Does Policy Create Barriers to Heritage Led Regeneration Projects

introduction

Interest groups such as the Heritage alliance have expressed concerns around how current planning Policy creates more barriers to using Heritage led Development as a concept in projects than it does to facilitate it with concerns such as extremely high VAT rates and bias towards listed properties being frequently brought up.

From the evidence already available, there appears to be an impact, with Historic England outlining how almost 5000 Historic Buildings and Heritage Assets are listed on the at risk register with a further 175 being added in 2022 while only 223 were removed bringing into question the uptake of Heritage based projects.

This research will aim to identify current planning policies impacting Heritage assets, and assess their effectiveness in facilitating heritage led Development projects for a range of different Stakeholders.

Methodology

	Objectives	Methods	Outcome	
Literature Review /Policy Review	To identify key principles of good Heritage led Regeneration and how policy works with them	Analysing Policy documents i.e. the NPPF and drawing from relevant literature	To create a Conceptual Framework for suggesting effective Planning Policy framework.	
Conceptual Framework	To draw together a set of key principles from the literature review to assess related Heritage Policy framework	To create a spreadsheet to synthesise key ideas from the literature review into a spreadsheet	Develop conceptual framework to assess policy effectiveness and its impacts on Heritage	
Interviews	gain an idea of how the effectiveness of Policy is perceived by relevant key actors	20x Semi structured interviews using 5 questions regarding current Policy and its impacts	Gain an understanding of how third Parties perceive Policy and identify if there are other greater concerns	
Case Study Analysis	Identify how past projects have been helped or failed by Planning Policy framework	Analysing 3 UK based Case studies to draw ideas on how policy has helped Buildings being preserved saved or not. - Desktop research	To support or improve the Principles of good planning policy identified by the conceptual framework	
Policy suggestions and conclusions	Use the data and Framework to draw together main Policy suggestions based on conclusions	Assess Data using the conceptual framework	A Conclusion to whether Planning Policy works in favour of Heritage led regeneration + Suggestions for improvement	

Research Questions

	Question	Rationale
Question 1	Do you think that Heritage planning policy is equally effective at saving non listed and Listed Heritage Buildings	To establish if planning policy shows bias towards protecting mostly listed buildings
Question 2	Do you think that Heritage Planning policy imposes costs too high to make it a Viable option for Developers	To establish if cost heavily impacts the uptake of Heritage Development projects.
Question 3	Do you think that Heritage Planning Policy ensures Developments follow good principles of Heritage planning policy as set out by ICOMOS	To find out is Heritage Planning policy is structured to follow model principles of Heritage developments
Question 4	How do you think Heritage Planning Policy could be improved and what polices would be involved	To highlight which Heritage based planning policies could be improved on from a professional viewpoint
Question 5	Do you think that Heritage Planning Policy can be easily manipulated to suit different interests from potential stakeholders	To establish whether Heritage planning policy is open to influence by different stakeholders' different agendas

Demolished or have been added to Historic England's atrisk register Do you think that Listed and non listed heritage assets deserve equal consideration for conservation Description 3 Have you encountered Historic Buildings in your area that have been altered or demolished regardless of a listing status. What was the outcome and why did this happen? Question 4 Do you think that Listed and non listed heritage assets the Built environment perceive the value of heritage assets based on listing status and whether they want policy to take a different approach. To understand how users of the Built environment perceive the value of heritage assets based on listing status and whether they want policy to take a different approach. To understand users personal experiences with the Heritage Environment and to gather potential reasons why policy may have failed certain assets. To also identify other shortfal happen? To establish if users of the Built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences. To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development projects and other limitations.		Question	Hationale
Demolished or have been added to Historic England's atrisk register Do you think that Listed and non listed heritage assets deserve equal consideration for conservation Description 3 Have you encountered Historic Buildings in your area that have been altered or demolished regardless of a listing status. What was the outcome and why did this happen? Question 4 Do you think that Listed and non listed heritage assets the Built environment perceive the value of heritage assets based on listing status and whether they want policy to take a different approach. To understand how users of the Built environment perceive the value of heritage assets based on listing status and whether they want policy to take a different approach. To understand users personal experiences with the Heritage Environment and to gather potential reasons why policy may have failed certain assets. To also identify other shortfal happen? To establish if users of the Built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences. To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development projects and other limitations.	Question 1	Why do you think that so	To understand how users of
Added to Historic England's atrisk register Do you think that Listed and non listed heritage assets deserve equal consideration for conservation Question 3 Have you encountered Historic Buildings in your area that have been altered or demolished regardless of a listing status. What was the outcome and why did this happen? Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried Do you think that Planning Policy to take a different approach To understand users personal experiences with the Heritage Environment and to gather potential reasons why policy may have failed certain assets To also identify other shortfal to suit the properties of the suilt Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on the woulds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to the Heritage based Development projects and other limitations	many listed buildings are being		the Built environment perceive
risk register Question 2 Do you think that Listed and non listed heritage assets deserve equal consideration for conservation Question 3 Have you encountered Historic Buildings in your area that have been altered or demolished regardless of a listing status. What was the outcome and why did this happen? Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried To understand users personal experiences with the Heritage Environment and to gather potential reasons why policy may have failed certain assets To also identify other shortfal Built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on the world policy believed the triangle based Development brojects and other limitations		Demolished or have been	the protection provided to
Question 2 Do you think that Listed and non listed heritage assets deserve equal consideration for conservation Question 3 Have you encountered Historic Buildings in your area that have been altered or demolished regardless of a listing status. What was the outcome and why did this happen? Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried Do you think that Listed and the Built environment perceiv the value of heritage assets on listing status and whether they want policy to take a different approach To understand how users of the Built environment perceiv the value of heritage assets passets and speriences. To also identify other shortfal built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences. To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development projects and other limitations		added to Historic England's at-	Heritage assets through Policy
non listed heritage assets deserve equal consideration for conservation Auestion 3 Have you encountered Historic Buildings in your area that have been altered or demolished regardless of a listing status. What was the outcome and why did this happen? Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried the Built environment perceiv the value of heritage assets based on listing status and whether they want policy to take a different approach to take a different approach to understand users personal experiences with the Heritage Environment and to gather potential reasons why policy may have failed certain assets To also identify other shortfal Built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation of new builds based on personal experiences In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried		risk register	
deserve equal consideration for conservation deserve equal consideration for conservation deserve equal consideration for conservation deserve equal consideration whether they want policy to take a different approach To understand users personal experiences with the Heritage environment and to gather potential reasons why policy may have failed certain assets to demolished regardless of a listing status. What was the outcome and why did this happen? Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried To understand users potential reasons why policy may have failed certain assets To also identify other shortfal built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to the Heritage based Development projects and other limitations	Question 2	Do you think that Listed and	To understand how users of
for conservation for conservation based on listing status and whether they want policy to take a different approach To understand users personal experiences with the Heritage Environment and to gather potential reasons why policy may have failed certain assets to also identify other shortfal happen? Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried based on listing status and whether they want policy to take a different approach To understand users personal experiences with the Heritage posent and to gather potential reasons why policy may have failed certain assets To also identify other shortfal Built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development projects and other limitations		non listed heritage assets	the Built environment perceive
Question 3 Have you encountered Historic Buildings in your area that have been altered or demolished regardless of a listing status. What was the outcome and why did this happen? Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried Whether they want policy to take a different approach To understand users personal experiences with the Heritage Environment and to gather potential reasons why policy may have failed certain assets To also identify other shortfal Built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation of new builds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development		deserve equal consideration	the value of heritage assets
Question 3 Have you encountered Historic Buildings in your area that have been altered or demolished regardless of a listing status. What was the outcome and why did this happen? Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried Have you encountered Historic Builderent approach To understand users personal experiences with the Heritage Environment and to gather potential reasons why policy may have failed certain assets To also identify other shortfal Built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development projects and other limitations		for conservation	based on listing status and
Question 3 Have you encountered Historic Buildings in your area that have been altered or demolished regardless of a listing status. What was the outcome and why did this happen? Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried To understand <u>users</u> personal experiences with the Heritage Environment and to gather potential reasons why policy may have failed certain assets To also identify other shortfal Built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development			whether they want policy to
Buildings in your area that have been altered or demolished regardless of a listing status. What was the outcome and why did this happen? Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Could this be			take a different approach
have been altered or demolished regardless of a listing status. What was the outcome and why did this happen? Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on could this be improved on In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried Environment and to gather potential reasons why policy may have failed certain assets To also identify other shortfal built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to the Heritage based Development projects and other limitations	Question 3	Have you encountered Historic	To understand <u>users</u> personal
demolished regardless of a listing status. What was the outcome and why did this happen? Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based development being carried Do you think that Planning Policy that users of the Built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences Do you think that Planning Policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences Do you think that Planning Policy the short feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on the projects and other limitations		, ,	experiences with the Heritage
listing status. What was the outcome and why did this happen? Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried Institute of the sold in may have failed certain assets and seating also identify other shortfal to al		have been altered or	Environment and to gather
Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation Built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development projects and other limitations		demolished regardless of a	potential reasons why policy
Appen? Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried To establish if users of the Built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development		listing status. What was the	may have failed certain assets.
Question 4 Do you think that Planning Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to limited Heritage based developments being carried Do you think that Planning To establish if users of the Built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development		outcome and why did this	To also identify other shortfalls
Policy balances Conservation and Development effectively or could this be improved on Could this be improved on Personal experiences Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried Built Environment feel as though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation onew builds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to the reitage based Development projects and other limitations		- ' '	
and Development effectively or could this be improved on could this be improved on development being carried though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences are come across policies that have limited Heritage based development being carried though policy creates equal consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences for identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to the return of the projects and other limitations.	Question 4	, ,	
or could this be improved on consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried or could this be improved on consideration for reuse of Heritage assets and creation on new builds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development projects and other limitations		1 '	
Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried Heritage assets and creation of new builds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development projects and other limitations			, , , ,
Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried new builds based on personal experiences To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development projects and other limitations		or could this be improved on	
Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried experiences. To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development projects and other limitations			Heritage assets and creation of
Question 5 In your experience, have you come across policies that have limited Heritage based developments being carried To identify Policies that users find potentially problematic to Heritage based Development projects and other limitations			new builds based on personal
come across policies that have limited Heritage based Heritage based Development developments being carried projects and other limitations			
limited Heritage based Heritage based Development developments being carried projects and other limitations	Question 5		To identify Policies that users
developments being carried projects and other limitations			find potentially problematic to
' " ' '			
out If not what others they bear identified in the in			1 ' '
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		out. If not, what others	they have identified in their
limitations have you identified personal experience.		limitations have you identified	personal experience.

Conceptual Framework

Conceptual Framework	Explanation	Rationale
Historic Integrity	Good Planning Policy should	 Historic Integrity of
	protect the Historical Integrity	buildings isn't harmed
	of Heritage assets, carrying out	without due cause
	work only when justifiable.	 Work is focused on
		saving them and
		allowing for reuse
Policy without bias	Planning Policy should explore	 To ensure that locally
	the protection and reuse of	valuable heritage
	both listed and Unlisted	assets aren't lost due
	structures. It should also look	to a lack of a listing
	to give equal chance to new	status
	builds and reuse options	
Informed / tailored Policy	Effective Planning Policy	- To ensure Heritage
	should be informed by	Planning Policy is
	Stakeholders and Tailored to	suited best to its user
	their needs.	- To ensure Policy
		allows Heritage
		development to be a
		viable option for firms
Multi-disciplinary approach	Heritage Planning should	- To ensure that option
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	involve a multi-disciplinary	are available to users
	approach meaning it should	in terms of solutions t
	use a range of different ideas	different Heritage
	and solutions in its use	based challenges
		posed by Heritage
		assets
Cost	Planning Policy should look to	- To ensure that
-	ensure that cost isn't a major	Heritage
	barrier in carrying out Heritage	Developments aren't
	based Development projects	made into an
	based Development projects	unattractive
		investment for
		developers
		- To ensure Heritage
		Developments can be
		carrier out by a range
		of stakeholders
	,1	or stakeholders