# Effective strategies for Integrating Pronunciation Instruction With a Focus on Intelligibility and Comprehensibility for Adult ESL Students

By: Ashley E. Carrel

A capstone submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages (TESOL)

Hamline University

Saint Paul, Minnesota

May 2023

Capstone Project Facilitator(s): Julia Reimer and Maggie Struck Content Reviewers: Heather Huckstadt-Gonzalez and Diane Powers

#### **Project Summary**

After over a decade of experience teaching adult ESL learners and getting asked by multiple students every semester how they can improve their pronunciation, I was still feeling like I was unequipped and ill prepared to teach pronunciation effectively to my students. Because of this I was led to create my research question that guided this project: What are some effective strategies for integrating pronunciation instruction in an adult ESL course with the focus being on intelligibility and comprehensibility? Research has shown that I was not alone in my situation and that ESL instructors often do not feel adequately trained to teach proper pronunciation and give corrective feedback efficiently in their adult classrooms. (Alzahrani, 2021; Darcy et al., 2020).

The purpose of this project is to equip adult ESL instructors in their confidence and capabilities of teaching pronunciation to their students. After reading through extensive literature on this subject, I came to the realization that pronunciation is most effectively taught while using an intelligibility approach as opposed to a nativeness approach. In addition, it is more practical to focus on intelligibility over accent reduction as a native like accent is seen as an unrealistic goal for language learners. We must also take into account the ethical ramifications of teaching students that a non-native accent is a liability to one's success in the United States.

The project includes a two and half hour professional development workshop that is primarily presented with a Powerpoint presentation slideshow. The slides cover a brief overview of the nativeness and intelligibility approaches and why I chose to focus on intelligibility and comprehensibility over accent reduction. The presentation divides segmental and suprasegmental parts of English pronunciation and breaks them down into basic ways to understand and teach

the concepts. It provides practical hands-on activities for teachers to use with their students and provides new resources for a variety of elements such as consonant and vowel sounds, intonation, word stress, and thought groups. This project includes the speaker's notes and a slide description for all the slides.

A professional learning community was created for teachers to continue the conversation and collaborate with one another after the professional development workshop is completed. Included in this project are the monthly discussion guides that each group will receive. In each of these guides there will be opportunities for teachers to create an inventory of helpful resources and compile them together with others. Teachers will use these guides during their meetings which occur the first week of each month for the semester. Many of the materials were based on the activities or discussions that were found in *Teaching Pronunciation: A Course Book and Reference Guide* by Celce-Muria et. al. and *Teaching Adult ESL: a practical introduction (1st ed.)* by Betsy Parrish.

The hope is that the professional development workshop and the professional learning community will equip and prepare these adult ESL instructors to guide students in their desire to become more intelligible in their speech without an unrealistic expectation of speaking just like a native speaker. This project aims to empower teachers to feel more confident and comfortable with teaching pronunciation activities and skills to their students.

# Effective strategies for Integrating Pronunciation Instruction With a Focus on

# Intelligibility and Comprehensibility for Adult ESL Students

# PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT WORKSHOP

**Estimated Time: 2.5 hours** 

**Link for Slides: Powerpoint Slideshow** 

Slides	Content	Approximate Time
Slide 1 and 2	Welcome. Introduce myself and my experience.	5 min
Slide 3-4	<ul> <li>Teachers' Beliefs Survey</li> <li>Teachers will have filled out the google form individually before the workshop.</li> <li>A copy of the survey will be printed for each small group table to read outloud.</li> <li>Compare and contrast your answers with a small group of 3-4</li> <li>Discuss the biggest questions and concerns about pronunciation instruction for your students.</li> <li>Report back to large group discussion</li> <li>GIve statistic on slide 4 and see if there is agreement</li> </ul>	15 min
Slide 5	Nativeness Approach There are lots of red flags that we find with the	2 minutes

	approach that teaches that it is realistic to completely eliminate a foreign accent and speak like a native! What are they? First, We can see glimpses of racism as it teaches that an accent is a liability to success. Secondly, we see it taught as a magic method that is done is record amount of speed at ease Lastly, they usually charge a hefty sum of money and is not often taught in academic settings. It's a for profit business.	
Slide 6	"What does a native accent sound like to you? How would YOU pronounce these words?  • Allow teachers to yell out answers and it is likely that they will be pronounced differently. We can see from this small exercise that there is variation in pronunciation even among native speakers and there is no perfect "native accent"	5 minutes
Slide 7, 8, 9,	If nativeness is not the goal then what is? Intelligibility!  • Give definitions of intelligibility  • Ask for examples of celebrities or famous	5 minutes

	people who have non native accents but are still intelligible? Maybe there are teachers in this room? When we stop to think about it, we realize that an accent has no relation to intelligibility! We may need to remind our students of this!	
Slide 9	The Role of the Listener In the intelligibility and comprehensibility approach, the listener is no longer a silent partner.  Communication is a two-way street  As ESL teachers we cannot train others to be better listeners, so what do we teach and how do we help our students?  How often do your students know the word they are saying is correct, yet the listener cannot seem to understand them? Is the listener trying? Has this happened in your own classroom between you and a student? Do you think native speakers feel any responsibility in their role of understanding, when they are talking with a non-native speaker?  • Let 1-2 teachers	5 minutes

	respond to these	
	questions before	
	moving on.	
Slide 10	Metaphonological	5 minutes
	Awareness	
	1. Ghoti? Allow	
	different responses to	
	be given before	
	saying the answer is "Fish". <i>How is the</i>	
	answer fish? GH-	
	what does that sound	
	like in words such as	
	Rough or enough? 0-	
	what does the o sound	
	like in the word	
	"women?" ti- what	
	does the ti sound like	
	in word like action or	
	fiction? DO you see	
	how our students	
	could be confused on	
	which letters make	
	which sounds?	
	2. Do these words	
	rhyme? Rough and	
	Cough. Lost and Most. One and Bone	
	No they don't!	
	3. What does the a	
	sound like in Banana.	
	Every a in this word	
	sounds differently!	
	4. How many sounds	
	are there in English?	
	Wait and Allow	
	answers to be given.	
	When I ask my	
	students, they usually	
	say 26 because there	
	are 26 letters in the	
	alphabet, but we can	
	obviously see that a	

	letter doesn't always make the same sounds. In fact some say that there are over 100 sounds in the ENglish language.	
Slide 11	IPA Chart Is anyone familiar with the IPA chart or ever used it in their teaching? We can categorize pronunciation into two categories: Segmental and Suprasegmental. Segmentals deal with the individual and specific sounds that are made.  • Show how the place of articulation starts at the front of the mouth with bi-labial and moves backwards. • Manner of articulation describes HOW the airstream is affected as it flows out. • Every detail of the IPA chart does not need to be covered. This is just a general overview. Give some examples! • The main idea is to show that there is a chart of sounds that go above the alphabet phonics native speakers learn. • It is helpful for teachers to study these on their own.	5 minutes
Slide 12	Place of articulation • Give a few examples	3 minutes

	like the /p/ and /b/ and /t/ or /g/ and how the place changes in your air flow	
Slide 13	<ul> <li>Manner of Articulation</li> <li>Only need to review nasal, plosive and fricative. Read the examples on the slide and ask if there are any questions.</li> <li>Remember to point out that there are more, but for the sake of time we can only cover a few.</li> </ul>	3 minutes
Slide 14	Teaching with IPA  • Remind teachers that the IPA chart is mostly for them to understand and that they don't need to teach our level of students to memorize this chart.	2 minutes
Slide 15	Sounds that don't exist in English  Ask if anyone has an example in their native language. Give examples on slide Have teachers think through the languages of their students they have had recently. Encourage them to look up the sounds that don't exist in those languages or ask their students	5 minutes

Slide 16	<ul> <li>Explain the chart noting that the front, central, back refers to where the sound is produced. While the close- open describes the position of your mouth.</li> <li>Give an example of the sounds going from front to back and close to open.</li> <li>Give examples of words to show the comparisons: Eat vs Ate, Beat vs Boot,</li> </ul>	5
Slide 17	Example Exercises for Segmental Pronunciation  • Having students SEE the sounds they are making is important and something they probably aren't doing on their own. Beach vs Bitch example: I always tell students that they are probably smiling when talking about the 'beach'', however their mouth would be more rounded and less smily if they are using the word "bitch"  • Hold a piece of paper up to your lips as you say the /p/ sound vs the /b/ sound. Notice that the paper will move when you say /p/ and will remain motionless when you	5 minutes

	say /b/. Students can easily do this activity as short activity in class  • Listening is important to highlight for segmentals.	
Slide 18-19	Listening Perception: Can you hear a difference?  Listen to the examples given by a Korean student. Ask teachers for each word if they were the same word or different words being spoken? Could they hear any differences between the examples 1-5? Korean Words  Each word spoken was a completely different word with a very different meaning. If there is a Korean speaker they could repeat the words.  Ask teachers if it was difficult to hear the differences the first time.  Play the record ing again and see if it was any easier.  Emphasize the importance of repeated listening activities.	5 minutes
Slide 20- 21	Use English Minimal Pairs Similarly!	5 minutes

	<ul> <li>Read through examples.</li> <li>Students hold up a 1 or 2 with their fingers for which word they heard.</li> <li>Intelligibility Approach</li> <li>Teachers have probably done minimal pair activities before.</li> <li>You can challenge them to use the words in context like the real world most often does. Give the examples and see how its easier for students intelligibility to go up when the words are in context and not used alone</li> <li>Note that it is not always true and you may need to adjust this.</li> </ul>	
Slide 22	Break TIme	10 minutes
Slide 23	Welcome back  • Gather everyone back and do a quick review of the presentation  • Note that you cannot cover everything regarding pronunciation in detail but give an overview of ideas and strategies with the focus always being on intelligibility.  Suprasegmentals	5 minutes
	intelligibility.	

	<ul> <li>Also known as prosody</li> <li>We will cover word stress, intonation, and thought groups/rhythm</li> </ul>	
Slide 24-25	<ul> <li>Explain the difference between syllable timed and stress timed languages.</li> <li>Many common world languages are not stress timed like English is.</li> <li>Word Stress Examples</li> <li>Use the word happiness as an example of word stress.</li> <li>Ask the audience how many syllables and which syllable is stressed. (they should say that there are three syllables and that the first syllable is stressed.</li> <li>Ask the audience what happens when we put the stress on the second? Wait for someone to yell it out and the laughter to follow- Ha- PI-ness will sound a lot like Penis.</li> <li>Emphasize the embarrassment that a non-native speaker might have.</li> <li>Have the audience</li> </ul>	5 minutes

	point out the patterns of pronunciation: Make sure they say something like this 1) In numbers like 30, 40, 50 the first syllable is stressed 2) in teen number, the second syllable is stressed 3) The penultimate syllable is stressed in words with tian/cian at the end. 4) In words of study that end in -ology, the /o/ syllable is stressed. 5) the last syllable is stressed in words with -eer at the end.  • Emphasize the idea that patterns exist and teachers can point students toward them.	
Slide 26	Strategies for Teaching Word Stress  Show examples of how to teach Word Stress with Clapping, Tapping, Jumping up and down, Rubber Band Method Shouting and whispering  Activities are based off ideas found in this Youtube Video about teaching stress from BBC Learning English channel	5 minutes
Slide 27	`Intonation  ■ Read the intonation definition without any	5 minutes

	intonation, keeping it flat.  • Sometimes non-native speakers can sound like a robot, or lacking emotions when they don't know how to use intonation correctly. This happens in some Oral Communication classes when students give presentations.  • GIve examples of each: Fall in intonation with certainty- We are happy today. Whquestion: Why are you happy today?  • Rise in Intonation-Uncertainty- The capital of Illinois is Springfield? Yes/No questions- Will you drive your car? Surprise- I can't believe it!	
Slide 28	Intonation Activities  • Share ideas on slides and ask volunteers to participate in using intonation to read sentences  Some ideas were based off this Intonation Activities  Video	5 minutes
Slide 29	Thought Groups/Rhythm  • Ask teachers to read the sentence "A woman without her man is nothing" Show that with different	5 minutes

	thought groups, this sentence changes in meaning.  • Give other examples of thought group activities	
Slide 30	What is Most Essential for Intelligibility Approach?  • Emphasize that there is not just one factor that is most important to focus on. There are several factors and it will depend on each student  • We can use the segmental and suprasegmental together	2 minutes
Slide 31	Accent Familiarity with Listening  • Intelligibility approach relies on the agreement that there is not a perfect English accent. We can reinforce this to our students.  • It is important for teachers to use a variety of accents in their curriculum instead of the standard one often used in our textbook audio lessons.  • Show the website ELLLO - English Listening Lesson Library Online which offers a variety of English accents	5 minutes

	•	
Slide 32	Ideas for Student Assessment  Explain the comprehensibility chart and learners pronunciation log These can be assessed either formally or informally depending on the needs for your classroom.	5 min
Slide 33 and 34	Resources for teachers and References  • Share the powerpoint with teachers so they can access these later.	1 minute
Slide 35	Professional Learning Community  Explain the purpose of a PLC and the plan for the PLC to meet monthly for the semester.  Teachers will gather in their professional learning communities to meet and exchange contact information.  If there is time, teachers can discuss their experience with pronunciation instruction and ESL education overall.	15-20 minutes



# Professional Learning Community- Pronunciation Instruction

Fall 2023 Semester

# Ashley E. Carrel

Heartland Community College

# **Overview**

Welcome to your professional learning community (PLC)! This is a group designed to help you learn effective strategies for teaching pronunciation to your adult ESL learners. Your PLC will meet to discuss areas of pronunciation and how you can teach them in your classrooms. Each month, there will be a focal point for discussion. You will use the questions provided to lead your discussions, but are more than welcome to branch out on related topics. Each group will have a scribe who will take notes and share the biggest takeaways that their group had from their meeting and will email that to the administration. There will also be a continuous google document that groups can add teaching resources they have found throughout the semester. Topics for each month's meetings are 1) segmentals (metaphonological awareness) 2) suprasegmentals (intonation, stress, and rhythm) 3) listening (familiarizing with accents) and 4) assessments and learning.

# Who

You will meet with fellow adult ESL instructors in our academic and functional levels of English program. You are grouped with those who teach similar levels as you. Groups will be between

3-5 teachers. Teachers are highly encouraged to bring their background knowledge and experience into these conversations and collaborate with one another.

#### When

The PLC groups will be meeting monthly during the semester. The plan is that your group will meet in the first week of each month for one hour. Groups will be responsible for choosing their dates and reporting back to their administrators. PLC meetings may be held either in person or online.

# **Goals**

- 1. Teachers will feel more qualified and equipped to teach adult ESL students in the area of pronunciation.
- 2. Teachers will gain a sense of community as they collaborate with one another and feel less isolated in their work.
- 3. Teachers will be able to incorporate new knowledge, teaching approaches and strategies in a less structured informal and interactive forum.
- 4. Teachers and students will embrace the intelligibility and comprehensibility approaches of pronunciation instruction.
- 5. Students will gain more knowledge and understanding in their pronunciation skills and feel more confident to speak freely both inside and outside the classroom..

# **September Guide**

# **Segmentals/ Metaphonological Awareness**

#### THE INTERNATIONAL PHONETIC ALPHABET (revised to 2005)

	Bila	abial	Labio	dental	Dental Alveolar Pos		Postalveolar		Retr	oflex	Palatal		Velar		Uvular		Pharyngeal		Glo	ottal		
Plosive	p	b	4				t	d			t	d	С	J	k	g	q	G			?	
Nasal		m		nj				n				η		Jì		1]		N				
Trill		В						r			8						V.	R				
Tap or Flap				V				ſ				t										
Fricative	ф	β	f	v	θ	ð	S	Z	I	3	ş	Z	ç	j	X	γ	χ	R	ħ	S	h	ĥ
Lateral fricative							1	ß					<del>- 13</del>			- 62						
Approximant			0.	υ				J				ŀ		j		щ	V.					
Lateral approximant								1				1		λ		L						

Where symbols appear in pairs, the one to the right represents a voiced consonant. Shaded areas denote articulations judged impossible.

# Questions to Discuss in your group

- 1. Were you familiar with the International Phonetic Alphabet before the PD workshop? Do you find or have you found this to be helpful in instruction at all? Why or why not?
- 2. Which consonant or vowel articulation problems have you noticed most with your students? Which ones impact intelligibility the most?

- 3. Were there any new activities or resources that you incorporated into your classroom, either from the PD workshop or another place. If so, how were they received?
- 4. Choose a Case Study and discuss what you would do to help your student in this situation:
  - a. Your Spanish speaking student is having difficulty pronouncing words that start with /s/ sound. She keeps adding an  $\epsilon$  sound at the beginning of the word.
  - b. An Indian student who learned English in the UK is confused because she learned to pronounce the /t/ sound in the middle of words such as butter or water, however she keeps hearing English speakers here in the USA say it with a /d/ sound. She wants to know which one is right.

# Final Comments and Questions

# **October Guide**

# Suprasegmentals: Intonation, Rhythm, Word stress

- 1. From your experience and observations do suprasegmentals such as intonation, word stress and rhythm have more effect on intelligibility than consonant and vowel sounds?
  Why or why not?
- 2. In your second language learning, do you remember ever being taught suprasegmentals such as intonation? Can you think of any examples of the differences between English intonation or word stress as compared to another language?
- 3. Which element of suprasegmentals have been most challenging for your current students? If you had to guess, what are their barriers for learning these?
- **4.** What activities or resources have you used in your classroom, either from the PD workshop or elsewhere, to teach suprasegmentals and how were they received by your students?

Word or Sentence Stress	Kinesthetic learning! Jumping up and down, whispering and shouting, clapping, rubber band technique Video Links Stress timed vs Syllable Timed Languages Teaching Word Stress Activities
Intonation	Using different intonation (rising and falling pitch) to say the same sentences

	Example: We are moving today (Excited, Sad, Surprise, Anger, etc) Read a text from Reaching Out or Breaking Through book Video Link Intonation Ideas
Thought Groups	Use reading texts to read aloud in class and have students choose where to put thought groups. Use listening for thought groups in formal speeches or Ted Talks.  Video Links Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie: The danger of a single story Obama's Farewell Speech

Final Comments and Questions

# **November Guide**

# **Listening to Enhance Pronunciation**

# Questions to Discuss in your group

- In your second language learning, what were your biggest challenges with listening?
   How were you able to overcome them? Did your learning include direct listening activities?
- 2. During the PD workshop, how did the Korean listening perception activity help you to understand your students' challenges in distinguishing sounds in English?
- 3. In the intelligibility approach, the listener does not play a silent role but becomes an active participant. How as an ESL teacher have you been able to help students use listening to improve their own intelligibility with others?
- 4. How would you respond to a student who says they cannot understand certain accents in English?
- 5. Ideas or activities to do in class: Listen to authentic materials, podcasts, interviews, news clips, youtube videos with speakers who have different dialects of English accents.

Final Comments and Questions

# **December Guide**

# **Assessment and Evaluation**

- 1. Do you feel like the comprehensibility chart is clear and helpful to adult ESL teachers when assessing pronunciation? If not, how would you improve it or what do you think it is lacking?
- 2. How and when do you offer pronunciation feedback to students? Do you interrupt a student while speaking, wait until they are finished, or let it go completely?
- 3. What has been the biggest challenge for you this semester in regards to teaching speaking and listening skills to your students?
- 4. What successes would you like to celebrate in regards to students speaking and listening skills?
- 5. Case study: Maria is an advanced ESL student who has been in the country for 10 years. Yet, when she reads you notice that she has difficulty pronouncing the past tense endings of words. She is a native Spanish speaker. What kind of feedback would you give her and how would you go about it?

Comprehensibility	The L2 speaker
High	Produces fluent stretches of speech; generally only pauses or hesitates at the end of the clause Provides sufficient vocabulary to set the scene and propel the story plot forward; lexical errors, if present, are not distracting Assigns word stress correctly in most instances Produces grammatical errors infrequently; errors do not detract from the overall message
Intermediate	Produces some fluent stretches of speech; occasionally pauses or hesitates in the middle of the clause Experiences occasional lapses in vocabulary, although may roughly convey the setting or main plot of the story; lexical errors are prevalent Is inconsistent in word stress placement Produces some grammatical errors that may detract from the overall message
Low	Produces dysfluent stretches of speech; frequently pauses or hesitates between lexical items Experiences frequent lapses in vocabulary that make the storyline unelaborated or indecipherable; high proportion of lexical errors, including L1 lexical influences Frequently misplaces word stress Produces frequent grammatical errors that are likely to detract from the overall message

# **Learner Pronunciation Log**

(Retrieved from Teaching Adult ESL: A Practical Introduction by Betsy Parrish)

Learner Pronunciation Log	Student Name:
Sounds (consonant cluster, individual sounds, insertions, deletions)	
Word Stress	
Sentence Stress	
Intonation (rising and falling in pitch)	
Rhythm (thought groups)	

#### References

- Alzahrani, R. (2021). Factors affecting pronunciation for adult second language learners in

  Tennessee. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global.

  <a href="https://ezproxy.hamline.edu/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/factors-affecting-pronunciation-adult-second/docview/2659290598/se-2">https://ezproxy.hamline.edu/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/factors-affecting-pronunciation-adult-second/docview/2659290598/se-2</a>
- Ballard, L. & Winke, P. (2016). 7 Students' attitudes towards English teachers' accents: The interplay of accent familiarity, comprehensibility, intelligibility, perceived native speaker status, and acceptability as a teacher. In T. Isaacs & P. Trofimovich (Ed.), *Second language pronunciation assessment: Interdisciplinary perspectives* (pp. 121-140). Bristol, Blue Ridge Summit: Multilingual Matters. <a href="https://doi.org/10.21832/9781783096855-009">https://doi.org/10.21832/9781783096855-009</a>
- BBC Learning English. (2017, February 9). *The Teachers' Room: Teaching word stress* [Video]. YouTube. <a href="https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=o0l00sZSBBE">https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=o0l00sZSBBE</a>
- BBC Learning English. (2017, March 23). *The Teachers' Room: Top tips about intonation* [Video]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vkgMFZMBfqQ
- Beuckens, T. (n.d.). *ELLLO English Listening Lesson Library Online*. English Listening Lesson Library Online. <a href="https://elllo.org">https://elllo.org</a>.
- Carson, A (2020, June 12). STRESS vs SYLLABLE-timed languages | Accent Artisan [Video].

  YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=K38gIcarHBo
- Celce-Murcia, M., Brinton, D. M., Goodwin, J. M., & Griner, B. (2015). *Teaching*pronunciation: A course book and reference guide. Cambridge University Press.

- Darcy, I., Rocca, B., & Hancock, Z. (2020). A window into the classroom: How teachers integrate pronunciation instruction. *RELC Journal*, *52*(1), 110–127. https://doi.org/10.1177/0033688220964269
- Dawson, H., & Phelan, M. (Eds.). (2016). *Language files: materials for an introduction to language and linguistics* (12th ed.). The Ohio State University Press
- Parrish B. (2004). Teaching adult esl: a practical introduction (1st ed.). McGraw-Hill ESL/ELT.
- TED. (2009, October 7). *Chimamanda Ngozi Adichie: The danger of a single story* | *TED* [Video]. YouTube. https://www.voutube.com/watch?v=D9Ihs241zeg
- The Obama White House. (2017, January 12). *The Final Minutes of President Obama's Farewell Address: Yes, we can.* [Video]. YouTube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uWRmBjFxttc