Journal Pre-proofs

Continuous lactate-driven dark fermentation of restaurant food waste: Process characterization and new insights on transient feast/famine perturbations

Lois Regueira-Marcos, Raúl Muñoz, Octavio García-Depraect

PII:	S0960-8524(23)00811-8			
DOI:	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2023.129385			
Reference:	BITE 129385			
To appear in:	Bioresource Technology			
Received Date:	3 May 2023			
Revised Date:	19 June 2023			
Accepted Date:	20 June 2023			



Please cite this article as: Regueira-Marcos, L., Muñoz, R., García-Depraect, O., Continuous lactate-driven dark fermentation of restaurant food waste: Process characterization and new insights on transient feast/famine perturbations, *Bioresource Technology* (2023), doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2023.129385

This is a PDF file of an article that has undergone enhancements after acceptance, such as the addition of a cover page and metadata, and formatting for readability, but it is not yet the definitive version of record. This version will undergo additional copyediting, typesetting and review before it is published in its final form, but we are providing this version to give early visibility of the article. Please note that, during the production process, errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.

© 2023 The Author(s). Published by Elsevier Ltd.

- Continuous lactate-driven dark fermentation of restaurant food waste: Process 1 characterization and new insights on transient feast/famine perturbations 2 Lois Regueira-Marcos ^{a, b}, Raúl Muñoz ^{a, b}, Octavio García-Depraect ^{a, b*} 3 4 5 ^a Institute of Sustainable Processes, University of Valladolid, Dr. Mergelina, s/n, 47011, Valladolid Spain 6 7 ^b Department of Chemical Engineering and Environmental Technology, School of Industrial Engineering, University of Valladolid, Dr. Mergelina, s/n, 47011, Valladolid 8 Spain 9 10 11 *Corresponding author: Dr. Octavio García Depraect; E-mail address: octavio.garcia@uva.es; Full postal address: Institute of Sustainable Processes, 12 13 University of Valladolid, Dr. Mergelina, s/n, 47011, Valladolid Spain 14 Abstract 15 16 The effect of hydraulic retention time (HRT) on the continuous lactate-driven dark fermentation (LD-DF) of food waste (FW) was investigated. The robustness of the 17 bioprocess against feast/famine perturbations was also explored. The stepwise HRT 18 decrease from 24 to 16 and 12 h in a continuously stirred tank fermenter fed with 19 20 simulated restaurant FW impacted on hydrogen production rate (HPR). The optimal
- 21 HRT of 16 h supported a HPR of 4.2 L H_2/L -d. Feast/famine perturbations caused by
- 12-h feeding interruptions led to a remarkable peak in HPR up to 19.2 L H₂/L-d, albeit the process because stable at 4.2 L H /L d following mature stable stars.
- the process became stable at 4.3 L H_2/L -d following perturbation. The occurrence of LD-DF throughout the operation was endorsed by metabolites analysis. Particularly,
- hydrogen production positively correlated with lactate consumption and butyrate
- 25 Inverse production positively correlated with factate consumption and butyrate
 26 production. Overall, the FW LD-DF process was highly sensitive but resilient against
- 27 transient feast/famine perturbations, supporting high-rate HPRs under optimal HRTs.
- 28

29 Keywords:

Acidogenic fermentation, Biogenic hydrogen, Hydraulic retention time, Organic waste,
 Process disturbances, Robustness.

32

33 **1. Introduction**

Renewable hydrogen produced from biomass via biochemical conversion processes is 34 gaining momentum in the European Union and beyond, since it fosters the 35 decarbonisation of energy-intensive industrial processes and the transition towards a 36 circular economy (European Commission, 2020). Hydrogen can not only be used as a 37 clean energy carrier, but it can also be an industrial feedstock (European Commission, 38 2020; Dawood et al., 2020). Dark fermentation (DF) stands out as the most promising 39 biological method to produce renewable hydrogen, owing to its potentially higher 40 hydrogen production yields (HY) and rates (HPR), and good flexibility in using a wide 41 range of different organic wastewaters and wastes (Cheng et al., 2022). In this context, 42 food waste (FW) has attracted an increasing attention as a biorefinery feedstock due to 43 its year-round availability and physicochemical features, conferring it a high potential 44 for producing added-value compounds and energy carriers including hydrogen via 45 microbial fermentation processes (Zabaniotou & Kamaterou, 2019; Battista et al., 2020; 46 Talan et al., 2021; Shanmugan et al., 2023)). To date, one third of the food produced 47 worldwide ends up as FW, which in turn causes serious environmental, social and 48 health issues (Scherhaufer et al., 2018; Fattibene et al., 2020; Shanmugan et al., 2023). 49 In the European Union, this figure accounted for 56.8 million tons in 2020, 50 corresponding to about 127 kg of FW generated per inhabitant (Eurostat, 2022). The 51 North America, Latin America and Caribbean, sub-Saharan Africa and Asia-Pacific 52 53 regions generate yearly about 168, 127, 232 and 465 million tons of FW, respectively (García-Depraect et al., 2023b). 54

55 Although DF has long been proven as a feasible technology to produce hydrogen from FW (Yun et al., 2018; Habashy et al., 2021), its development and further scale up 56 57 is still limited by several technical bottlenecks. Of them, the inhibition of hydrogen production caused either directly or indirectly by the overgrowth of lactic acid bacteria 58 (LAB) in DF systems remains one of the most prevalent and deleterious issues (García-59 Depraect et al., 2021). Indeed, the proliferation of LAB has been considered the main 60 cause of process collapse in the long-term operation of continuous DF processes. LAB 61 often outcompete hydrogen-producing bacteria (HPB) due to their wider capacity to 62 degrade complex substrates and because they can release antimicrobial compounds 63 (Sikora et al., 2013; García-Depraect et al., 2021). Besides, LAB such as Lactobacillus 64 and lactate-oxidizing-HPB such as Clostridium butyricum, share similar physical and 65 chemical growth requirements, thus it is quite challenging to keep LAB away from the 66 DF process by modulating process parameters such as the hydraulic retention time 67 68 (HRT), organic loading rate (OLR), temperature, and pH (García-Depraect et al., 2021). Another aspect contributing to the common occurrence of LAB in dark fermenters is 69 their ubiquitous nature, being part of the autochthonous microbiota of many organic 70 71 feedstocks including FW. Indeed, the microbial community structure of FW is typically dominated by LAB during its storage (García-Depraect et al., 2023b). 72

Unfortunately, the effective elimination of LAB from the DF of FW still presents serious technical and economic issues, since pre-treatments intended to that purpose (heat shock for instance) are not only typically costly but have also been shown to be impractical and inefficient (Villanueva-Galindo et al., 2023). In this context, lactate-driven DF (LD-DF) is recently attracting scientific attention as a platform able to produce hydrogen from FW, while tackling the overgrowth of LAB (Regueira-Marcos et al., 2023). Although LD-DF is seen as a non-conventional hydrogen-producing

pathway, its prevalence in dark fermenters seems thermodynamically efficient, which is 80 desirable in shaping stable microbial communities in the long run operation (Fuess et 81 al., 2018). It has been argued that the long-lasting functional ecosystem in LD-DF is 82 driven by syntrophic (cross-feeding) interactions between LAB and some HPB, in 83 which the former microbial group ferment carbohydrates into lactate, while the latter 84 transforms lactate into hydrogen (García-Depraect et al., 2021). This process would 85 benefit both microbial groups, as lactate can be consumed by certain HPB avoiding 86 deleterious LAB growth by product inhibition, while preventing competition between 87 88 LAB and HPB for the fermentable carbohydrates (Park et al., 2021; Pérez-Rangel et al., 89 2021; Ohnishi et al., 2022). Despite the potential of this syntrophic microbial association to boost hydrogen production, the fate of lactate in the DF process is usually 90 overlooked in most studies (Detman et al., 2019; García-Depraect et al., 2021; Ohnishi 91 et al., 2022). In the case of LD-DF of FW, this has not been extensively investigated, 92 93 thus many relevant insights remain unrevealed yet. To the best of the authors' 94 knowledge, the process performance of the LD-DF of FW under continuous operation has not been systematically investigated yet. In continuous DF systems, HRT is likely 95 the most critical process parameter determining the hydrogen production efficiency, in 96 97 terms of HY and HPR (Sivagurunathan et al., 2016).

Hence, this work investigated for the first time the influence of the HRT on the
continuous LD-DF of simulated restaurant FW. Additionally, the robustness and
resilience of this novel LD-DF technology was assessed by characterizing process
response to short-term feast/famine perturbations, which are foreseen to occur in full
scale DF facilities and might compromise hydrogen production. The results and
discussion of this study can be helpful in the development and deployment of
enhancement strategies aimed at harnessing the presence of LAB in dark fermenters.

105

106 **2. Materials and Methods**

107 2.1 Microbial inoculum and feedstock

The inoculum source was digestate collected from a well-performing 100-L anaerobic 108 digester fed with restaurant FW and operated under mesophilic conditions. A hydrogen-109 110 producing mixed culture was obtained by applying a heat shock pretreatment (90 °C for 20 min) followed by three consecutive subcultures, following the procedure reported by 111 Martínez-Mendoza et al. (2022). The resulting acidogenic culture was composed of 112 Lactobacillus, Klebsiella, Clostridium, Stenotrophomonas, Acinetobacter, among others 113 (Regueira-Marco et al., 2023). Then it was stored at 4 °C and used on-demand as 114 inoculum for LD-DF (Garcia-Depraect et al., 2022; Regueira-Marcos et al., 2023). Prior 115 to use and with the aim of reactivating microorganisms, the bacterial inoculum was 116 subjected to a 17-h fermentation step using a 2.1-L gas-tight anaerobic reactor filled 117 with 0.1 L of inoculum and 0.9 L of a growth medium composed of (in g/L): 10.0 118 lactose, 2.40 NH₄Cl, 2.4 K₂HPO₄, 1.18 MgCl₂, 0.60 KH₂PO₄, 0.11 CaCl₂, and 0.024 119 FeCl₂ (Martínez-Mendoza et al., 2022). The incubation conditions applied were 37 ± 1 120 °C and ≈ 200 rpm. 121

122	The feedstock herein used was simulated FW prepared according to Neves et al.
123	(2008), which mimics the composition of restaurant-derived F w. That formulation
124	included 78% potatoes, 14% chicken, 4% pork lard, and 4% cabbage (on wet weight
125	basis), as the source of carbohydrate, protein, lipid, and fiber, respectively. Potatoes and
126	chicken breast were boiled in an autoclave at 120 °C for 30 min to simulate cooked FW.
127	The FW was initially blended by using a commercial blender (Sammic, XM-32, Spain)
128	and subsequently stored at -20 °C to prevent any change in its composition. The
129	microbial community structure of the recipe-based FW used has been reported
130	previously by García-Depraect et al. (2023b). The blended FW was physiochemically
131	characterized as follows: $51.0 \pm 0.5\%$ carbohydrates, $22.3 \pm 1.6\%$ proteins, $17.6 \pm 1.5\%$
132	lipids, and $4.0 \pm 0.4\%$ ash (on dry basis). Moreover, the blended FW had a pH of $6.2 \pm$
133	0.1, a chemical oxygen demand (COD) content of 286 ± 21.9 g O ₂ /kg, and a total (TS)
134	and volatile (VS) solids content of 215.6 ± 1.7 g/kg and 207.0 ± 1.6 g/kg, respectively.
135	Finally, the elemental analysis of the FW blend showed the following composition: 51.2
136	\pm 0.2% carbon, 8.1 \pm 0.1% hydrogen, 35.6 \pm 0.9% oxygen, 3.4 \pm 0.1% nitrogen, 2.0 \pm
137	0.0% phosphorus and a negligible content of sulphur.

2.2 Experimental set-up 139

140 Continuous hydrogen production via LD-DF was performed in a 1.2-L continuously 141 stirred tank reactor (CSTR) with 0.8 L of working volume. The body of the reactor was made of glass PVC, while polypropylene was used for the base and cover. The CSTR 142 was equipped with sampling ports for both the liquid and gaseous phase (see 143 Supplementary Material). The amount of acidogenic off-gas evolved was measured by 144 using an in-house wet gas flow meter based on the water displacement method, which 145 was interconnected to the reactor using low gas permeability Marprene[®] and 146 polyethylene Tubepack® tubing. The CSTR was placed in a temperature-controlled 147 room at 37 ± 1 °C and magnetically stirred at ≈ 200 rpm. A pH controller (BSV, 148 EVOPH-P-5 model, Spain) was used to measure and maintain constant the operational 149 pH at 6.5 ± 0.1 by pumping a 6 M NaOH solution on demand (Regueira-Marcos et al., 150 151 2023). Finally, continuous FW feeding and anaerobic broth withdrawal was carried out by using a time controlled peristaltic pump and a liquid level controlled peristaltic 152 pump, respectively.

153

154

2.3 Impact of HRT on the performance of continuous lactate-driven dark 155 fermentation of food waste 156

The CSTR was operated for 51 days to assess the influence of HRT and transient 157 158 feast/famine perturbations on the FW LD-DF process performance. The response of the process to changes in the HRT was evaluated during the first 35.4 days of operation, 159 which were divided into 3 operational stages, i.e., I-III (Table 1). The HRT was 160 stepwise reduced from 24 to 16 and 12 h, leading to corresponding OLRs values of 161 162 99.5, 149.3 and 199 g COD/L-d for stage I, II and III, respectively. The CSTR reactor was initially operated in batch mode. To that aim, the reactor was filled with 720 mL of 163

FW and 80 mL of inoculum with a volatile suspended solids (VSS) concentration of 164

Journal Pre-proofs

165 0.41 ± 0.05 g/L. The initial TS content of the FW was 7.5% (*w/w*), as it was previously 166 found to be optimal for FW LD-DF (Regueira-Marcos et al., 2023). The feeding regime 167 of the reactor was switched to continuous mode during the exponential phase in regard 168 to hydrogen production. The CSTR was thus continuously fed at a variable flow rate 169 depending on the HRT tested. It is noteworthy that the FW supplied was refrigerated at 170 4 °C and had a constant TS concentration of 7.5% (*w/w*) throughout the operation.

171 Liquid samples were taken and analysed periodically during operation for the determination of pH and the concentration of carbohydrates, VS, COD, and organic 172 acids. Likewise, the flow rate of the gas produced and its composition was periodically 173 monitored. The volume of hydrogen was adjusted to standard temperature and pressure 174 conditions (0 °C and 1 atm). The HPR, HY, acidogenic off-gas quality (hydrogen 175 176 content), hydrogen production stability index (HPSI), and carboxylic acid profile were 177 selected as the main process performance indicators. HPSI was calculated as reported previously by García-Depraect et al. (2020b). The process was also characterized based 178 on VS, COD and total carbohydrates removal efficiencies, and the requirement of alkali 179 (expressed in mL OH⁻/g-VS_{added} and mL OH⁻/L-d). Energy production rate (kJ/L-d) and 180 energy production yield (kJ/g-VS_{added}) were calculated as reported elsewhere (Martínez-181 Mendoza et al., 2023). Pseudo-steady state was considered to occur when HPR 182 183 deviation remained within 20% of the mean value for at least three consecutive days.

184 See Supplementary material for a more detailed information about the equations used to

evaluate operational parameters and process performance.

186

187 2.4 Transient feast/famine perturbations on the performance of continuous lactate 188 driven dark fermentation of food waste

189 Three consecutive transient feast/famine perturbations (i.e., FF1, FF2, FF3) were applied during stage IV, from the 35th day of operation onwards, to evaluate the 190 robustness and resilience of the FW LD-DF process. All feast/famine perturbations 191 192 consisted of 12 h (equivalent to 1 HRT) of famine followed by continuous feeding at 12 h of HRT (FW feast). Before any process perturbation, the CSTR always showed HPS 193 indices $\geq 80\%$ for at least 3 consecutive days. The response of the process to transient 194 fest/famine perturbations was evaluated based on the HPR, HY, hydrogen content in the 195 gaseous phase, and the organic acids profile. More specifically, the response to famine 196 perturbations was assessed in four different states, as follows: i) pre-perturbation 197 198 pseudo-steady state, which included process data collected prior to the perturbation; ii) transient perturbation state, which included those process data collected during famine 199 conditions; iii) recovery state, which included process data collected following feeding 200 201 restauration until the start of a new pseudo-steady state, and iv) post-perturbation 202 pseudo-steady state, which included process data from the new steady state. 203 Additionally, the process was also characterized based on the settling time, which was defined as the time required by the process to reach a new pseudo-steady state (HPR 204 205 values within 20% tolerance deviation for at least 3 consecutive days) following perturbation. It is noteworthy to mention that resilience was herein defined as the ability 206 of the process to return to its steady state following the temporary feast/famine 207 disturbance, while robustness is referred to the ability of the process to remain stable 208

- and at high performance even under adverse perturbations (Stricker and Lanza, 2014).
- 210 The higher the robustness of the DF system was, the lower the modification of process
- 211 performance indicators by operational perturbations.
- 212

213 2.4 Analytical methods

The concentrations of TS, VS and total and soluble COD were measured following 214 standard methods (Eaton, 2005). The characterization of the substrate, in term of 215 CHN(O)SP, carbohydrate, protein and lipid contents, was performed according to the 216 methods previously described by Regueira-Marcos et al. (2023). The content of 217 hydrogen in the acidogenic off-gas was analysed by gas chromatography, employing a 218 Varian CP-3800 gas chromatograph (GC) equipped with a thermal conductivity detector 219 (TCD) and a Varian CP-Molsieve 5A capillary column (15 m \times 0.53 mm \times 15 μ m) 220 interconnected with a Varian CP-PoreBOND Q capillary column (25 m \times 0.53 mm \times 10 221 222 μm) (Alcántara et al., 2015). Helium, at a flow rate of 13 mL/min, was used as the 223 carrier gas. The GC-TCD was also capable of measuring methane, carbon dioxide and hydrogen sulphide. Finally, organic acids were analysed by high-performance liquid 224 225 chromatography (HPLC) using an Alliance HPLC system (model e2695, USA), which was equipped with an ultraviolet detector (214 nm) and an Aminex chromatographic 226 column (HPX-87H, Bio Rad, USA) maintained at 75 °C. A Micro-Guard Cation H+ 227 228 refill cartridge of 30 × 4.6 mm (Bio Rad, USA) was used as a pre-column. Sulfuric acid (25 mM), at a flow rate of 0.7 mL/min, was employed as the eluent. The target organic 229 acids included lactate, acetate, formate, propionate, butyrate, iso-butyrate, valerate, and 230 iso-valerate. 231

232

233 2.4 Statistical analysis

One-way ANOVA followed by the Tukey or Kruskal-Wallis test (p-value < 0.05),

depending on the case, was employed to compare the different process performance

236 measures computed during the operation. Data normality distribution was assessed with

- the Shapiro-Wilk test (p-value ≤ 0.05). All the statistical analyses were carried out using
- the Statgraphics Centurion software (version 19.2.01).
- 239

240 **3. Results and discussion**

3.1 Influence of HRT on the continuous lactate-driven dark fermentation of food waste

243 **3.1.1 Hydrogen production**

- The key operational parameter tested *viz* HRT exerted a significant effect on process performance. The HPR achieved during pseudo-steady state at an HRT of 24, 16 and 12 h accounted for 3.5 ± 1.0 , 4.2 ± 0.6 and 2.9 ± 0.6 L H₂/L-d, respectively (Table 2). As
- shown in Figure 1, the recorded HPR peaked at the beginning of the operation at 9.1 L

H₂/L-d before suddenly decreasing down to 0.7 L H₂/L-d. This behaviour in HPR is 248 typically observed in healthy DF systems and tends to occur because hydrogen 249 production kinetics are promoted batchwise (Regueira-Marcos et al., 2023). 250 Interestingly, an HRT of 24 h (stage I) led to a much less stable process with fluctuating 251 HPR values in the range of 1.9 and 4.7 L H₂/L-d and with a HPSI of 0.71. In stage II, a 252 clear trend to increase HRP until day 17th was observed, wherein reactor feeding was 253 unfortunately interrupted overnight due to tubing clogging. Following this unforeseen 254 perturbation, the LD-DF reactor was able to recover, reaching a relatively high HPSI of 255 256 0.86. An in-depth analysis of transient feast/famine perturbations is presented in section 257 3.2. In stage III, the HPR showed a gradual decreasing trend when reducing the HRT from 16 to 12 h, reaching a new equilibrium state with less than 20% variation in HPR. 258 This sharply decrease in HPR may be attributed to a transient organic overloading due 259 to the high OLR (199 g COD/L-d) imposed in stage III, as previously observed Paudel 260 et al. (2017). The DF process capacity found in this study was very similar to that 261 reported by Martinez-Mendoza et al. (2023), who assessed the continuous DF of fruit-262 vegetable waste at HRTs ranging from 24 down to 6 h using the same biocatalyst. These 263 authors reported the highest HPR (11.8 NL H₂/L-d) and HY (95.6 mL H₂/g-VS_{added}) at 264 an HRT of 9 h with a corresponding OLR value of 136.5 g COD L-d, which is very 265 similar to the OLR (149.3 g COD/L-d) associated with the best HRT in this study. 266 267 Martinez-Mendoza et al. (2023) also observed a marked decrease in HPR at 6 h HRT 268 and 182 g COD/L-d OLR, the latter parameter being quite similar to the OLR imposed herein at 12 h HRT (199 g COD/L-d). 269

A statistically significant negative correlation was found between HY and HRT 270 (Table 2). More specifically, the corresponding HY data recorded in stage I, II and III 271 272 were 48.5 ± 13.9 , 38.8 ± 5.35 and 20.4 ± 4.1 mL H₂/g-VS_{added}, respectively. In terms of energy recovery, the energy production rate ranged between 37.4 and 53.4 kJ/L-d, while 273 the computed energy yield was 0.62, 0.49 and 0.26 kJ/g-VS_{added} in stage I, II and III, 274 respectively. Regarding the quality of the off-gas produced, the hydrogen content was 275 found to be similar in operational stages I and III (57% on average), which was 276 significantly higher than that computed in stage II ($53.0 \pm 1.2\%$). No methane 277 production was observed during the entire experiment, which suggested that the short 278 279 HRT and pH values imposed washed out methanogenic communities. On the other hand, the removal efficiencies of VS remained on average at $50.9 \pm 3.6\%$ throughout 280 the entire operation. Likewise, the pseudo-steady state carbohydrate and COD removal 281 282 efficiencies averaged 90.7 ± 2.7 and $30.0 \pm 7.0\%$, 86.2 ± 3.2 and $23.8 \pm 1.1\%$, and 87.1 \pm 1.0 and 28.0 \pm 1.2 % in stage I, II and III, respectively. These results indicated that the 283 performance of the LD-DF process was not sufficiently described by the hydrogen 284 285 content in the off gas and the removal of VS, COD and carbohydrates provided valuable information, which is in accordance with previous observations (Martínez-Mendoza et 286 al., 2022; García-Depraect et al., 2023a). Finally, it was found that the shorter the HRT, 287 288 the higher the amount of alkali required for the system to keep pH constant, which ranged from 317.7 ± 56.6 to 767.2 ± 98.0 mL OH⁻/L-d (Table 2). Interestingly, the 289 alkali requirements normalised to the amount of VS fed ranged between 4.40 and 5.33 290 mL OH⁻/g-VS_{added} (on average) during operational stages I-III. 291

There are not many reports in the literature dealing with the effect of HRT on the continuous DF process using FW as substrate. Besides, the conditions and

294 methodologies applied markedly differ from each other, making the benchmarking of disclosed data difficult. Hydrogen productivity during the DF of FW has been 295 commonly reported to be in the range of 0.2–1.4 L H₂/L-d (Villanueva-Galindo et al., 296 2023), although there are few recent studies reporting higher HPR (as high as 13 L 297 H₂/L-d) (Algapani et al., 2019; Lee et al., 2014; Jung et al., 2022; Regueira-Marcos et 298 al., 2023). Thus, the LD-DF process can be considered as a promising platform to 299 produce hydrogen from FW based on the best HPR of $4.2 \pm 0.6 \text{ L H}_2/\text{L-d}$ achieved in 300 this study. However, further process optimization with enhanced hydrogen 301

302 productivities is still required.

303

304 **3.1.2 Metabolic profile**

The profile of carboxylic acids experienced well-defined trends throughout the entire 305 experiment (Figure 2). Particularly, butyrate and acetate remained at relatively high 306 307 concentrations (5.43 ± 0.96 g/L and 5.40 ± 2.17 g/L, respectively) during operational 308 stages I-III. However, low concentrations of butyrate were detected when HPR slow down by the day 17th and during the putative transient overloading in the beginning of 309 310 stage III. According to the PCA analysis, butyrate concentration was found to be positively correlated with both the HPR and HY, which were clustered together, but it 311 had a negative association with lactate and acetate (Figure 3). Notably, the 312 313 concentration of lactate in the broth skyrocketed from a few milligrams to about 9.8 g/L while HPR and butyrate plummeted from 6.1 to 1.1 L H₂/L-d and from 9.1 to 4.3 g/L 314 during the operational failure that occurred on day 17. This lactate-butyrate-HPR 315 correlation was confirmed at the beginning of stage III. Therefore, higher HPR values 316 were closely associated with low titers of lactate and acetate (specially of the former) 317 and high concentrations of butyrate in the fermentation broth, which reinforced the 318 hypothesis of hydrogen production via LD-DF (García-Depraect et al., 2021). It has 319 320 been reported that during LD-DF, lactate serves as the electron donor while acetate acts as an oxidant agent (Tao et al., 2016), explaining their close association. The putative 321 LD-DF mechanism starts with the oxidation of lactate to acetate and carbon dioxide (or 322 323 a derivative thereof), and the subsequent formation of butyrate by condensation of two moles of acetate to produce an intermediate compound that is ultimately reduced to 324 butyrate (García-Depraect et al., 2021). The behaviour of propionate, which was 325 326 detected throughout the operation at average broth concentrations of 2.24 ± 0.99 g/L, 327 was also unexpected. It is commonly recognized that propionate acts as a hydrogen sink during DF, which can be produced either from the fermentation of carbohydrates or 328 lactate (Grause et al., 2012; Fuess et al., 2018). Here it seems that propionate was 329 negatively related to lactate (Figure 3). It has been reported that propionate can be 330 331 produced from lactate, thereby leading to lower hydrogen production (Chen et al., 2019; Sim et al., 2022). Sim et al. (2019) avoided the conversion of lactate to propionate by 332 Megasphaera elsdenii by bioaugmenting the process with Clostridium butyricum which 333 can oxidase lactate to hydrogen. Other soluble metabolite identified over the course of 334 335 the process was iso-valerate, with concentrations ranging from 2.1 g/L in stage I to 0.15 g/L in stage III, regardless of the behaviour of hydrogen production, suggesting that the 336 production of iso-valerate did not significantly affect the electron flux toward hydrogen. 337

339 3.2 Influence of feast-famine perturbations on the continuous lactate-driven dark 340 fermentation of food waste

341 3.2.1 Hydrogen production during transient feast/famine perturbations

342 Feast/famine perturbations did not cause a severe deterioration on the degradation efficiency of carbohydrates and VS, which varied between 71.3 and 93.4 % and 343 between 43.2 and 52.0 %, respectively. Hydrogen content in the acidogenic off-gas was 344 slightly reduced only during famine conditions, from $52.3 \pm 2.5\%$ down to $41.5 \pm 1.7\%$, 345 but it rapidly returned to previous values after FW feeding resumption. However, all the 346 three feast/famine perturbations intentionally applied led to a similar process's 347 348 behaviour, which was characterized by a significant reduction in HPR during famine operation followed by an up-down HPR response following perturbation and 349 subsequent HPR stabilization (Figure 4). It is also worth noting that the HY response to 350 feast/famine perturbations showed a similar trend to the one observed for HPR, pointing 351 out that the LD-DF process had the ability to bounce back from perturbation (Figure 4). 352 Previous studies have also pointed out the resilience of dark fermenters against different 353 354 types of stresses such a sudden pH acidification/alkalinization, organic overloading, substrate composition, and starvation (Park et al. 2015; Monroy et al., 2018; García-355 Depraect et al., 2020a). 356

357 Four different stages were defined using HPR as target process indicator, i.e., i) 358 initial pseudo-steady state, ii) transient perturbation state, iii) recovery state, and iv) post-perturbation pseudo-steady state in order to have a deeper in-sight in the 359 feast/famine perturbation effect. The preceding steady state HPR value of 2.9, 2.8, and 360 3.7 L H₂/L-d was used as reference for FF1, FF2 and FF3, respectively. A ratio between 361 the HPR recorded during the four different stages and the reference HPR higher than 1 362 indicates a global process enhancement, while a global HPR reduction can be inferred 363 from a ratio lower than 1 (Table 3). On average, the HPR recorded under starvation 364 conditions (transient perturbation state) decreased to 0.7 ± 0.3 L H₂/L-d. Interestingly, 365 when comparing the HPR achieved during transient perturbation state with the steady-366 state HPR computed prior to perturbation, a more pronounced decrease in HPR was 367 368 observed as perturbations were applied, pointing out that the process became more susceptible to starvation as feast/famine operation progressed. During the recovery state 369 (which lasted for 2.13, 1.31 and 1.35 for FF1, FF2, and FF3, respectively) HPR 370 371 suddenly peaked to 10.1, 19.2 and 7.7 L H₂/L-d and rapidly levelled off reaching a new steady state. The underlying mechanisms of the observed behaviour need to be further 372 investigated. However, the r/K selection theory could explain in some extent the sudden 373 increase in HPR recorded. In this regard, lactate-oxidizing-HPB are classified as r-374 strategists with high growth rate and a competitive advantage in resource-rich 375 376 environments. In contrast, LAB are suggested to be K-strategists with a high biomass 377 specific uptake rate for fermentable carbohydrates (Kim et al., 2021). Thus, it was 378 hypothesized that temporary starvation and subsequent feeding somewhat improved the activity of lactate-oxidizing -HPB, which could explain the HPR patterns observed 379 380 during the transient perturbation state and the recovery state. The assumption of an enhanced hydrogen-producing activity could also endorse the behaviour of HPR 381 identified during the post-perturbation pseudo-steady state. The HPR computed after 382 perturbation was similar to the reference HPR value in FF1, and 33 and 17% higher in 383 FF2 and FF3, respectively. This entailed an increase in hydrogen productivity after 384

three feast/famine stresses despite an HRT of 12 h was not the best operating condition,as discussed previously in section 3.1.

387

388 3.2.2 Metabolic profile during transient feast/famine perturbations

389 The transient feast/famine perturbations impacted not only the hydrogen production performance but also the profile of organic acids (Figure 3). Compared to an HRT of 16 390 h, an HRT of 12 h was found to be more conducive to the accumulation of lactate and 391 392 acetate, but not of butyrate and propionate. Interestingly, all perturbation events applied resulted in a sudden and drastic decrease in lactate and acetate levels, and increases in 393 butyrate, propionate and, to a lesser extent formate, after feeding restoration, which 394 395 agrees with previous observations (Monroy et al., 2018). Hence, feast/famine perturbations likely triggered bacterial acidogenic activity, leading to a peak in the 396 alkali requirement (Figure 4). In the LD-DF process, hydrogen production is closely 397 related to the evolution of lactate. The low levels of lactate (electron donor) and acetate 398 (acceptor donor) observed during the recovery state seems to reinforce the assumption 399 that transient feast/famine cycles fostered, at least temporarily, the activity of lactate-400 oxidizing-HPB (Tao et al., 2016; Fuess et al., 2018). As discussed previously, the 401 402 operational failure on day 17 is very illustrative for that case (Figure 2). In LD-DF, it has been argued that low concentrations of lactate in the broth are an indicator of an 403 efficient process (García-Depraect et al., 2021). Thus, the fact that the broth 404 405 concentrations of lactate and acetate slowly returned to high concentrations during the post-perturbation pseudo-steady state was likely attributed to the suboptimal HRT/OLR 406 condition imposed (Paudel et al., 2017). Therefore, it can be hypothesized that 12 h of 407 408 HRT boosted the activity of LAB over HPB, which would lead to a gradual accumulation of lactate under long term operation. 409

410 In brief, the present LD-DF study targeted an enhanced hydrogen production from FW. This alternative hydrogen-producing approach can cope with the inhibition 411 412 issues related to the overgrowth of LAB, which typically outcompete HPB for fermentable carbohydrates (García-Depraect et al., 2021; Canto-Robertos et al., 2023). 413 This study also helped filling the knowledge gap of continuous LD-DF of organic 414 waste, which has been commonly studied in batch mode (e.g., Martínez-Mendoza et al., 415 2022; Lois-Regueira et al., 2023). The LD-DF process herein evaluated resulted in 416 relatively high hydrogen productivities and confirmed the key role of HRT on stable 417 418 process performance. Additionally, the LD-DF process was tested against temporary feast/famine disturbances, mimicking a stress that could occur in large DF plants. 419 Despite the process rapidly deteriorated during famine periods, leading to low hydrogen 420 production, the LD-DF exhibited a high resilience. Although the Readiness Technology 421 Level (RTL) of DF is 5-6, it is expected that some unforeseen and/or foreseen 422 perturbations can exist in further large-scale systems. In this line, further studies should 423 focus on the impact of different operational perturbations, e.g., shocks in pH, organic 424 425 load, temperature, and long starvation, etc, on process performance and the structure of the microbial populations. One of the weaknesses of this study was the use of synthetic 426 organic recipe, which was used in the proof of concept of the continuous hydrogen 427 production from FW via LD-DF. It is thus highly recommended to conduct further 428 validation studies using real FW, which is expected to be more complex than the recipe-429

Journal Pre-proofs

430 based FW. Real FW would present a high autochthonous bacteria load, be highly

431 heterogenous and pre-acidified at some extent, all of which can impact the process.

Finally, it must be pointed out that the peak in HPR observed during the transient state

following famine conditions along with the associated profile of lactate strongly

suggested that an adequate balance between LAB and lactate-oxidizing-HPB is crucial

to support a high hydrogen production rate. Further studies should not only perform
molecular analyses to get an in-depth knowledge of the microbiome involved but also to

436 indicedual analyses to get an in-depth knowledge of the incrobioline involved but also t437 bridge the gap between process design and strategy and microbial and ecological

438 aspects. The development of novel strategies aiming at improving the syntrophic

439 association between LAB and HPB can further boost the high HPR herein achieved.

440

441 **4.** Conclusions

442 The influence of the HRT on the continuous LD-DF of FW was investigated for the first

time. The best hydrogen production performance was found at 16 h of HRT, leading to a more stable operation and a HPR of $4.2 \text{ L H}_2/\text{L}$ -d. Lactate consumption was identified

a more stable operation and a first of $4.2 \pm 11_2/2$ -d. Eactate consumption was identified as the main hydrogen-producing pathway rather than the one-step fermentation of

445 as the main hydrogen-producing pathway rather than the one-step refinentation of 446 carbohydrates. Further operation under temporary feast/famine perturbations evidenced

447 a poor robustness of the process, but it exhibited a prominent resilient capacity

following the disturbed operation. Overall, the LD-DF process supported promising

449 results for the further optimization of continuous hydrogen production from real FW.

450

451 E-supplementary data for this work can be found in the e-version of this paper online.

452

453 Acknowledgments

This work has received funding from the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and 454 innovation programme under the Marie Skłodowska-Curie grant agreement No. 894515. 455 The work was also supported by Grant RYC2021-034559-I funded by MCIN/AEI 456 /10.13039/501100011033 and by European Union NextGenerationEU/PRTR. The 457 regional government of Castilla v León and the European FEDER Programme (CLU 458 2017-09, CL-EI-2021-07 and UIC 315) are also acknowledged for their support. The 459 co-financial support of the "Consejería de Educación" of the regional government of 460 Castilla y León and the European Social Fund are also acknowledged. 461

462

463 **5. References**

[1] Alcántara, C., Fernández, C., García-Encina, P.A., Muñoz, R., 2015. Mixotrophic
metabolism of *Chlorella sorokiniana* and algal-bacterial consortia under extended darklight periods and nutrient starvation. Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 99, 2393–2404.
[2] Algapani, D.E., Qiao, W., Ricci, M., Bianchi, D., Wandera, S.M., Adani, F.,
Dang, B., 2010. Dia hudra gan and his methane and duction from food wastering.

468 Dong, R., 2019. Bio-hydrogen and bio-methane production from food waste in a two-

- stage anaerobic digestion process with digestate recirculation. Renew. Energ. 130, 469 1108-1115. 470 Battista, F., Frison, N., Pavan, P., Cavinato, C., Gottardo, M., Fatone, F., Eusebi, 471 [3] A.L. Majone, M., Zeppilli, M., Valentino, F., Fino, D., Tommasi, T., Bolzonella, D., 472 2020. Food wastes and sewage sludge as feedstock for an urban biorefinery producing 473 biofuels and added-value bioproducts. J. Chem. Technol. Biotechnol. 95(2), 328-338. 474 Canto-Robertos, M., Quintal-Franco, C., Ponce-Caballero, C., Vega-De Lille, M., 475 [4] Moreno-Andrade, I., 2023. Inhibition of hydrogen production by endogenous 476 477 microorganisms from food waste. Braz. J. Chem. Eng. 40(1), 137-150. Chen, L., Shen, Y., Wang, C., Ding, L., Zhao, F., Wang, M., Fu, J., Wang, H., 478 [5] 2019. Megasphaera elsdenii lactate degradation pattern shifts in rumen acidosis models. 479 Front. Microbiol. 10, 162. 480 Cheng, D., Ngo, H.H., Guo, W., Chang, S.W., Nguyen, D.D., Deng, L., Chen, Z., 481 [6] Ye, Y., Bui, X.T., Hoang, N.B., 2022. Advanced strategies for enhancing dark 482 fermentative biohydrogen production from biowaste towards sustainable environment. 483 Bioresour. Technol. 351, 127045. 484 Dawood, F., Anda, M., Shafiullah, G.M., 2020. Hydrogen production for energy: 485 [7] An overview. Int. J. Hydrog. Energy 45, 3847–3869. 486 Detman, A., Mielecki, D., Chojnacka, A., Salamon, A., Błaszczyk, M.K., Sikora, 487 [8] 488 A., 2019. Cell factories converting lactate and acetate to butyrate: Clostridium butyricum and microbial communities from dark fermentation bioreactors. Microb. Cell 489 490 Factories 18, 36. Eaton, A.D., Clesceri, L.S., Greenberg, A.E., 2005. Standard methods for the 491 [9] examination of water and wastewater, 21st ed. American Public Health 492 Association/American Water Works Association/Water Environment Federation, 493 494 Washington DC. [10] European Commission, Directorate-General for Energy, 2020. Communication 495 from the commission to the European parliament, the council, the European economic 496 and social committee and the committee of the regions a hydrogen strategy for a 497 498 climate-neutral Europe. https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-499 content/EN/ALL/?uri=CELEX:52020DC0301. [11] Eurostat. 2022. Food waste: 127 kg per inhabitant in the EU in 2020. 500 https://ec.europa.eu/12urostat/web/products-eurostat-news/-/ddn-20220925-2. 501 502 [12] Fattibene, D., Recanati, F., Dembska, K., Antonelli, M., 2020. Urban food waste: A framework to analyse policies and initiatives. Resources 9(9), 99. 503 [13] Fuess, L.T., Júnior, A.D.N.F., Machado, C.B., Zaiat, M., 2018. Temporal 504 505 dynamics and metabolic correlation between lactate-producing and hydrogen-producing bacteria in sugarcane vinasse dark fermentation: the key role of lactate. Bioresour. 506 Technol. 247, 426-433. 507 508 [14] García-Depraect, O., Diaz-Cruces, V. F., Rene, E. R., León-Becerril, E., 2020a. Changes in performance and bacterial communities in a continuous biohydrogen-509 producing reactor subjected to substrate-and pH-induced perturbations. Bioresour. 510 Technol. 295, 122182. 511 [15] García-Depraect, O., Muñoz, R., van Lier, J. B., Rene, E. R., Diaz-Cruces, V. F., 512 León-Becerril, E., 2020b. Three-stage process for tequila vinasse valorization through 513
- 513 Leon-Becerrii, E., 2020b. I nree-stage process for tequila vinasse valorization through
- sequential lactate, biohydrogen and methane production. Bioresour. Technol. 307,
- 515 123160.

[16] García-Depraect, O., Castro-Muñoz, R., Muñoz, R., Rene, E.R., León-Becerril, 516 E., Valdez-Vazquez, I., Gopalakrishnan, K., Reves-Alvarado, L.C., Martínez-Mendoza, 517 L.J., Carillo-Reyes, J., Buitrón, G., 2021. A review on the factors influencing 518 biohydrogen production from lactate: The key to unlocking enhanced dark fermentative 519 processes. Bioresour. Technol. 324, 124595. 520 521 [17] García-Depraect, O., Mena-Navarro, V., Muñoz, R., Rene, E. R., León-Becerril, E., 2023a. Effect of nitrogen and iron supplementation on the process performance and 522 microbial community structure of a hydrogen-producing reactor continuously fed with 523 524 tequila vinasse. Fuel 334, 126736. [18] García-Depraect, O., Mirzazada, I., Martínez-Mendoza, L. J., Regueira-Marcos, 525 L., Muñoz, R., 2023b. Biotic and abiotic insights into the storage of food waste and its 526 effect on biohydrogen and methane production potential. J. Water Process Eng. 53, 527 103840. 528 [19] Grause, G., Igarashi, M., Kameda, T., Yoshioka, T., 2012. Lactic acid as a 529 530 substrate for fermentative hydrogen production. Int. J. Hydrog. Energy 37(22), 16967-16973. 531 [20] Habashy, M.M., Ong, E.S., Abdeldavem, O.M., Al-Sakkari, E.G., Rene, E.R., 532 2021. Food waste: a promising source of sustainable biohydrogen fuel. Trends 533 Biotechnol. 39(12), 1274–1288. 534 535 [21] Jung, J.-H., Sim, Y.-B., Ko, J., Park, S.Y., Kim, G.-B., Kim, S.-H., 2022. Biohydrogen and biomethane production from food waste using a two-stage dynamic 536 membrane bioreactor (DMBR) system. Bioresour. Technol. 352, 127094. 537 [22] Kim, D.-H., Park, J.-H., Kim, S.-H., Kumar, G., Lee, B.-D., Kumar, S., Yoon, J.-538 J., 2021. Shift of microbial community structure by substrate level in dynamic 539 membrane bioreactor for biohydrogen production. Int. J. Energy Res. 45(12), 17408-540 17416. 541 [23] Lee, C., Lee, S., Han, S.-K., Hwang, S., 2014. Effect of operational pH on 542 biohydrogen production from food waste using anaerobic batch reactors. Water Sci. 543 Technol. 69, 1886-1893. 544 [24] Martínez-Mendoza, L.J., Lebrero, R., Muñoz, R., García-Depraect, O., 2022. 545 546 Influence of key operational parameters on biohydrogen production from fruit and vegetable waste via lactate-driven dark fermentation. Bioresour. Technol. 364, 128070. 547 [25] Martínez-Mendoza, L.J., García-Depraect, O., Muñoz, R., 2023. Unlocking the 548 549 high-rate continuous performance of fermentative hydrogen bioproduction from fruit and vegetable residues by modulating hydraulic retention time. Bioresour. Technol. 550 373, 128716. 551 [26] Monroy, I., Bakonyi, P., Buitrón, G., 2018. Temporary feeding shocks increase 552 the productivity in a continuous biohydrogen-producing reactor. Clean Technol. 553 554 Environ. Policy. 20, 1581-1588. [27] Neves, L., Gonçalo, E., Oliveira, R., Alves, M.M., 2008. Influence of composition 555 on the biomethanation potential of restaurant waste at mesophilic temperatures. Waste 556 Manage. 28, 965-972. 557 [28] Ohnishi, A., Hasegawa, Y., Fujimoto, N., Suzuki, M., 2022. Biohydrogen 558 production by mixed culture of Megasphaera elsdenii with lactic acid bacteria as 559 lactate-driven dark fermentation. Bioresour. Technol. 343, 126076. 560 [29] Park, J.-H., Kumar, G., Park, J.-H., Park, H.-D., Kim, S.-H., 2015. Changes in 561 performance and bacterial communities in response to various process disturbances in a 562 high-rate biohydrogen reactor fed with galactose. Bioresour. Technol. 188, 109-116. 563

Journal Pre-proofs

- [30] Park, J.-H., Kim, D.-H., Baik, J.-H., Park, J.-H., Yoon, J.-J., Lee, C.-Y., Kim, S.-564 H., 2021. Improvement in H₂ production from *Clostridium butyricum* by co-culture with 565 Sporolactobacillus vineae. Fuel 285, 119051. 566 [31] Paudel, S., Kang, Y., Yoo, Y.-S., Seo, G.T., 2017. Effect of volumetric organic 567 loading rate (OLR) on H₂ and CH₄ production by two-stage anaerobic co-digestion of 568 569 food waste and brown water. Waste Manage. 61, 484-493. [32] Pérez-Rangel, M., Barboza-Corona, J.E., Navarro-Díaz, M., Escalante, A.E., 570 Valdez-Vazquez, I., 2021. The duo Clostridium and Lactobacillus linked to hydrogen 571 production from a lignocellulosic substrate. Water Sci. Technol. 83(12), 3033-3040. 572 573 [33] Regueira-Marcos, L., García-Depraect, O., Muñoz, R., 2023. Elucidating the role of pH and total solids content in the co-production of biohydrogen and carboxylic acids 574 from food waste via lactate-driven dark fermentation. Fuel 338, 127238. 575 [34] Scherhaufer, S., Moates, G., Hartikainen, H., Waldron, K., Obersteiner G., 2018. 576 Environmental impacts of food waste in Europe. Waste Manage. 77, 98-113. 577 578 [35] Sikora, A., Błaszczyk, M., Jurkowski, M., Zielenkiewicz, U., 2013. Lactic acid bacteria in hydrogen-producing consortia: on purpose or by coincidence?, in: Kongo, 579 J.M. (Ed.), Lactic Acid Bacteria - R & D for Food, Health and Livestock Purposes. 580 IntechOpen, Craotia, pp. 488-514. 581 [36] Shanmugam, S., Mathimani, T., Rajendran, K., Sekar, M., Rene, E.R., Chi, 582 583 N.T.L., Ngo, H.G., Pugazhendhi, A., 2023. Perspective on the strategies and challenges in hydrogen production from food and food processing wastes. Fuel 338, 127376. 584 [37] Sim, Y.-B., Yang, J., Joo, H. H., Jung, J.-H., Kim, D.-H., Kim, S.-H., 2022. Effect 585 of bioaugmentation using Clostridium butyricum on the start-up and the performance of 586 continuous biohydrogen production. Bioresour. Technol. 366, 128181. 587 [38] Sivagurunathan, P., Kumar, G., Bakonyi, P., Kim, S.-H., Kobayashi, T., Xu, K.Q., 588 Lakner, G., Tóth, G., Nemestóthy, N., Bélafi-Bakó, K., 2016. A critical review on 589 issues and overcoming strategies for the enhancement of dark fermentative hydrogen 590 production in continuous systems. Int. J. Hydrog. Energy 41(6), 3820–3836. 591 [39] Stricker, N., Lanza, G., 2014. The concept of robustness in production systems 592 and its correlation to disturbances. Procedia CIRP 19, 87-92. 593 594 [40] Talan, A., Tiwari, B., Yadav, B., Tyagi, R.D., Wong, J.W.C., Drogui, P., 2021. Food waste valorization: Energy production using novel integrated systems. Bioresour. 595 Technol. 322, 124538. 596 597 [41] Tao, Y., Hu, X., Zhu, X., Jin, H., Xu, Z., Tang, Q., Li, X., 2016. Production of butyrate from lactate by a newly isolated *Clostridium* sp. BPY5. Appl. Biochem. 598 Biotechnol. 179, 361-374. 599 [42] Villanueva-Galindo, E., Vital-Jácome, M., Moreno-Andrade, I., 2023. Dark 600 fermentation for H₂ production from food waste and novel strategies for its 601 enhancement. Int. J. Hydrog. Energy 48(27), 9957–9970. 602 603 [43] Yun, Y.-M., Lee, M.-K., Im, S.-W., Marone, A., Trably, E., Shin, S.-R., Kim, M.-G., Cho, S.-K., Kim, D.-H., 2018. Biohydrogen production from food waste: current 604 status, limitations, and future perspectives. Bioresour. Technol. 248, 79-87. 605 606 [44] Zabaniotou, A., Kamaterou, P., 2019. Food waste valorization advocating Circular Bioeconomy – A critical review of potentialities and perspectives of spent coffee 607 grounds biorefinery. J. Clean. Prod. 211, 1553-1566. 608 609
- 610
- 611

- 612
- 613
- 614
- 615
- 616
- 617

618 Figure captions:

Fig. 1. Time course of A) hydrogen production rate (HPR), hydrogen content, and
volatile solids (VS) and total carbohydrates (CH) removal, and B) hydrogen yield (HY)
and alkali requirement during the continuous LD-DF of FW. Vertical dotted lines stand

for the shifts in HRT (24, 18 and 12 h for stage I, II and III, respectively).

Fig. 2. Time course of organic acids concentration and HPR during the continuous LD-DF of FW at decreasing HRTs (24, 18 and 12 h for stage I, II and III, respectively).

Fig. 3. Principal component analysis (PCA) based on the evolution in HPR, HY and the
concentration of lactate, acetate, propionate and butyrate at decreasing HRTs (24, 18
and 12 h for stage I, II and III, respectively).

- **Fig. 4.** Time course of A) hydrogen production rate (HPR), hydrogen content, and
- volatile solids (VS) and total carbohydrates (CH) removal, and B) hydrogen yield (HY)
- and alkali requirement during the feast/famine perturbations applied in the continuous
- 631 LD-DF of FW. Vertical shaded bars indicate the length of famine condition.
- **Fig. 5**. Time course of organic acids concentration and HPR during the feast/famine
- 633 perturbations applied in the continuous LD-DF of FW. Vertical shaded bars indicate the
- 634 length of famine condition.

Parameter	Stage I	Stage II	Stage III	Stage IV
Time (days)	0–11.4	11.4–26.0	26.0-35.4	35.4–51.0
HRT (h)	24	16	12	12
OLR (g VS/L-d)	72.0	108.0	144.0	144.0
OLR (g COD/L-d)	99.5	149.25	199.0	199.0
HRT cycles (-)	11.4	21.9	18.8	31.2

Table 1. Summary of the operating conditions tested during the continuous LD-DF ofFW.

637 Note: Stages I to III aimed at investigating the effect of HRT on the continuous LD-DF

of FW, while stage IV was devoted to the study process performance under transient

639 feast/famine perturbations. HRT: Hydraulic retention time; OLR: Organic loading rate;

640 COD: Chemical oxygen demand.

Parameter	Stage I	II	III
HRT	24	16	12
HPR (L $H_2/L-d$)	$3.5 \pm 1.0 \text{ ab}$	4.2 ± 0.6 a	$2.9\pm0.6\;b$
HY (mL H ₂ /g-VS _{added})	$48.5\pm13.9a$	$38.8 \pm \mathbf{5.35b}$	$20.4\pm4.1c$
H ₂ content (%)	$56.5 \pm 2.9a$	$53.0 \pm 1.2 b$	$56.9 \pm 2.2a$
VS _{removal} (%)	52.5 ± 6.3	49.8 ± 2.5	51.8 ± 3.6
CH _{removal} (%)	90.7 ± 2.7	86.2 ± 3.2	87.1 ± 1.0
COD _{removal} (%)	30.0 ± 7.0	23.8 ± 1.1	28.0 ± 1.2
Alkali requirement (mL OH ⁻ L/L-d)	317.1 ± 56.6a	$507.7\pm 66.8b$	$762.2\pm98.1\text{c}$
Alkali requirement (mL OH ⁻ /g-VS _{added})	$4.4\pm0.8a$	$4.7\pm0.6ab$	$5.3\pm0.7b$
Energy production rate (kJ/L-d)	$44.5\pm12.7ab$	$53.4 \pm 7.4a$	$37.4 \pm 7.5b$
Energy yield (kJ/g-VS _{added})	$0.62\pm0.18a$	$0.49\pm0.07b$	$0.26\pm0.05\texttt{c}$

Table 2. Summary of the process performance indicators collected during the 642

continuous FW LD-DF process. 643

Note: HRT: Hydraulic retention time; HPR: Hydrogen production rate; HY: hydrogen 644

yield. Mean and deviation data is reported during pseudo-steady state, which lasted for 645

3.1, 7.0 and 4.3 days in stage I, II and III, respectively. Means with the same letter in the 646 same raw do not differ significatively ($p \le 0.05$). The sample size was 6, 15 and 10 for

647 stage I, II and III, respectively. 648

Conditi on	Settling period (Days)	TPS	TPS/	RS	RS/	PPSS	PPSS/
		(L H ₂ /L- d)	referenc e	(L H ₂ /L- d)	referenc e	(L H ₂ /L- d)	referenc e
FF1	2.13	1.03	0.68	7.2	2.46	2.8	0.96
FF2	1.31	0.65	0.23	10.80	3.90	3.7	1.33
FF3	1.35	0.39	0.11	5.5	1.48	4.3	1.17
Average	1.6 ± 0.5	$\begin{array}{c} 0.69 \pm \\ 0.32 \end{array}$	0.3 ± 0.3	7.9 ± 2.7	2.6 ± 1.2	3.6 ± 0.8	1.2 ± 0.2

Table 3. Summary of hydrogen productivities achieved from the LD-DF of FW duringthe different stages assessed under feast/famine perturbations.

Note: Settling time is defined as the time required by the process to reach a new pseudosteady state following perturbation. TPS (transient perturbation state): HPR recorded along the 12-h starvation period. RS (recovery state): HPR computed during the settling period. PPSS (post-perturbation pseudo-steady state): average HPR achieved during a new steady state after perturbation. TPS/reference, RS/reference and PPSS/reference indicate the ratio between the value of HPR attained in TPS, RS or PPSS and the

657 immediately preceding pseudo-steady HPR value. The steady-state HPR data recorded658 prior to FF1, FF2 and FF3 were used as the reference. For interpretation of the obtained

ratios, the reader is kindly referred to section 3.2.1.



Figure 1



Figure 2



667

Figure 3



Figure 4







Highlights

689 LD-DF showed high potential for continuous H₂ production from simulated FW
690 HRT impacted on LD-DF, with maximum HPR of 4.2 ± 0.6 NL H₂/L-d at 16 h
691 Feast/Famine stress resulted in low robustness of HPR against the perturbation
692 Fast stability recovery after perturbation highlighted LD-DF as resilient process
693 High HPRs correlated with lactate/acetate consumption and butyrate production