## THE UNIVERSITY OF HULL

# WHAT KIND OF POLITICAL SOCIALIZATION IN SECONDARY SCHOOLS IS NEEDED IN HONG KONG IN THE 21<sup>ST</sup> CENTURY?

Being a Thesis submitted for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

in the University of Hull

by

NGAI Siu Keung, George

September, 2005

#### Declaration

I hereby declare that this submission is my own work and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no material previously published or written by another person, nor material that has been accepted for the award of any degree or diploma of an university of higher learning, except where due acknowledge has been made in the text.

Signed: Date: 28<sup>th</sup> September, 2005

#### Acknowledgements

During the course of this study, I have had the support and encouragement of many people in various ways. To them all I express my deepest thanks.

First and foremost, I would like to thank Professor Mike Bottery, supervisor of my thesis, for his insightful academic guidance and unfailing support throughout the preparation of the research and his constructive comments and advices during the writing up of the thesis. I would like to thank Nigel Wright, my second supervisor, for his advices and support.

Special debt of gratitude is extended to the school supervisors, principals, teachers, students, past students and parents of the two researched schools who kindly agreed to be interviewed and contributed to the completion of this research study. I would like to thank Dr. Derek Sankey for proof reading my thesis and Dr. Percy Kwok for giving me academic insights.

I have to thank God for giving me the strength, courage and peace of mind to the work related to this thesis.

Last but not least, I have to thank my wife Bang and my daughter Cherry for their support and patience throughout my study.

#### Abstract

In 1842, when Hong Kong became a British colony, it was only a small number of remote villages. By the time Hong Kong returned to China, in 1997, it had become a major international commercial and financial centre. Under British rule, the Chinese population of Hong Kong was largely apolitical. However, people started to taste the fruits of democracy when the British were about to go. From 1997 onwards, following the establishment of Hong Kong as a Special Administrative Region (SAR) of China, many more people became actively interested in politics, as evidenced in the July 1<sup>st</sup> March, 2003.

As the relevant literature reveals, governments of different countries need to educate their fellow citizens politically in their own way, while individuals have to find their own means of survival that include being politically socialized into society. Among the different agents of political socialization, school is very important, for it socializes the students politically in a systematic way. From the literature on political socialization, and with reference to the particular situation of Hong Kong, four elements have been argued as essential to political socialization in Hong Kong secondary schools. They are: national identity and consciousness, democracy/participation, globalization, and critical thinking. This research was conducted in the form of qualitative case studies undertaken in two secondary schools in Hong Kong: one "patriotic" school which is generally supposed to be more political, and one "ordinary" school which might be expected to be more apolitical. Findings and lessons were drawn from the fieldwork.

The findings from the researched schools revealed that students on the whole are no longer as weak in their sense of national identity and consciousness as previously. The students of both schools had learnt the importance of democracy and participation. With regard to critical thinking and globalization, however, the students of both schools appeared to be rather weak. It was found that most of the interviewees including the supervisor, principal and teachers of the schools and the parents agreed on the importance of the four elements of political socialization. Hong Kong along with its schools has to find its own place in the new global era. Schools in Hong Kong have a duty to help their students develop fully the suggested essential elements of political socialization. Students have to acquire an identity as citizens in this Hong Kong SAR. The four elements identified in this study would appear to be crucial in achieving this aim.

## **Table of Contents**

Declaration		i
Acknowledgm	nents	ii
Abstract		iii
Table of Cont	ents	iv
List of Tables		ix
CHAPTER 1	INTRODUCTION	1
	The Research Questions	8
	<ul> <li>An Overview of this Thesis</li> </ul>	9
CHAPTER 2	REVIEW OF LITERATURE: CONCEPTUAL HISTORY AND DEFINITIONS	13
	2.1 Setting the Theme: Political Socialization and Education	13
	2.2 Terms Related to Political Socialization	19
	2.3 The Development of Political Socialization as a Research Topic	23
	2.4 Political Socialization in Different Ages: During Childhood, Adolescence and the Adult Years	26
	2.5 Methods of Political Socialization	28
	2.6 Agencies of Political Socialization Other than the Schools: the Family, Social Groups and Communication Media	31
	2.7 School as an Important Agent of Political Socialization	33
	2.8 Does Political Socialization Really Matter in schools?	35
	2.9 Summary and Conclusions	43
CHAPTER 3	A HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF POLITICAL DEVELOPMENT OF HONG KONG	44
	3.1 During the Early Colonial Years to 1960s	44
	3.2 From Late 1960s to 1980s	46
	3.3 The Transition Years: 1984 to June 1997	47
	3.4 The New Identity as the HKSAR: from July 1997 Onwards	51
	3.5 Some Remarks about the Nature of the Political Development	53

CHAPTER 4	A HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF THE EDUCATION SYSTEM AND THE POLITICAL EDUCATION IN SCHOOLS OF HONG KONG	56
	4.1 The Development of the Education System and Political Socialization of Hong Kong Schools	56
	4.2 The Effectiveness of Political Socialization in Hong Kong Schools	69
	4.3 Summary and Remarks about the Education System and Political Socialization of Schools in Hong Kong	81
	4.4 The Background and Development of the "Patriotic" Schools	83
	4.5 Political Socialization in the "Patriotic" Schools of Hong Kong	93
	4.6 The Effectiveness of Political Socialization in the "Patriotic" Schools	94
	4.7 Summary and Remarks about the "Patriotic" schools	96
	4.8 Orientation for the Fieldwork in the Two Types of Schools	97
	4.9 Summary and Conclusions	98
CHAPTER 5	EDUCATION IN HONG KONG IN THE 21 <sup>ST</sup> CENTURY	100
	5.1 Hong Kong: a Prosperous Economic City	100
	5.2 Political and Managerial Problems of the HKSAR Government	102
	5.3 The Nature of Hong Kong as a Metropolis: an Economic City or a Political City?	104
	5.4 Who is Going to Define the Needs of Hong Kong?	107
	5.5 Education as a Key Positioning Hong Kong for the 21 <sup>st</sup> Century	108
	5.6 The Overall Aims of Education for the 21st Century	110
	5.7 Aims of Civic Education or Political Socialization	111
	5.8 Political Socialization and the Needs of Hong Kong	112
	5.9 Summary and Conclusions	113

CHAPTER 6	ELEMENTS OF POLITICAL EDUCATION IN SCHOOLS	115
	6.1 Justifications for Devising Some Essential Elements of an Appropriate Kind of Political Socialization in Schools	115
	6.2 Some Essential Elements of an Appropriate Political Socialization in Schools	119
	6.3 Are the Elements Complementary or Conflicting? : Some Remarks and Discussions	133
	6.4 Orientations for the Fieldwork in the Two Researched Schools	139
	6.5 Summary and Conclusions	140
CHAPTER 7	RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY	142
	7.1 A Discussion of Research Strategy	142
	7.2 Theoretical Orientation of this Qualitative Research Study	144
	7.3 Case Study as the Preferred Research Design	148
	7.4 Data Collection in this Qualitative Research (Case Studies)	151
	7.5 Choice of the Researched Schools	159
	7.6 Data Management and Analysis	161
	7.7 Summary and Conclusions	163
CHAPTER 8	HOW ARE THE STUDENTS BEING POLITICALLY SOCIALIZED: CIVIC EDUCATION PROGRAMMES IN THE TWO SCHOOLS	165
	8.1 The Portrait of the Researched Schools	165
	8.2 Provision of Civic Education: Objectives, Priorities, Organization and Management	170
	8.3 Political Socialization in the Formal Curriculum	174
	8.4 Political Socialization in the Informal Curriculum	187
	8.5 Possible Influence from Other Agents	196
	8.6 Summary and Conclusions	200

CHAPTER 9	HOW EFFECTIVE ARE THE STUDENTS BEING POLITICALLY SOCIALIZED: VIEWS AND PERCEPTIONS OF DIFFERENT PARTIES	201
	9.1 Effectiveness of Political Socialization in the Schools: Views and Perceptions of Different Parties	201
	9.2 Students' Interest in News, Current Issues and Political Issues	210
	9.3 Analysis and Conclusions	226
CHAPTER 10	HOW EFFECTIVE ARE THE STUDENTS BEING POLITICALLY SOCIALIZED: THE FULFILLMENT OF THE FOUR SUGGESTED ELEMENTS (1)	230
	10.1 National Identity and Consciousness	230
	10.2 Democracy / Participation	256
CHAPTER 11	HOW EFFECTIVE ARE THE STUDENTS BEING POLITICALLY SOCIALIZED: THE FULFILLMENT OF THE FOUR SUGGESTED ELEMENTS (2)	282
		202
	11.1 Critical Thinking 11.2 Globalization	282 300
	11.3 National Identity and Consciousness vs. Democracy /	317
	Participation	317
	11.4 National Identity and Consciousness vs. Globalization	322
	11.5 Summary and Conclusions	326
CHAPTER 12	CONCLUSIONS: THE KIND OF POLITICAL	328
	SOCIALIZATION NEEDED FOR SECONDARY	
	SCHOOL STUDENTS IN HONG KONG	
	12.1 The Debate on the Needs of Hong Kong and its Nature as a Metropolis	328
	12.2 An Assessment of the Role of School in Political Socialization in Hong Kong	329
	12.3 The Elements and Requirements of Political Socialization for Equipping Future Citizens of Hong Kong and their	330

Fulfillment in the Two Schools	
12.4 Further Thoughts on the Four Suggested Elements of	334
Political Socialization: Lessons to be Drawn from the	
Researched Schools for Improvement	
12.5 Seize the Day and Forward Looking	339
12.6 Limitation of the Present Study and Recommendations	341
for Further Studies	
Bibliography	343
Appendices	
Appendix 1: Interview Questions for the Six Parties (students, teachers,	363
principal, supervisor/ chairperson of the management, past	
students and parents)	
Appendix 2: Interview Records of the Two Researched Schools	371
Appendix 3: Details about the Interviewees	372
Appendix 4: An Overview of Data Collection and Data Analysis Strategies	374

## **List of Tables**

Table 8.1	A Profile of the Two Researched Schools in September 2003	170
Table 8.2	Curriculum of School A (2003/2004)	174
Table 8.3	Curriculum of School B (2003/2004)	181
Table 8.4	Provisions of Extra-curricular Activities in School A (2003-04)	190
Table 8.5	Provisions of Extra-curricular Activities in School B (2003-04)	194

#### CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

Hong Kong was a British colony that returned to Chinese sovereignty on 1 July 1997. It now has the status of a Special Administrative Region (SAR) within China. Mr. Tung Chee Hwa took the oath of office for his first and second five-year term as Chief Executive of the SAR in July 1997 and July 2002, respectively. However, Mr. Tung eventually resigned in March 2005 and Mr. Donald Tsang became his successor in June 2005. Mr. Tsang's ability to rule Hong Kong is yet to be seen.

As a British colony, political power was tightly controlled, vested in the hands of those Governors who were directly appointed by the Crown (British Government). A group of career civil servants (originally mostly British) and a small but growing group of co-opted Chinese elites administered this colony (Tse, 1997a; Harris, 1978; King, 1981a, 1981b; Lau, 1982; Miners, 1996; Scott, 1989). However, Hong Kong was described as a secluded and autocratic bureaucratic polity (Lau, 1982). As a loosely organized Chinese immigrant society, growth was largely conceived economically. Economic success was bought at the price of accepting the status quo, a strong 'sense of political powerlessness and political inefficacy and a low level of political participation' (Tse, 1997a, p.2).

Since the signing of the Sino-British Joint Declaration in 1984, which guaranteed the return of Hong Kong's sovereignty to China in 1997, Hong Kong has

been undergoing one of the greatest political changes -- the process of de-colonization. Hong Kong's future thus becomes a big issue (Tse, 1997a). As stipulated in the Basic Law of the Special Administrative Region (SAR) of the People's Republic of China (PRC), Hong Kong will preserve the capitalist system and enjoy a high degree of self-government under the principle of "one country, two systems". It is a solemn promise made by the Chinese Government. Ever since 1997 and the return of the sovereignty, Hong Kong people have been trying to acquire a new identity -- as citizens of the Hong Kong SAR.

Hong Kong was part of China before being ceded to the British under treaty. Following the return of sovereignty, Hong Kong has been developing her own distinctive socio-economic milieu, which is quite different from that of China. In part, this is because of the economic systems of China and Hong Kong but it also results from separation of Hong Kong from Mainland China as two distinct political entities (Leung et al., 1999; Tse, 1997a). Since the 1970s, when Hong Kong's economy started to prosper, a kind of Hong Kong-centeredness has been growing and the majority of Hong Kong residents tend to view their Chinese identity as cultural rather than political (Lau, 1990; Luk, 1991).

From the 1980s onwards, there have been various attempts by some people in Hong Kong to increase political participation, though it has tended to be an immature

form of political participatory culture. However, most Hong Kong people are still politically apathetic. Many people remain at the level of spectators (Lee, 1999, 2004; Tse, 1997a). On the other hand, for those who are politically aware, their sense of political powerlessness was exacerbated as the people of Hong Kong were excluded from participation in the Sino-British negotiations. The subsequent debates between Britain and China concerning Hong Kong's social and political affairs were thus a cause of annoyance. Overall, there has been a widespread sense of political inefficacy and 'a strong feeling of political frustration and alienation' (Lam, 1992; Lau, 1992a, 1992b; Tse, 1997a, p.5).

However, on 1 July 2003, more than half of a million people appeared to gain their political voices, taking to the streets to express their concern over the bill to implement Article 23 of the Basic Law plus their general dissatisfaction with the Hong Kong SAR government's performance since the change of sovereignty. There are some who believe that Hong Kong is no longer just an economic city, it is a political city as well. It seems that people in Hong Kong, especially those middle class

I July 2003 should have been a day of celebration in remembrance of the 6<sup>th</sup> year of the return of sovereignty. However, over 500,000 people marched to the streets to express their discontents on the HKSAR government. There were several reasons for the march. Despite the inefficient policies of the government over the past six years, there was a move to pass a bill (Article 23) about treason that people suspected was an attempt to tighten the control of freedom and political rights of Hong Kong people. It was a very hot day but many people were willing to join the march. The crowd was highly praised for being very disciplined and self-controlled. Hong Kong people were regarded as more willing to express themselves in political ways by then. It served as a milestone in Hong Kong history.

citizens who formed the vast majority of the protestors, were trying to find their identity in this post-colonial city. It is the intention of the Hong Kong SAR Government and her people that Hong Kong sustains her past economic success and also be developed as a world-class city in the future, other than just being an important city of China. As remarked in an official document, 'with the political, economic, cultural and technological changes taking place in Hong Kong and around the world... there is an urgent need to provide opportunities and an environment for the people of Hong Kong to develop their potentials' (Education Commission, 2000a, p.5). People in Hong Kong are witnessing the wind of change and have to meet the challenges ahead.

Secondary school students are, of course, influenced by the broader political and social milieu of Hong Kong. Like the adults, Hong Kong adolescents have been described as politically apathetic and passive (Tse, 1997a, 1997b, 1999). Their sense of national identity and consciousness is rather weak. The civic education of Hong Kong is criticized as being "a-nationalistic" and the so-called "colonial education" is blamed (Ng, 1985; Yeung, 1993). Hong Kong students are accused of lacking civic consciousness (Tse, 1997a, 1997b; Leung, 1997). There has been public concern for political socialization, civic education and nationalistic education in schools, which are important to Hong Kong's future. It is these concerns that provide the backdrop of

this thesis.

There are a number of terms emerging in this discussion that need some initial clarification. They will be discussed and elaborated more fully in Chapter 2. The term "political socialisation" refers to the broad process of learning political attitudes and behaviour through interaction; the term "political education", by contrast, is a less inclusive term with particular reference to institutionalised forms of political knowledge acquisition. "Civic education" and "citizenship education" are frequently associated with the ideas of liberal democracy while stressing apolitical orientations. However, as civic education is the main agent of political socialization in schools and most of the school in Hong Kong have their own civic education programs, the terms "political socialization" and "civic education" are used interchangeably in this thesis. "National or nationalistic education" is regarded as a part of civic education; it might be associated with various degrees of indoctrination if it is not well conducted.

Governments of different countries will always have a need to educate their fellow citizen politically in their own ways, while individuals will have to find their own means of survival that includes being socialized politically into the society. However, these processes can be comprehended as being like some kind of indoctrination at one end, to critical thinking at another end. As Tse (1999) remarked, The content and orientation of political education varies from country to country,

and from time to time, depending on the definition of a particular political

system. Political education could be about an obedient passive subject in a despotic monarchy or an active participating citizen in a democratic polity. (p.151)

Most people believe that 'education holds the key to the future success of Hong Kong, as well as for the future success of each individual citizen' (Education Commission, 2000a, p.2). Among the various aims and objectives, students have to develop a sense of duty and responsibility to the society through some kind of political or civic education. It is then the mission of the school 'to help students become aware of both their rights and their duties as citizens and foster civic-mindedness' (*School Education in Hong Kong: A Statement of Aims*, 1993, p.19).

However, due to the long neglect of civic education, research findings have pointed to the poverty of political education in Hong Kong – it fails to fulfill the mission of preparing students for citizenship and, in turn, for political change (Tse, 1997a, 1997b, 1999; Leung, 1997). Even though efforts have been made by the Government to foster civic education in the past few years, by issuing guidelines to the schools in Hong Kong, it is by no means successful.<sup>2</sup>

The government managed to issue two official guidelines in 1985 and 1996 respectively. They were meant to provide instructions on civic education for the schools to follow. A committee of civic education comprising representatives of different sectors (including school teachers) was set up to foster civic education in the schools and the society as a whole. The government began efforts to promote civic education during the transition period and after the change of sovereignty. Some research like Tse (1997a, 1997b, 1999) point out that civic education in Hong Kong on the whole has not been

An important issue is whether the youth (including the secondary school students) will become more political or not when compared with those of the same age prior to 1 July 1997. Moreover, there is need to examine the real situation in the schools and to enquire whether students are receiving civic education or political socialization, and if they are, of what kind? Scholars of political socialization like Dawson et al. (1977) and Fairbrother (2003) believe that it is possible for students to be socialized with a responsible mind and a sense of civic duty. But one should not assume that students simply follow all the instructions of the school without holding their own, possibly different views. Thus there is a need for research that attempts to investigate how students are being politically socialized in schools in Hong Kong, drawing on actual cases.

While nationalistic education and political education for national and state identities have been rare in most of the schools in Hong Kong, there are a small number of partisan schools in Hong Kong that are exceptions. These so called "patriotic" secondary schools, which are often dubbed "leftist" or "pro-Beijing", maintain very close relationships with Mainland China. 'What distinguishes these schools is that they have traditionally supported the Beijing government's policies. During the Cultural Revolution, for instance, they rejected the formal curriculum of

very successful.

the Hong Kong education department. They have very strong links with schools in China.' (South China Morning Post, October 2, 1989) They have placed great stress on political or nationalistic education and a concern for current affairs of Hong Kong and China. Long before July 1997, they held nationalist ceremonies, raising the national flag and singing of the National Anthem, for example, during morning assemblies and on speech days.

#### The Research Questions

In general, however, schools in Hong Kong have tended to be a-political, which is related to the arrangements of the colonial government in the past, in contrast to the political socialization of the "patriotic" school, which mostly socialized their students in their own ways. In this research study, an "ordinary" school (School A) and a "patriotic" school (School B) were chosen as targeted subjects, based on the assumption that the "patriotic" schools have been more political and sensitive to political issues.

A qualitative research method was used. By using observations, document-study and detailed interviews, the researcher investigated the political socialization in the schools to see whether they have anything worthwhile for the rest of Hong Kong citizens to learn and adopt, or perhaps avoid. The research questions are:

- 1. What kind of political socialization is needed in Hong Kong?
- 2. How are the students in the schools being politically socialized?
- 3. How effective is the political socialization of the students in the schools?
- 4. What changes are needed to achieve the suggested kind of political socialization?

#### An Overview of this Thesis

This chapter, then, is the introductory chapter setting the context of this research and the division of labour among the chapters. The following chapter provides a discussion of the literature on the conceptual history and definitions of political socialization and the related terms that include political socialization, political education, political literacy, civic education, citizenship education and nationalistic education. By drawing attention to the past and previous findings and suggestions of the scholars in the field, the evolution and developments of this field of study are discussed. Political socialization is found essential for the functioning of a regime while individuals are finding their own political orientation.

As the focus of this research study is on Hong Kong, the history of Hong Kong as a British colony in the past, and as a Special Administrative Region of China for the past eight years, is traced in Chapter 3. With reference to the previous chapter, the

development of political socialization corresponding to the historical development of the political entities is also described. People of Hong Kong simply could not participate in the government or taste the fruits of democracy and were unable to develop an essential sense of national identity and consciousness under colonial rule in the past.

In Chapter 4, there is an historical overview of the education system and political socialization in Hong Kong. It is believed that schooling is an important agency of political socialization that is vital to the functioning of the society. Since the education system has stressed competition and public examination results, students turn to rote learning, which diminishes their critical thinking abilities (Tse, 1997a, 1997b). Studies have pointed out that secondary school students in Hong Kong have been politically apathetic and lack a sense of national identity and consciousness in most of the schools (Tse, 1999, 1997a, 1997b; Leung, 1997, Lau, 1982; King, 1981; Hoadley, 1970), with, perhaps, the exception of the "patriotic" schools.

Chapter 5 discusses the kind of education required in Hong Kong in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. Apart from the official statements of the HKSAR government regarding the future developments of Hong Kong, which pinpoint the need to equip the students of Hong Kong with critical minds and an international outlook, incorporating globalization and the knowledge-based economy, recent events have shown that Hong

Kong is no longer just an economic city but a political metropolis as well. Thus, students need to be further equipped to become responsible and sensible citizens for Hong Kong and the mother country, China.

In Chapter 6, based on the settings and contexts discussed in the previous chapter, it is argued that some elements of an appropriate political education are essential to the future needs of Hong Kong. It is suggested that critical thinking, national identity and consciousness, democracy/participation, and globalization are also essential parts of the political education that need to be cultivated. Hong Kong needs citizens with a clear and appropriate sense of national identity and consciousness, with the ability of critical thinking and the sense of international outlook if they are to accept the rather new identity of SAR citizens and face the challenges and chances of globalization. These all require an active involvement in a democratic society. Efforts are made here to justify the choice of the two researched schools: one being an "ordinary" school which is actually the "norm" of most of the secondary schools in Hong Kong while another one is the "patriotic" school which had been special in the colonial years of Hong Kong. Lessons on political education are drawn from them by examining the four suggested essential elements.

Chapter 7 discusses the research design and methodology of this research study.

There is a description and justification of the research methodology used (qualitative

method, case studies) in the researched schools, including a description about how the interviews were analyzed.

Results findings, analysis and discussions about the results of the case studies are included in chapters 8 to 11. In chapter 8, emphasis is placed on how the students in the schools are being politically educated, with descriptions about what the schools are doing in the formal and informal curricula, which affect the education of the students there. Chapters 9 to 11 will be used to discuss the research question of whether the students in the schools are being politically educated to an appropriate kind of political socialization, with the findings from the school documents, observations and in-depth interview data.

The last chapter (chapter 12) is a set of summaries and conclusions, making suggestions and recommendations for the kind of political education needed by secondary schools in Hong Kong in the 21<sup>st</sup> century, with reference to the research findings from the fieldwork.

# CHAPTER 2 REVIEW OF LITERATURE: CONCEPTUAL HISTORY AND DEFINITIONS

In this chapter, the concepts of political socialization and allied terms, briefly introduced in the previous chapter, are further defined and discussed. The chapter also reviews the development of research in this particular field. The political socialization of individuals of different ages and the methods of acquiring it are examined. Particular attention is devoted to the role played by schools in socializing students politically, along with other different agents of socialization, such as family, peers and mass media.

#### 2.1 Setting the theme: Political Socialization and Education

"Political socialization" is a special form of the more general phenomenon of "socialization".

Sociologists use "socialization" to describe 'the processes whereby people learn to conform to social norms, a process that makes possible an enduring society and the transmission of its culture between generations' (Abercrombie et al., 1994, p.394). Socialization is 'a process by which we learn to become members of society, both by internalising the norms and values of society, and also by learning to perform our social duties such as worker, friend and citizen' (Marshall, 1998, p.624). The term of socialization 'embodies all the ways in which the young person, through interaction

with the family and other social groups such as school, church, neighbourhood and peers group, learns and adapts to the form of belief, behaviour, social norms, political values, moral principles, which are favoured and stressed in the society' (Brennan, 1981, p.15). And, as Frederick Elkin claims: 'we may define socialization as the process by which someone learns the ways of a given society or social group so that he can function within it' (Elkin, 1960, p.4).

As concerning the nature and process of socialization, another reference can be drawn from a dictionary of sociology:

Socialization is no longer regarded as the exclusive preserve of childhood, with the primary agents being the family and school. It is now recognized that socialization continues throughout the life-course. It is also recognized that socialization is not simply a one-way process, in which individuals learn how to fit into society only, since people may also redefine their social roles and obligations. (Marshall, 1998, p.624)

According to Danziger (1971), socialization may be divided into three stages: the primary stage involves socialization of the young child in the family; the secondary stage involves the school; and the third stage is adult socialization.

In the field of sociology, socialization has been one of the primary concerns of the functionalist tradition, which strongly emphasizes its role in the operation and stable reproduction of the social order. The functionalists see socialization as all-powerful and effective. This was why D.H. Wrong (1961) called it the "over-socialized conception of man" (Abercrombie et al, 1994). As according to a

dictionary of social science:

Functionalists also tend to describe socialization as a top-down process that fits individuals into fixed roles. However, an alternative tradition is symbolic interactionism, which emphasizes the active part that individuals play in meeting, negotiating, and redefining their roles. In such a context, socialization tends to be a much more flexible and less strongly determined process. (Calhoun, 2002, p.369)

According to Hills (1982), there are different alternative perspectives on socialization, for instance, 'symbolic interactionism calls attention to the new meanings and values that can be created through socialization; phenomenological sociology views socialization in relation to modes of acquisition of common sense knowledge and interactional competence, and Marxian theory tends to consider it in relation to the concept of ideology' (p.252).

Political socialization is not the earliest and may not be the deepest form of socialisation. That is probably one's awareness of gender and ethnicity (McLean and Mcmillan, 2003). Political socialization is 'the process of learning political attitudes and behaviour through social interaction. Political socialization (and education) can be understood as a task of the political system towards individuals' (Braungart & Braungart, 1994, p.4575). Also, political socialization is 'the process by which regimes attempt to justify their rule and motivate populations behind national goals, whereby children are taught about and encouraged to form attitudes supportive of the political system and the nation' (Fairbrother, 2003, p.20). Political socialization can

also be defined as 'the structures and processes through which individuals and groups acquire their political orientations.' (Dekker, 1996, p.398)

In most political systems, 'there is a conscious and unconscious attempt to transfer political knowledge, insights, beliefs, opinions, preferences, attitudes, values, emotions, and behavioural intentions and patterns from one generation to the next generations' (Dekker, 1996, p.398). According to Fairbrother (2003), some kind of regularity and consistency in the transfer and adoption of these orientations are required, otherwise there would hardly be any stability in the political culture and political structure. These can be done 'through the construction and promotion of national symbols and myths, such as flags, emblems, anthems, and histories, which provide materials for the development of positive attachments to the nation and contribute to citizens' feelings of commonality with fellow nationals' (Fairbrother, 2003, p.21). Moreover, according to Tse (1999):

The content and orientation of political education varies from country to country, and from time to time, depending on the definition of a particular political system. Political education could be about an obedient passive subject in a despotic monarchy or an active participating citizen in a democratic polity (p.151).

One of the main functions of education in most societies is to legitimise and maintain the political system although the way this function is carried out may vary widely from one society to the next. For instance, 'in totalitarian societies education goes beyond the system maintenance function to indoctrinating the younger

generation into the "correct" political thinking, with the educational system acting as some kind of social and political control.' (Braungart & Braungart, 1994, p.4576) (One has to admit that it is also the practice in Mainland China right now.) In societies undergoing transformation, such as Eastern European nations, education may be directed toward a form of "system creation". In most democratic societies, one of the most important tasks of schools is to produce some kind of 'informed, critical, competent and active citizens' (Braungart & Braungart, 1994, p.4576). It can be comprehended as some kind of indoctrination at one end to critical thinking at another end of the spectrum.

Heater (2004) quotes an epigram from Aristotle's *Politics*, 'the citizens of a state should always be educated to suit the constitution of a state' (Aristotle, 1948: 1377aII) and claims that there can be no doubt that the practices of citizenship education or political education have been concerned with the stability of the state, no matter whether in ancient Sparta and Athens, in the France of the Third Republic or the Germany of the Third Reich. Again, the Chinese Government often claims that the stability of the state should be of utmost importance.

On the other hand, 'individuals can be helped by political socialization to understand patterns of both similarities and differences in political outlooks among the constituents of a given system, and developments and disseminations of

consensus values or common outlooks' (Dawson et al, 1977, p.11). One has to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in different kinds of socializations, which include the aspect of political socialization in order to survive in the specific society.

The phases "political socialization" and "political education" have been used loosely and interchangeably, as if they have the same meaning (Tse, 1997a, 1997b, 1999). It is necessary to make a distinction between them:

"Political education" refers to institutionalized forms of political knowledge acquisition, which take place within formal educational frameworks (such as schools and universities) and informal education frameworks (such as youth movements). It is less inclusive than "political socialization", which consists of learning processes both planned and unintentional, at every stage of an individual's life, and within a great variety of social contexts (Ichilov, 1994, p.4568).

#### As Tse (1997b) remarked,

First, political education is less inclusive than political socialization, which consists of learning processes both planned and unintentional, at every stage of individual's life, and within a great variety of social contexts. Second, it differs from political socialization in its deliberate nature and institutionalized form. Third, school is but one of many agents of political socialization and political education. (p.3)

In such a way, 'political socialization is a broad phenomenon about the transmission and learning of political knowledge, attitudes, socio-political norms and values for the members of a political community' (Tse, 1997b, p.3), whereas political education can be regarded as a part of it. This thesis adopts the term "political socialization" (instead of "political education") for it is more inclusive and thus more

appropriate, given the nature of this research study.

This thesis aims to examine the condition of political socialization in two Hong Kong secondary schools.

#### 2.2 Terms Related to Political Socialization

Political socialization and political education are often used interchangeably with "civic education", "citizenship education", and "political literacy" (Ichilov, 1994) and even "nationalistic education". Political education (or political socialization) is also commonly called civic education or citizenship education, especially in the US literature (Tse, 1999).

Civic education is broadly concerned with the development of citizenship or civic competence by conveying the unique meaning, obligation, and virtue of citizenship in a particular society or the acquisition of values, dispositions, and skills appropriate to that society. Civic education includes both explicit and implicit aims, which may be conveyed through statements of educational goals, curriculum guidelines, textbook content, and teacher lesson. (Hursh, 1994, p.767)

Heater (1991) states: 'Citizen is both a status and a feeling. In educational terms, therefore, it requires both cognitive and affective skills leading to understand and use the status, and affective learning to want to behave in citizenly manner.'(p.4) Heater (1990) also argues that citizenship education is like a cube with three dimensions: element (identity & loyalty, virtues, legal or civil status, and political entitlement & social rights); geographical level (local, nation-state, regional or world); and

outcomes of education (knowledge, attitudes and skills).

According to Tse (1999), the content of citizenship education includes knowledge, values and attitudes. Group identifications for a political community are also necessary. It is essential to acquire knowledge of the history and structure of political institutions at the local, national and even global levels. Moreover, attributes like loyalty to the nation, positive attitudes towards political authority, obedience to laws and social norms, sense of political efficacy, and interest and skills concerning political participation, are stressed.

According to Morris (1997),

Citizenship education stresses commitment to the status quo, focuses more on providing pupils with appropriate knowledge about the workings of the state, and stresses the responsibilities and duties of a model citizen. (p.108)

The nature of these terms can also be summarised as follows:

Civic education and citizenship education are frequently associated with the ideas of liberal democracy. Stressing apolitical orientations, they often focus upon individuals' relations with the social / civic realm, rather than on their affinity with the political arena. Their political curriculum mainly relates to the structural, procedural, and legal aspects of political institutions, avoiding the discussion of controversial issues, and stressing consensus, harmony, and compliance. (Ichilov, 1994, p.4569)

According to Ichilov (1994):

"Political literacy" is associated with more radical traditions. It is related to ideas of participatory democracy, Neo-Marxism and left-wing politics in general... The curriculum tends to be issues-based, confronting controversial issues on the local, national, and international levels. Activity-based

teaching methods, such as role-play, socio-drama, simulations, and games are often employed. (p.4569)

As Morris (1997) remarked, sometimes, civic or citizenship education in the schools in Hong Kong include Moral Education, Sex Education and even Environmental Education. Tse (1997a, 1997b, 1999) also remarked that civic education or citizenship education in Hong Kong schools is a mixture of moral, social and political education, which even contains elements of moral virtues, moral creeds and sex education. However, it is not the purpose of this thesis to cover the areas of sex education and moral education as well. As the terms "citizenship education" and "civic education" may contain elements that are beyond the interest of this research, they are not to be used as the topic title. The term "political literacy" has not been used either, because this thesis is not aiming at association with rather radical traditions of left wing politics.

However, 'civic education is generally regarded as an important agent of political socialization in schools' (Leung, 1997, p.59); political socialization is chiefly carried out in the civic education programs of the schools. In Hong Kong, nearly all schools have their own programs of civic education. The words of "civic education" and "citizenship education" have the same Chinese meaning but most of the secondary schools in Hong Kong stick to the term "civic education". "Political socialization" is also quite a technical or academic term while "civic education" is a

term that can be understood by the teachers, students and parents. Therefore, the term "civic education" was often used to communicate with the interviewees. This thesis has to refer to these terms very often and the terms "civic education" and "political socialization" are used interchangeably.

Moreover, "national or nationalistic education" refers to 'educational programmes/curricular for and about nationalism, aimed at cultivating people's knowledge about the nation and instilling a sense of national identity, patriotism and loyalty to the nation state' (Leung, 2003, p.71). As Choi (2005) remarked, 'national education is not only the dissemination of knowledge about our nation, it tackles the issue of identity and responsibilities of all the citizens of the nation' (p.1). This can be regarded as a part of civic education or citizenship education and thus, political socialization. Whilst it may be desirable to develop a sense of national identity and consciousness among the students through education, many may feel that the installation of an extreme sense of nationalism by means of indoctrination was undesirable.

This thesis aims to study issues of political awareness of students in the particular city of Hong Kong, as she engages in the process of moving from a British colony to being a Special Administrative Region of China. The term political socialisation therefore seems to be most appropriate, and is the one that is used as the

topic title.

#### 2.3 The Development of Political Socialization as a Research Topic

According to Brennan (1981), the earlier political socialization research was largely an American product that began with Hyman's work (1959). Then there was a rapidly growing interest in political learning, which was starting with strong emphasis on mass social survey questionnaires. In the later stages, some more refined techniques were used.

According to Hahn (1998), research on political learning or education tends to fall into two traditions – political socialization and a cognitive development model. In the 1960s and 1970s, political socialization research was mainly associated with structural functionalist and systems theories and it focused on the macro level. It was 'concerned with the processes used to instil in individuals concepts, beliefs, attitudes and values, which sustained the political system' (p.xi). From the perspective of socialization, the importance of the family, media and schooling were identified — transmitting standard sets of attitudes and behaviours. This approach has been criticized as 'limited by its tendency to assume that young people passively receive messages from their environment' (p.xi). Leung (1997) also remarked that during the 1960s and 1970s, the consensus model was surely the most influential perspective in the studies of political socialization.

According to Hahn (1998), the second tradition is based on a cognitive development model. The focus is 'on the micro level or how individuals construct meaning about the political world' (p.xi). It stresses how individuals actively construct meaning on their own, relating new ideas to their prior knowledge and beliefs, either by assimilating new information or restructuring their thinking to accommodate new information.

This research aims to study both the macro and micro accounts of political socialization in Hong Kong, without assuming that young people passively receive messages from their environment. Efforts will be made in this research to see how individuals construct meaning about their political worlds.

According to Farnen and Meloen (2000), recent political socialization research in the US, Europe, and other places chiefly deal with the topics like 'growth of partisanship, party identifications, post-materialism (support for environmentalism, civil liberties, and self-government and the like), and economic beliefs' (p.3).

Political socialization, however, is no longer a very popular term in the research fields. According to Leung (1997), the study of political socialization has been stagnant in recent years. He quoted Scars' (1990) review of six major journals. Among the 125 issues reviewed, offering about 1000 articles, only some 14 were on the traditional topics of political socialization research. One of the reasons might be

due to the fact that 'political socialization research has not been able to determine completely the relative importance of the various factors and the interactions between/among them' (Dekker, 1996, p.400) for developing various individual political orientations and behaviours in different periods of life. Efforts will be made to distinguish the relative importance of different factors and parties in this study.

The terms civic and citizenship education seem to be much more common instead even if the researchers are actually examining some very similar things. As Leung & Ng (2004) remarked, there has been a remarkable increase in interest and levels of activity in civic and citizenship education in different parts of the world. There have been many international group activities on enhancing civics and citizenship education, such as the CIVITAS Pan American in 1996, CIVITAS African in 1997, CIVITAS at Kuala Lumpur in 1998 and CIVITAS International Conference at Palmero in 1999. The International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA) has initiated an international study of civic and citizenship education knowledge and practice in schools in 28 countries. The civic and citizenship education programs have now been assigned a mission for preparing citizens of the 21st century.

Though the title here is not civic or citizenship education, this thesis also tries to address the issue of preparing future citizens of the Hong Kong SAR in the 21st

century, through an appropriate kind of political socialization.

# 2.4 Political Socialization in Different Ages: During Childhood, Adolescence and the Adult Years

The study of political socialization assumes that adult political life is rooted in childhood. A child starts some kind of politically relevant learning as he or she comes in contact with the social environment and identifies with social groups. The young child develops a sense about his or her social class, race and religion, and thus interprets and relates to the political world. The young child is beginning to develop orientations toward political authorities and roles (Dawson et al., 1977). According to Easton and Hess (1962), political outlooks are shaped during late childhood -children begin to get away from the highly personal and emotional perceptions and comprehend more abstract ideas and relationships. However, young children may only form attachments to some very concrete political symbols instead of those abstract political ideas. Because of the abstract nature of politics, primary school children may have only an initial grasp of political concepts (Braungart & Braungart, 1994).

However, with the development of abstract thinking during adolescence, awareness and understanding of political concepts and symbols increase. It is often considered as the significant stage for the formation of political values and norms.

Experience and behaviour learned during adolescence are so important that they may last a lifetime (Adelson, 1986; Braungart and Braungart, 1986).

Adolescence is a period of change and development – physically, psychologically, and socially. Adolescents are learning to be adults and acquiring social skills, forming internal standards of judgment and conduct, and developing participatory skills. Adolescence is a period of getting rid of the influence of their parents and getting on with peers. They manage to have some basic political attachment and identifications and with strong emotional feelings regarding political institutions, symbols and authorities (Dawson et al., 1977). Therefore, it is understandable that adolescence is the time when youngsters in many countries take their civic education courses and become familiar with their rights and duties as citizens (Braungart and Braungart, 1994).

The adult period of a person is not the main stage for political socialization. Adults largely maintain the basic political identifications and outlooks they acquired during the earlier years. Adult political learning involves the adoption and alteration of more specific opinions and preferences. Adults are much more influenced by events and personalities in the contemporary political world (Dawson et al., 1977).

This research will examine political socialization in two secondary schools in Hong Kong where most of the students are at the stage of adolescence. They may

develop most of their political orientations in the school settings within their secondary years.

#### 2.5 Methods of Political Socialization

Different methods regarding political socialization are suggested by scholars. For example, Hess and Torney (1967) provide four ways of political learning: the accumulation model, the interpersonal transfer model, the identification model and the cognitive-development model.

According to Hess and Torney (1967), the accumulation model 'assumes that the acquisition of political role expectations proceeds by the addition of units of knowledge, information, attitudes and activities' (p.19). It usually involves direct teaching by adults. The Interpersonal Transfer Model 'assumes that the child approach explicit political socialization already possessing a fund of experience in interpersonal relationships' (p.20), such as in the family or in the school as he or she has developed different levels of relationships to figures of authority. For example, one may see the President's power over the country as if his or her father's power in the family. The identification model 'stresses the child's imitation of the behaviour of some significant other person' (p.21), such as a parent or a teacher. This explains why a child tends to adopt his or her parents' political stance. The cognitive-development

model 'assumes that the capacity to deal with certain kinds of concepts and information set limits on the understanding that can be acquired of political phenomena' (p.21) – it may not be possible to teach a child a given concept if it is too complex and abstract. The suggested methods are able to describe most of the political learning patterns that we can think of.

Some scholars like Dekker (1996) and Dawson et al. (1977) try to identify two general formations of political socialization: (1) direct and (2) indirect forms of political learning.

Direct socialization is defined as 'the acquisition of orientations that are specifically political in nature. Indirect socialization involves orientations which are not (in themselves) political, but which exert influence on the subsequent acquisition of specific political orientations' (Dekker, 1996. p.398).

Dawson et al. (1977) suggest several forms of direct political learning by: (1) imitation, (2) anticipatory political socialization, (3) political education, and (4) political experiences. Imitative learning may either be 'a conscious, deliberate effort, or... unconscious copying of values, and behavioural patterns from others' (p.106). The anticipatory socialization mode of learning is similar to imitation. Professional jobs or high social positions holders tend 'to take on the values and behaviour associated with those roles long before they actually occupy them... Law students

and medical students begin to think and act like lawyers and doctors' (p.108). Those with an aspiration to hold political positions would imitate the politicians. Political education applies to 'direct, deliberate attempts to transmit political orientations' (p.109). The family, the schools, political or governmental agencies, and all the other groups carry out instruction of politics. The concept of political experiences 'to some extent overlaps with the concept of political education, but the emphasis here is more on the person being socialized rather than the socializer; political experience is not randomly or evenly distributed within society' (p.110). Some people choose to be more actively and directly involved in politics than others.

According to Dawson et al (1977), the types of indirect political learning include:

(1) interpersonal transference, (2) apprenticeship, and (3) generalization. The method of interpersonal transference explains the development of orientations toward authority. The child first perceives political authorities from his or her 'earliest contact with more immediate but non-political authorities' (p.99), like the parents and then transfers the feelings to political figures. Apprenticeship consists of the 'transferring developmental experiences from the non-political to the political world ... Non-political activities are viewed as practice or apprenticeship for political activities' (p.100). Generalization is the process that 'social values are extended toward specifically political objects' (p.104) as a person's political self grows

(Dawson et al, 1977).

Some types of political orientations are more likely to be acquired through direct political learning and others through direct political socialization. For instance, identification with a political party may be a direct political learning resulted from the influence of one's family and close associates. Political predispositions such as political trust and political competence may result from indirect forms of political learning (Dawson et al, 1977).

# 2.6 Agencies of Political Socialization Other than the Schools: the Family, Social Groups and Communication Media

Research on political socialization has pointed out that the family is important in inculcating basic political attachments and attitudes in children (Dawson et al., 1977; Langton, 1969; Merelman, 1972; Dekker, 1995; Fairbrother, 2003). Children are exposed to political education through parents or family members who impose or teach particular political attitudes, intentionally or unintentionally (Greenstein, 1969). Moreover, children's political attitudes are fundamentally influenced by their family's particular socio-economic-political backgrounds, though in indirect ways. The nature and degree of their exposure to various types of socialization agents are in many ways determined by such family contexts (Beck, 1977).

Apart from the family, social groups can influence one's political thinking and

preference. One's attitudes tend to be formed, sustained and changed by the group and associational ties surrounding them. There are relationships between an individual's political predispositions and one's social and economic groupings. People tend to share common opinions with those people who have close relationships with them (Dawson et al., 1977; Hess and Torney, 1967).

In modern societies, 'the mass media are believed to be able to shape political information, transmitting political opinions and even creating particular images of political events and figures' (Fairbrother, 2003, p.22). Althusser claims that the mass media are important means of ideological control in modern society and one of the definers of our culture today (Osborne and Van Loon, 1999). Newspaper, radio, television, magazines, and other communication media transmit many types of messages that affect political orientations. As Jean Baudrillard remarked, we are now living in a post-industrial society, which is media-saturated. There is no reality but just simulations that people take for real (Osborne and Van Loon, 1999).

In Hong Kong, the mass media are an important factor in political socialization. Since 1980 onwards, the mass media have been flourishing along with economic development. In the early 1990, in terms of both quality and quantity, the mass media in Hong Kong underwent tremendous changes. There are now more new newspapers and magazines. New kinds of media are also evolving, such as Cable TV

#### 2.7 School as an Important Agent of Political Socialization

The school, just like the family and peer groups, acts as another important agent of political learning. The influence of the school may be even greater than the other two socialization agents, under some circumstances. The school influences the child and adolescent during the crucial formative years and provides the would-be citizens with knowledge about the political world and their roles in it. It equips the students with concrete perceptions of political institutions and their relationships. Usually the school transmits the kind of consensus values and attitudes of the society (Dawson et al., 1977).

As noted in the official guidelines of civic education in Hong Kong which stresses the importance of schooling in political socialization:

The school provides an organized learning experience for the population at large. Most people spend a significant length of the early part of their lives in school, where they establish and consolidate their fundamental values, attitudes and beliefs, and develop their competence. (Curriculum Development Council, 1996, p.26)

It is clear that school affects the building up of students' political characteristics in both direct and indirect ways, formally and informally. Schools manage 'to influence students' political attitudes by conveying knowledge and prescribing

attitudes through the curriculum and textbooks and also through children's participation in extracurricular and ritual activities.' (Fairbrother, 2003, p.22)

According to Dawson et al. (1977), there are three ways that the formal classroom and educational program serve as political socialization agents: the curriculum, the ritual life, and the teacher. Through courses or subjects like civics, citizenship education, national history and geography, school transmit knowledge about the nation, the political system and political processes. Besides, rituals and activities that are available at school reinforce positive attitudes toward the nation. Activities like the raising of the national flag and singing of national anthems, plus other activities and ceremonies, foster a sense of patriotism toward the nation. Teachers themselves have an important influence on students' political beliefs. For non-classroom forms, they include the social composition of the school, and extracurricular activities and student political groups available in the school.

There are, of course, other ways of outlining the processes of political socialization in a school. The formal curriculum and informal curriculum are two main divisions. In a research study on political socialization in Hong Kong schools, Tse (1997b) describes the fieldwork as formal curriculum at work (provision of subjects, syllabuses and textbooks, pedagogy, assessment, and students' curricular experience), and informal curriculum at work (school climate and classroom climate,

student organization and students' participation).

#### 2.8 Does Political Socialization Really Matter in Schools?

While many sociologists of education have recognized the socializing function of the school, the role of schooling in political socialization is still an issue of debate and controversy.

Modern education can be comprehended as a means of promoting democracy and citizenship by liberal philosophers like John Dewey, and a number of political scientists like John Cogan, Ray Derricott, Denis Lawton, Walter Feinberg and Walter Parker. As an agent of political socialization, school is an indispensable element of democratic political culture, and significant to the pertaining of a political system. Schools are important in fostering political attitudes that are positive in nature (Tse, 1997b).

However, some empirical research findings do question the effects of schooling on building up students' political socialization. As Fairbrother (2003) remarked, 'despite this view of schooling's role in fostering political attitudes, empirical research has resulted in equivocal findings on the effects of schooling on political attitudes.' (p.23) He claims that reviews on relevant empirical studies have also cast doubts upon the effects of the school experience on political orientations, whilst some

studies specifically demonstrate weak schooling effects on attitudes toward the nation. He quotes the following studies as examples. In the study conducted by Langton and Jennings (1969), the effectiveness of schooling on shaping political beliefs was doubted because of the very weak correlations between attendance in American high school civic education courses and a number of political attitudes. In the study conducted by Canieso-Doronila (1989), primary school students' attachment towards the nation (the Philippines) was found not to be strong and the schools simply failed to accomplish their mission of creating patriotic students. In the study conducted by Dougherty et al. (1992), the so-called differences in the meaning of national identity among English and Argentine secondary school students were attributed to cultural differences rather than to the direct effect of schooling and nothing to do with political socialization in school.

Fairbrother (2003) summarizes the reasons deduced from the previous research for the ineffectiveness of schooling in influencing the students to build up proper political socialization. The structures and actors of the schools are to be blamed. The political messages of the school are repetitive and duplicating those that students have already heard in earlier stages of schooling or outside the school. Thus the new information and political messages have a diminishing effect (Beck, 1977; Langton and Jennings, 1969). Teachers are unable to teach the curriculum as intended because

there are insufficient resources; teachers find themselves under too much pressure and without guidance for them to teach (Weatherley and Lipsky, 1977). Teachers do have a degree of autonomy and choice in carrying out tasks — they may teach the political attitudes in their own ways but might not be as effective as expected. Besides, students themselves may fail to grasp certain political messages and concepts (Clark and Yinger, 1979; Morris, 1995; Schwille et al., 1983; Schwab, 1983). The teaching from the schools may not fit to the needs of the students. Differences among students (both in mental capacity or intelligence) have limiting effects on political socialization efforts (Hess and Torney, 1967). Different students may receive political messages differently as they are of varying levels of interest in the subject matter. Civic and political education may not be effective as it may cause boredom among students and thus missing or ignoring the intended lesson (Dawson et al., 1977).

The studies mentioned above, which review the relative effectiveness of political socialization on individuals, largely originate from the traditional functionalist's view.

As Fairbrother (2003) remarked,

The functionalist sociological perspective characterizes societies as being based on balance among social groups, order and broad value consensus. It holds that political socialization is designed to preserve this social order and consensus and to maintain the political, economic and social status quo. Failures of political socialization are chiefly attributed to dysfunctions in the system. (p.26)

However, another school of sociologists, the conflict theorists, offers another

perspective on political socialization of schools, which is worth examining. Marxists reminds us of the prominent role of the ruling class in political socialization. The ideology of the working class is said to be nothing but "false consciousnesses". The working class believes that the prevailing socio-political system works in their interests, but in fact it works primarily for the interest of the powerful few (Leung, 1997). Antonio Gramsci provides a theory of "hegemony" (Gramsci, 1971). The idea of "hegemony" can be defined as the 'winning leadership by consent in society' (Osborne and Van Loon, 1999, p.108). It is 'an ideological apparatus which secured the consent of the dominated classes' (Abercrombie, 1994, p.189). According to Gramsci, a "passive consensus" is created in which the masses are integrated through a system of absorption and neutralization of their interests in such a way that they are not willing to oppose those of the hegemonic class (Mouffe, 1979). According to Fairbrother (2003), hegemony is 'the process by which the dominant group gains its acceptance of subordinate groups for its position and authority to direct society, a process that encompasses political socialization' (p.32). Marxists believe that the ruling class in capitalist societies not only controls the means of economic production, but also the means of mental production (Marger, 1981).

Just like the functionalist political system theorists, Neo-Marxists like Althusser,

Apple, Bowles and Gintis, view school as an effective agency of political

socialization. They argue that schools are effective in maintaining the status quo and social inequalities for the interests of the dominant class. Schooling is a reproduction of social inequalities, domination and oppression (Bowles and Gintis, 1976; Apple, 1982). Therefore, 'the school is considered as an ideological apparatus for the ongoing persistence of domination and oppression in a capitalist society' (Tse, 1997b, p.12). Rather like Gramsci, the French Neo-Marxist Louis Althusser argues that education plays an important role in spreading bourgeois ideology or reproducing the dominant culture (Osborne and Van Loon, 1999).

Neo-Marxists claim that school knowledge or curriculum is not neutral at all, which is also taken-for-granted in the tradition of political socialization studies (Tse, 1997b). School knowledge is strongly tied in with ideology of the dominant class, giving it political legitimacy (Giroux, 1983). The content messages of political education are by no means neutral. Giroux (1983) claims that citizenship education has three modes of rationality: the technical, the hermeneutic and the emancipatory. Only the mode of emancipatory, he believes, can provide students with a critique of the existing social and political order, providing suggestions for the possibility of social transformation.

Neo-Marxists also claim that the ideological transmission or the legitimization function of schooling can be commonly and easily found in the daily curricula in

school, no matter whether in the formal curriculum, hidden curriculum or invisible pedagogy (Tse, 1997b). For example, Anyon (1981) points out how history and social science textbooks favour American Capitalism, the wealthy and the powerful, and provide justifications for that. In Hong Kong, textbooks in the subject of General Studies at primary level tend to portray a utopian picture of a consensus atmosphere prevailing in the society, which is actually unreal.

Apart from the textbooks and syllabuses, the overall atmosphere of the school and classroom practices, such as the unequal power structures, evaluation methods, compulsion of work and stratification systems, all foster in students a consciousness of political and economic legitimacy. These are aimed at making students accept their future social class positions (Bowles and Gintis, 1976; Anyon, 1981).

As a critical theorist, Michael Apple (2003) claims that formal schooling is by and large organized and controlled by the government. He remarks that:

By its very nature the entire schooling process – how it is paid for, what goals it seeks to attain and how these goals will be measured, who has power over it, what textbooks are approved, who does well in schools and who does not, who has the right to ask and answer questions, and so on – is by definition political. (p.1)

Apple (2003) points out that it is true in terms of the constantly shifting role the state plays in producing and policing what counts as "legitimate knowledge", both within schools and in the larger society as well.

Apart from the Neo-Marxists, advocates of the New Sociology of Education in the United Kingdom, such as Young, Whitty and Bernstein, also contended that school knowledge or curriculum is not neutral at all. Through selection, classification, distribution, transmission and evaluation of educational knowledge, the distributions of power in the society are assigned and the principles of social control are held (Bernstein, 1971; Whitty, 1985). They point out that working-class children are in some ways deprived. Young (1971) proposes that we should question all generally accepted definitions of reality, how they have become dominant and in whose interest they are maintained.

To summarize and comment on the debate on the effects of schooling on political socialization, on one hand we should not claim that there is no relevance at all while on the other hand the actual practices or processes of political socialization in the school setting should not be taken for granted. Schooling and knowledge itself are not neutral. However, the reproduction theory put forward by some Nco-Marxists tends to be deterministic and mechanistic. It is too simplistic to assume students passively absorb the curricular messages since it simply ignores the intermediate social context where learning takes place (Tse, 1997b). In comparison, resistance and interaction studies have demonstrated the importance of human agency and autonomy in the process of reproduction (Willis, 1977; Hargreaves, 1982; Woods, 1983; Giroux,

1983). Students should not be regarded as passive subjects within the schooling experience; they are active learners instead. They are able to restructure the knowledge they receive and utilize it for their own ends (Tse, 1997b). For instance, the ethnographic study conducted by Paul Willis (1977) on schoolboys shows the active responses of the students towards their school life. Even Michael Apple, who claims the state controls the legitimate knowledge in schools, admits 'that schools themselves might generate profound effects that may block or modify the course of state formation' (Apple, 2003, p.20).

# As Tse (1997b) remarked:

School is neither a well integrated nor a homogenous agent of socialization... In the past, some theorists showed a macro-bias and remain only at societal, institutional or policy levels, and therefore touch little upon the level of school practices, or teachers and students inside the school and thus fail to demonstrate the complexity of schooling processes and actors' responses to the state's policy or institutional constraints (pp.20 and 19).

This research is based on the assumption that the school does matter in socializing students politically, but its effects should not be taken for granted. Findings from the fieldwork of this study will examine what some schools are doing in the area of political socialization. By studying the schooling settings and interviewing the different parties the effects of schooling are explored.

#### 2.9 Summary and Conclusions

It is believed that political socialization is essential for the functioning of a regime or nation while individuals are finding their own orientations through political socialization. The term "political socialization" is used in this research as the topic title, as it is more inclusive than the term "political education" and more suitable than the terms of citizenship education, civic education and political literacy in this particular study. As one of the forms of socialization, individuals are politically socialized during different ages and by different means or agents. More emphasis is placed on the age of adolescence and the secondary school settings. Even though there are debates on the effectiveness of political socialization in schools, some effects can be expected. This research will also try to deal with this query and examine the nature and settings of political socialization in the researched schools.

It is argued that certain elements are needed for the school so as to allow students to be socialized politically in a way that is found acceptable, and this will be dealt with in chapter 6 after reviewing the particular historical and educational settings of Hong Kong.

# CHAPTER 3 A HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF POLITICAL DEVELOPMENT OF HONG KONG

In this chapter, the developments of Hong Kong's socio-political milieu and political culture are traced and discussed. Hong Kong had been a British colony for 155 years; people in Hong Kong in general had been deprived of the opportunity to participate in politics. Her fortunes changed when Hong Kong moved from being a colony to becoming a Special Administrative Region. In this move, people in Hong Kong lost their previous political orientations and have to rediscover them anew, from being colonial British to nationally Chinese.

#### 3.1 During the Early Colonial Years to 1960s

Hong Kong had been part of China before it was ceded as a colony to the British. Hong Kong became a British colony in 1840s, after China was defeated in the so-called Opium War and signed an unequal treaty, the Treaty of Nanking, in 1842. It was the first treaty in which "Hong Kong Island" was ceded. In 1860, "Kowloon" was ceded by another unequal treaty. In 1898, "the New Territories" was "leased" to the British for 99 years by the third treaty.

As an official document of the Hong Kong SAR Government noted:

Hong Kong's administration followed the normal pattern of a British territory

overseas, with a governor nominated by Whitehall and a nominated Executive and Legislative Councils with official majorities. (Hong Kong 2000, p.429)

Political power was tightly controlled, vested in the hands of the Governors who were directly appointed by the Crown (British Government). A group of career civil servants (originally mostly British) and a small but growing group of co-opted Chinese elites administered this colony (Tse, 1997a; Harris, 1978; King, 1981a, 1981b; Lau, 1982; Miners, 1996; Scott, 1989). The majority of Hong Kong people were not expected to be involved in politics of any kind. Most Hong Kong people were not interested in political issues and public posts.

After the Chinese revolution of 1911 that overthrew the last Chinese dynasty, the Manchu Dynasty, and the subsequent political movements, there was a long period of unrest in China and many people migrated to Hong Kong and found shelter here.

During World War II, Hong Kong was captured and held by the Japanese for three years and eight months. People in Hong Kong suffered greatly during the military occupation. With the defeat of the Japanese in 1945, Hong Kong returned to British rule rather than to the Chinese Nationalist Government. In 1949, with the defeat of the Chinese Nationalist Government of the Chinese Nationalist Party (Kuomintang) in the civil war, a communist regime, the People's Republic of China, took control in Mainland China. The sovereignty of Hong Kong continued in the hands of the British; otherwise Hong Kong would have become part of the newly

established Chinese regime, thus not benefiting from the prosperous years of the 1980s and 1990s.

A large number of immigrants came to Hong Kong from China after 1949 so as to escape the political upheavals there. This brought a big problem to the then colonial government of Hong Kong. But eventually, the new immigrants settled down, with the result that Hong Kong became much more populated.

Between the 1950s and the late 1960s, Hong Kong was a secluded and autocratic bureaucratic polity. Hong Kong at that time has been described as a loosely organized Chinese immigrant society that could only develop in terms of the economic base (Tse, 1997a; King, 1981a, 1981b; Lau, 1982; Miners, 1996; Scott, 1989).

# 3.2 From Late 1960s to 1980s

The socio-political situation changed rapidly after the late 1960s. There was a widespread political movement in Mainland China, which was termed the Cultural Revolution. Even Hong Kong was exposed to extreme Communist propaganda; there were riots organized by the leftists in Hong Kong in 1966 and 1967<sup>3</sup>. Following the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> In 1966, there was mounting tension in Hong Kong that associated with events in China. In 1967, it developed into a series of civil disturbances, affecting all aspects of life and temporarily paralyzing the economy. The leftists in Hong Kong initiated the riots. By the end of 1967, the disturbances were contained.

serious challenges of the riots in 1966 and 1967, the colonial government developed its political structure and took a more active role in regulating economic and social affairs, also providing public services to the community (Scott, 1989). The riots had been a very important challenge to the rule of the colonial government. It made the government re-think the strategies and priorities of ruling. The government seemed to understand that she had to handle the relations with her subjects in a more cautious way. Efforts were made to improve the channels of communications with the people and the government, more provisions for the people were considered. The government was not willing to see further riots that would threaten peace and stability. It was also realized that some kind of rapport had to be maintained with the mainland. The government started to develop district offices in different regions so as to develop mutual understanding between the government and the people. It also started to build more schools and public housing for the people.

#### 3.3 The Transition Years: 1984 to June 1997

Since the early 1980s, with the signing of the Joint Declaration<sup>4</sup>, the process of

4

Joint Declaration: 'the British and Chinese Governments signed the Sino-British Joint Declaration on the Question of Hong Kong on December 19, 1984. Under the terms of the agreement, on July 1, 1997, the British Government would restore Hong Kong to the Republic of China and Hong Kong would become a Special Administrative Region (SAR) of China, enjoying a high degree of autonomy. In addition, the capitalist system and life-style of Hong Kong would remain unchanged for 50 years. To

de-colonization has proceeded. Besides, there have been measures to let Hong Kong people be involved more in politics. This transition period has initiated a lot of political changes (Tse, 1997a; Hook, 1993).

The Chinese supporters believed that as the British knew that they were about to leave the colony after some years, they were by then willing to let the people in Hong Kong enjoy even more freedom and democracy so as to make way for self-rule once Hong Kong returned to China. It is worthwhile mentioning that a series of democratic measures were passed in the early 1980s which started to allow Hong Kong people to participate more in politics, chiefly in the district boards elections.

In 1989, there was a massive political movement triggered off by the university students in Peking. Hong Kong people were passionately concerned and many actively involved as well. After years of political indifference, their awareness had been aroused, with many wondering what this would mean for the future of Hong Kong. With the June Fourth Incident<sup>5</sup>, most Hong Kong people became quiet again,

ensure effective implementation of its provisions, the Joint D

ensure effective implementation of its provisions, the Joint Declaration provided for the establishment of the Sino-British Liaison Group (JLG) and the Sino-British Land Commission' (Hong Kong Government, 1994, p.47).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> June Fourth Incident: Some historians tend to call it as June Fourth Massacre or the 1989 Tiananmen Square Incident. It is estimated that the Chinese soldiers killed hundreds of people when they were ordered to clear up the mass student demonstration in the capital of China, Beijing. The Western countries isolated China diplomatically for some time after this incident.

though the event continues to be remembered by thousands each year. It also triggered off a massive trend of migration. Many middle class people chose to leave Hong Kong and move to other places, chiefly the English speaking countries, such as Canada, USA, Australia, New Zealand and England. Under pressure from groups both in Hong Kong and England, the British government granted "Right of Abode" to some people in Hong Kong, provided that they satisfied some very strict requirements.

With the introduction of representative government, and the political reform package brought by Governor Christopher Patten in 1993 7, the scope of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Right of Abode to Britain (British Nationality Selection Scheme): After the 1989 Tiananmen Square incident, the number of persons leaving Hong Kong for foreign countries increased rapidly. Quite a number of them (about one-third) were in professional, technical, administrative and managerial occupations. To counter the outflow of talent, the Hong Kong Government had taken some measures to retain people in Hong Kong. One of them was the granting of the Right of Abode to Britain to some qualified Hong Kong people under the British Nationality Selection Scheme. To the British Government, it was a sign of gesture to fulfill some kind of moral responsibility to the to-be-returned colony, Hong Kong. The British Government adopted the British Nationality Selection Scheme to anchor 50,000 key people and their families in Hong Kong, a total of 135,000, by granting them British nationality without having to leave Hong Kong. The scheme was designed to absorb the professional, technical, administrative and managerial occupation applicants. The scheme began in December 1990. The first phase of the scheme ended on January 1, 1994. But as it was not very well received, the remaining places were distributed in the second phase. However, the scheme has not been welcoming by the Chinese Government. According to the Nationality Law of the People's Republic of China, the British Citizenship acquired by Chinese nationals in Hong Kong through the scheme will not be recognized. They are still Chinese nationals and will not be entitled to British consular protection in the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region and other parts in China.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Christopher Patten came to Hong Kong and became the 28<sup>th</sup> Governor of Hong Kong on July 9, 1992.

democratization was extended. However, the pace of democratization progressed slowly. Party politics has had an extremely short history in Hong Kong because the direct elections were only introduced to the Legislative Council in 1991 (Tse, 1999). The high-sounding reform statements by governor, Chris Patten, aroused the suspicions of the Chinese officials who stayed in Hong Kong and the top leaders in China. It triggered off a long period of "cold" relations between the Hong Kong government and China.

From the 1980s onwards, the years of colonial transition did witness obvious

He announced and claimed in his annual policy address in October 1992, a constitutional package to ensure that Hong Kong has a vigorous and effective executive-led government which is accountable to the legislature; to broaden the participation of the conduct of Hong Kong's affairs; and to devise arrangements for the district board elections in 1994 and the Legislative Council and municipal council elections in 1995 which command the confidence and the support of the community (Hong Kong Government, 1994). "Regarding the 1994 and 1995 elections, it was proposed that the voting age should be lowered from 21 to 18; that corporate voting be replaced by individual voting in all the present Legislative Council functional constituencies, that every eligible member of Hong Kong's 2.7 million-strong working population be able to vote in one of the nine additional functional constituencies; that a 'single seat, single vote' voting system be adopted for all geographical constituency elections; that all appointed seats in the municipal councils and the district boards be abolished; and an Election Committee drawing all, or most of its members from the elected district board be established to elect up to 10 Legislative Council members in 1995" (Ibid:16). The Governor claimed that he aimed for arrangements that were fair, open and acceptable to the people of Hong Kong and also were within the framework of the Basic Law so that continuity through 1997 could be achieved, that is, the so-called 'through train arrangement' (the political systems with their personsin-charge and practices will not be started as brand new but continue). However, the Chinese Government was very angry with Chris Patten and his political reforms. The arrangements were regarded as too drastic and contrary to the Joint Declaration and the Basic Law. Eventually there was no 'through train' for the SAR, most of the election arrangements had to be renewed again after 1997.

changes in the territory's political scenario (Lee, 2004). There started a growing normative orientation towards political participation, in the nature of immature forms of participatory political culture (Lau and Kwan, 1995). As Tse (1997a) remarked, 'Hong Kong people's political aloofness and apathy remained strong, and many people stayed at the spectator level regarding political participation' (p.4). Political quiescence was still the main characteristic. The society continued to operate in a depoliticized atmosphere just like the years before. This can be reflected in the low voting turn out rate in various elections (Tse, 1997a; Lee, 2004). On the other hand, the people's sense of political powerlessness became stronger as a result of their exclusion from participation in the Sino-British negotiations and the subsequent quarrels between Britain and China concerning Hong Kong's social and political affairs. Commentators claimed that there was a sense of political cynicism and political inefficacy prevailing among Hong Kong people, with a strong feeling of political frustration and alienation (Lam, 1992; Lau, 1992; Tse, 1997a, 1999). No Hong Kong leaders were allowed to be representatives to reflect the interests or feelings of Hong Kong people.

## 3.4 The New Identity as the HKSAR: from July 1997 Onwards

Hong Kong became a Special Administrative Region (SAR) of the People's

Republic of China on July 1, 1997. The Sino-British Joint Declaration, signed between China and Britain on December 19, 1984 and with the provision of the Basic Law<sup>8</sup>, Hong Kong's lifestyle will remain unchanged for 50 years after 1997. Hong Kong will enjoy a high degree of autonomy, except in foreign and defence affairs, and China's socialist system and policies will not be enforced in the SAR (Hong Kong Government, 2001). Under the leadership of the first Chief Executive, Mr. Tung Chee Hwa (Mr. Tung), Hong Kong has been ruled by a Hong Kong person, fulfilling the promise of "Hong Kong people ruling Hong Kong". Since the Asian financial crisis hit in 1997, bringing about one of the worst recessions in Hong Kong history, it has been a difficult time for Hong Kong.

People in Hong Kong in general are still not very interested in politics and all the things related to constitutional issues, except those which are closely related to the general economic situation, such as the problems of unemployment, inflation or

The Basic Law: The Joint Declaration provided that the basic policies of the People's Republic of China regarding Hong Kong would be stipulated in a Basic Law of the Hong Kong SAR by China's National People's Congress (NPC). The Basic Law Drafting Committee and Basic Law Consultative Committee were established in 1985 to undertake the drafting of the Basic Law and to canvass public views on the drafts of the Basic Law. The first draft was published in April 1988 and the second draft in February 1989. The Basic Law was promulgated in April 1990 by the NPC, together with the designs for the flag and emblem of the SAR. It will come into effect on July1, 1997. Like the Joint Declaration, the Basic Law provides that the SAR will enjoy a high degree of autonomy and that the capitalist system and way of life shall remain unchanged for 50 years after July 1, 1997. It also prescribes the systems to be practised in the SAR.

deflation, and similar matters of livelihood.

However, on 1 July 2003, half a million citizens took to the streets to express their concern over the bill to implement Article 23<sup>9</sup> of the Basic Law and their dissatisfaction with the SAR government's performance over the past six years (Ming Pao 2 July 2003). The SAR Government yielded to some of the political demands of Hong Kong people such as to stop the passage of the controversial Article 23 and the resignations of two principal officers who were unpopular. Commentators claim that the people of Hong Kong were simply discontented with the poor performances of the new SAR Government. The economic hardships, as well as the governing inabilities, prompted people to vent their discontent through political rallies and demonstrations. Perhaps, however, people are no longer as politically apathetic as before.

## 3.5 Some Remarks about the Nature of the Political Development

All in all, and as argued by Lee (2004), Hong Kong's colonial history was characterized by a strategy of de-politicization on the part of the government and by a-politicized attitudes among its people. Hong Kong itself was a territory of

The HKSAR shall enact laws of its own to prohibit any act of treason, secession, sedition, subversion against the Central People's Government, or theft of state secrets, to prohibit from conducting political activities in the Region, and to prohibit political organizations or bodies of the Region from establishing ties with foreign political organizations or bodies (p.8).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> The Basic Law Article 23 says:

immigrants from China who came to Hong Kong as refugees. The relations of Hong Kong and China had been very close since Hong Kong was just situated on the border of China and she needed food and water supply from the Mainland. Therefore, it had been obvious that the governance of Hong Kong would depend on reaching a consensus between the British, Chinese and Hong Kong governments.

During the colonial days, Hong Kong people were not expected to play an active part in the political arena; democratic elections were only granted to Hong Kong people when the British were about to leave. Actually such practice was also the normal practice of this imperial country towards her colonies like India and Singapore. In fact it is what all colonialist nations do, and is largely what is implied by colonialism, because if a colonial ruler gave democracy to the population, they might choose to vote the colonialists out.

The British were skillful in handling their colonies and British rule in Hong Kong was regarded in many ways as quite efficient. Hong Kong people in general did not feel antagonistic towards the British when they were about to leave in 1997.

## 3.6 Summary and Conclusions

To conclude, when Hong Kong was a British colony, people were not expected to participate actively in politics. Quite a number of Hong Kong people seemed to be

Government. After a three years and eight months period of Japanese rule, the British resumed her rule in Hong Kong after World War II. Political events prompted the government to grant more freedom and political participation chances to Hong Kong people. Political events over the past century and a half have been prompting Hong Kong people to demand a say and search for their political orientations. These demands continue as Hong Kong acquires a new political status under Chinese rule.

The future challenges faced by Hong Kong will be considered in Chapter 5. The next chapter will examine the development of the educational system and political socialization in Hong Kong schools.

# CHAPTER 4 A HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF THE EDUCATION SYSTEM AND THE POLITICAL EDUCATION IN SCHOOLS OF HONG KONG

In the previous chapter, it was noted that before the return of sovereignty of Hong Kong to China, in 1997, the society was highly de-politicized and little attention was paid to civic education before the 1980s. Although efforts have been made to enhance civic education, students in Hong Kong are still described as poor in political socialization. The nature of the education system is to be blamed for this as well. However, the so-called "patriotic" schools have been the exceptions – they are regarded as relatively more political than the other schools in Hong Kong.

# 4.1 The Development of the Education System and Political Socialization of Hong Kong Schools

There is a saying that civic education had never been implemented well over the 155 years of British rule, as Hong Kong was a colony rather than a political entity, people living in Hong Kong were "residents" but not "citizens" (Chan, 1996). Scholars like Kelly and Altback (1978), and Altback and Kelly (1991) even claim that it is the very nature of colonial governments to carry out alien education policies that make students unfamiliar with their indigenous culture. However, different people would have different interpretations on the nature of the colonial education system, which will be dealt with later in this chapter.

### a) Before 1984: Civic Education for Colonial Rule and De-politicization

As Morris & Sweeting (1992) remarked, the apolitical politics of the territory were closely paralleled by an apolitical educational system before the 1980s. In ways similar to the socio-political circumstances at that time, formal political education in Hong Kong was marginalized till the mid-1980s (Leung and Lau, 1993; Lee, 1987; Tsang, 1985a; Wong, 1981; Yu, 1989; Tse, 1997a).

The period of time since World War II can further be divided into two. According to Morris (1997), from 1945 to 1965, the role of civic education in Hong Kong was 'to define the nature of valid knowledge that relied on coercion and was primarily designed to counter any direct threats to the legitimacy of the colonial government' (p.109). In the period of 1965 to 1984, the nature of valid knowledge was primarily 'defined by the market, but was also influenced by a desire to avoid offending the sensitivities of the People's Republic of China (PRC)' (p.109).

In the period since 1945, Hong Kong experienced a remarkable increase in population. Schooling was mainly provided by the private sector. It included the schools sponsored by the Chinese Communist Party and the Nationalist Party (Kuomintang). These schools did not view Hong Kong's colonial status in a favourable manner. To counter the influence of such schools, the government built its own schools and encouraged the many missionary societies to establish schools in

Hong Kong. It also enacted regulations so as to suppress anything perceived as dissident in both the government and private school curricula, which aimed at countering communist propaganda and promoting the duties and commitments of a citizen to the status quo (Morris, 1997; Morris and Sweeting, 1991). As Morris (1997) remarked:

The outcome of this process was the emergence of a highly centralized and bureaucratic system of control of the curriculum in which schools were provided with official approved teaching guides and examination syllabuses, so as to ensure that the content of syllabuses and textbooks was depoliticized. (p.120)

According to Morris (1997), in the 1960s, there was a significant shift in the political and economic conditions in Hong Kong. On the political front, it became very clear that Hong Kong existed because it was tolerated by the PRC and the riots of the mid 1960s showed that Hong Kong was very vulnerable to events in the PRC. Thus, in terms of curriculum policy, efforts were made to avoid sensitive content and issues in the curriculum. On the other hand, as the economy grew with rapid industrialization from about 1965 onwards, there was public pressure to expand educational provision. In 1969 nine years of compulsory education became government policy and was fully implemented in 1978. Civics education in this period 'can best be characterized as dormant and maintaining the role it had played in the previous period' (Morris, 1997, p.111). Bray and Lee (1993) also remarked that no annual Education Department reports and white papers on education made any

reference to civics education throughout the 1970s.

On the other hand, schools in this period were busy with the task of preparing pupils for the highly academic public examinations. Morris (1997) vividly describes how 'whilst pupils (and parents) competed to get into the best schools, the schools competed to attract the best pupils' (p.112).

The subject of Civics ceased to exist as a school subject in 1965 and was replaced by a subject called Economics and Public Affairs (EPA). EPA was designed to be the main subject to provide secondary school students with a sense of political awareness. However, the EPA syllabus was essentially descriptive, transmitting factual political knowledge only. Its outcome was to cultivate politically apathetic citizens. Political participation was not stressed. Controversial political questions and any mention of China were consciously avoided. The syllabus largely concerned itself with a surface exposition of liberal democracy and some passive forms of political participation, like consultation and redress of grievances (Morris, 1992a, 1992b, 1997; Tse, 1997a).

The Director of the Department of Education was empowered to control school subjects, textbooks and all other teaching materials, and any activities in schools that might be thought to be political and preventing teachers and school authorities from imparting political indoctrination (Morris, 1997; Tse, 1997a).

Regulations 96 in the 1971 issue of Education Regulations stated that:

If in the opinion of the Director (of Education) the behaviour of any pupils is undesirable or improper or contrary to the good of the school or the other pupils, or if any pupil participates in processions, propaganda or political activities or in any disputes between an employer and his employees or in any disorderly assembly, he may, in his absolute discretion, require the supervisor and principal to expel such pupil from the school or to suspend him for such time and under such conditions as the Director may specify.

### The regulation 98 further states:

(1) No instruction, education, entertainment, recreation or propaganda or activity of any kind which, in the opinion of the Director, is in any way of a political or party political nature and prejudicial to the public interest or the welfare of the pupils or of education generally or contrary to the approved syllabus, shall be permitted upon any school premises or upon the occasion of any school activity. (2) No salutes, songs, dances, slogans, uniforms, flags, documents or symbols which, in the opinion of the Director, are in any way of a political or party political nature shall be used, displayed or worn, as the case may be, upon the occasion of any school activity except with the permission of the Director and in accordance with such conditions as he may see fit to impose.

#### Moreover, according to the Education Regulations, S92 (1):

No instruction may be given by any school except in accordance with a syllabus approved by the Director ... No person shall use any document for instruction in a class in any school unless particulars of the title, author and publisher of the document and such other particulars of the document as the Director may require have been furnished to the Director not less than fourteen days previously.

Even if political education was to be taught in the curriculum, it tended to be "subject-oriented"; the concept of "citizenship" transmitted was distorted and one-sided, because the students were alienated from their own indigenous nationality

and local politics (Tsang, 1994). As Tse (1997a) remarked, 'the transmission approach was used to transmit a passive image of citizenship that was conducive to a political culture of silence; thus the content of political education was de-politicized into some kind of "civic education for good citizens" (p.9).

All in all, the government did achieve the "a-politicization" of education successfully, which can be regarded as a kind of civic education without an active conception of citizenship (Morris, 1992a, 1992b; Morris and Sweeting, 1992; Tse, 1997a).

# b) From 1984 to 1989: Civic Education for Political Transition

Since the mid-1980s, political reform in Hong Kong was closely related to the signing of the Joint Declaration in 1984. It made way for changes in the government's policy concerning the mode of political education. Thus, there was a growing concern over the issue of "civic education" in the society as it was then considered as an important way to provide Hong Kong's future citizens with the necessary political orientation and competence to prepare for the new political changes (Tse, 1997a).

In 1984, the Hong Kong government, for the very first time, published a White Paper entitled *The Further Development of Representative Government in Hong Kong*. It clearly stated the aim was 'to develop progressively a system of representative

government ... which is more directly accountable to the people of Hong Kong' (1984, p.14). The White Paper also stated that:

Arrangements should be made for the people of Hong Kong to be educated more effectively and comprehensively in political and constitutional matters so that they will be able to understand better all the implications and complexities of proposals for the development of the system of government in Hong Kong. (1984, p.12)

It was expected that civic education would play a vital role in promoting an understanding of the new system of representative government and a concern for its successful development (Tse, 1997a).

Civic education was further advocated with the signing of the Joint Declaration in 1984. By signing the declaration, the British would end colonial rule in Hong Kong by 1997 and China would assume sovereignty over the territory and preserve its status quo for a period of 50 years. That meant Hong Kong could run its own capitalist system instead of following the socialist system of China, with the promise of setting up the "one country, two systems" policy. There were more calls and debates for using civic education to enhance nationalistic education and prepare for national integration in 1997 (Tse, 1997a; Ng et al, 2000).

In response to the changing local socio-political situations and public demand for civic education, the Hong Kong government changed its stance from de-politicization to more active on civic education in schools. One of these measures was the issuing of

The Guidelines on Civic Education in Schools (Guidelines 1985) by the Education Department in 1985. It symbolized the very first attempt by the government to promote civic education in catering for political change through schools. This document also outlined in detail the knowledge, skills and attitudes to be inculcated, curriculum contents and approaches, and recommendations to teachers on how to achieve them (Tse, 1997a; Ng et al., 2000). But it has been criticized as inadequate largely because it tended to be "conservative", "apolitical", "a-nationalistic" and "all-inclusiveness" (Lee, 1987; Leung, 1997).

Attempts were also made to revise the curriculum for the major social subjects, together with the introduction of some new subjects. The new subjects were "Liberal Studies" and "Government and Public Affairs" (GPA) in senior forms. According to Morris (1991, 1992a), who analyzed the impact of Hong Kong's return to Chinese sovereignty in 1997 on the changes in the content of the syllabuses of EPA, History, Geography, and Social Studies in the secondary school curriculum, there is an increasing focus on understanding China. For examples, the new syllabus of Social Studies in lower forms included more topics on Chinese culture and the development of the PRC, with specific reference to the Joint Declaration and the Basic Law. In History, more weight was given to the study of China, and a more politicized historical framework was adopted. Also, much more teaching materials on civic

education were distributed to schools.

The demand for better civic education was also echoed and supported by other parties in the society. They included the Legislative Council, District Boards, pressure groups and even the mass media. They set up political forums and organized civic education programs (AGB McNair Hong Kong Limited, 1987).

The other incident that both directly and indirectly facilitated civic education in this period was the Student Movement of 1989 (the June-Fourth Incident). On 4 June 1989, the People's Liberation Army suppressed students' demonstration for democracy in Tiananmen Square, Beijing. In response to the suppression, more than one million people took to the streets to condemn the military action. At that time, people in Hong Kong were highly motivated by the democratic movement in Beijing, and many Hong Kong people showed their support to the movement. Seminars, board-shows, petitions, and other activities and gatherings were organized, some in schools. Many teachers discussed this political issue with their students. Even though the enthusiasm for political education lessened as the movement was suppressed, one can say that Hong Kong people, especially students, learnt a lot from this event. It provided a good political education lesson (Tse, 1997a; Ng et al., 2000). It is still remembered by thousands of Hong Kong people, who assemble in Victoria Park on Hong Kong Island each year for a candle-lit vigil.

#### c) From 1990 to June 1997: In Search of a New Direction

There were several landmarks for political education at that time. First, the Education Regulations concerning political control were finally amended in 1990, as it became normal to talk in school about the question of political transition and related politics. Second, the implementation of reforms in school included the introduction of the School Management Initiative (SMI) in 1991 that permitted room for greater school autonomy and aimed at making the schools more democratic and accountable, as well as the promotion of home-school cooperation through the setting up of Parent-Teacher Associations (PTA). Each was regarded as relevant to civic education, though, of course, it is difficult to tell the effects on democratization these measures had (Tse, 1997a).

In 1993, the government issued an official pamphlet School Education in Hong Kong: A Statement of Aims. This was the very first time that the Hong Kong government stated explicitly its official aims for education in Hong Kong. Among the 15 aims of school education, one of them was the promotion of social, political, and civic awareness. This can be regarded as an acceptance of the importance of civic education in official and public spheres (Tse, 1997a).

In 1995, the Education Department set up a Review Committee of the Guidelines on Civic Education in Schools. A second set of "Guidelines" was published in 1996

(Guidelines 1996). Most of the parties involved in civic education tended to view this new document as a more complete conception of citizenship, in comparison with the 1985 version. It may also be noted that the importance of civic education was further stressed, as there was only one year left for the change of sovereignty (Tse, 1997a; Ng et al., 2000).

As 1997 was getting closer, there were an increasing number of debates on the orientation of future civic education. Some supporters of the Chinese government suggested strengthening nationalistic and patriotic education in schools inculcating in the younger generation a sense of national identity, pride and loyalty, plus an understanding of the Basic Law and China's policy of "one country, two systems" (Wen Wei Po, May 20, 1995, May 22, 1995; Yeung, 1993). On the other hand, bodies like the Professional Teachers' Union (PTU) and the Hong Kong Catholic Church claimed that more emphasis should be placed on democratic education instead of nationalistic education (Tse, 1997a; Ng et al., 2000; Morris, 1997; Lee, 2004).

# d) From 1997 Onwards: Starting a New Page

As Anthony Sweeting (2004), a historian of Hong Kong education, has remarked: 'probably the most important characteristics of education in Hong Kong in the years immediately after the change of sovereignty was the overall lack of dramatic or

conspicuous change.' (p.533). Reasons for this included the reassurance of the concept of "one country, two systems" by politicians and officials in the PRC, which was also echoed and amplified by their followers in Hong Kong. Under the promise of "one country, two systems", Hong Kong need not follow the practices in the mainland, whilst changes on education had already begun to take place well before 1997.

However, some argue that there is a continuing government trend to de-politicize civic education. Leung and Ng (2004) point to the dilution of the political elements by adding a lot of non-political and moral content into the civic education curriculum. They argue that political education has been substantively downsized in the new official document of 2001, *Learning to Learn: Life Long Learning and Whole-person Development*, noting its decreased share of the whole curriculum.

On the other hand, it can be argued that the new government under Mr. Tung has been explicit about the importance of education, and has stressed that patriotic education should be one of the areas to be improved. Morris et al. (2001) point out that Tung has repeatedly emphasized the need to be patriotic. Tung believes it is essential to display love for the motherland and for traditional Chinese culture. It is then seen as good to uphold values of filial piety, love for the family, modesty,

integrity, the desire for continuous improvement and collective responsibilities, while sensitive topics are to be avoided.

One can find that there are some schools that pay attention to civic education, especially fostering national identity and consciousness, but the majority is not so eager to do so. Thus most of the students in Hong Kong remain as politically apathetic as before. There are different surveys (such as the ones conducted by Wong and Shum, 1998 and 2002) reporting the general picture concerning students' views on civic education, especially the beliefs and attitudes towards their national identity and consciousness. The findings are not identical and convey mixed messages. For example, in a survey on civic awareness conducted just after the handover in 1997, young people were still found to be rather negative and cynical in civic attitudes. They still maintained a strong indigenous identity (Wong and Shum, 1998).

However, since the big rally on 1 July 2003, people in Hong Kong are not as politically apathetic as before, thus it is conceivable that the situation regarding civic education in Hong Kong schools might be changing too. Schools might be more enthusiastic about engaging students with political socialization. It would therefore seem worthwhile to conduct research to discover the most recent situation regarding political socialization in Hong Kong schools.

# 4.2 The Effectiveness of Political Socialization in Hong Kong Schools

Political socialization in Hong Kong schools has been ineffective and civic education at school level has been inadequate. The senses of national identity and consciousness, democracy/participation, critical thinking and globalisation are weak.

# a) Inadequacy of Civic Education at School level

According to Tse (1997a, 1997b) and Leung, (1995, 1997), who have been studying political socialization in Hong Kong and conducting fieldwork in the secondary schools, not all the schools in Hong Kong have had an explicit and systematic agreement upon policy or written statement about citizenship studies within the school, nor have the goals of civic education been adequately articulated in curriculum documents addressing the issue. The majority of secondary schools adopt a cross-curricular approach and only a small proportion of schools teach civic education as an independent subject (Leung, 1995; Education Department, 1986, 1987). Among the ways of implementing political education, the most frequent methods are to use school assemblies and form periods.

The two official Guidelines issued by the Government are supposed to be guiding documents for the schools in implementing civic education. However, in practice, they may only serve as references or simply be neglected. In fact, different schools tend to interpret "civic education" or "citizenship education" in their own

ways (Tse, 1997a).

For quite a number of schools, civic education is a mixture of moral, social and political education, containing ethical and moral creeds, moral virtues, political institutions, current issues, nationality and sex education (Tse, 1997a, 1997b). Tse (1997a, 1997b, 1999) uses the word "hotchpotch" to describe such a mix. Tse (1997a) remarked that:

A broad and diffused conception of civic education merely obscured the political objectives, and the overlap of moral, social and civic education lead to the subordination and, even, displacement of political education. (p.17)

According to a survey (Hong Kong Christian Institute and Action Group for Education, 1994), less than half of the responding secondary schools included political education in their current year's civic education programs. Only a few schools had a clearer and more explicit political education program. Political education was reduced to knowledge of public affairs or concern with current issues, while democratic education and nationalistic education were not stressed. To a great extent, civic education was being defined as education for the "moral" and "good" citizen, rather than a politically competent citizen. Citizenship thus becomes equivalent with good conduct and behaviour, conforming to the status quo. Tse (1997a) remarked that such possible mixing up of civic education and moral education programmes 'further enhance the tendency of moralization and de-politicization of

political education, as well as its marginal and dependent status' (p.18).

The differences in the secondary schools curriculum also reduce many opportunities for students to learn civic education. Most of the secondary schools in Hong Kong try to stream their students from Secondary 4 onwards, mainly into either science or arts classes. Students of the science classes will concentrate on subjects like Physics, Chemistry and Biology, while only the students of the arts classes will study the social subjects like History, Economics and Public Affairs, Geography and Liberal Studies which cover topics related to politics or civic education. However, even when political education is provided, the emphasis is on the cognitive aspects, rather than on a cultivation of political attitudes and skills (Morris, 1997; Tse, 1997a; Tse, 1997b).

Moreover, civic education and in particular political education, is not well regarded by the teachers themselves. Quite a number of studies (Au Yeung, 1991; Hong Kong Christian Institute, 1994; Hok Yau Shek, 1987; Leung, 1995; Morris and Tang, 1992; Wong, 1988) showed that teachers' involvement in the promotion of civic education was very low. Most of them had not read the official Guidelines before conducting civic education lessons. Many teachers had never visited the civic education resources centre of the Education Department or attended any courses or seminars about civic education. As noted by Leung (1995, 1997) and the Education

Department (1995), the implementation of civic education has to face the difficulties that arise from the lack of a clear curriculum specification, lack of time, inadequacy of teaching materials, and the very a-political culture of teachers. Many teachers are not interested in politics, and they do not put much emphasis on political education, while other teachers hold a confused conception of civic education and equated it with moral education. Some may feel it is not important at all. Moreover, form periods and assemblies are often not conducted effectively, because teachers have a heavy workload. They have to place tremendous stress on their students' performance in public examinations. Besides, the interest of their students in civic education is not high in general.

After the handover of sovereignty, there has been a more obvious talking about strengthening civic education. However, it remains a slogan rather than reality. Schools tend to define civic education in a loose manner, which is then reflected in their claims that civic education is in place in the school (Lee, 2004).

# b) Ineffective Political Socialization for the Sense of National Identify and Consciousness

Some scholars like Tse (1997a) and Tsang (1994) claim that in the years before 1997, education for national and state identity had been absent in Hong Kong schools. Nationalistic education was marginalized or even eliminated for a long period of time.

There were deliberate efforts to obscure the national image and alienate the students from their motherland, China.

According to Tse (1997a, 1997b), there was only very limited coverage of Chinese politics and recognition of national symbols so as to avoid political controversies and sensitiveness. Even though the British government in Hong Kong made no attempt to foster an identity with Britain, it did not permit the promotion of an identity with the politics of Communist China. Identification with China in the textbooks was also confined to an ethno-cultural identity or historical heritage only. In the textbooks, China was recognized as 'motherland in terms of both ethnic, geographical and historical linkages with Hong Kong, rather than the object of political loyalty' (Tse, 1997a, p.21), or just presented as a neighbouring country. According to Fan (1995) and Luk (1991), the colonial government deliberately used Chinese cultural heritage in the curriculum to counterbalance the influence of contemporary Chinese nationalism so as to consolidate its rule in Hong Kong. Besides, in the curricula of Chinese Language and Chinese History, there was little discussion of Chinese society and the PRC, while avoiding sensitive political topics such as Hong Kong's colonial status and issues concerning contemporary China in EPA, Geography and History.

As for the informal curriculum, most schools largely detached themselves from

the political environment and played down the aspect of nationalistic education without touching any rituals related to patriotism. As there were official regulations over any political activities of schools in Hong Kong, nationalistic education or political education for national and state identities was uncommon in most schools (Tse, 1997a).

Bond (1993) argues that Hong Kong students display a complex identity -- a low level of identification with Hong Kong but ascribing themselves with desirable features of traditional Chinese and modern Western identities. Hong Kong students are accused of being ignorant of their nation and state. The civic education of Hong Kong is criticized as being "a-nationalistic" and the so-called "colonial education" is blamed (Ng, 1985; Yeung, 1993).

The situation now may have improved, after the end of the colonial rule. Hong Kong students may have become more certain about their national identity. The new government under Mr. Tung has been willing to promote nationalistic education. However, there have been different surveys conducted in the past years, which convey mixed messages. In a survey conducted in 2001 by a youth organization, Breakthrough, the sense of national identity among the youth was still low, over 80% of the 655 interviewed persons tended to regard themselves as Hongkongese rather than Chinese and over 90% of them would regard the national day as just an ordinary

holiday (Ming Pao, October 1, 2001). According to Lee (2003), there were altogether 13 surveys conducted between the periods of August 1997 to September 2002 (including the one mentioned above) on this issue, the messages were mixed. However, some parties tend to claim that the situation is ever improving. As the editorial of a local newspaper remarked, 'since the handover, in survey after survey, plus the overwhelmingly positive response to the visit of the first manned mission astronaut, the people of Hong Kong have displayed a strong sense of identity with the Chinese mainland' (South China Morning Post, October 3, 2004).

As Lee (2004) remarked, before 1997 people identified themselves as Hong Kong Chinese or Hongkongese, but this has declined since 1997. Time does make a difference in shaping people's national identity after the handover. There are, however, still quite a large number of students who still tend to think they are "Hongkongese", rather than "Chinese". As there has been such a long period of "a-national" mentality, it needs much more time to turn the clock back.

# c) Ineffective Political Socialization for the Sense of Democracy/Participation

Democratic education is regarded as not so successful for various reasons, mainly due to the problems in the formal and informal curricula.

First, according to Tse (1997b), who has conducted fieldwork in six secondary

schools in Hong Kong concerning political socialization which includes looking at the daily running of the schools, the curricular objectives and contents of civic education are by no means complete, with very limited learning opportunities. The teaching materials are 'distorted, formalistic, and non-critically presented' (Tse, 1997a, p.21). The curricular objectives and topics of the syllabuses of social subjects are also evaluated as incomplete, which restricts the possibility of democratic education.

According to Tse (1997a, 1997b), there is little coverage of political education, with more non-political topics than political topics while factual knowledge overriding skills and attitudes. Even those topics relevant to political issues are 'omitted, oversimplified, trivialized, or marginalized' (1997a, p.22). The knowledge and political messages transmitted conform to a mode of "citizenship transmission", while little chance is open for discussion of political principles such as democratic principles and civic liberties issues. The textbooks also place little concern on the citizen's right to participate in government. The citizen's power to influence government is not given equal regard with that of the citizen's duties and responsibilities. According to Lee (2004), teachers generally avoid politically sensitive issues in the process of teaching civic education. They tend to deal only with general issues of environmental protection and with social affairs. Concepts of democracy and politics are rarely discussed.

Democratic education does require a democratic school climate and management styles. Tsang (1986) and Leung (1995) comment that democratic education can hardly be developed with the undemocratic school organization and schooling practices in Hong Kong environment. Other scholars echo such views. Morris (1997) claims that there is little evidence to suggest the culture of Hong Kong schools would support the development of skills associated with a kind of active citizenship. Some scholars have also described Hong Kong schools as highly autocratic (Visiting Panel, 1982; Tsang, 1985a). A published government document (Education and Manpower Branch (EMB) and Education Department (ED), 1991) even described some principals as operating like 'little emperors' (p.14). As Morris (1997) remarked:

The standard portrayal of Hong Kong schools and classrooms is in terms of the prevalence of strong hierarchical structures, rote learning, memorization and teacher centered instruction. This would suggest that patterns of classroom interaction would reinforce the de-politicized and descriptive approaches to civic education in which pupils are encouraged to recognize their duties and accept the status quo. (p.124)

School club activities seem to have a positive effect on political participation.

There is evidence that being an executive in a school club enhances one's intention to register as a voter (Cheung and Leung, 1994). Students who participate or take an active role in extra-curricular activities tend to have better civic knowledge and attitudes than those who do not (CDI, 1995). And it would therefore seem useful if students had the chances to participate in the school governance. However, Tse (1997a)

#### remarked:

There is little participation in school governance, extra-curricular activities and political activities on the side of students in school elections, clubs and societies, and service and community groups. (p.26)

According to Lee (2004), among the various extra-curricular activities found in the schools, election to the student union executive committee is probably the most common activity promoting democratic experience. Although students in those schools with student unions tend to be more vocal and take part more actively in classroom discussion, there is also evidence that even the presence of a student union shows little correlation with the students' civic consciousness (Hong Kong Catholic Education and Studies Centre, 1989; Ho, 1989).

An international survey on civic education study conducted by the International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA) comprising 28 countries or regions indicated that Hong Kong students are good in terms of civic knowledge which ranked fifth. A different picture is found in the aspect of civic participation which just reached the international mean; and the scores for the importance of social movement related activities, for citizenship and confidence in participating at school are significantly lower than the international mean (Lee, 2004).

# d) Ineffective Political Socialization for the Sense of Critical Thinking

First of all, as mentioned in the previous paragraph, the formal curriculum in secondary schools tends to be adopting a transmission approach at the expense of a critical orientation. According to Tse (1997a), for most academic subjects, it is typical that the lesson is dominated by a teacher-centred approach where teachers lecture most of the time. It is the norm for pupils to answer narrow questions and be expected to transcribe what is heard into their notebooks, without having much active involvement. On the other hand, the textbooks of the social subjects such as EPA and History merely provide a cluster of discrete topics dealing with economic and public affairs or historical facts without showing direct relevance to any reflective or critical citizenship education.

In terms of assessment, tests and examinations are particularly significant in selection and certification. However, the assessment of students' performance is still dominated by the traditional methods, like workbook, formal tests, and examination, while a more active approach or inquiry-based form of assessment, like project work, self-assessment and peer evaluation are rarely devised and utilized (Yu, 1989; Tse, 1997b). According to Tse (1997a), the format of questions focuses mainly on the cognitive domain and of low-level skills, asking for fact-recall rather than the demonstration of analytical and communicative abilities. For the sake of marking convenience, teachers would like to use conventional tests, such as filling-in-blanks

and multiple-choice. This practice places strong emphasis on factual knowledge and thus confines the scope of curricular objectives. Students are hardly likely then to develop high-order thinking skills and reasoning abilities. Such practices facilitate the transmission of factual knowledge rather than critical inquiry. All in all, Tse (1997a) remarked:

....the spoon-feeding mode of teaching like recitation, jotting notes as well as notes-oriented examinations and tests are still pervasive in a majority of lessons. Students are given little opportunity to discuss issues or practice critical thinking and actions skills, and value analysis. (p.23)

# e) Political Socialization for the Sense of Globalization

In the official documents, students in Hong Kong are expected to develop an international outlook. Senior officials in Hong Kong, like the former Chief Executive, Mr Tung, the Secretary for Education and Manpower, Mr. Arthur Li, and the Permanent Secretary for Education and Manpower, Mrs. Fanny Law, have been reminding the citizens that we are facing the challenges and chances of globalization. There is little literature concerning the data relevant to education for globalization and its relevant effectiveness in Hong Kong schools.

However, in a survey conducted by the Hong Kong Institute of Education and the charity organization, Oxfam, Hong Kong secondary school students were found to lack an international outlook in comparison with their counterparts in Shanghai. Hong

Kong teachers largely blamed the phenomenon on their own ignorance of world affairs or lack of support they provide their students (South China Morning Post, December 16, 2003).

# 4.3 Summary and Remarks about the Education System and Political Socialization of Schools in Hong Kong

Most of those who have been studying the political culture of Hong Kong Chinese like Tse (1997a, 1997b), Leung (1995) and Lau (1982) claim that "political apathy" is one of the main characteristics which also deters people from active political participation.

It is necessary to evaluate the role played by the British. Some commentators like Tse (1997a, 1997b, 1999), Tsang (1994) and Leung (1997) tend to think that the introduction of civic education by the British pre-1997 could be interpreted much more cynically as an attempt to provide a Hong Kong population with western democratic principles which would not sit well with the PRC and its idea of political education. The measure of developing the representative government in Hong Kong in 1984 could also be given a negative interpretation. There has been a saying that perhaps the British Government wanted to upset China by giving Hong Kong people practice in democracy, once it was decided that Hong Kong would become part of China after 1997. Such democratic measures were not given to Hong Kong people for

the previous 140 years before 1980s. However, it is also suggested that it was because Britain was aware that China was Communist, and like most democratic societies it was very opposed to Communism especially in the 1960's, at the height of the utterly destructive Cultural Revolution. Britain had not tried to stop Chinese people feeling they are ethnically Chinese. But they may well have tried to discourage allegiance to the Communist government in China. Based on the historical development and the subsequent measures taken by the then Hong Kong government such views seen convincing.

Concerning the development of political socialization in Hong Kong schools, the changes outlined above were consistent with the shifting policy of the government toward the role of civic education in schools. One can see that there was an active pursuit of a de-politicized curriculum in the first period, followed by the promotion of civic education in the later period. The Education Department started to promote civic education from 1980s onwards, with the issuing of two official guidelines to give instructions and suggestions to schools. However, reports conducted by the government and other bodies showed that the impact of civic education programs in schools had focused on the provision of "civic knowledge", rather than on themes related to "civic participation". In general, most of the schools do not place civic education in an important position.

The situation was poor before 1997, for which the colonial education is at least partly to blame. However, the situation has not remarkably improved since the move to "Hong Kong people ruling Hong Kong". Political socialization for national identity and consciousness, democracy/participation, critical thinking and even globalization do not seen to have been effective in most of the secondary schools in Hong Kong.

# 4.4 The Background and Development of the "Patriotic" Schools

After examining the development of the political culture in Hong Kong and the political socialization in Hong Kong schools, it is important to look at schools that have been outside the situation described above. The history and settings of the so-called "patriotic" schools are therefore examined.

While nationalistic education and political education for national and state identities has been rare in most of the schools in Hong Kong, there are a small number of partisan schools in Hong Kong, which are the exceptions. These are the so-called "patriotic" ("leftist", "pro Beijing" / "pro-Communist") secondary schools that maintain very close relationship with Mainland China. There are now five secondary schools of this kind – Pui Kiu Middle School, Fukien Secondary School (formerly Fukien Middle School), Hon Wah Middle School, Mongkok Workers' Children Middle School and Heung To Middle School. What distinguishes these schools is that

they have traditionally supported the Beijing government's policies. We now examine the evolution and development of these schools and the forms of political socialization found there.

Before the setting up of the People's Republic of China (PRC) in 1949, the education system of Hong Kong had close relations with Mainland China, even though it was under the British colonial rule. Many students who wished to further their studies would consider going to the universities or other tertiary institutions in the mainland (Sweeting, 1990; Ng, 1984). However, after the setting up of the communist regime in China, this connection was no longer available. The border between Hong Kong and Mainland China was not opened for free-entry into China (Choi, 1990). Moreover, according to Choi (1990), 'with the outbreak of the Korean War in 1950 and the intensification of the Cold War, Hong Kong became a major stronghold for the western bloc in southeast Asia, right at the doorstep of a recently established Chinese communist state' (p.85).

According to Ip (1994), only the "patriotic" schools managed to maintain close ties with the Communist China. They had been 'quite detached from the mainstream of the colony's school system' (p.32) for decades. They became a special form of school in this small colony of Hong Kong.

# a) 1945-49: Creation of the Schools

The history of the "patriotic" school begins in 1945, just after the surrender of Japan in the Second World War. During the period of the civil war (1945-1949) between the Nationalist Party (Kuomintang) and the communists, quite a number of pro-Communist liberals from the mainland and other areas gathered in Hong Kong to establish new schools. According to Gu (1992), the following schools were established in a few years. They were Hon Wah Middle School (1945), Pui Kiu Middle School (1946), Heung To Middle School (1946) and Mongkok Workers' Children School (1946). At that time, these schools called themselves "progressive schools". They formed a small but distinguishable group of schools. Their aim was very clear -- to nurture the young generation to make contributions to the mother country (Ip, 1994).

# b) 1949-66: Segregation from the Main Stream of Hong Kong's Schools

The People's Republic of China was born in the year of 1949 and these schools then openly declared their political standpoint. The schools celebrated the communist takeover, which certainly alarmed the British. As mentioned in the previous section, the Hong Kong government adopted a policy of "counter-communist education" by introducing new measures to tighten control over all schools. Before then, the Hong Kong government did not care or intervene much in the colony's educational affairs.

Also, as Ip (1994) remarked, it could be comprehended as driven by "the Cold War mentality" (p.35) that the Hong Kong government tried its best to stop communist ideologies from spreading to the colony. In fact, according to Sweeting (1989, 1993), a pro-communist tertiary institution, Tat Tak Institute, was already ordered by the government to close down in February 1949, well before the setting up of the communist regime in China.

Despite "counter-communism" measures, the left-wing schools began to call themselves "patriotic" schools so as to distinguish themselves from the majority of schools that were apolitical. They had clashes with the anti-communist government as they used different textbooks and hoisted national flags in their school premises. In 1950s, two principals of the "patriotic" schools were accused of communist connection and forced to leave Hong Kong. Such pressure from the government resulted in the "patriotic" schools taking efforts to strengthen themselves. They developed their own education and life style practices. According to Ip (1994), the teachers' salaries were comparatively low, but 'they were still willing to live a hard life and donate much of their savings and salaries to buy national bonds<sup>10</sup> for the

National bonds: When the regime of the PRC was first established in 1949, the new government confronted an extreme shortage of fiscal revenues in order to establish the country. In the period of 1949 to 1957, the government financed deficits through both domestic and foreign borrowing – national bond issuance and borrowing money from the USSR. People were encouraged to buy national bonds as a way to "save the country".

benefits of the mother country' (p.36). Besides, their teaching methods were also affected by the norms on the mainland, such as practising collaborative lesson planning by teachers. All these appeared strange to other teachers in Hong Kong.

# c) 1967-1976: Confrontation

The political movement called the Great Cultural Revolution lasted in China for ten years, from 1967 to 1976. It was a disaster for China. Hong Kong was also seriously affected by this event especially during the 1967 riots. The leftist trade unions organized strikes, demonstrations and public gatherings and even produced bombs. The leftist schools did play a part on these activities. Eventually, there was an open appeal to the Hong Kong students to participate in the struggle against the colonial government, in alliance with workers and farmers (Ip, 1994). It was reported that pupils of leftist schools were 'involved in street demonstrations, in the writing, dissemination and display of inflammatory posters, and in the planting of bombs, both simulated and real' (Education Department, 1968, p.9).

In addition, a "student committee" was set up in 1967 that subordinated itself to the "Hong Kong and Kowloon Compatriots' Committee for Struggling against Suppression". It was tightly connected with the Chinese Communist Party (CCP). The "students committee" issued a public statement on November 8, 1967 attacking the

colonial government, labelling the Hong Kong education system as "slavery education" (Ip, 1994).

In November 1967, the Chung Wah Middle School was accused of being used as a workplace to make bombs and was ordered to close by the government. Its principal was arrested and expelled out of Hong Kong (Wah Kiu Yat Pao, November 29, 1967).

In this period, the "patriotic" schools adopted the following measures: refusing to use local ordinary textbooks but setting high priority in studying the works of Chairman Mao Zedong. They also read "leftist" newspapers every day during the class periods and discussed politics from time to time. Most of the students refused to participate in the School Certificate Examination (the main public examination in Hong Kong which was equivalent to the British ordinary level examination), as a sign of boycotting the colonial "slavery education" system. However, it was also an expansion period for the "patriotic" schools. It was reported that at its highest point there were about 10,000 students in one single "patriotic" school, Heung To. It was the peak of the "patriotic" schools movement (Ip, 1994).

# d) 1976-1991: Downfall and Re-integration

In 1976, there was another very great political event in China: the "Gang of Four" was bought down. It marked the end of the Cultural Revolution and led to an

anticipated ideological collapse among the "leftists" in Hong Kong including the teachers, administrative staffs, students and parents of the "patriotic" schools. As Choi (1990) remarked, it had a devastating effect on the local student movement as well; 'a phase of de-politicisation rapidly set in, and the student movement subsided' (p.82). A sense of disillusionment prevailed. Many teachers abandoned their previous political orientation and left the schools.

At the same time, there were changes to the education provisions in Hong Kong. The original six-year free and compulsory education was expanded to nine-years, from 1978, which included lower secondary level. The Government introduced the so-called 'Bought Place Scheme' so as to increase the necessary enrolment places for students (Postiglione, 1992). There were many more available places for secondary school students. This created a big challenge to the "patriotic" schools as parents who were not zealous in politics as before preferred to send their children to subsidized schools or Bought Place private schools instead, where school fees were cheaper and providing better prospect for students. Some smaller leftist schools were

\_

Bought Place Scheme was a scheme to increase the number of subsided secondary school places for students of Hong Kong. As the nine-year-free and compulsory education policy was fully enforced in 1978 and there were not enough places for all students of relevant ages. At the end of the primary course, pupils were allocated to government or aided secondary schools, or to private schools with bought places. The Secondary School Places Allocation System was based on internal school assessments, scaled by a centrally administered academic aptitude test, and on parental choice. As the relations of the then Hong Kong Government with the "patriotic" schools were no good, the places offered by them would normally not be "bought" by the then Education Department.

forced to close down while the remaining ones had to downsize. There were six leftist schools that existed in the 1980s (Ip, 1994).

However, starting from the 1980s, China started to adopt an open door policy in its economy while there was the signing up of the Sino-British Joint Declaration on the future of Hong Kong in 1984. There was a better relationship between the PRC and Hong Kong government. According to the principal of a "patriotic" school who has been interviewed by this researcher, graduates from these schools were unable to enrol in police and teacher training colleges until 1989 when the ban was lifted. This was a sign of improved relations. As a leading newspaper in Hong Kong remarked, the leftist schools became less radical in attacking the colonial rule, whilst the Hong Kong government also became less antagonistic towards these schools (South China Morning Post, October 2, 1989).

As the relationship between the Hong Kong Government and the schools improved, the leftist schools eventually asked the government for financial support 'while maintaining their political allegiance' (Sweeting, 2004, p.382). They aimed at being converted to subsidized schools. However, the government gave them another alternative by offering them the "Direct Subsidy Scheme" (DSS). Under the newly introduced scheme, these schools could receive a subsidy from the government (Postiglione, 1992; Sweeting, 2004). According to the terms of this scheme, private

secondary schools meeting specified standards are able to receive a public subsidy for each student enrolled. They are free to decide their own curriculum, and to set entrance requirements and fee levels (Government Information Services, 1992). They all accepted the offer and became a DSS school, receiving a degree of financial support from the Hong Kong government. A new relationship was started.

# e) 1991 - June 1997: Progress and Transformation

During the latter half of the transition period, the status of the leftist organizations, including the "patriotic" schools had been increasingly improving. Some notable "leftists" became very important leaders of the political organizations in these years, such as Tsang Yuk Shing, Cheng Kai Nam and Ip Kwok Him. Quite a number of them were (and still are) supervisors, principals, teachers and past students of these schools. On the other hand, according to Ip (1994), who has conducted a case study on a "patriotic" school in joining the DSS, some of the "patriotic" schools had to recruit more "qualified" teachers who had gained the recognized status, under the new requirements by the DSS. But these newly recruited teachers did not necessarily have similar attitudes and backgrounds to some old teachers who were devoted to the schools, without asking for good salaries and enduring hardship in the very difficult years. The schools placed more and more attention on the results of the public

examinations; otherwise, they could hardly recruit enough students. They pay much more attention to academic results, just like other schools in Hong Kong.

However, they still placed a strong emphasis on nationalist education. Principals (such as Yeung Yiu Chung of Heung To) and supervisors tried to suggest that civic education should be strengthened while stressing on the ideas of the "mother country", Chinese identity and national consciousness, the Basic Law, and "one country, two systems" among the students (Yeung, 1993; Wen Wei Pao, May 20 and 22, 1995)

# f) July 1997 Onwards: Models of Other Hong Kong schools?

The "patriotic" schools entered a new era after 1<sup>st</sup> July 1997. They could celebrate the return of sovereignty to China and would no longer be marginalized by the newly established government. The former Chief Executive, Mr. Tung, was very favourable to the schools, paying visits to some. He seldom went for visits to other schools in Hong Kong. However, there are more and more schools that adopt a very positive attitude towards the Chinese and Hong Kong governments now and they also sing the National Anthem and hoist the national flag on special occasions, as the "patriotic" schools have done. The "patriotic" schools have been keeping a very close relationship with the Communist Party and the PRC government and this special relationship is likely to remain. However, there might be some other schools that also

want to develop a closer relationship with the PRC government. And it is difficult to tell whether the "patriotic" schools could serve as models for the other schools, or not.

# 4.5 Political Socialization in the "Patriotic" Schools of Hong Kong

According to the findings of some scholars who have conducted research and fieldwork in the "patriotic" schools, political socialization has a special character in these schools. Lam (1994) points out that the partisan schools ("patriotic" schools) are different from most other schools in Hong Kong where nationalistic education or political education for national and state identities is rare. According to Tse (1997a), they have put a lot of stress on political or civic education and the concern of current affairs of Hong Kong and China. They held ceremonies of raising the national flag and singing the National Anthem on occasions such as morning assemblies and speech days, well before July 1997. The "patriotic" schools are commonly expected to play a very crucial role in socializing their students' attitudes towards the Communist government and its political ideology. Students in the schools are provided with the information and incentives for acquiring more knowledge on affairs concerning both the mainland and Taiwan through discussions between teachers and students. There were talks and activities organized by the schools concerning Chinese affairs. Students were assigned to read the pro-Communist newspapers daily. To many people, it was a kind of indoctrination, not education.

Wan (1990) found that students of the "patriotic" schools were more knowledgeable about the Communist government when compared with students of other schools in Hong Kong. They were more patriotic and more positive towards Chinese socialism, and less negative towards the Communist government, in comparison with students of other schools. Students' general knowledge about China was gained through the various means available in the school, like the talks, sharing in assembly and even messages on boards. The attitudes of the "patriotic" school students, it seems, could be partly attributed to the pro-Communist newspapers they read.

# 4.6 The Effectiveness of Political Socialization in the "Patriotic" Schools

It is argued that political socialization for a sense of national identity should be strongly stressed in these schools. However, there has not been enough data to assess the effectiveness of political socialization for elements of democracy/participation, critical thinking and globalization.

# a) Political Socialization for a Strong Sense of National Identity and Consciousness

To the "patriotic" schools, the element of national identity and consciousness in

political socialization would constitute patriotic education. And patriotic education has been one of the major characteristics of these leftist schools. They have been upholding this kind of political socialization since 1949.

According to a research study on a "patriotic" school by Ip (1994), patriotic education has been carried out in three major ways: assembly and propaganda; festival education and newspaper reading.

There were assemblies for all students each week. Themes conveyed to students would concentrate on the latest developments in China, especially on the country's achievements in terms of the economy and technology. Post boards were used for the promotion of the achievements of the country. There would be reports on the record and success of the Chinese athletes on important sports events like the "Olympic Games". Moreover, the school celebrated the National Day, May Fourth Festival and the Teacher Festival as three special festivals, although they had no significance to other schools in Hong Kong. Before the National Day, there would be contests like inter-class board decoration competitions to show aspects of national achievement. Effort would be made to let students express their gratitude or passion towards the motherland on the National Day. Every morning before lessons began, 20 minutes would be allocated for all students and teachers to read newspapers. Students were allowed to choose only either Wen Wei Pao or Ta Kung Pao, both newspapers were well known for their pro-China stance. One teacher would be responsible for reading the newspapers in advance every morning and then sharing the information with the students.

As expected, one can deduce that much emphasis has been placed on nationalistic education, as it was the original purpose for which these schools were created. The element of political socialization for the sense of national identity and consciousness should be strong and effective in the schools.

# b) Political Socialization for the Senses of Democracy/Participation, Critical Thinking, and Globalization

There are no concrete data or strong research findings and fieldwork studies to assess the possible political socialization for the senses of democracy/participation, critical thinking and globalization. Therefore, a research with concrete fieldwork in one of the "patriotic" schools is indispensable in order to get a clearer picture about these.

# 4.7 Summary and Remarks about the "Patriotic" Schools

During the 1940s to early 1980s, "patriotic" schools had a poor relationship with the then Hong Kong Government, because of their deference to the mainland. 'During the Cultural Revolution, they rejected the formal curriculum of the Hong Kong Education Department. They had very strong links with schools in China.' (South China Morning Post, October 2, 1989) These schools were not given financial support by the Hong Kong Government, when most of the schools in Hong Kong became subsidized schools receiving most of their funding from the Educational Department in 1970s and 1980s. They had long been excluded from financing from the government's Code of Aid. In fact, they had been purposefully marginalized by the then Hong Kong Government. However, under the newly established scheme in the early 1990s, the "patriotic" schools became DSS schools.

Meanwhile people related to the schools became important political figures in the transition period and after. In the area of political socialization for the sense of national identity and consciousness, the "patriotic" schools should therefore be expected to be strong.

# 4.8 Orientation for the Fieldwork in the Two Types of Schools

As noted in this chapter, the developments of the "ordinary" schools and the "patriotic" schools have marked differences. Previous research on Hong Kong schools indicated that political socialization has been unsatisfactory; students are still politically apathetic and also weak in the sense of national identity and consciousness. Research on the "patriotic" schools indicate that the way of political socialization in

these schools has been quite different to the rest of schools in Hong Kong while they are now having a status different from the colonial days.

After the big rally of 1 July 2003, the political situation here in Hong Kong is changing, people might not be as politically apathetic as before and the ways that students are being politically socialized in schools of Hong Kong are therefore worth researching again, as the relevant fieldworks were undertaken a few years ago. Conducting research on one of the "patriotic" schools and an "ordinary" school becomes very worthwhile in order to understand the updated situations of political socialization inside the schools and making comparisons on these two different schools.

# 4.9 Summary and Conclusions

The developments of the "ordinary" schools and the "patriotic" schools are quite different. Both have been affected by the historical situations they faced – one has been made to be a-political while the other has been prompted to be political and nationalistic. It is interesting to look at the past history of these schools and to see the situations now. Schools, including the "patriotic" schools, have to cope with the needs and changes of Hong Kong.

In the following chapter we take up the issue of the future of Hong Kong and its

provision of education.

### CHAPTER 5 EDUCATION IN HONG KONG IN THE 21<sup>ST</sup> CENTURY

This chapter will mainly discuss the kind of education required in Hong Kong in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. It will do so with reference to the economic, political and social backgrounds of Hong Kong, now and in the future, by referring to the official agenda of the Hong Kong SAR Government and comments from other relevant parties. However, it will also examine a number of issues that are more fundamental – such as "the nature of Hong Kong as a metropolis"; and "who is going to define the needs of Hong Kong". This thesis is premised on the view that political socialization or civic education is an important area of the overall education that Hong Kong students should receive. However, political socialization should be something more than a small subject area of the whole education process, if we really want our citizens to be politically fit for future needs.

### 5.1 Hong Kong: a Prosperous Economic City

Hong Kong, described as a 'barren rock' over 150 years ago, has become a world-class financial, trading and business centre and, according to the Hong Kong government, a great world city (Hong Kong Census and Statistics Department, 2003).

Hong Kong's development into a commercial centre began with its founding as a settlement under the British flag in 1840s. In the early days of Hong Kong, 'the

territory was regarded as an uninviting prospect for settlement. A population of about 3650 was scattered over 20 villages and hamlets, and 2000 fishermen lived on board their boats in the harbour' (Hong Kong Government, 1994, p.419). As an official document introducing Hong Kong (Hong Kong Census and Statistics Department, 2003) notes,

Hong Kong has no natural resources at all, except one of the finest deep-water ports in the world. But a hardworking, adaptable and well-educated workforce of about 3.5 million, coupled with entrepreneurial spirit, provided the foundation of Hong Kong's productivity and creativity. (p.1)

Hong Kong is described as a prosperous economic city, not only regionally but also in terms of the world. From the same official document, we find the following description concerning Hong Kong's economic competitiveness:

Hong Kong is characterized by its high degree of internationalization, business-friendly environment, rule of law, free trade and free flow of information, open and fair competition, well-established and comprehensive financial networks, superb transport and communications infrastructure, sophisticated support services, and a well-educated workforce complemented by a pool of efficient and energetic entrepreneurs. Added to these are substantial fiscal reserves and foreign exchange reserves, a fully convertible and stable currency, and a simple tax system with low tax rates. (Hong Kong Census and Statistics Department, 2003, p.5)

Hong Kong has really achieved a lot economically. Just to quote a few pointers, Hong Kong is the world's 10<sup>th</sup> largest trading economy; one of the world's four largest gold markets; the world's 7<sup>th</sup> largest foreign exchange market; the world's 12<sup>th</sup>

largest banking centre; and Asia's 3<sup>rd</sup> biggest stock market (Hong Kong Census and Statistics Department, 2003).

The Hong Kong SAR Government tries its best to define Hong Kong as an economic city and claims that the needs of Hong Kong lie mainly on the area of economics. Education should be chiefly used for the development of a globalised economy. However, problems with government's management have harmed the economy of Hong Kong and this has "awakened" many Hong Kong people.

### 5.2 Political and Managerial Problems of the HKSAR Government

Hong Kong became a Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China on July 1, 1997. Mr. Tung Chee Hwa took the oath of office for his first and second five-year term as Chief Executive in July 1997 and July 2002 respectively. However, within seven years following the handover of sovereignty, Mr. Tung had lost credibility in the eyes of many Hong Kong people. As one newspaper editorial remarked, 'the people of Hong Kong have watched their overall standard of living deteriorate in a city that Mr. Tung likes to refer to as "Asia's World City", a "world city" where unemployment is now at record levels' (Hong Kong Standard, July 2, 2003).

Mr. Tung was unfortunate that his first term of office was coincident with the Asian financial crisis and the new government simply failed to deal with the

ever-increasing problems properly. When the Asian financial crisis broke the asset bubble, Hong Kong's economic adjustment began. As described by a newspaper editorial, 'inflation gave way to deflation. Property prices, rents and wages kept falling; unemployment, pay cuts, bankruptcies and negative equity troubled Hong Kong people' (Ming Pao, July 1, 2003). By 2003 the situation had reached its lowest point. It was a painful experience for the people of Hong Kong resulting in the government's popularity also dropping to its lowest point.

The people of Hong Kong voiced their opposition by turning out onto the streets on July 1, 2003, which was designated as the celebration day for the return of Hong Kong to China. The protest was the biggest anti-government protest in Hong Kong in recent times as half of a million people participated. As a newspaper editorial remarked, 'it is believed that the main root of the problem lies with the political system. The crux of the matter is that the Chief Executive (CE) is not elected by universal suffrage; the CE may persist in making blunders because he is empowered by the "800-member electoral college" <sup>12</sup> and the central government, which appointed him' (Ming Pao, July 2, 2003). He is only accountable to them, and not the whole adult population.

The Chief Executive of Hong Kong has not been elected directly by Hong Kong people. A group of 800 people, who are supposed to be representatives from different sectors of Hong Kong, are to be elected as an electoral college that vote for this important post.

Mr. Tung eventually resigned from the post as the Chief Executive in March 2005.

Mr. Donald Tsang was sworn in to become his successor in June 2005. Mr. Tsang's ability to rule Hong Kong is as yet unknown.

# 5.3 The Nature of Hong Kong as a Metropolis: an Economic City or a Political City?

Is Hong Kong an economic, or a political city? There have been many discussions on this issue after the great march of July 1, 2003.

Once upon a time, Hong Kong was not a political city. It was a business and financial centre. People in Hong Kong were simply satisfied to be economic animals and preferred to earn their living with hard work. Indeed, even after the big march of July 1, 2003, some mainland officials and commentators in Hong Kong continue to argue that Hong Kong should not become too politicized. They say Hong Kong should only be an economic city, not a political one. They simply warn Hong Kong people that being a political city would be harmful. The fact is those who argue Hong Kong is an economic city are politicians themselves. It is true that people in Hong Kong do care for their livelihoods and all the things related to their living standards. Hence a newspaper editorial remarked, 'as a prosperous and advanced financial centre, Hong Kong people are surely concerned with the health of our stock and property markets, the best opportunities for investment and the overall health of their economy'

(South China Morning Post, September 9, 2003). To that extent, Hong Kong is certainly an economic city.

However, Hong Kong is more than just an economic city. It is quite obvious that Hong Kong people are becoming increasingly aware of political issues and they are more interested in contributing to the debate now. Hong Kong has been accumulating her experiences in the field of politics for years. For instance, Hong Kong has its own government, which is created with its own characteristics; Hong Kong people do have the chance to elect their representatives for the village, district and even legislature sectors. As a newspaper editorial remarked, 'with the improvements in education and living standards, along with changing views of the role of the government, Hong Kong people are becoming more vocal' (South China Morning Post, July 7, 2003). According to this editorial, people in Hong Kong now are much more willing to voice their opinions or complaints by different means such as by telephoning radio talk shows, writing letters to newspapers, and even protesting to official bodies or marching on the streets. People in Hong Kong do wish to secure a healthy economic future, while at the same time longing for appropriate political reform. As remarked in a newspaper editorial, Hong Kong needs 'to play a greater role as a Chinese city while ensuring her international character is not to be eroded' (South China Morning Post, September 16, 2003).

It should be recognized that politics and economics are tightly interconnected. Politics can be comprehended as the resolution of conflicting ideas about how the city should be governed and the best ways of using common resources. In order to plan for a better future, the importance of politics to Hong Kong should be regarded as essential.

According to the analysis of a newspaper editorial on the real reason for the big march, people were not just marching in protest against the economic hardships, but condemning an incompetent administration. 'People blame it on an administration that lacks direction and vision'. (Hong Kong Standard, July 30, 2003) The root of the problem should be political as much as economical.

Therefore, Hong Kong is not only an economic city. According to a monthly bulletin of a middle-class political discussion organization, Synergy, Hong Kong people in general and in particular, the younger generation who are born in Hong Kong do not just regard Hong Kong as a place to make money. They wish to build their pride in and identity with this society. To those who took to the streets on July 1, 2003, Hong Kong is by no means a business company that just cares for making a profit. Synergy further remarked that 'they want to participate in the collective governance of Hong Kong, and they have much higher expectation about the SAR Government... in any case, Hong Kong cannot be stable for too long if it continues to

be politically crippled by its defective constitutional arrangements' (Synergy Bulletin, July 2003, p.1).

It is believed then that Hong Kong people are not satisfied in letting Hong Kong be defined as just an economic city and they are more willing to demand a better government with good management skills and political sense.

### 5.4 Who is Going to Define the Needs of Hong Kong?

Before Hong Kong's change of sovereignty, quite a number of Hong Kong people as well as some overseas thought that, with the return of sovereignty, Hong Kong would lose her freedom and her usual life style. However, under the Joint Declaration and the Basic Law, Hong Kong is entitled to 50 years of keeping to the capitalist economy and she is accorded a high degree of autonomy, except in defence and foreign affairs.

But many people just did not believe that China would keep its promise. After more than eight years since the return, one can comment that there has been very little interference from the central government of the PRC. Therefore, the needs of Hong Kong are being defined by the HKSAR itself instead of the central government. (However, things are changing, the central government has been blamed by the democrats in Hong Kong that it has shown too much concern on some issues like the progress of political reforms in Hong Kong which resulted in the "reinterpretation of

the basic law".)

However, education has not been interfered with by the central government.

According to the wordings of Hong Kong's Basic Law Article 136:

On the basis of the previous education system, the Government of Hong Kong Special Administrative Region shall, on its own, formulate policies on the development and improvement of education, including policies regarding the educational system and its administration, the language of instructions, the allocation of funds, the education system, the system of academic awards, and the recognition of educational qualifications.

In order to meet the challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> century, the needs of Hong Kong and the requirements for the provision of education have been spelt out in various official documents. Government officials are supposed to have consulted the various stakeholders, that is, the people of Hong Kong. It is worth looking at the picture and the messages conveyed by the official documents.

### 5.5 Education as a Key Positioning Hong Kong for the 21st Century

'Education holds the key to the future of Hong Kong as well as each individual.' (Education Commission, 2000a, p.2) No one denies that 'the world is undergoing unprecedented changes, and Hong Kong is no exception' (Education Commission, 2000b, p.3). According to government, education is Hong Kong's most important long-term social investment. The Government, it claims, has been investing heavily in education and in cultivating talent for the future (Hong Kong

Government, 2001).

The former Chief Executive, Mr. Tung, mentioned many times that education expenditure is really an "investment" rather than "expenditure". He was also heard to say that when he stepped down from office, he hoped his main legacy to the people in Hong Kong would be his efforts in implementing the education reforms.

In his address to the Legislative Council meeting on 6 October 1999, he said "Quality People, Quality Home – Positioning Hong Kong for the 21st Century", Hong Kong has to be developed into a world-class city – the New York and London of Asia, and not just an important city of China. In comparing Hong Kong with these two world cities, Hong Kong has 'to inspire everyone to work harder to achieve greater economic development, so that people of Hong Kong will enjoy a richer cultural life and a high standard of living in the future' (Paragraph 50/ p.18).

As according to the policy address by the former Chief Executive in 1999, apart from the required per capita income of the Hong Kong people, the infrastructure, the rule of law, and well-established regulatory and management systems, Hong Kong still needs to make progress to develop into a knowledge-based society, through education.

The quality of our people has a direct bearing on Hong Kong's competitiveness in the next century. It determines whether we continue to develop economically, our wealth continues to grow and our lives continue to improve. To realize our vision of Hong Kong as a world-class city with a

thriving economy and an affluent and culturally rich society, it is first and foremost necessary to cultivate and retain a critical mass of talented people . . . Education remains a key issue because in the next century, knowledge-based economies will take the lead in the world. It is imperative that our education system keeps pace with the times. (Paragraphs 52 & 53 / p.19)

On top of that, as in an official document issued by the Education Commission (2000a) stressed, with the political, economic and cultural changes taking place in Hong Kong and around the world, Hong Kong people need to cope with a trend towards globalization, knowledge-based economies and cultural diversity. People are expected to 'develop their potentials and to upgrade themselves, build a culturally diverse, democratic and civilized society with a global outlook and strengthen Hong Kong's competitive edge... They have to learn and enrich themselves throughout their lives' (p.5).

As in the Reform Proposals for the Education System in Hong Kong issued in 2000 (Education Commission, 2000b) remarked, Hong Kong is "to become a diverse, democratic, civilized, tolerant, dynamic and cultured cosmopolitan city" (p.1).

## 5.6 The Overall Aims of Education for the 21st Century

After several consultations and amendments, the Education Commission (2000b) issued Hong Kong's overall aims of education for the 21st century as follows:

To enable every person to attain all-round development in the domain of ethics, intellect, physique, social skills and aesthetics according to his/her

own attributes so that he/she is capable of life-long learning, critical and exploratory thinking, innovating and adapting to changes in life; filled with self confidence and team spirit; willing to strive incessantly for the prosperity, progress, freedom and democracy of the society, and contribute to the future well-being of the nation and the world at large. (p.30)

It is also stressed in this official document that the priority of the education objectives 'should be accorded to enable students in Hong Kong to enjoy learning, enhance their effectiveness in communication, and developing their creativity and sense of commitment' (Education Commission, 2000b, p.30).

#### 5.7 Aims of Civic Education or Political Socialization

Among the aims and objectives to be achieved, students have to develop a sense of duty and responsibility. This is to be achieved through the area of civic education in schools or the political socialization as mentioned in this research.

Moreover, the aims and objectives for the stage of "school education" as stated in the same official document are as follows:

School education is the stage where the students develop their basic life-long learning abilities and attitudes . . . Aims: To motivate students to construct a core of basic knowledge and develop their basic abilities and attitudes to prepare them for the building of learning and civilized society. (Education Commission, 2000b, p.31)

There are altogether six objectives to achieve the stated aims of the school education as listed in the document. Among the six objectives, the following is what political socialization in the secondary schools of Hong Kong is said to have to

achieve:

• to nurture in students a longing for learning, independent and critical thinking, creativity, a commitment to their families, their society and their country, as well as a global outlook. (Education Commission, 2000b, p.32)

In the official curriculum of 2001, Learning to Learn: Life Long Learning and Whole-person Development, the importance of civic education was again stressed. In the latest curriculum reform structure, Basic Education Curriculum Guide (2002), civic education (and moral education) was regarded as one of the four key tasks of the curriculum.

### 5.8 Political Socialization and the Needs of Hong Kong

As the previous chapter noted, the term political socialization is closely related to civic education, and civic education can be regarded as one of the areas that Hong Kong education needs to strengthen. However, political socialization is something more than a small part of education. According to Feinberg and Soltis (1992), political socialization is an integral part of the make up of a modern state. Assimilation, modernization and political socialization are the three elements that require building up in a modern state.

Facing the problems encountered by the newly created Hong Kong SAR, students in Hong Kong need an appropriate political socialization to find their place

and develop their views on many issues. No one would deny the importance of the Hong Kong economy, but it is too naive to think that Hong Kong is only an economic city. Signs show that people in Hong Kong are starting to move from political apathy and aloofness. As Hong Kong people move into a new era, the secondary schools in Hong Kong have to be placed to meet the challenges, providing appropriate ways of political socialization.

### 5.9 Summary and Conclusions

To sum up, there is a lot of work to do if Hong Kong is to sustain her excellence of previous years and remain a cosmopolitan city in Asia and the world. Education is simply one of the keys to fulfilling the target. There are, of course, many other areas of education that students in Hong Kong need to be nurtured and trained in, such as moral, intellectual, and physical development. But among the various aims and objectives that education in Hong Kong has to achieve, political socialization or civic education is surely very important. Hong Kong is no longer just an economic city. Most of the people will not be satisfied in simply being sufficient in material terms – they want to have a say in their future. It is suggested that an appropriate kind of political socialization has to be developed in Hong Kong schools. No one would deny that Hong Kong is facing a lot of problems and politics

is by no means simple and without conflict; students simply need the tools to understand the situations they are facing so that they can position themselves, after carefully examining the evidence, to face the issues that come up fresh everyday.

In the next chapter, an effort will be made to deduce some essential elements of political socialization that schools in Hong Kong have to develop in order to fulfil the needs of Hong Kong.

# CHAPTHER 6 JUSTIFICATION FOR THE FOUR SUGGESTED ELEMENTS OF POLITICAL EDUCATION IN SCHOOLS

In the light of the literature in the field of political socialization and with particular references to the development of Hong Kong's education system and political socialization, it is argued that some elements are essential for an appropriate kind of political socialization in Hong Kong schools. These are: national identity and consciousness, democracy/participation, critical thinking, and globalization. They will be defined and examined in detail with particular reference to the situations of Hong Kong. Efforts are also made to evaluate the relationship between the various elements.

# 6.1 Justifications for Devising Some Essential Elements of an Appropriate Kind of Political Socialization in Schools

By examining the literature on political socialization, it is believed that some elements should be generated so as to judge whether the kind of political socialization being provided is effective or not for a particular society. Without having some essential elements in mind, it is difficult to examine the effectiveness of political socialization in certain schools or regions. Improvement can be made on the programmes of civic education by referring to the fulfilment of some essential elements. It is desirable to deduce some essential elements for an appropriate kind of political socialization in Hong Kong schools, with particular references to the

situations and developments of Hong Kong.

Different countries have produced their own programmes of civic or citizenship education. They have refined the aims and content of their programmes, in response to their particular contexts and needs. On the other hand, as mentioned in the literature review chapter, the nature of political socialization is multi-dimensional, and the same is true for the content of citizenship or civic education. Efforts are made to examine the general ideas underlying citizenship education programmes of different regions in order to generate some very essential content elements.

Generally speaking, the framework of citizenship education includes knowledge, values and attitudes, together with reflection, action, beliefs and competence (Curriculum Development Council, 1996).

As Heater (1990) points out, citizenship education is like a cube with three dimensions: elements (identity & loyalty, virtues, legal or civic status, and political entitlement & social rights); geographical level (local, nation-state, regional or world); and outcomes of education (knowledge, attitudes, and skills). If all the elements are elaborated with the levels and outcomes, there will be altogether 27 elements. These would be too complicated and lengthy to deal with here.

By examining the aims and contents of civic education in different countries, some elements are found essential, while others can be grouped as one single element.

First of all, it is found that the promotion of national education is regarded as indispensable in civic or citizenship education programmes of most countries. Of course, some countries tend to place more emphasis on promoting patriotism among their citizens. Thus, my first suggested element of political socialization is national identity and consciousness.

Most countries try to promote a sense of democracy, with special emphasis on the participation of the citizens in public affairs. For example, according to Case et al. in Derricott's (2000) article, who highlight the main features of citizenship education in Canada, there are items like political education, law-related education, human rights education and community service. For the features of citizenship education programmes in Thailand, some characteristics like good citizenship responsibility, respect for one's rights and freedom, and understanding and acceptance of different political ideologies are highlighted (Derricott, 2000). Walter Parker in Derricott's (2000) article highlights the contents of citizenship education programmes in the United States, which include law-related education and community service. Thus it seems that elements of democracy and participation are important elements of political socialization. Cogan (2000) lists five attributes of citizenship as: a sense of identity; the enjoyment of certain rights; the fulfilment of corresponding obligations; a degree of interest and involvement in public affairs; and an acceptance of basic

societal values. It is argued that four of the attributives can be grouped as one single element – democracy/participation. The term "democracy/participation" is used to include all these four out of the five attributes as suggested by Cogan while highlighting the part of participation.

It is also suggested that more and more countries or regions have started adopting some discussion of globalization into their citizenship education programmes, though they may give it different names. According to Derricott (2000), emphasis has been placed on multicultural education in the United States, global and international education in Canada, globalization in England, global perspective in Japan. In Thailand, characteristics like acceptance of different cultures, understanding of world economics, being interested in world affairs, developing an awareness of world problems and solutions, and participating in the promotion of world peace are stressed. Thus, it is believed that the element of globalization is also increasingly important.

On top of that, it is believed that the element of critical thinking is also essential even though there is seldom an explicit use of this term in the various national citizenship education programmes. However, this element has been considered very important in the official document on Hong Kong's civic education.

In Hong Kong schools, of course, there are different combinations and

classifications of aims or elements on civic education. References are made chiefly from the official document of *Guidelines on Civic Education in Schools* (Curriculum Development Council, 1996) (*Guidelines 1996*), which outlines three main aims. (The details of the three aims are quoted in the next section.) From these three aims, it is argued that there should be altogether four elements that can be derived from them and these seem to be optimal when they are used as essential elements for evaluating the effectiveness of political socialization in schools of Hong Kong. Aim One refers to both elements of national identity and consciousness, and globalization; Aim Two refers to the element of democracy/participation; Aim Three is the element of critical thinking. It is believed the identified four elements are useful for evaluating the current situation regarding civic education in the schools featured in this research.

### 6.2 Some Essential Elements of an Appropriate Political Socialization in Schools

The suggested four elements will be used as a means to evaluate whether the kind of political socialization in a particular secondary school in Hong Kong is appropriate or not. The definitions and general meanings, as well as their contextual relevance to the particular situations of Hong Kong schools are examined and discussed as follows.

### a) National Identity and Consciousness

A sense of national identity and patriotism is usually seen as an essential

ingredient of civic or citizenship education in most countries (Cogan, 2000). As Dawson et al. (1977) remarked, 'citizens within a given nation share a common sense of national identity and loyalty that distinguishes them from citizens of other nations' (p.2). Such identities are supposed to be very important for they serve to tie the members of a nation together and to differentiate them from other nations.

According to the *Guidelines 1996*, one's national identity is developed from where one is born, and this identity does not normally change. Such a sense of belonging can be further extended to the spirit of nationhood. Furthermore, as it also remarked, 'such national spirit as nationalism or patriotism is essential not only for one's national identity and sense of belonging, but also for the cohesion and strength of one's own nation' (p.23).

As suggested by the *Guidelines 1996*, it is natural that citizens in a country or region should be proud of their own uniqueness. Citizens have to appreciate their culture and the glory of the past ages explicitly and implicitly, understand the ideologies fundamental to one's own government and culture, as well as the political, economic and administrative systems of the country. He or she should also 'be aware of the country's social and political issues, the modes of participation, and the citizen's rights and responsibilities' (p.24), in order to be able to make contributions.

According to Dawson et al. (1977), political leaders in different countries have

of the educational leaders to help shape the outlook of future citizens, and also influence the maturing citizen in the direction of loyalty toward the existing order.

However, one has to make a distinction between loyalty to the nation and loyalty to any particular regime that happens to be in power. Hence it might be necessary to criticise or protest against the government of your nation as a result of your love for the nation.

As stated in the *Guidelines 1996*, one of the three aims of school civic education in Hong Kong is related to the national identity or a sense of belonging:

To enable students to understand how the individual, as a citizen, relates to the family, the neighbouring community, the regional community, the national community and the world; and to develop in them positive attitudes and values conducive to the development of a sense of belonging to Hong Kong and China so that they are ready to contribute to the betterment of the society, the state and the world. (Curriculum Development Council, 1996, p.5)

In order to achieve this aim, there are some objectives to achieve as stated in the Guidelines 1996 for the secondary level. They include: 'to enable students to develop an understanding of and concern for the local social conditions, the rights and duties of citizens, the functioning of the government and the communications between the government and the people' (objective a); 'to help students become aware of and understand matters of concern for Hong Kong, China and the world' (objective b); and 'to help students understand the special features of the Chinese culture, identity

with the noteworthy aspects of the Chinese culture, and strengthen their esteem for it' (objective g) (Curriculum Development Council, 1996, p.6).

The Guidelines 1996 also suggests that a citizen in Hong Kong should know the cultural and political identity of Hong Kong as a Chinese community. It is necessary to enhance one's understanding of Chinese culture and Chinese history, which is essential for developing national identity and a patriotic spirit (Curriculum Development Council, 1996). It is not suggesting a total identification with the communist regime in the mainland but having a basic understanding of it.

As mentioned in previous chapters, people of Hong Kong in general have lacked a sense of national identity and consciousness, and much has to be done to foster this in the minds of the secondary school students. This is not arguing for a very strong sense of nationalism, but rather a sensible state of national identity and consciousness.

#### b) Democracy/Participation

Democracy/Participation here means a set of attributes that students should develop as an element of an appropriate kind of political socialization in order to be democratic, devoted and participative citizens, namely, 'rights and entitlements; responsibilities, obligations and duties; acceptance of basic societal values; and active

in public affairs' (as adopted from four of the five attributes of citizenship suggested by Cogan (2000, p.2-5)).

According to Cogan (2000), students should understand their rights or entitlements. Being a citizen is 'to be a member of a group and thus to be entitled to the benefits that group membership confers' (p.3). There are certain rights and entitlements for citizens including 'protection of their government when they are travelling outside their own country', 'protection of the law and to whatever rights their constitution and political system guarantees them' (Cogan, 2000, p.3).

Cogan (2000) remarked that 'it is also universally accepted that citizenship carries with it the obligation to perform certain duties, including the responsibility to obey the law, to pay one's tax, to respect the rights of other people, to fight for one's country and generally to fulfil one's social obligations' (p.4). Another attribute is 'the acceptance of basic societal values' (p.5), with the examples of trust, cooperation, respect for human rights and non-violence. Such social values are useful in constituting the distinctive identity of a country and thus making social living possible (Cogan, 2000).

Moreover, another attributive of a citizen is participation in public affairs.

According to Cogan (2000), there is a long tradition that distinguishes between a good person and a good citizen. Such tradition can be dated back to the time of the Ancient

Greeks. A good person is defined as someone who lives his or her life morally and honourably, but without any involvement or interest in public affairs. By contrast, a good citizen is someone who 'not only lives decently in his or her private life, but is also committed to participation in public life; at the very least to taking an informed interest in public affairs, ideally, playing an active part in them' (p.4).

As stated in the *Guidelines 1996*, another aim of civic education in Hong Kong schools is:

To help students understand the characteristics of Hong Kong society and the importance of democracy, liberty, equality, human rights and the rule of law, and to employ these concepts in daily life. (Curriculum Development Council, 1996, p.6)

In order to achieve this aim, there are some objectives to achieve as stated in the *Guidelines 1996* for the secondary level. They include: 'to help students acquire a basic understanding of democracy, liberty, equality, human rights and the rule of law, and to employ these concepts in daily life' (objective c); 'to equip students with the necessary social and political skills and understanding, and to prepare them for a responsible and decision-making role ready to make contributions to Hong Kong society and the nation' (objective d); and 'to help students develop open-mindedness and objectivity towards their own people and other people, their cultures, values and ways of life' (objective f) (Curriculum Development Council, 1996, p.7).

The aim of this suggested element (democracy/participation) is to facilitate students, as civic learners, 'to acquire certain values, attitudes, beliefs and competences that are essential for individual well being and societal well being' (Curriculum Development Council, 1996, p.12).

According to the *Guidelines 1996*, there are some civic values, attitudes, beliefs and competence, which are believed to be essential. Civic values constitute the foundation of one's attitudes and beliefs, which are essential to develop as a responsible, responsive and contributive citizen in society. In terms of attitudes, it is expected that students should develop civic and social concern and to become a participative citizen; being positive and empathetic; and to respect and appreciate different views. Certain civic beliefs may include the betterment of human societies through individuals endeavour and education. And the equipment of civic competence will provide the civic learner with the capability of putting beliefs into practice (Curriculum Development Council, 1996). The element of democracy/participation includes all of the above attributes.

#### c) Globalization

The domestic context is the most relevant and immediate contact for a civic learner in one's daily life, but one should also be aware of the significance of the

international context. Therefore, the element of globalization is also very important. Scholars are telling us that we are now living in an interdependent world, a so-called "global village", where we are confronted with global issues. Kazuko Otsu in Derricott's (2000) article even claims that 'we will not be able to survive if we think and act only based on a nation-centric view of world' (p.71). Thus, a global perspective is also needed, apart from the need of a national perspective and with a sense of national identity and national consciousness. It is argued that 'national citizenship alone will not be enough to meet the challenges of the 21st century as the world becomes ever more interconnected and interdependent' (Cogan, 2000, p.3). Global trends are seen in several themes — economic, technology and communication, and population and the environment, they are not mutually exclusive, but are interwoven and linked to one another (Cogan, 2000).

There are many definitions and descriptions of globalization. Giddens (1998) sees globalization as:

a complex range of processes driven by a mixture of political and economic influences. It is changing everyday life, particularly in the developed countries; at the same time as it is creating new trans-national systems and forces... Globalization is transforming the institutions of the societies in which we live. (p.33)

Waters (1995) suggests that there are three forms of globalization, they are: Economic Globalization, Political Globalization and Cultural Globalization. Bottery (2000) claims that there may be six forms of globalization. On top of the three forms of globalization suggested by Waters, he argues that there are also Demographic Globalization, Managerial Globalization and Environmental Globalization as well.

Globalization can be comparable to the recently developed concept of "multidimensional citizenship". Kubow, Grossman and Ninomiya (2000) have suggested the concept of "multidimensional citizenship". It is a broadened notion of citizenship necessary to enable citizens to respond effectively to the challenges and demands of the 21<sup>st</sup> century. They believe that citizens should be able to approach problems as members of a global society and understand citizenship, as 'membership in an inter-connected, global world challenges us to define ourselves in a much broader context, to expand our concept of citizen identity to include a global identity, as well as our local, state and national ones' (p.132).

According to Kubow, Grossman and Ninomiya (2000), multidimensional citizenship has four dimensions: (1) the personal dimension, (2) the social dimension, (3) the spatial dimension, and (4) the temporal dimension. For the personal dimension, 'it involves developing a personal capacity for and commitment to a civic ethic characterized by individually and socially responsible habits of mind, heart and action' (p.134). The social dimension recognizes that personal qualities are not sufficient for citizenship; 'it also involves people living and working together for civic

purposes. Citizens should be able to work and interact with other people in different settings and contexts' (p.136). For the spatial dimension, it is suggested that 'citizens must see themselves as members of several overlapping communities -- local, regional, national and multinational' (p.137). The temporal dimension requires that a 'citizen, in dealing with contemporary challenges, must not be so preoccupied with the present that they lose sight of the past and the future' (p.139). These dimensions can provide ways to understand the meanings of globalization and the notion of multidimensional citizenship better.

According to Tang (1997), Hong Kong is really a good form of international city. Hong Kong has been upheld the philosophy of free trade, economic liberalism and openness, and has been ranked the most liberal economy in the world without unnecessary barriers to trade and capital flow. Hong Kong's international and cosmopolitan nature has been interpreted as a key feature of its economic success. If trade is a major force in globalization, Hong Kong is surely at the forefront of such a process, playing her role as an international world central point of various business activities. Hong Kong also acts as a major finance, communications and transport centre. Hong Kong has also performed very well in terms of its involvement in international institutions. Hong Kong still enjoys a high degree of autonomy in its external relations. 'From the globalization perspective, Hong Kong is part of the

globalization process – a major international city in a world without boundaries' (Tang, 1997, p.187). Hong Kong needs to keep herself "online" in the process of globalization.

As stated in the first aim of school civic education (previously quoted above) in the *Guidelines 1996*, the scope of understanding and sense of belonging is meant to extend beyond Hong Kong and China to the world. Therefore, the element of globalization is also stated in the official education document of Hong Kong as one of the very important aims. As stated as an objective (objective h): 'to cultivate in students a sense of communal identity and belonging to nurture their concern for the nation and the life of its people, and to strengthen their awareness of the relations and conflicts in the international arena' (Curriculum Development Council, 1996, p.7).

As reiterated in the *Guidelines 1996*, students are expected to notice the existence of an international community, which requires them to participate in and contribute to the betterment of humankind. This refers to the spirit of mutuality among humans, and notions as universal brotherhood, sisterhood and neighbourhood. Thus the Guidelines 1996 remarks that:

The concept of the global village illustrates the significance and inter-dependence of all individuals as global citizens. As a global citizen, the civil learner should be well aware of the basic human rights and responsibilities that form the grounds for respecting individuals and various social and ethnic groups. (Curriculum Development Council, 1996, p.24)

As suggested by the *Guidelines 1996*, a Hong Kong student should be aware of the current issues in the contemporary global world, such as poverty, discrimination, environmental pollution and war. A student needs to understand the roles and functions played by prominent international organizations, which include political and legal organizations, economic organizations, educational and cultural organizations, environmental organizations, health organizations and aid organizations. We have to develop an awareness of the needs and achievements of other parts of the world (Curriculum Development Council, 1996). One has a duty to make contributions to the advancement of human civilization and the betterment of humankind, and such responsibility is by definition international in nature. This thesis terms it "globalization".

### d) Critical Thinking

According to the *Guidelines 1996*, critical thinking is very important for students to be developed as civic learners. It should be comprehended as a unique cognitive skill that is different from problem solving, creative thinking, decision-making and inquiry. It further defines critical thinking as:

a truth seeking mental exercise that involves careful, precise, persistent and objective analysis of any knowledge claim and belief to judge its validity worth. Thus critical thinking is a kind of reflective thinking that is focused on deciding the authenticity, accuracy and worth of information and claims.

There are quite a number of definitions on critical thinking. Fairbrother (2003) defines it as 'reasoned reflections about one's beliefs and actions, discovery, scepticism, and the consideration of alternative viewpoints in forming one's attitudes (p.108). Noddings (1995) defines critical thinking as 'emphasis on reasonableness, reflection, scepticism, and commitment to use one's capacities for reason and reflection' (p.91). Paul (1987) claims that critical thinking requires students to 'explicate, understand, and critique their own deepest prejudices, biases, and misconceptions, thereby allowing students to discover and contest their own egocentric and socio-centric tendencies' (p.140)

As Paul and Elder (2001) remarked, 'critical thinking is the disciplined art of ensuring that you use the best thinking you are capable of in any set of circumstances...we need the best information to make the best choice' (p.xiii). Critical thinking is about becoming a better thinker in every aspect of our life as a person (Paul and Elder, 2001). It is obvious that critical thinking should not just be confined to politics. However, it is natural that we pay particular attention to the issues related to politics with our critical thinking ability.

Fairbrother (2003) regards scepticism as an essential element in developing critical thinking and such skill is indispensable in political socialization. 'Scepticism

can be defined as the ability and willingness to evaluate the reliability of sources and to judge the relative credibility of arguments while taking into account the possible "vested interests" of the sources.' (p.108)

Critical thinking in political socialization should also be comprehended as a means to deter possible indoctrination. "Indoctrination" is defined by Harber (1984) as an act of 'deliberately ignoring or falsifying evidence as well as presenting it in a biased way in order to achieve the desired end' (p.119), something which is undesirable.

As stated in the *Guidelines 1996*, another aim of the civic education in Hong Kong schools is:

To develop in student's critical thinking dispositions and problem-solving skills that would allow them to analyze social and political issues objectively and to arrive at a rational appraisal of these issues. (Curriculum Development Council, 1996, p.6)

In order to achieve this aim, the *Guidelines 1996* say that it is important: 'to develop students' skills in collecting, analyzing, synthesizing and evaluating information concerning different social problems, so that they can identify the root of these problems, consider them from different perspectives and suggest solutions to these problems' (objective e) (Curriculum Development Council, 1996, p.7).

It is argued in this thesis that critical thinking is one of the essential elements in an appropriate kind of political socialization. Such a view is also echoed in the

"Appendix" of the *Guidelines 1996*, which reiterates the importance of critical thinking for civic education. It remarks that:

Civic education should also promote personal autonomy, efficacy and a critical frame of mind so that the citizens are not just informed voters, but also wise decision-makers who are able to demonstrate judgment when electing representatives or deciding important issues. A critical aspect of this development of the political self for citizenship in a participatory democracy is the willingness and ability to think critically (Curriculum Development Council, 1996, p.75).

# 6.3 Are the Elements Complementary or Conflicting? : Some Remarks and Discussions

The four identified element will be used to evaluate the perceptions of effectiveness of political socialization or civic education in the schools. Each of them might be related to some different educational outcomes, like knowledge, action, values, beliefs and attitudes. However, it is believed that these elements are complementary, though conflicting in some ways. Thus it is worthwhile examining the possible complementary or conflicting situations and conditions.

### a) National Identity and Consciousness vs. Participation / Democracy

Concerning the priorities of these two elements for an appropriate kind of political socialization in Hong Kong's schools, different sectors of people in Hong Kong have different views. There have been many debates in the years running up to the change of sovereignty.

According to Lee (1996, 2001), different camps of opinion emerged during the

debates. The patriotic camp claimed that patriotic or nationalistic education, as well as knowledge of China should be strengthened while the liberal camp called for strengthening of education for democratic education, legal education and human rights education. The Chinese government supporters denounced colonial education as the source of political apathy and inadequate understanding of the nation. They emphasized that civic education should be based upon an identity with one's nation first. Such an argument for nationalistic/ patriotic education was in fact mixed with anti-colonial sentiments. However, there were some scholars in Hong Kong who reacted to the proposals for a nationalistic and patriotic focus in civic education. Choi Po-king (1995) reacted by writing to distinguish national education from civic education. She considered that the purpose of civic education was to develop critical thinking for political participation, while nationalistic education was a kind of irrational or non-rational identification with the nation. Man Si-wai (1995) commented that education should allow freedom of expression and participation; "politics" should not to be defined by a political entity that suppressed citizens. Other educational organizations like the Professional Teachers' Union (PTU) and Hong Kong Catholic Church put more emphasis on the role of civic education as democratic education (Tse, 1997a; Ng et al., 2000; Morris, 1997; Lee, 2004).

The debate on the priority of emphasis on either national education or

democratic education is still present among the stakeholders in Hong Kong. However, as Lee and Sweeting (2001) remarked, 'conceptually, nationalistic and patriotic education was not necessarily incompatible with democracy and human rights education' (p.117). A democrat can also be a sensible patriotic person.

#### b) National Identity and Consciousness vs. Globalization

There would also seem to be potential problems of globalization versus national identity. Some people would tend to think it is difficult to be loyal to both. However, the possible conflict of having both the elements of national identity and multi-dimensional citizenship (globalization) might still be resolved, as one has to be loyal to his/her place of origin and also pays attention to the arenas beyond. Some scholars point out that too much nationalism may not be good. Others emphasize that a global perspective is needed as well as a national view in citizenship education. Some people even say we will not be able to survive if we think and act only based on a nation-centric view of the world.

The task is not to dismiss the claims of patriotism and national identity but to ensure that citizenship education also includes the realization that we live in an interdependent world and nations, and the communities within them, must work together if the challenges of the 21st century are to be successfully overcome. (Kubow, Grossman & Ninomiya, 2000, p.138).

However, it seems that it is more difficult to develop in students a global sense

as compared with developing a national sense, though it remains necessary to emphasize the global perspective in school education.

According to Tang (1997), there have been concerns that nationalism or China's influence will be over emphasised in determining Hong Kong's future, instead of taking an international outlook. On some occasions, the Chinese Government has been sensitive that some issues are being brought to the international forum while she has considered that the issues are actually Hong Kong and China's own affairs. The Beijing officials do not welcome "the internationalization of Hong Kong" and "foreign interference in the affairs of Hong Kong". Such warnings of asking the foreign governments (such as the USA Government) not to interfere in Hong Kong issues have indeed been raised several times in the past few years.

It seems that there need to be a good balance between these two elements and this issue needs debating further. However, it must be admitted that having both elements of national identity and consciousness, and globalization may be a delicate task. Having an international character, Hong Kong students have to learn a balancing act -- maintaining open-mindedness on the one hand, and demonstrating some form of patriotic credentials to their mother country as well (Tang, 1997).

#### c) National Identity and Consciousness vs. Critical Thinking

It is believed that we expect students in Hong Kong to have a sense of national

identity and consciousness, as most of them are relatively poor in this area. It is natural that we care for our country and wish China to be prosperous and great. But it does not imply that we are saying all the things that China does are always right. We also find that there should be considerable room for improvement in our country. Critical thinking can exist with an active sense of national identity and consciousness, but is unlikely to survive with extreme forms of nationalism.

#### d) Democracy/Participation vs. Globalization

The elements of democracy/participation and globalization should be complementary rather than conflicting. The understanding of democracy and human rights should be a global phenomenon. All people in different countries should be entitled to enjoy their rights and fulfil their obligations. Of course, this is complicated by the fact that different countries in this world have their own particular situations and backgrounds. On the other hand, there are people who exercise their rights to protest against the trend of globalization. What they really protest against should be the trend of globalization as dominance by some rich countries and super commercial giants. They protest against the people in the Third World being deprived of their rights and wealth. It has been termed as the "global anti-capitalist movement" (Desai & Said, 2001; Held & McGrew, 2002). The protestors are entitled to have the right to

lobby for their goals if they observe the laws or at least do not resort to means that are too harmful to others or themselves. Their motives are usually admirable. We should prefer a democratic globalization instead of a capitalist dominated world.

#### e) Democracy/Participation vs. Critical Thinking

The elements of democracy/participation and critical thinking are more complementary than conflicting. Democracy is in many ways compatible with critical thinking as when people are participating in certain political or social activities, and they should be conscious of what it means to be involved and critical of their possible roles.

There are different interpretations about democracy. As Lee (1999) remarked:

Opinions about democracy are diverse, ranging from an almost idealized version of democracy to what is in effect an entirely pragmatic view. To the idealists, democracy means constitutional democracy, seeing the nature of government as "government of, for and by the people". To them, democracy is associated with freedom, equal opportunity, social security, political participation, elections and human rights. To the pragmatists, since Hong Kong is destined to be a dependent territory (either under Britain or China), democracy is defined by the extent to which the people can participate in government affairs (p.323).

Actually, some people would like to see a full-fledged democratization but others are cautious to guard against the abuse of democracy. Some people simply think that Hong Kong is not yet ready for a true democracy. Some tend to think that the pace towards democracy is too slow while some think it is too fast (Lee, 1999,

2004). We should admit that different people might have different feelings on the pace of democratisation.

Moreover, a citizen should not always stress their rights in the society. He or she should think of their obligations and duties as well. There has been a tendency elsewhere and even in Hong Kong that some people abuse their rights and keep asking for something that would be unfair for other citizens in the society. This can be regarded as some kind of "mob-rule" or "the tyranny of democracy".

#### f) Globalization vs. Critical Thinking

The elements of globalization and critical thinking are more complementary than conflicting. Critical thinkers will know the trend of globalization and its contributions and drawbacks. It does not mean accepting all the values that come with it. As Hardt and Negri (2000) remarked in their classic book, *Empire*, globalization should not be accepted unconditionally. We should somehow have a place to shape the form of globalization we want. We should also set our priorities and know one's positions in the whole trend.

#### 6.4 Orientations for the Fieldwork in the Two Researched Schools

As mentioned in chapter 4, political socialization in the "ordinary" schools and

the "patriotic" schools may be quite different. It is worthwhile conducting fieldwork in both types of schools, so as to examine the possible fulfilment of the four suggested elements in the two researched schools.

Hong Kong needs citizens with a clear sense of national identity and consciousness, with an ability to think critically and the sense of an international outlook, so as to accept their rather new identity as SAR citizens and face the challenges and chances of globalization, which require an active involvement in a democratic society.

The choice of the two researched schools is between one being an "ordinary" school which is the "norm" of most of the secondary schools in Hong Kong while the other is a "patriotic" school which was special in the colonial years of Hong Kong. Lessons on political education will be drawn from them to see whether the suggested four essential elements of an appropriate political education are workable in them or not.

#### 6.5 Summary and Conclusions

Based on the previous literature, worldwide, and the main official document on civic education in Hong Kong, some essential elements have been identified. It is believed that they are important, in order to develop an appropriate kind of political

socialization for Hong Kong secondary schools for the future.

The importance of the four elements have been stressed and evaluated with respect to whether they are complementary or conflicting. Different groups of people might have different emphases, based on their particular backgrounds and perceptions. For instance, extreme patriotism would mean a narrow-minded nationalism that is not preferred. Democracy is not equivalent to "mob-rule". When we stress globalization, it does not mean we have to forget our own national identities. We somehow need the sense of critical thinking to understand essential values and whether we find them acceptable and preferable. Students in Hong Kong, at the secondary school level, are bound to face different conflicting values, issues and information; one must have the training of critical thinking so as to become a competent citizen. Therefore, it is clear that they need the ability of critical thinking as the key to upholding the various elements of being socialized politically in the school.

Having examined the background of this research study, in the previous six chapters, we now come to the chapter on methodology, outlining the details for doing research in the targeted schools and the justification for conducting a qualitative case study research on this topic.

#### CHAPTER 7 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

This chapter discusses the research methodology adopted for the study. It explains the rationale behind the choice of a qualitative research methodology and the case study approach. It also discusses the methods and procedures that were used to gather data for analysis. This chapter also contains a discussion of some of the philosophical issues that supported the choice of the methodological approach for the study. The last section of the chapter discusses the development and design of the research, especially the data collection and analysis procedure and the way in which the findings are reported and analyzed.

#### 7.1 A Discussion of Research Strategy

Educational research can be defined as 'the application of systematic methods to the study of educational problems' (Verma and Mallick, 1999, p.33). There are basically two main strategies to the gathering of information in research, namely, the qualitative and quantitative approaches. Each is associated with different methods of collecting data or information. However, such a classification is too simplistic in nature for there are overlapping areas between the two approaches. Nevertheless, the definition of Bell (1987) makes a clear distinction, as follows:

Quantitative researchers collect facts and study the relationship of one set of facts to another. They measure, using scientific techniques that are likely to produce quantified and, if possible generalizable conclusions. Researchers adopting a qualitative perspective are more concerned to understand individuals' perceptions of the world. They seek insight rather than statistical analysis. (p.4)

According to Blaxer, Hughes and Tight (2000), the nature of the two strategies can also be comprehended as follows:

Quantitative research is concerned with the collection and analysis of data in numeric form. It tends to emphasize relatively large-scale and representative sets of data, and is often perceived as being about the gathering of "facts". Qualitative research, on the other hand, is concerned with collecting and analyzing information in as many forms, chiefly non-numeric, as possible. It tends to focus on exploring, in as much detail as possible, smaller numbers of instances or examples which are seen as being interesting or illuminating, and aims to achieve "depth" rather than "breadth". (p.60)

It is believed that quantitative research is high in reliability but low in validity while qualitative research is seen as being high in validity and low in reliability (Coolican, 1990). According to Hitchcock and Hughes (1995), 'validity is concerned with the extent to which descriptions of events accurately capture those events, for example, the extent to which the materials collected by the researcher presents a true and accurate picture of what it is claimed is being described' (p.105). Reliability is about replicability. Reliability 'concerns the extent to which a particular technique will produce the same kinds of results, however, whenever and by whomever it is carried out' (Ibid, p.107).

The use of quantitative methodology with its emphasis on reliability may get closer to what is being studied while the use of qualitative methods may give more insights but less replicability. However, there has been a trend that social scientists are beginning to reject quantitative methodology with its emphasis on objectivity and accuracy and are looking towards qualitative research as a way of understanding reality from the point of view of the individual(s) being studied (Verma and Mallick, 1999). Qualitative research 'has become increasingly popular over the last two decades' (Blaxter, Hughes and Tight, 2000, p.61). Moreover, there are views that education is so complex that it is of very limited value to focus on what can be statistically measured. As schools and their participants have their own histories and relationships, they respond to innovations in different ways. Thus, it requires a qualitative appreciation of the variables and factors of interactions and changes (Hitchcock and Hughes, 1995).

As this research aims to understand the situations of political socialization of the two selected schools in depth, the qualitative research approach has been used.

### 7.2 Theoretical Orientation of this Qualitative Research Study

As Greene (1994) remarked, 'when...information needs comprise multiple perspectives, contextualized meanings, or the experience of program

participation...then qualitative methods should be employed' (p.539). Since this thesis aims at looking into the contexts and perceptions of different parties about political socialization in the two researched schools, it requires the use of qualitative approach.

According to Bryman (2001), in terms of epistemologically orientation, qualitative research tends to be described as "interpretivist": 'the stress is on the understanding of the social world through an examination of the interpretation of that world by its participants' (p.264); in contrast to the adoption of a natural scientific model in quantitative research. Ontologically speaking, qualitative research tends to be described as "constructionist", implying that 'social properties are outcomes of the interactions between individuals, rather than phenomena "out there" and separate from those involved in its construction' (p.264).

The quantitative tradition is different to that of the qualitative. Quantitative research employs standardized statistical methods designed to confirm or refute a proposed hypothesis and with the intention towards generalization. In qualitative studies, emphasis is on thick descriptions and a more holistic approach to data collection and analysis (Miles and Huberman, 1994). Maykut and Morehouse (1994) further point out that qualitative research seek to understand phenomena in all its complexity and within a particular situation and environment.

There are different positions in relation to reliability and validity in qualitative

research. Miles and Huberman (1994) are of the view that qualitative research can be conducted by making it lean more towards formalization and structure of methods like quantitative designs. In contrast, Lincoln and Guba (1985) argue that there are already intrinsic criteria within qualitative research, which provide an alternative to reliability and validity in quantitative research. They propose "trustworthiness" and "authenticity" as two basic criteria in assessing a qualitative study. They disagree with the simple application of reliability and validity standards to qualitative research and argue that there can be more than one and possibly several accounts of social reality (Bryman, 2001).

Stakes (1995) also claims that since qualitative inquiry is by nature subjective, it does not require 'widely agreed-upon protocols that put subjective misunderstanding to a stiff enough test' (p.45). However, validation of evidence must be considered important. The primary intention of qualitative research is to provide "thick description" of phenomena.

In relation to the role of theory and research, according to Bryman (2001), the main orientation of quantitative and qualitative strategies has fundamental differences. It seems to be the norm that being "deductive" or "testing of theory" is central to quantitative researches; while being "inductive" or "generation of theory" is central to the qualitative approach. "Deductive" can be defined as 'an approach to the

relationship between theory and research in which the latter is conducted with reference to hypotheses and ideas inferred from the former' (p.502). "Inductive" can be defined as 'an approach to the relationship between theory and research in which the former is generated out of the latter' (p.504).

Bryman (2001) remarked, most qualitative researchers do 'emphasize a preference for treating theory as something that emerges out of the collection and analysis of data' (p.269), especially those practitioners of grounded theory. However, some qualitative researchers like Silverman (1993) do 'argue that qualitative data can and should have an important role in relation to the testing of theories as well' (Bryman, 2001, p.269).

According to Bryman (2001), pre-specified theories can be and sometimes are tested with qualitative data, even though the generation of theory tends to be the preferred approach for most of the qualitative researches. He remarked that:

There is no reason why qualitative research cannot be employed in order to test theories that are specified in advance of data collection. In any case, much qualitative research entails the testing of theories in the course of the research process. (p.269)

With regard to this thesis, the four essential elements for political socialization were identified (based on the solid literature reviews from the past in Hong Kong and elsewhere in the world) well before the fieldwork was conducted. It can be comprehended that the research is in part a "testing of theory" – how are the students

Therefore, this research contains elements of a deductive approach. However, the data derived from the fieldwork were to be analyzed and then generated into theory again, so as to find ways to further improve the political socialization or civic education in schools of Hong Kong, by using the grounded theory method. It also followed an inductive method.

#### 7.3 Case Study as the Preferred Research Design

The next stage in setting up the research was to consider possible research designs or approaches. Blaxter, Hughes and Tight (2000) outline four traditional research approaches: action research, case studies, experiments and surveys. Kemmis (1988) defines action research as 'a form of self-reflective enquiry undertaken by participants in social (including educational) situations in order to improve the rationality and justice of their own social or educational practices' (p.42). According to Cohen and Manion (1989), 'experimental research involves the tight control of variables, surveys usually involve interviews or the issuing of questionnaires and case studies involve in-depth accounts of a single "case"; the case may be an individual, small group or even a whole community' (p.124).

For this particular research it was believed that the action research approach was

not relevant as this research is not a form of self-reflective enquiry. The experimental research method would not be appropriate for the purpose of this study either, as there is no attempt to isolate a group of schools so as to contrast one with another in the "real world". The survey approach would not be useful, because an in-depth study of the political socialization in some schools of Hong Kong was preferred to an overall but rough picture of the situation in Hong Kong. Thus, the case study approach was considered most appropriate. 'The case study is, in many ways, ideally suited to the needs and resources of the small-scale researcher. It allows, indeed endorses, a focus on just one example, or perhaps just two or three.' (Blaxter, Hughes & Tight, 2000, p.66) Another definition is also illuminating:

In a case study, a single case is studied in depth, for a period of time and the results recorded. A case study may be of a person, a group, a family, a classroom, a town or a nation. (Verma and Mallick, 1995, p.195)

Bryman (2001) outlines five different research designs: they are experimental design, cross-sectional design, longitudinal design, case study, and comparative design. According to him, 'experimental design rules out alternative explanations of findings deriving from it (i.e. possess internal validity) by having at least (a) an experimental group, which is exposed to a treatment, and a control group, which is not, and (b) random assignment to the two groups' (p.503). Cross-sectional design is defined as a research design 'that entails the collection of data on more than one case

(usually quite a lot more than one) and at a single point in time in order to collect a body of quantitative or quantifiable data in connection with two or more variables usually many more than two), which are then examined to detect patterns of association' (p.502). Longitudinal design is 'a research design in which data are collected on a sample (of people, documents, etc) on at least two occasions' (p.504). Case study is defined as 'a research study that entails the detailed and intensive analysis of a single case. The term is sometimes extended to include the study of just two or three cases for comparative purposes' (p.501). Comparative design 'entails the comparison of two or more cases in order to illuminate existing theory or generate theoretical insights as a result of contrasting findings uncovered through the comparison' (pp.501-2).

For this study, the experimental design was not regarded as appropriate. The case study approach was used, with comparative purposes, as altogether two schools had been involved in the fieldwork. This study regarded the two schools as "cases" and studied their situations in detail. This research study was rather cross-sectional than longitudinal; efforts were not made to follow the observed behaviours or interviewed opinions for different timings and occasions to see whether there had been any changes.

There are questions concerning whether the findings of a qualitative research

study like this one are can be generalized to other settings, particularly when only a small number of individuals in only two cases are involved. One or two cases are hardly representative of all cases, especially when the interviews are conducted with interviewees who have not been selected through a probability procedure or quota sampling (Bryman, 2001). As Bryman (2001) remarked,

A case study is not a sample of one drawn from a known population. Similarly, the people who are interviewed in qualitative research are not meant to be representative of a population ... we may find it more or less impossible to enumerate the population in any precise manner. Instead the findings of qualitative research are to generalize to theory rather than to populations ... it is the quality of the theoretical inferences that are made out of qualitative data that is crucial to the assessment of generalization (p.283).

The findings obtained from the researched schools are to draw up the theory – to see whether the four suggested elements of political socialization are appropriate instead of claiming that other schools in Hong Kong are of the same situations of the researched schools.

#### 7.4 Data Collection in this Qualitative Research (Case Studies)

The case study uses a mixture of methods: personal observation, which for some periods or events may develop into participation; the use of informants for current and historical data; straightforward interviewing; and the tracing of study of relevant documents and records from local and central government, travelers, etc. (Cosley and Lury, 1987, p.65)

In qualitative inquiries, it is common to use the data collections of interviewing,

observation and archival research, or as described by Walcott (1992) "listening, watching and reviewing". Such application of these qualitative data collection methods to educational situations is well documented. Case study is no exception. I conducted my research chiefly by the mentioned data collection methods.

The data obtained were to answer the research questions step by step. It is worth listing these questions again:

- 1. What kind of political socialization is needed in Hong Kong?
- 2. How are the students in the schools being politically socialized?
- 3. How effective is the political socialization of the students in the schools?
- 4. What changes are needed to achieve the suggested kind of political socialization?

For Question 1, the answer has been obtained from the previous chapters by literature review and comes to the conclusion that the four elements of national identity and consciousness, democracy/participation, critical thinking, and globalization, are essential elements of the kind of political socialization needed in Hong Kong.

For Question 2, in order to know how the students are being politically socialized, the study is actually aiming at exploring two areas: the formal curriculum and the informal curriculum. Emphasis was placed on the informal curriculum as the school

climate and atmosphere were identified as more important arenas of political socialization. To answer this research question, the tools of interview, observation and study of documents were used.

For Question 3, in order to explore how effectively the students are being politically socialized with reference to the four essential elements, the interviews with the six parties (the students, teachers, principal, supervisor, past students and parents) were the main sources of data collecting tool.

For Question 4, the data from the interviews and summing up remarks from the fieldwork were utilized to answer the ultimate question and to suggest changes to achieve an appropriate type of political socialization for Hong Kong schools.

#### A) Interview

Interview is important for collecting data in qualitative researches. Most of the data collected in this study came from the interviews of different parties in the researched schools. As Blaxter, Hughes and Tight (2000) remarked:

The interview method involves questioning or discussing issues with people. It can be a very useful technique for collecting data, which would be unlikely to be accessible using techniques such as observation or questionnaires. (p.153)

In qualitative research, it is important that the researcher manages to get access to the field. The richness of the data obtained depends on what access is given to and

what sources of data are available. The researcher has to assure his or her integrity so that the interviewees in the fieldwork are co-operative during interview situations. Hammersley and Atkinson (1995) comment on the importance of access in conducting research:

The problem of access is not resolved once one has gained entry to a setting, since this by no means guarantees access to all the data available within it ... not every one may be willing to talk, and even the most willing informant will not be prepared, or perhaps even able, to divulge all the information available to him or her. (p.79)

According to Fetterman (1989), interviewing is widely used in qualitative research. In interviewing, the researcher tries to understand what people think through their speech. Interviews simply explain and put into a larger context what the researcher sees and experiences. There are formal and informal interviews. Formally structured and semi-structured interviews are described as 'verbal approximations of a questionnaire with explicit research goals' (p.48).

The semi-structured interview approach is able to 'allow depth to be achieved by providing opportunity on the part of the interviewer to probe and expand the interviewees' responses' (Hitchcocks & Hughes, 1993, p.83). The semi-structured interview approach can facilitate comparability. The semi-structured approach of interview was mainly used in this study to gather descriptive data in the subjects' own words in order to gather the insights.

I was able to gain access to the two researched schools and conduct many interviews there. The following parties were interviewed, namely students, past students, teachers, the principal, the supervisor, and parents, in the form of semi-structured interviews. Questions asked of the students focused on their interactions with the teaching staff, the possible political socialization they received in the school, their interest in news and current affairs, possible influence from their parents (factors other than the school), and their views about the present situations and the future of Hong Kong. Questions for the past students were of a similar focus; they were asked to recall the possible political socialization they received, and their interest on politics and current issues. The supervisor, the principal and teachers are all socialization agents of the school, who may have great impact on their students. Questions for teachers were focused more on the daily practice in the school, about the civic education or political socialization, their interactions with students, and the views about the present situation and future of Hong Kong. Questions for the principal and the supervisor (managing director of the school board) were focused on the "macro" aspect, namely, the rationale and ethos of the school. Questions for parents were aimed at assessing the effects of socialization factors other than the school. The information gathered from the interviews was used to assess how the students were being politically socialized and how far the four elements of political socialization were being fulfilled in the schools.

The interviews with the teachers, principals, supervisors and parents were conducted on an individual basis. However, the interviews with the students and past students were in the form of group interview, as this type of interview could let the interviewees speak up and the interactions among themselves were also enlightening. The interviewees tended to express themselves freely and supplement things when their counterparts were unable to recall some details of some events or occasions. This can also be termed as the focus group method. According to Bryman (2001), the focus group method is a form of group interview which places emphases in the questioning 'on a particular fairly tightly defined topic, and which the accent is upon interaction within the group and the joint construction of meaning; the focus group method appends to the focused interview the element of interaction within groups as an area of interest' (p.503). Since the students and past students were expected to mention or recall the possible political socialization they received in their schools as a focused topic, their interactions among themselves were welcome.

The interview questions were tested in the pilot study. Pilot tests were conducted with the following three parties only, as they were considered representative to other parties as well. They were: parents, teachers, and students.

A parent who was not a parent of either School A or School B but a father of a

secondary school student was interviewed. The interview questions for the parents were found to have no problems at all. Two groups of students and one teacher in School A were invited to participate in the pilot interviews. The questions for the teachers were found to have no problems at all, thus only slight amendments on the wordings of the questions were needed. The questions for students were found to have problems in that the participants might find it difficult to answer semi-structured questions that were too open-ended. Thus, more guided questions were devised so that the interviewed students would be able to provide more concrete responses. These questions were still semi-structured, as they were still expected to construct their responses freely. Another group of students from School A were invited and interviewed with the modified questions. After ensuring that the new set of questions worked well, the formal interviews of the three parties were conducted.

#### B) Observation

Observation is a basic technique used in most qualitative research. 'Observation usually means the researcher's act to find out what people do'. (Bernard, 1988, p.62) However, according to Nisbet (1977), 'observation is not a "natural" gift but a highly skilled activity for which an extensive background knowledge and understanding is required; it is certainly not an easy option' (p.15). As Bell (1987) remarked,

observation 'is a technique that can often reveal characteristics of groups or individuals that would have been impossible to discover by other means. Direct observation may be more reliable than what people say in many instances' (p.88).

With the permission of the targeted schools, I conducted thorough observations of the schools' environment (including the school atmosphere, teacher-pupils interactions, as well as the posters, notice boards and etc.) and the various activities of the schools, which included extra-curricular activities, some important school functions like speech days and parents' days and etc, so as to observe and evaluate how effective were the four essential elements of political socialization being fulfilled in the schools.

#### C) Archival Review / Analysis of Documentary Evidence

Most educational projects require the analysis of documentary evidence. It is used to supplement information obtained by other methods or simply serves as the central or even exclusive method of research. It is particularly useful when access to the subjects of research is difficult. Documentary analysis of educational files and records serves as an extremely valuable source of data (Johnson, 1984).

Documentary sources were an important focus of this study. Yin remarked (1994) that it is important to have documentary information in every case study topic and it

serves as a major source of data collection.

Apart from the relevant literature in the field and the official documents that serve as the background knowledge, it was also my wish to be able to access all the relevant documents of the targeted schools. All of the documents that related to the topic and disclosed to me were carefully and critically examined. I read the school yearly reports, the school magazines (which record the daily running of the school and the historical events in the past), anniversary journals, students' journals, school newspapers, minutes of the class meetings and records of the student union, and the web sites of the schools.

#### 7.5 Choice of the Researched Schools

What I wanted to study was the precise culture in these so called "patriotic" schools and the "ordinary" secondary schools in Hong Kong -- how students there are being politically socialized. The two target schools were contacted and asked the permission to do such research there.

In the previous chapters, the poverty of political socialization in Hong Kong schools in general has been pointed out with the exception of the "patriotic" schools. In order to understand the situations of political socialization in the secondary schools of Hong Kong, it was believed that two schools were needed for conducting this

research study – one "patriotic" school and one other school. Since there have been only five such "patriotic" schools (excluding those subsidiary schools of Heung To and Fukien, for they are under a different type of school management), one school was judged to be enough. In order to make concrete comparison, another "ordinary" secondary school was chosen as well.

In Hong Kong, there are three main types of school – government schools which are wholly operated by the Government; aided schools which are fully aided by the Government but run by voluntary bodies; and private schools, some of which receive financial assistance from the Government (Hong Kong Government, 2002). The "patriotic" schools are private schools in nature, but receive financial support from the Government. As mentioned in the previous chapter, they became DSS schools in the 1990s. In addition, there are three types of school curriculum being taught in secondary schools in Hong Kong – grammar, technical and prevocational. The technical and prevocational curricula aim at providing students with a foundation of general knowledge. They place emphasis on business and technological subjects, aiming at imparting generic but fundamental and transferable skills to students (Ibid.). The majority are the grammar schools in Hong Kong.

As the "patriotic" school was a grammar school, the chosen "ordinary" school had to be a "grammar school" as well. The schools were not chosen by random

sampling or by clustering. For clustering, it would require a much larger sample that would be beyond the scope of this study. As it was difficult to conduct research of sensitive topics like political socialization in the schools, the researcher had to ask for permission to enter the field. A form of convenience sampling has been used. As gender is also a variable for political socialization, the "ordinary schools" is "co-ed" (with boys and girls) school, and the "patriotic" schools is a "co-ed" school as well, in order to make them comparable and compatible.

#### 7.6 Data Management and Analysis

The interviews were the main source of data for the study. The interviews were recorded mostly by audiotape recording supplemented by note taking. The value of tape recording interview is widely recognized by social and educational researchers. Powney and Watts (1987) point out that:

Using a tape recorder frees the interviewer to concentrate upon the task at hand-exploring the interviewee's account ... Truth lies on the tape, it becomes objective fact through transcription, whilst the researcher's own understanding of what was happening and being said in the interview are relegated to "unreliable data". (p.147)

I tried to make note-taking a part of interview engagements whether formal or informal during the fieldwork. But I have to say I was not too successful in jotting down notes, as I sometimes needed to give some responses to the answers of my

interviewees. The study relies mainly on the tapes.

For the interviews, all the tapes were transcribed into Chinese first. All the "useful" parts were quoted and translated into English. It took eight to ten times the recorded lengths to write a complete transcript. Transcription was done as comprehensively as possible except for a few inaudible sections.

As Bryman (2001) remarked, 'coding is one of the most central processes in grounded theory. It entails reviewing transcripts or field notes and giving labels to component parts that are of potential theoretical significance' (P.392). According to Strauss and Corbin (1990), there are three types of coding practice in grounded theory approach, namely, open coding ('the process of breaking down, conceptualizing and categorizing data' (p.61)), axial coding ('a set of procedures whereby data are put back together in new ways after open coding, by making connections between categories' (p.96)), and selective coding ('the procedure of selecting the core category, systematically relating it to other categories, validating those relationships, and filling in categories that need further refinement and development' (p.116)). These three can be regarded as different levels of coding and each relates to a different point in the elaboration of categories in grounded theory (Bryamn, 2001).

However, these types of coding were not used in the analysis of the interview data because the interview questions for different parties had been carefully set and

thus they served as concrete answers and materials for the research questions. To minimize the complexities, concepts and materials for different sections had been constructed by referring to the relevant responses of the questions from different parties, one by one and step by step, with supporting thick descriptions and verbatim quotations.

The documents that I obtained from the school and the information that I had collected from the teaching staff, students and all the related parties were also thoroughly considered and examined.

#### 7.7 Summary and Conclusions

This research was conducted in the form of a qualitative study, using a case study approach, examining two secondary schools in Hong Kong, one "patriotic" school and one "ordinary" school. The typical data collection methods of qualitative research were used, namely interviews, observations and document study. Bearing in mind the four essential elements of political socialization identified in the previous literature review and related chapters, data were obtained to understand the situation in the research schools and as the basis of proposing subsequent suggestions.

After several background chapters and the chapter of research and methodology,

the findings and analyses of data in the fieldwork will be reported and discussed in the following chapters.

# CHAPTER 8 HOW ARE THE STUDENTS BEING POLITICALLY SOCIALIZED: CIVIC EDUCATION PROGRAMMEMES IN THE TWO SCHOOLS

In this chapter and those that follow, the findings of the fieldwork in the two schools are reported. This chapter will concentrate on the situations of the schools concerning political socialization – describing the settings of the school, provision of civic education and the related education programmes which account for the political socialization in the schools. As students are politically socialized in formal and informal curricula, both of them are to be described and evaluated. Effort is made to detect the possible influence from other agents on the students in the schools, such as parents, which is beyond the control of the schools. Most of the data in this chapter came from the official documents provided by the schools, though data from the interviews plus observation notes are given when relevant and useful.

#### 8.1 The Portrait of the Researched Schools

School A is a member of those secondary schools in Hong Kong which are supposed to be apolitical in nature. It is a Protestant subsidized co-ed school situated in a new town in the New Territories, Hong Kong. School B is one of the "patriotic" schools that are supposed to be relatively political in nature. School B is a DSS co-ed secondary school located in urban Kowloon, Hong Kong.

#### a) A Portrait of School A

Located in a new town of the New Territories, School A is an aided Anglo-Chinese grammar school sponsored by a Christian church since 1983. It is a "symmetrical" school with five classes at each level from F.1 to F.5 and two classes at each level from F.6 to F.7. Classes are streamed from F.4 to F.5 with three arts/commercial classes and two science classes. In F.6 and F.7, there is one arts/commercial class and one science class. In September 2003, there were 29 classes with approximately 1100 students. It is a co-educational school with an almost equal numbers of boys and girls.

System (SSPAS) operated by the Education and Manpower Bureau (EMB), with a small number of discretionary places filled through the school's self-recruitment. Most places at F.6 are filled by its own F.5 graduates, while a limited number of places are filled by external students with quite good performance in the Certificate Examination. As an established school, School A recruits students with quite good results in the central allocation pool. Most of the F.1 students are of the so-called 'band one' students. (There are now altogether three bands for classifying standards of primary six students in Hong Kong; band one being the best and band three the worst.)

The school has maintained a satisfactory academic standard, as evident in the students' performance in the public examinations like Hong Kong Certificate of Education Examination (HKCEE) and Hong Kong Advanced Level Examination (HKALE). Apart from academic achievements, the school also emphasizes students' participation in extra-curricular activities. The school actively participated in numerous inter-school activities, and received prizes for drama performances.

The parent-teacher association was founded in the 1990s to enhance the friendship between parents and teachers, the linkage between parents and the school and to support the development of school matters. An alumni association was established in 1990 and a student's union was founded in 1999.

#### b) A Portrait of School B

Located in an urban area, School B is one of the existing "patriotic" schools with a history of more than fifty years. As a pro-Communist school with close ties to Mainland China and an emphasis on patriotic education, it has been in a position outside the mainstream of Hong Kong secondary schools for many years. The school's mission is to make contributions to the motherland and to serve the society by educating the students. For many years until the 1980s, the school, like other patriotic schools, adopted an anti-establishment orientation and showed an un-compromising attitude towards the colonial government. In 1967, a year of riots in

Hong Kong, some students of the school were arrested when they tried to protest against the colonial government at the Governor's House. One of them is now a school administrator at the school.

School B was run as a non-profit-making private school until 1991 when it joined the new Direct Subsidy Scheme (DSS). Under this scheme, the school receives a public subsidy from the government for each eligible student they have. It is also free to decide the school curriculum and set entrance requirements and fee levels. Unlike School A where students are admitted to F.1 classes through the centralized placement scheme, School B's students are admitted mainly through an open application for entrance.

The school offers a grammar school curriculum. It has four to five classes at each level from F.1 to F.5 and 2 classes at each level from F.6 to F.7. At each level from F.4 to F.5, 4 classes are streamed into 2 arts/commercial classes and 2 science classes respectively. At each level in F.6 and F.7, there is one arts class and one science class. In September 2003 there were altogether 27 classes with an enrolment of about 1000 students.

In the past, the majority of its students were born in Mainland China, having subsequently migrated to Hong Kong. In terms of family socio-economic status, most were working class. More recently, as the school moved to a new area with a much

bigger campus, it has been able to recruit more locally born students, such that the majority students are not now new immigrants from China.

Since the early 1980s, the school has been striving for a high standard in academic performance, especially in public examinations. To meet this end, teachers have been making extra efforts to organize remedial classes for students preparing for the public examinations. The school students have attained very good performances in public examinations. It has become a "selling point" of the school that the school tries to stress when recruiting new students. In addition, the school has a good record of sending its graduates to local tertiary institutes.

The school and the students' association organize clubs and societies for academic activities, sports and games, arts and crafts, and social services. In recent years, the school has sent its students to a number of inter-school contests in sports, dance, music, composition, verse speaking and mathematics. They have attained satisfactory results.

There has been a tradition that teachers visit the students' parents every year. The parent-teacher association was founded in the 1950s to enhance the friendship between parents and teachers, and the linkage between parents and the school and to support the development of school matters. An alumni association was established in the mid-1960s and a student's union was founded a few years earlier in 1958.

Table 8.1 A Profile of the two selected schools in September 2003

Features	School A	School B
Location	A new town in the New Territories	Urban Kowloon
Campus area (square meter)	5000	8000
Year founded	1983	1951
Curriculum	Grammar	Grammar
Medium of instruction	Mainly English	Mixed (English, Mandarin & Cantonese)
Finance	Aided	Directly subsidized (DSS)
Religion	Protestant	None
Gender composition	Co-educational	Co-educational
Intake of S1 students	Mostly Band 1	Not applicable
Number of students	1142	1050
Number of classes	29	27
Number of teachers	56	72
Number of clubs for extracurricular activities	44	48
Student Union	Yes	Yes
Parent-teachers association	Yes	Yes
Alumni association	Yes	Yes

## 8.2 Provision of Civic Education: Objectives, Priorities, Organization and Management

As mentioned in the previous chapter, political socialization is chiefly acquired through the civic education programmes and activities of the school. Civic education is to be provided in all the schools of Hong Kong but the format and nature may differ. It is the norm for schools in Hong Kong to promote civic education through their subjects and various activities and functions provided in the school settings. Some secondary schools in Hong Kong do provide a specific subject called "Civic

Education" in the formal curriculum, chiefly in junior forms. But more schools tend to promote their own programmes of civic education without having this subject. They are teaching civic education by other means, chiefly through the morning assemblies and other functions of the school. Both School A and School B chiefly carry out civic education in this way, while there is the subject called "Civic Education" in School A only.

# School A

Civic education is one of the areas that the school authorities place on the school programmes. The objectives of civics education in School A stick to the official guidelines issued by the government.

The teacher in charge of the programme, Mr. Ho, claims that there should be more resources (chiefly teaching staff and then funding) for civic education. This does not mean that the school is not weighting civic education in a high position, but since the school really has too many agendas on hand, such as the discipline work, the sports competitions, and the academic work and the related competitions and contests, civic education is regarded as just one of the areas that the school has to cover.

The subject of Civic Education has been provided for students of F.1 to F.3. The chairperson of this subject, Mr. Ho, is also the chairperson of the Civic Education Programme Committee. The committee includes chairpersons of the panel subjects of

Geography, History and Civic Education, as these humanities subjects are supposed to be closely related to civic education and the related matters. The committee is responsible for all the civic education programmes of the whole school.

However, Civic Education as a separate subject is fading out in the school. Originally, there was one period for students of F.1 to F.3 per a 6-day cycle. However, as "Project Learning" has been adopted, it seized the time space previously allocated for Civic Education; only F.3 students will study the subject this year. The subject will disappear next year to make way for the new curriculum measures.

The Civic Education Programme Committee did assign some tasks that the school would do each year, including environmental education, nationalist education, knowing about Hong Kong and Hong Kong current issues, together with topics on special issues that arise unexpectedly.

#### School B

Civic education, which in School B is closely related to nationalist and patriotic education, has been a long-standing educational goal of the school since it was founded. In the school magazines and during interviews with the supervisor of the school, the message of fostering students' national and ethnic consciousness is stressed.

According to the teacher-in-charge of the civic education programme, the school has a detailed plan for civic education and largely follows the routines of the past in line with the school's tradition. Civic education is transmitted through activities and occasions such as newspaper reading periods, form periods, current issues contests, "festival education", and the student union and student award-scheme, instead of a subject called Civic Education.

School B has a Civic Education Programme Committee responsible for organizing the activities for the whole school. According to the document provided by the school, there were two big events in the academic year of 2003/2004: the celebration of the National Day and the Youth Festival of the May Fourth Movement. There were some other activities organized in the year which included a current affairs forum (for senior form students), a quiz on newspapers and current affairs, programmes for fostering Chinese culture and nationalism and programmes for learning the National Anthem and the school song. The document also highlights community services provided by the students to the nearby community and the possible involvement of students in various community activities as a way of promoting civic responsibility.

#### **Summary and Comparisons**

School A and School B have rather different interpretations of civic education.

For School A, civic education is one of the areas that the school has to deal with and no extra efforts are made to place additional emphasis on it. For School B, civic education is a function closely related to nationalistic education. To the management board of the school it is the very purpose of the school to run it so that the students love and serve the mother country. Efforts are made to foster nationalistic education.

As this research regards nationalistic education as one of the areas of political socialization, one can summarize that School B places a lot of emphasis on civic education or political socialization, even though there is no subject called Civic Education.

#### 8.3 Political Socialization in the Formal Curriculum

The "formal curriculum" refers here to three main areas, namely, the curriculum, ritual life of the classroom and school, and the teachers.

#### School A

#### a) Curriculum

In School A, the following subjects are offered in the academic year of 2003/2004.

#### Table 8.2 Curriculum of School A (2003/2004)

Subjects	SI	S2	S3	S4-S5	S4-S5	S6-S7	S6-S7
				(Arts/Commercial	(Science Stream)	(Arts/Commercial	(Science
				Stream)		Stream)	Stream)
Chinese Language	٠	٠	٠	•	•	•	•
Putonghua	٠	٠	٠				
English Language	•	٠	*	•	•	•	•
Mathematics/ Pure	٠	•	٠	•			•
Mathematics							
Additional Maths./					•		*
Maths & Statistics							
Chinese Literature				•		•	
Chinese History							
History			*		•	*	
Geography			٠	•		•	
Economics				•		•	
Principles of				•		•	
Accounts							
Physics					•		•
Chemistry					•		•
Biology				•	•		•
Integrated Science	٠	٠	•				
Computer Literacy		•	•				
Computer Studies				•	•		
Home Economics	•	٠					
Design &	٠	•					
Technology							
Art & Design	٠	٠	٠	•			
Music	٠	•	٠	•	•	•	•
Drama	•	٠	•				
Project Learning	٠	٠					
Civic Education			٠				
Physical Education	٠	•	•	•	•	•	•
Biblical Knowledge	٠	٠	•	•	•	•	•
Religious Studies				•	•		

The students of the arts/commercial classes have more chance to learn about

political issues and civic education. The subject of Civil Education (as mentioned above) was offered as one of the subjects for students from F.1 to F.3 for a few years. Up to the academic year of 2003/2004, only students of F.3 take this subject, and the subject will be completely deleted from the formal curriculum.

#### b) Classroom and School Ritual Life

As in most schools in Hong Kong, political rituals are not stressed in School A. There is no established ceremony of raising the national flag and singing the National Anthem every school day, except when celebrating the National Day of 1<sup>st</sup> October and on other special days. However, as a Protestant school, School A has prayer assembly on most school days. For most of the special functions like the speech day, sports days and parent days, prayer is an indispensable item instead of the raising of the national flag and singing of the National Anthem. However, the ritual items of raising the national flag and singing of the National Anthem are also included in speech days and even the sports days.

The singing of the Chinese National Anthem and the raising of the national flag on National Day were adopted after 1997, the year of transfer of sovereignty. The school had not raised the British national flag, or sung God Save the Queen, the National Anthem of Britain, prior to 1997.

#### c) The Teachers

The influence of teachers on school children must be great as they interact with each other day by day. The teachers are the ones who implement the actual curricula in their lessons. Therefore, "the teachers" are grouped under the category of formal curriculum of the school (Dawson et al., 1977).

#### a) Backgrounds of the teachers

School A is a Christian school (Protestant). There are now 56 teachers in the school and most of them received their university education and teacher training in Hong Kong. There are a few teachers who received their tertiary education in English speaking countries like Canada and the US and two teachers studied in Taiwan many years ago. No one received his or her qualifications in Mainland China. All the five teachers interviewed were born in Hong Kong and received their university education and teacher training in Hong Kong.

#### b) Interactions with students and interest on politics

When teachers were asked about their perceptions of the criteria of good students, most interviewed teachers in School A mentioned the need for compliant attitudes.

Mr. Yau: A good student has to be keen in learning, hard working and thrust for knowledge; be polite and respectful to teachers; be cooperative to teachers as long as they are reasonable.

Mr. Sum: Be willing to learn and taught by teachers; be serious in learning and hard

working.

Ms Kung: Learning motive is of utmost importance. As school is a big family, students must abide school regulations.

Mr. Ho: Be respectful to the teachers, and other students; be polite; keen on learning and with good learning motive.

Teachers in School A were rather "traditional"; they did not mention attitudes of critical thinking, the right or ability to question authority. It seems that the teachers themselves hold traditional Chinese views, having inherited the culture of obedience.

When teachers in School A were asked whether they spend a lot of time talking with their students, 3 out of 5 said that they did. All of them regarded it as important. The topics of the interactions varied from how to study better, family background sharing, time management and interpersonal relationships.

However, topics relating to current affairs and politics were not areas that they found very interesting, even though they said they would share their views with students on some very hot issues, lest they become out of touch with the society.

- Mr. Ho: I find current affairs more interesting. Politics is somehow boring. As I am a teacher of Civic Education, I try my best to pay attention to, even though I am not so interested.
- Mr. Yau: My interest on current affairs is greater than politics. I am not so familiar with the backgrounds of some political issues, such as the historical developments and the present political settings.

However, teachers were keen on topics they found related to the subject matter

that they were teaching, or issues that would probably become examination essay topics in the coming public examinations.

- Mr. Yau: If those issues are closely related to the benefits of students for preparing public examinations, they will be given first priority.
- Mr. Sum: As time is always short for finishing the set syllabus, I will concentrate on teaching instead of sharing with the students. However, if the topics are by chance related to those elements of the syllabus, I am very glad to mention them. For example, when I am talking about reforms in Chinese History, I will ask my students to make comparisons with the present Hong Kong situations. It is rather a good way of sharing the current issues.
- Ms Kung: As a teacher of the subject Economics, it is good to talk with a series of economic as well as political issues since they are all related and inter-dependent. I am surprised by the reactions that when I tried to narrate some current issues to the students, a number of students would sometimes say they are out of the syllabuses and have no use to sit for the public examinations. This makes me stick to the textbooks again.

#### c) Views and attitudes on civic and political education in Hong Kong

All the teachers agreed that Hong Kong had been apolitical for a long period of time and there should be more emphasis on political education in schools. They gave the reasons for this situation. Some teachers also thought that the situations would get better as time goes by.

- Mr. Ho: Agreed. There were simply no such political topics when we were studying [secondary school]. We all know that it was due to the historical reasons. We lacked of a sense of nationality.
- Mr. Yau: Agreed. But it is getting better in these couple of years as these policies are having adverse effects on people's livelihood and freedom, and with the

leadership of some councillors, we manage to respond, such as going for a great march on July 1.

When the teachers were asked to talk about the objectives and contents of civic education in their school, most of them showed that they understood what has been going on in the school. Of course, the teacher-in-charge of the civic education programmes in the school, Mr. Ho, could give a fuller account of the things being done. While Mr. Yau and Ms Kung, who had not taught the subject of Civic Education at all, claimed that they knew very little about the objectives and contents of the school concerning this area. However, Mr. Yau still managed to narrate some episodes that had happened in the school the previous year.

#### d) Summary

The interviewed teachers in general claimed that they would like to share with their students, but the topics seldom touched upon current issues and political matters as these sounded boring, with the exception as those topics that could be related to teaching and public examinations. Teachers generally thought that civic education had been neglected in the past years and would be glad to see some positive changes. They did not have an unfavourable attitude towards the school policy of civic education. However, this does not mean it was of the most importance; it was regarded more as one of the agendas that the school had to achieve.

# School B

# a) Curriculum

In School B, the following subjects are offered in the academic year of 2003/2004.

Table 8.3 Curriculum of School B (2003/2004)

Subjects	S1-S2	S3	S4-S5	S4-S5	S6-S7	S6-S7
			(Arts/Commercial	(Science	(Arts/Commercial	(Science
			Stream)	Stream)	Stream)	Stream)
Chinese Language	*	٠	•	+	*	*
Putonghua		*	•	•	*	
English Language	٠	•	•	*		*
English Oral	•	•	•	•	•	
Mathematics/ Pure Mathematics	•	•	•	*		*
Additional Maths./ Maths & Statistics				•	•	*
Chinese Literature			*		•	
Chinese History	•	•	*			
History				*		*
Geography				*		
EPA			•	•	•	
Economics/ Accounting			*	*	•	
Commerce			•			
Physics		*		*		ale .
Chemistry		ů		*		*
Biology		*		*		+
Integrated Science	•					
Computer	•			•	•	•
Domestic Science	•					

Art and Design		*				
Music		•	•			
Moral Education	*	*				
Library Lesson	*					
Project Learning	*					
Physical Education	*	*	•	*	*	•

The students of the arts/commercial classes have more chances to contact political issues and civic education. The subject of Civil Education (as mentioned above) has not been offered as one of the subjects for students.

#### b) Classroom and School Ritual Life

Unlike most other schools in Hong Kong, political rituals are stressed in School B. There are ceremonies of raising the national flag and singing the National Anthem on special days, such as the national day of 1<sup>st</sup> October, sports days and speech days. As a "patriotic" school, School B has the routine of raising the national flag and singing of National Anthem on quite a number of school days.

The singing of National Anthem and the raising of the national flag for the national day was a ceremony before 1997, the transfer of sovereignty.

I had the chance to participate in the speech days of School B. There were some formal procedures of raising the national flag and the singing of the National Anthem. In 2001, I participated in the school's speech day, and the entertainment programmes

after the formal ceremony impressed me much. There were some programmes that were very Chinese in nature; identical to the television programmes that I saw in the CCTV of the Mainland.

#### c) The Teachers

#### a) Backgrounds of the teachers

There are now 72 teachers in the school. In the past, most of the teachers were from Mainland China. Up to now, still quite a number of teachers received their university education in China while some teachers received their university education and teacher training in Hong Kong. Among the teachers interviewed by me, most were born in China but received their university education and teacher training in China and Hong Kong.

#### b) Interactions with students and interest on politics

When teachers were asked about their perceptions of the criteria of good students, most of the interviewed teachers in School B mentioned the need for good manners and attitudes, plus good learning motivation and results.

Mr. Tong: The first thing must be the good conduct. He or she should be mature in terms of treating people and handling things. The second thing is in the area of knowledge. Overall speaking, good conduct is even more important than knowledge.

Miss Lam: Firstly, it should be the serious manner in learning, no matter you could do well or not. Besides, it should be the personal conduct. Both are important.

When teachers in School B were asked whether they had spent a lot of time talking with their students, most of them said that they had. All of them regarded it as important. The topics of these interactions varied from how to study better, careers, love and romance, emotions, time management and interpersonal relationships.

Some explicitly claimed that they were very interested in politics while some said they were quite interested. However, all the teachers claimed that they were willing to share their views with the students on topics related to current affairs and politics. One also said what she was interested in issues related to China.

- Mr. Hui: Even though I am a Mathematics teacher, I am very interested in politics. I would like to discuss politics and current affairs with my students. Nowadays, the first Chinese manned space mission and the District Board Elections are our cup of tea.
- Mr. Tong: I will take the initiative to discuss issues concerning politics and current affairs with my students. Apart from the space mission, I share my views on issues like the debate on the scheme of harbour reclamation and the appearance of the crocodile in Yuen Long.
- Miss Fu: I have no special interest in politics and current issues, but I will share my views with my students on some relevant news stories. I will print them out and share them with the students during reading lessons.
- Miss Lam: As an EPA teacher, I will discuss issues related to politics and current affairs with my students. I will not avoid sensitive issues like the Article 23 debate. I will present views from different angles to my students.

Ms Lee: My interest in politics and current affairs is not too great; what I concerned about is issues related to China. I share my views with my students concerning the first Chinese manned space mission as it is something to do with national pride. It serves as a very good lesson.

#### c) Views and attitudes on civic and political education in Hong Kong

Not all the teachers agreed that Hong Kong has been apolitical but they tended to think that there should be more emphasis on political education in schools.

Mr. Tong: Different people have different views on whether Hong Kong is apolitical but the big march of 1 July and the debate of the Article 23 show that Hong Kong people are no longer apolitical.

Ms Lee: Agreed. When Hong Kong was a British colony the sense of national identity was not strong, what the people were concerned with was their livelihood instead of politics. Therefore I think it is important to strengthen political education.

#### d) Summary

The teachers in School B should not be regarded as typical as other teachers in Hong Kong. Unlike teachers in other school of Hong Kong who avoid discussing sensitive issues, the interviewed teachers in School B in general claimed that they would like to share with their students and the topics would touch upon current issues and political matters. Teachers generally believed that civic education had been neglected in the past and would be glad to see some positive changes.

#### **Summary and Comparisons**

Both School A and School B offer similar subjects for their students. The

students are prepared to sit for the public examinations. The subjects of higher forms are classified chiefly as "arts" subjects, "science" subjects and "commercial" subjects. Some subjects are more related to political issues and civic education and students of the "arts" classes study these subjects. Most schools give attention to academic matters in preparing their students for public examinations. Civic Education and even some social subjects are accorded relatively lower academic and practical values. They are thus disadvantaged in competition with other major academic subjects that are more established and highly valued, in competition for staffing and teaching time. The subject of Civic Education has been marginalized in relation to other subjects. As in School A, this subject is eventually fading out as the new subject of "project learning" becomes more important. There is no such subject of "Civic Education" in School B simply because there are already too many other subjects on offer. Students also view Civic Education as an accessory and assign it low priority, academically.

In terms of political rituals, both schools follow routines in daily practices. Both schools have similar classroom greetings. Since School A is a Christian school, it has religious acts. But it also has ceremonies of raising the national flag and singing National Anthem on some occasions. For school B, there are more chances to do such things and it simply puts more emphasis on ceremonies related to national identity and consciousness.

Both sets of teachers have similar expectations for their students. They regard students having good manners as very important. Of course most of the teachers in both schools expect their students to have good academic results and to put real effort into their studies. However, one can also spot the differences between teachers of both schools. Teachers in School B tend to be more interested in politics and current affairs than teachers in School A. The more profound difference seems to be the fact that teachers in School B are more willing to share their views with their students on sensitive political or current issues while teachers in another school are not so willing unless related to possible questions in public examinations.

#### 8.4 Political Socialization in the Informal Curriculum

Apart from the formal curriculum, students' experience with the informal curriculum is regarded as an important source of political learning. Students can learn politics in a more effective but subtle way, as when they interact with their fellow students in the extra curricular activities and within the specific atmosphere of the school. Here, the social composition of the schools and the school climate, and the extra curricular activities and student organizations are reported, with reference to the frameworks of Dawson, et al. (1977) and Tse (1997b). In this section, the social compositions of the schools are examined. The backgrounds of different parties in the

schools are analyzed. They include the management board, students, past students and parents of the two schools. Moreover, the extra-curricular activities and the student political groups of the schools are also examined in order to see how the students in the schools have been politically socialized in the school settings.

# School A

#### a) The Social Composition of the School and the School Climate

When the backgrounds of the management board members of School A were examined, it was found that all of them are members of the church that owns the running right of the school. All of them are Christians as this school is a Protestant school. These management board members are of different occupations, some are professionals and some are businessmen. They include the pastor of the church and the supervisor of the school, who is a Chief Executive in an evangelical organization. For the composition of the teaching staff, the profile has been reported in the previous section.

For the parents and students, most of them live in nearby areas. According to the principal, quite a number of them are working class while some of them are middle class. It is interesting to know the reasons given by parents for sending their children to this school. A rough idea may be gained from the two interviewed parents, both of whom said that they liked the way of bringing up children in this school and they also

found that the academic standard of the school was satisfactory. One of the parents, Mr. Fong, said explicitly that one of the reasons was that this school is an "English medium of instruction" (EMI) school. Another parent, Ms Ho said she preferred a Christian school for her daughter.

I visited this school several times. I could sense the Christian atmosphere in this school as the venue was also used for church activities on Saturdays and Sundays. One can see some routine displays of curricular for different activities and functions of different themes. When I went for the ceremony of the National Day, I could see some display boards showing the themes about the newest establishments and events in China. These were borrowed from a pro-China teacher organization. However, the display lasted for just a few days. Actually displays about China are routine for the remembrance of National Day.

#### b) Extra-curricular Activities and Student Political Groups

In School A, there were altogether 43 extra-curricular activities (ECA) clubs or organizations, on top of the Christian Fellowship, in the academic year of 2003/2004. There were other activities organized by the school itself and students were also encouraged to participate in various activities and competitions outside the school. The winning of records earned outside were praised and reported by the school

authorities. These clubs or organizations were classified as academic, interest, social services and sports. Of course, students participating in most of these organizations were also being socialized there. However, the organizations in the sector of social services were rather more related to political socialization.

Table 8.4 Provisions of Extra-curricular Activities in School A (2003-04)

Types of activities	Number of clubs/ organizations
Religion	1 (Christian Fellowship)
Academic	8
Interest	19
Social Services	5
Sports	11
Number in total	44

The participation of students is of utmost importance in evaluating the effectiveness of the activities. But it is difficult to rate the overall participation of students in School A, even though some statistical data of students' participation were disclosed to me. According to Ms Kung in her interview data, most of the activities draw on the same group of frequent participants.

With regard to the student body of School A, reference can be made to the student union and the organization of the four houses. In School A, the Chairperson chairs the student union. There are two vice-chairpersons; one of them is in-charge-of the welfare section. Under this section, there are two divisions. One is responsible to students' welfare; another for academic, cultural and sports activities. Second

vice-chairperson is responsible for the publication of the student newspaper. Under this section, there are two divisions. One is responsible for publication and publicity; another for inter-house affairs.

The functions and composition of the school union are stated in the union's documents. The functions are mainly confined to the services provided to the fellow students in the school. They are measures to let students participate in the activities, plus some kind of democratic mechanism of voting has been practiced. However, the union has not attempted to participate in the daily running of the school management and has no say in some important decision about the school administration.

# School B

# a) The Social Composition of the School and the School Climate

School B is run by a commercial organization, which is closely linked to China. (In Hong Kong, quite a number of commercial organizations maintain close relationship with the mainland as they rely a lot on China trade.) For the management board members, some of them are businessmen and members of the same commercial organization as well. There are also some scholars with notable reputations from some universities in Hong Kong. The supervisor of School B is a successful businessman with lots of titles gained in Hong Kong and China. He has extensive linkages with

businessmen and officials in China. He is currently a standing committee member of the National Committee of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Committee.

One can see compliments from some Chinese and Hong Kong officials in its 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary magazine. The former Chief Executive, Mr. Tung, was invited to be the guest of honour to officiate the 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary ceremony of the school. It maintains a very good relationship with the Hong Kong SAR government. For the composition of the teaching staff, the profile has been reported in the previous section.

In terms of the backgrounds of the students and parents, it used to recruit many newly arrived immigrants from China some years ago. However, according to the supervisor of the school, the majority of students are locally born students now. Since the school has moved to a new area with much bigger premises, it manages to recruit more students than some years ago. Therefore, it is quite impossible for it to just depend on the sources of new immigrants from China. However, there is still a higher percentage of this type of students than most of the other schools in Hong Kong.

It is important to trace the reason for the parents sending their children to this school. According to the parents interviewed, the reasons for are nothing to do with the school's political background. Of course, one can deduce that those who manage to send their children to this school will not totally disagree with its political stance. Both the interviewed parents, Mr. Hay and Mrs. Tsui claimed that they liked the way

of bringing up children in this school. Mr. Hay said he had examined the academic results of the school in the previous years and he was delighted to see the very good results attained by the students in the public examinations. Mrs. Tsui is a Catholic but she appreciates the efforts of the school in different perspectives even though it is not a religious school. I found that the parents were very satisfied with the provisions of the school and the PTA was strong and effective.

I have been to this school several times on both its present and previous premises. There have been two things which attracted my attention, one being the news and records about China, another has been the academic results recorded achieved in the previous years. Of course, there are other posters and circulars. I could see a lot of information concerning the first manned Chinese mission to the space when I conducted some interviews in the school. I listened to the staff of the school talking about issues related to China ever since I first conducted fieldwork in this school. On the other hand, I could sense that the school places very important emphasis on the academic results of the students. This impression has been endorsed when I conversed with the teachers and the students. It seems that it is a more important "selling point" of the school than its political stance in being pro-China. The parents are pragmatic enough to choose a school that guarantees good academic results, while the school can only survive as long as there are enough students in the present situation of Hong

#### b) Extra-curricular Activities and Student Political Groups

In School B, there were altogether 48 extra-curricular activities (ECA) clubs or organizations in the academic year of 2003/2004. There were other activities organized by the school itself and students were also encouraged to participate in various activities and competitions outside the school. The winning of records earned outside were to be praised and reported by the school authorities. These clubs or organizations were classified as academic, art and music, sports, interest and social services. Of course, students participating in these organizations could learn some civic education or political socialization lessons there. However, the organizations in the sector of social services were rather more related to political socialization.

Table 8.5 Provisions of Extra-curricular Activities in School B (2003-04)

Types of activities	Number of clubs/ organizations		
Academic	11		
Art & Music	6		
Sports	12		
Interest	7		
Social Services	12		
Number in total	48		

According to the school documents, the whole student population set up the Student Union with committee members elected. As it says in one of the promotion

leaflets of the school, 'its aim is primarily to foster a sense of belonging and fraternity among the students and develop leadership skills in the committee members. Bearing the mission of "Serving fellow students, challenging ourselves", it plays an active consultation role in the smooth functioning of the school'.

In School B, the function and composition of the school union are stated in the documents. The function is mainly confined to the services provided to fellow students in the school. They are measures to let students participate in the activities and some kind of democratic mechanism of voting has been practiced. As in School A, the union has not attempted to participate in the daily running of the school management and has no say in important decisions about the school administration.

#### **Summary and Comparisons**

The social composition of the two schools is quite different. The school management board members of School A are Christians and wish to provide Christian education while the school management of School B is largely composed of "loving-country businessmen" hoping to foster national education. The parents of both schools who were interviewed were pragmatic enough to choose a learning environment that guaranteed academic results for their children, without paying too much attention to the schools' specific political or religious backgrounds.

The running of voluntary associations depended on the students' active

involvement and initiative. However, the participation of students was not even. There were always some students who were keen to participate in many of the activities organized by different organizations of the school while some were unwilling to show up for a single setting. There were always some sleeping members of the clubs and societies or "officers in name". Students tended to favour sports rather than community or politically oriented organizations.

Most of the student union's activities were confined to student's welfare, cultural, sport, recreational, social functions and extra-curricular activities. School A and School B did participate in some joint school functions with other schools. The unions of both schools had not attempted to play a part in the business of school administration, academic affairs, school rules and discipline. The acceptance of students' opinions was always subject to the discretion of the school authorities.

#### 8.5 Possible Influence from Other Agents

After examining the political socialization that students in the two schools might be exposed to, it is worthwhile detecting some possible influences from agents other than the school, such as the parents and friends of the students. Of course, students are also influenced by the mass media like the radio and TV programmes they watch and the newspapers and magazines they read. But whether the students are interested in

this aspect is dealt with in the next chapter. In this section, the responses from the students and parents are examined to see whether students were keen on interacting with their parents and friends in the area of political socialization.

#### School A

The students were asked to say whether they often talked with their parents and, if they did, what topics that they would talk about. This was to assess whether they would interact on the topics related to news or politics. I received a variety of responses that could not be generalized in a simple way. Out of the nine students, some said they would often talk with their parents, but without touching serious topics like current issues. Some said they would ask their parents (chiefly father) about some issues they wanted to know more about. Some said their parents tended to talk with them about some hot issues and shared their views with them. Two of them said they seldom talked with their parents (especially their fathers).

Both of the interviewed parents said that they interacted with their child on different topics, which included politics and news. One of the parents, Ms Ho, was very confident she had a great influence on her daughter. But both of them said that they and their respective child were not interested in such serious topics. Therefore, it can be assumed their influence on their child on this aspect was strong.

The students were also asked whether they often talked with their peers and the topics that they would talk about. This was to assess whether they would interact on topics related to news or politics. Most of them said the topics related to news and politics were not their cup of tea at all and it was far too serious to share their views among the peers. However, quite a number of them said they would sometimes discuss among themselves if there were really some very hot issues that caught massive attention in the city. But they stressed that they would not be very serious when talking about these issues.

Chu/F.6: Very seldom. But sometimes we would like to make jokes on the negative news from the government.

Cheung/F.6: I do not talk about news with my peers except those that are funny enough. We just regard them as some kind of gossips.

Therefore, it can be assumed that the peers of the students may be very influential on their political socialization as the topics in the related area were not in the agenda at all.

# School B

The students in School B were also asked to say whether they often talked with their parents and which topics they would talk about. Similar to the situations in School A, I received a variety of responses that could not be generalized in a simple

way. Some said they would often talk with their parents on topics, but without touching on serious topics like current issues. Some said they would talk with their parents on some hot issues and share their views with them. Two of them said they seldom talked with the parents (especially their fathers).

Both of the interviewed parents said that they did interact with their child on different topics but very seldom related to politics and news. But both of them were confident that they were very influential on their respective child. But as they seldom discussed these topics, it can be assumed that their influence on their child on political socialization is strong.

The students were also asked whether they often talked with their peers and the topics that they would talk about. This was to assess whether they would interact on the topics related to news or politics. Most of them said the topics related to news and politics were not their interest at all and it was far too serious to share their views among the peers. Some of them said they sometimes discussed some very hot issues among themselves, but they said they would not bring forward these topics in a deliberate way.

Leung/F.7: There is no reason for me to talk about politics with a friend that we have not been meeting for a long period of time. Even though we would talk about some issues related to politics, we won't be discussing them in a deliberate way.

Therefore, it can be assumed that the peers of the students in School B may be

very influential on their political socialization as the topics in the related area were not on the agenda at all.

To summarize and compare, both students of School A and School B are very similar. Their parents affect them but as they are not keen in exchanging their views on issues related to news and politics, it can be assumed that the influence is great. Moreover, as the students of both schools are not keen to talk about so-called serious topics with their friends, the assumption must be that peer influence on the political socialization of the students is not minimal.

#### 8.6 Summary and Conclusions

It is obvious that the portraits of both schools are different, given the backdrop and development of the respective schools. Both schools place emphasis on the provision of civic education programmes. However, School A would regard it as one of the various agendas that the school has to fulfill. Unlike School A, Civic Education in School B is closely related to nationalistic education. Anyway, students of both schools develop their political socialization in their own ways, being affected by the formal curriculum and informal curriculum. Students of both schools are affected by their school settings, apart from the possible influence of their parents and peers.

# CHAPTER 9 HOW EFFECTIVE ARE THE STUDENTS BEING POLITICALLY SOCIALIZED: VIEWS AND PERCEPTIONS OF DIFFERENT PARTIES

In this chapter, the research question on the effectiveness of the students being socialized politically will be evaluated through the views and perceptions of different parties, including the principals, teachers, and past and existing students. To rate the effectiveness of the political socialization of the schools, it is also meaningful to examine the extent of interest of the students and the past students in news and political issues, together with views of the school staff members and the parents.

# 9.1 Effectiveness of Political Socialization in the Schools: Views and Perceptions of Different Parties

In this section, the effectiveness of civic education programmes in the two schools will be evaluated by examining the views of the principal and teachers, as well as the responses from students and past students of the two sampled schools.

# School A

### a) The Principal

In School A, the principal (Mr. So) claimed that it was difficult to decide whether the School had done sufficient work for civic education or not. However, the School had been trying its best to do as much as possible. He tended to think that the students in the School were improving in this arena because they were more

conscious of their national identity and becoming more mature in their civic behaviour.

Mr. So: We have been doing everything that we can think of. Our students are gaining their sense of nationality. Some years ago, they laughed and felt very uneasy when they were singing the national anthem. The situation, however, is changed now. They are very attentive during the hoisting of the national flag. I think the students have been socialised in a subtle way that proved the effectiveness of our civic education programmes. We have been keeping on doing the right job by reminding them something.... To name one example -- students used to tear up publication leaflets of the election of Student Union for fun in the past years but they are behaving themselves and are more considerate now.

#### b) Teachers

None of the teachers indicated that there has been sufficient civic education programmes in the School over previous years. Mr. Ho, the teacher-in-charge of civic education programmes in the School, added that they had not done enough work for it.

Mr. Ho: Not enough. The School authority should place more resources into civic education in terms of manpower and funding. Teachers usually regard Civic Education as an auxiliary subject. Teachers are not willing to spend much time on it. Together with the wide scope of the subject, I cannot see it being very effective in the area of political education. Hence, there is a long way for the School to go in promoting the sense of national identity among students who may have negative feelings for China before. Yet, there are so many other current issues that require our attention, e.g. 'District Board Elections'.

Ms Kung: We have talked about the history of China on National Day without touching upon the present situation of China, given its sensitivity. More importantly, the School has no intention to introduce it to students.

Mr. Wong: We really have done something, e.g. hoisting of the national flag during the National Day, participating in some related activities organized by external bodies. However, students and teachers are usually playing the role of spectator and so the effectiveness is doubtful. Definitely, there is room for improvement if we really want to have more in-depth understanding of the subject. One point to note is that we cannot be too "hard sell" on it as we are avoiding being labeled as a "left-wing" school.

Mr. Sum: At present, the students do not have the habit of showing concern for civic education. In the sphere of fostering the sense of national identity, students are simply thinking that it is not their business at all... The teaching staff members in the School have no consensus either on the aims/objectives to be achieved in this area or the political stance to take.

#### c) Students

In order to evaluate the effectiveness of the civic education programmes, students were asked questions on their feelings about messages related to civic education, chiefly delivered in the form period and assemblies. Varied answers were received. Some of them said that they learnt something from the messages, while others claimed that the messages were boring and most of them did not pay great attention to them.

Tang/F.4: Those messages of civic education are basically useful. If we are willing to listen, we will learn a lot from them. For those who are unwilling to listen, it is no use for the teachers to repeat them again and again.

Cheung/F.6: The principal and teachers will share with us their views on the current issues and we tend to agree with them.

- Ng/F.7: I think the messages are repeated every year. It may be their intention to have them formalized and become a routine through such practice. They served effectively as reminders only.
- Chan/F.7: The messages are having slight effectiveness. Actually, the messages are easy to understand. Nonetheless, the poor presentation skill of the presenter, i.e. the principal, deters our interest in them.

#### d) Past Students

All the six graduates were unclear about the messages conveyed in the assemblies and form periods or other occasions. In their memories, there had been far more topics concerning religion and music than on political issues or civic education. However, given the School had invited some external guests to speak in the assemblies and there were different topics each time, they were able to learn something from them.

- Lui/00: I can recall that the School has put some efforts on the learning of civic education but my memory on that was very vague. The most impressive one should be the ceremony of hoisting national flag because school prefects have to patrol for that. For those topics on civic education, we learnt them in the morning but simply forgot them in the afternoon.
- Yeung/92: I like the sharing of teachers, on matters of religion or civic education because it is inspiring. I have some vague memory on the topic of election only as I have little interest in politics.
- Chan/92: For the assemblies and form periods in my years, there have been many more topics on religion and music than on civic education.

To summarize, the perception of the principal on the effectiveness of the civic

education programmes in the School was quite different from that of the teachers. From the viewpoints of the teachers, civic education in the School could not be regarded as very successful. The teachers managed to describe some of the activities but these were mostly on a surface level. It was also doubtful whether students in the School fully understood the meaning of the messages that the School intended to convey. Most of the students and past students did not have much interest in the messages delivered in assemblies and form periods. They appeared to be apolitical.

#### School B

#### a) The Principal

Mr. Tam, the principal of School B, indicated that the School had organized a lot of civic education programmes, which were well received by students. However, he also agreed that it was difficult to assess the effectiveness of the programmes. Anyway, the School was willing to put more effort into the promotion of civic education for students.

Mr. Tam: It is difficult to evaluate the effectiveness of the programmes since we have not done any surveys or built up any mechanism to measure it. We have organized civic education programmes, such as the hoisting of the national flag and exchange projects with counterparts in Mainland China. Nevertheless, we do not have designed any structured mechanism to assess whether there is any enhancement in the sense of national identity/consciousness and the level of social knowledge of students after

taking part in the activities. So, it is difficult to tell. Honestly, I think there is nothing called "enough" and we always try to do our best.

#### b) Teachers

When the teachers in School B were asked about the effectiveness of civic education programmes in the School, one teacher claimed that the result was satisfactory. However, Mr. Hui, the teacher-in-charge of civic education for the previous academic year, pointed out that it was difficult to decide on the effectiveness within a short period of time. Other teachers thought that it was difficult to evaluate because they had not been directly involved in the related programmes.

- Mr. Tong: Very satisfactory. There are some very hot issues recently, e.g. the first Chinese manned mission to space. We manage to use these chances to organize activities to arouse students' interest. Both students and teachers fully participated in the activities.
- Mr. Hui: It is difficult to tell right now as it takes years to see. Take my own case as an example. I did not realize that I had strong interests in social issues and politics when I was in the lower form. I just eventually found that I had keen interest in it after some years when I had grown up. Likewise, the effectiveness of these programmes will only be realized after several years later.
- Miss Fu: I know the School always makes use of the current hot issues to educate our students. Nevertheless, it has been done in a scattered, discontinued and non-systematic manner. Since I am not a member of the Civic Education Group, I don't know what exactly they have done. They should have done something, but they may not catch the attention of students.

Miss Lam: This part is out of my responsibilities. Hence, I am not sure the exact

objective of the programmes. In my mind, we have done a lot of things concerning national identity and consciousness and we do have some achievements.... But as civic education is not just confined to national education, I think we have to make more adjustments and do more.

#### c) Students

The students said that they understood the pro-China background of their School. They said that quite a number of topics of the messages conveyed in the form periods and assemblies were on patriotic education, rather than civic education that stressed civic mindedness. Of course, there were also topics and themes other than political socialization. No negative comments on the programmes from students were observed. One F.5 student recalled that when she was in F.1, the School arranged students to help candidates of elections who were close to the School (or simply past students). This should be regarded as a significant exposure to political socialization.

- Wong/F.4: We have assemblies on civic education, for example, about the first manned mission to the space. We watched the live broadcast together through the television in the School. Therefore we are familiar with the issue.
- Chan/F.5: When I was in F.1, we were asked by teachers to help dispatch some promotion leaflets on the streets for candidates of the District Board elections. These candidates were friends of the School or our past students.
- Fu/F.7: As this is a pro-China school, the principal always talk about patriotism and we have lots of patriotic activities.
- Leung/F.7: The School actively shares its viewpoints with students on different

political issues, like supporting the passing of Article 23 of the Basic Law. However, students are given the freedom to choose to follow or not.

#### d) Past Students

Most of the past students indicated that they received a lot of civic education during their school years. However, this was not just confined to the form periods and the assemblies. Such messages were also transmitted from their teachers through lessons and other means. One even said that the assemblies were used mainly for moral education, as there were other chances/means for patriotic education during her years in the School.

- Wong/69: When we studied in the School, the School indoctrinated in us a sense of patriotism.
- Shi/66: The teacher teaching Chinese History sometimes talked about messages of civic education during his lessons.
- Lee/97: On the year of return of Hong Kong's sovereignty to China (1997), the School had been initiating discussion on this issue for one whole year.
- Ip/95: I was a new immigrant from China during my years in the School; the teachers were also new immigrants. Therefore, we had a strong sense of national identity already and we were all patriotic. We did not need to stress political things at all. The School just spent most of the assemblies on moral education instead.

To summarize, the principal was rather satisfied with the effectiveness of the School's civic education programmes even though he indicated that it was difficult to

measure and more work could still be done. For the teachers, the senior teacher (Mr. Tong) and the teacher-in-charged of the civic education programme (Mr. Hui) tended to give very positive views on the effectiveness of the programmes. Another two teachers doubted such views and claimed that better organized work had to be done in order to achieve better results. The students themselves knew the background of their school and anticipated that the civic education programmes would be focused on patriotic education. The past students claimed that they managed to touch upon civic education in the school a lot of time simply because of their particular backgrounds as they were mostly coming from the mainland. They claimed that the School promoted civic education through different channels, including assemblies, form periods, lessons, etc. Given most of the students and teachers were new immigrants from China, they actually did not require special training on civic/political education.

# **Summary and Comparisons**

The principals of both schools tended to think that the schools were qualified in the area of civic education since they had put effort and resources into the subject.

Senior staff and the teacher-in-charge of the civic education programme of School B claimed that the School's civic education programmes should be regarded as successful. On the other hand, the teacher-in-charge of the civic education programme

of School A said that he was not so satisfied with its sufficiency and suggested that more resources should be devoted to the programmes. Other teachers of both schools also claimed that more work had to be done. For students, negative comments were received from School A only. Students in School B understood the standpoint of the School and accepted the nature of the civic education messages. Past students of School A had a very vague impression on the messages of the civic education programmes or those related to politics. However, past students of School B had much more exposure in politics or patriotic education within the school settings.

Different parties expressed their views on the effectiveness and sufficiency of the civic education programmes. In the next section, the students' interests in news and political issues will be examined to triangulate the effectiveness of political socialization

# 9.2 Students' Interest in News, Current Issues and Political Issues

In this section, the responses from the students and past students are recorded and examined to see how interested they are in the areas of news, current issues and politics. In order to get a clearer picture, the views of the teachers on this aspect are also examined since the teachers are the ones closest to the students.

# School A

#### The teachers' views

When teachers were asked whether their students were interested in news and political issues, most of them explicitly said 'no'.

- Mr. Sum: Students are not very interested to talk about current and political issues during the lessons but there are some students who would like to talk with me other than the lesson times. But these students are really very limited.
- Ms Kung: Students are interested in some issues that are related to the public examinations of the subject Economics as some questions are concerned with current issues. Students are interested in all examination-oriented things.
- Mr. Ho: Students are not very interested in some topics that I find very important.

  There are certainly some political issues that students should know. For example, they find the topics on the Basic Law very boring. As their teacher, I just wonder whether I should proceed on teaching these topics or not.

According to the observations of the interviewed teachers, students in general are not interested in current and political issues. Of course, there are always exceptions, but they seem to be very limited. If students show their concern for current issues simply as a means of preparing for the public examinations, it is hard to claim they really have any interest at all.

#### The students' responses

When the students were asked whether they often talked with their teachers and schoolmates, with special reference to current issues or politics, some said they sometimes talk with the teachers on different issues and most of them said they

seldom talked about politics with their teachers. Some also said they tended to talk with their fellow schoolmates instead of the teachers if there were really some hot political or current issues. Some even said they simply had not talked with their teachers at all.

- Lau/F.4: I seldom talk with my teachers for we have no time to communicate at all. Sometimes I would talk briefly with my classmates if some political hot issues arise.
- Law/F.6: I seldom talk about politics since these are too serious issues. I don't like talking about serious things at all.
- Cheung/F.6: I have never talked about politics with my teachers and even some other issues are seldom discussed. I don't want to talk about such boring issues with my schoolmates also.
- Ng/F.7: We managed to discuss some issues in the lessons, such as during the History periods for the teacher is an expert in this area.

The students were also asked to say whether they were active in participating in any extracurricular activities related to civic education within and outside the school. The responses were varied. Some said they were not active at all and did not participate in any form of activities related to civic education because they found themselves too busy or simply not interested in those activities. Some managed to name some of the activities they had engaged in such as the student union committee and going to the mass rally of 1 July 2003. Overall, the students of School A are not active in participating in activities at all.

Questions were also asked about their interests in reading newspaper, magazines and TV programmes.

Out of the nine interviewed students, two said that they would not read the newspaper daily at all, except if there were some very hot issues that they would try to read some articles only. Some mentioned to me that they would read most of the columns available in the newspapers while some said that they would mainly concentrate on reading the "entertainment page" first. Two students did mention that they read newspapers simply because they wanted to improve their English standard and to prepare for the public examinations.

- Wan/F.4: I seldom read the pages about the news. I used to read pages of entertainment, sports and the likes.
- Ng/F.7: I like reading the South China Morning Post because I can learn English from it.
- Chu/F.6: I will read the pages that are related to my homework assignments. Those news articles about Hong Kong will most probably become questions of public examinations.

Nearly all the interviewed students claimed that they were not keen on reading the magazines. Some of them managed to read some simply because their family members bought them and they happened to scan through some of the articles there. They managed to mention some of the names of the magazines they sometimes read that included things such as entertainment, youth, women and religion. Only one

student managed to mention the name of a magazine that talks about political and current issues in Hong Kong and elsewhere – the Asia Weekly. But this student had already given up reading this for some time.

Most of the students also mentioned that they had the habit of watching the TV news. One of them even said it was very necessary to be kept informed of current situations. There were fewer students who listened to the radio news as well. For TV programmes concerning the current issues other than the news, nearly all the students said that they would not watch them purposefully, but just by chance or depending on the topics of the programmes.

The students were asked whether they were interested in news and current affairs at all, and whether they could describe one issue that interested them most. Some students mentioned that they were not interested in news and current affairs at all. Some said they were partly interested and willing to spare some limited time. Some did mention that they were interested in these issues and managed to express their views clearly in detail. One also mentioned that it helped to prepare for further studies.

Law/F.6: I am quite interested in political news and current issues for they help me to think.

Ng/F.7: I have to sit for the university entrance examination and I want to study social work. That is why I pay more attention to current issues and politics.

# The past students' responses

When the past students were asked whether they often talked with their teachers and schoolmates, with special reference to current issues or politics, some said they sometimes talked with the teachers on different issues and most of them said they seldom talked about politics with their teachers. Some also said that they tended to talk with their teachers if there were really some hot political or current issues but that would not be the norm.

The past students were also asked to say whether they were active in participating in any extracurricular activities related to civic education within the school. Most of them said they were inactive, without participating in any form of activities related to civic education. One student mentioned that she had participated in some voluntary service work for other needy groups through the school. One of them mentioned that he participated in the Christian Fellowship of the school that also talked about civic education sometimes. One mentioned that he had participated in the Community Safety Services Squad as a way of fulfilling his civic responsibilities. Overall, the past students of School A were not very active in participating in activities at all.

All the interviewed past students said that they had the habit of reading newspapers. They named a variety of newspapers that were popular but not very

serious, and some were serious but less popular. Some of them tended to say they would scan most of the pages in the newspapers, while some also mentioned that the "page of entertainment" was their favourite. Again, one response was recorded that reading newspaper was something to do with study or public examination.

Tsui/99: I started reading Ming Pao (newspaper) from F.5 onwards since I had to prepare for the public examinations. I have to read the column of forum. I have to read these as well since my university study also requires me to read. For leisure, I read the pages of entertainment and miscellaneous.

Among the six interviewed past students, only two of them (who turned out to be male) said that they would constantly read magazines on serious themes that included politics and economics. The other four (who turned out to be female) said that they had no constant habit of buying and reading some magazines. But they would just scan through magazines concerned with leisure and beauty.

Most of them said they would listen to the news on the radio and watch the TV news as well. But nearly all of them said that they would not be very keen in watching special programmes. Some said they would watch those programmes if they just happened to do so. One of them said she had no interest in those sorts of programmes at all.

The past students were also asked whether they were interested in politics and current affairs and active in political activities of any form. Three out of six said that

they had no interest in politics and would not participate in political activities. The other three said that they tended to have some interest in knowing about events that happened locally, but they would not have much interest in participating in those political activities.

Yeung/92: I will not be involved and would never think of participating in any political activities. I have no experience either. Concerning current affairs, I would like to be a spectator only.

To summarize, the responses from the teachers, students and past students show that they are not very interested in politics, news and current affairs. Both students and past students showed little or no interest in civic education. They are not keen readers of serious articles in the newspapers and magazines that talk about politics, economics and current issues. Their interests in news and current issues programmes are in general not strong.

# School B

#### The teachers' views

When the teachers were asked whether their students were interested in news, current issues and political issues, most of them said they tended to share their views on different issues with them. As mentioned in a section of the previous chapter, teachers would like to share their thoughts with their students, though these might not

be confined to news and politics. However, some teachers said that they tended to share some current issues and the issues related to China with their students, because they themselves are interested in these areas. This implied that their students were quite willing to listen to their teachers' sharing on these fields as well. There were not too many responses from the teachers directly on their views about students' interest in these issues, except the one below.

Ms Lee: Just like students of other schools in Hong Kong, students may not be interested in politics; they care more about their future careers.

#### The students' responses

When the students were asked whether they often talked with their teachers and schoolmates, with special reference to current issues or politics, some said they sometimes talked with the teachers on different issues and most of them said they seldom talked about politics with their teachers. Most of the students said that they were inclined not to talk about current issues and politics at all for various reasons, such as they were not interested in that at all, that these topics are far too serious to discuss with the teachers and schoolmates and they wanted to simply avoid any conflict. They said that the teachers seldom talked about these topics nowadays, unlike in past years. Some mentioned that they would still be interested in current issues but just mainly for the sake of examinations.

- Wong/F.4: We don't talk about these things in detail since I am not interested in these at all.
- Chan/F.5: We, of course, do not talk about politics since these are too serious issues. We should study well first. Politics are something we have to know later in the society.
- Siu/F.5: These are none of my business at all.
- Fu/F.7: We are too busy concentrating on our studies. As we always have different viewpoints with each other then we tend not to talk about politics with our teachers. As the teachers, especially those teachers of elder age, tended to be pro-China (most probably because this is a pro-China school), and I have my own views therefore I had better not discuss with them.
- Leung/F.7: I will not talk too much about politics with my classmates lest it be harmful to our friendship.
- Kwan/F.7: We would like to discuss some issues that are related to subjects like Chinese Culture and Economics. If they are exam-related, we will pay much more attention. Besides, we can broaden our horizons as well.

The students were also asked to say whether they were active in participating in any extracurricular activities related to civic education within and outside the school. The responses were varied. Some said they were completely inactive, without participating in any form of activities related to civic education because they found themselves too busy. Some managed to name some of the activities they had engaged in such as the student union committee, Girl Guides and music. One student mentioned she participated in activities for instrumental reasons. Two students in F.7 mentioned that they participated in the student union but were afraid of the elections.

- Wong/F.4: We don't participate too much in school's activities because we are very busy with our homework assignments. We have lots of pressure.
- Wan/F.5: Participating in activities can gain me experiences which are helpful when we go for work. That is some kind of instrumental purpose and might not be anything in relation to the sense of politics and participation.
- Leung/F.7: In the student union, I am not so keen on election lest they are harmful to friendship with others.

With regard to participating in activities outside the school, only students from F.7 said they had experiences in participating in voluntary work related to civic education and they would work as voluntary helpers after finishing the public examinations. However, they said they were not interested in politics at all. They just wanted to help.

- Kwan/F.7: After sitting for the A-level examinations, I will work as a voluntary helper for a councilor's office.
- Kwan/F.7: I am not interested in these activities even though I work as a helper for a candidate running for a district board election. I helped dispatching the promotion leaflets.
- Kwan/F.7: I work as a helper in the Labour Federation which is a pro-China organization simply because my mother works there. I just help doing some kind of clerical work; it is nothing to do with politics.

Questions were also asked about their interests in reading newspapers, magazines and TV programmes.

School B subscribed to four newspapers for their students to read in the school

days, two being pro-China newspapers. The students expressed their views on these newspapers. Some students claimed that they did not like the two pro-China newspapers. Two students said they liked reading the two pro-China newspapers because of the high standard of some articles, nothing to do with their political backgrounds. Some mentioned to me that they would read most of the columns available in the newspapers while some said that they would mainly concentrate on reading the "entertainment page" first.

- Wong/F.4: Wen Wei Pao (a pro-China newspaper) mainly reports the things in China, this news seem to be very remote to me.
- Wan/F.5: I don't like Tai Kung Pao (a pro-China newspaper) because it is lack of vividness at all and reports things in the mainland mainly. These are boring. When we were in F.1, we could only read "Wen Wei" and "Tai Kung". But since students did not like to read, the school was forced to subscribe to Ming Pao and Sing Tao as well.
- Leung/F.7: I read Tai Kung as well because the articles are of high standard and there will not be so much reporting of negative news.

Nearly all the interviewed students claimed that they were not keen on reading magazines. One even said she had no habit of reading any magazines. Some of them managed to read some simply because their family members buy them and they happened to scan through some of the articles there. They managed to mention some of the names of the magazines they sometimes read that included some kind of entertainment, youth, lady and sports.

Some of the students mentioned that they had the habit of watching the TV news.

Quite a number of them (F.5 and F.7 students) said that they simply had no time for watching TV programmes. Nearly all the students said that they would not watch them purposefully, but just by chance or depending on the topics of the programmes.

Some mentioned that they tended to listen to the news in English radio and TV channels as a way to learn English.

The students were asked whether they were interested in news and current affairs at all and to describe to me one piece of news that interested them most. Students of F.4 and F.5 mentioned that they were not interested in news and current affairs at all. However, all the three students of F.7 said that they were interested to know the things happening around. They managed to tell me their views about the debate on Article 23 of the Basic Law and the Chinese first manned space mission. They claimed that it should be the citizens' duty to be concerned with the development of Hong Kong and elsewhere. The following response was remarkable in showing the maturity of this F.7 student.

Kwan/F.7: I am interested in the Article 23 debate. I did go to the mass rally on 1 July 2003. I know the standpoint of my school that is supporting the passing of this article. Therefore, I tried to keep a low profile when I went for the protest gathering since I had to care for the feelings of the school authorities.

The past students' responses

When the past students were asked whether they often talked with their teachers and schoolmates, with special reference to current issues or politics, some said their teachers quite often talked with them on different issues about politics. Students would sometimes also discuss the related issues among themselves. They also had experience of helping some people who were friends of the school lobbying for votes in elections.

- Kong/94: When I was in F.2 and F.3, we helped someone lobbying for votes in elections. We were "semi-voluntary" as we were asked by the school to do so. When we did not understand the meaning of that, the teachers explained what this kind of politics was about.... As we had the period of reading newspaper, we would sometimes talk about current affairs and politics.
- Lee/97: Most of the time, it was the teachers who took the initiative to talk with us about politics.
- Ip/95: I did not know how to distinguish whether the things we were talking about could be regarded as political issues or not. What the teachers were concerned with was the feelings towards the mother country. They would talk a lot on patriotism. We were surely moved by them.

The past students were also asked to say whether they were active in participating in any extracurricular activities related to civic education within the school. They could just manage to narrate some jobs like "selling the flag" (for charity purposes) and helping to run the election campaign of candidates who were related to the school. Helping to run election campaigns should be regarded as a

typical political activity.

All the five interviewed past students said that they had the habit of reading the two pro-China newspapers because they were required to read them at school in the past. Unlike the present students in this school, they had good comments on these two newspapers. Some of them would also read other newspapers as well. One said he did not read newspapers so often now. His response about reading newspapers is worth quoting.

Kong/94: As I have a strong feeling of patriotism, I do not like those articles that criticize my country.

Nearly all the five interviewed past students said that they had no habit of reading any magazine at all. Only one of them named the type of computer science magazines that would be his favourite.

Most of them said they would listen to the news on the radio and watch the TV news as well. But nearly all of them were not very keen on watching special programmes about current issues or politics. One of them did mention that she liked a programme that talked about news headlines in a humorous way. Some said they would watch those programmes if they just happened to do so.

The past students were also asked whether they were interested in politics and current affairs and whether they were active in political activities of any form. Only one of them said she would be a voluntary helper in election campaigns. Two of them

said that they tended to have some interest in knowing the events happening around them but they would not have much interest in participating in those political activities. One said he was not very interested in politics at all.

To summarize, as revealed from the responses from the teachers, students and past students in School B, it seems that both the students and past students are not very interested in politics, news and current affairs. They are not keen readers of serious articles that talk about politics, economics and current issues in the newspapers and magazines now. Their interest in news and current issues programmes (both radio and TV) is generally low. However, the mentality of the present students and past students is quite different. The present students are not very willing to discuss politics and current issues with their teachers and schoolmates for all sorts of reasons while the past students were more willing to listen to their teachers. The present students generally do not like reading the pro-China newspapers while the past students liked to read them when they were studying in the school. They still read these newspapers even though they read other newspapers as well. It seems that the teachers past and present would usually try to share their views concerning current issues and especially patriotic feelings with their students.

#### **Summary and Comparisons**

The findings show that students' interest in politics, current issues and news of both schools are actually similar. The teachers in School A claimed that their students were not very interested in the mentioned areas while teachers in School B in general did not convey this picture but they did try to share their views with their students. Findings show that students and past students of the both schools are not very interested in politics, current affairs and news. They are neither keen in reading related magazines, radio and TV programmes, nor in participating much in activities of this kind both within and outside the school. There is a coherent picture of the responses of students and past students in School A, since the responses to different questions were similar. However, one can see differences between the students and past students in School B. The past students tended to accept the standards and instructions set by the school and this attitude is actually still being kept up to the present. The present students often think differently. They may not totally follow the teachers' views even though they tend to respect the standpoint of the school authorities.

# 9.3 Analysis and Conclusions

The effectiveness of the political socialization in the schools has been assessed through the perceptions of different parties of both schools, and also by examining the

extent of interest of the students and the past students in news and political issues.

In School A, it was found that different parties would have their own perceptions on the effectiveness of the civic education programme of their school. It is quite obvious that the students and the past students are or were not very interested in the messages contained in the civic education of the school. Both parties are also not very interested in reading newspaper, magazines and television programmes about news and political issues. Actually, such findings are consistent with the previous findings by Hong Kong scholars on this issue – students are in general apathetic. As revealed from the responses of the students and past students, it was seen as too serious to talk about news and political issues and they preferred not to run into possible conflicts with their peers when exchanging their ideas.

In School B, different parties have their own perceptions on the effectiveness of the civic education programme of their school. The difference between the students and the past student is worth noting. The past students seemed to be more willing to accept the messages from the civic education programme of the school. However, both the students and the past students are not very interested in news and political issues, except, for the past students, those issues related to China. This finding is actually contrary to some previous findings such as Lam (1994), which claimed that students of the "patriotic" schools are more political than the other students in Hong

Kong. Of course, the times have changed and the student intake of School B has not been confined to new immigrants from China. As shown in the quoted responses, unlike in the past when reading the two pro-China newspapers were the only choices for the interviewed past students, the current students could choose to subscribe to another two newspapers. The school authorities cannot so easily control their choices now. Some of the interviewed students claimed that they do not like reading the two pro-China newspapers, as they thought they were boring.

According to the school authorities of the two schools, the political socialization of the civic education programmes of the schools was quite successful, as they had put a lot of resources into it, though they also admitted that more work could be done. However, as revealed by the responses of the teachers, students and past students, the effectiveness might not be as much as the supervisors and the principals of the two schools expect. There is always a gap of perceptions between the senior managers of the schools and the front-line teachers. Moreover, the students and the past students of the two schools are not interested in news and political issues in general, except for preparing for the public examinations. It was found that students of both schools and the past students of School A can be grouped into the same category as their responses are actually very similar while the past students of School B provide another category as their responses are different from the other three parties.

One cannot conclude that there is marked difference between the two schools in terms of interest towards politics, as revealed from the responses of different parties. However, it is worthwhile examining their responses concerning the four suggested elements of political socialization in the following two chapters.

# CHAPTER 10 HOW EFFECTIVE ARE THE STUDENTS BEING POLITICALLY SOCIALIZED: THE FULFILLMENT OF THE FOUR SUGGESTED ELEMENTS (1)

In this and the next chapter, the fulfilment of the four suggested elements of political socialization in the two schools will be evaluated. The elements of national identity and consciousness, and democracy/participation will be examined in this chapter. The views of the supervisor, principal, teachers and parents of one school on each element will be evaluated first and then the responses of the students and past students on that element will be reported and evaluated. Efforts will be made to analyse the responses from the different parties.

# 10.1 National Identity and Consciousness

# School A

#### The views of the supervisor, principal, teachers and parents

The supervisor, Mr. Lai, claimed that he had no concrete data to prove whether the students in School A were strong in their sense of national identity and national consciousness. His impression, however, drawn from his contact with the School prefects was that the students of his school should be quite good in this regard. Mr. Lai himself thought that this sense was of utmost importance.

Mr. Lai: I have a general feeling that the national education of our school is relatively successful, as students in Hong Kong generally accept their national identity after 1997.

The principal, Mr. So, expressed a similar message to that of the supervisor. He also claimed that he had no concrete research data on this issue. But he believed his students should be quite good in the sense of national identity and consciousness now. He compared the situation of past years with the present days concerning the students' singing of the National Anthem. He found his students were improving in this sense. Mr. So himself thought that this sense was very important.

From the viewpoints of the teachers interviewed, however, students were not developing a good sense of national identity and consciousness. All agreed that their students were weak in this sense while the teachers themselves regarded it as important. According to the teachers, students tend to term themselves as "Hongkongese" rather than "Chinese", the reason probably being due to the fact that some students simply did not like the Chinese regime. However, they thought the situation was getting better since the image of China, as well as her economic environment, was improving.

Mr. Yau: Students call themselves "Hongkongese" rather than "Chinese", as they find the educational level and economic situation of the mainlanders are inferior to that of Hong Kong.

Ms Kung: Not strong. The weak sense can be reflected from their attitude towards the

Chinese Language. As an English language teacher, I find most of the students are more eager to brush up their English and have a high motive to learn it, instead of their mother language.

- Mr. Wong: Some students regard nationalism as equivalent to identification with the present (communist) government. As they do not accept the present Chinese regime, they tend to think that they are resisting the nationalist feelings.
- Mr. Ho: The situation is improving, as China is becoming stronger and stronger. When China really becomes a strong country, there will be a greater chance for students in Hong Kong to have a stronger sense of national identity and consciousness. But it takes time and it cannot be achieved by force.

It is worthwhile referring to the responses from the parents on this issue. One of the interviewed parents, Mr. Fong, thought that his son was not strong in this sense. He himself did not think this sense was so important and he said he would not expect the school to strengthen this sense.

Mr. Fong: Very weak. My son would sense himself as a Chinese but he seldom makes this explicit. He does not regard it as important at all.

However, another interviewed parent, Ms Ho, claimed that her daughter was quite strong in this respect but she also admired foreign things at the same time. She herself thought that this sense was important.

Ms Ho: To the sense of national identity, my daughter should be quite all right at the present time. She regards herself as Chinese, but at the same time, I think she admires foreign things more. She likes English Language rather than Chinese.

#### The views of the students

The students were asked to tell me what national identity and consciousness meant to them. When asked whether they regard themselves more as "Chinese" or "Hongkongese", most of the responses sided with the "Hongkongese" rather than "Chinese"— only two of the nine interviewed students mentioned that they would rather regard themselves as "Chinese". But most of those who responded as regarding themselves as Hongkongese noted they were not denying their Chinese origins. Let us look at some of their responses.

- Chu/F.6: Chinese. I am having the Chinese blood in my body.
- Chan/F.7: I think Hong Kong is an integral part of China. I am proud of being Chinese.
- Ng/F.7: I would rather claim myself as Hongkongese as Hong Kong is better.
- Law/F.6: Hongkongese. There are lots of differences between Hong Kong and China. China is still so backward.
- Lau/F.4: As I have been claiming myself as "Hongkongese" since I was very young before 1997, I just used to think so.

The students were asked to tell me whether they were proud of being Chinese especially on occasions when Chinese players managed to get gold medals at the Olympics. Nearly all the interviewed students gave me a similar response – they would feel happy when China managed to get gold medals at the Olympics and with

events like the first manned mission to the space, as they were Chinese as well.

However, most of them added that they were not very satisfied with the situation in

China and they tended to be not so proud as Chinese in this respect.

- Cheung/F.6: Whenever there is any good news about China, such as getting prizes at the Olympics, I feel proud. But on normal days, there are so many negative reports about China, such as the environmental, economic and moral problems, I am not proud as a Chinese.
- Wong/F.7: It is very natural that I expect China would get more and more gold medals at the Olympics. I would feel very happy. However, I don't appreciate all the things done by the Chinese.
- Wan/F.4: I feel proud and happy with the success of the first Chinese manned mission. However, some people are just exaggerating!

However, one of the students said he was proud of being Chinese simply because of the Chinese culture.

Chan/F.7: We should be proud for our culture. We have a long history and we managed to retain it among the world of nations. We have our unique sense of thinking.

When the students were asked how much they were going to contribute to the mother country and whether they would sacrifice their lives for the country or not, most of the students thought that to die for the country was actually too remote and too serious. Only one student did not reject such a possibility.

Law/F.7: It is too extreme to say dying for the country. I hope I can contribute to the

country in a less serious way like giving money.

Wan/F.5: May be. We have to repay our country that gives us so many things.

The students were also asked to rate whether the welfare of the individual was more important than the welfare of the nation or vice versa. All tended to say that both were important. No one said he or she would just care for their own affairs and no one said he or she would just give everything to the country. However, some seemed to be caring a bit more for themselves.

- Chu/F.6: Just half and half. I will care for my own interest and the interest of my country. If I were expected to make too much sacrifice, it seems to be too remote for me.
- Chan/F.7: I admire those who fully contribute all to their country. But I can't be that great.
- Wong/F.7: I will act according to my strength. I can't be just thinking of nothing but the country. I need to care for myself.

The students were also asked to mention their impressions of Chinese people. It seemed that most of them had a quite good impression. They managed to point out the strong points of Chinese generally while three of the nine students also pinpointed some weak points as well. But on the whole, their impression of Chinese people was good.

Wan/F.4: Chinese people should be regarded as quite good; they have high intelligence.

- Law/F.6: Chinese people are hard working.
- Cheung/F.6: Chinese have good moral standards. China has a long history, in comparison with other countries. China has lots of historical sites and legends.
- Siu/F.5: In terms of character, Chinese people are very hard working. But some Chinese are low in education standards and their behaviours are to be improved as well.
- Chan/F.7: Some Chinese people are poor in public hygiene. My impression on Chinese people is fair, not too bad or too good.

The students were also asked to say something about the status of China among the nations of the world. All the students thought that the status of China would be ever ascending even though it was not so great at the present time.

- Tang/F.4: The status of Chinese people is constantly improving. In the past, China was not open and too conservative, and thus being backward. Now China is open and manages to compete, therefore her status is quite high now.
- Ng/F.7: When I studied histories of China and the western world, I learnt that China was very strong in the ancient times. Now China is rising slowly. China is not very strong at all right now.

The students were also asked to say whether they wanted to see China powerful in the world of nations, and whether China should strive for power and take strong actions in some foreign policies. All the responses said that they would like to see China being strong. But in terms of foreign polices, only a few responses supported a firmer pose. Even for those who stressed firmer actions, they claimed that China

should avoid using force as far as possible.

Tang/F.4: I want China to become a strong power in the world and she should not try to resort to aggressive foreign policies but by means of self- improvement.

Chu/F.6: On the issues of Diaoyutai and Taiwan, I think China should take firmer policies and take them back with the least casualties. But it will be good to avoid any war.

I also tried to ask whether they had discussed all the related or similar issues with their teachers or anyone else in the school setting so as to see whether they were really affected by the school or not. Most of them answered that they had seldom discussed such issues except on a few occasions during lessons of Chinese History or Chinese Culture that might touch upon some of the related topics.

#### The views of the past students

When the question 'do you regard yourself as a "Hongkongese" rather than "Chinese" or vice versa' was posed to the six past students of School A, the answers were diversified. Only one gave me a definite answer: Chinese. Some said they would now claim themselves Chinese as Hong Kong had been returned to China.

Lee/92: I think I am Chinese as Hong Kong belongs to China.

Yeung/92: I would rather think I am Hongkongese as we are smarter in terms of thinking and culture.

Chan/92: I think I was Hongkongese during the days of British rule. As Hong Kong has been returned, I am Chinese now.

Hui/99: Both.

Tsui/99: When I studied in secondary school, I tended to think I was Hongkongese, as I did not feel proud of China. After 1997, I am very willing to claim myself as Chinese.

Lui/00: Hongkongese. I used to use the identity of Hong Kong people. Even though Hong Kong has been returned, I still think I am Hongkongese.

I asked them whether they were proud of being Chinese and whether they were happy if they heard China's National Anthem at the Olympics. All said that they would be pleased. But two of them said that they would not be extremely pleased.

Lee/92: When we Chinese managed to win, I felt glory and happy.

Tsui/99: I was proud and happy with the success of the first Chinese manned space mission. But it is not an "exaggerated" joy.

When the question of 'do you think a citizen should be willing to sacrifice his life for his country and would you help the country attain its goals' was asked, the answers were varied. Most of them said they were willing to contribute to the country. Some said they would not sacrifice their lives for the country. Some said such an extreme act had to depend on the situation. Just to quote a few of them.

Lee/92: I think it is natural and right to make some contributions for the country.

Lui/00: I will not take such a serious act as to sacrifice my own life. But it is natural

that I could do something for my country within my capacity.

Chan/92: I think it all depends on the situation, but it is too extreme to say so.

I did ask them the question whether they would regard the welfare of the individual as more important than the welfare of the nation or vice versa. I got just two definite responses. One said the welfare of the individual was important while another one said vice versa. The others could not give me a definite answer.

They were also asked whether they had a favourable impression of Chinese people or not. Most of them did not give me positive responses but some of them added that the younger Chinese they met were better.

- Chan/92: The impression was rather negative I mean for those I met during my tours and in business transactions.
- Lui/00: Both good and bad impressions. Chinese people of the new generation are very polite while those people of the past years were impolite and not very hygienic.
- Yeung/92: As I often go into China for business, I have contacted some young Chinese who are fresh graduates from the university. I just find these intellectuals being very good and energetic. But many Chinese of previous generations are no good since they just want to take advantages from the country.

The question of 'how do you think about the status of China among the nations of the world?' was asked; all the responses claimed that China's status would be getting higher and higher in the future.

- Lee/92: The status of China is ever rising, like in the areas of military, technology and economics. Chinese are starting to be proud of their county.
- Lui/00: Its status is rising. I notice that people of other countries start learning Putongua (Mandarin/ the official dialect of China), it means they are respecting our country.

The past students were also asked their opinions on whether they hoped that China would become more important in the world of nations and whether China should take firmer action in foreign policies. All the six past students hoped that China would become a great country. There had been no consensus about whether stronger foreign policies should be taken. One tended to stress firmer action while some preferred not to take strong action.

- Tsui/99: If China wants to be a strong power, she has to be firm as other countries are firm as well.
- Hui/99: If it is possible, we should not be firm because it is more effective to handle things peacefully.
- Yeung/92: I think the present leaders of China are very clever. They will do the right things accordingly. When all the things are under control, including economics, others things can be settled easily.

I also tried to ask whether they had discussed all the related or similar issues with their teachers or anyone else in the school setting so as to see whether they were really affected by the school or not. Most of them answered that they had seldom discussed the issues mentioned. However, two out of the six interviewees mentioned that they

did discuss some of the issues during some lessons like Chinese Culture because there were similar questions in the public examinations.

# **Summary and Supplements**

To summarize, the senior management of School A, the supervisor and the principal, tended to think that the sense of national identity and consciousness was not too weak among the students in their school. But the teachers were not so satisfied with the situation among their students. All of them and the two interviewed parents also thought that this element was very important. Of course, it is difficult to judge how far this element is being achieved in the school as the responses from the students and past students are so diversified. However, my impression regarding the sense of national identity and consciousness among the students and past students was that -- even though most of the interviewed students saw themselves more as Hongkongese rather than Chinese, they still took a favourable attitude towards China in general. I would rather say they are rooted in Hong Kong while they still have good wishes for the future of China. The past students tended to agree with the present students. The responses to the same questions were actually very similar. However, both students and past students claimed that they seldom had chance to talk much about the sense of national identity and consciousness at the school level, which showed that such an element had never been at the top of the agenda of the school.

I had the chance to observe the ceremony of hoisting the national flag and singing National Anthem at the eve of the national day, that is, on 30.9.2003. The school authorities have set this as a standard program in remembrance of the national days. I noticed that students in general were paying attention in a serious manner during the ceremony. Such an impression supports the words of the principal who once said to me that his students were constantly improving in their sense of national feelings.

### School B

# The views of the supervisor, principal, teachers and parents

The supervisor of the school, Mr. Pong, was very confident that students in School B had a strong sense of national identity and consciousness. He remarked that it was the school's policy to emphasize the identification of being Chinese in the minds of their students. The principal, Mr. Tam, made similar remarks.

Mr. Tam: It is the school's policy to foster "loving the country and loving Hong Kong" among our students. This sense in our school should be stronger than other schools. When the National Anthem is being played, they (the students) will not feel uneasy at all. We used to hoist our national flag every Monday.

From the viewpoints of the teachers interviewed, students in their school had a better sense of national identity and consciousness than the students of other schools. But they also thought that this awareness was not up to their expectations. They thought that this was because most of the students were not now coming from Mainland China.

- Miss Fu: For the students' intake, most of the students were coming from Mainland China and they had a much stronger sense of loyalty towards the country. Now, the situation is different. Most of the students have never been to China or they know little about the country.
- Miss Lam: We have admitted many more students who were born in Hong Kong. In comparison, they have a weaker sense of national identity and consciousness. But the fact is: though students of F.1 have a weaker sense, they will build up a stronger and stronger sense as time goes by in the school.
- Mr. Tong: Students of the senior forms have a stronger sense since there are more new immigrants from China among them and they have received longer period of national education. Students in the lower forms have a weaker sense.
- Ms Lee: The sense of national identity and consciousness among our students might be stronger than other school students. But it is not up to my expectations. On the one hand, we celebrate the success of the Shenzhou V manned space mission. We manage to express our joy such as by means of writing short essays. However, on the other hand, such a joy seemed to be limited. When some students managed to get tickets to attend the celebration ceremony in Hong Kong Stadium, it seemed to me that those who had the tickets were not very gracious while those who could not get them had not felt they had missed anything important.

Mr. Hui: Not so strong, especially those students of lower forms. They were not so

joyous with the Shenzhou V manned space mission. They just know very little about our country.

All the five teachers interviewed claimed that they regarded the sense of national identity and consciousness as very important. They hoped that their students would have a very strong sense of this but they felt that more and more students who were born in Hong Kong instead of Mainland China would simply be unable to meet their expectations even though their students were already better than students of other schools.

It is also worthwhile referring to the responses from the parents in this issue. According to the two interviewed parents, they thought the sense of national identity and consciousness should not be strong at all, as their family background was not pro-China or leftists. However, both of them mentioned that they noticed that their children were becoming more and more inclined towards the standpoint of their school.

Mrs. Tsui: Not so strong at all. When my child just entered into this school, he was not so happy because the school had quite a number of new immigrants from China. He used to look down upon Mainland China and the new immigrants from China. After studying in this school for one to two years, he has been changing. He has made friends with the new immigrant classmates. He also finds that those classmates are always hard working and have the top results.

Mr. Hay: Before my child came to this school, she had no sense of national identity as I myself also have a weak sense only. But in these two years, her sense of

national identity and consciousness has been becoming stronger simply because of the school's influence. She has been affected by the hoisting of the national flag, listening and singing of the National Anthem, as well as the newspaper.

# The views of the students

The students were asked to tell me what national identity and consciousness mean to them. When the question was asked whether they regarded themselves as "Chinese" or "Hongkongese", most of the responses sided with the "Chinese" rather than "Hongkongese" – only one of the nine interviewed students mentioned that she would rather regard herself as "Hongkongese". Some students managed to give me very concrete answers that they were Chinese.

- Chan/F.5: Chinese. Hong Kong, anyway, is part of China.
- Siu/F.5: May be because I came from China, I think there is no difference between Mainlanders and Hong Kong people. Hong Kong is part of China.
- Leung/F.7: I regard myself as Chinese all the time, since this is very meaningful. My root and living place is in China. I am strictly a Chinese.
- Fu/F.7: Chinese. As Hong Kong is now returned to China. Chinese people comprise Hong Kong people as well. I am Chinese. No matter where to go, I will say I am Chinese.
- Leung/F.4: Before 1997, Hong Kong was a British colony but now we have returned to China. We could be proper Chinese again.
- Kwan/F.7: I admit that I am of Chinese origin. But if someone asks me about my identity, I would rather answer him I am "Hongkongese".

Wong/F.4: Now I tend to think I am more Chinese than "Hongkongese". But I used to claim myself as "Hongkongese" before. In the past, I thought China was too backward and I did not want to identify with her. As I find China progressing at a very fast pace and nearly a match for the USA, my sense of national identification has changed a lot.

The students were asked to tell me whether they were proud of being Chinese especially on occasions as when Chinese players managed to win gold medals at the Olympics. Most of them gave me a positive answer. Students of senior forms tended to express their gratitude, while one of the F.4 students said she was not so happy at all simply because she was not patriotic at all. And her two classmates also mentioned that they only felt happy to a certain degree if China managed to win gold medals.

To/F.4: At the present time, I feel happy when I hear the Chinese anthem at the Olympics. But it only lasts for a few seconds since I am not patriotic at all.

However, all the six students of F.5 & F.7 said they would be very joyful. Just to quote one of them.

Fu/F.7: I feel proud and moved. When any fellow countryman gets his or her personal glory, it is the glory of the whole country; as a Chinese, I can share his glory as well.

When the students were asked how much they were going to contribute to the mother country, even to the extent of sacrificing their lives for the country or not, all the three F.4 students thought that to die for the country was actually too remote and

too serious. A F.5 student had the following response.

Siu/F.5: It is not necessary to die in order to serve the country. We don't have such an urgent need now. But it is very natural to do something for the country.

However, the responses from two F.7 students are worth noting for they were willing to risk their lives for the country.

Fu/F.7: If my country invades another country without any proper reason, I will not sacrifice my life for this sake. But if it is for the protection of my mother country, I will.

Kwan/F.7: If others invade my country, I will do every possible thing to protect it. But I will not be the invader.

The students were also asked to rate whether the welfare of the individual was more important than the welfare of the nation or vice versa. The responses were varied. A F.4 student (To/F.4) simply gave me her simple answer – 'one is selfish, individual welfare always comes first'. The other responses either tended to say that it all depended on the situation or that both were important. However, two answers were worth noting.

Fu/F.7: I think protecting the interest of one's country is a civic duty.

Leung/F.7: One can't simply care for one's own interest lest it endangers others' interests. Sometimes, we have to make sacrifice so as to meet the majority's needs.

The students were also asked to mention their impressions of Chinese people. It

- seemed that most of them did not have a very good impression of people in China.
- Wong/F.4: People in the cities are more polite; people in the villages are impolite as they are not so educated.
- Leung/F.4: Average. Some tourists from Mainland do not behave well.
- Chan/F.5: No good impressions at all. Chinese people are selfish. If something wrong has happened, they will just cover it lest foreign countries find out.
- Siu/F.5: When people are travelling in the buses, they will just scramble for the seats.
- Wan/F.5: There are some places in China that are very backward and dirty. Hong Kong is more hygienic.
- Kwan/F.7: As a new immigrant from China, I am quite familiar with the situations there. I think there has been progress in different aspects. People in some big cities like Beijing and Shanghai are having better qualities while people in some remote places are much inferior in qualities.... I admit that civic education and the economic situation in the West are better than China, so they are of higher quality. China needs to improve herself.
- Leung/F.7: China is a large country, its people are of different qualities in different regions.
- Kwan/F.7: In terms of mental abilities, Chinese people are superior. We have our smart minds. Some people who commit the crimes simply because they cannot earn their living.

The students were also asked to say something about the status of China among the nations of the world. Not all of the students responded to this questions. But for those who responded, they all thought that the status of China would constantly improve. Two responses are worth quoting here.

Wong/F.4: I see China has been progressing very fast and she will catch up with USA

soon. This changes my perception of national identity a bit.

Fu/F.7: The status of China is getting more and more important as her economic power is constantly rising. I am very proud of this.

The students were also asked to say whether they wish to see China being important in the world of nations, and whether China should strive for power and take strong action on some foreign policies. Again, all the responses said that they would like to see China being strong. But on foreign polices, some responses supported a firmer pose but some stressed that China should avoid using force as far as possible.

I also tried to ask whether they had discussed all the related or similar issues with their teachers or anyone else in the school setting so as to see whether they were really affected by the school or not. Nearly all answered that they had discussed some of the mentioned issues.

### The views of the past students

When the question 'do you regard yourself as a "Hongkongese" rather than "Chinese" or vice versa' was posed to the five past students of School B, all said they were definitely Chinese. Just one of the five responses is quoted.

Lee/97: Even though I was born in Fukien (a province in eastern part of China), I think I am Chinese rather than "Fukienese". I think being Chinese is my identity. Hong Kong is just the place I live. I am very sure I am Chinese. But relatively speaking, some people who were born in Hong Kong might not think they are Chinese at all.

When I asked them whether they were proud of being Chinese and whether they were happy if they heard China's National Anthem at the Olympics, again all said they were absolutely positive about this. They all said they would be very sentimental on the occasions that China gained her glories.

Lee/97: As when the first manned space mission was successful, there were tears in my eyes – because it's the glory of our nation.

When the question of 'do you think a citizen should be willing to sacrifice his life for his country and would you help the country attain its goals' was asked, the answers were positive but not so definite as the previous question. Let us have a look on all five responses.

Wong/69: I will try my best to do something.

- Shi/66: For all the important issues, I will side with the interests of the country. We should always do something we can for the country. But if it is saying sacrificing my life, it will always depend on the situation.
- Kong/94: I did think of sacrificing myself for my country but I had no chance of doing that. I intended to participate in the army as well. If my country needs me, I will have no reservations.
- Lee/97: I think doing some kind of service for the country itself is good and it is natural as well. But it is too serious to talk of sacrificing one's life.
- Ip/95: In the past, I did adore the soldiers and I thought that it would be glorious to be participating in the army. Later, when I grew up, I thought we could contribute to the country in different ways without just dying for her.

I did ask them the question if they regarded the welfare of the individual as more important than the welfare of the nation or vice versa. I got four responses. Two said that they would act according to the welfare of the state and two tended to say it all depended on the particular situation.

Wong/69: The welfare of the state is more important.

Shi/66: I will never do anything harmful to my country.

Kong94/: It all depends on particular situations.

Lee/97: I won't be blind in doing anything for my nation because in most cases, they are just the insistence of some statesmen. I will examine the situations.

They were also asked whether they had a favourable impression of Chinese people or not. All of them gave me positive responses.

Kong/94: Chinese are better than other peoples as I am Chinese too.

Lee/97: I think Chinese are smart enough. They are clever and many great people are Chinese. We can be proud of that.

Ip/95: I think quite a number of Chinese are influential in this world. My impressions on Chinese are positive and fine.

Wong/69: All peoples have their own strengths and weaknesses; for Chinese, fidelity and good moral behaviours are our strengths.

Shi/66: We (Chinese) have our strong points but we still have to learn the good points of other countries.

The question of 'what do you think about the status of China among the nations

of the world?' was asked; four responses are recorded.

Wong/69: In the past, we have been "bullied" by other countries; but we are strong

now. I am very glad on this.

Ip/95: Chinese is a superior people. China has a long history of five thousand years

and she has left behind a lot of good things that include poems and historical

stories. I can still see and study while other civilizations have lost their own.

China is simply great.

Lee/97: China is a civilized country.

Kong/94: I am proud of China.

The past students were also asked their opinions on whether they hoped that

China would become important in the world of nations and should China take firmer

actions in foreign policies. All the five past students hoped that China would become

a great and superior country. One of them also added that China would never become

a dominating power even though she would become strong some day. There was no

consensus over taking stronger foreign policies but some argued that the Chinese

Government should be given a free hand to decide the best for the country.

Ip/95: We (Chinese) are peace-loving people, so if China really becomes a strong

nation in the world, she will never do harm on others.

Lee/97: As a Chinese, I hope that we should take back the sovereignty of our own

territory (Diaoyutai) as we have the right to take back our own things.

Kong/94: I wish to take back Diaoyutai too. However, those in power should have

their own consideration of factors.

Moreover, most of them claimed that they did discuss the mentioned issues in the school settings widely.

Kong/94: In the school setting, there was no need to talk about the identity as Chinese, as we were all sure we were Chinese. What we talk about was something about the development of the country that included the bright side and gloomy side of things.

### **Summary and Supplements**

To summarize, the senior management of School B, the supervisor and the principal, thought that the sense of national identity and consciousness was strong among the students in their school. But the teachers were not so satisfied with the situation among their students even though they still thought that their students were better than students in other schools. All of them, and the two interviewed parents also, thought that this element was very important. More students said they would rather regard themselves as Chinese rather than Hongkongese. However, I did record one student of F.4 who claimed she was not patriotic at all. And some students did mention they might not agree with the pro-China or leftist stances of the school. I would say their attitudes were quite different from the past students. Past students had a really very strong sense of national identity and consciousness. Moreover, both present students and past students claimed that they had many chances to talk about the sense of national identity and consciousness at the school level. But the past students seemed to have had even more chances. This element had been at the top of the agenda of the school.

The following are some pieces of composition in the school 45<sup>th</sup> anniversary journal on the topic, "HOW I VIEW JULY 1<sup>ST</sup>, 1997".

The sovereignty of Hong Kong will return to China on 1<sup>st</sup> July 1997. All the patriotic teenagers must be extremely happy, including me. However, there are a lot of differences between Hong Kong and mainland China, for example their political ideologies, therefore we must do something in order to make sure that Hong Kong can return to China smoothly. (5B, C J)

As a student in a patriotic school, we should take part in the building of the soon-to-be SAR... Since more and more sophisticated and colourful materialistic temptations keep appearing in the physical world, Hong Kong people naturally are more concerned about material things. In general, Hong Kong people don't think highly of patriotism. Therefore, it becomes necessary for us to organize some events to raise their patriotic awareness.... With a view to remaining and reinforcing the stability and prosperity of the soon-to-be SAR, we should play an active part in its building. (5B, SLM)

The time for handover is approaching. As a patriotic student, I should participate in the building at the soon-to-be Special Administrative Region.... Everything we do or will not do is not so important; the most important is that everyone should love his country just like you love your parents, not because someone tells you. I believe everyone in Hong Kong should be glad to see the handover. (5B, H M T)

These clearly show that the students of the school had a strong sense of national identity and consciousness and the writers expressed their eagerness to make contributions to the new SAR.

### **Comparisons and Analysis**

The principal of School A, Mr. So, remarked that in terms of national identity and consciousness, the students are constantly improving. My own observations support this statement.

In comparison, students of School B were stronger on this element even though the teachers in School B were not totally satisfied with the level. However, the supervisor and the principal of School B were very confident that their students were strong in this area. In the eyes of those Chinese supporters with strong nationalism, the nationalistic feelings of past students of School B were impressive; they are really very patriotic. However, there are differences between present students and past students. The present students are not as patriotic as their seniors on one hand; they do start developing the line of thinking, which is not that of the past students.

Students and past students of School A said they seldom had chance to talk about the sense of national identity and consciousness in the school settings, while there had been far more chances for their counterparts in School B.

All the parties regarded the element of national identity and consciousness as important in both schools. Again, this finding is not totally coherent with the research conducted in the past which claim that people in Hong Kong are in general a-national. The responses put forward from the students and past students could provide some

explanation for this. They believed that China is now much stronger than in the past.

Some even hoped that China would be strong enough to compete with the USA simply because they disliked the dominance of the Americans. It is remarkable to find that even the parties of School A place importance on this element as well.

It is understandable that this element has been placed as very important in School B since it has been the top priority of the agenda of the sponsoring body of the school. In this sense, the finding is consistent with the research studies conducted in Hong Kong in the past, like Tse (1997b) and Lam (1994). The atmosphere of the whole school did try to promote a strong sense of national identity and consciousness. However, it is also remarkable to find that some of the present students did explicitly claim that they were not very patriotic. This phenomenon can be explained by the changing intake of the students. The majority of students of School B are not the new immigrants. As the students are not required to read the two pro-China newspapers as their only choices, they develop their own line of political thinking which is similar to their counterparts in School A instead of their senior past schoolmates of the same school.

# 10.2 Democracy/ Participation

School A

# The views of the supervisor, principal, teachers and parents

Both the supervisor and principal of the school claimed that their students had a strong sense of democracy/ participation. The supervisor, Mr. Lai, tried to convey a message that the school wanted to maintain an open atmosphere, with the participation of not just the top management members, but also the front-line teachers as well. He added that he could see the students having a sense of democracy in their elections of student union. He himself thought that democracy was very important.

Mr. Lai: Overall speaking, our school is very open because apart from the top management members who participated in the school management, there is room for staff of all levels to participate as well. The principal also makes room for the teachers to practice democracy. Under such circumstances, students are given room for expressing their ideas and participating in the school management. The sense of openness could be reflected in the elections of the student union as well. They have a strong sense of democracy. I think democracy is important in an open society that helps sustain the economic prosperity and international status of Hong Kong.

The principal, Mr. So, expressed similar views. He pinpointed the situation of elections in the school that enlisted the support of the students. Quite a number of students managed to vote in the elections of the student union and the four houses in the school. He said he was glad to see his students were improving their sense of democracy/ participation.

Mr. So: Students are improving their sense of democracy/ participation. The school teaches them democracy through the elections of the student union and the

houses. Every student is entitled to have two votes for these two elections. We have a very fine turn up rate. I can see that they are constantly improving; the candidate did their promotion very seriously. And the students gave their votes in a democratic way. I am very glad to see that.

All teachers agreed on the importance of democracy but their perceptions of students' strength in this area varied as some teachers thought their students were quite strong in the sense of democracy and were willing to participate while others were not so positive. They all agreed that since Hong Kong's atmosphere tended to be open and free, the school simply provided a similar environment for the students. But one teacher doubted whether the school authorities were so willing to listen to the opinions of the students. However, there were comments from the teachers that the students could understand their rights but they did not care for their duties. Students were not willing to participate in services.

- Mr. Ho: Rather satisfactory. The school simply gives plenty of chances for the students to choose -- this is the substance of democracy. Students are in general okay in participating in activities and services.
- Mr. Yau: It is constantly improving in the school. As Hong Kong society itself has channels to vocalize out people's grievances and discontents, students are very willing to put forward their demands. However, sometimes these demands are not rational at all and it shows that students are sometimes irresponsible.
- Ms Kung: Students know very well about their rights but they are not so willing to care for their responsibilities... Students are not zealous in participating in activities. Actually, the same groups of students attend most of the activities... The school authorities should really listen to the opinions of

the Student Council instead of listening in a selective way.

Mr. Sum: Students would rather see their rights than their responsibilities. They never consider the resources needed for making a decision favorable to students.

Mr. Wong: Students have a stronger sense of democracy but they know more of their rights than their responsibilities.

For the two parents interviewed, the views of Mr. Fong were quite different from that of Ms Ho. Mr. Fong tended to think that his son was too young to understand the meaning of democracy and he himself did not think of democracy as being so important. However, Ms Ho thought that her daughter has a sense of democracy even though it was not very strong. She thought her daughter was willing to participate in services. Ms Ho also thought that democracy was important.

Mr. Fong: My son is not mature enough to think of the issues related to democracy. He might have heard a lot of things concerning democracy in the news reports. But he just follows others' views about that, without really knowing exactly about the issues.... I think freedom is important, but democracy may not be so important. Democracy may not turn everything right. It cannot solve all the problems such as the economic ones by having universal suffrage.

Ms. Ho: My daughter should have such sense but it will not be so strong. I don't think this sense is strong in the school as well since the school has no strong stance about it. She does not participate in too many extra-curricular activities but she is very willing to participate in services to her teachers.

### The students' views

I started with an open question by asking them to tell me what democracy/

participation meant to them. Some responses were recorded. Most of them expressed views on the importance of democracy.

- Wan/F.4: Democracy is very important; just like the Americans who can choose their own presidents. But Hong Kong people cannot choose their own Chief Executive.
- Tang/F.4: Democracy is important. But we have to pay for the price of it, just like we need extra time to discuss any new policies.
- Lau/F.4: Democracy is very important. If we have no democracy, we will be governed by autocratic rule.
- Chan/F.7: I think democracy is something that we have to fight for. I think we Hong Kong people are lucky enough to enjoy freedom and democracy, among the Chinese societies.
- Ng/F.7: Living in Hong Kong, I used to feel that I am enjoying democracy.
- Wong/F.7: I think democracy is quite important but it might not be the best thing in some sense. For example, Singapore is not a very democratic country but she is very successful.

The students were asked to say whether they understood the basic human rights and responsibilities that a citizen in Hong Kong should have. Nearly all of them managed to tell me that they knew about the rights and responsibilities they could have in Hong Kong, namely freedom of speech, freedom of press, freedom of assembly, freedom of worship, the rights to vote and to be elected, and the duty to abide by law. As they managed to talk of free elections, rights and responsibilities, it suggested that they did have an idea on democracy. However, some students still said

that they did not know much about this. One student also said that she found the citizens of Hong Kong did not care too much about their rights.

- Lau/F.4: Basically, I know the rights I am enjoying, but what I know is very limited.
- Tang/F.4: People in Hong Kong have their human rights for no one will force you to do anything. But Hong Kong people are not so keen on activities like the District Board Elections; they just think that these are not their business.

The students were also asked to evaluate whether Hong Kong was a democratic and fair society. All of them expressed the similar view. They thought that Hong Kong was quite a democratic and fair society although there was room for improvement.

- Chan/F.7: Relatively speaking Hong Kong is a fair and just society, but it is not absolute at all.
- Cheung/F.6: Hong Kong is a just society, for example we do not discriminate against disadvantaged groups but give them help instead.
- Lau/F.4: The extent of democracy of Hong Kong is better than a lot of countries but behind some countries. For example, the government here sometimes is not willing to listen to us.

The students were asked to say whether they had the chance to learn democracy/
participation in the school. They were also asked to give examples of how they
thought they had learnt this sense. They were asked to say whether they participated
actively in the student union and its affiliated clubs or associations. The three students
in F.4 said they had seldom participated in the activities of the student union except

voting in the elections of the student union. But the students of F.6 and F.7 were active in the student union or the related organizations and they thought that they could practice democracy through the union and the school.

- Chu/F.6: Everyone in the school is entitled to vote. It is very democratic. The student union of this year had a financial problem and we managed to pass the 'non-confident' decision. We could see the power of voting. The student union can practice democracy through the 'Democratic Wall', which lets students voice their opinions. Lots of students have used this channel to express their thoughts in the past few years.... The student union has a say in some big functions. In some activities, it was the students who took charge of everything; the teachers were just taking an auxiliary role. It shows the school's democratic atmosphere.
- Law/F.6: I am the Head Prefect of the school. I express my views when teachers ask me questions concerning students' affairs. There are some students who will reflect their views directly to teachers. Teachers are willing to listen to us (prefects). It is a sense of democracy.
- Wong/F.7: All the important decisions made in the student union are to be decided by the majority. It is democratic.
- Chan/F.7: The student union can influence the decisions of the school. We did try to suggest students coming back to school in the holidays could be exempted from wearing the school uniform and students could bring their mobile phones back to school. These two suggestions were approved eventually. These two things are not allowed by nearby schools. From these we can see the democracy enjoyed by students.

The students were asked whether they had actively participated in social services organized by the school or other organizations or not. Most of them managed to describe some activities that they had previously participated in, namely selling flags

for charity purposes, organizing activities for the youth centres and the aged homes and visits to an orphanage. Students in F.7 did mention that they were too busy in preparing for the public examinations and thus inactive in services. It is difficult to tell whether the interviewed students were active or not. But the fact is none of them tried to convey a message that he or she had been very active in giving services.

The students were also asked to predict whether they would participate actively in the democratic movement or social services in the future. Most of them claimed that they were more interested and more willing to participate in social services rather than democratic movements if they had time in the future. Some said they would participate by voting in the elections but were not so willing to contribute more than that.

Lau/F.4: I will vote in the elections when I reach 18. I don't intend doing any other things yet. I am more interested in social services.

Cheung/F.6: I am more interested in being a voluntary helper. I will vote instead of being elected. It is too remote to be elected as councillor.

Ng/F.7: I would rather participate in social services. I am not interested in politics.

# The past students' views

I also started with an open question by asking the past students to tell me what democracy/ participation meant to them. Some responses were recorded. All of the

three respondents expressed the views on the importance of democracy and their wish for Hong Kong to attain democracy. They placed the importance on choice, namely in having the rights to choose someone to represent them.

- Lee/92: We fight for democracy because if some of the councillors could no longer represent you, you could give him no more votes in the next term so that he cannot be elected again. Democracy is a good thing.
- Yeung/92: Democracy is a must. As Hong Kong is an advanced and prosperous city, democracy is a protection. Having democracy, there will not be the abuse of power and extravagant use of public money. However, the present government is unable to hear people's views. It makes me frustrated.
- Chan/92: Democracy is very essential to the developed countries or regions. What the people demand is freedom and a government of trust.

The past students were asked to say whether they understood the basic human rights and responsibilities that a citizen in Hong Kong should have. Two of them answered me that they were not so sure. The other four managed to tell me something about the rights and responsibilities they could have in Hong Kong, namely the freedom of speech, freedom of knowing, the rights to vote and the duty to pay tax. However, they stressed that they did not know much about this.

- Chan/92: For the laws and the details of rights and responsibilities, I am not so sure. But I know the general rights we have.
- Yeung/92: Generally I know. Those who have Hong Kong Identity Cards are Hong Kong citizens and are entitled to enjoy the rights and responsibilities. Paying tax is one of our responsibilities.

The past students were also asked to evaluate whether Hong Kong was a democratic and fair society. Most of them expressed the similar view -- Hong Kong now was not as democratic and fair as before 1997. They certainly had a lot of grievances in their minds.

- Tsui/99: The efficiency, transparency and degree of democracy in Hong Kong are regressing. I just don't know what the Hong Kong Government is doing.
- Hui/99: Hong Kong can be regarded as a democratic society. People are able to express their opinions, but the final decisions are still made by the government. It is not totally democratic at all. Something has been done to show Hong Kong is a just society. But it is just a show, not real at all.

Lui/00: Hong Kong has its limitations because she is somehow controlled by China.

Lee/92: The democracy and justice of the government are taking backward steps.

- Yeung/92: I cannot see democracy and justice in lots of political issues.... But the power of the people is strong; Hong Kong people love Hong Kong.
- Chan/92: I agree that democracy in Hong Kong is worse than before the return. People will come out to protest when they feel too discontented and the government will make concessions accordingly.

The past students were asked to say whether they had the opportunity to learn democracy/ participation in the school. They were also asked to give examples of how they thought they had learnt this sense. They were asked to say whether they participated actively in the student union and its affiliated clubs or associations. Some of them did not think they could learn a lot on democracy/ participation in the school.

And some teachers themselves were not democratic enough. Some of them also said they had seldom participated in the activities organized by the school or the student union.

- Lee/92: Every house has its own elections. Some teachers were democratic while some were not. For example, some chairpersons were just appointed by teachers instead of elected. Therefore, we might not be able to learn a whole set of democratic sense.
- Yeung/92: We managed to learn some basic ideas about democracy. We also learnt and participated in democracy in the 'Democracy Week' and through the elections of the house leaders.
- Chan/92: We did not learn too much and we had no strong sense of democracy.
- Lui/00: We seldom participated in the activities organized by the student union and its affiliated organizations.

The past students were asked whether they had actively participated in social services organized by the school or other organizations or not. Most of them managed to describe some activities that they had participated in, such as selling flags for charity purposes and visiting the ageing homes. Some mentioned that they participated in some services through the church. It is difficult to assess whether they were active or not at all by the limited information that they provided.

The past students were also asked to say whether they would participate actively in the democratic movement or social services. Some of them claimed that they were more interested and more willing to participate in social services instead of

democratic movements if they had the time. One said he was too busy to participate in services and the democratic movement since he was busy earning his living. However, there were some who said they intended to participate by voting in the elections and participating in other kinds of democratic activities.

#### Summary

To summarize, the senior management of School A had a more favourable picture of the sense of democracy/participation among the students than the teachers in general. The principal and the supervisor tried to convey the message that the school authorities had been trying its best to maintain openness in the school management. Some teachers did not totally agree with such a message. However, there were still some teachers who claimed that the atmosphere of the school was open and democratic. Such a view was actually shared by the students interviewed. They were very willing to narrate the lessons that they had learnt in the school about democracy/ participation. They appreciated the democratic measures of the school. They were also quite satisfied with the situation of Hong Kong and showed they knew the rights and duties of Hong Kong citizens. However, the teachers were not so satisfied, as indicated by their observations that students tended to enjoy their rights rather than fulfilling their responsibilities. One can also say that there is a paradox at School A – it is fairly traditional, with didactic lessons on one hand, but a fairly open encouragement of democratic participation on the other hand.

The past students were not so satisfied with the situation in Hong Kong. As they were more mature, they might have much higher aspirations for democracy. However, they claimed that they could not sense too much democracy in the school and they seldom practiced democracy at the school.

It may seem remarkable that one parent doubted the importance of democracy. He simply feared that democracy could be abused in ways similar to giving welfare without any constraint or represented a kind of mob rule. However, his worry might be better comprehended as referring to the extent to which democracy as a system of governance can deliver. What he really valued was freedom of expression.

# School B

#### The views of the supervisor, principal, teachers and parents

The supervisor, Mr. Pong, said that the students were not very good in terms of a sense of democracy/ participation and thus needed to improve it further.

Mr. Pong: Our school is still making efforts to improve it... Our school thinks that the sense of democracy/ participation is to be nurtured. It really takes time to foster such a sense, slowly.

The principal, Mr. Tam, was satisfied with the progress over the past few years in

building the sense of democracy/ participation among his students. He pinpointed the situation regarding elections in the school that enlisted the participation and involvement of more and more students. He believed that, based on the democratic environment of Hong Kong, students were able to know their rights very well. He also listed the available channels through which students could voice their opinions to him directly.

Mr. Tam: Students are given chances to practice the sense of democracy/ participation in the school. In these two years, there would be two teams competing for the running of the student union. In Hong Kong, the sense of democracy is strong now because of the mass media and the overall atmosphere here. Everyone in Hong Kong knows their rights to participate, to know and to complain.... There are channels for the students to express their viewpoints such as through the "principal's mailbox" or they can simply email me. The student union itself reflects the views of the students. It can express their demands to the school authorities.

When the teachers were asked about whether their students had a strong sense of democracy, most of them said the students were quite all right.

Mr. Hui: It was not good in the past as our school was too small and the students did not ask for anything. Now it is different, we have much more spacious school premises and more students. The students simply emphasize their freedom, rights and democracy. Unlike before when teachers were obeyed unquestionably, teachers now have to earn their respect by being democratic.... Students of senior forms are quite willing to participate in the student union.

Mr. Tong: I think around half of the school students are willing to participate in school affairs. Quite a number of students are willing to voice their opinions

about the school. But I can't say they are very active at all.

Miss Lam: Quite a number of students are willing to participate in the running of the student union. Usually there will be two parties campaigning for the student council. The parties manage to express their platforms clearly. The school authorities are supportive to the student union and the principal himself is willing to listen to the opinions of the student union.... Students are also willing to participate in services outside. But students could not spare too much time to devote themselves in services.

Ms Lee: Students are willing to voice their opinions. They are happy when they see teachers are listening.

Miss Fu: The students of senior forms know more about the meaning of democracy; to students of junior forms, their civic responsibilities are more about being active in voluntary services. They are active in participating in clubs of the school especially those uniform groups.... The elections of the student union are run successfully. There will be fierce competitions between the teams. The team members manage to give very sensible answers. They are able to find creative means for lobbying the votes.

For the two parents interviewed, the views of Mr. Hay were a bit different from that of Mrs. Tsui. Mr. Hay tended to think that his daughter was able to understand some basic meanings of democracy and he himself thought democracy was important. However, Mrs. Tsui thought that her son did not have a strong sense of democracy even though he might have chances to learn it in the school. Mrs. Tsui also thought that democracy was important.

Mr. Hay: My daughter should have a basic understanding on democracy. Our family itself is a model of democracy. I think the school should have taught her something on this sense.... It is important to have a sense of democracy because she will encounter such issues when she goes for work in the

society in future.

Mrs. Tsui: Not too strong. Even though such civic senses have been taught from primary to secondary years of school, time devoted to this aspect has not been great. I don't think my son is too strong in the sense of democracy.

#### The students' views

I started with an open question by asking them to tell me what democracy/
participation meant to them. Most of them expressed their views on the importance of
democracy and the significance of voting in elections.

- Leung/F.7: I think when we talk about democracy we have to emphasize voting in the elections. As we can choose those councillors who have similar view to ours and represent us in the Legislative Council and the District Boards. If we cannot vote for the elections, no one will represent our voices at all.
- Kwan/F.7: When we vote, we have to examine the platforms of the candidates and give our votes only to the ones who are really worthwhile supporting.
- Fu/F.7: I also care for the voting in elections because it is important to select those who could really represent us. Voting is a duty.

The students were asked to say whether they understood the basic human rights and responsibilities that a citizen in Hong Kong should have. Nearly all of them managed to tell me something they knew about the rights and responsibilities they could have in Hong Kong, namely freedom of speech, freedom of news, freedom of press, freedom of assembly, freedom of worship, freedom to get married and the right to vote, while the duties included abiding by the law, voting in the elections, keeping

Hong Kong clean and paying tax. However, most of the students did say that they did not know much about this.

The students were also asked to evaluate whether Hong Kong was a democratic and fair society. All of them expressed the similar view. They thought that Hong Kong was quite a democratic and fair society although people in Hong Kong did not get enough of it.

- Siu/F.5: Hong Kong is not democratic enough as many Hong Kong people always say that we can't elect our Chief Executive directly. But it does not mean we have no democracy at all.
- Leung/F.4: Hong Kong is a just society because everyone is willing to abide by the law. No one is deliberately doing something illegal.
- Leung/F.7: In terms of democracy, we have elections for the Legislative Council. It would be better if we directly elected all the councillors. In terms of justice, we have a good judicial system where the judges are employed life-long and they cannot be dismissed arbitrarily.

The students were asked to say whether they had the chances to learn democracy/ participation in the school. They were also asked to give examples of how they thought they had learnt this sense. They were asked to say whether they participated actively in the student union and its affiliated clubs or associations. The three students in F.4 said they had quite actively participated in the activities of the student union and they thought they could learn democracy/ participation through them. They also claimed that the school was willing to let the student union be run by

the students themselves. Students of F.5 said that they were too busy to participate in activities. They were not encouraged to do so because they had to prepare for the public examinations. I heard negative comments from two F.7 students. They did not think the school was really letting its students have real democracy.

- To/F.4: The school does not interfere with the running of the student union but just gives some suggestions. Students themselves settle most of the things.
- Leung/F.7: We have elections for the student union. Both the principal and teachers welcome the suggestions of students for improving the school. The school is open in its attitude. However, whether the suggestions are accepted is another question. Most of the time, nothing is changed at all.
- Kwan/F.7: I think we might not be able to learn democracy/ participation in this school. Although we have elections, the systems are never consistent but keep on changing with their regulations and formats. Students find it difficult to cope with.

The students were asked whether they had actively participated in social services organized by the school or other organizations. Students of F.4 and F.7 managed to describe some activities that they had participated in before, namely being a girl guide or a leader of boy's scout, helping with some cleaning campaigns and organizing activities for the ageing homes. Students in F.5 did mention that they were very busy in preparing for the public examinations and thus inactive in services. My impression was they were rather passive in terms of participating in social services.

The students were also asked to predict whether they would participate actively

in the democratic movement or social services in the future. Not all the students responded to this question. Quite a number of them claimed that it was too soon and too remote to think of giving services to the society as they were too young to plan for it. Only one student managed to say firmly that he would give some help for social services. Another one said she would help if she managed to study a related course in the university. The students did not seem very eager to participate in social services.

- Leung/F.7: I will participate in social services. The degree of contributions will be depended on my capacity.
- Kwan/F.7: If I manage to study politics or sociology in the university, I will pay more attention to the services of the society.

#### The past students' views

I also started with an open question by asking the past students to tell me what democracy/ participation meant to them. Three responses were recorded. All of them expressed their views on some kind of misinterpretations of democracy by some people in Hong Kong. They tended to think that democracy was not something without constraints.

Lee/97: I don't think democracy means anti-government. Nowadays, many political parties or organizations simply use democracy as a pretext. They may not be democratic at all. I think democracy means participation by the citizens. It is not the extreme view of opposing China on everything.

Ip/95: Democracy is something to be enjoyed by all people. But it cannot be exaggerated. We can't afford to be democratic for all the things. I think the society is very chaotic. Some people just try to protest against all things Chinese. This is not democracy but vandalism.

Kong/94: Democracy is something within some kind of structure. It can't be just doing anything you like. Democracy should have boundaries.

The past students were asked whether they understood the basic human rights and responsibilities that a citizen in Hong Kong should have. Three of them managed to tell me something they knew about the rights and responsibilities they could have in Hong Kong, namely freedom of speech and freedom of press, and the duties to vote and to pay tax. However, one of them claimed that it was up to different people's own interpretations.

Wong/69: For the meanings of human rights, freedom and democracy, different people may have different interpretations.

The past students were also asked to evaluate whether Hong Kong was a democratic and fair society. Most of them expressed the similar view -- Hong Kong was a democratic and just place and sometimes it should be regarded as over-democratic that could be abused by some people.

Kong/94: Some years ago, Hong Kong had the problem of sheltering the Vietnamese refugees. We managed to help those refugees while the British government was reluctant to do so. Hong Kong had been doing extremely well.

- Lee/99: Hong Kong is a democratic society or it is simply over democratic. There is justice in Hong Kong since we don't have so many gloomy things in the society.
- Ip/95: I think the form of democracy in Hong Kong is even better than that of USA because USA is "too open". There are a lot of democratic things in Hong Kong like having human rights and elections.

As they were so satisfied with the present democratic situations in Hong Kong, I asked a follow up question on whether there was any more room for Hong Kong to improve. Two of them claimed that Hong Kong was not ready for electing the Chief Executive by universal suffrage even though this should be Hong Kong's next target.

- Lee/99: Hong Kong is not up to the stage of choosing the Chief Executive by universal suffrage. Democracy has to be developed step by step.
- Ip/95: Only when there is an overall development of a civic sense in Hong Kong can the electing of the Chief Executive by universal suffrage becomes representative. But the sense of national identity and consciousness of Hong Kong people is not enough. They even claim themselves as Hong Kong people rather than Chinese. It is a dangerous thing. Therefore, it is not the right time for universal suffrage.

I also asked some past students about the views on the big rally at 1 July 2003. They termed it as a kind of economic problem rather than the problem of Mr. Tung's misgovernment. They said they did not oppose this rally at all. But they did not agree with all rallies, for some were without proper reasons.

The past students were asked to say whether they had the chance to learn democracy/ participation in the school. They were also asked to give examples of

how they thought they had learnt this sense. They were asked to say whether they participated actively in the student union and its affiliated clubs or associations. Two of them said the school in their years was not so developed and they seldom had chance to participate in activities organized by the student union even though there was already the existence of the student union. Another group of interviewed students said that they had a very strong sense of national identity and consciousness, but they seldom had chance to talk about democracy. One added that he had been a helper of district board elections but he seldom participated in activities of the student union. These students, who felt they had had little actual democratic experience, did not seem to want it for Hong Kong either, as they simply doubted the importance of democracy.

The past students were asked whether they had actively participated in social services organized by the school or other organizations or not. Most of them managed to tell of some activities that they had participated in before. It is difficult to assess whether they were active or not by the limited information they have provided.

The past students were also asked to say whether they would participate actively in the democratic movement or social services. Most of them claimed that they were more interested and more willing to participate in social services than the democratic movement.

### Summary

To summarize, the senior management of School B claimed that there was room to improve the sense of democracy/participation among the students as they also regarded this element as important. The principal said that Hong Kong has an open and democratic atmosphere and it was natural for students to ask for a similar situation in the school. Some teachers did agree with this message. Such a view was actually shared by some of the interviewed students. However, I did record two students of F.7 who doubted whether the school would really listen to their suggestions or not. Students were also quite satisfied with the situation of Hong Kong and believed that they knew the rights and duties of Hong Kong citizens.

The views of the past students were quite different from the other parties. They simply doubted the importance of democracy because it could be abused as mob rule and democracy itself could not solve all the problems. They also claimed that they did not have too many chances to talk about democracy and to practice democracy at the school.

Both the students and past students did not participate too much in activities organized by the student union and other organizations. Some teachers also mentioned this fact.

#### **Comparisons and Analysis**

In the area of democracy/ participation, both school authorities did try to convey a message that they cared for this element and were being open in the school management.

Students in School A said they learnt a lot of democratic/ participation practices in the school settings. They expressed their appreciation for the open and free environment in the school. However, such feelings were not totally shared by the past students in School A. They claimed that they did not have much chance to learn democracy/ participation in the school.

In School B, situations were similar. The supervisor and the principal of School B also claimed that they would like to let their students learn democracy/ participation. Most of the students in School B expressed the view that they managed to learn democracy/ participation in the school settings, except for a very few who doubted whether the school authorities really listened to their views and suggestions. The past students of School B said that they seldom had the chance to talk about democracy in their school days.

Teachers of both schools tended to think that their students were more interested in their rights than their responsibilities. It is also necessary to point out that the past students of School A placed a very important emphasis on democracy while some past students of School B simply doubted its use and the possible misinterpretation of

democracy in Hong Kong. One may comprehend that the communist government in Beijing opposes the issue of democracy. This is where the big differences show up — the value attached to democracy. So School B has had an important political influence on these students.

Most parties in the two schools regarded democracy/participation as important.

Again, such findings are not coherent with research conducted in the past that depicted the undemocratic nature of the schools in Hong Kong in general. It is therefore believed that a more open and free atmosphere is prevailing in Hong Kong even though authority and discipline are still stressed in the school settings including the two researched schools. In School A, it is remarkable to find that the past students did not feel the democratic and participatory nature of the school settings when they studied in the school while the present students admire the democratic nature of the school in general. If other schools in Hong Kong are like these two, then one may tend to think that the present atmosphere as a whole welcomes an open and democratic atmosphere.

It is perhaps understandable that only the past students in School B made it very explicit that they doubt the possible abuse of the meaning of democracy by some people in Hong Kong. They did not hold democracy in high regard. This is actually very similar to the tone and the message of some pro-China newspapers in Hong

Kong. These newspapers criticize some notable democrats in Hong Kong who oppose the policies of China. Again, the group of past students in School B is distinctive from other parties and suggests that the school has been effective in terms of political socialization of its own terms.

# CHAPTER 11 HOW EFFECTIVE ARE THE STUDENTS BEING POLITICALLY SOCIALIZED: THE FULFILLMENT OF THE FOUR SUGGESTED ELEMENTS (2)

In this chapter, the other two suggested elements of political socialization in the two schools will be evaluated: critical thinking and globalization. Again, the views of the supervisor, principal, teachers and parents of one school on each element will be evaluated first and then the responses of the students and past students on that element will be reported and evaluated. After examining all the elements respectively for each school, efforts will be made to rate the relative importance of the four elements, according to the views of the related parties.

## 11.1 Critical Thinking

## School A

#### The views of the supervisor, principal, teachers and parents

According to the supervisor of the school, Mr. Lai, students in Hong Kong are not strong in critical thinking. However, he said students in his school were better than the average Hong Kong students in this regard. Mr. Lai claimed that it was important to have critical thinking.

Mr. Lai: The thinking ability of our students is quite good. This can be reflected in the

creativity in their drama performances. However, the students in Hong Kong in general have no signs of improvement in the area of critical thinking.

The principal, Mr. So admitted that critical thinking was an area that the school had to cultivate among the students. He explained that this was due to the traditions of education in Hong Kong, which stressed students listening to the instructions of their teachers. Mr. So also thought that critical thinking was important because teachers could no longer provide all the materials that are needed by students in this information era.

Mr. So: We have training on thinking for the senior forms students. But there is room for improvement for critical thinking. This situation is related to the traditional style of teaching, which requires students to listen to their teachers. Teachers provide their notes and what students have to do is to study them all.

Teachers thought that their students were weak or even very weak in critical thinking, while all of them claimed that this ability was very important. They managed to give some examples of students not displaying critical thinking and the possible reasons for this.

Mr. Sum: During the lessons, students are unable to give examples to support their arguments.

Mr. Wong: When we discussed the performance of the SAR Government under the leadership of Mr. Tung, their responses were one-sided and they only echoed the criticisms of the media on the government.

Ms Kung: Our school just stresses academic results but neglects the training of thinking. Students are spoon-fed by teachers. We have to prepare all the notes and the analyses of the public examinations to students. Since the competition between colleagues of different subjects in the school is so severe, we have become "short-sighted". Even though we place more emphasis on critical thinking in upper forms as the format of the public examinations do require that, it is for the sake of assessment again. It is the failure of our education system.

The two parents were also asked how far their child displayed critical thinking and whether they regarded it as important. Both of them thought that this ability was important. However, Mr. Fong and Ms Ho had their own perceptions on this issue.

Mr. Fong tended to think that his son was not strong enough in this sense. However, he did not expect teachers in the school to discuss political issues very much with students, because the teachers would have their views and could not be neutral. He suggested that the school should train students to have critical thinking but not use political issues as discussion topics.

Mr. Fong: My son tended to oppose the passing of the Article 23 but without knowing the details of it.... Teachers themselves have their own viewpoints and cannot be neutral in their analysis of issues, while the parents cannot enter the classroom to listen to what the teachers say.

Ms Ho claimed that her daughter would concentrate on issues that only directly related to her own interest. She did not think the school had made sufficient efforts to train the students in critical thinking.

Ms Ho: My daughter will examine those things that are directly related to her concern.

She will express her views if she finds something being unfair to her. But to things that are not her concern, she just does not bother to think about that....

I can't see the school has put much effort to train the students in this sense.

#### The students' views

The students were asked to tell me what critical thinking meant to them. Most of the responses managed to give some relevant definitions of critical thinking. Some simply said they did not know. The students were also asked whether they usually made up their own minds on different issues rather than being greatly influenced by others. The responses to this question varied. Three of the nine students definitely claimed that they would stick to their own views without being influenced by others. However, the majority either said that other people would easily influence them on some issues and they tended to accept them.

Law/F.6: I will have my own stance.

- Cheung/F.6: If I find my views are not remarkably different from others, I will express them. I try not to deviate too much from others' opinions because I don't want to argue with them or be marginalized. If my views are too different from others, I will just hide them.
- Tang/F.4: I may have my own views but when all others raise their hands and agree on something, I will just follow them. I don't want to be singled out.
- Ng/F.7: If the political or current issues are narrated and commented by the experts, they will influence me.

Wong/F.7: Others easily influence me. But I will still re-consider whether those ideas are right or not.

The students were also asked to tell me some current issues that they found very complicated which required the skills of critical thinking in order to analyse them. This question was to see whether they could be analytical and critical in examining some issues. Most of them managed to narrate some hot issues and express their comments accordingly. The topics covered included some issues related to Hong Kong's recent development like the passing of the Article 23, the election of Hong Kong's Chief Executive, the situation in Taiwan and even American's attack on Iraq. It is difficult to judge whether they had a sense of critical thinking by listening to their commentaries, as it is hard to tell how deeply they could understand the issues or whether they were just able to repeat some standard answers. However, it did show that they could identify things that are complicated and required critical thinking in dealing with them.

The students were asked whether they managed to develop skills of critical thinking in their school. Nearly all of them said that they seldom had the chance to develop this because most of the subjects were not meant to train for it, except for one or two subjects.

Chu/F.6: Either within or outside the classroom, such skill of critical thinking has not

been taught to us in the school.

Cheung/F.6: During the Chinese Culture lessons, we have the chances to discuss

some related issues. Not so many chances apart from that.

Lau/F.4: Little; not being stressed at all. We are not expected to question our subject

teachers.

Chan/F.7: It is the drawback of Hong Kong's secondary schools. For Hong Kong's

education just stresses the knowledge of the subjects and does not care for

nurturing thinking power.

The past students' views

The past students were also asked to tell me what critical thinking meant to them.

Two of them were able to give me some relevant definitions of critical thinking. One

defined it as something beyond common sense. Another defined it as having the

ability to view things from different perspectives and in thorough ways. Two said they

were not very sure about its meaning. The students were also asked whether they

would usually make up their own minds on different issues rather than being greatly

influenced by others. The responses to this question varied. All five responses

claimed that they would somehow consider their own views and the views of others.

No one conveyed the message that he or she tended to be influenced by others.

Lee/92: I will compare others' views with that of my own.

Yeung/92: I will try to examine the others' views and formulate my own views.

Chan/92: I will have my own views first and then consider the opinions of others.

Tsui/99: It depends on how far I understand the issue.

Hui/99: I have to get hold of the issue before a decision is made.

The students were also asked to tell me some current issues that they found very complicated which require the skills of critical thinking to analyse them. This question was aimed at seeing whether they could be analytical and critical in examining some issues. Most of them managed to narrate some hot issues and express their comments accordingly. Only one of them claimed that she seldom spent her time thinking of critical issues. The topics covered include some issues related to Hong Kong's recent development like the passing of the Article 23, the performances of Hong Kong's Chief Executive and the expenditure of education provisions. Again, it is difficult to judge whether they had a sense of critical thinking by listening to their commentaries, as it is hard to tell how deeply they could understand the issues or whether they were just able to repeat some standard answers. However, it does show they agreed that things in this world were sufficiently complicated that they required critical thinking to deal with them.

The students were asked whether they managed to develop skills of critical thinking in their school. Nearly all of them said that they seldom had chance to develop this ability in the school itself because the school tended to stress the

academic results of the subjects, or whenever they spent time discussing the critical issues, they were for the sake of public examinations. Some claimed that they eventually developed the sense of critical thinking at university or when they went out to work.

Hui/99: In my memory, the school had not deliberately taught us on this sense.

Lee/92: What we had received was the traditional type of education.

Tsui/99: The teaching of critical thinking in the school was to prepare for the "A-levels", not for educating us to think from different angles. It was just for getting higher marks.

Lui/00: What the school stressed was the academic results of the subjects therefore we seldom think of the critical issues. I learnt it when I came out to work in the society.

Chan/92: No such training in the secondary school level. I received such training in the university level.

Yeung/92: I learn this ability in other settings, such as in the working environment.

#### Summary

To summarize, the supervisor, the principal, the teachers and the parents thought that students of School A were not strong in critical thinking. The school authorities admitted that the school had not provided much training in this regard. Teachers managed to narrate some examples to show that students on the whole were not being very critical when examining some important issues. The students said they tended to

side with the others' views lest they were singled out. The past students had a similar message. But relatively speaking, the past students were stronger than the students. They also said that they seldom had the chance to develop the skill of critical thinking at the school, even though there were some subjects, which required being critical when answering some questions. It is also clear that the training or acquiring of critical thinking in the school had been related primarily to subject assessment.

## School B

## The views of the supervisor, principal, teachers and parents

Both the supervisor and principal of School B admitted that their students were not strong in critical thinking. They tended to think students in their school were actually so nice and obedient that they were unable to develop the skills of judgment and independent thinking. However, they thought that critical thinking should be regarded as important and measures were needed to improve this.

Mr. Pong: Students of our school are relatively obedient in general. Thus they are weak in developing a sense of judgment and independent thinking. In fact, such phenomenon applies to students in general in Hong Kong.... I have talked with the principal about this. We admitted that being obedient is something good, but it is by no means complete. We need to improve it.

Mr. Tam: Students are not so strong in this sense. Our students are relatively simple and obedient. It is always the teachers who are in-charge-of different

things and students tend not to develop the ability of critical thinking. It is our future plan to give more chances for the students to develop the analytical and self-learning abilities.

When the teachers were asked whether their students had an ability to apply critical thinking, all of them tended to think their students were rather weak in this area.

- Mr. Hui: Rather weak. Students used to listen to their teachers. Students are just led by their teachers to do something. In the past, the sense of obedience was very strong. It might due to the fact that most of the students were coming from Mainland China where there is a lot of stress on obedience and seniority. Therefore, students of F.1 and F.7 are quite different here; F.7 students always respect and obey the teachers while F.1 students always ask why should I do that or ask whether it is a must to follow some instructions. This situation can be explained by the different education systems of Mainland China and Hong Kong.
- Miss Lam: Students are strongly influenced by the mass media and they simply cannot evaluate the messages from them in a critical way. For example, concerning the issue of harbour reclamation, there should be pros and cons for this project. But most of the students just follow the line of thinking of the media saying that the government is wrong again. But when we tried to discuss how to deal with the problem of traffic congestion without carrying out reclamation projects, many students would just say let us not use the cars anymore. Students would just keep saying that the government is wrong again!
- Miss Fu: Weak. Although they are very hard working in their studies, they are too narrow-minded. Maybe it is due to the fact that our school seldom trains our students to have critical thinking. We just expect them to be obedient.

All the teachers think that the sense of critical thinking is very important. As a teacher (Ms Lee) remarked, the students are expected to possess high quality potential,

having the ability to express their opinions and ideas freely.

The two parents were also asked the question how far their child could employ critical thinking and whether they would regard it as important. Mr. Hay and Mrs. Tsui had their own perceptions on this issue.

Mr. Hay tended to think that this ability was important. He claimed that his daughter as well as other family members were easy-going persons and did not like to argue with others. Therefore, she would not like to put forward opposing ideas unless she found them hard to accept.

Mr. Hay: My daughter and all of us are easy-going persons. We don't want to oppose others' views unless we really find it hard to accept.

Mrs. Tsui tended to think that her son had quite independent thinking because she found it difficult to influence him. It is interesting to note that she said it might not be necessary to use critical thinking when considering all matters. But she did think it would be good if the school managed to put effort into training the students in having this ability.

Mrs. Tsui: My son is quite independent in thinking. I find it hard to influence him....

It is unnecessary to think critically for all matters unless in some serious issues.... I expect the school to teach my son to think from different perspectives, as I myself am not so educated.

#### The students' views

The students were asked to tell me what critical thinking meant to them. Most of the respondents said they did not know its meaning. They tried to convey to me the message that they were emotional and therefore not very good in having a sense of critical thinking.

- Leung/F.7: I won't talk about politics with my friends lest it is harmful to our friendship. In terms of critical thinking, I am very weak as I am a very emotional person.
- Fu/F.7: In terms of critical thinking, my performance is fair. I will consider things from the emotional angle. I don't want to disagree with others. But I still have my own principles keeping justice is my final standpoint.
- Kwan/F.7: I am also an emotional person rather than a rational person. But when I express my views, I will not just follow others' points.

The students were also asked whether they would usually make up their own minds on different issues rather than being greatly influenced by others. Most of the responses to this question did not vary too much, tending to claim that they were "half and half". One student said she tended to follow her teachers' ideas. Three students in F.7 did try to suggest that they had their own sets of thinking even though they had admitted being emotional in my previous question.

- Wong/F.4: I tend to follow my teachers' ideas.
- Fu/F.7: I have my personal views and principles. Usually I will think of my own ideas and then consider others' views as well.

Leung/F.7: My basic principle is not to be arguing with others. In terms of subject matters issues, I will have my own ideas. If I manage to synthesis others' views and find that I am wrong, I will correct them promptly.

The students were also asked to tell me some current issues that they found very complicated which required skills of critical thinking to analyse them. This question was aimed at seeing whether they could be analytical and critical in examining some issues. Among the three F.4 students, only one of them gave me a response. She said nearly all the political issues required some sort of critical thinking. But she was unable or unwilling to narrate any one of them. All the remaining six students of F.5 and F.7 managed to name some hot issues but they did not express their comments accordingly. One of them even said she was not so sure about the details of that issue. The topics included some issues related to Hong Kong's recent development like the passing of the Article 23 and the debate on a reclamation scheme of the Victoria Harbour. It is difficult to judge whether they had a good sense of critical thinking by listening to their narrations, as it is hard to tell how deeply they could understand the issues or whether they were just able to repeat others' comments. But it does indicate that they were not so willing to utilise their ability of critical thinking.

However, it is worth pointing out here that I did record a response from the F.5 students saying that they knew the stance of their school in the debate over the passing of the Article 23 but they simply disagreed with it. They knew the school was

a firm supporter of the government and sided with the other left wing organizations that supported the passing of this article. But they said they supported the big rally that protested against the government. Thus they claimed that they had a sense of critical thinking. However, this can only be comprehended as having a different point of view.

- Chan/F.5: For the debate of Article 23, I think the big rally was good. It shows people in Hong Kong have channels to vent their opinions.
- Wan/F.5: Our school gives people impressions of patriotic and leftist. But we won't accept the stance of the school. We have our own standpoints. We have critical thinking.

The students were asked whether they managed to develop skills of critical thinking in their school. Students of F.4 said they seldom had chance to develop this. Even in the subject of Economics and Public Affairs that was supposed to be a subject stressing discussions of current issues, they claimed that there was no analysis of issues at all. Students of F.5 gave me similar answers. But one of them claimed that students of the arts stream had more chances to develop this compared to the science students. Two of the F.7 students claimed that they did have chances to learn it at the school and listed some subjects that helped train their critical thinking. The third F.7 student said she would rely on herself instead of the school to improve her thinking ability.

- Leung/F.7: The school provides such kind of training. We managed to discuss different issues, not just for the sake of preparing for the A-levels but also for making preparations for the future's work in the society. We need critical thinking.
- Fu/F.7: The school has done something; for example in the subjects of Chinese and Geography.
- Kwan/F.7: We managed to learn something in the lessons, but we have to rely on our own to develop such sense of critical thinking.

## The past students' views

The past students were asked to tell me what critical thinking meant to them and whether they would usually make up their own minds on different issues rather than being greatly influenced by others. Two out of the five wanted to convey the message that they had a rather critical thinking mind and were not easily affected by others. The rest of them admitted that other people would easily influence them.

- Kong/94: I think I have a strong sense of critical thinking. But I will still consider the views of the experts in particular fields.
- Ip/95: I will only comment on the things that I am familiar with. I have my own ideas and thoughts. I will not follow the sayings of someone unless I agree with him or her.
- Lee/97: Just half and half. I will have my own views but at the same time am affected by others to make my decisions.
- Wong/69: I am quite easily influenced by others.
- Shi/66: If the speakers manage to talk in an attractive way, I tend to follow and accept

his or her ideas, especially if I find them similar to my own views.

The past students were also asked to tell me some current issues that they found very complicated which required the skills of critical thinking to analyse them. This question was aimed at seeing whether they could be analytical and critical in examining some issues. Most of them managed to name some hot issues and express their brief comments accordingly. The topics covered in one of the two groups were chiefly related to Hong Kong's recent development like the passing of the Article 23 and the performances of Hong Kong's Chief Executive. They showed sympathy for the former Chief Executive, Mr. Tung. One past student of another group said she was too busy to show concern for critical issues.

- Lee/97: Since Mr. Tung is the very first Chief Executive of Hong Kong I can understand the hardships faced by him. It is difficult to tell whether his performances are good or not.
- Ip/95: I think the performance of the Chief Executive is not stable. He can be quite outstanding sometimes. But he is not a professional politician at all; he needs to improve his political skills.
- Kong/94: I tend to be sympathetic with Mr. Tung too.
- Shi/66: Facing different social issues, we need critical thinking in order to analyze them clearly. I am interested to know more, but I have no time at all.

It is noted that quite a number of Hong Kong people are very dissatisfied with the governance of the Chief Executive, while the past students showed their support for him. Nevertheless, they still agreed that things in this world are so complicated they require a sense of critical thinking to deal with them.

The students were asked whether they managed to develop these critical thinking skills in their school. Nearly all of them said that they seldom had chance to develop this ability in the school because this was not one of the key topics to be discussed. One of them also said that they had no habit of questioning the words of their teachers.

Lee/97: We seldom touch upon this issue of critical thinking.

Shi/66: In the past, we just listen to what the teachers said; we did not question their words.

#### **Summary**

To summarize, the supervisor and the principal of School B thought that their students were not strong in critical thinking because they tended to be too obedient. The teachers shared similar feelings. The school authorities admitted that the school had not provided much training in this aspect. All the parties thought that this element was important. The teachers managed to narrate some examples to show that students on the whole were not very critical when examining important issues. They said their students tended to listen to their teachers' instructions and also echoed the comments of the media, without using their own thinking critically. Some students said they

unable to narrate any controversial issues they had had thought of. However, some past students believed that they had a critical mind. But most of the past students were unable to narrate issues that showed they did examine these thoroughly with critical minds. Both students and past students claimed that they had not learned critical thinking in the school setting.

It is interesting to point out that some students tried to claim they had critical thinking because they dared to be different from the pro-government stance of the school. However, the past students showed their heart-felt sympathy for the government (chiefly the former Chief Executive, Mr. Tung).

## **Comparisons and Analysis**

The supervisors, the principals and the teachers of both schools tended to think the sense of critical thinking was not very strong among their students. The supervisor of School A was more optimistic that his students had abilities in this sense in comparison with the average Hong Kong students. The supervisor and the principal of School B claimed that since their students were nice and obedient they were not very ready to develop the sense of being critical to their teachers. The teachers of both schools managed to quote lots of examples to show that their students were unable to

be critical in evaluating different issues. From the responses of the students of both schools, there was a common view that some of them tended to side with others' views sometimes so as to avoid conflicts. In comparison, students from School A were more able to narrate some controversial issues and give their comments. In comparison with the present students, the past students were more willing to claim they had a sense of critical thinking now. However, such ability was not developed in the school setting, as they all said there was no such training at all. Some past students of School A explicitly claimed that they developed such a sense only when they went out to work.

All parties in both schools regard the sense of critical thinking as very important. However, the settings of the school that include the exam-oriented subject nature, pedagogy, nature of assessment and even the teaching contents do not foster developing a strong sense of critical thinking. This situation is similar to the previous finding of Tse (1997a, 1997b). It is worth noting that there is a culture of avoiding conflict among peers and thus an unwillingness to stick to personal thoughts. This may be related to the Confucian notion of harmony.

#### 11.2 Globalization

## School A

## The views of the supervisor, principal, teachers and parents

The supervisor, Mr. Lai, was able to define the term "globalization" in detail. As a chief executive in an international evangelical fellowship in Hong Kong, Mr. Lai might be expected to have a good understanding on this topic. He managed to narrate the scope and aspects of globalization and its impact on youth in detail. However, he admitted that the students in his school might not be strong in this sense because in civic education the school chiefly stressed the local society of Hong Kong, instead of a wider international outlook. He, of course, regarded the sense of globalization as very important.

Mr. Lai: There are three aspects of globalization, which include economic, culture and information.... The young people may easily feel lost in the new information era.... Student in our school might not be strong in this sense since we stress the local society instead of international arenas in civic education.

The principal, Mr. So, also admitted that his students might not be too strong in an understanding of globalization even though he also thought that it was important.

Mr. Ho said that he himself had seldom come across the term globalization.

Mr. Ho: There are few chances for our students to learn things about globalization. Therefore, they may not be too familiar with this concept unless they learn this elsewhere.... Globalization is important as it is the world trend and we cannot just confine ourselves within walls.

Teachers thought their students weak or even very weak in the sense of

globalization, while most of them claimed that this element was very important.

Teachers tried to compare their own students with some they had come across during exchange programmes and found that their students were no better than the others.

They also suggested the reasons for the situation and ways of improving it.

- Mr. Sum: Students concerns are very narrow and are related to themselves and near-by, such as eating, drinking and entertainments. They pay attention to the movie and singing stars or the way to university. I contacted some students in Beijing and found that they paid much more attentions to the outside world.
- Ms Kung: Having an international outlook is something to do with the family backgrounds; as our students are chiefly coming from the lower classes, the inspiration from them must be very limited and is reflected in the newspaper they read and the TV programs they watch.
- Mr. Wong: It would be good for students to develop a sense of international outlook if we manage to organize more study tours to foreign countries. Through examining the systems and frameworks of others, we learn the shortcoming of ours.

The parents were asked a similar question – whether they thought their child would have a sense of globalization and whether they regarded it as important. Mr. Fong thought that his child was not too bad, while Ms Ho claimed that her child had not acquired such a sense yet. Both of them thought this sense was important.

Mr. Fong: My son is concerned with things happening elsewhere like news in Burma, the Philippines and the Americans attacking Iraq. But his interest is confined to that political news only.

Ms Ho: I think my daughter has not acquired a sense of international outlook yet. But she is interested and admires the culture and living styles of foreign countries that make her have a wider vision. I think an international outlook is important. You will always have alternatives other than just one view when you pay attention to foreign experiences.

#### The students' views

The students were asked what globalization meant to them. Some of the responses managed to give some relevant definitions of globalization and pinpoint some advantages and disadvantages of it. One student simply said she had heard this term, but she did not understand it at all.

- Tang/F.4: The whole world is linked together, joining hands to develop, prosper and unify. We have to foster the equality of world nations, without using force as a means to solve problems.
- Law/F.6: Globalization is to lessen the barriers among nations by improving communications.
- Cheung/F.6: There are certain orientations for globalization and different countries would have their own interpretations. Being affected by globalization, there are advantages and disadvantages to some nations.

The students were also asked to name some of the important international organizations they know. Four of them did not respond to this question. Some managed to name some organizations they had heard of, they included the United Nations, Greenpeace, Medecins Sans Frontieres, Nobel Prizes, World Trade Organization (WTO) and World Health Organization (WHO). One student added that

she had heard of the WTO but without exactly understanding what it was.

They were also asked to narrate some recent international news, in which they were interested, so as to check whether they had a strong sense of globalization. The three students in F.4 could not give me very detailed descriptions. One of them was able to mention a big fire in California. Two of the three F.6 students also managed to mention some international news they knew about, but not in detail. The third F.6 student claimed that he did not pay attention to international news unless it was reporting very big issues. The three students in F.7 managed to give me more details of the international issues they knew and with their comments. Two of them shared their views on the issue of the Americans attacking Iraq and the roles played by the United Nations. Another F.7 student expressed her views on the relations of Israel and Palestine, the role of the USA in this issue and a big fire in California. One student (Law/F.7) explicitly claimed that she was interested in international issues and would try her best to notice them.

The students were asked whether they would identity themselves as "global citizens". Six responses were received and all claimed they would.

Tang/F.4: Probably yes. As we live on this earth and we hope it will be good for living.

Lau/F.4: Probably yes.

- Chu/F.6: Probably yes. As we are living on this earth and all the things happening here deserve our attention.
- Law/F.6: Probably yes on the environmental aspect but not on the political aspect.
- Chan/F.7: Yes. Just like a good football team is composed of some good players from all over the world.
- Wong/F.7: Yes. I feel I belong to this world and I want to know more things about what is happening in this world.

The students were also asked about their feeling towards people who are suffering from various worldwide problems like poverty, hunger, war and plague, and what they would do about it. All of the nine students were aware of worldwide problems and they showed sympathy toward the suffering of people. Some managed to analyse reasons behind the misfortunes of the people who suffered. Some students claimed that they had to improve themselves first in order to help others. Most of them were willing to give some money to help those in need, but had no plan to contribute more than that.

- Chu/F.6: I think some problems originated from the lack of education for the previous generations that bring bad consequences to the next generation.... What we can do is to improve ourselves first so that our next generation will become better. I will contribute some money if my economic situation is good enough.
- Law/F.6: I think many people are just very innocent. Some politicians spark off wars and people are harmed. There is simply no justice in some places that make people poor.

- Cheung/F.6: I can contribute some money. But I can't contribute more than that.
- Ng/F.7: We have to improve ourselves first. For example, there is widespread hunger in some countries and thus we should not waste our food.
- Wong/F.7: I will help selling flags for charities. I may not be able to contribute a lump sum of money.

## The past students' views

The past students were asked to tell me what globalization meant to them. Two of them managed to give some relevant definitions of globalization and pinpoint some advantages and disadvantages of it.

- Lee/92: Globalization is a good chance for development. In economic terms, people can go to different places for business. There are disadvantage too. The problems included trade conflicts and limitations.
- Yeung/92: There are advantages. There will be no more barriers in the flow of information and capital. But the disadvantages are letting the giant enterprises become bigger and bigger while the small business firms are squeezed out. Those young people who want to create their own business would find it very difficult.

The past students were also asked to name some of the important international organizations they know. Only one of them tried to name some organizations he knew, they included the Medecins Sans Frontieres, Red Cross and World Vision. One student said that she had heard of the United Nations but without exactly understanding how it operated.

They were also asked to narrate some recent international news, which they were interested in so as to check whether they had a strong sense of globalization. Among the six students, one said she could not recall any issue at that moment. Three of the other five (females) managed to name some issues but not in detail. The issues include the campaign of President Bush for the next term of presidency, the election of the Taiwan president and the Americans attacking Iraq. Among these three females, one claimed that she did not pay attention to international news unless it was really very interesting. The remaining two past students (male) managed to narrate more details of the international issues they knew and provide their comments. They shared topics of the Americans attacking Iraq and the effects of China's growth within the world.

The students were asked whether they would identity themselves as "global citizens". None of them said they would have such a claim. They said they were not interested in international issues as it was too big a topic.

The students were also asked about their feeling towards those people who are suffering from various worldwide problems like poverty, hunger, war and plague, and what they would do about it. Most of them were aware of worldwide problems and they showed their sympathy for the people who suffered. One of them said he would pray for them. Most of them were willing to give some money to help those in need.

One said she would just contribute to those reliable organizations. One said she would rather contribute to those needy people in China first.

Lee/92: I will pray for them and make money contributions.

Chan/92: I think many children are really very poor. I will be selective in making money contributions to those reliable organizations.

Tsui/99: I will help the needy ones in China first.

#### Summary

To summarize, the supervisor of School A managed to say a lot about globalization. But he and the principal did not think their students had strong a strong sense of globalization. The teachers also shared similar feelings. However, all of them, plus the interviewed parents tended to think this issue was important.

Some students managed to provide relevant definitions of globalization and some international organizations they knew. The more senior students were more able to provide comments on international issues. I was much impressed by the willingness of most of them to claim they are global citizens. Relatively speaking, the past students were less willing to try to act as global citizens even though they managed to define the term globalization and name some international organizations. Both students and past students said they were willing to do something to help those needy groups in this world by making money contributions.

## School B

## The views of the supervisor, principal, teachers and parents

The supervisor, Mr. Pong, thought that students in his school were relatively weak in their sense of globalization. He quoted a recent report that compared students of Shanghai and Hong Kong. He concluded that students of Hong Kong in general are not strong in their understanding of globalisation.

Mr. Pong: Our students are relatively weak. Today there is a report comparing the students of Shanghai and Hong Kong.... Hong Kong students are weaker in this sense. Even students of our school are not so strong.

The principal, Mr. Tam, also admitted that his students might not be very strong in their sense of globalization even though he also thought this very important. Mr. Tam managed to elaborate his views on global trend developments and thus stressed the significance of acquiring a sense of globalization.

Mr. Tam: The messages of globalization are very important. In terms of economics, politics or information, they are no longer regionalized.... Students in Hong Kong are weak in this sense. They should know something about what is happening, but they have little interest in this.... As Hong Kong is an international city, our students need a sense of globalization.

When the teachers were asked to evaluate whether their students had a sense of globalization, they also said that their students were weak in this area as well.

Miss Fu: In terms of international outlook, students of senior forms are better. But

overall speaking, their concern in international affairs is not enough. They are just unclear about the issue of globalization. To the junior form students, they are just concerned with things in Hong Kong and things around them. When they read the newspaper, they just pay attention to the Hong Kong Page and its issues concerning incidents and violence scenes, or they are just concerned to read the entertainment pages. Even the issues in Mainland China are unfamiliar to them, with the exception of the students coming from the mainland.

Ms Lee: Not strong. They show their concern in Hong Kong affairs, such as the economy and their future prospects in finding a job. If Hong Kong's economy becomes better, it would be easier for the students to pay more attention to things outside Hong Kong. But as Hong Kong is suffering so much in economic terms, people just concentrate on their own sorrows.

Miss Lam: They manage to talk about some hot issues that they can hear people echoing in this city. However, when I try to bring out some serious issues like uneven wealth distribution, starvation of the African children, they think that they are boring.

Teachers generally thought that the sense of globalization was also important.

But as Miss Lam remarked, students of senior forms (say F.6 and F.7) should understand this concept while it takes time for the lower form students to develop it.

Mr. Tong: Students of senior forms should be better. Lower students might not understand the meaning of globalization.

Mr. Hui: Students have not got such sense yet. In order to show concern for current affairs and happenings in the international arena, one has to be equipped with the ability of critical thinking. Students have not developed both of these elements.... In junior and some senior form students, they just do not know what is going on with the issues like China entering the WTO. They are just concerned with things happening around them. They go back home to study and play computer games there. Their concerns do not reach a higher level. They are just concerned with the things in Hong Kong.

The parents were asked a similar question – whether they thought their child would have a sense of globalization and whether they regarded it as important. Mr. Hay thought that this sense was important but his daughter was not strong on this.

Mr. Hay: I think it is good to know and anticipate something would happen to us by knowing about global trends. The attention of my daughter is not on this sense unless something really shocking has happened. It might be due to the fact that she is female and thus not interested in some global issues. But she did browse information in the websites.

Mrs. Tsui was able to give her views on globalization. She thought that her son had little sense of globalization. She also thought that this sense was important.

Mrs. Tsui: I think globalization should mean equality for the whole world. The resources in this world should be fairly distributed by nations instead of some big powers.... We should have a broader vision instead of a narrow mind that concentrates on things around us.

## The students' views

The students were asked to tell me what globalization meant to them. Some of the respondents managed to give some relevant definitions of globalization and point out some advantages and disadvantages of it. Some students simply said they had never heard of this term.

Leung/F.7: Globalization makes the transfer of information through the web ever faster.

Fu/F.7: Globalization may lead to the unequal distribution of economic resources. It is a complicated problem.

Kwan/F.7: There will be problems if the economies are unified. It will be easy for the small nations to be exploited by the big powers.

The students were also asked to name some of the important international organizations they knew. Most of them managed to name some organizations they had heard of. They included the United Nations, Medecins Sans Frontieres, Red Cross, Boy's Scout, World Trade Organization (WTO) and World Health Organization (WHO). Some added that they had heard of some organizations, but without exactly understanding what they did.

They were also asked to narrate some recent international news that they were interested in, in order to check whether they had a strong sense of globalization. Most of them managed to list one issue that they could remember. The issues included a big fire and the election of the Governor in California, the Americans attacking Iraq, an earthquake in China and SARS in Asia. But no one was willing or able to make detailed comments on the named issues.

The students were asked whether they would identity themselves as "global citizens". Only one student in F.7 gave me a positive response on this question. All students of F.4 and F.5 said it was too remote to make such a claim.

Kwan/F.7: Personally I would like to see more things around and I hope I can acquire

more sense of being a global citizen.

The students were also asked about their feeling towards those people who were suffering from various worldwide problems like poverty, hunger, war and plague, and the things they would do about that. Most of students were aware of the worldwide problems and they showed their sympathy toward the people who suffered. Some of them were willing to give some money to help those in need if they had money.

Fu/F.7: As the Africans are so poor, the wealthy countries should fight fewer battles and save up the money to help them.

Leung/F.4: I think many people are very poor. I will try my best to help.

#### The past students' views

The past students were asked to tell me what globalization mean to them. Most of them were unable to give me any sort of definition. They were also asked to name some of the important international organizations they knew. Again, most of them were unable to list organizations that other interviewees had mentioned in other interviews. One named the United Nations while another one named the Red Cross.

They were also asked to narrate some recent international news that they were interested in so as to check whether they had a strong sense of globalization. But again, none of the five past students were able to narrate any event in detail. Some of them even claimed that they were not interested in international news at all. Only one

past student mentioned that she was concerned with the issue of international terrorism but without relating it to some recent issues.

Shi/66: We don't care very much about international issues. We would rather be concerned about issues of Hong Kong.

Kong/94: I have a concern for international issues. But such a concern is sometimes very limited.

The students were asked whether they would identity themselves as "global citizens". None of them said they would have such a claim. Some of them said they were not really interested in international issues and one said she would care more for issues related to China.

Lee/97: Such a sense of a global village is not strong for me.

Ip/95: I would be concerned more on the development of China because China is my country and most important to me.

The students were also asked about their feeling towards those people who were suffering from various worldwide problems likes poverty, hunger, war and plague, and the things they would do about that. Most of them were aware of worldwide problems and they showed their sympathy toward the people who suffered. However, three out of the five said they would rather contribute to needy people in China first. Only one of them said she would not follow such a priority.

- Lee/97: My own country is the most important one. Those hungry people in Africa and the aids victims are to be taken care of by some international agencies.
- Ip/95: Our country has a lot of needy people also and we should take care of them first.
- Wong/69: I think many people are really miserable.... I hope I can do something for that such as making some money contributions.... I tend to help those needy people in China first.
- Shi/66: I won't give my priority to China but to the neediest ones. Even though our country has a lot of people who are still very poor, there are far more people who are very desperate and they need our urgent help.

#### Summary

To summarize, the supervisor and the principal, the teachers and the parents of School B did not think the students had a strong sense of globalization. Nevertheless, they tended to think this sense was important.

Some students managed to provide relevant definitions of globalization and list some international organizations they knew. The more senior students were more able to provide comments on international issues but not in detail. Most of them did not claim themselves as global citizens. The past students even said they did not care for international issues at all and had no wish to claim they were global citizens even though they managed to define the term globalization and name some international organizations. Some of the students and past students said they were willing to do something to help those needy groups in this world by making money contributions.

However, there were some past students who explicitly said money donations should be given to the needy groups of China first.

#### **Comparisons and Analysis**

The supervisors, the principals and the teachers of both schools tended to think the sense of globalization was not very strong among their students. In comparison, students from School A in general expressed more favourable views in identifying themselves as "global citizens" and they were more able to narrate international issues in detail. However, the past students of School A, the students and past students of School B did not show their eagerness to talk about international issues.

The parties of the supervisor, principal and teachers in each school did not think their students were strong in the sense of globalization. However, most of them regarded it as very important. It is rather difficult to judge whether students and past students have a strong concept of globalisation or not. Even relevant research conducted in recent years, such as in the survey conducted by the Hong Kong Institute of Education and Oxfam in 2003, is subject to different interpretations. But the fact is that quite a number of present students in both schools and some past students in School A managed to name some international organizations and narrate the international hot issues in quite a detailed way. Some even wished to see themselves

as "global citizens". One should not forget Hong Kong is a well-informed city and people here manage to absorb different messages efficiently.

Apart from the views of the different parties of the two schools on the four suggested elements, efforts were made to elicit their responses to compare and rate the different elements. The parties were chiefly asked to share their views on the elements of national identity and consciousness vs. democracy/ participation, and national identity and consciousness vs. globalization.

## 11.3 National identity and Consciousness vs. Democracy/ Participation

# School A

#### The views of the supervisor, principal, teachers and parents

The supervisor, Mr. Lai, thought that it was not necessary to prioritize these two elements, for they were actually two related things.

Mr. Lai: When people are demanding democracy in an open society, they should at the same time having a strong sense of national identity and consciousness. Democracy itself is good for building up the nation.

The principal, Mr. So, had a slightly different view from Mr. Lai. He also thought that both were important. However, he did think that it was essential to have a sense of national identity first. And the pace of democracy should not exceed the

development of the country (China).

Mr. So: National identity is the first priority. We have to refer to the particular situations of the nation before we seek further development of democracy. We can't be too drastic in achieving our goals.

When teachers were asked to comment on the relative importance of these two elements, they tended to think both were important, and that these two were complementary rather than contradictory. However, if the two elements were really to be compared in the strictest sense, two teachers claimed that democracy would be more important.

- Mr. Wong: It is not a must to compare which one of the two elements is more important. If either one of the two elements is being given too much emphasis the balance will be lost. In the area of civic education, it is important that we do not put forward too much of our views but rather let our students to make their own judgments.
- Mr. Ho: The two are not contradictory if one has the sense of democracy he or she may be critical of the country, but it is a way to be patriotic.
- Mr. Sum: I will incline more to the sphere of democracy because China itself has a lot of problems with its system. I think we cannot let Hong Kong take a back step.
- Ms Kung: I think the element on democracy is more important, for China of today needs more democracy. Hong Kong can somehow help China to be more open and develop democracy.

As a parent, Mr. Fong could sense the different views of the leftists and the

democrats on this issue. He therefore suggested having a kind of nationalist education that is without the ideology of party politics.

Mr. Fong: I think the leftists want to input the ideas of the communist party into education while the democrats are afraid of such kind of indoctrination. I think both of them should not argue. We should be neutral and establish a way of Chinese national identity and consciousness, with the emphasis on culture, not politics.

Another parent, Ms Ho, also had her own ideas on this issue. She tended to think both were important but the sense of national identity and consciousness should come first.

Ms Ho: National identity and consciousness should come first and then be followed by democracy. If there is nothing called national identity, it is unclear why we would fight for something called democracy.

To summarize, all the parties tended to think that the elements of national identity & consciousness and democracy/ participation were complementary rather than contradictory. But if the two elements were to be compared in the strictest sense, opinion was spilt. Some believed that the national sense should come first, whilst some said that democracy should be given priority.

## School B

The views of the supervisor, principal, teachers and parents

The supervisor, Mr. Pong, thought that these two elements were not contradictory at all and it was not necessary to state which one was the more important. He thought that a process to develop both elements is required.

Mr. Pong: It is a process for students to develop a sense of democracy and national identity and consciousness. It cannot be accomplished within a very short period of time.

The principal, Mr. Tam, shared a similar view to Mr. Pong. He also thought that both were important. He claimed that some people who fought for democracy were simply showing discontent. And he thought that it would be good to get a balance between the two elements.

Mr. Tam: In Hong Kong, it is no good fighting for democracy just for the sake of expressing discontent. We should think of ways of building up a better government. We should strike for a balance between the elements of democracy and national identity.

When teachers were asked to comment on the relative importance of these two elements, they tended to think both were important. These two were complementary rather than contradictory. However, if the two elements were really to be compared in the strictest sense, only one teacher claimed that the sense of national identity and consciousness needed to be developed first. Another teacher claimed that having national senses was not equivalent to being loyal to the communist party, therefore democracy was more important.

Mr. Tong: As Hong Kong has a special historical background, students are weak in the sense of national identity and consciousness, and we have to develop such sense.

Mr. Fu: In this modern age, we cannot just listen to the arrangements of the Communist Party, therefore democracy is important.

As a parent, Mr. Hay thought that the sense of national identity and consciousness should be developed first and democracy might not be the best mode for all things.

Mr. Hay: I think the basic thing is to develop a sense of national identity and consciousness then followed by democracy. It should be step by step.

And it does not mean we need democracy for everything.

Another parent, Mrs. Tsui, thought that democracy was more important than the national sense.

Mrs. Tsui: If there is democracy, you will be free in your mind and behaviour.

Having democracy does not mean you will not love your country any more.

To summarize, all the parties tended to think that the elements of national identity and consciousness and democracy/ participation were complementary rather than contradictory. But if the two elements were to be compared in the strictest sense, some responded that the national sense should come first, whilst others thought that democracy should be given priority.

#### **Comparisons and Analysis**

It is remarkable that even the supervisor and the principal of School B claimed that both elements were of the same importance. One might expect that they would rate the element of national identity and consciousness as more important. I tend to think that they wanted to present me with a picture that they placed democracy in an important position. It is also remarkable to find that the principal of School A did mention that democracy should be exercised within the limits of the particular national context and thus national identity and consciousness should be a bit more important than democracy/participation. There are also some people who were concerned with the possible misuse of democracy.

#### 11.4 National Identity and Consciousness vs. Globalization

# School A

#### The views of the supervisor, principal, teachers and parents

The supervisor thought that both elements of national identity and globalization were compatible. These two could co-exist and be interactive with each other.

Mr. Lai: Man has different identities. For example, I am a person of my home and I am a Hongkongese as well. If someone was born in Shanghai, he is still a Chinese but being socialized by the culture of Shanghai and at the same

time by the culture of the Chinese nation.... We have the elements of nation and culture within us. We should take this as a starting point and look through the world from it, which is another identity – the global citizen.

The principal again had slightly different view on this question. On one hand he thought that both elements were compatible, but on the other hand, the nation itself should always come first.

Mr. So: Our country is our own place that affects us all round. And then the effects of globalization affect us. Globalization will not kill off the national consciousness. For example, using the currency of the Euro does not mean the end of France and Germany. But we have to love our own country and make efforts for its development first.

When the teachers were asked to comment on the relative importance of these two elements, they tended to think both were important. These two were complementary rather than contradictory. However, if the two elements were really to be compared in the strictest sense, different teachers had different views.

- Mr. Wong: Both are not contradictory at all. But as globalization is so big as an issue, we have to start from knowing our nation first.
- Mr. Ho: We have to stress both elements. If we just stress national identity without a sense of globalization, we will tend to adopt an extreme nationalism.
- Mr. Yau: It is more important to strengthen the sense of nationalism rather than have a sense of globalization because we need to root ourselves on a firm foundation and then to know the situations of other nations.
- Mr. Sum: As globalization is such an irresistible world trend, I will rate it a little higher than the national sense.

Ms Kung: Globalization is more important. I am not a person with strong national feelings; I think "all mankind" is more important.

Both parents, Mr. Fong and Ms Ho, shared a similar view that we should establish our own sense of national identity first and then follow that with a sense of globalization.

Mr. Fong: I think we have to develop a sense of national identity of our own first and then think of anything beyond.

Ms Ho: National education is some kind of "root". If we have no such root, we can't be firm and it becomes dangerous to examine things outside.

To summarize, all the parties tended to think that the elements of national identity and consciousness and globalization were complementary rather than contradictory. But if the two elements were to be compared in the strictest sense, there was a division of opinion. Some thought that the national sense should come first, whilst others thought that globalization should be given priority, because placing too much emphasis on national feelings might lead to extreme nationalism.

## School B

The views of the supervisor, principal, teachers and parents

The supervisor thought that both elements of national identity and globalization were compatible. It was not necessary to state which one should come first.

The principal had a slightly different view on this question. On the one hand he thought that both elements were compatible, but on the other hand, the nation itself should come first.

Mr. Tam: We have to be familiar with the things in our own country before we show concern for global issues. Otherwise, it is too one-sided and not enough.

When the teachers were asked to comment on the relative importance of these two elements, they tended to think both were important. These two were complementary rather than contradictory. However, if the two elements were really to be compared in the strictest sense, four out of five teachers explicitly said knowing the nation itself should come first.

Ms Lee: I think we have to know our own country first. If we don't have any knowledge about our country, it will be useless to speak of globalization.

Both parents, Mr. Hay and Mrs. Tsui, shared a similar view that these two elements were complementary rather than contradictory.

To summarize, all the parties tended to think that the elements of national identity and consciousness and globalization were complementary rather than contradictory.

#### **Comparisons and Analysis**

Similar responses were received in the comparison of national identity &

consciousness and globalization. But there were some more responses in favour of the national identity and consciousness element rather than the element of globalization, especially in School B.

#### 11.5 Summary and Conclusions

To compare the two schools on the fulfilment of the four suggested elements of political socialization, some similarities and differences can be drawn in this and the previous chapters.

For the fulfilment of the four suggested elements, I think students of School A do have rather strong senses of national identity & consciousness and democracy/participation, not being so strong in their ability of critical thinking and globalization.

One can also see the coherence between the students and past students of School A. Students of School B are rather strong on their sense of national identity & consciousness, being sound on the element of democracy/participation, not being so strong on the ability of critical thinking and rather weak on the sense of globalization. The students and past students of School B are not so common in their mindsets — the present students simply claimed that they would not stick to the pro-China stances of the school even though they did respect it.

Nearly all the interviewed parties regarded the four suggested elements as important. But democracy was the most controversial element among the four. On

one hand, the senior managers of the two schools claimed that it was natural to have a free and open atmosphere at the schools and they welcomed the students developing such a sense. However, there were some past students of School B and a parent of School A that expressed their doubts on democracy. This can be regarded as representative of the view of at least some people in Hong Kong.

In the next (final) chapter, the findings of the fieldworks will be furthered utilized to draw lessons for the needs of Hong Kong secondary schools in the area of political socialization.

# CHAPTER 12 CONCLUSIONS: THE KIND OF POLITICAL SOCIALIZATION NEEDED FOR SECONDARY SCHOOL STUDENTS IN HONG KONG

In this concluding chapter, the background of the study and the findings of the fieldwork are linked and furthered discussed, thus making suggestions for the schools in Hong Kong in the area of political socialization. The needs of Hong Kong and its nature as a metropolis are briefly discussed again. There is an assessment of the role of the school in political socialization in Hong Kong with reference to the two research schools. With the research schools as examples, the four suggested elements and the related requirements of political socialization for equipping future citizens of Hong Kong will be discussed further. Efforts are made to outline future developments in Hong Kong, the possible measures that the schools have to take and the preparation of the school students, in order to keep up with the pace of the society.

#### 12.1 The Debate on the Needs of Hong Kong and its Nature as a Metropolis

Hong Kong was just a remote village with very few people 160 years ago. The fate that Hong Kong encountered in 1842 was to fall under the rule of the British, when Hong Kong was detached from China and became a British Colony. Hong Kong managed to build up its economy eventually, especially from 1970s onwards. By the time Hong Kong was returned to China, in 1997, Hong Kong was an important

commercial and financial centre in the Far East. Hong Kong had become a metropolis.

Under British rule, the mentality of Hong Kong people had been apolitical and they sometimes had been called "economic animals", enjoying earning money but giving up the basic civil rights of democratic participation. However, things constantly change, and the people of Hong Kong started to taste the fruits of democracy and learn to be more political when the British were about to go. Therefore, when the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region was formally established in 1997, fewer and fewer Hong Kong people were as apolitical as before. Quite a number of people in Hong Kong now are not content to let Hong Kong be an economic city only. Hong Kong people can no longer be linked to economic terms only. Hong Kong is becoming an economic but also political metropolis, for no big city can afford just to be strong in only the economic aspect.

#### 12.2 An Assessment of the Role of School in Political Socialization in Hong Kong

As the relevant literature reveals, political socialization can be concerned with a range of dispositions, from an obedient passive subject under a despotic autocracy to an active participating citizenship in a democratic polity (Tse, 1997a, 1997b, 1999). Governments of different countries need to educate their fellow citizens politically in their own way, while individuals have to find their own means of survival that include

being socialized politically in the society. Among the different agents of political socialization, school is very important, for it socializes students politically in a systematic way.

From the fieldwork, it was clear that all the parties involved believed that the schools socialized students in different ways, political socialization being one of them. They also believed that the schools managed to socialize their students politically in formal and informal ways. Through the formal curriculum, it was believed that students were exposed to some important concepts related to political terms and issues, apolitical students further acquired their knowledge and more importantly their behaviours through informal ways that included their interactions with their teachers, fellow schoolmates and the activities they participated in. Research findings suggested that the schools and the teaching staff had their own political beliefs and the related background did affect their way of thinking and their political stances. Certainly students were affected by the schools and the staff there even though the parties involved might not always realize this.

# 12.3 The Elements and Requirements of Political Socialization for Equipping Future Citizens of Hong Kong and their Fulfillment in the Two Schools

From the literature on political socialization, and with reference to the particular situation of Hong Kong, four elements have been argued as essential to political

socialization in Hong Kong secondary schools. They are: national identity and consciousness, democracy/ participation, globalization, and critical thinking.

Since the education system has emphasized competition and public examination results, students have been used to rote learning but have thereby not developed the ability for critical thinking (Tse, 1997a, 1997b). Studies have pointed out that secondary school students in Hong Kong are politically apathetic and lack a sense of national identity and consciousness in most schools (Tse, 1999, 1997a, 1997b; Leung, 1997, Lau, 1982; King, 1981a, 1981b; Hoadley, 1970). Apart from the official version of the HKSAR government on future developments in Hong Kong, which pinpoints the needs to equip Hong Kong students with critical minds and an international outlook, given the trend towards globalization and knowledge-based economies, recent events have shown that Hong Kong is no longer just an economic city but a political metropolis as well. Thus, students need to be further equipped to become responsible and sensible citizens for Hong Kong and the mother country, China. Hong Kong citizens need a clear sense of national identity and consciousness, with an ability for critical thinking and a sense of international outlook in order to accept the rather new identity of SAR citizens and face the challenges and chances of globalization, which all require an active involvement in a democratic society.

As revealed in the findings from the research schools, students on the whole are

no longer as weak in their sense of national identity and consciousness, as they were previously. It was found that students in School B did appear quite strong in this area, while the past students were even stronger. In fact, the teaching staff, as well as the whole school, had a very strong mission to uphold the sense of nationality. However, some of this seems to have been by means of indoctrination to foster an unquestionable loyalty to a regime or a nation, and indoctrination is not educational. Students in School A were not weak in this sense at all, as the school authorities sensed the importance of this element and started to do something after 1997, even though some teachers were not totally in line with the school's policy.

The students of both schools had learnt the importance of democracy and participation. They understood quite well meanings of human rights and the freedom they might enjoy under the democratic atmosphere in the school settings and the society of Hong Kong as a whole. However, their teachers were sometimes critically aware that they tended to enjoy their rights but were not very willing to fulfill their responsibilities.

With regard to critical thinking and globalization, the students of both schools appeared to be rather weak. For students of School B, the teachers and the principal commented that it might be due to the fact that the students were used to being obedient, always listening to the instructions of the teachers, and thus were unable to

develop a sense of critical thinking. Similar comments also were recorded in School A. Students were also described as being unable to see things in a global way and thus lacked a sense of international outlook. From the responses of the students, the situation should be regarded as variable, as there were some students in both schools who had a global vision and managed to tell me something beyond the local context.

It was found that most of the interviewees including the supervisor, principal and teachers of the schools and the parents agreed on the importance of the four elements of political socialization. Some rated national identity and consciousness as more important, while some tended to think democracy was more important. However, quite a number said both were of the same importance. Some teachers stressed the importance of critical thinking and hoped that their students would develop this sense, as it was seen as most important for them to develop this as persons.

The meanings of nationalism and patriotism are related to the element of national identity and consciousness proposed in this study. It has been suggested that a degree of patriotism or nationalism is not bad thing. It is interesting that some of the interviewees managed to distinguish between loving one's country and loving of the Chinese Communist Party.

As echoed by some interviewees of the two schools who were concerned about possible misinterpretations of democracy, quite a number of people in Hong Kong

might share the same concerns. It is believed the element of democracy/ participation is important and vital to political socialization in schools.

Globalization can be simply regarded as some kind of international outlook, for it has a wider meaning than this. Globalization is becoming more important in the 21<sup>st</sup> century, especially in places like Hong Kong. As a metropolis, Hong Kong citizens have to try to acquire global citizenship as well. Attempts need to be made to reduce any conflict between the elements of national identity & consciousness and globalization.

Finally, secondary school students in Hong Kong need the element of critical thinking in order to distinguish between and balance the other three elements and guard against the possible misinterpretation or over emphasis of some suggested elements.

# 12.4 Further Thoughts on the Four Suggested Elements of Political Socialization: Lessons to be Drawn from the Researched Schools for Improvement

One can sense the difference between the two researched schools in terms of their background and atmosphere. As School A is a Christian school and most of the teachers are Christians (Protestants). Quite a number of students are Christians too. The school premises are used for church services and activities on Sundays and Saturdays. Teachers and students as a whole accept the norms and practices of

Christianity. Some of them are converted to be Christians with the inculcation of the school atmosphere and teaching. Teachers have a wish to share their Christian faith with their students. This has also been the mission of the sponsoring body to run the school in this way.

School B is a non-religious school. The sponsoring body, however, does have a mission – to foster a strong sense of nationalism among the students. Both the administrative and teaching staff share this mission. They mentioned the issues concerning China (motherland) so often that this researcher had to express his own viewpoints quite often in response. Being patriotic was somehow akin to "religion" among quite a number of staff in the school. It is difficult to judge whether they are faithful to the communist regime or just to the nation.

The sense of national identity and consciousness was clearly stronger in School B. There are lessons that School A might learn from it. However, one can argue that it was the very background of School B that paved the way for the strong sense of national identity and consciousness. Quite a number of the teaching staff and students had been new immigrants from China and they were more familiar with the situation on the mainland and tended to identify themselves with the mainland. It is noteworthy that only the group of past students showed strong nationalistic feelings while the present students of School B were comparatively not so strong in this sense, as the

present students did not possess the new immigrants' backgrounds. However, the sense of national identity and consciousness among the students interviewed in School B was still strong in general as revealed in the responses to the questions related to this aspect. Even the two interviewed parents said that their children were moving from having a bad impression of China to a favourable attitude towards it. One therefore can conclude that the atmosphere of the school, teaching and influence of the teaching staff was still important and influential in socializing their students. Teachers in School B also narrated that they had some programs of exchanges with the mainland. The frequent reporting of events happening in the mainland will probably be influential among the students in developing such a sense. Perhaps School A should also organize more programs of exchange with the mainland and with more frequent reporting of the issues related to China.

It is worthwhile reflecting on the relations between patriotism (national identity and consciousness) and critical thinking, as based on the findings of the researched schools. First of all, as mentioned and argued in chapters 2 and 6, one should not be loyal to a regime or his/ her nation without question. The past students of School B did convey a message that they loved and cared for their country. They were most willing to declare that they were patriotic, and even to the point that they were willing to sacrifice themselves. However, as mentioned in their own responses to the

questions, they did not believe they were being educated in a critical manner when they received their patriotic education in the school. One past student did mention the word "indoctrination" to describe the teaching and learning processes during her school days. Indoctrination is not educational at all. As argued above, in School B, loving the country was somehow similar to a religious education that did not allow questioning of the authority. However, love for country is not the same as love for any particular government of the country. The most loving thing one can sometimes do is to be highly critical of the government.

As discussed in the thesis, critical thinking has been regarded as very important. However, students from both schools did not seem to be doing very well in this aspect. Lessons can still be drawn from their responses. Students and teachers in School A did mention that they tended to discuss some controversial issues in critical ways simply as preparation for the possible questions coming out for the public examinations. Both students and teachers in the two schools did place great emphasis on the results of the public examinations. It is suggested that the examination or assessment mechanism should be suitably adjusted to foster this kind of critical thinking. The curriculum and teaching pedagogy also need to be adjusted accordingly. More emphasis should be placed on higher order thinking instead of rote learning across different subjects. Teachers need to encourage their students to think critically in the learning processes

while adopting innovative teaching methods that invite discussions and questions from students. It is interesting to note in this respect that a new compulsory subject called Liberal Studies will come into place in the senior secondary forms in Hong Kong shortly, which stresses more on acquiring knowledge in a flexible and critical way. It might then be more possible to enhance critical thinking.

Students of both schools in the sense of globalization were rather weak, in relation to other suggested elements. Certainly, both schools did not pay much attention to this element even though they started to feel its importance. The experience of School B in organizing exchange programs with the mainland during which students did acquire a stronger sense of national identity and consciousness could be extended to foster a sense of globalization. By organizing some more exchange programs with other parts of the world and reporting of the global issues, students should be able to increase their interest and start developing their international outlook. Students should be encouraged to pay attention to issues beyond the local context. Schools should also enlist discussion of more elements of globalization in the formal and informal curricula. Schools could start by highlighting some interesting and/or important news to the students.

As revealed from the findings of the two schools, students of both schools did start to have a reasonable understanding of democracy/participation. In School A, past

students and present students presented different pictures – the latter tended to think that the school atmosphere was becoming more and more open and democratic. The school authorities of both schools claimed that they would like to promote a democratic atmosphere in the school premises. However, teachers in School A and students in School B did question whether the school authorities were democratic enough and willing to listen to the opinions of the students. As mentioned in chapter 8, the student unions of both schools did not participate in deciding upon some important decisions of the schools. It is suggested that secondary school students should be given more chance and encouraged to participate more in the daily running and decision making processes of the school affairs; participating is a strong way to learn democracy. Learning to bear responsibilities and knowing their rights are parts of the education process at all. The school authorities have to be willing to let their students to taste real democracy and participation.

#### 12.5 Seize the Day and Forward Looking

It has been more than eight years since the return of the sovereignty of Hong Kong to China and even the Chief Executive is no longer Mr. Tung, but Mr. Donald Tsang. Hong Kong as a Special Administrative Region of China has encountered a lot of challenges in economic and political terms. Hong Kong used to be very strong

economically but has faced setbacks in the past few years. Hong Kong, as a free capitalist economy, is now ruled by socialist China. Critics have argued that there are structural problems even though Hong Kong is protected by the Joint Declaration and the Basic Law. Under the principle of "one country, two systems", Hong Kong is entitled to be governed by Hong Kong people without the interferences of the central government. However, more and more problems are arising. Among the political problems, there are some quarrels related to the topics of national identity and consciousness or patriotism, and democracy or the pace towards democracy.

The schools themselves have to find their own place in the new era. Schools are not independent organizations without reference to the political and economic settings surrounding them. Schools in Hong Kong have to find ways to survive as there are less and less students available and those with poorer academic results cannot recruit students and may eventually be closed. This is the force of "marketization". Schools were expected to be apolitical and not to promote national identity and consciousness explicitly during the days of British rule. But now, schools are expected to promote civic education with much more emphasis on national identity and consciousness. Influenced by the ever opening, free and democratic atmosphere in Hong Kong, schools are trying or tending to be as open and liberal as possible. Students are finding their own way as well. Most of the students have started to acquire an identity as a

citizen in this Hong Kong SAR, even though some of them are still wondering whether they are "Hongkongese" or "Chinese". Students on the whole understand their rights and responsibilities, even though a number of them seem to stress their rights rather than their responsibilities. Schools in Hong Kong can help their students develop more fully the suggested essential elements of political socialization.

#### 12.6 Limitation of the Present Study and Recommendations for Further Studies

The scope of the study was necessarily wide, and the terms were necessarily so interwoven that the interviewees might not have totally understood all of my questions, despite their careful piloting before hand. For the fieldwork conducted in the two selected schools, I was unable to choose the interviewees freely on my own. Even though most of the interviewees were chosen by responsible colleagues at the respective schools, it would have been even better if I could have chosen interviewees. For example, if I could have chosen freely I would have liked to interview some teachers of School B who were of different backgrounds. But it was impossible for this researcher to select and interview some teachers, students, past students and parents without the permission or introduction of the school authorities. However, effort has been made to triangulate the responses from different parties so that a clearer picture of the political socialization in the two schools could be drawn.

Further, it would have been useful to conduct the fieldwork in more schools, in order to provide more information on the "patriotic" schools and the ordinary schools, and therefore enable greater generalization. However, due to constraints of time and resources, two schools were regarded as sufficient, and they did generate plenty of data to process and analyze. Besides, the pedagogy and assessment of the two schools were examined directly and indirectly, but not in detail. It would be better to do more.

As discussed in the chapter on the research design and methodology, qualitative case study research has its own characteristics with respect to the generalization of research findings. There is no intention to claim that other schools and students are like the ones that have been studied in this research. There is also no intention to say that other schools in Hong Kong need to follow the exact ways of developing the four suggested elements of political socialization as the two researched schools. They are by no means representatives of Hong Kong schools. The findings of this study are to generalize to theory rather than to draw exact lessons that all schools in Hong Kong have to follow. However, it is argued that the four suggested elements of political socialization are essential and appropriate for the secondary schools in Hong Kong in general. What exactly most of the schools in Hong Kong have to do in order to further improve political socialization obviously requires more research within these other schools and this is an area for future study.

# **Bibliography**

- Abercrombie, N., Hill, S. and Turner, B.S. (eds.) (1994). *Dictionary of Sociology*. London: Penguin Books.
- Adelson, J. (1986). *Inventing Adolescence: The Political Psychology of Everyday Schooling*. New Brunswick, New Jersey: Transaction Books.
- AGB McNair Hong Kong Limited (1987). *Opinion Survey on Civic Education Report.*Hong Kong: AGB McNair Hong Kong Limited.
- Aitbach, P. G. and Kelly, C. P. (eds.) (1991). *Education and the Colonial Experience*, Second edition. New York: Advent Books.
- Apple, M.W. (ed.) (1982). Cultural and Economic Reproduction in Education: Essays on Class, Ideology and the State. London: Roultledge and Kegan Paul.
- Apple, M. W. (2003). The State and the Politics of Knowledge. In M.W. Apple (ed.), *The State and the Politics of Knowledge*, pp.1-24. New York: Roultledge/Falmer.
- Aristotle (trans. and ed. E. Barker) (1948). Politics. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Au-Yeung, W.Y. (1991). Civic Education in Geography Teaching in Lower Forms of Secondary Schools in Hong Kong. M. Ed. thesis, the University of Stirling.
- Beck, Paul Allen (1977). The Role of Agents in Political Socialization. In Stanley Allen Rebshon (ed.). *Handbook of Political Socialization*, pp. 115-41. New York: The Free Press.
- Bell, J. (1987). Doing your research project: a guide for first-time researchers in education and social science. Milton Keynes: Open University Press.
- Bernard, R. (1988). Research methods in cultural anthropology. Newbury Park: Sage.
- Bernstein, B. (1971). On the Classification and Framing of Educational Knowledge. In M.F.D Young (ed.). Knowledge and Control: New Directions for the

- Sociology of Education, pp.47-69. London: Collier-Macmillian.
- Blaxer, L., Hughes, C. and Tight, M. (2000). *How to research*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Bond, M. H. (1991). Beyond the Chinese Face, Insights from Psychology. Hong Kong: Oxford University Press.
- Bottery, M. (2000). Education, Policy and Ethics. London: Continuum.
- Bowles, S. and Gintis, H. (1976). Schooling in Capitalist American: Educational Reform and the Contradictions of Economic Life. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Braungart, R.G. and Braungart, M.M. (1986). Life-course and generational politics. *Ann Rev. Sociol*, 12: 205-31.
- Braungart, R.G. and Braungart, M.M. (1994). Political Socialization and Education. In T. Husen and T. N. Postlethwaite (eds.), *International Encyclopedia of Education* (2nd ed.), pp.4575-81. New York: Pergamon.
- Bray, Mark and Lee, Wing-on (1993). Education, Democracy and Colonial Transition: The Case of Hong Kong. *International Review of Education* 39(6):541-60.
- Brennan, T. (1981). *Political Education and Democracy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bryman, A. (2001). Social Research Methods. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Calhoun, Craig (ed.) (2002). *Dictionary of the Social Sciences*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Canieso-Doronila, Maria Luisa (1989). The Limits of Educational Change: National Identity Formation in a Philippine Public Elementary School. Quezon City: University of the Philippines Press.

- Case, R., K. Osborne and Skau, K. (2000). National Case Studies of Citizenship Education (Canada). In John Cogan and Ray Derricott (eds.), *Citizenship for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century: An International Perspective on Education*, pp. 57-66. London: Kegan Page.
- Chan, K. K. (1996). Review and forward on civic education in Hong Kong. In K. K. Lau and S. K. Lee (eds.), *Ethic and civic education: The experience in East Asia*, pp.229-248. Hong Kong: Chinese University of Hong Kong, Education Research Institute. (In Chinese)
- Cheung, Chiu-Kiu and Leung, Kwan-kwok (1994). *Political Attitudes of Senior Secondary Students during the Transition Period in Hong Kong.* Hong Kong: Department of Applied Social Studies, the City Polytechnic of Hong Kong.
- Choi, Po-king. (1990). A Search for Cultural Identity: the Students' Movement of the Early Seventies. In A. Sweeting (ed.), *Differences and Identities: Educational Argument in Late Twentieth Century in Hong Kong*, pp. 81-107. Hong Kong: Faculty of Education, University of Hong Kong.
- Choi, Po-king (1995). 1997 and Decolonization. In Susan Romaniuk and Denise K. W. Tong. (eds.) *Uncertain Times: Hong Kong Women Facing 1997*, pp.27-33. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Women Christian Council.
- Choi, Yuen Wan (2005). Welcome Speech. *International Symposium on National Education* (June 7).
- Clark, C. M. and Yinger, R. J. (1979). Ideology and Practice: A Decade of Change and Continuity in Contemporary Chinese Education. *Comparative Education*, 20: 107 116.
- Cogan, John J. (2000). Citizenship education for the 21<sup>st</sup> century: Setting the context. In John Cogan and Ray Derricott (eds.), Citizenship for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century: An International Perspective on Education, pp. 1-22. London: Kegan Page.
- Cohen, L. and Manion, L. (1989). Research Methods in Education. London: Routhledge.

- Coolican, H. (1990). Research Methods and Statistics in Psychology. London: Hodder and Stoughton.
- Cosley, C. and Lury, D. (1987). *Data Collection in Developing Countries*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Curriculum Development Committee (CDC), Education Department (1985).

  Guidelines on Civic Education in Schools. Hong Kong: Education Department.
- Curriculum Development Council (1996). *Guidelines on Civic Education in Schools*. Hong Kong: Curriculum Development Council.
- Curriculum Development Council (2001) Learning to Learn: The Way Forward in Curriculum Development. Hong Kong: Curriculum Development Council.
- Curriculum Development Council (2002) Basic Education Curriculum Guide Building on Strengths. Hong Kong: Curriculum Development Council.
- Curriculum Development Institute (CDI), Education Department (1995). The Development of Civic Awareness of Hong Kong Primary and Secondary School Students. Hong Kong: Government Printer.
- Danziger, K. (1971). Socialization. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books.
- Dawson, Richard E., Prewitt, K. and Dawson, K. (1977). *Political Socialization* (Second Edition). Boston: Little, Brown and Company.
- Dekker, H. (1996). Democratic Citizen Competence. In R. Farnen, H. Dekker, R. Meyenberg, and D. German (eds.) *Democracy, Socialization, and Conflicting Loyalties in East and West*, pp.386-410. London: Macmillian and New York: St. Martins Press.
- Derricott, Ray et al. (2000). National case studies of citizenship education. In John Cogan and Ray Derricott (eds.), Citizenship for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century: An International Perspective on Education, pp. 23-92. London: Kegan Page.

- Desai, M. and Said, Y. (2001). The new anti-capitalist movement: money and global civil society. In H. Anheier, M. Glasius and M. Kaldor (eds.) *Global Civil Society* 2001, pp.51-78. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Dougherty, K. C., Eisenhart, M. and Webley, P. (1992). The Role of Social Representatives and National Identities in the Development of Territorial Knowledge: A Study of Political Socialization in Argentina and England. *American Educational Research Journal*, 29: 809-35.
- Easton, D. and Hess, R. D. (1962). The Child's Political World. *Midwest Journal of Political Science*, VI, pp. 231-232.
- Education and Manpower Branch, Hong Kong Government (1991). The School Management Initiative: Setting for Framework for Quality in Hong Kong Schools. Hong Kong: Government Printer.
- Education Commission (2000a). Excel and Grow: Review of the Education System Reform Proposals (Abridged version of the Consultation Document). Hong Kong: Hong Kong Government.
- Education Commission (2000b). Learning for Life Learning through Life: Review of the Education System Reform Proposals. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Government.
- Education Department (1968). Annual Report, 1967-68. Hong Kong: Government Printer.
- Education Department (1971). Education Regulations. Hong Kong: Government Printer.
- Education Department (1991). Education Regulations. Hong Kong: Government Printer.
- Education Department (1993). School Education in Hong Kong: A Statement of Aims. Hong Kong: Government Printer.
- Education Department (1995). Information Concerning the Situation of the

- Implementation of Civic Education in Schools. Hong Kong: Education Department.
- Elkin, Frederick (1960). The Child and Society: the Process of Socialization. New York: Random House.
- Fairbrother, G. (2003). Toward critical patriotism: student resistance to political education in Hong Kong and China. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Fan, K. (1995). An Examination of the Effects of Hong Kong Education Policy on Chinese Language Teaching Materials in Secondary Schools from 1950s to 1970s. In Ping-kee Siu and Peter T. K. Tam (eds.), *Quality in Education: Insights from Different Perspectives*, pp.233-245. Hong Kong: The Hong Kong Educational Research Association.
- Farnen, Russell F. and Meloen, J. D. (2000). *Democracy, Authoritarianism and Education: a Cross-National Empirical Survey*. Basingstoke: Macmillan Press.
- Feinberg, W. and Soltis, J. F. (1992). *School and Society*. New York: Teachers College, Columbia University.
- Fetterman, D.M. (1989) Ethnography step by step. Newbury Park: Sage.
- Giddens, A. (1998). *The Third Way: The renewal of social democracy*. London: Polity Press.
- Giroux, H. (1983). Theory and Resistance in Education: A Pedagogy for the Politics of the Opposition. New York: Bergin and Garvey.
- Gramsci, Antonio (1971). Selections from the Prison Notebooks, edited and translated by Quintin Hoare and Geoffrey Nowell Smith. New York: International Publishers.
- Greene, J. C. (1994). Qualitative Program Evaluation: Practice and Promise. In N.K. Denzin and Y.S. Lincoln (eds.), *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, pp.530-544. Thousand Oaks: Sage.

- Greenstein, Fred I. (1969). *Children and Politics (Revised Edition)*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Gu, Mingyuan (ed.) (1992). Great Dictionary of Education (Jiaoyu Da Qidian), vol.4. Shanghai: Shanghai Education Press. (In Chinese)
- Hahn, C. (1998). Becoming Political: Comparative perspectives on citizenship education. New York: State University of New York.
- Hammersley, M. and Atkinson, P. (1995). *Ethnography: Principles in Practices*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. London: Routledge.
- Harber, C. (1984). Politics and Political Education in 1984. *Educational Review*, (36) 2: 3-119.
- Hardt, M. and Negri, A. (2000). Empire. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Hargreaves, A. (1982). Resistance and Relative Autonomy Theories: problems of distortion and incoherence in recent Marxist analyses of Education. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 3(2): 107-126.
- Harris, P. (1978). Hong Kong: A Study in Bureaucratic Politics. Hong Kong: Heineman Asia.
- Heater, D. (1990). Citizenship: The Civic Ideal in World History, Politics and Education. London: Longman.
- Heater, D. (1991). What is Citizenship?. Citizenship, Vol. 1, No.2, pp.3-5.
- Heater, D. (2004). A History of Education for Citizenship. London: Routledge/Falmer.
- Held, David and McGrew, Anthony (2002). Globalization/Anti-Globalization. Oxford: Polity Press.
- Hess, R.D. and Torney, J. V. (1967). The Development of Political Attitudes in Childhood. Chicago: Aldine.

- Hills, P.J. (ed.) (1982). A Dictionary of Education. London: Routledge.
- Hitchcock, G. and Hughes, D. (1995). Research and the teacher: a qualitative introduction to school-based research. London: Routledge.
- Ho, S. C. (1989). A Study of the Relationship between School Climate and the Effectiveness of Civic Education, M. A. thesis, Faculty of Education, the Chinese University of Hong Kong. (In Chinese)
- Hoadley, J. S. (1970). Hong Kong Is the Lifeboat: Notes on Political Culture and Socialization. *Journal of Oriental Studies*, 8:217-18.
- Hoadley, J. S. (1973). Political Participation of Hong Kong Chinese: Patterns and Trends, *Asian Survey*, 13(6):603-16.
- Hok, Yau Shek (Learning-mate Group) (1987). Report on the Opinion Survey of Hong Kong Secondary Teachers on Civic Education. (In Chinese)
- Hong Kong Catholic Education and Studies Centre, Group of Educational Studies (1989). A Preliminary Study on Democracy Education in Hong Kong Catholic Secondary Schools. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Catholic Education and Studies Centre.
- Hong Kong, Census and Statistics Department (2003) Facts on Hong Kong. Hong Kong: Government Printer.
- Hong Kong, Government of (1992). *Hong Kong 1991*. Hong Kong: Information Service Department.
- Hong Kong, Government of (1994). *Hong Kong 1993*. Hong Kong: Information Service Department.
- Hong Kong, Government of (2000). *Hong Kong 1999*. Hong Kong: Information Service Department.
- Hong Kong, Government of (2001). Hong Kong 2000. Hong Kong: Information

- Service Department.
- Hong Kong, Government of (2002). *Hong Kong 2001*. Hong Kong: Information Service Department.
- Hong Kong Standard (2003). Resounding vote of no confidence in Tung (July 2). Hong Kong: Hong Kong Standard.
- Hong Kong Standard (2003). *Inside runners* (July 30). Hong Kong: Hong Kong Standard.
- Hook, Brian (1993). Political Change in Hong Kong. *The China Quarterly*, 136 (December):840-63.
- Hursh, D. (1994). Civic Education. In T. Husen and T. N. Postlethwaite (eds.), *International Encyclopedia of Education* (2nd ed.), pp.767-770. New York: Pergamon.
- Hyman, Herbert (1959). Political Socialization. Glencoe, Ill: The Free Press.
- Ichilov, 0. (1994). Political Education. In T. Husen and T. N. Postlethwaite (eds.), *International Encyclopedia of Education* (2nd ed.), pp.4568-71. New York: Pergamon.
- Ip, Kin-yuen (1994). Organizational Change: The Case of a 'Leftist School' in Joining the Direct Subsidy Scheme. M.Ed. thesis, School of Education, the University of Hong Kong.
- Johnson, D. (1984). Planning small-scale research. In J. Bell, T. Bush, A. Fox, J. Goodey and S. Goulding (eds.) *Conducting Small-Scale Investigations in Educational Management*, pp.5-26. London: Paul Chapman Publishing.
- Kelly, C. P. and Aitbach, P. G. (1978). *Education and Colonialism*. New York: Longman.
- Kemmis, S. (1988). Action Research. In J. Keeves (ed.), Educational Research Methodology and Measurement: An International Handbook, pp42-49. Oxford:

Pergamon.

- King, A. (1981a). Administration Absorption of Politics in Hong Kong: Emphasis on the Grass Roots Level. In A. Y. C. King and R. P. L. Lee (eds.), *Social Lift and Development in Hong Kong*, pp.127-46. Hong Kong: Chinese University Press.
- King, A. (1981b). The Political Culture in Kwun Tong: A Chinese Community in Hong Kong. In A. Y. C. King and R. P. L. Lee (eds.), *Social Lift and Development in Hong Kong*, pp.147-68. Hong Kong: Chinese University Press.
- Kubow, P., Grossman, D. and Ninomiya, A. (2000). Multidimensional citizenship: Educational policy for the 21<sup>st</sup> century. In John Cogan and Ray Derricott (eds.). *Citizenship for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century: An International Perspective on Education*, pp. 131-150. London: Kegan Page.
- Lam, Jermain. (1992). Towards a More Alienated Political Culture in Hong Kong: Implications for the Administration in the Transition to 1997. *Hong Kong Public Administration*, 1(September):1-23.
- Lam, Ka-ka. (1994). Interaction between Politics and Education: A Case Study of a "Patriotic School" in Hong Kong. M. Phil. thesis, School of Education, the Chinese University of Hong Kong. (In Chinese)
- Langton, Kenneth P. (1969). *Political Socialization*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Langton, Kenneth P. and Jennings, M. K. (1969). Formal Environment: The School. In Kenneth P. Langton (ed.), *Political Socialization*, pp. 84-119. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Lau, Siu-kai (1982). *Politics and Society in Hong Kong*. Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press.
- Lau, Siu-kai (1990). Decolonization without Independence and the Poverty of Political Leaders in Hong Kong. Occasional Paper No.1, Hong Kong: Hong Kong Institute of Asia-Pacific Studies, the Chinese University of Hong Kong.

- Lau, Siu-kai (1992). Decline of Governmental Authority, Political Cynicism and Political Inefficacy in Hong Kong. *Journal of North east Asian Studies*, 11(2):3-20.
- Lau, Siu-kai and Kuan, Hsin-chi (1995). The Attentive Spectators: Political Participation of the Hong Kong Chinese. *Journal of Northeast Asian Studies*, 14(1):3-24.
- Lee, Wing-on (1996). From De-politicization to Politicization: the Reform of Civic Education in Hong Kong in Political Transition. In Chinese Comparative Education Society Taipei (ed.), *Education Reform from Tradition to Post-modernity*, pp.295-328. Taipei: Shih Ta Publishers.
- Lee, Wing-on (1999). Controversies of Civic Education in Political Transition: Hong Kong. In J. Torney-Purta, J. Schwille and J. Amadeo (eds.), Civic Education across Countries: Twenty-four National Case Studies from IEA Civic Education Project, pp.313-340. Amsterdam: The International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement.
- Lee, Wing-on (2003). Civic Education Before and After the Handover: Some Reflections from Social Capital Perspectives. *Youth Study Journal*, 6 (1): pp.112 125. (In Chinese)
- Lee, Wing-on (2004). Citizenship Education in Hong Kong: Development and Challenges. In W.O. Lee et al. (eds.) Citizenship Education in Asia and the Pacific: Concepts and Issues, pp.59-80. Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Centre, the University of Hong Kong.
- Lee, Wing-on (2005). Teachers' Perceptions of Citizenship in China. In W.O. Lee and Jeffrey T. Fouts (eds.), *Education for Social Citizenship: Perceptions of Teachers in USA, Australia, England, Russia and China*, pp.55-92. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Lee, Wing-on and Sweeting, A. (2001). Controversies in Hong Kong's political transition: Nationalism versus liberalism. In M. Bray and Wing-on Lee (eds.), Education and political transition: Themes and experiences in East Asia, pp.101 121. Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Centre, the University of

- Lee, Siu-ming (1987). Political Education and Civic Education: The British Perspective and Hong Kong Perspective. *International Journal of Educational Development* 7(4): 251-63.
- Leung, Sai-wing (1995). Depoliticization and Trivialization of Civic Education in Secondary Schools: Institutional Constraints on Promoting Civic Education in Transitional Hong Kong. In Ping-kee Siu and Tim-kui Tam (eds.), *Quality in Education: Insights from Different Perspectives*, pp.283-312. Hong Kong: The Hong Kong Educational Research Association.
- Leung, Sai-wing (1997). The Making of an Alienated Generation: The Political Socialization of Secondary School Students in Transitional Hong Kong. Brookfield: Ashgate.
- Leung, Yan-wing (2003). Harmony or Conflict: the Role of Nationalistic Education within Civic Education in Hong Kong. PhD thesis, the University of Sydney.
- Leung, Yan-wing and Lau, Kit-fai (1993). *Political Education in a Hong Kong Setting: Theory and Practice*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Christian Institute. (In Chinese)
- Leung, Yan-wing and Ng, Shun-wing (2004). Back to Square One: The 'Re-depoliticizing' of Civic Education in Hong Kong. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, Vol 24, No.1 (March, 2004) pp.43-60.
- Lincoln, Y. S. and Guba, E. (1985). Naturalistic Inquiry. Beverley Hill, Calif.: Sage.
- Luk, Bernard H. K. (1991). Chinese Culture in the Hong Kong Curriculum: Heritage and Colonialism. *Comparative Education Review*, 35(4): 650-68.
- Man, Si-wai (1995). Poor Civic Education Philosophy A Critique of Education Convergence's 'Opinions on Civic Education'. *Sing Tao Daily*, October 25, 1995. (In Chinese)
- Marger, M.N. (1981). Elites and Masses. New York: Van Nostrand.

- Marshall, Gordon (ed.) (1998). A Dictionary of Sociology. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Maykut, P. S. and Morehouse, R. (1994). *Beginning Qualitative Research: a Philosophic and Practical Guide*. London: Falmer Press.
- McLean, Ian and Mcmillan, A. (eds.) (2003). *The Concise Oxford Dictionary of Politics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Merelman, R.M. (1972). The Adolescence of Political Socialization. *Sociology of Education*, 45(1): 134-166.
- Miles, M. B. and Huberman, M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis: an Expanded Sourcebook*. Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- Miners, Norman J. (1996). *The Government and Politics of Hong Kong*, 5th ed. Hong Kong: Oxford University Press.
- Ming Pao (2001). (Oct.1, 2001) Eighty percent of students deny their national identity. Hong Kong: Ming Pao.
- Ming Pao (2003). (July 1, 2003) Dark before dawn. Hong Kong: Ming Pao.
- Ming Pao (2003). (July 2, 2003) Government is in danger of becoming lame duck. Hong Kong: Ming Pao.
- Morris, Paul (1991). Preparing Pupils as Citizens of the Special Administrative Region: An Analysis of Curriculum Change and Control during the Transitional Period. In C. A. Postiglione (ed.), *Education and Society in Hong Kong: Toward One Country and Two Systems*, pp. 117-145. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Morris, Paul (1992a). Preparing Pupils as Citizens of the Special Administrative Region: Curriculum Change and Control during the Transitional Period. In Paul Morris (ed.), *Curriculum Development in Hong Kong*, pp. 120-143. Hong Kong: Occasional Paper No.7, Faculty of Education, the University of Hong Kong.

- Morris, Paul (1992b). Teachers' Attitudes towards a Curriculum Innovation. In Paul Morris (ed.), *Curriculum Development in Hong Kong*, pp. 23-32. Hong Kong: Occasional Paper No.7, Faculty of Education, the University of Hong Kong.
- Morris, Paul (1997). Civics and Citizenship Education in Hong Kong. In Kerry Kennedy (ed.), *Citizenship Education and the Modern State*, pp.107-125. London: Falmer Press.
- Morris, Paul and Sweeting, Anthony (1992). Education and Politics: The Case of Hong Kong from a Historical Perspective. In Paul Morris (ed.), *Curriculum Development in Hong Kong*, pp.144-169. Hong Kong: Occasional Paper No.7, Faculty of Education, the University of Hong Kong.
- Morris, Paul and Tang, Chung-keung (1992). The Abuse of Educational Evaluation: A Study of the Evaluation of the Implementation of the Civic Education 'Guidelines'. In Paul Morris (ed.), *Curriculum Development in Hong Kong*, pp. 102-119. Hong Kong: Occasional Paper No.7, Faculty of Education, the University of Hong Kong.
- Morris, Paul, Kan, F. and Morris, E. (2001). Education, Civic Participation and Identity: Continuity and Change in Hong Kong. In M. Bray and W.O. Lee (eds.), *Education and Political Transition: Themes and Experiences in East Asia*, pp.163-181. Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Centre, the University of Hong Kong.
- Mouffe, C. (1979). Hegemony and Ideology in Gramsci. In C. Mouffe (ed.), *Gramsci* and Marxist Theory, pp.168-204. London: Roultledge and Kegan Paul.
- Ng, Hong Man (1985). Nationalistic Education and Civic education. *Focus Weekly*, 9 February, p.9.
- Ng, L.N. H. (1984). Interactions of East and West: Development of Public Education in Early Hong Kong. Hong Kong: Chinese University Press.
- Ng, S. W., Leung, Y.W. and Chai, W.L. (2000). A Study of the Development of Civic

- Education: the Social and Political Perspectives. In Y.C. Cheng, K.W. Chow and K.T. Tsui (eds.), *School Curriculum Change and Development in Hong Kong*, pp.391-410. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Institute of Education.
- Nisbet, J.D. (1977). Small-scale research: guidelines and suggestions for development. *Scottish Educational Studies*, 9 May, 13-17.
- Noddings, Nel. (1995). Philosophy of Education. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- Osborne, Richard and Van Loon, Borin (1999). *Introducing Sociology*. Cambridge: Icon Books.
- Otsu, Kazuko (2000). National Case Studies of Citizenship Education (Japan). In John Cogan and Ray Derricott (eds.), *Citizenship for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century: An International Perspective on Education*, pp. 66-72. London: Kegan Page.
- Parker, Walker (2000). National Case Studies of Citizenship Education (USA). In John Cogan and Ray Derricott (eds.), Citizenship for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century: An International Perspective on Education, pp.79-89. London: Kegan Page.
- Paul, Richard W. (1987). Dialogical Thinking: Critical Thought Essential to the Acquisition of Rational Knowledge and Passions. In Joan Boykoff Baron and Robert J. Sternberg (eds.), *Teaching Thinking Skills: Theory and Practice*, pp.127-48. New York: W.H. Freeman.
- Paul, Richard W. and Linda Elder (2001). Critical Thinking: Tools for Taking Charge of Your Learning and Your Life. Upper Saddle River, N.J.: Prentice Hall.
- Postiglione, G.A. (1992) The Decolonization of Hong Kong Education. In Postiglione, G.A. (ed.), *Education and Society in Hong Kong: Towards One Country and Two Systems*, pp.3-38. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Powney, J. and Watts, M. (1897). *Interviewing in Educational Research*. London: Routledge.
- Schwab, Joseph J. (1983). The Practical 4: Something for Curriculum Professors to do. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 13(3): 239-65.

- Schwille, et al. (1983). Teachers as Policy Brokers in the Content of Elementary School Mathematics. In Lee S. Shulman and Gary Sykes (eds.), *Handbook of Teaching and Policy*, pp.370-391. New York: Longman.
- Scott, I. (1989). *Political Change and the Crisis of Legitimacy in Hong Kong.* London: Hurst.
- Sears, D. O. (1990). Wither Political Socialization Research? The Question of Persistence. In O, Ichilov (ed.), *Political Socialization, Citizenship Education, and Democracy*, pp.69-97. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Silverman, D. (1993). Interpreting Qualitative Data: Methods for Analyzing Qualitative Data. London: Sage.
- South China Morning Post (1989). (Oct. 2, 1989) Leftist School Leavers Gain Acceptance. Hong Kong: South China Morning Post.
- South China Morning Post (2003). (July 7, 2003) *July 1 marchers were well-educated, says survey.* Hong Kong: South China Morning Post.
- South China Morning Post (2003). (Sept. 9, 2003) Politics or the economy? That is not the question. Hong Kong: South China Morning Post.
- South China Morning Post (2003). (Sept. 16, 2003) City's psychoanalysis is a healthy step. Hong Kong: South China Morning Post.
- South China Morning Post (2003). (Dec. 16, 2003) Hong Kong student lack international outlook. Hong Kong: South China Morning Post.
- South China Morning Post (2004). (Oct. 3, 2004) *Healthy patriotism is not for spoon-feeding*. Hong Kong: South China Morning Post.
- Stakes, Robert E. (1995). *The Art of Case Study Research*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Strauss, A. and Corbin, J. (1990). Basics of qualitative research: grounded theory procedures and techniques. Newbury Park: Sage.

- Sweeting, Anthony (1989). The Reconstruction of Education in Post-war Hong Kong, 1945-1954: Variations in the Process of Policy Making. Ph D. thesis, the University of Hong Kong.
- Sweeting, Anthony (1990). The Significance of June 4, 1989 for Education in Hong Kong, In Anthony Sweeting (ed.), *Differences and Identities: Educational Argument in Late Twentieth Century Hong Kong*, pp.13-28. Hong Kong: Education Paper No.9, Faculty of Education, University of Hong Kong.
- Sweeting, Anthony (1993). A Phoenix Transformed: The Reconstruction of Education in Post-war Hong Kong. Hong Kong: Oxford University Press.
- Sweeting, Anthony (2004). Education in Hong Kong, 1941 to 2001: Visions and Revisions. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Synergy (2003). What is to be done next?. Synergy Bulletin, No. 17 (July 13, 2003).
- Tang, James T. H. (1997). Hong Kong in Transition: Globalization Versus Nationalization. In Ming K. Chan (ed.), *The Challenges of Hong Kong's Reintegration with China*, pp.171-197. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.
- Tsang, Wing-kwong (1985a). Political Development and Civic Education in Hong Kong. Quarterly of Hong Kong Council of Social Service, No. 93:2-10. (In Chinese)
- Tsang, Wing-kwong (1985b). A Study of the Direction and Approach of the Guidelines on Civic Education. *Chung Pao Monthly*, No.71: 47-52. (In Chinese)
- Tsang, Wing-kwong (1986). Democratization of School Administration: Interpretation and Clarification. In Y. W. Fung (ed.), *Democratization of School Administration*, pp.14-16. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Christian Council. (In Chinese)
- Tsang, Wing-kwong (1994). Decolonized Citizenship Education: A Framework of Post-1997 Hong Kong School's Civic Education. *Journal of Education*,

- Tse, Kwan-choi (1997a). *The Poverty of Political Education in Hong Kong Secondary Schools*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Institute of Asia-Pacific Studies, Chinese University of Hong Kong.
- Tse, Kwan-choi (1997b). Preparing Students for Citizenship? Civic Education in Hong Kong Secondary Schools. Ph.D. dissertation, Department of Sociology, the University of Warwick.
- Tse, Kwan-choi (1999). Civic and Political Education. In Mark Bray and Ramsey Koo (eds.), Education and Society in Hong Kong and Macau: Comparative Perspectives on Continuity and Change, pp.151-169. Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Centre, University of Hong Kong.
- Tung, Chee-hwa (1999). Address by the Chief Executive the Hourable Tung Chee Hwa at the Legislative Council meeting on 6 October 1999 Quality People Quality Home: Positioning Hong Kong for the 21 st Century. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Government.
- Verma, G.K. and Mallick, K. (1999). Researching education: perspectives and techniques. London: Falmer Press.
- Visiting Panel (1982). A Perspective on Education in Hong Kong. Government Printer: Hong Kong.
- Wah Kiu Yat Pao (1967). (Nov. 29, 1967) Chung Wah Middle School is ordered to close by the government. Hong Kong: Wah Kiu Yat Pao. (In Chinese)
- Walcott, H. (1992). Posturing in qualitative research. In M. LeCompte, W. Millroy and J. Preissle (eds.) *The handbook of qualitative research in education*, pp.3-44. San Diego, CA: Academic Press.
- Wan, Wai-kwan (1990). Political Attitudes of Hong Kong Adolescents Towards the PRC: A Study of Political Socialization. M. Phil. thesis, the Chinese University of Hong Kong.

- Waters, M. (1995). Globalization. London; New York: Routledge.
- Weatherley, R. and Lipsky, M. (1977). Street-Level Bureaucrats and Institutional Innovation: Implementing Special Education Reform. *Harvard Educational Review*, 47:171-197.
- Wen Wei Pao (1995). (May 20, 1995) Lau Siu-kai Interpret Contents of Civic Education. Hong Kong: Wen Wei Pao. (In Chinese)
- Wen Wei Pao (1995). (May 22, 1995). Civic Education Should Be Matched with Change in Society: Lau Siu-kai Says Its Contents Should Be Closely Related to the Motherland. Hong Kong: Wen Wei Pao. (In Chinese)
- White Paper (1984). The Further Development of Representative Government in Hong Kong. Hong Kong Government.
- Whitty, G. (1985). Sociology and School Knowledge: Curriculum Theory, Research and Politics. London: Methuen.
- Willis, Paul (1977). Learning to Labour: How Working Class Kids Get Working Class Jobs. Aldershot, Hants: Gower Publishing.
- Wong, Hin-wah (1988). A Study of Hong Kong Secondary School Civic Education Curriculum Development (1984-1988). Ed. D. dissertation, the University of California at Los Angeles.
- Wong, Ping-man (1981). Civic Education and the Curriculum of the Subject "Economics and Public Affairs" in Hong Kong after World War II: A Comparative Perspective. M. A. thesis, Faculty of Education, the Chinese University of Hong Kong. (In Chinese)
- Wong, T.K. and Shum, K. (1998) Civic awareness of young people in post-1997. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Institute of Asia-Pacific Studies, Occasional Paper No.78.
- Wong, T.K. and Shum, K. (2002) Civic awareness and attitudes toward civic education among young people in post-1997. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Institute

- of Asia-Pacific Studies, Occasional Paper No.125.
- Woods, P. (1983). Sociology and the School: an interactionist viewpoint. London: Roultledge and Kegan Paul.
- Wrong, D.H. (1961). The Over-socialized Conception of Man. *American Sociological Review*, 26(Apr): 185-193.
- Yeung, Yiu-Chung (1993). Education Objectives and 1997. *Hong Kong Education and 1997*, pp.23-26. Hong Kong: Hong Kong Educational Workers' Association (HKEWA). (In Chinese)
- Yin, R.K. (1994). Case Study Research: design and methods. Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- Young, M.F.D. (ed.). Knowledge and Control: New Directions for the Sociology of Education. London: Collier-Macmillian.
- Yu, Shu-tak (1989). A Study of the Effects of Formal Curriculum on Students' Civic Consciousness in Hong Kong Secondary Schools. M. A. thesis, Faculty of Education, the Chinese University of Hong Kong. (In Chinese)

# Appendix 1: Interview Questions for the six parties (students, teachers, principal, supervisor/ chairperson of the management, past students and parents)

#### A. Interview questions for teachers

(Interactions with students)

- 1. In your opinion, what are the major criteria for a student to be a "good" student?
- 2. Do you often talk with your students? What do you talk about?
- 3. Are you interested in current affairs and politics? Do you talk about current affairs or politics with students? Why? Why not? Are there any issues in these few weeks that you find important and you try to discuss with your students?

(Education -- civic and political education)

- 4. What do you think is the most important objective and content of civic education (just in the area of political education/ socialization)?
- 5. Some people think that Hong Kong people are politically apathetic and thus suggest that we should strengthen civic and political education in schools. Do you agree? What do you think?
- 6. Do you think the civic education activities in your school in the previous years have been consistent with what you think civic education should do? Are they sufficient? Can you suggest a few ways to improve civic education in your school?

- 7. How far do the students in your school have a sense of national identity and consciousness? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 8. How far do the students in your school have a sense of democracy/ participation? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 9. Some people in Hong Kong think that the element of national identity and consciousness is more important than the element of democracy/ participation in civic education while some others think the opposite. What do you think?
- 10. How far do the students in your school have an ability of critical thinking? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 11. How far do the students in your school have a sense of globalization? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 12. Some people tend to think that education for globalization is not compatible with education for national identity and consciousness. What do you think?

#### (About Hong Kong's future needs)

13. In your opinion, what kind of political socialization and education is needed for secondary students in Hong Kong in the 21st century?

#### **B.** Interview questions for students

#### (Interactions with teachers)

- 1. In your opinion, what are the major criteria for a student to be a "good" student?
- 2. Do you often talk with your teachers? What do you talk about?
- 3. Do you talk about current affairs or politics with them? Why? Why not?

#### (Political socialization in the school)

- 4. Do you participate in any extracurricular activities in your school that are related to civic education? What are they? Why do you choose those?
- 5. Do you participate in any extracurricular activities organized by other bodies that are related to civic education or politics?
- 6. What do you think of your form period and assemblies? What do you think is their purpose? Do you think they are effective?

#### (Interest in news and current affairs)

- 7. Do you read newspaper? What newspapers do you most often read? Which articles do you most often read? Why?
- 8. How about magazines? Which magazines do you most often read? Why?
- 9. Do you watch TV news and current affairs programs? Which program(s) do you most often watch? Why?
- 10. Describe to me one piece of political news / current issue that interests you most. Why does it interest you?

#### (Possible influence from parents)

- 11. Do you often talk with your parents? What do you talk about most often?
- 12. Do your parents discuss news and current affairs with you? Why? Why not?

#### (Possible influence from peers)

- 13. Do you often talk with your peers? What do you talk about most often?
- 14. Do your peers discuss news and current affairs with you? Why? Why not?

- 15. Tell me what national identity and consciousness mean to you.
  - a) Do you regard yourself as a "Hongkongese" rather than "Chinese" or vice versa?
  - b) Are you proud of being a Chinese? Do you feel very happy when you hear China's national anthem at the Olympics?
  - c) Do you think a citizen should be willing to sacrifice his life for his country? Would you like personally to help your country attain its goals?
  - d) Is the welfare of the individual more important than the welfare of the nation or vice versa?
  - e) Do you have a favourable impression of Chinese people or not?
  - f) Do you agree that China is the best country in the world and no other nation's culture can compare to China's?
  - g) Do you hope that China would become great and be superior in the world of nations? Should China strive for power in the world and take strong actions in some foreign polices like in the Diaoyutai dispute?
  - h) Are some of the above questions ever discussed in the school settings?
- 16. Tell me what democracy/ participation mean to you.
  - a) Do you think you understand the basic human rights and responsibilities that a citizen in Hong Kong should have? What are they?
  - b) Are you aware of issues in relation to rights and responsibilities of people in Hong Kong? Give some examples.
  - c) Do you think you have the chances to learn democracy / participation in the school? Do you participate actively in the school union and its affiliated clubs or associations?
  - d) Do you ever participate in social services organized by the school or other organizations?
  - e) Do you think you will participate actively in democratic movements or social services in the future?
- 17. Tell me what critical thinking mean to you.
  - a) Do you usually make up your own minds on different issues rather than being influenced by others?
  - b) Tell me some current issues that you find very complicated which require the skills of critical thinking to analyze them.
  - c) Do you think you manage to develop such skill of critical thinking in your school? How?
- 18. Tell me what globalization mean to you.

- a) Do you think you have understanding of some significant global issues and international organizations? Please mention some of them?
- b) Is there any world news or issue that interest you? Tell me some.
- c) Will you identify yourself as a global citizen and why?
- d) What is your feeling towards those people who are suffering from various worldwide problems, e.g. poverty, hunger, war and plague? What can you do?

#### C. Interview questions for the Principal

(Political socialization in the school)

- 1. In your opinion, what are the major criteria for a student to be a "good" student?
- 2. What do you think is the most important objective and content of civic education?
- 3. Some people think that Hong Kong people are politically apathetic and thus suggest that we should strengthen civic and political education in schools. Do you agree? What do you think?
- 4. Do you think the civic education activities in your school in the previous years have been consistent with what you think civic education should do? Are they sufficient?
- 5. What is the policy in civic and political education for the school?

- 6. How far do the students in your school have a sense of national identity and consciousness? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 7. How far do the students in your school have a sense of democracy/ participation? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 8. Some people in Hong Kong think that the element of national identity and consciousness is more important than the element of democracy/ participation in civic education while some others think the opposite. What do you think?
- 9. How far do the students in your school have an ability of critical thinking? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 10. How far do the students in your school have a sense of globalization (international outlook)? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 11. Some people tend to think that education for globalization is not compatible with education for national identity and consciousness. What do you think?

(About Hong Kong's future needs)

12. In your opinion, what kind of political socialization and education is needed for secondary students in Hong Kong in the 21st century?

#### D. Interview questions for the Management Board (Supervisor)

(Political socialization in the school)

- 1. In your opinion, what are the major criteria for a student to be a "good" student?
- 2. What do you think is the most important objective and content of civic education?
- 3. Some people think that Hong Kong people are politically apathetic and thus suggest that we should strengthen civic and political education in schools. Do you agree? What do you think?
- 4. What is the policy in civic and political education for the school?

(The 4 essential elements of political socialization)

- 5. How far do the students in your school have a sense of national identity and consciousness? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 6. How far do the students in your school have a sense of democracy/ participation? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 7. Some people in Hong Kong think that the element of national identity and consciousness is more important than the element of democracy/ participation in civic education while some others think the opposite. What do you think?
- 8. How far do the students in your school have an ability of critical thinking? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 9. How far do the students in your school have a sense of globalization? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 10. Some people tend to think that education for globalization is not compatible with education for national identity and consciousness. What do you think?

(About Hong Kong's future needs)

11. In your opinion, what kind of political socialization and education is needed for secondary students in Hong Kong in the 21st century?

#### E. Interview questions for the past students

(Political socialization in the school)

- 1. In your opinion, what are the major criteria for a student to be a "good" student?
- 2. Did you often talk with your teachers and schoolmates? What did you talk about? Why?
- 3. Did you talk current affairs or politics with them? Why? Why not?
- 4. Did you participate in any extracurricular activities that are related to civic education in your school? What were they? Why did you choose them?
- 5. What did you think of your form period and assemblies? What were their purposes? Were they effective?
- 6. Do you read newspaper? What newspapers do you most often read? Which articles do you most often read? Why?
- 7. How about magazines? Which magazines do you most often read? Why?
- 8. Do you watch TV news and current affairs programmes? Which one do you most often watch? Why?
- 9. Are you active in political activities of any form? Why? Why not?

(The 4 essential elements of political socialization)

10. Tell me what national identity and consciousness mean to you.

- a) Do you regard yourself as a "Hongkongese" rather than "Chinese" or vice versa?
- b) Are you proud of being a Chinese? Do you feel very happy when you hear China's national anthem at the Olympics?
- c) Do you think a citizen should be willing to sacrifice his life for his country? Would you like personally to help your country attain its goals?
- d) Is the welfare of the individual more important than the welfare of the nation or vice versa?
- e) Do you have a favourable impression of Chinese people or not?
- f) Do you agree that China is the best country in the world and no other nation's culture can compare to China's?
- g) Do you hope that China would become great and be superior in the world of nations? Should China strive for power in the world and take strong actions in some foreign polices like in the Diaoyutai dispute?
- h) Are some of the above questions ever discussed in the school settings?
- 11. Tell me what democracy/ participation mean to you.
  - a) Do you think you understand the basic human rights and responsibilities that a citizen in Hong Kong should have? What are they?
  - b) Are you aware of issues in relation to rights and responsibilities of people in Hong Kong? Give some examples.

- c) Do you think you have the chances to learn democracy / participation in the school? Do you participate actively in the school union and its affiliated clubs or associations?
- d) Do you ever participate in social services organized by the school or other organizations?
- e) Do you think you will participate actively in democratic movements or social services in the future?
- 12. Tell me what critical thinking mean to you.
  - a) Do you usually make up your own minds on different issues rather than being influenced by others?
  - b) Tell me some current issues that you find very complicated which require the skills of critical thinking to analyze them.
  - c) Do you think you manage to develop such skill of critical thinking in your school? How?
- 13. Tell me what globalization mean to you.
  - a) Do you think you have understanding of some significant global issues and international organizations? Please mention some of them?
  - b) Is there any world news or issue that interest you? Tell me some.
  - c) Will you identify yourself as a global citizen and why?
  - d) What is your feeling towards those people who are suffering from various worldwide problems, e.g. poverty, hunger, war and plague? What can you do?

#### F. Interview questions for the parents

(Political socialization in the school)

- 1. In your opinion, what are the major criteria for a student to be a "good" student?
- 2. Why do you send your child to this school? Do you consider the background (say on the areas of religion, political stand) of the school being important for your choice?
- 3. Are you satisfied with the provisions of the school?

(Possible influence from parents)

- 4. Do you often talk with your child? About what?
- 5. Does your child discuss news and current affairs with you? Why? What?

- 6. How far does your child have a sense of national identity and consciousness? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 7. How far does your child have a sense of democracy/ participation? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 8. Some people in Hong Kong think that the element of national identity and consciousness is more important than the element of democracy/ participation in civic education while some others think the opposite. What do you think?
- 9. How far does your child have an ability of critical thinking? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 10. How far does your child have a sense of globalization? Do you regard this as an important issue that you have to stress it?
- 11. Some people tend to think that education for globalization is not compatible with education for national identity and consciousness. What do you think?

#### (About Hong Kong's future needs)

12. In your opinion, what kind of political socialization and education is needed for secondary students in Hong Kong in the 21st century?

# **Appendix 2:** Interview Records of the Two Researched Schools

School A

Parties	No. of Interviewee(s)	Duration	Nature of the interview(s)	Remarks(if any)
Students	3 x (3 students)	About 40 to 55 minutes	Group Interview	Students of upper forms (F.4, F.6 & F.7)
Past Students	2 x (3 students)	About 40 to 50 minutes	Group Interview	
Teachers	5	About 25 to 35 minutes	Individual Interview	Experienced teachers in the school
Principal	1	About 35 minutes	Individual Interview	
Supervisor	1	About 30 minutes	Individual Interview	
Parents	2	About 25 to 30 minutes	Individual Interview	Included the chairperson of the PTA in 1 of the 2 interviews

## School B

Parties	No. of Interviewee(s)	Duration	Nature of the interview(s)	Remarks(if any)
Students	3 x (3 students)	About 40 to 50 minutes	Group Interview	Students of upper forms (F.4, F.5 & F.7)
Past Students	2 x (3 students; 2 students)	About 30 to 40 minutes	Group Interview	
Teachers	5	About 25 to 35 minutes	Individual Interview	Experienced teachers in the school
Principal	1	About 35 minutes	Individual Interview	
Supervisor	1	About 30 minutes	Individual Interview	
Parents	2	About 25 to 30 minutes	Individual Interview	Included the chairperson of the PTA in 1 of the 2 interviews

## Appendix 3: Details about the Interviewees

## School A

Party	Code in the text	Remarks	
Teacher	Mr. Yau	20 years teaching experience; 16 years in the school	
	Mr. Wong	18 years teaching experience; 18 years in the school	
	Mr. Sum	11 years teaching experience; 6 years in the school	
	Mr. Ho	11 years teaching experience; 11 years in the school	
	Ms Kung	12 years teaching experience; 11 years in the school	
Student	Chan/F.7 Wong/F.7 Ng/F.7	Arts students; 7 years in the school	
	Wan/F.4 Tang/F.4 Lau/F.4	Science students; 4 years in the school	
	Chu/F.6 Law/F.6 Cheung/F.6	Science students; 6 years in the school	
Principal	Mr. So	Over 30 years teaching experience; principal of the school since 1983	
Supervisor	Mr. Lai	Supervisor of the school for 3 years; served in the management board since 1987	
Past Student	Lec/92 Yeung/92 Chan/92	F.5 graduate (1992); F.7 graduate (1994) F.5 graduate (1992); F.7 graduate (1994) F.5 graduate (1992)	
	Hsu/99 Tsui/99 Lui/00	F.5 graduate (1999) F.5 graduate (1999); F.7 graduate (2001) F.5 graduate (2000)	
Parent	Mr. Fong	Has a son in F.5; chairperson of the PTA	
1 alem	With Tong	This is son in 1.5, champerson of the 1 1A	

# School B

Party	Code in the text	Remarks	
Teacher	Miss Lam	6 years teaching experience; 6 years in the school	
	Ms Lee	30 years teaching experience; over 20 years in the school	
	Miss Fu	4 years teaching experience; 4 years in the school	
	Mr. Hsu	6 years teaching experience; 6 4years in the school	
	Mr. Tong	11 years teaching experience; 11 years in the school	
Student	Wong/F.4 Leung/F.4 To/F.4	Science students; 4 years in the school	
		Science students;	
	Chan/F.5	5 years in the school;	
	Siu/F.5	2 years in the school;	
	Wan/F.5	3 years in the school	
		Arts students;	
	Leung/F.7	4 years in the school;	
	Fu/F.7	7 years in the school;	
	Kwan/F.7	2 years in the school	
Principal	Mr. Tam	Over 25 years teaching and management experience;	
		principal of the school for 4 years	
Supervisor	Mr. Pong	Supervisor of the school for 10 years; served in the management board since 1987	
Past Student	Lee/97	F.5 graduate (1997);	
	Kong/94	F.5 graduate (1994);	
	Ip/95	F.5 graduate (1995)	
	Shi/66	F.5 graduate (1966)	
	Wong/69	F.5 graduate (1969)	
Parent	Mr. Hay	Has a daughter in F.4; chairperson of the PTA	
	Mrs. Tsui	Has a son in F.2	

# **Appendix 4:** An Overview of Data Collection and Data Analysis Strategies

Research questions What kind of political socialization is needed in Hong Kong? (Ch1 to 6)	Objectives  To deduce an appropriate kind of political socialization needed in HK	Data/participants  Relevant literature on political socialization; Official documents in HK	Sources of the data Literature available in the past; Official documents	Data analysis  Review of literature; Secondary data analysis
How are the students in the schools being politically socialized? (Ch 8)	To illuminate the day-to-day practice of civic education programs of the 2 secondary schools	The documents of civic education programs & activities (formal curriculum); School climate & classroom climate, student organizations (informal curriculum); In-depth interviews with teachers and administrators who are chiefly in charge of the civic education	Documents of the schools; Fieldwork in the 2 schools	Documentary analysis; Observation; Interview transcription & analysis
How effective are the students in the schools being politically socialized to an appropriate kind of political socialization? (Ch 9 -11)	of political socialization in the schools	In-depth interviews with teachers, students, past students, principals, supervisors and parents of the 2 schools concerning the four essential elements	Fieldwork in the 2 schools	Interview transcription & analysis
What changes are needed to achieve the suggested kind of political socialization?	To draw conclusions & make suggestions	Interviews; Summing up remarks from the fieldwork	Fieldwork in the 2 schools; Fieldwork notes & remarks	transcription &