



Breaking the commute barrier: How women in Jabodetabek overcome daily challenges on commuting for work

Inayah Hidayati

Research Center for Population BRIN, Indonesia.

Correspondence author: inay001@brin.go.id

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:

Population mobility;
commuting; commuter;
gender; Jabodetabek.

How to cite:

Hidayati, I. (2023).
Breaking the commute
barrier: How women in
Jabodetabek overcome
daily challenges on
commuting for work.
ETNOSIA: Jurnal
Etnografi Indonesia. 8(1):
44 – 62.

DOI:

10.31947/etnosia.v8i1.26085

ABSTRACT

Ensuring safe and convenient transportation is vital for promoting gender equality. Unfortunately, women in Jabodetabek, Indonesia, frequently express insecurity in public transport due to harassment and violence, particularly in crowded buses and trains. This is a critical issue since secure and reliable transportation enables women to engage fully in education, employment, and daily activities. To better understand women's experiences with public transportation in Jabodetabek, a study was conducted using a case study method. Six women commuters who used public transportation to travel within and between Jabodetabek were recruited based on their willingness to share their experiences and the diversity of their routes. The study used qualitative research methods to collect data, including in-depth interviews and observations of informants' commutes. The study discovered that women in Jabodetabek consider safety concerns and social norms crucial when deciding their transportation mode and route. Women's route choices are influenced by the presence of other women, well-lit areas, and visible security personnel, which contribute to their perceived safety and comfort. Gender plays a significant role in shaping these decisions. The implications of these findings are significant for transportation policy and planning in Jabodetabek. The research underscores the need to develop gender-responsive transportation policies and programs that address women commuters' unique challenges and needs. For example, transportation planners can take steps to increase security personnel presence and improve lighting in areas frequented by women. Moreover, providing women-only transportation options can enhance the safety and comfort of women during their travel. The present research is distinguished by its investigation of women's route choices and the multifaceted factors that shape their decision-making process. In addition, this research represents a gap in the existing literature that has yet to be extensively examined, thereby rendering this study a distinctive and valuable contribution to the field.

1. Introduction

Women in Jabodetabek often report feeling unsafe while using public transportation due to the prevalence of harassment and violence, particularly on crowded buses and trains. According to the results of the Sexual Harassment Survey in Public Spaces during the COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia (in Bahasa Indonesia: *Survei Pelecehan Seksual di Ruang Publik selama Pandemi COVID-19 di Indonesia*), conducted by the Safe Public Spaces Coalition (in Bahasa Indonesia: *Koalisi Ruang Publik Aman - KRPA*), 79% of 3,539 women surveyed reported experiencing sexual harassment in public spaces during the pandemic and the most common locations of harassment were public streets or parks (70%) and public transportation, including facilities and infrastructure (23%). In addition, women were six times more likely to experience sexual harassment in public spaces than men.

Women may also face barriers to accessing public transportation due to safety, cultural and social norms. For example, in some communities, women may be discouraged from travelling alone or restricted from leaving their homes without a male companion (Jordan & Gibson, 2005; Harris & Wilson, 2007; Stevenson, 2016). In some societies, women are expected to stay at home and take care of the family, which can limit their ability to access education and employment opportunities that require mobility. Women may need help accessing public transportation due to a lack of safe and affordable options, particularly in low-income and rural areas. Women are vulnerable to harassment and violence in public transportation worldwide, regardless of the country's level of development or the women's social class. However, the prevalence and severity of these issues may vary depending on cultural norms, social and economic inequalities, and the effectiveness of policies and programs aimed at addressing them.

Some research shows that women in lower socio-economic classes may be at higher risk of experiencing harassment and violence in public transportation due to their limited access to safe and reliable transportation options (Gardner, Cui & Coiacetto, 2017; Jayachandran, 2021; Sundling & Ceccato, 2022). Additionally, women in developing countries may face more significant transportation access and safety challenges due to the lack of infrastructure and resources. In contrast, developed countries may have more comprehensive policies and programs to address gender-based violence in public transportation (Bott, Morrison & Ellsberg, 2005; Hoor-Ul-Ain, 2020). Nonetheless, women in developed countries may still experience harassment and violence, albeit somewhat less than in underdeveloped countries. Therefore, it is essential to develop transportation policies and programs that consider women's specific challenges and needs, regardless of their social and economic status and the country's level of development.

One solution to address the limitations faced by women in mobility, especially when using public transportation, is to provide dedicated transportation facilities for women (Loukaitou-Sideris & Fink, 2009; Dunckel-Graglia, 2013). Women-only transportation can make it easier and safer for women, especially in places where violence or harassment against women is common. For example, in Jabodetabek, the government has provided women-only services on the Trans Jakarta bus and electric commuter line (KRL) trains. The availability of women-only buses makes women feel safer from

harassment. Similarly, providing dedicated train cars for women offers them the freedom to choose transportation less likely to result in sexual harassment. These transportation options provide women with greater mobility and security when accessing public transportation.

However, there are also worries that this could reinforce gender segregation and stereotypes and that women with disabilities might be unable to use these ways of getting around. A study from Dunckel-Graglia (2013) concludes that women-only transportation should be considered part of a larger plan to promote gender equality in transportation. It should be paired with efforts to change the social and cultural factors that lead to violence and harassment based on gender in public spaces. To effectively address gender-based violence and harassment in public spaces, efforts should also be made to change the social and cultural factors contributing to the problem. This may involve challenging gender stereotypes and negative attitudes towards women, promoting women's empowerment, and creating safe and inclusive environments for everyone.

A study from Turner (2012) discusses the challenges faced by women in accessing public transportation in Jakarta, Indonesia. Gender planning protocols can play an important role in promoting social sustainability and improving access to transportation for women. Women in Jakarta often face safety concerns while using public transportation, especially during the late hours of the day. This can lead to a reduction in their mobility and can limit their access to education, work, and other resources. This way, gender planning protocols can help address these challenges by ensuring that public transportation systems are designed to meet women's needs.

Studying women's commuting patterns is crucial because women often have more complex travel needs than men (Root, Schintler & Button, 2000; Elias, Benjamin & Shiftan, 2015; Scheiner & Holz-Rau, 2017). This is often due to their multiple roles and responsibilities, such as caregiving and household duties. Additionally, safety concerns and the need to navigate certain neighbourhoods or areas perceived as unsafe may influence women's travel patterns. Therefore, understanding the local context in which women make travel decisions is important. It includes factors such as the available transportation options and the social and cultural norms that impact women's travel behaviours. For example, in some areas, women may be more likely to use private transportation or travel with family members. By considering these factors, we can design transportation systems that better meet the needs of women and promote gender equality in transportation.

Despite the importance of understanding women's route choices, more research should be done in the Jabodetabek region. Most studies have focused on broader issues related to women's mobility and transportation access rather than specific factors influencing women's route choices. Although commuting is a gendered experience, the gendered dimensions in the Jabodetabek region need to be better understood. This research addresses this gap by analyzing women's route choices and exploring the factors influencing their decisions. While there have been studies that have used quantitative methods to analyze travel behaviour in the Jabodetabek region (Stark & Meschik, 2018; Hidayati, Tan & Yamu, 2020; Noel et al., 2022), there is a need for more research using

qualitative methods such as interviews and deep-observations to gain a deeper understanding of women's travel experiences and the factors that influence their route choices related to social, cultural factors, and socioeconomic statuses.

Applied to the study on navigating gender commuting, this study suggests that various gendered factors likely influence women's route choices in Jabodetabek. For example, women may choose certain routes perceived as safer or more comfortable, even if there are more efficient or direct options. They may also choose routes that avoid particular areas or modes of transportation associated with higher levels of harassment or violence. Social norms and cultural expectations around women's mobility may also shape their route choices, particularly for women from more conservative or traditional backgrounds. By applying gendered mobility concept to studying women's route choices in Jabodetabek, we can understand how gender shapes women's commuting experiences in this region.

2. Method

This study examined how women in Jabodetabek chose their routes using a case study method. The study recruited six women commuters who use public transportation to travel within and between Jabodetabek. The informants were chosen based on how willing they were to talk about their commutes and how different their routes were. Data was collected using qualitative research methods, including in-depth interviews and participant observations. Qualitative data analysis was used to identify common themes and patterns in women's route choices in Jabodetabek. First, the data analysis process will thoroughly review interview transcripts and observation notes to identify key factors influencing women's route choices. Then, a thematic analysis approach will be used to identify themes and patterns in the data. Finally, these themes will conclude the factors influencing women's route choices in Jabodetabek.

In this study, the critical informants was selected using the snowball sampling technique. After conducting multiple preliminary interviews, one informant was selected as the primary case study to represent the discussion on gender and commuting from one area. In order to provide a comprehensive representation of the commuting experiences of women in the Jabodetabek region, a diverse sample of individuals was selected. This sample included one participant from each location: Tangerang, Depok, Bekasi, Bogor, South Tangerang, and DKI Jakarta. By including participants from various locations within the Jabodetabek region, the study aims to capture various experiences and perspectives on commuting, which various conditions may influence. The data collection process involved conducting several in-depth interviews with the selected informant. The initial step of this process involved obtaining basic informants to provide an initial description of the phenomenon under study.

To ensure the validity and reliability of the data collected, the research team employed a rigorous data collection process. This process involved conducting multiple interviews with the informant to obtain a detailed and comprehensive understanding of their experiences, perceptions, and behaviours related to commuting. The collected data were then analyzed using appropriate qualitative research methods to identify relevant themes and patterns. Overall, the selection of a critical informant and the rigorous data

collection process employed in this study aimed to provide a comprehensive understanding of the phenomenon of gender and commuting, as well as to generate insights that can inform future research and policy-making in this area.

3. Result and discussion

- *Gender and Commuting: A Review*

Research on gender differences in travel behaviour has gained increasing attention over the past few decades. This recognition stems from the notion that men and women may have distinct travel patterns and preferences (Gordon, Kumar & Richardson, 1989; Johnston-Anumonwo, 1992; Nobis & Lenz, 2005; Simićević, Milosavljević & Djoric, 2016; Saigal, Vaish & Rao, 2021). Specifically, men have been observed to travel longer distances and rely more on cars for transportation. In contrast, women take shorter, utilitarian trips such as shopping and transporting children. Moreover, women have reported a greater propensity for public transport than men. These differences may be attributed to a multitude of factors, including societal gender roles, responsibilities, and expectations both in the home and workplace, as well as variances in safety and accessibility perceptions (Hidayati, Tan, & Yamu, 2020). Therefore, it is important to take these gender differences into account while formulating transportation policies and promoting sustainable travel behaviour.

Studies have revealed that gender differences in commuting and travel behavior have brought to the forefront the intricate ways in which gender influences transportation systems and the experiences of users, as established by experts in the field (Gordon, Kumar & Richardson, 1989; Dunckel-Graglia, 2013; Martens, 2016; Sabogal-Cardona et.al., 2021). As transportation represents a fundamental aspect of social justice, ensuring equitable access to transportation can aid in promoting social and economic equity. Adopting a gender-sensitive approach in transportation planning and policymaking holds immense potential for creating more inclusive and equitable transportation systems that benefit all members of society.

Gender-based disparities in travel behavior can exert a profound influence on transportation planning and policy. Failing to consider the diverse travel needs and preferences of different genders could have unintended repercussions. In particular, transport infrastructure geared solely towards one gender may prove insufficient to meet the demands of all users, resulting in suboptimal outcomes. This could manifest, for example, in the form of transport systems that prioritize automobiles over public transit, walking, or cycling (Harrell, 1991; Talen, 2002; Hidayati & Rifani, 2021), which could disproportionately disadvantage women and other gender groups that rely on alternative modes of transport.

In addition, the prevalence of harassment and violence towards women while utilizing public transportation can serve as a deterrent, leading to a reduction in the utilization of these modes of transport (Tripathi, Boron & Belur, 2017; Quinones, 2020; Soesilo, Alfian & Rachmawati, 2021). This can exacerbate the limitations on women's mobility and access to essential resources, further emphasizing the need to incorporate gender-inclusive perspectives in transportation planning and policymaking. A comprehensive

approach that considers the requirements and preferences of all users can guarantee that the transportation system is inclusive, safe, and accessible to all.

Addressing these issues requires transportation planners and policymakers to consider the gendered dimensions of travel behaviour and work towards creating safe, accessible, and equitable transportation systems that cater to the needs of all users, irrespective of their gender. For example, this could involve implementing initiatives such as improving the safety and availability of public transportation, enhancing pedestrian and cycling infrastructure, and promoting flexible work arrangements that better balance work and family responsibilities.

In order to achieve the goal of developing more inclusive and sustainable transportation systems, it is essential to engage a diverse range of stakeholders, including women's groups, transportation experts, policymakers, and community organizations. Collaboration between these stakeholders can ensure that a gender perspective informs transportation planning and policy-making. This approach can lead to developing transportation systems that are more responsive to the needs and preferences of different user groups and prioritize safety, accessibility, and sustainability. In addition, by bringing together various perspectives and expertise, stakeholders can work together to identify and address the barriers and challenges different groups face and promote more equitable and efficient transportation systems for all.

Gender differences in perceptions of safety and security while using public transportation in Jabodetabek have been the subject of growing research interest. Women face unique challenges and experiences when navigating public transportation in the region, and their perceptions of safety and security play a significant role in their travel behaviour. Hidayati, Tan, and Yamu (2020) conducted a study exploring gender differences and perceptions of safety shaping urban mobility in Southeast Asia, including Jakarta. The study revealed that women were more likely to perceive public transportation as unsafe and approached it more cautiously than men. Women also reported experiencing more sexual harassment and assault on public transportation than men, which impacted their travel behaviour and route choices. The study concluded that enhancing safety and security measures on public transportation would foster more equitable and accessible transportation for women. Overall, the findings highlight the need for gender-sensitive transportation planning and policy-making that prioritizes the safety and security of all users.

- *The Daily Commuting Story of Women in Jabodetabek*

Jabodetabek, which refers to the urban agglomeration of Jakarta and its surrounding cities and regencies, represents a significant metropolitan area in Indonesia. Within this context, the daily commuting experiences of women in Jabodetabek are shaped by a diverse range of factors, including but not limited to gender norms, cultural beliefs, and socioeconomic status. These factors can profoundly impact women's commuting patterns, as well as their experiences of accessibility, safety, and security while travelling. Therefore, understanding the complex interplay between these factors is crucial in developing transportation policies and initiatives that promote equitable access,

facilitate safe and secure travel and address gender-based disparities in commuting behaviour.

The utilization of public transportation by women in Jabodetabek is significantly higher than that of private vehicles, mainly due to several factors such as cost, availability, and convenience (Hidayati, 2021a). Public transportation provides a more cost-effective alternative to private vehicles, especially for daily commutes, as fuel and parking costs can be prohibitively high. Moreover, public transportation is readily accessible, with numerous bus and train stations across Jabodetabek, making it convenient for people to travel to and from their destinations (Hidayati, 2021a). However, despite the advantages of public transportation, women often encounter significant challenges while commuting, with numerous reports of sexual harassment and insecurity (Ginting, Gelgel & Apriani, 2022). These incidents can traumatize women and may even discourage them from using public transportation altogether. As a result, women may modify their commuting patterns or opt for alternative modes of transportation, which can exacerbate their challenges.

In recent years, there have been concerted efforts to address the challenges faced by women while commuting on public transportation. For instance, authorities have introduced measures such as deploying more female security personnel, introducing women-only cars on trains and buses, and installing CCTV cameras on public transport to enhance women's safety. However, more work must be done to ensure that women can commute safely and conveniently on public transportation without facing harassment or safety concerns. Public transportation remains a popular and cost-effective mode for women in Jabodetabek. However, the challenges women face while commuting can lead to changes in their commuting patterns or preferences. Therefore, addressing these challenges through implementing safety measures and policies is crucial to ensuring that women can enjoy a safe and convenient commuting experience on public transportation.

This subsection examines the decision-making process of female commuters who travel to Jakarta daily for work, emphasizing their route choices and the factors that influence them. The study utilized purposive sampling techniques to select informants who were full-time female workers following a work-from-office (WFO) system and worked from Monday to Friday, five days a week. The profiles and characteristics of the informants will be discussed to provide a better understanding of the decision-making process. This informant's characteristics will provide a comprehensive background and facilitate detailed explanations of their decision-making. Furthermore, this subsection will present a range of route and mode options and highlight each option's associated pros and cons.

Mrs YN from Tangerang, 38 years old, married with children, commute with bus, train and online bike taxi

Mrs YN, a government employee, engages in daily commuting practices from her residence in Tangerang to her office in South Jakarta. Her commuting experience is shaped by the availability of various transportation options, including public transportation, such as the Transjakarta bus, rapid mass transportation (MRT), electric

train (KRL), and shared transportation, such as a taxi-bike or car. To complete her commute from home to work, Mrs YN must utilize at least two modes of transportation. The selection and combination of transportation modes differ daily, influenced by situational and road conditions. The variability in transportation mode selection is due to the time constraint of Mrs YN's workplace, which necessitates employees' punctual arrival at 7:30 am. Failure to meet this requirement may result in a salary deduction as a form of punitive action.

Mrs YN begins her day at 5 a.m. to prepare for her daily commute to the office. At 5:40, she proceeds to the nearest Transjakarta bus stop in Ciledug, either driven by her husband or using an online taxi bike. Mrs YN can board the 6:00 bus and obtain a seat if she is punctual. However, if she is five minutes late, there may not be any available seats, forcing her to stand for 25-30 minutes until her next destination in Pancoran, where she can transfer and change vehicles. The morning bus journey is generally smooth, despite the heavy traffic congestion towards Jakarta, as the bus she takes has a dedicated lane. During her bus ride, Mrs YN takes a nap if she is seated. However, if she cannot find a seat, she watches K-dramas on her mobile phone. The bus she rides is relatively safe from sexual harassment because Mrs YN always selects the women-only section and sometimes even takes a bus designated exclusively for women.

Upon reaching the South Jakarta bus stop, Mrs YN travels to the KRL station in Duren Kalibata, where she usually takes a minibus or an online taxi-bike. However, due to the minibus being frequently overcrowded and uncomfortable to share with male passengers, Mrs YN now prefers to use an online taxi-bike for this leg of her journey. Furthermore, although she has not personally experienced sexual harassment incidents on the minibus, she prefers to avoid it as some of her friends have reported unpleasant incidents. As a result, Mrs YN opts for the pricier option of an online taxi bike for her safety and comfort.

Mrs YN typically experiences a hassle-free ride in the KRL train as she takes a train that goes against the commuter flow. The train cars are typically unoccupied, providing her with the flexibility to choose a seat with ease. Mrs YN expresses that this train ride is her preferred choice as she can briefly take a respite and alleviate the crowdedness of public transportation. Nonetheless, this respite phase is short-lived as she only passes through three stations before disembarking. Upon reaching her destination station in Lenteng Agung, Mrs YN often prefers to walk to her office since it is within proximity, taking approximately 5-7 minutes.

The commute from the KRL station to Mrs YN's workplace is characterized by comfort and convenience. The presence of shaded pedestrian walkways adorned with luscious trees provides respite from the heat. Unfortunately, along the way, Mrs YN encounters areas frequented by male buskers. In the past, she was subject to verbal sexual harassment, particularly when not wearing her government office uniform. However, as time progressed, the frequency of these incidents subsided as the harassers became increasingly reluctant upon recognizing Mrs YN's status as a government office employee.

Mrs YN follows the same route for her return journey as her departure, but with more comfortable and less crowded conditions, as she leaves the office on time at 4 PM. She ensures she reaches the Transjakarta bus stop before 5 PM to secure a relatively empty bus for her journey home. The commute back to her residence can take up to 90 minutes, 30 minutes less than her journey to work. Under normal circumstances, Mrs YN can reach home before the Maghrib call to prayer and have enough rest to prepare for their journey in the next day.

Miss IN from South Tangerang, 30 years old, single, commute with train and online bike taxi

Miss IN, an employee of a national bank in Jakarta, commutes daily from her South Tangerang residence to her office in the Sudirman area. As a corporate employee, Miss IN is mandated to work from the office five days weekly. Although her employer provided the option for remote work during the height of the COVID-19 pandemic, all employees must now report to the office. Miss IN identifies herself as a "Roker," short for "Rombongan Kereta", or a commuter who travels by KRL train. The KRL train is the fastest and most cost-effective mode of transportation for her daily office commute.

Miss IN's daily commute to her office in Jakarta involves a multi-modal transportation system. She starts her day by riding her motorcycle to the nearest KRL station at 7 am. From there, she takes the train to Tanah Abang Station, which takes approximately 28 minutes. Due to the distance between the station and her boarding point, the train is usually already full, with no available seats. However, Miss IN still considers the KRL train her best option because it is relatively cheap and fast. She chooses the women-only carriage if the train is crowded to make her journey more comfortable. Nevertheless, she chooses the mixed carriage if the train is open enough. After arriving at Palmerah Station, Miss IN continues her journey to her office in Sudirman using an online motorcycle taxi. Although she can take the TransJakarta bus with a route from the station to a bus stop near her office, she prefers the motorcycle taxi because it is more comfortable, faster, and easier. She can even arrive at the office before 9 am if the traffic is smooth. If she arrives early, she usually looks for breakfast around her office.

Miss IN's daily commute is characterized by its smoothness, ease, and low incidence of sexual harassment. Despite being exposed to news and articles about sexual harassment incidents on the KRL train, she has never personally encountered them and viewed her train route as relatively safe compared to others. While opting for the women-only carriage is more effective in avoiding sexual harassment, it is often more crowded than the other carriages. To mitigate the risk of sexual harassment in mixed carriages, Miss IN chooses to stand in areas with more women.

Miss IN departed later at night to avoid heavy traffic and overcrowded public transportation when commuting home. Along with working overtime, Miss IN engages in extracurricular activities after work, including exercising, socializing with peers, watching films at the cinema, or simply relaxing at a coffee shop. As a single woman, Miss IN need not hasten home immediately. Typically, after 8:00 pm, traffic congestion dissipates, and Miss IN proceeds homeward via the same mode of transportation, specifically by utilizing a motorcycle taxi to reach the station. During the evening, the train remains somewhat occupied, though not excessively so, although seats from the

Tanah Abang station are no longer available. To address this concern, Miss IN selects a train travelling in the opposite direction at Tanah Abang Station to secure a seat until her destination arrives. Furthermore, the ride by motorcycle from Rawa Buntu Station poses relatively low safety risks as the roadway is moderately busy. Miss IN's multi-modal transportation system illustrates the complexity of commuting in Jakarta. However, despite the challenges, she has found a way to make her journey as comfortable and efficient as possible.

Mrs TK from Bekasi, 50 years old, married with grandchild, commute with train and bus

Mrs TK is a senior employee working in a ministry located in the Thamrin area of Central Jakarta. Following the end of the pandemic, the ministry has mandated that all employees, particularly administrative staff like Mrs TK, work from office daily. Although her official working hours are from 8:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m., the ministry offers some flexibility regarding arrival time, provided she completes a full eight-hour workday. Therefore, Mrs TK departs for work at 7:30 a.m. from her residence in Bekasi City.

Mrs TK's daily mode of transportation comprises a combination of a commuter train (KRL), a TransJakarta bus, and an online bike taxi. In the morning, her retired husband drives her to Bekasi Station, which takes around 20-30 minutes, subject to traffic conditions in some congested areas. If the traffic is smooth, Mrs TK reaches Bekasi Station at 8:00 a.m. and boards the first train. Despite the trains being generally crowded daily, Mrs TK, being of old age, always manages to secure a seat. If she stands, a passenger, usually a male, offers her a seat shortly afterwards.

Previously, Mrs TK could get off at Tanah Abang Station and continue her journey to the office by taking an online bike taxi or bajaj for a relatively short distance. However, when all trains had to transfer at Manggarai Station, Mrs TK chose to get off there rather than continue her journey to Tanah Abang Station. She believed the transfer conditions at Manggarai Station needed to be more relaxed and easier for older people like herself. Therefore, Mrs TK chose to get off at Manggarai and continue her journey by taking the TransJakarta bus with two transfers, which would drop her off at a bus stop near her office. However, if she runs late and has an urgent meeting, Mrs TK opts to take an online motorcycle taxi.

Mrs TK has reported feeling secure during her daily commute and has not encountered any instances of sexual harassment. However, changing between various modes of transportation can be challenging for her. Previously, prior to her husband's retirement, Mrs TK would travel to her workplace via car with him. However, she now relies on public transportation due to financial considerations and her inability to drive. Compared to her morning commute, the route for Mrs TK's return journey is comparatively easier. To commute back home, Mrs TK uses the employee bus that departs from her office at 4:00 p.m. Despite the extended travel time due to traffic congestion, Mrs TK can rest and nap inside the bus.

Miss ME from Depok, 28 years old, single, commute with train and bus

Miss ME's daily commute is a challenging routine that she has to endure to reach her workplace at Taman Anggrek Mall in West Jakarta. She lives in Depok City, and her primary mode of transportation is the commuter train (KRL) combined with other modes such as the TransJakarta bus and online motorcycle taxi. Her commute starts at 5:00 a.m. every day, so she must reach her workplace by 9:00 a.m. She travels by motorcycle from home to Depok Lama Station, where she takes the train to Cawang Station. She then switches to the TransJakarta bus from the Cawang bus stop to the S Parman Podomoro City bus stop in front of her workplace. The travel time on the TransJakarta bus can be challenging to predict due to congestion in some busway routes. If the route is clear, the journey from Cawang to the Grogol area can be completed within 30 minutes. However, the travel time can take 1-1.5 hours if there is traffic. The route also passes through the building of the Indonesian Parliament, which is often a site of protests that can disrupt traffic flow.

Miss ME's route home is the same as her morning route but with more severe traffic. The route to Cawang Station is heavily congested from afternoon to evening, and the TransJakarta bus is usually packed. Miss ME rarely gets a seat, which makes her commute even more challenging. Despite the difficulties, Miss ME continues to endure her daily commute with perseverance. She has considered moving to a boarding house closer to her workplace, but she finds it hard to leave her mother, who lives alone at home and has weak health. Therefore, she remains open to better job offers closer to her home. Unfortunately, Miss ME had to experience pickpocketing and sexual harassment while using public transportation. These experiences are indeed bitter. However, she perseveres and continues her daily commute to sustain her life.

Mrs ST from Bogor, 43 years old, married with children, commute with train

Mrs ST's work as an editor for an online magazine in Jakarta requires her to commute daily from her home in Bogor City. To save time and energy, she prefers to use public transportation, namely KRL. This transportation choice allows her to avoid the traffic congestion often encountered by car or motorcycle.

Mrs ST's preference for using KRL is not new, as she has been doing it since she was a student. This suggests that she is accustomed to the train system and finds it a reliable mode of transportation. Additionally, using KRL allows Mrs ST to multitask during her commute, such as reading or replying to emails, which can help her save time and be more productive. According to Mrs ST, KRL is much better now than when she was younger. This suggests that the train system has undergone improvements, including better safety features, more frequent and punctual schedules, and cleaner and more comfortable facilities. These improvements further cemented Mrs ST's preference for using KRL as her main mode of transportation.

Although Mrs ST goes to the office daily, her working hours are flexible and can be adjusted to her needs. Mrs ST chooses to go to the office later in the morning after preparing for her family's needs and when the train situation is relatively quiet. According to Mrs ST, taking the train from Bogor Station is also quite comfortable and

safe because, at the initial departure station, Mrs ST can choose a seat more freely. Even if she leaves later, Mrs ST can work on her laptop inside the train carriage.

Mrs ST's destination station is Cikini Station, within walking distance of her office. After getting off the train, she walks to her office while enjoying the coffee she bought at the station. Mrs ST's choice to use KRL for her daily commute reflects the practicality and convenience of public transportation in Jakarta. It also highlights the importance of reliable and efficient transportation systems in facilitating daily activities, such as work and education, for many people in the city.

Miss GS from East Jakarta, 26 years old, single, commute with motorcycle

Miss GS has to commute a considerable distance from East Jakarta to South Jakarta for her job, despite residing in the same province as her workplace. This is a common scenario in Jakarta, as many individuals have to travel long distances to work due to the city's sprawling layout and inadequate public transportation infrastructure. In the morning, she starts going to work at 7:00 am and arrives at her office at 8:00 am. The traffic situation in Jakarta is renowned for its congestion, especially during peak hours, making commuting a stressful and time-consuming experience. Commuters often face long delays and slow-moving traffic, exacerbating commuting difficulties.

Furthermore, the unpredictability of traffic conditions may lead to uncertainty and frustration for commuters, making planning and scheduling of journeys challenging. Miss GE's choice to employ her personal motorcycle underlines commuting challenges in Jakarta. Although a personal vehicle may provide greater flexibility and independence than public transportation, it has hazards and complications. As the passage indicates, the congested road conditions in Jakarta pose a hazard to drivers, particularly those who lack experience or confidence on the road.

Additionally, the behaviour of other road users, such as drivers and motorcyclists disregarding traffic regulations and failing to yield to others, may be unpredictable. Therefore, Miss GE prefers to leave work at 4:00 pm sharp to avoid the congested traffic situation during her evening commute to ensure that the roads remain open. This demonstrates the strategic planning required by commuters in Jakarta to navigate the challenges of daily commuting.

- *Understanding women's commuting practices*

The stories above highlight the importance of a comprehensive approach to understanding women's commuting practices. Beyond analyzing transportation mode choices, the analysis should consider various factors influencing decision-making, such as availability, affordability, accessibility, safety, personal preferences, and experiences. Moreover, social and cultural factors related to women's decision to use public transportation should also be considered. By doing so, we can develop sustainable and inclusive transportation systems that meet the diverse needs of commuters. The women's safety concerns can influence their choice of transportation mode, with many women opting for more expensive but perceived as safer modes of transportation (Pirra et al., 2021). Transportation planning and policy should consider women's safety

concerns and prioritize investments in infrastructure and services that promote women's safety and security.

Female passengers in the Jabodetabek region are particularly affected by these transportation problems. Due to the limited coverage and uncomfortable conditions on some modes of transportation, women may face difficulties accessing safe and reliable transportation options. The issue of traffic congestion also affects women commuters, who may have to spend long hours in crowded public transportation or deal with the stress of driving in heavy traffic. Additionally, the undisciplined behaviour of road users and inadequate parking spaces may make it harder for women to park their vehicles or walk safely to public transportation stops. Furthermore, the issue of safety and security is a critical concern for women commuters, as they are more likely to experience harassment and violence during their commute. Addressing these transportation problems is essential to ensure that women in Jabodetabek have equitable access to safe, efficient, and sustainable transportation options.

In the context of population mobility, Mrs YN's daily commute from Tangerang to South Jakarta reflects the complexity and variability of urban transportation systems. She uses a combination of public and private transportation modes to navigate the city and reach her workplace, which indicates the limitations and challenges of commuting in urban areas. Her reliance on multiple modes of transportation also highlights the interconnectivity and interdependence of transportation systems and their impact on people's mobility (Aleta, Meloni & Moreno, 2017).

Several factors, including the availability and quality of transportation modes, situational and road conditions, and time constraints, influence Mrs YN's commuting experience. The need to arrive at work on time and the threat of salary deduction reinforce the importance of punctuality and efficiency in urban transportation. However, the variability in transportation mode selection also underscores the need for flexibility and adaptability in commuting practices. From a social and cultural perspective, Mrs YN's mobility decision-making is influenced by her family's predominantly working-class culture. This cultural background results in the absence of social norms or family constraints that restrict her mobility; Mrs YN's family values and culture do not see mobility as a privilege reserved for certain individuals or groups but as a necessity for daily life. Additionally, her choice of public transportation mode is also influenced by her family's economic situation, which belongs to the middle economic group. This economic status limits her ability to utilize more comfortable and convenient transportation options. This type indicates that economic factors play a significant role in shaping mobility patterns among women in the middle-income bracket and highlights the need for transportation policies that consider the economic constraints of different groups.

Another story, Miss IN prefers to use the KRL train as it is fast and cost-effective, even though it is usually crowded. She chooses the women-only carriage to make her journey more comfortable, and in mixed carriages, she stands in areas with more women to avoid the risk of sexual harassment. She also prefers the online motorcycle taxi to the TransJakarta bus because it is more comfortable, faster, and easier. Miss IN's daily commute is characterized by its smoothness, ease, and low incidence of sexual

harassment. She has never personally encountered sexual harassment incidents on the KRL train, although she is aware of their prevalence. In the evenings, she avoids heavy traffic and overcrowded public transportation by leaving later and using the same mode of transportation to return home. Despite the challenges of commuting in Jakarta, Miss IN has found a way to make her journey as comfortable and efficient as possible. She also engages in extracurricular activities after work, indicating a work-life balance.

Miss IN's mobility patterns indicate a departure from urban society's traditional social and cultural norms. Women are increasingly joining the workforce and are anticipated to have the same mobility as their male counterparts. This condition reflects a shift in the conventional gender roles assigned to women in society. In the past, women were expected to remain at home and tend to domestic responsibilities, which restricted their mobility. However, as more women occupy white-collar jobs in urban areas, societal expectations are evolving, and traditional gender roles no longer restrict women. Consequently, they can travel long distances and work late hours without encountering significant social or cultural impediments.

The information provided about Mrs TK's daily commute can be associated with the population mobility of pre-elderly individuals. Mrs TK is 50 years old, which falls into the pre-elderly age group. She commutes to work using a combination of public transportation modes such as the commuter train, TransJakarta bus, and an online motorcycle taxi. This suggests that pre-elderly individuals, like Mrs TK, are mobile and capable of using various modes of transportation to travel to their workplaces or other destinations.

Furthermore, the description of Mrs TK's commute highlights the challenges that pre-elderly individuals may face when commuting, such as changing between different modes of transportation and dealing with crowded public transportation systems (Cirella et al., 2019). However, despite these challenges, Mrs TK has reported feeling secure during her daily commute, suggesting that pre-elderly individuals can still maintain an active and independent lifestyle despite the potential obstacles they may encounter while travelling. Women daily commute highlights the challenges women face regarding safety and mobility (Hidayati, 2021a). The analysis of their commute underscores the importance of creating safe and accessible transportation systems that address the specific needs and concerns of women in urban (Hidayati, 2021b), particularly those travelling alone during early morning and late evening hours.

Mrs TK's daily commute indicates the changing social and cultural norms regarding pre-elderly individuals' mobility patterns. Despite their age, pre-elderly individuals like Mrs TK can still utilize various modes of transportation to commute. However, as highlighted by Mrs TK's challenges, such as crowded public transportation systems, it is important to create safe and accessible transportation systems that cater to diverse groups of individuals. Moreover, Mrs TK's daily commute also brings attention to women's safety and mobility challenges while commuting, particularly those travelling alone. The concerns of women's safety and mobility during their commute can be addressed by designing transportation systems catering to their needs and concerns.

Additionally, Miss ME's commute highlights the impact of familial responsibilities on women's mobility patterns. Despite the challenges of her commute, Miss ME is unwilling to move closer to her workplace due to her responsibility towards her mother. This reflects the traditional gender roles and expectations that women are expected to prioritize familial responsibilities over career opportunities (Aryee, Srinivas & Tan, 2005). In the same condition, Mrs ST's commuting experience reflects the complex interplay of various factors. As a married woman with children, Mrs ST likely has more responsibilities and time constraints than her male counterparts.

Furthermore, the flexibility of her working hours allows her to adjust her schedule to her family's needs, which is an important consideration for many working mothers. This familiarity with the train system reflects the importance of transportation habits and how they can shape individuals' mobility patterns. Mrs ST's commuting experience demonstrates the importance of gender-sensitive transportation policies that consider the different mobility needs and constraints women face. The availability of safe, reliable, and accessible public transportation can empower women by increasing their mobility and access to economic opportunities.

The social and cultural norms reflected in Miss ME's and Mrs ST's commuting experiences highlight the traditional gender roles and expectations that women are often expected to prioritize familial responsibilities over career opportunities. As a result, women are expected to balance their work and family responsibilities, which can impact their mobility patterns. Furthermore, the decision-making process for women's mobility is often influenced by their familial responsibilities and traditional gender roles.

Miss ME's unwillingness to move closer to her workplace due to her responsibility towards her mother and Mrs ST's need to adjust her working hours to accommodate her family's needs reflect the complex interplay of various factors that shape women's mobility patterns. Therefore, gender-sensitive transportation policies that consider women's different mobility needs and constraints are emphasized, as safe, reliable, and accessible public transportation can empower women by increasing their mobility and access to economic opportunities.

More story from Miss GS, her commuting experience highlights the impact of inadequate public transportation infrastructure on women's mobility. Due to her job's nature, Miss GS has to commute long distances, which could be challenging for women's safety and mobility. In addition, in Jakarta, women are often subjected to sexual harassment and violence while using public transportation, which could further limit their access to opportunities outside their homes. Miss GS's use of a personal motorcycle also highlights the importance of road safety for women. However, female drivers and motorcyclists may face additional risks due to gendered norms and stereotypes affecting their driving behaviour and attitudes towards road safety. Women may also face discrimination and unequal treatment in accessing driving licenses and other road-related services.

Miss GS's commuting experience highlights the impact of inadequate public transportation infrastructure on women's mobility, especially given the risks of sexual harassment and violence women face while using public transportation in Jakarta.

Additionally, gendered norms and stereotypes can impact women's driving behaviour and attitudes towards road safety, potentially leading to additional risks for female drivers and motorcyclists. Gender-sensitive transportation policies that consider the specific needs and constraints women face, including their familial responsibilities, safety concerns, and access to economic opportunities, can help empower women by increasing their mobility, promoting their safety and well-being, and expanding their access to economic opportunities.

Furthermore, the unpredictable traffic conditions and long commuting hours may have implications for women's unpaid care work, as they may have to spend more time commuting, leaving less time for caregiving activities. This could further exacerbate gender inequalities in access to education, employment, and other opportunities. Women commuting experience underscores the need for gender-sensitive transportation policies that address women's specific mobility needs and challenges. Improving public transportation infrastructure, enhancing road safety, and providing flexible work arrangements could enhance women's access to opportunities and reduce gender inequalities in mobility.

The issue of safety and security is a critical concern for women commuters, as they experience different forms of harassment during their commute. The fact that women commuter chooses women-only sections in buses and avoids crowded and uncomfortable minibuses illustrates the gendered nature of transportation and the need for safer and more inclusive transportation systems. The women's commuting experience offers valuable insights into the challenges and opportunities of population mobility in urban areas, including the need for safe, efficient, and sustainable transportation systems that meet people's diverse needs and preferences for women.

The participant observation conducted in this study further supports the finding that women commuters often adopt specific behaviours and coping strategies to navigate the challenges of their daily commute, such as travelling during off-peak hours or taking longer but safer routes. It emphasizes the importance of understanding women's mobility patterns and decision-making processes to develop effective transportation policies that cater to their needs. Additionally, the lack of gender-sensitive transportation policies can negatively affect women commuters, including limited economic opportunities and increased risk of harassment and violence. Therefore, it is crucial to incorporate women's perspectives and experiences in transportation planning and decision-making to develop more inclusive and equitable transportation systems.

4. Conclusion

Through this case study in Jabodetabek, we explored the factors influencing women's route and transportation choices in the region, including safety concerns, social norms, and transportation availability. Our findings highlight the gendered dimensions of commuting in the region and the unique challenges women face when navigating public transportation. This study adds to the growing body of research on how gender affects transportation in Indonesia by focusing on women's experiences. It provides a nuanced understanding of the factors that influence women's mobility. Our findings suggest that gender plays a significant role in shaping women's commuting patterns and that a more

gender-sensitive approach to transportation planning and policy is needed to support women's mobility needs better. A gender-sensitive approach to transportation planning and policy in urban areas of Indonesia could involve gender-disaggregated data collection, creating safe infrastructure, providing gender-sensitive transportation services, promoting gender diversity in the workforce, and involving women in decision-making processes.

This study provides important insights into the factors influencing women's route choices when commuting in Jabodetabek. Using a case study approach and qualitative methods, we explored the region's complex and multifaceted experiences of women commuters. Our findings indicate that gender plays a significant role in shaping women's route choices, with safety concerns and social norms being key considerations. Through our analysis, we identified several factors that contribute to women's perceived safety and comfort on different transportation modes and routes, including the presence of other women, well-lit areas, and visible security personnel.

The findings of this study have important implications for transportation policy and planning in Jabodetabek. By highlighting women commuters' specific challenges and needs, our research can inform the development of more gender-responsive transportation policies and programs. This development could include increased investment in safe and reliable public transportation, the provision of women-only transportation options, and the implementation of measures to address harassment and violence against women in public spaces.

This study has several limitations. Firstly, it relies solely on qualitative research methods, which may restrict the ability to quantify the extent of the problem and evaluate the potential impact of interventions. Secondly, the study only focuses on the perspectives and experiences of women, neglecting other gender identities that may have provided additional insights into the safety and security issues in public transportation.

However, The study has some strengths despite its limitations. Qualitative research methods enabled an in-depth exploration of women's experiences with public transportation in Jabodetabek. Moreover, the study's focus on women's perspectives provides valuable insights into their unique challenges and needs concerning transportation safety and security. These findings can inform gender-responsive transportation policies and programs catering to women's concerns and needs.

Acknowledgment: This research was not sponsored by any other party. The author sincerely thanks all the participants for their generous contribution of valuable data, which played a crucial role in shaping the outcomes of this study.

Conflicts of Interest: The author declare no conflict of interest.

References

- Adira, N., & Kusumawardhani, D. E. (2022). Persepsi Ketidakamanan dan Prosocial Risk Taking pada Pengguna KRL di Jabodetabek. *INQUIRY: Jurnal Ilmiah Psikologi*, 13(02).
- Aleta, A., Meloni, S., & Moreno, Y. (2017). A multilayer perspective for the analysis of urban transportation systems. *Scientific reports*, 7(1), 44359.

- Aryee, S., Srinivas, E. S., & Tan, H. H. (2005). Rhythms of life: antecedents and outcomes of work-family balance in employed parents. *Journal of applied psychology*, 90(1), 132.
- Bott, S., Morrison, A., & Ellsberg, M. (2005). Preventing and responding to gender-based violence in middle and low-income countries: a global review and analysis.
- Cirella, G. T., Båk, M., Kozlak, A., Pawłowska, B., & Borkowski, P. (2019). Transport innovations for elderly people. *Research in Transportation Business & Management*, 30, 100381.
- Dunckel-Graglia, A. (2013). Women-only transportation: How “pink” public transportation changes public perception of women’s mobility. *Journal of Public Transportation*, 16(2), 85-105.
- Elias, W., Benjamin, J., & Shifan, Y. (2015). Gender differences in activity and travel behavior in the Arab world. *transport policy*, 44, 19-27.
- Gardner, N., Cui, J., & Coiacetto, E. (2017). Harassment on public transport and its impacts on women’s travel behaviour. *Australian Planner*, 54(1), 8-15
- Ginting, R., Gelgel, N. M., & Apriani, K. (2022, August). Feminism and the Women's Carriage of the KRL Jabodetabek. In *Proceedings of the 6th Batusangkar International Conference, BIC 2021, 11-12 October, 2021, Batusangkar-West Sumatra, Indonesia*.
- Goel, R., Oyebode, O., Foley, L., Tatah, L., Millett, C., & Woodcock, J. (2022). Gender differences in active travel in major cities across the world. *Transportation*, 1-17.
- Gordon, P., Kumar, A., & Richardson, H. W. (1989). Gender differences in metropolitan travel behaviour. *Regional Studies*, 23(6), 499-510.
- Harrell, W. A. (1991). Factors influencing pedestrian cautiousness in crossing streets. *The Journal of Social Psychology*, 131(3), 367-372.
- Harris, C., & Wilson, E. (2007). Travelling beyond the boundaries of constraint: women, travel and empowerment. In *Tourism and gender: Embodiment, sensuality and experience* (pp. 235-250). Wallingford UK: Cabi.
- Hidayati, I., & Rifani, I. (2021). Mewujudkan Kota Ramah Pejalan Kaki: Kasus Kota Yogyakarta. *GEOGRAPHIA: Jurnal Pendidikan dan Penelitian Geografi*, 2(1), 87-93.
- Hidayati, I., Tan, W., & Yamu, C. (2020). How gender differences and perceptions of safety shape urban mobility in Southeast Asia. *Transportation Research Part F: Traffic Psychology and Behaviour*, 73, 155-173.
- Hidayati, I. (2021a). Daily Commute of Circular Migrant in Greater Jakarta: a Review: A REVIEW. *DEMOS: Journal of Demography, Ethnography and Social Transformation*, 1(1), 14-23.
- Hidayati, I. (2021b). Urbanisasi dan Dampak Sosial di Kota Besar: Sebuah Tinjauan. *Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Sosial*, 7(2), 212-221.
- Hoor-Ul-Ain, S. (2020). Public sexual harassment mayhem on public transport in megacities-Karachi and London: A comparative review. *Aggression and violent behavior*, 52, 10142.
- Jayachandran, S. (2021). Social norms as a barrier to women’s employment in developing countries. *IMF Economic Review*, 69(3), 576-595.
- Johnston-Anumonwo, I. (1992). The influence of household type on gender differences in work trip distance. *The Professional Geographer*, 44(2), 161-169.
- Jordan, F., & Gibson, H. (2005). “We're not stupid... But we'll not stay home either”: Experiences of solo women travelers. *Tourism Review International*, 9(2), 195-211.
- Laia, T. C., & Nurlaela, S. (2021). Evaluasi Kualitas Pelayanan Commuter Line Berdasarkan Perspektif Gender. *Jurnal Teknik ITS*, 9(2), E233-E238.
- Loukaitou-Sideris, A., & Fink, C. (2009). Addressing women's fear of victimization in transportation settings: A survey of US transit agencies. *Urban affairs review*, 44(4), 554-587.
- Martens, K. (2016). *Transport justice: Designing fair transportation systems*. Routledge.

- Nobis, C., & Lenz, B. (2005). Gender differences in travel patterns. *Research on Women's Issues in Transportation*, 2(3), 114-123.
- Pirra, M., Kalakou, S., Carboni, A., Costa, M., Diana, M., & Lynce, A. R. (2021). A preliminary analysis on gender aspects in transport systems and mobility services: Presentation of a survey design. *Sustainability*, 13(5), 2676.
- Root, A., Schintler, L., & Button, K. (2000). Women, travel and the idea of 'sustainable transport'. *Transport Reviews*, 20(3), 369-383.
- Sabogal-Cardona, O., Oviedo, D., Scholl, L., Crotte, A., & Bedoya-Maya, F. (2021). Not my usual trip: Ride-hailing characterization in Mexico City. *Travel Behaviour and Society*, 25, 233-245.
- Saigal, T., Vaish, A. K., & Rao, N. M. (2021). Gender and class distinction in travel behavior: evidence from India. *Ecofeminism and Climate Change*, 2(1), 42-48.
- Scheiner, J., & Holz-Rau, C. (2017). Women's complex daily lives: a gendered look at trip chaining and activity pattern entropy in Germany. *Transportation*, 44, 117-138.
- Simičević, J., Milosavljević, N., & Djoric, V. (2016). Gender differences in travel behaviour and willingness to adopt sustainable behaviour. *Transportation Planning and Technology*, 39(5), 527-537.
- Soehartono, A. A. (2022). *Persepsi penumpang perempuan terhadap pelayanan angkutan umum di Kota Makassar* (Doctoral dissertation, Universitas Hasanuddin).
- Soesilo, G. B., Alfian, M., & Rachmawati, A. F. (2021). Penegakan Hukum Pelaku Tindak Pidana Pelecehan Seksual terhadap Perempuan di Moda Transportasi Umum Konvensional. *Ahmad Dahlan Legal Perspective*, 1(2), 145-154.
- Stark, J., & Meschik, M. (2018). Women's everyday mobility: Frightening situations and their impacts on travel behaviour. *Transportation research part F: Traffic psychology and behaviour*, 54, 311-323.
- Stevenson, K. (2016). 'Women and young girls dare not travel alone': the dangers of sexual encounters on Victorian railways. In *Gendered Journeys, Mobile Emotions* (pp. 211-222). Routledge.
- Sundling, C., & Ceccato, V. (2022). The impact of rail-based stations on passengers' safety perceptions. A systematic review of international evidence. *Transportation research part F: traffic psychology and behaviour*, 86, 99-120.
- Talen, E. (2002). Pedestrian access as a measure of urban quality. *Planning Practice and Research*, 17(3), 257-278.
- Tripathi, K., Borrión, H., & Belur, J. (2017). Sexual harassment of students on public transport: An exploratory study in Lucknow, India. *Crime prevention and community safety*, 19, 240-250.
- Turner, J. (2012). Urban mass transit, gender planning protocols and social sustainability—The case of Jakarta. *Research in transportation economics*, 34(1), 48-53.
- Quinones, L. M. (2020). Sexual harassment in public transport in Bogotá. *Transportation Research Part A: Policy and Practice*, 139, 54-69.