ALIX DIDIER SARROUY* - RITA GRÁCIO**

# THE ONLINE COMMUNICATION OF ART-BASED EDUCATION ORGANISATIONS WORKING WITH UNDERAGE REFUGEES AND MIGRANTS IN EUROPE

*Abstract*

Communication is one of the critical issues organisations working with migrants and refugees in Europe must face. Our research question is how do art-based education organisations' projects working with underage migrants and refugees communicate online? There is a gap concerning three key discursive approaches that we wish to tackle when communicating about these populations: miserabilism, even-image, and gender-neutrality. We propose to analyse them by focusing the research on a case study of two music organisations in two different European countries – the Swedish Dream Orchestra and El Sistema Greece. Through a multimodal critical discourse analysis of their digital communication, the results show that both organisations use their multicultural contexts as an asset to persuade people to join the orchestra (as volunteers, as teachers) and to make donations. However, they do not present intercultural and transcultural alternative approaches. These findings are important to question the choices made when communicating about such ethically and emotionally-charged social phenomenon as the social inclusion of underage migrants and refugees through art-based educational projects in Europe.

* Instituto de Etnomusicologia – Música&Dança, Universidade NOVA de Lisboa, Lisbon – alixsarrouy@fcsh.unl.pt.
** CICANT – Centre for Research in Applied Communication, Culture, and New Technologies, Lusófona University, Lisbon – rita.gracio@ulusofona.pt.

1. INTRODUCTION

One of the main issues when dealing with migrants and refugees in Europe is related to communication. A telling example is that of language barriers and cultural differences between arriving migrants and the local hosts. In response, The United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), the United Nations' Refugee Agency, has promoted reports and guides to prepare its humanitarian staff for properly communicating with the incoming multicultural populations[1]. Other examples are related to the choice of words and images to label displaced people (e.g. exiled, migrant, refugee); to who has the power to do such labelling (e.g. politicians, journalists, third-sector organisations, international organisations, researchers, etc.); to what are the social, political, legal consequences and struggles over those choices[2]. Organisational communication is thus a key element in such sensitive social matters as migrations in Europe nowadays. We postulate that for the two art-based education organisations we use as case studies in Sweden and Greece, it contributes to advancing their mission of social integration of refugees and migrants through music, but the communication choices tend to reproduce certain defaults based on emotion and that must be questioned.

Communication scholarship has long recognized that communication is constitutive of organisations[3], as well as the importance of mediations, such as websites, blogs, social media in communication processes[4], which applies to nonprofit art-based education organisations like the ones in our case study. Given that we live in a growing mediatized world[5], the organisational communication field has been studying web-based communication strategies of projects dealing with refugees and migrants[6].

On one hand, the literature on the use of arts towards social integration of refugees has been fruitful in analysing the processes of production and reception of artistic initiatives, privileging face-to-face interaction[7]. However, it has overlooked the organisational communication of art-based education projects working with and for migrant youth in Europe. On the other hand, the fields of cultural economics, arts marketing and cultural management have devoted some attention to digital communication of art-

[1] UNHCR, Munich University of Applied Sciences, *Effective and Respectful Communication in Forced Displacement,* 2015. Accessed September 3, 2021. https://www.refworld.org/pdfid/573d5cef4.pdf.

[2] M. Krzyżanowski, A. Triandafyllidou, R. Wodak, "The Mediatization and the Politicization of the 'Refugee Crisis' in Europe", *Journal of Immigrant & Refugee Studies*, 16, 1/2 (2018): 1-14. Accessed September 3, 2021. DOI: 10.1080/15562948.2017.1353189.

[3] L. Putnam, K.J. Krone, eds., *Organisational Communication*, London: Thousand Oaks, Calif.: Sage, 2018.

[4] J.G. Wirtz, T.M. Zimbres, "A Systematic Analysis of Research Applying 'Principles of Dialogic Communication' to Organisational Websites, Blogs, and Social Media: Implications for Theory and Practice", *Journal of Public Relations Research*, 30, 1/2 (2018): 5-34. Accessed August 27, 2021. DOI: 10.1080/1062726X.2018.1455146.

[5] A. Hepp, F. Krotz, eds., *Mediatized Worlds: Culture and Society in a Media Age*, London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014. Accessed August 27, 2021. DOI: 10.1057/9781137300355.

[6] L. Chouliaraki, A. Vestergaard, eds., *Routledge Handbook of Humanitarian Communication*, London: Routledge, 2019.

[7] S. Musca, "Crisis in the Making: Public Theatre, Migration and Activist Aesthetics", *Comunicazioni Sociali*, 1, (2019): 42-51. Accessed August 29, 2021. DOI: 10.26350/001200_000042; R.K. Raanaas, S.Ø. Aase, S. Huot, "Finding Meaningful Occupation in Refugees' Resettlement: A Study of Amateur Choir Singing in Norway", *Journal of Occupational Science*, 26, 1 (2019): 65-76. Accessed August 29, 2021. DOI: 10.1080/14427591.2018.1537884.

based education organisations but have overlooked the communication in multicultural contexts[8].

Our research question is how do art-based education organisations' projects working with underage migrants and refugees communicate? We propose to start answering by focusing the research on a case study of two similar music organisations in two different European countries – the Swedish Dream Orchestra and El Sistema Greece. Our empirical analysis will focus on the digital communication of these two programs as they use symphonic music as a tool for the education and inclusion of underage migrants and refugees.

We find that the organisational communication of these two orchestras does not dialogue with neither migrants and refugees nor with potential listeners/audiences, but with potential donors in the host countries and internationally: donors of time (volunteers), donors of expertise (musicians, from local professional ones to high-profile international musicians), and donors of money (sponsors, international funding agencies). The organisational communication of these two orchestras might be at odds with the music program itself, jeopardizing the social inclusion potential of the orchestra. We discuss the implications of our findings to the field of refugee studies and music education.

In the next sections we will presen t our theoretical framework, followed by our case study, the methods used, and the results found. We wrap up with a conclusion.

## 2. REPRESENTATIONS OF UNDERAGE MIGRANTS AND REFUGEES

Music education programs for refugees and migrants involve the constant sharing of space between people with extremely diverse sociocultural backgrounds. The reality lived daily by directors, teachers and students is a multicultural one. Reflection on how to communicate about it, either face-to-face or online, either in interpersonal interactions or in institutional communication, is crucial.

To set a framework for the analysis of the communication of music education programs aimed at migrants and refugees, we provide a review of controversial themes regarding their representation. This enables us to understand how the communication of these music education projects relates to broader issues, assess to what extent the discursive strategies of arts organisations' communication reproduce or subvert more mainstream discourses on migrants and refugees. We then conceptualize multi-inter and trans-cultural views, which helps us tackle the issue of migrant and refugees' representation.

The way migrants and refugees are socially constructed through discourses by words and images in several outlets (e.g. policy documents, news, international organisations, arts-based projects, academic literature, etc.), has produced a vast amount of literature. We identified three main problematic themes when representing refugees and migrants: the "even image", the miserabilist perception, and the gender-neutral approach.

Firstly, migrants and refugees each tend to be portrayed through an "even image" based on the collective, at the expense of the agency of individuals, especially of mul-

ticultural underage refugees[9]. Concerning the choice of concepts during the 2015 migration crisis that caused a massive flow of people towards Europe, mainly coming from the Middle-East, Central Asia and sub-Saharan countries[10] has shown how chosen nationalities, such as the Syrians were labelled by some governments and by the media as "refugees" because of what they condemn as a dictatorship in the respective country, while others were labelled as migrants. Moreover, such application of the word refugee as a distinctive tag was used before any legal procedures and applied to the collective of moving Syrians, a procedure known as *prima facie*. Refugees from Afghanistan for instance didn't benefit from such treatment but were also under an "even image" perception, starting with the umbrella label "Afghans", to present a multitribal and multireligious population in which, for instance, Shia minorities, such as the Hazara, are persecuted.

Secondly, there is also a "miserabilist" perception of refugees[11]. This is a reductionist approach, limiting the acknowledgement of the diversity of individual biographies and the richness of the cultures of origin. A miserabilist approach also seems to focus on a limited time frame, based around the migrant and refugee experience, forgetting all other aspects of the concerned individuals. There is a life before and after the migration experience, one must be open to it for more accurate communication.

Thirdly, migration and refugee studies, as well as social sciences literature on the topic, are not fully attentive to the particularities of gender, and even less so about non-normative sexuality[12]. This shortcoming might be explained in terms of "equality approaches" in secular societies or lost amid the "even image". Nonetheless, it erases experiences according to gender, namely related to the family's culture of origin, especially religion and customs.

Hence, the way art-based education organisations represent refugees and migrants calls for scrutiny. To do so we will complement our conceptual approach by applying the work done by the French philosopher and sociologist, Jacques Demorgon, who has extensively written about three connected concepts that are operative for the analysis we propose: multicultural; intercultural; transcultural.

### 3. A CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK TO RETHINK THE REPRESENTATION OF REFUGEES AND MIGRANTS

The "multicultural" approach sets instruments of thought and perception of the other, to incite mutual recognition and respect but having defined spaces for each culture[13], which

---

[9] J. Kühnemund, "Attempts of Visibility and Recognition", in *Topographies of "Borderland Schengen". Documental Images of Undocumented Migration in European Borderlands*, edited by J. Kühnemund, Bielefeld: transcript, 2018: 179-216. Accessed August 28, 2021. DOI:10.14361/9783839442081-006.

[10] K. Akoka, "Distinguer les réfugiés des migrants au XXème siècle: Enjeux et usages des politiques de classification", in *Définir les réfugiés,* edited by M. Agier and A. Madeira, Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 2017: 47-68 (65).

[11] A. Flipo, "Entre misérabilisme et injonction à la mobilité. Dominocentrisme et dominomorphisme dans l'étude des migrations internationals", in *Migrations, circulations, mobilités. Nouveaux enjeux épistémologiques et conceptuels à l'épreuve du terrain,* edited by N. Ortar, M. Salzbrunn, M. Stock, Aix en Provence: Presses Universitaires de Provence, 2017: 47-57.

[12] E. Pittaway, L. Bartolomei, "Enhancing the Protection of Women and Girls through the Global Compact on Refugees", *Forced Migration Review*, 57 (2018): 77-79.

[13] J. Demorgon, *Complexité des cultures et de l'interculturel. Contres les pensées uniques*, Paris: Economica, 2004, 22.

Taylor has conceptualized as "politics of recognition"[14]. In its noun form, *interculturality* represents a social fact that happens as soon as two or more cultures share a territory, whatever the moral and practical quality of its results. The reciprocity of actions and non-actions influences all involved cultures at individual and collective levels. This is where the author proposes to distinguish between "adjustment *interculturality*" (based on mutual adaptation) and "engendering *interculturality*" (based on new collective creation)[15].

Conceptually, after multicultural and intercultural, the next step is "transcultural". It can signify what is transversal to different and even distant cultures but again, Demorgon complexifies the approach by differentiating between sharing biological and practical features, "infracultural *transculturality*", from sharing symbolic matters related to beliefs and spirituality, "supracultural *transculturality*"[16]. Borrowing on Piaget[17], Demorgon operates the conceptual neologism of *equilibration*, meaning the action of trying to reach a certain equilibrium between the three conceptions, in which the awareness of what is transcultural[18] in a historical time frame perspective has a key role to play for reaching *interculturation*, the process of co-construction in intercultural social settings[19]. For such awareness to be transmitted through art-based education organisation's communication in multicultural contexts, the fields of history, sociology, and anthropology may provide fundamental tools, revealing cultural bridges and explaining path differences.

## 4. THE SWEDISH DREAM ORCHESTRA AND EL SISTEMA GREECE

As a case study of art-based education organisations working with migrants and refugees we choose two music education projects: the Swedish Dream Orchestra and El Sistema Greece. Based in Gothenburg, the Swedish Dream Orchestra (SwedishDO) was founded in 2016 and specifically aimed at the recently arrived underage refugees. It started as a specific project of the main music organisation, El Sistema Sweden, but has taken full independence since 2021. It benefits over 300 students from eighteen countries nowadays.

The second program we focus our attention on is based in Athens and was also founded in 2016. El Sistema Greece (ESGreece) has the mission of providing free music classes to underprivileged youth, namely migrants and refugees. It has over 2500 students, in five different locations, including two refugee camps. These two art-based education programs were chosen because they were specifically created to respond to the 2015 migrant crisis in two very different societies, in opposite ends of Europe. The fact that they use music-learning as a tool for social integration, was a key element in our choices since we had previously worked on similar projects in Portugal (Orquestra Geração), France (Demos), Brazil (Neojiba) and Venezuela (El Sistema), in the field of music sociology[20].

---

[14] C. Taylor, "The Politics of Recognition", in *Multiculturalism: Examining the Politics of Recognition*, edited by A. Gutmann, Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994: 25-74.

[15] Demorgon, *Complexité des cultures et de l'interculturel. Contres les pensées uniques*, 23.

[16] *Ibid.*, 25.

[17] J. Piaget, *The Equilibration of Cognitive Structures: The Central Problem of Intellectual Development*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985.

[18] Demorgon, *Critique de l'interculturel: l'horizon de la sociologie*, Paris: Economica, 2005, 149.

[19] *Ibid.*, 57.

[20] A.D. Sarrouy, *Atores da educação musical: etnografia comparativa entre três núcleos que se inspiram no programa El Sistema na Venezuela, no Brasil e em Portugal*, Famalicão: Edições Húmus, 2022.

Even if they are independent institutionally, financially, and methodologically, both music programs are inspired by the acclaimed and contested El Sistema[21], a Venezuelan music-education program started in 1975, that has followers in over sixty countries. Originally it applied to national socioeconomically disadvantaged children and youth, not to refugees or migrants[22]. Having closely experienced El Sistema and the possibilities of music learning as a tool for social inclusion, the leaders of the SwedishDO[23] and ESGreece have decided to adapt such original motivations and methodologies to new very specific contexts.

These organisations are run in European countries with two different migrant and refugee contexts. One of the main differences is that most underage music students in Greece are accompanied by family members and are based in camps[24]. In Sweden, many more minors are unaccompanied, mostly those arriving during the 2015 migrant crisis, with a majority from Afghanistan and Syria[25]. Protected by national laws and the UN Convention on the Rights of Child, they were placed in safe accommodations under social workers' and municipalities' responsibility, having to go to school to learn a trade and Swedish language in three years to gain more chances of an authorized residency once they become adults.

There is a growing body of scholarship on El Sistema inspired music education projects in general[26] and on those focusing on migration issues[27]. Nonetheless, on one hand, they overlook its organisational communication, with exceptions such as the analysis of two videos on El Sistema Sweden's website[28]. On the other hand, these studies do not focus on the work of El Sistema inspired programs with migrants and refugees in Europe. The marketing studies on orchestras' communication are rare and mostly focus on audiences, not on the digital organisational communication itself[29]. Moreover, the fact that in

---

[21] G. Baker, *El Sistema: Orchestrating Venezuela's Youth*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014; B. Bolden, S. Corcoran, A. Butler, "A Scoping Review of Research that Examines El Sistema and Sistema-Inspired Music Education Programmes", *Review of Education*, 9, 3 (2021). Accessed September 9, 2021. DOI: 10.1002/REV3.3267.

[22] In 2014, El Sistema Venezuela worked in partnership with UNHCR in an inclusive program for the immigrants arriving from Colombia. Interview of Janet Lim, UNHCR Assistant High Commissioner. Accessed February 13, 2022. https://www.acnur.org/noticias/noticia/2014/12/5b0c22f1b/.

[23] Dream Orchestra's music teaching leaders have recently published a book on the specifics of this program and of its pedagogical methods: F. Verhagen, R.D. Alvarez, *Dream Orchestra: A Learning Model*, Gothenburg: B4PRESS, 2021.

[24] H. Cabot, "The European Refugee Crisis and Humanitarian Citizenship in Greece", *Ethnos*, 84, 5 (2019): 747-771. Accessed September 9, 2021. DOI: 10.1080/00141844.2018.1529693.

[25] U. Wernesjö, "Across the Threshold: Negotiations of Deservingness among Unaccompanied Young Refugees in Sweden", *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 46, 2 (2020): 389-404. Accessed September 4, 2021. DOI: 10.1080/1369183X.2019.1584701.

[26] A. Creech, ed., *El Sistema and Sistema-Inspired Programmes: A Literature Review of Research, Evaluation, and Critical Debate*, Sistema Global, 2016. Accessed September 4, 2021. https://sistemaglobal.org/literature-review/.

[27] C. Lenette, N. Sunderland, "'Will There Be Music for Us?' Mapping the Health and Well-Being Potential of Participatory Music Practice with Asylum Seekers and Refugees across Contexts of Conflict and Refuge", *Arts & Health*, 8, 1 (2016): 32-49. Accessed September 4, 2021. DOI: 10.1080/17533015.2014.961943; S. Vougioukalou, R. Dow, L. Bradshaw, T. Pallant, "Wellbeing and Integration through Community Music: The Role of Improvisation in a Music Group of Refugees, Asylum Seekers and Local Community Members", *Contemporary Music Review*, 38, 5 (2019): 533-548. Accessed September 4, 2021. DOI: 10.1080/07494467.2019.1684075.

[28] A.-K Kuuse, M. Lindgren, E. Skåreus, "'The Feelings Have Come Home to Me': Examining Advertising Films on the Swedish Website of El Sistema", *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, 15, 1 (2016): 188-215.

[29] V. Gosling, G. Crawford, G. Bagnall, N. Light, "Branded App Implementation at the London Symphony Orchestra", *Arts and the Market*, 6, 1 (2016): 2-16. Accessed September 4, 2021. DOI: 10.1108/A AM-08-2013-0012; D. Patmore (2014), "The Marketing of Orchestras and Symphony Concerts", in *The Routledge Companion to Arts Marketing*, edited by D. O'Reilly, Routledge, 2014: chapter 35.

our case studies the orchestra members are mostly underage migrants and refugees, brings a new complexity concerning communication since there are constant ethical issues and a risk of image exploitation[30].

## 5. METHOD: MULTIMODAL CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS

Websites are *loci* of the digital organisational discourse, with a wide world reach. Via these websites, organisations present their identity and activities to the public, and, at the same time, through website design, they configure their users, as they communicate to an implied audience.

Website communication is multimodal (e.g. text, image, video/moving image, hyperlinks). Hence, we use multimodal critical discourse analysis[31] to analyse websites. We follow the understanding that its visual information produces "ways of seeing"[32], which create particular social and power relations[33], as some people/things/actions are seen while others are made invisible.

Due to a lack of literature on art-based education organisations working with refugees/migrants' digital communication, we also draw on the literature on humanitarian organisations' digital communication[34], and non-profit organisations' digital communication[35] to empirically study the Swedish Dream Orchestra (SwedishDO) and El Sistema Greece (ESGreece). Humanitarian organisations studies have shown that, along with mass media, the Internet is a widely used tool to launch campaigns for migrants, which aim to promote positive intercultural attitudes, doing public advocacy for the migrants' cause[36]. We draw on this literature as humanitarian organisations, such as SwedishDO and ESGreece, are nonprofit organisations (NPOs) working with underprivileged people and for social inclusion causes. We also draw on arts marketing literature, with a focus on symphonic marketing (as cited above).

The data set consists of a mapping of the elements on the websites of both organisations, the SwedishDO (https://dreamorchestra.se/) and ESGreece (https://elsistema. gr/). This mapping was conducted by manually accessing and extracting information on each website during the summer of 2021. Adapted from previous studies[37], we collected

[30] J. Kędra, M. Sommier, "Children in the Visual Coverage of the European Refugee Crisis: A Case Study of the World Press Photo 2016", *Journal of Applied Journalism and Media Studies*, 7, 1 (2018): 37-58. Accessed September 7, 2021. DOI: 10.1386/AJMS.7.1.37_1.

[31] G.R. Kress, T. Van Leeuwen, *Reading Images: The Grammar of Visual Design*, Routledge, 2020; D. Machin, *Introduction to Multimodal Analysis*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.

[32] J. Berger, *Ways of Seeing*, Pinguin Books, 1990.

[33] G. Rose, *Visual Methodologies: An Introduction to Researching with Visual Materials*, Sage, 2016, 260.

[34] Chouliaraki, Vestergaard, eds., *Routledge Handbook of Humanitarian Communication*.

[35] J.G. Wirtz, T.M. Zimbres, "A Systematic Analysis of Research Applying 'Principles of Dialogic Communication' to Organisational Websites, Blogs, and Social Media: Implications for Theory and Practice", *Journal of Public Relations Research*, 30, 1/2 (2018): 5-34. Accessed September 8, 2021. DOI: 10.1080/1062726X.2018.1455146.

[36] Y. Moskovich, A. Binhas, "NGOs Helping Migrants: An Israeli Case Study of Counterculture", *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, 35, 9/10 (2015): 635-648. Accessed September 8, 2021. DOI: 10.1108/IJSSP-11-2014-0109.

[37] K. Lovejoy, G.D. Saxton, "Information, Community, and Action: How Nonprofit Organisations Use Social Media", *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, 17, 3 (2012): 337-353. Accessed September 8, 2021. DOI: 10.1111/j.1083-6101.2012.01576.x; L. Stein, "Social Movement Web Use in Theory and Practice: A Content Analysis of US Movement Websites", *New Media & Society*, 11, 5 (2009): 749-771. Accessed September 8, 2021. DOI: 10.1177/1461444809105350.

data on the following themes: information-sharing (e.g. information about the organisation's mission, values, events, news, reports, etc.), community building (e.g. giving recognition to people/entities outside the organisations, acknowledgement of other entities' events); and action-oriented (e.g. sections and/or messages that aim to get viewers to take action for the organisation, from donating money to attending concerts). These are considered the main organisational functions when using web-based communication. For each of these items, we analyzed which words, images (such as photographs and videos), and hyperlinks are present on the website, as they are here understood as the discursive elements that fulfil those organisational functions.

Because the photographs were a very prominent element on the websites, and focusing on social semiotic resources, we conducted a separate analysis of the photographs on the following dimensions: the gaze, positionality/angle of interaction, distance, collectivization/individualization, attributes, absences[38]. The gaze refers to the fact that people depicted might be looking at the viewer, meaning there is interaction with the viewer – it might be pleading, seductive, friendly, etc. – or not, in which case the depicted people are, to some extent objectified. Positionality is given by the angle from which we view a person: horizontal, vertical oblique. A horizontal angle shows "face to face" interaction, and a side-on (profile) view can mean more detachedness. The vertical angles are often indexed to looking down or looking up to someone. Distance is a signifier of social relations, hence, if short distance and intimacy are indexed by close shots/close-ups, long shots reflect non-intimate relations and even anonymity. The kinds of people represented can be individuals or groups: pictures that show only one person are individualizing (individualization), and those which show groups or crowds are homogenizing the people depicted. There are combinations: even if a person is alone, it can have their traits less recognizable through a long shot; or the people can be homogenized in different degrees, such as wearing the same clothes, performing the same actions, striking the same poses. Categorisation of people can be conducted through cultural attributes (e.g. dress, hairstyle, adornments) or biological attributes (e.g. stereotyped physical characteristics, ethnic-racial stereotypes), or both. Finally, we also analyzed the absences: who and what (e.g. instruments) are not on the photographs.

## 6. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### 6.1. *A comparative analysis of the web-based communication*

The menu structure of both websites is similar, as well as the visual structure, with high-quality photographs in every website's section heading. On both websites, we can find the following categories: organisation's mission, goals, members' profile.

In the case of ESGreece, the website is available in two languages: English and Greek. However, in social media, the content is available in Greek only (although some platforms have an automatic translation tool, enabling the translation to virtually any language). This seems to indicate that ESGreece's social media is targeted at local Greek audiences, whereas the website is targeted at both local and international stakeholders. SwedishDO has made more languages available as the website can be read in Swedish,

---

[38] D. Machin, *Introduction to Multimodal Analysis*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.

English and Spanish. The same goes for their social media accounts, in which they publish content in all three languages.

The use of Spanish as a language in both the website and social media seems to be a way for SwedishDO to perform its affiliation with El Sistema Venezuela. This is confirmed by the fact that the teaching and artistic directors, as well as the website maker/keeper, have previously worked for El Sistema in Caracas. Both websites present the organisations as global players in the international arena of music programs inspired by El Sistema's teaching methods, adapting them to each country and its specific immigration contexts. SwedishDO has a section with News, whereas ESGreece has a section with Stories. Both these sections have the rhetorical function of showing the implementation of (globalist) music education programs in the local contexts.

Even though compared to ES Greece, there is more diversity of languages available in the website communication of the Swedish DO, the former as chosen to employ the word "inclusion" and the latter "integration". These much-worked concepts in social-science literature, have developed notions with particular symbolic weighs: integration may be perceived as an inwards movement, leading to acculturation; inclusion may be perceived as an acceptance of the difference, looking for a compromise that sets an acceptance of the other without disowning its original culture[39]. On the other hand, ESGreece's communication choices, namely in the pictures and in the use of certain words, reveal a more inclusive approach. This raises the question of how and why such concepts, integration and inclusion, are chosen and applied in the organisation's communication. For instance, visiting the two websites, it is noticeable that ESGreece benefits from a bigger team, having a communications manager such as Sevi Matsakidou, presented as "the person behind the *words* of El Sistema Greece, having studied theatre, communications and semiotics".

## 6.2. *Not an even image, but a musical collective made of individual people*

The metaphor of the orchestra as a family and as a microcosmos of society emerges in both organisational discourses, through text and images. The main difference is that ESGreece displays a more collective presentation of the organisation: the photographs show more people playing, they are often photographs taken top-down, capturing the orchestra as a whole. It also shows more often an important actor that was missing from most SwedishDO photographs: the audience. This reinforces the broader collective display of the organisation.

Both websites have a section for presenting the teachers, where we can find a photograph and a biography of each one. However, whereas in SwedishDO the teachers are portrayed by a frontal close up, in ESGreece, they are portrayed acting at distance, playing or teaching, and often we can see the students in those photographs. Both websites present detailed information about their music programs and their pedagogies, too. Whereas the pedagogical programs in ESGreece are segmented by the musical activity itself (e.g. Instrumental lessons, Music theory, Choir, etc.), in SwedishDO, they are

---

[39] A.C. Korteweg, "The Failures of 'Immigrant Integration': The Gendered Racialized Production of Non-Belonging", *Migration Studies*, 5, 3 (2017): 428-444. Accessed September 10, 2021. DOI: 10.1093/migration/mnx025; A. Lems, "Being Inside Out: The Slippery Slope between Inclusion and Exclusion in a Swiss Educational Project for Unaccompanied Refugee Youth", *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 46, 2 (2020): 405-422. Accessed September 10, 2021. DOI: 10.1080/1369183X.2019.1584702.

segmented considering the students' ages (e.g. Vivaldi program, from 3 years old, Mozart program, from 6 years old) and the size of the musical group itself (e.g. Full orchestra or smaller Working groups). This textual and visual display of information shapes the construction of ESGreece's image as a more collective musical project, where group interaction is key, whereas SwedishDO individualizes both teachers and their students.

We argue that in both websites the musical group that is the orchestra as a family, reproduces the "common humanity" discourse[40], the "oneness" criticized by post-colonial readings of humanitarian approaches, as the orchestra becomes that common humanity musical space. This is conveyed textually, for instance, paraphrasing a SwedishDO's teacher: "we are all on the same ground, either you're a professional musician or an amateur". In ESGreece, more than music proficiency it is the unity of social status that is highlighted: everyone can join the orchestra with the aim of "bringing people together, no matter their background, language and religion" (in *Proud of Our Story*).

On both websites, there is a use of direct quotes. In ESGreece these quotes are placed on the main page, whereas in SwedishDO they are spread throughout the different sections. In SwedishDO quotes are identified only by the person's first name and their role in the project (e.g. musicians and played instruments, teachers, parents and volunteers). This is a form of music individualization – instead of identifying one's cultural origin, they identify the person's musical role. This is also a way of individualizing through the musical role in the orchestra. In both websites, they do not include other information, which reinforces the trope that one is a member or a student, regardless of their biographical experiences, whether that background is musical (e.g. professional or amateur), religious or geographical.

It is the collective character of orchestral music playing (i.e., Let's play music together is SwedishDO's website's signature, and we highlighted the collective dimension of ESGreece) which enables individualization in the new collective (i.e., becoming a legitimated member in Sweden or Greece societies), but not personalization at all levels. For example, according to what's portrayed on the websites, there does not seem to be a musical choice beyond the symphonic repertoire and the symphonic instruments available.

### 6.3. *Not "miserables", but in-need learners in a musical collective*

On SwedishDO's website it is stated that the students are underage refugees only, whereas in ESGreece, the orchestra is said to be for refugees, migrants, and Greeks. However, in SwedishDO, the children and young people are seldom referred to as refugees or migrants, but as "vulnerable" or "excluded". Most often they are referred to as "orchestra members". Hence, they are not represented as threats, which is another issue when representing refugees although we argue that they are, to some extent, represented as "passive" (but not victims), and in need of help.

Underage refugees and migrants are constructed as learners through textual and visual dimensions (symphonic orchestral members/instrument learners). However, it is not revealed if they had previous music knowledge, skills, or genre preferences. The

---

involved minors are often portrayed as if, apart from the traumas of the forced migration, they were "blank pages", artistically speaking. They may choose the instrument, from those available in the symphonic orchestra, and that seems to be the only musical agency they have.

Whereas in ESGreece children are referred to as "true artists", in SwedishDO the children and young people are positioned more often as learners-only. Because in ESGreece the audience is shown (unlike in SwedishDO) it also reinforces the idea of the students as "artists", as arts need an audience, in the same way, they need a venue for concerts.

In terms of the visual choices, in SwedishDO there is recurrent imagery of children attentively and quietly listening or, at most, interacting with a teacher, positioning such a figure as the bearer of musical knowledge, and as the active element in the photographs. Passivity is also reinforced by images of the children and young people playing in an apparently quiet and effortless manner, contrasting with representations of the energetic teacher and the recurrent media representations of El Sistema's orchestras and its enthusiastic players. Nonetheless, this projection of "passiveness" is relative, as learning is an action and demands individual agency. Interpretation may be guided by the communicator but it is largely influenced by each one's perception tools and pre-conceptions.

Children and young people are also constructed as learners through visual imagery in SwedishDO, as in the photographs the audience is absent during the rehearsals, but also on stage and after the concerts. The only photographs showing the audience's presence are associated with "action" (in *Invite Us*) and information (in *Where We Rehearse*).

Children and young people are individualized in the way they are represented on the website, as the viewer is always able to watch their faces and expressions through videos and photographs. In this sense, we can say that children and young people are humanized, unlike in other media representations. At the same time, they are collectivized musically, when they appear in the orchestra photographs, without even being identified by their names – which is common in the visual representations of orchestras, and hence they are no different from other symphonic orchestras.

Concerning miserabilism, the discourse of helpless/in-need is also part of the SwedishDO history, as this orchestra was created "especially for those who needed it the most: the unaccompanied minors escaping from countries in conflict" (in *About us*). The discourse of helpless/in-need is also implicit in the website's calls to action, an action that is undertaken by the website viewers, who are people not in need (unlike the in-need music students). More specifically, the appeals to "*Support our work*", and the appeals to donate, textually position children and young people as "in need", both musically (e.g. needing instruments), and extra-musically (e.g. home, safety, medical support, job). Regarding the musical necessities, these are visually represented by violins reproducing this instrument's high symbolic capital, one that could "convince" of full legitimacy towards integration.

On both sites we have several calls to action: to donate (e.g. money, instruments), to become a member of the orchestra, to join as a volunteer, to connect via social networks and to subscribe to newsletters. Concerning the SwedishDO, another reason presented in the *Support our work* section is that in Sweden companies must have Corporate Social Responsibility, which is a legal mechanism that enables funding. This type of mechanism can be said to have a visual "post-humanitarian" appeal. According to Lilie Chouliaraki the "post-humanitarian" form of appeals addresses the morality of the "Western self" to achieve solidarity with the displaced people. Hence, if it is the

displaced people as a collective in need, it is also the West collectively that must be solidary.

### 6.4. *Male gendering of teachers, and the feminization of the students*

When paying attention to gender representations, we note that there is a binary gendering of staff in SwedishDO: the section *Teachers* is headed by a male figure, the artistic director, but female teachers outnumber male teachers. Also, volunteers and applicants are visually represented as female, as if the social reproduction of care[41], was also characterised by image selection. In SwedishDO female children and young people are portrayed more often with religious symbols, namely, the hijab. It is telling that one of the main page heading photographs shows six children playing their instruments and, in the middle, is a young girl with a hijab, holding a clarinet, whereas on her left side every other youngster is playing the trumpets, and on her right side, they are playing the trombones. Hence, the gender becomes distinctively associated with a religion visible by its outfit customs and that female representation of Islam becomes a symbol of "otherness" that may be integrated. In SwedishDO, not only girls show more often wearing a hijab, as those pictures are highlighted and placed as headlines. That is not the case in ESGreece, where girls are not portrayed using hijabs.

Regarding gender and phenotypes, in ESGreece we can see more pictures of girls with darker skin tones, whereas in SwedishDO the girls portrayed have lighter skin tones but are more often portrayed wearing a hijab. If, on one hand, this is a way of legitimating these music programs as multicultural spaces, on the other hand, they are also stressing cultural differences based on ethnicity, an issue that has been pointed out in previous studies[42].

## 7. AN ORCHESTRAL REPRESENTATION OF UNDERAGE MIGRANTS AND REFUGEES AS A PATHWAY TO *INTERCULTURATION* THROUGH ONLINE ORGANISATIONAL COMMUNICATION

The digital organisational communication of arts organisations is an overlooked topic, which we explored, due to the constitutive nature of communication in organisations. More specifically, we aimed at answering the question of how art-based education projects for underage migrants and refugees communicate. We proposed an empirical study of the web-based strategies in two specific music education projects: the Swedish Dream Orchestra (SwedishDO) and El Sistema Greece (ESGreece).

Because websites are not accessible in the native languages of refugees and migrants, only in the host country language and in English and Spanish, we might say that the websites are not fully accessible to the people to whom SwedishDO and ESGreece target their music education programs for. In the context of the labour market integration

---

[41] E. Kofman, "Rethinking Care through Social Reproduction: Articulating Circuits of Migration", *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State & Society*, 19, 1 (2012): 142-162. Accessed September 11, 2021. DOI: 10.1093/sp/jxr030.

[42] Å. Bergman, M. Lindgren, E. Sæther, "Struggling for Integration: Universalist and Separatist Discourses within El Sistema Sweden", *Music Education Research*, 18, 4 (2016): 364-375 (371). Accessed September 11, 2021. DOI: 10.1080/14613808.2016.1240765

of young refugees and asylum seekers, studies show that language is one of the biggest barriers[43]. Hence, to potentiate integration in music education projects, websites could be also made available in the mother tongues of refugees and migrants, Arabic and Persian being the most common in both cases.

If websites configure their users, given this language issue, the refugees and migrants themselves do not seem to be perceived as the main website users. Textually, the website seems to configure its users as donors: donors of time (appealing to volunteers), financial donors (appealing to funders and sponsors), and donors of expertise (appealing to music educators and professional musicians). Mostly it is the image of girls and women using their hijab and holding a violin that serves as a token to capture possible donors' attentions. More than darker skins or than young middle eastern boys holding instruments, the female presence wearing Islamic veils and playing in an orchestra serves as a strong statement based on the high symbolic characters – the peaceful girls/women; the Islamic religion being compatible with European artistic and social integration; the possibility of sharing the same orchestral space between genders; among others.

Refugees and migrants are visually represented in a broad positive manner, that contrasts with negative depictions of migrants (i.e., as victims, as miserable, as threats, as totally passive, as an even mass of people). Visually, they are represented as learning and playing music, confirming their status as engaged music students, committed orchestra members, and "true artists". The claims to integration through music are provided by these seemingly positive visual representations, and by direct quotes from orchestra members and their families. However, there is a lack of evidence to support the claims of integration in the context of the policy-making and stakeholders' pressure towards an adequate impact evaluation of arts, which can translate into funding. Given this context, the website itself might act as a proxy for that evidence.

We conclude that the websites subvert the mainstream "even image" of refugees, as well as the miserabilist approach. However, it still represents refugees as "in need", not only of non-artistic assistance (e.g. home, transportation, job, and salary) but also of musical support. Both websites have a visual and written discourse of integration possibilities based on respect in multicultural contexts, but we argue that there is a lack of intercultural and transcultural[44] approaches to communication.

What Chouliaraki[45] has conceptualized as "common humanity" is used as an emotional argument to convince all sorts of donors, but the results reveal that it mostly serves as a ground to push the migrants and refugees towards the host country's culture. The communication is mostly made in one direction, inward, with a lack of equitable exchange in terms of music instruments, genres, social codes. Demorgon's conceptualisation of *transculturality*, as what is shared between cultures at infracultural and supracultural levels[46], is only observed in the communication choices when the culture of the underage migrants and refugees is needed to enhance the possible union between differences (e.g. the hijab in the multi-gendered and cultural orchestra) or to create emo-

[43] S. Udayar *et al.*, "Labour Market Integration of Young Refugees and Asylum Seekers: A Look at Perceived Barriers and Resources*", British Journal of Guidance & Counselling*, 49, 2 (2021): 287-303. Accessed February 16, 2022. DOI: 10.1080/03069885.2020.1858023.

[44] Demorgon, *Complexité des cultures et de l'interculturel. Contres les pensées uniques*, Paris: Economica, 2004.

[45] L. Chouliaraki, "Post-Humanitarianism: Humanitarian Communication beyond a Politics of Pity", *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, 13, 2 (2010): 107-126. Accessed September 10, 2021. DOI: 10.1177/1367877909356720.

[46] Demorgon, *Complexité des cultures et de l'interculturel. Contres les pensées uniques*, 25.

tions (e.g. refugee children holding a symbolically legitimated violin and therefore legitimising themselves in the arrival culture).

In the communication of both organisations, instead of an intercultural approach, implying sharing each one's original culture with others (*interculturation*), and revealing common points (*transculturality*), children and young people are presented as the receptors of western musical knowledge. The orchestra is a musical space for modelling non-musical behaviours, namely citizenship behaviours, informed by supposedly shared national and European values (e.g. pluralism). To learn how to play a western instrument in a symphonic orchestra is symbolically equated with becoming a European citizen or, at least, it may serve as a communication tool helping the organisations as well as the individuals, to come closer to each's integration goals (e.g. financial, organisational, societal, relating to citizenship, language and independence).

Analysing the overall web-based communication choices, there is a definite lack of "engendering *interculturality*"[47], one that would result from the daily creative and equilibrated union[48] between cultures in art-based education projects, influencing the ways of teaching, learning, playing and communicating. A type of "third-culture", engendered by daily intercultural experiences, insisting on inclusion rather than solely on integration, doesn't come across in the communication of both organisations.

Nevertheless, to avoid a shallow analysis over this observation, further research is needed to tackle it, namely, to understand how and why art-based education programs working with underaged migrants and refugees might be caught in a communication posture that is more centred on acculturation than on what Demorgon names "interculturation"[49], based on a two-way inclusion effort, one that could be effective in the actions and clear in the communication.

---

[47] *Ibid.*, 23.
[48] Demorgon, *Critique de l'interculturel: l'horizon de la sociologie*, 149.
[49] *Ibid.*, 57.