researchers to understand crime from the individuals involved, such as offenders, survivors, and law enforcement (Marvasti, 2004). Data from the five cases were categorized and analyzed in depth accordingly, with the analysis compared with previous research and literature.

Results and Discussion

Throughout the five cases, all survivors were found to have experienced sexual abuse, either in person or online during the live broadcast. In case 1, the operator sodomized the survivors, and it was broadcast live via Skype. In case 2, the survivors danced naked, masturbated, had sexual intercourse with one of the viewers, and were livestreamed via LINE. In case 3, the survivors showed their genitals and masturbated while having a video call on WhatsApp with the operator. In case 4, the operator was found rubbing a perfume bottle on the survivor's genitals and broadcasted live through a private video call, but it was unclear what medium was used. In case 5 the survivor showed her genitals and masturbated, and the medium used for the live broadcast was LINE.

Europol defines child sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming as “the live broadcast of video footage of a child being sexually abused, where the actions of the hands-on offender are directed by viewers who are observing remotely” (Desara, 2019). Based on Europol's definition, all five cases constitute criminal child sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming. Based on a criminology lens, the aspects of discussion in describing crime are the crime itself, the offender, the victim, and the reaction of society (Mustofa, 2010, p. 28). Therefore, this section will be divided into four subheadings. First, this section will explain the modes and offender patterns. Second, Foucauldian power relations will be used to explore how the unequal relations between offenders as adults and survivors as children are the root of the phenomenon. Third, the victimization experienced by the survivors will be explored. The final section will address the policies and measures that have been used to deal with this crime.

Modes and Offender Patterns of Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation through Livestreaming

In all five cases, two groups of offenders were found, operators and viewers. The offenders, especially the operators, were predominantly men. Operators generally aim for financial gain, and they were found to have no interest in engaging in sexual activity with survivors (Terre des Hommes, 2013; Desara, 2019). However, only case 2 and case 5 found the operators only aiming for financial gain. Meanwhile, in case 1 and case 3, the operators were found to be aiming for their own sexual satisfaction. On the other hand, the operator in case 4 was found to be aiming to fulfill the sexual satisfaction of the viewer who happened to be her husband. Similarly, the viewers aimed to fulfill their own sexual satisfaction.

In order to obtain financial benefits, operators in case 2 and case 5 operated in the form of syndicates of 4 to 5 people. These syndicates consist of strangers who approach children to recruit them for creating sexual livestreaming content (Terre des Hommes, 2013, Desara, 2019). In these cases, all survivors were girls. The syndicate recruited girls by luring them in with money, although the money they received is far below the total profit that the operator earned. The survivors in case 5 only received IDR (Indonesian Rupiah) 50,000 per content, while the profit earned by the operators per month could reach IDR 4,000,000 (Kompas, 2020e). The operators exploit the survivors' need for money. One of the survivors explained that she continued to make sexual livestream content due to financial need (Kompas, 2020e).

These syndicates provided sexual livestreaming services through LINE, namely private video call sex and live streaming of girls having sex with adults (Kompas, 2019b; Kompas, 2020c). The girls were instructed by the viewers to perform certain sexual acts. Adults who had sex with the girls while being livestreamed were chosen from the viewers. In previous studies, no viewers have been found to have sexually abused children directly (Terre des Hommes, 2013; Carback, 2018; Desara, 2019). These viewers gained access to the services by paying certain amounts for group LINE memberships to the operators.

Two different *modus operandi* were found in operators to fulfill their own sexual satisfaction needs. The operator in case 1 took advantage of his position as the father and uncle of survivors. This contrasts with previous studies, where family members generally become operators for financial benefits. He had sexual intercourse with the two survivors while doing a livestream on Skype (Republika, 2017). Operators were joined by dozens of viewers from international "child lovers" groups on WhatsApp, Telegram, and Skype. All members of the groups could watch the sexual assaults committed by operators against both survivors, in real-time, for free. There were viewers from other countries too, such as Mexico, Costa Rica, and Yemen (Kompas, 2017). Operators also often livestream person-to-person, where viewers could watch livestreaming privately and ordered the operator to perform certain sexual acts against survivors (Kompas, 2017).

In case 3, the offender acted as an operator and viewer at once, where the offender was not physically present while sexually assaulting the survivor online. According to the findings of the IWF (2017) and Desara (2019), offenders who aim to fulfill their own sexual satisfaction generally have two roles at once. The offender was found to be recruiting survivors, who were all girls, through online game applications (Kumparan, 2019). He approached the girls by inviting them to play online games together. The communication then moved to WhatsApp. Finally, the offender persuaded the girls to do video call sex with him and secretly recorded the video call sex (CNN Indonesia, 2019). The offender threatened to spread the livestreaming video footage of the girls if they did not comply with his request to do another video call. Although the survivors had complied with the offender's request, the offender was found to distribute the video footage to a WhatsApp group of 100 people (Kompas, 2019e).

The operator of case 4, who aimed to fulfill the sexual satisfaction of the viewer, was the only female operator among the five cases (Suara, 2020). She performed her actions because she was coerced by her husband, who was the viewer. This was consistent with Masri's (2014) findings, where operators were often coerced by viewers to become operators. The operator was the babysitter of an 8-month-old baby girl. She used her position as a babysitter to sexually abuse the baby while on a video call with her husband (Kompas, 2020b). The operator admitted that she committed the act because her husband threatened to murder her if she did not obey his orders (Kompas, 2020f).

The viewers also have their own roles. They gain access to live broadcasts in various ways, including joining groups that center on watching child sexual content and paying a fee for access. Most of the viewers identified were active viewers. Passive viewers are those who only watch sexual abuse against the survivor. Active viewers are viewers who direct offenders

to perform certain sexual acts with children (Elsheranki, 2020). Moreover, some viewers were found to make use of people who have access to children to become operators (Kompas, 2020f). Viewers threaten operators to gain access to live broadcasts of children's sexual content.

The modes and offender patterns that were found in all five cases show that this Internet-facilitated crime breaks down borders. Operators and viewers were mostly found not to be physically present with the survivors yet were still able to exploit and sexually assault the survivors. Livestreaming allows the sexual abuse experienced by the survivors to be watched by many people in real time. The impact is similar to experiencing direct sexual violence by many people at once (Desara, 2019). The Internet removes the boundaries of space and provides a high degree of anonymity, allowing offenders to protect their identities while targeting a larger number of children (Harrison, 2006). This crime occurs in two worlds at once, offline and online, breaking down the boundaries of children's safe spaces.

Unequal Power Relations at The Root of Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation through Livestreaming

Unequal power relations, according to a Foucauldian analysis, were found to be the cause of this phenomenon. Power, meaning the capacity of institutions or individuals to coerce and control others to do things they do not want to do (Foucault, 1980), is not only in particular institutions or individuals but is spread throughout social relations (Foucault, 1988). There are five aspects of analyzing power relations: (1) The system of differentiation, which are differences that allow one party to apply power to the other party; (2) The types of objectives pursued by those who apply power; (3) instrumental modes, which addresses how power is applied; (4) forms of institutionalization that vary based on the mode and type of power applied; and (5) The degrees of rationalization, applying power by looking at the effectiveness and certainty of the results whether it is proportional to the costs incurred (Foucault, 2001). The relationship between operators and survivors in all five cases met the five aspects of Foucauldian power relations.

Figure 1: Power Relations Between Operators and Survivors

Aspects	Case 1	Case 2	Case 3	Case 4	Case 5
System of Differentiation	Adult operator, Child survivor; Operator is father and uncle of survivors.	Adult operator, Child survivor; male operator, girl survivor; operator hires survivor.	Adult operator, child survivor; male operator, girl survivor.	Adult operator, child survivor; operator is babysitter of survivor.	Adult operator, child survivor; male operator, girl survivor; operator hires survivor.
Types of Objectives	Fulfill operator's sexual satisfaction	Financial gain	Fulfill operator's sexual satisfaction	Financial gain	Fulfill viewer's sexual satisfaction
Instrumental Modes	Directly sexually assaulting survivor	Use money to persuade survivors	Approaching survivor in online game; threatening the survivor	Directly sexually assaulting survivor	Use money to persuade survivors
Institutions	Family	Syndicate	Undetermined	Undetermined	Syndicate
Degrees of Rationalization	Believes social media platform is not monitored by police and can avoid legal responsibility.	Believes social media platforms are not monitored by police and can financially benefit from crimes.	Online game application allows for easy access to target survivors; believes social media is not monitored by police.	Avoiding murder threats by viewer	Believes social media platforms are not monitored by police and can financially benefit from crimes.

All operators were found to be using their position as adults to apply coercive power to survivors who were children. Unequal power relationships cause adults to manipulate children into unwanted sexual activity (Davidson & Gottschalk, 2010). Deep-rooted patriarchal cultural norms that position men above women and children intersect with the gendered abuse seen in these case studies (Harrison, 2006; Martinello, 2019), which promotes gender inequality. Most operators also take advantage of their close position to the survivor, such as being a family member, babysitter, or teacher. When there are trusting relationships or positions of authority

involved, offenders are more able to control children and manipulate their consent (Desara, 2019). Different positions of economic access are also utilized by operators, in which they can employ survivors and control their source of income.

Operator's position in relation to the survivor determines how an operator can apply power. Initially unknown to the survivors, the operators exercised their power by approaching the survivors. Some built friendships with survivors through online game applications (CNN Indonesia, 2019; Kumparan, 2019), while others persuaded survivors using money (Kompas, 2019c; Kompas, 2020a). Meanwhile, operators who were close to the survivors applied their power by directly committing sexual abuse (Liputan6, 2017; Kompas, 2020b). Even in unstructured institutions, operators can still apply their power over survivors by considering the enormous profits and losses obtained. This is possible because this crime is facilitated by the Internet, which breaks down the boundaries of space and time.

In these case studies, active viewers were found to order survivors to perform certain sexual activities, with some viewers sexually assaulting the survivor directly. In applying power, children are treated as objects by operators and viewers. According to Foucault, power manifests by regulating objects, where exploitation and sexual abuse against children are the proof of power, which is confirmed through their submission to the offender (Bell, 1991). Unequal power relations allow offenders to treat survivors as objects through livestreamed child sexual abuse and exploitation.

Figure 2: Power Relations Between Viewers and Operators

Aspects	Case 4
The System of Differentiations	The viewer is the husband, and the operator is the wife
The Types of Objectives	Fulfilling their own sexual satisfaction
Instrumental Modes	Using coercion and death threat
Forms of Institutionalization	Marriage
The Degrees of Rationalization	Believing the social media used is not monitored by the police and is in a different location from the operator to avoid legal responsibility

Unequal power relations are also found between the viewer and the operator, namely in case 4 (figure 2). Viewers, especially active viewers, often take advantage of operators' access to survivors and the power inequality between operators and survivors (Whittle & Giachritsis, 2017; Desara, 2019). In case 4, the viewer used the operator's access as the survivor's babysitter. Gender inequality also plays a role once again, where the viewer uses his position, as a man and as a husband, to apply his power over the operator, who is a woman and his wife.

Unequal power relations between all parties cause this crime to occur. These power relations are influenced by structural power that has long existed in society. The position of the offender as an adult allows them to apply their power to the survivor. This is influenced by existing societal perceptions of how children should behave toward adults. Children are taught to be fully obedient to adults, and non-compliance is often punished (Bell, 1991; Harrison,

2006). Society portrays children as individuals who have no voice of their own and depend on adults for all their needs. Then, the community resorts to victim-blaming against children who are survivors of online sexual crimes. Society considers that children's involvement in online sexual activity is based on their own decisions, especially if the existing content only shows the presence of children without the offender (Leonard, 2010; Powell & Henry, 2017). This victim-blaming causes children not to report these crimes, leading these survivors to rely on adults to report them.

The long-standing commodification of children as sexual objects also plays a role in child pornography. The Internet has supported the global proliferation of the multi-billion-dollar child pornography industry (Jenkins, 2001; Desara, 2020), allowing child sexual abuse content to be watched in real-time via livestreaming (Desara, 2020), which is deemed more interesting than non-real-time pornographic content (Acar, 2017; Horsman, 2018). These digital platforms gave rise to increasing demands for highly profitable child sexual livestreaming content (Terre des Hommes, 2013; Desara, 2019) in an industry that normalizes the commodification of children as sexual objects.

Multiple Victimization and Re-victimization

One of the main discussion areas in criminology involves victimization, which examines the experiences of crime victims (Mustofa, 2013, p. 67). By understanding the process of how survivors become the victims of certain crimes, society and law enforcement can best address the survivors' needs, instead of only considering the offenders' punishments. In these case studies, all survivors were found to have been victims of two to three different crimes in less than a year, with multiple offenses experienced by survivors at the same time. All survivors in the five cases experienced sexual harassment victimization, both in person and virtually, along with online victimization that was witnessed by non-present people via livestreaming.

In the syndicate of case 5, survivors were also found to experience economic abuse victimization. The survivors received a very low payment compared to the amount of profit that the operator received. They were only paid IDR 50,000 per content, while operators earned up to IDR 4,000,000 per month (Kompas, 2020c). Survivors often experience economic abuse in livestreamed sexual assault. Operators were identified to strictly control survivors' income, and survivors were often paid late (Cruz & Sajo, 2015).

It can be concluded that survivors in all five cases experienced multiple victimizations, meaning individuals are victimized by more than one type of crime over some time period potentially by one or multiple offenders (Hope et al., 2001; Outlaw et al., 2002; Finkelhor, 2008). Once children experience victimization, they become vulnerable to other victimizations (Turner et al., 2010; Finkelhor et al., 2011). Children who experience multiple victimizations are found to have suffered recovery stress as if they were trapped in a pattern (Finkelhor, 2008, p. 36). Multiple victimizations impact post-traumatic stress, anxiety symptoms, and other mental problems more significantly than single instances of victimization (Turner et al., 2010; Hamby et al., 2018).

The survivors were also found to have suffered victimizations numerous times. In case 1, the seventeen-year-old survivor experienced direct sexual abuse victimization starting at two years old (Republika, 2017), which means the survivor was victimized for fifteen years. The survivor who was ten years old experienced direct sexual victimization for three years, from age seven to ten (Republika, 2017). The survivors in case 3 made several video calls according to the request of the offender (CNN Indonesia, 2019; Kompas, 2019a), causing survivors to experience online sexual victimization more than once. The survivor in case 4 experienced direct sexual victimization four times (Kompas, 2020d). The survivors in case 5 made sexual livestreaming content ten times a week (Kompas, 2020e), creating cycles of online sexual

victimization. In case 2, the survivors also made sexual livestreaming content more than once (Kompas, 2019d). All instances of sexual abuse were experienced simultaneously with online victimization.

The survivors experience what is known as revictimization, which is defined as victimization where individuals become survivors of the same type of crime at least twice in a given period (Outlaw et al., 2002; Doerner & Lab, 2012). Survivors experienced further revictimization by being recorded during the abuse and the footage being shared on the Internet. In case 1, the operator distributed videos of sexual abuse victims in fifty Skype groups (with a total of 1,023 members), twenty-eight WhatsApp groups (with a total of 4,221 members), and fifty Telegram groups (with a total of 14,045 members) (Kompas, 2017). In case 3, the operator distributed video recordings of survivors to a WhatsApp group with around one hundred members (Kompas, 2019e). Survivors are revictimized every time their sexual live content is viewed (Martin, 2014). The number of people who can view survivors' content is unlimited, and re-victimization can last indefinitely because content shared on the Internet is difficult to remove (Rogers, 2008; Leonard, 2010). Therefore, victimized children often do not know when their victimization will end.

Research shows that survivors of revictimization from online crimes feel helpless because they cannot control the content being shared (Rogers, 2008; Meydan et al., 2018). Survivors also experience various mental disorders, such as anxiety, excessive fear, and trauma (Martin, 2014; Meydan et al., 2018). The Canadian Centre for Child Protection (2017) found that the anxiety suffered by survivors impacted their daily functioning, decreased their quality of life, and increased the potential for psychological and physiological illness (Broadhurst, 2019, p. 9). These short-term and long-term losses associated with multiple victimizations and revictimizations remains deeply detrimental for survivors of livestream child sexual abuse and exploitation.

Child Protection Systems against Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation through LiveStreaming

The operators in all five cases were caught and subjected to punishment according to applicable laws. In three out of five of the cases, the operators were caught through self-cyber-patrols by a police cyber team. While this shows that the police have taken the initiative in dealing with this crime, their process is not quick. The police admitted their process required a long time to collect the evidence (Kompas, 2019d). Arresting the operator in case 1 required lengthy communications and cooperation with US ICE Homeland Security to find the operator's location (Liputran6, 2017). The police struggle to detect this crime because livestreaming, which has an end-to-end encryption system, prevents third parties from deciphering the data communicated between the service provider and the user. Also, livestreamed content is not saved and downloaded to various devices but disappears immediately after viewing (Desara, 2019). This makes it more difficult for the police to detect this crime. In only two of the five cases, the operator was caught due to reports from the family, not the survivors. This is likely because the police institutions in Indonesia are not yet sensitive to children's experiences and perspectives, making survivors and their families less likely to report online sexual exploitation and abuse (Martinello, 2019).

The laws imposed on the operators include the ITE Trade Act, the Child Protection Law, and the Pornography Act. Unfortunately, the laws imposed are not appropriate. The use of the Pornography Law means that law enforcement officials consider child sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming as a form of pornography, but it is significantly different. The regulation of pornographic content in Indonesia only covers data that has been recorded, not content that is broadcast live (Ramadani et al., 2019). Pornography also does not include the payment aspect per livestream or viewer comments that command the victim in real time to perform certain sexual acts (Carback, 2018). Overall, the ITE Trade Act, the Child Protection

Act, and Pornography Act do not have precise definitions for child sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming (Ramadani et al., 2019).

In these cases, the viewers were not legally acted on since there is no existing law that can take action against them. To find justice for the survivors, the viewer should be legally punished because they are also offenders who played active roles in the livestreaming of child sexual abuse and exploitation. The viewers are also the ones who create the demand for the livestream content (Terre des Hommes, 2013; Acar, 2017; Desara, 2019). The absence of a legal definition of child sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming and the lack of laws that act on the viewer leaves a legal gap in protecting children against this specific crime.

Conclusion

Using a criminological perspective, this study describes child sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming as a serious crime against children, rather than as mere pornography. It provides an overview of the patterns, causal factors, impacts on survivors, and efforts to protect children from sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming in Indonesia. This phenomenon destroys safe boundaries for children where this crime occurs offline and online at the same time, and the offender does not have to be physically present with the child. Unequal power relations among the various parties involved in this phenomenon are found to put children, especially girls, in a vulnerable position. This allows offenders to force other offenders or children to perform certain actions according to their wishes. The unequal power relations are driven by patriarchal structural power systems that have long existed in society. The children who become survivors were found to experience two forms of victimization at once, which included multiple victimizations and re-victimizations. Various studies have shown that multiple victimizations have more significant adverse impacts compared to other forms of victimization. In addition, several studies have shown that re-victimization causes harm not only in the short term but also in the long term.

Overall, the system for protecting children against such crimes was found to be lacking in scope and effectiveness. First, the tracking system needs to be optimized so that law enforcement has better knowledge regarding the characteristics of this crime, especially the livestreaming aspect, so they can develop quicker detection systems. Also, police institutions should start positioning themselves as child-friendly institutions where they understand children's perspectives, which can encourage the reporting of these types of sensitive crimes. Most importantly, Indonesia urgently needs to have laws that define and regulate child sexual abuse and exploitation through livestreaming in exact terms. These laws must address the unique characteristics of online sex crimes that can lead to multiple victimizations and chronic re-victimizations for survivors. Also, in an attempt to minimize the demand for this crime, the Indonesian government needs to establish laws that can take action against viewers, since they generate the demand for child sexual livestreaming content.

This research is limited through the use of secondary data, which circumscribes the scope of the research and the researcher's perspective. Thus, future research on similar phenomena may use primary data, such as in-depth interviews with offenders, victims, or law enforcers who handled the cases under review. This will provide more comprehensive data. Future research can also discuss other aspects that have not been addressed in this research, such as details regarding the survivors' experiences, losses, and healing.

References

- Acar, K. V. (2017). Webcam Child Prostitution: An Exploration of Current and Futuristic Methods of Detection. *International Journal of Cyber Criminology*, Vol. 11, pp. 98-109
- Bell, V. (1991). Two modes of power? Foucault, feminism and child sexual abuse. *Journal of Gender Studies*, Vol. 1, pp. 168-185
- Binus Law. (2020). *Perlindungan Anak dari Eksploitasi Seksual Online Selama Covid-19*. From <https://business-law.binus.ac.id/2020/05/29/perlindungan-anak-dari-eksploitasi-seksual-online-selama-covid-19/>
- Broadhurst, R.G. (2019). *Child Sex Abuse Images and Exploitation Materials*. Oxon: Routledge
- Carback, J. (2018). Cybersex Trafficking: Toward a More Effective Prosecutorial Response. *Criminal Law Bulletin*, Vol. 54, pp. 66-183
- CNN Indonesia. (2019). *Polisi Tangkap Pelaku Pornografi Video Call Anak-Anak*. <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20190729165121-12-416493/polisi-tangkap-pelaku-pornografi-video-call-anak-anak>
- Cruz, E.M., & Sajo, T.J. (2015). Exploring The Cybersex Phenomenon In The Philippines. *EJISDC*, Vol. 5, pp. 1-21
- Davidson, J., & Gottschalk, P. (2010). *Internet Child Abuse: Current Research and Policy*. Oxon: Routledge
- Desara, D. (2019). *The Phenomenon of Online Live-Streaming of Child Sexual Abuse: Challenges and Legal Responses*. Doctoral Dissertation, THE Luxembourg University. Bologna, Italy
- Desara, D. (2020). *Combating the Live-Streaming of Child Sexual Abuse and Sexual Exploitation: A Need for New Legislation*. Switzerland: Springer Nature
- Doerner, W.G., & Lab, S.P. (2012). *Victimology*. USA: Elsevier, Inc.
- Detiknews. (2019). *Prostitusi 'Live Show' Jajakan Pelajar SMA, Anggota Grup Dipatok Rp 1 Juta*. <https://news.detik.com/berita/d-4413011/prostitusi-live-show-jajakan-pelajar-sma-anggota-grup-dipatok-rp-1-juta>
- ECPAT Indonesia. (2020). *Catatan Akhir Tahun ECPAT Indonesia 2020*. <https://ecpatindonesia.org/en/press-release/catatan-akhir-tahun-2020-perlindungan-anak-dari-eksploitasi-seksual-perlu-respon-cepat/>
- Elshenraki, H.N. (2020). *Combating the Exploitation of Children in Cyberspace: Emerging Research and Opportunities*. Pennsylvania: IGI Global
- Finkelhor, D. (2008). *Childhood Victimization: Violence, Crime, and Abuse in the Lives of Young People*. Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Foucault, M. (1980). *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972- 1977*. New York: Pantheon Books
- Foucault, M. (1988). *Critical Theory/Intellectual Theory: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1977-1984*. London: Routledge
- Foucault, M. (2001). *Power: The Essential Works of Foucault 1954-1984*. New York: The New Press
- Finkelhor, D., Turner, H., Hamby, S., & Ormrod, R. (2011). Polyvictimization: Children's Exposure to Multiple Types of Violence, Crime, and Abuse. *Juvenile Justice Bulletin*, pp. 1-10
- Hamby, S., Blount, Z., Smith, A., Jones, L., Mitchell, K., & Taylor, E. (2018). Digital poly victimization: The increasing importance of online crime and harassment to the burden of victimization. *Journal of Trauma & Dissociation*, Vol. 19, pp. 382-398
- Harrison, C. (2006). Cyberspace and Child Abuse Images: A Feminist Perspective. *Journal of Women and Social Work*, Vol. 21, pp. 365-379

- Horsman, G. (2018). A forensic examination of the technical and legal challenges surrounding the investigation of child abuse on live streaming platforms: A case study on Periscope. *Journal of Information Security and Applications*, Vol. 42, pp. 107-117
- IWF. (2017). *Trends in Online Child Sexual Exploitation: Examining the Distribution of Captures of Live-streamed Child Sexual Abuse*.
- Jenkins, P. (2001). *Beyond Tolerance: Child Pornography on the Internet*. New York: New York University Press
- Kopecky, K. (2016). Misuse of web cameras to manipulate children within the so-called webcam trolling. *Telematics and Informatics*, Vol. 33, pp. 1-7
- Kompas. (2017). *Ayah Ini Berbuat Asusila Terhadap Anak Sembari Live di "Skype"*. <https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2017/05/24/17051191/ayah.ini.berbuat.asusila.terhadap.anak.sembari.live.di.skype>
- Kompas. (2019a). *Ancam Anak di Bawah Umur Lakukan Video Call Sex, AAP Cari Korban Lewat Game*. [://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/07/29/17293361/ancam-anak-di-bawah-umur-lakukan-video-call-sex-aap-cari-korban-lewat](https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/07/29/17293361/ancam-anak-di-bawah-umur-lakukan-video-call-sex-aap-cari-korban-lewat)
- Kompas. (2019b). *Pelajar Perempuan Terlibat dalam Praktik Prostitusi Online Via Line*. <https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/02/04/19244241/pelajar-perempuan-terlibat-dalam-praktik-prostitusi-online-via-line>
- Kompas. (2019c). *Polisi Bongkar Praktik Prostitusi Online Via Aplikasi Line*. <https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/02/06/10215151/polisi-bongkar-praktik-prostitusi-online-via-aplikasi-line?page=all>
- Kompas. (2019d). *Polisi Selidiki Video Porno Anak-Anak di Kasus Prostitusi Online Via Line*. <https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/02/04/20282301/polisi-selidiki-video-porno-anak-anak-di-kasus-prostitusi-online-via-line>
- Kompas. (2019e). *Rekam Video Call Sex Anak, Tersangka Sebar ke Grup WA*. <https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2019/07/29/18400181/rekam-video-call-sex-anak-tersangka-sebar-ke-grup-wa>
- Kompas. (2020a). *3 Pemuda Ditangkap Buat Grup Berbayar Jual Pornografi Anak-Anak*. <https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2020/08/10/15563631/3-pemuda-ditangkap-buat-grup-berbayar-jual-pornografi-anak-anak>
- Kompas. (2020b). *Fakta Pembantu Cabuli Bayi 8 Bulan Saat Video Call Suami Berusia 19 Tahun*. <https://regional.kompas.com/read/2020/08/13/15150071/fakta-pembantu-cabuli-bayi-8-bulan-saat-video-call-suami-berusia-19-tahun?page=all>
- Kompas. (2020c). *Fakta Terungkapnya Jaringan Penjual Video Pornografi Anak di Jakarta Barat*. <https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2020/08/11/08591681/fakta-terungkapnya-jaringan-penjual-video-pornografi-anak-di-jakarta?page=all>
- Kompas. (2020d). *Pembantu Ini Sudah 4 Kali Cabuli Bayi Sambil Video Call Suami*. <https://regional.kompas.com/read/2020/08/13/15203551/pembantu-ini-sudah-4-kali-cabuli-bayi-sambil-video-call-suami?page=all#page2>
- Kompas. (2020e). *Pemeran Anak dalam Konten Pornografi Dibayar Rp 50.000, KPAI: Tak Sebanding dengan Risikonya*. <https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2020/08/10/20084221/pemeran-anak-dalam-konten-pornografi-dibayar-rp-50000-kpai-tak-sebanding>
- Kompas. (2020f). *Seorang Pembantu Cabuli Bayi dan Disaksikan Suaminya Via Video Call*. <https://regional.kompas.com/read/2020/08/12/12584041/seorang-pembantu-cabuli-bayi-dan-disaksikan-suaminya-via-video-call>
- Kumparan. (2019). *Polisi Ungkap Kasus Pornografi Anak Bermodus Video Call Via Whatsapp*. <https://kumparan.com/kumparannews/polisi-ungkap-kasus-pornografi-anak-bermodus-video-call-via-whatsapp-1rYuZebzZUm/full>

- Lilley, C. (2017). *UK Policy Responses and Their International Relevance dalam buku Online Risk to Children*. UK: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.
- Leonard, M.M. (2010). "I did what I was directed to do but he didn't touch me": The impact of being a victim of internet offending. *Journal of Sexual Aggression: An international, interdisciplinary forum for research, theory and practice*, Vol. 16, pp. 249-256
- Liputan6. (2017). *Begini Modus Kejahatan Agus Si Pedofil Melalui Skype*. <https://www.liputan6.com/news/read/2963815/begini-modus-kejahatan-agus-si-pedofil-melalui-skype>
- Martin, J. (2014). "It's Just an Image, Right?": Practitioners' Understanding of Child Sexual Abuse Images Online and Effects on Victims. *Child & Youth Services*, Vol. 35, pp. 96-115
- Martinello, E. (2019). Applying the Ecological Systems Theory to Better Understand and Prevent Child Sexual Abuse. *Sexuality & Culture*, pp. 326-344
- Marvasti, A. B. (2004). *Qualitative Research in Sociology*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd
- Masri, L. (2014). *Webcam Child Sex Abuse*. CUNY Academic Works. https://academicworks.cuny.edu/gj_etds/64
- Meydan, A.G., Walsh, W., Wolak, J., & Finkelhor, D. (2018). The complex experience of child pornography survivors. *Child Abuse & Neglect*, Vol. 80, pp. 238-248
- Mustofa, M. (2010). *Kriminologi*. Bekasi: Sari Ilmu Pratama
- Neuman, W. L. (2014). *Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. Harlow: Pearson Education Limited
- Outlaw, M., Ruback, B., & Britt, C. (2002). Repeat and Multiple Victimization: The Role of Individual and Contextual Factors. *National Crime Justice Reference Services*, pp. 1-36
- Powell, A., & Henry, N. (2017). *Sexual Violence in A Digital Age*. London: Palgrave Macmillan
- Ramadani, D., Bastiani, M.C., & Ghози, A. (2019). *Buku Panduan Terminologi Perlindungan Anak dari Eksploitasi*. Jakarta: Kementerian Pemberdayaan Perempuan dan Perlindungan Anak
- Ramiro, L.S., Martinez, A.B., Tan, J.R., Mariano, K., Miranda, G.M., & Bautista, G. (2019). Online child sexual exploitation and abuse: A community diagnosis using the social norms theory. *Child Abuse & Neglect*, Vol. 96, pp. 1-13
- Rogers, A. (2008). Child Pornography's Forgotten Victims. *Pace Law Faculty Publications*, Vol. 28, pp. 847-863
- Republika. (2017). *Pedofil Tayangkan Aksi Via Skype Ditangkap Polisi*. <https://www.republika.co.id/berita/nasional/jabodetabek-nasional/17/05/25/oqgvf3330-pedofil-tayangkan-aksi-via-skype-ditangkap-polisi>
- Suara. (2020). *Polisi Ungkap Kasus VCS Anak di Bawah Umur Tiga Pelaku Ditangkap*. https://www.suara.com/news/2020/08/10/173116/polisi-ungkap-kasus-vcs-anak-di-bawah-umur-tiga-pelaku-ditangkap?page=all&_gl=1*x7c56a*_ga*YW1wLW13aHJQa2w4Z001dFIFtZjhJUmQxNXFJeEUyeGZZOGJFLXYtc0cwQUJrYVVB6SEJ1OG1OckFKSkNOUSTRGOVKN28
- Suara Jogja. (2020). *Cabuli Bayi Sambil Vcs Dengan Suami Pengasuh Berlagak Gantikan Popok*. <https://amp.suara.com/jogja/2020/08/10/184003/cabuli-bayi-sambil-vcs-dengan-suami-babysitter-berlagak-gantikan-popok>
- Terre Des Hommes. (2013). *Webcam Child Sex Tourism*. http://tdh-europe.org/upload/document/6438/1696_Webcam-child-sex-tourism-terre-des-hommes-NL-nov-2013_original.pdf
- Tribunnews. (2017). *Agus Iswanto Pengidap Pedofilia Ini Menyesal Setelah Cabuli Anak Kandung dan Keponakan Sendiri*.

- <https://www.tribunnews.com/metropolitan/2017/05/25/agus-iswanto-pengidap-pedofilia-ini-menyasal-setelah-cabuli-anak-kandung-dan-keponakan-sendiri>
- Turner, H.A., Finkelhor, D., & Ormrod, R. (2010). Poly-Victimization in a National Sample of Children and Youth. *American Journal of Preventive Medicine*, Vol. 38, pp. 323-330
- Whittle, H., Giachritsis, C., Beech, A., & Collings, G. (2013). A review of young people's vulnerabilities to online grooming. *Aggression and Violent Behavior*, pp. 135- 146