

AFRICAN PERSPECTIVES ON TRADITION AND JUSTICE

Edited by

Tom BENNETT

Eva BREMS

Giselle CORRADI

Lia NIJZINK

Martien SCHOTSMANS



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:
Hart Publishing Ltd.
16C Worcester Place
Oxford OX1 2JW
UK
Tel.: +44 1865 517 530
Email: mail@hartpub.co.uk

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinierstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:
Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

African Perspectives on Tradition and Justice
Tom Bennett, Eva Brems, Giselle Corradi, Lia Nijzink and Martien Schotsmans
(eds.)

© 2012 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Cover photo: *People gossip and smoke waiting for the sun to come out, Chench Village, Southern Ethiopia* (© Marcin Bartosz Czarnoleski/Dreamstime.com)

ISBN 978-1-78068-059-0
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This publication was completed in the framework of the research project 'Addressing Traditional Law in Post-Conflict Legal and Judicial Development Aid in sub-Saharan Africa', with the financial support of the Belgian Ministry of Science Policy within its programme 'Society and Future' 2007 [TA/00/17 AFTRALAW]. The editors wish to express their gratitude to the programme administrators, Mrs. Margarida Freire, and her predecessor, Mrs. Zakia Khattabi, for their enthusiastic support to the project. They also wish to thank Dr. Marleen Renders for her role in designing the research project and the members of the Scientific Support Committee for their valuable inputs and critical comments as the project moved on: Mrs. Lara Deramaix, Prof. Marie-Claire Foblets, Mr. Renaud Galand, Prof. Em. Luc Huyse, Mr. Robert Olbrechts, Prof. Barbara Oomen, Mr. Dick Oosting, Prof. Stephan Parmentier, Prof. Filip Reyntjens, Mrs. Heidy Rombouts, Dr. Stef Vandeginste, Mr. Marc Van Wymeersch and Mr. Pierre Vincke. The authors of the chapters especially deserve our thanks for accepting our invitation to contribute to the volume and for addressing our comments and adjusting their chapters accordingly. Finally, our thanks are due to the University of Cape Town for the organization of the international forum 'Traditional Justice and the Role of External Actors in sub-Saharan Africa' in March 2010, which planted the seeds out of which this publication grew.

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>About the authors and editors</i>	xi
Chapter I. Introduction	
Giselle CORRADI and Martien SCHOTSMANS	1
1. Background to the Volume	1
2. Historical context and current approaches	2
2.1. Traditional justice and development in Africa	2
2.2. The localisation of transitional justice	5
3. The contributions	9
4. Common themes	11
Bibliography	14
Chapter II. Access to justice and human rights in the traditional courts of sub-Saharan Africa	
Tom BENNETT	19
1. Introduction	19
2. The traditional African style of justice	22
3. Due process of law	24
4. Equal treatment	26
5. Rights in criminal proceedings	28
5.1. The civil/criminal distinction	28
5.2. Due process in criminal proceedings	31
5.3. The presumption of innocence	32
5.4. Legal representation	33
6. Access to justice	34
7. Conclusion – And the right to culture	38
Bibliography	40
Chapter III. Courts and the application of customary law in Malawi: Towards the reintroduction of local courts	
Kenan Tilombe MANDA	47
1. Introduction	47
2. Historical background	47
Intersentia	vii

3.	The structure of the Malawi court system since 1994.....	50
4.	The application of customary law.....	51
4.1.	Problems in the magistrate courts.....	51
4.2.	Developing customary law jurisprudence.....	54
5.	The recommendations of the Malawi Law Commission.....	59
5.1.	The structure and positioning of the new local courts.....	60
5.2.	Presiding officers and assessors.....	61
5.3.	Jurisdiction.....	62
6.	Conclusion.....	64
	Bibliography.....	65

Chapter IV. Powers, rights and citizenship: The ‘return’ of the traditional authorities in Mozambique

Maria Paula G. MENESES.....	67
-----------------------------	----

1.	Introduction.....	67
2.	Tradition, between the past and the future.....	68
3.	Civilization, culture and citizenship in the colonial context.....	72
3.1.	Nationality and citizenship: toughening the abyssal line.....	72
3.2.	Highlights of colonial administrative reforms.....	75
4.	Old and new actors in the political fabric of independent Mozambique..	78
4.1.	Amplifying the plural network of justices.....	79
4.2.	The return of ‘old’ actors.....	83
5.	Contemporary political implications of legal pluralism.....	87
	Bibliography.....	90

Chapter V. Traditional justice and human rights in post-war African countries: Prospects and challenges

Joe A.D. ALIE.....	95
--------------------	----

1.	Introduction.....	95
2.	Confronting the justice challenge.....	96
3.	Is traditional justice the answer?.....	98
4.	Characteristics.....	101
5.	The human rights question.....	106
6.	The Sierra Leone conflict.....	109
7.	Justice and reconciliation from below.....	111
7.1.	Reintegration and reconciliation of ex-combatants.....	112
7.2.	Community reconciliation.....	113
7.3.	Philosophical expressions that are germane to the reconciliation process.....	115

8. Conclusion: The future of traditional justice	116
Bibliography	117
Chapter VI. Reinventing and validating the cosmology and ontology of restorative justice: Hermeneutics of the traditional Acholi justice system in Northern Uganda	
Daniel KOMAKECH	121
1. Rationale of the study: Contextualizing the assumptions and traits of justice in transitional justice.	121
1.1. Introduction.	121
1.2. The thesis and outline of the chapter	122
1.3. Central argument	122
1.4. Methodology	123
2. Live and let live: A critique of dominant modernist justice in transitional justice discourse.	124
2.1. Introduction.	124
2.2. The modernist critique of tradition	124
2.3. The modernist epistemology and retributive justice.	126
2.4. The ICC and retributive justice in the Northern Uganda armed conflict	128
3. The resurgence of the traditional justice system in Northern Uganda. . .	130
3.1. The notion of tradition in the Acholi community.	130
3.2. Reconstructing and validating tradition: A hermeneutics.	131
3.3. Acholi cosmology and ontology: Tempels' framework.	132
3.4. Cosmology and ontology among the Acholi of Uganda.	133
3.5. The ontological hierarchy – Reconciliation and restoration in Acholi	135
4. Acholi traditional justice and human rights.	137
4.1. Acholi understanding of human rights.	137
4.1.1. The Acholi concept of rights being natural and communal.	138
4.1.2. Duty and responsibility in human rights	139
5. Reliving Acholi traditional justice mechanisms: Plant Acholi in an Acholi garden	140
5.1. The Acholi concept of <i>dano</i> as a framework for reconciliation . . .	140
5.2. Justice and systemic thinking: Returning the ICC to the classroom	142
6. Conclusion	144
Bibliography	145

Chapter VII. Revisiting the legal and socio-political foundations and (Western) criticisms of *gacaca* courts
Felix Mukwiza NDAHINDA and Alphonse MULEEFU 149

1. Introduction..... 149
2. Legal and socio-political underpinnings of *gacaca* courts
2.1. Prosecuting genocide cases in post-genocide Rwanda 152
2.2. Motivations for the establishment of the *gacaca* courts 154
2.2.1. Socio-legal dimensions..... 155
2.2.2. Socio-political considerations..... 156
2.2.3. Socio-cultural motivations 159
3. (Western) criticisms of *gacaca* courts 160
3.1. Non-inclusion of RPF/A crimes in the *gacaca* process 161
3.2. Non-compliance with due process guarantees..... 165
3.3. Lack of judicial independence..... 166
4. Conclusion 168

Bibliography 168