

Campbell Systematic Reviews

2011:9

First published: 01 December, 2011

Last updated: March, 2011

Search executed: June, 2009

Cross-border Trafficking In Human Beings: Prevention and Intervention Strategies for Reducing Sexual Exploitation

Peter H. van der Laan, Monika Smit, Inge Busschers,
Pauline Aarten



THE CAMPBELL COLLABORATION

Colophon

Title	Cross-border trafficking in human beings: prevention and intervention strategies for reducing sexual exploitation
Institution	The Campbell Collaboration
Authors	van der Laan, Peter Smit, Monika Busschers, Inge Aarten, Pauline
DOI	10.4073/csr.2011.9
No. of pages	50
Last updated	March, 2011
Citation	van der Laan P, Smit M, Busschers I, Aarten P. Cross-border trafficking in human beings: prevention and intervention strategies for reducing sexual exploitation. Campbell Systematic Reviews 2011:9 DOI: 10.4073/csr.2011.9
Copyright	©van der Laan et al. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.
Contributions	Peter van der Laan , Monika Smit, Inge Busschers and Pauline Aarten contributed to the writing and revising of this protocol.
Editors for this review	Editor: David Wilson Managing editor: Charlotte Gill
Support/funding	The Campbell Collaboration (C2) in Norway Dutch Ministry of Security and Justice
Potential conflicts of interest	The authors have no vested interest in the outcomes of this review, nor any incentive to represent findings in a biased manner.
Corresponding author	Peter H. van der Laan, PhD Netherlands Institute for the Study of Crime and Law Enforcement (NSCR) & VU University Amsterdam Email: PvanderLaan@nscr.nl

Campbell Systematic Reviews

Editors-in-Chief Mark W. Lipsey, Vanderbilt University, USA
Arild Bjørndal, The Centre for Child and Adolescent Mental Health, Eastern and Southern Norway & University of Oslo, Norway

Editors

Crime and Justice David B. Wilson, George Mason University, USA

Education Sandra Wilson, Vanderbilt University, USA

Social Welfare William Turner, University of Bristol, UK
Geraldine Macdonald, Queen's University, UK & Cochrane Developmental, Psychosocial and Learning Problems Group

Managing Editor Karianne Thune Hammerstrøm, The Campbell Collaboration

Editorial Board

Crime and Justice David B. Wilson, George Mason University, USA
Martin Killias, University of Zurich, Switzerland

Education Paul Connolly, Queen's University, UK
Gary W. Ritter, University of Arkansas, USA

Social Welfare Aron Shlonsky, University of Toronto, Canada
Paul Montgomery, University of Oxford, UK

Methods Therese Pigott, Loyola University, USA
Ian Shemilt, University of Cambridge, UK

The Campbell Collaboration (C2) was founded on the principle that systematic reviews on the effects of interventions will inform and help improve policy and services. C2 offers editorial and methodological support to review authors throughout the process of producing a systematic review. A number of C2's editors, librarians, methodologists and external peer-reviewers contribute.

The Campbell Collaboration
P.O. Box 7004 St. Olavs plass
0130 Oslo, Norway
www.campbellcollaboration.org

Table of contents

TABLE OF CONTENTS	3
ABSTRACT	5
Background	5
Objectives	5
Selection Criteria	5
Data collection	6
Results and Conclusion	6
Summary	6
1 INTRODUCTION	7
1.1 Definition of human trafficking	7
1.2 Research on cross-border trafficking	8
1.3 Limitations of research on THB	9
2 OBJECTIVES OF THE REVIEW	12
3 METHODS	13
3.1 Criteria for considering studies for this review	13
3.2 Search strategy for identification of relevant studies	15
3.3 Description of methods used in primary research	18
3.4 Criteria for determination of independent findings	18
3.5 Details of coding categories	18
3.6 Qualitative data	18
4 RESULTS	20
5 NARRATIVE REVIEW	21
5.1 Type of interventions	21
5.2 Methodology and type of evaluation	22
5.3 Findings	23
6 CONCLUSION	24
7 DISCUSSION	25
8 IMPLICATIONS	27
9 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	28

10	PLANS FOR UPDATING THE REVIEW	29
11	REFERENCES	30
12	APPENDIX	34
12.1	List of Key Words	34
12.2	List of Consulted Databases	37
12.3	List of Consulted Websites	39
12.4	Reports on Internal Trafficking	42
12.5	Additional Information On 20 Studies That Were Excluded After Coding	43
12.6	Publication Year of Evaluation Studies	50

Abstract

BACKGROUND

Over the years, growing attention has been given to the phenomenon of trafficking in human beings (THB). Sexual exploitation was until recently by far the most commonly identified feature of THB, followed by forced labour. Many activities to combat trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation have been initiated by numerous supranational, international as well as national organizations. Much is written about these initiatives, but some areas have been neglected. Knowledge on 'what works' is in particular limited. The growing attention to THB entails a demand for more information. The severity of the crime and the impact on its victims makes it of utmost importance to gain more insight into the working and effectiveness of anti-trafficking strategies and interventions.

OBJECTIVES

The main objective of this review was to assess the presently available evidence on the effects of interventions that aim to prevent and suppress trafficking in human beings.

The following questions were central to the systematic review:

- What types of anti-THB strategies and interventions can be identified that have been accompanied by some form of empirical analysis?
- Which of these studies incorporate (quasi-)experimental evaluations that are rigorous enough to determine the effect of these anti-THB strategies on preventing and suppressing THB?
- What are the outcomes of these (quasi-)experimental studies?

SELECTION CRITERIA

In this review only studies that focused on cross-border trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation were included. The focus is on cross-border trafficking, because internal trafficking is not (yet) or just recently recognized in many countries. Furthermore, this review was limited to trafficking for prostitution or sexual exploitation, in any form there is. Trafficking for forced labour or services, slavery or

practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs were kept out of consideration. In addition, included were only studies on anti-trafficking measures that involved evaluations of strategies - policies and interventions - to prevent or suppress cross border trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation with at least a level 3 research method of the Maryland Scientific Methods Scale (SMS).

DATA COLLECTION

An extensive search strategy was used to identify studies for inclusion, consisting of a search in electronic databases, a search in the library of the Bureau of the (Dutch) National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings (BNRM), and an Internet search. Furthermore, we contacted relevant members of the professional network. Among the over 19.000 titles we came across, 144 studies were found, of which around 20 studies seemed possibly eligible and were coded by the authors.

RESULTS AND CONCLUSION

No studies were found that met all criteria (prevention and suppression strategies, cross-border trafficking, sexual exploitation and a design of at least level 3 of the Maryland Scientific Methods Scale (SMS), i.e. a controlled design with both pretest and posttest measures and comparable control conditions.). Consequently, no conclusions could be drawn on the effectiveness of anti-THB intervention strategies for preventing and reducing sexual exploitation. Some studies had employed other evaluation designs. We decided to include a narrative review presenting these studies since they sketch the landscape of anti-THB interventions, and are informative of the current state of evaluations of these interventions. However, since these are non-controlled studies, they do not provide a basis for drawing conclusions about actual outcomes and impacts.

SUMMARY

Policies or interventions to prevent or suppress cross border trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation have not been evaluated rigorously enough to determine their effect. Using different search strategies and key words in nine different languages, the authors identified 19.000 studies on trafficking that came out between January 2000 and June 2009. They examined and coded the full text of the 20 studies that contained a combination of the relevant key words in their title, subtitle and/or abstract. None of these were controlled and most did not even use pre- and posttest measures.

1 Introduction

Over the years, growing attention has been given to the phenomenon of trafficking in human beings (THB). Human trafficking generally involves the use of force, fraud, or coercion to enslave people in situations that are exploitative and in many cases illegal and dangerous (GAO, 2007). The use of fraud, force, or coercion typically distinguishes THB from smuggling people. Victims of trafficking may be forced to work in prostitution, strip clubs, sweatshops, agricultural businesses, armed conflict, service industries and people's homes (Boonpala & Kane, 2002; GAO, 2007; Gervais, 2005; Kelly, 2005). Underage victims are forced to beg for money in cities, work in carpet shops, and participate in pornography and sexual acts with adults (BNRM, 2009; Friesendorf, 2007). Furthermore, trafficking in children in the sports business, especially in soccer, is not uncommon (de Boer, 2002; David, 2005). In summary: trafficking occurs in many different sectors and industries.

Not all governments recognize trafficking as a problem. They may treat foreign trafficking victims as illegal immigrants and deport them back to their home countries, rather than protect them against their perpetrators or against possible future trafficking (GAO, 2007). However, in most countries trafficking has been recognized as a national and international problem, and there is a widespread agreement for the need of a multilateral response on both levels (Laczko, 2005). The United Nations (UN) Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children, supplementing the UN convention against Transnational Organized Crime (2000) stimulated anti-THB legislation and interventions in many countries all over the world. Furthermore, there have been a growing number of (inter)national conventions on human trafficking in the last decade as well as a vast increase in the number of publications on THB and on ways to prevent and suppress it (Kelly, 2005; Laczko, 2005).

1.1 DEFINITION OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING

In this systematic review cross-border trafficking is operationalized by following the definition of the United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations convention against Transnational Organized Crime (2000). Article 3 (a) of this UN Protocol states:

“Trafficking in persons shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs”.

The anti-trafficking protocol is used in combating trafficking through judicial and law enforcement means. It has been signed by 117 countries¹, and the definition in the protocol is used by governmental and non-governmental organizations (De Sas Kropiwnicki, 2007), making it the most widespread trafficking definition (e.g. Gallagher, 2006).

1.2 RESEARCH ON CROSS-BORDER TRAFFICKING

Until recently, sexual exploitation was by far the most commonly identified feature of THB, accounting for 79% of all cases (Chawla, Me & Pichon, 2009). According to a working paper of the International Labour Organization (ILO) 75% of the reported cases were identified as sexual exploitation (Belser, 2005).² Traditionally labour exploitation is not a priority for law enforcement activities and often remains undetected (Europol, 2009). Legal definitions may fail to include labour trafficking (Smit, 2011), and victims of forced labour may not come forward because they do not consider themselves victims of trafficking (Andrees & Van der Linden, 2005). Still, even though sexual exploitation is the most documented type of THB, this does not imply an overall consistency in recognizing sexual exploitation. For example, governments disagree on whether there is a difference between ‘forced’ and ‘voluntary’ prostitution (GAO, 2007).³ Furthermore, organizations continue to face difficulties as they work on global and regional initiatives to combat trafficking (Barnitz, 2001). It proves to be difficult to develop initiatives for under-reported forms of exploitation such as forced or bonded labour, domestic servitude and forced marriage, trafficking for the purpose of organ removal and the exploitation of children in begging.

¹ Status at 03-01-2011 (<http://treaties.un.org>).

²Reported instances of labour exploitation increased (Europol 2009a; ILO 2009), and the US State Government Trafficking in Persons Report 2009 states that the majority of human trafficking in the world takes the form of forced labour. So the assumption that prostitution-related trafficking makes up the bulk of all global trafficking in persons, until recently present in almost every publication on the trafficking topic, is probably not accurate (Smit, 2011).

³Furthermore, some researchers claim prostitution always to be trafficking and therefore use the term prostitution as a synonym for sexual exploitation, see for example Balanon and Barrameda (2007), and Ekberg (2004).

Much research has focused on the prevalence of THB, but no consensus has been reached on its incidence (Friesendorf, 2007; Goodey, 2008). In 2006 the United States Government estimated 600,000 to 800,000 persons being trafficked across international borders annually. However, according to UN Children's Fund (UNICEF) and ILO the number is much higher with approximately 2 million people being trafficked every year worldwide (Boonpala & Kane, 2002). These estimates are questionable due to methodological weaknesses, gaps in data, the interpretations made and the numerous discrepancies found in studies (Cwikel & Hoban, 2005; GAO, 2006; Tyldum & Brunovskis, 2005; World Congress against CSEC, 2001). With regard to registered victims, the numbers vary greatly as well. Italy, for example, accounts for a high number of reported victims compared with other countries in Europe. In 2006, Italy reported 2,143 victims of trafficking. This relatively high number⁴ is possibly related to large numbers of illegal immigrants in general, and also to both an actually high number of victims and the extensive care for victims. This can lead to a higher motivation for victims to denounce. In all probability only a small percentage of human trafficking is registered leaving a high dark number in its prevalence (BNRM, 2007; Goodey, 2008).

Research on THB has also focused on trends and developments, and on facts about traffickers in order to understand the phenomenon. This understanding of the depth, the breadth and the scope of the problem is needed before developing any initiatives towards prevention and suppression (Chawla et al., 2009; Surtees, 2008; Weiner & Hala, 2008). Research on conviction has also been done. Statistics have shown an increase in the number of convictions, but most convictions still take place in only a few countries. According to Chawla et al. (2009), who studied THB in Europe, Asia, Africa and America, two out of every five countries (41%) do not report any convictions of THB and 14% of all countries have no data available at all. Possible explanations for the lack of data and/or (reporting of) THB convictions are that some countries pay little or no attention towards the phenomenon or are poorly prepared and equipped for dealing with THB (Chawla et al., 2009). More attention given to THB seems to lead to higher statistics. As more is known and/or reported about THB, more awareness to the phenomenon is given by the criminal justice system. Consequently, more cases of THB are investigated which in turn leads to an increase in the number of trafficking cases reported. A rise in prevalence is, therefore, not necessarily (only) the result of an increase in THB cases.

1.3 LIMITATIONS OF RESEARCH ON THB

Much is written about these initiatives, but some areas have been neglected. Knowledge on 'what works' is particularly limited (Tyldum, Tveit & Brunovskis, 2005). Most publications are primarily descriptive, for example describing the

⁴ See US Trafficking in persons report (US Department of State 2009) for numbers of identified victims in different European countries.

hardship of, or social assistance to victims. Others mainly aim at collecting trustworthy numbers to define the scale of the phenomenon (Kelly, 2005). Few, if any, interventions are accompanied by evaluation research and few systematic data collections exist (Larsen, Lindley & Putt, 2009). There has been relatively little independent⁵ research that evaluates and assesses the effectiveness of counter trafficking policies, programs, and various interventions (Chase & Statham, 2005; Laczko, 2005). This can be problematic since organizations evaluating their own initiative may have explicit or implicit political or practical agendas that could influence their conclusions, for instance by selecting or disposing of certain information (Vandekerckhove, 2003). It is possible that more or less weight is given to certain data due to the authority of certain key actors (Tyldum & Brunovskis, 2005).

The individuals involved in human trafficking, whether they are the perpetrators or victims, are considered *hidden populations* of which the size and boundaries remain unidentified (Laczko, 2005; Tyldum & Brunovskis, 2005; Weiner & Hala, 2008). As human trafficking is illegal and mainly underground (BNRM, 2007; Boak, Boldosser & Biu, 2003) trustworthy data is difficult to collect, resulting in conclusions that may be far from the truth. Deficient data tracking systems and methodologies for estimation and evaluation could increase the risk that programmes targeting this specific phenomenon are not accurate (Clawson, Williamson & Garrett, 2008; Kelly, 2002). Evaluation is important as evaluative knowledge on trafficking can be used to develop adequate prevention techniques or policies (Dottridge, 2007a; Kelly, 2005; Larsen, Lindley & Putt, 2009). The United States Government Accountability Office reviewed documents of 23 U.S. Government funded anti-trafficking projects in Indonesia, Thailand and Mexico. It revealed that 21 of the 23 projects included one or more monitoring elements but only 10 state how performance was measured. The majority lacked a logic framework of monitoring that linked activities to goals, indicators and targets (GAO, 2007). And even though the number of monitoring and evaluation studies seems to be rising, more scientific evaluation research is needed to ensure the effectiveness of the interventions developed, to help agencies achieve the results desired, and to enable more effective oversight and accountability (GAO, 2006).

Another frequently encountered restriction in the research on THB is the availability of only small samples. Often, this is due to the limited access to victims and perpetrators (Ennew, 2008; Laczko, 2005). Intrinsicly, there is nothing wrong with small samples. If treated sensibly a variety of methods can produce illuminating results. But often preference is given to a single method such as interviews only, or questionnaires only. Furthermore, small amounts of data are sometimes pushed through numerical hoops that produce misleading results

⁵ Here, independent research regards research that is not carried out by the same organization that has developed or carried out the initiative in the first place.

(Ennew, 2008). As a result, little (reliable) knowledge on effectiveness of interventions in this area is available (BNRM, 2007).

While knowledge on the effectiveness of anti-trafficking interventions is scarce, interventions can cause collateral damage (Boermans, 2009; Dottridge, 2007b; Limanowska, 2003). Anti-trafficking programs can cause damage by putting restrictions (sometimes unlawful) on young women's decisions to migrate, to travel or even leave the parental house (Friesendorf, 2007). For instance, refusal to issue a visa or to allow a young woman to enter the country is presented as an anti-trafficking measure (Limanowska, 2003). In 2002 the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights issued a series of recommended Principles and Guidelines on Human Rights and Human Trafficking. The third principle states that anti-trafficking measures "*shall not adversely affect the human rights and dignity of persons, in particular the rights of those who have been trafficked...*" (p. 3) thereby aiming to protect victims of trafficking against (more) damage by interventions. Guideline 3 provides more detail on this point and urges governments, intergovernmental organizations and NGOs to monitor and evaluate "*the relationship between the intention of anti-trafficking laws, policies and interventions, and their real impact*" and to distinguish "*between measures which actually reduce trafficking and measures which may have the effect of transferring the problem from one place or group to another*" (p. 7). According to Dottridge (2007c), the High Commissioner's Guidelines do not appear to have been heeded by many government agencies and NGO's involved in anti-trafficking activities. Many years have passed since the endorsement of the UN Trafficking Protocol but little is known about which interventions have been the most effective in preventing human trafficking, protecting victims and prosecuting traffickers (Friesendorf, 2007; GAO, 2007).

2 Objectives of the Review

The background information yields a number of justifications for a Campbell Systematic Review on this topic. The growing attention to THB entails a demand for more information (Goodey, 2008). The number of interventions to counter THB is rising, and many initiatives have been described. At the same time the effectiveness of these programs remains unknown.⁶ However, the severity of the crime and the impact on its victims makes it of utmost importance to gain more insight into the working and effectiveness of anti-trafficking strategies⁷ and interventions. Hence, the objectives of this systematic review are twofold. Firstly, this review will bring together and assess the available evidence on the effects of anti-THB strategies and interventions. This will contribute to the knowledge on anti-THB interventions and their effectiveness and will therefore provide information to policy makers. Secondly, this review will increase the knowledge about the strengths and weaknesses of research concerning anti-trafficking strategies and interventions that can stimulate future research and improve evaluations. Awareness will be raised on the need for more rigorous research designs that also shed light on possible collateral damage of interventions that otherwise may remain unknown (Dottridge, 2007c).

Consequentially, this review aims at contributing to a more evidence-based approach in the prevention and suppression of cross border THB for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

The questions to be answered are the following:

- a) What types of anti-THB strategies and interventions that have been accompanied by some form of empirical analysis can be distinguished?
- b) Which of these studies incorporate (quasi-)experimental evaluations that are rigorous enough to determine the effect of these anti-THB strategies on preventing and suppressing THB?
- c) What are the outcomes of these (quasi-)experimental studies?

⁶For example, at least 44 studies on human trafficking are added to the electronic library of Terre des hommes in February 2009, and 82 in March 2009. None of these studies are evaluations of anti-trafficking measures.

⁷Strategy is a collective term referring to multiple interventions.

3 Methods

To meet the objectives of this systematic review, the following methodology was proposed. This section is a summary of the methodology detailed in the protocol which was approved by the Campbell Collaboration in 2010.⁸

3.1 CRITERIA FOR CONSIDERING STUDIES FOR THIS REVIEW

Types of interventions

As discussed in the introduction, the definition of human trafficking is wide-ranging. In this review only studies focusing on cross-border trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation were collected. The focus is on cross-border trafficking, because internal trafficking is not (yet) or just recently recognized in many countries. Furthermore, this review was limited to trafficking for prostitution or sexual exploitation, in any form there is. Trafficking for forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs were kept out of consideration. Until recently, there was little awareness of these types of trafficking, and for quite some time no legislation against these types of trafficking existed. Today, many countries have included into their laws trafficking for labour exploitation and organ removal. But often, labour exploitation has not been strictly defined, leaving the burden of interpreting that part of the law to the judge (ILO, 2005). This resulted in different definitions and many discussions about when bad labour conditions turn into trafficking (Smit, 2011), not making it a very transparent field to study. Furthermore, trafficking for sexual exploitation, trafficking for labour exploitation and especially trafficking for organ removal represent crimes in different 'domaines', which are not necessarily committed, nor investigated, prosecuted, or studied by the same people or organizations, resulting in a field considered too broad to include entirely in the present review.

In addition, studies on anti-trafficking measures were included that involved evaluations of strategies - policies and interventions - to prevent or suppress cross border trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation. This meant that evaluation studies focusing exclusively on sexual exploitation were incorporated in the analysis.

⁸ See <http://www.campbellcollaboration.org/library.php>.

Furthermore, studies focusing on trafficking in general, but where data on trafficking for sexual exploitation could be extracted were included. Studies evaluating general interventions were excluded from the systematic review as it was impossible to isolate the effectiveness of interventions focusing on trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation due to the absence of transparent data.

Types of studies

All quantitative evaluation studies with respect to anti-trafficking interventions and strategies that focused on sexual exploitation were included. They were categorized according to the Maryland Scientific Methods Scale (SMS) (Sherman et al., 1998) in order to identify and assess the strength of the evidence (Sherman, Farrington, Welsh & MacKenzie, 2002). Accordingly, only studies with a design of level 3 or higher were included in the review, meaning that both pretest and posttest measures should be administered and that control conditions are comparable to experimental conditions.⁹ Studies considering *best-practices* or *evidence-based practices* on how to counteract THB were included. Descriptions of *good practices* based on field experiences but lacking any numerical data were excluded.

Participants

Evaluation research dealing with initiatives targeting individual perpetrators and criminal groups as well as vulnerable individuals and professionals in the field of anti-THB were included. Policies or initiatives exclusively regarding victim assistance, the reintegration of victims and arrangements for legal status, were not included.

Publication

Eligible studies were either published - electronically or in print - or unpublished. Studies from the year 2000 and onwards were incorporated in the review. This year was chosen since it marks the UN Trafficking Protocol. Our search included publications up to the end of June 2009. Publications after this date were not included in this review, but will be examined in the update.

Country of origin

Studies from any country all over the world were included. However, due to limited resources and knowledge of a few foreign languages within the research team, only those studies that were written in Danish, Dutch, English, French, German, Italian, Norwegian, Spanish and Swedish were reviewed. Eastern European languages were

⁹ Farrington (2003) describes the various levels of the SMS. Level 1: correlation between a prevention programme and a measure of crime at one time. Level 2: pre and posttest measures but no comparable control conditions. Level 3: pre and posttest measures and comparable control conditions. Level 4: pre and posttest measures in multiple experimental and control units, controlling for variables that influence crime. Level 5: random assignment of programme and control conditions to units.

not included; however, inquiry at La Strada International yielded no additional studies in these languages.¹⁰

Of all the possibly eligible studies (144), only 18 were not in English. Of these, 13 studies were written in Dutch, 1 in German, 1 in French, 1 in Danish and 1 in Spanish. One study was in Finnish but had an English summary.

3.2 SEARCH STRATEGY FOR IDENTIFICATION OF RELEVANT STUDIES

This review employed a broad search to identify all studies - published or otherwise - that meet the criteria described above. This included a search through electronic databases, searching the BNRM library, contacting professional networks, searching through the reference list of all documents and an Internet search. Special attention was given to searching and collecting relevant studies captured in the so-called grey literature. Table 1 provides a summary of the search results.

Table 1. Summary of search results

Search Source	Citations reviewed
Electronic Databases	973
Library of BNRM	3080
Professional Networks (existing contacts)	306
Cross-referencing of bibliographies	39
Internet	around 15,000
Total	19,398

To find relevant studies, keywords and wild card terms were used as showing in Figure 1. These keywords have been constructed in a preliminary review of the literature. Only studies with these keywords in the title, subtitle and/or abstract were eligible for this review. A list of key words in the different languages used can be found in appendix I.

¹⁰La Strada International contacted its European network of NGOs in different countries (Belarus, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, the Czech Republic, the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, Moldova, Poland and Ukraine) with the request of any additional evaluation studies on trafficking for sexual exploitation in their languages. No studies came up.

Figure 1. Keyword Search

Keywords that were used involved words that described that: - the subject of study (e.g. human trafficking, sexual exploitation, sex*, anti-trafficking) AND - the interventions and programs of interest (intervention, prevent*, program) AND - research effectiveness (effect*, evaluat*, best practice)

From the 19,398 citations found on sex trafficking, we found 144 studies that seemed eligible for this review. These studies contained the keywords in the title and/or abstract. A detailed scan of these 144 studies resulted in 20 studies that were relevant for this review (for example, they contained empirical research). The authors read these 20 studies with scrutiny and coded them. Of these 20 studies only four studies seemed to have some form of evaluation (level 1 or 2 of the SMS) of an intervention that prevents trafficking with sexual exploitation and were therefore included in the narrative review (see 3.6 for more information on the relevance of a narrative review in this systematic review). None of these studies contained an evaluation with a level 3 or higher of the SMS.

Table 2. Review of citations and studies

	N
Citations reviewed	19,398
Studies retrieved and screened	144
Studies coded	20
Studies included in the narrative review	4
Studies included with level 3 SMS or higher	0

Electronic Databases

Computerized bibliography searches were conducted using different electronic databases. The databases were selected due to a number of reasons. Some we knew in advance to contain relevant literature, others came forward during the internet searches, or because they were mentioned in relevant literature or by people from our professional network. A detailed list of the searched databases can be found in appendix II. In total, 66 electronic databases were searched. Of these databases, 973 citations were reviewed. However, none of the citations were found to have a design according to level 3 or higher of the SMS.

BNRM library

The Bureau of the (Dutch) National Reporter on Trafficking in Human Beings (BNRM) has a library with over 3,000 articles, books and reports related to human trafficking. Using their search engine (Reference Manager), all articles were scanned for applicability by using the keywords. In total, 3080 citations were reviewed and of these citations 10 documents seemed to fit the initial criteria. After careful

examination, these documents were removed from the final inclusion as they did not have a design according to level 3 or higher of the SMS.

Professional Networks (existing contacts)

Staff of relevant organizations was contacted to provide the authors with any published or unpublished study. Initially, the network of BNRM was contacted. Furthermore, other personal networks of the authors were consulted such as policymakers, researchers and contacts at international and supranational organizations. We sent 954 letters, by mail and e-mail. Of these, 91 individuals e-mailed or wrote back with information or suggestions. This search strategy yielded much information; however, many citations did not deal with evaluations of initiatives. Instead, many National Action Plans, program descriptions and general information were received.

Furthermore, Terre des Hommes, a non-governmental organization located in the Netherlands, invited the researchers to examine their effect studies on anti-THB interventions. These studies were not published and therefore fell under the grey literature. In total 15 studies were reviewed of which 6 seemed to meet our initial criteria. A closer examination of these studies, however, resulted in an exclusion for the systematic review due to their research design and/or for focusing on THB in general and not specifically on sexual exploitation.

Cross-referencing of bibliographies

During the process, references in relevant review articles, primary studies and meta-analyses were scanned for new leads. Only articles that contained the words listed in appendix II in the title or subtitle were reviewed. To locate any grey literature, government reports as well as nongovernmental organization's reports, book chapters, policy documents, personal networks, and research organizations' websites were consulted. Another 39 unduplicated references seemed useful and were examined. Furthermore, many relevant websites were found in bibliographies, which were all visited. None of the references or websites resulted in an inclusion of studies. Two studies found by cross-referencing were included in the narrative review.

Internet searches

Websites of NGOs (e.g. Terre des Hommes, UNICEF and CATW), professional associations and organizations involved in applied and policy research on human trafficking were searched. A list of related NGOs (and their websites) available at BNRM was used and supplemented. In addition, keyword searches were conducted using search engines such as google.com. In total 110 websites were visited. These websites are listed in appendix III. Furthermore, the authors and organizations of studies that seemed eligible, but lacked (empirical) data, were contacted by e-mail to

request additional data. The Internet search merely led to 2 studies that were included in the narrative review.

3.3 DESCRIPTION OF METHODS USED IN PRIMARY RESEARCH

The authors searched for evaluation studies individually by applying the inclusion criteria. The abstracts of these articles were assessed on their relevance for the systematic review. Initially, all studies that made any reference to an evaluation of a program were included, regardless of the research design or quality. An overview was made of all 144 studies containing any (combination) of the relevant key words in their title, subtitle and/or abstract. When a final overview of all studies was compiled, the second stage started by examining full-texts using the coding sheet.¹¹ The third and final stage consisted of selecting studies that evaluated interventions using an evaluation design of level 3 or higher of the SMS.

3.4 CRITERIA FOR DETERMINATION OF INDEPENDENT FINDINGS

This systematic review examined outcomes related to the effectiveness of anti-THB interventions. It was expected that studies might include different types of strategies or different study samples. In a few studies several independent samples were presented, these samples and their outcomes were treated as separate findings.

3.5 DETAILS OF CODING CATEGORIES

A preliminary coding sheet was developed for this review. This sheet covered a series of key aspects of the study, such as research design, methodological quality and outcome measures. Furthermore, characteristics of the intervention were coded such as the type of intervention, the population it is aimed at and the procedures used. All studies from the initial screening were coded independently by at least two authors. Coding differences did not appear.

3.6 QUALITATIVE DATA

A narrative review was done on studies that fit the criteria except for the criterion of studies that involved a comparison or reasonable counterfactual condition (SMS levels 3-5). Narrative reviews are used to summarize results from qualitative and quantitative but non-controlled studies (Lipsey & Wilson, 2001).¹² A narrative review can be useful to summarize findings which are excluded from meta-analysis

¹¹ The coding sheet is included in the Research Protocol of this Review on pp.22-31 and can be found at <http://www.campbellcollaboration.org>.

¹² A narrative review may increase self-knowledge and improve reflective practice (Jones, 2004).

and is conducted to highlight the current landscape of evidence on evaluations of anti-trafficking interventions. This narrative review gives insight in the critical research areas and the gaps in the evaluation studies on cross-border trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

4 Results

The search resulted in 144 potentially eligible studies. Many of these studies (38), concerned interventions of a primarily preventive nature, 23 concerned suppressive interventions (mostly regarding legislation and prosecution), and 8 were of a combined preventive/suppressive nature. In 48 studies no specific initiative was described. Most studies were in the field of sexual exploitation (68), or concerned several types of exploitation (55). The target group varied. It most often consisted of both adults and children (57), focusing on women and children, but studies on programs that were especially developed for minors (24) were found as well.

After a more extensive review no more than 20 studies seemed eligible. These studies were entirely read and coded independently by two authors, using the coding sheet. Findings were discussed with all four authors. No studies were found to be applicable for this review. There were no disagreements between authors regarding study inclusion or exclusion. Two studies appeared potentially relevant but a closer look at the website of the organization indicated that they needed to be excluded from analysis as they did not address cross-border trafficking but internal trafficking.¹³

All 20 studies regarded anti-trafficking interventions that were evaluated. In some cases it was unclear whether the focus was on sexual exploitation or on trafficking in general; 11 interventions focused solely on sexual exploitation, 4 on both sexual as labour exploitation and 5 concentrated on trafficking in general. Some interventions did not specify whether they focused on internal or cross-border trafficking. Separate results for cross-border trafficking were not available.

None qualified as a (quasi-)experimental study and therefore all 20 studies were excluded from analysis. Although these studies are excluded, they are listed in Appendix IV to give an impression of existing evaluations in this area. Additionally, some information about the nature of these interventions is attached (appendix V).

¹³ Because of their eligible design, these studies are described in Appendix IV.

5 Narrative Review

Four studies fit the criteria for a narrative review. Included in this narrative review are studies that regard:

1. Interventions developed for prevention or suppression of THB;
2. Cross border trafficking in human beings;
3. For the purpose of sexual exploitation;
4. An evaluation corresponding with level 1 or 2 of the SMS [ditto].

Some studies evaluated more than one intervention. In those cases only interventions that fit the selection criteria were included. The following results were found.

5.1 TYPE OF INTERVENTIONS

The first study (Association for Emancipation, Solidarity and Equality of Women, 2006) is a qualitative evaluation of the economic and social stabilization program for potential victims of trafficking in the border regions of Former Yugoslav Republic Macedonia. The main goal of this program was empowering these potential victims and providing employment opportunities through skills training. Basic business training courses were organized aiming to develop knowledge on how to start and manage a small business, and how to generate income. The intervention focused on vulnerable groups, especially women.

The second study (Balanon & Barrameda, 2007) evaluated the impact of the Young Men's Camp in the Philippines, which was developed to change the sexual attitudes and practices of boys and young men. It is believed that these attitudes and practices contribute to trafficking for sexual exploitation by encouraging (illicit) prostitution. This preventive program aimed at transforming socially constructed notions held by men about gender issues.

The third study (Centre for Research on Environment Health and Population Activities, 2004) included an evaluation of an awareness raising program in rural Nepal. The primary target group of the program was adolescent girls, and their peers, parents and the community were the secondary focus group. This intervention educated the girls and aimed to prevent them from becoming victims of trafficking.

The fourth study (Hashash, 2007) evaluated an Israeli prevention program aiming at raising awareness among the wider public and creating attitudinal and institutional change among decision makers and law enforcement personnel. Education on trafficking was achieved by distributing information, providing training, publicizing reports, using media advocacy and giving lectures. The program intended to influence public policy and opinion that would lead to a decrease in trafficking.

5.2 METHODOLOGY AND TYPE OF EVALUATION

The first study assessed the impact of the project on the beneficiaries, their families and local stakeholders. The main dimensions were the socio-economic position, quality of life as well as potential vulnerability towards human trafficking. The evaluators used questionnaires and interviews. For the target groups, different interview discussion guides were designed. The study consisted of a post-test measure only (SMS level 1). There was no control or comparison group and no empirical outcomes were reported.

The second study conducted pre- and posttests (SMS level 2) to assess changes in knowledge and perceptions among the boys and young men. Direct outputs, such as changes in knowledge and attitudes, were measured as well as the immediate impact of the camp on the graduates. Next to these assessments there were follow-up activities, consisting of one day fora and workshops. It remained unknown whether the intervention focused only on cross-border trafficking.

In the third study the effects were measured using interviews and surveys. It contained a pre- and posttest measure without a comparison or control group (SMS level 2). Program participants were randomly picked from the target population. Outcome measures were the increase of awareness and knowledge on trafficking.

The fourth study (Hashash, 2007) evaluated a hotline for migrant workers in Israel. The researchers conducted a pre- and posttest by carrying out interviews and questionnaires. However, there was no control or comparison group (SMS level 2).

None of the four studies met level 3 or higher of the SMS. Three studies were level 2 studies including pre- and post- test measurements, one study was only level 1. All four studies failed in generating control or comparison groups. Furthermore, data available were only of a qualitative nature, empirical data was lacking in the reports and could not be obtained from the researchers.

5.3 FINDINGS

The first three studies reported positive outcomes, referring to “*immediate effects [such] as changes in awareness and perceptions*” (AESEW, 2006). The fourth study addressed that there were no differences between pre-and posttest regarding awareness (Hashash, 2007). No negative or side effects were reported. In none of the four studies long-term effects were assessed. Only measurements during the intervention and shortly after were reported. The Young Men’s Camp had follow-up activities, however these activities consisted of workshops, and not a follow-up evaluation. The authors recommended an improved monitoring and evaluation system indicating (some) awareness about the weaknesses in their research.

It should be noted that even though some outcomes were reported, the methodological quality of the evaluation studies do not allow for firm conclusions regarding the effectiveness of these interventions.

6 Conclusion

The current landscape of anti-trafficking initiatives shows that many activities to combat trafficking have been initiated by numerous supranational¹⁴, international as well as national organizations. In general, these organizations assess the prevalence and seriousness of the phenomenon and develop initiatives based on their findings. These activities can be distinguished in preventive, suppressive and victim support interventions. The specific goals of these interventions vary from raising awareness, providing education and employment to changing the legislation, prosecution of perpetrators and empowerment of victims.

Literature suggests that most interventions focus on prevention through awareness raising activities. Some of the interventions aim directly at the at-risk population, victims or perpetrators, others focus more indirectly on populations, trying to create more awareness among social workers and policy makers. Furthermore, initiatives can combine several goals and activities, such as focusing on legislation, policy development and awareness-raising. Different methods are used in awareness-raising initiatives. In most cases, awareness-raising initiatives provide skills training to the targeted population, such as victims and the at-risk population. A popular instrument is the media (television, radio and posters), mainly used to raise awareness among the public.

The aim of this systematic review was to explore what is known about the effectiveness of interventions that prevent or suppress cross-border trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation, in order to contribute to a more evidence-based approach in the prevention and suppression of cross-border trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation. The main conclusion is that there is no evaluation research on anti-trafficking initiatives that meets the methodological criterion of level 3 or higher of the SMS. Consequently, no substantive conclusion about the effectiveness can be made, resulting in neither support nor rejection of the present anti-trafficking initiatives.

¹⁴ For example Terre des Hommes, Save the Children and UNICEF.

7 Discussion

Even though reliable conclusions about effectiveness are lacking, some observations are worth mentioning.¹⁵

First, the number of evaluation studies seems to increase. Researchers more often include some form of evaluation or monitoring of a program in their report.¹⁶ This may indicate a growing interest in an evidence-based approach and a willingness to evaluate anti-THB initiatives. However, researchers face many methodological challenges and ethical concerns (Brennan, 2005), such as attaining the vulnerable population, and the secrecy of the crime (Gozdziak & Bump, 2008). Although some serious attempts have been made to evaluate anti-trafficking initiatives, improvements in the research design are needed in order to draw substantive conclusions on the effectiveness of these initiatives. Improving research designs is perhaps not that difficult. For example, the study of the Young Men's Camp, which we described briefly in the narrative review used a pre- and post test measure, but a control group was lacking. Adding a control group would strengthen the design. Young men who do not participate or who are on the waiting list can be treated as the control group.

Second, outcomes are not always presented comprehensively. Weaknesses in the research design are not acknowledged and empirical evidence is lacking, making it difficult to fully understand or to replicate the research.

Third, a certain inconsistency seems to arise. Whereas existing programs have not been evaluated properly, new anti-THB interventions arise frequently. This is not only costly, but initiatives can also cause collateral damage (Boermans, 2009; Dottridge, 2007b; Limanowska, 2003). It is therefore crucial to know more about the effectiveness of anti-THB initiatives to understand where money needs to go and to understand which support the (potential) victims of trafficking need.

Fourth, goals of evaluation and monitoring activities are diverse. For example, evaluating the implementation of an intervention, the satisfaction of received services, increased knowledge about the topic and increased collaboration between organizations. Program evaluation operates under the idea that social programs

¹⁵See also the 'narrative review' at p.22.

¹⁶ See Appendix VI for the distribution of evaluation studies by year of publication.

should have explicit goals by which success or failure can be measured (Berk & Rossi, 1999), but several studies do not focus solely on trafficking, but on more general social-economic problems or child protection as well (e.g. Bühler, Barron, Thy & Sovanny, 2004). Some evaluation researchers use questionnaires, others conduct interviews or observations and focus group discussions. In other words, the methods varied. The variety in objectives and methods makes comparison difficult.

Fifth, numerous reports did not make a distinction between prostitution and trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation. Instead, these terms were used as synonyms. Neither was a clear distinction made between trafficking for forced prostitution and voluntary migration for sex work (see also Gozdziaik & Bump, 2008). This makes reviewing these studies difficult.

Sixth, as many interventions concern awareness raising, it should be noted that:

“by definition, [awareness raising] rests on a presumption of possible future entrapment and can therefore never be fully empirically tested. The programs therefore depend on something of a leap of faith, supported by knowledge of the general vulnerability of children/families/communities in a given town or region, and a belief in certain strategies to influence their behavior and lifestyle. This undoubtedly has some validity, even if it cannot be empirically measured over the short life span of a project, but disconcertingly, the realities and modalities of the clients and exploiters are rarely factored into the equation. Given so many intangibles, it is extremely important that prevention programs have built into them medium-term monitoring and/or follow-up of the children and families.” (ILO-IPEC, 2001 p.22).

A possible problem with information campaigns can be the broad target group. A mixed population asks for a variety of methods, or at least various materials (posters, TV commercials) that are attractive and can reach the subgroups. It is not always clear whether the instrument fits the target group.

Finally, this review only dealt with trafficking for sexual exploitation. Other forms of trafficking, may be relevant to study as well. Relevant evaluation studies on internal trafficking seem to exist. And in our search for eligible studies for this review also studies on labour exploitation were found. Therefore, it seems worthwhile to explore the possibility of systematic reviews on internal trafficking and on labour exploitation.

8 Implications

Methodological weaknesses of available studies preclude any conclusions concerning program effectiveness, ineffectiveness or collateral damage. The absence of appropriate studies makes it difficult to advice about policy implications. The designs were not rigorous enough and empirical data was lacking. More detailed information on working mechanisms was missing as well. It goes without saying that there is a need for rigorous evaluation research. Researchers, funding institutions, and policy makers, they should all demand higher standards of evaluation studies in order to gain knowledge on outcomes. This would enable them to better succeed in preventing and suppressing trafficking in human beings for the purpose of sexual exploitation. To bring about more rigorous research designs, partnerships can be sought in the area of politics and funding agencies. Funding agencies and other external parties are able to influence researchers to make use of a more rigorous research design (Lum and Yang, 2005). It should be standard practice that evaluations are not conducted by the agency funding or offering the program.

Also, more attention should be paid to the methodology. Information on methodology is crucial in order to be able to rate a study and the results at its true value, this is crucial information. In addition, to interpret the results, a transparent presentation of the qualitative as well as quantitative data is required. This includes adding examples of questionnaires and interview questions used. Such information is also a necessary requirement for conducting a meta-analysis.

Doing evaluation research and publicizing the conclusions allows others to see what is effective and what not. This may lead to the development of new and more effective anti-THB initiatives. Such an evidence-based approach is needed to reduce and eliminate human trafficking. As Dottridge (2007a) puts it:

“In the case of every substantial initiative to prevent trafficking, therefore, it is important that it should be evaluated. Whenever possible, the lessons from the evaluation should be published or made available to others conducting similar work. The fastest way of circulating information of this sort at the moment is to put it on a website, ensuring the title mentions ‘evaluation’ or ‘impact assessment’ (of efforts to prevent child trafficking), so that this is picked up by Internet search engines” (Dottridge, 2007a, p.66).

9 Acknowledgements

We would like to thank the Campbell Collaboration (C2) in Norway and the Dutch Ministry of Justice for their financial support. We are also grateful for the support given by the BNRM by allowing us to search through the library. Furthermore, we would like to thank Peter van der Voort from the Netherlands Institute for the Study of Crime and Law Enforcement (NSCR) for his expertise in searching relevant studies. And finally, we would like to thank all the people and organizations for responding to our request by sending their information on trafficking. Finally, we are grateful for the comments of our anonymous reviewers and the Campbell reviewers for their comments on earlier versions of this review.

10 Plans for updating the Review

The next update of this review will be in five years.

11 References

- Andrees, B., & Van der Linden, M.N.J. (2005). Designing trafficking research from a labour perspective: the ILO experience. *International Migration*, 1-2, 55-73.
- Association for Emancipation, Solidarity and Equality of Women. (2006). *Qualitative evaluation of the economic and social stabilization programme for potential victims of trafficking in the border regions of FYR Macedonia – ESS*. CEB, IOM & the Norwegian government.
- Balanon, F. G., & Barrameda, T. V. (2007). *Coalition against trafficking in women – Asia Pacific 2004 to 2006. Evaluation of Programs*. The Philippines: CATW.
- Barnitz, L. (2001). Effectively responding to the commercial sexual exploitation of children: A comprehensive approach to prevention, protection and reintegration services. *Child Welfare Journal. Special Issue: International Issues in Child Welfare*, 80(5), 597-610.
- Belser, P. (2005). *Forced Labour and Human Trafficking: Estimating the Profits*. Geneva: International Labour Office.
- Berk, R.A., & Rossi, P.H. (1999). *Thinking about program evaluation* (2nd ed.). California: Sage.
- Boak, A., Boldosser, A., & Biu, O. (2003). *Smooth Flight: Guide to Preventing Youth Trafficking*. New York: International Organization for Adolescents.
- Boermans, B. (2009). *Uitgebuut en in de bak! Slachtoffers van mensenhandel in vreemdelingendetentie*. Amsterdam: Bonded Labour in Nederland (BLinN).
- Boonpala, P., & Kane, J. (2002). *Unbearable to the human heart: Child trafficking and action to eliminate it*. Geneva: International Labour Organization.
- Brennan, D. (2005). Methodological challenges in research with trafficked persons: tales from the field. *International Migration*, 43 (1/2), 35-54.
- Bühler, M., Barron, M., Thy, A., & Sovanny, P. (2004). *Child Protection Networks. Findings and recommendations of the external evaluation*. Phnom Penh: Ministry of Social Affairs, Labour, Vocational Training and Youth Rehabilitation & UNICEF Cambodia.
- Bureau Nationaal Rapporteur Mensenhandel. (2007). *Mensenhandel - Vijfde rapportage van de nationaal rapporteur*. Den Haag: BNRM.
- Bureau Nationaal Rapporteur Mensenhandel. (2009). *Mensenhandel - Zevende rapportage van de Nationaal Rapporteur*. Den Haag: BNRM.
- Centre for Research on Environment Health and Population Activities. (2004). *The anti-trafficking programme in rural Nepal: Assessment of change in awareness and communication among adolescent girls, peers and parents in Baglung District*. Gairidhare, Kathmandu: Centre for Development and Population Activities.

- Chase, E., & Statham, J. (2005). Commercial and sexual exploitation of children and young people in the UK – a review. *Child Abuse Review*, 14(1), 4-25.
- Chawla, S., Me, A., & Pichon, T. le (2009). *Global report on trafficking in persons. Human trafficking a crime that shames us all*. United Nations Global Initiative to Fight Human Trafficking (UN.GIFT).
- Clawson, H. J., Williamson, E., & Garrett, A. (2008). *Improving data to combat human trafficking*. USA: ICF International.
- Commission of the European Communities. (2008). *Commission Working Document. Evaluation and monitoring of the implementation of the EU Plan on best practices, standards and procedures for combating and preventing trafficking in human beings*. Commission of the European Communities. COM 657 final.
- Cwikel, J., & Hoban, E. (2005). Contentious issues in research on trafficked women working in the sex industry: study designs, ethics and methodology. *Journal of Sex Research*, 42(4), 306-316.
- David, P. (2005). *Human rights in youth sports. A critical review of children's rights in competitive sports*. Oxon: Routeledge.
- De Boer, J. (2002). De handel in jeugdige voetballers in Nederland. *Justitiële Verkenningen*, 3, 32- 45.
- De Sas Kropiwnicki, Z. (2007) *Children Speak Out: Trafficking Risk and Resilience in Southeast Europe*. Tirana: Save the Children in Albania.
- Dottridge, M. (2007a). *A handbook on planning projects to prevent child trafficking*. Lausanne: International Federation Terre des hommes.
- Dottridge, M. (2007b). *Collateral Damage. The impact of anti-trafficking measures on human rights around the world*. Bangkok: Global Alliance against Trafficking in Women.
- Dottridge, M. (2007c). *Measuring Responses to Trafficking in Human Beings in the European Union: an Assessment Manual*. Brussels: Consultancy for Directorate-General Justice, Freedom and Security, European Commission.
- Ekberg, G. (2004). Swedish law that prohibits the purchase of sexual services: Best practices for prevention of prostitution and trafficking in human beings. *Violence Against Women* 10 (10), 1187-1218.
- Ennew, J. (2008). *Exploitation of children in prostitution*. Thematic paper. Bangkok.
- EUROPOL (2009). *Trafficking in human beings in the European Union: A EUROPOL perspective*. Available at <http://www.europol.europa.eu/publications>.
- Farrington, D.P. (2003). Methodological quality standards for evaluation research. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 587, 49-68.
- Friesendorf, C. (2007). Pathologies of Security Governance: Efforts against human trafficking in Europe. *Security Dialogue*, 38 (3), 379-402.
- Gallagher, A. T. (2006). *Human trafficking: International law and international responsibility*. Utrecht: Utrecht University.
- Gervais, C. (2005). *Report on promising practices for the prevention of human trafficking*. Canada: National Crime Prevention Centre, Department of Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness.

- Gozdziaik, E., & Bump, M. (2008). *Data and research on human trafficking: bibliography of research-based literature*. Washington, D.C.: Institute for the study of international migration.
- Goodey, J. (2008). Human trafficking: sketchy data and policy responses. *Criminology & Criminal Justice*, 8(4), 421-442.
- Hashash, Y. (2007). *Evaluation report. Trafficking Project. Hotline for migrant workers and Isha*, L'Isha.
- ILO-IPEC. (2001). Action against trafficking and sexual exploitation of children - Going where the children are: an evaluation of ILO/IPEC programmes, Thailand, Philippines, Colombia, Costa Rica and Nicaragua.
- ILO. (2005). Human trafficking for labour exploitation: guidance for legislation and law enforcement. ILO, Geneva. ILO (2009). *The cost of coercion. Global report under the follow-up of the ILO Declaration on fundamental principles and rights at work*. Geneva, ILO.
- Jones, K. (2004). Mission drift in qualitative research, or moving toward a systematic review of qualitative studies, moving back to a more systematic narrative review. *The Qualitative Report*, 9, 1, 95-112.
- Kelly, L. (2002). *Journeys of Jeopardy: A review of research on trafficking in women and children in Europe*. London: Child and Woman Abuse Studies Unit, University of North London.
- Kelly, L. (2005). "You can find anything you want": A critical reflection on research on trafficking in persons within and into Europe. *International Migration*, 43(1/2), 235-265.
- Laczko, F. (2005). Data and Research on Human Trafficking. *International Migration*, 43(1/2), 5-16.
- Larsen, J.L., Lindley, J., & Putt, J. (2009). *Trafficking in persons monitoring report July 2007 – December 2008*. Canberra: Australian Institute of Criminology.
- Limanowska, B. (2003). *Women's human rights and elimination of all forms of violence against women and girls as defined in the Beijing Platform for Action and the outcome documents of the twenty-third special session of the General Assembly*. New York: United Nations 3 – 14 March 2003.
- Lipsey, M. W., & Wilson, D. B. (2001). *Practical meta-analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Lum, C., & Yang, S.M. (2005). Why do evaluation researchers in crime and justice choose non-experimental methods? *Journal of Experimental Criminology*, 1, 191-213.
- Rossi, P. H., Lipsey, M. W., & Freeman, H. E. (2004). *Evaluation: a systematic approach*. London: Sage publications.
- Sherman, L., Gottfredson, D., MacKenzie, D., Eck, J., Reuter, P., & Bushway, S. (1998). *Preventing Crime: What works, What Doesn't, What's Promising*. U.S.: Department of Justice.
- Sherman, L.W., Farrington, D.P., Welsh, B.C., & MacKenzie, D.L. (Eds.). (2002). *Evidence based crime prevention*. London, UK: Routledge.
- Smit, M. (2011). Trafficking in human beings for labour exploitation: The case of the Netherlands. *Trends in Organized Crime*, 14, 184-197.
- Surtees, R. (2008). Traffickers and trafficking in Southern and Eastern Europe: Considering the other side of human trafficking. *European Journal of Criminology*, 5(1), 39-68.

- Tyldum, G., & Brunovskis, A. (2005). Describing the unobserved: methodological challenges in empirical studies on human trafficking. *International Migration*, 43(1/2), 17-34.
- Tyldum, G., Tveit, M., & Brunovskis, A. (2005). *Taking stock: a review of the existing research on trafficking for sexual exploitation*. Fafo-report 493. Oslo: Fafo.
- United Nations. (2000). *Protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children supplementing the United Nations Convention against transnational organized crime*. Retrieved from: http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final_documents_2/convention_%20traff_eng.pdf.
- UN High Commissioner. (2002). *Recommended Principles and Guidelines on Human Rights and Human Trafficking*. Addendum to the Report of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights to the Economic and Social Council, UN document E/2002/68/Add.1. Retrieved from: <http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Press/OHCHR%20Recommended%20Guidelines.pdf>.
- United States Government Accountability Office (GAO) (2006). *Human Trafficking. Better Data, Strategy and Reporting Needed to Enhance U.S. Antitrafficking Efforts Abroad*. Report to the Chairman, Committee on the Judiciary and the Chairman, Committee on International Relations, House of Representatives. GAO-06-825.
- United States Government Accountability Office (GAO) (2007). *Human Trafficking. Monitoring and Evaluation of International Projects Are Limited, but Experts Suggest Improvement*. Report to Congressional Requesters. GAO-07-1034.
- US Department of State (2009). *Trafficking in Persons Report 2009*. Washington: US Department of State.
- Vandekerckhove, W. (2003). Ethische problemen van en voor NGO's in de strijd tegen mensenhandel. In W. Vandekerckhove (Ed.), *NGO's in de strijd tegen mensenhandel: humanitaire motieven, repressieve middelen?* Antwerpen: EPO.
- Weiner, N.A., & Hala, N. (2008). *Measuring Human Trafficking. Lessons from New York City*. New York: Vera Institute of Justice.
- Weintraub, I. (2006). *The role of grey literature in the sciences*. Brooklyn College Library. Retrieved from <http://academic.brooklyn.cuny.edu/library/access/greyliter.htm>
- Wilson, B.D. (2009). Missing a critical piece of the pie: simple document search strategies inadequate for systematic reviews. *Journal of Experimental Criminology*, 5, 429-440.
- World Congress Against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children. (2001). *Theme paper Yokohama Conference. Trafficking in children for sexual purposes: An analytical review*. Yokohama.
- Zimmerman, C., Yun, K., Shvab, I., Watts, C., Trappolin, L., Treppete, M., . . . Regan, L. (2003). The health risks and consequences of trafficking in women and adolescents. Findings from a European study. London: London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine (LSHTM).

12 Appendix

12.1 LIST OF KEY WORDS

LANGUAGE	TOPIC	RESEARCH	INTERVENTION
DANISH	Menneskehandel	Intervention	Evaluering
	Seksuel udnyttelse	Politik	Effektivitet
	Udnyttelse	Strategi	Følge
	Sexindustrien	Tilgang	Resultater
	Tvungen arbejdskraft	Hensigt	Værker
	Bekæmpelse af menneskehandel	Program	Analysere
	Prostitution		Vurdering
DUTCH	Mensenhandel	Interventie	Evaluatie
	Handel in mensen	Programma	Effect
	Seksuele uitbuiting	Beleid	Effectiviteit
	Uitbuiting	Strategie	Resultaat
	Seksindustrie	Aanpak	Resultaten
	Gedwongen arbeid	Plan	Werkt
	Anti mensenhandel		Analyse
	Prostitutie		Beoordeling
ENGLISH	Human trafficking	Intervention	Effect
	THB	Suppression	Evaluation
	Sexual exploitation	Prevention	Effectiveness
	Trafficking	Policy	Empirical
	Sexual purpose	Strategy	Assessment
	Forced labour	Programme	Works
	Sex industry	Repression	Analysis
	Anti-trafficking	Deterrence	Assess
	Prostitution	Guidelines	Evaluate

LANGUAGE	TOPIC	RESEARCH	INTERVENTION
		Approach	Best practice
FRENCH	Trafic humain	Intervention	Effet
	Trafic d'êtres humains	Suppression	Evaluation
	Commerce sexuel	Prévention	Efficacité, performance
	Trafic	Règles	
	A but sexuel	Stratégie	Evaluation, appréciation
	Travail forcé	Programme	Travaux
	Industrie du sexe	Répression	Analyse
	Anti-trafic	Dissuasion	Evaluer
	Prostitution	Guide, ligne directrice	Evaluer, constater, estimer, apprécier
		Approche	
GERMAN	Menschenhandel	Intervention	Bewertung
	Sexuelle Ausbeutung	Programm	Wirkung
	Ausbeutung	Politik	Wirksamkeit
	Sex-Industrie	Strategie	Ergebnis
	Zwangsarbeit	Unterdrückung	Ergebnisse
	Bekämpfung des Menschenhandels		Epirische
	Prostitution		
ITALIAN	Traffico	Intervento	Esito
	Sfruttamento sessuale	Soppressione	Risultato
	Sfruttamento	Prevenzione	Valutazione
	Industria del sesso	Politica	Efficacia
	Lavoro forzato	Strategia	Empirica
	Anti-traffico	Programma	Analisi
	Scopo sessuale	Repressione	
	Prostituzione	Dissuasione	
			Linee guida
		Metodo	
NORWEGIAN	Smugling	Intervensjon	Effekt
	Handel med mennesker	Undertrykkelse	Evalueringen
	Seksuell utnytting	Forebygging	Effektivitet
	Utnytting	Politikk	Eempiriske
	Sex industrien	Strategi	Vurdering

LANGUAGE	TOPIC	RESEARCH	INTERVENTION
	Tvungen arbeidskraft	Program	Hva som fungerer
	Anti-smugling	Retningslinjene	Analysen
	Prostitusjon	Avskrekking	Vurdere
SPANISH	La tratta di esseri umani	Intervención	Efecto
	La explotación sexual	Represión	Resultado
	Tráfico	Prevención	Eficacia
	Fin sexual	Política	Empírico
	El trabajo forzoso	Estrategia	Análisis
	Industria del sexo	Programa	Evaluar
	Lucha contra la trata (contra la trata de personas)	Disuasión	
		Directrices	
SWEDISH	Människohandel	Intervention	Utvärdering
	Sexuellt utnyttjande	Program	Effekt
	Utnyttjande	Politik	Effektivitet
	Sexindustrin	Strategi	Resultat
	Tvångsarbete	Närma sig	Resultat
	Mot människohandel	Projekt	Verk
	Prostitution		Analys
			Värdering

12.2 LIST OF CONSULTED DATABASES

1. Abstracts in Anthropology
2. Academic Search Premier
3. ACORN (Vanderbilt University library book search)
4. American Bibliography of Slavic and East European Studies
5. Annual reviews
6. AnthroSource
7. Arts and humanities citation index
8. ASLIB
9. Australian Criminology Database (CINCH)
10. Bibliography of Nordic Criminology
11. Boekmanstichting
12. Business Source Premier
13. Caredata (social work)
14. Catalogus University of Amsterdam
15. Cochrane Controlled Trials Register
16. Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews
17. CrimDoc (European)
18. Criminal Justice Abstracts
19. Campbell Collaboration Reviews of Intervention and Policy Effects (C2-RIPE)
20. C2-SPECTR (a trials register of the Campbell Collaboration, covering sociology, psychology, education and criminology)
21. Database of Abstracts of Reviews of Effectiveness (DARE)
22. Digital academic repository UvA-DARE
23. EconLit
24. Education-line
25. Elektronische Zeitschriftenbibliothek
26. Elsevier Science Direct
27. ERIC / International ERIC (Educational Resources Information Clearinghouse)
28. Esmerald fulltext
29. ESRC Funded Research (REGARD)
30. Google, Google Scholar and Google Books
31. GPO Monthly Catalog (MOCAT)
32. HMSO publications (Home Office Research Studies)
33. Internationaal Instituut voor Sociale Geschiedenis
34. JSTOR
35. Lexis Nexis Academic NL
36. MetaPress
37. National Criminal Justice Research Service
38. The National Institute for Clinical Excellence (NICE)
39. NHS EED
40. Online contents

41. Periodicals archive online
42. Periodicals index online
43. PiCarta
44. Police Executive Research Forum (PERF) database of problem-oriented policing examples (POPNet)
45. POPLINE
46. Project MUSE
47. ProQuest Social Sciences Index
48. PsychInfo/PsychLit
49. Psyn dex (a German database of psychological publications)
50. PubMed
51. Sage journals online
52. Science Direct
53. SIGLE (System for Information on Grey Literature in Europe)
54. Sociological Abstracts
55. Social Sciences Citation Index (Social SciSearch)
56. Social Science Electronic Data Library
57. Social Science Research Network
58. Social Sciences Abstracts
59. SpringerLink
60. UK National Health Service NRR (National Research Register)
61. UNESCO (UNESDO and UNESBIB)
62. Web of Science
63. Wiley InterScience
64. World Bank Documents
65. WorldCat
66. World wide political science abstracts

12.3 LIST OF CONSULTED WEBSITES

1. <http://www.abolishslavery.org>
2. <http://www.acf.hss.gov>
3. <http://www.afesip.org>
4. <http://www.aic.gov.au>
5. <http://www.animusassociation.org>
6. <http://www.ansarburney.org>
7. <http://www.antislavery.org>
8. <http://www.antitrafic.ro>
9. <http://www.apg23.org>
10. <http://www.awid.org>
11. <http://www.bewareofloverboys.nl>
12. <http://www.blinn.nl>
13. <http://www.businesstravellers.org>
14. <http://www.cbg.nl>
15. <http://www.cbss.org/tfthb>
16. <http://www.childtrafficking.com>
17. <http://www.childwatch.uio.nl/cwi/projects/indicators/prostitution/index.html>
18. http://citd.scar.utoronto.ca/mhso/trafficking_women.html
19. <http://www.clara-wichmann.nl>
20. <http://www.courtsni.gov.uk/en-GB/Services/Support+to+Victim+and+Witnesses/>
22. <http://www.coatnet.org/en/>
23. <http://www.cridoc.net>
24. <http://www.cross-border-crime.net>
25. <http://www.diversiteit.be>
26. <http://www.ecpat.nl>
27. <http://www.ecpat.com>
28. <http://www.enmp.org>
29. <http://www.e-quality.n>
30. <http://europa.eu.int>
31. <http://www.helenbamber.org>
32. <http://www.hetccv.nl>
33. <http://www.homeoffice.gov.uk/rds/policerspubs1.html>
34. <http://www.hrlawgroup.org>
35. <http://www.humantrafficking.org>
36. <http://www.humantraffickingsearch.net>
37. <http://www.huntalternatives.org>
38. <http://www.ilegaalkind.nl>
39. <http://www.imes.uva.nl>
40. <http://www.inlia.nl>

41. <http://www.interapy.nl/digihulp>
42. <http://www.international.metropolis.net>
43. <http://www.iom.int>
44. <http://www.jeugdprostitutie.nu>
45. <http://www.jip.org>
46. <http://www.just.ee>
47. <http://www.kbs.frb.be>
48. <http://www.kerkinactie.nl>
49. <http://www.kinderbescherming.nl>
50. <http://www.lastradainternational.org>
51. <http://www.law.uu.nl/sim>
52. <http://ligeuk.itide.dk>
53. <http://www.lover-boy.nl>
54. <http://www.meldmisdaadanoniem.nl>
55. <http://www.mensenhandel.nl>
56. <http://mensenhandel.blogspot.com>
57. <http://www.minbuza.nl>
58. <http://www.minjus.nl>
59. <http://www.minvws.nl>
60. <http://www.mirrorartgroup.org>
61. <http://www.mvcr.cz/clanek/obchod-s-lidmi-dokumenty-982041.aspx>
62. <http://www.napoweb.nl>
63. <http://www.ncjrs.org/pdffiles1/nij/trafficking.pdf>
64. <http://www.odccp.org>
65. <http://www.oijj.org>
66. <http://www.ojp.usdoj.gov/nij/international/traffsum.html>
67. <http://www.openbaarministerie.nl>
68. <http://www.opvang.nl>
69. <http://www.osce.org>
70. <http://www.overheid.nl>
71. <http://www.parlement.nl>
72. <http://pharos.nl>
73. <http://www.pic-amsterdam.nl>
74. <http://www.projetotrama.org.br>
75. <http://www.prostitutie.nl>
76. <http://www.recht.nl/internetvoorjuristen/sites/>
77. <http://www.rechtspraak.nl>
78. <http://www.rodedraad.nl>
79. <http://www.rutgersnissogroep.nl>
80. <http://www.rvr.org>
81. <http://www.sais-jhu.edu/protectionproject/index.htm>
82. <http://www.sctnow.org>
83. <http://www.sdu.nl>
84. <http://www.senaat.be>

85. <http://www.sexworkeurope.org>
86. <http://www.shop-den Haag.nl>
87. <http://www.slachtofferhulp.nl/>
88. <http://www.srtv.info/index.html>
89. <http://www.stakes.fi/sexviolence/stop1report.pdf>
90. <http://www.state.gov>
91. <http://www.steunpunthuiselijkgeweld.nl>
92. <http://www.stichtingstade.nl>
93. <http://www.stoploverboys.nu>
94. <http://www.stophetraffik.nl>
95. <http://www.swc-cfc.gc.ca>
96. <http://www.tai.ee>
97. <http://www.tampep.com>
98. <http://www.thehungersite.com>
99. <http://www.tldb.net>
100. <http://www.training.itcilo.it.ils>
101. <http://www.transact.nl>
102. <http://www.umn.edu/humanrts/iwraw/index.htm>
103. <http://www.un.org>
104. <http://www.unicri.it>
105. <http://www.unifem.org>
106. <http://www.uri.edu>
107. <http://www.usdoj.gov>
108. <http://www.usinfo.state.gov/topical/global/traffic>
109. <http://www.victims-of-trafficking.org>
110. <http://www.vng.nl/smartsite.dws?ID=37114>
111. <http://www.wodc.nl>

12.4 REPORTS ON INTERNAL TRAFFICKING

Additional information about two studies that meet the criteria for a possible systematic review on internal trafficking. These studies were discovered during the search for eligible studies. A systematic review about internal trafficking is recommended.

Reference: Skidmore, P. (2002). *What works against sexual exploitation of children: sharing and learning*. (Wat werkt bij seksuele exploitatie van kinderen: delen en leren). Barnardo's Research & Development.

Introduction: This project compares the achievement of prevention and intervention programs in the Netherlands and the United Kingdom. The programs focus on social care for commercial sexual exploited children.

Methodology: Pre and posttest study with comparison group, in which a specially designed monitoring tool and case study model are used to collect qualitative and quantitative data of at risk youth.

Outcome measures: Monitoring tool; lifestyle risks and level of sexual exploitation.

Results: In accordance to specific outcomes due to contact with social workers, small differences were discovered. However, the general risk for sexual exploitation was decreased by the intervention, as well in the Netherlands as in the UK.

Reference: Skidmore, P., & Robinson, B. (2007). *'It could be anyone'. Evaluation Report of the London Prevention Education Program (Child Sexual Exploitation)*. Barnardo's Policy and Research Unit.

Introduction: The Prevention Education Program (PEP) on Child Sexual Exploitation is a preventive program in London, achieved during 2005 until 2007.

Methodology: Data was collected from professionals (pre and posttest questionnaires, focus group discussions and interviews), young people in schools (questionnaires, focus group discussions and interviews) and young people in Pupil Referral Units (interviews). Pre and posttests were accomplished, as well as follow-up measures.

Outcome measures: There were items on knowledge of sexual exploitation, awareness of sexual exploitation, understanding of rights and on the assessment of the training.

Results: In general, the program has positive effects: there is an increase in awareness and knowledge for the professionals and young people in PRUs. For the young people in schools the growth in knowledge and awareness remains unknown, as they only conducted a posttest questionnaire.

12.5 ADDITIONAL INFORMATION ON 20 STUDIES THAT WERE EXCLUDED AFTER CODING

All 20 studies that were coded are reports, of which 16 come from an NGO and 4 are the result of cooperation between an NGO and a government. It were also mainly NGOs that were responsible for operating and maintaining the interventions (11), or NGOs in collaboration with a government (7). Half of the interventions (10) were evaluated by an independent evaluator. In one case the evaluator had delivered the intervention and had a direct influence on operations. Furthermore, all reports were written in English, although country of origin varied from Southeast European to Asian and Southeast Asian. Besides, not only the typical countries that are mostly cited in the literature were represented. Studies also regarded interventions in Israel, Austria, Kazakhstan and Costa Rica.

Explicit goals of the interventions consisted mainly of 'awareness raising', 'capacity building' and 'employment/empowerment'. Of the interventions that had 'awareness raising' as goal (16), 6 used a (information) campaign as primary method to reach their target group. Other interventions made use of trainings, shelter home visits, media advocacy and lectures. As most interventions attempted to raise awareness, their target group mainly consisted of a mixed group, including juveniles and adults and as well males and females. Some interventions focused in particular on juveniles (3), for example by life skills training, others exclusively on adults (3). Some interventions concentrated only on males or females.

1. Äijälä, P., & Roth, V. (2006). *Evaluation of counter trafficking: prevention and capacity building activities in Kosovo (Serbia and Montenegro) and F.Y.R. of Macedonia*. BIOTA BD.

Introduction: The purpose of the programme Prevention and Capacity Building Activities is to establish a functional government and NGO infrastructure capable of raising awareness, and to facilitate and build regional NGO network and also to effectively train the law enforcement personnel.

Methodology: Posttest, consisting of desk work (report analysis) and interviews.

Outcome measures: Level of awareness.

Reasons for exclusion: The evaluation did not focus on the effectiveness of the intervention, but on the expenditure.

2. Association for Emancipation, Solidarity and Equality of Women. (2006). *Qualitative evaluation of the economic and social stabilization programme for potential victims of trafficking in the border regions of FYR Macedonia – ESS*. CEB, IOM & the Norwegian government.

Introduction: The purpose of this ESS project is to reduce the potential for THB in the F.Y.R. of Macedonia through the stabilization of unemployed vulnerable groups,

particularly women in impoverished border regions. This employment assistance project included training and opening of micro business for income generation.

Methodology: Posttest, data collected by questionnaires and interviews.

Outcome measures: Socio-economic status, quality of life, knowledge and attitudes towards THB

Reasons for exclusion: The intervention did not focus on sexual exploitation, but on trafficking in general. *Included in narrative review.*

3. Back, L., & Gonzalez-Aleman, J. (2005). *Country program evaluation 2001-2005*. Royal Government of Cambodia / UNICEF.

Introduction: The aim of the 'Children in need of a special protection program' is to enable social and legal systems to undertake effective preventive and rehabilitative measures for children at risk and in distress, including combating child abuse, trafficking and sexual exploitation.

Methodology: Posttest, using interviews, a desk review, field visits, workshops and reports.

Outcome measures: The role and relevance of the intervention, its design & focus, its effectiveness and efficiency, sustainability, replicability and mainstreaming of results.

Reasons for exclusion: The intervention did not focus on sexual exploitation, but on trafficking in general.

4. Balanon, F. G., & Barrameda, T. V. (2007). *Coalition against trafficking in women - Asia Pacific 2004 to 2006. Evaluation of Programs*. The Philippines: CATW.

Introduction: This reports looks at the good practices of 4 programs, the only program with a description of evaluation: The Young Men's Camp. Five key components: 1) development of teaching materials, 2) the actual conduct of the Camp, 3) Training of Trainers, 4) the Camp assessment, 5) support to follow-up activities.

Methodology: Pre-and posttest, by reviewing documents and using questionnaires, interviews and text messaging.

Outcome measures: Changes in participants understanding, perceptions and knowledge about sexuality and gender issues.

Reasons for exclusion: No comparison group. *Included in narrative review.*

5. Budiharga, W., & Arna, A. P. (2007). *Combating human trafficking in Indonesia through law enforcement: an evaluation report on IOM Project supported by NZAID*. Jakarta, SCN-CREST.

Introduction: The project includes 1. increasing awareness and knowledge of the police, prosecutors and judges; 2. increase the number of human trafficking cases

that are both investigated and eventually prosecuted and convicted; 3. promoting collaboration and cooperation among the law enforcement agencies.

Methodology: Posttest, using interviews, questionnaires, a documentary study and focus group discussions.

Outcome measures: Increase in knowledge and awareness, influence in practice, socialization, usefulness of guidelines, decrease in constraints, increase in coordination and overall relevance, number of trafficking cases handled.

Reasons for exclusion: No comparison group.

6. Centre for Research on Environment Health and Population Activities. (2004). *The anti-trafficking programme in rural Nepal: Assessment of change in awareness and communication among adolescent girls, peers and parents in Baglung District*. Gairidhare, Kathmandu: Centre for Development and Population Activities.

Introduction: The goal of the Adolescent Girls Groups Anti-Trafficking Project (AGGATP) is to: increase the ability of 891 adolescent girls from nine village development committees (VDSCs) of Baglung district to resist trafficking attempts and to be able to help other girls and women protect themselves against traffickers.

Methodology: Pre- and posttest, using interviews and questionnaires.

Outcome measures: awareness of signs indicative of trafficking, knowledge of awareness of rights related to anti-trafficking, awareness of interpersonal communication on trafficking info.

Reasons for exclusion: No comparison group. *Included in narrative review.*

7. Engel, J. M. (2001). *Statistical abstract and summary report of Russia's first multi-regional, multi-media public education anti-trafficking campaign*. Moscow: The Angel Coalition & MiraMed Institute.

Introduction: The 100-day campaign is the largest multi-regional, multi media public education anti trafficking campaign in Russia. It aims to raise awareness on THB.

Methodology: Monitoring/posttest.

Outcome measures: The number of materials used and number of phone calls.

Reasons for exclusion: There was no evaluation, only monitoring activities.

8. ESCAP. (2002). *Evaluation report: implementation of ESCAP resolution 53/4 on the elimination of sexual abuse and sexual exploitation of children and youth in Asia and the Pacific*. New York: United Nations.

Introduction: The Program activities aimed to strengthen the human resources development capabilities of social development personnel in the participating countries to assist young victims and potential victims of sexual abuse and sexual exploitation ultimately to be reintegrated in communities and families, have access to food and health services.

Methodology: Posttest, by questionnaires.

Outcome measures: Program output and impact/content.

Reasons for exclusion: The evaluation was not about effectiveness.

9. Garcia, F. E. B. (2006). *Prevention, protection and rehabilitation of girl survivors of sexual abuse, prostituted girls and girls at risk*. The Netherlands: Terre des Hommes.

Introduction: The project aims to prevent, protect and rehabilitate girl survivors of sexual abuse, prostituted girls and girls at risk through the residential shelter and drop-in center, outreach and mothers and babies program. Relevant for this systematic review: girls at risk.

Methodology: Posttest, using interviews with stakeholder, observations, review of relevant documents and an existing database.

Outcome measures: Number of girls in residential setting and drop-in centre, extent of services, assessment of program and activities, assessment of services, long-term outcomes, positive-negative contributions to the project, organization capacities.

Reasons for exclusion: The program focused not specifically on cross-border trafficking.

10. Gilmore, J. (2008). *Evaluation of the Microsoft Unlimited Potential Anti-Trafficking Program in Asia*. University of Washington: Center for Information & Society.

Introduction: YMKK: Yayasan Mitra Kesehatan dan Kemanusiaan in Indonesia. ICT skills training programs for at-risk migrant youth and adults, and returned victims. The training focuses on finding better employment opportunities and improving their lives. The training comprises 12 hours of ICT and 12 hours of Life Skills.

Methodology: Posttest, using interviews.

Outcome measures: Employment rates, computer access, training program: the interviewees felt more positive about the future due to the training program. They had more friends, more confidence at their jobs and more information.

Reasons for exclusion: The program focused on trafficking in general, not specifically on sexual exploitation.

11. Gold, L. G., & Ami, N. B. (2004). *National NGOs report to the annual UN Commission on Human Rights: Evaluation of national authorities activities and actual facts on the trafficking in persons for the purpose of prostitution in Israel*. Israel: Awareness Center.

Introduction: This report looks at THB and prostitution in Israel where an overview is given of the actual context, legal dispositions, measures taken by national, local authorities and NGO's.

Methodology: Not applicable

Outcome measures: not applicable

Reasons for exclusion: The study did not include an evaluation of (any) anti-trafficking initiative.

12. Gopalan, S., & Livingston, L. (2008). *Terminal evaluation report. Strengthening the law enforcement response in India against trafficking in persons through training and capacity building*. UNODC.

Introduction: UNODC undertook 'project IND/16' in association with the government of India and State Governments on capacity building of law enforcement agencies and strengthening response systems to prevent and combat the problem of human trafficking in India, especially in women and children.

Methodology: Pre- and posttest, by questionnaires and interviews.

Outcome measures: Knowledge and awareness of the officials who attended the training.

Reasons for exclusion: The intervention did not focus on sexual exploitation.

13. Hagar, I., Leuthold, M., & Winkler, A. (2001). *'It's not only shameful...it's a crime' - Evaluation of the in-flight spot 'Child sex abuse is not a peccadillo' on flights of Austrian Airlines to Vienna*. Respect - Zentrum für Tourismus und Entwicklung.

Introduction: Evaluation of the in-flight video on the sexual abuse of children, presented by Austrian Airlines on their long-haul flights to South Africa and India since 1999.

Methodology: Posttest, using interviews.

Outcome measures: The extent to which the effect of the video is informative and emotionally stirring.

Reasons for exclusion: The evaluation was not about cross-border trafficking and the evaluation did not focus on effectiveness.

14. Hashash, Y. (2007). *Evaluation report. Trafficking Project. Hotline for migrant workers and Isha, L'Isha*.

Introduction: Trafficking in women is the focus of a concentrated education and advocacy campaign, aimed at creating attitudinal and institutional change within Israel. The action will impact public policy and opinion leading to a reduction in the trafficking while raising the status of women and other weak populations.

Methodology: Pre- and posttest, using questionnaires and interviews.

Outcome measures: Changes in attitude.

Reasons for exclusion: *Included in narrative review.*

15. Hendriati, A. (2006). *Summative evaluation report. South East Asia regional campaign against child trafficking*. Jakarta: Terre des Hommes-Netherlands.

Introduction: This evaluation looks at Cambodia, Indonesia, Philippines and Thailand and the projects implemented during 2001-2005 to account for the initiatives undertaken and to provide basis for future strategic planning. This report is a summary of the reports from the different countries.

Methodology: Posttest, using structured interviews and focus group discussions.

Outcome measures: Not available

Reasons for exclusion: The conducted study was not an evaluation.

16. IOM. (2008). *Final report to the Ministry of Interior of the Czech Republic: Counter-trafficking campaign targeting clients of prostitution in the Czech Republic*. Czech Republic: IOM.

Introduction: The IOM carried out an information campaign. The aim was to raise awareness about human trafficking and to present more information, such as information about non-profit organizations that offer support to victims of human trafficking. The campaign involved part of the Czech republic, with a focus on Prague.

Methodology: Posttest/monitoring, through registration.

Outcome measures: Registration of responses to hotline, email, website.

Reasons for exclusion: The study was not an evaluation.

17. Porumb, C., Moldovanu, I., Stepan, A., Platon, D., Besliu, A., Cretu, V., Moraru, N., & Guzun, I. (2004). *Life skills education for prevention of trafficking in human beings. Evaluation report*. CIDDC, Ministry of Education of the Republic of Moldova, UNICEF, Rădda Barnen.

Introduction: The project Life Skills Education for Prevention of Trafficking in Human Beings was implemented in 11 boarding schools in Moldova. The goal was to facilitate the psychosocial integration of students from institutions, through life skills development, in order to reduce the risk of unemployment and trafficking in human beings.

Methodology: Posttest, through interviews, focus group discussions and questionnaires.

Outcome measures: Educational approach bases on life skills development through interactive methods, peer-to-peer training in life skills, change in children's knowledge, attitudes and skills, improvement of educational process from the point of view of life skills development for prevention of THB.

Reasons for exclusion: The program did not focus specifically on sexual exploitation.

18. SIDA. (2006). *Evaluation of anti-trafficking activities in central Asia financed by SIDA*. SIDA.

Introduction: This report has evaluated SIDA-financed counter trafficking initiatives in 2 countries: Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan. It concerns mainly the impact of the SIDA financed support.

Methodology: not applicable

Outcome measures: Not applicable

Reasons for exclusion: The study was not an evaluation and the program did not focus specifically on sexual exploitation.

19. UNICEF. (2006). *Evaluation of anti-trafficking policies in Romania*.

UNICEF/Interministerial Working Group for the Coordination and Assessment of Activities to Prevent and Combating Trafficking in Human Beings.

Introduction: Evaluation of several policies in Romania. Special Law 678-2001 on trafficking in human beings prevention and control, transcribes into the Romanian legislation the provisions of the European and international legislation on trafficking in human beings. The law mentions which Ministry has which responsibility.

Methodology: Posttest, using interviews and questionnaires.

Outcome measures: Level of information and awareness.

Reasons for exclusion: The program did not focus specifically on trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

20. Valdambri, J. (2004). *Prevention through awareness. Campaigning on child sex tourism: a market research project*. UK: ECPAT.

Introduction: This project evaluates the awareness raising materials from the UK, the Gambia, Costa Rica and Thailand by looking at campaign posters of child sex tourism.

Methodology: Posttest/market research, consisting of interviews.

Outcome measures: Not applicable

Reasons for exclusion: The study was not an evaluation on effectiveness.

12.6 PUBLICATION YEAR OF EVALUATION STUDIES

The search strategy identified 144 potentially eligible studies based when reading title, subtitle and abstract. The distribution of these studies over the last ten years is presented in table 2.

Table 2. Publication year of reviewed studies

Year of publication	Number of evaluation studies	%
2000	7	5
2001	7	5
2002	6	4
2003	9	6
2004	18	13
2005	11	8
2006	20	14
2007	32	22
2008	28	19
2009 ¹⁷	6	4

Table 3 shows the distribution over the years for the 20 studies that were coded.

Table 3. Publication year of coded studies

Year of publication	Number of evaluation studies	%
2000	0	0
2001	2	10
2002	1	5
2003	0	0
2004	4	20
2005	1	5
2006	6	30
2007	3	15
2008	3	15
2009	0	0

¹⁷ Data collection ran to June 2009.