

# The Ideal Roman Catholic in Belgian Zouave Stories

THOMAS BUERMAN  
Ghent University

## ABSTRACT

Starting from the feminization of religion thesis, this chapter investigates masculinity in the 19th-century Belgian Catholic discourse produced around the Belgian pontifical Zouaves. Submission emerges as the quality most valued by this discourse. This inquiry into Belgian Roman Catholic masculinity takes a comparative look at research into manliness and Christianity in general, and the research done by Carol E. Harrison on Zouave stories in France in particular. Differences between the French and Belgian discourses are explained with reference to an earlier phase of anti-Catholicism in Belgium. Though many similarities with the French case emerge, the points of difference within the conclusions prompt other theoretical interpretations. The discourse and conclusions here differ a great deal from what Anglo-American research has claimed about masculinity and spirituality.

*Bij de verdeling in de negentiende eeuw van kwaliteiten volgens de man/vrouw as werd religiositeit gaandeweg aan vrouwen toegeschreven. Godvrezendheid harmonieerde namelijk met de vrouwelijke natuur van emotionaliteit en toegewijdheid terwijl onverschilligheid tegenover godsdienst deel uitmaakte van de geconstrueerde mannelijkheid die uitging van rationaliteit als een natuurlijk mannelijk gegeven. Gelovige mannen, zowel reguliere en seculiere geestelijken als leken, werden gezien als paradoxen van de moderniteit. Juist deze schijnbare tegenstrijdigheid tussen hun gender identiteit en hun geslacht maken van gelovige mannen geprefereerd studieobjecten voor zowel historisch onderzoek naar mannelijkheid als de religieuze geschiedschrijving. Daarbij komt men tot twee mogelijke antwoorden op de vraag hoe mannelijkheid en religiositeit in de 19de eeuw met elkaar werden verzoend. Sommige analyses stellen dat religiositeit werd vermannelijkt door het te verbinden met als mannelijk aangeduide activiteiten zoals sport of zakendoen. Andere casestudy's concluderen dat voor en door gelovige mannen een mannelijkheid werd gedefinieerd die eigenschappen bevatte waaraan tijdsgenoten vrouwelijkheid verbonden.*

*Aan de reeds bestaande historische studies naar mannelijkheid en religiositeit in de negentiende eeuw wil ik een analyse toevoegen van het discours over de Belgische pauselijke zoeaven. Door te analyseren wat werd gezegd en geschreven over deze Belgische katholieke mannen die tussen 1860 en 1870 als vrijwilligers voor het behoud van de pauselijke staten vochten, wordt het onderzoek naar religieuze mannelijkheid dat voornamelijk bestaat uit studies naar Anglo-Amerikaanse, i.c. protestantse, mannelijkheid aangevuld met een rooms-katholieke casus. Een gelijkaardige artikel omtrent Franse zoeavenverhalen, i.e. het discours over deze pontificale soldaten, werd recentelijk door de Amerikaanse historica Carol E. Harrison gepubliceerd. In mijn bijdrage poog ik Harrison's stuk met meer dan alleen beschrijving aan te vullen. Vooral door de auteurs van de bronnen meer in het middelpunt te plaatsen, kom ik tot gedeeltelijk andere conclusies.*

*In de Belgische zoeavenverhalen werd een ideale katholieke mannelijkheid gedefinieerd die naar negentiende-eeuwsnormen zowel bestond uit mannelijke deugdelijkheden als vrouwelijke kwaliteiten. Dit werd zelf met zoveel woorden gezegd en helemaal niet als problematisch beschreven. Aan de discrepantie tussen deze vaststelling en de besluiten van andere historische studies liggen twee zaken ten grondslag. Enerzijds doordat de meerderheid van het onderzoek naar religieuze masculiniteit zich op protestantse mannen heeft gericht, werden omtrent moderne mannelijkheid conclusies getrokken die niet van toepassing zijn op negentiende-eeuwse rooms-katholieke mannelijkheid. Om bepaalde redenen zijn protestanten namelijk minder bereid dan katholieken tot een analogisch denken waarbij de relatie tot god wordt uitgedrukt door middel van referenties naar zowel de vader als de moeder. Anderzijds behoorde de meerderheid van de auteurs van de zoeavenverhalen tot de geestelijke stand. Wat de rooms-katholieke clergé uit verschillende landen betreft, is de aanwezigheid bij hen bewezen van een grote moederbinding die zich vertaalt in een androgynse invulling van de genderrol. De geestelijke staat van de meeste auteurs van de bronnen is eveneens verantwoordelijk voor de bewondering in de zoeavenverhalen voor kinderlijke vroomheid ofwel het verheerlijken van een eenvoudige godsdienstige piëteit. Dit wordt door mij geïnterpreteerd als een manier waarmee men met het uitdragen van een eigen rooms-katholieke mannelijkheid een versterking van de klerikale autoriteit over katholieke gelovigen beoogde.*

*In de Belgische zoeavenverhalen zitten zowel beschrijvingen van godsvrucht die geïnterpreteerd kunnen worden als pogingen om religiositeit te vermannelijken als omschrijvingen van een religieuze mannelijkheid die gelovige mannen lijkt te vervrouwelijken. Het zijn echter het rooms-katholieke karakter van het discours en de geestelijke staat van de auteurs die de dubbelzijdige genderidentiteit van de rooms-katholiek ideale man in deze verhalen verklaren.*

## INTRODUCTION

A number of historical studies claim that for all Christian denominations gender has become one of the most important factors governing religious belief and practice in modern times. Authors working on 19th-century Christianity in the United States, the United Kingdom, France, Germany and Belgium speak of a feminization of religion in the 19th century<sup>1</sup>. This feminization of religion has replaced the so-called secularization thesis as the dominant paradigm or master narrative in the religious history of the 19th century<sup>2</sup>. Four possible meanings attach to this feminization of religion. The first two interpretations, known as the feminization of religious personnel and of the faithful, refer to increases in the number of women in the religious field<sup>3</sup>. The third notion describes a devotional change occurring in the 19th century by which the nature of religion became more sentimental. In general one can speak of the replacement of a vengeful God by a God of love. In particular this evolution is symbolized by Protestantism presenting Jesus as more androgynous, with passive stance and sentimental appearance, and by Catholicism giving greater prominence to Mary<sup>4</sup>. The fourth view, termed discursive feminization, refers to the general 19th-century discourse that equated women with religion and identified religiosity with womanliness<sup>5</sup>.

This last association has resulted in religious men being seen as effeminate; the impression has formed that religiosity and modern masculinity are irreconcilable. Historians of masculinity have reached similar conclusions. Most authors see the growing influence of nation-states replacing religion in the socio-cultural construction of masculinity<sup>6</sup> and have recognized that often religion was even seen as threatening to modern men<sup>7</sup>. Irreligiousness became a part of modern 'hegemonic' masculinity and religious men – which includes all priests, religious, lay brothers and church-attending laymen – were viewed by contemporaries as paradoxes of modernity<sup>8</sup>.

It was this alleged paradox of male gender identity that led historians to inquire into the complex interrelationships between religion and gender. As the majority of studies of masculinity have been carried out in Anglo research circles, it is not surprising that Protestant denominations have received the most attention<sup>9</sup>. The most influential study is Norman Vance's *The Sinews of the Spirit: The Ideal of Christian Manliness in Victorian Literature and Religious Thought* in which the author discusses muscular Christianity – which Vance terms Christian manliness – and traces the relation between religiosity and manliness, education, sport, empire and war<sup>10</sup>. According to Vance Christian manliness “represented a strategy for commending Christian virtue by linking it with more interesting secular notions of moral and physical prowess”<sup>11</sup>. Others have followed Vance in arguing that contemporaries sought to solve the paradox between manliness and religiosity by making religion more ‘manly’ and acceptable to men, linking “[...] religion to sports, business, or whatever seemed most manly at the moment”<sup>12</sup>. Other historians have proposed a different solution to the alleged contradiction. Instead of making religion more suited to the masculine world, Callum Brown among others argues that feminising men was the most important strategy to make the 19th-century male religious: “[...] exploration of the role of femininity in piety was never far from the surface in most evangelical literature about men. [...] the true Christian man had to show a restraint which others might take as effeminacy”<sup>13</sup>.

The present chapter explores Belgian Roman Catholic manliness, starting from this feminization of religion, the gender dilemmas of 19th-century Christianity and the research imbalance between the denominations. To this end I have chosen to analyse the discourse around the pontifical Zouaves that spread through Belgium Catholic circles in the second half of the 19th century.

The papal or pontifical Zouaves were members of a corps of volunteers, originally Frenchmen and Belgians and later supplemented with other nationalities, formed in Rome for the defence of the pope between 1860 and 1871<sup>14</sup>. The misfortune suffered by the States of the Church spurred the religious zeal of Catholics in Belgium. The fund-raising system of Peter's Pence was established and between 1860 and 1870 nearly two thousand Belgian men went to Rome to serve the pope<sup>15</sup>. In addition to these efforts, numerous addresses, petitions, newspaper articles, books, plays, allocutions and funeral orations were published in which the Zouaves were presented as Catholic heroes<sup>16</sup>. In a recent paper on the historical analysis of heroes, Max Jones states that “The hero is an ideal man or woman, and historians of gender, in particular, have analysed heroes in order to expose the cultural codes circulating around femininity and masculinity in the past”<sup>17</sup>. The present chapter will trace how the ideal Roman Catholic man was represented mentally and thus discover what masculinity was said and believed to be in Roman Catholic discourse. These pontifical volunteers seem highly suitable for analysing alleged nonexistent male religiosity. First, because the gender of these men is not in contention, nor is their religiousness as they are unquestionably committed to the Catholic Church. Again, since they belonged to an army (generally seen as a feature of modern masculinity<sup>18</sup>) and went off to war (a very powerful setting in which to express masculinity), their manliness is unlikely to have been questioned by contemporaries<sup>19</sup>.

## ROMAN CATHOLIC MEN AND THE PROTESTANT IMAGINATION

Without claiming to be up to date on all the historiography of Roman Catholicism or the history of manliness, I believe I have a fair notion of what has been published in the field and can say that contributions explicitly addressing Roman Catholic masculinity are rare<sup>20</sup>. Recently however two articles, one of them of major importance, have come out in unequivocal terms about Catholic masculinity. Unfortunately for me both cover the pontifical Zouaves as a topic. The first one is a study by Sophie Heywood on the oeuvre of the Comtesse de Ségur (1799-1874), a French Catho-

lic author of children's literature who in some of her books takes pontifical Zouaves as models for Catholic manhood<sup>21</sup>. The other article is *Zouave Stories: Gender, Catholic Spirituality, and French Responses to the Roman Question* by Carol E. Harrison<sup>22</sup>. While Heywood's article is primarily a study of one authoress and hence only secondarily deals with the Zouaves, the only difference between Harrison's article and the present study is the nationality of the discourse. Harrison's qualities as a historian and the excellence of this latest product of her pen, together with the status of the journal in which her article appeared, made it extremely hard for me to complete, confirm or disagree with her arguments and conclusions<sup>23</sup>. Nevertheless this is what I will here try to do.

The rest of my text is structured in what I think is the best way to do this. I will start by summing up some of Harrison's conclusions with which I totally agree. By throwing quotes from my own sources into the discussion I want to add to the description and show that French and Belgian Zouave stories really were to a certain degree very homogeneous. I will also give an extra explanation for something that Harrison and I both noticed in our sources. Afterwards I will discuss how I came to select my sources and their authors. Harrison does this only to a limited extent. Looking at the authors with more scrutiny, however, brings characteristics to the surface that I believe have influenced the Zouave image of manliness portrayed. The conclusions concerning the authors of the sources will have consequences for what is presented afterwards. As in Harrison's piece, the Zouaves will be discussed as children and within a mother-son relationship. Taking the authors more into account than Harrison does affords another explanation for the presence of these tropes in the Zouave discourse. In between I will also look at the father-son relation present in the Zouave stories. Harrison does not discuss this relation for the simple reason that it does not appear in her sources. In contrast with the leading part fathers have in Belgian Zouave stories, "[...] the fathers of Zouaves, play a minor role"<sup>24</sup> in the French stories. This difference will be explained and taken into account when I come to formulate a general conclusion.

In the middle of her article Harrison gives the initial impetus to her conclusion: "It is perhaps tempting to locate the Zouave within stereotypical 19th-century gender roles by describing him as effeminate [...]. The Zouaves were not simply effeminate men looking for a place in a feminized church. Their stories take seriously both the manliness of their military vocation and the gentle innocence at the heart of their sanctity; they are complementary, not opposite qualities"<sup>25</sup>. She elaborates this point in her final conclusion: "Explaining the gender ambiguity of the Zouave story in terms of delicate, feminized men and fierce, masculinised women does little to clarify the emotional resonance of Zouave sacrifice among French Catholics. It makes far more sense to argue – as these Catholics would surely have done – that religious faith inflects gender identity"<sup>26</sup>. Sophie Heywood comes to a similar conclusion in her article. The Zouaves in the oeuvre of the Comtesse de Ségur were ideal pious men who combined a virile religion based on militancy and combativeness with sensitive, romantic piety. According to Heywood, this combination was not perceived as problematic and even conformed to social norms. Any conclusion that would suggest otherwise is for Heywood more based on "*une vision moderne de la masculinité que d'une volonté chez la comtesse ou les ultramontains de féminiser les hommes*"<sup>27</sup>.

In the Belgian Zouave stories one can find the same representation of the pontifical volunteers as combining male and female qualities. It is a major point that the associations between certain qualities and manliness or womanliness are made by the contemporary writers themselves. The priest Petrus-Josephus Cautereels described in an obituary how the Zouave Carlos d'Alcantara displayed "[...] the vigour and resoluteness of a man coupled with the sweetness and open-heartedness of a child [...]"<sup>28</sup>. Canon Servaas Daems described the protagonists of his Zouave novel *For Two Fathers* as being "[...] heroes who weren't the same lads anymore. [...] Proud and dignified they now looked more like triumphant men-at-arms"<sup>29</sup>. The Zouave Ludovic de Taillart's biographer,

the Jesuit father Édouard Terwecoren, presented him as “[...] *un enfant sage, [...] d'un calme rare; et, quoiqu'il fût naturellement d'une sensibilité presque féminine [...]*”<sup>30</sup>. According to Canon Charles Cartuyvels, the Zouaves were at one moment terrifying lions and at another “[...] *se montreront partout ailleurs doux et innocents comme des colombes*”<sup>31</sup>. *Colombe* literally means dove but was in those days also used to describe an innocent young girl. The last example comes from a speech by the Catholic journalist Guillaume Verspeyen who said of the Zouaves: “*Ces lions si terribles à l'ennemi deviennent doux comme des soeurs de charité*”<sup>32</sup>.

The Zouave and his religiosity seem to incorporate all the above ambiguities and possess attributes that research into religion and masculinity has defined as being mutually exclusive. But instead of speaking about strategies to make religion more ‘manly’ or religious men feminine, Harrison and Heywood both deny that this ambiguity was problematic for the ideal Catholic man. I agree with Harrison and Heywood and furthermore believe that such a misleading conclusion has a lot to do with the bulk of the research on manliness in general or masculinity and religion in particular having been done in Anglo-American academia and consequently focusing almost solely on Protestant manliness and neglecting Roman Catholicism<sup>33</sup>. I believe that part of Michael P. Carroll’s critique of the influence of Protestant meta-narratives on the study of religion is applicable here. Carroll argues that because Catholics accepted and Protestants rejected the view that God could be immanent in this world, Catholics, more than Protestants, are

“[...] predisposed toward analogical thinking, that is, toward using familiar relationships found in the created world as analogies that can effectively convey an understanding of relationship between human beings and God. [Furthermore] [b]ecause Catholics see the sacred is immanent in all human relations, for example, they are more likely to think about God using maternal as well as paternal metaphors”<sup>34</sup>.

In this different attitude Carroll sees an explanation for the Catholic tradition of pilgrimages to sites where saints or the Madonna have appeared and devotion to the Virgin Mary. I think that this analogical thinking also made it possible to define the ideal Catholic man in contradictory gender terms. Thus what is seen as straightforward for one group but problematic for another is to me another example “[...] that show[s] how the differing Catholic and Protestant attitudes toward immanence play out in connection with popular practice”<sup>35</sup>.

## PONTIFICAL ZOUAVES AND THE CLERICAL IMAGINATION

The Zouave stories were found by using two bibliographical studies. Sabina Gola went through the *Bibliographie nationale* to see what was published between 1830 and 1880 in Belgium about the political-religious situation in Italy<sup>36</sup>. Almost half of the 150 titles she mentions, are concerned with the Roman question. Within this group 11 works are about the pontifical Zouaves. Gola’s study was complemented by J. Lorette’s *Historiographie des zouaves pontificaux Belges 1860-1980*<sup>37</sup>. Lorette’s title wrongly suggests that he was only concerned with historiography. He actually collected and annotated works that range from historiography to poems, eulogies, obituaries, speeches, novels and plays. 51 Zouave stories by 35 different authors were collected. From this group of 51 a selection was made for this study on the basis of two criteria. The story had to have been published between 1860 and 1871. Works also had to have been present in a 19th-century school library or been reviewed in a Belgian Catholic pedagogical journal of the 19th century. Without amounting to full proof, these criteria contain the possibility of the works having been read. 14 Zouave stories by 12 different authors were discarded.

Besides the already mentioned novel *For Two Fathers* by Canon Daems, the story *Les Soldats du Pape* by Gabriel Gerny was selected<sup>38</sup>. These fictional works were supplemented by two stage plays, one written by the Jesuit father Lefevre, the other by the Catholic journalist Demarteau<sup>39</sup>. The four

fictional works are highly illustrative as fiction leaves more space for authors to present the narrative in their own way. In this respect one could call Zouave fiction tendentious literature, which implies that the message is put in explicitly<sup>40</sup>. Two non-fictional accounts were used: the already mentioned work by the priest Cautereels and the extensive volume *Les Martyrs de Castelfidardo* by the French Catholic author Anatole de Ségur, son of the Comtesse de Ségur and brother of Mgr Gaston de Ségur<sup>41</sup>. Three biographies all written by Jesuit fathers were analysed<sup>42</sup>. The biographies of the Zouaves Ludovic De Taillart and Auguste Mission were both written by Jesuit father Eduard Terwecoren who was the editor and manager of the Belgian Jesuit bi-monthly “Précis Historiques” in which prepublications of these biographies appeared. Three funeral orations were added, along with the published speeches of the Catholic ultramontane journalist Guillaume Verpeyen concerning the Zouaves<sup>43</sup>.

What holds for this smaller selection – 8 out of 12 authors are clerics – holds for the total collection of Zouave stories in which 20 of the 35 authors are clerics representing most levels of Church hierarchy. The clerical character of these stories has repercussions. It has been argued that the popularity of what has been called ‘feminine’ devotions is partly explained by the attraction these devotions had for the clergy, who strongly supported dissemination of them<sup>44</sup>. According to some authors this clerical affinity with the devotion to the Virgin Mary or other emotive devotions stems partly from the immanent quality of such devotions. Apparently their Italian roots account for the presence in them of androgynous gender roles originating in an unconscious childlike attachment by Italian clerics to their mothers<sup>45</sup>. As an intense mother bond has been demonstrated for a range of clerics from varying countries<sup>46</sup> one might assume that the clergy were indeed receptive to these ‘feminine’ devotions and probably reproduced similar values in their own works.

#### CHILDREN GATHERED AROUND THE ROCK

Canon Daems concludes the introduction of his book *For Two Fathers* with an appeal to the “brave children of Belgium” to “gather around the rock of Peter”<sup>47</sup>. It is notable that he explicitly calls to children and not adults. Throughout his book Daems idealizes youth as the real defenders of the Catholic Church. One could even say that Daems sees children as the most powerful sheep of the Catholic flock. For Daems starts his story with two of his main characters, a brother and a sister with the most appropriate names Joseph and Maria, praying at a chapel in front of a statue of the Virgin Mary for the recovery of their terminally ill mother. The girl urges the boy to pray harder. Joseph suggests however that he has another means at his disposal, namely sacrificing himself for the pope: a prayer is not the only weapon<sup>48</sup>. As the mother is miraculously cured the author clearly suggests that Joseph’s promise to join the Zouaves was effective. On first thoughts this scene seems to conform to the definition the French publicist Louis Veuillot (1813-1883) gave to the century he lived in. Veuillot suggested that the 19th century should be called the century of Mary, following the century of Voltaire<sup>49</sup>. However Daems stresses the role of the children more: “[...] even if a miracle would happen – well! It would not be the first that came about through the prayer of children’s love”<sup>50</sup>. Several studies point to the 19th century attaching increasing importance to Mary’s motherly influence over Jesus. But Daems in this story clearly expresses that children must be seen first of all as intermediaries between Mary and the world.

This idealization of children and their sacrifices are themes that come back in other works by the same author and are general features of Catholic youth literature in the second half of the 19th century<sup>51</sup>. The other texts in my selection likewise emphasize youth although more exclusively boys. In the play “Pour le drapeau” by the Jesuit Lefevre the thirteen-year-old Antonio wants to join the Zouaves and spurns objections about him being too young:

Too small! Too small! Believe me, the enemy will feel that size doesn't matter when I put him under ground! Too small! Too young! Being an adult doesn't matter; fighting like a veteran is enough! Too small, yes, but courage sometimes makes miracles happen. [...] Being small of stature and young of age is no drawback in battle, as one only has to dedicate one's heart to a higher cause. Oh childlike courage! No father like children!<sup>52</sup>

Eventually Antonio is allowed to enter the Zouave army. More examples can be found in non-fictional works. In a funeral oration dating from 1860 the priest Joannes-Baptista De Corte speaks of Belgian sons with children's hearts but manly courage<sup>53</sup>. Eleven years later in a sermon delivered at the funeral of August De Rijck, a Zouave who died from injuries sustained at the battle of Porta Pia, De Rijck's parish priest emphasized De Rijck's chastity and virtuousness and how young he was in years when he had his calling to become a Zouave<sup>54</sup>. The priest Petrus Cautereels does the same in the third part of his book when he presents what he considers a pantheon of the Zouaves. It seems that Cautereels' selection criteria were being young and dying on the battlefield or of injuries sustained. In their life story Alfred de Limminghe and Auguste Mission are presented as pious young boys, who lived an exemplary life but died too young. Concerning de Limminghe his biographer adds that Alfred's devotion was still lively and true<sup>55</sup>.

The use of children, in this case a boy, as ideals was a common practice in all arts and ideologies. One might set this representation of the Zouaves as heroes dying young in the context of the creation of Joseph Bara and Agricole Viala as young champions of the French Revolution<sup>56</sup>, or in the tradition of child saints. Since Cautereels explicitly refers to it, the beatification of the young Johannes Berchmans in 1865 is the best example. Such personages not only increase the dramatic tension but also exert a cultural influence. As Karen Sánchez-Eppler says in a study on children's part in creating social meaning in the 19th century,

The death of a child stands as the quintessential example of how the helplessness of any actual individual child can be converted into cultural influence. The power that adheres in the figure of the dying child may be used to enforce a wide array of social issues, and any reader of 19th-century fiction can easily produce a list of the lessons – temperance, abolition, charity, chastity, and most of all piety – underscored by the death of a child<sup>57</sup>.

The same goes for the Roman Catholic tradition. Robert Orsi, who has studied American Catholicism, is one of the few historians to emphasize the importance of children for Catholic piety in general. Orsi is the first to have argued that instead of speaking about the 19th century as the century of Mary (see above) one had better talk about the century of children: the Virgin Mary appeared to children at La Salette, Lourdes, Fatima and Marpingen. According to Orsi this has consequences for 19th-century Catholic faith: "Childhood – meaning the qualities presumed by adults to belong to children – became the model of adult faith in the age of children"<sup>58</sup>. For Orsi this means that "Rome [...] called on the faithful to practice simple devotional piety in the face of the distress and complexity of modernity, the more securely to locate Catholic populations under its authority"<sup>59</sup>. One can say that the Zouave as an ideal Catholic had manly and womanly qualities combined with the innocence of a child. The net result for people wanting to live according to this ideal was to accept the authority of the church. As the works discussed are all about the Roman question, one might too easily conclude that this meant accepting the authority of the pope. But in considering the authors of the Zouave discourse one can probably agree that this first and foremost meant the authority of the local clergy. Norman Vance mentioned that authority was part of the awkwardness between 19th-century manliness and Christianity: "It was inevitable that manliness and Christianity should be sometimes uneasy together. [...] The secular hero is captain of his fate and master of his soul, confidently dominating the action. But sooner or later the Christian hero must acknowledge Christ as captain and master"<sup>60</sup>. The writers of the Zouave

stories suggested that it is possible to preserve manly qualities even when under control by somebody else.

#### COMING-OF-AGE BACKWARDS

The above remark concerning de Limminghe, that his devotion was still lively and true, is one of many indications in the texts to show that the dying Zouaves do not just stand for piety, but above all portray a pure form of piety in contrast to corrupt grown men. In the fictional works this contrast is underscored by focusing on a male generation gap. In *For Two Fathers* Victor's intention to become a Zouave gets him into a row with his father. Inspired by his nephew Joseph and their mutual friend Marten, Victor decides to join the Zouaves but as a minor he has to receive his parents' permission. Victor's mother is pleased at his decision but Mr. Morren as a freethinker refuses to let his son embark on what he calls "foolishness, preposterous foolishness! [...] Zealous, [...] fanciful"<sup>61</sup>. This quarrel is central to the narrative and only ends when Victor's father converts to Catholicism. But for that to happen, his son has to die first. The other Zouaves in Daems' book, Joseph and Marten, receive their parental permission without any problem. As their fathers are deceased, Joseph and Marten only need their mothers' consent – mothers who are at least fairly enthusiastic. It is striking that in *For Two Fathers* and other stories by Daems the father of Catholic families has died. When patriarchs are still alive, they are unreligious. Daems does not create one religious male adult protagonist. Maybe personal reasons lie at the basis of this narrative device or maybe Daems is using a strong symbol for the feminization thesis: the religious man is dead.

In both plays the two young Zouave protagonists find themselves actually fighting against their fathers who have joined Garibaldi. Both Zouaves are in the end able to convince their fathers to join the papal army but once again, just as in the case of Victor, they both pay for their fathers' religious regeneration with their own lives. Finally in *Les soldats du pape* a young Catholic named Gaston is set against his future father-in-law, an old unbeliever and army veteran. The latter's reaction at the beginning of the book to Gaston's proposal to his daughter are "[...] *je ne souffrirai jamais que ma fille épouse une poule mouillée, un homme sans énergie et sans caractère, dominé par des prêtres [...] ma volonté est que ma fille épouse un homme ferme qui ne fléchisse jamais, un homme capable de la diriger dans le monde, et non un enfant de vingt-deux ans qui ne sait pas tenir un fusil*"<sup>62</sup>. This is one of the few times that traditional patriarchal authority manifests itself in one of the Zouave stories. Although most of the time young men are rejected by their fathers because they do not measure up to economic demands, this time it is clearly on grounds of masculinity. But when his son-in-law to be joins the pontifical Zouaves the veteran's appreciation slowly grows. Most importantly, before any fighting takes place the hardened man "[...] *ne pouvait s'empêcher de convenir intérieurement que Gaston avait faite preuve d'une énergie dont il ne l'aurait pas cru capable*"<sup>63</sup> and shows his admiration for Gaston who endures the rigours of camp life, sleeps in the open air, digs trenches, and leaves behind a bright future, his family fortune and loved ones. His esteem for Gaston leads him to recognize the latter as his son, to become a Catholic and to join the Zouaves himself. Not surprisingly this conversion comes again at a price: both men die side-by-side on the battlefield. From a Catholic point of view all four stories can be seen as coming-of-age narratives, but backwards.

Daems elaborates on manly irreligiousness by introducing anticlerical men at several points in the story. This is worked out explicitly in a chapter entitled *How a freethinker ends*. In it Victor's father, Mr. Morren, witnesses the last moments of a Freemason. The dying man, flanked by his brother and sister, his doctor and a friend, cries out that he wants to see a priest. As all three men are members of a Masonic lodge they refuse to comply with the last wish of their friend and brother. The man turns to Mr. Morren: "Ah, Morren! cried he; a priest, a priest! ... They want me



to pass away without a priest! ... [...] No, no! moaned the sick person. It is death! I feel it burning deep down. A priest, quick! They don't want to call one, I can't die like a dog"<sup>64</sup>. Only the sister, clearly ashamed because she thinks a priest will not follow her into her house as it is notoriously the house of Freemasons, can be persuaded to find a priest. When the clergyman arrives, Mr. Morren and he are kicked out for their pains, after witnessing a terrible death agony unrelieved by confession or the last rites. Mr. Morren reflects:

So this, then, is how a Freemason ends!... Such is the fate that awaits you if you do not return to religion, to the faith of your younger years. [...]; the desperate death-struggle and the horrible rage of the wretched deceased appalled him and froze the blood in his veins, and the hideous face, immediately disfigured and turned black after death, stayed before his eyes and made his limbs shudder<sup>65</sup>.

Daems's rendition of the dying freethinker distinctly contrasts with his account of the newly-dead Victor, who had the soft radiance of blissfulness and a joyful smile on his face, and with the portrayals of dying Zouaves in other texts<sup>66</sup>. In his chapter *How a Zouave dies*, a title that mirrors the Daems passage we have discussed, Cautereels chronicles how Zouaves lose their lives with patience in suffering and resignation and with endurance and submission to God's will<sup>67</sup>. Similar accounts are given in the eulogies I have studied. De Corte tells about a young Zouave who was mortally wounded by a bullet, made the sign of the cross and departed to heaven with a sweet and laughing face<sup>68</sup>. De Rijcke's published tribute includes a description of his funeral service and the observer noticed that the open casket made it possible to see that De Rijcke's face remained expressive and full of power. By contrast with Daems's anticlerical character, death left no marks on August De Rijcke<sup>69</sup>.

Almost identical utterances are made about Auguste Misson: "*Auguste est mort doucement joyeux. Un sourire de foi, de piété, d'amour et de bonheur semblait animer encore ses lèvres immobiles et livides, qui avaient baisé avec tant d'effusion la croix du salut*"<sup>70</sup>. According to his biographer, Alfred de Liminghe died with the same quiet forbearance. The author adds that this is characteristic of the chosen few<sup>71</sup>. By this it is established that acceptance of death has much to do with the fact that the Zouaves are prepared to suffer and sacrifice themselves. Constant evidence of this can be found in the texts. I will give just two examples. In the novel *Les soldats du pape* the old army veteran finally comes to appreciate the Zouaves: "*Allons, murmura le vieux général, ce sont de vrais soldats; se faire tuer, c'est déjà beau; mais savoir souffrir, c'est héroïque*"<sup>72</sup>. Auguste Misson is said to have stated that "*Que pourrait-il m'arriver de plus avantageux? Je ne mourrai jamais dans de meilleurs conditions. Mourir défenseur de la foi, c'est ce qu'il peut y avoir de plus heureux en ce monde*"<sup>73</sup>. The different representation of Zouaves and other grown up males, irreligious ones in particular, and above all the difference in their deaths, leads me to the conclusion that the most important features of the Zouave as an ideal Catholic were suffering, sacrifice and resignation.

Because the French texts focus exclusively on the mother-son relationships Carol E. Harrison does not discuss a father-son conflict or the father-son relationship in general in her article. As the French and Belgians texts show many similarities, this difference is important. Since irreligiousness is the core issue here, this dissimilarity might be explained by a disparity in French and Belgian anti-clericalism. During the 1860s the secular-clerical conflict was already at its height in Belgium<sup>74</sup>. In France on the contrary the maturation of republican anti-clericalism only begins in the 1870s with the end of the Second Empire; the onset of the French *Kulturkampf* is seen in 1877<sup>75</sup>. Later French Zouave stories, produced after 1870, should hence be studied to see if the Catholic father also becomes a literary trope that develops in France at the end of the 19th century, as republican anti-clericalism grows and Catholic politics goes on the defensive.

Daems's depiction of anti-clericals suggests that the Belgian Zouave stories should also be seen in the context of the Belgian culture wars, which pitted Catholics against liberal secular freethink-

ers. Though his description of a dying freethinker Daems become an early example of Belgian current affairs slipping inside a narrative, for from the late 1850s onwards civil burials became recurring demonstrations of anti-clericalism and were at the heart of the culture wars in Belgium. Daems's disturbing 'take' on a Freemason's last breath was probably a reaction against the most illustrative example of a Belgian civil burial. In December 1862 Freemason Pierre-Théodore Verhaegen, founder of the liberal Université Libre de Bruxelles, died and under the terms of his will had no priest at his deathbed, did not receive extreme unction and was carried to his grave with a big politically-charged funeral procession. His devout Catholic family was distressed and the ultramontane journal "Le Bien Public" called the demonstration "*une orgie maçonnique*"<sup>76</sup>.

Of more general importance is the fact that in the ten years over which the Zouave stories were written, a structured Catholic movement emerged in Belgium that culminated in the formation of the Catholic party in 1869. The Catholic congresses held in Malines in the years 1863, 1864 and 1867, some speeches from which are adopted as Zouave discourse, played a large part in this. A liberal party had already been founded in 1846. The creation of an organized political structure was certainly one of the reasons that kept the liberal party in power from 1847 until 1870 with only the years between 1855 and 1857 as exceptions. The late formation of a Catholic party in comparison with the liberal party was because the Belgian Catholic Church hierarchy thought it inappropriate to establish another Catholic power structure besides themselves<sup>77</sup>.

The political dominance of the liberals over the Catholics was denounced in 1852 by Barthélemy Dumortier, a Catholic member of parliament, in words that closely resemble parts of the Zouave discourse: "One does not want to fight [...]. The apathy, the lack of will power, to freeze at 60 degrees, these are the things that have to be overcome"<sup>78</sup>. The Catholic journalist Alexandre Delmer utters a similar complaint in 1865:

It is problematic that many educated and devout Catholics engage in study or academic politics, instead of keeping their eyes on the forum and looking for support within the people. Ah, why aren't there amongst our Catholics more democrats, more men of action, more tribunes of the people? at the risk of being less diplomatic or parliamentarily conscious, we would hold a better position now<sup>79</sup>.

These pronouncements in combination with the ideal Catholic portrayed in the Zouave stories incline me to hazard the interpretation that the Zouave stories may be a discourse intended for Catholics who want to defend their faith in public life and who are not afraid to suffer defeat – not a bad quality seen in the political constellation of the time. Most importantly, however, the Zouave stories also contain the official position of the Belgian Catholic hierarchy: that taking up the defence of one's faith must be done under the authority of the clergy.

## VIRGIN SONS AND VIRGIN MOTHERS

Being youngsters, the Zouaves were logically presented as unmarried. But more strikingly, no mention was ever made of a fiancée, or even a girlfriend at home or a possible love interest in Italy. The Zouaves were innocent virgins. Their virginal state was bolstered by the support the papal soldiers received from their mothers. Mothers clearly outshone any possible wife or marriage. The Zouaves are sons, not husbands. The following quotation from the English Cardinal Nicholas Wiseman's *Fabiola*, cited by Daems at the beginning of *For Two Fathers*, is one of many references to mothers who have to be prepared to sacrifice their sons for the cause of the pope:

Many a pious parent has devoted her infant son from the cradle to the holiest and noblest state that earth possesses; has prayed and longed to see him grow up to be, first a spotless Lévitte, and then a holy priest at the altar; and has watched eagerly each growing inclination, and tried gently to bend the tender thought towards the sanctuary of the Lord of Hosts. And if this was an only child, as Samuel

was to Anna, that dedication of all that is dear to her keenest affection, may justly be considered as an act of maternal heroism. What then must be said of ancient matrons, – Felicitas, Symphorosa, or the unnamed mother of the Maccabees, – who gave up or offered their children, not one, but many, yea all, to be victims whole-burnt, rather than priests, to God<sup>80</sup>?

Not only does this quotation imply a likeness between Christian warriors and priests as role models, Wiseman and Daems also clearly attribute heroism to women.

The sacrifice and resignation of women, almost always mothers, can be found in every Zouave story. The reaction of August Mission's mother upon the news of her son's death is illustrative: "*Oh! Dites, je vous en prie, à Notre Saint et Vénéré Père, que je suis heureuse et fière d'avoir pu lui donner mon cher enfant. Dites-lui que, si le coeur souffre, l'âme se réjouit, et que jamais un sentiment de regret du départ de notre enfant n'entrera dans nos coeurs; [...]*"<sup>81</sup>. Motherly courage is a recurrent topic in Guillaume Verspeyen's speeches given at the annual meetings of the Peter's Pence committee. The most telling one is his address of 1866. Verspeyen first compares Catholic mothers with mothers from the Roman republic and expresses a higher opinion of the former:

*L'héroïsme des mères est à la hauteur du courage des fils. Il y a quinze jours, une humble femme d'Alost assistait à la station de Bruxelles au départ de nos volontaires. Le sifflet retentit. Elle donne à son fils un dernier baiser, puis, se retournant vers un de nos confrères: "Quelle bénédiction, Monsieur! Je n'ai que deux enfants! L'une est soeur de charité, voilà l'autre zouave du Pape!" – Et elle partit heureuse et fière, en essuyant une larme ... Ne me parlez plus maintenant de la mère des Gracques montrant avec orgueil deux petits tribuns en herbe. Foin de cette vanterie païenne! ... Nous avons mieux que cela! (Bravos et rires prolongés.)*<sup>82</sup>.

Afterwards Verspeyen tells another anecdote starring a Catholic mother. This time much to his approval the mother not only literally gives her son for the cause of the pope but also as a latter-day Mary symbolically sacrifices her eldest son to God on an altar by taking him to the Belgian Marian pilgrimage in Halle: "*Sa mère voulut l'accompagner jusqu'à Hal. Ce fut là, au pied de l'autel de la Vierge, qu'elle offrit à Dieu, à l'Église, à Pie IX, l'aîné de ses fils!*"<sup>83</sup>

Zouave mothers are dealt with most explicitly in Anatole de Ségur's *Les Martyrs de Castelfidardo*. De Ségur for one thing dedicates his book to the various women in the lives of his subjects. The mothers and sisters of Zouaves are women who "[...] *ont participé au sacrifice par leur abnégation, par leur dévouement, par le courage héroïque avec lequel elles l'ont accepté [...]*"<sup>84</sup>. Again, the last chapter before his concluding remarks, with the nicely alliterating title *Les mères des martyrs*, is entirely about Zouave mothers: "[...] *il me semble que cet ouvrage resterait incomplet si je ne consacrais un chapitre spécial aux mères de ces héroïques soldats de l'Église, à ces femmes admirables qui, par leur dévouement avant et après le sacrifice, ont participé au martyre de leurs enfants*"<sup>85</sup>. Both quotes make it already clear that according to de Ségur the mothers have joined in the sacrifice and accepted it.

De Ségur even goes further:

*Je ne sais quelle femme d'esprit, de ce triste esprit du dix-huitième siècle, disait en parlant du sacrifice d'Abraham: 'Dieu n'aurait jamais demandé ce sacrifice à une mère!' Cette pauvre femme d'esprit n'avait jamais lu sans doute ni la passion de Jésus-Christ ni l'histoire de l'Église. Elle y aurait vu que Dieu avait demandé le sacrifice d'Abraham à la vierge Marie, et après elle à des milliers de mères chrétiennes, avec cette seule différence qu'il la laissée s'accomplir. Ce sacrifice, il est vrai, est au-dessus des forces de la nature, mais ce qui est impossible à la nature est possible et facile même avec la grâce surnaturelle de Dieu*<sup>86</sup>.

De Ségur begins by a reference to '*femmes d'esprit*'. In the 19th century a '*femme d'esprit*' had various connotations ranging from a progressive or smart women to a female who appropriated male expressions and gestures and abandoned her traditional role<sup>87</sup>. The use of the word '*pauvre*' confirms that de Ségur's interpretation is situated on the negative side of this spectrum. Afterwards he sets Mary and a thousand other Catholic mothers against this '*femme d'esprit*' as the former

haven't renounced their traditional role as mothers but do transgress the gender boundaries set by nature. Thanks to their religion the women in the Zouave stories can easily don the male characteristic of sacrifice and resignation.

An interesting comparison with general trends can be made. In a paper on the rhetoric of masculine citizenship Anna Clark gives the influential painting "Le Serment des Horaces" (1784) by Jacques-Louis David as an example of rhetoric conveying masculinity: "The bare bodies of the Horatii, their muscles bulging as they clench their swords, displayed a virile, militaristic masculinity and an ideal of citizenship"<sup>88</sup>. Without using the same symbols the Zouaves are presented in more or less the same ways as the Horatii, displaying among other things a virile religion, militancy and combativeness. What is interesting for this article, however, is the women in the painting. David has painted a group of weeping women, mothers and sisters of the Horatii. This scene contrasts with the descriptions of mothers in the Zouave stories. When sons and brothers are preparing for battle the republican women do not show the same resignation as the Zouave women. Out of this difference one could conclude that what was seen as a modern masculine quality, namely that public duty should overcome private feelings, was more evenly distributed to both sexes in the religious construction of gender.

Harrison too sees maternal sacrifice as one of the most important themes in the French Zouave stories. She concludes that the significance of women in Zouave narratives shows that "Women's role in the development of ultramontane piety in 19th-century Europe clearly involved more than mere numbers of female religious vocations or charitable monies spent"<sup>89</sup>. Harrison's conclusion ties in with the broader argument within the feminization-of-religion thesis, expressed by Caroline Ford and Robert Orsi among others, that the possibility it afforded for female socialization explains why women flocked to the Church<sup>90</sup>. Harrison's conclusion is centred mainly on the reception of the Zouave stories. This is not so problematic since at several points in her article Harrison introduces other sources besides the Zouave stories and historical research, all of which show what roles women took upon themselves in the Roman question. In the case of Belgium, however, it is more difficult to put together such a variety of sources. Thus the mother-son relationship will have to be viewed from the perspective of the story-writers alone.

As the majority of the authors were priests or devout Catholics<sup>91</sup> one should evaluate the tribute to the Catholic mother's heroism in the light of the maternal bond discussed earlier. It is clear that in the Zouave stories some of the qualities of the Virgin Mary were bestowed upon Catholic mothers. This likening to Mary has clear consequences, however. Marlène Albert Llorca and Luisa Accati both argue that such idealization of the mother together with moral devaluing of the father, again very present in the Zouave stories, resulted in an unprecedented exaltation of maternal virginity in the 19th century<sup>92</sup>. Accati goes into the propagation of this Virgin-Mother antithesis thoroughly; in her view the fact of virginity becoming the model for all women affected the distribution of power in that "[...] that every man who married sealed a pact with the ecclesiastical authorities. For the wife was – and is – not a separate, independent person, but a part of that great collective subject the Mother-Madonna (the Church), pregnant since eternity in the mind of God"<sup>93</sup>. Accati sees the 19th century ascension of Mary not as the power of real mothers or women but a symbol of "[...] the power of the son (in the shape of the unmarried priests) over the mother [...]"<sup>94</sup>. Once again a core issue – the authority of the clergy over the laity – is found to be a major theme in the Zouave stories.

## CONCLUSION

This study argues that for various reasons the pontifical Zouaves are a good way of investigating the Roman Catholic discourse concerning the ideal Catholic man. It has shown that this ideal

Catholic man was supposed to possess characteristics that contemporaries saw as manly and also womanly. Harrison and Heywood have already argued the importance of this conclusion for research into the influence of religion on gender. I would add that such a conclusion also proves that we must look into more countries and more denominations when researching into religious masculinity or the history of masculinity in general.

Submission emerges as the most important quality through different literary tropes present in the Zouave stories. The historical context in which these stories were written accounts for some of this but most is explained by the clerical background of the authors. One can suppose that the general growing emphasis on personal independence in modern society might be a reason why men tend not to feel any affinity with this normative discourse.

## NOTES

- <sup>1</sup> Numerous studies have contributed to this postulation. For an overview I refer to a recent review articles that tackle a great deal of the existing historical literature in which this chapter is embedded, T. Van Osselaer, T. Buerman, *'Feminisation' thesis: a survey of international historiography and a probing of Belgian grounds*, in "Revue d'Histoire Ecclésiastique", 2008, 103, pp. 497-544. Although it is also mentioned in the article above J. F. McMillan, *Religion and Gender in Modern France: Some Reflections*, in F. Tallett, N. Atkin, *Religion, Society and Politics in France since 1789*, London 1991, pp. 55-66, is worth referring to separately as it points to some dangers in using the feminization thesis as a framework and helps to avoid reductionist or essentialist notions of manliness and womanliness.
- <sup>2</sup> M.E. Ruff, *The Postmodern Challenge to the Secularization Thesis: A Critical Assessment*, in "Schweizerische Zeitschrift für Religions- und Kulturgeschichte", 2005, 99, pp. 398-399.
- <sup>3</sup> In the three following endnotes I give the references of some of the historical literature concerning the four different meanings of the feminization thesis. See endnote 1 for more literature and a discussion of these. C. Langlois, *Le catholicisme au féminin*, in "Archives de Sciences Sociales des Religions", 1984, 57, pp. 29-53; S. Curtis, *Charitable Ladies: Gender, Class and Religion in Mid Nineteenth-century Paris*, in "Past and Present", 2002, 177, pp. 121-156.
- <sup>4</sup> M. Kimmel, *Manhood in America. A Cultural History*, New York 1996, p. 176; R.D.E. Burton, *Holy Tears, Holy Blood: Women, Catholicism, and the Culture of Suffering in France, 1840-1970*, Ithaca - London 2004; R. Harris, *Lourdes: Body and Spirit in the Secular Age*, New York 1999.
- <sup>5</sup> C.G. Brown, *The Death of Christian Britain. Understanding secularisation 1800-2000*, London 2001, pp. 58-87.
- <sup>6</sup> G.L. Mosse, *The image of man. The creation of modern masculinity*, Oxford 1996, pp. 48-51; W. Schmale, *Geschichte der Männlichkeit in Europa (1450-2000)*, Vienna 2003, pp. 229-230.
- <sup>7</sup> M.B. Gross, *The War against Catholicism. Liberalism and the Anti-Catholic Imagination in Nineteenth-Century Germany*, Ann Arbor 2005; T. Verhoeven, *Neither Male or Female: Androgyny, Nativism and International Anti-Catholicism*, in "Australasian Journal of American Studies", 2005, 24, pp. 5-19; J. Art, T. Buerman, *Is de katholieke man wel een echte vent?*, in "Historica", 2007, 30, pp. 27-29; D.K. Hastings, *Fears of a Feminized Church: Catholicism, Clerical Celibacy, and the Crisis of Masculinity in Wilhelmine Germany*, in "European History Quarterly", 2008, 38, pp. 34-65. Two authors working on masculinity in general mention the problems gender associations might have brought to men who were religious in any way: "Clearly, the minister's task placed him at a great distance from the men who subjected themselves to the daily pressures of the market. The decline in the status of the ministry from the late 18th century and through the 19th derived from many causes, but the daily association of the clergy with women and with the traits and cultural spaces allotted to women must surely have had an impact on the popular view of their profession". E.A. Rotundo, *American Manhood. Transformations in Masculinity from the Revolution to the Modern Era*, New York 1993, p. 206; "Women were not only domestic, they were domesticators, expected to turn their sons into virtuous Christian gentlemen – dutiful, well-mannered, and feminized." Kimmel, *Manhood* cit., p. 60.
- <sup>8</sup> Y.M. Werner, *Christliche Männlichkeit – ein Paradox der Moderne. Männer und Religion im nordeuropäischen Kontext 1840-1940*, unpublished project presentation, 2004, pp. 1-12, [[http://www.hist.lu.se/hist/forskning/kristen\\_manlighet/Homepage.pdf](http://www.hist.lu.se/hist/forskning/kristen_manlighet/Homepage.pdf)].
- <sup>9</sup> The essays collected in the volume edited by Andrew Bradstock and others tackle together a great deal of the possible topics for studying masculinity with regard to Victorian spirituality and are all more or less concerned with the relation between Christian manliness and hegemonic manliness, A. Bradstock, S. Gill, A. Hogan, S. Morgan, *Masculinity and Spirituality in Victorian Culture*, London 2000.

- <sup>10</sup> N. Vance, *The Sinews of the Spirit: The Ideal of Christian Manliness in Victorian Literature and Religious Thought*, Cambridge 1985. Vance uses the term “Christian manliness” instead of “muscular Christianity” (see his introduction for the rational behind this). In the bibliographical essay which closes Peter Gay’s *The Cultivation of Hatred*, Gay assigns great authority to Vance’s book, not only for the history of religion but for the understanding of Victorian manliness in general. Vance’s points and Gay’s appreciation prove that whatever the 19th-century reasoning was, religion was very important for the male identity in the 19th century, P. Gay, *The Cultivation of Hatred*, New York 1993, p. 613.
- <sup>11</sup> Vance, *The Sinews* cit., p. 1.
- <sup>12</sup> G. Bederman, “*The Women Have Had Charge of the Church Work Long Enough*: The Men and Religion Forward Movement of 1911-1912 and the Masculinization of Middle-Class Protestantism”, in “*American Quarterly*”, 1989, 41, p. 438.
- <sup>13</sup> Brown, *The Death of Christian Britain* cit., p. 108.
- <sup>14</sup> About the French Zouaves one extensive historical published study exists: J. Guenel, *La dernière guerre du pape. Les Zouaves pontificaux au secours du Saint-Siège 1860-1870*, Rennes 1998. In a study on the French devotion for Pius IX the Zouaves are discussed as a self-sacrificing movement B. Horaist, *La Dévotion au pape et les catholiques français sous le pontificat de Pie IX (1846-1878) d’après les archives de la Bibliothèque apostolique vaticaine*, Rome 1995, pp. 54-59. For Belgium an interesting and elaborate but very descriptive article is available, L. Leconte, *Les Belges au Service de Rome (1860-1870). Aux Tirailleurs franco-belges et aux Zouaves pontificaux*, in “*Carnet de la Fourragère*”, 1927-1929, 1-4, pp. 71-85, 169-189, 260-284, 356-364, and a thorough but of less scientific value local history, J. Goddeeris, *De Pauselijke Zouaven: met opgave van de vrijwilligers uit West-Vlaanderen*, s.l. 1978. In the literature on the *Risorgimento* the Zouaves are discussed obliquely and in religion history they are almost completely lacking. For example, F. Coppa, *Italy: the church and the Risorgimento*, in S. Gilley, B. Stanley (eds.), *The Cambridge History of Christianity. World Christianities c. 1815-1914*, Cambridge 2006, pp. 233-249, does not mention them. Small reference can be found in C. Clark, *The New Catholicism and the European culture wars*, in C. Clark, W. Kaiser (eds.), *Culture Wars. Secular-Catholic Conflict in Nineteenth-Century Europe*, Cambridge 2003, p. 22. The Zouaves received more attention in V. Viaene, *The Roman Question, Catholic Mobilisation and Papal Diplomacy during the Pontificate of Pius IX (1846-1878)*, in E. Lamberts (ed.), *The Black International. L’International Noire. 1870-1878: the Holy See and Militant Catholicism in Europe*, Leuven 2002, pp. 144-146, and recently Viaene called the Zouave engagement the most spectacular aspect of the Catholic mobilization on behalf of the pope and points to the fact that “[...] the Zouaves outnumbered any other international volunteer corps in the 19th-century Europe; [...]”, V. Viaene, *International History, Religious History, Catholic History: Perspectives for Cross-Fertilization (1830-1914)*, in “*European History Quarterly*”, 2008, 38, p. 598.
- <sup>15</sup> The first Belgian Zouave joined in Brussels on 17 April 1860 and the last one enrolled on 1 September 1870. Between those two 1961 other Belgian men joined the pontifical Zouaves. See F.E. Stevens, *Een goudmijn voor genealogen en geschiedschrijvers. De dienstverbintenissen bij de pauselijke troepen 1860-1870*, in “*Belgisch Tijdschrift voor Militaire Geschiedenis*”, 1973, 20, pp. 53-78.
- <sup>16</sup> In a study on the French devotion for Pius IX by Bruno Horaist the Zouaves are discussed as a self-sacrificing movement. According to this study the successive defeats of the Zouave army made the Zouaves into heroes in the eyes of French Catholics, children in particular: “*Cette défaite aviva, chez les jeunes, le désir de se battre, l’espoir d’être un héros*”, B. Horaist, *La Dévotion au pape et les catholiques français sous le pontificat de Pie IX (1846-1878) d’après les archives de la Bibliothèque apostolique vaticaine*, Rome 1995, p. 54. In an accompanying essay in the catalogue of the 2007-2008 exhibition ‘Héros d’Achille à Zidane’ in the Bibliothèque nationale de France on French heroes through the ages the Zouaves are not included in the ‘Galerie confessionnelle de héros zélés *ad majorem Dei gloriam*’ but a small reference is made to the importance of hero worship of Christian knights for the determination of French Catholics to defend the interests of the Pope. C. Amalvi, *La construction des héros nationaux à l’école et au foyer familial, de 1800 à 1914*, in O. Faliu, M. Tourret, *Héros d’Achille à Zidane*, Paris 2007, p. 115. Similar in-depth research into different aspects of the Belgian worship to Pius IX or the construction of Belgian national heroes has not been done yet.
- <sup>17</sup> M. Jones, *What should Historians Do With Heroes? Reflections on Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Britain*, in “*History Compass*”, 2007, 5, pp. 439-440.
- <sup>18</sup> R.A. Nye, *Western Masculinities in War and Peace*, in “*The American Historical Review*”, 2007, 112, pp. 417-438.
- <sup>19</sup> “*Nog niet veel onderzoek naar gedaan. Blijkt wel dat vooral het mogelijk rekruteren van kinderen werd aangeklaagd. In parlementaire bronnen die besproken worden in [werktitel opgeven] blijkt dat liberalen en katholieken bewondering hadden voor het opnemen van het engagement*”.
- <sup>20</sup> Notable exceptions are: P. Seeley, *O Sainte Mère: Liberalism and the Socialization of Catholic Men in Nineteenth-Century France*, in: “*The Journal of Modern History*”, 1998, 70, pp. 862-891; J.-F. Roussel, *Roman Catholic Religious Discourse About Manhood in Quebec: From 1900 to the Quiet Revolution (1960-1980)*, in “*Journal of Men’s*

- Studies”, 2003, 11, pp. 145-155; L. Bienvenue, C. Hudon, “Pour devenir homme, tu transgresseras...”: *Quelques enjeux de la socialisation masculine dans les collèges québécois (1880-1939)*, in “The Canadian Historical Review”, 2005, 86, pp. 485-511.
- <sup>21</sup> S. Heywood, *Les “petits garçons modèles”. La masculinité catholique à travers l’oeuvre de la comtesse de Ségur*, in R. Revenin (ed.), *Hommes et masculinités de 1789 à nos jours. Contributions à l’histoire du genre et de la sexualité en France*, Paris 2007, pp. 208-219.
- <sup>22</sup> C.E. Harrison, *Zouave Stories: Gender, Catholic Spirituality, and French Responses to the Roman Question*, in “The Journal of Modern History”, 2007, 79, pp. 274-305.
- <sup>23</sup> Carol E. Harrison is the author of the much acclaimed *The Bourgeois Citizen in Nineteenth-Century France: Gender, Sociability, and the Uses of Emulation*, Oxford 1999. “The Journal of Modern History” is one of the few historical journals for which a “Journal Impact Factor” has been or can be calculated.
- <sup>24</sup> Harrison, *Zouave stories* cit., p. 296.
- <sup>25</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 290-291.
- <sup>26</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 304.
- <sup>27</sup> Heywood, *Les ‘petits garçons modèles’* cit., p. 216.
- <sup>28</sup> J.-P. Cautereels, *De pauselijke zouaven: hunne heldenfeiten in 1867*, Mechelen 1868, p. 45.
- <sup>29</sup> The official title in English is *The Double Sacrifice: a tale of Castelfidardo* (London: John Philp, 1871). I prefer to use the literal translation *For Two Fathers* of the Dutch title *Voor Twee Vaders* as I have only read the Flemish version and as different fathers play an important role in the narrative, S. Daems, *Voor twee Vaders: tafereelen uit het der pauselijke zouaven*, Brussels 1868, p. 50.
- <sup>30</sup> Terwecoren, *August Misson* cit., pp. 7-8.
- <sup>31</sup> C. Cartuyvels, *Éloge funèbre des zouaves pontificaux morts pour la défense du Saint-Siege en 1867, prononcé en l’Église de Sainte-Gudule à Bruxelles, le 26 novembre 1867*, Louvain 1867, p. 22.
- <sup>32</sup> G. Verspeyen, *Rapport sur l’Association de St. Pierre*, in Anon., *Compte-Rendu de l’Assemblée Générale. Tenue à Gand, le 17 Décembre 1867*, Ghent 1867, p. 15.
- <sup>33</sup> The difference between two collections on French masculinities published in 2007 can be seen as symptomatic. The volume edited by Régis Revenin that includes the contribution of Heywood devotes one of its five sections to religion. In this section two out of three contributions tackle Roman Catholicism. See Revenin (ed.), *Hommes et masculinités* cit., pp. 192-207, 208-219, in C.E. Forth, B. Taithe (eds.), *French Masculinities. History, Culture and Politics*, Houndmills 2007, one has to search for any reference to Roman Catholicism. In one contribution the missionary is shortly discussed as “[...] a different type of colonial man, the celibate priest who renounced those twin signifiers of traditional masculinity, fornication and fatherhood, for love of God”, R. Aldrich, *Colonial Man*, in Forth, Taithe, *French Masculinities* cit., p. 127.
- <sup>34</sup> M.P. Carroll, *American Catholics in the Protestant Imagination: Rethinking the Academic Study of Religion*, Baltimore 2007, pp. 163-164.
- <sup>35</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 163. Sean Gill has indicated that not only the ambiguity in the thinking of men like Thomas Hughes and Charles Kingsley makes it difficult to examine Christian manliness but contemporary problems of interpretation also prevent going beyond absolute distinctions that differentiated the sexes, S. Gill, *How Muscular was Victorian Christianity? Thomas Hughes and the Cult of Christian Manliness Reconsidered*, in R.N. Swanson (ed.), *Gender and Christian Religion*, Woodbridge 1998, pp. 421-430.
- <sup>36</sup> S. Gola, *Un demi-siècle de relations culturelles entre l’Italie et la Belgique (1830-1880)*, in “Institut historique belge de Rome. Bibliothèque”, 1999, pp. 46-47.
- <sup>37</sup> J. Lorette, *Historiographie des zouaves pontificaux belges 1860-1980*, in Anon., *Actes du Colloque d’Histoire militaire belge (1830-1980), Bruxelles, 26-28 mars 1980*, Brussels 1981, pp. 151-163.
- <sup>38</sup> G. Gerny, *Les Soldats du Pape*, Tournai 1865.
- <sup>39</sup> P. Lefèvre, *Pour le drapeau, épisode de la guerre pontificale (1860)*, 1862; Demartean, *Le zouave pontifical ou le fils du soldat*, 1862. Both are handwritten manuscripts without pagination or other bibliographical information. Hence when referring to them in endnotes no page numbers are mentioned.
- <sup>40</sup> S.R. Suleiman, *Authoritarian fictions. The ideological novel as a literary genre*, New York 1983, p. 7.
- <sup>41</sup> Cautereels, *De pauselijke zouaven* cit.; A. de Ségur, *Les Martyrs de Castelfidardo*, Paris 1862.
- <sup>42</sup> A. Pruvost, *Notice sur la vie et la mort du comte Alfred de Limminghe*, Brussels 1861; E. Terwecoren, *Ludovic De Taillart, zouave pontifical*, Brussels 1862; Id., *Auguste Misson, zouave pontifical*, Brussels 1862.

- <sup>43</sup> Anon., *Bloemen geplukt op het graf van mijnheer August De Rijck, gewezen pauselijk zouaaf*, Roesselaere 1871; J.-B. De Corte, *Lijkrede, Uitgesproken in Onze Lieve Vrouw-Kerk te Brugge, door J.-B. De Corte, Missionaris en geestelyken schoolopziener des Bisdoms, Ter gelegenheid van den plegtigen Lykdienst aldaer op 6 November 1860 gevierd voor de gesneuvelde van het Pauselyk Leger*, Gent - Bruges 1860; C. Cartuyvels, *Éloge funèbre des Zouaves Pontificaux mort pour la défense du Saint-Siège en 1867, prononcé en l'église Sainte-Gudule, à Bruxelles*, Louvain 1867; G. Verspeyen, *Discours sur l'Oeuvre du Denier de Saint-Pierre*, in Anon., *Assemblée Générale des Catholiques en Belgique. Première Session à Malines. 18-22 Août 1863*, Brussels 1864, pp. 55-56; Id., *Rapport sur l'Association de St. Pierre*, in Anon., *Compte-Rendu de l'Assemblée Générale. Tenue à Gand, le 11 Décembre 1866*, Gent 1866, pp. 7-21; Id., *Rapport sur l'Association [...] 1867* cit., pp. 7-25.
- <sup>44</sup> "The Virgin's ubiquity in the religious psyche of the period meant that often Mary, not Christ, was seen as the intermediary between God and his suffering people. The clergy were not always able to control the impulses of the pilgrims who seemed to worship Mary as a deity in her own right, and some priests even seemed to countenance such deviations in an effort to galvanize popular piety and, perhaps, to give expression to their own intense feeling", Harris, *Lourdes* cit., p. 285.
- <sup>45</sup> J. Art, *The Cult of the Virgin Mary, or the feminisation of Roman Catholicism by males? A psycho-historical hypothesis*, in J. Art et al. (eds.), *'Dieu changea de sexe'? Christian Feminisation and masculinisation in Europe*, Leuven [forthcoming 2009].
- <sup>46</sup> On the one hand researchers have stressed the importance of the mother in vocations. For example Genenviève Gadbois claims on the basis of biographical documents that for Henri-Dominique Lacordaire (1802-1861) who from 1838 onwards revived the Dominicans in France "[...] chacun des passages de sa vie de foi, lorsqu'il les évoque, le ramène à sa mère, notamment l'éveil de sa foi, [...]". Gadbois even generalizes this statement: "Il est rare, dans une biographie d'homme d'Église du XIXe siècle, qu'on ne relie pas la vocation de l'intéressé principalement à la foi de sa mère", G. Gadbois, *La religion de ma mère. Le rôle des femmes dans la transmission de la foi*, Paris 1992, pp. 314-315. On the other hand has been pointed to Mary as a sublimate mother figure for different well-known clericals. According to Carol Marie Engelhardt, Frederick W. Faber (1814-1863) one of the most prominent defenders of Roman-Catholic formalistic Christianity took up an intense devotional style "[...] which included inviting his co-religionists to join him in addressing Mary as 'Dear Mama' or even 'Dearest Mama'", C.M. Engelhardt, *Victorian Masculinity and the Virgin Mary*, in Bradstock, Gill, Hogan, Morgan (eds.), *Masculinity and Spirituality* cit., pp. 52-53. Thomas A. Kselman found that Marie-Joseph Chirion (1797-1852), in 1824 one of the founders of the congregation of Sainte-Marie-de-l'Assomption, as a seminary student filled his notebooks with sentimental pleas towards Mary calling upon her as "Maman", T. Kselman, *Miracles and Prophecies in Nineteenth-Century France*, New Brunswick 1983, p. 226.
- <sup>47</sup> Daems, *Voor twee Vaders* cit., p. 7.
- <sup>48</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 16.
- <sup>49</sup> Cited in R. Gibson, *A Social History of French Catholicism, 1789-1914*, London 1989, p. 255.
- <sup>50</sup> Daems, *Voor twee Vaders* cit., p. 13.
- <sup>51</sup> J. Van Coillie, R. Ghesquière, *Uit de schaduw. Een beknopte geschiedenis van de West-Vlaamse en de Westfaalse jeugd-en kinderliteratuur*, Bruges 1996, pp. 92-97. In particular the story "Of Janneken and Mieken who went to Our Lady for food" in Daems his *Descriptions and Tales* [my translations], 1897, bears great resemblance to *For Two Fathers*.
- <sup>52</sup> Lefevre, *Pour le drapeau* cit.
- <sup>53</sup> De Corte, *Lijkrede* cit., p. 11.
- <sup>54</sup> Anon., *Bloemen geplukt* cit., p. 6.
- <sup>55</sup> Terwecoren, *Ludovic De Taillart* cit., p. VII; Pruvost, *Notice* cit., pp. 5, 9.
- <sup>56</sup> M. Burleigh, *Earthly Powers. The Clash of Religion and Politics in Europe from the French Revolution to the Great War*, New York 2005, p. 75.
- <sup>57</sup> K. Sánchez-Eppler, *Dependent states: the child's part in nineteenth-century American culture*, Chicago 2005, p. 101.
- <sup>58</sup> R. Orsi, *Between Heaven and Earth. The Religious Worlds People make and the Scholars who study them*, Princeton - Oxford 2005, p. 81.
- <sup>59</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 81.
- <sup>60</sup> Vance, *The Sinews* cit., p. 7.
- <sup>61</sup> Daems, *Voor twee Vaders* cit., p. 42.
- <sup>62</sup> Genry, *Les soldats* cit., pp. 24, 37.
- <sup>63</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 49.
- <sup>64</sup> Daems, *Voor twee Vaders* cit., p. 243.



- <sup>65</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 250-251.
- <sup>66</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 274.
- <sup>67</sup> Cautereels, *De pauselijke zouaven* cit., pp. 83-94.
- <sup>68</sup> De Corte, *Lijkrede* cit., p. 20.
- <sup>69</sup> Anon., *Bloemen geplukt* cit., p. 4.
- <sup>70</sup> Terwecoren, *Ludovic De Taillart* cit., pp. 60-66.
- <sup>71</sup> Pruvost, *Notice* cit., p. 77.
- <sup>72</sup> Gerny, *Les soldats* cit., p. 61.
- <sup>73</sup> Terwecoren, *August Misson* cit., p. 27.
- <sup>74</sup> E. Witte, *The battle for monasteries, cemeteries and schools: Belgium*, in Clark, Kaiser (eds.), *Culture Wars* cit., pp. 113-118.
- <sup>75</sup> J. McMillan, 'Priest hits girl': *on the front line in the 'war of the two Frances'*, in Clark, Kaiser (eds.), *Culture Wars* cit., pp. 77-78.
- <sup>76</sup> Witte, *The Battle* cit., pp. 117-118.
- <sup>77</sup> E. Gubin, J.-P. Nandrin, *Het liberale en burgerlijke België 1846-1878*, in E. Witte, J.-P. Nandrin, E. Gubin, G. Denekere, *Nieuwe geschiedenis van België I 1830-1905*, Tielt 2005, p. 318.
- <sup>78</sup> Cited in Gubin, Nandrin, *Het liberale* cit., p. 313.
- <sup>79</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 324.
- <sup>80</sup> N.P. Wiseman, *Fabiola; Or, The Church of the Catacombs*, s.l., Harvard University 1860, p. 11.
- <sup>81</sup> Terwecoren, *August Misson* cit., p. 58.
- <sup>82</sup> Verspeyen, *Rapport sur L'Association [...] 1866* cit., p. 18.
- <sup>83</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 18.
- <sup>84</sup> de Ségur, *Les Martyrs* cit., p. 5.
- <sup>85</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 319.
- <sup>86</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 321-322.
- <sup>87</sup> K. Powell, E.C. Childs, J. Bergman-Carton, L. Czyba, J. Wechsler, *Femmes d'esprit in Daumier's Caricature*, Hanover 1990.
- <sup>88</sup> A. Clark, *The Rhetoric of Masculine Citizenship. Concepts and Representation in Modern Western Political Culture*, in S. Dudink, K. Hagemann, A. Clark (eds.), *Representing Masculinity. Male Citizenship in Modern Western Culture*, New York 2007, p. 3.
- <sup>89</sup> Harrison, *Zouave Stories* cit., p. 297.
- <sup>90</sup> C. Ford, *Religion and Popular Culture in Modern Europe*, in "Journal of Modern History", 1993, 65, pp. 171-173; Id., *Divided Houses. Religion and Gender in Modern France*, Ithaca - London 2005, pp. 138-149; R. Orsi, "He Keeps Me Going": *Women's Devotion to Saint Jude Thaddeus and the Dialectics of Gender in American Catholicism, 1929-1965*, in T. Kselman (ed.), *Belief in History. Innovative Approaches to European and American Religion*, Notre Dame - London 1991, pp. 137-169. It is not only historians of religion who have argued that, with sociability as the hoped-for outcome, women surely thought and acted outside the pigeon-hole in which contemporaries and historians might have put them. A recent contribution on Florence Nightingale concludes, for instance, that Nightingale in her own discourse associated herself with contemporary claims as to the heroic sacrifice of the ordinary soldier and thereby attempted to receive the full citizenship of her country. Again, Rebecca Rogers, studying 19th-century education for women, and Carla Hesse, working from female eloquence and writings, claim that one should revise the accepted views on the boundaries between the public world of politics and the private world of the family and the exclusion of women from the public sphere. G. Mak, B. Waaldijk, *De politiek van Florence Nightingale in de feministische geschiedschrijving*, in R. Buikema, I. van der Tuin (eds.), *Gender in media, kunst en cultuur*, Bussum 2007, pp. 222-223; R. Rogers, *From the Salon to the Schoolroom: Educating Bourgeois Girls in Nineteenth-Century France*, University Park 2005; C. Hesse, *The Other Enlightenment: How French Women Became Modern*, Princeton 2001.
- <sup>91</sup> Paul Seeley has argued that devout Catholic men felt that they owed their mothers a debt for their own birth and their evangelical upbringing at the hands of their mothers, Seeley, *O Sainte Mère* cit., p. 877.
- <sup>92</sup> L. Accati, *Explicit Meanings: Catholicism, Matriarchy and the Distinctive Problems of Italian Feminism*, in "Gender & History", 1995, 7, pp. 241-259; M.A. Llorca, *Les femmes dans les apparitions mariales de l'époque contemporaine*, in "Clio, Histoire, Femmes et Sociétés", 2002, 15, pp. 123-134.
- <sup>93</sup> Accati, *Explicit Meanings* cit., pp. 250-251.
- <sup>94</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 244.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Accati L., *Explicit Meanings: Catholicism, Patriarchy and the Distinctive Problems of Italian Feminism*, in "Gender & History", 1995, 7, pp. 241-259.
- Aldrich R., *Colonial Man*, in Forth C.E., Taithe B. (eds.), *French Masculinities. History, Culture and Politics*, Houndmills 2007, pp. 123-140.
- Amalvi C., *La construction des héros nationaux à l'école et au foyer familial, de 1800 à 1914*, in O. Faliu, M. Tourret (eds.), *Héros d'Achille à Zidane*, Paris 2007, pp. 112-121.
- Art J., Buerman T., *Is de katholieke man wel een echte vent?*, in "Historica", 2007, 30, pp. 27-29.
- Art J., *The Cult of the Virgin Mary, or the feminisation of Roman Catholicism by males? A psycho-historical hypothesis*, in Art J. et al. (eds.), *'Dieu changea de sexe?' Christian Feminisation and masculinisation in Europe*, Leuven [forthcoming 2009].
- Bederman G., *"The Women Have Had Charge of the Church Work Long Enough": The Men and Religion Forward Movement of 1911-1912 and the Masculinization of Middle-Class Protestantism*, in "American Quarterly", 1989, 41, pp. 432-465.
- Bienvenue L., Hudon C., *"Pour devenir homme, tu transgresseras...": Quelques enjeux de la socialisation masculine dans les collèges québécois (1880-1939)*, in "The Canadian Historical Review", 2005, 86, pp. 485-511.
- Bradstock A., Gill S., Hogan A., Morgan S. (eds.), *Masculinity and Spirituality in Victorian Culture*, London 2000.
- Brown C.G., *The Death of Christian Britain. Understanding secularisation 1800-2000*, London 2001.
- Burleigh M., *Earthly Powers. The Clash of Religion and Politics in Europe from the French Revolution to the Great War*, New York 2005.
- Burton R.D.E., *Holy Tears, Holy Blood: Women, Catholicism, and the Culture of Suffering in France, 1840-1970*, Ithaca - London 2004.
- Carroll M.P., *American Catholics in the Protestant Imagination: Rethinking the Academic Study of Religion*, Baltimore 2007.
- Cartuyvels C., *Éloge funèbre des zouaves pontificaux morts pour la défense du Saint-Siège en 1867, prononcé en l'Église de Sainte-Gudule à Bruxelles, le 26 novembre 1867*, Louvain 1867.
- Cautereels J.-P., *De pauselijke zouaven: hunne heldenfeiten in 1867*, Mechelen 1868.
- Clark C., *The New Catholicism and the European culture wars*, in Clark C., Kaiser W. (eds.), *Culture Wars. Secular-Catholic Conflict in Nineteenth-Century Europe*, Cambridge 2003, pp. 11-46.
- Id., *The Rhetoric of Masculine Citizenship. Concepts and Representation in Modern Western Political Culture*, in Dudink S., Hagemann K., Clark A. (eds.), *Representing Masculinity. Male Citizenship in Modern Western Culture*, New York 2007.
- Coppa F., *Italy: the church and the Risorgimento*, in S. Gilley, B. Stanley (eds.), *The Cambridge History of Christianity. World Christianities c. 1815-1914*, Cambridge 2006, pp. 233-249.
- Curtis S., *Charitable Ladies: Gender, Class and Religion in Mid Nineteenth-century Paris*, in "Past and Present", 2002, 177, pp. 121-156.
- Daems S., *Voor twee Vaders: tafereelen uit het der pauselijke zouaven*, Brussels 1868.
- Demarteau, *Le zouave pontifical ou le fils du solidaire*, s.l. 1862.
- De Corte J.-B., *Lijkrede, Uitgesproken in Onze Lieve Vrouw-Kerk te Brugge, door J.-B. De Corte, Missionaris en geestelyken schoolopziener des Bisdoms, Ter gelegenheid van den plegtigen Lykdienst aldaer op 6 November 1860 gevierd voor de gesnewelden van het Pauselyk Leger*, Ghent - Bruges 1860.
- de Ségur A., *Les Martyrs de Castelfidardo*, Paris 1862.
- Engelhardt C.M., *Victorian Masculinity and the Virgin Mary*, in Bradstock A., Gill S., Hogan A., Morgan S. (eds.), *Masculinity and Spirituality in Victorian Culture*, London 2000.
- Ford C., *Religion and Popular Culture in Modern Europe*, in "Journal of Modern History", 1993, 65, pp. 152-175.
- Id., *Divided Houses. Religion and Gender in Modern France*, Ithaca - London 2005.
- Forth C.E., Taithe B. (eds.), *French Masculinities. History, Culture and Politics*, Houndmills 2007.
- Gabois G., *«Vous êtes presque la seule consolation de l'église». La foi des femmes face à la déchristianisation de 1789 à 1880*, in Delumeau J. (ed.), *La religion de ma mère. Le rôle des femmes dans la transmission de la foi*, Paris 1992, pp. 301-325.

- Gibson R., *A Social History of French Catholicism, 1789–1914*, London 1989.
- Gay P., *The Cultivation of Hatred*, New York 1993.
- Goddeeris J., *De Pauselijke Zouaven: met opgave van de vrijwilligers uit West-Vlaanderen*, s.l. 1978.
- Gill S., *How Muscular was Victorian Christianity? Thomas Hughes and the Cult of Christian Manliness Reconsidered*, in Swanson R.N. (ed.), *Gender and Christian Religion*, Woodbridge 1998, pp. 421-430.
- Gola S., *Un demi-siècle de relations culturelles entre l'Italie et la Belgique (1830-1880)*, Rome 1999.
- Gross M.B., *The War against Catholicism. Liberalism and the Anti-Catholic Imagination in Nineteenth-Century Germany*, Ann Arbor 2005.
- Guenel J., *La dernière guerre du pape. Les Zouaves pontificaux au secours du Saint-Siège 1860-1870*, Rennes 1998.
- Gubin E., Nandrin J.-P., *Het liberale en burgerlijke België 1846-1878*, in Witte E., Nandrin J.-P., Gubin E., Deneckere G., *Nieuwe geschiedenis van België I 1830-1905*, Tiel 2005, pp. 237-473.
- Harris R., *Lourdes: Body and Spirit in the Secular Age*, New York 1999.
- Harrison C.E., *The Bourgeois Citizen in Nineteenth-Century France: Gender, Sociability, and the Uses of Emulation*, Oxford 1999.
- Harrison C.E., *Zouave Stories: Gender, Catholic Spirituality, and French Responses to the Roman Question*, in "The Journal of Modern History", 2007, 79, pp. 274-305.
- Hastings D.K., *Fears of a Feminized Church: Catholicism, Clerical Celibacy, and the Crisis of Masculinity in Wilhelmine Germany*, in "European History Quarterly", 2008, 38, pp. 34-65.
- Hesse C., *The Other Enlightenment: How French Women Became Modern*, Princeton 2001.
- Heywood S., *Les "petits garçons modèles". La masculinité catholique à travers l'oeuvre de la comtesse de Ségur*, in Revenin R. (ed.), *Hommes et masculinités de 1789 à nos jours. Contributions à l'histoire du genre et de la sexualité en France*, Paris 2007, pp. 208-219.
- Horaist B., *La Dévotion au pape et les catholiques français sous le pontificat de Pie IX (1846-1878) d'après les archives de la Bibliothèque apostolique vaticaine*, Rome 1995.
- Jones M., *What should Historians Do With Heroes? Reflections on Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Britain*, in "History Compass", 2007, 5, pp. 439-454.
- Kimmel M., *Manhood in America. A Cultural History*, New York 1996.
- Kselman T., *Miracles and Prophecies in Nineteenth-Century France*, New Brunswick 1983.
- Langlois C., *Le catholicisme au féminin*, in "Archives de Sciences Sociales des Religions", 1984, 57, pp. 29-53.
- Leconte L., *Les Belges au Service de Rome (1860-1870). Aux Tirailleurs franco-belges et aux Zouaves pontificaux*, in "Carnet de la Fourragère", 1927-1929, 1-4, pp. 71-85, 169-189, 260-284, 356-364.
- Lefèvre P., *Pour le drapeau, épisode de la guerre pontificale (1860)*, s.l. 1862.
- Llorca M.A., *Les femmes dans les apparitions mariales de l'époque contemporaine*, in "Clio, Histoire, Femmes et Sociétés", 2002, 15, pp. 123-134.
- Lorette J., *Historiographie des zouaves pontificaux belges 1860-1980*, in Anon., *Actes du Colloque d'Histoire militaire belge (1830-1980), Bruxelles, 26-28 mars 1980*, Brussels 1981, pp. 151-163.
- Mak G., Waaldijk B., *De politiek van Florence Nightingale in de feministische geschiedschrijving*, in Buikema R., van der Tuin I. (eds.), *Gender in media, kunst en cultuur*, Bussum 2007, pp. 214-229.
- McMillan J.F., *Religion and Gender in Modern France: Some Reflections*, in Tallett F., Atkin N. (eds.), *Religion, Society and Politics in France since 1789*, London 1991, pp. 55-66.
- Id., "Priest hits girl: on the front line in the war of the two Frances", in Clark C., Kaiser W. (eds.), *Culture Wars. Secular-Catholic Conflict in Nineteenth-Century Europe*, Cambridge 2003, pp. 77-101.
- Mosse G.L., *The image of man. The creation of modern masculinity*, Oxford 1996.
- Pruvost A., *Notice sur la vie et la mort du comte Alfred de Limmingbe*, Brussels 1861.
- Orsi R., "He Keeps Me Going": *Women's Devotion to Saint Jude Thaddeus and the Dialectics of Gender in American Catholicism, 1929-1965*, in Kselman T. (ed.), *Belief in History. Innovative Approaches to European and American Religion*, Notre Dame - London 1991, pp. 137-169.
- Id., *Between Heaven and Earth. The Religious Worlds People Make and the Scholars Who Study Them*, Princeton 2005.
- Powell K., Childs E.C. (eds.), *Femmes d'esprit: Women in Daumier's Caricature*, Hanover 1990.

- Rogers R., *From the Salon to the Schoolroom: Educating Bourgeois Girls in Nineteenth-Century France*, University Park 2005.
- Rotundo E.A., *American Manhood. Transformations in Masculinity from the Revolution to the Modern Era*, New York 1993.
- Nye R.A., *Western Masculinities in War and Peace*, in "The American Historical Review", 2007, 112, pp. 417-438.
- Roussel J.-F., *Roman Catholic Religious Discourse About Manhood in Quebec: From 1900 to the Quiet Revolution (1960-1980)*, in "Journal of Men's Studies", 2003, 11, pp. 145-155.
- Ruff M.E., *The Postmodern Challenge to the Secularization Thesis: A Critical Assessment*, in "Schweizerische Zeitschrift für Religions- und Kulturgeschichte", 2005, 99, pp. 398-399.
- Sánchez-Eppler K., *Dependent states: the child's part in nineteenth-century American culture*, Chicago 2005.
- Schmale W., *Geschichte der Männlichkeit in Europa (1450-2000)*, Vienna 2003.
- Vance N., *The Sinews of the Spirit: The Ideal of Christian Manliness in Victorian Literature and Religious Thought*, Cambridge 1985.
- Seeley P., *O Sainte Mère: Liberalism and the Socialization of Catholic Men in Nineteenth-Century France*, in: "The Journal of Modern History", 1998, 70, pp. 862-891.
- Anon., *Bloemen geplukt op het graf van mijnheer August De Rijnck, gewezen pauselijk zouaaf*, Roesselaere 1871.
- Stevens F.E., *Een goudmijn voor genealogen en geschiedschrijvers. De dienstverbintenissen bij de pauselijke troepen 1860-1870*, in "Belgisch Tijdschrift voor Militaire Geschiedenis", 1973, 20, pp. 53-78.
- Suleiman S.R., *Authoritarian fictions. The ideological novel as a literary genre*, New York 1983.
- Terwecoren E., *Ludovic De Taillart, zouave pontifical*, Brussels 1862.
- Id., *Auguste Misson, zouave pontifical*, Brussels 1862.
- Van Coillie J., Ghesquière R., *Uit de schaduw. Een beknopte geschiedenis van de West-Vlaamse en de Westfaalse jeugd- en kinderliteratuur*, Bruges 1996.
- Van Osselaer T., Buerman T., *'Feminisation' thesis: a survey of international historiography and a probing of Belgian grounds*, in "Revue d'Histoire Ecclésiastique", 2008, 103, pp. 497-544.
- Verhoeven T., *Neither Male or Female: Androgyny, Nativism and International Anti-Catholicism*, in "Australasian Journal of American Studies", 2005, 24, pp. 5-19.
- Verspeyen G., *Discours sur l'Oeuvre du Denier de Saint-Pierre*, in Anon., *Assemblée Générale des Catholiques en Belgique. Première Session à Malines. 18-22 Août 1863*, Brussels 1864, pp. 55-56.
- Verspeyen G., *Compte-Rendu de l'Assemblée Générale. Tenue à Gand, le 11 Décembre 1866*, Ghent 1866.
- Id., *Compte-Rendu de l'Assemblée Générale. Tenue à Gand, le 17 Décembre 1867*, Ghent 1867.
- Viaene V., *The Roman Question, Catholic Mobilisation and Papal Diplomacy during the Pontificate of Pius IX (1846-1878)*, in Lamberts E. (ed.), *The Black International. L'International Noire. 1870-1878: the Holy See and Militant Catholicism in Europe*, Leuven 2002, pp. 144-146.
- Id., *International History, Religious History, Catholic History: Perspectives for Cross-Fertilization (1830-1914)*, in "European History Quarterly", 2008, 38, pp. 578-607.
- Werner Y.M., *Christliche Männlichkeit – ein Paradox der Moderne. Männer und Religion im nordeuropäischen Kontext 1840-1940*, unpublished project presentation, 2004, pp. 1-12, [[http://www.hist.lu.se/hist/forskning/kristen\\_manlighet/Homepage.pdf](http://www.hist.lu.se/hist/forskning/kristen_manlighet/Homepage.pdf)].
- Wiseman N.P., *Fabiola; Or, The Church of the Catacombs*, s.l. 1860.
- Witte E., *The battle for monasteries, cemeteries and schools: Belgium*, in Clark C., Kaiser W. (eds.), *Culture Wars. Secular-Catholic Conflict in Nineteenth-Century Europe*, Cambridge 2003, pp. 102-128.