# UNIVERSITY<sup>OF</sup> BIRMINGHAM University of Birmingham Research at Birmingham

# The integration of reactive oxygen species (ROS) and calcium signalling in abiotic stress responses

Ravi, Barkha; Foyer, Christine H.; Pandey, Girdhar K.

DOI: 10.1111/pce.14596

License: Creative Commons: Attribution-NonCommercial (CC BY-NC)

Document Version Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Citation for published version (Harvard):

Ravi, B, Foyer, CH & Pandey, GK 2023, 'The integration of reactive oxygen species (ROS) and calcium signalling in abiotic stress responses', *Plant, Cell and Environment.* https://doi.org/10.1111/pce.14596

Link to publication on Research at Birmingham portal

#### **General rights**

Unless a licence is specified above, all rights (including copyright and moral rights) in this document are retained by the authors and/or the copyright holders. The express permission of the copyright holder must be obtained for any use of this material other than for purposes permitted by law.

•Users may freely distribute the URL that is used to identify this publication.

•Users may download and/or print one copy of the publication from the University of Birmingham research portal for the purpose of private study or non-commercial research.

•User may use extracts from the document in line with the concept of 'fair dealing' under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 (?) •Users may not further distribute the material nor use it for the purposes of commercial gain.

Where a licence is displayed above, please note the terms and conditions of the licence govern your use of this document.

When citing, please reference the published version.

#### Take down policy

While the University of Birmingham exercises care and attention in making items available there are rare occasions when an item has been uploaded in error or has been deemed to be commercially or otherwise sensitive.

If you believe that this is the case for this document, please contact UBIRA@lists.bham.ac.uk providing details and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate.

### REVIEW



# The integration of reactive oxygen species (ROS) and calcium signalling in abiotic stress responses

Barkha Ravi<sup>1</sup> | Christine H. Foyer<sup>1,2</sup> 
| Girdhar K. Pandey<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Plant Molecular Biology, University of Delhi South Campus, Dhaula Kuan, New Delhi, India

<sup>2</sup>School of Biosciences, College of Life and Environmental Sciences, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, United Kingdom

#### Correspondence

Christine H. Foyer and Girdhar K. Pandey, Department of Plant Molecular Biology, University of Delhi South Campus, Benito Juarez Rd, Dhaula Kuan, New Delhi 110021, India. Email: C.H.Foyer@bham.ac.uk and

gkpandey@south.du.ac.in

#### **Funding information**

VAJRA; Department of Biotechnology, Government of India; Science and Engineering Research Board (SERB),

### Abstract

Reactive oxygen species (ROS) and calcium ( $Ca^{2+}$ ) signalling are interconnected in the perception and transmission of environmental signals that control plant growth, development and defence. The concept that systemically propagating  $Ca^{2+}$  and ROS waves function together with electric signals in directional cell-to-cell systemic signalling and even plant-to-plant communication, is now firmly imbedded in the literature. However, relatively few mechanistic details are available regarding the management of ROS and  $Ca^{2+}$  signals at the molecular level, or how synchronous and independent signalling might be achieved in different cellular compartments. This review discusses the proteins that may serve as nodes or connecting bridges between the different pathways during abiotic stress responses, highlighting the crosstalk between ROS and  $Ca^{2+}$  pathways in cell signalling. We consider putative molecular switches that connect these signalling pathways and the molecular machinery that achieves the synergistic operation of ROS and  $Ca^{2+}$  signals.

#### KEYWORDS

calcium sensor proteins, crosstalk, signal transduction

#### 1 | INTRODUCTION

The sessile nature of plants requires that they perceive environmental challenges that may pose threats to their viability. Rapid signalling and communication from individual cells that perceive potential threats to neighbouring cells is a prerequisite for survival, driven by evolutionary necessity. Sensitive detection of physical and chemical changes in the environment occurs at level of the plasma membrane (PM) and also in the systems that produce and use energy. These detection systems incorporate fluctuations in reactive oxygen species (ROS) and cytoplasmic calcium (Ca<sup>2+</sup>) that are interlinked to a raft of pre-emptive adaptation mechanisms that respond to external threats. ROS are oxidative signals that arise from primary and secondary metabolism and provide essential information on metabolism and the energy state of the different cell compartments. They are thus considered to be major "pro-life" survival signals. The different ROS forms [singlet oxygen ( ${}^{1}O_{2}$ ), superoxide ( $\bullet O_{2}^{-}$ ), hydrogen peroxide ( $H_{2}O_{2}$ ), hydroxyl radicals ( $\bullet OH$ )] trigger different signalling pathways (Foyer and Hanke, 2022). The oxidation of protein cysteinyl (Cys) thiols that reversibly changing in protein characteristics and functions, is a major route of  $H_{2}O_{2}^{-}$ mediated signal transduction that regulates plant growth and defence (Considine & Foyer, 2021). Recent studies have identified a number of redox-sensors in plants, including HPCA1 ( $H_{2}O_{2}^{-}$ induced Ca<sup>2+</sup>increases 1) and QSOX1 (quiescin sulfhydryl oxidase homolog; Chae et al., 2021; Wu et al., 2020). QSOX1 contains a protein disulphide isomerase-like oxidoreductase with an active CxxC motif within a thioredoxin (TRX)-like fold as well as a sulfhydryl oxidase

This is an open access article under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited and is not used for commercial purposes. © 2023 The Authors. *Plant, Cell & Environment* published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd.

-WILEY-PC Plant, Cell 8

mitochondrial ERV (Essential for Respiration and Vegetative growth)/ ALR (Augmenter of Liver Regeneration)-related domain with two CxxC motifs and a flavin adenine dinucleotide-binding motif (Chae et al., 2021). These receptor proteins perceive extracellular  $H_2O_2$  and transmit information to regulate downstream redox responses through different signalling pathways.

The spatiotemporal increase in rapidly diffusing extracellular and intracellular signalling molecules and ions is often called 'wave generation' (Choi et al., 2014; Mittler et al., 2011; Trewavas, 1999). This process allows rapid signalling in a stimulus-dependent manner to bring about appropriate responses in gene expression (Assmann and Romano, 1999; Newton et al., 2016). It is easy to imagine how the apoplastic ROS burst (hypersensitive response) became the basis of cell-to-cell communication and formed the foundation for a robust type of systemic response that we now call systemic acquired acclimation (SAA; to abiotic stress) and systemic acquired resistance (SAR; to biotic threats). This response is characterized by a rapid, directional spread of signal(s), which can reach systemic tissues that have not experienced the threat within minutes of the first stress perception. The ROS wave model of cell-to-cell signalling incorporates intracellular Ca<sup>2+</sup> waves via the influx of Ca<sup>2+</sup> ions, as well as electric signals. Furthermore, it has been shown that the Ca<sup>2+</sup> channels called glutamate receptor-like (GLR)3.3 and GLR3.6 play an important role in regulating systemic electric and Ca<sup>2+</sup> signals after wounding (Mousavi et al., 2013; Nguyen et al., 2018; Shao et al., 2020; Toyota et al., 2018). Wound signalling molecules that are released by damaged cells bind to corresponding receptors that trigger the propagation of slow wave potentials (SWPs). The SWPs initiate the transmission of cytoplasmic calcium Ca<sup>2+</sup> signals and so activate iasmonate synthesis and expression of defence-responsive genes. The wounding response includes mechanisms for the integration and propagation of rapid systemic signals, leading to SAA and SAR. Moreover, the electric signal induced in response to wounding or high light stress in dandelion leaves was recently shown to be transmitted from plant to plant by direct contact, in a manner that involved changes in the ion channel activity and ROS waves (Szechyńska-Hebda et al., 2022).

Exposure to environmental stress induces rapid local increases in cytosolic Ca<sup>2+</sup> levels that are sensed and relayed inside the cell, as well as activating the respiratory burst oxidase homolog D, (RBOHD) proteins and generate an apoplastic ROS burst. In the case of high light stress this activation also involves phytochrome (phyB; Devireddy et al., 2020). The ROS and Ca<sup>2+</sup> waves depend on a continuous chain of cell-to-cell signalling events that extends from the initial tissue that senses the stress (the local tissue) to the entire plant (systemic tissues) through a positive feedback loop mechanism. A crucial feature of the signalling process is that it involves the coordination and integration of apoplastic and symplastic signalling pathways so that they function synchronously to drive directional signalling.

All ROS molecules potentially have signalling functions. Periods of high ROS accumulation in specific cellular compartments are required to effectively transmit signals, often related to energy

metabolism. Each cellular compartment contains low molecular weight antioxidants such as ascorbate and glutathione, antioxidant enzymes and ROS processing enzymes that limit ROS accumulation and signalling (Foyer and Noctor, 2009; Noctor and Foyer, 2016). It is likely that the concentrations of ascorbate and glutathione, the activities of antioxidant enzymes and abundance of ROS processing enzymes are regulated in the different intracellular compartments to allow appropriate regulation of the cell-to-cell ROS signalling wave. Many developmental, biotic, and abiotic signals are primarily perceived at the PM by receptor proteins. However, crosstalk between the signalling pathways is triggered by extracellular and intracellular receptors. This occurs, for example, in the co-activation of plant immune responses involving a branched innate immune response system. Plant PM-localized pattern-recognizing receptors (PRRs) detect conserved pathogen molecular patterns, activating pattern-triggered immunity (PTI). Some microbes are able to bypass PTI by transferring effector protein and molecules that trigger susceptibility in plant cells. In response to these effectors, a second branch of immune responses called effector triggered immunity (ETI) is activated (Jones & Dangl, 2006). Both PTI and ETI cause significant transcriptional reprogramming in plants. PTI and ETI are likely to result in stronger signalling than either system alone (Ngou et al., 2021). The crosstalk between Ca<sup>2+</sup> and ROS signalling pathways in response to biotic stresses and plant immune responses has been reviewed recently (Marcec and Tanaka, 2021; Marcec et al., 2019). Hence, the following discussion will focus largely on Ca<sup>2+</sup>-ROS interactions during abiotic stress responses.

In the following discussion, we summarize recent findings concerning the regulatory proteins involved in  $Ca^{2+}$  and ROS interactions and we consider the fine-tuning of ROS and  $Ca^{2+}$  waves in the establishment of SAA and SAR. The organellar signalling events that mediate this integration are discussed with particular reference to stress responses. Much of the information presented here and used to illustrate current concepts is shown in Figure 1 (Dell'Aglio et al., 2019; Godbole et al., 2003; Israelson et al., 2007; Kanwar et al., 2021; Li et al., 2016). While much of the information shown in Figure 1 has been derived from studies in Arabidopsis, similar findings are now being reported in other species, as outlined below. Our aim is to provide a current perspective of the intracellular regulators and  $Ca^{2+}$  sensor proteins that are involved in  $Ca^{2+}$  and ROS interactions during stress signalling.

### 2 | APOPLASTIC SIGNALLING

Stress-induced cell signalling requires the perception of stimuli, often by membrane-bound receptors, that trigger Ca<sup>2+</sup> fluxes and lead to the activation of RBOHs resulting in ROS accumulation in the apoplast that in turn triggers MITOGEN-ACTIVATED PROTEIN KINASE (MAPK) signalling cascades and other similar pathways that regulate nuclear gene expression. These pathways are also triggered in response to biotic stress, for example in the sensing of pathogen-, microbe-, or damage-associated molecular patterns by PM-localized

-WILEY Plant. Cell 8



FIGURE 1 A hypothetical model for the regulation of cytosol-mitochondria communication via Ca<sup>2+</sup>-ROS cross-talk. The VDACs and the MCU complex are gatekeepers that mediate cytosol-mitochondrial communication. In animals, VDACs such as VDAC1 function in Ca<sup>2+</sup> transport (Israelson et al., 2007). Similarities in VDACs between plant and animal systems (Godbole et al., 2003) suggest that plant VDACs may also be involved in  $Ca^{2+}$  signalling. We propose that plant VDACs might regulate  $Ca^{2+}$  passage in mitochondria and thus influence mitochondrial  $Ca^{2+}$ levels and ROS homoeostasis. However, excessive Ca<sup>2+</sup> accumulation can trigger ROS accumulation in mitochondria and affect respiration. The Ca<sup>2+</sup>-signalling kinase CIPK9 phosphorylates VDAC3. We suggest that this process allows transport of ROS from the mitochondria to the cytosol through a mechanism yet to be defined. In this way,  $Ca^{2+}$  signalling may modulate oxidative stress responses, as depicted by the dashed line. Mitochondrial ROS homoeostasis is also controlled by the Ca<sup>2+</sup>-mediated CaM-Hsc70-BAG5 complex and NADKc, which interacts with Ca<sup>2+</sup> activated CaM to increase NADP(H) synthesis to drive ROS production by RBOH proteins (Dell'Aglio et al., 2019; Li et al., 2016). This diagram illustrates possible interactions between Ca<sup>2+</sup> and ROS that may occur either directly (solid lines) or indirectly (dashed lines). BAG5, BCL-2associated athanogene; Ca<sup>2+</sup>, Calcium; CaM, calmodulin; CBL, calcineurin B-like proteins; CIPK9, CBL-interacting protein kinase 9; Hsc70, heat shock cognate protein 70; MCU, mitochondrial calcium uniporter; NADKc, NAD<sup>+</sup> kinase; NADP(H), nicotinamide adenine dinucleotide phosphate; ROS, reactive oxygen species; VDAC, voltage dependent anion channel. [Color figure can be viewed at wileyonlinelibrary.com]

receptors leading to the regulation of genes involved in pathogen defence (Nguyen et al., 2021). The apoplastic ROS burst is a fundamental response of plant cells to the perception of physical and chemical signals. The ROS burst involves the generation of

superoxide by the RBOHs, which are the plant equivalent of the mammalian NADPH (nicotinamide adenine dinucleotide phosphate) oxidases (NOX). H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> is then generated from superoxide by the action of superoxide dismutases (SODs). A paradigm-shift in current

-WILEY-PC Plant, Cell &

understanding occurred when it became clear that this response is intrinsic to the cell-to-cell transmission of long-distance cell-to-cell signals in plants, as well as plant to plant and microorganism to plant communication (Fichman et al., 2019, 2021; Mittler et al., 2011., 2022; Zandalinas, Fichman, Devireddy, et al., 2020; Zandalinas, Fichman, & Mitler, 2020; Zhu, 2016). Several RBOH forms, particularly RBOHD and RBOHF, were identified as essential sources of the apoplastic ROS generation that is essential for this process (Fichman and Mittler, 2020; Fichman et al., 2019, 2021; Mittler et al., 2022; Zandalinas, Fichman, Devireddy, et al., 2020; Zandalinas, Fichman, & Mitler, 2020; Miller et al., 2009). Similarly, the PM-associated leucine-rich-repeat receptor-like kinase (LRR-RLK) called HPCA1 (Wu et al., 2020 {also called CANNOT RESPOND TO DMBQ 1; CARD1}), which is an important receptor for extracellular H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> (Fichman et al., 2022) and guinones (Laohavisit et al., 2020) was shown to be required for the propagation of cell-to-cell ROS signals (Fichman et al., 2022).

HPCA1 mediates the H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>-induced activation of Ca<sup>2+</sup> channels in guard cells leading to stomatal closure (Wu et al., 2020). According to the model of Wu et al. (2020) the kinase activity of HPCA1 is low in the absence of  $H_2O_2$  so the Ca<sup>2+</sup> influx channel is closed. HPCA1 has two additional pairs of cysteine residues in the extracellular domain that are subject to covalent modification in the presence of H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>, leading to autophosphorylation of the HPCA1 protein. The autophosphorylation of amino acid residues in the cytosolic domain facilitates gating of Ca<sup>2+</sup> channels, leading to an increase in cytosolic Ca<sup>2+</sup> levels. HPCA1 is required for systemic transmission of ROS and  $Ca^{2+}$  signals (also termed the ' $Ca^{2+}$  wave') in all cell types but not for electric signals and related systemic membrane depolarization responses (Fichman et al., 2022). Moreover, the systemic Ca<sup>2+</sup> signals mediated by HPCA1 recruit the Ca<sup>2+</sup>-permeable channel called Mechanosensitive ion channel like 3 (MSL3). Some downstream components of the Ca<sup>2+</sup>-dependent signalling cascade are identified including components such as the calcineurin B-like Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensor (CBL4), the CBL-interacting protein kinase 26 (CIPK26), and the sucrose-non-fermenting-1-related protein kinase 2.6 (SnRK2.6, also termed 'open stomata 1', OST1; Fichman et al., 2022). The serine residues S343 and S347 on RBOHD are putative phosphorylation targets of OST1. In this way, HPCA1 links the accumulation of apoplastic  $H_2O_2$  to  $Ca^{2+}$  signalling and the further activation of superoxide production by RBOHs in a positive feedback loop (Wu et al., 2020). HPCA1 is therefore a key component in coordinating the systemic cell-to-cell ROS and Ca<sup>2+</sup> signals that are required for plant resilience to stress.

While much of the above information has been derived from studies in Arabidopsis, RBOH-mediated apoplastic ROS generation has been shown to be important in systemic signalling leading to stress tolerance in crop species such as tomato. For example, the expression of SIRBOH1 is induced under elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> (eCO<sub>2</sub>) levels leading to increased H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> accumulation in the vascular tissues of roots, stems and leaf petioles. eCO<sub>2</sub>.induced increases in salt tolerance were abolished in SIRBOH1-silenced plants, suggesting that salt tolerance was increased under eCO<sub>2</sub> in an apoplastic

ROS-dependent manner (Yi et al., 2015). Further work revealed that eCO<sub>2</sub> triggers apoplastic H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>-dependent auxin production in tomato shoots, a process that facilitates systemic signalling that results in strigolactone biosynthesis in the roots and improved associations with arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi (AMF). This was accompanied by enhanced nutrient acquisition and carbon, nitrogen and phosphate cycling (Zhou et al., 2019). Thus, a RBOH-dependentauxin-strigolactone systemic signalling cascade was involved in the regulation of eCO2-induced AMF symbiosis and phosphate uptake (Zhou et al., 2019). Moreover, systemic signalling via RBOH-mediated apoplastic ROS generation was shown to be important in the light signalling-dependent regulation of photosynthesis by the tomato shoot apex. A series of grafting experiments was used to demonstrate that information regarding red light perception at the shoot apex triggers phytochrome B-mediated auxin production leading to RBOH-mediated apoplastic ROS generation in systemic leaves to allow adaptation to the light environment (Guo, Wang, et al., 2016). Reciprocal grafting experiments were also used to investigate the role of apoplastic ROS signalling in the shoot/root crosstalk that controls the synthesis of jasmonates (JAs) in the defence responses of tomato plants to root knot nematodes (RKN; Wang, Zhang, et al., 2019). Grafting stem sections from mutants lacking GLR3.5 or the mutants deficient in RBOH1 attenuated resistance to RKN and abolished RKN-induced electrical signals, as well as associated ROS and JA accumulation in the upper stems and leave. Similarly, silencing the tomato MPK1 or MPK2 abolished RKN-induced accumulation of JAs and associated resistance (Wang, Hu, et al., 2019). Such studies demonstrate the presence of systemic signalling systems in crop plants that integrate electrical, ROS and phytohormone signals to modulate plant defences in distal organs via cell-to-cell and rootshoot-root communication.

### 3 | SYMPLASTIC SIGNALLING

Plasmodesmata (PD) are required for the rapid transmission of RBOHD-generated ROS signals and the orchestration of cell-to-cell systemic communication that leads to SAA in response to high light stress (Fichman et al., 2021). PD are intercellular concentric pores that cross cell walls and mediate the local and systemic transport of signalling molecules to coordinate developmental and environmental responses. These pores have an outer specialized membranous domain that is a continuation of the PM and an inner desmotubule, which connects the endoplasmic reticulum (ER) of neighbouring cells. Symplasmic transport occurs through the cytoplasmic sleeve, which is the space between the PM and the desmotubule (Paniagua et al., 2021). The size of the PD pore is increased in response to RBOHD-generated apoplastic ROS accumulation in a manner that is dependent on PD-localized protein 1 (PDLP1) and PDLP5. In addition, PD amplify the systemic signal in each cell along the path of the systemic ROS wave, as well as participating in the establishment of local and systemic acclimation (Fichman et al., 2021). The regulation of PD is targeted by pathogenic effectors to facilitate

cell-to-cell movement (Li et al., 2021). Plant cells respond to the perception of pathogens by depositing callose in the paramural space around the PD to constrict the space available for transport (Wu et al., 2018).  $Ca^{2+}$ -dependent and  $Ca^{2+}$ -independent activities, phytohormones and receptor-like kinases participate in the control of callose synthase activity, callose deposition and PD closure (Leijon et al., 2018). For example, the regulation of PD closure via flagellin 22 (flg22)-induced callose deposition involves the  $Ca^{2+}$  signalling component called CML41 (Calmodulin-like proteins). Cytosolic  $Ca^{2+}$ -dependent control of PD pores has been reported in response to pathogens (Tilsner et al., 2016; Xu et al., 2017).

The mechanisms by which RBOHD-generated ROS counteract such stress responses and so allow systemic signalling to occur are unknown. However, this regulation may involve substantial cellular reprogramming and protein re-localisation. PD also house clusters of receptor-like activities that may function together with PM receptor proteins to orchestrate developmental and stress signals. For example, the PM-localized Leucine Rich Repeat Receptor Like Kinases (LRR-RLKs) QSK1 (Qiān Shǒu kinase) and IMK2 (Inflorescence Meristem Kinase2) are relocated to PD intercellular pores in response to osmotic stress (Grison et al., 2019). Such findings indicate that the reorganization of RLKs to PD and other intracellular sites is an important feature of plant stress responses.

#### 4 | ORGANELLAR SIGNALLING SYSTEMS

Different types of second messengers are involved in the relay of stress signals in the cytosol (e.g., cyclic nucleotides and other metabolites), cell membranes (e.g., lipid-based second messengers), as well as within or between cellular compartments (metabolites) and between cells {ROS ( $\bullet O_2^-$  and  $H_2O_2$ ) and volatile compounds}. Several signalling components and pathways have been identified but the mechanisms that integrate different signalling pathways to elicit appropriate responses to the various signals that occur simultaneously in distinct cellular compartments remain poorly understood (Jeandroz et al., 2013; Mazars et al., 2010; Smékalová et al., 2014; Xia et al., 2015; Xuan et al., 2020).

Signals arising from central energy metabolism (photosynthesis and respiration) are crucial for cell survival in changing environmental conditions. Superoxide and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> are produced by the photosynthetic and respiratory electron transport chains in a semiregulated manner (Foyer and Hanke, 2022). ROS, metabolite and associated signals operate in multiple overlapping retrograde pathways that are collectively often called 'organelle-to-nucleus', 'chloroplast-to-nucleus', or 'mitochondria-to-nucleus retrograde' signalling, act in a co-ordinated manner. For example, mitochondria-to-nucleus signalling, which involves two key transcription factors belonging to Arabidopsis NAC (NAM, ATAF and CUC) domain containing family: *ANAC013* and *ANAC017*, is linked to chloroplast-to-nucleus signalling (Shapiguzov et al., 2019). The *ANAC013* and *ANAC017* transcription factors are released from the ER upon perception of appropriate signals and translocated to the nucleus, where they activate the

expression of a specific set of genes called mitochondrial dysfunction

Plant, Cell &

**R**-WILEY-

stimulon (MDS) genes that include the alternative oxidases, *SOT12* (*sulphotransferase12*) and ANAC013 (De Clercq et al., 2013). The enhanced expression of ANAC013 provides positive feedback regulation of the signalling pathway. In addition, SOT12 belongs to the group of MDS genes that overlap with the genes induced by the SAL1, 3'-phosphoadenosine 5'-phosphate (PAP) chloroplast retrograde signalling pathway (Van Aken, & Pogson, 2017).

Retrograde signalling networks are vital for organelle biogenesis and functions. They are particularly important in the adaptation to changing environmental cues such as light. Interestingly, the organelle to nucleus signalling pathways also incorporate the regulation of PD in 'organelle-nucleus-PD signalling (ONPS)'. Redox signals from chloroplasts can modify PD-mediated intercellular trafficking (Ganusova et al., 2020).

Perturbations in the energy-generating systems of the chloroplast serve as a marker by which the nucleus perceives environmental stress (Foyer and Hanke, 2022). Nuclear-encoded plastid proteins are differentially expressed in response to changes in photosynthetic energy metabolism. These include the light harvesting chlorophyll a/b binding proteins (LHCB) and the small subunit (SSU) of ribulose-1, 5-bisphate carboxylase/oxygenase (Mayfield & Taylor, 1984; Oelmüller & Mohr, 1986; Pogson et al., 2008). The activation of MAPK signalling pathways in response to abscisic acid (ABA)-induced H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> generation might also involve chloroplast signals (Zhang et al., 2006) through the participation of a chloroplast CAS (Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensor protein; Guo, Feng, et al., 2016). The CAU1 gene, which encodes H4R3sme2 (for histone H4 Arg 3 with symmetric dimethylation)-type histone methylase protein arginine methytransferase5/Shk1 binding protein1, regulates the expression of  $Ca^{2+}$  signalling genes such as CAS. H4R3sme2 binds to the CAS promoter and regulates the CAS chromatin's H4R3sme2-type histone methylation. As cytosolic Ca<sup>2+</sup> levels increase, H4R3sme2 methylation is decreased, alleviating the repression of CAS expression in the control stomatal closure and drought tolerance (Fu et al., 2013, 2018). CAS-mediated cytosolic  $Ca^{2+}$  fluctuations activate MAPK signalling cascades. The 14-3-3 $\omega$ Ca<sup>2+</sup> binding proteins function as protein scaffolds for the MKK4/ MKK5-MPK3/MPK6 complex that participates in retrograde signalling pathways. For example, the ABI4 (ABA-insensitive 4) transcription factor can be phosphorylated by MPK3, MPK4, and MPK6, a posttranslational modification that leads to decreased expression of LHCB (light harvesting chlorophyll a/b binding) genes (Guo, Feng, et al., 2016). Such findings demonstrate that chloroplast-localised processes participate in cellular Ca<sup>2+</sup> signalling events.

While the interplay between Ca<sup>2+</sup> and ROS signals is likely to be conserved in unicellular organisms and multicellular plants, the molecular components involved in these interactions are likely to be different. For example, calredoxin (CRX), which is the only CML identified in *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii*, is a potential site of integration of ROS and Ca<sup>2+</sup> signals. CRX are chloroplast-localised proteins that contain CaM domain, 4 Ca<sup>2+</sup> binding EF- hands and a TRX domain. CRX is involved in both redox and Ca<sup>2+</sup> signalling in the chloroplasts (Hochmal et al., 2016). CRX interacts with chloroplast -WILEY-

E Finite Cell &

2-Cys peroxiredoxin 1 (PRX1). The activity of the TRX domain is influenced by  $Ca^{2+}$  binding, which is crucial for the downstream binding and reduction of PRX1 in oxidative stress responses. ROS and  $Ca^{2+}$  signalling pathways are linked in the regulation of lipid accumulation in response to a combination of nitrogen limitation and oxidative stress in *Chlorella sorokiniana* (Liufu et al., 2023). The two RBOH isoforms in *Marchantia polymorpha* have conserved C-terminal phosphorylation sites, which may serve as sites of  $Ca^{2+}$ dependent regulation (Bánfi et al., 2004; Kimura et al., 2020; Marchetti et al., 2021).

Ca<sup>2+</sup>-ROS crosstalk regulates metabolic and energetic functions in chloroplasts and mitochondria, as well as retrograde signalling. For example, the VDACs (voltage dependent anion channels) located on the outer mitochondrial membrane (OMM) and the MCU (mitochondrial Ca<sup>2+</sup> uniporter) complex located on the inner mitochondrial membrane (IMM) are central gatekeepers in animal systems that may also fulfil similar roles in plants, particularly by enabling cytosol-mitochondrial communication. In Arabidopsis, six putative MCU orthologs have been identified. Of these MCU1, MCU2 and MCU3 are reported to mediate mitochondrial Ca<sup>2+</sup> uptake (Ruberti et al., 2022). The MCU complex in mammalian systems contains the essential MCU regulator (EMRE) and three mitochondrial Ca<sup>2+</sup> uptake (MICU) proteins with EF-hands that serve as regulatory components (Garg et al., 2021; Liu et al., 2020; Xing et al., 2019). While only the MICU1 protein was reported to have a conserved regulatory function in Arabidopsis (Wagner et al., 2015). MCU complex proteins are required for mitochondrial Ca<sup>2+</sup> homoeostasis (Ruberti et al., 2022; Zhang, Ma, Bao, et al., 2022). VDACs are the most abundant proteins present in the outer mitochondrial membranes (OMM) of all eukarvotes. Four VDAC isoforms have been identified in Arabidopsis and it has been suggested that they might regulate the fluxes of ions including Ca<sup>2+</sup> (Ravi et al., 2021; Wagner et al., 2016). Interestingly, the VDAC1 proteins in mammals also reported to contain Ca<sup>2+</sup> binding sites (Israelson et al., 2007).

The MCU complex and VDACs are considered to participate in two-way communication across the mitochondrial membrane via Ca<sup>2+</sup> and ROS signals. The MCU complex and VDACs influence Ca<sup>2+</sup> uptake and hence mitochondrial Ca<sup>2+</sup> levels (Wagner et al., 2016). They also influence ROS homoeostasis (Sanyal et al., 2020; Zhang et al., 2019) and contribute to Ca<sup>2+</sup>-ROS crosstalk by interacting with either Ca<sup>2+</sup> or ROS signalling components (Kanwar et al., 2021; Li et al., 2013; Wen et al., 2013). Mitochondrial Ca<sup>2+</sup>-ROS crosstalk might be facilitated by the Ca<sup>2+</sup> signalling kinase CIPK9 and VDAC3 in a phosphorylation-dependent manner. The MCU complex also participates in Ca<sup>2+</sup> uptake at the inner mitochondrial membrane (Ruberti et al., 2022; Wagner et al., 2015; Wang and Teng, 2018). The MCU complex and VDACs act as ROS sensors during hypoxia and inflammation-mediated oxidative stress in animals (Dong et al., 2017). However, the precise functions of these systems in regulating ROS in plant mitochondria remains to be demonstrated.

The Arabidopsis CaM-dependent NAD<sup>+</sup> kinase (NADKc) that is localised on the mitochondrial periphery participates in the

elicitor-induced oxidative burst, suggesting NADKc serves to link Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensing through CaM and ROS generation by the RBOH proteins. The cytosolic NADP(H) pool drives RBOH activity to produce the ROS burst (Pugin et al., 1997). CaM recruitment to NADKc and the formation of the NADKc-CaM complex occurs as a result of a cytosolic Ca<sup>2+</sup> influx, for example in response to flg22, which is a potent elicitor of plant immune responses that is recognised by the membrane bound leucine-rich repeat-receptor kinase called flg-Sensitive 2. The influx of cytosolic Ca2+ results in NADKc activation and NADPH production, as system that may serve to amplify the ROS burst in response to the elicitor (Dell'Aglio et al., 2019). While the role of mitochondria in these pathways is unknown, we may speculate that NADKc-CaM interactions may activate additional mitochondrial targets or signalling processes that perturb mitochondrial homoeostasis enhancing ROS production by the respiratory electron transport chain. These signals may eventually lead to programmed cell death (PCD) or fine-tuning of other redox signalling pathways (Sies et al., 2017) as illustrated in Figure 1, which incorporates current concepts regarding ROS- Ca<sup>2+</sup> crosstalk. However, many components of this system remain to be identified and the processes must be defined more clearly in order for the mechanistic elements of the crosstalk to be fully understood.

Although the nucleus has never been considered to be a source of ROS signals, it is clear that oxidation of the nucleus is an early response to environmental stresses such as heat (Babbar et al., 2021) and inhibitors of chloroplast and mitochondrial functions (Karpinska et al., 2017). The nucleus serves as a source of Ca<sup>2+</sup> signals in plant-microbe interactions. For example, the nuclear-membrane localised potassium-permeable channel called DMI1 (does not make infections1) and the type IIA Ca<sup>2+-</sup>-ATPase isoforms (SERCA-type Ca2+ ATPase, ECA) called MCA8 (mid1complementing activity 8) are required for the Ca<sup>2+</sup> oscillations underpinning symbiosis in Medicago truncatula (Charpentier et al., 2016). Nuclear and perinuclear Ca<sup>2+</sup> oscillations were induced by Nod (nodulation) factors and Myc (mycorrhizal signalling) factors that are released by rhizobia bacteria and arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi, respectively. The interface between the DMI1 and RCK (regulator of conductance of K<sup>+</sup>) domains forms a locked channel (Liu et al., 2022).

# 5 | ROLE OF $Ca^{2+}$ SENSOR PROTEINS IN CROSSTALK WITH $Ca^{2+}$ AND ROS DURING ABIOTIC STRESS

An increase in intracellular  $Ca^{2+}$  is one of the earliest signalling events that occurs in response to a wide range of abiotic stresses (Xu et al., 2022). The above discussion has highlighted the integration and close co-operation  $Ca^{2+}$  and ROS signalling that is mediated by components such as  $Ca^{2+}$ -induced ROS production (CIRP) and ROSinduced  $Ca^{2+}$ -release (RICR) (Gilroy et al., 2014). Crucially, the RBOH proteins are synergistically activated by the binding of  $Ca^{2+}$  to EFhand motifs as well as  $Ca^{2+}$ -dependent phosphorylation (Gilroy



**FIGURE 2** A hypothetical model of calcium-sensing proteins involved in  $Ca^{2+}$ -ROS crosstalk. Abiotic stresses such as heat, salinity, drought, and cold stress induce increases in cytosolic  $Ca^{2+}$  levels, each generating a  $Ca^{2+}$  signature that is decoded and translated into a biological signal by  $Ca^{2+}$  sensor proteins (CaMs, CMLs, CDPKs and CBLs) that interact with different target proteins to elicit an appropriate response. These  $Ca^{2+}$  signalling pathways are coordinated with different signalling pathways, including ROS signalling. Abiotic stresses induce oxidative signalling through increased ROS production, which in turn might activate  $Ca^{2+}$  signalling pathways in plants.  $Ca^{2+}$  signalling can activate apoplastic ROS production leading to systemic signalling as illustrated in Figure 3. Apoplastic ROS production can further increase cellular  $Ca^{2+}$  levels that activates the antioxidant and ROS-processing systems to decrease ROS within the cytoplasm. In this way, ROS and  $Ca^{2+}$  idependent protein kinase; CIPK, CBL-interacting protein kinase; CML, Calmodulin-like proteins; CNGCs, cyclic nucleotide gated channels; GLR, glutamate receptor-like;  $H_2O_2$ , hydrogen peroxide; MCA, mid1-complementing activity; MSL, mechanosensitive ion channel like; OSCA, hyperosmolality-gated calcium permeable channel; Rboh, respiratory burst oxidase homolog; ROS, reactive oxygen species;  $\bullet O_2^{-}$ , superoxide anion;  $\bullet OH$ , hydroxyl radical. [Color figure can be viewed at wileyonlinelibrary.com]

et al., 2014; Kimura et al., 2012). Similarly, the expression of antioxidant and redox proteins is regulated through Ca<sup>2+</sup>-dependent pathways (Siddiqui et al., 2020; Xue et al., 2018; Yang, Gao, et al., 2022) under stress conditions. The ROS-dependent activation of a wide variety of inwardly-, outwardly-rectifying, and voltage-independent groups of ion channels is crucial to cell signalling that underpins growth as well as defence processes (Demidchik, 2018). The CNGCs (cyclic nucleotide gated channels) and mechanosensitive ion channels may function as ROS (H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>)- activated Ca<sup>2+</sup> channels that mediate Ca<sup>2+</sup>-influxes in such responses (Fichman et al., 2022; Wang et al., 2013). Some components of the Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensing machinery may therefore function in Ca<sup>2+</sup>-ROS crosstalk.

The Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensors and responders such as Calmodulin (CaM), CMLs, calcineurin B-like proteins (CBLs), Ca<sup>2+</sup>-dependent protein kinases (CPKs/CDPKs) and Ca<sup>2+</sup> relay/responders are central to the regulation of ROS production in response to stress, as illustrated in Figure 2 (Li et al., 2008). They contain a common structural motif with conserved helix-loop-helix structure (EF-hand) that binds to Ca<sup>2+</sup> (DeFalco et al., 2010). These proteins are grouped into sensor-relays (CaMs, CMLs, CBLs) and sensor-responder (CDPKs) systems because of their catalytic activity. There are 34 CDPKs, 7 CaM, 50 CMLs and 10 CBLs in Arabidopsis (Kolukisaoglu et al., 2004; McCormack & Braam, 2003; McCormack et al., 2005; Shi et al., 2018). Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensor proteins are crucial components of stress signalling pathways

-WILEY

(Ma et al., 2020; McCormack et al., 2005; Reddy et al., 2011; Singh et al., 2018).

# 6 | CDPKS: A SENSOR-RESPONDER SYSTEM FOR Ca<sup>2+</sup> AND ROS CROSSTALK DURING ABIOTIC STRESS

A raft of  $Ca^{2+}$  sensors including the CDPK family of  $Ca^{2+}$  binding regulatory protein kinases decode Ca<sup>2+</sup> signals in each cellular compartment. The CDPKs fulfil a diverse range of essential regulatory functions, including the differential expression of antioxidant enzymes in response to a range of abiotic stresses. For example, LeCDPK1 (tomato), 12 CDPKs (wheat), BnaCDPK6 and BnaCDPK14 (rapeseed) are required for activation of antioxidant defences in response to wounding, oxidative stress and drought (Ahmadi et al., 2022; Chico et al., 2002; Li et al., 2008). Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensing proteins and antioxidant enzymes were also prominent in the transcript signature of peanut plants subjected to drought stress (Thoppurathu et al., 2022), winter rapeseed subjected to cold stress (Wei et al., 2022) and rice in response to salinity (Arefian et al., 2022). The CDPK/CPK network functions together with the RBOH proteins to regulate ROS homoeostasis and drive stress signalling (Suzuki et al., 2011). Some examples of this type of regulation include the CPK5-dependent phosphorylation of RBOHD that activates ROS production (Dubiella et al., 2013), the CPK8-dependent phosphorylation of CAT3 (catalase) at S261 that regulates ABA signalling in stomatal guard cells (Zou et al., 2015) and the CDPK10-dependent phosphorylation of the Poncirus trifoliata PtrAPX (ascorbate peroxidase) that regulates drought stress responses (Meng et al., 2020). Additionally, the Brassica napus CPK2 interacts with RBOHD to regulate ROS production and PCD (Wang et al., 2018). Moreover, phosphorylation of the tomato APX2 protein by CPK28 at threonine residues T59 and T164 enhances the activity of the enzyme in response to heat stress (Hu et al., 2021). The intensity and systemic spread of the ROS wave is influenced by the levels of antioxidants such as APX (Fichman et al., 2019). This involves a  $Ca^{2+}$  signalling component that regulates RBOH phosphorylation in most reports. Moreover, redox modifications of Cystiene32 in the APX protein leading to S-nitrosylation and S-sulfhydration also increases the catalytic activity of the enzyme (Aroca et al., 2015; Yang et al., 2015). Therefore, the posttranslational modification of enzymes such as APX plays an important role in ROS-Ca<sup>2+</sup> interactions.

The Ca<sup>2+</sup>-dependent phosphorylation of the potato RBOH enzymes occurs at the S82 and S97 residues at the N-terminus of the protein. These sites are phosphorylated by CDPK4 and CDPK5 in a Ca<sup>2+</sup>-dependent manner (Kobayashi et al., 2007). StCDPK5-mediated ROS generation is important in plant defence against potato blight pathogens (Kobayashi et al., 2012). The wheat RBOH called TaNOX7 was shown to interact with CDPK13 in luciferase complementation, *BiFC* (Bimolecular fluorescence complementation), and co-immunoprecipitation assays (Hu et al., 2020). This interaction regulated ROS production, drought tolerance and fertility in wheat

(Hu et al., 2020). A genome-wide characterization of Dendrobium officinale revealed 24 genes encoding CDPKs. Of these, CDPK9 and CDPK20 were shown to interact with RBOHD and RBOHH in a yeast two-hybrid assay system (Yang, Chen, et al., 2022). Further studies have revealed information on other components involved in the ROS or Ca<sup>2+</sup> signalling systems but not ROS-Ca<sup>2+</sup> interactions. For example, the overexpression of CPK4 in rice conferred salt and drought tolerance (Campo et al., 2014). Similarly, a drought tolerant canola (Brassica napus) cultivar had higher levels of BnaCDPK6 and BnaCDPK14 transcripts than a drought sensitive variety. Antioxidant enzymes such as catalase (CAT) and SOD were highly expressed in the drought tolerant variety, suggesting that CDPK activates antioxidant defences in response to drought in Brassica napus (Ahmadi et al., 2022). The apple CPK1 was shown to regulate  $H_2O_2$ and O<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> accumulation through the modulation of antioxidant enzyme activities in relation to cold tolerance in Nicotiana benthamiana (Dong et al., 2020). Hence, CDPKs can regulate both ROS production by RBOH enzymes and the extent of ROS accumulation through the control of antioxidant enzymes.

# 7 | CAM AND CML CONNECT Ca<sup>2+</sup> AND ROS SIGNALLING IN RESPONSE TO ABIOTIC STRESS

CaM and CMLs are Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensors that ensure tight coupling of Ca<sup>2+</sup> and ROS signalling pathways in response to abiotic stress through the mediation of protein kinase and phosphatase activities (Zeng et al., 2015). For example, CaMK [(CaM-dependent protein kinase); also known in CCaMK (Ca<sup>2+</sup>/CaM-dependent protein kinase) in maize] regulates brassinosteroids (BR)-induced antioxidant defence mechanisms. BR activates two positive feedback loop mechanisms involving  $[Ca^{2+}]_{cvt}$  that regulate cellular H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> levels in maize leaves. In this system, ZmCCaMK is activated by BR to increase intracellular  $Ca^{2+}$  accumulation, which in turn regulates  $H_2O_2$  production in the apoplast by the RBOH enzymes. The activation of antioxidant enzymes such as APX and SOD thereafter limits intracellular ROS accumulation (Yan et al., 2015). Similarly, the rice OsCam1-1 protein is important in the regulation of salt tolerance by the modulation of antioxidant enzymes (Chaicherdsakul et al., 2017). The heterologous expression of the cyclophilin OsCYP2 was found to enhance tolerance to several abiotic stresses in a similar manner (Kumari et al., 2009). Exposure to abiotic stress and auxin signalling trigger OsCYP2 interactions with CaM to initiate defence responses (Roy et al., 2022). Peroxidases (POD) may serve as a node for CaMmediated Ca<sup>2+</sup>-ROS crosstalk. For example, a Ca<sup>2+</sup>-dependent POD called Euphorbia characias peroxidase (ELP) is activated by CaM (Mura et al., 2005). CaM was linked to H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> signalling in Panax ginseng in a pathway that involved ABA-induced increases in antioxidant defence. Blocking CaM functions by the application of antagonists or the addition of ROS scavengers prevented the expression of PgCaM and abolished the increased expression of antioxidants. The expression of potato CaM2 in tobacco (Raina et al., 2021) and the Eleusine coracana

Plant, Cell & PC

CaM in Arabidopsis (Jamra et al., 2021) decreased intracellular ROS accumulation and enhanced drought tolerance. Such CaM-mediated regulation may operate in the control of plant development as well as plant responses to a wide range of abiotic and biotic stresses (Parvin et al., 2012). For example,  $Ca^{2+}$  and CaM synchronise ROS production in the formation of adventitious roots (Niu et al., 2017).  $Ca^{2+}$  acts together with nitric oxide (NO) to promote adventitious root formation and regulate antioxidant functions in response to osmotic stress (Niu et al., 2017).

ABA-induced ROS production is fine-tuned by the Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensor CML20 in the regulation of stomatal closure in response to water stress. APX2 expression and intracellular ROS accumulation are decreased in an ABA-independent manner, suggesting that CML20 serves as a negative regulator of ABA-induced ROS production in guard cells (Wu et al., 2017). This system has been analysed using either 'gain-of-function' approaches (OsCML4, OsDSR1 (Drought stress response-1), Solanum habrochaites CML44) or the ectopic expression of CMLs (Millettia pinnata CML40 in Arabidopsis. Medicago sativa CML46 in tobacco) (Du et al., 2021; Munir et al., 2016; Yin et al., 2015, 2017; Zhang et al., 2021). Together, the data obtained from these studies demonstrates that CML homologs are also positive regulators of stress tolerance via regulation of antioxidant systems. Similarly, the overexpression of the CaM binding transcription activator (CAMTA) in chickpea resulted in the enhanced expression of antioxidant enzymes such as APX, CAT, GST and so forth. and decreased intracellular H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> accumulation in response to drought and salt stress (Meenakshi et al., 2022). The expression of GmCAMTA genes was found to be decreased by H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> treatment in Glycine max (Wang et al., 2014).

Crosstalk between ROS and MAPK signalling pathways is central to plant stress responses (Jalmi and Sinha, 2015; Nakagami et al., 2006; Son et al., 2011, 2013). The binding of CaM to MPK8 in a Ca<sup>2+</sup> dependent manner is required for enzyme activation, which in turn, controls the expression of RBOHD genes, thereby negatively regulating apoplastic-ROS production in Arabidopsis in response to mechanical wounding (Takahashi et al., 2011). Ca<sup>2+</sup> and CaM signalling pathways are also linked to ROS signalling in plant responses to heat stress. For example, Arabidopsis and yeast mutants that are defective in phosphomannomutase (PMM), an enzyme in the ascorbate synthesis pathway (Wheeler et al., 1998) show enhanced sensitivity to heat stress because of a lower antioxidant capacity. Ca<sup>2+</sup> pretreatment was found to activate the ascorbate synthesis pathway (Ding et al., 2014). CML10 interacts with PPM to regulate ascorbate synthesis and Ca<sup>2+</sup> mediated ROS signalling in Arabidopsis (Cho et al., 2016). These signalling pathways are also important in the regulation of stress-induced PCD, a process that can be activated by decreases in the expression of antioxidant enzymes. For example, the ROS regulated CaM binding protein called AtBAG5 (BCL-2associated anthanogene) is important in the regulation of PCD in Arabidopsis (Kang et al., 2005). Group I members of the BAG protein family (viz., SIBAG4, SIBAG7 and SIBAG9) in tomato have an isoleucine glutamine (IQ) CaM binding motif. These proteins are differentially expressed in response to a wide range of abiotic stress conditions. The heterologous expression of tomato SIBAG9 in Arabidopsis decreased the expression and activities of Fe-SOD1 (FSD1) and CAT1, resulting in intracellular  $H_2O_2$  accumulation and increased stress sensitivity (Jiang et al., 2022).

The Ca<sup>2+</sup> signalling network also interacts with the Hsc70 (heat shock cognate protein 70) chaperone system via CaM (apo- or holo) to regulate senescence in Arabidopsis (Li et al., 2016). Hsc70 interacts with AtBAG5 only at low Ca<sup>2+</sup> concentrations to promotes ROS generation. The AtBAG5 protein binds to Hsc70 (K<sub>d</sub> = 0.24  $\mu$ M) and apo-CaM (0.17  $\mu$ M) in absence of Ca<sup>2+</sup>. In presence of Ca<sup>2+</sup>, the CaM and BAG5 interactions show a higher binding affinity (3.36  $\mu$ M) than the BAG5/holo-CaM complex with Hsc70 (K<sub>d</sub> = 53.3  $\mu$ M). The binding affinity of bag5-Hsc70 complex is greatly reduced for holo-CaM (21.2  $\mu$ M) in presence of Ca<sup>2+</sup>, concentrations alter CaM (0.39  $\mu$ M). High mitochondrial Ca<sup>2+</sup> concentrations alter CaM characteristics and limit the ability of the Hsc70 protein to bind to AtBAG5. The disruption of AtBAG5 binding to Hsc70, frees Hsc70 from the CaM-Hsc70-BAG5 complex in the mitochondria, reducing ROS levels and vice versa (Fu et al., 2017; Li et al., 2016).

## 8 | THE CBL-CIPK MODULE AS A NODE CONNECTING ROS AND Ca<sup>2+</sup> SIGNALLING EVENTS

CBLs are Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensors that work together with interacting CIPKs to regulate a multitude of signalling processes (Luan, 2009; Pandey, 2008; Sanyal et al., 2015; Tang et al., 2020). The CBLinteracting protein kinases (CIPKs) are differentially expressed in rbohB mutants (Shi et al., 2020). The Ca<sup>2+</sup>-dependent activation of RBOH enzymes by protein phosphorylation is regulated by the CBL-CIPK module in a Ca<sup>2+</sup> dependent manner. For example, CIPK26 was shown to interact with the N-terminal region of AtRBOHF, which contains the EF-hands (Kimura et al., 2013). The RBOHF-mediated production of ROS increases together with increases in the [Ca<sup>2+</sup>]<sub>cvt</sub> concentration. ROS generation is strongly enhanced by coexpression of CBL1 (or CBL9) with CIPK26. Together with CIPK26, CBL1 and CBL9 were found to enhance ROS production through the synergistic activation of RBOHF. This was facilitated by Ca<sup>2+</sup> binding to the EF-hands and Ca<sup>2+</sup>-induced phosphorylation by CBL1 or the CBL9-CIPK26 complex in HEK293T cells (Drerup et al., 2013). It is possible that Ca<sup>2+</sup> binding at the N-terminal causes structural changes that activate and recruit the CBL-CIPK module. Increases in [Ca<sup>2+</sup>]<sub>cvt</sub> that occur in response to hormones such as ABA (Hua et al., 2012), can also result in the activation of the CBL-CIPK26 module, thus enhancing RBOHF activity and ROS production that leads to stomatal closure.

Drought stress induces the expression of various members of the rice CIPK family, including CIPK11 (Xiang et al., 2007). For example, overexpression of CIPK11 increased the extent of ROS accumulation in Arabidopsis under drought stress (Ma, Cao, et al., 2019). CIPK11 is reported to phosphorylate RBOHF at the N-terminal, functioning as an alternative pathway to CIPK26 in the regulation of ROS

-WILEY

WILEY-PC Plant, Cell & Environment

production in Arabidopsis (Han et al., 2019). In contrast, however, the expression of CIPK11 from the halophyte *Nitraria tangutorum* in *Arabidopsis thaliana* conferred salt tolerance, a finding was linked to increased proline accumulation and lower ROS levels (Lu et al., 2021). CIPK11 may therefore serve different functions in response to a range of environmental cues.

The salt tolerance pathway, also known as the salt overly sensitive (SOS) pathway, includes SOS2 (CIPK24), a protein kinase that is activated by interactions with SOS3 or CBL4 in a Ca<sup>2+</sup>-dependent manner. The interaction between SOS2 and NDPK2 (nucleotide diphosphate kinase 2) in Arabidopsis modulates CAT2 and CAT3 activities and decreases ROS accumulation in plants exposed to salt stress (Verslues et al., 2007). Similarly, the wheat TaCIPK29 protein functions as a positive regulator of salt stress, regulating ROS homoeostasis in transgenic tobacco lines (Deng, Hu, et al., 2013).

The *Brachypodium distachyon* CIPK31 protein activates ROS scavenging systems in response to abiotic stress. CIPK31-expressing tobacco plants had lower malondialdehyde (MDA) and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> levels with increased CAT, POD, SOD and GST activities (Luo et al., 2017). Moreover, the BdCIPK31 protein functions as a positive regulator of cold and osmotic stress tolerance (Luo et al., 2018). The expression of an apple CIPK MdSOS2L1 (MdCIPK24-like1) protein in transgenic apple and tomato lines conferred salt tolerance through lower ROS accumulation. MdSOS2L1 was found to interact with *MdCBL1*, *MdCBL4* and *MdCBL10* in yeast two-hybrid systems. In addition, proteome analysis and LC/MS showed the involvement of antioxidant pathway genes in the enhanced salt tolerance of the transgenic lines overexpressing MdSOS2L1 (Hu et al., 2016).

CIPK2 interacts with TaCBL1, 2, 3 and 4 and CBL1, 4, 5 and 8 in wheat and grapevines, respectively (Wang et al., 2016; Xu et al., 2020). Overexpression of CIPK2 in tobacco resulted in lower levels of ROS accumulation and higher CAT and SOD activities, as well as enhanced drought tolerance (Wang et al., 2016). Moreover, VaCIPK2 overexpression in Arabidopsis decreased ABA-induced ROS accumulation and altered ABA-dependent stomatal movements (Xu et al., 2020). Similarly, the *Capsicum annuum L*. CIPK3 regulates drought responses through the activation of antioxidant defences and the methyl jasmonate pathway. Overexpression of CaCIPK3 in tomato leads to drought tolerance through increases in CaSOD, CaPOD and CaCAT activities (Ma, Li, et al., 2021). Increases in ROS accumulation induce the expression of the Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensor CBL10, which functions in abiotic stress-induced Ca<sup>2+</sup> signalling pathways. For example, Ca<sup>2+</sup>, CBL10, BR and ROS are linked in drought stress responses (Kang and Nam, 2016).

MdCIPK13 regulates salt tolerance in apples by phosphorylating the sucrose transporter MdSUT2.2, a process that enhances transport activity and promotes sugar-associated osmo-regulatory compound accumulation (Ma, Sun, et al., 2019). CaCIPK13 knockdown lines show enhanced cold sensitivity with increased  $H_2O_2$ accumulation and reduced CAT, POD and SOD activity during cold stress in pepper. CaCIPK13 interacts with CBL1, 6, 7 and 8 (Ma et al., 2022). Such interactions suggest that Ca<sup>2+</sup> and ROS interact to enhance abiotic stress tolerance through the Ca<sup>2+</sup>-CBL-CIPK complex-dependent regulation of ROS levels.

ROS and Ca<sup>2+</sup> might also synergistically regulate salt stress responses. For example, the synthetic strigolactone (SL) analogue GR24 mediates salt tolerance in cucumber through the regulation of Ca<sup>2+</sup> and ROS. SLs increase antioxidant enzyme activity under salt stress (Ling et al., 2020; Zheng et al., 2021). Exposure to salt stress increases the expression of RBOHA-F, together with intracellular Ca<sup>2+</sup> contents and the levels of CaMKs, CaM, CDPKs and Ca<sup>2+</sup>-ATPase in the cucumber seedlings and leaves (Jakubowska et al., 2015; Niu et al., 2018) and all these parameters further increased with the addition of SL analogue GR24. The addition of EGTA, LaCl<sub>3</sub>, DPI or DMTU reversed the effects of GR24 on key parameters such as the levels of ROS and Ca<sup>2+</sup>, antioxidant enzyme activities, as well as CaMKs, CaM, CDPKs and Ca<sup>2+</sup>-ATPase. Together, these findings indicate that Ca<sup>2+</sup> and ROS signalling pathways are interconnected in a feedback loop mechanism (Zhang, Ma, Zhang, et al., 2022). Arabidopsis mutants lacking functional CBL9 and CIPK23 proteins have lower levels of APX1, CAT1, CAT3 transcripts and increased H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> levels (Nath et al., 2019).

GhCIPK6 is required for salt tolerance in Gossypium hirsutum (He et al., 2013) and mediates crosstalk between Ca<sup>2+</sup>, ROS scavenging and MAPK pathways (Su et al., 2020). For example, SICIPK6 phosphorylates SIRd2 (responsive to desiccation 2). Overexpression of Rd2 resulted in lower ROS accumulation through the mediation of SICIPK6. This protein regulates the oxidative burst through activation of RBOHB in response to biotic stress (de la Torre et al., 2013). These findings suggest that SIRd2 functions as a negative regulator of the CBL10-CIPK6-RBOHB interactions that control ROS production (Gutiérrez-Beltrán et al., 2017). These studies highlight the importance of CIPK-dependent protein phosphorylation in response to ROS signalling. TaCIPK14 is an abiotic stress responsive gene, that regulates a wide range of stress responses. The expression of TaCIPK14 in tobacco cells exposed to cold and salt stress increased CAT activity and decreased H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> levels. Increases in ROS levels trigger the expression of CIPK14, which in turn regulates the activities of antioxidant enzymes (Deng, Zhou, et al., 2013). Moreover, both CIPK6 and CIPK14 negatively regulates of plant immune response to Pseudomonas syringae in Arabidopsis (Ma, Chen, et al., 2021; Sardar et al., 2017)

The discovery of CBLs and CIPKs, which belong to the sensorrelay protein family, revolutionised concepts concerning plant Ca<sup>2+</sup> signalling. CBLs and CIPKs directly regulate ROS-producing enzymes. They exert positive and negative controls over RBOHs activity and regulate the expression of ROS regulating genes. They are also involved in other signalling cascades with stress regulators such as ABA, BR, JA and SL. In association with CIPK, they fine-tune downstream responses. For example, CBL1 and CBL9 interact with CIPK26 to regulate RBOHF and ROS signalling. In association with CIPK23, CBL1 and CBL9, they also regulate AKT1 (inward-rectifying K<sup>+</sup> channels) and SLAC1, which regulates ion homoeostasis in Arabidopsis (Lee et al., 2009; Xu et al., 2006). The CBLs and CIPKs fulfil indispensable functions in cell-to-cell communication and ROS wave propagation. A list of Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensing proteins that are crucial to Ca<sup>2+</sup>-ROS crosstalk is provided in Table 1.

Calcium sensing proteins	ldentified homolog	Organism	Mechanism of regulating ROS pathways	Mode of detection	Functional relevance
Ca <sup>2+</sup> -dependent protein kinases (CDPK/CPK)	CDPK1	Tomato	Differential expression by ROS	Northern blot analysis	Plant defence to wound and biotic stress [1]
	CDPK6, CDPK12	Rapeseed	Differential gene expression and changed antioxidant enzymes activity	Real time PCR	Response to drought stress [2]
	CDPK family homologs	Wheat	Differential gene expression due to H <sub>2</sub> O <sub>2</sub> and abiotic stress conditions	·	Response to biotic and abiotic stress [3]
	CDPKs/CIPKs family homologs	Rice	Differential expression in <i>rbohB</i> mutant	Transcriptome profile analysis	Role of RbohB in drought tolerance in rice [4]
	CPK8	Arabidopsis	Phosphorylate CAT3 at Ser261	In-vitro and in-planta protein phosphorylation	Regulates ABA mediated drought responses and ROS homoeostasis [5]
	CPK2	Rapeseed	Interacts with RbohD	Mating-based split ubiquitin assay and BiFC	Putative role in ROS and cell death regulation [6]
	CDPK10	Poncirus trifoliata	Interacts and phosphorylates APX, its overexpression shows reduced ROS	Yeast-two-hybrid and in-vitro kinase assay	Modulates ROS homoeostasis and functions during drought tolerance [7]
	CDPK 4, CDPK5	Potato	Phosphorylates RbohB at Ser82, Ser97 and induces ROS production	Mass spectrometry analysis and ectopic expression in Nicotiana benthamiana	Regulates oxidative burst [8]
	CDPK13	Wheat	Interacts with NOX7	Luciferase complementation, BiFC and co-immunoprecipitation assay	Regulates ROS homoeostasis during wheat development and fertility as well as drought tolerance [9]
	CDPK9, CDPK20	Dendrobium officinale	Interacts with RbohD and RbohH	Yeast-two-hybrid	Regulates ROS production and stomatal closure in response to SA/JA [10]
	CDPK6, CDPK14	Rapeseed	Induction of ROS scavenging machinery	Antioxidant enzymatic assays	Drought resistance [2]
	CPK1	Apple	Reduced MDA and ROS level, increased antioxidant enzyme activities	Ectopic expression in N. benthamiana	Cold tolerance response in plants [11]
Calmodulin (CaM) and Calmodulin-like proteins (CMLs)	CCaMK	Maize	Induced expression and activity in response to BR, regulates BR-induced antioxidant defence	Transient expression in maize protoplast and complementation in rice	Functions in BR regulation Ca <sup>2+</sup> and ROS loop [12]
	CaM1	Rice	Increased antioxidant enzyme activity and reduced ROS content	Transgenic overexpression in rice	Salt tolerance in rice [13]
	CaM	Rice	Interacts with CYP2		Drought and salt tolerance in rice [14]
					(Continues)

	Identified				
Calcium sensing proteins	homolog	Organism	Mechanism of regulating ROS pathways	Mode of detection	Functional relevance
	ELP	Euphorbia characias	CaM binding protein regulated by $Ca^{2^+}/CaM$	CaM binding assays	CaM mediated Ca <sup>2+</sup> /ROS crosstalk [15]
	CaM	Panax ginseng	Induce expression followed by increased antioxidant enzyme activity under ABA and H <sub>2</sub> O <sub>2</sub> , which is abolished by CaM blocker and ROS scavengers	CaM blocker for example, TFP and ROS scavengers such as DMTU	ABA mediated ROS production regulated through CaM [16]
	CaM2	Potato	Overexpression depicts decreased ROS accumulation	Ectopic expression in N. benthamiana	Drought tolerance [17]
	CaM	Eleusine coracana	Overexpression shows reduced oxidative load	Ectopic expression in Arabidopsis	Drought and salt tolerance [18]
	BAG9	Tomato	Overexpression shows reduced antioxidant enzymes expression level as well as activity	Overexpression in Arabidopsis	Increased sensitivity to multiple abiotic stress [19]
	CML20	Arabidopsis	CaM binding protein activity, upregulated stress responsive genes, down regulated antioxidant scavenging genes, increased ROS levels	In-vitro CaM binding assays,	ABA induced ROS production during drought [20]
	CML40	Pongamia	Overexpression lines shows increased proline and lower MDA content	Overexpression in Arabidopsis	Salt tolerance [21]
	CML4	Rice	Increased ROS scavenging enzymes activity and expression	Rice transgenic lines overexpressing CML4	Drought tolerance in ABA independent manner [22]
	DSR1	Rice	Increased ROS scavenging enzymes activity and expression	Rice transgenic lines overexpressing DSR1 and DSR1 RNA interference lines	Drought tolerance in rice [23]
	CaM	Arabidopsis	CaM binds to MPK8 and controls expression of RbohD genes	CaM binding assays	${\rm Ca}^{2+}$ and ROS interplay during wound signalling pathways [24]
	CML10	Arabidopsis	Interacts with PPM	Yeast-two-hybrid, BiFC and co- immunoprecipitation assay	Regulates oxidative stress through ascorbic acid pathway [25]
	CML44	Solanum habrochaites	Differential expression of ROS scavenging machinery and reduced ROS content	Enhance antioxidant enzyme activity and reduced ROS load	Transgenic tomatoes overexpressing CML44 [26]
	CML46	Alfalfa	Enhanced ROS scavenging enzymes activity and reduced ROS content	Ectopic expression in N. benthamiana	Tolerance to abiotic stress [27]
	CAMTA	Chickpea	Enhanced ROS scavenging enzymes activity and reduced expression of stress marker genes	Chickpea transgenic lines overexpressing CAMTA	Regulates salt and drought stress [28]
	CAMTA	Soybean	Differential expression under various abiotic stress and $\rm H_2O_2$ treatment	RT-PCR	Regulates ROS in response to stress [29]

TABLE 1 (Continued)

Plant, Cell & Environment

Calcium sensing proteins	Identified homolog	Organism	Mechanism of regulating ROS pathways	Mode of detection	Functional relevance
Calcineurin B-like proteins (CBL) and CBL- interacting protein	CBL1/9-CIPK26	Arabidopsis	Interacts and phosphorylates RbohF, ROS production is increased in CBL9, CIPK26 and RbohF co expression	Yeast-two-hybrid, in-vitro phosphorylation and co-expression analysis in HEK293T cells	CIRP and RICP in plants [30]
kinases (CIPKs)	CIPK11	Arabidopsis	Overexpression lines shows increased ROS content, it also phosphorylates RbohF	Overexpression in Arabidopsis, in-vitro phosphorylation assay	Response to drought stress [31, 32]
	CIPK11	Nitraria tangutorum	Increased antioxidant enzymatic activity and decreased ROS content	Ectopic expression in Arabidopsis	Response to salt stress [33]
	SOS2 (CIPK24)	Arabidopsis	Interacts with NDPK2, CAT2 and CAT3	Yeast-two-hybrid	Salt stress responses [34]
	CIPK31	Brachyposium distachyon	Enhanced ROS scavenging enzymes activity and reduced ROS content	Transgenics overexpressing CIPK31 in N. benthamiana	Drought and Salt stress responses [35]
	CIPK31	Brachyposium distachyon	Improved ROS detoxification	Ectopic expression in N. benthamiana	Cold and osmotic stress responses [36]
	CBL10	Arabidopsis	ROS and BR regulated induced CBL10 expression	RT-PCR	Response to drought stress [37]
	SOS2L1	Apple	Involvement of antioxidant pathway gene	LC/MS performed in transgenic lnes overexpressing CBL10 in apple and tomato	Salt stress responses [38]
	CIPK29	Wheat	Enhanced ROS scavenging enzymes activity and reduced ROS content	Transgenics overexpressing CIPK29 in N. benthamiana	Salt stress responses [39]
	CIPK2	Wheat	Enhanced ROS scavenging enzymes activity	Transgenics overexpressing CIPK2 in N. benthamiana	Response to drought stress [40]
	CIPK2	Amur grape	Reduced ABA induced ROS level	Overexpression in Arabidopsis	ABA dependent stomatal movement and ROS homoeostasis during drought stress [41]
	CIPK3	Capsicum annuum	Altered ROS scavenging enzymes activity and JA pathway	Ectopic expression in tomato	Drought tolerance [42]
	CIPK13	Pepper	Altered ROS scavenging enzymes activity and ROS levels	Knockdown lines in pepper	Cold stress responses [43]
	SOS3	Tamarix hispida	Altered ROS scavenging enzymes activity and ROS levels	Transgenic T. <i>hispida</i> lines as well as overexpression in Arabidopsis	Salt stress responses [44]
	CBL9, CIPK23	Arabidopsis	Altered ROS scavenging enzymes activity and ROS levels	Cbl9 and cipk23 mutant in Arabidopsis	Salt stress responses [45]
	CBL10, CIPK6	Gossypium hirsutum	Induced expression in response to drought, salt and ABA treatment	Overexpression in Arabidopsis	Multiple abiotic stress tolerance [46]
					(Continues)

TABLE 1 (Continued)

**WILEY** 

Plant, Cell & Environment

# 9 | CONCLUSIONS AND PERSPECTIVES

While plants lack of a nervous system, they still have the ability to transmit environmental signals systemically from the site of perception to distal tissues. Within this context, Ca<sup>2+</sup> and ROS are versatile signalling components that operate individually or synchronously to transmit information concerning environmental conditions to facilitate appropriate adjustments in plant growth and defence. Membrane-associated channels and pumps shuttle Ca<sup>2+</sup> ions between the extracellular space, the cytosol, organelles and the nucleus, and multiple systems generate oxidative (ROS) signals in the extracellular and intracellular compartments to regulate protein functions, metabolism and gene expression. The changes in Ca<sup>2+</sup> ion distribution control the membrane potential, modulate mitochondrial and photosynthetic ATP production and regulate the activities of proteins such as CaM, which have a diverse range of functions. The evidence discussed above highlights the central role of Ca<sup>2+</sup> and ROS interplay in the regulation of plant growth, development and defence, particularly in relation to environmental triggers (Marcec and Tanaka, 2021; Marcec et al., 2019).

The recent characterisation of the ROS wave pathway of cellto-cell signalling in Arabidopsis and other species has led to a steep change in current concepts of how the Ca<sup>2+</sup>-ROS interplay is regulated at a mechanistic level, as illustrated in Figure 3. In summary, the perception of changes in apoplastic ROS accumulation by HPCA1 activates a CPK-dependent signal transduction pathway that involves many Ca<sup>2+</sup>-signalling proteins including CBL4, CIPK26 and OST1. A number of these Ca<sup>2+</sup>-regulated proteins activate RBOHD and RBOHF and amplify apoplastic ROS production, which is then sensed by the cell following in the chain. via its own HPCA1. The repetition of these processes from cell-tocell forms a positive amplification loop that drives the ROS signal from cell-to-cell (Fichman et al., 2019, 2022). In this concept, CIPK26 activates RBOHF and OST1 (Drerup et al., 2013), and in turn OST1 activates RBOHD and RBOHF (Wang et al., 2020). Perception of apoplastic ROS by HPCA1 also leads to the opening of aquaporins such as PIP2;1 (Maurel et al., 2021; Mittler et al., 2022) that facilitate the transfer of apoplastic ROS into the cytosol. In this way, the redox state of signalling components in the cytosol can be changed to regulate multiple proteins and transcription factors such as MYB30 and ZAT12 (Mittler et al., 2022) to enhance stress tolerance (Fichman et al., 2021; Zandalinas, Fichman, Devireddy, et al., 2020; Zandalinas, Fichman, & Mitler, 2020b; Fichman and Mittler, 2021; Mittler et al., 2022). The systemic transmission of ROS signals is also dependent on a range of Ca<sup>2+</sup>-permeable channels, including MSL3, that function downstream of HPCA1 (Fichman et al., 2022).

The systemic cell-to-cell transmission of  $Ca^{2+}$  and ROS signals is also linked to an 'electric wave' that involves rapid depolarization of the PM and is dependent on the function of GLRs (Fichman and Mittler, 2021). While the systemic cell-to-cell changes in  $Ca^{2+}$  and ROS signals are suppressed in *hpca1* mutants, the rapid local and systemic membrane depolarization signal is unaffected (Fichman

TABLE 1 (Continued)

Calcium sensing proteins	ldentified homolog	Organism	Mechanism of regulating ROS pathways	Mode of detection	Functional relevance
	CBL10, CIPK6	Tomato	CIPK6 phosphorylates Rd2 whose overexpression shows reduced ROS	In-vitro phosphorylation assay, Transgenics overexpressing Rd2 in N. benthamiana	Oxidative stress signalling [47]
	CIPK9	Arabidopsis	CIPK9 phosphorylates VDAC3 and alters ROS levels	In-vitro and in-planta phosphorylation assays, Genetic evidence	Oxidative stress signalling [48]
	CIPK14	Wheat	Altered ROS scavenging enzymes activity and ROS levels	Tobacco cell expression	Cold and salt stress response
Abbreviations: ABA, abscisic a activator: CAT, catalase: CCal	acid; APX, ascorbate MK. calcium/calmod	e peroxidase; BAG, Bc Julin dependent protei	l-2 associated athanogene; BiFC, bimolecular fluore in kinases: CIRP. Ca <sup>2+</sup> induced ROS production: DN	escence complementation; Ca <sup>2+</sup> , calcium; C MTU. dimethylthiourea: DSR. drought stress	AMTA, calmodulin binding transcription response: ELP. <i>Eurborbia</i>

characias peroxidase; H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>, hydrogen peroxide; JA, jasmonic acid; PPM, phosphomannomutase; Rboh, respiratory burst oxidase homolog; Rd, responsive to desiccation; RICP, ROS Ca<sup>2+</sup> induced production;

SOS, salt overly sensitive; TFP, trifluoperazine; VDAC3, voltage dependent anion channel

reactive oxygen species; SA, salicylic acid;

ROS,

Plant, Cell &

-WILEY-🅵

# Plant, Cell & PC-WILEY-



**FIGURE 3** A simple model illustrating how the waves of Ca<sup>2+</sup> and reactive oxygen species (ROS) may facilitate cell-to-cell signalling. Any physical or chemical shock to the plasma membrane induces a ROS burst in the apoplast by the activation of RBOH proteins. Many factors are likely be involved in the perception and transmission of environmental and metabolic signals that promote RBOHD activation in local tissues. The example illustrated here is the requirement for phytochrome B (phyB) in the plant response to high light. RBOH-mediated ROS production is crucial for in cell-to-cell signalling and long-distance communication, as described by Fichman et al. (2022). In this model, HPCA1 senses changes in apoplastic ROS levels and initiates cell signalling pathways including cytosolic Ca<sup>2+</sup> fluctuations mediated at least in part through MSL3. Thereafter, Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensor proteins govern downstream signalling and activate RBOH-dependent ROS generation as well as the antioxidant and ROS processing machinery. The regulation of PD size by PDLP enhances the symplastic communication between cells allowing the spread of the cell-to-cell signals. PD functions are regulated by Ca<sup>2+</sup>, callose synthase activity and callose deposition. Many components of this signalling cascade remain to be identified. Examples of signalling systems that are less well characterised are indicated by dashed lines. APX, ascorbate peroxidase; CaM, calmodulin; CAT, catalase; CBL, calcineurin B-like proteins; CIPK, CBL-interacting protein kinase; CPK, Calcium dependent protein kinase; H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>, hydrogen peroxide; HPCA1, H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>-induced Ca<sup>2+</sup> increase; MSL3, mechanosensitive ion channel like 3; MYB, myeloblastosis domain protein; OST1, open stomata 1; PD, plasmodesmata; PDLP, PD localised protein; PhyB, Phytochrome B; PIP2;1, plasma membrane intrinsic protein; RBOH, respiratory burst oxidase homologs; RD2, responsive to desiccation; Zat12, zing finger of *Arabidopsis thaliana*. [Color figure can be viewed at wileyonlinelibrary.com]

et al., 2022), demonstrating that the waves of different signals can operate independently. While the signalling system illustrated in Figure 3 is intrinsic to plant stress responses, there is as yet little indication of how specificity is entrained in the signalling pathways. The signalling-induced increases in apoplastic and cytosolic  $H_2O_2$ accumulation are likely to be accompanied by stress-induced fluctuations in  $H_2O_2$  accumulation in mitochondria and chloroplasts that may serve to add specificity to the signal but little is known about the mechanisms that integrate signals from the different cellular compartments. Moreover, the movement of other signalling molecules through the PD is likely to be key to honing the specific nature of signal transmission.

The molecular machinery that achieves the synergistic operation of ROS and Ca<sup>2+</sup> signals remains poorly understood. Redox posttranslational modifications (PTMs) are likely to operate synchronously with protein phosphorylation and other PTMs to modulate a wide range of signalling protein functions (Spoel, 2018), as is the case with HPCA1 and many more. The subsequent increase in intracellular Ca<sup>2+</sup> levels, followed by the activation of Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensing proteins, regulates a range of PTMs and other functions either by direct regulation (CDPKs and CBL-CIPKs) or by activating other signalling cascades (mostly but not exclusively governed by CaM and CMLs). Many questions remain to be addressed, particularly concerning how the ROS-Ca<sup>2+</sup> interplay regulates key processes such as the cell cycle and epigenetic controls that allow adaptation to prevailing environmental conditions. In vivo imaging systems that will allow the direct measurement of key parameters such as Ca<sup>2+</sup>, glutathione and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> in different cellular compartments using genetically encoded biosensors will be essential to investigate the dynamic nature of such controls (Kostyuk et al., 2020).

For simplicity, the above discussion has focussed on the proteins and processes that facilitate intercations between ROS and Ca<sup>2+</sup> signalling pathways in response to abiotic stress. It is important to emphasise, however, that these and similar proteins and systems are likely to form nodes for ROS/Ca<sup>2+</sup> signalling that regulate many aspects of plant biology, as illustrated in Figure 4. -WILEY-

16



**FIGURE 4** Schematic representation of the many possible roles of calcium sensor proteins and ROS/Ca<sup>2+</sup> interactions in plant growth and development. Ca<sup>2+</sup> sensor proteins such as CPK5, CPK6, CPK12, CaM1, Msr1, CaM7, CML1, CIPK31, CIPK6 and the CBL1-CIPK26 complex have been shown to influence ROS signalling pathways during a wide range of plant growth and developmental responses (Cui et al., 2020; He et al., 2013; Jiang et al., 2017; Kimura et al., 2013; Luo et al., 2018; Tang et al., 2014; Wang, Zhang, et al., 2019; Yang et al., 2018). Hence, crosstalk between ROS and Ca<sup>2+</sup> may be considered to regulate nearly every stage of plant development, from germination to senescence, and to even extend to the postharvest physiology of fruits and vegetables. ABA, abscisic acid; ANN1, annexin 1; BAG, Bcl-2-associated athanogene; Ca<sup>2+</sup>, calcium; CaM, calmodulin; CCX1, Cation/Ca<sup>2+</sup> exchanger; CNGC, cyclic nucleotide gated channel; Hsc, heat shock cognate; HvC2d1, *Hordeum vulgare* C2-domain; MSR, methionine sulfoxide reductase; NOX, NADPH oxidases; Rboh, respiratory burst oxidase homolog; RHD, root hair development; ROS, reactive oxygen species; SAG, senescence-associated gene; WSR1, WRKY regulating SA and ROS 1. [Color figure can be viewed at wileyonlinelibrary.com]

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Research in GKP's lab is supported by Delhi University (IoE/FRP grant), Department of Biotechnology (DBT), Science and Engineering Research Board (SERB), Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR), Board of Research in Nuclear Studies (BRNS), India. CHF thanks SERB, India for a VAJRA fellowship (VJR/2019/000068). BR thanks CSIR, India for Junior/Senior Research Fellowship. BR thanks DBT, India and The British Council for Newton-Bhabha fellowship.

#### DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

Data sharing not applicable to this article as no data sets were generated or analysed during the current study.

### ORCID

Christine H. Foyer D http://orcid.org/0000-0001-5989-6989 Girdhar K. Pandey D http://orcid.org/0000-0001-9180-0924

#### REFERENCES

- Ahmadi, H., Abbasi, A., Taleei, A., Mohammadi, V. & Pueyo, J.J. (2022) Antioxidant response and calcium-dependent protein kinases involvement in canola (*Brassica napus* L.) tolerance to drought. *Agronomy*, 12, 125.
- Van Aken, O. & Pogson, B.J. (2017) Convergence of mitochondrial and chloroplastic ANAC017/PAP-dependent retrograde signalling pathways and suppression of programmed cell death. *Cell Death & Differentiation*, 24, 955–960.

- Arefian, M., Antil, N., Najar, M.A., Behera, S.K., Subba, P. & Prasad, T.S.K. (2022) Identifying novel genes and proteins involved in salt stress perception and signaling of rice seedlings. OMICS: A Journal of Integrative Biology, 26, 151–164.
- Aroca, Á., Serna, A., Gotor, C. & Romero, L.C. (2015) S-sulfhydration: a cysteine posttranslational modification in plant systems. *Plant Physiology*, 168, 334–342.
- Assmann, S.M. & Romano, L. (1999) Secondary messenger regulation of ion channels/plant patch clamping. *Methods in Enzymology*, 294, 410-441.
- Babbar, R., Karpinska, B., Grover, A. & Foyer, C.H. (2021) Heat-induced oxidation of the nuclei and cytosol. *Frontiers in Plant Science*, 11, 617779.
- Bánfi, B., Tirone, F., Durussel, I., Knisz, J., Moskwa, P., Molnár, G.Z. et al. (2004) Mechanism of Ca2+ activation of the NADPH oxidase 5 (NOX5). Journal of Biological Chemistry, 279, 18583–18591.
- Campo, S., Baldrich, P., Messeguer, J., Lalanne, E., Coca, M. & San Segundo, B. (2014) Overexpression of a calcium-dependent protein kinase confers salt and drought tolerance in rice by preventing membrane lipid peroxidation. *Plant Physiology*, 165, 688–704.
- Chae, H.B., Kim, M.G., Kang, C.H., Park, J.H., Lee, E.S., Lee, S.U. et al. (2021) Redox sensor QSOX1 regulates plant immunity by targeting GSNOR to modulate ROS generation. *Molecular Plant*, 14, 1312–1327.
- Chaicherdsakul, T., Yuenyong, W., Roytrakul, S., Chadchawan, S., Wutipraditkul, N., Limpaseni, T. et al. (2017) Proteomic analysis of transgenic rice overexpressing a calmodulin calcium sensor reveals its effects on redox signaling and homeostasis. *Journal of Plant Biochemistry and Biotechnology*, 26, 235–245.
- Charpentier, M., Sun, J., Martins, T.V., Radhakrishnan, G.V., Findlay, K., Soumpourou, E. et al. (2016) Nuclear-localized cyclic nucleotide-gated channels mediate symbiotic calcium oscillations. *Science*, 352, 1102–1105.
- Chico, M., Raíces, M., Téllez-Iñón, T. & Ulloa, R. (2002) A calciumdependent protein kinase is systemically induced upon wounding in tomato plants. *Plant Physiology*, 128, 256–270.
- Cho, K.M., Nguyen, H.T.K., Kim, S.Y., Shin, J.S., Cho, D.H., Hong, S.B. et al. (2016) CML10, a variant of calmodulin, modulates ascorbic acid synthesis. *New Phytologist*, 209, 664–678.
- Choi, W.G., Toyota, M., Kim, S.H., Hilleary, R. & Gilroy, S. (2014) Salt stress-induced Ca2+ waves are associated with rapid, long-distance root-to-shoot signaling in plants. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 111, 6497–6502.
- Considine, M.J. & Foyer, C.H. (2021) Stress effects on the reactive oxygen species (ROS)-dependent regulation of plant growth and development. *Journal of Experimental Botany*, 72, 5795–5806.
- Cui, X., Zhao, P., Liang, W., Cheng, Q., Mu, B., Niu, F. et al. (2020) A rapeseed WRKY transcription factor phosphorylated by CPK modulates cell death and leaf senescence by regulating the expression of ROS and SA-synthesis-related genes. *Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry*, 68, 7348–7359.
- De Clercq, I., Vermeirssen, V., Van Aken, O., Vandepoele, K., Murcha, M.W. & Law, S.R. et al. (2013) The membrane-bound NAC transcription factor ANAC013 functions in mitochondrial retrograde regulation of the oxidative stress response in Arabidopsis. *The Plant Cell*, 25, 3472–3490.
- DeFalco, T.A., Bender, K.W. & Snedden, W.A. (2010) Breaking the code: Ca2+ sensors in plant signalling. *Biochemical Journal*, 425, 27-40.
- Dell'Aglio, E., Giustini, C., Kraut, A., Couté, Y., Costa, A., Decros, G. et al. (2019) Identification of the Arabidopsis calmodulin-dependent NAD+ kinase that sustains the elicitor-induced oxidative burst. *Plant Physiology*, 181(4), 1449–1458.

Demidchik, V. (2018) ROS-activated ion channels in plants: biophysical characteristics, physiological functions and molecular nature. International Journal of Molecular Sciences, 19, 1263.

S-WILEY

- Deng, X., Hu, W, Wei, S, Zhou, S, Zhang, F. & Han, J et al. (2013) TaCIPK29, a CBL-interacting protein kinase gene from wheat, confers salt stress tolerance in transgenic tobacco. *PLoS One*, 8, e69881.
- Deng, X., Zhou, S., Hu, W., Feng, J., Zhang, F., Chen, L. et al. (2013) Ectopic expression of wheat TaCIPK14, encoding a calcineurin B-like protein-interacting protein kinase, confers salinity and cold tolerance in tobacco. *Physiologia Plantarum*, 149, 367–377.
- Devireddy, A.R., Liscum, E. & Mittler, R. (2020) Phytochrome B is required for systemic stomatal responses and reactive oxygen species signaling during light stress. *Plant Physiology*, 184(3), 1563–1572.
- Ding, H., Zhang, H., Zhu, X., Liu, H., Liang, J. & Lu, B. (2014) Involvement of calcium and calmodulin signaling in adaptation to heat stressinduced oxidative stress in *Solanum lycopersicum* L. leaves. *African Journal of Biotechnology*, 11, 3259–3269.
- Dong, H., Wu, C., Luo, C., Wei, M., Qu, S. & Wang, S. (2020) Overexpression of MdCPK1a gene, a calcium dependent protein kinase in apple, increase tobacco cold tolerance via scavenging ROS accumulation. *PLoS One*, 15, e0242139.
- Dong, Z., Shanmughapriya, S., Tomar, D., Siddiqui, N., Lynch, S., Nemani, N. et al. (2017) Mitochondrial Ca2+ uniporter is a mitochondrial luminal redox sensor that augments MCU channel activity. *Molecular Cell*, 65, 1014–1028.
- Drerup, M.M., Schlücking, K., Hashimoto, K., Manishankar, P., Steinhorst, L., Kuchitsu, K. et al. (2013) The calcineurin B-like calcium sensors CBL1 and CBL9 together with their interacting protein kinase CIPK26 regulate the arabidopsis NADPH oxidase RBOHF. *Molecular Plant*, 6, 559–569.
- Du, B., Chen, N., Song, L., Wang, D., Cai, H., Yao, L. et al. (2021) Alfalfa (*Medicago sativa* L.) MsCML46 gene encoding calmodulin-like protein confers tolerance to abiotic stress in tobacco. *Plant Cell Reports*, 40, 1907–1922.
- Dubiella, U., Seybold, H., Durian, G., Komander, E., Lassig, R., Witte, C.P. et al. (2013) Calcium-dependent protein kinase/NADPH oxidase activation circuit is required for rapid defense signal propagation. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 110, 8744–8749.
- Fichman, Y., Miller, G. & Mittler, R. (2019) Whole-plant live imaging of reactive oxygen species. *Molecular Plant*, 12, 1203–1210.
- Fichman, Y. & Mittler, R. (2020) Noninvasive live ROS imaging of whole plants grown in soil. *Trends in Plant Science*, 25, 1052–1053.
- Fichman, Y. & Mittler, R. (2021) Integration of electric, calcium, reactive oxygen species and hydraulic signals during rapid systemic signaling in plants. *The Plant Journal*, 107(1), 7–20.
- Fichman, Y., Myers, R.J., Grant, D.A.G. & Mittler, R. (2021) Plasmodesmata-localized 549 proteins and ROS orchestrate lightinduced rapid systemic signaling in Arabidopsis. *Sci. 550 Signal.* 14, 322.
- Fichman, Y., Zandalinas, S.I., Peck, S., Luan, S. & Mittler, R. (2022) HPCA1 is required for systemic reactive oxygen species and calcium cell-tocell signaling and plant acclimation to stress. *The Plant Cell*, 34(11), 4453–4471.
- Foyer, C.H. & Hanke, G. (2022) ROS production and signalling in chloroplasts: cornerstones and evolving concepts. *The Plant Journal*, 111, 642–661.
- Foyer, C.H. & Noctor, G. (2009) Redox regulation in photosynthetic organisms: signaling, acclimation, and practical implications. *Antioxidants & Redox Signaling*, 11, 861–905.
- Fu, S., Li, L., Kang, H., Yang, X., Men, S. & Shen, Y. (2017) Chronic mitochondrial calcium elevation suppresses leaf senescence. *Biochemical and Biophysical Research Communications*, 487, 672–677.

Figure Plant, Cell &

- Fu, Y., Ma, H., Chen, S., Gu, T. & Gong, J. (2018) Control of proline accumulation under drought via a novel pathway comprising the histone methylase CAU1 and the transcription factor ANAC055. *Journal of Experimental Botany*, 69(3), 579–588.
- Fu, Y.L., Zhang, G.B., Lv, X.F., Guan, Y., Yi, H.Y. & Gong, J.M. (2013) Arabidopsis histone methylase CAU1/PRMT5/SKB1 acts as an epigenetic suppressor of the calcium signaling gene CAS to mediate stomatal closure in response to extracellular calcium. *The Plant Cell*, 25(8), 2878–2891.
- Ganusova, E.E., Reagan, B.C., Fernandez, J.C., Azim, M.F., Sankoh, A.F. & Freeman, K.M. et al. (2020) Chloroplast-to-nucleus retrograde signalling controls intercellular trafficking via plasmodesmata formation. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, 20, 190408.
- Garg, V., Suzuki, J., Paranjpe, I., Unsulangi, T., Boyman, L., Milescu, L.S. et al. (2021) The mechanism of MICU-dependent gating of the mitochondrial Ca2+ uniporter. *eLife*, 10, e69312.
- Gilroy, S., Suzuki, N., Miller, G., Choi, W.G., Toyota, M., Devireddy, A.R. et al. (2014) A tidal wave of signals: calcium and ROS at the forefront of rapid systemic signaling. *Trends in Plant Science*, 19, 623-630.
- Godbole, A., Varghese, J., Sarin, A. & Mathew, M.K. (2003) VDAC is a conserved element of death pathways in plant and animal systems. *Biochimica et Biophysica Acta (BBA)-Molecular Cell Research*, 1642, 87–96.
- Grison, M.S., Kirk, P., Brault, M.L., Wu, X.N., Schulze, W.X., Benitez-Alfonso, Y. et al. (2019) Plasma membrane-associated receptor-like kinases relocalize to plasmodesmata in response to osmotic stress. *Plant Physiology*, 181, 142–160.
- Guo, H., Feng, P., Chi, W., Sun, X., Xu, X., Li, Y. et al. (2016) Plastid-nucleus communication involves calcium-modulated MAPK signalling. *Nature Communications*, 2717, 1–15.
- Guo, Z., Wang, F., Xiang, X., Ahammed, G., Wang, M., Onac, E. et al. (2016) Systemic induction of photosynthesis via illumination of the shoot apex is mediated by phytochrome B. *Plant Physiology*, 172, 1259–1272.
- Gutiérrez-Beltrán, E., Personat, J.M., de la Torre, F. & del Pozo, O. (2017) A universal stress protein involved in oxidative stress is a phosphorylation target for protein kinase CIPK6. *Plant Physiology*, 173, 836–852.
- Han, J.P., Köster, P., Drerup, M.M., Scholz, M., Li, S., Edel, K.H. et al. (2019) Fine-tuning of RBOHF activity is achieved by differential phosphorylation and Ca2+ binding. *New Phytologist*, 221, 1935–1949.
- He, L., Yang, X., Wang, L., Zhu, L., Zhou, T., Deng, J. et al. (2013) Molecular cloning and functional characterization of a novel cotton CBLinteracting protein kinase gene (GhCIPK6) reveals its involvement in multiple abiotic stress tolerance in transgenic plants. *Biochemical and Biophysical Research Communications*, 435, 209–215.
- Hochmal, A.K., Zinzius, K., Charoenwattanasatien, R., Gäbelein, P., Mutoh, R., Tanaka, H. et al. (2016) Calredoxin represents a novel type of calcium-dependent sensor-responder connected to redox regulation in the chloroplast. *Nature Communications*, 7(1), 11847.
- Hu, C.H., Zeng, Q.D., Tai, L., Li, B.B., Zhang, P.P., Nie, X.M. et al. (2020) Interaction between TaNOX7 and TaCDPK13 contributes to plant fertility and drought tolerance by regulating ROS production. *Journal* of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 68, 7333–7347.
- Hu, D.G., Ma, Q.J., Sun, C.H., Sun, M.H., You, C.X. & Hao, Y.J. (2016) Overexpression of MdSOS2L1, a CIPK protein kinase, increases the antioxidant metabolites to enhance salt tolerance in apple and tomato. *Physiologia Plantarum*, 156, 201–214.
- Hu, Z., Li, J., Ding, S., Cheng, F., Li, X., Jiang, Y. et al. (2021) The protein kinase CPK28 phosphorylates ascorbate peroxidase and enhances thermotolerance in tomato. *Plant Physiology*, 186, 1302–1317.

- Hua, D., Wang, C., He, J., Liao, H., Duan, Y., Zhu, Z., et al. (2012) A plasma membrane receptor kinase, GHR1, mediates abscisic acid-and hydrogen peroxide-regulated stomatal movement in Arabidopsis. *The Plant Cell*, 24(6), 2546–2561.
- Israelson, A., Abu-Hamad, S., Zaid, H., Nahon, E. & Shoshan-Barmatz, V. (2007) Localization of the voltage-dependent anion channel-1 Ca2+binding sites. *Cell Calcium*, 41(3), 235–244.
- Jakubowska, D., Janicka-Russak, M., Kabała, K., Migocka, M. & Reda, M. (2015) Modification of plasma membrane NADPH oxidase activity in cucumber seedling roots in response to cadmium stress. *Plant Science*, 234, 50–59.
- Jalmi, S.K. & Sinha, A.K. (2015) ROS mediated MAPK signaling in abiotic and biotic stress- striking similarities and differences. Frontiers in Plant Science, 6, 769.
- Jamra, G., Agarwal, A., Singh, N., Sanyal, S.K., Kumar, A. & Pandey, G.K. (2021) Ectopic expression of finger millet calmodulin confers drought and salinity tolerance in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Plant Cell Reports*, 40, 2205–2223.
- Jeandroz, S., Lamotte, O., Astier, J., Rasul, S., Trapet, P., Besson-Bard, A. et al. (2013) There's more to the picture than meets the eye: nitric oxide cross talk with Ca2+ signaling. *Plant Physiology*, 163, 459–470.
- Jiang, G., Xiao, L., Yan, H., Zhang, D., Wu, F., Liu, X. et al. (2017) Redox regulation of methionine in calmodulin affects the activity levels of senescence-related transcription factors in litchi. *Biochimica et Biophysica Acta (BBA) - General Subjects*, 1861, 1140–1151.
- Jiang, H., Ji, Y., Sheng, J., Wang, Y., Liu, X. & Xiao, P. et al. (2022) Genomewide identification of the Bcl-2 associated athanogene (BAG) gene family in *Solanum lycopersicum* and the functional role of SIBAG9 in response to osmotic stress. *Antioxidants*, 11, 598.
- Jones, J.D.G. & Dangl, J.L. (2006) The plant immune system. *Nature*, 444(7117), 323-329.
- Kang, C.H., Jung, W.Y., Kang, Y.H., Kim, J.Y., Kim, D.G., Jeong, J.C. et al. (2005) AtBAG6, a novel calmodulin-binding protein, induces programmed cell death in yeast and plants. *Cell Death & Differentiation*, 13, 84–95.
- Kang, H.K. & Nam, K.H. (2016) Reverse function of ROS-induced CBL10 during salt and drought stress responses. *Plant Science*, 243, 49–55.
- Kanwar, P., Sanyal, S.K., Mahiwal, S., Ravi, B., Kaur, K., Fernandes, J.L. et al. (2021) CIPK9 targets VDAC3 and modulates oxidative stress responses in Arabidopsis. *The Plant Journal*, 109(1), 241–260.
- Karpinska, B., Alomrani, S.O. & Foyer, C.H. (2017) Inhibitor-induced oxidation of the nucleus and cytosol in Arabidopsis thaliana: implications for organelle to nucleus retrograde signalling. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society*, B: Biological Sciences, 372, 20160392.
- Kimura, S., Hunter, K., Vaahtera, L., Tran, H.C., Citterico, M., Vaattovaara, A. et al. (2020) CRK2 and C-terminal phosphorylation of NADPH oxidase RBOHD regulate reactive oxygen species production in Arabidopsis. *The Plant Cell*, 32(4), 1063–1080.
- Kimura, S., Kawarazaki, T., Nibori, H., Michikawa, M., Imai, A., Kaya, H. et al. (2013) The CBL-interacting protein kinase CIPK26 is a novel interactor of Arabidopsis NADPH oxidase AtRbohF that negatively modulates its ROS-producing activity in a heterologous expression system. *Journal of Biochemistry*, 153, 191–195.
- Kimura, S., Kaya, H., Kawarazaki, T., Hiraoka, G., Senzaki, E., Michikawa, M. et al. (2012) Protein phosphorylation is a prerequisite for the Ca2+-dependent activation of Arabidopsis NADPH oxidases and may function as a trigger for the positive feedback regulation of Ca2+ and reactive oxygen species. *Biochimica et Biophysica Acta* (BBA)-Molecular Cell Research, 1823, 398–405.
- Kobayashi, M., Ohura, I., Kawakita, K., Yokota, N., Fujiwara, M., Shimamoto, K. et al. (2007) Calcium-dependent protein kinases regulate the production of reactive oxygen species by potato NADPH oxidase. *The Plant Cell*, 19, 1065–1080.

-WILEY-

- Kobayashi, M., Yoshioka, M., Asai, S., Nomura, H., Kuchimura, K., Mori, H. et al. (2012) StCDPK5 confers resistance to late blight pathogen but increases susceptibility to early blight pathogen in potato via reactive oxygen species burst. *New Phytologist*, 196(1), 223–237.
- Kolukisaoglu, U., Weinl, S., Blazevic, D., Batistic, O. & Kudla, J. (2004) Calcium sensors and their interacting protein kinases: genomics of the Arabidopsis and rice CBL- CIPK signaling networks. *Plant Physiology*, 134, 43–58.
- Kostyuk, A.I., Panova, A.S., Kokova, A.D., Kotova, D.A., Maltsev, D.I., Podgorny, O.V. et al. (2020) In vivo imaging with genetically encoded redox biosensors. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences*, 21, 8164.
- Kumari, S., Singh, P., Singla-Pareek, S.L. & Pareek, A. (2009) Heterologous expression of a salinity and developmentally regulated rice cyclophilin gene (OsCyp2) in E. coli and S. cerevisiae confers tolerance towards multiple abiotic stresses. *Molecular Biotechnology*, 42, 195–204.
- Laohavisit, A., Wakatake, T., Ishihama, N., Mulvey, H., Takizawa, K., Suzuki, T. et al. (2020) Quinone perception in plants via leucine-richrepeat receptor-like kinases. *Nature*, 587, 92–97.
- Lee, S.C., Lan, W., Buchanan, B.B. & Luan, S. (2009) A protein kinasephosphatase pair interacts with an ion channel to regulate ABA signaling in plant guard cells. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 106, 21419–21424.
- Leijon, F., Melzer, M., Zhou, Q., Srivastava, V. & Bulone, V. (2018) Proteomic analysis of plasmodesmata from populus cell suspension cultures in relation with callose biosynthesis. *Frontiers in Plant Science*, 9, 1681.
- Li, A., Wang, X., Leseberg, C.H., Jia, J. & Mao, L. (2008) Biotic and abiotic stress responses through calcium-dependent protein kinase (CDPK) signaling in wheat (*Triticum aestivum L.*). *Plant Signaling & Behavior*, 3, 654–656.
- Li, L., Xing, Y., Chang, D., Fang, S., Cui, B., Li, Q. et al. (2016) CaM/BAG5/ Hsc70 signaling complex dynamically regulates leaf senescence. *Scientific Reports*, 6, 31889.
- Li, Z., Variz, H., Chen, Y., Liu, S. L. & Aung, K. (2021) Plasmodesmatadependent intercellular movement of bacterial effectors. *Frontiers in plant science*, 12, 640277.
- Li, Z.Y., Xu, Z.S., He, G.Y., Yang, G.X., Chen, M., Li, L.C. et al. (2013) The voltage-dependent anion channel 1 (AtVDAC1) negatively regulates plant cold responses during germination and seedling development in Arabidopsis and interacts with calcium sensor CBL1. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences*, 14, 701–713.
- Ling, F., Su, Q., Jiang, H., Cui, J., He, X., Wu, Z. et al. (2020) Effects of strigolactone on photosynthetic and physiological characteristics in salt-stressed rice seedlings. *Scientific Reports*, 10, 1–8.
- Liu, H., Luo, Z., Sun, J., Huang, X., Yang, Y. & Xu, J. et al. (2022) Constitutive activation of a nuclear-localized calcium channel complex in *Medicago truncatula*. *Plant Biology*, 119, e2205920119.
- Liu, J.C., Syder, N.C., Ghorashi, N.S., Willingham, T.B., Parks, R.J., Sun, J. et al. (2020) EMRE is essential for mitochondrial calcium uniporter activity in a mouse model. JCI Insight, 5(no. 4), 1–4.
- Liufu, W., Di, M., Yingying, P., Liqiu, S. & Wenzhi, W. (2023) Nitrogen limitation and hydrogen peroxide act synergistically to enhance lipids accumulation via ROS/Ca2+ dependent mechanism in *Chlorella* sorokiniana. Algal Research, 70, 102974.
- Lu, L., Chen, X., Wang, P., Lu, Y., Zhang, J., Yang, X. et al. (2021) CIPK11: a calcineurin B-like protein-interacting protein kinase from Nitraria tangutorum, confers tolerance to salt and drought in Arabidopsis. *BMC Plant Biology*, 21, 123.
- Luan, S. (2009) The CBL-CIPK network in plant calcium signaling. *Trends* in plant science, 14(1), 37–42.
- Luo, Q., Wei, Q., Wang, R., Zhang, Y., Zhang, F., He, Y. et al. (2017) BdCIPK31, a calcineurin B-like protein-interacting protein kinase,

regulates plant response to drought and salt stress. *Frontiers in Plant Science*, 8, 1184.

- Luo, Q., Wei, Q., Wang, R., Zhang, Y., Zhang, F., He, Y. et al. (2018) Ectopic expression of BdCIPK31 confers enhanced low-temperature tolerance in transgenic tobacco plants. Acta biochimica et biophysica Sinica, 50, 199–208.
- Ma, Q.J., Sun, M.H., Kang, H., Lu, J., You, C.X. & Hao, Y.J. (2019) A CIPK protein kinase targets sucrose transporter MdSUT2.2 at Ser254 for phosphorylation to enhance salt tolerance. *Plant, Cell and Environment*, 42, 918–930.
- Ma, X., Gai, W.-X., Li, Y., Yu, Y.-N., Ali, M. & Gong, Z.-H. (2022) The CBLinteracting protein kinase CaCIPK1. 3 positively regulates defence mechanisms against cold stress in pepper. *Journal of Experimental Botany*, 73, 1655–1667.
- Ma, X., Li, Q. H., Yu, Y. N., Qiao, Y. M., Haq, S. U. & Gong, Z. H. (2020) The CBL-CIPK pathway in plant response to stress signals. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences*, 21(16), 5668.
- Ma, X., Li, Y., Gai, W.X., Li, C. & Gong, Z.H. (2021) The CaCIPK3 gene positively regulates drought tolerance in pepper. *Horticultural Research*, 8, 1–10.
- Ma, Y., Cao, J., Chen, Q., He, J., Liu, Z., Wang, J. et al. (2019) The kinase CIPK11 functions as a negative regulator in drought stress response in arabidopsis. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences*, 20, 2422.
- Ma, Y., Chen, Q., He, J., Cao, J., Liu, Z., Wang, J. et al. (2021) The kinase CIPK14 functions as a negative regulator of plant immune responses to Pseudomonas syringae in Arabidopsis. *Plant Science*, 312, 111017.
- Marcec, M.J., Gilroy, S., Poovaiah, B.W. & Tanaka, K. (2019) Mutual interplay of Ca2+ and ROS signaling in plant immune response. *Plant Science*, 283, 343–354.
- Marcec, M.J. & Tanaka, K. (2021) Crosstalk between calcium and ROS signaling during Flg22-Triggered immune response in arabidopsis leaves. *Plants (Basel, Switzerland)*, 11, 1–13.
- Marchetti, F., Cainzos, M., Cascallares, M., Distéfano, A.M., Setzes, N., López, G.A. et al. (2021) Heat stress in Marchantia polymorpha: sensing and mechanisms underlying a dynamic response. Plant, Cell & Environment, 44(7), 2134–2149.
- Maurel, C., Tournaire-Roux, C., Verdoucq, L. & Santoni, V. (2021) Hormonal and environmental signaling pathways target membrane water transport. *Plant Physiology*, 187, 2056–2070.
- Mayfield, S.P. & Taylor, W.C. (1984) Carotenoid-deficient maize seedlings fail to accumulate light-harvesting chlorophyll a/b binding protein (LHCP) mRNA. European Journal of Biochemistry, 144(1), 79–84.
- Mazars, C., Thuleau, P., Lamotte, O. & Bourque, S. (2010) Cross-talk between ROS and calcium in regulation of nuclear activities. *Molecular Plant*, 3, 706–718.
- McCormack, E. & Braam, J. (2003) Calmodulins and related potential calcium sensors of Arabidopsis. *New Phytologist*, 159, 585–598.
- McCormack, E., Tsai, Y.C. & Braam, J. (2005) Handling calcium signaling: Arabidopsis CaMs and CMLs. *Trends in Plant Science*, 10, 383–389.
- Meenakshi, K.umar, Kumar, A., Kumar, V., Dubey, A.K., Narayan, S., Sawant, S.V. et al. (2022) CAMTA transcription factor enhances salinity and drought tolerance in chickpea (*Cicer arietinum L.*). *Plant Cell, Tissue and Organ Culture (PCTOC)*, 148, 319–330.
- Meng, L., Zhang, Q., Yang, J., Xie, G. & Liu, J.H. (2020) PtrCDPK10 of Poncirus trifoliata functions in dehydration and drought tolerance by reducing ROS accumulation via phosphorylating PtrAPX. Plant Science, 291, 110320.
- Miller, G., Schlauch, K., Tam, R., Cortes, D., Torres, M.A., Shulaev, V. et al. (2009) The plant NADPH oxidase RBOHD mediates rapid systemic signaling in response to diverse stimuli. *Science Signaling*, 2, 1–10.
- Mittler, R., Vanderauwera, S., Suzuki, N., Miller, G., Tognetti, V.B., Vandepoele, K. et al. (2011) ROS signaling: the new wave? *Trends in Plant Science*, 16, 300–309.

-WILEY

WILEY - PC Plant, Cell & Environment

- Mittler, R., Zandalinas, S.I., Fichman, Y. & Van Breusegem, F. (2022) Reactive oxygen species signalling in plant stress responses. *Nature Reviews Molecular Cell Biology*, 23, 663–679.
- Mousavi, S.A.R., Chauvin, A., Pascaud, F., Kellenberger, S. & Farmer, E.E. (2013) GLUTAMATE RECEPTOR-LIKE genes mediate leaf-to-leaf wound signalling. *Nature*, 500(7463), 422–426.
- Munir, S., Liu, H., Xing, Y., Hussain, S., Ouyang, B., Zhang, Y. et al. (2016) Overexpression of calmodulin-like (ShCML44) stress-responsive gene from *Solanum habrochaites* enhances tolerance to multiple abiotic stresses. *Sci. Reports*, 6, 1–20.
- Mura, A., Medda, R., Longu, S., Floris, G., Rinaldi, A.C. & Padiglia, A. (2005) A Ca2+/calmodulin-binding peroxidase from Euphorbia latex: novel aspects of calcium-hydrogen peroxide cross-talk in the regulation of plant defenses. *Biochemistry*, 44, 14120–14130.
- Nakagami, H., Soukupová, H., Schikora, A., Zárský, V. & Hirt, H. (2006) A mitogen-activated protein kinase kinase kinase mediates reactive oxygen species homeostasis in Arabidopsis. *Journal of Biological Chemistry*, 281, 38697–38704.
- Nath, M., Bhatt, D., Jain, A., Saxena, S.C., Saifi, S.K., Yadav, S. et al. (2019) Salt stress triggers augmented levels of Na+, Ca2+ and ROS and alter stress-responsive gene expression in roots of CBL9 and CIPK23 knockout mutants of Arabidopsis thaliana. Environmental and Experimental Botany, 161, 265–276.
- Newton, A.C., Bootman, M.D. & Scott, J.D. (2016) Second messengers. Cold Spring Harbor Perspectives in Biology, 8, a005926.
- Ngou, B.P.M., Ahn, H.K., Ding, P. & Jones, J.D.G. (2021) Mutual potentiation of plant immunity by cell-surface and intracellular receptors. *Nature*, 592, 110–115.
- Nguyen, C.T., Kurenda, A., Stolz, S., Chételat, A. & Farmer, E.E. (2018) Identification of cell populations necessary for leaf-to-leaf electrical signaling in a wounded plant. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 115(40), 10178–10183.
- Nguyen, Q.M., Iswanto, A.B.B., Son, G.H. & Kim, S.H. (2021) Recent advances in effector-triggered immunity in plants: new pieces in the puzzle create a different paradigm. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences*, 22, 4709.
- Niu, L., Yu, J., Liao, W., Yu, J., Zhang, M. & Dawuda, M.M. (2017) Calcium and calmodulin are involved in nitric oxide-induced adventitious rooting of cucumber under simulated osmotic stress. *Frontiers in Plant Science*, 8, 1684.
- Niu, M., Huang, Y., Sun, S., Sun, J., Cao, H., Shabala, S. et al. (2018) Root respiratory burst oxidase homologue-dependent H2O2 production confers salt tolerance on a grafted cucumber by controlling Na+ exclusion and stomatal closure. *Journal of Experimental Botany*, 69, 3465–3476.
- Noctor, G. & Foyer, C.H. (2016) Intracellular redox compartmentation and ROS-related communication in regulation and signaling. *Plant Physiology*, 171, 1581–1592.
- Oelmüller, R. & Mohr, H. (1986) Photooxidative destruction of chloroplasts and its consequences for expression of nuclear genes. *Planta*, 167(1), 106–113.
- Pandey, G.K. (2008) Emergence of a novel calcium signaling pathway in plants: CBL-CIPK signaling network. Physiology and Molecular Biology of Plants, 14, 51–68.
- Paniagua, C., Sinanaj, B. & Benitez-Alfonso, Y. (2021) Plasmodesmata and their role in the regulation of phloem unloading during fruit development. *Current Opinion in Plant Biology*, 64(714), 102145. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.PBI.2021.102145
- Parvin, S., Lee, O.R., Sathiyaraj, G., Khorolragchaa, A., Kim, Y.J., Devi, B.S.R. et al. (2012) Interrelationship between calmodulin (CaM) and H2O2 in abscisic acid-induced antioxidant defense in the seedlings of *Panax* ginseng. Molecular Biology Reports, 39, 7327–7338.
- Pogson, B.J., Woo, N.S., Förster, B. & Small, I.D. (2008) Plastid signallingto the nucleus and beyond. *Trends in Plant Science*, 13, 602–609.

- Pugin, A., Frachisse, J.M., Tavernier, E., Bligny, R., Gout, E., Douce, R. et al. (1997) Early events induced by the elicitor cryptogein in tobacco cells: involvement of a plasma membrane NADPH oxidase and activation of glycolysis and the pentose phosphate pathway. *The Plant Cell*, 9, 2077–2091.
- Raina, M., Kumar, A., Yadav, N., Kumari, S., Yusuf, M.A., Mustafiz, A. et al. (2021) StCaM2, a calcium binding protein, alleviates negative effects of salinity and drought stress in tobacco. *Plant Molecular Biology*, 106, 85–108.
- Ravi, B., Kanwar, P., Sanyal, S.K., Bheri, M. & Pandey, G.K. (2021) VDACs: an outlook on biochemical regulation and function in animal and plant systems. *Frontiers in Physiology*, 12, 1142.
- Reddy, A.S.N., Ali, G.S., Celesnik, H. & Day, I.S. (2011) Coping with stresses: roles of calcium-and calcium/calmodulin-regulated gene expression. *The Plant Cell*, 23(6), 2010–2032.
- Roy, S., Mishra, M., Kaur, G., Singh, S., Rawat, N., Singh, P. et al. (2022) OsCyp2-P, an auxin-responsive cyclophilin, regulates Ca2+ calmodulin interaction for an ion-mediated stress response in rice. *Physiologia Plantarum*, 174, e13631.
- Ruberti, C., Feitosa-Araujo, E., Xu, Z., Wagner, S., Grenzi, M., Darwish, E. et al. (2022) MCU proteins dominate in vivo mitochondrial Ca2+ uptake in Arabidopsis roots. *The Plant Cell*, 34, 4428-4452.
- Sanyal, S.K., Kanwar, P., Fernandes, J.L., Mahiwal, S., Yadav, A.K., Samtani, H. et al. (2020) Arabidopsis mitochondrial voltagedependent anion channels are involved in maintaining reactive oxygen species homeostasis, oxidative and salt stress tolerance in yeast. Frontiers in Plant Science, 11, 50.
- Sanyal, S.K., Pandey, A. & Pandey, G.K. (2015) The CBL-CIPK signaling module in plants: a mechanistic perspective. *Physiologia Plantarum*, 155, 89–108.
- Sardar, A., Nandi, A.K. & Chattopadhyay, D. (2017) CBL-interacting protein kinase 6 negatively regulates immune response to *Pseudom-onas syringae* in Arabidopsis. *Journal of Experimental Botany*, 68, 3573–3584.
- Shao, Q., Gao, Q., Lhamo, D., Zhang, H. & Luan, S. (2020) Two glutamateand pH-regulated Ca2+ channels are required for systemic wound signaling in Arabidopsis. *Science Signaling*, 13, eaba1453.
- Shapiguzov, A., Vainonen, J.P., Hunter, K., Tossavainen, H., Tiwari, A., Järvi, S. et al. (2019) Arabidopsis RCD1 coordinates chloroplast and mitochondrial functions through interaction with ANAC transcription factors. *eLife*, 8, e43284.
- Shi, S., Li, S., Asim, M., Mao, J., Xu, D., Ullah, Z. et al. (2018) The Arabidopsis calcium-dependent protein kinases (CDPKs) and their roles in plant growth regulation and abiotic stress responses. International Journal of Molecular Sciences, 19, 1900.
- Shi, Y., Chang, Y.L., Wu, H.T., Shalmani, A., Liu, W.T., Li, W.Q. et al. (2020) OsRbohB-mediated ROS production plays a crucial role in drought stress tolerance of rice. *Plant Cell Reports*, 39, 1767–1784.
- Siddiqui, M.H., Alamri, S., Nasir Khan, M., Corpas, F.J., Al-Amri, A.A., Alsubaie, Q.D. et al. (2020) Melatonin and calcium function synergistically to promote the resilience through ROS metabolism under arsenic-induced stress. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, 398, 122882.
- Sies, H., Berndt, C. & Jones, D.P. (2017) Oxidative stress. Annual Review of Biochemistry, 86, 715–748.
- Singh, A., Yadav, A. K., Kaur, K., Sanyal, S. K., Jha, S. K., Fernandes, J. L. et al. (2018) A protein phosphatase 2C, AP2C1, interacts with and negatively regulates the function of CIPK9 under potassiumdeficient conditions in Arabidopsis. *Journal of Experimental Botany*, 69(16), 4003–4015.
- Smékalová, V., Doskočilová, A., Komis, G. & Šamaj, J. (2014) Crosstalk between secondary messengers, hormones and MAPK modules during abiotic stress signalling in plants. *Biotechnology Advances*, 32, 2–11.

- Son, Y., Cheong, Y.-K., Kim, N.-H., Chung, H.-T., Kang, D.G. & Pae, H.-O. (2011) Mitogen-activated protein kinases and reactive oxygen species: how can ROS activate MAPK pathways? *Journal of Signal Transduction*, 2011, 1–6.
- Son, Y., Kim, S., Chung, H. T. & Pae, H. O. (2013) Reactive oxygen species in the activation of MAP kinases. *Methods in enzymology*, 528, 27–48.
- Spoel, S.H. (2018) Orchestrating the proteome with post-translational modifications. *Journal of Experimental Botany*, 69, 4499–4503.
- Su, Y., Guo, A., Huang, Y., Wang, Y. & Hua, J. (2020) GhCIPK6a increases salt tolerance in transgenic upland cotton by involving in ROS scavenging and MAPK signaling pathways. *BMC Plant Biology*, 20, 421.
- Suzuki, N., Miller, G., Morales, J., Shulaev, V., Torres, M.A. & Mittler, R. (2011) Respiratory burst oxidases: the engines of ROS signaling. *Current Opinion in Plant Biology*, 14, 691–699.
- Szechyńska-Hebda, M., Lewandowska, M., Witoń, D., Fichman, Y., Mittler, R. & Karpiński, S.M. (2022) Aboveground plant-to-plant electrical signaling mediates network acquired acclimation. *The Plant Cell*, 34, 3047–3065.
- Takahashi, F., Mizoguchi, T., Yoshida, R., Ichimura, K. & Shinozaki, K. (2011) Calmodulin-dependent activation of MAP kinase for ROS homeostasis in arabidopsis. *Molecular Cell*, 41, 649–660.
- Tang, R.J., Wang, C., Li, K. & Luan, S. (2020) The CBL-CIPK calcium signaling network: unified paradigm from 20 years of discoveries. *Trends in Plant Science*, 25, 604–617.
- Tang, W., Tu, L., Yang, X., Tan, J., Deng, F., Hao, J. et al. (2014) The calcium sensor GhCaM7 promotes cotton fiber elongation by modulating reactive oxygen species (ROS) production. *New Phytologist*, 202, 509–520.
- Thoppurathu, F.J., Ghorbanzadeh, Z., Vala, A.K., Hamid, R. & Joshi, M. (2022) Unravelling the treasure trove of drought-responsive genes in wild-type peanut through transcriptomics and physiological analyses of root. *Functional & Integrative Genomics*, 22, 215–233.
- Tilsner, J., Nicolas, W., Rosado, A. & Bayer, E.M. (2016) Staying tight: plasmodesmal membrane contact sites and the control of cell-to-cell connectivity in plants. *Annual review of plant biology*, 67, 337–364.
- de la Torre, F., Gutierrez-Beltran, E., Pareja-Jaime, Y., Chakravarthy, S., Martin, G.B. & del Pozo, O. (2013) The tomato calcium sensor Cbl10 and its interacting protein kinase Cipk6 define a signaling pathway in plant immunity. *The Plant Cell*, 25, 2748–2764.
- Toyota, M., Spencer, D., Sawai-Toyota, S., Jiaqi, W., Zhang, T., Koo, A.J. et al. (2018) Glutamate triggers long-distance, calcium-based plant defense signaling. *Science*, 361(6407), 1112–1115.
- Trewavas, A. (1999) Le calcium, C'est la Vie: calcium makes waves1. *Plant Physiology*, 120, 1–6.
- Verslues, P.E., Batelli, G., Grillo, S., Agius, F., Kim, Y.-S., Zhu, J. et al. (2007) Interaction of SOS2 with nucleoside diphosphate kinase 2 and catalases reveals a point of connection between salt stress and H2O2 signaling in Arabidopsis thaliana. Molecular and Cellular Biology, 27, 7771–7780.
- Wagner, S., Behera, S., De Bortoli, S., Logan, D.C., Fuchs, P., Carraretto, L. et al. (2015) The EF-hand Ca2+ binding protein MICU choreographs mitochondrial Ca2+ dynamics in arabidopsis. *The Plant Cell*, 27, 3190–3212.
- Wagner, S., De Bortoli, S., Schwarzländer, M. & Szabò, I. (2016) Regulation of mitochondrial calcium in plants versus animals. *Journal of Experimental Botany*, 67, 3809–3829.
- Wang, B., Zhang, Y., Bi, Z., Liu, Q., Xu, T., Yu, N. et al. (2019) Impaired function of the calcium-dependent protein kinase, OsCPK12, leads to early senescence in rice (*Oryza sativa* L). *Frontiers in Plant Science*, 10, 52.
- Wang, G., Hu, C., Zhou, J., Liu, Y., Cai, J., Pan, C. et al. (2019) Systemic root-shoot signaling drives jasmonate-based root defense against nematodes. *Current Biology*, 29, 3430–3438.
- Wang, G., Zeng, H., Hu, X., Zhu, Y., Chen, Y., Shen, C. et al. (2014) Identification and expression analyses of calmodulin-binding transcription activator genes in soybean. *Plant and Soil*, 386, 205–221.

- Wang, M. & Teng, Y. (2018) Genome-wide identification and analysis of MICU genes in land plants and their potential role in calcium stress. *Gene*, 670, 174-181.
- Wang, P., Hsu, C.C., Du, Y., Zhu, P., Zhao, C., Fu, X. et al. (2020) Mapping proteome-wide targets of protein kinases in plant stress responses. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 117, 3270–3280.
- Wang, W., Zhang, H., Wei, X., Yang, L., Yang, B., Zhang, L. et al. (2018) Functional characterization of calcium-dependent protein kinase (CPK) 2 gene from oilseed rape (*Brassica napus* L.) in regulating reactive oxygen species signaling and cell death control. *Gene*, 651, 49–56.
- Wang, Y., Sun, T., Li, T., Wang, M., Yang, G. & He, G. (2016) A CBLinteracting protein kinase TaCIPK2 confers drought tolerance in transgenic tobacco plants through regulating the stomatal movement. *PLoS One*, 11, e0167962.
- Wang, Y.F., Munemasa, S., Nishimura, N., Ren, H.M., Robert, N., Han, M. et al. (2013) Identification of cyclic GMP-activated nonselective Ca2+-permeable cation channels and associated CNGC5 and CNGC6 genes in Arabidopsis guard cells. *Plant Physiology*, 163(2), 578–590.
- Wei, J., Zheng, G., Dong, X., Li, H., Liu, S., Wang, Y. et al. (2022) Integration of transcriptome and proteome analysis reveals the mechanism of freezing tolerance in winter rapeseed. *Plant Growth Regulation*, 96, 103–118.
- Wen, G.-Q., Cai, L., Liu, Z., Li, D.-K., Luo, Q., Li, X.-F. et al. (2013) Arabidopsis thaliana VDAC2 involvement in salt stress response pathway. African Journal of Biotechnology, 10, 11588–11593.
- Wheeler, G.L., Jones, M.A. & Smirnoff, N. (1998) The biosynthetic pathway of vitamin C in higher plants. *Nature*, 393, 365–369.
- Wu, F., Chi, Y., Jiang, Z., Xu, Y., Xie, L., Huang, F. et al. (2020) Hydrogen peroxide sensor HPCA1 is an LRR receptor kinase in Arabidopsis. *Nature*, 578, 577–581.
- Wu, S.-W., Kumar, R., Iswanto, A. & Kim, J.-Y. (2018) Callose balancing at plasmodesmata. Journal of Experimental Botany, 69, 5325–5339.
- Wu, X., Qiao, Z., Liu, H., Acharya, B.R., Li, C. & Zhang, W. (2017) CML20, an Arabidopsis calmodulin-like protein, negatively regulates guard cell ABA signaling and drought stress tolerance. *Frontiers in Plant Science*, 8, 824.
- Xia, X.J., Zhou, Y.H., Shi, K., Zhou, J., Foyer, C.H. & Yu, J.Q. (2015) Interplay between reactive oxygen species and hormones in the control of plant development and stress tolerance. *Journal of Experimental Botany*, 66, 2839–2856.
- Xiang, Y., Huang, Y. & Xiong, L. (2007) Characterization of stressresponsive CIPK genes in rice for stress tolerance improvement. *Plant Physiology*, 144, 1416–1428.
- Xing, Y., Wang, M., Wang, J., Nie, Z., Wu, G., Yang, X. et al. (2019) Dimerization of MICU proteins controls Ca2+ influx through the mitochondrial Ca2+ uniporter. *Cell Reports*, 26(5), 1203–1212.
- Xu, B., Cheval, C., Laohavisit, A., Hocking, B., Chiasson, D., Olsson, T.S.G. et al. (2017) A calmodulin-like protein regulates plasmodesmal closure during bacterial immune responses. *New Phytologist*, 215(1), 77–84.
- Xu, J., Li, H.D., Chen, L.Q., Wang, Y., Liu, L.L., He, L. et al. (2006) A protein kinase, interacting with two calcineurin b-like proteins, regulates K+ transporter AKT1 in Arabidopsis. *Cell*, 125, 1347–1360.
- Xu, T., Niu, J. & Jiang, Z. (2022) Sensing mechanisms: calcium signaling mediated abiotic stress in plants. *Frontiers in Plant Science*, 13, 925863.
- Xu, W., Shen, W., Ma, J., Ya, R., Zheng, Q., Wu, N. et al. (2020) Role of an Amur grape CBL-interacting protein kinase VaCIPK02 in drought tolerance by modulating ABA signaling and ROS production. *Environmental and Experimental Botany*, 172, 103999.
- Xuan, L., Li, J., Wang, X. & Wang, C. (2020) Crosstalk between hydrogen sulfide and other signal molecules regulates plant growth and development. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences*, 21, 4593.

-WILEY

WILEY <u>Plant</u>, Cell & Environmen

- Xue, L., Ren, H., Long, W., Leng, X., Wang, J. & Yao, X. et al. (2018) Ecophysiological responses of calcicole cyclobalanopsis glauca (Thunb.) oerst. to drought stress and calcium supply. *Forests*, 9, 667.
- Yan, J., Guan, L., Sun, Y., Zhu, Y., Liu, L., Lu, R. et al. (2015) Calcium and ZmCCaMK are involved in brassinosteroid-induced antioxidant defense in maize leaves. *Plant and Cell Physiology*, 56, 883–896.
- Yang, H., Mu, J., Chen, L., Feng, J., Hu, J., Li, L. et al. (2015) S-nitrosylation positively regulates ascorbate peroxidase activity during plant stress responses. *Plant Physiology*, 167(4), 1604–1615.
- Yang, J., Wu, C., Yu, Y., Mao, H., Bao, Y., Kang, Y. et al. (2018) A Mongolian pine specific endoplasmic reticulum localized CALMODULIN-LIKE calcium binding protein enhances arabidopsis growth. *Journal of Plant Physiology*, 226, 1–11.
- Yang, W., Gao, Y., Wang, X., Li, S., Zheng, H., Chen, Z. et al. (2022) Exogenous calcium application enhances salt tolerance of sweet sorghum seedlings. *Journal of Agronomy and Crop Science*, 208(4), 441–453. https://doi.org/10.1111/jac.12585
- Yang, X., Chen, Z., Yin, X., Wang, Y., Yang, Y. & Yang, Y. (2022) Genomewide survey indicates diverse physiological roles of dendrobium officinale calcium-dependent protein kinase genes. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences*, 23, 1298.
- Yi, C., Yao, K., Cai, S., Li, H., Zhou, J., Xia, X. et al. (2015) High atmospheric carbon dioxide-dependent alleviation of salt stress is linked to RESPIRATORY BURST OXIDASE 1 (*RBOH1*)-dependent H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> production in tomato (*Solanum lycopersicum*). *Journal of Experimental Botany*, 66, 7391–7404.
- Yin, X., Huang, L., Wang, M., Cui, Y. & Xia, X. (2017) OsDSR-1, a calmodulin-like gene, improves drought tolerance through scavenging of reactive oxygen species in rice (*Oryza sativa L.*). *Molecular Breeding*, 37, 75.
- Yin, X.M., Huang, L.F., Zhang, X., Wang, M.L., Xu, G.Y. & Xia, X.J. (2015) OsCML4 improves drought tolerance through scavenging of reactive oxygen species in rice. *Journal of Plant Biology*, 58, 68–73.
- Zandalinas, S.I., Fichman, Y., Devireddy, A.R., Sengupta, S., Azad, R.K. & Mittler, R. (2020) Systemic signaling during abiotic stress combination in plants. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 117, 13810–13820.
- Zandalinas, S.I., Fichman, Y. & Mittler, R. (2020) Vascular bundles mediate systemic reactive oxygen signaling during light stress. *The Plant Cell*, 32, 3425–3435.
- Zeng, H., Xu, L., Singh, A., Wang, H., Du, L. & Poovaiah, B.W. (2015) Involvement of calmodulin and calmodulin-like proteins in plant responses to abiotic stresses. *Frontiers in Plant Science*, 6, 600.

- Zhang, A., Jiang, M., Zhang, J., Tan, M. & Hu, X. (2006) Mitogen-activated protein kinase is involved in abscisic Acid-Induced antioxidant defense and acts downstream of reactive oxygen species production in leaves of maize plants. *Plant Physiology*, 141, 475–487.
- Zhang, M., Liu, S., Takano, T. & Zhang, X. (2019) The interaction between AtMT2b and AtVDAC3 affects the mitochondrial membrane potential and reactive oxygen species generation under NaCl stress in Arabidopsis. *Planta*, 249, 417–429.
- Zhang, X., Ma, C., Bao, X., Zhang, S., Zayed, O. & Zhang, Z. (2022) Perturbation of mitochondrial Ca2+ homeostasis activates crosscompartmental proteostatic response in Arabidopsis. *bioRxiv*, 1–38.
- Zhang, X.H., Ma, C., Zhang, L., Su, M., Wang, J., Zheng, S. et al. (2022) GR24-mediated enhancement of salt tolerance and roles of H2O2 and Ca2+ in regulating this enhancement in cucumber. *Journal of Plant Physiology*, 270, 153640.
- Zhang, Y., Huang, J., Hou, Q., Liu, Y., Wang, J. & Deng, S. (2021) Isolation and functional characterization of a salt-responsive calmodulin-like gene MpCML40 from semi-mangrove Millettia pinnata. International Journal of Molecular Sciences, 22, 3475.
- Zheng, X., Li, Y., Xi, X., Ma, C., Sun, Z., Yang, X. et al. (2021) Exogenous strigolactones alleviate KCl stress by regulating photosynthesis, ROS migration and ion transport in *Malus hupehensis* Rehd. *Plant Physiology and Biochemistry*, 159, 113–122.
- Zhou, Y., Ge, S., Jin, L., Yao, K., Wang, Y., Wu, X. et al. (2019) A novel CO<sub>2</sub>responsive systemic signaling pathway controlling plant mycorrhizal symbiosis. New Phytologist, 224, 106–116.
- Zhu, J.-K. (2016) Abiotic stress signaling and responses in plants. *Cell*, 167(2), 313–324.
- Zou, J.J., Li, X.D., Ratnasekera, D., Wang, C., Liu, W.X., Song, L.F. et al. (2015) Arabidopsis calcium-dependent protein Kinase8 and Catalase3 function in abscisic acid-mediated signaling and H2O2 homeostasis in stomatal guard cells under drought stress. *The Plant Cell*, 27, 1445–1460.

How to cite this article: Ravi, B., Foyer, C.H. & Pandey, G.K. (2023) The integration of reactive oxygen species (ROS) and calcium signalling in abiotic stress responses. *Plant, Cell & Environment*, 1–22. https://doi.org/10.1111/pce.14596