

March 2023

A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest: Haydn's "Farewell" Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Opus 25/5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26

James S. MacKay

Loyola University New Orleans, jsmackay@loyno.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>



Part of the [Music Theory Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

MacKay, James S. (2023) "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest: Haydn's "Farewell" Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Opus 25/5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26," *HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America*: Vol. 13, Article 3.

Available at: <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal/vol13/iss1/3>

A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest: Haydn's "Farewell" Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Opus 25/5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26

Cover Page Footnote

This article is a revised version of a paper presentation given at the annual meeting of the Canadian University Music Society (MUSCAN), Vancouver, Canada, June 5-7, 2019; and at the Southampton Music Analysis Conference (SOTONMAC 2019), Southampton, UK, July 29-31, 2019.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's "Farewell" Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26¹

By James MacKay

Loyola University

Introduction

In 1772, Joseph Haydn composed his "Farewell" Symphony, so named because of the elaborate ruse of its closing movement, in which the performers depart one by one, leaving two violinists (likely Haydn himself, and his concertmaster, Luigi Tomasini, at the premiere²) to complete the movement on their own. This eccentric finale, though justly famous, has overshadowed the work's equally bold and tonally unusual opening movement. Haydn bypasses the relative major in the exposition, concluding this section in the dominant minor instead. This tonal decision, though common in C. P. E. Bach (whose music Haydn knew and admired³), was exceedingly rare in Haydn's output, and represents a unique tonal experiment among his sonata-form works.

This movement must have come to Muzio Clementi's attention by the time that he composed his Op. 25 piano sonatas, published in London in 1790. Op. 25 no. 5,⁴ in the unusual key of f-sharp minor like the "Farewell" Symphony, proceeds from the home key to the dominant minor with a brief stopover in the relative major, in a clear homage to the earlier movement's tonal plan. This essay will provide a close reading of both the Clementi and Haydn movements, suggesting that Clementi was not strictly modelling on the earlier work: rather, he was using its tonal plan as a jumping-off point, filling the large-scale structure with material that was solely his own.

¹ This article is an expanded version of a paper presentation given at the annual meeting of the Canadian University Music Society (MUSCAN), Vancouver, Canada, June 5–7, 2019; and at the Southampton Music Analysis Conference (SOTONMAC 2019), Southampton, UK, July 29–31, 2019.

² As suggested in Landon (Volume 2), 303.

³ Landon (Volume 2), 337–40.

⁴ Op. 26 no. 2 in Artaria's edition, published in Vienna in the 1790s.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

Finally, as an extension of the prior discussion: H. C. Robbins Landon has convincingly asserted that Haydn's London-era keyboard works (including the 15 piano trios, Hob. XV: 18-32, and the solo sonatas Hob. XVI: 50–52) display the influence of the London Pianoforte School of Clementi and his followers.⁵ This study will conclude with a brief postscript, exploring the similarities of thematic content, figuration, and emotional content between the first movements of Haydn's Piano Trio in f-sharp minor, Hob. XV: 26, and Clementi's Op. 25 no. 5. These (perhaps subconscious) similarities illustrate how Haydn's indebtedness to Clementi's sonata brought the musical material full circle nearly a quarter century later, recalling (if second hand) the "Farewell" Symphony as the ultimate source.

Haydn's "Farewell" Symphony and Clementi's Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5: Comparison of Expositions

Though Haydn and Clementi worked on opposite sides of Europe for the majority of their lives (Haydn at Eszterháza in present-day Hungary, and Clementi in and around London, England), Haydn was certainly aware of Clementi's keyboard music at least from the early 1780s onward. It is possible that Haydn may have met Clementi in person around the time of the Mozart-Clementi piano contest in Vienna, which took place on December 24, 1781, or on the following day, when Haydn presided over the premiere of his Op. 33 string quartets at the home of one of his students (Countess von Norden),⁶ though there is no concrete evidence of their meeting. Clementi's name first appears in Haydn's correspondence in a letter dated June 18, 1783: Haydn thanked Artaria for sending him a set of Clementi piano sonatas (likely Op. 7 or 9), which he commended for their beauty.⁷ In addition, he asked the publisher to convey his compliments to Clementi in person if the opportunity arose.⁸

⁵ See Landon (Volume 3), 413–15, for a brief discussion of Clementi's influence on the late piano trios, specifically Hob. XV: 18–23.

⁶ Landon (Volume 2), 456.

⁷ Graue, 426. Saint-Foix, 252, n. 1 argues that Clementi's Op. 7, specifically, was Artaria's gift to Haydn.

⁸ Landon (Volume 2), 476.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

Clementi would likely have encountered Haydn's music around the same time on one of his frequent visits to Paris or Vienna in the early 1780s, cosmopolitan centers of art and culture where his compositions were frequently played. At the very latest, he would have been able to study Haydn's music in greater depth beginning in 1784, through William Forster's publication of various Haydn symphonies and piano trios in London. By the end of the decade, Clementi knew Haydn's musical style well enough to parody it in two preludes "alla Haydn," from his *Musical Characteristics*, Op. 19, of 1787.⁹ Later on, both musicians were active in London's musical scene in the early-to-mid-1790s, when Haydn made his two visits to England under the auspices of violinist and impresario Johann Peter Salomon. On February 24, 1792, a London concert featured a Clementi overture and one of Haydn's London Symphonies¹⁰: no doubt this was one time among many that the two celebrated composers had an opportunity to collaborate and socialize.

Though Haydn and Clementi had little or no personal contact outside the five-year window (1791–1795) in which they were both in London, it is still probable that Clementi knew of Haydn's musical precedent in the "Farewell" Symphony when he composed his Op. 25 sonatas. Jean-Georges Sieber had published Haydn's work in Paris in 1784¹¹: its first performance at the Concerts Spirituels on April 13 of that year received a write-up two days later in the *Journal de Paris*.¹² The work's novel finale, with its gradual departure of the orchestra player by player, was a *cause célèbre*, provoking a mixture of astonishment and laughter.¹³ Its reputation and notoriety confirmed by the savvy Paris audience, the "Farewell" Symphony quickly circulated widely throughout Europe,¹⁴ including England, where it received a single performance in London in 1785,¹⁵ which Clementi could certainly have attended.

⁹ Saint-Foix, 254.

¹⁰ Saint-Foix, 254.

¹¹ Hoboken (Volume 1), 54.

¹² Hoboken (Volume 1), 54.

¹³ Rice, 9.

¹⁴ Landon (Volume 2), 302.

¹⁵ McVeigh, 142.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

Haydn, of course, was revered in England long before he embarked on his first London journey in 1791. After Johann Christian Bach's death in 1782, the London public settled upon Haydn as his illustrious successor: as David Wyn Jones states, "they craved Haydn's music to the extent that few concerts did not feature a work by him."¹⁶ All things considered, it is unlikely that Clementi, who had resided in London for most of his adult life, and had traveled frequently to Vienna, Paris, and other continental European cities, had been unaware of the "Farewell" Symphony and its reputation. (Ironically, Clementi had no way of knowing that his highly regarded colleague would soon be a major rival for the affections of London's music-loving public.)

Though the documentary record cannot confirm that Clementi encountered the "Farewell" Symphony prior to composing his sonata in f-sharp minor in 1790, formal similarities between the works, starting with the unusual choice of key,¹⁷ provides evidence of Haydn's influence. Clementi's exposition section appears particularly indebted to Haydn: as is evident from Table 1, the tonal and thematic parallels between the works are readily apparent. However, upon listening to the passages, one is struck by the interesting mix of seeming disparity and underlying similarity, as Clementi employs markedly different melodic material from Haydn to conceal the resemblance of formal and tonal design to his model.

Examples 1 and 2 present scores for Haydn and Clementi's exposition sections, with formal analysis. Clementi's main theme illustrates his subtle concealment of the formal similarities with Haydn's model. Although these themes are quite different in character (Clementi's languid melodic line, with its frequent turning figures and pseudo-improvised nature, contrasts with Haydn's arpeggiated melody, a "rocket theme" in reverse that descends repeatedly in two-measure segments with great nervous energy), they both articulate a sentence design, ending conclusively with a perfect authentic cadence (PAC). Clementi's intermediate half cadence (HC) in measure 8

¹⁶ Jones, 125–26.

¹⁷ Though Proksch (398) cites C. P. E. Bach's Sonata in f-sharp minor, Wq. 52/4 (from the *Probestucke*, published in 1763) as a possible antecedent, it bears little resemblance tonally or formally to the Haydn or Clementi movements under examination, other than the unusual choice of key.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

Table 1. Comparison of Expositions: Haydn "Farewell"/I and Clementi, Op. 25/5/I

Haydn, Symphony no. 45/I	Clementi Sonata, Op. 25/5I
1-8: MT (presentation)	1-4: MT (presentation)
	5-8: MT (continuation to HC/f#)
9-16: MT (continuation to PAC/f#)	9-12: MT ("one more time" to PAC/f#)
17-22: TR, dependent (MT presentation)	13-16: TR, dependent (MT presentation)
22-28: TR (continuation to V/A)	17-21: TR (continuation to HC/A)
	21-25: TR (dominant pedal)
29-37: ST 1, presentation	26-29: ST 1 (MT incipit, presentation)
38-43: TR 2 (Purple Patch, MT incipit, a)	30-36: ST 1 (continuation, PAC/A, elided)
	36-40: ST 1 ("one more time," PAC/A)
44-49: Sequence to c# minor; becomes	41-49: TR 2 (to HC/c#)
49-55: ST 2-like (cadential 1, to VI/c#)	50-51: ST 2 (MT incipit)
56-65: ST 2-like (cadential 2, to PAC/c#)	52-58: ST 2 (Fortspinnung to IAC/c#)
66-72: codetta (becomes retransition)	58-64: codetta (IAC in 61, 64)

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: *Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America* 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

Example 1. Haydn, *Farewell* Symphony, first movement: analysis of exposition

MAIN THEME (Presentation)

Continuation

12 ==>Cadential

PAC

TRANSITION (dependent--with MT incipit)

(To A major...)

23

V arrival, A major (V₂⁴)

SUBORDINATE THEME

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: *Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America* 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.
© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

"Purple Patch" as Transition 2 (dependent--with MT incipit)

(a minor...)

to c-sharp minor...

=>Cadential 1 (Subordinate Theme 2-like, presentation)

Cadential 2 (continuation)

c-sharp minor: VI (deceptive)

Codetta

PAC, c-sharp minor

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: *Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America* 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

Example 2. Clementi, Piano Sonata in f-sharp minor, Opus 25, no. 5, first movement: analysis of exposition

MAIN THEME (Presentation) Continuation

Piano *dolce* *p*

f *f* *p* *f*

(HC)

TRANSITION 1 (dependent)

dolce *rinforzando*

PAC, f-sharp minor

cresc.

f *fz p*

HC, A major, then V pedal...

SUBORDINATE THEME 1

espressivo *fz* *fz* *f*

The musical score is written for piano in f-sharp minor, 2/4 time. It consists of six systems of music. The first system is the 'MAIN THEME (Presentation)', starting with a piano (*p*) and *dolce* marking. The second system is the 'Continuation', featuring a half cadence (HC) and dynamic markings of *f*, *p*, and *f*. The third system is 'TRANSITION 1 (dependent)', marked *dolce* and *rinforzando*, leading to a PAC in f-sharp minor. The fourth system continues the transition with a *cresc.* marking. The fifth system features a half cadence (HC) in A major, followed by a V pedal, with dynamic markings of *f* and *fz p*. The sixth system is 'SUBORDINATE THEME 1', marked *espressivo*, with dynamic markings of *fz*, *fz*, and *f*.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

is a slight departure from Haydn's model—in general, Clementi's musical language in Op. 25 no. 5 is more heavily punctuated than Haydn's in the "Farewell" Symphony, which we can attribute at least in part to the change in musical approach between 1771 and 1790 from a C. P. E. Bach-derived *Empfindsamer Stil* to a Galant-derived High Classical style.

Both composers then initiate lengthy transition and subordinate theme regions that touch upon the more typical mediant tonality (A major) before detouring to the dominant minor (c-sharp minor). This remarkable i-III-v tonal sequence is a unique experiment for Haydn in a sonata exposition, recalling a strategy often found in C. P. E. Bach,¹⁸ while foreshadowing the three-key expositions of Franz Schubert. Though Clementi favors the dominant minor as the exposition's tonal goal more often than Haydn, Opus 25, no. 5 is the first of his works to use the mediant major as an intermediate step.¹⁹ There is no clear evidence that Clementi was aware of C. P. E. Bach's music: thus, the most likely impetus for this intriguing tonal plan in Opus 25, no. 5 is Haydn's striking employment of it in the then recently rediscovered "Farewell" Symphony.

From the end of the main theme to the final measures of the exposition, Clementi's thematic procedures also closely mirror Haydn's model. Both composers begin the transition with the main theme's opening incipit, corresponding to Douglass Green's "dependent transition,"²⁰ equivalent to the "statement-counterstatement" strategy described as a common opening gambit in many late 19th and early 20th century discussions of sonata form.²¹ Both Haydn and Clementi quickly turn away from the main theme material, modulating to the relative tonality of A major—the most typical tonal goal for a minor-mode exposition in the mid-to-late 18th century. Haydn reaches his new tonal destination in 12 measures, while Clementi, who lingers on a dominant pedal in A major for an entire five-measure segment, takes 13 measures to accomplish the same thing.

¹⁸ C. P. E. Bach's "Württemberg" Sonata in a minor, Wq. 49/I, first movement (1742-44), a work which Haydn likely knew, is an early example of a tonic/mediant/dominant minor expositional tonal plan.

¹⁹ Clementi does modulate to the dominant minor in certain of his minor-mode piano sonata expositions throughout his career (e.g., Op. 34 no. 2, Finale, Op. 40 no. 2, first movement, Op. 50 no. 3, "Didone Abbandonata," first and last movements), but only the last-mentioned work, dating from 1821, uses the mediant key as intermediate step.

²⁰ Green, 192–93.

²¹ Summarized in Rosen, 1–2.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

Haydn marks the arrival of A major in measure 29 with a new thematic idea (marked Subordinate Theme 1 on Example 1), a descending arpeggio figure in eighth notes that has some affinity with the movement's opening gesture.²² Clementi goes one step further in unifying his exposition, beginning the subordinate theme with a main theme incipit before dissolving into new material. Once again, Clementi's version of this tonal plan receives clearer punctuation: he marks the end of this segment with a PAC in A major before modulating to the exposition's eventual goal (c-sharp minor) via a second transition, following which a new subordinate theme—once more, beginning with a main theme incipit—leads to the exposition's final cadence (unusually, an imperfect authentic cadence, or IAC²³) in measure 59. Similarly, Haydn's thematic unit in A major quickly dissolves into a second transition (dependent, like the first one), initiated by what Donald Francis Tovey calls a "purple patch"²⁴ (with a modal shift to a minor). After this harmonic disturbance, Haydn introduces two cadential ideas to confirm the exposition's ultimate tonal destination (c-sharp minor). Derived from the descending arpeggio motifs of the subordinate theme and main theme, respectively, this section ends with an emphatic PAC in the dominant,²⁵ followed by a brief codetta.

Though the similarity of the two expositions' tonal design is beyond question, Clementi does update Haydn's thematic and cadential procedures for greater formal clarity. Haydn drifts gradually toward the dominant minor with a minimum of cadential articulation, complicating the recognition of thematic material: from the beginning of the transition to the exposition's

²² Webster (34) labels this passage (measure 29ff.) as the subordinate theme, despite the lack of an overt dominant harmony in the new key (Sonata Theory's "medial caesura," cf. Hepokoski/Darcy, 23–50) to set it in relief. Though the analysis in Table 1 follows Webster on this point, we will consider alternate readings below.

²³ Caplin (270) mentions a few rare cases of IACs as the concluding cadence of a sonata exposition, a formal decision in which, to cite Hepokoski/Darcy (169), the exposition's closing space (codetta) takes on some of the responsibility of completing the cadential process. This point is expanded upon in MacKay 2018.

²⁴ Tovey, 41–42, defines a purple patch as an excursion to an unexpected harmonic region. See Ludwig, *passim*, for further consideration of Tovey's term, along with its application to Haydn's tonal practice.

²⁵ Since Haydn does not precede this cadential segment with a cadence (i.e., a medial caesura), it falls short of being a meaningful subordinate theme according to Caplin's theory of formal functions, or Hepokoski and Darcy's Sonata Theory. It more closely resembles a closing section, completing the thematic and tonal arc of the preceding "purple patch" (hence the label on Example 1 as Transition 2→Cadential, in keeping with Janet Schmalfeldt's "becoming," or retroactive reinterpretation, outlined in Schmalfeldt, 8–12).

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

conclusion, he elicits a sense of constant development. Featuring syncopated accompaniment figures, aggressive *sforzandi*, abrupt dynamic contrasts, and jagged melodies, the terse exposition projects a singleness of affect, forming an apt exemplar of Haydn's *Sturm und Drang* musical style.²⁶ Clementi's languid musical material more clearly demarcates into discrete sections: he precedes each subordinate theme with a HC, thus opening rhetorical space for them (in Sonata Theory terminology) with medial caesuras.

The lack of clearly defined cadences after the main theme in Haydn's "Farewell" Symphony suggests a three-part, or *continuous exposition*,²⁷ wherein the transition and subordinate theme merge into a longer composite unit, with the subordinate key confirmed by closing material.²⁸ The musical discourse suggests a frenzied journey through a variety of tonalities whose ultimate destination becomes apparent only with the section's final measures. (Rey Longyear accordingly describes this movement as having "a tripartite exposition...with a closing section in C-sharp minor."²⁹) Clementi, while arriving at the same tonal destination in much the same way (with a stopover in the "expected" subordinate key, A major), carefully delineates the arduous journey in Op. 25 no. 5 through frequent cadences, clearly demarcating each tonal goal.

Haydn's "Farewell" Symphony and Clementi's Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5: Comparison of Development/Recapitulation

While Clementi largely follows Haydn's formal lead from the "Farewell" Symphony in the exposition, in the second part of the movement (development-recapitulation), he deviates markedly from his putative model. However, there are still many striking points of similarity, as will be explored below. Though the two development sections begin quite differently (Haydn

²⁶ Landon (Volume 2), 273–76, mentions these (and other) musical devices that typify Haydn's *Sturm und Drang* period.

²⁷ Defined and discussed in Hepokoski/Darcy, 51–64. Their concept has some affinity with the "three-part exposition," espoused by Larsen 1963/2013, and further explored by Fillion 1975, and Ludwig 2010 and 2013.

²⁸ Though not specifically discussed in Schmalfeldt, such a retrospectively reinterpreted formal unit (Transition→Subordinate Theme) would be an apt illustration of Schmalfeldt's "becoming."

²⁹ Longyear, 197.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

begins with the main theme in the relative key, A major, while Clementi begins with the main theme's continuation phrase, stated in model-sequence design to move further afield tonally. Clementi does retain, to some degree, the most striking feature of Haydn's development section: a lyrical excursion in the submediant as the section concludes (see examples 3a and 3b).

In the "Farewell" Symphony, this tranquil passage is in the closely related and hitherto unexplored submediant major (D major, or diatonic VI of the home key). Haydn introduces this key as a surprise: it follows an extended F-sharp major triad, the goal of an emphatic HC in b minor. As such, the key arrives through a chromatic third-related shift rather than any cadential preparation. Clementi, in partial emulation of Haydn, retains the idea of a submediant excursion in the development, but moves to the more remote submediant *minor* (d minor, vi-flat of f-sharp minor) which he sets up with five measures of A pedal, thereby aptly preparing the distant key with an emphatic HC. Paradoxically, though Clementi's tonal goal is considerably more distant than Haydn's, he introduces it in a far more conventional manner.

Haydn's lyrical theme in the submediant, a pair of eight-measure sentences that form a 16-measure period, provocatively described by H. C. R. Landon as a "misplaced subordinate theme,"³⁰ compensates for the underdeveloped subordinate theme in the exposition, providing, as A. Peter Brown remarks, "the only oasis for the *Sturm und Drang* style in the movement."³¹ Clementi's emphasis of the submediant tonal region is rather more agitated in character, consisting of a main theme incipit in d minor that quickly spins off sequentially, touching upon e minor before ending on a diminished seventh harmony (vii^{o7}) in f-sharp minor. This retransition, however, closely resembles Haydn's tonal procedure in the "Farewell" Symphony: following the initial statement of his lyrical theme, Haydn restates its opening measures in an ascending step sequence, thereby also passing through e minor to conclude on a diminished seventh chord in the home key.

³⁰ Landon (Volume 2), 302. In comparison, Rosen, 163 calls it a "trio section"; Webster, 39–45, refers to it as an "interlude," compensating for the lack of a lyrical melody earlier in the movement; Hepokoski/Darcy, 221 refers to the passage as a "slow episode."

³¹ Brown, 134.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: *Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America* 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.
 © Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

Example 3a. Haydn, *Farewell* Symphony, measures 102-13: lead-in to lyrical D major theme in development

V pedal in b minor

HC, b minor

Lyrical excursion (H. C. R. Landon: "misplaced subordinate theme")

Presentation

Continuation

D major (VI of the home key)

Example 3b. Clementi, Sonata, Opus 25, no. 5, measures 82-90: Lead-in to theme in d minor

V pedal (d minor)

6

(MT incipit in d minor)

HC, d minor (vi of home key)

In the following measures, Haydn and Clementi demonstrate the inadequacy of the traditional sonata-form terminology for the section that follows the development, traditionally termed the

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

recapitulation. In the movements under examination, both Haydn and Clementi create more of a revisiting or wholesale rethinking of material than a genuine recapitulation in the conventional sense: both composers significantly reorder their exposition material in the recapitulation for dramatic effect. Such a refashioning of prior content is by nature idiosyncratic: consequently, Haydn and Clementi subvert the sense of recapitulation differently. Haydn begins forthrightly with main theme material, but quickly abandons it after four measures: as Landon remarks, "Haydn simply goes on developing."³² Clementi, having already stated main theme material prominently as part of the submediant excursion late in the development, initially bypasses this material in the recapitulation to avoid musical redundancy, instead beginning with the subordinate theme group (examples 4a and 4b).³³

Continuous development and reordering of thematic material will become the fundamental principle of organization in both recapitulations. Haydn's main theme incipit initiates an extended, nervous sequence, followed by a restatement of main theme material in the subdominant, which leads to the subordinate theme group, transposed to reconfirm the home key. Haydn reduces this central section from 52 measures in the exposition (measures 29–70) to 31 measures in the recapitulation, streamlining the nebulous themes that had initially been presented off tonic in the exposition to lead to a forceful codetta over a pulsating tonic pedal. The restless *Sturm und Drang* character of the movement remains in force through its conclusion, but the continuous development that Haydn had achieved in the exposition gives way to a single-minded tonal clarity.

³² Landon (Volume 2), 302.

³³ Clementi's formal decision cleverly blurs the boundary between development and recapitulation, which Schmalfeldt, 67 labels as retransition→recapitulation.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: *Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America* 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.
 © Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

Example 4a. Haydn, *Farewell* Symphony, measures 132-44: retransition to main theme in recapitulation

RETRANSITION

RECAPITULATION (Main Theme)

vii^o6
5

Example 4b. Clementi, Opus 25, no. 5, measures 95-105: retransition to recapitulation

RETRANSITION

Piano

f-sharp minor: vii^o7

RECAPITULATION
Subordinate Theme I

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

Clementi's reworking of thematic material late in the form is even more radical than Haydn's. Having bypassed the main theme in favor of subordinate theme material to begin the recapitulation, Clementi returns to this omitted material late in the movement: its belated reprise after an emphatic PAC suggests the beginning of a coda rather than a misplaced primary theme in a "reversed recapitulation."³⁴ Its thematic regularity typifies closing material, as Clementi compresses the initial 12-measure unit from the exposition into an eight-measure balanced theme. Following a partial restatement of Subordinate Theme 2, The brief codetta from measures 59–64 returns in the home key, leading to the same understated and inconclusive cadence in the lower register with which the exposition had concluded.

In this carefully controlled formal ambiguity, featuring blending or rearranging of formal elements, the opening movement of Clementi's Op. 25 no. 5 arguably surpasses its model in boldness and subtlety of form. Clementi surely learned a few things from Haydn's "Farewell" Symphony, but whatever techniques and procedures he borrowed from Haydn's model, he adapted to his own musical ends, subtly acknowledging his model while remaining audibly distinct from it.

Postscript: Clementi's Op. 25 no. 5 and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26: A Musical Debt Repaid?

Though it is sometimes challenging to quantify Haydn's influence on Clementi's music, it is much easier to demonstrate Clementi's influence on Haydn, particularly concerning his late keyboard works. Clementi was the spiritual father of the London Pianoforte School, whose members included such influential and well-known figures as Jan Ladislav Dussek, Johann Baptist Cramer, and John Field. Spurred on by the fuller sound of John Broadwood's pianos compared to the lighter Viennese pianos that dominated Continental Europe, Clementi and his circle

³⁴ Caplin, 173–74, expresses misgivings about the "reversed recapitulation" as a formal construct (not surprisingly, as it would signify a disconnect between musical content and formal function). Hepokoski/Darcy, 382–83, alludes to the "reversed recapitulation fallacy" in their discussion of the Type 2 (binary) sonata, categorizing such apparent reversals of thematic content in the recapitulation as a coda that begins with the main theme: a common practice in the Classical period, as Rosen (97) indicates.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

revolutionized piano writing, foreshadowing both the orchestral density of Beethoven's piano music, and the *bel canto* melodies and delicate, pedal-washed sonorities of Frédéric Chopin. It is documented that Haydn met some of these composers during his two London trips of 1791-91 and 1794-95: he developed friendships with Dussek and Cramer, and heard the precocious Field, at that time a child prodigy and student of Clementi, perform as soloist in a Dussek piano concerto.³⁵

Many concerts in London during these years featured works by both Clementi and Haydn: a note in Haydn's diary, dated March 24, 1795, describes the unsuccessful premiere of a Clementi orchestral work,³⁶ on a program that also featured a Mozart symphony and a Haydn string quartet. (Georges de Saint-Foix conjectured that this work by Clementi might have been the original symphonic version of his Piano Sonata in g minor, Op. 34 no. 2.³⁷) Given Haydn's busy musical life in London, and his natural curiosity about the music of his contemporaries, it is possible that he might have encountered Clementi's most recent piano music by the time he composed his Piano Trio in f-sharp minor, Hob. XV: 26, in 1795, one of only two chamber works by Haydn in that key.³⁸ This work's somber opening movement, along with revisiting the unusual tonal center of the "Farewell" Symphony, shows some evidence of the influence of Clementi's Op. 25, no. 5.

Unlike the formal and tonal modelling that links the opening movement of Clementi's Op. 25, no. 5 with Haydn's "Farewell" Symphony, Haydn's piano trio movement resembles Clementi's sonata rather more superficially. Nonetheless, there are a few moments that suggest Haydn's familiarity with Clementi's sonata (these passages appear as Example 5a-c). The resemblance is most striking in Haydn's brooding main theme, whose melodic line, like Clementi's, is replete with meandering neighbor motions, including a near-direct quote (perhaps unwittingly?) of Clementi's opening material, a melodic figure that has no equivalent in the "Farewell" Symphony. More significantly, the brusque arpeggiated sextuplets that pervade the subordinate theme of Hob. XV: 26 (and

³⁵ Cf. Graue, 426; and Landon (Volume 3), 396.

³⁶ Quoted in Landon (Volume 3), 297.

³⁷ Saint-Foix, 256.

³⁸ The other chamber work, Haydn's String Quartet, Op. 50 no. 4, composed in 1787, displays no meaningful similarities with the "Farewell" Symphony.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

return with heightened intensity in the movement's final measures) also recall Clementi's sonata, whose subordinate theme prominently features this rapid-fire rhythm (cf. especially measures 30–38 in the exposition). Finally, Haydn's offbeat *sforzati* near the exposition's midpoint, further expanded upon in a lengthy passage that comprises the bulk of the development section, evoke the agitated rhythmic/dynamic language of Clementi's Subordinate Theme 1 (and Transition 2). This dynamic volatility (also featured of the "Farewell" Symphony's opening movement) further demonstrates Haydn's affinity with the overall somber mood and musical content of Clementi's slightly earlier work.

Thus, we have come full circle: if Clementi's sonata, Op. 25, no. 5, is indeed indebted to Haydn's "Farewell" Symphony, as this study has sought to illustrate, then Haydn's seeming homage to Op. 25, no. 5 in his piano trio, Hob. XV: 26, effectively repaid the debt, both metaphorically and musically. At the same time, with a subtle nod to Clementi's sonata, Haydn had the opportunity to re-appropriate some of the techniques, tonal decisions, and musical character of his probably nearly forgotten work from almost a quarter century earlier: the bold, ever-influential "Farewell" Symphony.

As the third version of a musical thrice-told tale, somewhat altered with each re-telling, the musical content of Hob. XV: 26, first movement, bears little resemblance (other than the eccentric choice of key) to the "Farewell" Symphony, the source from which Clementi drew his inspiration in his 1790 sonata. However, the triptych of f-sharp minor works considered in this study give ample evidence of mutual influence. That which Clementi borrowed from Haydn, he repaid with interest by creating a unique (and still occasionally played) piano composition championed by some high-profile performers, including Vladimir Horowitz.³⁹ In turn, whatever Haydn borrowed from Clementi's sonata, whether consciously or subconsciously, was at the same time a second-hand borrowing from himself.

³⁹ The sonata can be found on the 1989 recording, "Horowitz Plays Clementi," released on the RCA Victor label.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: *Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America* 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.
 © Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

Example 5. Haydn, Piano Trio in f-sharp minor, Hob. XV: 26 and parallels to Clementi opus 25 no. 5 (selected passages)

(a) Measures 1-4: brooding main theme (motive from Clementi's Opus 25 no. 5 bracketed)

(cf. Clementi incipit)

Piano

(b) Pervasive sextuplets in subordinate theme (measures 22-27)

Piano

(c) Syncopated sforzandi in development (measure 44ff.)

Piano

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

Conclusion

James Webster has described the "Farewell" Symphony as not only Haydn's best-known pre-1780 work, but also his most extraordinary composition from the *Sturm und Drang* period.⁴⁰ Its unique musical (and extramusical) features have elicited positive appraisals from many other writers, including A. Peter Brown, H. C. R. Landon, and Charles Rosen. The symphony, unique in Haydn's output in many ways, has long had its supporters, starting with the work's premiere outside of Eszterháza in Paris during the 1780s. Two generations later, Felix Mendelssohn called it "a curiously melancholy little piece" after successfully reviving the work in an 1838 concert.⁴¹ Robert Schumann, who wrote a review of the concert, was grudgingly impressed by Haydn's seriousness of intent in the work, quite different from his usual, dismissive attitude toward Haydn's music.⁴² This study has sought to demonstrate that the "Farewell" Symphony made a positive impression on Clementi as well, to the extent that he borrowed the basic plan of its first movement for his own Op. 25 no. 5 sonata. Clementi's fascinating musical response to Haydn's "Farewell" Symphony is but one example of the work's influence that continues to the present day, two and a half centuries after its composition and first performance in 1772.

⁴⁰ Webster, 3.

⁴¹ Landon (Volume 2), 303.

⁴² Webster, 115.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

Works Cited

- Brown, A. Peter. *The Symphonic Repertoire. Volume II. The First Golden Age of the Viennese Symphony: Haydn, Mozart, Beethoven, and Schubert*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2002.
- Caplin, William. *Classical Form: A Theory of Formal Functions for the Instrumental Music of Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1998.
- Fillion, Michelle. "Sonata Form Procedures in Haydn's Keyboard Sonatas." In *Haydn Studies: Proceedings of the International Haydn Conference, Washington, DC, 1975*. Ed. Jens Peter Larsen, Howard Serwer and James Webster. New York: Norton, 1981: 475–81.
- Graue, Jerald. "Haydn and the London Pianoforte School." In *Haydn Studies: Proceedings of the International Haydn Conference, Washington, DC, 1975*. Ed. Jens Peter Larsen, Howard Serwer, and James Webster. New York: W. W. Norton, 1981: 422–31.
- Green, Douglass. *Form in Tonal Music: An Introduction to Analysis*. Second Edition. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1979.
- Hepokoski, James, and Warren Darcy. *Sonata Theory: Norms, Types, and Deformations in the Late-Eighteenth-Century Sonata*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2006.
- Hoboken, Anthony. *Joseph Haydn, Thematisch-bibliographisches Werkverzeichnis*. Band I. Mainz: Schott, 1957.
- Landon, H. C. R. *Haydn: Chronicle and Works*. 5 volumes. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1976–80.
- Larsen, Jens Peter. "[Sonata-Form Problems \(1963\), as translated by Jerald C. Graue \(1978\)](#)." *Haydn: The Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America* 3.2 (Fall 2013).
- Longyear, Rey. "The Minor Mode in Eighteenth-Century Sonata Form." *Journal of Music Theory* 15/1–2 (1971), 182–229.
- Ludwig, Alexander. "Three-Part Expositions in the String Quartets of Joseph Haydn." Ph.D. dissertation, Brandeis University, 2010.
- _____. "Expecting the Unexpected: Haydn's Three-Part Expositions." *Lumen* 32 (2013): 31–40.

MacKay, James. "A Musical Debt Repaid with Interest? Haydn's 'Farewell' Symphony, Clementi's Piano Sonata, Op. 25 no. 5, and Haydn's Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 26."

HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America 13 (2023), <https://remix.berklee.edu/haydn-journal>.

© Haydn Society of North America, and Boston: Berklee Library, 2023. Duplication without the express permission of the authors and/or the Haydn Society of North America is prohibited.

- MacKay, James. "Exploring the IAC as Terminal Cadence: Melodic Deferral and Cadential Function in Classical Sonata-Form Movements." Paper presented at the South-Central Society for Music Theory (SCSMT), Hattiesburg, MS, March 24–25, 2018.
- McVeigh, Simon. *Concert Life in London from Mozart to Haydn*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993.
- Plantinga, Leon. *Clementi: His Life and Music*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1977.
- Proksch, Bryan. Review of *The Viennese Minor-Key Symphony in the Age of Haydn and Mozart* by Matthew Riley. *Fontes Artis Musicae* 62/4 (October–December 2015): 397–99.
- Rice, John A. "[The "Farewell" Symphony Between Paris and Russia.](#)" *HAYDN: Online Journal of the Haydn Society of North America* 3.2 (Fall 2013).
- Riley, Matthew. *The Viennese Minor-Key Symphony in the Age of Haydn and Mozart*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014.
- Rosen, Charles. *Sonata Forms*. Revised Edition. New York: Norton, 1988.
- Saint-Foix, Georges de. "Haydn and Clementi." Translated by Theodore Baker. *The Musical Quarterly* 18/2 (April 1932), 252–59.
- Schmalfeldt, Janet. *In the Process of Becoming: Analytic and Philosophical Perspectives on Form in Early Nineteenth-Century Music*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Tovey, Donald Francis. "Haydn's Chamber Music," in *Cobbett's Cyclopedic Survey of Chamber Music*, Vol. I, A-H, ed. William Wilson Cobbett. London: Oxford University Press, 1929.
- Webster, James. *Haydn's "Farewell" Symphony and the Idea of Classical Style: Through-Composition and Cyclic Integration in His Instrumental Music*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991.