

June 2012

## Was Dale Carnegie the Father of Modern Management?

C. R. Marshall

*University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point*

Robert E. Allen

*Lindenwood University*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://thekeep.eiu.edu/jnams>

---

### Recommended Citation

Marshall, C. R. and Allen, Robert E. (2012) "Was Dale Carnegie the Father of Modern Management?," *Journal of the North American Management Society*. Vol. 6: No. 2, Article 1.

Available at: <https://thekeep.eiu.edu/jnams/vol6/iss2/1>

This Research Article is brought to you for free and open access by The Keep. It has been accepted for inclusion in *Journal of the North American Management Society* by an authorized editor of The Keep. For more information, please contact [tabruns@eiu.edu](mailto:tabruns@eiu.edu).

# JOURNAL OF THE NORTH AMERICAN MANAGEMENT SOCIETY

# NAMMS

NORTH AMERICAN MANAGEMENT SOCIETY

## EDITORIAL STAFF

### JOURNAL & PROCEEDINGS EDITOR

Julia Teahen, Baker College

### JOURNAL BOARD OF EDITORS

Bob Ballenger, Washington and Lee University  
 Richard Barker, Consultant  
 Amanda Baugous, Augustana College  
 Jeff Fahrenwald, Rockford College  
 John Farlin, Ohio Dominican University  
 Ronald Faust, University of Evansville  
 Gideon Falk, Purdue University-Calumet  
 Michele Govekar, Ohio Northern University  
 Paul Govekar, Ohio Northern University  
 Regina Greenwood, Kettering University  
 Brian Hinrichs, Saint Xavier University  
 Peggy Houghton, Baker College  
 John Humphreys, Texas A & M University  
 Lynn Isvik, Upper Iowa University  
 Richard Leake, Luther College  
 Bill Livingston, Baker College  
 Jim Maddox, Friends University  
 Terry Maris, Ohio Northern University  
 C. R. Marshall, U. of Wisconsin-Stevens Point  
 Joseph Martelli, The University of Findlay  
 Edward Murphy, Embry Riddle Aeronautical Univ.  
 Richard Sebastian, St. Cloud State University  
 John Vinton, Baker College  
 Carolyn Wiley, Roosevelt University

### COPYRIGHT AND PERMISSION TO COPY

*The Journal of the North American Management Society* owns the copyright of all content published within it. Permission to copy JNAMS content is subject to the fair use principles of U.S. copyright law. For permission to copy JNAMS materials, contact the Journal Editor by e-mail at [julia@baker.edu](mailto:julia@baker.edu).

## Was Dale Carnegie the Father of Modern Management? 1

*C.R. Marshall and Robert E. Allen*

## The Association of Strategies and the Effects of Deployment on Organizational Operations 8

*Lee L. Hisey*

## The Impact of Organizational Capabilities, Environmental Uncertainties, and Generic Strategies on Crisis Readiness: An Empirical Examination of Retail Professionals 19

*William Crandall, John A. Parnell, and Maria Nathan*

## Evaluating Title VII Exposure in a Manufacturing Setting: A Case Study for Human Resource Management Students 33

*William R. Livingston, Michael F. Peters, and Timothy D. Johnson*

## Building Learning Communities Utilizing Team-Based Learning in an On-Line Environment 48

*Mary B. DuBois, Gyongyi Konyu-Fogel, and Valerie Wallingford*

## Guidelines for Contributors 57

---

## Was Dale Carnegie the Father of Modern Management?

C.R. Marshall, University of Wisconsin, Stevens Point

Robert E. Allen, Lindenwood University

---

**Abstract:** *As academics, we like to believe that our research leads and informs the best practice of industry. Much of what is taught in college classrooms in business and economics departments is the application of the theoretical work of our colleagues past and present. Three examples of this pattern are Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs (Malsow, 1954) Herzberg's Motivation-Hygiene theory (Herzberg, Mausnar & Snyderman, 1959) and Emotional Intelligence (Salovey & Mayer, 1990, Goleman, 1995). This paper shows that all of these theories were in the popular press years before they were discovered and studied by academics. Each of these theories is at least partially explored in Dale Carnegie's How to Win Friends and Influence People, first published in 1936.*

### INTRODUCTION

Dale Carnegie was born and grew up in the northwest Missouri town of Maryville in 1888. In 1906, at the age of eighteen, he attended Warrensburg State Teacher College in Warrensburg, Missouri. He left school prior to graduation to start a sales career. He studied at the American Academy of Dramatic Arts in New York City during 1910. Leaving acting, Mr. Carnegie started selling for Packard Car and Truck Company in 1912. Later that year, Dale Carnegie began to teach public speaking classes at the Harlem YMCA in New York City. This course was offered to business professionals and Carnegie was paid on commission (Thomas, 1936, Coffey, 2003).

In 1936, Simon and Schuster persuaded Carnegie to publish a book that was based upon his lectures (Findarticles website, 2003). This book was titled; How To Win Friends and Influence People (1936).

The book outlines a common sense approach to human relations. The philosophy of Carnegie has skeptics and converts. The skeptics believe that Carnegie was naively enthusiastic and was promoting subtle styles to manipulate other (Coffey, 2003). While his converts believe that his ideas help to improve their communications and leadership skills (dcarnegie website, 2003).

To truly appreciate Carnegie's insight, one must understand Mr. Carnegie's place in history's timeline. Fredric Taylor wrote his article "Shop Management" in 1903 and Taylor's book; Scientific Management appeared in 1911 (Wrege & Greenwood, 1991). Up to this time, most management philosophy was originating out of the engineering discipline (Marshall & Allen, 2000). The intent of management works was to identify ways that productivity could be improved, primarily through engineering concepts.

The Hawthorne Studies, which initiated the human relations movement, did not begin until 1927. Mr. Carnegie was conducting courses on 'How to Win Friends and Influence People' from 1912 to 1927, fifteen years prior to the recognized beginning of the human relations movement. Carnegie lacked academic credentialing and research accreditation for his philosophy, however, he did begin to address workplace human relationship issues prior to the official recognition of that body of knowledge.

If one looks at the concepts of how to win friends and influence people, there are several key principles that Carnegie espoused which later were to become pillars in the human relations movement. These include:

### **THE HIERARCHY OF NEEDS THEORY**

Abraham H. Maslow (1954) constructed a pyramid consisting of five need levels. The foundation level was physiological needs, which contains the basic needs of food, shelter, clothing, and sex. The second tier is the safety needs level, which addresses such issues as: security, stability, dependency, anxiety, job tenure, retirement, medical insurance, old age concerns, and the desire to organize the universe with a religion or a philosophy. The third tier is the belongingness and love level, known, as the social needs level, which contains the desire for relations with people or a desire to have a place in one's group. The social need includes both the need to receive and to give love. The fourth tier is the esteem needs level, which has two subsidiary classifications: 1.) the desire of achievement, competence and mastery; and 2.) the desire for reputation, prestige, status and fame (Maslow, 1954). The fifth and final tier is the self-actualization needs level, which is the need for an individual to be what they can be or what they must be in order to be content. This level acknowledges that individuals must be true to their own nature. Individuals display the greatest differences among themselves at this level, since each person has different perceptions of their own potential (Maslow, 1954).

Carnegie acknowledges the fact that every normal adult wants food, sleep and sexual gratification. These three needs relate directly to Maslow's physiological needs. Carnegie stated that normal people want: 1. health and preservation of life; 2. the well-being of their children; and 3. the things money will buy. These three needs relate directly to the safety level of Maslow's Hierarchy.

Next, Carnegie addresses the human need to feel important. This could be placed in Maslow's social level as reflected in the desire to have a place in one's group. This need could also be rooted in the esteem need and the human desire for achievement; prestige, and status. Finally Carnegie was a religious man who felt that humans, generally, desire life in the here after. This is most closely tied to the self-actualization level, the human desire to be all of what they can be or what they must be.

### **MOTIVATIONAL-HYGIENE THEORY**

The Motivational-Hygiene theory divides the individual and the environment into two very different parts: 1.) motivational factors, that motivate an individual's behavior; and 2.) hygiene factors, that have the potential to create dissatisfaction for the individual (Herzberg, Mausnar, & Snyderman, 1959). Initial research asked 200 engineers and accountants the simple question of; "What do people want from their jobs?" The research conclusions indicate a difference regarding what people wanted depending whether they felt good or bad about their job. Through a series of interviews, the researchers located characteristics that were consistently related to job satisfaction (feeling good about one's job) or to job dissatisfaction (feeling bad about one's job). Intrinsic factors seemed to motivate individual behavior, while extrinsic factors seemed to cause dissatisfaction. Motivational factors include: achievement, recognition, the work itself, responsibilities, and advancement. Hygiene factors include: policy and administration, supervision, interpersonal relationships, working conditions and salary (Herzberg et al., 1959). The theory suggests that motivators can lead to job satisfaction, but the lack of motivators does not lead to dissatisfaction. The lack of motivators leads to "no satisfaction" or a neutral state. The lack of acceptable hygiene factors can lead to job dissatisfaction, but the presence of

acceptable hygiene factors does not lead to job satisfaction. The presence of acceptable hygiene factors leads to “no dissatisfaction” or a neutral state. It must be noted that motivational factors contribute little to dissatisfaction and that hygiene factors contribute little to motivation (Herzberg, 1966).

In a simplistic and straightforward way Dale Carnegie had some early insight into what later became Motivational-Hygiene Theory. In part 1 of his book, Carnegie wrote three fundamental principles to provide guidance in addressing people, which were later supported by the research of Herzberg, Mausnar, and Snyderman.

**Principle 1:** *Do not criticize, condemn, or complain about/or to a worker.* Carnegie supported this statement by, recognizing the facts that criticism puts a man on the defensive and usually makes him strive to justify himself. Herzberg would classify this as a hygiene factor, which could be about poor attitudes. Generally, individuals wish to avoid unpleasant situations ( Herzberg, Mausnar, and Snyderman, 1959). Being criticized is an unpleasant situation for most people. Criticism often facilitates poor attitudes and potential job dissatisfaction.

**Principle 2:** *Give honest and sincere appreciation.* Carnegie separated false flattery from appreciation. He felt that true appreciation is from the heart out. Herzberg would classify this as a motivational factor under recognition. Humans want to be recognized as having made a contribute. Carnegie recognized that sincere appreciation and recognition of an individual or group would serve to motivate them to greater task performance.

**Principle 3:** *Arouse in the other person an eager want.* Carnegie said that people needed intrinsic motivation. They had to have the desire to perform a task. Herzberg felt that it is the positive performance of tasks that provides an individual with their desired rewards, that in turn serves to motivate the individual to do a task well ( Herzberg et al., 1959). It is from the performance of a task that an individual can get rewards to reinforce their aspirations. When the motivational factors are good, people will work using maximum energy and enthusiasm (Cryer, 1988).

## EMOTIONAL INTELLIGENCE

In the last few years Emotional Intelligence (EI) has been a hot topic in business. Daniel Goleman’s 1998 Harvard Business Review article on EI and leadership attracted more readers than any other article that HBR had ever published (Goleman, 1998, Performance Unlimited, 2003). Articles on EI have appeared in Time (Gibbs, Park & Birnbaum, 1995), Fortune (Farnham, 1996), and countless other business and popular press publications.

The first usage of the term Emotional Intelligence was in an empirical study by Mayer, DiPaolo and Salovey (1990). A formal model was laid out by Salovey and Mayer (1990) and will be discussed below. The move to the popular press happened five years later, when New York Times science writer Daniel Goleman published the book Emotional Intelligence (1995).

In defining EI, Salovey & Mayer (1990) laid out a set of emotional management abilities which includes:

- Self Awareness – recognizing an emotion as it engulfs us,
- Emotion Management – controlling reactions to emotion laden events so that our response fits the situation,

- Self motivation – directing emotions in service of a desirable goal.
- Empathy – recognizing emotions in others, and
- Relationship Management – managing the emotions of others.

Goleman (1995) defines EI as “a different way of being smart” that is distinct from cognitive intelligence. In general Goleman follows the Salovey and Mayer definition above, but includes “knowing what you are feeling, being confident about your strengths and weaknesses, and using those feelings to make sound decisions” in the idea of Emotion Management (Schmutter, 1996). A notable distinction between Salovey and Mayer’s view of EI and Goleman’s view is the relationship between Emotional Intelligence and traditional intelligence as measured by IQ. Goleman seems to view EI as a substitute for IQ while Salovey and Mayer view it as a complement. Both agree that low EI can allow emotions to short-circuit the intellect.

Dale Carnegie's book (Carnegie, 1936) was originally organized into 37 chapters, each of which ended with a related rule or principle (See Appendix A for a list of section and chapter titles, as well as the full list of Principles and Rules). The current edition omits Part 5: Letters that produced Miraculous Results and Part 6: Seven Rules For Making Your Home Life Happy. You have seen the three principles from part one of the book listed in the previous section. While many of these rules are quite general, such as Rule 2 from Part 2 of the book: Smile, a number of them can be linked fairly directly to the emotional management abilities laid out by Salovey and Mayer (1990).

As early as Chapter 1, Carnegie argues that people are emotional and not logical, that they are driven by "prejudice, pride and vanity". Examples of the need for Self Awareness include Two Gun Crowley the cop killer, who described himself as "one that would do nobody any harm", and Al Capone who thought of himself as a person who helped people have a good time. In the areas of Emotional Management and Self Motivation he advises, for example that the only way to get the best of an argument is to avoid it (Part 3, Rule 1).

The majority of the book deals with empathy and relationship management. Carnegie argues that "The only way to make anybody do anything is to make him or her want to do it." and says that you should "Arouse in the other person an eager want" (Part 1, Principle 3). You should "Make the other person feel important - and do it sincerely" (Part 2, Rule 6). Other example of empathy can be found in the advice to "Try honestly to see things from the other person's point of view" (Part 3, Rule 8) and "Be sympathetic with the other person's ideas and desires" (Part 3, Rule 9). A perusal of the list will show numerous additional examples.

## CONCLUSION

Dale Carnegie, a college dropout from Missouri, foreshadowed at least three major management theories, and beat the scholars to press with his ideas by 18 to 54 years. We do not claim that these management principles were fully formed in 1936. We are not suggesting that you throw out Maslow and Herzberg or that you replace the motivation chapter of your Organizational Behavior and Management Principles texts with a popular press book from the 1930's. What we do claim is that Dale Carnegie, and perhaps numerous other popular press writers, have had insights into management, and that the practices that they recommend are fertile ground for theoretical study in academic settings. Our role as scholars is not only the development of theory and best practice, but also the further development and codification of ideas developed by practitioners. It is important that ideas flow in both directions.

## REFERENCES

- Bennett, Amanda (1986), Who Made Iacocca Not Quite So Shy? It Was Dale Carnegie" *The Wall Street Journal*, New York, NY Jun 16, 1986; Eastern Edition, pg. 1.
- Carnegie, D. (1936), *How to Win Friends and Influence People (Seventh Printing)*.
- Coffey, Dan, (2003). *St. James Encyclopedia of Pop Culture: Dale Carnegie*. Retrieved August 19, 2003, from <http://www.findarticles.com/glep/bio>.
- Cryer, P. (1988). Insights to participants' behavior in educational games, simulations and workshops: a Catastrophe Theory application to motivation, *Simulation/Games for Learning*, 18, 161-178.
- Dale Carnegie Training. Retrieved August 19, 2003, from <http://www.dcarnegie.com.ph>
- Farnham, Alan (1996), Are You Smart Enough to Keep Your Job?, *Fortune*, Jan. 15, 1996. Vol. 133, Issue 1.
- Gibbs, Nancy, Park, Alice, Birnbaum, Jesse, The EQ Factor, *Time*. New York: Oct 2, 1995. Vol. 146, Issue 14.
- Goleman, Daniel (1995), *Emotional Intelligence*, New York: Bantam.
- Herzberg, F., Mausnar, B., & Snyderman, B. B. (1959). *The Motivation To Work*. New York: Wiley.
- Herzberg, F. (1966). *Work and The Nature of Man*. Cleveland; World.
- Marshall, C. R. & Allen, R. E. (2000). The Father of the Father of Scientific Management: What Henry R. Towne told Frederick W. Taylor. *Proceedings of the North American Management Society*.
- Maslow, A. H. (1954). *Motivation and Personality*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Mayer, J.D., DiPaolo, M.T. and Salovey P. (1990) Perceiving Affective Content in Ambiguous Visual Stimuli: A Component of Emotional Intelligence. *Journal of Personality Assessment*, 54, 772-781.
- Salovey, P & Mayer, J.D. (1990) Emotional Intelligence, *Imagination, Cognition, and Personality*, 9, 185-211.
- Schmotter, J. W. (1996), An Interview with Daniel Goleman, *Selections*; Autumn 1996, 13, 1; ABI/INFORM Global, 10-16
- Thomas, Lowell (1936) A Shortcut to Distinction, Introduction to Dale Carnegie's *How to Win Friends and Influence People*.
- Wooldridge, Adrian (2002) Everything You Want to Know, and Less (Review of *Business: The Ultimate Resource* Perseus). *Wall Street Journal*; New York, NY; Aug 30, 2002.
- Wrege, C. D. & Greenwood, R. G. (1991). *Frederick W. Taylor: The Father of Scientific Management, Myth and Reality*. New York: Irwin.

**APPENDIX 1: RULES & PRINCIPLES FROM  
HOW TO WIN FRIENDS AND INFLUENCE PEOPLE 1936  
(SEVENTH PRINTING)**

**Introduction:** A Short-Cut to Distinction - Lowell Thomas (p1)

**Preface:** How this book was written, and why - Dale Carnegie (p17)

**Part One: Fundamental Techniques in Handling People**

**1. If you want to gather honey, don't kick over the beehive.** (p29)

Principle 1. Don't criticize, condemn or complain.

**2. The Big Secret of Dealing With People** (p43)

Principle 2. Give honest and sincere appreciation.

**3. He Who Can Do This Has The Whole World With Him. He Who Cannot Walks A Lonely Way.** (p56)

Principle 3. Arouse in the other person an eager want.

**Nine Suggestions On How To Get The Most Out Of This Book** (p75)

**Part Two: Six Ways To Make People Like You** (p81)

**1. Do This And You'll Be Welcome Anywhere** (p83)

Rule 1. Become genuinely interested in other people.

**2. A Simple Way To Make A Good First Impression** (p97)

Rule 2. Smile.

**3. If You Don't Do This, You Are Headed For Trouble** (p105)

Rule 3. Remember that a person's name is to that person the sweetest and most important sound in any language.

**4. An Easy Way To Become A Good Conversationalist** (p114)

Rule 4. Be a good listener. Encourage others to talk about themselves.

**5. How To Interest People** (p126)

Rule 5. Talk in terms of the other person's interests.

**6. How To Make People Like You Instantly** (p130)

Rule 6. Make the other person feel important - and do it sincerely.

**Part Three: Twelve Ways To Win People To Your Way Of Thinking** (p147)

**1. You Can't Win An Argument** (p149)

Rule 1. The only way to get the best of an argument is to avoid it.

**2. A Sure Way Of Making Enemies - And How To Avoid It** (p157)

Rule 2. Show respect for the other person's opinions. Never say, "You're wrong."

**3. If You're Wrong, Admit It** (p171)

Rule 3. If you are wrong, admit it quickly and emphatically.

**4. The High Road To A Man's Reason** (p179)

Rule 4. Begin in a friendly way.

**5. The Secret of Socrates** (p192)

Rule 5. Get the other person saying "yes, yes" immediately.

**6. The Safety Valve In Handling Complaints** (p199)

Rule 6. Let the other person do a great deal of the talking.

**7. How To Get Cooperation** (p206)



Rule 7. Let the other person feel that the idea is his or hers.

**8. A Formula That Will Work Wonders For You (p214)**

Rule 8. Try honestly to see things from the other person's point of view.

**9. What Everybody Wants (p219)**

Rule 9. Be sympathetic with the other person's ideas and desires.

**10. An Appeal That Everybody Likes (p227)**

Rule 10. Appeal to the nobler motives.

**11. The Movies Do It. The Radio Does It. Why Don't You Do It? (p234)**

Rule 11. Dramatize your ideas.

**12. When Nothing Else Works, Try This (p238)**

Rule 12. Throw down a challenge.

**Part Four: Nine Ways To Change People Without Giving Offense Or Arousing Resentment**

**1. If You Must Find Fault, This Is The Way To Begin (p245)**

Rule 1. Begin with praise and honest appreciation.

**2. How To Criticize - And Not Be Hated (p252)**

Rule 2. Call attention to people's mistakes indirectly.

**3. Talk About Your Own Mistakes First (p254)**

Rule 3. Talk about your own mistakes before criticizing the other person.

**4. No One Likes To Take Orders (p259)**

Rule 4. Ask questions instead of giving direct orders.

**5. Let The Other Man Save His Face (p261)**

Rule 5. Let the other person save face.

**6. How To Spur Your Men On To Success (p265)**

Rule 6. Praise the slightest improvement and praise every improvement. Be "hearty in your approbation and lavish in your praise."

**7. Give The Dog A Good Name (p270)**

Rule 7. Give the other person a fine reputation to live up to.

**8. Make The Fault Seem Easy To Correct (p275)**

Rule 8. Use encouragement. Make the fault seem easy to correct.

**9. Making People Glad To Do What You Want (p279)**

Rule 9. Make the other person happy about doing the thing you suggest.

**Part 5: Letters That Produced Miraculous Results (Not in revised edition)**

**Part 6: Seven Rules For Making Your Home Life Happier (Not in revised edition)**

**1. How To Dig Your Marital Grave In The Quickest Possible Way**

Rule 1. Don't, don't nag!!!

**2. Love And Let Live**

Rule 2. Don't try to make your partner over.

**3. Do This And You'll Be Looking Up The Time-Tables To Reno**

Rule 3. Don't criticize.

**4. A Quick Way To Make Everybody Happy**

Rule 4. Give honest appreciation

**5. They Mean So Much To A Woman**

Rule 5. Pay little attentions. (The small things)

**6. If You Want To Be Happy, Don't Neglect This One**

Rule 6. Be courteous.

**7. Don't Be A "Marriage Illiterate"**

Rule 7. Read a good book on the sexual side of marriage.