





## Breast and complementary feeding in Ethiopia

Habtewold, Tesfa Dejenie; Mohammed, Shimels Hussien; Endalamaw, Aklilu; Akibu, Mohammed; Sharew, Nigussie Tadesse; Alemu, Yihun Mulugeta; Beyene, Misrak Getnet; Sisay, Tesfamichael Awoke; Birhanu, Mulugeta Molla; Islam, Md Atigul

Published in: European Journal of Nutrition

DOI: 10.1007/s00394-018-1817-8

IMPORTANT NOTE: You are advised to consult the publisher's version (publisher's PDF) if you wish to cite from it. Please check the document version below.

Document Version Final author's version (accepted by publisher, after peer review)

Publication date: 2019

Link to publication in University of Groningen/UMCG research database

Citation for published version (APA):

Habtewold, T. D., Mohammed, S. H., Endalamaw, A., Akibu, M., Sharew, N. T., Alemu, Y. M., Beyene, M. G., Sisay, T. A., Birhanu, M. M., Islam, M. A., & Tegegne, B. S. (2019). Breast and complementary feeding in Ethiopia: New national evidence from systematic review and meta-analyses of studies in the past 10 years. *European Journal of Nutrition*, *58*(7), 2565-2595. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00394-018-1817-8

#### Copyright

Other than for strictly personal use, it is not permitted to download or to forward/distribute the text or part of it without the consent of the author(s) and/or copyright holder(s), unless the work is under an open content license (like Creative Commons).

The publication may also be distributed here under the terms of Article 25fa of the Dutch Copyright Act, indicated by the "Taverne" license. More information can be found on the University of Groningen website: https://www.rug.nl/library/open-access/self-archiving-pure/taverneamendment.

Take-down policy If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Downloaded from the University of Groningen/UMCG research database (Pure): http://www.rug.nl/research/portal. For technical reasons the number of authors shown on this cover page is limited to 10 maximum.

1	Breast and complementary feeding in Ethiopia: new national evidence from systematic review and meta-
2	analyses of studies in the past 10 years
3	
4	
5	
6	Tesfa Dejenie Habtewold <sup>1,2*</sup> , Shimels Hussien Mohammed <sup>3</sup> , Aklilu Endalamaw <sup>4</sup> , Mohammed Akibu <sup>1</sup> , Nigussie
7	Tadesse Sharew <sup>1</sup> , Yihun Mulugeta Alemu <sup>5</sup> , Misrak Getnet Beyene <sup>6</sup> , Tesfamichael Awoke Sisay <sup>7</sup> , Mulugeta Molla
8	Birhanu <sup>8</sup> , Md. Atiqul Islam <sup>9</sup> , Balewgizie Sileshi Tegegne <sup>2</sup>
9	
10	
11	
12	<sup>1</sup> Department of Nursing, College of Medicine and Health Science, Debre Berhan University, Debre Berhan,
13	Ethiopia.
14	<sup>2</sup> Department of Epidemiology, University Medical Centre Groningen, University of Groningen, Groningen, The
15	Netherlands.
16	<sup>3</sup> Department of Community Nutrition, School of Nutritional Sciences and Dietetics, Tehran University of Medical
10	Sciences-International Campus (TUMS-IC), Tehran, the Islamic Republic of Iran.
18	<sup>4</sup> Department of Pediatrics and Child Health Nursing, School of Nursing, College of Medicine and Health Sciences,
19	University of Gondar, Gondar, Ethiopia.
20	<sup>5</sup> Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics, School of Public Health, College of Medicine and Health Science,
21	Bahir Dar University, Ethiopia.
22	<sup>6</sup> Ethiopian Public Health Institute, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.
23	<sup>7</sup> Department of Public Health, College of Medicine and Health Sciences, Wollo University, Dessie, Ethiopia.
24	<sup>8</sup> Department of Adult Health Nursing, School of Nursing, College of Health Sciences, Mekelle University, Mekelle,
25	Ethiopia.
26	<sup>9</sup> Department of Statistics, Shahjalal University of Science and Technology, Sylhet, Bangladesh.
27	
28	
29	
30	
31	* =Corresponding author
32	Tesfa Dejenie Habtewold
33	Email: <u>tesfadej2003@gmail.com</u>
34	ORCID: 0000-0003-4476-518X
35	Phone: +251910025860
36	P.O.BOX: 445
37	
38	
39	
40	
41	Acknowledgment
42	Our special gratitude forwarded to Sjoukje van der Werf (University of Groningen, the Netherlands) for her support
43	to develop the search strings.
44	
45	
45	
46	

47	Abstract
47	ADSIFACI

- 48 Purpose: The aim of this systematic review and meta-analysis was to provide a national estimate of breast and
  49 complementary feeding practices and its predictors in Ethiopia.
- 50 Methods: PubMed, SCOPUS, EMBASE, CINHAL, Web of Science and WHO Global Health Library electronic
- 51 databases were searched for all available literature published until April 2018. Observational studies including cross-
- 52 sectional, case-control and cohort studies were included. Newcastle-Ottawa Scale (NOS) was used to assess the
- for quality of studies. Heterogeneity of studies was quantified using Cochran's Q  $\chi^2$  statistic and Higgins's method (I<sup>2</sup>).
- A meta-analysis using a weighted inverse variance method was performed. Subgroup analysis was carried out based
   on region and study area.
- **Results:** In total, 70 studies that involved >55,000 women from nine regions and two chartered cities in Ethiopia
- 57 were included. The pooled national prevalence for timely initiation of breastfeeding (TIBF), exclusive breastfeeding
- 58 (EBF) and timely initiation of complementary feeding (TICF) was 66.5%, 60.1% and 62.5% respectively. Guidance
- and counselling on breastfeeding, vaginal delivery and health institution delivery significantly increased the odds of
- 60 TIBF and EBF. In addition, TIBF significantly associated with high EBF practice. Maternal occupational status
- 61 significantly associated with low EBF practice, but not TIBF.
- 62 **Conclusions**: Based on the WHO standard, the current breast and complementary feeding practice in Ethiopia is
- 63 good and improving. Integrated intervention is still required for further improvement and minimizing the effect of
- 64 occupational status.
- 65
- 66
- 67
- 68
- 69 Keywords: Breastfeeding, Complementary feeding, Meta-analysis, Infant Nutritional Physiological Phenomena,
- 70 Ethiopia
- 71
- 72

#### 73 Introduction

74 The World Health Organization (WHO) and the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) Innocenti Declaration 75 urges developing a national breastfeeding strategy and establishing monitoring and control system [1]. In 2017, the 76 global coverage of timely initiation of breastfeeding (TIBF), exclusive breastfeeding (EBF) and timely initiation of 77 complementary feeding (TICF) was 44%, 40% and 64.5% respectively [2,3]. A meta-analysis of demographic and 78 health surveys from 29 sub-Saharan African countries shows that the prevalence of TIBF ranges from 37.8% to 79 69.3%, EBF is 23.7% to 56.6%, predominant breastfeeding is 17.6% to 46.4% and bottle feeding is 8.17% to 30.1% 80 [4]. Based on the WHO survey of the 129 nations, only 22 nations have achieved 70% TIBF and 23 countries have 81 achieved at least 60% of EBF [2]. Generally, optimal breast and complementary feeding are high in low- and middle-82 income countries [2,3].

TIBF within 1 hour after birth and EBF until 6 months followed by appropriate complementary foods have various advantages for maternal, child and societal health [5]. Optimal breast and complementary feeding are also crucial for the achievement of three Sustainable Development Goals (SDG): improves nutrition (SDG-2), decreases child mortality and the risk of non-communicable diseases (SDG-3), and improves cognitive development and education (SDG-4) [2]. Despite these advantages, many women stop breastfeeding and switch to infant formula feeding too early. Suboptimal feeding increases the risk of morbidity and mortality up to fivefold [6]. Approximately 25 to 50% of infant mortality in developing countries occurs due to suboptimal feeding practice [7,8].

Globally, previous studies identified multiple predictors of suboptimal feeding including guidance and
counselling, smoking, residence, place of delivery, maternal educational level, maternal occupational status, income,
mother's age, mode of delivery, newborn's gender, health status of mother and newborn at delivery [9-11]. The same
factors have been reported to contribute to sub-optimal breastfeeding in Sub-Saharan Africa [12].

Ethiopia is Africa's second most populated country located in the Horn of Africa. According to the 2015
projection, the total population was 90,078,000 [13]. Ethiopia is administratively divided into nine regional states
(Afar, Amhara, Benishangul-Gumuz, Gambela, Harari, Oromia, Somali, Tigray and SNNPR) and two chartered
cities (Addis Ababa and Dire Dawa). Figure 1 shows regions and chartered cities of Ethiopia.
Fig. 1 Geographic map of Ethiopia that shows regions and chartered cities.

In Ethiopia, several studies have been conducted on breast and complementary feeding, and they identified
 multiple predictors. However, none of these studies provided a national estimate and the findings are inconsistent.

101	Since 2000, the Ethiopian Demographic and Health Survey has been conducted every 5 years and provided a
102	national estimate on breast and complementary feeding; however, it does not provide evidence on the associated
103	factors. So far, one meta-analysis [14] was done in Ethiopia aimed to study the prevalence of TIBF and its
104	association with the place of residence and delivery. The present study has the following aims: (1) to provide a
105	national pooled estimate on the prevalence of TIBF, EBF and TICF separately; (2) to conduct a comprehensive
106	systematic review on various associated factors of TIBF, EBF and complementary feeding; (3) developing/proposing
107	a multilevel theoretical model in the context of Ethiopian population; (4) to conduct meta-analysis on the association
108	between TIBF and maternal occupational status, guidance and counselling on breastfeeding, place of delivery and
109	mode of delivery; and (5) to conduct meta-analysis on the association between EBF and maternal occupational
110	status, guidance and counselling on breastfeeding, place of delivery, mode of delivery and TIBF. We hypothesized
111	(1) guidance and counselling on breastfeeding, health institution delivery and vaginal delivery increases TIBF and
112	EBF; (2) TIBF increase EBF; and (3) Being government employed reduce TIBF and EBF.
113	
114	
115	
116	
117	
118	
119	
120	
121	
122	
123	
124	
125	
126	
127	
128	

#### 129 Methods

#### 130 Protocol registration and publication

- 131 The protocol has been registered in the International Prospective Register of Systematic Reviews (PROSPERO)
- 132 (<u>http://www.crd.york.ac.uk/PROSPERO/display\_record.asp?ID=CRD42017056768</u>) and published [15].

#### 133 Databases searching

- 134 PubMed, SCOPUS, EMBASE, CINHAL, Web of Science and WHO Global Health Library databases were searched
- 135 for all available literature. Additional studies were also identified from the reference lists of identified articles and
- 136 gray literature. Search string was constructed for each database (Supplementary file 1).

#### 137 Inclusion and exclusion criteria

**138** Studies that meet the following criteria were included: (1) observational studies including cross-sectional, case-

139 control and cohort studies; (2) studies reported the prevalence and/or associated factor(s) of TIBF or EBF or TICF;

140 (3) studies conducted in Ethiopia; and (4) studies that ascertained outcomes based on WHO [16] infant and young

141 child feeding (IYCF) indicators definitions. The search was further limited to studies published in English from

- 142 October 2000 to April 2018. Commentaries, anonymous reports, letters, protocols, systematic reviews, program
- 143 evaluation reports, duplicate studies, editorials, qualitative studies, and abstracts without full-text were excluded. In
- addition, studies with infants who were preterm, low birth weight, in neonatal intensive care unit and mothers or
- 145 infants with known medical problems such as HIV/AIDS were excluded.

#### 146 Study screening and selection

147 Firstly, all studies retrieved from all databases were exported to RefWorks version 2.0 web-based citation manager 148 and, close and exact duplicates were deleted. Secondly, all independent studies were exported to Microsoft Excel 149 spreadsheet. Thirdly, two independent reviewers' (TD and BS) screened the title and abstract of each study followed 150 by agreement test using Cohen's kappa coefficient. The kappa coefficient was 0.76 with an asymptotic standard error 151 of 0.05 indicating the agreement between the two reviewers' was 'good'. Finally, full-text review was performed and 152 the following data were extracted: first name of author, year of publication, region, study area, study design, study 153 population, number of respondents, data collection method, prevalence, and significantly associated factors with its 154 respective odds ratio (OR) and 95% confidence interval (CI).

#### 156 Quality and validity of risk assessment

Newcastle-Ottawa Scale (NOS) [17] was used to assess the quality of studies. The following items were included to evaluate studies: (1) selection, (2) comparability, and (3) the ascertainment of the outcome. NOS has a good interrater reliability and validity [18]. We ensured that the study population of all included studies was randomly chosen from the sampling frame and all NOS criteria satisfactorily fulfilled.

#### 161 Statistical analysis

162 A meta-analysis using a weighted inverse variance method was performed to calculate the pooled national

163 prevalence rate of breast and complementary feeding and the odds ratio of associated factors. To adjust the effect of

high or low prevalence studies on the pooled estimate, the arc-sine transformation was used [19]. Publication bias

165 was checked through visual inspection of Funnel plot asymmetry and Egger's regression test [20]. Heterogeneity of

studies was quantified using the significance level of Cochran's Q  $\chi^2$  statistic and Higgins's method where I<sup>2</sup> statistic

167 >80% (reference value) indicating substantial heterogeneity [15]. Given the limitations of these methods and lack of

168 consensus on the exact cut-off value to confirm heterogeneity in different studies [21,22], however, homogeneity of

studies rigorously checked in terms of study setting, study population, study design, data collection method,

170 sampling technique and statistical analysis [23]. A separate forest plot was constructed for each meta-analysed

variable. The data were entered using SPSS version 23 and meta-analysed using 'meta' and 'metafor' packages in R

172 software version 3.4.2. Subgroup analysis was carried out based on region (Amhara region versus other regions) and

173 study area (rural, urban, rural and urban).

#### 174 Data synthesis and reporting

175 Firstly, a meta-analysis of prevalence was done for TIBF, EBF and TICF separately. Secondly, all previously

176 reported significantly associated factors were collected and categorized into four levels using the multilevel

theoretical model adapted from previous systematic reviews [24,25]. Finally, a meta-analysis was done for selected

178 (level 1 and level 2) associated factors; to increase the power, all studies that reported significant and non-significant

179 association were included in the meta-analysis. Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis

180 (PRISMA) 2009 statement [26,27] and A MeaSurement Tool to Assess Systematic Reviews (AMSTAR 2)[28] were

used to report this systematic review and meta-analysis.

183 Results

184 Search results

185 We obtained 169 articles from PubMed search, 24 articles from EMBASE, 200 articles from Web of Science, 85 186 articles from SCOPUS and 5 articles from others (CINHAL and WHO Global Health Library). Forty-nine additional 187 articles were found through a manual search of cross-references. After removing duplicates and screening of titles 188 and articles, 83 studies were selected for full-text review. Eleven primary studies on late initiation of breastfeeding, 189 duration/cessation of exclusive breastfeeding, early initiation of complementary feeding, prelacteal feeding and breastfeeding measurements tools [29-39] and two project reviews [40,41] were excluded from the final analysis. 190 191 These articles were published between the years 2007 and 2016. Seven studies were conducted in Amhara region 192 [32-38], two studies in Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples' Region (SNNPR) [30,31], one study in Oromia 193 region [29] and one study in Amhara, Oromia, SNNPR and Tigray regions [38]. Two studies have used EDHS-based 194 data[32,34], eight studies were conducted in urban and rural setting, 10 studies were interviewer administered and 195 one study was prospective study [34]. Detailed explanations of excluded studies presented in Supplementary file 2. 196 Finally, 70 articles published between years 2009 and 2018 were included and used for meta-analysis. The PRISMA 197 flow diagram of literature screening and selection process is shown in Fig. 2. 198 Fig. 2 PRISMA flow diagram of literature screening and selection process; "n" in each stage represents the total 199 number of studies that fulfilled a particular criterion (Note: There are studies reported more than one outcome

200 indicator)

#### 201 Timely initiation of breastfeeding (TIBF)

Among the 70 included studies, 45 studies reported the prevalence of TIBF with a total of 47,858 individuals.

203 Seventeen studies conducted in Amhara region, nine in SNNPR, 7 studies in Oromia, and 9 studies in other regions,

such as Tigray, Addis Ababa, Harari and Afar. Two studies [42,43] were nationally conducted and one study [44]

was conducted in SNNPR, Oromia and Amhara regions. Regarding setting, 11 studies were conducted in a rural, 17

in urban and 17 in both urban and rural. Furthermore, the detailed characteristics of included studies presented in

207 Tables 1.

The highest prevalence (93.3%, 95% CI 88.4 to 96.6%) was reported in Oromia region [70] and the lowest (39.6%,
95% CI 34.7 to 44.7%) was reported in SNNPR [76]. The national prevalence of TIBF was 66.5% (95% CI 62.1%
to 70.8%) (Fig. 3).

Fig. 3 Forest plot of the national prevalence of TIBF with sample size, 95% confidence interval, weight and test for heterogeneity. The horizontal line represents confidence interval, the large polygon represent a pooled estimate from a random effects model, the small polygon represents a pooled estimate form the fixed effects model. Each box and its size represent the weight of the sample size. The overall pooled estimate was presented in the last line (bold color)

The subgroup analysis based on study area showed that the pooled prevalence was 62.3% (95% CI 52.9 to 71.3%) in rural, 74.5% (95% CI 67.6 to 80.9%) urban and 60.7% (95% CI 55.2 to 66.1%) both rural and urban. The subgroup analysis based on region depicted that the prevalence was 68.2% (95% CI 59.9 to 76.0%) in Amhara region and 65.4% (95% CI 60.2 to 70.5%) in other regions. Subgroup analysis based on region was repeated after excluding two national studies [42,43] and one study [44] conducted in SNNPR, Oromia and Amhara region; the prevalence remained high in Amhara region.

Nineteen studies reported 18 factors that significantly associated with TIBF. Based on a model built by
previous meta-analysis [24,25], these factors were categorized into four levels. The most commonly reported
predictors were mothers' knowledge of TIBF, guidance and counselling on breastfeeding, place of delivery, mode of
delivery and place of residence (table 2).

225 In order to estimate the pooled effect, a meta-analysis was carried out on the association between TIBF and 226 occupational status (government employed versus unemployed), guidance and counselling on breastfeeding ('yes' 227 versus 'no'), place of delivery (health institution versus home) and mode of delivery (vaginal versus cesarean 228 section). The pooled odds ratio (OR) of TIBF for women who were government employed was 0.82 (95% CI 0.59 to 229 1.13, p = 0.22, Fig. 4) [42,51,58,60,61,66,77], counseled 1.96 (95 % CI 1.18 to 3.26, p = 0.01, Supplementary Fig. 1) 230 [56,58-61,68], delivered at health institution 1.76 (95% CI 1.15 to 2.71, p = 0.01, Supplementary Fig. 2) [42,51,56-231 59,61,62,64-66,68,77,78] and delivered vaginally 3.35 (95% CI 1.94 to 5.79, p <.0001, Supplementary Fig. 3) 232 [42,51,57-59,61,66-68].

Fig. 4 Forest plot of the unadjusted odds ratios with corresponding 95% CIs of studies on the association of maternal
 occupational status and TIBF. The horizontal line represents the confidence interval, the box and its size in the

middle of the horizontal line represent the weight of sample size. The polygon represents the pooled odds ratio. The
 reference category is 'Nonemployed'. TIBF=timely initiation of breastfeeding; LIBF=late initiation of breastfeeding;
 REM=random effects model

## 238 Exclusive breastfeeding (EBF)

Out of 70 included studies, 44 studies reported the prevalence of EBF with a total of 25,816 participants. Seventeen studies conducted in Amhara region, 12 in SNNPR, five studies in Oromia and eight studies in other regions, such as Tigray, Addis Ababa, Harari and Afar. Two studies were nationally conducted [43,45]. Based on setting, 10 studies were conducted in a rural, 17 in urban and 17 in both rural and urban. Detailed characteristics of included studies presented in Tables 3.

The highest prevalence (87.8%, 95% CI 79.2 to 93.7%) was reported in Oromia region [72] and lowest
(29.3%, 95% CI 25.8 to 33.0%) prevalence in Addis Ababa [75]. The national prevalence of EBF was 60.1% (95%
CI 55.5% to 64.6%) (Fig. 5).

Fig. 5 Forest plot of the national prevalence of EBF with sample size, 95% confidence interval, weight and test for heterogeneity. The horizontal line represents confidence interval, the large polygon represent a pooled estimate from a random effects model, the small polygon represents a pooled estimate form the fixed effects model. Each box and its size represent the weight of the sample size. The overall pooled estimate was presented in the last line (bold color)

The subgroup analysis based on study area showed that the prevalence was 68.8% (95% CI 60.8 to 76.3%)

252 in rural, 54.9% (95% CI 47.5 to 62.3%) urban and 60.0% (95% CI 52.3 to 67.3%) both rural and urban area.

253 Subgroup analysis based on region depicted that the prevalence was 58.6% (95% CI 51.3 to 65.8%) in Amhara

region and 61% (95% CI 54.8 to 67.0) in other regions. Subgroup analysis based on region was repeated after

excluding two national studies [43,45]; the prevalence remained low in Amhara region.

256 Thirty-two studies reported 26 factors that significantly associated with EBF. Similar to TIBF, these factors
257 were categorized into four levels. The most commonly reported predictors were maternal occupational status,

258 mothers' knowledge on exclusive breastfeeding, guidance and counselling on breastfeeding, timely initiation of

breastfeeding, antenatal care follow-up, household income and age of newborn (table 4).

260 Meta-analysis was carried out on the association between EBF and mode of delivery (vaginal versus
 261 cesarean section), occupational status (government employed versus unemployed), guidance and counselling on

breastfeeding ('yes' versus 'no'), place of delivery (health institution versus home) and TIBF (within one hour versus

- after 1 hour) to estimate the pooled effect on EBF. The pooled odds ratio (OR) of EBF for women who delivered
- vaginally was 1.81 (95% CI 1.19 to 2.77, p =0.006, Fig. 6) [50,51,73,75,81,82,85,88,92,96], government employed
- 265 0.60 (95% CI 0.40 to 0.91, p = 0.02, Supplementary Fig. 4) [45,51,73,80,81,85-88,92,93,96,100], counselled 2.29
- 266 (95 % CI 1.56 to 3.34, p < 0.001, Supplementary Fig. 5) [68,73,75,81,82,85-88,90,99], delivered at health institution
- 267 2.33 (95% CI 1.82 to 2.98, p < 0.001, Supplementary Fig. 6) [48,68,73,75,80-82,85,87-92,95-99] and initiated
- 268 breastfeeding within one hour 2.02 (95% CI 1.46 to 2.79, p < 0.001, Supplementary Fig. 7) [47,51,81,83,84,89-
- **269** 91,97-99].
- Fig. 6 Forest plot of the unadjusted odds ratios with corresponding 95% CIs of studies on the association of mode of
  delivery and EBF. The horizontal line represents the confidence interval, the box and its size in the middle of the
  horizontal line represent the weight of sample size. The polygon represents the pooled odds ratio. The reference
  category is 'CS'. EBF=exclusive breastfeeding; NEBF=non-exclusive breastfeeding; REM=random effects model;
- 274 CS=Caesarean section

#### 275 Complementary feeding

From 70 selected studies, 21 studies reported the prevalence of timely initiation of complementary feeding (TICF)
with 8,644 individuals. Six studies conducted in Amhara region, five in SNNPR, three studies in Oromia, three
studies in Tigray and three studies in Harari and Benishangul-Gumuz. One study [43] was nationally conducted.

- 279 Based on place of residence, five studies were conducted in a rural, eight in urban and eight in both rural and urban.
- 280 Detailed characteristics of included studies presented in Tables 5.
- 281 The highest prevalence (86.2%, 95% CI 82.5 to 89.5%) was reported in Amhara region [111] and lowest
  282 (34.3%, 95% CI 30.3 to 38.4) in SNNPR [76]. The national prevalence of TICF was 62.5% (95% CI 56.6% to
  283 68.2%) (Fig. 7).
- Fig. 7 Forest plot of the national prevalence of TICF with sample size, 95% confidence interval, weight and test for heterogeneity. The horizontal line represents confidence interval, the large polygon represent a pooled estimate from a random effects model, the small polygon represents a pooled estimate form-from the fixed effects model. Each box and its size represent the weight of the sample size. The overall pooled estimate was presented in the last line (bold color)

289 The subgroup analysis based on study area showed that the prevalence was 54.8% (95% CI 36.5 to 72.5%)

290 in rural, 64.9% (95% CI 57.6 to 71.9%) urban and 63.8% (95% CI 54.3 to 72.8%) both rural and urban. Subgroup

analysis based on region depicted that the prevalence was 67.8% (95% CI 57.2 to 77.6%) in Amhara region and

292 60.2% (95% CI 53.0 to 67.1%) in other regions. Subgroup analysis based on region was repeated after excluding one

- 293 national study [43]; the prevalence remained high in Amhara region.
- Fourteen studies reported 17 significantly associated factors of complementary feeding and categorized intofour levels using the aforementioned method (table 6).

#### 296 Summary of prevalence estimates

Table 7 shows the summary of number of <u>people and</u> studies in each region/city and prevalence estimates (i.e.
national, regional and areal) of each infant and young child feeding indicator. Nearly half of the studies on each
infant and young child feeding indicator conducted in Amhara region. The prevalence of TIBF, EBF and TICF was
66.5%, 60.1% and 62.5 respectively.

#### 301 Quality check, heterogeneity and publication bias

302 All the included studies meet a reasonably acceptable quality level. Notably, high  $I^2$  value and a significant 303 Cochran's Q  $\chi^2$  statistical test was observed in the meta-analysis of prevalence estimate and odds ratio respectively. 304 Firstly, included studies were rigorously checked for their study design, data collection technique, outcome 305 definition, statistical analysis, study setting, publication year and study population [23]. Secondly, the prevalence 306 was transformed using the arcsine square root to adjust the influence of studies that reported high or low prevalence 307 estimate. Thirdly, stratification analysis was done based on quartile of the total sample size of included studies, study 308 area and region. However, there was no major change in the  $I^2$  value. Given the absence of a single  $I^2$  cut-off value 309 for deciding on heterogeneity in different studies [21,22] and lack of changes after the above-mentioned measures, a 310 meta-analysis was done based on the reviewer's judgment. Finally, the interpretation was done based on the random-311 effects model.

- $\label{eq:Regarding meta-analysis of the odds ratio, based on I^2 value, homogeneity of studies was reasonably good.$
- 313 Given the limitation of Cochran's Q  $\chi^2$  statistical test when the number of studies is small [112] and lack of
- substantial heterogeneity based on reviewers' qualitative evaluation, a meta-analysis was done as well. Following a

315	visual inspection of a funnel plot and Egger's statistical test for asymmetry, significant publication bias was not
316	observed among included studies.
317	Time-trend analysis
318	The prevalence of TIBF from 2011 to 2018 was steady. The prevalence of both EBF and complementary feeding
319	have been increasing substantially since 2009 (Fig. 8).
320	Fig. 8 Time-trend analysis of timely initiation of breastfeeding (A), exclusive breastfeeding (B) and timely initiation
321	of complementary feeding (3). Red mark indicates the individual studies. The blue line represents the average point
322	estimate (middle) and their 95% confidence band (lower and upper)
323	
525	
324	
325	
326	
327	
328	
329	
330	
331	
332	
333	
334	
335	
336	
337	
338	
339	
340	

#### 341 Discussion

347

This is the most comprehensive systematic review and meta-analysis to date and the first of its kind that involving
>55,000 participants from Ethiopia. The national prevalence of timely initiation of breastfeeding (TIBF), exclusive
breastfeeding (EBF) and timely initiation of complementary feeding (TICF) was 66.5%, 60.1% and 62.5%
respectively. Guidance and counselling on breastfeeding, mode of delivery and place of delivery significantly
associated with high odds of TIBF and EBF. TIBF significantly associated with low odds of EBF. Maternal

occupational status (being employed) significantly associated with low odds of EBF, but not TIBF.

348 According to the World Health Organization (WHO) standard [113], the nationwide practice of TIBF and 349 EBF in Ethiopia is 'good' (i.e., 50 to 89%) whereas TICF is 'fair' (i.e., 60 to 79%). This is novel given only 22 out of 350 129 nations achieved 70% in TIBF and 23 out of 129 nations achieved 60% in EBF [2]. The prevalence rate of TIBF 351 in Ethiopia is equivalent with the recent estimate in Zambia, Sudan, Iran, United Kingdom, Uzbekistan, Lesotho, 352 Madagascar and Ukraine [114,115]. The prevalence of EBF is equivalent with Uganda, Zambia, Bolivia, Peru and 353 Cambodia [115]. On the other hand, the current finding is 2 to 3 times higher compared to the recent estimate of 53 354 WHO European Region member countries where the rate of TIBF and EBF was 43% and 23% respectively [116]. 355 This finding also higher than the prevalence of TIBF (34.3%) and EBF (20.5%) in Middle East countries (Saudi 356 Arabia, Iran, Egypt, Turkey, Kuwait, the United Arab Emirates, Qatar, Lebanon, and Syria) [117]. The prevalence of 357 TICF in Ethiopia was the same as the recent global estimate [3], but on the other hand, it was lower than the 358 prevalence rate in five European Union countries (Germany, Belgium, Poland, Italy and Spain) [118] and two South 359 Asian countries (Bangladesh and Nepal) [119] where 87% and approximately 71% of infants receiving 360 complementary feeding by 6 to 8 months.

361 In this study, health institution delivery, counselling on breastfeeding and vaginal delivery significantly 362 increased the odds of TIBF and EBF. This is in agreement with an international study from 57 nations [120], WHO 363 survey [121], systematic review and meta-analysis [122] and a prospective cohort study in North America [123]. 364 Additionally, maternal employment status and TIBF significantly associated with EBF as concluded by previous 365 studies in Africa, Middle East and Europe [124-126]. On the other hand, recent studies in Ireland and UK [114], and 366 Canada [127] reveals that home delivery significantly increased the odds of TIBF and EBF. Another study in Central 367 America showed that mode of delivery does not affect TIBF and EBF [128]. This inconsistency may be due to the 368 difference in socio-economic status and health care services. In our study, maternal employment status not

significantly reduced TIBF. This non-significant result may be due to the small number of studies included in themeta-analysis.

371 All previously identified predictors of breast and complementary feeding were carefully reviewed and a 372 hierarchical theoretical model was developed. The model would be helpful for future researchers to develop a priori 373 hypothesis. We noticed all the included studies have no prior hypothesis about a specific variable and researchers 374 just included all studied variables into a model and checked the association with the outcome. This may create 375 overestimation of the model and may bias the interpretation of results. In addition, primary health care workers may 376 have faced difficulty on the prioritization of factors for intervention as evidenced by the low coverage of breast and 377 complementary feeding although the government implementing several programs, such as Baby-friendly Hospital 378 Initiative programme (BF-HIP) and health extension package. Thus, the proposed model can also be used as a 379 framework for prioritization of community problems. Moreover, Ethiopia is not included in the current WHO 380 evaluation surveys [2,121] which may be due to the unavailability of updated data; therefore, this finding may be 381 useful for next WHO international surveys.

This study has limitations. First, almost all included studies are cross-sectional which may influence the strength of evidence; however, this can be compensated by a large sample of selected studies <u>which could increases</u> the power of our analyses. Second, high heterogeneity was detected based on the conventional method; therefore, readers should interpret the result cautiously. Third, the risk of reporting bias may be added due to exclusion of studies with preterm newborn or known maternal diseases. Fourth, even though studies were conducted in all regions and cities, some regions/cities may be over- or under-represented. Finally, the pooled effect size was not adjusted for the size of the sampling frame.

## 389 Conclusions and future directions

TIBF, EBF and TICF practices were promising and improving compared to the previous years as revealed in the
time-trend analysis. Occupational status (being government employed) was a barrier to optimal breastfeeding
although not significant for TIBF. Counselling on breastfeeding, health institution delivery and vaginal delivery were
facilitators of TIBF and EBF. Moreover, TIBF was a facilitator for EBF. Based on the time-trend analysis, the
coverage has been increasing from year-to-year.

To further increase the coverage and minimize barriers of optimal IYCF, the government should implement the global breastfeeding collective calls [2] including increasing fund, endorse workplace breastfeeding policies and

- 397 fulfill necessary facilities, improve access to skilled breastfeeding counselling and encourage community networks.
- 398 Further meta-analysis based on (inter)national studies on other IYCF indicators and associated factors other than
- 399 currently studied is required to conclude whether they are facilitator or inhibitor of optimal breast and
- 400 complementary feeding. Moreover, case-control, cohort, and randomized control trial studies on breast and
- 401 complementary feeding in Ethiopia would be relevant which can provide a strong evidence. So far unlike
- 402 institutional-, demographic- and health-related factors, behavioural factors are not studied very well yet. Therefore,
- 403 further studies shall give due emphasis to those factors.

## 404 Contributorship statement

405 Tesfa Dejenie conceived and designed the study. Tesfa Dejenie and Balewgizie Sileshi screening articles, extracted

- the data and carried out the statistical analysis. All authors contributed for writing and revising the manuscript. All
- 407 the authors read the manuscript and have given the final approval for publication.

#### 408 Data sharing statement

All the data used in this systematic review and meta-analysis were included in the main documents and as asupplementary file.

#### 411 Funding statement

412 This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial or not-for-profit sectors.

## 413 Conflict of interest

414 The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

- 416
- 417
- 418
- 419
- 420
- 421

## 422 References

423 1. United Nations Children's Fund (1990) Innocenti Declaration on the protection, promotion and support of breastfeeding 1990. UNICEF homepage. http://www.unicef.org/programme/breastfeeding/innocenti.htm. 424 425 Accessed 1 January 2017 426 2. World Health Organization (2017) Babies and mothers worldwide failed by lack of investment in 427 breastfeeding. Saudi Med J 38:974-975. 428 3. White JM, Bégin F, Kumapley R, Murray C, Krasevec J (2017) Complementary feeding practices: Current global and regional estimates. Matern Child Nutr. https://doi.org/10.1111/mcn.12505 429 430 4. Issaka AI, Agho KE, Renzaho AM (2017) Prevalence of key breastfeeding indicators in 29 sub-Saharan 431 African countries: a meta-analysis of demographic and health surveys (2010-2015). BMJ open 7:e014145. 432 5. Rollins NC, Bhandari N, Hajeebhoy N, Horton S, Lutter CK, Martines JC, et al (2016) Why invest, and 433 what it will take to improve breastfeeding practices? Lancet 87:491-504. 434 6. Ogbo FA, Page A, Idoko J, Claudio F, Agho KE (2016) Diarrhoea and Suboptimal Feeding Practices in Nigeria: Evidence from the National Household Surveys. Paediatr Perinat Epidemiol 30:346-355. 435 436 7. Begum K, Dewey KG (2010) Impact of early initiation of exclusive breastfeeding on newborn deaths. 437 POPLINE.https://www.popline.org/node/562148. Accessed 1 January 2017 438 World Health Organization (2011) Exclusive breastfeeding for six months best for babies everywhere. 8. 439 WHO updates. http://www.who.int/mediacentre/news/statements/2011/breastfeeding\_20110115/en/. 440 Accessed 23 December 2017 441 Sharma IK, Byrne A (2016) Early initiation of breastfeeding: a systematic literature review of factors and 9. 442 barriers in South Asia. Int Breastfeed J 11:17: eCollection 2016. 443 10. Oakley LL, Renfrew MJ, Kurinczuk JJ, Quigley MA (2013) Factors associated with breastfeeding in 444 England: an analysis by primary care trust. BMJ Open 3:e002765. 445 11. Santana GS, Giugliani ERJ, Vieira TdO, Vieira GO (2017) Factors associated with breastfeeding maintenance for 12 months or more: a systematic review. J Pediatr. 446 447 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jped.2017.06.013 448 12. Yalcin SS, Berde AS, Yalcin S (2016) Determinants of Exclusive Breast Feeding in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Multilevel Approach. Paediatr Perinat Epidemiol 30:439-449. 449 450 13. Thomas B (2015) Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia. http://www.citypopulation.de/Ethiopia.html. 451 Accessed 29 April 2018 452 14. Alebel A, Dejenu G, Mullu G, Abebe N, Gualu T, Eshetie S (2017) Timely initiation of breastfeeding and 453 its association with birth place in Ethiopia: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Int Breastfeed J 454 12:44:eCollection 2017. 455 15. Habtewold TD, Islam MA, Sharew NT, Mohammed SH, Birhanu MM, Tegegne BS (2017) SystEmatic 456 review and meta-aNAlysis of infanT and young child feeding Practices (ENAT-P) in Ethiopia: protocol. 457 BMJ Open 7:e017437-2017-017437. 458 16. World Health Organization (2008) Indicators for assessing infant and young child feeding practices: part 1: 459 definitions: conclusions of a consensus meeting held 6-8 November 2007 in Washington DC, USA. WHO. http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/10665/43895/1/9789241596664\_eng.pdf. Accessed 20 August 2016 460

461 462 463	17.	Peterson J, Welch V, Losos M, Tugwell P (2011) The Newcastle-Ottawa scale (NOS) for assessing the quality of nonrandomised studies in meta-analyses. The Ottawa Hospital. http://www.ohri.ca/programs/clinical_epidemiology/oxford.asp. Accessed 20 August 2016
464 465 466	18.	Hartling L, Hamm M, Milne A, Vandermeer B, Santaguida PL, Ansari M, et al (2012) Validity and Inter- Rater Reliability Testing of Quality Assessment Instruments. Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality (US). https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmedhealth/PMH0077153/. Accessed 20 August 2016
467 468	19.	Barendregt JJ, Doi SA, Lee YY, Norman RE, Vos T (2013) Meta-analysis of prevalence. J Epidemiol Community Health 67:974-978.
469 470	20.	Egger M, Davey Smith G, Schneider M, Minder C (1997) Bias in meta-analysis detected by a simple, graphical test. BMJ 315:629-634.
471 472	21.	Borenstein M, Higgins J, Hedges LV, Rothstein HR (2017) Basics of meta-analysis: I2 is not an absolute measure of heterogeneity. Res Synth Methods 8:5-18.
473 474	22.	von Hippel PT (2015) The heterogeneity statistic I 2 can be biased in small meta-analyses. BMC Med Res Methodol 15:35.
475 476	23.	Melsen W, Bootsma M, Rovers M, Bonten M (2014) The effects of clinical and statistical heterogeneity on the predictive values of results from meta-analyses. Clin Microbiol Infect 20:123-129.
477 478 479	24.	Esteves TMB, Daumas RP, Oliveira, Maria Inês Couto de, Andrade, Carlos Augusto de Ferreira de, Leite IC (2014) Factors associated to breastfeeding in the first hour of life: systematic review. Rev Saude Publica 48: 697-708.
480 481	25.	Boccolini CS, Carvalho MLd, Oliveira, Maria Inês Couto de (2015) Factors associated with exclusive breastfeeding in the first six months of life in Brazil: a systematic review. Rev Saude Publica 49:91.
482 483	26.	Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG, PRISMA GROUP (2009) Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. J Clin Epidemiol 62:1006-1012.
484 485	27.	Beller EM, Glasziou PP, Altman DG, Hopewell S, Bastian H, Chalmers I, et al (2013) PRISMA for abstracts: reporting systematic reviews in journal and conference abstracts. PLoS Med 10:e1001419.
486 487 488	28.	Shea BJ, Reeves BC, Wells G, Thuku M, Hamel C, Moran J, et al (2017) AMSTAR 2: a critical appraisal tool for systematic reviews that include randomised or non-randomised studies of healthcare interventions, or both. BMJ 358: j4008. <u>https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.j4008</u>
489 490 491	29.	Deme GG, Bekele SA, Argaw MD, Berhane Y (2015) Factors Associated with Early Initiation of Complementary Feeding in Bishoftu Town, Oromia, Ethiopia. Open Access Libr J 2: e1949. http://dx.doi.org/10.4236/oalib.1101949
492 493 494 495	30.	Abeshu MA, Adish A, Haki GD, Lelisa A, Geleta B (2016) Assessment of Caregiver's Knowledge, Complementary Feeding Practices, and Adequacy of Nutrient Intake from Homemade Foods for Children of 6-23 Months in Food Insecure Woredas of Wolayita Zone, Ethiopia. Front Nutr 3: 32. <u>https://doi.org/10.3389/fnut.2016.00032</u>
496 497 498	31.	Kasahun AW, Wako WG, Gebere MW, Neima GH (2016) Predictors of exclusive breastfeeding duration among 6–12 month aged children in gurage zone, South Ethiopia: a survival analysis. Int Breastfeed J 12: 20:eCollection 2016. <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/s13006-017-0107-z</u>

- 499 32. Tariku A, Biks GA, Wassie MM, Gebeyehu A, Getie AA (2016) Factors associated with prelacteal feeding
   500 in the rural population of northwest Ethiopia: a community cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeed J
   501 11:14:eCollection 2016. <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/s13006-016-0074-9</u>.
- 33. Bililign N, Kumsa H, Mulugeta M, Sisay Y (2016) Factors associated with prelacteal feeding in North
   Eastern Ethiopia: A community based cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 11:13:eCollection 2016.
- 34. Biks GA, Berhane Y, Worku A, Gete YK (2015) Exclusive breast feeding is the strongest predictor of infant survival in Northwest Ethiopia: a longitudinal study. J Health Popul Nutr 34:9.
   <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/s41043-015-0007-z</u>.
- 507 35. Yeneabat T, Belachew T, Haile M (2014) Determinants of cessation of exclusive breastfeeding in Ankesha
   508 Guagusa Woreda, Awi Zone, Northwest Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. BMC Pregnancy Childbirth 14:
   509 262. <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2393-14-262</u>.
- 510 36. Rogers NL, Abdi J, Moore D, Nd'iangui S, Smith LJ, Carlson AJ, et al (2011) Colostrum avoidance,
  511 prelacteal feeding and late breast-feeding initiation in rural Northern Ethiopia. Public Health Nutr 14:2029512 2036.
- 513 37. Legesse M, Demena M, Mesfin F, Haile D (2014) Prelacteal feeding practices and associated factors among
  514 mothers of children aged less than 24 months in Raya Kobo district, North Eastern Ethiopia: a cross515 sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 9:189. eCollection 2014.
- 516 38. Salasibew MM, Dinsa G, Berhanu D, Filteau S, Marchant T (2015) Measurement of delayed bathing and
  517 early initiation of breastfeeding: a cross-sectional survey exploring experiences of data collectors in
  518 Ethiopia. BMC Pediatr 15:35. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12887-015-0350-7.
- 519 39. Salasibew MM, Filteau S, Marchant T (2014) Measurement of breastfeeding initiation: Ethiopian mothers' perception about survey questions assessing early initiation of breastfeeding. Int Breastfeed J
   521 9:13.eCollection 2014.
- 40. Abeshu MA, Lelisa A, Geleta B (2016) Complementary Feeding: Review of Recommendations, Feeding
   Practices, and Adequacy of Homemade Complementary Food Preparations in Developing Countries Lessons from Ethiopia. Front Nutr 3:41:eCollection 2016
- 41. Henry CJ, Whiting SJ, Regassa N (2015) Complementary feeding practices among infant and young
  children in Southern Ethiopia: Review of the findings from a Canada-Ethiopia project. J Agric Sci 7:29.
  http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/jas.v7n10p29
- Lakew Y, Tabar L, Haile D (2015) Socio-medical determinants of timely breastfeeding initiation in
   Ethiopia: Evidence from the 2011 nationwide Demographic and Health Survey. Int Breastfeed J
   10:24:eCollection 2015.
- 531 43. Disha A, Rawat R, Subandoro A, Menon P (2012) Infant and young child feeding (IYCF) practices in
  532 Ethiopia and Zambia and their association with child nutrition: analysis of demographic and health survey
  533 data. African Journal of Food, Agriculture, Nutrition and Development 12:5895-5914.
- 44. Horii N, Guyon AB, Quinn VJ (2011) Determinants of delayed initiation of breastfeeding in rural Ethiopia:
   programmatic implications. Food Nutr Bull 32:94-102.
- 45. Alemayehu T, Haidar J, Habte D (2009) Determinants of exclusive breastfeeding practices in Ethiopia.
  Ethiop.J Health Dev 23:12-18.
- 538 46. Derso T, Biks GA, Tariku A, Tebeje NB, Gizaw Z, Muchie KF, et al (2017) Correlates of early neonatal feeding practice in Dabat HDSS site, northwest Ethiopia. Int Breastfeed J 12:25:eCollection 2017.

540 541 542	47.	Tariku A, Alemu K, Gizaw Z, Muchie KF, Derso T, Abebe SM, et al (2017) Mothers' education and ANC visit improved exclusive breastfeeding in Dabat Health and Demographic Surveillance System Site, northwest Ethiopia. PLoS One 12:e0179056.
543 544 545	48.	Biks GA, Tariku A, Tessema GA (2015) Effects of antenatal care and institutional delivery on exclusive breastfeeding practice in northwest Ethiopia: a nested case–control study. Int Breastfeed J 10:30:eCollection 2015
546 547	49.	Egata G, Berhane Y, Worku A (2013) Predictors of non-exclusive breastfeeding at 6 months among rural mothers in east Ethiopia: a community-based analytical cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 8:8.
548 549 550	50.	Dachew BA, Bifftu BB (2014) Breastfeeding practice and associated factors among female nurses and midwives at North Gondar Zone, Northwest Ethiopia: a cross-sectional institution based study. Int Breastfeed J 9:11:eCollection 2014.
551 552 553	51.	Berhe H, Mekonnen B, Bayray A, Berhe H (2013) Determinants of Breast feeding Practices Among Mothers Attending Public Health Facilities, Mekelle, Northern Ethiopia; A Cross Sectional Study. IJPSR 4:650-660.
554 555	52.	Semahegn A, Tesfaye G, Bogale A (2014) Complementary feeding practice of mothers and associated factors in Hiwot Fana Specialized Hospital, Eastern Ethiopia. Pan Afr Med J 18:143:eCollection 2014.
556 557 558	53.	Shumey A, Demissie M, Berhane Y (2013) Timely initiation of complementary feeding and associated factors among children aged 6 to 12 months in Northern Ethiopia: an institution-based cross-sectional study. BMC Public Health 13:1050.
559 560	54.	Minas AG, Ganga-Limando M (2016) Social-Cognitive Predictors of Exclusive Breastfeeding among Primiparous Mothers in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. PloS one 11:e0164128.
561 562	55.	Wubante AA (2017) Determinants of infant nutritional status in Dabat district, North Gondar, Ethiopia: A case control study. PLoS One 12:e0174624.
563 564	56.	Beyene MG, Geda NR, Habtewold TD, Assen ZM (2017) Early initiation of breastfeeding among mothers of children under the age of 24 months in Southern Ethiopia. Int Breastfeed J 12:1:eCollection 2016.
565 566	57.	Liben ML, Yesuf EM (2016) Determinants of early initiation of breastfeeding in Amibara district, Northeastern Ethiopia: a community based cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 11:7:eCollection 2016.
567 568 569	58.	Setegn T, Gerbaba M, Belachew T (2011) Determinants of timely initiation of breastfeeding among mothers in Goba Woreda, South East Ethiopia: a cross sectional study. BMC Public Health 11:217. https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2458-11-217.
570 571 572	59.	Tewabe T (2016) Timely initiation of breastfeeding and associated factors among mothers in Motta town, East Gojjam zone, Amhara regional state, Ethiopia, 2015: a cross-sectional study. BMC Pregnancy Childbirth 16:314.
573 574	60.	Hailemariam TW, Adeba E, Sufa A (2015) Predictors of early breastfeeding initiation among mothers of children under 24 months of age in rural part of West Ethiopia. BMC Public Health 15:1076.
575 576 577	61.	Tilahun G, Degu G, Azale T, Tigabu A (2016) Prevalence and associated factors of timely initiation of breastfeeding among mothers at Debre Berhan town, Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 11:27.
578 579	62.	Bimerew A, Teshome M, Kassa GM (2016) Prevalence of timely breastfeeding initiation and associated factors in Dembecha district, North West Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 11:28.

580 581 582	63.	Tamiru D, Belachew T, Loha E, Mohammed S (2012) Sub-optimal breastfeeding of infants during the first six months and associated factors in rural communities of Jimma Arjo Woreda, Southwest Ethiopia. BMC Public Health 12:363.
583 584	64.	Adugna DT (2014) Women's perception and risk factors for delayed initiation of breastfeeding in Arba Minch Zuria, Southern Ethiopia. Int Breastfeed J 9:8:eCollection 2014.
585 586 587	65.	Tamiru D, Tamrat M (2015) Constraints to the optimal breastfeeding practices of breastfeeding mothers in the rural communities of Arba Minch Zuria Woreda, Ethiopia: A community-based, cross-sectional study. S Afr J Clin Nutr 28:134-139.
588 589 590	66.	Alemayehu M, Abreha K, Yebyo H, Zemichael K, Gebremichael H (2014) Factors associated with timely initiation and exclusive breast feeding among mothers of Axum town, Northern Ethiopia. Sci J Public Health 2:394-401.
591 592 593	67.	Musa Seid A (2014) Vaginal Delivery and Maternal Knowledge on Correct Breastfeeding Initiation Time as Predictors of Early Breastfeeding Initiation: Lesson from a Community-Based Cross-Sectional Study. ISRN Epidemiology. http://dx.doi.org/10.1155/2014/904609
594 595 596 597		Gultie T, Sebsibie G (2016) Determinants of suboptimal breastfeeding practice in Debre Berhan town, Ethiopia: a cross sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 11:5:eCollection 2016. Regassa N (2014) Infant and child feeding practices among farming communities in Southern Ethiopia. Kontakt 16:e215-e222. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.kontakt.2014.09.002
598 599 600	70.	Wolde T, Birhanu T, Ejeta E (2014) Prevalence and determinants of timely initiation of breastfeeding among lactating mothers of urban dwellers in Western Ethiopia: A community based cross sectional study. Food Science and Quality Management 31:110-116.
601 602 603	71.	Woldemichael B, Kibie Y (2016) Timely Initiation of Breastfeeding and Its Associated Factors among Mothers in Tiyo Woreda, Arsi Zone, Ethiopia: A Community-Based Cross Sectional Study. Clinics Mother Child Health 13:2. http://dx.doi.org/10.4172/2090-7214.1000221
604 605 606	72.	Yonas F, Asnakew M, Wondafrash M, Abdulahi M (2015) Infant and young child feeding practice status and associated factors among mothers of under 24-month-old children in Shashemene Woreda, Oromia Region, Ethiopia. Open Access Libr J 2:e1635.
607 608 609	73.	Arage G, Gedamu H. Exclusive Breastfeeding Practice and Its Associated Factors among Mothers of Infants Less Than Six Months of Age in Debre Tabor Town, Northwest Ethiopia: A Cross-Sectional Study. Advances in Public Health. http://dx.doi.org/10.1155/2016/3426249
610 611 612 613	74.	Zenebu BB, Belayneh KG, Alayou G, Ahimed A, Bereket C, Abreham A, et al (2015) Knowledge and practice of mothers towards exclusive breastfeeding and its associated factors in Ambo Woreda West Shoa Zone Oromia Region, Ethiopia. Epidemiology: Open Access 5:182. http://dx.doi.org/10.4172/2161-1165.1000182
614 615	75.	Shifraw T, Worku A, Berhane Y (2015) Factors associated exclusive breastfeeding practices of urban women in Addis Ababa public health centers, Ethiopia: a cross sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 10:22.
616 617 618	76.	Yohannes B, Ejamo E, Thangavel T, Yohannis M (2018) Timely initiation of complementary feeding to children aged 6–23 months in rural Soro district of Southwest Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. BMC Pediatr 18:17.
619 620 621	77.	Ekubay M, Berhe A, Yisma E (2018) Initiation of breastfeeding within one hour of birth among mothers with infants younger than or equal to 6 months of age attending public health institutions in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Int Breastfeed J 13:4:eCollection 2018.

- 622 78. Tariku A, Biks GA, Wassie MM, Worku AG, Yenit MK (2017) Only half of the mothers practiced early 623 initiation of breastfeeding in Northwest Ethiopia, 2015. BMC Res Notes 10:501. 624 https://doi.org/10.1186/s13104-017-2823-2 625 79. Ersino G, Henry CJ, Zello GA (2016) Suboptimal Feeding Practices and High Levels of Undernutrition 626 Among Infants and Young Children in the Rural Communities of Halaba and Zeway, Ethiopia. Food Nutr 627 Bull. pii: 0379572116658371. 628 80. Chekol DA, Biks GA, Gelaw YA, Melsew YA (2017) Exclusive breastfeeding and mothers' employment 629 status in Gondar town, Northwest Ethiopia: a comparative cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 630 12:27:eCollection 2017. 631 81. Setegn T, Belachew T, Gerbaba M, Deribe K, Deribew A, Biadgilign S (2012) Factors associated with 632 exclusive breastfeeding practices among mothers in Goba district, south east Ethiopia: A cross-sectional 633 study. Int Breastfeeding J 7:17. 634 82. Seid AM, Yesuf ME, Koye DN (2013) Prevalence of Exclusive Breastfeeding Practices and associated 635 factors among mothers in Bahir Dar city, Northwest Ethiopia: a community based cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 8:14. 636 637 83. Liben ML, Gemechu YB, Adugnew M, Asrade A, Adamie B, Gebremedin E, et al (2016) Factors 638 associated with exclusive breastfeeding practices among mothers in dubti town, afar regional state, 639 northeast Ethiopia: a community based cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 11:4:eCollection 2016. 640 84. Lenja A, Demissie T, Yohannes B, Yohannis M (2016) Determinants of exclusive breastfeeding practice to 641 infants aged less than six months in Offa district, Southern Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeed 642 J 11:32. 643 85. Hunegnaw MT, Gezie LD, Teferra AS (2017) Exclusive breastfeeding and associated factors among 644 mothers in Gozamin district, northwest Ethiopia: A community based cross-sectional study. Int 645 Breastfeeding J 12:30: eCollection 2017. 646 86. Mekuria G, Edris M (2015) Exclusive breastfeeding and associated factors among mothers in Debre 647 Markos, Northwest Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 10:1:eCollection 2015. 648 87. Asfaw MM, Argaw MD, Kefene ZK (2015) Factors associated with exclusive breastfeeding practices in 649 Debre Berhan District, Central Ethiopia: a cross sectional community based study. Int Breastfeed J 10:23. 650 88. Tewabe T, Mandesh A, Gualu T, Alem G, Mekuria G, Zeleke H (2017) Exclusive breastfeeding practice 651 and associated factors among mothers in Motta town, East Gojjam zone, Amhara Regional State, Ethiopia, 2015: a cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeed J 12:12:eCollection 2016. 652 653 89. Gizaw Z, Woldu W, Bitew BD (2017) Exclusive breastfeeding status of children aged between 6 and 24 654 months in the nomadic population of Hadaleala district, Afar Region, northeast Ethiopia. Int Breastfeed J 655 12:38:eCollection 2017. 656 90. Sonko A, Worku A (2015) Prevalence and predictors of exclusive breastfeeding for the first six months of 657 life among women in Halaba special woreda, Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples' Region/SNNPR/, 658 Ethiopia: a community based cross-sectional study. Arch Public Health 73:53:eCollection 2015. 659 91. Tadesse T, Mesfin F, Chane T (2016) Prevalence and associated factors of non-exclusive breastfeeding of 660 infants during the first six months in rural area of Sorro District, Southern Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study.
- 661 Int Breastfeed J 11:25:eCollection 2016.

- 662 92. Asemahagn MA (2016) Determinants of exclusive breastfeeding practices among mothers in azezo district, northwest Ethiopia. Int Breastfeed J 11:22:eCollection 2016.
- Alemayehu M, Abreha K, Yebyo H, Zemichael K, Gebremichael H (2014) Factors associated with timely
  initiation and exclusive breast feeding among mothers of Axum town, Northern Ethiopia. Sci J Public
  Health 2:394-401.
- 667 94. Fenta EH, Yirgu R, Shikur B, Gebreyesus SH (2017) A single 24 h recall overestimates exclusive
  668 breastfeeding practices among infants aged less than six months in rural Ethiopia. Int Breastfeed J
  669 12:36:eCollection 2017.
- 670 95. Abera K (2012) Infant and young child feeding practices among mothers living in Harar, Ethiopia. Harar
  671 Bulletin of Health Sciences 4:66-78.
- 672 96. Adugna B, Tadele H, Reta F, Berhan Y (2017) Determinants of exclusive breastfeeding in infants less than six months of age in Hawassa, an urban setting, Ethiopia. Int Breastfeed J 12:45.
- 674 97. Taddele M, Abebe L, Fentahun N (2014) Exclusive breastfeeding and maternal employment in Ethiopia: a comparative cross-sectional study. Int J Nutr Food Sci 3:497-503.
  676 https://doi.org/10.11648/j.ijnfs.20140306.12
- 677 98. Echamo M (2012) Exclusive breast feeding in Arbaminch, SNNPR, Ethiopia. Harar Bull Health Sci 5:44678 59.
- 679 99. Teka B, Assefa H, Haileslassie K (2015) Prevalence and determinant factors of exclusive breastfeeding
   680 practices among mothers in Enderta woreda, Tigray, North Ethiopia: a cross-sectional study. Int Breastfeed
   681 J 10:2:eCollection 2015.
- 682 100.Sefene A, Birhanu D, Awoke W, Taye T (2013) Determinants of exclusive breastfeeding practice among
  683 mothers of children age less than 6 month in Bahir Dar city administration, Northwest Ethiopia; a
  684 community based cross-sectional survey. Sci J Clin Med 2:153-159.
- 101.Ayana D, Tariku A, Feleke A, Woldie H (2017) Complementary feeding practices among children in
   Benishangul Gumuz Region, Ethiopia. BMC Res Notes 10:335.
- 687 102.Demilew YM, Tafere TE, Abitew DB (2017) Infant and young child feeding practice among mothers with
  688 0-24 months old children in Slum areas of Bahir Dar City, Ethiopia. Int Breastfeed J 12:26:eCollection
  689 2017.
- 690 103.Kassa T, Meshesha B, Haji Y, Ebrahim J (2016) Appropriate complementary feeding practices and
   691 associated factors among mothers of children age 6-23 months in Southern Ethiopia, 2015. BMC Pediatr
   692 16:131.
- 693 104.Sisay W, Edris M, Tariku A (2016) Determinants of timely initiation of complementary feeding among
   694 mothers with children aged 6-23 months in Lalibela District, Northeast Ethiopia, 2015. BMC Public Health
   695 16:884.
- 696 105.Zeleke LB, Gebremichael MW, Adinew YM, Gelaw KA (2017) Appropriate Weaning Practice and
   697 Associated Factors among Infants and Young Children in Northwest Ethiopia. J Nutr Metab.
   698 https://doi.org/10.1155/2017/9608315
- 106.Mekbib E, Shumey A, Ferede S, Haile F (2014) Magnitude and factors associated with appropriate
  complementary feeding among mothers having children 6–23 months-of-age in Northern Ethiopia; A
  Community-Based Cross-Sectional Study. J Food Nutr Sci 2:36-42.
  https://doi.org/10.11648/j.jfns.20140202.13

703	107.Gessese D, Bolka H, Alemu Abajobir A, Tegabu D (2014) The practice of complementary feeding and
704	associated factors among mothers of children 6-23 months of age in Enemay district, Northwest Ethiopia.
705	Nutr Food Sci 44:230-240.
706	108. Yemane S, Awoke T, Gebreslassie M (2014) Timely initiation of complementary feeding practice and
707	associated factors among mothers of children aged from 6 to 24 months in Axum town, north Ethiopia. Int J
708	Nutr Food Sci 3:438-442.
709	109.Molla M, Ejigu T, Nega G (2017) Complementary Feeding Practice and Associated Factors among Mothers
710	Having Children 6–23 Months of Age, Lasta District, Amhara Region, Northeast Ethiopia. Advances in
711	Public Health. https://doi.org/10.1155/2017/4567829
712	110.Agedew E, Demissie M, Misker D, Haftu D (2014) Early initiation of complementary feeding and
713	associated factors among 6 months to 2 years young children. Kamba Woreda, South West Ethiopia: A
714	Community–Based Cross-Sectional Study.J Nutr Food Sci 4:314.
715 716	111.Wubante AA (2017). Determinants of infant nutritional status in Dabat district, North Gondar, Ethiopia: A case control study. PloS one 12:e0174624.
717 718	112.Higgins JP, Thompson SG, Deeks JJ, Altman DG (2003) Measuring inconsistency in meta-analyses. BMJ 327:557-560.
719	113.World Health Organization, LINKAGES (2003) Infant and young child feeding: a tool for assessing
720	national practices, policies and programmes. WHO.
721	http://www.who.int/nutrition/publications/infantfeeding/9241562544/en/. Accessed 15 August 2017
722	114.Quigley C, Taut C, Zigman T, Gallagher L, Campbell H, Zgaga L (2016) Association between home birth
723	and breast feeding outcomes: a cross-sectional study in 28 125 mother-infant pairs from Ireland and the UK.
724	BMJ Open 6:e010551-2015-010551.
725	115.World Health Organization (2017) Global Health Observatory Data Repository. Nutrition: Exclusive
726	breastfeeding under 6 months. Data by country. WHO. <u>http://apps.who.int/gho/data/view.main.NUT1730</u> .
727	Accessed 17 September 2017
728 729	116.Bosi ATB, Eriksen KG, Sobko T, Wijnhoven TM, Breda J (2016) Breastfeeding practices and policies in WHO European region member states. Public Health Nutr 19:753-764.
730 731	117.Alzaheb RA (2017) A Review of the Factors Associated With the Timely Initiation of Breastfeeding and Exclusive Breastfeeding in the Middle East. Clin Med Insights Pediatr 11:eCollection 2017.
732	118.Fewtrell M, Bronsky J, Campoy C, Domellof M, Embleton N, Fidler Mis N, et al (2017) Complementary
733	Feeding: A Position Paper by the European Society for Paediatric Gastroenterology, Hepatology, and
734	Nutrition (ESPGHAN) Committee on Nutrition. J Pediatr Gastroenterol Nutr 64:119-132.
735 736	119.Senarath U, Dibley MJ (2012) Complementary feeding practices in South Asia: analyses of recent national survey data by the South Asia Infant Feeding Research Network. Matern Child Nutr 8:5-10.
737	120.Oakley L, Benova L, Macleod D, Lynch CA, Campbell OM (2017) Early breastfeeding practices:
738	Descriptive analysis of recent Demographic and Health Surveys. Matern Child Nutr.
739	https://doi.org/10.1111/mcn.12535
740 741 742	121. Takahashi K, Ganchimeg T, Ota E, Vogel JP, Souza JP, Laopaiboon M, et al (2017) Prevalence of early initiation of breastfeeding and determinants of delayed initiation of breastfeeding: secondary analysis of the WHO Global Survey. Sci Rep 7:44868.

743 744	122.Sinha B, Chowdhury R, Sankar MJ, Martines J, Taneja S, Mazumder S, et al (2015) Interventions to improve breastfeeding outcomes: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Acta Paediatrica 104:114-134.
745 746 747	123.Hobbs AJ, Mannion CA, McDonald SW, Brockway M, Tough SC (2016) The impact of caesarean section on breastfeeding initiation, duration and difficulties in the first four months postpartum. BMC pregnancy and childbirth.16:90.
748 749	124.Mikiel-Kostyra K, Mazur J, Wojdan-Godek E (2005) Factors affecting exclusive breastfeeding in Poland: cross-sectional survey of population-based samples. Soz Praventivmed 50:52-59.
750 751 752	125.Mensah KA, Acheampong E, Anokye FO, Okyere P, Appiah-Brempong E, Adjei RO (2017) Factors influencing the practice of exclusive breastfeeding among nursing mothers in a peri-urban district of Ghana. BMC Res Notes 10:466.
753 754	126. Alzaheb RA (2017) Factors Influencing Exclusive Breastfeeding in Tabuk, Saudi Arabia. Clin Med Insights Pediatr. 11:1179556517698136.
755 756	127.Norris S, Collin SM, Ingram J (2013) Breastfeeding practices among the old order Mennonites in Ontario, Canada: A multiple methods study. J Hum Lact 29:605-610.
757 758	128.Kiani SN, Rich KM, Herkert D, Safon C, Pérez-Escamilla R (2018) Delivery mode and breastfeeding outcomes among new mothers in Nicaragua. Matern Child Nutr. https://doi.org/10.1111/mcn.12474
759	
760 761	
762	
763	
764	
765	
766	
767	

First author and year of publication	Region	Place	Study area	Study design	Study population	Sample size/Participated	Data collection technique	Prevalence	Associated factors (least adjusted)
Beyene et al 2017[56]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Urban and Rural	Dale Woreda	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 24 months	634/634	Interviewer- administered	83.7%	Living in rented house
Liben and Yesuf 2016[57]	Afar, Northeastern Ethiopia	Urban and Rural	Amibara district	Cross- sectional study	Mothers of children aged < 24 months	407/403	Interviewer- administered	39.6 %	Urban residence Attended formal education Cesarean section delivery Birth order
Derso et al 2017[46]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban and Rural	Dabat district	Cross- sectional study (EDHS- based)	Mothers with children < five years of age	6,761/6,761	Interviewer- administered	43.9%	Urban residence Antenatal care No prelacteal feeding
Setegn et al 2011[58]	Oromia, South Eastern Ethiopia	Urban and Rural	Goba district	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 12 months	668/608	Interviewer- administered	52.4%	Urban residence Postnatal counseling
Tewabe 2016[59]	Amhara, Northeast Ethiopia	Urban	Motta town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with infant < six months	423/405	Interviewer- administered	78.8 %	Health institution delivery Vaginal delivery No prelacteal feeding
Hailemariam et al 2015[60]	Oromia, West Ethiopia	Rural	East Wollega zone	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 24 months	594/593	Interviewer- administered	83.1 %	Being a housewife Colostrum feeding No access to mass media No breastfeeding counseling Prelacteal feeding
Tilahun et al 2016[61]	Amhara, Northeast Ethiopia	Urban	Debre Berhan town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < six months	416/409	Interviewer- administered	62.6 %	High monthly income Extended family No breastfeeding counseling Cesarean section delivery Traditional birth attendant No colostrum feeding
Lakew et al 2015[42]	National	Urban and Rural	National	Cross- sectional study (EDHS- based)	Mothers children < 5 years	11,654/11,654	Interviewer- administered	52 %	Rural residence High educational status Cesarean section delivery Maternal employment Sex of newborn Aware of community

768 Table 1: Characteristics of included studies that reported the prevalence and/or least adjusted associated factors of TIBF.

									conversation program
Bimerew et al 2016[62]	Amhara, North West Ethiopia	Rural	Dembecha district	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 2 years	739/739	Interviewer- administered	73.1 %	Antenatal care Access to mass media Traditional birth attendant
Tamiru et al 2012[63]	Oromia, Southwest Ethiopia	Rural	Jimma Arjo Woreda	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 0 to 6 months	384/382	Interviewer- administered	62.6%	Painful breastfeeding experiences
Adugna et al 2014[64]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Rural	Arba Minch Zuria	Cross- sectional study	Women with children < two years	384/383	Interviewer- administered	57.2%	Breastfeeding knowledge Health education
Tamiru et al 2015[65]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Rural	Arba Minch Zuria Woreda	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with < two years	384/384	Interviewer- administered	57%	Health education
Horii et al 2011[44]	SNNPR, Oromia and Amhara	Urban and Rural	SNNPR, Oromia and Amhara	Survey	Mothers with children 0 to 11 months	2,084/2,072	Interviewer- administered	41.6%	Received iron-folate supplements
Alemayehu et al 2014[66]	Tigray, Northern Ethiopia	Urban	Axum town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6 to 12 months	418/418	Interviewer- administered	41.6%	Sex of newborn Colostrum discarding
Berhe et al 2013[51]	Tigray, Northern Ethiopia	Urban	Mekelle town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers of children < two years	361/361	Interviewer- administered	77.9%	Home delivery Vaginal delivery Health professional birth attendant
Seid 2014[67]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban	Bahir Dar City,	Cross- sectional study	Mothers of children < two years	819/819	Interviewer- administered	87.0%	Vaginal delivery Breastfeeding knowledge
Gultie and Sebsibie 2016[68]	Amhara, Northeastern Ethiopia	Urban	Debre Berhan town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 2 years	548/548	Interviewer- administered	82.5%	No breastfeeding counseling Home delivery
Regassa 2014[69]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Urban and Rural	Sidama zone	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 0 and 6 months	1,100/1,094	Interviewer- administered	80.1%	
Wolde et al 2014[70]	Oromia, Western Ethiopia	Urban	Nekemte town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers children < two years	182/174	Interviewer- administered	88.5%	
Disha et al 2012[43]	National	Urban and Rural	All regions	Cross- sectional study (EDHS	Mothers with children < two years	244/244	Interviewer- administered	60.7%	

				based)					
Woldemichael et al 2016[71]	Oromia, Central Ethiopia	Urban and Rural	Tiyo Woreda	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < one year	386/373	Interviewer- administered	67.3%	
Wubante 2017[55]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban and Rural	Dabat District	Case-control study	Mothers with children < one year	400/400	Interviewer- administered	59%	
Yonas et al 2015[72]	Oromia, Southwest Ethiopia	Urban and Rural	Shashemene Woreda	Case-control study	Mothers with < two years	423/417	Interviewer- administered	58%	
Arage et al 2016[73]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban	Debre Tabor Town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 6 months	470/453	interviewer administered	78.6%	
Bayissa et al 2015[74]	Oromia, West Ethiopia	Urban and Rural	Ambo woreda	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 2 years	403/371	Interviewer- administered	71.2%	
Minas et al 2016[54]	Addis Ababa, Central Ethiopia	Urban	Addis Ababa	Prospective study	Primiparous women, and at the third trimester of pregnancy	233/233	Interviewer- administered	64.3%	
Shiferaw et al 2015[75]	Addis Ababa, Central Ethiopia	Urban	Addis Ababa	Cross- sectional study	Mothers who attended a public health center for their children's measles vaccination at nine months of age	660/648	Interviewer- administered	29.3 %	
Yohannes et al 2018 [76]	SNNPR, Southwest Ethiopia	Rural	Soro district	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6-23 months	543/543	Interviewer- administered	55.4%	
Ekubay et al 2018[77]	Addis, Central Ethiopia	Urban	Addis Ababa	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children $\leq 6$ months	597/583	Interviewer- administered	58.3%	Parity Antenatal care
Tariku et al 2017[78]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Dabat District	Cross- sectional study (EDHS	Mothers with children 6–24 months	822/822	Interviewer- administered	53.3%	Health institution delivery Knowledge of infant and young child feeding

				based)					Husband educational status
Ersino et al 2016a[79]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Rural	Halaba	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 2 years	268/268	Interviewer administered	62.7%	
Ersino et al 2016b[79]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Rural	Zeway	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 2 years	90/90	Interviewer administered	92.3%	
Chekol et al; 2017[80]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban	Gondar town	Comparative cross- sectional study	Employed and unemployed mothers with children 7–12 months	649/649	Interviewer- administered	68%	

 769
 EDHS = Ethiopian Demographic Health Survey; SNNPR = Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples' Region

S.No.	Factors
Level 1 (I	Addel 1): Proximal factors
1.	Mothers' occupational status [42,60]
2.	Mothers' knowledge about timely initiation of breastfeeding [42,60,62,64,65,67,78]
3.	Guidance and counselling on breastfeeding [58,60,61,68]
Level 2 (M	Model 2): Proximal intermediate factors
1.	Place of delivery [51,59,68,78]
2.	Mode of delivery [42,51,57,59,61,67]
3.	Birth attendant [51,61,62]
4.	Sex of newborn [42,66]
Level 3 (I	Model 3): Distal intermediate factors
1.	Antenatal visit [46,62,77]
2.	Prelacteal feeding [46,59,60]
3.	Colostrum feeding [60,61,66]
Level 4 (M	Model 4): Distal factors
1.	Paternal educational status [42,57,78]
2.	Household income [56,61]
3.	Family size [61]
4.	Breastfeeding experience [63]
5.	Place of residence [42,46,57,58]
6.	Birth order [57]
7.	Received iron-folate supplements [44]
8.	Parity [77]

## 770 Table 2: Predictors of TIBF and hierarchical theoretical model.

## 774 Table 3: Characteristics of included studies that reported the prevalence and/or least adjusted associated factors of EBF.

First author and year of publication	Region	Place	Study area	Study design	Study population	Sample size/Participated	Data collection technique	Prevalence	Associated factors (least adjusted)
Setegn et al 2012[81]	Oromia, South East Ethiopia	Urban and Rural	Bale Zone, Goba district	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 6 months	668/608	Interviewer- administered (24hrs recall method)	71.3%	Unemployment Age of infants of less than two months
Seid et al 2013[82]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban	Bahir Dar city	Cross- sectional study	Mothers gave birth in the last 12 months	819/819	Interviewer- administered (Since birth dietary recall method)	50.3%	Age of infant < 3 months Being a housewife Prenatal breastfeeding plan Health institution delivery Vaginal delivery Infant feeding counseling/advice
Dachew et al 2014[50]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban and rural	North Gondar Zone	Cross- sectional study	Nurses and midwives with children 6 to 20 months	178/178	Self- administered questionnaire	35.9%	Older women Rural residence Being midwife Vaginal delivery Multiparity Resumption of work after 3 months
Liben et al 2016[83]	Afar, Northeast Ethiopia	Urban	Dubti town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 6 months	346/333	Interviewer- administered (24-hrs recall method)	81.1%	Initiation of breastfeeding within one hour Age of infants < 2 months Being a housewife Counseling
Lenja et al 2016[84]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Rural	Offa district	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 6 months	403/396	Interviewer- administered (24-hrs recall method)	78.0%	Initiation of breastfeeding within one hour Attending formal education Awareness of the benefits of exclusive breastfeeding Knowledge of colostrum feeding
Hunegnaw et al 2017[85]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Rural	Gozamin district	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6 to 12 months	506/478	Interviewer- administered	74.1%	Government employment No breastfeeding counseling Health institution delivery
Tariku et al	Amhara,	Urban	Dabat	Cross-	Mothers with	5,227/5,227	Interviewer-	54.5%	Higher mothers' education

2017[47]	Northwest Ethiopia	and rural	District	sectional study (EDHS based)	children < 59 months		administered		Age (20±35 years) Urban residence Antenatal care Initiation of breastfeeding within one-hour High household income Withholding prelacteal feeding
Mekuria et al 2015[86]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban	Debre Markos	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < six months	423/413	Interviewer- administered (Seven-day self-recall method	60.8%,	Unemployment Breastfeeding counseling No prelacteal feeding Knowledge of breastfeeding
Asfaw et al 2015[87]	Amhara, Central Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Debre Berhan District	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 12 months	634/634	Interviewer- administered	68.6 %	Rural residence Mothers aged 25 to 35 years No infant feeding Counseling Employment Home delivery High educational status
Tewabe et al 2017[88]	Amhara, Northeast Ethiopia	Urban	Motta town, East Gojjam zone	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < six months	423/405	Interviewer- administered (24-hour infant diet recall method)	50.1%	Infants age 0-1 month Unemployment Low income Breastfeeding counseling Colostrum feeding No prelacteal feeding Husband support
Gizaw et al 2017[89]	Afar, Northeast Ethiopia	Rural	Hadaleala district	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children between 6 and 24 months	258/254	Interviewer- administered ( 6 months recalling method)	74%	Mothers aged > 35 years Breastfeeding initiation within one hour Rural to urban migration
Sonko et al 2015[90]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Rural	Halaba special woreda	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < six months	422/420	Interviewer- administered	70.5 %	Antenatal care Postnatal care Initiation of breastfeeding within one hour Attending formal education Breastfeeding counseling Awareness of exclusive breastfeeding High monthly income (≥500ETB) Being

									housewife
Alemayehu et al 2009[45]	National	Urban and rural	National	Cross- sectional study (EDHS based)	Mothers with children < six months	14,500/1,142	Interviewer administered (24-hrs recall method)	49.0%,	Being not married High household income Child age < three months
Tamiru et al 2015[65]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Rural	Arba Minch Zuria Woreda	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < two years	384/384	Interviewer- administered	69%	Access to mass media Antenatal care Breastfeeding education Knowledge of exclusive breastfeeding
Tadesse et al 2016[91]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Rural	Sorro District	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 5 months	602/579	Interviewer- administered ( 24-hrs recall method)	50.6%	Unmarried Initiation of breastfeeding after one hour No antenatal care No postnatal care
Tamiru et al 2012[63]	Oromia, Southwest Ethiopia	Rural	Jimma Arjo Woreda	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 6 months	384/382	Interviewer- administered	47.9%	Ownership of radio Colostrum discarding
Asemahagn 2016[92]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban	Azezo district	Cross- sectional study	Women with children < 6 months	346/332	Interviewer- administered (24-hrs recall method)	79 %	Mothers aged $\geq$ 30 yearsUnemploymentLow maternal incomeHealth institution deliveryAntenatal carePostnatal careNo prelacteal feeding
Alemayehu et al 2014[93]	Tigray, Northern Ethiopia	Urban	Axum town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children between 6-12 months	418/418	Interviewer- administered	40.9%	No colostrum feeding
Berhe et al 2013[51]	Tigray, Northern Ethiopia	Urban	Mekelle town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 24 months	361/361	Interviewer- administered	60.8%	Unemployment Child age (<1 months)
Gultie and Sebsibie 2016[68]	Amhara, Northeastern Ethiopia	Urban	Debre Berhan town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 23 months	548/548	Interviewer- administered	50.2%	No breastfeeding counseling
Regassa 2014[69]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Sidama zone	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children between 0 and 6 months old	1100/1094	Interviewer- administered	56.0%	

Biks et al 2015[48]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Dabat district	Nested case- control study (EDHS based)	All pregnant women in the second/third trimester	1,769/1,769	Interviewer- administered	30.7 %	Private job Housewife Antenatal care Health institution delivery
Fenta et al 2017[94]	SNNPR, Southwest Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Gurage zone	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 6 months	422/410	Interviewer- administered (Seven repeated 24 h recall method)	53.2%	
Wubante 2017[55]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Dabat District	Case-control study	Mothers with children <one year</one 	400/400	Interviewer- administered	85.5%	
Yonas et al 2015[72]	Oromia, Southwest Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Shashemene Woreda	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 24 months	423/417	Interviewer- administered (24-hrs recall method)	87.8%	
Abera 2012[95]	Harari, Eastern Ethiopia	Urban	Harar town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < two years	604/583	Interviewer- administered	51.8%	High monthly income Health institution delivery
Arage et al 2016[73]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban	Debre Tabor Town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < six months	470/453	Interviewer- administered (24-hrs recall method)	70.8%	Child age (2-3 months) Health institution delivery Housewife Infant feeding counseling Colostrum feeding
Adugna et al 2017[96]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Urban	Hawassa city	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 6 months	541/529	Interviewer- administered (24-hrs recall method)	60.9%	Infant age Married Housewife Vaginal delivery Health institution delivery No breast complication
Bayissa et al 2015[74]	Oromia, West Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Ambo woreda	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 2 years	403/371	Interviewer- administered	82.2%	
Egata et al 2013[49]	Oromia, Easter Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Kersa district	Cross- sectional study (EDHS based)	Mothers with children < two years	881/860	Interviewer- administered	71.4%	Not married No access to health institution Lack of knowledge about

									infant and young child feeding practices
Minas et al 2016[54]	Addis Ababa, Central Ethiopia	Urban	Addis Ababa	Prospective study	Primiparous women during third trimester of pregnancy	233/233	interviewer administered	34.3%	Breastfeeding self-efficacy Breastfeeding outcome expectancy
Shiferaw et al 2015[75]	Addis Ababa, Central Ethiopia	Urban	Addis Ababa	Cross- sectional study	Mothers who attended a public health center for their children's measles vaccination at nine months of age	660/648	Interviewer- administered	29.3 %	Monthly income Breastfeeding counseling Mode of delivery
Ersino et al 2016a[79]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Rural	Halaba	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 2 years	87/87	Interviewer administered	86.2%	
Ersino et al 2016b[79]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Rural	Zeway	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 2 years	15/15	Interviewer administered	93.3%	
Taddele et.al. 2014[97]	Amhara, North west Ethiopia	Urban and Semi urban	Injibara Town	Comparative cross- sectional study	Mothers with children ≤ 1 year	524/473	Interviewer- administered	65%	Husband support Timely initiation of breastfeeding Health education Non-professional delivery attendant Maternal age Health institution delivery
Echamo. 2012[98]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Urban	Arbaminch town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6 to 12 months	768/768	Interviewer- administered	46.5%	Lack of knowledge Home delivery Antenatal care Timely initiation of breastfeeding Colostrum discarding
Teka et al. 2015[99]	Tigray, Northern Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Enderta Woreda	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < 24 months	541/530	Interviewer- administered	70%	Maternal age Child age Postnatal care
Sefene et al. 2013[100]	Amhara, Northeast Ethiopia	Urban and	Bahir Dar city	Cross- sectional	Mothers with children < 6	170/159	Interviewer- administered	49.1%	Maternal educational status Family size

		rural		study	months				Sex of child Postnatal care Parity
Chekol et al; 2017[80]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban	Gondar town	Comparative cross- sectional study	Employed and unemployed mothers with children 7–12 months	649/649	Interviewer- administered	34.8%	Lack of knowledge Unemployment Poor attitude towards breastfeeding

775 EDHS = Ethiopian Demographic Health Survey; SNNPR = Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples' Region

S.No.	Factors
Level 1 (M	odel 1): Proximal factors
1.	Mothers' occupational status [48,50,51,73,80-83,85-88,90,92,96]
2.	Mothers' knowledge about exclusive breastfeeding [49,63,65,80,84,86,90,98]
3.	Guidance and counselling on exclusive breastfeeding [65,68,73,75,82,83,85-88,90]
4.	Access to health facility [49]
5.	Poor attitude [80]
6.	Age of newborn [45,51,73,81-83,88,96,99]
Level 2 (M	odel 2): Proximal intermediate factors
1.	Place of delivery [48,73,82,85,87,92,95-98]
2.	Breast feeding practice (TIBF) [47,83,84,89,90,97,98]
3.	Intention/plan to breastfeed [82]
4.	Mode of delivery [50,75,82,96]
5.	Breast complication [96]
6.	Breastfeeding self-efficacy [54]
7.	Breastfeeding outcome expectancy [54]
8.	Sex of new born [100]
Level 3 (M	odel 3): Distal intermediate factors
1.	Antenatal visit [47,48,65,90-92,98]
2.	Postnatal visit [90-92,99,100]
3.	Prelacteal feeding [47,86,88,92]
4.	Colostrum feeding [63,73,88,93,98]
Level 4 (M	odel 4): Distal factors
1.	Paternal educational status [47,84,87,90,100]
2.	Household income [45,47,75,88,90,92,95]
3.	Marital status [45,49,91,96]
4.	Parity [50,100]
5.	Husband support [88,97]
6.	Maternal age [50,87,89,92,97,99]
7.	Place of residence [47,50,87,89]
8.	Family size [100]

# 776 Table 4: Predictors of EBF and hierarchical theoretical model.

778 Table 5: Characteristics of included studies that reported the prevalence and/or least adjusted associated factors of TICF.

First author and year of publication	Region	Place	Study area	Study design	Study population	Sample size/Participated	Data collection technique	Prevalence	Associated factors (least adjusted)
Ayana et al 2017[101]	Benishangul Gumuz, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Pawe District	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6–23 months	806/785	Interviewer- administered	61.8%	Urban residence Postnatal care
Demilew et al 2017[102]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban	Bahir Dar City	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6 and 23 months	423/412	Interviewer- administered ( 24-hr recall method)	7% <sup>¥</sup>	High maternal educational status Postnatal care Access to mass media Health institution delivery
Kassa et al 2016[103]	Oromia, Southeastern Ethiopia	Rural	Arsi Negele Woreda	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6–23 months	626/611	Interviewer- administered	9.5% <sup>¥</sup>	Child's age (12–17 months) Maternal educational status (primary) Small family size
Semahegn et al 2013[52]	Harari, Eastern Ethiopia	Urban	Harar town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6–23 months	203/200	Interviewer- administered	60.5%	Sex of child
Shumey et al 2013[53]	Tigray, Northern Ethiopia	Urban	Mekele town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6 to 12 months	422/422	Interviewer- administered	62.8%	High maternal educational status Housewife Parity Antenatal care Birth preparedness
Sisay et al 2016[104]	Amhara, Northeast Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Lalibela District	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6– 23 months	421/421	Interviewer- administered	63 %.	Maternal educational status Antenatal care Health institution delivery
Zeleke et al 2017[105]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban	Feres Bet Town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6 to 23 months	353/351	Interviewer- administered	23.9% <sup>¥</sup>	Child age (>9 months) Husband's occupation (employed) Maternal weaning advice Family size (larger >=4)
Mekbib et al 2014[106]	Tigray, Northern Ethiopia	Urban	Abyi-Adi town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6 - 23 months	434/428	Interviewer- administered	10.75%¥	Child's age High maternal educational status Postnatal care
Gessese et al 2013[107]	Amhara, Northwest	Urban and	Enemay district	Cross- sectional	Mothers with children 6-23	554/543	Interviewer- administered	40.5% <sup>¥</sup>	Child age (higher) Higher family income

	Ethiopia	rural		study	months				Antenatal care Health institution delivery
Yemane et al 2014[108]	Tigray, Northern Ethiopia	Urban	Axum town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6 to 24 months	422/422	Interviewer- administered	52.8%	Antenatal care Home delivery
Molla et al 2017[109]	Amhara, Northeast Ethiopia	Rural	Lasta District	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6-23 months	476/470	Interviewer- administered	56.5%	Exposure to public media Occupation of mother (housewife) Maternal decision making Postnatal care
Regassa 2014[69]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Sidama zone	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with infants < 6 months	1,100/1,094	Interviewer administered	71.5%	
Agedew et al 2014[110]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Kamba Woreda	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6 to 24 months	567/562	Interviewer- administered	40.6%	
Deme et al 2015[29]	Oromia, East Ethiopia	Urban	Bishoftu town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children < six months	422/422	Interviewer- administered	67.1%	Timely initiation of breastfeeding Housewife Home delivery Lack of knowledge on infant feeding
Disha et al 2012[43]	National	Urban and rural	National	Cross- sectional study (EDHS based)	Mothers with children 0-23 months	244/244	Interviewer administered	60.7%	
Wubante 2017[55]	Amhara, Northwest Ethiopia	Urban and rural	Dabat District	Case-control study	Mothers with children < one year	400/400	Interviewer- administered	86.3%	
Yonas et al 2015[72]	Oromia, Southwest Ethiopia	Mixed	Shashemene Woreda	Case-control study	Mothers with children < 24 months	423/417	Interviewer- administered	65.7%	
Abera 2012[95]	Harari, Eastern Ethiopia	Urban	Harar town	Cross- sectional study	Mothers of children < two years	604/583	Interviewer- administered	54.4%	Monthly income Antenatal care
Yohannes et al 2018 [76]	SNNPR, Southwest Ethiopia	Rural	Soro district	Cross- sectional study	Mothers with children 6-23 months	543/543	Interviewer- administered	34.3%	High educational status Postnatal care
Ersino et al 2016a[79]	SNNPR, Southern Ethiopia	Rural	Halaba	Cross- sectional	Mothers with children < 2	31/31	Interviewer administered	58.1%	

				study	years				
Ersino et al	SNNPR, Southern	Rural	Zeway	Cross-	Mothers with	9/9	Interviewer	44.4%	
2016b[79]	Ethiopia			sectional	children < 2		administered		
				study	vears				

**779** EDHS = Ethiopian Demographic Health Survey; SNNPR = Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples' Region;  $^{\text{F}}$  = Timely initiation, minimum meal frequency

780 and minimum meal diversity

S.No.	Factors								
Level 1 (M	odel 1): Proximal factors								
1.	Mothers' occupational status [29,53,109]								
2.	Mothers' decision making [109]								
3.	Mothers' knowledge of complementary feeding [29,102,109]								
4.	Guidance and counselling on complementary feeding [105]								
5.	Age of newborn [103,105-107]								
Level 2 (M	odel 2): Proximal intermediate factors								
1.	Place of delivery [29,102,104,107,108]								
2.	Breastfeeding practice (TIBF) [29]								
3.	Sex of newborn [52]								
Level 3 (M	odel 3): Distal intermediate factors								
1.	Desire for pregnancy/plan for pregnancy [53]								
2.	Antenatal visit [53,95,104,107,108]								
3.	Postnatal visit [76,101,102,106,109]								
Level 4 (M	odel 4): Distal factors								
1.	Paternal educational status [53,76,102-104,106]								
2.	Household income [95,107]								
3.	Husband occupation [105]								
4.	Family size [103,105]								
5.	Parity [53]								
6.	Place of residence [101]								

# 781 Table 6: Predictors of complementary feeding and hierarchical theoretical model.

. 54

Infant and Young Child Feeding indicators	Number of studies per region/city and total population			National prevalence	Regional prevalence (%)		Areal prevalence(%)		
	Name of region/city	Number of studies	Population <sup>+</sup>	(%)	Amhara	Other regions	Rural	Urban	Rural and Urban
Afar	3	1,723,000	CI 62.1 -	(95% CI	CI 60.2 -	CI 52.9 -	67.6 - 80.9)	55.2 - 66.1)	
Amhara	17	20,401,000	70.8)	59.9 -	70.5)	71.3)			
Benshangul-	-	1,005,000		76.0)					
	Gumaz								
	Dire Dawa	-	440,000						
	Gambela	-	409,000						
	Harari	1	232,000						
	Oromia	7	33,692,000						
	Somali	-	5,453,000						
	SNNP	9	5,056,000						
	Tigray	2	18,276,000						
EBF <sup>¥</sup>	Addis Ababa	2	3,273,000	60.1 (95%	58.6	61.0 (95%	68.8 (95%	54.9 (95% CI	60.0 (95% CI
	Afar	2	1,723,000	CI 55.5 -	(95% CI	CI 54.8 -	CI 60.8 -	47.5 - 62.3)	52.3 - 67.3)
	Amhara	17	20,401,000	64.6)	51.3 -	67.0)	76.3)		
	Benshangul-	-	1,005,000	_	65.8)				
	Gumaz								
	Dire Dawa	-	440,000						
	Gambela	-	409,000	—					
	Harari	1	232,000						
	Oromia	5	33,692,000	_					

792 Table 7: Number of studies in each region/city and prevalence estimate (National, regional and areal) of infant and young child feeding indicators.

	Somali	-	5,453,000						
	SNNPR	12	5,056,000						
	Tigray	3	18,276,000						
TICF <sup>f</sup>	Addis Ababa	-	3,273,000	62.5 (95%	67.8	60.2 (95%	54.8 (95%	64.9 (95% CI	63.8 (95% CI
	Afar	-	1,723,000	CI 56.6 -	(95% CI	CI 53.0 -	CI 36.5 -	57.6 - 71.9)	54.3 - 72.8)
	Amhara	6	20,401,000	68.2)	57.2 -	67.1)	72.5)		
	Benishangul-	1	1,005,000	_	77.6)				
	Gumuz								
	Dire Dawa	-	440,000						
	Gambela	-	409,000						
	Harari	2	232,000						
	Oromia	3	33,692,000						
	Somali	-	5,453,000						
	SNNPR	5	5,056,000	-					
	Tigray	3	18,276,000						

\*=Two national studies and one study conducted in SNNPR, Oromia and Amhara region; SNNPR = Southern Nations, Nationalities, and Peoples; \*= Two

794 national studies; <sup>f</sup> = One national study; +=2015 population projection (available at <u>http://www.citypopulation.de/Ethiopia.html</u>)

- **798** Supplementary file 1: Search string for all databases searched.
- 799 Supplementary file 2: Overview of studies excluded after full-text review.
- 800 Supplementary file 3: Meta-analyses results for various variables. This was prepared to maintain the conciseness of
- the main manuscript.